CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

---------- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES
AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS
JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON IMMIGRATION

---------- X

December 15, 2015
Start: 10:54 a.m.
Recess: 1:03 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: JAMES G. VAN BRAMER
Chairperson

CARLOS MENCHACA
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Elizabeth S. Crowley
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Peter A. Koo
Stephen T. Levin
Andy L. King
Costa G. Constantinides
Laurie A. Cumbo
Helen K. Rosenthal
Mathieu Eugene
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Nisha Agarwal, Commissioner
Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs, MOIA

Edwin Torres, Acting Commissioner
Department of Cultural Affairs, DCLA

Leonard Jacobs, Director
Cultural Institutions
Department of Cultural Affairs, DCLA

Bridget Quinn-Carey, Interim President & CEO
Queens Library

Nick Buron, Vice President
Public Service
Queens Library

Jorge Daniel Veneciano
Executive Director, El Museo del Barrio
Vice Chair, CIG Manhattan

David Freudenthal, Director
Government Operations
Carnegie Hall

Eva Reza, Coordinator
Immigrant Services
Brooklyn Public Library

Caryl Soriano, Chief Librarian
Mid-Manhattan Library

Cheryl Adolph, Interim President & CEO
Staten Island Museum

Rosemary De Luca, Director
Government and Community Affairs
Wildlife Conservation Society

Catherine Le Clair, Director
Foundation Government Relations
New York City Ballet

[sound check, background comments]

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Good morning everyone. I believe we are ready for this very exciting important and dare I say historic hearing. First of all, I just want to say on behalf of the Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries and International and Intergroup Relations what a privilege it is to co-host this hearing with the amazing Carlos Menchaca, the Chair of our Immigrant Services Committee, an amazing leader in the City Council and I might add one of the people who brought the IDNYC to New York City. I know Commissioner Agarwal and our Speaker and the Mayor and so many share in this moment, but I don't believe it's an oversight to say that this is one of the most successful and historic programs that have ever been launched in the City of New York. People talk about a game changer so often in politics. It's overused but this IDNYC is, in fact, a game changer, and I want to also say that there is a lot of excitement. We are live Tweeting this hearing. The hash tag is IDNYC. Also, of course, you can Tweet IDNYC, and you see at Jimmy Van Bramer and at Carlos Menchaca. So feel free to join in the conversation about this

amazing program. Obviously, as the Chair of the Cultural Affairs Committee I am here with such great pride knowing that the cultural community, the Cultural Institutions group members in particular came to the table in a monumental way. And--and I believe firmly that the testimony today will show that this program IDNYC close to 700,000 New Yorkers have already enrolled, and we are approaching 200,000 cultural organization memberships, which is absolutely remarkable. Those numbers show that this program I believe would not have been as successful had the cultural component not been there, had the memberships not been offered to make it so much more attractive. And, with the joy of having both culturals and libraries in my portfolio libraries, our public libraries are so often the front lines for so many in our immigrant communities have been so instrumental in serving as sites for folks to register. I myself have seen the Flushing library where virtually the entire entrance to the library has been used and used in a way that is so, so important. So this program is something that we have to be very proud of, very excited about, and is something that is going to reach numbers that I'm

sure the Commissioner may never have imagined when it was launched. So, the question is what is the limit if there is a limit, and it is--it is going to be something that has lives. I just want to say on a personal level before I hand it over to our amazing co-chair, I have heard from so many families even on Facebook today who are talking about the fact that they have signed up for some of these memberships. And families in Sunnyside telling me that they have young children and would not have normally been able to take their children to some of these museums and cultural institutions, performance venues. But now they are doing that because of this program. That chances the future of not just that family. That actually changes the future of the city of New York making all of us better. And I know that Council Member Menchaca will talk about some of the other incredibly important benefits about making sure that no one lives in the shadows in New York City and that we are all equal partners in the city of New York. But I am particularly proud of--of the cultural and library piece of this, and those folks who are doing that work, and actually changing in some ways their missions and the services that they provide because

of all of the new folks who are coming and enjoying the venues is just spectacular. So, this is a timely, timely moment for the program given that we are ending the first year going into the new year. There are some questions about benefits continuing. Obviously the Mayor made a big announcement with the Speaker, but I think there's even better news on that front that we're all going to hear about. So, this is indeed one of the most historic programs, and historic hearings that this committee has ever held, and perhaps the first jointly with Chair Menchaca. So with that, I want to hand it over to an amazing leader for the city of New York not just the great borough of Brooklyn but our Chair Carlos Menchaca.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. Thank you Majority Leader and Chair Van Bramer. I am really excited to be here with you, and have been looking forward to this moment where we can sit back and realize how much we've done together as the people of New York. Whether you're an organization, a leader, a staff member or a parent, it's trying to access these services. This is a moment in time where we can actually understand how far we have come, and I do want to say buenos dias todos. And as

we continue to live Tweet, I want to encourage you to Tweet in whatever language you can at home, and also just kind of talk to us through social media. We really want to make sure that we test this out today. Again, my name is Carlos Menchaca, and the Chair of the Immigration Committee. Thank you all for being here with us today to discuss this program, and as I continue to thank Jimmy Van Bramer, our Majority Leader and Chair, I also want to say that without his leadership this kind of work really requires a hands-on approach and he does that every single time. And that's not something that--that you see often in politics, and so I just want to say thank you again to really working with us, and really putting his personal touch this program. I also want to recognize all the members of the City Council who are here, Peter Koo from Queens, Costa Constantinides, from Queens as well, and there are some others that are coming. Crowley as well is here today.

Today the committee or committees are holding the hearing to learn about the status of the City's Municipal Identification program known as IDNYC as it relates to the cultural organizations. IDNYC is a free government issued photo

identification card available to every New York City resident regardless of race, color, creed, age, national origin, citizenship status, gender, sexual orientation, disability, marital status, partnership status, any lawful source of income, housing status, status as a victim of domestic violence, or status as a victim of sex offenses or stalking or conviction or arrest record as defined in the Title 8 of the Administrative Code. Now, what's important about this is that we're trying to reach every New Yorker especially our vulnerable New Yorkers that need access to our city services. And clearly, we have worked to ensure that this accessible. This is available in 25 languages at any of the program's 12 enrollment sites, or pop-up locations. This is why people are accessing it at the root record rates that we're seeing today. The City Council created IDNYC in response to the needs of individuals and communities who face barriers to obtaining a legitimate identification to fully participate in and take advantage of the city's institutions, and services. This is true for hundreds of thousands of immigrants that call New York City home. Many members of the immigrant community lack documents

proving their identify while others have some documents like the Consular ID--the Consular identification cards, driver's licenses and birth certificates from their countries of origin. For those trying to access basic services, these documents are often unacceptable forms of identification in the application process. In establishing IDNYC, we worked with the administration and advocates including many of you who are here today. We hard to create a safe and affordable form of identification including it being recognized by the NYPD our New York City Police Department. Our partnership with NYPD was a vital component in making this form of identification useful for the city's hundreds of thousands of homeless, undocumented and LGBTQ community members who cannot afford to do--who cannot afford not to have necessary documents, or to obtain state issued identification. NYPD recognition of NYDC allows for disenfranchised communities to feel safer and better integrated in the city. For example, they can now report crimes directly to the NYPD. NYPD is recognized by every city agency, and serves as a valid form of identification to open up a bank account or credit union account for at least 12

different financial institutions and that continues to grow as well. Furthermore, cardholders are eligible for a wide variety of benefits including discounts at movie theaters. It's a popular one right now, local food bazaar supermarkets, certain health and sport facilities. You should start taking notes here if you haven't taken advantage of those. And even for prescription drug discounts at many pharmacies throughout the city. And for calendar 2015--for calendar year 2015 IDNYC cardholders are eligible for a one-year membership at the 33 city agencies. And we had some really great announcements yesterday as we celebrate the City Council legislative victory in 2014, the de Blasio Administration announced that this would continue in 2016. This is very, very exciting for all of us as we keep it free for New Yorkers.

As IDNYC moves into its second year, cardholders will be happy to learn that they are eligible for new benefits. This includes discounts on Citi Bike memberships, NYC--NYC Football Club tickets, concession purchases at Barclay Center in Brooklyn and more. Not only does the program's expansion give credence to New York City residents no

matter who they are or where they come from, it also encourages integration and belonging by improving access to many of our city's world-class cultural institutions and entertainment attractions and services. I hope that with this is good news more and more New Yorkers will take advantage of IDNYC. And my personal hope is that we can reach a million before--before Christmas, before the end of the year and our New Years and our holidays as we celebrate. So that's just my--my wish before the end of the fiscal year.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: [off mic] It's a good one. (sic)

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: I know. It's--it's possible. It's possible. I've got to--I've got to put it out there. If anybody is interested in helping us do that, let us know. Get your families to sign up. As both the Chair of Immigration and as one of the co-sponsors of the legislation that created IDNYC I am particularly interested in the members and experiences of our immigrant holders--cardholders. The committees are interested in learning about how IDNYC has been used as well as how New Yorkers have taken advantage of the card's

various uses and benefits. We hope to hear testimony and implementation of the--and carrying out of the program as well from our institutions. And so again, I thank you for being here today, and look forward to all of the testimony, and I'll just say a couple of sentences in Spanish for everyone listening. Buenos dias again. [Speaking Spanish] Thank you so much and let's get started with our first panel, and we would like to call up Mr. Edwin Torres and Commissioner Agarwal from MOIA and the Department of Cultural Affairs. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: And to swear you in we have the counsel to Cultural Affairs and Libraries Committee, Aminta Kilawan.

LEGAL COUNSEL KILAWAN: Commissioners, will you both raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee, and to respond honestly to Council Member questions?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Yes.

EDWIN TORRES: I do.

LEGAL COUNSEL KILAWAN: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Thank you so much Chair Van Bramer, Chair Menchaca and the members of

1 both committees for the opportunity to testify today.
2 My name is Nisha Agarwal, and I'm the Commissioner of
3 the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs. I am joined
4 today by my colleague Edwin Torres, Acting
5 Commissioner at the Department of Cultural Affairs.
6 I am very happy to say that in just under a year more
7 than 670,000 New Yorkers have received their IDNYC
8 cards. I sit before you on the heels of Mayor de
9 Blasio and Speaker Mark-Viverito's announcement that
10 in 2016 IDNYC will continue to be free for all New
11 Yorkers. This will ensure that regardless of
12 immigration status New Yorkers have easier access to
13 government issued ID, can enter city buildings and
14 apply for services, and have all--an all-access pass
15 essentially to the city we all love with memberships
16 and discounts on a range of benefits. The large
17 number of enrollments make IDNYC the largest
18 municipal ID program in the country, and demonstrates
19 a glaring need for government issued identification
20 in New York City. The success is in no small way a
21 testament to the collaboration in our city's
22 libraries, and our community and benefit partners
23 including the city's world-class cultural
24 institutions. Throughout its first year, IDNYC has
25

1 become a New York City fixture. The ID has been
2 praised by New Yorkers across all five boroughs with
3 nearly 10% of the city's eligible population already
4 enrolled. Queens, our most diverse borough and the
5 heart of many immigrant communities leads the way
6 followed closely by the Bronx, Brooklyn, Manhattan
7 and State Island. Of particular note our communities
8 like Jackson Heights, East Harlem, Corona, Sunset
9 Park, Flushing and others where upwards of 14% of the
10 eligible population have enrolled. Further, the
11 IDNYC program continues to facilitate access for New
12 Yorkers without pop-up enrollment centers. Since
13 launching these temporary and mobile enrollment
14 centers in April, we have popped up at nearly 50
15 locations throughout the five boroughs. These
16 locations include an array of hosts from Bellevue
17 Hospital to our Lady of Ascension Church to the
18 Queens Council of Arts, El Museo del Barrio, and the
19 Gay Men's Health Crisis. Our library partners are
20 central to the success of our enrollment and pop-ups.
21 All five permanent library centers boast some of the
22 most active enrollment centers and account for over
23 265,000 enrollments. Additionally, we have had 11
24 libraries specific pop-ups such as the New York
25

Public Library Inwood and New York Libraries, the Brooklyn Public Library, New Lochs and Flatbush Libraries and the Queens Public Library in Jackson Heights. And recently, we announced the Bayside Library pop-up.

