

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

January 19, 2016
Start: 1:41 p.m.
Recess: 3:27 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
The Speaker of the Council
LETITIA JAMES
The Public Advocate

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Inez E. Dickens
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Daniel R. Garodnick

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson
David G. Greenfield
Barry S. Grodenchik
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Rev. Chloe Breyer
Associate Priest
St. Phillips Church

Bishop Walsh
Archdiocese of New York

Father Brian McWeeney
Archdiocese of New York

David Pollock
Jewish Community Relations Council

Big Brothers Big Sisters
Representatives

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

4

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We're gonna get started; we have two ceremonials today; one is by Council Member Levine; think it's Ulrich, but I don't see him here right now. So we have [background comment] and Vallone, if he's around... okay. Yes. Yes. Yes.

So this is celebrating the 50th anniversary of Nostra Aetate, Vatican II, which marked a watershed in the reduction of institutional anti-Semitism and proved to be the beginning of a journey of cooperation and respect between Catholics and Jews... [background comment] okay. Alright, Council Member Cornegy has joined us. Again, this is Council Member Levine, he'll take the lead on it, Council Members Ulrich and Vallone as well and I will hand it off to Council Member Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madame Speaker. I am so passionate about calling attention to this proclamation that I staged an elaborate stunt earlier, when I appeared to fall in the middle of the chamber [background comments] and Council Member Williams made fun of me, but that's okay.

In all seriousness, I'm so happy to be able to mark this important anniversary; you know, on

1 Sunday Pope Francis visited the Grand Synagogue in
2 Rome; only the third time in history that that's ever
3 happened in 2000 years, and he went, among other
4 reasons, to mark the half-century anniversary of what
5 I think is the most important milestone in the
6 history of interfaith relations, which was the
7 encyclical of Vatican II, *Nostra Aetate*; that for the
8 first time began to melt the wall of separation
9 between Jews and Catholics and then really began
10 decades of milestones, including the recognition of
11 the State of Israel by the Vatican; actually
12 including the first ever visit to a synagogue by Pope
13 John Paul, who at the time famously called Jews the
14 elder brothers of the church, language that the
15 current pope echoed on Sunday. Really, I think that
16 this message is more needed than ever today, the
17 message that we have a common humanity, whatever our
18 faith background and what a powerful moment now to
19 remind the world that if two groups that have had
20 2000 years of strife, Catholics and Jews, can come
21 together, that it can happen between any two groups;
22 it's really a powerful and inspiring moment and I'm
23 thrilled that we're able to acknowledge this today.
24 Thank you.

[background comments]

Okay. I'd like to actually ask if my colleague, Paul Vallone would like to say a couple words and then we'll read them.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you, Council Member and thank you, Speaker.

Just real quickly, I think being a Catholic, growing up in the faith and also being so instilled from an early age and then passing it on to our children, the importance of faith and such a wonderful celebration today to stand here, 50 years later and this stands the tenants of time what this had done to bring the Catholic and the Jewish religions together, but also, it did say all religions and it mentioned all faiths and that was so important, so I'm just very proud to be a part of it. Thank you very much [sic].

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Alright, so we'd like to ask the Committee Clerk to please read the proclamation.

CITY CLERK: Council, City of New York Proclamation. Whereas the Council of the City of New York is proud to commemorate the 50th anniversary of Nostra Aetate, the Second Vatican Council's 1965

1
2 declaration on relations with other religions which
3 marked a watershed in the beginning of a journey of
4 cooperation and respect that continues to endure
5 today.

6 And whereas, while *Nostra Aetate* is by
7 far the shortest of all the major documents of the
8 Second Vatican Council, it has been one of the most
9 consequential particularly as a decisive turning
10 point in relations between the Catholic Church and
11 Judaism. After centuries of tension it ushered in an
12 era of collaboration and benevolence, this
13 declaration has been called the Magna Carta of
14 interreligious dialogue.

15 And whereas, in the decades since the
16 *Nostra Aetate* declaration, the International Jewish
17 Committee on interreligious consultations has served
18 as an umbrella organization, representing the Jewish
19 community to the Vatican; advancing improved
20 relations.

21 And whereas, this golden anniversary
22 provides an opportunity to reflect upon the great
23 progress made over the past five decades to reaffirm
24 *Nostra Aetate* as an influential compass for
25

1
2 strengthening relations between Christians, Jews,
3 Muslims and other faiths in the years ahead.

