

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND
WORKER PROTECTION

Jointly with the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

----- X

October 20, 2022
Start: 10:34 a.m.
Recess: 11:55 a.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway Committee Room,
16th floor

B E F O R E: Marjorie Velázquez, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Shaun Abreu
Erik D. Bottcher
Gale A. Brewer
Amanda Farias
Julie Menin
Chi A. Ossé
Linda Lee

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Michael Tiger
General Counsel
Dept of Consumer and Worker Protection

James Hurst
Deputy Commissioner of Enforcement
Dept of Consumer and Worker Protection

Inspector Robert LaPollo
Commanding Officer
N.Y.P.D. Auto Crime Unit

Michael Clark
Director of Legislative Affairs
New York Police Department

Paula Frendel
Director
New York Independent Auto Dealers Assoc.

Vic Bensen
Policy Analyst
City Meals on Wheels

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION
Jointly with the COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3

2 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Good morning. My name is
3 Marjorie Velázquez, and I'm the Chair of Committee on
4 Consumer and Worker Protection. I'd like to thank
5 everyone for joining us this hearing, joint with the
6 Committee on Public Safety, chaired by Camilla Hanks.

7 Today we will focus on the enforcement of the
8 city's laws pertaining to secondhand auto dealers and
9 issues of theft prevention, as well as two pieces of
10 related legislation. The first, Intro 525A in
11 relation to the purchase of catalytic converters
12 sponsored by Councilmember Brewer, and the second
13 Intro 759 in relation to the creation of a program to
14 distribute catalytic converter etching kits sponsored
15 by Councilmember Lee.

16 Used car dealerships are consistently one of the
17 most common sources of consumer complaints in the
18 city. The Department of Consumer and Worker
19 Protection licenses all dealers in secondhand goods.
20 Additionally, they issue a separate license carrying
21 with it additional responsibility to secondhand auto
22 dealers. Historically, used car dealers have
23 employed deceptive tactics such as bait-and-switch
24 advertising, issuing subprime auto loans, and failing
25 to make crucial disclosures to unknowing buyers.

2 Over the years the council has passed numerous
3 local laws to tighten relations pertaining to used
4 car dealers. We are interested in hearing from the
5 administration on enforcement of these local laws, as
6 well as whether there was any uptick in violations
7 pertaining to car purchases during the height of the
8 COVID-19 pandemic, as many New Yorkers found
9 themselves purchasing cars for the first time, and
10 price gouging prevailed in relation to various
11 consumer products. Relatedly, the committees seek to
12 address the issue of rampant theft of catalytic
13 converters in the city. Notably, we'd like a better
14 understanding of why these thefts are so prevalent
15 and what happens to these stolen car parts that make
16 it so valuable, and particularly, what if any role
17 the businesses licensed by DCWP, including secondhand
18 dealers, scrap metal processors, and auto wreckers
19 play in proliferating or curbing this theft.

20 Just this week the state took steps to address
21 this issue by passing legislation pertaining to
22 documentation and chain of custody issues regarding
23 the sale of catalytic converters. We'd like to do
24 our part at the local level by tying responsibility
25 to businesses licensed by the city and making sure

2 New Yorkers receive the most helpful tips and
3 protection from local law enforcement.

4 I'd like to thank central staff who helped
5 putting this hearing together, Wyam, Chad, and Josh.
6 Now I'd like to read a statement from Public Safety
7 Chair Hanks.

8 "Although I'm unable to join you today, I
9 want to thank my colleagues for having this
10 important and timely hearing. And particularly
11 I'd like to thank Chairperson of the Committee on
12 Consumer and Worker Protection, Marjorie
13 Velázquez for reading these comments on my
14 behalf. That's a little odd, y'all, but you
15 know, it's Thursday.

16 Today, our committees will be hearing two
17 bills, Intro 525 and Intro 759, both of which I'm
18 proud to be signed on to. Together these bills
19 seek to address the recent uptick in catalytic
20 converter thefts, which have become a pervasive
21 issue in our city, particularly car-reliant areas
22 like my district in Staten Island. In my
23 district office alone, we've received numerous
24 calls from residents who have either been the
25

2 victim of these crimes or fear that their vehicle
3 may be next.

4 During already difficult times. The economic
5 impacts of catalytic converter theft are
6 extremely burdensome on the average New Yorker
7 with replacements costing up to \$3,000, and
8 coupled with the economic impacts, catalytic
9 converter theft poses major environmental and
10 public health concerns since their purpose is to
11 convert harmful substances in our cars' exhaust
12 into safer and less toxic pollutants.

13 Intro 525 and Intro 759 serve as critical
14 efforts towards limiting the profitability and
15 feasibility of catalytic converter theft, the
16 distribution of these kits to etch identifying
17 numbers into catalytic converters coupled with
18 requiring the disclosure of where a seller got
19 the converter before they were able to sell it to
20 an auto body shop would work to both deter this
21 crime and bring bad actors who try to profit off
22 of illegal activity to justice. I'm grateful for
23 the collaboration with my colleagues on this
24 legislation, which I know will serve to improve
25 our city's public safety outcomes.

2 I look forward to hearing from those
3 testifying today. Now I'll turn it over to
4 Councilmember Brewer for some opening remarks.

5 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much. I
6 can tell you I don't own a car, and I don't know too
7 much about catalytic converters, but I have received
8 tons of complaints. And I mostly look forward to
9 hearing from the speakers who are going to be giving
10 us much more information today.

11 My understanding is that there are certain cars
12 that the catalytic converters are most able to be
13 stolen from and are best for sales. I know that the
14 governor, as you heard earlier, has come up with some
15 ideas. I think that hopefully what comes out of this
16 hearing is the best possible legislation. It may be
17 a combination of both, figuring out how we work with
18 the federal legislation. I think that the... the,
19 how we approach those who sell and how we approach
20 those who steal are two different entities that we
21 have to deal with. But more importantly, we have to
22 figure out what it is that we can do to stop the
23 literally instantaneously theft that takes place. I
24 know there was one block of my district that one
25 night, I think every single car that was relevant got

2 their catalytic converter stolen from. So the idea
3 is to listen. Obviously the information that we that
4 I'm still supporting says that they should not be
5 sold, and we should find a way to stop that. And
6 maybe the etching is another way to go about it. So
7 I'm here, all ears to hear what the best solution is.
8 But I do hope that as a result of this hearing, we do
9 have a solution, because I think the public is
10 looking to us to come up with how we can address it.
11 And thank you very much, Madam Chair.

12 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Now I'll turn it over to
13 Councilmember Lee for some opening remarks.

14 COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Good morning. And thank you
15 so much Chair Velázquez, and also virtually Chair
16 Hanks, if she's watching, and colleagues.

17 So I actually... My district is in a transit
18 desert, so we do rely heavily on cars. We have a lot
19 of cars that people use to get to either other modes
20 of transit or work on a daily basis. And you know,
21 this is happening very, very frequently, all over the
22 city, but our district... and plus I live right by
23 four major highways. I think I got the Clear View
24 the LIE, the Grand Central, and Cross Island. And so
25 traditionally, in that part of Queens, there has

2 always been a ton of theft when it comes to any sort
3 of car-related activities, because it's very easy to
4 hop on one of those highways. And it's... it's
5 insane how quickly people are able to take the
6 catalytic converters off the cars. And
7 unfortunately, this actually happened to one of our
8 staff. And, you know, on top of all the rising
9 costs, this is another burden that falls on a lot of
10 our constituents and city residents. And so, you
11 know, I'm proud... and thank you so much for having
12 me here today to talk about Intro 759. And I just
13 want to especially thank, you know, the officers and
14 attorneys at NYPD, at the City Council, and elsewhere
15 because we need your help and consulting with you to
16 refine the legislation and work on the bill. So I
17 look forward to hearing from your testimony today and
18 your insights on this. And thank you so much.

19 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: So I'd like to recognize
20 Councilmembers Abreu, De La Rosa, Joseph and min and,
21 and Menin as well.

22 And now we're going to get everyone their oath.

23 COUNSEL KINGSLEY: Good morning, everyone. I'm
24 Josh Kingsley, Counsel to the Public Safety
25 Committee. We're here for the Public Safety

2 Committee and Consumer Affairs hearing. From the
3 administration, we're going to have testimony from
4 DCWP and NYPD. I'm going to call your names, and if
5 you could just raise your right hand and affirm the
6 following.

7 We have Michael Tiger from DCWP, James Hurst from
8 DCWP, Inspector Michael Clark, and Inspector Robert
9 LaPollo. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
10 truth and nothing but the truth and your testimony
11 before this committee and the answer honestly to
12 Councilmember questions?

13 ALL: I do.

14 COUNSEL KINGSLEY: You may go ahead. Thank you
15 everyone.

16 MR. TIGER: Good morning Chair Velázquez Chair
17 Hanks virtually and members of the committee. My
18 name is Michael Tiger and I'm the General Counsel at
19 the Department of Consumer and Worker Protection.
20 Today I'm joined by DCWP's Deputy Commissioner of
21 Enforcement, James Hurst, and our colleagues from the
22 New York City Police Department.