We are happy to say, and you will hear more from my colleague in a moment, that all of the 2015 benefit partners are returning for year 2, and that includes the YMCA, Food Bazaar, Big Apple RX, the Parks and Recreation Centers, New York Pass, which has entertainment discounts as well as 33 members of the Cultural Institutions Group. The return of these benefit partners is indicative of the success of and interest in IDNYC. In addition to welcoming back all of the 2015 benefit partners, in 2016 IDNYC will provide New Yorkers with free one-year memberships to seven more cultural institutions including the Solomon R. Guggenheim Museum, the Museum of Modern Art, the New Museum, the Metropolitan Opera, the Museum of Chinese in America, BRIC Arts Media and Pregones Theater. And discounted tickets and memberships for Citi Bike, the New York City Football Club and my favorite the Animal Care Centers of New York. Adding to the prestigious

museums and art centers that are joining us are the New York Theater Ballet and Ballet School, the Alliance of Resident Theaters or ART New York, A-R-T New York and Roundabout Theater Company. All of these cultural partners will offer discounts on performances and classes with the ART New York Theater participation comprising 30 distinct theater offerings throughout the city. A central component of publication--of public education and outreach initiatives for IDNYC include information on program benefits and access. The program boasts a cadre of outreach organizers that work diligently with community partners, elected officials and service providers to deliver trainings, answer questions and assist residents in both receiving and utilizing their cards. These efforts have yielded tremendous interest, including a recent African community town hall with some 300 residents in the Bronx and IDNYC and other city initiatives. Successful small businesses canvases with elected officials and roundtables with religious leaders. Additionally, the City has continued to explore new and creative ways to share information at the IDNYC program. These initiatives include a recently completed live

hot line in partnership with the Hispanic Federation and Univision, Radio Lotto and El Diario. The hotline received over 2,000 callers over two days, and featured a PSA with the New York City Football Club ball payers. The Mayor's Office and the Department of Education had also initiated focus groups with youth to ensure that the program meets the needs and interests of the young population. Further, in collaboration with our colleagues of the Department of Cultural Affairs we have recently welcomed the first artists and residents of the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs, Tania Bruguera. Tanya a renowned internationally acclaimed artist who employed her practice of arte util or useful art to develop new methods of addressing pressing issues facing immigrant communities. In particular, Tania will focus aspects of her work around IDNYC and to expand the way the immigrant communities receive information about the program.

I want to finish by telling you a few stories, two stories of cardholders. The first is Amande (sp?) To him this card symbolizes that he is a real New Yorker. He had only visited the Bronx Zoo on Wednesday when there's free admission previously,

but now he sees the zoo as part of his neighborhood and visits it regularly. And Sienna (sic) who has two children and has used the cultural benefits as a way to organize parents and children together with meet-ups in institutions. And Judy who never visited the cultural institutions before she got her IDNYC, and Sonia who finally has a document that makes her feel safe, and that she can use in the City without fear while also using her access pass to discounts and memberships. Our partners, communities, staff and outreach teams have heard repeatedly what it means to cardholders to have an ID document that makes them feel safe, and that simply identifies them as a New Yorker. An ID that speaks to who they are and the pride that they have to be part of this large beautiful city. And that demonstrates a small but really profound way what this has meant for the city.

The Cultural Institutions Group, the libraries and all our extraordinary benefit partners from 2015 pave the way when they said loudly and clearly that these beloved places are truly for every New Yorker. We are thrilled and grateful to have them back, and overjoyed to welcome our new

innovators on the great path forward. Thank you. [pause]

COMMISSIONER TORRES: There we go. I realized just in time we're not supposed to clap. That was really inspiring. I would have to follow that. [laughs] Thank you, Commissioner Agarwal and good morning Chair Van Bramer, Chair Menchaca and other members of the committee. I'm Edwin Torres, Acting Commissioner of the New York City Department of Cultural Affairs. I'm here today to present testimony regarding IDNYC and the Cultural Institutions Group. I'm joined by a number of staff from DCLA as well as colleagues from the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs. By any measure the cultural benefits provided by the Cultural Institutions Group or the CIG to IDNYC cardholders have been a tremendous success. The 33 members of the CIG are non-profit cultural organizations that occupy city-owned land encompassing a wide range of groups including Lincoln Center and Staten Island Museum, Brooklyn Children's Museum, Queens Botanical Garden and Bronx Museum to name just a few.

In exchange for annual operating and energy subsidies, these organizations provide broadly

accessible cultural programming for city residents. New Yorkers have fully embraced the IDNYC cultural benefits redeeming memberships that have helped connect them to the full breadth of our city's incredible cultural assets. The impact on institutions has also been transformative. New members from hundreds of city zip codes have signed up giving groups a powerful tool to engage with audiences, and in many cases diversifying the geography of memberships. As the Mayor said, the American Museum of Natural History in July when the program surpassed 400,000 cardholders this card is a pocket-sized expression of a hugely powerful message that this is a city for everyone. This program has proven without a doubt that residency, cultural experiences as an integral part of being a New Yorker.

Now, I'd like to walk you through some of the impressive statistics we've collected on the program. Since January, New Yorkers have redeemed over 160,000 memberships at all 33 CIG members. As of October, nearly 10% of these came from the immigrant rich communities of Central Queens including Elmhurst, Woodside, Corona, Jackson Heights

and Flushing. Other neighborhoods among the top 25 zip codes like Sunset Park, Crown Heights and Bedford-Stuyvesant in Brooklyn, and Kingsbridge in the Bronx tell us that this program is attracting new members from diverse communities all over the city. It's no surprise that the cultural benefit has been so successful. From the start, the CIG has embraced the program. They have hosted pop-up IDNYC enrollment sites such as El Museo del Barrio earlier this year where I enrolled for my card. Organizations have also worked to incorporate IDNYC into their promotional materials, and institutional identify as places that are essential to making New York the dynamic and energetic place that it is. We've heard stories of this impact from around the city. It has fostered and increased diversity in memberships across the board, whether you're considering geography, background or even age. For instance, at Brooklyn Botanical Garden, which has always cultivated a diverse audience of participation, 40% of IDNYC members are from boroughs other than Brooklyn. An incredible 78% are under the age of 55. Thanks to BBG's exemplary engagement with our IDNYC members, they even know that 98% of new

1 members said the garden has met or exceeded their
2 expectations. At the Metropolitan Museum of Art 54%
3 of its nearly 25,000 IDNYC members live in boroughs
4 outside of Manhattan. That's as opposed to 23% of
5 paid members who are Manhattan residents. More than
6 20% of IDNYC members are from Queens compared to just
7 11% of paid Manhattan members. This remarkable
8 pattern is repeated for the other boroughs as well.
9 The Brooklyn Academy of Music reported just last
10 month that more than 10% of their IDNYC members
11 purchased tickets to the Next Wave Festival
12 indicating that our groups have found ways to sustain
13 these new relationships made possible by IDNYC.
14 In a letter from October, New York City
15 Ballet Executive Director Katherine Brown wrote of
16 the importance of the program to her organization
17 where IDNYC members constituted around 40% of the
18 audience at recent events. Katherine's quote is,
19 "Many of these people had not previously been to our
20 theater, and staff reports there our newest members
21 who are eager to embrace all aspects of members'
22 activities and access. The IDNYC program is
23 providing the company a pool of potential patrons
24 previously unknown to us who have predisposition to
25

the ballet. We're pleased to have the opportunity to get to know these individuals and cultivate their interest over the course of a year-long membership." We've seen evidence of this transformative impact again and again, of institutions developing larger and more diverse member bases than ever before, and New Yorkers taking their families to experience a museum, zoo, garden or performance for the first time. For us, it's truly inspiring. We're eager to improve and build on this program so that even more residents and cultural groups can participate in this extraordinary program. I am so please to echo an announcement made by Mayor de Blasio just yesterday. All 33 members of the CIG along with seven new cultural organizations have signed on to offer residents who get their ID sent--IDNYC cards in 2016 free membership benefits. Additional cultural groups including the Roundabout Theater and New York Theater Ballet will offer discounts as well. This is a testament to these cultural organizations' commitments to engaging New Yorkers, and to their importance not only for their world-renowned programming, but also as something essential to our city's civic fabric.

Las week, our agency hosted a panel discussion where CIGs could share their experiences from the first year with their fellow participating organizations including the seven newcomers. It was packed with stories that explored creative ways of engaging new members, processing applicants efficiently and strategies for retaining these members in the long term. The discussion made clear that these groups are seizing the opportunities presented by IDNYC. They're surveying their new members to get a better understanding of the people that are joining, and they're developing communications and attention strategies to make sure that these new members keep coming back as paying members even after their one-year terms is up. The success of IDNYC wouldn't be possible without the support of our partners in the City Council. We thank you for your role in increasing access to these treasured institutions. I'm happy to answer any questions that you have.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you to both of you, and the--the incredible I think snapshot of where and how far we've come this far, and actually what I want to do is start with the kind of basic

1 question about the CIGs and their incredible
2 recommitment. What do you think were the three
3 factors that really led to the--from the agencies'
4 perspectives--led to the reauthorization of the
5 program and led to the seven new cultural
6 institutions? What three factors can we tell our New
7 Yorkers really made an impact in this?
8 COMMISSIONER TORRES: I mean I--I would
9 really have a hard time probably limiting it to just
10 three, and I'll ask Linda (sic) to weigh in if I
11 leave anything out.
12 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: If you could talk
13 closer to the mic.
14 COMMISSIONER TORRES: Oh, pardon me.
15 Certainly.
16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.
17 COMMISSIONER TORRES: You know, I--first
18 of all, I think that these cultural organizations are
19 genuinely interested in serving the greatest number
20 of New Yorkers as possible. I think that this has
21 been a--a real opportunity for them, and they see it
22 as a real opportunity to serve the greatest number as
23 possible. So one is just the numbers of people being
24 able to--to access. Two is the diversity that's
25

contained within the program. I mean the program was divine--designed so smartly by you guys and by--by Nisha's agency to be really all-inclusive so that it is, you know, by design a program for undocumented immigrants, but it was designed so smartly that it could be a card for everyone. And so that you're able to reach a real cross-section of--of our residents.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Can I--can I ask a question about the--the--

COMMISSIONER TORRES: [interposing] Sure.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: --the kind of--One of the things that was--that had popped out was the makeup of the new signups from multiple boroughs outside of the borough, the institution itself. What--what--I have some assumption about what--that that could mean, but from the agency's perspective what does that mean for a cultural institution?