4 Now therefore be it known, that the
5 Council of the City of New York is proud to honor
6 Nostra Aetate in celebration of its 50th anniversary.
7 Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the Entire
8 Council; Mark D. Levine, Council Member 7th District
9 Manhattan; Eric A. Ulrich, Council Member 32nd
10 District Queens; Jimmy Van Bramer, Majority Leader,
11 Chair Cultural Affairs Committee, and Paul Vallone,
12 Council Member 19th District Queens.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you. I'm
14 pleased that we're joined today by Bishop Walsh, from
15 the Archdiocese and Father.. [background comments]
16 Father Brian McWeeney and from the Jewish Community
17 Relations Council, our good friend David Pollock and
18 I'd like to ask the Bishop if he'd say a few words.

19 BISHOP WALSH: Father McWeeney and I are
20 here for the Archdiocese to thank the Council for its
21 recognition of this wonderful document, Nostra
22 Aetate. Just two points I would like to make; this
23 is a reflection of the wisdom of Pope John XXIII, the
24 man who began opening the doors and the windows who
25 told us, all of us, concentrate on those things that

1 unite you; don't get too hung up on what divides you
2 -- very good advice. Second, I heard the gentleman
3 reading the document saying Nostra Aetate is by far
4 the smallest document, but it got much more done than
5 the others, so that's the good message there -- less
6 talk and more action. [laughter, background
7 comments] Thank you very much for this thing.

8 [background comments]

9 DAVID POLLOCK: Thank you. Thank you,
10 Bishop.

11 BISHOP WALSH: Thank you.

12 DAVID POLLOCK: I remember when I was a
13 student, my teacher, Abraham Joshua Heschel, speaking
14 of the tectonic shift that Nostra Aetate meant, not
15 only for the Jews, but for the Orthodox, for the
16 Protestants, for religion all over the world and it
17 opened an avenue for people to dialogue, for people
18 to find out what joins us, what unites us and it's a
19 great lesson that we should move forward from.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Well again I
21 wanna... anything else? No. I wanna thank you all for
22 coming and Mark, thank you for bringing this to our
23 attention; I think it really is a very important
24 moment in particular that we're celebrating these 50
25

1
2 years. So thank you all for being here and I think
3 it's a small gesture that we can have from the
4 Council to make sure that we recognize the importance
5 of that moment, so great. Thank you.

6 [applause, background comments]

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright. Thank
8 you. [background comments, clapping] Okay, I think
9 we have... Oh, thank you so much, nice to see you
10 again. We have one more proclamation that we're
11 doing today, one more ceremonial. Council Member
12 Torres, if you can come on up. Okay. I know I saw
13 him a minute ago. Okay. And all those that are
14 being honored, if you can come on up; we're giving
15 recognition to Big Brothers Big Sisters of New York
16 for their outstanding work mentoring young people.

17 [background comments] Alright. So I'm gonna pass it
18 on to Council Member Torres, who will say a few words
19 and then we'll hear the proclamation and wanna thank
20 everyone that is here representing this wonderful
21 organization, valuable work that you do in our city
22 on behalf of our young people. Council Member
23 Torres.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Thank you, Madame
25 Speaker.

1
2 It's obviously fitting that we're here
3 one day after Dr. King's birthday; in many ways
4 Dr. King, who lived through the horrors of Jim Crow,
5 was a national mentor to all of us; he spent his
6 life, he lost his life for the sake of social justice
7 and so it's fitting that we celebrate his birthday on
8 the same day that we celebrate Brothers and Sisters,
9 Gabriel Mendez and Thomas Cabrera, all of whom have
10 been mentors and it's the... if you wanna... and Brothers
11 and Sisters has been in existence for how many years
12 now; 104... 110 years, so thank you for exuding
13 [applause] the spirit of Dr. King's civic [sic]
14 leadership and for everything that you do to promote
15 national mentoring. Madame Clerk, read the
16 proclamation.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council, City of New
18 York Proclamation. Whereas, in celebration of
19 National Mentoring Month, the Council of the City of
20 New York is proud to honor Big Brothers Big Sisters
21 New York City for its role in shaping the lives of
22 countless young people across the five boroughs.

23 And whereas, during January we celebrate
24 National Mentoring Month, a time to reflect and
25 celebrate those mentors who positively shape and

1
2 influence the lives of children across the city,
3 whether they are family members or members of the
4 community-at-large, they answer the call to service
5 by mentoring a child and ultimately having a profound
6 impact on that child's life.

7 And whereas, through volunteering their
8 time, support, love, energy and guidance they serve
9 as mentors and positive role models, instilling
10 valuable life skills and empowering young people to
11 pursue their highest aspirations and realize their
12 full potential; they are big brothers and big sisters
13 from across New York City.

