

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS

AND DISPOSITIONS

1

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC  
SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

----- X

October 1, 2024  
Start: 11:14 a.m.  
Recess: 12:00 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 BROADWAY - COMMITTEE ROOM, 16TH  
FLOOR

B E F O R E: Kamillah M. Hanks, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Oswald Feliz  
Christopher Marte  
Sandy Nurse  
Yusef Salaam

OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ATTENDING:

Mercedes Narcisse  
Rita C. Joseph

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS  
AND DISPOSITIONS

2

A P P E A R A N C E S

Carl Hedman, Director of Leveraged Preservation Programs at New York City Housing Preservation and Development

Nicholas Simmons, Director of Construction and Development at MHANY Management Group

Alessandra Woodman, Project Manager at MHANY Management Group

Annabelle Meunier, Senior Queens Planner at New York City Housing Preservation and Development

Jack Heaney, Founder and Managing Principal of Fulcrum Properties

Bryan White, Chairman of Thomas White Jr. Foundation

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS AND  
DISPOSITIONS

3

1  
2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning. This is a  
3 microphone check for the Subcommittee on Landmarks,  
4 Public Sitings and Dispositions. Today's date is  
5 October 1, 2024, recorded by Edwards on the 16th  
6 Floor.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Can everybody settle  
8 down, please? Everybody settle down.

9 Good morning, and welcome to the New York  
10 City Council hearing of the Committee on Landmarks,  
11 Public Sitings and Dispositions.

12 At this time, can everybody please  
13 silence your cell phones.

14 If you wish to testify, please go up to  
15 the Sergeant-at-Arms desk to fill out a testimony  
16 slip. Written testimony can be emailed to  
17 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Once again, that is  
18 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

19 At this time and going forward, no one is  
20 to approach the dais. I repeat, no one is to approach  
21 the dais.

22 Chair, we are ready to begin.

23 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: [GAVEL] Good morning.  
24 Welcome to the meeting on Subcommittee on Landmarks,  
25 Public Sitings and Dispositions. I am Council Member

1 Kamillah Hanks, and I am the Chair of this  
2 Subcommittee. Today, I am joined by my colleagues,  
3 Council Member Marte, Council Member Nurse, Council  
4 Member Joseph, and Council Member Narcisse.  
5

6 Before we begin with today's agenda, I  
7 will remind everyone that this meeting is being held  
8 in a hybrid format. For members of the public who  
9 wish to testify remotely, we ask that you first  
10 register online, and you may do so by visiting  
11 [www.council.nyc.gov/landuse](http://www.council.nyc.gov/landuse) to sign up, and then sign  
12 into the Zoom and remain signed in until you have  
13 testified.

14 For anyone that is with us today in  
15 person and wishing to testify, and if you have not  
16 already done so, please see one of our Sergeants to  
17 fill out a speaker's card, and we will call your name  
18 at the appropriate time.

19 For anyone wishing to submit written  
20 testimony on the items being heard today, we ask that  
21 you please send it via email to  
22 [landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov). Include the land  
23 use number and/or project name in the subject line of  
24 your email. Video and audio testimony will not be  
25 accepted.

1  
2 I will remind members of the public that  
3 this is a government proceeding and that decorum will  
4 be observed at all times. As such, members of the  
5 public shall remain silent unless and until called to  
6 testify.

7 The witness table is reserved for people  
8 who wish to testify. No video or recording or  
9 photography is allowed from the witness table.

10 Further, members of the public may not present audio  
11 or video recordings as testimony, but they may submit  
12 transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant for  
13 inclusion in the hearing record.

14 On today's agenda, we have a hearing on  
15 LU-158, 159, 160 in South Jamaica Gateway Rezoning in  
16 Speaker Adams' and Council Member Williams' District  
17 in Queens, Pre-Considered Land Use MHANY Multifamily  
18 Preservation Loan Program in Council Members Joseph,  
19 Louis, and Narcisse's Districts in Brooklyn.

20 Now, I'm going to open up the public  
21 hearing for Pre-Considered LU applications brought by  
22 New York City Department of Housing, Preservation,  
23 and Development for MHANY Multifamily Preservation  
24 Loan Program, which includes the designation of an  
25 urban development action area, approval of an urban

1 development action project, disposition of City-owned  
2 and approval of an Article XI tax exemption pursuant  
3 to Section 577 of the private housing finance law for  
4 a 40-year exemption from real estate property  
5 taxation to facilitate preservation of an affordable  
6 housing project. The project is located in multiple  
7 neighborhoods throughout Brooklyn. Upon completion of  
8 rehabilitation of these four buildings, there will be  
9 a total of 12 rental units and one commercial space  
10 under the HPD Multi-Preservation Loan Program.

11  
12 Appearing today on this proposal is Nicholas Simmons,  
13 Director of Construction and Development, Alessandra  
14 Woodman, Project Manager of MHANY, so M-H-A-N-Y for  
15 the public's (INAUDIBLE) Carl Hedman, Director of  
16 Leveraged Preservation Programs, and those wishing to  
17 testify must register online by visiting the  
18 Council's website at council.nyc.landuse.

