

A P P E A R A N C E S

Kate Daly
Executive Director
Landmarks Preservation Commission

Gregory Shaw
Attorney for Real Estate
New York City School Construction Authority

Tami Rachelson
Deputy Director of Real Estate
New York City Board of Education

Margaret Russo
Principal
P.S. 160

Carol Shine
Counsel
New York City Council Subcommittee on Landmarks,
Public Siting and Maritime Uses

1
2 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: You ready back
3 there?

4 MALE VOICE: No, we're not ready.

5 MALE VOICE: Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Excellent.
7 Good morning. Welcome to the Land Use
8 Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Siting and
9 Maritime Uses. I am Jessica Lappin, the Chair.
10 And, we are joined today by Councilwoman Annabel
11 Palma from the Bronx, Council Member Miguel
12 Martinez from Manhattan, Council Member John Liu
13 from Queens, Council Member Leroy Comrie from
14 Queens, Council Member Maria del Carmen Arroyo
15 stepped out of the room, but I'm sure she will be
16 back in just on moment.

17 So, with that, I wanted to begin
18 today's hearing with the Landmarks that are on the
19 agenda. We have one in Council Member Gerson's
20 district. So, actually Kate Daly, from the
21 Commission is here to testify. Miss Daly, if you
22 could please come up and we'll start with One
23 Chase Manhattan Plaza.

24 KATE DALY: Now, it's on. Great,
25 thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Please, begin.

KATE DALY: Good morning, Council Members. My name is Kate Daly, Executive Director of the Landmarks Preservation Commission. I'm here today to testify on the Commission's designation of One Chase Manhattan Plaza in Manhattan. On June 24th, 2008, the Landmarks Commission held a public hearing on the proposed designation. Seven people spoke in favor of the designation, including representatives of the building's owner, U.S. Representative Gerald Nadler and Council Member Alan Gerson. There were no speakers in opposition to designation. On February 10th, 2009, the Commission voted to designate One Chase Manhattan Plaza an individual landmark.

Faced with shimmering panels of natural color and black enameled aluminum, H-shaped mullions and glass, One Chase Manhattan Plaza is among the largest and most important 20th century skyscrapers in New York City. The project was designed by Skidmore, Owings and Merrill in the international style.

Chase merged with the Bank of

1
2 Manhattan Company in 1955 and the new headquarters
3 was planned to consolidate 8,700 employees under a
4 single roof, resulting in an 813-foot tall slab-
5 like tower that dramatically altered the skyline
6 and character of the Financial District. At that
7 time, few buildings had been constructed downtown
8 since the early 1930s. And, One Chase Manhattan
9 Plaza signaled a new start for this historic era.
10 Not only did it stand out sharply from its older
11 masonry neighbors, but the planning of the site,
12 incorporating an irregularly shaped two and a half
13 acre plaza established a break from the narrow
14 twisting streets that characterized much of the
15 neighborhood. Completed in 1964, it was one of
16 the Financial Districts' first buildings to boldly
17 reflect the aesthetic and planning strategies of
18 20th century European modernism.

19 The Commission urges you to affirm
20 the designation. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Thank you very
22 much. Do any of my colleagues have questions for
23 Miss Daly? Oh, I wanted to welcome Council Member
24 Barron, who is here. - - testify? No.

25 MALE VOICE: Okay.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Great. Seeing
3 nobody else signed up to testify on this item,
4 this hearing is closed. I want to open the
5 hearing on the Consolidated Edison Company
6 building, which is in Council Member Mendez'
7 district and in Community Board 6. Council Member
8 Mendez is in support. And, the mic is currently
9 not working?

10 MALE VOICE: It's working. It's
11 just-- well, I'll turn it up.

12 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Is that
13 better? There we go. Is that better? Okay. So,
14 I'll just repeat that. We're going to open the
15 hearing on the item in Councilman Mendez'
16 district, the Consolidated Edison and Company
17 building in Community Board 6, pre-considered
18 item. Miss Daly.

19 KATE DALY: For the record, my name
20 is Kate Daly, Executive Director of the Landmarks
21 Preservation Commission. I'm here to testify on
22 the Commission's designation of the Consolidated
23 Edison Building in Manhattan.

24 On October 28th, 2008, the Landmarks
25 Commission held a public hearing on the proposed

1
2 designation. Seven people spoke in favor of
3 designation, including representatives of the
4 owner, City Council Member Rosie Mendez and
5 preservation organizations. There were no
6 speakers in opposition to designation. On
7 February 10th, 2009, the Commission voted to
8 designate the Consolidated Edison building an
9 individual landmark.