14 And whereas, for more than 110 years BBBS
15 of NYC is considered the founding agency of the
16 nation's youth mentoring movement; since 1904 its
17 mission has been to give all children in New York
18 City who face adversity an opportunity to experience
19 a strong, enduring, professionally supported one-to-
20 one mentoring relationship with adults that will help
21 change their lives for the better. We partner with
22 families, volunteers, organizations and the community
23 to inspire positive change in all.

24 And whereas, currently there are 520,799
25 children living at or below the poverty level in New

1
2 York City; 149,000 are from single-parent families.
3 Every year BBBS of NYC connects more than 5,000 of
4 these kids with a BIG who can help them believe that
5 their present situation does not have to be their
6 future.

7 And whereas, Big Brothers Big Sisters NYC
8 has changed lives of struggled to lives [sic] of
9 opportunity where success is attainable by
10 establishing a strong connection between children and
11 responsible adults; they have changed the course of
12 communities across our city for generations; they
13 have earned our gratitude and recognition not only
14 during January, but throughout the year.

15 Now therefore be it known, that the
16 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors Big
17 Brothers Big Sisters of New York City for their
18 outstanding contributions to New York City. Melissa
19 Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the Entire Council;
20 Ritchie Torres, Council Member 15th District Bronx.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright. So
22 congratulations; [applause] we're gonna hear from the
23 executive director, the president and then I'm sure
24 we're probably recognizing these two young mentors,
25 right, obviously they're [sic] mentors and thanking

1
2 them for the work that they do on behalf of young
3 people, so pass it off.

4 MALE VOICE: First of all, I wanna thank
5 our Speaker for recognizing Big Brothers Big Sisters.
6 As you heard from Council Member Torres, this is
7 National Mentoring Month and it's also... we just
8 celebrate Dr. King's movement and what he gave for a
9 lot of us to do the work that we're doing today, but
10 as part of National Mentoring Month, we and with the
11 support of the City Council, we've been now opening
12 up... we now are... we've always been a citywide
13 organization, but we now have an office in each of
14 the boroughs of the City of New York; we're very,
15 very proud of that and Queens and Staten Island, the
16 Bronx and Brooklyn, so we're very proud of that and
17 we feel by having presence in those boroughs, you
18 know, physical presence in those boroughs, we'll be
19 able to provide better support to our families and
20 our kids. So we wanna thank the Speaker, we wanna
21 thank the City Council for their continued support
22 and I wanna recognize Thomas and Gabriel for their
23 commitment; these young men represent the kind of
24 volunteers that our organization recruits and
25 participate in our program.

Now let me give you a little bit of PR.

When a kid is mentored in our program, 97% of them are getting promoted to the next grade, 96% of them are graduating from high school and 94% of them are going on to college and all that because they have a positive role model in their life; the things that some of us take for granted, some of us have been very fortunate to have parents and role models in our lives; a lot of our kids in New York City don't have that and just by having that role model and having the support of Big Brothers and Big Sisters, we actually see these young people just do a lot better, so today, thank you so much. [applause]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: No, no and thank you for the young people that do that and giving of your time to be mentors to the next generation; it is all about that, so congratulations to the two of you and congratulations to Big Brothers and Big Sisters.

That ends ceremonials.

[pause]

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen, can I have your attention, please; can I please have your attention, please? [applause] Quiet on the floor, please. At this time, please place all

1
2 electronic devices, all electronic devices to
3 vibrate. Will all non-Council employees please leave
4 the main floor of the chambers? We have additional
5 seating upstairs in the balcony. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May all members
7 have their seats; all visitors please exit the
8 chamber or find a seat. May we cease all
9 conversations, please? Members, please have their
10 seats.

11 [gavel]

12 All rise for the invocation, I mean for
13 the pledge.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

15 [Pledge of Allegiance]

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

17 Roll call.

18 CITY CLERK: Barron.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

20 CITY CLERK: Borelli.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh, quiet in
22 the chambers please.

23 CITY CLERK: Cabrera.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

25 CITY CLERK: Chin.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 17

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

3 CITY CLERK: Cohen.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Yes. Here.

5 [background comments]

6 CITY CLERK: Thank you. Constantinides.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

8 CITY CLERK: Cornegy. Crowley.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

10 CITY CLERK: Cumbo.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

12 CITY CLERK: Deutsch.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

14 CITY CLERK: Dickens. Dromm.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

16 CITY CLERK: Espinal. Eugene. Ferreras-

17 Copeland.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Here.

19 CITY CLERK: Garodnick.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

21 CITY CLERK: Gentile.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

23 CITY CLERK: Gibson.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.

25 CITY CLERK: Greenfield.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.

CITY CLERK: Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

CITY CLERK: Johnson. Kallos. King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

[background comments]

CITY CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

CITY CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

CITY CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

CITY CLERK: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

CITY CLERK: Maisel. Mealy. Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

CITY CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

CITY CLERK: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Here.