19                   Counsel, will you please administer the  
20 affirmation?

21                   COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists, would you  
22 please raise your right hand and state your name for  
23 the record?

24                   DIRECTOR HEDMAN: Carl Hedman.

25                   NICHOLAS SIMMONS: Nicholas Simmons.

2 ALESSANDRA WOODMAN: Alessandra Woodman.

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And do you affirm to  
4 tell the truth and nothing but the truth in your  
5 testimony before this Subcommittee and in answer to  
6 all Council Member questions?

7 DIRECTOR HEDMAN: I do.

8 NICHOLAS SIMMONS: I do.

9 ALESSANDRA WOODMAN: I do.

10 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. For the  
11 viewing public, if you need an accessible version of  
12 this presentation, please send an email request to  
13 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

14 Now, the applicant team may begin. Thank  
15 you.

16 DIRECTOR HEDMAN: Hi. Good morning. My  
17 name is Carl Hedman. I'm Director of Leveraged  
18 Preservation Programs at HPD, and I'm here to start  
19 off the presentation.

20 Today, this morning, we'll be discussing  
21 TBK1007, MHANY. It's a Multifamily Preservation Loan  
22 Program project, ULURP number G 240058 XUK. We can  
23 advance to the next slide, please.

24 This is just a quick map showing  
25 locations of the projects within Brooklyn in the

1 Flatbush and Canarsie neighborhoods. We'll be  
2 discussing the individual properties in the  
3 forthcoming slides so you can advance the slide,  
4 please.

5  
6 The proposed action today, the applicant  
7 is the New York City Department of Housing  
8 Preservation and Development. As mentioned  
9 previously, these buildings are part of the  
10 Multifamily Preservation Loan Program, MPLP, which  
11 designates qualified sponsors to purchase and  
12 rehabilitate City-owned vacant and/or occupied  
13 multifamily and mixed-use buildings in order to  
14 create low-to-moderate income rental housing. At  
15 closing, the properties will be sold to the sponsor,  
16 MHANY Mother Gaston, LLC, for a nominal 1-dollar  
17 price per property. The property manager will be  
18 MHANY Management, and the land use actions today are  
19 an Urban Development Action Area designation and an  
20 Urban Development Action Area project UDAAP approval,  
21 the disposition of City-owned development sites.  
22 Those are blocks 4735, 7922, 5022, 5089, and lots 43,  
23 22, 10, and 20, respectively. At closing, we're  
24 requesting an Article XI tax exemption for the  
25 cluster of these buildings and a 40-year regulatory



1  
2 agreement preserving the affordability so you can  
3 advance the next slide, please.

4                   ALESSANDRA WOODMAN: Hi, everyone. I'm  
5 Alessandra Woodman, Project Manager at MHANY  
6 Management. The MHANY Brooklyn cluster includes four  
7 City-owned buildings with 12 residential units and  
8 one commercial space. The addresses are 1073 Eureka  
9 Avenue, which is currently occupied, 649 East 87th  
10 Street, which is also occupied, 996 East 46th Street,  
11 occupied, and 38 Martense, which is vacant. The  
12 cluster consists of five occupied units in total,  
13 seven vacant units, and one vacant commercial space  
14 at 1073 Eureka Avenue. Currently, there's no existing  
15 regulatory agreement because these are City-owned  
16 buildings. These properties will go through  
17 substantial and moderate rehab. Overall, the cluster,  
18 it's composed of third-party transfer buildings,  
19 MPLP, and a private cluster. In total, we have 13  
20 buildings and 116 units around Brooklyn. So, HPD will  
21 enter into a regulatory agreement for all of these 13  
22 buildings with substantial rehab, with a private  
23 loan, City capital subsidy, and LIHTC equity. The  
24 first building.. oh, next slide, please.

1  
2           So, the first building is 1073 Eureka  
3 Avenue in Brooklyn in the East Flatbush neighborhood,  
4 Council District 45 and Council Member Farrah Louis.  
5 It has two floors, two residential units that are  
6 occupied, one that is vacant, and the commercial  
7 space, which is also vacant. As you can see in the  
8 map, it's located in Eureka Avenue between Tilden  
9 Avenue and Beverly Road.

10           The next building is 996 East 46th Street  
11 in the East Flatbush neighborhood at Brooklyn,  
12 Council District 45, Council Member Farrah Louis. It  
13 has two floors. Both residential units are currently  
14 occupied. This is between Farragut Road and Glenwood  
15 Road in East 46th Street.

16           Third building is 639 East 87th Street,  
17 Canarsie, Brooklyn, Council District 46, Council  
18 Member Mercedes Narcisse. Two floors, one residential  
19 unit, which is currently occupied, and between Foster  
20 Avenue and, I can't see the name of the other one,  
21 Glenwood Road, I guess.