COMMISSIONER TORRES: Oh, for the cultural institutions. I mean, I--I think that the cultural institutions are--are really interesting in that they are bound by a place because they'll exist within a facility. But they want to serve all New Yorkers as possible. The fact of the matter is to be

able to serve New Yorkers that aren't necessarily within close physical proximity. I think this has been a real opportunity to do that. The--the fact of the matter is yeah, we're--we're a huge population in a tiny land mass. We have the--the luxury of not being car-reliant, but still, you know, there--with the--even with the centralized public transit system--it's nice to have a bit of a--a bit of a goose to leave your borough to leave your neighborhood and to go to a cultural institution, and this has really created that, you know.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And--and so just to follow up, and Commissioner Agarwal--

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Yeah, I was just going to add that not only for the cultural institutions, but so many of the benefits that are attached to the ID card like prescription drug discounts, right, are things that have been available to New Yorkers all along. But by attaching it to this IDNYC, which has had such a tremendous response in the community across the board, it has in a way opened a door. And--and made people feel connected to services the city was already providing, which is exactly the point. And so I think that's what's

1 really exciting here is it's becoming--it's becoming
2 a symbol like key to the city even for programs like
3 the cultural institutions and the prescription drug
4 discounts that were always available.
5 COMMISSIONER TORRES: Yeah, and I think
6 that's actually--if I could add to that--I think
7 that's actually true of the cultural institutions as
8 well. You know, a good number of them are literally
9 pay what you wish. I mean to--to get a membership,
10 to go out of your way to get a membership clearly
11 means something so much more than just the financial.
12 It's a membership to a museum where you would have
13 paid a quarter to get in anyway. I mean this--this
14 is something also symbolic.
15 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And so what--what
16 I also want to understand, too, is the agency's
17 perspective to support our cultural institutions and
18 we support our cultural institutions through capital
19 infrastructure, through programming.
20 COMMISSIONER TORRES: Yes.
21 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: How has this
22 allowed for--or how--how has this give the--the
23 Department of Cultural Affairs and MOIA an
24 opportunity to create and design new programming?
25

I'm going to--I'm going to point to a question from Twitter that Ms. Melissa Portillo just asked about how we integrate and redeem these benefits across the board including our cultural institutions for our seniors? And so, how--how--now that we've kind of had a year, we're seeing the numbers grow. We're--we're--it's a kind of shotgun approach. The IDNYC and MTA ads. I mean we're seeing it everywhere. We're seeing it on social media. How do we start fine fine-tuning this program, and have you started thinking about that for vulnerable populations like our seniors that might not have that kind of access like a--like a young family might?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Yeah, I can start with that and then perhaps Vita (sic) and Mystilfie (sp?) is really the leading on the outreach efforts for IDNYC can speak to this as well. You know, we have tried to take the opportunity to do outreach special programming for a variety of different groups that have a special interest in getting, in the IDNYC and who we would like to encourage to get the IDNYC. One of the strategies that I mentioned in my testimony in partnership with the Department of Cultural Affairs is to bring an artist in residence

into MOIA to really focus on a program like IDNYC, and as creative as we may be in the bureaucracy, in fact, an artist may be able to come up with ways to reach people across the board seniors to young people that are more exciting and more creative that we could. And so, I hope as Tania works with us that we'll develop new and more innovative strategies as well to do that kind of outreach.

VITA: And I'll just add to that. One of the key initiatives that we do from an outreach perspective is our team partners with senior centers they partner. We've actually partnered for pop-ups at locations and have ones coming down the line as well. We've arranged filed trips with senior centers, which is really great. So larger numbers coming to our enrollment centers and enrolling together. And we recently did a presentation at one where we--we asked, you know, how many folks in the audience already have their cards, and nearly three-fourths of the seniors of the center had already received their cards. So we're definitely penetrating in those localized ways in some of the communities that we're targeting. But we're also sort of thinking about how you elevate some of that

work, and I actually think our library partners can probably speak pretty in tune and genuinely to this. If you've spent any time at the enrollment centers at Flushing, at Brooklyn Public Library at Mid-Manhattan you'll see in terms of who's coming in through those doors seniors often are the primary people accessing library services. And you'll see that they are, in fact, enrolling for IDNYC when they're at those locations.

COMMISSIONER TORRES: Are you capturing--so let's star shifting to some--some of the things that we're hearing both on Twitter and just through our conversations with folks about where--where we're needing a little bit more improvement or are seeing some things that can offer--that are offering challenges, but we can offer some responses to. And one of the things that I want to--I want to point to is staff level training, and where the--what--what--what's the responsibility for MOIA and the Department of Cultural Affairs to really require a kind of competency ad the lowest staff level where there's interaction maybe-- And this is what we're hearing, too. People are walking in with their IDNYC. Maybe they didn't know that they had to actually enroll in

a membership, and what we'll talk specially to cultural institution, but what's the agencies' responsibility to ensure that there a kind of consistency and message from--from the lowest staff member at a cultural institution, or at a library or at a bank to make sure that activate. Some--some folks are--are telling us that they're--they're having that interaction, and they're just walking away and saying, oh, I guess I was misunderstood. There's a language barrier sometimes in some of the cases that we've seen. What's the responsibility for the city?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: So I can start and speak to IDNYC in general. The staff of IDNYC across the board received extensive training on language access. All of our sites are linguistically accessible--accessible for people with disabilities, et cetera. And, the training was very rich. It wasn't just, you know, it was about all of the different types of New Yorkers who may come into an enrollment center and ensuring that people feel welcomed, that their needs are met. That this is--that we don't erect any barriers in enabling people to apply. And so I think that's been one part of it,

and for a lot of our partners for example in schools we have signs that say your IDNYC is accepted here. We're trying to make sure that that's--that serves a function of communicating to the cardholder that you can use your IDNYC in this particular location. If there are problems that cardholders are experiencing either with our partners or at any of our enrollment sites, we want to hear about them. And we really hope that people will reach out to us. We've expanded our customer service team within IDNYC to be able to respond to these concerns. We have a really fantastic outreach team that's in the community that also hears the concerns and elevates them to us as we need them, too. And we are fully dedicated to making sure that our staff gets the proper training and support that they need to serve the many different New Yorkers who are coming into our sites.

COMMISSIONER TORRES: Well, I'm--

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [interposing] Are you going to--are you going to answer?

COMMISSIONER TORRES: Well, I was just going to say at the Department of Cultural Affairs we recently convened a number of the cultural institutions because, you know, we have been hearing

with such frequency that our cultural institutions were really finding themselves going above and beyond what they had done prior specifically in response to the opportunities IDNYC created. So they were simply getting a far high level of enrollments in memberships than they had initially anticipated or that they had gotten in the past. And some of them had just such sort of inspiring stories in terms of how to do that (1) we wanted them to be able to share this one another. but (2) it was also the perfect timing in terms of securing seven additional cultural organizations. So they were able to walk into this experience already forewarned and pre-armed with peers' operational insights. Do you want to add anything to that, Leonard.

LEONARD JACOBS: [coughs] I would just add that we thought it was important that we encourage an atmosphere of sharing between the cultural institutions in very much the same way that each cultural institution does something different in terms of its programming. There are sort of, you know, baselines around registration and how they on-board IDNYC members who come in the door and want to redeem their membership. And, how these institutions

1 engage with those people. We thought it would be
2 useful not just for the agency to sort of move from a
3 place of receiving anecdotes, but to try and begin to
4 quantify that in some way. But to also encourage the
5 institutions to collaborate and communicate with one
6 another. What's been very interesting about it
7 subsequent to that meeting, which was a week ago
8 Monday, was how many of them then went back to their
9 staff and started looking and referencing before, you
10 know, the lowest level of staffer all the way up to
11 the top. How they brought a lot of those stories and
12 ideas back to their staff, and they're now actually
13 reviewing what they do, how they do it, why they do
14 it, and trying to sort of get a handle on best
15 practices that would be effective for their
16 institutions. So, you know, I think we're going to
17 do more of these. I mean they're asking that we do
18 more. So I imagine we will.
19 COMMISSIONER TORRES: Yeah.
20 LEONARD JACOBS: And, you know, as we--as
21 we do that we can begin to craft additional seminars
22 and panels that might deal with-- For example, we
23 touched on very briefly retention, but, you know,
24 we're only going into the second year. Their
25

1 challenge is going to be retaining the people who
2 redeemed in the first year. So as we get into the
3 spring and summer of 2016 the question of retention
4 will become much more critical for these groups.
5 And, so with that, like for example we might convene
6 them again, and start talking in-depth about
7 retention strategies.
8 COMMISSIONER TORRES: Yeah.
9 VITA: I just want to add briefly because
10 as everybody knows this was the first year. This was
11 really folks coming together and figuring--and
12 anticipating and in some ways speculating what we
13 were to expect, and all of the cultural institutions
14 to their credit approximately a year ago to dates met
15 with MOIA, met with DCLA and began to brainstorm at
16 the membership level how to receive people and how to
17 impart information and to do so consistently. So
18 this is the--the kind of evolving best practices.
19 This is amazing and something we'll continue, but
20 really right out of the gate with something that
21 everybody was on the same page about and
22 communicating about.
23 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: That's great--and-
24 -and again, the--the fact that a city this large with
25

so many institutions can move like this and so quickly it's actually a huge fete. And so, thank you for those--those--you know, I think in a lot of ways it's kind of organizing 101. Just get people in a room, talk about your experiences and share them. It's happening. So thank you--thank you so much for that--those pieces. I do want to say that or ask if Twitter would be a way since this is a social media moment for us here in our hearing, if it's okay for the--for us to allow for Twitter, and other social media outlets to kind of get used to the specific issues. And would you be able to kind of commit to checking IDNYC Twitter handle kind of seeing things. Harlem Medic was talking a little bit about MTA refusing to recognize IDNYC when filing for reduced fare, Metro Card or reduced fare Metro Card. There's another issue of--of city buildings not accepting IDNYC. Maybe it's just a staff member again that didn't get the memo. But can--can social media be a way where an immediate situation can--you know, rather than, you know, maybe it happened on the weekend in a council member's office, gets a phone call. But can--can you commit to--to kind of hearing

1 people's thoughts and ideas and challenges on--on
2 social media.
3 COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Absolutely. We
4 already do hear quite a lot from New Yorkers on
5 social media, and really any way folks want to
6 communicate with us we want to hear the feedback.
7 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Wonderful. I'm
8 going to pause my questions and recognize Council
9 Member King from the Bronx and Council Member Cumbo
10 from Brooklyn, and I know Council Member King had a
11 question.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Yes. Thank you,
13 Mr. Chair, I appreciate it and happy holidays to
14 everyone. Peace and blessings. Thank you,
15 Commissioner, and all of you for being here today. I
16 just have two quick questions. The first one is--and
17 if it's been asked for give me--but the first one is
18 what would you say has been your number one problem
19 instituting IDNYC over the year. And the second
20 question is have you gotten to a one-stop shop? Is
21 there a plan for a one-stop shop, and I ask that
22 because when we started, and I had people coming and
23 setting up for appointments, they thought they were
24 coming in to go through the hole process not coming
25

to set up an appointment to go to another appointment to get to the next appointment. But hopefully one day get a picture and they're not going to have another appointment. So I'm asking you where are we in that process that people can just sign up one time, and if I wanted to do it in my district that the whole shop comes and they just walk out with an ID.

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Sure. So I think perhaps our largest challenge was also really a good problem to have, which was the incredible demand for the cards especially early on. And so we had to expand the number of enrollment sites, and staffing and the ability to really meet that demand. And so, while that was really challenging, we were able to do so quickly, and now we have appointments available at all of the sites across the five boroughs this week. And so I think that was a challenge, but we're really proud to overcome it and be in a really good place. In terms of the one-stop shop, there's a few things that we're thinking about doing. I mean right now you basically come in and apply to get your picture taken once, and then the card is mailed to you. And in most cases it's mailed to you, and I think that's

1 going to continue to be an important feature of the
2 program, but we want to get out into the community
3 more. So people can get the cards in their
4 neighborhoods. So we'd love to work with you
5 certainly to bring pop-up sites into your district or
6 any other community around the--around the city.
7 We're also developing more mobile technologies that
8 will allow us even more freedom especially when the
9 weather--I guess the weather is pretty warm right now
10 [laughs]--
11 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [interposing] Uh-
12 huh.
13 COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: --but when it's
14 supposed to be warmer to be able to get even further
15 out into the communities. So that's something we're
16 very committed to we're working on.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Okay, anybody else
18 want to chime in on the number one issue?
19 COMMISSIONER TORRES: Oh, no, well, I
20 mean I--I hesitate to call it an issue, because again
21 it's--it's both an issue and an opportunity. Again,
22 just volume. I mean the response has been fantastic.
23 the response has been huge, and more than
24
25

anticipated, but, you know, we should have such problems.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Your smile says it all. Okay. [laughs] So, my final question is what has been the most successful thing that you've experienced over the year?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Oh, that's a good question. So I will say that for me talking to New Yorkers who have gotten their ID card and hearing from them about why and how they're using it is hands down the best part of this. And having--having the opportunity obviously to talk to all 670,000, but truly every person you talk to has a different reason why they love their IDNYC. And related to that I've been in so many meetings like the senior center with immigrant seniors when three-quarters of them hold up their card just to acknowledge I got my ID card. I'm a New Yorker, and that's pretty awesome. That goes beyond benefits. That goes beyond everything. It's just to say here I am. I'm a New Yorkers. I belong and I think that's wonderful.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Well, thank you for belonging. Thank you for administering this ID. Mr. Chair, thanks so much.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. Thank you so much. Next, we're going to have Council Member Koo from Queens.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Chair Menchaca and all the Commissioners that are here.