23 Thank you for the opportunity to testify today on
24 secondhand auto dealers and Introduction 525 relating
25 to the purchase of catalytic inverters. DCWP licenses

2 secondhand automobile dealers, or SHADs, which are
3 businesses selling used automobile dealers and
4 separately, secondhand dealers general, or SHDG,
5 which are businesses that sell secondhand articles
6 such as, for example, a used catalytic converter. A
7 licensed SHAD does not need an SHDG license if it
8 only sells used cars.

9 DCWP currently licenses 522 SHADs across the five
10 boroughs. We receive a high number of complaints
11 related to activity at these businesses each year,
12 and in response, dedicate a high level of enforcement
13 resources to them. Last year, we conducted 439
14 inspections, and so far this year we have visited
15 licensed SHADs 353 times. Since 2018, we have
16 secured more than \$2 million in restitution for
17 consumers and almost \$5 million in civil penalties
18 from these businesses. Recently, we announced a
19 settlement with two businesses in Brooklyn in
20 response to numerous violations of city laws and
21 rules, which included protections against deceptive
22 practices. This settlement resulted in more than
23 \$300,000 in restitution for consumers and \$500,000 in
24 civil penalties. Separately, there are currently
25 3915 businesses holding SHDG licenses. This includes

2 140 licensed SHADs who also hold an SHDG license to
3 allow them to sell us goods other than used to
4 automobiles, such as a used catalytic converter.

5 Since 2018, we have received 216 complaints
6 regarding SHDGs, conducted 10,254 inspections, issued
7 1065 violations, and recovered more than \$1 million
8 in restitution and civil penalties concerning the
9 SHDGs. Both the SHAD and SHDG licenses include
10 explicit record keeping requirements for the dealer.
11 Specifically, any licensee buying or selling a
12 secondhand article must keep a written record of the
13 transaction, including a description of the item sold
14 and information about the person from whom the
15 purchase or sale was made. Additionally, a SHAD
16 licensee selling a vehicle must record its vehicle
17 identification number or VIN, the details about its
18 removal from the dealership, the driver license
19 information of the purchaser, and the address to
20 where the vehicle is removed, among other required
21 records. Licensees must share records about these
22 purchases with the NYPD and other law enforcement
23 agencies at their request.

24 Today's legislation Intro 525 is aimed at
25 preventing the theft of catalytic converters which as

2 you'll hear from our colleagues at the NYPD has
3 markedly increased in recent years. Introduction 525
4 would require SHDG and SHAD licensees that purchase a
5 catalytic converter to obtain information about the
6 vehicle from which the catalytic converter was
7 removed and a copy of documentation proving ownership
8 of the vehicle on the part from the seller. This
9 information would have to be made available to DCWP,
10 NYPD, and the Fire Department upon inspection. DCWP
11 supports this legislation to the extent that NYPD
12 believes its passage will aid their investigations by
13 enabling the city to better track instances of
14 catalytic converter theft.

15 We look forward to working with Council during
16 the legislative process on this bill.

17 Thank you for the opportunity to testify today
18 regarding our licensees and related legislation. We
19 greatly appreciate Council's partnership and look
20 forward to answering any questions you may have.

21 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Good morning Chair Velázquez
22 and members of the council. I am Inspector Robert
23 LaPollo, the Commanding Officer of the NYPD Auto
24 Crime Unit. I am joined here today by Michael Clark,
25 the NYPD's Director of Legislative Affairs, Michael

2 Tiger, and James Hurst from the Department of
3 Consumer and Worker Protection. On behalf of Police
4 Commissioner Keechant Sewell, I am pleased to testify
5 before your committee regarding Intros 525A and 759
6 under consideration today, and the growing problem of
7 catalytic converter theft.

8 The theft of catalytic converters has become
9 nothing short of an automotive epidemic over the last
10 few years. In 2018, there were 1298 reported deaths
11 of catalytic converters in the United States. In
12 2019, there were 3389. In 2020, the number jumped to
13 14,433. And in 2021, there were more than 52,000
14 such thefts. That is more than a 3900% increase
15 nationwide since 2018. And unfortunately, there is
16 no sign that this is slowing down. In New York City
17 we have experienced a similar spike. In 2018, 198
18 catalytic converters were stolen. In 2019, it was
19 211. In 2020, it was 802. And in 2021, there were
20 3705, a 1771% increase from 2018.

21 So far this year, there have been 7334 such
22 thefts compared to 2285 at the same point last year,
23 a 220% increase.

24 The significant increase in thefts is driven
25 largely by the surging value of three metals that are

2 found in catalytic converters, rhodium, palladium,
3 and platinum. At the beginning of 2018, rhodium cost
4 about \$1,700 per ounce, palladium cost about \$1,000
5 per ounce, and platinum was just under \$1,000 per
6 ounce. At their peak, rhodium was worth as much as
7 \$29,000 per ounce, palladium \$3,400 an ounce, and
8 platinum over \$1,300 per ounce.

9 Today, rhodium sells for nearly \$14,000 per
10 ounce, palladium sells for a little bit more than
11 \$2,000 per ounce and platinum sells for just under
12 \$1,000 an ounce. At these prices the financial
13 incentive simply has become too great with unethical
14 scrap yards and other buyers paying \$250 or more for
15 one catalytic converter. Stealing catalytic
16 converters is not difficult. These use commonly
17 available power tools to extract the catalytic
18 converter from the underside of a car. For only a
19 few minutes of work thieves earn hundreds of dollars
20 while victims pay thousands. Crude extraction
21 methods cause substantial damage to the car costing
22 victims thousands to repair on top of the substantial
23 cost to replace the catalytic converters. These
24 crimes are also difficult to solve. Most catalytic
25 converters lack unique identifiers. As a result,

2 they are all interchangeable, making it impossible to
3 prove that a converter sold to a scrapyard is the
4 same converter that was stolen from a victim's car.

5 Prior to turning my attention to the bills being
6 heard today, I would like to thank the Council for
7 your help in deterring these criminals from

8 victimizing hardworking New Yorkers. Intro 525A

9 would require that secondhand dealers or anyone who
10 purchases catalytic converters for commercial use

11 collect information on the vehicle that it was

12 removed from, as well as proof that the seller either

13 owns the vehicle or was otherwise authorized to

14 remove the catalytic converter. Records of these

15 transactions must be maintained for at least five

16 years.

17 The Department supports the intent of the

18 legislation and we look forward to working with the

19 council to pass the most effective version of this

20 bill. Increased record keeping is of course welcome

21 and would assist in deterring catalytic converter

22 thefts. Requiring proof of ownership and long-term

23 record keeping will limit the purchase and sale of

24 stolen catalytic converters, when we have seen

25 similar pawn shop and secondhand dealer record

2 keeping requirements provide a strong deterrent to to
3 purchasing the stolen property at these
4 establishments. Additionally, this bill would align
5 with the goals of Chapter 574 of the laws of 2022.
6 signed earlier this week by governor Governor Hochul,
7 which requires increased record keeping by vehicle
8 dismantlers and scrap yards when purchasing a
9 catalytic converter. Intro 759 would require the
10 NYPD and the Department of Transportation to
11 establish a program to distribute etching kits in
12 order to enable vehicle dealers to etch unique
13 identifiers on catalytic converters. It would also
14 require that the department distribute etching kits
15 to the public and assist in using such kits.
16 Finally, it would require that the department engage
17 in outreach, informing the public of the efforts to
18 curb catalytic converter theft.

19 The existence of unique identifiers on items that
20 are susceptible to theft is a powerful tool, which
21 enables law enforcement to identify and trace stolen
22 property. For several years, the department has
23 offered such a service for items prone to theft such
24 as smartphones and laptop computers, bikes, and on
25 car windows free of charge. In October, the

2 department began our own catalytic converter etching
3 program in Queens with further initiatives in
4 Brooklyn, Staten Island, and Manhattan. Tomorrow, we
5 will host a catalytic converter etching event in the
6 Orchard Beach parking lot in the Bronx from 12pm to
7 4pm. Officers etch the unique code on a person's
8 catalytic converter at no cost to the member of the
9 public. So far the department has provided etching
10 for nearly 2000 vehicles. Having a unique identifier
11 on the catalytic converter assists our investigators
12 in linking a person who sold a catalytic converter to
13 the theft of the converter.

14 As the etching program expands, so too will our
15 ability to identify the criminals driving the spike
16 in converter thefts. Currently, the department is
17 exploring expanding this pilot to make it a citywide
18 program available in every precinct, provided that
19 additional funding is made available to support this
20 initiative.

21 Total reliance on the NYPD to conduct etching is
22 an imperfect method to get the roughly 3 million
23 registered cars in the city etched. As such, it is
24 important that we collectively explore whether the
25 solution lies in city, state, or federal law,

2 additional touch points where catalytic converters
3 can be etched.