22           Last building we'll talk about is 38  
23 Martense in Flatbush neighborhood in Brooklyn,  
24 Council District 40, Council Member Rita Joseph. It  
25 has three floors, six residential units that are all

1 vacant, and this is between, it's very close to  
2 Flatbush Avenue and Carleton Avenue. Next slide,  
3 please.  
4

5                   NICHOLAS SIMMONS: Hi. My name is Nick  
6 Simmons. I'm the Director of Construction and  
7 Development with MHANY Management. I'll be going over  
8 the next few slides. The slide that we're going to be  
9 going over now is just a little introduction, a brief  
10 history on MHANY Management. MHANY, Mutual Housing  
11 Association of New York, which is the acronym for  
12 MHANY, is a 501(c)3 not-for-profit. We've been around  
13 for nearly 40 years. As you can see on the slide, we  
14 have a portfolio of around over 220 buildings, over  
15 3,000 units that are all for low- and moderate-income  
16 individuals and families, and about 10,000 square  
17 feet of commercial space across New York City. We're  
18 primarily in East New York, Brownsville, East  
19 Brooklyn neighborhoods, and South Bronx, but we are  
20 also in East Harlem and a little bit in Queens,  
21 Jamaica, Queens area. You can go to the next slide.

22                   So, can we go one slide back? Thank you.

23                   So, MHANY's mission is to increase  
24 affordable housing for low-income and moderate-income  
25 families with a focus on preservation and deep

1  
2 affordability. We aim to improve the way affordable  
3 housing for low-income and moderate-income people is  
4 developed and operated. We work with building and  
5 community residents to get involved with their  
6 communities and neighborhoods, and another mission is  
7 to improve the community conditions and increase  
8 neighborhood involvement. Next slide, please.

9           ALESSANDRA WOODMAN: So, to give you a  
10 summary of the work for this cluster, it will be a  
11 substantial rehab to address 38 Martense, which has  
12 been vacant for quite some time, and then there'll be  
13 a moderate rehab for the other three buildings, 1073  
14 Utica, 639 East 87, and 996 East 46. Just to give a  
15 little context, these buildings are occupied with  
16 families that have been there for a long time. There  
17 has been a lot of conversation with residents, a lot  
18 of engagement in which they have expressed that they  
19 do not want to be relocated. For them, they've lived  
20 there their whole life. It's their home so we changed  
21 the scope and worked around them to be able to keep  
22 them in place while we do the work. That's what they  
23 want, and we'll do it that way. So, like we were  
24 saying, it's 12 units across these four buildings,  
25 and we're not changing the unit mix. It will be 12

1 units of affordable housing after our renovations.  
2  
3 There's one commercial space at 1073 Utica, which  
4 will be also renovated for any new tenant to move  
5 there and then make it their own space based on their  
6 needs. There's 10,062 gross square feet of  
7 residential space and 810 gross rate of commercial  
8 space in total for these four buildings. Existing  
9 tenants will be offered a preferential rent to  
10 preserve their affordability. That's really important  
11 for MHANY and HPD and, for the whole cluster, which  
12 is 14 buildings, we'll set a 15 percent set aside for  
13 formerly homeless individuals or families.

14           The scope of work, kind of the highlights  
15 of what it includes, if we go to the next slide,  
16 please, will be roof replacement, façade work, window  
17 replacement, electrical upgrades, boiler replacement,  
18 and in-unit repair, which focuses for the  
19 (INAUDIBLE), rehabs in new kitchens and new bathrooms  
20 as well as new flooring, painting, anything that is  
21 needed so it looks and it is brand new. The  
22 construction for the whole cluster, the 14 buildings,  
23 is anticipated to last 27 months. We are planning on  
24 doing it in two phases because it's 13 buildings and  
25 that way residents, it will take around 13 months for

1 each phase, while residents are some in place and  
2 some relocated.  
3

4           So, to give you a unit mix, like I said,  
5 we are not changing the unit count. We have, from  
6 those four buildings, 12 units. There's nine one-  
7 bedrooms. There is three two-bedrooms for the total  
8 of 12, and that's what it will look like after  
9 renovation.

10           If we look at the AMIs, the units that  
11 are currently occupied will be at 40 percent AMI,  
12 which is five units, and the vacant units will be at  
13 75 percent AMI, which is seven units. If we can move  
14 two slides, please. So, yeah, that's what I was  
15 talking about, the AMI. And here, just to give you an  
16 overall of the project, like I'm saying, it's 13  
17 buildings. It's scattered around many neighborhoods  
18 in Brooklyn. It's 116 units in total, and from those,  
19 we're looking at almost half of them being at 40  
20 percent AMI. That's our strong number. And then we  
21 see 24 units are going to be at 50 percent AMI, 14  
22 units will be at 60 percent, 13 at 70, and seven at  
23 75, with one super unit. The plan has been to do that  
24 tiered, so there's a broad spectrum of residents that  
25

1  
2 could move into those units, and total, like I said,  
3 it's 116 units, the whole project. That's it.