10 The Con-Ed building, constructed in
11 stages between 1910 and 1929 for the Consolidated
12 Gas Company, predecessor to Con-Ed, and designed
13 by the leading architectural firms of Henry
14 Hardenbergh and Warren and Wetmore, is a
15 monumental presence in the Union Square
16 neighborhood and has one of the towers that define
17 the Manhattan skyline. Hardenbergh's 18-story,
18 classically inspired façades feature giant
19 segmental arches and double-story porticos at the
20 base and rusticated limestone piers balanced by
21 strong horizontal moldings at the upper stories.
22 Hardenbergh also incorporated an early and
23 historically significant program of nighttime
24 illumination in his design. The tower continues
25 to be illuminated at night.

1
2 Between 1926 and 1929, Warren and
3 Wetmore built two more additions on Irving Place
4 and East 14th Street, wrapping 18-story office
5 wings, which matched the Hardenbergh-designed
6 portions of the building, around a signature 26-
7 story corner tower. The Consolidated Edison and
8 its predecessors, the Consolidated Gas Company of
9 New York and New York Edison, have continuously
10 been headquartered here since the building's
11 construction.

12 The Commission urges you to affirm
13 the designation. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Thank you. I
15 grew up a few blocks from this building. I can't
16 believe it hasn't been landmarked before. It is,
17 to me, one of the most beautiful buildings in
18 Manhattan and, certainly, an icon when it comes to
19 the skyline. And, in fact, after the Empire State
20 Building, it's probably my favorite building in
21 Manhattan. So, I'm very glad that we're
22 designating this today.

23 I wanted to note that Councilman
24 Crowley has joined us. Are there any questions
25 from my colleagues? Great. Seeing nobody here to

1
2 testify on this item, the hearing is closed. I
3 wanted to move to the third, and final, landmark
4 on the agenda, which is the Alice and Agate
5 Courts, which is in Council Member Vann's district
6 and Community Board 3 and, ask Miss Daly to
7 testify.

8 KATE DALY: Thank you. For the
9 record, my name is Kate Daly, Executive Director
10 of the Landmarks Preservation Commission. I'm
11 here today to testify on the Commission's
12 designation of the Alice and Agate Courts Historic
13 District in Brooklyn.

14 On September 16th, 2008, the
15 Landmarks Commission held a public hearing on the
16 proposed designation. Ten witnesses spoke in
17 favor of designation, including representatives of
18 local preservation organizations and property
19 owners. There were no speakers in opposition to
20 designation. On February 10th, 2009, the
21 Commission voted to designate Alice and Agate
22 Courts a historic district.

23 The Alice and Agate Courts Historic
24 District consists of 36 row houses, set on two
25 cul-de-sacs on the north side of Atlantic Avenue

1
2 between Kingston and Albany Avenues in Bedford-
3 Stuyvesant. Designed by Brooklyn architect Walter
4 M. Coots in the Queen Anne style, the houses were
5 built in 1888 to '89 for industrialist Florian
6 Grosjean. These row houses form a quiet
7 residential oasis in the midst of the heavily
8 commercial Atlantic Avenue.

9 Constructed of red brick,
10 brownstone, bluestone and terracotta, the
11 buildings of Alice and Agate Courts feature corner
12 turrets, projecting bays, carved stonework, and
13 elaborate ironwork and stained glass windows. To
14 a large extent, the rows retain their original
15 appearance.

16 The Commission urges you to affirm
17 the designation. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Council Member
19 Barron.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yeah, I
21 just wanted to support this application because
22 it's been a long struggle with that community to
23 have it preserved. And, I wanted to make sure,
24 did it include the Agate, the wall?

25 KATE DALY: It does.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: The wall is
3 included.

4 KATE DALY: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Because I
6 think that was a major issue with some of the
7 residents of that area. But, it is a beautiful
8 area and it's definitely worth preservation. So,
9 I just want to urge my colleagues to support that.

10 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Any other
11 questions? Great. Seeing no one else here to
12 testify, this hearing is closed. Thank you,
13 Miss Daly.

14 KATE DALY: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Now, we can
16 move on to the schools. We are going to vote.
17 The first school, P.S. 160-K Annex in Council
18 Member de Blasio's district and ask Mr. Shaw from
19 the SCA to come and testify. Yes, Council Member
20 de Blasio is in support of this.