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

19

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY CLERK: Palma.
COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.
CITY CLERK: Reynoso.
COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.
CITY CLERK: Richards.
COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.
CITY CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.
Rosenthal.
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.
CITY CLERK: Torres. Treyger.
COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.
CITY CLERK: Ulrich.
[background comments]
PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh..
CITY CLERK: Borelli.
COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Present.
CITY CLERK: Vacca.
COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here [sic].
CITY CLERK: Vallone.
COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.
CITY CLERK: Williams.
COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.
CITY CLERK: Wills. Matteo.
COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Yes [sic].

CITY CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

CITY CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise for the invocation that will be delivered by Rev. Chloe Breyer, the Associate Priest [background comment] of St. Phillips Church. All quiet in the chambers please.

[background comment]

SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise. Please remove your caps.

REV. CHLOE BREYER: Good morning. I understand that many of you went to Martin Luther King Day celebrations yesterday, so these words will not be unfamiliar.

From the letter from the Birmingham Jail: I had hoped that the white moderate would understand that law and order exist for the purpose of establishing justice and that when they fail at this purpose they become dangerously structured dams that block the flow of social progress. I had hoped that the white moderate would understand that the present tension in the South is a necessary phase of the transition from a negative peace. Actually, we who

1
2 engage in nonviolent direct action are not the
3 creators of tension. We merely bring to the surface
4 the hidden tension that is already alive. Oppressed
5 people cannot remain oppressed forever. The yearning
6 for freedom eventually manifests itself, and this is
7 what has happened to the American Negro. I have not
8 said to my people: "Get rid of this discontent."
9 Rather, I have tried to say that this is normal and
10 healthy discontent and it can be channeled into the
11 creative outlet of nonviolent direct action. And now
12 this approach is being termed extremist. But I
13 thought though I was initially disappointed at being
14 characterized as extremist, I continued to think
15 about the matter and gradually gained a measure of
16 satisfaction from the label. Was not Jesus an
17 extremist for love? Was not Amos an extremist for
18 justice? And was not Paul an extremist for the
19 gospel? And Abraham Lincoln and Martin Luther and
20 Jefferson, we hold these truths to be self evident
21 that all men are created equal. Amen.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen. Please be
23 seated.

24 On behalf of Council Member Inez Dickens,
25 I move to spread the invocation of Rev. Breyer, the

1
2 Associate Priest of St. Phillips Church in the
3 Village of Harlem, a historic black church where the
4 late great Thurgood Marshall was on the vestry and
5 the church continues to preach the gospel of social
6 justice in the spirit of Dr. Martin Luther King. We
7 thank you for joining us.

8 Now adoption of minutes. Council Member
9 Rosenthal.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I move that
11 the minutes [background comments] of the Stated
12 Meeting of December 16th... [crosstalk]

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: 2015 and the
15 Charter Meeting of January 6, 2016 be adopted at
16 printed by the Council.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
18 Messages and papers from the Mayor.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: M 0363, submitting the
20 name of Shin-pei Tsay to the Council for his advice
21 and consent... [crosstalk]

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: regarding her
24 appointment as a member of the New York City
25 [background comments] Art Commission.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 23

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules, Privileges

3 and Elections.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: M 0364, Communication

5 from the Mayor, submitting the report of the

6 quadrennial Advisory Commission.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Received,

8 ordered, printed and filed.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication

10 from city, county and borough offices.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and

13 communications.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-

16 ups.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: M 0365, 0366 and 0367.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on call-

19 up vote. Ask for a roll call.

20 CITY CLERK: Barron.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes.

22 CITY CLERK: Borelli. Cabrera.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

24 CITY CLERK: Chin.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

CITY CLERK: Cohen.
COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.
CITY CLERK: Constantinides.
COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.
CITY CLERK: Cornegy.
COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.
CITY CLERK: Crowley.
COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye.
CITY CLERK: Cumbo.
COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.
CITY CLERK: Deutsch.
COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yes.
CITY CLERK: Dickens. Dromm.
COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.
CITY CLERK: Espinal. Eugene. Ferreras-
Copeland.
COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Aye.
CITY CLERK: Garodnick.
COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.
CITY CLERK: Gentile.
COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.
CITY CLERK: Espinal.
COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.
CITY CLERK: Gibson.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

25

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.

CITY CLERK: Greenfield. Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

CITY CLERK: Johnson. Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

[background comments]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
Kallos; how do you vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CITY CLERK: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.