[background comment]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: True. I'm just going to put a three--a three-minute clock as we get through the first round of questions.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Okay, yeah, oh, yeah, you give me three minutes, yeah. So I'm really happy the IDNYC was successful. I think we have to thank the libraries for making IDNYC successful. The library is a good location for people to apply. They are not afraid to go to the libraries. So thank you to all the libraries for hosting this thing. I'm--I have some questions, but I--I asked the questions first and then you answer me.

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: The first question is that of all of those applications can you say how much from legal residents or from U.S. citizens? [bell] Oh, the first bell goes off. The second question is how long will they get these applications

free of charge? Because I personally believe nothing is free in the world. Even air is not free. Freedom is not free. So applications will not be free. When you apply for a birth certificate, it costs you $15.00 in New York City. That's the figure they charge, plus $2.75 processing fee. A passport costs you over $100, you know. A driver's license costs you like $67.00, you know. So everything has a cost. So why should we continually not charging the application fee? Because this is something I don't understand. Even though the city has money, I mean we can charge it, and put this money in reserve for later on when we have--we have a financial crisis it will be nice, right. So this is something I urge the Commissioner to consider because if you charge them $20 it's not an excessive fee. It's a very reasonable fee. If you go to Jackson Heights and apply for--get one of those fake IDs, it costs you over $100. [laughs] No, and they're fake, you know. And now we're giving them a real ID and no charge? Oh. So this is something like I--personally, I think this is, you know, we have to charge them somehow in the future. I mean the first year--the first two years may be to attract people to apply. My question

is--the third question is out of those successful applications, do they have any applicants that live--from other states, yeah, from the Tri-State area. You know, a lot of people come here to apply for ID because the bar is real low. You only need a passport and a--and a cell phone or a bill. So like everyone can apply, you know, whether you--whether you are living in New York City or not. So sometimes it's not fair that we're subsidizing people [bell] from other states. So those are my three questions.

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Sure. Thank you for those questions. So first on the question of whether we have a breakdown on the immigration statuses of our cardholders? We don't. We don't ask about immigration status when individuals apply. What we do know that in immigrant communities the uptick of the card has been very, very high. And some of the highest enrollment areas in New York also are very immigrant registered communities. In Corona, for example, one out of five people has an IDNYC, which is pretty remarkable. So that's the best we can do there. In terms of the free of charge, there's a number of reasons. So the card will remain free through 2016, and there's a few

reasons for that. One big one, and we're going to be doing an evaluation soon, to stress our sense of the return on investment for a program like this. So earlier Chairman Menchaca mentioned that the NYPD accepts this ID card, and it--and with encounters with New Yorkers. If that means we reduce arrests, that's actually a cost savings to us in the long term, which is well worth the--the investment that we've made in something like IDNYC? It's also actually--it costs money to charge people money, and we have so many of our sites in community locations where adding a charge will really add a significant infrastructure burden to them. And so, we've been wanting to be mindful of that as well on the operational side. And then finally, I think the fact that the card is free actually has an important fraud prevention. As you mentioned, there are plenty of fraudsters out there who want to charge people for fake IDs, charge people to make appointments for IDNYC. Nobody has to pay for this program and that's a very clear and easy message we've been trying to push out, particularly through ethnic media. And then finally, the other states, the program integrity process for IDNYC is very rigorous. Both the front

line and enrollment staff have been trained on which documents are acceptable and not, and we have technological support to validate as well. And then we have a large back office program integrity staff as well. Only individuals who live in the five boroughs or New York City are getting these ID cards, and unfortunately we know especially early in the program people from elsewhere outside the five boroughs wanted to apply. I think they're interested in the card, but they will get through our process because this is a card for the five boroughs of New York City.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: [off mic] Thank you very much. I want to say that while we-- [on mic] Thank you. I'm a little winded. I ran across the street. We are passing very important bills of mine out of the Transportation Committee cracking down on hit and run drivers. So we went and spoke and voted on those two pieces of legislation, and Chair Menchaca has just gone to vote. He's also in the Transportation Committee. So as I catch my breath I'd like to call on Council Member Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [off mic] Thanks. I asked my questions. I asked them.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Oh, you did. Then Council Member Crowley.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you Chairman. [coughs] Good morning. I have three questions. First, how much does the program cost the city, and in terms of the cost who are the employees working for, which agency? Has it been used, the ID card to open bank--bank accounts, and thirdly, how often is it used for identification with the NYPD? And do we know if this has helped people who might have been arrested if they didn't have ID?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Great. So in terms of the budget for IDNYC for Fiscal 16 it's around $24 million and then for Fiscal 17 it goes down to $11 million. We're anticipating that this high level of demand will not persist year after year. And that staff for the program are at HRA, the Human Resources Administration, which provides the support for the program. In terms of bank accounts we have some initial members on usage of the card for bank--opening bank accounts. We have over 75 branches around the city that accept IDNYC, and at present some 400 bank accounts have been opened using IDNYC. We're also going to be doing outreach on

financial education and financial empowerment connected to IDNYC to actually increase those numbers even more. And then finally, on NYPD use, we don't have data at the moment, though we've been talking closely with NYPD to be able to track use of the card in the field, and hope to do that. But we've certainly heard anecdotally how individuals have been able to use that IDNYC to report crimes to feel more comfortable interacting with law enforcement, and that's great.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: And you might have said this earlier, but I don't remember the answer. What was the total number of IDs issued and how did it break down from borough to borough?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Yep, so the total number we're over 670,000 cards right now, and we have--I can give you percentages is probably the easiest. Around 11% of folks in Queens and the Bronx have signed up for IDNYC, 9 and close to 10% in Brooklyn; 8% and almost 9% in Manhattan, and then 4 to 5 % in Staten Island. So it's like really amazing penetration across the five boroughs.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I'm so surprised because Staten Island is the least populated borough,

yet they're the borough that has most of these ID cards?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: No, no, they have 4 to 5% of their population has the ID cards.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing] Oh, but how about the total population is 600 and some odd thousand. How does that break down from borough to borough?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Yep. So approximately in the Bronx about 125,000 people have--are among the 670,000 or so. About 200,000 in Brooklyn and Queens, a little bit more in Queens than Brooklyn. Manhattan about 125,000 and then in Staten Island around 17,000.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: No further questions. Thank you chair. [bell]

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you very much, and Commissioner, you just said that Queens was number one?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Yes, I did.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: So I'd just like to repeat that [laughter] just to make sure that everyone heard that. There are four Queens Council Members including Council Member Dromm who just

joined us. I am enormously proud of that. Before we turn to Council Member Cumbo, I wanted to ask a little question about the actual places where people are signing up, and what you're finding there. How many are signing up at libraries for example? How many are at the pop-up sites? I know I got my IDNYC at La Guardia Community College at its site. What do those numbers look like?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Yep. So the public sites have been very popular and we intend to keep doing them, but the libraries are far and away probably the place where the most New Yorkers are signing up. Over 265,000 cardholders got their cards at the library locations.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: How many?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: More than 265,000.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: 265,000 people have received their cards from the public library?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: That's amazing.

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Which is amazing, and we've had several pop-ups that have been through the libraries as well. And so that's just been a really fantastic partnership for us. Unfortunately,

I don't have the numbers of how many enrollments have been through the pop-ups. We can easily get them to you after this hearing.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: That's certainly obviously to hear from the libraries themselves about this program, but just an enormous partnership between libraries, and our culturals and your agency to make sure that this has happened. I know that Council Member Cumbo has some questions, and then we have some other council members as well.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer as well as Council Member Carlos Menchaca for this very important hearing. I'm going to ask my questions all like at one time. That's a strategy I've seen some use to handle the clock. One, I guess my first question will be directed to Eddie Torres, and wanted to focus has there been thought about the program expanding to other cultural institutions that could also be included in the mix of this? Many other cultural institutions have suggested that they want to participate and want to be a part of it. Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer as a suggestion created the Cultural Immigrant Fund, and I think perhaps those

receiving institutions perhaps could be considered for this type of expansion, and initiative because there's already a way that's created about it. I also wanted to understand do you know what the impact has been on the paying membership of the CIGs so that when everyone signing up for the IDNYC program that's also have an impact on the existing cultural institutions that are there, and already providing that program? Also wanting to know has there been a thought--I know Council Member Koo began to touch on this--has there been a thought a concrete thought or a concrete dollar amount in terms of what the cultural institutions will be given in order to expand this program. And to see that, you know, we recognize that this is an incredible benefit from the--for the city and that people are coming to the institutions in droves. And that's probably not even really been thoroughly quantified in terms of that, and is there a consistent or--or a defined dollar amount in terms of how that will be incorporated into this year budget? And the other question that I have is have the CIGs been able to handle the influx of IDNYC members? Are they equipped? Have they been given any resources as far as staffing to handle this

new influx, and how are they dealing with the fact that they have had such an outpour of support in terms of people coming to the institutions, but that includes staffing. That includes everything from how the facilities are maintained and managed. I just wanted to see if there were any thoughts around that.

COMMISSIONER TORRES: Sure. So thanks for that, Council Member Cumbo. So in terms of other culutures--

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] Is your microphone on? I'm sorry.

COMMISSIONER TORRES: I think so.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay.

COMMISSIONER TORRES: Maybe I'm just not close enough to it. There we go. So in terms of other culturals I think it's fantastic. I--we would love to have any organizations interested in this program as humanly possible. So, I--I'm well open to that. That sounds fantastic.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Do you think that will happen in the upcoming fiscal year?

COMMISSIONER TORRES: Yeah, I mean I don't--I mean I would be happy to work with MOIA and the culturals in terms of the logistics around it. I

don't see what inhibitions could--would stop it, but--

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Wonderful [bell]

COMMISSIONER TORRES: Yeah, I would be--I would be very open to that.

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: And also just to underscore the seven institutions that are joining this year the Museum of Modern Art, the Guggenheim, the Metropolitan Opera, the Museum of Chinese in America, BRIC Arts, the New Museum and Pregones Theater are all joining, and then when we do the Veterans Designation, the Intrepid Museum joined as well. So we're--this is the beginning, not the end necessarily.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And just to add to that point, I think that's wonderful, and you've already started to identify some spaces, but I guess because of the collaboration with IDNYC as well as your department it would be great to get into some of those non-traditional spaces like Pregones in the outer boroughs. So that they can feel a part of this--of this dynamic

COMMISSIONER TORRES: Sure. Yeah, we would love that. As regards the budget implications,

you know, the--the CIG has really stepped up in this regard. They have gone above and beyond and we're incredibly proud of them. In terms of the sort of operational issues, they've really had to step up their capacity in terms of dealing with this the number of new sign-ups was, you know, far greater than anticipated. You know, we've brought them together to sort of share best practices, et cetera. Obviously, this is something that we're thinking about in terms of the upcoming budget cycle. We--we don't have numbers around that and, you know, we're not a--a--we don't have specifics around that, but we think the CIG has done a fantastic job and we're very proud of them.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Are you comfortable saying at this time that there will be resources put forward, but you don't know what that dollar amount will be?