21 GREGORY SHAW: That's good.

22 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Mr. Shaw,
23 please begin.

24 GREGORY SHAW: Thank you. Good
25 morning, Chairperson Lappin and Council Members.

1
2 My name is Gregory Shaw. I'm principal attorney
3 for real estate for the New York City School
4 Construction Authority. And, to my immediate
5 left, is Tami Rachelson [phonetic], Deputy
6 Director for Real Estate for the Board of
7 Education of City of New York. And, next to her
8 is Margaret Russo, who's the principal of P.S. 160
9 for which this Annex will be located adjacent to.

10 The New York City School
11 Construction Authority has undertaken the site
12 selection process for the proposed 410-seat
13 Primary School Facility that will be located on
14 tax block 5653, lots 55 and part of lot 21,
15 located on the block bounded by Ft. Hamilton
16 Parkway, 51st Street, 11th Avenue and 52nd Street in
17 the Borough Park section of Brooklyn. The
18 proposed school site is also located in Community
19 School District Number 20 and Brooklyn Community
20 Board Number 12.

21 I just want to note for the record
22 that, initially, this site was considered at a
23 535-seat school. It was downsized pursuant to a
24 request by the Community Board and others within
25 the community to scale back the size of the school

1
2 to a 410-seat school, which we responded to those
3 request.

4 The project site contains a total
5 of approximately 17,500 square feet of lot area.
6 The site consists of a privately owned vacant lot
7 and a small portion of an existing play yard of
8 P.S. 160. Under the proposed plan, the SCA would
9 acquire the privately owned lot and construct a
10 new 410-seat Primary school facility serving
11 students in pre-kindergarten through fifth grade
12 in Community School District Number 20. The new
13 facility would provide relief from overcrowding in
14 other Primary schools in the district. The
15 proposed school would contain approximately 61,971
16 gross square feet. The new Annex building's
17 entrance would be located on 52nd Street. An
18 enclosed walkway would connect the new Annex with
19 the existing P.S. 160 building.

20 The notice of filing for the site
21 plan was published in the New York Post and the
22 City Record on October 31st, 2008. Brooklyn
23 Community Board Number 12 was also notified of the
24 site plan on that date and was asked to hold a
25 public hearing. Community Board Number 12 held

1
2 its public hearing on the site plan on
3 November 20th and December 16th, 2008 and submitted
4 written comments that conditionally recommended in
5 favor of the proposed site plan. The City
6 Planning Commission was also notified of the site
7 plan on October 31st, 2008. And, it also
8 recommended in favor of the site.

9 The SCA's considered all comments
10 received on the proposed site plan and affirms it
11 pursuant to Section 1731 of the Public Authorities
12 Law. In accordance with Section 1732 of the
13 Public Authorities Law, the SCA submitted the
14 proposed site plan to the Mayor and Council on
15 April 16th, 2009. We look forward to your
16 Subcommittee's favorable consideration of this
17 proposed plan. And, we're willing to take any
18 questions you might have regarding--

19 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: So, the play
20 area of P.S. 160 would be slightly reduced. But,
21 you're going to be building an additional early
22 childhood playground. Is that correct?

23 TAMI RACHELSON: Correct, yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: So, there will
25 be sufficient outdoor space to accommodate - -

1
2 TAMI RACHELSON: Well, basically
3 the existing play area was about 14,000 square
4 feet for the existing P.S. 160. That's going to
5 be reduced to like 10,250 square feet. And, the
6 additional play area, there'll be an early
7 childhood center play area for both the Annex and
8 the original school. And, that's going to be
9 about 1,900 square feet.

10 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Are you going
11 to be sole principal for both the Annex and - - ?

12 MARGARET RUSSO: Yes. That is
13 correct. I would also like to add to what
14 Miss Rachelson just said. The existing building
15 does not have a gym. And, the new building will
16 have a gym. So, there will be additional space
17 for physical activity for the children with the
18 Annex.

19 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: And, the new
20 building, in addition to having a gym, will have a
21 cafeteria and kitchen?

22 MARGARET RUSSO: That's correct.

23 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: A library?

24 MARGARET RUSSO: And, a library.
25 The existing building does not have a library.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: It'll have
3 music and art rooms.

4 MARGARET RUSSO: Um, hm.

5 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: And, it'll
6 have science classrooms.