4 The NYPD stands ready to do its part in combating
5 these steps, and we look forward to continuing to
6 work with the council to address this issue. Thank
7 you for this opportunity to speak before you today,
8 and we look forward to answering any questions you
9 may have.

10 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Thank you. So we'd like
11 to begin with our questions. So going to DCWP: Does
12 DCWP license scrap metal processors as part of its
13 second hand licensing scheme? Or is this a separate
14 license issued pursuant to state law?

15 MR. TIGER: It's the latter Chair. There's a
16 separate scrap metal processor law pursuant to a
17 state law. And the structure of the licensing scheme
18 is actually a bit different.

19 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Can you explain?

20 MR. TIGER: Yeah. I mean, the... So this body
21 has passed various laws within the administrative
22 code for like secondhand dealer general licensees.
23 As I said, the scrap metal processing... and those
24 are enforceable by our agency. Some of them are
25 consumer protection. Some of them are record keeping

2 provisions that are there to ensure that NYPD has the
3 information that they need when they conduct a
4 criminal investigation. Scrap metal processors under
5 state law... We license them, and there are record
6 keeping requirements, but the record keeping
7 requirements are not enforced by DCWP.

8 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: And then the same for
9 auto wreckers.

10 MR. TIGER: We don't license auto wreckers as
11 auto wreckers.

12 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Okay. Thank you. So
13 DCWP has received over 5000 complaints about this
14 industry which has led to over 3300 inspections. How
15 does DCWP determine whether a complaint should move
16 to the inspection stage? And what is the likely
17 timeframe for these inspections?

18 MR. TIGER: When we talk we're talking about
19 SHADs now, secondhand automobile dealers. So we're
20 not talking about the catalytic converter issue.
21 We're talking about the used car dealerships.

22 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Yes. Yeah. The second
23 hand... yeah, the SHADs.

24 MR. TIGER: Generally... Well, we do... We put
25 in a lot of resources, both from our... our

2 enforcement division, who our patrol inspectors, that
3 my colleague, Mr. Hurst here, overseas and from the
4 lawyers in our General Counsel division. So we spend
5 a lot of resources. We actually get many complaints,
6 as you alluded to, Chair Velázquez, and we take
7 almost all of them very seriously. And if consumers
8 give us the information that there's been a violation
9 of the SHAD laws and rules, we will take a look at
10 that, and we will make a decision about whether it
11 makes sense to be pursued through an inspection
12 through our enforcement division, or as part of a
13 broader investigation helmed by one of our lawyers in
14 our General Counsel Division.

15 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: What are the most common
16 violations issued to the SHADs?

17 MR. TIGER: Overcharging. Breach of contract...
18 It is called Contract Cancel, but that means
19 essentially the goods... the car was not provided in
20 the condition that was promised. We get a lot of
21 complaints about cars being parked on the street.
22 That's different than... sort of from a consumer
23 protection standpoint. That's people in the
24 community complaining that a dealership is using the
25 public space in a way they shouldn't. We get

2 unlicensed activity complaints. Those are our
3 biggest complaints that we get.

4 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: And how many violations
5 have been issued to the SHADs in... during 2022.

6 MR. TIGER: I think the latest numbers would have
7 been 101 violations issued in 2022.

8 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: And what were they in
9 2021?

10 MR. TIGER: Uh, 115.

11 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: So we're looking to
12 surpass it by the end of this year.

13 MR. TIGER: Yeah. It's possible.

14 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Did consumer complaints
15 pertaining to use car dealers increase during COVID?
16 And was price gouging an issue in this industry?

17 MR. TIGER: Consumer complaints have... have been
18 pretty steady for From a pre and post-pandemic
19 standpoint. They... Over the last five years, the
20 high was actually in 2018 at 1136. But every year
21 has had at least at least 850. We're at 620 at most
22 recent count from 2022, but we obviously still have
23 several months to go.

24 So we didn't necessarily see a spike during the
25 pandemic, but it's been a consistent drumbeat,

2 frankly, as it always has been about complaints
3 regarding this industry.

4 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: And have there been
5 improvements in recent years with the industry
6 compliance with transparency and fair dealing
7 disclosure requirements enforced by DCWP?

8 MR. TIGER: I... I mean... I think that we have
9 definitely seen an array of the level of compliance
10 across the industry. There are, of course,
11 dealerships that are very much adhering to a sort of
12 culture of compliance that we're trying to build with
13 the regulated community. And of course, there are
14 other actors where we receive a lot of complaints,
15 and then we try to act and make sure that consumers
16 get the money returned to them, and that we send a
17 message that we are going to take action against
18 dealerships that break the city's laws and rules.

19 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: And what kind of
20 documentation is maintained by these various SHADs to
21 show chain of custody of the items they sell? And
22 how often do you guys inspect it?

23 MR. TIGER: Well, I mean, under the secondhand
24 article law, which combines both the SHAD and the
25 SHDG licensing scheme that I described in our

2 testimony, there are certain documents that they have
3 about the basic facts of the transaction, that have
4 to be recorded and made accessible to us, and to PD
5 and other law enforcement agencies.

6 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: So now that you brought
7 NYPD into the cameras, does NYPD alert DCWP when
8 arrests and investigations indicate a licensed entity
9 was selling stolen property?

10 MR. TIGER: I don't... We don't have a sort of
11 constant give and take on that, but we have
12 definitely over the years been alerted about licensee
13 misconduct by PD and we're always willing to work
14 with PD in any joint investigation that they think
15 would help their prosecution of criminal offenses by
16 licensees.

17 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: I'd like to take two
18 seconds to recognize Councilmember Stevens,
19 Councilmember Cabán, Councilmember Ossé, and Ariola,
20 that's joining us virtually. Yeah, I said, Stevens.
21 Uh-huh. I'm not going to forget my Bronx peeps.

22 So going back to what you mentioned about no
23 constant give and take, can we expand on why does
24 that not happen? Is there anything preventing you
25 guys from having a more...

2 MR. TIGER: Well, we... I'm sorry Chair. It's
3 important to remember that we're not a criminal
4 enforcement agency. So it's more if... if the police
5 department identifies an issue where they can where
6 we can be of assistance to them in an individual case
7 may make sense for them. And I can't speak for them.
8 But... But it may make sense for them to reach out
9 to us, of course, we're always willing to help.
10 We're obviously a civil enforcement agency. We make
11 sure that the licensees are keeping the records that
12 are detailed in the administrative code. So when
13 there comes time for criminal investigation, the
14 licensees can provide it to the police department.
15 And we find that that's the best way. And also...
16 I'm sorry. NYPD can also check the records on their
17 own. They don't need to rely on us necessarily. So
18 there actually is sort of an efficient system already
19 in place where there doesn't have to be sort of a
20 weekly check in on the ship.

21 MR. CLARK: Right. And I just wanted to follow
22 up, I think it's accurate to say that we will
23 certainly... When we find another agency that has an
24 enforcement tool that we don't have necessarily, like
25 we will loop them in to see what they can do to help.

2 Right? So if it's a problematic licensee, we'll see
3 if they can do... what they need to help maybe
4 suspend a license or whatever they can do on the
5 civil end while we do the criminal end. So that...
6 that does happen whenever we can identify those
7 things. But Michael's right. We do have the ability
8 work on our own and we rely on them to make sure that
9 the record keeping is... the stores are on top of
10 their record keeping. So when we need it for our
11 criminal investigation, it's there.

12 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: And so how many instances
13 has an investigation led into auto shops for the
14 possession of stolen property? Led to any arrests or
15 fines?

16 MR. TIGER: Well, arrests I would have to defer
17 to my colleagues at the police department.

18 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: That would be a number we'd
19 have to look up and we'd get back to you with.

20 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Okay, I'd appreciate it.
21 And then lastly, does DCWP support additional
22 documentation requirements for the purchase of
23 catalytic converters given the prevalence of theft of
24 those parts?

2 MR. TIGER: Well, we support any... any
3 requirements that PD believes will help with them
4 their criminal investigation of these matters, we
5 would be supportive of.

6 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Does DCWP support
7 violations of such requirements having some sort of
8 effect on the purchaser's ability to do business with
9 the city?

10 MR. TIGER: I'd have to give that a little more
11 thought. I'd have to have a little bit of
12 understanding about what that would mean for... Are
13 you saying that... if their contractor with the city?

14 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Right, and does it affect
15 it? If there's some effect with it?

16 MR. TIGER: I think we would want to talk
17 internally with our colleagues at other agencies that
18 really handle the contracting for the city.

19 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Thank you for that. And
20 now, NYPD: How many individuals have been arrested
21 by NYPD for theft of catalytic converters? And in
22 what are the charges?

23 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Well, so far this year, there
24 have been, excuse me... there have been 53 People
25 that have been arrested, with a total of 139 total

2 arrests, meaning some were charged with multiple
3 arrests. The charges usually stem from grand larceny
4 to petty larceny and criminal mischief, for the most
5 part. Also possession of burglars tools when we
6 catch them with the tools that they use to cut the
7 catalytic converters out of the cars.