COMMISSIONER TORRES: No, I don't know if there will be resources put forward or not. The fact of the matter is, you know, if I--if I was able to set my own budget it would be $73 billion [laughs] and this is the budget for the city. The--the fact of the matter is the budget for the city--

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] You have a lot more power than you know.

COMMISSIONER TORRES: What did you say?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I said you have a lot more power than you know.

COMMISSIONER TORRES: But the budget process is a process that involves you guys and the Office of Management and Budget. So, you know, we look forward to engaging in that process with you guys and with City Hall. As regards the impact on paying a membership, I'm not sure I'm exactly understanding that question. So if you could just say a little bit more about that.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So all of these institutions I'm sure had existing membership programs that impacted their dollars--their--their bottom lines in a very real way. S o because everyone, and I know my mom is one of them if she's watching today--

COMMISSIONER TORRES: [interposing] Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: --she will chose the opportunity to utilize her IDNYC card versus becoming a paid member of that institution, and is

that having an impact or drawing away from significant membership dollars that those institutions count on?

COMMISSIONER TORRES: Yeah, that's an interesting one. I mean, you know, a couple of things related to that, and I'll ask my colleague Leonard Jacobs to chime in if I'm missing any of this. You know, two things. One is that, you know, we stipulated that you can't receive a membership unless you haven't been a member since 2012. So like I couldn't join several of the CIGs because I've been a member recently, one. Two, there are a couple of institutions where they have told me that they've actually been able to re-engage members for free, but re-engage what had been past paying members who just managed to fall off. But in terms of--I'm sure there are some institutions where past members maybe would have signed up, and paid and didn't do so. So I think that, you know, there's a mix of real opportunity and real sacrifice being made by--by the cultural organizations. Do you want to add to that Leonard?

LEONARD JACOBS: Yeah, sure. Some institutions make membership a real strategic priority--

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] Uh-huh.

LEONARD JACOBS: --and some a little bit less so. So the volume has transformed in many institutions the way they think about their membership programs. I don't want to single out any particular institutions, but in a couple of cases where their--their membership programs were not particularly robust. It was not the way that they were mostly engaging their audiences. But now, they're sort of looking at those numbers and saying, ah, here's an opportunity. Now, the other thing that we're finding out, which is interesting, it's a--it kind of depends on how you look at it. There are institutions where we know where 50% of the membership is now IDNYC. In some cases it's higher, which is why a little earlier we were referring to the tension. So now, you've got them in the door. Now, they're going to, you know, show up and participate in the programming of this and that institutions. Now the institutions has an

opportunity to, if you will, convert those people to potentially paying people. It won't be all of them. I mean it might only be 10% of them. It might only be 20% of them, but it's 10 or 20% that they would have never had most likely otherwise. So it's ultimately our--our tremendous benefits. You asked also about the financial implications of that. I'm not a membership manager, but my understanding anecdotally is that memberships don't generally provide profit. There's a cost to servicing your members, and when the members are free, and obviously they're not making a profit on free, but over the long term in terms of things like trying to retain them as paying members going forward it's--it's about developing that relationship over the long term. We are not hearing from any cultural institution that they're unhappy with those numbers.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Uh-huh.

LEONARD JACOBS: There are challenges logistically just around onboarding them and servicing them and servicing them or whatever, and there is a financial impact. And, we are working very closely with them to try and mitigate that impact whenever possible. [bell]

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you very much, and I know my time is up and I thank Council Member Van Bramer and Carlos Menchaca. I just want to say that in closing that maybe those conversations are different than the ones that they're having with me. So I just want to make sure that we recognize, you know, the arts are wonderful, and I don't want them to become a victim of their own success. This level of growth and this unprecedented success we certainly don't want them to become a victim of it. So in the upcoming budget I think it would be prudent to make sure that these organizations are able to provide that level of service and quality at the highest level without taking away from anything else that they've already been doing. So that's my conclusion. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you very much, Council Member Cumbo. I want to echo that Commissioner Torres rightly points out that we are involved in the budget process as is also OMB but so is Mayor de Blasio, and it is very important that the budget reflect our values, and the cultural organizations certainly the CIGs and all those joining in have demonstrated their values by being

such critical players in this effort. And, we all have an obligation to support them as they have supported the people of the City of New York in this amazing endeavor. I want to welcome back--welcome back my co-chair Council Member Carlos Menchaca, who made it back in about four minutes from across the street, which just shows he's much younger than I am. And--and I do want to ask a couple of Twitter questions that I've received before handing it over to Council Member Dromm, and then we'll move onto our--our subsequent panels. We have two other panels. But Joel Reamer asks, "Can you advise of the new cultural organizations that are joining the program the Guggenheim and MoMA, et cetera, are accepting memberships for 2015 enrollees?"

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Sure. So I can say now that five of the institutions, MoMA, BRIC Arts, Pregones, Museum of Chinese in America and the Metropolitan Opera will offer memberships to 2015 cardholders as well, and while I have the mic we got the number of enrollments for pop-ups and that 57,170, which is awesome.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: That is great on top of the 265 library number, which was amazing and

then another Twitter question. "Are the cultural institution groups collaborating with--speaking with the newer culturals that are coming on board to talk about best practices, and what we've all learned through this process?"

COMMISSIONER TORRES: Yes, yes, they are. They actually just had a meeting last week specifically about this, and we'll continue to do so.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: [off mic] And now--[on mic] And now I see we're joined by Council Member Lander, and we'll hand the mic over to Council Member Dromm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, well thank you very much. I think that this has been fantastic. I remember when we were in negotiations that we felt we might get 350,000 people to sign up, and I guess we're close to doubling that number at this point or almost maybe even doubling it at this point. So it's been hugely successful. I'm glad to see that Jackson Heights is way up there, but it does ask a--it does bring a question to mind. I'm wondering if you have numbers on the pop-up centers versus the more permanent centers. Are you getting a lot of success out of the pop-up centers versus the other ones?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Yes. I mean I think that far and away the permanent library sites have been the ones that have had the highest level of enrollments. But over 57,000 have come from pop-ups. And the pop-ups actually started a little bit later in the program, and so I think there's been a huge amount of interest. I know at the Jackson Heights Library we extended the time because the pop-ups was--was so popular. And so, we intend to keep doing them. They've been a great way to get into communities that don't have a permanent site or where there's just simply a very high demand.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So, you know, at last week's immigration hearing I asked you about youth, and the numbers of youths. Have you--it's only a week ago, but I want to ask you again are you moving forward in terms of trying to get more youth enrolled? And how are the discussions going with the DOE in terms of--you know because their records are already right there in the school. And I think it would be a tremendous asset if we could get more students enrolled in the IDNYC.

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Yes. So I have those numbers for you now, a week later, and IDNYC

has been issued to 16,794 minors, and that's a very key targeted population for us. We actually initially struggled a little bit with youth enrollment and so we partnered with a number of our-- our sister agencies like DYCD and the Department of Education. And with the parent coordinator groups across the city to ensure that we increased the youth numbers, and we would like to continue doing that. And in addition to you, Council Member Lander has also raised this question of how do we facilitate youth enrollment particularly at schools. And so, we're actively working with DOE to figure that out so we can streamline it even more.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: And then I guess my next question is really is about how many people have chosen not to identify their sex on the card?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: So we have 785 individuals who have chosen not to have a gender marker on their card, and that's sort of the extent of what we know about it, but it's a pretty big number and I think a popular benefit for many cardholders.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: And do you feel that the training of the people in the intake

offices--because, you know, initially there was a little bit of some confusion about just marking somebody's paperwork by the way that they appeared.

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Uh-huh.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Has that situation been corrected?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Yes, we have done some additional training for staff on those issues. We're also going to clarify in [bell] in a new set of rules that will be coming out issues around gender identification as well to make sure that there aren't problems. But, if there are, we do want to hear from cardholders and from applicants so that we can remedy any issues at a--at a sort of localized level.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I see my time is up, but I always have to say the funnies thing for me was when I went to Las Vegas, and they were offering 20% off on all the cultural things in Las Vegas. So it's gone nationwide, and it's an example for the rest of the country to follow. Thank you.

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, Council Member Dromm, and I--I also stand so proud to have worked along your side in the creation of this card

and how--how sweet it is to be here today. We're going to have--Oh, we've also been joined by Council Member Mathieu Eugene from Brooklyn, and I'm passing it over to Council Member Lander for questions.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Chair Menchaca, and Chair Van Bramer, and Commissioner, I will just add to the congratulations to everyone for setting up this fantastic program, and also on the great success of the immigrant conference. I guess it's still going on just across the river in Brooklyn. It's exciting to see, you know, the city has obviously long been a leader in welcoming immigrants, but at this moment to have it so in the forefront is really a tremendous credit to the whole city, but also to you and the Mayor and thank you. Anyway, I'm just going to push a little further on Council Member Dromm's question. As you know, we hosted now just last month the first NYC ID pop-up in a public New York City high school and I--my--I waited until this one at John Jay Educational Campus to get mine, but I'm pleased it's here now. I'm getting in the mail just in time for this hearing. But I know as you've talked about before, it's difficult for students to get--to get their NYC ID.

They need to already have a photo ID in which case, you know, they already have a photo ID And some schools do that paid largely by their PTAs not by the--the DOE. So it over-privileges those kids who are at schools that have the resources to do it. Or, they have to come in person with their parents with a whole series of documents so technical to be honest that my son came with me to John Jay, but we had brought a copy of his birth certificate instead of his original birth certificate, and he wasn't able to get his yet. So those numbers are--are low. Meanwhile, in our public schools we obviously know who the kids are. DOE has them enrolled. We know exactly who they are. I mean they've been showing up all this time. So, I know one thing we've talked about is for enrollment in schools--I appreciate this is not feasible at the other enrollment sites where you--we need to know that the kid--you can't just let them print out their report card--

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: [interposing] Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: --because we don't know that that's that kid just because they're holding it. But for enrollment sites in schools

there's got to be a way for DOE official representatives, the principal or someone like that to--to do what the parents would be doing at the other enrollment site and vouch for the fact that yes that is my--whoever it is--and they, you know, use that plus their school identification. It seems to me if we could do that then there's no reason why we can't get the vast majority of New York City public high school kids IDs. And for so many of the reasons that we've talked about, that's a set of people who we, you know, we want to get on their first trips to cultural institutions. Who we want to have ID if they happen to end up in an interaction with law enforcement who would want to know their right age. So when they try to get into a bar, the cop could say, Let me see your NYC ID and see that they're underage. And for all the reasons why this is good to have, it would be especially good to have it for high school kids. So I just wonder what--what progress we're making and how we can move that along.

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Yeah, so I agree with you completely and, you know, the way in which the rules currently are structured a caretaker can come in and help a child set up for the card, and in

many ways [bell] especially when the children are at school, the school assists the caretaker. So what we are working with DOE on doing now is figuring out how can we make that happen where at school based enrollment sites like what happened at John Jay would it be possible for the administration officials to be able to essentially sort of vouch for the child even if they don't have a school ID, which some schools don't have that. So we're working on it. We have to figure out whether it needs to be part of the rules process. It could be independent of the rules process, but my hope is that very soon we'll have that resolved.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very much. Thank you to the Chairs. [pause]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you to the administration, and we'll continue to do some follow up. [background comments]

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Just one additional question that's--that's come to me about the--the IDNYC website--

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: [interposing] Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --and whether or not it includes the new culturals yet or does it need to be updated in terms of Guggerheim or MoMA Museum, et cetera?