7 MARGARET RUSSO: That's correct.

8 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: And, that will
9 be used by the entire school, not just - - ?

10 MARGARET RUSSO: That's correct.

11 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Right. Okay.
12 Is there any other questions from my colleagues?

13 MALE VOICE: - -

14 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: - -

15 MALE VOICE: - - time - -

16 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Oh, what's the
17 total number - - the Annex - -

18 MARGARET RUSSO: Right now, we're
19 at 137% utilization. We have 825 children in the
20 building that was built for 500 children.

21 TAMI RACHELSON: At the turn of the
22 century.

23 MARGARET RUSSO: In--

24 TAMI RACHELSON: [Crosstalk]

25 MARGARET RUSSO: --1908 it was

1
2 built.

3 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: And so, now,
4 you have how many?

5 MARGARET RUSSO: We're overcrowded
6 by about 325 children.

7 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: And, you have
8 800 and some odd--

9 MARGARET RUSSO: Eight hundred and
10 twenty-five children.

11 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: And, when the
12 Annex is built, how many children do you
13 anticipate? The same--

14 MARGARET RUSSO: There's going to
15 be 410. But, I'm hoping that they take 325 of
16 them from the existing building.

17 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: I see. So,
18 you're adding capacity for 410 [crosstalk]--

19 MARGARET RUSSO: [Interposing]
20 That's correct.

21 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: But, you're
22 already 325 [crosstalk]--

23 MARGARET RUSSO: [Interposing]
24 That's correct.

25 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: - -

1
2 MARGARET RUSSO: Um, hm. We don't
3 have a gym. We don't have a library. Our
4 teachers teach in the hallways and in former
5 custodial closets.

6 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Thank you.
7 Any other questions?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I have a
9 question.

10 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Council Member
11 Crowley.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I have a
13 question. Was the soil tested for contamination?

14 MARGARET RUSSO: Yes, it was.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: And, what
16 was the result of that?

17 TAMI RACHELSON: The result, there
18 was some contamination. And, there'll be a soil
19 vapor barrier membrane and a sub-slab
20 depressurization system to address any problems on
21 the site.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: What was
23 the use of the property?

24 TAMI RACHELSON: The use of the
25 property, it's been vacant for many years. But,

1

2 my understanding was that going back, it was auto
3 related uses.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: So, how
5 did you do that soil sample, mind me asking, just
6 curious?

7

TAMI RACHELSON: Basically, my
8 understanding, they had done a series of test
9 pits, borings, you know, our technical staff was
10 out there probably half a dozen times, you know.
11 I can--

12

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Yeah.

13

TAMI RACHELSON: -- give you the
14 summary.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I'm just
16 curious--

17

TAMI RACHELSON: Yeah.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: -- if the
19 School Construction Authority finds sites that
20 they think could be-- like, do you gauge it on the
21 level of one to ten, how contaminated a site is?
22 And, is there ever a point where you find a site
23 that you say we're not going to develop here
24 because it's too contaminated?

25

TAMI RACHELSON: Absolutely. There

1
2 have been many sites we've walked away from
3 because of the level of contamination. And, this
4 one does not have that level of contamination that
5 we would walk away from.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Okay.
7 Thank you.

8 TAMI RACHELSON: You're welcome.

9 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Thank you.
10 Okay.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: Madam
12 Chair?

13 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Yes, Council
14 Member Martinez.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: Yeah, I
16 just want to comment on the Community Health
17 Academy of the Heights.

18 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: That, that's
19 next on the - -

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: Oh, I
21 thought I heard him testify on that.

22 MALE VOICE: No - -

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: No?

24 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: No, not yet.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: I'm

1

2 jumping the guns. Okay.

3 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: You are.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: Thanks.

5 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: But, we can
6 wrap up this item and move to that, if there are--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: All

8 right. Sorry. I thought--

9 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: -- no other
10 questions--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: -- I
12 heard testimony on that and you were right. All
13 right. Thanks.

14 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Okay. Seeing
15 nobody else signed up to testify on this item,
16 this hearing is closed. Thank you very much. And
17 now, we can move right along to the last item on
18 the agenda, which is the Community Health Academy
19 that Council Member Martinez just referenced,
20 which is in Council Member Jackson's district in
21 Community Board 12.

22 GREGORY SHAW: Thank you, again,
23 Chairperson Lappin and Council Members. My name,
24 again, is Gregory Shaw, principal attorney for
25 real estate for the School Construction Authority.