4 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. Now  
5 I'd like to recognize some of my Colleagues, if they  
6 have any questions or remarks. Council Member  
7 Narcisse.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Good morning,  
9 and thank you for being here, and thank you for  
10 answering almost all my questions before. This is a  
11 great project. The whole idea, we're in a crisis, and  
12 keeping housing affordable for those in need is  
13 always a great thing in our city and in my District,  
14 and one other thing too, you prevent those housing,  
15 you prevent them from being an eyesore in our  
16 community too, because you're fixing them.

17 And my question is, while the  
18 construction is going on, how much involved the  
19 tenants are, because they're already occupied? Are  
20 you keeping them up to date on a regular basis? Is it  
21 contractors? I mean, are you introducing the  
22 contractors who are doing the construction with the  
23 tenants, and to understand the rule and regulation,  
24 what can be done? Are those things being discussed?

1  
2           ALESSANDRA WOODMAN: Absolutely. We'll  
3 have tenant meetings with our team, HPD, the  
4 contractors and the architects, to go through what is  
5 the next steps, what is the plan, how the actual  
6 renovation is going to be with the tenants in place  
7 so they'll feel more comfortable of what's next so,  
8 when we do renovation with tenants in place, we  
9 normally work by sectors. So, for example, we're  
10 doing the kitchen, we try and leave some space for a  
11 temporary kitchen for them, and every day, the  
12 contractors work there, and they clean the space  
13 after, so residents can be living there in some way,  
14 comfortably, while we do the work.

15           COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Okay. My next  
16 question is the roofing because to do a complete  
17 roof, how is that going to be working while the house  
18 is occupied?

19           NICHOLAS SIMMONS: Yeah, just to answer  
20 your last question, we also went to all the residents  
21 to get them to sign the tenant layout to make sure  
22 that the layout that will be eventually built is  
23 something that they're going to be comfortable with  
24 so that all the residents have been showed what the  
25 layouts will look like, and that we try to get all



1 their sign-offs, and I think we did pretty well with  
2 that.  
3

4 In regards to the renovations, MHANY's  
5 bread and butter is doing renovations with tenants in  
6 place. The majority of our portfolio is our existing  
7 buildings, so they do need to get renovated, and our  
8 vacancy is about 2 percent out of the 3,000  
9 apartments so it's very low vacancy turnover. So, in  
10 order to do a renovation with tenants in place and  
11 not to be so disruptive, we try to use contract that  
12 has experience so that's the first step. We're not  
13 going to bid the project out to a contract that has  
14 never worked with a resident in place. Specifically  
15 for a roof, they're going to look at the weather to  
16 make sure they're not doing it during the raining or  
17 snowing season and, based off the weather, they will  
18 create a schedule. They will put down a temporary  
19 roof, tarping until the permanent roof could go down,  
20 and if there is a case where there is a leak during  
21 the construction of the roof, MHANY will be  
22 responsible for any damages that does happen because  
23 it is construction. Stuff does happen, but for the  
24 most part, from my experience, I've done maybe about  
25 20 buildings with roofs with residents in place. I've

1  
2 only had one instance like that, and that was just  
3 because a freak rainstorm came out of nowhere, and we  
4 do boilers, too. We change boilers with residents in  
5 place. We give them temporary heating devices,  
6 whether that's an in-unit electrical heater, or we  
7 set them up with a temporary boiler that you might  
8 see when you're driving across New York City that are  
9 parked on the street in front of the building with a  
10 vent that goes towards the building so we work with  
11 the contractors, and from our experience, we talk  
12 with the residents, and we do the coordinating with  
13 the residents. We don't allow the contractors to do  
14 the coordinating because it helps our relationship,  
15 and after the construction, it helps us maintain a  
16 good relationship going forward after, and we keep it  
17 going.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: In case the  
19 house becomes not livable, do you have a plan to get  
20 those folks in a temporary place, in a hotel or  
21 something? Is any kind of things like that in place?

22 NICHOLAS SIMMONS: Yeah, so for the four  
23 buildings that we're focused on today, so I think the  
24 one building that will need substantial is actually

25

1 the vacant one on 1073 Utica, so we won't have to  
2 relocate anyone.

3  
4 ALESSANDRA WOODMAN: 38 Martense.

5 NICHOLAS SIMMONS: No, Martense, sorry, 38  
6 Martense, so that is vacant so there won't be any  
7 relocation. In the portfolio, there is another  
8 building that has some structural issues so we'll  
9 need to do some temporary relocating, and how we do  
10 temporary relocations, when that time comes, we  
11 sometimes use a broker to find available apartments  
12 that are of the same size bedroom, so they're not  
13 downsizing or upsizing. MHANY also has buildings in  
14 the neighborhood, so when we have vacant units that  
15 are ready to be rented, we use those as temporary  
16 relocation apartments sometimes, and I think for this  
17 project, one of the ideas is to work on the vacant  
18 buildings first, and then those buildings will have  
19 vacant units, and if we need to relocate anyone, we  
20 can use those buildings, so we wouldn't have to go to  
21 the market or a broker.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: My last  
23 question, how is the condition of those places that  
24 occupied now, are they livable for real?