8 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: How many stolen catalytic
9 converters have been recovered by y'all?

10 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: That's a number we'd have to
11 that's in a movie, we'd have to try to find out if we
12 can identify. They're... Because they're not marked,
13 it's difficult to say they were stolen.

14 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: How many... Are there
15 certain precincts experiencing higher rates of
16 catalytic converter theft than others? And if so,
17 where?

18 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Well, I do have it broken
19 down by borough. We don't have the specific
20 precincts.

21 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Can I get precincts
22 afterwards?

23 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Perfect.
25

2 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: But currently, right now
3 we're seeing the largest increases in... in the
4 Bronx, Brooklyn South, Queens both north and south.
5 Those are the ones that are driving the spike. But
6 it's not unique... It's not unique to those
7 boroughs. It's actually occurring everywhere in the
8 city.

9 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: What measures does the
10 department take in responding to these localized
11 patterns of reported theft?

12 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Well, every incident that was
13 reported is investigated. And we tried to determine
14 if there are patterns that we can find that a group
15 of individuals are responsible for multiple catalytic
16 converter thefts. So we... Whenever we get a
17 complaint that comes in, we investigate the complaint
18 and we try to we try to make an arrest on that
19 complaint, if it's possible.

20 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: What's the timeline with
21 that? If I make a complaint... Someone just stole
22 it. Now I'm out \$3,000? How soon can I expect you
23 to apprehend someone or get someone?

24 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: That would depend on the
25 specific circumstance. Because if we have a witness

2 that said that somebody just came and cut the
3 catalytic converter out of their car, and they're
4 able to identify, it would be an immediate arrest.
5 But most likely, usually what happens is, we end up
6 seeing surveillance video, and we have to work
7 backwards. And depending upon the quality and the
8 availability of witnesses, it may take some time to
9 come to a conclusion.

10 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Is there value in
11 alerting local residents of this pattern of theft?
12 And how can we raise awareness?

13 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Yes, I believe there is. I
14 believe, by alerting the residents, they may be able
15 to take measures such as signing up for our
16 identifier program, where we are putting the unique
17 serial number on each catalytic converter. So we
18 encourage that the members of the public be aware.
19 Also, just to be aware of the what is happening in
20 and of itself, will give people an idea to maybe park
21 their car, if they have the availability of a
22 driveway, maybe to park it in...

23 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: There are no driveways in
24 Manhattan.

2 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Right. That's why I'm saying
3 if they have the ability to do so. But also just to
4 be aware, and to understand that there is this
5 activity occurring and maybe what to look for.

6 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: And so, does the
7 department increased patrols in the areas with these
8 higher rates of catalytic converter theft?

9 MR. CLARK: Yeah, and I think that's something we
10 typically do we you know, all the precinct commanders
11 are looking at all the data of crime data in their
12 area, and if they see patterns in certain areas, they
13 will send more officers to those areas, not just
14 catalytic converter thefts, but all crime in the
15 precinct. So, that is something every precinct
16 commander is frequently doing to try and make sure...
17 if they if it's identified that this is a location,
18 they will have increased resources at those at those
19 places.

20 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Can you explain the work
21 of the auto Crime Unit? And how is it structured?
22 And what are the types of investigation it conducts?

23 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Sure, The Auto Crime Unit
24 predominantly investigates organized groups of
25 individuals that steal cars for profit. And when I

2 say by for profit, it's usually... they will change
3 the VIN numbers, the vehicle identification number on
4 the vehicle, so that they can sell it either to
5 people who are aware or unsuspecting buyers, that
6 don't realize that they're purchasing a stolen car.
7 Also vehicles that are being exported out of the
8 country in shipping containers. So we predominantly
9 work on those types of cases. However, we also look
10 into large scale parts theft as well. So if we have
11 a ring that we are aware of that is selling catalytic
12 converters, and possibly shipping them out of the
13 state, we try to identify them and investigate them
14 and bring them... have them arrested as well.

15 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: To what extent does the
16 NYPD investigate the SHADs and scrap metal processors
17 or even auto records for possessing and selling
18 stolen property?

19 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: When we have an investigation
20 ongoing that involves one of those locations, we will
21 go in and inspect the records of those of those
22 establishments to determine if the record keeping is
23 is being kept properly, if certain... certain things
24 are required to be entered into a database, and make
25 sure that these vehicles that are being brought in

2 that they are entered into the database. When
3 catalytic converters are being brought in to a scrap
4 yard or a recycler, we make sure that they have the
5 required paperwork, the documentation, that is... the
6 person who is selling that to the scrapyard has
7 supplied to them with their identification and that
8 they have input this into the system.

9 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: And how many
10 investigations have resulted in the seizure of
11 stolen... stolen catalytic converters?

12 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Um, I would have to get that
13 number to you.

14 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Do you guys use
15 administrative subpoenas to conduct searches of auto
16 body shops?

17 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Not necessarily. We are
18 allowed to under the DMV rules to inspect certain
19 books and records that they possess to ensure that
20 they're in compliance?

21 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: What's the typical
22 process for stripping and selling valuable metals
23 from stolen catalytic converters?

24 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Well, the process would be
25 that somebody would actually go out and remove the

2 catalytic converter from the vehicle. They would
3 bring the cat... -- this is the traditional method --
4 they would be they would bring the catalytic
5 converter to a scrap yard, the scrap yard would -- as
6 long as they don't... it's not indicated that it's a
7 stolen item -- would take the documentation required
8 from the person who's selling it to them, upload it
9 into their system and pay for the catalytic
10 converter. Currently, what we're seeing is a little
11 bit of a shift, whereas the people who are actually
12 stealing them are bringing them to say, a middleman
13 type of situation where we have them collecting
14 catalytic converters from the thieves, and then what
15 they'll do is they'll load up a truck or a van full
16 of catalytic converters, and then bring them to a
17 scrap processor within the city or outside of the
18 city.

19 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Do you believe that
20 there's a market for stolen parts in local secondhand
21 auto shops?

22 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: For them to purchase stolen
23 parts?

24 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Yes.

25

2 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: I... I do believe that if...
3 I've seen in the past that they have taken in stolen
4 parts, and they have tried to conceal the fact that
5 they were stolen. I don't know if it's as prevalent
6 as it has been in the past, because of the
7 inspections we have done in the past. We haven't
8 really seen stolen parts going into auto shops as
9 much as... lately, as we have in the past.

10 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: And you had mentioned in
11 your statement about my district tomorrow, Orchard
12 Beach, we're going to have you guys do the etching.
13 Can you provide a description of what the initiative
14 is and how many cars you do get to do in that amount
15 of time?

16 MR. CLARK: Okay, sure. We... What we'll do is
17 we'll set up in a location such as Orchard Beach
18 parking lot, and what we're going to do is I'll have
19 my members of my unit, they have the technical
20 expertise to do this. They will apply to each
21 vehicle, an etching kit, which has two stickers.
22 Some cars have two catalytic converters, and what
23 this does is they'll place the etching... the
24 sticker... the label onto the catalytic converter,
25 wipe it with a reactive agent, and that will embed

2 the number it's a unique serial number into the
3 catalytic converter of the part. So what we're
4 looking to do is have three stations where the
5 residents can pull up, and we can safely jack up the
6 vehicle so we can get underneath as soon as it cools
7 down... -- the part is very hot -- as soon as it
8 cools down and apply this sticker, it also has a
9 window sticker to inform people that the catalytic
10 converter has been etched as a deterrent to thieves.
11 And then it really should take no more... once we are
12 able to do it no more than 5 or 10 minutes per car.
13 And then they can be on their way with their... with
14 their catalytic converter etched.

15 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Are you... Are there
16 plans to expand this program, by the way?

17 MR. CLARK: So I think that's something our Crime
18 Prevention Division is trying to figure out. And
19 what we want to do is see if we can do one that's a
20 little bit more efficient and more cost effective,
21 that we can, you know, etch more catalytic
22 converters. So, I think these cost about \$10 each.
23 So right now they're testing other options to see if
24 there's a better way, and a quicker way and a more
25 cost effective way. So that's something we're

2 looking at right now, and hopefully, we can figure
3 out a way to get more cars and be better at it.

4 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: And how do you raise
5 awareness of these initiatives? Besides like people
6 like myself, like retweeting and sharing on socials?
7 Do you mention it during precinct council meetings?
8 How do you work with local precincts to make sure

9 that this... that folks and residents are aware

10 MR. CLARK: We work with the community affairs
11 folks for each borough, and that they, with their
12 contacts provide the information to get the word out.
13 We rely on them to have everybody know where the
14 event is, so that my team can actually do the
15 installation.

16 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Now, does the NYPD
17 support Intro 759 which seeks to codify the etching
18 program?