The New York City School

Construction Authority has undertaken the site selection process for the proposed 572-seat Intermediate and High School facility on a block bounded by West 158th Street, Amsterdam Avenue, West 157th Street and Broadway in the Borough of Manhattan and tax block 2116 on a portion of lot 33. The proposed school is also located in Community School District Number 6 in Manhattan Community Board Number 12.

The proposed site is owned currently by the New York City Housing Authority, adjacent to the Justice Thurgood Marshall Senior Citizen Housing Project. No changes are planned for the Senior Citizen Housing facility, except a new smaller courtyard will be constructed with replacement parking for six vehicles. Under the proposed plan, the SCA would construct, on the vacant lot, a new 572-seat Intermediate High School facility.

The notice of filing for the site plan was published in the New York Post and City Record on January 9th, 2009. Manhattan's Community Board Number 12 was also notified of the site plan

1
2 on January 9th, 2009. It was asked to hold a
3 public hearing on the proposed site. The
4 Community Board held its public hearing on
5 February 17th, 2009, but did not submit written
6 comments regarding the site plan. The City
7 Planning Commission was also notified of the site
8 plan on that date and it recommended in favor of
9 the proposed site.

10 The SCA has considered all comments
11 received on the proposed site plan and affirms it
12 pursuant to Section 1731 of the Public Authorities
13 Law. In accordance with Section 1732 of the
14 Public Authorities Law, the SCA submitted the
15 proposed site plan to the Mayor and City Council
16 on April 16th, 2009. We look forward to your
17 Subcommittee's favorable consideration of the
18 proposed site plan. We're prepared to answer any
19 questions you might have.

20 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Council Member
21 Martinez.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: Thank
23 you, Madam Chair. There must have been an
24 oversight by the Community Board 12. I just want
25 to say that for the record, 'cause I know that the

1
2 Board did demonstrate to be in favor of this
3 development. This had been a project that the
4 Department of Education, Council Member Jackson
5 and a local nonprofit uptown have been working for
6 many-- a couple of years in making it happen.
7 And, it's now become a reality.

8 And, it is also serves as a model
9 when the Department of Education and some of our
10 nonprofit get together, not only to provide the
11 educational or enhance the educational experience
12 of our student, but also to provide the
13 afterschool program which is also a component
14 that's going to be taking place in this new
15 facility and to specialize teaching in the health
16 field. It could also be a very important. And,
17 it's the main focus of the new school. So, I just
18 want to encourage and ask my colleagues at the
19 Committee, even though Council Member Jackson's
20 not here, to vote in favor of this project.

21 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Thank you.
22 Any questions from my colleagues? Seeing nobody
23 else signed to testify, this hearing is closed.
24 Thank you very much.

25 GREGORY SHAW: Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: And, with
3 that, these are all very worthy applications, the
4 landmarks and the schools that have been a long
5 time coming. So, I would ask for the Council to
6 call for a vote and recommend a favorable vote.

7 CAROL SHINE: Carol Shine, counsel
8 to the Subcommittee. Chair Lappin.

9 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Aye.

10 CAROL SHINE: Council Member
11 Barron.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

13 CAROL SHINE: Council Member
14 Comrie.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Aye.
16 Congratulations to the principal of P.S. 160.

17 CAROL SHINE: Council Member Liu.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LIU: Yes.

19 CAROL SHINE: Council Member
20 Martinez.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: Yes.

22 CAROL SHINE: Council Member Palma.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Yes.

24 CAROL SHINE: Council Member
25 Arroyo.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes.

3

CAROL SHINE: Council Member

4

Mendez.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Can you

6

hear me? I vote aye. I vote aye. I vote aye.

7

Can you hear me? Am I recorded?

8

CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: - -

9

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Ayes have

10

it. Okay.

11

CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Congrats on

12

Con-Ed.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: What?

14

CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Con-Ed.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Oh, thank

16

you.

17

CAROL SHINE: Council Member

18

Crowley.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote aye

20

on all.

21

CAROL SHINE: By a vote of nine in

22

the affirmative, none in the negative and no

23

abstentions, the aforementioned items are approved

24

and referred to the full Committee.

25

CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Tell you what

2

I did in a minute. Meeting adjourned.

3

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, DeeDee E. Tataseo certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "DeeDee E. Tataseo". The signature is written in black ink and is positioned above a horizontal line.Date May 1, 2009