CITY CLERK: Koo.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
Koo. Council Member Koo; how do you vote? Council
Member Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CITY CLERK: Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I'd like to vote
on all Call-ups... [interpose]

[background comment]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: and with
3 permission I'd like to vote on all coupled general
4 orders and resolutions.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I vote aye.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 CITY CLERK: Koslowitz.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

10 CITY CLERK: Lancman.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

12 CITY CLERK: Lander.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
14 Lander.

15 CITY CLERK: Levin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

17 CITY CLERK: Levine.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

19 CITY CLERK: Maisel.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes. [sic]

21 CITY CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

23 CITY CLERK: Mendez.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I'd like to vote
25 aye on all Call-ups and with permission, Madame

1
2 Public Advocate, I'd like to vote aye on all coupled
3 general orders and resolutions.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye.

6 Thank you very much... [crosstalk]

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. May
8 we have quiet in the chambers, please? Quiet in the
9 chambers.

10 [background comments]

11 CITY CLERK: Miller.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Vote aye.

13 CITY CLERK: Palma.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

15 CITY CLERK: Reynoso.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

17 CITY CLERK: Richards.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

19 CITY CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.

20 Rosenthal.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

22 CITY CLERK: Torres. Treyger.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

24 CITY CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY CLERK: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

CITY CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

[background comments]

CITY CLERK: Matteo. Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Yes.

[background comments]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member

Cornegy; did you... okay. [background comments]

Council Member Cornegy; did you wanna say something?

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Yeah, no, I'd

like to vote aye on all Land Use Call-ups and

resolutions.

[background comments]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And general

orders.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: And general

orders.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: You're welcome.

[background comments]

CITY CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

1 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye on all...

2 [crosstalk]

3 [background comments]

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Today's Land Use

5 Call-ups were adopted by a vote of 40 in the

6 affirmative, 0 in the negative. Quiet in the

7 chambers, please. [background comments] And now

8 we'll hear from The Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito.

9 Thank you.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madame

11 Public Advocate and good afternoon, buenas tardes to

12 all my colleagues.

13 Obviously we heard from the reverend

14 earlier and alluding to and mentioning that obviously

15 a very important commemoration that we did yesterday

16 acknowledging Martin Luther King Day, which we

17 observed yesterday; we spent the day throughout this

18 city honoring the inspiration and exemplary

19 leadership of Dr. King in the fight for equality.

20 Obviously it's up to us to continue in that legacy,

21 that we not only celebrate that one day a year, but

22 that we constantly are reminded of what he sacrificed

23 and gave his life for. And I'm proud of the work

24 that we're doing in this Council, from opening our

1
2 doors to recent immigrants looking for a better
3 opportunity, to ensuring that workers are getting
4 paid a fair wage and putting forward policies in this
5 Council that will... [crosstalk]

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: uplift all New
8 Yorkers; we must renew our commitment to creating the
9 kind of world that Dr. King envisioned. And I know
10 we hear a lot of different quotes and I wanted to at
11 least share one that kind of touched me as I was
12 looking for quotes that you don't often hear about
13 when you hear about Dr. Martin Luther King, and I
14 think it speaks and is very prophetic about the kind
15 of work and the world that we're living in now. So
16 he said that "we must rapidly begin the shift from a
17 thing-oriented society to a person-oriented society.
18 When machines and computers, profit motives and
19 property rights are considered more important than
20 people, the giant triplets of racism..." [interpose]

21 [background comments]

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: "materialism and
24 militarism are incapable of being conquered." And I
25 think in light of all the challenges we have at a

1 national level, when we hear the discourse, when we
2 hear about citizens united, when we hear about voting
3 rights that continue to be denied across this nation,
4 our work is very much ahead of us. So this Council
5 stands with all New Yorkers in the fight to provide a
6 living wage for all New Yorkers, that we continue to
7 provide equity and justice for every New Yorker and
8 we're gonna dedicate ourselves to making Dr. King's
9 dream a reality.
10

11 So shifting now to the legislative work
12 of today, today we're gonna be voting on legislation
13 requiring the Department of Buildings to notify
14 Council Members and community boards of applications
15 for new building construction or alteration on a
16 weekly basis. This legislation is part of our
17 ongoing effort to keep City agencies responsive and
18 in touch with local neighborhoods and the officials
19 representing them; this is legislation that is
20 sponsored by Council Member Cabrera; I'm not sure if
21 he's here. 'Kay, we'll move on, but we thank him for
22 this legislation that we'll be voting on today.