1  
2           NICHOLAS SIMMONS: What MHANY has done  
3 since the TBT round was designated, I think it was  
4 2018, so it was a very long time ago, we've managed  
5 the buildings, so what we do is we try to keep it in  
6 living order, because the residents still have to pay  
7 their rent, so if there is issues, we do try to take  
8 care of them. When it's a big capital improvement, we  
9 try to ask them to be patient because the renovations  
10 need to take place, but if there's a heating issue,  
11 leaks, anything, any emergency issues, those get  
12 addressed right away, but I think more cosmetic or  
13 flooring, you can't really do that with the resident  
14 in place, so those stuff, we ask the residents to be  
15 patient, some of them are patient, some of them, it's  
16 been since 2018, so it's time, and understandably, I  
17 think they're right when it is time to get the work  
18 done.

19           COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: All right, thank  
20 you. Thank you, Chair. Thank you, my Colleagues.

21           CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.  
22 Before I recognize Council Member Louis, I'd like to  
23 recognize that Council Member Feliz and Council  
24 Member Salaam are also here.

25

1  
2           So now we have Council Member Joseph for  
3 some questions.

4           COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Good morning,  
5 thank you. 38 Martense, you said it was six vacant  
6 units?

7           ALESSANDRA WOODMAN: Correct.

8           NICHOLAS SIMMONS: Correct.

9           COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: And what are the  
10 make-ups going to be, one, two bedrooms?

11           ALESSANDRA WOODMAN: I believe they're all  
12 two bedrooms.

13           COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: All two bedrooms,  
14 good. And in terms of affordability?

15           ALESSANDRA WOODMAN: I'm sorry, I'm sorry,  
16 I'm wrong. It's four one-bedrooms, two two-bedrooms.

17           COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Four one-bedrooms  
18 and two two-bedrooms. Thank you. And in terms of  
19 affordability, will there be a community outreach  
20 part?

21           NICHOLAS SIMMONS: Yes, so we're open for  
22 the entire cluster, because this is not the only  
23 building that we do need to fill. We will be going to  
24 the community, and we are open to recommendations  
25 from you guys if you have any in regards to it.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: And you said the  
3 renovations, well, I know it's a vacant. I've seen  
4 it. It's in my District. I'm familiar with the  
5 property. When I first got in, I kept on asking who  
6 owns it, and nobody could tell me. They said there  
7 was an owner, but nobody knew where. In terms of  
8 affordability, we talked about that, and that should  
9 be what are the AMIs for that?

10 NICHOLAS SIMMONS: So those are all  
11 vacant, so we're setting all of the vacant ones at 75  
12 percent AMI.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Why so high? The  
14 median income in Flatbush, where it is, is on  
15 Martense, between Flatbush and Bedford.

16 NICHOLAS SIMMONS: Understood, and yes, we  
17 agree and don't believe that AMIs really reflect the  
18 neighborhood. All of our buildings in all of our  
19 neighborhoods, we feel the same way. However, the  
20 amount of work that is needed is a lot throughout the  
21 cluster, so what we wanted to do for the residents  
22 that were in place, that's why we wanted to leave  
23 those at 40 percent AMI, as low as we could try to  
24 make sure that we're not making them rent burdened  
25 and then, since these are vacant units, we figured it

1  
2 might be easier to fill them with new residents that  
3 could afford them.

4           COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: That doesn't come  
5 from the neighborhood. If we're really talking about  
6 affordability, which is what we're facing right now  
7 in this city, it's an affordability crisis. We need  
8 to look at the AMI, and that part of the  
9 neighborhood, that AMI does not reflect that part of  
10 the neighborhood so I'm going to advocate on behalf  
11 of my constituent always to make sure it reflects the  
12 needs of the community, if we want to make sure we're  
13 not displacing anyone and we want to keep folks here,  
14 we have to offer them, you don't want to rent burden,  
15 but we also want to make sure neighbors stay in the  
16 communities as well. If we're offering it to the  
17 community, it should go to Community Boards. Let me  
18 know if that's something we need to have a side  
19 conversation. I'm open for that, but 75 AMI is  
20 outrageous.

21           NICHOLAS SIMMONS: Okay. Understood. I  
22 think we talked to our Executive Director that wasn't  
23 able to make it today, just had an emergency. We are  
24 open to suggestions in regards to setting the AMIs.  
25 For our portfolio of buildings, we also do have

1  
2 preferential rents for some tenants, for cases like  
3 this where we're not trying to rent burden them or we  
4 can't fill the units because the neighborhood isn't  
5 at that AMI like you mentioned so, yes, we would love  
6 to...

7 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Definitely have a  
8 side conversation on that. Thank you. Because  
9 affordability right now, that's what all New Yorkers  
10 face across the board. We don't want none of our  
11 residents to be displaced, and we're seeing more and  
12 more. As you may know, more and more families are  
13 entering shelters. I was an educator, so most of my  
14 kids, 114,000 kids in the New York City public  
15 schools live in shelters. That's opening a door for a  
16 family to enter. We really need to look at how we  
17 address neighborhoods. We can't do a cookie-cutter  
18 model for a whole neighborhood. It has to meet the  
19 needs of the neighborhood where they are. Thank you,  
20 and I look forward to working with you.