19 MR. CLARK: Yeah, so I think we, we support
20 etching as a general matter. So we... we're excited
21 to see it in legislation. I think what we would need
22 to figure out and work with you and Councilmember Lee
23 is... is how to effectively touch the most vehicles
24 as possible. So I think that's... that's a great
25 start, and we should work on that, and it's stuff

2 we're doing anyway. But we should, how do we get the
3 most catalytic converters etched as possible? And
4 that's sort of what we need to figure out together,
5 and the legislation that will make that happen,
6 whether it's... And what the city can do, some of it
7 may be federal or state laws, but where the city can
8 interact is, you know, so that... The idea of
9 etching we support and how to make that work, how to
10 make that as broad as possible.

11 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Do you have any suggested
12 or recommended changes to the legislation right now?

13 MR. CLARK: So I think, you know, a few things.
14 So and I mentioned -- you know, it's not necessarily
15 the City Council bill -- but I think a federal bill
16 that would help is... there is a federal law that
17 requires certain car parts to be etched with the VIN.
18 It's doors, bumpers, hoods, engines. I think,
19 globally, and that's necessarily here. But globally,
20 if we could figure out a way... or if the... if
21 Congress could act and make that mandatory for cars
22 across the nation, because even if we figured out a
23 way to hit every car in New York City, or every car
24 in New York State, there's still cars coming from
25 Pennsylvania, New Jersey, Connecticut, that won't

2 have those protections. So I think that's probably
3 the most efficient. But short of that, I think there
4 are ways, and you know, we touched upon it in, in the
5 bill of new cars, and used car dealerships, and, you
6 know, maybe ways to figure out how to make sure that
7 they're doing it, rather than just distributing kits
8 and making sure that it's happening.

9 I think one thing we would suggest is also
10 penalty coupling it with a penalty, so that if you
11 destroy the etching, or if yo...u you know, in some
12 way, remove it, that's its own penalty, because
13 that's something... you know, and that penalty exists
14 for other parts. So those are a few things that to
15 explore. And, you know, I'm... at least in the city
16 level.

17 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: And you kind of hinted at
18 it... Do you support efforts to distribute catalytic
19 converter etching kits to car dealerships, and you
20 kind of refer to... but if you can...

21 MR. CLARK: Yeah, I think to the extent they have
22 it, and actually the state, you know, at least for
23 new car dealerships, they in their bill, require them
24 to have it as an option. So I think... I do think it
25 is... Now if we get every car sold, etched. That's

2 a slow way to get there. But it is a way to get
3 there eventually. So I do think it makes a lot of
4 sense to, you know, work with that point. That's a
5 touch point where we can start getting a lot of cars
6 etched with unique codes.

7 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Thank you. I also want
8 to recognize Councilmember Holden, who has joined us.
9 And I'd like to turn it over to Councilmember Brewer,
10 who has several questions.

11 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much. I...
12 One thing that isn't directly related to 525, but I
13 had a question, which is when you talk about paper,
14 or keeping track: Is that really paper? And is that
15 something that could be changed so that it would be
16 mandated that they would keep track of what they need
17 to keep track of electronically? That would maybe
18 help, so you don't have to go look at the paper in
19 the office? Or is it really electronically... uh...
20 record keeping?

21 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Most of it is electronic.

22 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: It is?

23 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Yes.

24 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: But... But some of it is
25 paper? In other words, I'm just trying to see... you

2 couldn't have a better sense of some of the data by
3 everyone being electronic? It's not really relevant,
4 but it is relevant if you're trying to catch the bad
5 guys.

6 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Yes. All the information
7 that I've seen has come electronically, printed out.

8 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Okay. So it's not a...
9 because the way you talked about I was a little
10 nervous.

11 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Well, there were some...
12 there were some issues in in repair shops, where they
13 actually keep paper records.

14 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: So could that be changed,
15 do you think? Or is that not relevant to the
16 catalytic converter issue? Not as much?

17 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: At this point, I don't think
18 it's as relevant.

19 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Okay. It might be
20 somebody to look at for Consumer Affairs though,
21 keeping them electronic.

22 The other question I have is, do the insurance
23 companies... Obviously, if you get it stolen, you're
24 going to call your insurance company, and then you
25 have a long haul. Are you in touch with them? Are

2 they helpful in this discussion in terms of figuring
3 out how they can keep track of some of their
4 requests, et cetera? I'm just trying to think of all
5 the angles to get at these... this situation.

6 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Yes, we work with this
7 closely with the National Crime Insurance Bureau to
8 ensure that all the bases are covered when it comes
9 to these... these occurrences.

10 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: So they keep track of the
11 specifics in terms of filings for catalytic
12 conversion. I'm just wondering if that's another
13 avenue to...

14 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: I can't speak for how they
15 keep their records, but I'm sure that they are... are
16 able to get that information from the insurance
17 companies.

18 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Okay. Wouldn't that be
19 helpful with us trying to figure out exactly where
20 the problems are? Or it's not relevant?

21 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Well, we know where the
22 problems are through the reporting system.

23 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Okay. Because the
24 insurance company might add to it. That's what I'm
25 trying to say.

2 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Sure.

3 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Okay. The other thing I
4 have is... question is: On the legislation, is there
5 a specific type of car that... or is it across the
6 board in terms of the catalytic converters? In other
7 words, are there certain cars that are more demand by
8 the thieves?

9 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Yes, there are.

10 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Because that is my
11 understanding. Because people say, my car didn't get
12 stolen, but my neighbor's did, and it's a different
13 kind of car.

14 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: That's correct. The thieves
15 are aware of which catalytic converters from which
16 vehicles to take, which would give them the most
17 money the resale value. They are also aware that if
18 someone's catalytic converter has been replaced, that
19 that catalytic converter isn't worth as much as one
20 that came on the car originally, so they bypass that
21 as well.

22 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Okay. Do you... Can you
23 give us a sense of which cars are more prone to
24 thievery?

25

2 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: I can tell you absolutely the
3 Toyota Prius was one of them. It because it has two
4 catalytic converters in a line. So it's basically
5 all they have to do is make two cuts. It's quick,
6 and now they have two catalytic converters. So that
7 was highly sought after.

8 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: That's definitely what I
9 have heard. The same thing.

10 In terms of 525, I appreciate the general
11 support. Are there ways that you think that it could
12 be improved, obviously... and also, how does... I
13 know you mentioned how the... Governor Hochul... or
14 the state law plays a role. But if you could just
15 add anything that 525 should also include and how
16 does this fit in with the state legislation?

17 MR. CLARK: Yeah, I think it...

18 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: This guy is one of my
19 heroes. We went listening to noise together.
20 [Laughter] Noisy police cars. We had a great time
21 together.

22 MR. CLARK: Yeah, I think... I think... So it
23 pairs nicely, in the sense that they're... they're
24 complementary, you know, legislation. So the state
25 legislation is going to increase the amount of record

2 keeping for the scrap processors, and I think this
3 complements that and increases it for the... the
4 second hand dealers, right? So I think... So I
5 think that's good. I think, you know, like you said,
6 making some of it, making sure it comes
7 electronically into the electronic system is a good
8 ideas. I think, you know, making sure to the extent
9 we have etching and we have unique numbers, that that
10 is also something that's collected, just to
11 thinking... but you know, we certainly want to work
12 with you on making sure that's... whatever...
13 whatever else is in there will get in there. But
14 that is two things that we're thinking.

15 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Okay. And do you have a
16 sense of the persons who are apprehended? Do they
17 return? Is there any sense of... How many is it
18 like... you know, we always hear there are 50 people
19 committing all the crimes in New York City. I'm just
20 making up numbers. But it's obviously a ring, I
21 would assume. Is there some way that you can even
22 attack it now, as opposed to... we obviously want to
23 make it harder for them? And hopefully, this
24 legislation will do that. But is it something that
25 is sold online? In other words, told people online?

2 Or is it just the metals are given to the way in
3 which you described? What... what's the status of
4 these thieves, kind of what I'm trying to get at?

5 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Well, the thieves, the
6 thieves have expanded because of the knowledge of
7 this. So there are more thieves today than there had
8 been in the past. It used to be more of a specialty
9 type of crime, because of you had to know what you
10 were looking for, you had to know how to remove it,
11 and you're not had to know where to bring it to get
12 paid.

13 Now, there are... the thieves have their
14 middleman let's say. Those people are advertising,
15 either word of mouth or maybe social media. And the
16 thieves know that they can meet up with these people
17 at a certain location, which is happening frequently.
18 That's when the thieves will bring this... the
19 catalytic converters to the thief with a van that
20 has, you know... we've seen as much as 50 catalytic
21 converters in a van. Last week, we had an incident
22 with 25 in a pickup truck. Unfortunately, none of
23 them are identifiable. So it's very difficult. And
24 just to give you a sense of how my unit investigates,
25 we actually look for complaint reports throughout the

2 city to see where the catalytic converters was stolen
3 from. And then what we'll do is we try to figure out
4 which kind of car it came from, go to that person.
5 Hopefully, they reported it timely, and that they
6 didn't have the car repaired immediately. And we
7 will actually go under the car and try to fit the
8 piece. It's like almost a puzzle piece to where the
9 cuts were. So we can identify and now testify in
10 court that yes, this catalytic converter came from
11 that vehicle. So now out of the 25 that we had last
12 week, we have one that we can identify as stolen.