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: It is updated. So there's information about the 2016 benefits, and we'll keep updating it in case there's new benefits that roll out, but that is on the website right now. So why don't you check it out.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Great, and I know the--this panel is ending. So I just want to say thank you--

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: [interposing] Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --for the leadership, and it's been an amazing success, and now we're obviously going to hear from the Cultural Institutions Group and some of the libraries who make all the magic happen.

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: But thank you for your leadership.

COMMISSIONER AGARWAL: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER TORRES: Thank you for doing this.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Okay. Thank you so much, and as we get transitioning to the next panel, we're going to call up Bridget Quinn-Carey the Interim President of the Queens Library; Mr. David Freudenthal, Carnegie Hall; Jorge Daniel Veneciano at El Museo del Barrio, and CIG. Come on up.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: And just so folks know, we are mixing it up a little bit. We want to actually pair some of the libraries with the culturals since this is a partnership, and it seems fun to have libraries and culturals on the same panel since you all are working so closely together. And obviously BPL and NYPL we're going to mix as well in with some--some culturals. [background comments]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And as we transition, I just want to let--give a shout out to at--Get Women Cycling this weekend. Both Council Member Van Bramer and I we're supporting the tour that they started in Brooklyn, and I got my Met membership and the museum, the City Museum of New York as well through this tour. And so, this is a great little partnership where a local organization

took this on their own. Informed us that they were doing it, and we got--we were invited to--to join them. So I got to ride 20 miles and do some exercise on a beautiful spring during December weekend. And this is just kind of the innovation that's happening and the recruiting right on Twitter as well to get part--be part of their tours.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: And Chair Menchaca is very generous. I did support it, but I did not bike the 20 miles. Let's be clear. So I know [laughs] Bridget Quinn-Carey, and then we'll hear from Jorge and David.

BRIDGET QUINN-CAREY: Thank you very much. Good morning. Well, actually good afternoon, everyone. I'm Bridget Quinn-Carey. I'm the Interim President and CEO of the Queens Library. I want to thank Chair Van Bramer and Chair Menchaca for being--for inviting me to be here with you today, and to testify about the IDNYC program. I wanted to be here today to--to talk about this amazing program even though, you know, the--the person that runs it in our library is sitting to my right, Nick Buron. He's the V.P. of Public Service, and he's doing an amazing job. But I felt very strongly about coming and

1 participating today because this to me really
2 embodies a perfect partnership between the Council,
3 the Libraries and the Administration. And it has
4 been such a seamless implementation of a program.
5 We've got--we've had many successes together between
6 UPK and, you know, the schools partnership and six-
7 day service. I mean so many things to--to celebrate
8 together, but this program in particular really hits
9 the heart and soul of what libraries are about and
10 what the IDNYC program is about. And the
11 Administration has been a pleasure to work with, and
12 really made this such a--a wonderful transition for
13 us to be able to offer this program.
14 So share the Mayor's and the Council's
15 goals of inclusion of equality for all New Yorkers.
16 That is a founding principle of public libraries. I
17 mean while we would like every single person in New
18 York City to have an ID or a library card or one or
19 the other or both, it is the--it is the disconnected,
20 the disenfranchised, the marginalized, the at-risk
21 people that libraries really I think shine as far as
22 what we provide as a value to society. And those are
23 the people that find a safe harbor in the libraries
24 to be able to come and get that ID. And so, our
25

1 mission really to provide everybody that comes
2 through that door with opportunity, and this program
3 even--even more than the services and the things that
4 we do on a daily basis helps to expand the
5 opportunities for people that come through our door.
6 We are trusted entities for people in need, and when
7 the city was looking for partners to do this, we
8 jumped at the chance. I remember the first day we
9 got the call, and we said we're in. You know, we
10 didn't have to hear about. We said we're in. We've
11 been helping to serve immigrants and new Americans,
12 New Yorkers for decades and this was just another way
13 for us to expand that level of services. So as
14 you've heard, Queens Library houses two IDNYC
15 enrollment centers at our busiest libraries, the
16 Central Library in Jamaica and at the Flushing
17 Library. Those were our--those are our flagship
18 sites. Flushing is an incredibly busy library. I
19 mean we see over--you know, some days we have 10,000
20 people coming through those doors. And that means
21 that a lot of the people coming through probably
22 don't have an ID but we want to make sure they know
23 they've got the opportunity. It's located in one of
24 the most ethnically diverse zip codes in the United
25

1 States. So what a perfect place to have a IDNYC
2 enrollment center. [bell] We've had a great deal of
3 success in helping the City administer the program,
4 and have seen huge amounts of people. So I want to
5 share some of our numbers as far as in context to
6 what you've heard from--from Commission Agarwal. So
7 as of November 15th, we've enrolled 35,166 people at
8 the Central Library and 42,715 people at the Flushing
9 Library for an enrollment of those two sites
10 individually 77,881. But, that does not include the
11 success that we've had at our pop-up sites. The pop-
12 up sites have been great. We had our first one at
13 Jackson Heights Library, which was fantastic. We, in
14 fact, extended it two additional weeks because it was
15 so popular. 1,700 people over those two weeks
16 applied. So all tolled in all of our pop-up centers-
17 -we've got one right now happening at Far Rockaway--
18 we've enrolled 79,931 New Yorkers in the IDNYC
19 program. That is 12% of all enrollees have come
20 through libraries in Queens, and we are incredibly
21 proud of that. We have other pop-ups scheduled in
22 Maspeth, Briarwood, Bayside and Ridgewood, and
23 Lefferts is beginning this month. So we would like
24 to see those continue, and I think that that gives us
25

1 an even added benefit to our--to our users. The--the
2 added benefit, too, of having people come to the
3 library is the opportunity for people to link their
4 library card to the IDNYC ID, and that's a very
5 simple process. If they already have an account,
6 it's just a switching of the--of the ID. If they
7 don't have an account since they already have the
8 IDNYC, it's a very simple process for them to get a
9 library card. It's very convenient to carry one card
10 instead of two, and why we, you know, want to do that
11 is that once they're engaged with the library, they
12 are eligible for all of the information that we put
13 out about library services including English as a
14 second language or other language courses; Job and
15 Business Academy courses; after school programs; pre-
16 school programs. All of the things that come with a
17 library card. Many people who haven't been in a
18 library for decades that come into it to get their
19 ID, they have no idea what the range of offerings are
20 in libraries. And that is a wonderful opportunity
21 for us to share that and to make sure that they can
22 avail themselves of the--the breadth and depth of
23 services that public libraries are providing in the
24 city today. So I just want to thank you again, Chair
25

Van Bramer and Chair Menchaca for having me here today, and I'm happy to answer any specific questions you have about the library's program.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you very much, and I know we're on a timer, and you could probably say a lot more, but I just want to highlight something you said, 80,000 New Yorkers are signed up for the IDNYC card out of Queens Library branch, which is 12% overall in the city, but in Queens you're almost half. What are you, 35, 40% of all of those who have signed up in Queens, which is really impressive and an incredible contribution. And I see where you condensed it the integration of the IDNYC and library card piece in there, which is very important as well for all of us.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And we'll start the thee-minute clock. Thank you so much. Daniel.

JORGE DANIEL VENECIANO: Yeah. Good afternoon. I'm Jorge Daniel Veneciano. I'm the Executive Director at El Museo del Barrio and also the Vice Chair for the CIG in Manhattan. And I also want to thank Chairs James Van Bramer and Carlos Menchaca as well as the other members of the committee, and the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito and

1 the rest of the City Council for this opportunity to
2 speak before you today. As a Latin-American
3 immigrant to the United States, I am especially proud
4 of the great achievement that the City has had in
5 establishing the IDNYC. It lends added dignity to
6 working and living in New York City. And that is
7 what we members of a Cultural Institutions Groups
8 have historically provided the city. Our
9 institutions are bastions of cultural pride and
10 participation for all New Yorkers. And that is why
11 this partnership between the city and the group has
12 made not only good sense, but has garnered great
13 success. An objective to the partnership was
14 initially to help dispel any potential stigma to
15 using the card. Given the immediate and overwhelming
16 popularity of IDNYC, that risk has been resoundingly
17 checked. Our collective means in accomplishing this
18 is to give all New Yorkers greater access to the best
19 arts and cultural programming the city has to offer.
20 For many of us it is for this cultural quality of
21 life that we choose to live and work in New York
22 City. IDNYC has helped us members of the CIG extend
23 the cultural quality of life to more New Yorkers
24 through free institutional memberships. Our hope is
25

that they--these--the members will renew their membership after the initial free year and become supporting members of the city's cultural life. At El Museo this has meant a number of--of great successes one of which is the doubling of the membership that the museum has garnered. Also, we, too, were one of the pop-up sites for enrollment, and we are proud to say that we brought in nearly 10,000 new members during the pop-up program period. As a group, we recognize the invaluable contribution of IDNYC, and we're proud to be partners in delivering its qualify of life benefits to all New Yorkers. We thank the City Council and the Mayor's Office for engaging us in this initiative and look forward to a continuing successful partnership. We're excited to be so closely aligned to the key successes of the Council, and the Administration. Thank you very much.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you.

[background comments]

DAVID FREUDENTHAL: Hi. I'm David Freudenthal, and I'm glad to speak to you briefly about Carnegie Hall's experience with the--with IDNYC as a member of the Cultural Institutions Group.

First, our thanks to the Majority Leader, to Chair Menchaca and to the committee members for holding this joint committee. We love the fact that you're holding a committee meeting with--between these two issue areas. We think it's a wonderful demonstration of the importance of the relationship of culture to so many other city priorities as--as expressed here today. The--the partnership for us has been a great opportunity to--to expand engagement, to connect to more New Yorkers. And for us Carnegie Hall fills a really core responsibility to give New Yorkers access to great musical experiences, and--and the program has really helped us t do that. In this first year for all--all the IDNYC members who become--become Carnegie Hall friends to reduce barriers to participation, we let folks apply either online or in person at Carnegie Hall whatever is easier for them. They all get our Friends Newsletter, access to free rehearsals, priority ticketing and special discounted ticket offers. We've had a real surge in membership toward the end of the year as I know that many of our colleagues have. With 7,000 members now signed up they have just surpassed our--our regular paying Friends membership, and this is both been a--an

opportunity and a challenge for us with the volume of membership growing. We--so, you know, we're excited to continue it and look forward to the--to meeting that demand. As I touched on it, in terms of opportunities crated by the program, it's great to have more New Yorkers have a chance to experience what we offer. I'm just going to cite some numbers. About three-quarters of our paying Friends memberships, our Manhattan residents, of the New York City members. And by contrast, less than half of the IDNYC members are from Manhattan. So we're getting--what it means is about a 25% increase in--in members from Staten Island, Queens and Brooklyn. Bronx has stayed about the same. So, it's--you know, it's a chance to get to New Yorkers that we haven't seen before. We're also seeing people that have not engaged with Carnegie Hall before. Only 10% ever purchased tickets before. So it's great, and the people that are signing up are taking advantage of the benefits. We hope that some of these people are going to stay on as--as friends, but either way we're really excited for them to be part of the Carnegie Hall family. We hope that they'll buy tickets, that they'll come to our free community programs, that

they'll become friends in the future. And we're really, really glad to--for them to be part of this for all these reasons as I'm sure shared by my colleagues today we thank--we hope--we look forward to the program's continued success. [bell] Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, David, for that, for--for the information, and the stats really speak highly to the work that you're doing as just one cultural institution out of the whole. I do want to recognize that we've also been joined by Immigration Committee Member Rafael Espinal from Brooklyn. And-and my question to you, David, is as you think about how Carnegie Hall positions itself in the city with what we're seeing across the board in increases in Lower Manhattan are not geo specific areas for membership looking at Staten Island for example. How are you already planning for the conversion, the full conversion post that first three years. What kinds of things are you cooking up right now that you can kind of share with us, and--and our public about what--what kind of things are you thinking of right now.