21 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Council  
22 Member.

23 Next, I'm going to read a statement from  
24 Council Member Louis.



1  
2           Thank you, Chair Hanks, which is me, for  
3 allowing me to submit this statement on the record  
4 today. I would like to acknowledge today's hearing on  
5 the Multifamily Preservation Loan Program application  
6 for MHANY Management to oversee the rehabilitation of  
7 two properties in my District. I want to applaud  
8 MHANY for their remarkable work in providing  
9 affordable housing across our city. However, I must  
10 express my concerns regarding HPD's recent  
11 performance in my District. My experience with HPD  
12 has been marked by a troubling lack of communication  
13 and coordination, particularly on these two major  
14 projects. The Article XI at Flatbush Garden suffered  
15 an inadequate communications plan with tenants and  
16 surrounding community. Additionally, the Bethany  
17 Senior Terraces, one of our flagship affordable  
18 housing developments, was launched with insufficient  
19 outreach and notification to the residents who need  
20 it most. It would be a disservice to my constituents  
21 to support this project without clear safeguards and  
22 assurances from HPD. We need to know how our  
23 communities will be engaged in future housing lottery  
24 efforts, how current residents will be kept housed  
25 during construction, and how we will address issues

1  
2 that may arise during the 40-year regulatory  
3 agreement. I look forward to hearing about these  
4 assurances today as we assess on how to move forward  
5 with this application.

6           Next, Counsel, is there any members of  
7 the public who wish to testify on this item?

8           COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, there are two  
9 members of the public.

10           CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. This  
11 applicant panel is now excused.

12           As a reminder, if I or any Council  
13 members have questions, witnesses are asked to remain  
14 online or stay seated at the microphone after their  
15 testimony until they are excused.

16           For those participating online, once you  
17 or your group has been excused following any  
18 questions, participants may continue to view live  
19 streamed broadcasts of this hearing on the Council  
20 website. Members of the public will be given two  
21 minutes to speak, and please do not begin until the  
22 Sergeant-at-Arms has started the clock.

23           We will now hear from the first panel,  
24 which is Alessandra Woodman and Nicholas Simmons.

25           That was them.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Oh, that was them.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Yeah.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I apologize. Those  
were given to us.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Pardon me. Just please  
hold.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay. We have no  
members of the public signed up to speak.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: With there being no  
other members of the public who wish to testify  
regarding Pre-Considered LU MHANY Multifamily  
Preservation Loan Program, the public hearing is now  
closed.

Thank you, everyone.

Now, I will open the public hearing for  
LU 158, 159, and 160, the South Jamaica Gateway  
Rezoning, an application by the New York City  
Department of Housing Preservation Development and  
several private applicants for a zoning map change, a  
zoning text amendment, and a designation of an urban  
development action area, approval of an urban  
development action area project, and disposition of  
City-owned property. These actions are to facilitate  
the development of two mixed-use residential

community facility buildings containing approximately  
143 affordable housing units in Jamaica, Queens in  
Speaker Adams' Council District and Council Member  
Dr. Williams' District.

Appearing today on this proposal is  
Annabelle Meunier, Senior Queens Planner of HPD, Jack  
Heaney, Founder and Principal of Fulcrum Properties,  
Bryan White, Chairman of Thomas White Jr. Foundation.

Those wishing to testify must register  
online visiting the Council's website at  
council.nyc.gov/landuse.

Counsel, will you please administer the  
affirmation?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists, would you  
please raise your right hand and state your name for  
the record?

ANNABELLE MEUNIER: Annabelle Meunier.

BRYAN WHITE: Bryan White.

JACK HEANEY: Jack Heaney.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And do you affirm to  
tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the  
truth in your testimony before this Subcommittee and  
in answer to all Council Member questions?

ANNABELLE MEUNIER: I do.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

BRYAN WHITE: I do.

JACK HEANEY: I do.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. For the viewing public, if you need an accessible version of this presentation, please send an email request to [landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov).

Now, the applicant team may begin.

ANNABELLE MEUNIER: Thank you and good morning, Chair Hanks and Members of the City Council Land Use Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings and Dispositions. Thank you, Chair Hanks. As you mentioned, my name is Annabelle Meunier, and I am a Senior Planner with HPD's Queens and Staten Island Planning Team in the Office of Neighborhood Strategies, and I'm here to present the South Jamaica Gateway Rezoning Project today, and I'm joined by Jack Heaney, Founder and Managing Principal of Fulcrum Properties, who is part of the development team for this project, as well as Bryan White, Chairman of the Thomas White Jr. Foundation, one of the non-profit partners for this project, and we're also joined today in the audience by Kevin Parris, Director of the Queens and Staten Island Planning at HPD as well as the other members of the development

1 team, Ira Brown, who is the Director of Development  
2 and General Counsel for the Briarwood Organization,  
3 and Bernard Warren, managing member of Moses Sole  
4 Realty as well as other HPD staff on this project who  
5 are present, and we thank you for the opportunity to  
6 present this project today. Next slide, please.