13 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: I appreciate that. I
14 think the bottom line is we've got to solve this
15 problem, because that's an insane amount of staffing.
16 Yeah. And terrific that NYP is doing it. But let's
17 all work together to solve the problem. Thank you
18 very much.

19 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: I'd like to recognize
20 Councilmember Bottcher. And I also would like to
21 pass it over to Councilmember Menin for her
22 questions.

23 COUNCILMEMBER MENIN: Thank you so much Chair.
24 Um, so I want to talk a little bit about the second
25 hand auto dealers and predatory loans, which has been

2 a historic problem. When I was at the agency, we
3 released a Request For Expression of Interest to
4 create a new auto loan product. So we released that
5 RFEI to banks and credit unions to try to get them to
6 have an auto loan product that was a safe auto loan
7 that had transparent terms, that didn't have terms
8 buried in the language that locked people into a
9 cycle of debt. Can you talk a little bit about
10 what's happening with that? And where is the agency
11 in terms of trying to encourage banks and credit
12 unions to offer better auto loan products?

13 MR. TIGER: Well, thank you for that question,
14 Councilmember. I'm not sure exactly how what was the
15 result of that RFEI, to be to be candid, but
16 generally speaking one of our priorities is to look
17 at predatory lending in different aspects across the
18 city and for different... for different industries.
19 You know, we have our Office of Financial Empowerment
20 that is working on these issues on... broadly
21 speaking, about debt and safe debt through our
22 Oversight of the Financial Empowerment Centers across
23 the city. I would have to talk to that... to them to
24 get a better sense of what we're currently working on

2 in the auto loan space as far as safe auto loan
3 products.

4 COUNCILMEMBER MENIN: Yeah. If you could get
5 back, as we released that in 2015, and there were
6 banks and credit unions that were interested. We
7 also had issued subpoenas to Santander Bank, who was
8 clearly... and the AG entered into a settlement.

9 Could you give an update on what's happening with
10 Santander? Are they still are you still after the AG
11 settlement seeing any kind of predatory practices out
12 of them?

13 MR. TIGER: Well, we haven't gotten complaints
14 specifically about Santander since I've been at the
15 agency over the last few years, but I can... we
16 can... I can go back and take a deeper dive into this
17 with you.

18 COUNCILMEMBER MENIN: Okay. Yeah. Because
19 just... I mean, even reading the committee report, we
20 see it's still historically a problem. So we'd love
21 to know what the agencies doing to combat this
22 subprime loan issue. Okay, thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: I'll turn it over now to
24 Councilmember Stevens.

2 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: Good morning. I just had
3 a couple of questions, because as we know, I know
4 we're talking about the catalytic converters. But
5 just thinking about in general, there's been a lot of
6 theft, especially in the Bronx around just cars in
7 general and vandalism. But and my question just, I
8 guess, is around like some of the auto body shops:
9 Are there inspections done of the auto body shops?
10 If so, how often are they done, and who's in charge
11 of like, kind of doing these inspections?

12 MR. TIGER: So... let me just note, auto body
13 shops are...

14 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: Like the secondhand auto
15 body shops.

16 MR. TIGER: Right. If you have... if you sell
17 secondhand goods, you have a... you have to have a
18 second hand dealer general license. And just to be
19 clear, separately, the New York State Department of
20 Motor Vehicles licenses auto body shops. And so
21 there is a raft of records that they have to keep
22 under DMV regulations that the state enforces. We
23 inspect routinely all secondhand dealer general, on a
24 regular cadence. I think I don't have the exact
25 numbers. I don't have it broken down by auto body

2 shops, but we inspected SHDGs, as we call them, over
3 10,000 times since 2018. There are several thousand
4 SHDGs.

5 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: Which is fine, thanks,
6 because to be honest, we all know, for example... we
7 all know... like I know where I can go get the stuff.
8 I'm like, they just stole my mirrors the other day.
9 I went back and bought them. I mean, we know where
10 they're at. So like, what are you finding when
11 you're going to these shops? Because we know that...
12 We know where they are. We know what they're doing.
13 And so even with these catalytic converters, like...

14 MR. TIGER: Once again, just... just to take a
15 step back on our regulatory scheme that we enforce.
16 There are about two buckets of protection... or
17 provisions of the Administrative Code for secondhand
18 dealer channels are ones that are going to our core
19 agency mission about consumer protection, "Are you
20 representing that these are new goods? Or used
21 goods?" You've got to make... You have to make that
22 clear the consumer. And there are all these record
23 keeping provisions that are really there to aid NYPD
24 in their criminal investigations. And what our
25 inspectors do is they go and make sure that the

2 secondhand dealer general licensees are keeping
3 records in a manner prescribed by the police
4 department and by the administrative code, so that
5 when there comes time for PD to seek these records,
6 as part of their criminal investigation, they're in
7 the proper order, and they can do that. Our
8 inspectors are not actually inventorying, "Here are
9 the types of secondhand goods that are being sold in
10 your roster," because we're there just to ensure that
11 the records are being kept in the proper order.

12 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: You're just going to look
13 at the records. And that's it. And so you're not
14 looking for like inconsistencies, or things like
15 that, so that you can then flag with NYPD?

16 MR. TIGER: Well, I mean, I think I can I can
17 turn to my colleague, Mr. Hurst, about... in a little
18 bit more granular detail about what would happen at
19 an individual inspection, but generally is to make
20 sure that the records are in the proper order as
21 opposed to an individual investigation.

22 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: That's just
23 counterintuitive, right? Because if you're just
24 going to look at the records, and you're not like
25 looking at inventory. Anyone can like do paperwork,

2 right? And so that's where I'm trying to, like... I
3 need more understanding.

4 MR. TIGER: Well, again it's important to
5 understand the PD has also has access to records and
6 they conduct their own investigations and obtain
7 access to these records. So we're there routinely to
8 make sure that they're keeping records, and they're
9 keeping... and they're kept in the proper order. And
10 PD then can look at it for an individual... on an
11 individual basis.

12 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: Right. So you guys are
13 saying you look at the paperwork, and then PD looks
14 at the paperwork. So whose looking for the
15 inconsistencies.

16 MR. HURTS: What we'll do is we'll inspect... at
17 the time of inspection, see what items... inventory
18 of used items they have, and identify that the
19 paperwork... that the record keeping reflects what we
20 see at the time. We will ask for an invoice at an
21 auto body shop. And we can check that against the
22 records to make sure they've kept their
23 documentation. I think if a business was subject to
24 multiple complaints, we could potentially do a more
25 in-depth investigation, NYPD would probably do a more

2 in-depth investigation, if we knew... had the 311
3 complaints regarding that business. But in an
4 inspection, a routine inspection of a licensee, we're
5 just going based on the observations we can make at
6 the time of inspection. We're comparing what's
7 available versus what's in the records.

8 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: So if I could add: If we
9 received a complaint of a repair shop that is taking
10 in stolen property, we can go to the repair shop and
11 we can inspect the repair shop to ensure that the
12 items that are in the repair shop are listed in the
13 documentation that they're required to keep. In the
14 past we found inconsistencies where we found no
15 records where the person operating the repair shop
16 was subject to arrest based upon the statute, for not
17 up keeping the books and records. So if we do go to
18 have an investigation into a repair shop, we will go
19 with either our partners from the Department of
20 Consumer and Worker Protection, or more commonly for
21 repair shops, Department of Motor Vehicles
22 investigators.

23 MR. CLARK: And if... and if you have a specific
24 shop that you're thinking of, I'll find...

2 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: We all know where the
3 shops are at. That's why I'm confused, and like why
4 are we pretending like we don't know where these
5 shops are? And why are we not inspecting them
6 routinely? And it's... it's, it's kind of strange to
7 me, but I'll stop here. But I just think it's really
8 weird that we're not doing consistently we know the
9 shops, people... even the precincts know the shops,
10 right? Like, I mean, we're pretending like we don't.
11 And so if we have a system where you're doing these
12 inspections, and we're seeing the inconsistencies,
13 what happens then? Right? Like, how many times...
14 like, do they get fined? Like what happens? Because
15 like, we know where 90% of the shops are, and a lot
16 of them are in the Bronx. So I'll leave it at that.

17 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: I actually have a
18 question from Councilmember Abreu that he wanted me
19 to ask: So earlier you had described rhodium,
20 palladium, and platinum as being the three metals
21 that are in catalytic converters. Do we know the
22 ounces of each per part?

23 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: It's it depends on the
24 catalytic converter and the specific metal, but it's
25 not really at the level of ounces. It's minute grams

2 that they use for the to coat the ceramic substance
3 that's inside. So it's only a few grams of each,
4 depending upon the catalytic converter. And that's
5 what makes it so valuable. Because when you take it
6 and you look at the cost of profit per ounce, it
7 translate into... into a hundreds of dollars per
8 unit.