DAVID FREUDENTHAL: Yeah, I want to refer back--thank you, Chair. We--I want to refer back to the--to the meeting that--that Daniel that El Museo hosted with Cultural Affairs where all these--the participants at CIG and non-CIG the new folks talked about what we can do? What are the best practices? It was so helpful to us all to think about that challenge about what--what are the ways we could do it. I'd say part of it is just treating these new members really well, and enabling them to--encouraging them to participate in the--in the benefits that we offer. And then I know that some of our colleagues have talked about offering-- I believe it's New York City Ballet has been very thoughtful about this process of offering a challenge grant that's--that one of their--one of their members of their board has offered it to--as part of the outreach to other members. We--we're going to do a--a special event, Personally Carnegie Hall. We're going to do an event for these--for these constituents to--to encourage them to come. So, you know, it's essentially, you know, these folks have selected our organization. So, they're interested in us, and the work is on us to--to find ways to

1 continue to engage them whether as paying members or
2 as participants in any number of ways. So it's a
3 challenge, and we're really excited about the
4 opportunity it creates for us.
5 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Great thank you,
6 and I do want to ask one last question about the--the
7 access to ideas. We asked our Commissioner if they
8 would take ideas on Twitter or Facebook. Would you
9 be interested and I'll ask all three, in receiving
10 ideas on how--how maybe members new members would
11 like to be courted, and convinced to--to kind of join
12 in that membership, and would you take that on--on
13 social media as well.
14 BRIDGET QUINN-CAREY: Absolutely. That's
15 an easy yes for us.
16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Okay, great. All
17 across the board. Wonderful and I--I don't doubt
18 that we're going to have good ideas coming out.
19 Thank you.
20 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you very
21 much. I want to thank all of you, but I do want to
22 ask specifically to Daniel and David. You all have
23 done an extraordinary thing. Our cultural partners
24 have really come forward and what can we do to help
25

you now continue your mission and continue the work that you're--you're doing. Has there--has there been a cost associated with--with all of this, and--and if so, what--what does that look like, and, you know, I want to make sure that--that what you have done for the City of New York is recognized by--by everyone here at City Hall. And--and maybe you can talk a little bit about that. We all know the stories. They're amazing. They're powerful. The Chair and I were just talking about Carnegie Hall, and really all of these places, and some of them seeming so--so grand and so imposing, and-and yet this is breaking down barriers to access and making sure that every New Yorker feels like the beautiful that I was at last night is--is everyone's. And that is very powerful, but--but is there a cost? What challenges have you incurred, and--and, you know, obviously I believe that the moment is overripe for increasing funding for--for culture in the City of New York. I am assuming that you would agree with me that--that we should increase the budget for--for culture in the city of New York. But maybe you can talk a little bit, both of you specifically about the challenges and--and what's needed now.

JORGE DANIEL VENECIANO: The first thing I would like to say is that you have done something for us already, and that is to engage the Cultural Institutions Group in this important initiative, and we are proud partners. So, that's a great start, and that it comes with the cost to the institutions and the groups. That's true and so certainly your recognition at the appropriate time would be something we would love to see. But really I think the partnership as a beginning has been something that you have provided for us, and we're very--very happy with. Do you want to--?

DAVID FREUDENTHAL: Yeah, Daniel said it very well that we're--we're really thrilled to be aligned with this priority of this City Council and this Administration, and the burden varies for the 33 members of the CIG, and it has--but it has been significant for us, and--and I don't want to understate every-every organization's experience around it has--has been different. For--for my institution we have--we've struggled to keep up with the volume of participation. Just because you want to get folks signed up quickly, and then you want to service those memberships. We've got challenges

1 around folks being able to access and not crowding
2 out our existing members. So for this to succeed in
3 future years, we're going to have to offer more of
4 those benefits like the free working rehearsals, and
5 the things that we offer our members to be able to--
6 to be able to service these folks in the ways that we
7 are servicing our existing paying friends
8 memberships. So we've hired temps. We spread the
9 pain among various departments to--to fill these out,
10 but I know that many of our--my colleague or
11 colleague institutions they have been overwhelmed by
12 the--by the challenges of meeting this enormous and
13 extraordinary and exciting demand. And I don't want
14 to--I don't want to understate. We have managed to
15 do it, but it has been very, very challenging for us
16 to do, and it is ultimately a matter of resources.
17 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you. Did
18 you have something to add, Daniel?
19 JORGE DANIEL VENECIANO: Yes, I would
20 like to underscore the--the process and if there is
21 something that the Council can provide in terms of
22 assistance in helping to manage the large processing
23 burden that would be significant. And it's true as
24 David said that with the increased membership means
25

an increased demand in programming, which, of course also is a cost. One we would like to take on, but one with which we could use some help.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you very much. That was also the most polite funding request I have [laughter] ever-- It's true. As Carlos said, I asked for it. I did, but it came back in such a gentle way, and almost blew right by me. [laughter] But--but this is being recorded and City Hall is monitoring it on the other side. So, I just want to say thank you to all three of you. This is an amazing time and an amazing partnership, and--and our libraries have come through and--and we have come through for the libraries. Our--our culturals have come through, and we have to do more for our culturals, and this is the moment. You have stepped up and made history for the City of New York, and you embraced it, embraced the challenges. And so, we have an obligation to come back for you. So with that, I want to say thank you to the panel, and then my co-chair will say a few words and call the last panel.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Ditto. [laughs] I think--I think that that kind of speaks for itself,

and I know the Administration is monitoring this, and really appreciates your partnership in making this card incredibly successful. So, the next and last panel we're going to have Rosemary De Luca from Wildlife Conservation Society; Cheryl Adolph from Staten Island Museum; Caryl Soriano, New York Public Library; Director of Manhattan--Mid-Manhattan Library; Eva Reza the Brooklyn Public Library; Katherine LeClair, Lincoln Center--sorry. New York City Ballet. We're going to be putting a three-minute clocks and if you can focus on a summary for your testimony we'll ask some questions right after. Thank you.

FEMALE SPEAKER: Can you get one more chair? [background comments]

EVA REZA: [off mic] Good morning.

FEMALE SPEAKER: [off mic] Press the button.

EVA REZA: [on mic] Good morning. My name is Eva Reza and I'm the Coordinator of Immigrant Services for Brooklyn Public Library, and I'd like to thank Chairpersons Van Bramer and Menchaca for the opportunity to testify today. I'd also like to thank many of our IDNYC partners for inviting the New York

City Libraries to participate in the planning and implementation of this program including Speaker Mark--Mark-Viverito, and the members of the Council and the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs, particularly Nisha Agarwal. Thank you all for your leadership. Brooklyn Public Library's 60 branches are centers of learning and opportunity for more than one million patrons, and we are proud to serve as a registration site for ID card that is like the library, free and available to all. Demand for the program has been high since its launch. In the opening days and weeks of IDNYC, I would arrive at Central Library at 7:00 a.m. to lines to get into the registration center that stretched out the front doors and around the block down Flatbush Avenue. Despite the cold and the wait, the Central Library lobby was filled with a multi-lingual and positive energy of all of the IDNYC applicants. And my colleagues and I assisted Brooklyn--assisted in the Brooklyn Public Library helping people sign up for computer sessions, access WiFi, and answer reference questions like we do everyday. But for those couple of weeks all reference questions were about the IDNYC application. So even now nearly a year into the

program, we're finding that our office continues to do a very steady business. And to day, 4,357 IDNYC cards have been activated as library cards at BPL that allow users to borrow materials, to access online courses and databases, access library computers, borrow devices and reserve meeting rooms. We've also been able to connect patrons with the library services that we provide to veterans, older adults, immigrants and other Brooklynites with unique and often overlooked needs including people transitioning into and out of the city's correctional and shelter systems. In order words, we serve many of the people who are most in need of photo identification and least likely to have it. Our multi-lingual programs provide the borough's large and growing immigrant communities with citizenship preparation courses, free English classes, free immigration legal support, computer classes and courses for entrepreneurs. Also this year we've launched a lot of partnerships with the city and the three library systems including New American Corners, which are centralized collections of information and resources for immigrant communities in every BPL branch and actually in every library in New York

City. And I can tell you from experience that the library is very often the first stop [bell] for immigrants upon their arrival to New York City. I've often enrolled people in ESL classes who arrive two or three days prior. And we're an essential hub of immigrant integration. I think I've seen how the IDNYC card has really become a symbol of welcome that is as essential as the Statue of Liberty was for immigrants who arrived over a century ago. IDNYC is particularly helpful to immigrants, and we worked with the City to open temporary pop-up enrollment sites in neighborhoods and branches that serve large immigrant communities including the Utrecht in Bensonhurst, New Lots in East New York and Bay Ridge in Flatbush. And this month we'll be opening our fifth temporary enrollment site at Midway Library and the sixth will open next year at our Jamaica Bay Branch. So thanks to IDNYC, 600,000 New Yorkers are now able to engage more fully in the life the city. And we are very pleased that so many of them have taken advantage of what we feel is a principal benefit of the ID is its function as a library card in all three systems. Brooklyn Public Library looks forward to our continued participation in the IDNYC

program, and we congratulate the city on an incredibly successful first year. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: I just want to congratulate you, and whoever had a hand in helping to write the testimony. The line that we are as essential to the modern immigrant experience as Ellis Island was to those who arrived here a century ago. I think you also used the Statue of Liberty. Very powerful imagery and I think it's true and beautifully done. So kudos to the team at BPL whoever is helping to write that testimony having done that myself many times. Next, and--and Katherine there's a seat over there for you if you'd like to--to join in. We've put that especially for you. Thank you.

CARYL SORIANO: Good afternoon. I am Caryl Soriano, Chief Librarian of the Mid-Manhattan Library, the largest New York public library--circulating library. I'd like to thank Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, Majority Leader Jimmy Van Bramer, Chair Carlos Menchaca, and the entire City Council for hosting me today. I appreciate the opportunity to testify today on our system's involvement in the implementation and continued success of IDNYC. For over 100 years, NYPL has

committed to providing New Yorkers with access to knowledge and services they deserve. Embedded in our mission of inspiring lifelong learning, advancing knowledge, and strengthening our communities is our dedication to opening doors of opportunity for the underserved. Consistently, we have advanced this mission by joining with our partners in City government to increase access to programs and services for all New Yorkers. IDNYC is one such program. On January 12th of this year the library opened its doors to two brand new IDNYC enrollment centers. As a critical partner in the delivery of this city service along with our colleagues of the Brooklyn Public Library and Queens Library, the New York Public Library houses two of the city's busiest IDNYC enrollment centers. One at the Mid-Manhattan Library, the location at which I serve and another at the Bronx Library Center off Fordham Road. After hiring support staff, building out the physical spaces needed, allowing the ID cards to function as a library card and open each enrollment location to the public, I can proudly say that today IDNYC's partnership with the New York Public Library has been a successful one. With approximately 1.7 million

visitors last year, Mid-Manhattan is a bustling community center, and a natural location to host an enrollment center. The demand, however, was even greater than we had imagined. Mid-Manhattan opened three enrollment terminals, and due to the high demand we quickly expanded to 15 terminals. To date, BOC (sic) and Mid-Manhattan have enrolled over 140,000 individuals. Due to this success, the library has continued to work with the city to expand IDNYC access through all locations. [bell] Recently, we have begun to host IDNYC public enrollment centers at our Clason's Point Branch in the Bronx, our Inwood Branch in Manhattan and our Newdorf and Mariner's Harbor Branches on Staten Island. At Kingsbridge in the Bronx, which will be opening this Friday, we are planning on hosting even more in 2016. Together, the public centers have accounted for an additional-- additional 2,060 IDNYC enrollments. We are proud to say that as of this month, 140,947 people enrolled in IDNYC at NYPL. That is 140,947 people who now have access to photo identification that they may not have had otherwise. Patrons have told my colleagues, "Finally, I can go inside a city building without having to show my benefit card as ID." and "Now I

can have an ID that I can proudly show without fear of being singled out for having an out-of-country ID." One day, a woman approached me to let me know how excited she was at being able to have an ID that would allow her into her children's to have meetings with their teachers. 140,947 people with IDs translates to a stronger more connected community, and again the furthering of the core mission of New York Public Library. Thank you again for this opportunity to testify. We look forward to continuing our partnership, and building on the success that we've had. Thank you.