23 Next we're voting on a legislative
24 package of three bills to increase transparency and
25 oversight for City schools, these bills will require

1
2 the Department of Education to report on a variety of
3 matters related to health services and sexual health
4 education. With these new requirements we'll better
5 understand what types of services are being provided...

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: from the number
8 of nurses on staff at our schools to information on
9 educational efforts designed to help students avoid
10 unsafe sexual practices and reduce teen pregnancy.

11 There's a clear link between
12 comprehensive sex health ed. and the responsible
13 decisions that can positively impact the rest of a
14 teen's life. So much so that state and city laws
15 already require sexual health education to be
16 provided to all of our students. However, the
17 Department of Education currently lacks a mechanism
18 to track their compliance with these requirements.
19 With these bills, that will no longer be the case and
20 we'll be able to find out exactly how well our
21 schools across the city are serving students in this
22 area. This is a legislative package, three bills,
23 sponsored by Council Members Johnson, Cumbo and
24 Gibson. I'd like to ask Council Members Cumbo and
25

1
2 Gibson if you could say a few words. I don't think
3 Council Member Johnson is here yet.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Madame
5 Speaker.

6 I would like to thank Council Member
7 Danny Dromm and Council Member Corey Johnson for co-
8 chairing a joint oversight hearing on sex education
9 in New York City schools.

10 We must face it; our young people are
11 making very adult decisions in their youthful years.

12 I would like to thank Council Member Ben Kallos, the
13 co-sponsor on Int. 0952, this legislative body,
14 reproductive healthcare providers, policymakers,
15 advocates, educators and some really dynamic and
16 extraordinary young people who expressed their
17 support of Int. 0952, a bill that I introduced and
18 would require the New York City Department of
19 Education to report annually information regarding
20 school compliance with state regulations governing
21 comprehensive health education and HIV/AIDS education
22 for students in 6th-12th grade.

23 I'd like to thank Aysha Schomburg; she
24 drafted the bill of the Education Council; Aminta
25 Kilawan of the Women's Issues Council. I'd like to

1
2 thank Laura Popa and Matt Gewolb for their unwavering
3 support and leadership. I'd also like to thank the
4 advocates, because without them this could not have
5 happened -- Planned Parent of New York City, NARAL
6 Pro-Choice of New York and the New York Civil
7 Liberties Union. Nationally the average that young
8 people begin to date is 12-1/2 years of age, with 1.1
9 million students enrolled in over 1800 public
10 schools, New York City has the largest school
11 district in the U.S. In New York City there are more
12 than 17,000 unintended pregnancies every year; nearly
13 50% of all New York City public high school students
14 have had sexual intercourse; 32% of sexually active
15 New York City students did not use a condom, and if
16 we just think about that fact... [interpose]

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: we understand just
19 how important this piece of legislation is. One-
20 third of New York City high school students have not
21 or are unaware if they have received sex education.
22 Of those that have recalled sex education, only 32%
23 have had one or two lessons.

24 To further expose our dire challenge, 74%
25 of those students reported not learning about LGBTQ

1
2 identity, an education that promotes heterosexuality
3 as the normal or preferred sexual orientation
4 perpetuates stigma associated with the LGBTQ
5 community and creates an unsafe atmosphere where
6 students are likely to experience bullying and
7 discrimination. Thirty-three percent of suicides are
8 committed by LGBTQ youth and sadly, 25% of New York
9 City public school students have been bullied because
10 of their gender identity.

11 I wanna thank on my staff, Monica Abend,
12 who's worked critically on this; my Legislative
13 Director, Drew Gabriel. This is really important
14 legislation because if we don't give our young people
15 all the tools that they can have, then we are setting
16 them up for failure. We can talk about all of the
17 algebra and geometry and mathematics and science, but
18 if we are sending our young people down a road with
19 HIV, AIDS; many other diseases that could be
20 prevented and unintended pregnancies, then we've done
21 them a great disservice.

22 I thank all of my colleagues for
23 supporting me today and I thank you for your support.
24 Thank you.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

Council Member Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very much, Madame Speaker and Madame Public Advocate. Good afternoon to all of my colleagues. I am proud to stand here and talk about Int. 0957-A which will require... [interpose]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: the Department of Education to report information on instructors receiving training in sexual health education. Our great city has recognized the importance of sexual health education... [interpose]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: and has since academic year 2011-12 mandated that public school students take a semester of sex ed. in both middle and high school. Despite this mandate, educators teaching these subjects do not have a standard curriculum and are not required to obtain certification. While the Department of Education provides optional professional development, whether or not someone chooses to take this isn't necessarily tracked nor followed up on. This important

1
2 legislation will bring transparency to the level of
3 education and optional professional development
4 obtained by the educators who teach sexual health
5 education in our public schools by requiring the DOE
6 to report on the number of licensed health
7 instructors employed by the department, the number of
8 instructors assigned to teach at least one health
9 education class, the number and percentage of
10 instructors who received professional development
11 training by the DOE on sexual health education, as
12 well as the total number and percentage of
13 instructors who attended multiple sessions of
14 professional development provided by the DOE.