9 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Got it. Do any other
10 Councilmembers... If businesses have had DCWP
11 license revoked due to sell due to the selling of
12 stolen auto parts. That's for you...

13 MR. TIGER: Has that happened?

14 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Yes.

15 MR. TIGER: Is that question?

16 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: That's the question.

17 Sorry. I was trying to read it off the paper and not
18 like sound weird.

19 MR. TIGER: No, no. No problem.

20 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: I probably failed on that
21 one.

22 MR. TIGER: Um, not to my knowledge as I'm
23 sitting here. But we'd have to go back and look, and
24 we can answer that definitively. There are cert...
25 you can get your license revoked if you violate

2 elements of the administrative code. So the
3 requirements of the second-hand dealer general
4 license.

5 Also, if you're subject at renewal to a criminal
6 conviction review, and that's based under factors
7 that are in the New York State Corrections Law
8 applies to criminal convictions for anyone obtaining
9 any sort of license in New York State, but again that
10 would be after a conviction.

11 CHAIRPERSON VELÁZQUEZ: Okay, thank you for that.
12 Councilmember Holden, you have a question?

13 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair. And I'm
14 sorry I missed you some of your testimony. I was at
15 another hearing at City Hall.

16 But so far this year, you say 7334, catalytic
17 converters were stolen. And I kind of missed the...
18 the numbers of arrests. 50... Did I hear 53?

19 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: There... There have been 139
20 arrests of 53 persons.

21 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: 139 arrests, so they could
22 be charged with multiple charges.

23 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Yes.

24 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: 53 out of 7000.

25 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Yeah.

2 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: That's pretty miserable.

3 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Yes.

4 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: So I'm just wondering, is
5 this because it's property crime and... Because
6 obviously with the understaffed NYPD, we're seeing...
7 The precinct commanders are complaining to us
8 constantly that the same people are getting caught.
9 And they arrest them, and they're out the next day.
10 That this is not a priority in... with the DAs. Or,
11 you know, have you been working with the Das, because
12 because if not, then maybe the Councilmembers could,
13 because I just feel at this point, with my
14 constituents calling every day. "Councilman, what
15 are you doing about this?" "We're getting...
16 We're... You know, they're preying upon us." And I
17 think it could even be more than... a lot more than
18 7000, because some people just don't even report it.
19 They just say, "Alright, what am I going to do?
20 They're not going to get these guys," because 53
21 arrests out of, you know, let's say 7334. Not a good
22 record.

23 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Yes. And to address that,
24 the difficulty is... is that when we come in contact
25 with the people that are in possession of what we

2 know to be stolen, they're not identifiable. There's
3 no unique serial numbers to prove that they are
4 stolen. So we will not be able to establish probable
5 cause even though we've come in contact with the
6 individual who actually has this in their possession,
7 unless we come in contact with them while they're in
8 the act of cutting the catalytic converters out. And
9 once they drive away and they're in possession of
10 catalytic converters, there's no way for us to say at
11 this point that that person... we would have probable
12 cause establish probable cause that that person is in
13 possession of a stolen item. And that's why we are
14 doing the sticker labeling program to identify as
15 many of these catalytic converters as possible.

16 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, because we
17 identified a location in my district that was storing
18 some of these catalytic converters in their backyards
19 and auto crimes, never... you know, again, we never
20 heard back from them. We didn't know what... what's
21 going on. They're still there. This is going a year
22 now that we reported this.

23 And it just seems... I just, you know, I just
24 feel at this point very frustrated. So I'm just...
25 is there something that people can actually secure

2 the catalytic converters better? Put it put a sleeve
3 on it? Put some kind of metal around it, you know,
4 do something. It's gotten to the point where people
5 are paying... like they say they have a deductible on
6 their insurance, they're paying \$1,000 anyway. You
7 know, most people have \$1,000 deductible on their
8 insurance. Right?

9 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Yes. There are aftermarket
10 items that are being made now that would surround the
11 catalytic converter to make it difficult for thieves
12 to remove. That's... that's on the market now. That
13 is one way that people can protect their catalytic
14 converters. The other way is with -- as I mentioned
15 before, with our labeling program -- to put some sort
16 of unique identifier, that this way it will deter
17 them when they see that it is marked. So coupled
18 with... with maybe an aftermarket device to protect
19 it. Unfortunately, not all catalytic converters are
20 in a convenient location that this kind of device can
21 be applied to it.

22 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Right. We did the etching
23 program in my district a number of times. I'm just
24 wondering, has any... anyone been traced yet? I
25 mean, we've been doing this for a while now, I don't

2 know how many months. But has something shown up
3 where somebody etched the catalytic converter and it
4 came back.

5 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: As of this point, we have not
6 seen a report of a stolen catalytic converter that
7 has been etched.

8 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Okay, so... But... So
9 nothing's turned up yet.

10 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Correct.

11 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: And... But is there a
12 failsafe system where you're tracking that? Let's
13 say something is as it's sold? How do you track it?
14 Because let's say some... I etched it, and my
15 catalytic converter was stolen. What does the police
16 department do at that point? If I report... you
17 know, I etched it, and it was stolen. What... When
18 does that kick in... What... what happens? Tell me
19 the procedure.

20 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: When we come in contact with
21 that particular item, either in the hands of the
22 thief itself, or... or the scrap yard.

23 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: So... it sounds like a
24 needle in a haystack. I mean, that... The fact that
25 if it's going to a scrap yard that's unscrupulous,

2 that we have all around. We have a lot of them,
3 apparently, because they are selling them. You know,
4 how's that number going to be reported? Is that,
5 again, the scrapyard doesn't have to report it if
6 it's on there, right? There's no law that says, you
7 know, they get a catalytic converter with it with an
8 etching on it. They could they could just sell it?
9 And not pay any penalty?

10 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: At this point, that would be
11 correct. That's why we're pushing for... for
12 identifying marks...

13 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Right.

14 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: ...to put on catalytic
15 converters.

16 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Well, I think some states
17 have actually required new car manufacturers to put
18 the numbers on the catalytic converters. Like I
19 think Maine has that now, I think. Or at least
20 that's... that's going through the process, right?

21 MR. CLARK: Yeah. I'm not sure about other
22 states. I know that the state law that just passed
23 requires it to be offered, at least at new car shops.
24 It's not... I don't think it's a mandatory that they

2 have to put it on. But it's an offer, which helps,
3 but it's not...

4 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: It should be mandatory,
5 because at this point... if this is going to be
6 lucrative for the thieves, and they can do it... and
7 I've watched... we've watched videos, countless
8 videos, how fast they do it, they pull up next to the
9 car... Brazen, very brazen. Now they're doing in
10 broad daylight. I used to do it only at 2 a.m. and 3
11 a.m. we've seen. Now it's broad daylight. Now they
12 could just go anywhere and do it. Because it's,
13 again, the consequences of getting caught. Even if
14 they get caught they're... they're out the next day,
15 or they're not even... they don't do any time. And
16 that... that, I think is the issue. And again, we're
17 being preyed upon. Thank you, Chair.

18 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much.
19 Councilmember Joseph?

20 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Good morning. Earlier I
21 know you talked about it, but I wanted to know what
22 precincts are offering the etchings? What precinct?
23 Can you tell me?

24 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Well, currently right now it
25 is the Auto Crimes Unit that is doing the etching,

2 and we are expanding the program citywide so that we
3 can offer it... we offer to the patrol borough, and
4 the patrol borough will let us know where they
5 believe it would be most effective. So that's how
6 we're determining what precincts the program has been
7 in.

8 MR. CLARK: And I just want to... it's... it's
9 not every precinct all the time. It's when the Auto
10 Crime sets up for these events... the Auto Crime Unit
11 setup for the events. The... What we're exploring
12 is trying to make it more universal, and have it
13 available more of the time and trying to figure out a
14 way to do that.

15 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Yeah. You mentioned
16 Brooklyn south. I represent one of those areas,
17 especially in the 67th precinct. What is being done
18 with that precinct?

19 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Again, that would... that
20 would be determined by the... the patrol borough as
21 to where they would like us to set up this operation
22 so we could label... and as I said, we are trying to
23 expand this to get this out as much as possible.

24 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: How many etchings have you
25 done?

2 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Probably just under 2000 at
3 this point.

4 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: 2000. But yet we have
5 7000 converters being stolen. So again, the
6 numbers... I'll have to piggyback with Councilmember
7 Golden.

8 How do you raise awareness? How does communities
9 know about this event? Is it done in different
10 languages? Is it done...? Because we do serve... I
11 represent a large immigrant community. And as their
12 converters are being stolen, is that being offered in
13 languages as well? Is language access being offered?

14 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: We rely on the community
15 affairs people from the borough and from the police
16 department to get the word out. My unit is basically
17 responsible for doing the doing the operation and
18 supplying the... the etchings. So I'm not exactly
19 familiar with things... how they proceed with it.