[pause]

CHERYL ADOLPH: Good afternoon, City Council Members of the Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries and International Intergroup Relations and of the Committee on immigration. My name is Cheryl Adolph, Interim President and CEO of the Staten Island Museum. Thank you for the opportunity to testify in favor, but with concerns of providing free museum memberships to IDNYC cardholders. Staten Island Museum feels very strongly about encouraging all New Yorkers to visit us especially since we opened our new outstanding flagship location at Snug

Harbor this past September. The remarkable $24.4 million renovation was funded through City capital funds and we thank you for that. In the last three months we have seen a tremendous increase in IDNYC membership applications tripling from about 70 a month to more than 210 a month. The IDNYC program has allowed us to make more in-roads to other boroughs than ever before. More than twice as many of our new IDNYC members come from off island. We are benefitting from being marketed to the whole city, and it is gratifying to see people travel more than an hour to visit us. These new members receive our printed newsletter, program calendar and invitations to events and programs in addition to email notices. Our goal is that after a year of free membership at least 5% will continue with us as paid members. However, free IDNYC membership is challenging to administer with a small staff of only 16. Between the expensive staff time, printing costs, postage, lost admission this is quite an investment. About $15 per membership for the 560 IDNYC memberships we have to date. With the opening of the new museum, we know there is an increased interest in the institution. However, we are not seeing a jump in

membership or admission revenue that we would have expected. Actual membership revenue is down for this quarter compared to previous years. Is it possible that people who would have otherwise paid for a museum membership or admission are instead utilizing IDNYC? In closing, while we can't foretell the future impact of IDNYC, Staten Island Museum is committed to absorbing the associated risks of participating so that more New Yorkers can enjoy and appreciate our two locations, one by the ferry and future home of the Empire Outlet Mall and New York Wheel, and our newly opened state-of-the-art museum on the scenic campus of Snug Harbor Cultural Center. Please, visit us soon and tell your constituents about the museum that you as City Council members helped to create. Thank you.

ROSEMARY DE LUCA: Good afternoon Chairmen Van Bramer and Menchaca and committee members. I am Rosemary De Luca, Director of Government and Community Affairs for the Wildlife Conservation Society. Thank you for this opportunity to testify today regarding our successful collaboration with the City of New York to offer free one-year memberships to 2015 IDNYC registrants. WCS

is pleased to be part of this historic partnership with the Administration and the City Council that allows all New Yorkers the opportunity to excess-- access more arts and cultural opportunities throughout the city. As you know, WCS runs the Bronx Zoo and the New York Aquarium, which are part of the Cultural Institutions Group, CIG, as well as the city zoos and Central Park and Prospect Park in Queens. In an effort to help promote registration for the new IDNYC program, a free one-year IDNYC membership includes free admission, general admission to all five of our parks as well as discounts at selected shops and restaurants at our parks and for education programs and courses. IDNYC members also receive invitations to members evenings and free newsletters. To date, WCS has issued more than 31,000 IDNYC memberships. I believe the most of any CIG. Based on our equivalent basic individual membership this equates to a combined value of more than $2 million to participating New York residents. While we expected membership enrollments would begin to go down after school started in September, they have grown exponentially with more than 50% or 16,000 enrollments over the last 3-1/2 months. Based on our

data covering January through November of 2015, nearly 31% of our IDNYC members are residents of Queens; 28% Brooklyn; 24.5% Manhattan; 14% Bronx; and 2% Staten Island. In terms of visitation we have had over 51,000 visits to our five parks from IDNYC members; over 37,000 to the Bronx Zoo; almost 5--550--5,500 to Central Park; approximately 4,700 to the New York Aquarium and the reminder split between Prospect Park and Queens Zoo. While we do not have income data for IDNYC members, we have done a zip code based analysis applying 2014 US Census poverty data to gain an understanding of our IDNYC membership. To clarify, this is not a direct representation of our members, but am ex---I had--[laughs] how the process worked. Extrapolation based on their residential zip codes. In general we found the average citywide poverty percentage for member zip codes trended with the city average of just over 20% below the poverty line. Broken down by borough the average zip code percentage below the poverty--sorry--the poverty line for IDNYC members is 30% for the Bronx, 22% for the Brooklyn; 18% for Manhattan [bell] 16% for Queens and 14% for Staten Island. WCS is pleased--is pleased it could deepen its century

long public-private partnership with the City of New York for the benefit of its many residents. We look forward to continuing this benefit one more year for 2016 IDNYC registrants. Thanks.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

[pause]

CATHERINE LECLAIR: Good afternoon. My name is Catherine LeClair and I am with the New York City Ballet. I'm the Director of Foundation and Government Relations there, and thank you Chair Van Bramer and Chair Menchaca for this opportunity to testify. A lot of what you've been hearing is what we've been experiencing as well. At the start of the IDNYC program when we were asked as a CIG to participate, we though, you know, maybe a few hundred people would sign up for the ballet membership, and we approaching 7,000, which more than doubles our members. It's about 60%, which was incredible. We were so thrilled to realize that there are so many people out there who are interested in New York City ballet, and in taking advantage of some of our benefits. And for the ballet, truly member benefits are special and unique. The public cannot buy a ticket to--to some of the benefits that we offer to

our members. So we're very pleased and proud to have the instructional objectives to access--to provide access, and a real--a real engagement opportunity with--with that many people. 50% of our IDNYC members, just 50% of our IDNYC members are--are coming from outside of Manhattan. Their attendance at membership events has been very high, about 70% of--of our members who are attending events, our IDNYC holders. We had a chance to survey some of them and would like to continue this because we really felt like we wanted to get to know who they were, and we also wanted to find out what they valued about being a member. And over 90% of those survey respondents said that they were extremely happy with what their experiences were, and felt like the--the benefits that we offered were very valuables. So again, this is a super well qualified group of new people by and large who are coming into theater and seeing New York City Ballet, and engaging with the company. And we're excited about the next phase, the second year, which is both a renewal--our first renewal year, and also it's the second year of the program. To see really what kind of--what kind of results we're getting from this investment. And that

1 does lead me to the second part of what I want to
2 say, which is, of course, what you've been hearing
3 all along as well, which is that we are as much as we
4 are community centers and cultural centers we are
5 also all running businesses. And for New York City
6 Ballet, our membership program is a revenue center
7 for the company. And so, we're looking at this with
8 an eye towards access and engagement first and
9 foremost, and then secondly how do we leverage this
10 investment. In the first four to five months of the
11 program, we were really struggling, and our staff was
12 overwhelmed. Again, our expectations were blown out
13 of the water, which is a very good thing. But we
14 really struggled to figure out how to--how to handle
15 this. We had an opportunity with--through DCLA to
16 apply for a competitive grant called their
17 Supplemental Support, and at the end of the calendar
18 year along with our CIG colleagues. And one of the
19 things we applied for was some funding for part-time
20 help with our indigent defense program [bell] and I
21 bring this up because we received that funding, and
22 it was absolutely critical to--to making it possible
23 for us to administer this program and steward our new
24 IDC--IDNYC members correctly. And so, I just put
25

that out there because a little extra money from the city specifically for this program again for us, and I think for our colleagues will make an enormous difference. So I look forward to fighting that battle. Hopefully, it's not a battle as the budget season approaches. And I'll just say lastly we are anticipating having to add a full-time person to our staff for the next year of the program. As the fundraise for the company, I've been out getting--seeking support for that, and it's been very gratifying to have conversations with donors, institutional donors and individual donors about New York City Ballet's participation in IDNYC and what that means. Because by and large they are so supportive of this program for the city and the New York City Ballet's involvement. And that has a gone a long way to helping us figure out how to put together some additional funding to help pay for our part of this program going forward. And with that said, I just want to say thank you again for this opportunity and we're very, very pleased to be in this partnership with the city.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you very much, and this panel is incredibly important in terms

of pointing out some of the success stories. I think WCS some of those numbers were--were the most compelling that I've seen in terms of actual participation and--and obviously some of the challenges that this poses to our culturals as well. I'm grateful for that testimony and--and I'm glad that you were able to access some supplemental funding, but I think many of us agree that there is a larger supplemental funding issue at hand that--that I believe we can address in the coming budget and fiscal year. So I just want to say thank you to all of you for your participation. And as someone as you know who loves ballet, I'm incredibly excited to hear that level of interest in participation in--in ballet, which is so incredibly special on so many levels. I was at Carnegie Hall last night and went through the Rose Building and--and just to see all of those young people, you know, moving about the building dancing, getting ready to dance was very exciting.

CATHERINE LECLAIR: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: And--and I think we're about to end the hearing. I'll--I'll turn it over to my co-chair but before I do that, thank you

so much and he and I both have our IDNYC cards right here. And it's just been a very, very powerful piece of plastic, right--

CATHERINE LECLAIR: [interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --that has changed lives, and I want to thank all of you, and I want to thank my friend and colleague Council Member Menchaca for helping to deliver this and make life so much more meaningful for so many. So with that, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. Thank you, Chair and as we end, I--I want to lift up a couple of pieces that I know Chair Van Bramer already did and that's the--the added taxing nature on staff and--and we heard that today. I encouraged, though, these meetings that are happening. People alluded--several folks at agencies and the cultural institutions alluded to a meeting that was held where information was exchanged by the cultural institutions. It's a--it's a--it's a blessing in a lot of ways that we're able to get into these rooms for something that kind of unites us like this. As we continue in each of our membership conversations to include members that have not ever walked through

our doors before whether you're a librarian or a museum. And so, in those conversations I would ask you to really think about what that--what that means for the City of New York, and the agencies to be able to bring auxiliary resources to ensure that we continue to do this. What we don't want is--especially in the last few weeks, and I--again, I--I spent some time this weekend getting new memberships and, of course, I asked the questions how has the membership been. And like you testified, through the roof. One employee showed me a stack this thick of papers that were just from that weekend. 200 people had come into one of the museums, the City Museum of New York, and--and they were talking about getting interns to come in and help them get through this so they can get the--the actual cards and numbers. Just part of membership customer service. And so they're thinking of ways to--to really amplify their ability. We need to here that more and more especially for such a program that's so important to the City of New York, and I'm hoping that you as you continue to organize across the CIGs what other cultural institutions that you share those waves. And--and I don't know. Maybe we could create an IDNYC

internship program where cultural institutions can tap into. So there's a lot of ideas here. We want them to come from you. You know best and we'll support you in that. And so I want to say thank you on that front. And then finally as--as--as we kind of end the social media component, let's continue to talk about this and stuff for people at home. Bring your ideas you heard from--from-- And actually, I'll ask the question here will all of you--will all of you through your social media outlets take ideas on how to better your membership relationships with the new constituency that you just created. Is anybody--does anybody oppose that.

PANEL MEMBERS: No.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Great. So all of you are excited about that idea, and so many people are coming on social--to social media. So let's--let's get those ideas at hash tag #myidnyc. Let's get those ideas out to you, and to--to the public and get people excited about--about joining this card and this program, and really it's a lifestyle in so many ways one that is a welcoming one from the founding days of our city. So thank you so much and this concludes our hearing. [gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.

Date December 30, 2015