8 This is an application by the New York  
9 City Department of Housing Preservation and  
10 Development and the development team, which is a  
11 joint venture between Fulcrum Properties, the  
12 Briarwood Organization, and Moses Sole Realty and,  
13 importantly, the non-profit partners, the Godian  
14 Fellowship, and the Thomas White Jr. Foundation.  
15 Pastor Kendra Manigault represents the Godian  
16 Fellowship and could not make it in person but is  
17 observing remotely. Next slide, please.

18 This application was certified into ULURP  
19 on May 28, 2024. The proposed land use actions and  
20 proposed project are listed here, and we will go over  
21 these later in the presentation. Next slide, please.

22 The majority of this project area, as  
23 shown here, was zoned in its current designation of  
24 R5D with a C1-4 commercial overlay as part of the  
25 City-sponsored Jamaica Plan Rezoning, approved in

1  
2 September 2007. The Jamaica Plan was a comprehensive  
3 planning and rezoning strategy for a 368-block area  
4 designed to encourage the economic revitalization of  
5 downtown Jamaica as well as encourage the provision  
6 of affordable housing while preserving the adjoining  
7 residential homeowner neighborhoods. Prior to 2007,  
8 the rezoning area was zoned R4 with a C1-2 commercial  
9 overlay, which was the original zoning designation  
10 established in 1961 when the zoning resolution of the  
11 City of New York was first enacted. Next slide,  
12 please.

13           The two HPD-owned lots in the proposed  
14 project area were later included as part of the  
15 Revitalizing Neighborhoods New Infill Homeownership  
16 Opportunities Program, or NIHOP, and Neighborhood  
17 Construction Program, or NCP, request for  
18 qualifications, published in 2014. In 2018, this  
19 development team was awarded the cluster included in  
20 South Jamaica and later brought on their non-profit  
21 partners and worked with HPD to create a separate  
22 proposal and project plan that would facilitate the  
23 production of more affordable housing, helping meet a  
24 stated need in this area. Next slide, please.

1  
2           This slide shows the existing conditions  
3 on both sites. The project's objectives are to create  
4 a new R7A C1-4 district with MIH requirements that  
5 would allow for approximately 143 units of new low-  
6 income or workforce housing units on two  
7 underutilized commercial properties where no housing  
8 currently exists, to provide worship and office  
9 spaces for these two existing non-profit owners that  
10 have been providing worship and social services to  
11 South Jamaica for over 40 years, and finally to  
12 enhance the public realm along Tuskegee Airmen Way  
13 and Guy R. Brewer Boulevard with new streetscaping,  
14 including trees and street furniture, and community  
15 benefits would include Community Board 12 resident  
16 preference for 20 percent of the apartments, expanded  
17 community services, and M/WBE and local subcontractor  
18 hiring. Next slide, please.

19           Once again, the proposed actions as  
20 certified on May 28th are, number one, a zoning map  
21 amendment from R4, R5B, R5D, and R5D with a C1-4  
22 overlay to R7A with no change in the overlay for  
23 portions of block fronts on blocks 10129 and 10161,  
24 you can see the map comparison shown, the rezoning  
25 area is highlighted in yellow for visibility, number



two, a zoning text amendment to the New York City Zoning Resolution Appendix F, including inclusionary housing designated areas and Mandatory Inclusionary Housing areas to establish the rezoning area as a Mandatory Inclusionary Housing area and, number three, an urban development action area designation and approval of an urban development action area project for proposed development A, including the disposition of the City-owned portion of Development Site A, or Block 10161, Lots 3 and 9, to the developer. Next slide, please.

The two development sites for this proposal are shown here. Development Site A is located at 106-01 Guy R. Brewer Boulevard on the eastern side of the street and comprises Queens Block 10161 Lots 1, 3, and 9. Lot 1 is privately owned, and Lots 3 and 9 are City-owned under HPD jurisdiction. Lot 9 is not within the proposed rezoning area. And Site A is the site that would be subject to the UDAAP, and this site is located in Council District 27. Development Site B is located at 162-02 Tuskegee Airmen Way on the southern side of the street at the intersection of Union Hall Street and consists of three privately owned lots, Queens Block 10129 Lots

1  
2 1, 3, and 4, and this site is located in Council  
3 District 28.

4 I will now pass the presentation over to  
5 Jack Heaney, who will discuss the proposed  
6 developments and affordability and speak a little  
7 more on the non-profit partners.

8 JACK HEANEY: Thank you, Annabelle. So,  
9 zooming in on the development sites, Site A, which is  
10 the home of Godian Fellowship Church, this will be  
11 100 percent affordable senior housing, 79 units  
12 total, contained in a nine-story building that will  
13 be following AERS zoning rules. Oh, I'm sorry. Next  
14 slide, please. The gross square footage of the Site A  
15 is approximately 42,000 square feet. The ground floor  
16 will be activated by Godian Fellowship's new home,  
17 which will be approximately 4,000 square feet on the  
18 ground floor and cellar, interior recreation spaces  
19 for the senior residents as well as an outdoor garden  
20 space that's adjacent to the project. In addition to  
21 the housing units above, there will be several  
22 terraces and interior recreation spaces, again, for  
23 use by the senior residents. Next slide, please.