20 MR. CLARK: Yeah, and I think... You know,
21 they... they certainly publish it on their social
22 medias. Their community affairs officers are
23 supposed to talk to members, you know... key members
24 of the community let them know to see if they can
25 spread the word that it's happening. I don't know if

2 the 67th precinct has had one, but we can... we
3 can...

4 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Yeah. I represent
5 Brooklyn South, and 67 is one of my hot precincts.

6 MR. CLARK: Right.

7 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: I would love to see it
8 happen there. And I'm a senior citizen, and I drive,
9 and I'm not on social media. How does that word get
10 to me?

11 MR. CLARK: Right, I think that's part of, you
12 know, community affairs, using the community context
13 to try and put it out. And...

14 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: How do you penalize? Or
15 is there any... I know Councilmember Stevens also
16 asked that: What are you doing to penalize
17 secondhand shops that are selling these parts?

18 INSPECTOR LAPOLLO: Well, if... if we come across
19 a say a scrap yard that's taking these in and they're
20 not following the existing rules, by keeping the
21 documentation required, then we will now... possibly
22 they may be subject to arrest themselves for failure
23 to maintain the books and records that are necessary.
24 Most of the times we go in now we find that they are
25 in compliance, and that they're taking the

2 information supplied by the seller... the thief or
3 seller, and they're... they're loading it into their
4 systems and they have been cooperative to the point
5 where they will give us that information readily Upon
6 asking.

7 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Okay, thank you.

8 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: If there no other
9 questions, then we will go to those that are on Zoom,
10 because I believe those are the ones from the public
11 who have questions. You guys are welcome to stay,
12 but you can also leave if you like. We'd like to
13 have somebody here to listen to the public.

14 Thank you very much. And we look forward to
15 passing legislation and solving this problem. Thank
16 you very much.

17 COUNSEL: First up, we'll hear from Paula
18 Frenzel, followed by Vik Bensen. Paula, you may turn
19 on your camera and we'll unmute you in one sec.

20 Paula?

21 MS. FRENDEL: Hi, good morning. I want to thank
22 the committee for having me. My name is Paula
23 Frenzel. I'm the director of the New York
24 Independent Auto Dealers Association. We represent
25 all the used car dealers in the state of New York.

2 We're also affiliated with the National Independent
3 Auto Dealers Association. I do have a couple of
4 questions and comments. Regarding Intro 525, it does
5 states that the purchaser will be required to
6 determine if the catalytic converter present is
7 consistent with the one removed, and it has further
8 language. I think there might be an omission there
9 because it does not state that the dealer or anyone
10 who is purchasing, they should not be responsible for
11 any erroneous information that might be obtained by
12 the seller of this catalytic converter.

13 Also, what will verify that it's authentic? Does
14 the document need to be notarized or signed besides
15 the owner? These are just a couple of questions that
16 we have on 525 at this point.

17 I do want to say that we are supportive the
18 process to eliminate catalytic converter theft.
19 Actually, my daughter was a victim of it and we had
20 to get her a complete new car for college. So I do
21 want to see legislation that does work.

22 Also, I'm hearing that there isn't any
23 legislation in regards to if a party actually removes
24 the etching. I believe that would be a really
25 important aspect of the legislation. You could etch

2 all you want. But if someone is actually just going
3 to scratch it off, and, you know, break up open the
4 catalytic converter and take out, you know, it's
5 precious metals, it's really not going to be helping
6 us at that point.

7 I'll stop there on 525. And then we can go on to
8 759. And then I have some other thoughts that I'd
9 like to discuss with you in regards to used car
10 dealers in the state of New York.

11 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much. Your
12 comments are excellent and will be included. I
13 appreciate it very much.

14 MS. FRENDEL: Okay. Shall I move on to 759?

15 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Yes.

16 MS. FRENDEL: It just seems unclear if the dealer
17 must do the etching. I did get confirmation that it
18 is not mandatory. Maybe that... we would want to
19 put that into the language. Also, is there a
20 timeframe for the public to etch this? Is there any
21 way to verify the etching is the same kit that was
22 provided to the public? How can you track the kits
23 to make sure they are authentic? These are all
24 questions that we have. And also how will we know
25 the public is doing this etching properly? Is there

2 any kind of procedure? Is there any kind of hazard
3 for them to be for them to be doing that?

4 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: These are all good
5 questions that will be considered when the
6 legislation is reviewed.

7 MS. FRENDEL: Okay. And then on a broader scope,
8 there's a lot of mention about deceptive practices of
9 use car dealers and other dialogues like that. I do
10 want to let you know that the association is open to
11 any kind of mandatory education for the independent
12 car dealers for pre-licensing and continuing
13 education.

14 New York is one of the only... New York and New
15 Jersey is actually one of the few states that do not
16 have mandatory education. I have some open dialogue
17 with a Senator in Albany to start that process. I
18 would ask the committee if they were interested in
19 maybe spearheading this, because you could probably
20 get it done quicker in the five boroughs. So it's
21 something that I did want to bring to your attention
22 that we are open to and we'd like to expand the
23 conversation for that point.

24

25

2 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you. I hope that
3 you will submit your excellent ideas in writing and
4 we look forward to working with you.

5 MS. FRENDEL: Okay, thank you.

6 COUNSEL: Up next, we'll hear from Vik Bensen.
7 Vik, you may begin as soon as you're unmuted.

8 MS. BENSEN: All right, good morning. My name is
9 Vic Bensen, and I'm the Policy Analyst at City Meals
10 on Wheels. I'd like to thank the Council for holding
11 this important hearing on catalytic converters, a
12 pressing issue for nonprofit service providers
13 relying on specialty vehicles. City Meals works in
14 partnership with the city and a network of home
15 delivered meal providers funded by the Department for
16 the Aging to fill a significant gap in its home-
17 delivered meals program by funding the continued
18 delivery of meals on weekends holidays and
19 emergencies to homebound older adults alongside
20 supplemental feeding and connected services.

21 In the past year of home delivered meal providers
22 and older adult centers have reported frequent
23 repeated catalytic converter theft. When a delivery
24 truck or transportation van has its converter stolen,
25 replacing it will be a time consuming and costly

2 process that strains contracted funds and interrupts
3 service to vulnerable home delivered meal recipients.

4 Any time a truck breaks the meals delivered by
5 that truck must be delegated to other delivery
6 routes, creating longer wait times for hungry
7 recipients and longer days for delivers already
8 engaged in strenuous work. When older adult centers
9 have converters taken from their transportation vans,
10 it impacts service, forcing centers to cancel newly
11 resumed activities and trips.

12 These bills would enforce proper sourcing for
13 catalytic converters, which will deter theft, easing
14 a burden that comes with specialty truck maintenance.
15 However, they do not address an important point of
16 vulnerability for nonprofit service providers
17 regarding these steps, which is the lack of reliable
18 parking for provider vehicles. While home-delivered
19 meal programs are largely funded through city
20 dollars, their contracts do not include adequate
21 provisions or funding to maintain the infrastructure
22 required to run them. We've heard from programs in
23 all five boroughs affected by converter theft, and
24 when programs lack a secure place to park their

2 vehicles, they become more susceptible to theft,
3 especially when left on the street overnight.

4 Given that the city recognizes the critical
5 importance of providing home delivered meals and
6 transportation services to older adults with limited
7 mobility, it stands to reason that it should also
8 provide adequate support and funding to ensure the
9 proper maintenance of the infrastructure required to
10 operate these programs. Vehicle security and
11 maintenance are not an optional part of running these
12 vital programs. Moreover, it is not cost efficient
13 to fund the purchase of vehicles, but not their
14 security and maintenance. Because these services...
15 these service vehicles are target for catalytic
16 converter thefts, more is needed to ensure that they
17 are protected. We see how providers with a secure
18 place to park whether that is on site or through
19 relationships with other members of their community
20 that have space have far fewer incidences of
21 catalytic converter theft, vehicle damage or break
22 ins and thus fewer service interruptions and lower
23 repair and maintenance costs.

24 So while we support these bills, we also asked
25 that the council consider additional actions to

2 ensure that city contracted program... programs like
3 home delivered meals receive the proper
4 infrastructure support, including in this case,
5 secure parking to combat the underlying security
6 issues facilitating catalytic converter theft, as
7 well as other damage and break ins that routinely
8 occur. Thank you for the time we'll also be
9 submitting a written comment with more information
10 and anecdotes.

11 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much.

12 COUNSEL: At this time, if anyone is here that
13 wishes to testify, but has not been called on would
14 like to do so please step forward.

15 Okay, seeing nobody's hand may close.

16 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Yeah. We're going to
17 close out this hearing. Thank you all very much for
18 your testimony on this important topic. One more
19 question. Go ahead. You have a question? I
20 recognize the very important Councilmember from the
21 Bronx, Councilmember Farias. Thank you very much.
22 Closed out. Thank you.

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 10/31/2022