15 Conversations around sexual health can
16 truly be sensitive, particularly with our teenagers
17 and it is extremely important that all of our
18 teachers are knowledgeable, skilled and prepared to
19 discuss what can be a very difficult subject. Sexual
20 health education saves lives and it is imperative
21 that all of our young people have equal access to
22 well-informed teachers. Simply put, the quality of
23 our students' education and their health outcomes are
24 too important to be determined by the level of
25 instruction their teacher chooses to obtain. It is

1
2 truly my hope that this legislation encourages our
3 educators to focus on evidence-based approaches,
4 allows us to better evaluate the sex education
5 mandate, as well as improving sexual health education
6 for all of our young people.

7 I wanna thank our Speaker, Melissa Mark-
8 Viverito for her commitment and leadership, the Chair
9 of the Committee on Education, Council Member Danny
10 Dromm for supporting this measure and allowing this
11 bill to come forward. I thank all of my colleagues
12 for prioritizing the health and wellbeing of the
13 students of our great city. I also wanna thank my
14 fellow co-chairs who also introduced important bills,
15 Council Member Laurie Cumbo and Council Member Corey
16 Johnson. I also wanna recognize all of the advocates
17 and our powerful youth and their impactful
18 [background comments] voices that have been a very
19 critical part of this discussion moving forward. I
20 too recognize Laura Popa, Matt Gewolb, Eric
21 Bernstein, Aysha Schomburg, as well as my staff,
22 Kaitlyn O'Hagan and Dana Wax. Thank you so much;
23 this is truly a very important piece of legislation
24 and I'm thankful to have been introduced as well as
25 to have been a part of very critical conversations

1
2 moving forward. Thank you very much, Madame Public
3 Advocate and Madame Speaker.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. Next
5 we'll be voting on legislation to protect the job
6 security of workers in grocery stores that have
7 recently changed ownership. Across the city there
8 has been a trend of supermarkets and grocery stores
9 changing ownership frequently. Workers at these
10 stores frequently have no job protections and can
11 find themselves in a position of becoming unemployed
12 with no notice or warning.

13 This legislation will require new
14 ownership to retain existing employees for 90 days
15 after acquiring a grocery store. After these 90
16 days, the employees must be evaluated and the owner
17 may offer them continued employment going forward.
18 This is legislation that protects hardworking New
19 Yorkers who currently find themselves in a vulnerable
20 position through no fault of their own.

21 This City Council is committed to
22 protecting the rights and dignity of all workers on
23 our city and with today's legislation we're taking
24 another step towards that goal. Grocery store
25 employees provide a valuable service to their

1
2 community and at a minimum should have the
3 opportunity to prove their worth before losing their
4 job due to changes in ownership.

5 I wanna thank all my colleagues for their
6 support on this important legislation and Council
7 Member Miller is the lead sponsor and he'll say a few
8 words.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madame
10 Speaker. As the Speaker just mentioned, that today
11 we voted this 0632 out of the Civil Service and Labor
12 Committee and we'll be voted on it here today. It's
13 been a great topic of conversation over the past
14 year-and-a-half as grocery stores have changed
15 ownership throughout the city, but has been
16 highlighted over the last few months as we've seen
17 the bankruptcy of A&P Supermarkets, including
18 Pathmark, Food Emporium, Waldbaum's and Food Basics
19 subsidiaries and highly destabilized impacts on the
20 closure of the sales and mergers of supermarkets and
21 communities.

22 The impact on communities where we have
23 seen dozens and sometimes even hundreds of workers
24 simultaneously out of a job has great impact on
25 communities; this bill will certainly give us an

1
2 opportunity to address that. Workers have been
3 pushed out of their jobs, families apply for
4 government assistance; communities left wanting and
5 lacking nutritional services. While Grocery Workers
6 Retention Act is but a small step to address this
7 crisis, it is a step in the right direction. Through
8 the simple act of providing a 90-day transition
9 period following a change in ownership of grocery
10 store, we may help families throughout the city.
11 There are 50,000 supermarket workers throughout the
12 city; close to two-thirds of that come from the
13 immigrant community; the act will serve to protect
14 workers' rights, allowing accountability needed to
15 protect workers against wage theft in a traditionally
16 low-paying field; it allows for experienced employees
17 to be evaluated by their new ownership and
18 potentially continue delivering critical services at
19 competent levels to local communities and to provide
20 a transition window for employees to seek new
21 employment where they'll continue employment beyond
22 90 days is unlikely [sic]. A similar concept that
23 has been included and others were warned [sic] on the
24 federal act and notification prior to this mass
25 layoff [sic] does not exist currently. Finally and

1
2 most importantly, the legislation will help to ensure
3 that a knowledgeable workforce trained in proper food
4 preparation, health regulations and sanitation
5 procedures are employed to our local supermarkets and
6 in our local communities. For this reason I urge my
7 colleagues to support 0632 and look forward to its
8 passage.