24 Site B is the home of the Thomas White  
25 Foundation. This will follow Mandatory Inclusionary

1 Housing zoning. It will be approximately 66 units,  
2 again, nine stories. The ground floor will be  
3 activated by Thomas White Foundation's new home with  
4 units above as well as several exterior terraces for  
5 resident recreation and a rooftop that's accessible  
6 as well. Thomas White's new home will be  
7 approximately 12,000 square feet on the ground floor  
8 and cellar, and there will be parking for  
9 approximately 16 spaces. Next slide, please.  
10

11           So, going back to Development Site A,  
12 this will be 100 percent affordable through HPD's  
13 SARA program, so all of the residents, all the units  
14 will have project-based vouchers. Within this mix,  
15 there will be 30 percent of the residents will be set  
16 aside for formerly homeless seniors who will be  
17 referred to the project through DHS and a non-profit  
18 social service provider. The remaining units will be  
19 set at approximately 40 percent AMI of income, but  
20 again, the project as a whole will be 100 percent  
21 project-based vouchers to ensure that the rent  
22 remains affordable for folks who are primarily on  
23 Social Security income. Next slide, please.

24           Development Site B, which is the Thomas  
25 White Foundation's home, this will be developed

1 through the NCP program, so this will be a  
2 multifamily mixed-income project. 15 percent of the  
3 units will be set aside for formerly homeless  
4 individuals. The bulk of the units will be set at 50  
5 percent of AMI, and the remaining will be at  
6 approximately 80 percent AMI. This will be a mix of  
7 studios, ones, twos, and three bedrooms to  
8 accommodate larger families in the neighborhood. Next  
9 slide, please.  
10

11 ANNABELLE MEUNIER: Thank you, Jack. This  
12 slide is just showing where we are in terms of ULURP.  
13 The project was reviewed and voted favorably by the  
14 Community Board, and I'll point out that the timeline  
15 was short in terms of ULURP, but this project has  
16 actually been in the making for many years, and the  
17 development team and the non-profit partners  
18 conducted thorough outreach with the community so the  
19 Board was pretty familiar with this application by  
20 the time of their vote, thank you to Bryan, and the  
21 project also received a favorable vote by Queens  
22 Borough President Donovan Richards' office and was  
23 approved unanimously by the City Planning Commission  
24 on September 11th. Next slide, please.  
25

1  
2                   This concludes our presentation. Thank  
3 you all for your time today.

4                   CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. I  
5 do have one question. The Borough President  
6 recommended a 30 percent M/WBE contracting goal. Does  
7 HPD have targets for reaching the M/WBE goal for  
8 contracting?

9                   JACK HEANEY: So both HPD and the  
10 developer team and the contractor team who is with us  
11 today intend to meet and exceed that goal of 30  
12 percent, and we'll be working in partnership,  
13 actually with the Thomas White Foundation. Bryan, I  
14 don't know if you want to say a few words about your  
15 job training programs.

16                   BRYAN WHITE: Yes. Good afternoon. The  
17 Thomas White Jr. Foundation, formerly J-CAP  
18 Foundation, founded by City Councilman Thomas White,  
19 the late Thomas White, has been involved in community  
20 empowerment for over 40 years. We are currently  
21 providing OSHA training and also computer  
22 professional training classes to the residents of the  
23 community to help them in a lot of the economic  
24 development that is going on in Southeast Queens  
25 right now. As a member of the JFK Redevelopment

1 Project, we are putting people on a list of job  
2 placement lists for the JFK Project through that, and  
3 also we are working with our developer team to make  
4 sure that the members of the community that can meet  
5 to help build our projects, both ours and the Godian,  
6 get the opportunity to do so so we are reaching out  
7 to the community and we do have an outreach program  
8 for that and a training program for that.

9  
10 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. I  
11 appreciate that answer.

12 Any of my colleagues, if you'd like to?

13 Seeing none, thank you. This applicant  
14 panel is now excused.

15 JACK HEANEY: Thank you for your time.

16 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you.

17 ANNABELLE MEUNIER: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Counsel, are there any  
19 members of the public who wish to testify on this  
20 item?

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Is there a Mr. Warren  
22 who is here to testify? Oh, okay, thank you. I just  
23 wanted to clarify on that.

24 Are there any other members of the  
25 public?

2                   There are no members of the public who  
3 wish to testify.

4                   CHAIRPERSON HANKS: With there be no other  
5 members of the public who wish to testify on LU-158,  
6 159, and 160, South Jamaica Queens Gateway rezoning,  
7 this public hearing is now closed.

8                   That concludes today's business. I would  
9 like to thank the members of the public, my  
10 Colleagues, Subcommittee Counsel, Land Use Staff, and  
11 the Sergeant-at-Arms for all your participation  
12 today.

13                   This meeting is hereby adjourned. [GAVEL]

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 8, 2024