9 I would also like to thank the many
10 advocates who have worked on this for more than a
11 year; I'd like to thank the staff... [interpose]

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: it has been very
14 complicated [background comments] working with all
15 parties involved over the past year, so I'd like to
16 thank Mr. Ali Rasoulinejad; for my staff, who have
17 worked tirelessly on this legislation and again, look
18 forward to the passage.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
20 Council Member.

21 Today we're also... I just wanna at least
22 recognize and I know we'll be hearing from our
23 Majority Leader later, but today we're also voting on
24 two resolutions that call for legislation to be
25 passed, both on the state and federal level, that

1
2 will restore honorable discharge status to any former
3 service members who were discharged in the past due
4 to the don't ask, don't tell policy. I'll just take
5 an aside and I know that Jimmy Van Bramer, our
6 Majority Leader's husband, Dan Hendrick is here today
7 as we pass and adopt these two resolutions which
8 directly impacted him and as a result we've been
9 inspired to take action on this. We all know that
10 don't ask, don't tell was -- where is he; is he in
11 back there? [background comments] Okay, there he
12 is. Okay, good to see you, Dan. [applause] We all
13 know that don't ask, don't tell was terrible
14 discriminatory policy and President Obama was right
15 to end it, but we can't forget those who have and
16 still do suffer as a result of it; that's why the
17 Council will call on Albany and Washington, D.C. to
18 fully restore honorable status to all those brave men
19 and women who did nothing but tell the truth about
20 who they are and received a less than honorable
21 discharge as a result. So again, these are two
22 resolutions that we will be speaking about later on;
23 I'm really proud that this Council is taking this
24 measure.

1
2 And before we finish, I do wanna
3 recognize Officer Sherrod Stuart, an NYPD officer who
4 was wounded by a gunshot while in the line of duty
5 last Sunday; this was in my district and I know that
6 we were all very concerned; glad to hear that he's
7 gonna make a full recovery; we definitely thank him
8 for his service and all those NYPD officers that each
9 and every day put their lives on the line for every
10 one of us. Our brave men and women put their lives
11 on the line and this is just another reminder of the
12 gratitude and respect we all owe them for their
13 selfless commitment to keeping this city safe.

14 And I'd like to end, but today just to
15 take note that today marks the one-year anniversary
16 of the one-year since the enactment of our Vision
17 Zero initiative. The members of this City Council
18 all worked hard to pass a comprehensive package of
19 legislation that created commonsense solutions to
20 making our streets safer for drivers, cyclists and
21 pedestrians alike and we're proud to say that in the
22 last year traffic fatalities are down by 23% and
23 pedestrian fatalities by 27%. These bills have saved
24 lives and we all look forward to making our streets
25 even safer in the future. So again, thank you to all

1
2 of my colleagues and that ends communication from the
3 Speaker.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet
5 in the chambers, please. And now General Orders,
6 beginning with Council Member Barron.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madame
8 Public Advocate.

9 I wanna call my colleagues' attention to
10 Reso 0969 and 0970, which addresses the Van Sinderen
11 Plaza. It's new construction of two 7-story
12 buildings with ground floor commercial use and 130
13 residential units above; this is an ELLA project that
14 is 100% affordable to the people who live in my
15 community. Not only are all of the units below 60%
16 AMI, but there are designated bands so that there's
17 not a bunching at the top. There's 27% AMIs, 37%
18 AMI, 47% AMI and 57% AMI. That means that you can
19 get a one-bedroom apartment for as low as \$396 or a
20 three-bedroom apartment for \$882; that's the lower
21 range of the rentals. There are also eight units
22 that are reserved for Section 8 and there is a
23 superintendent's unit included in the construction.
24 In addition, there are 21 parking spaces and 69
25 bicycle spaces involved in that. It's partnering

1
2 with a local developer that's there and there's local
3 preferences for the community and amenities include a
4 recreation room, a laundry room and an outdoor
5 terrace in each of the two buildings.

6 So we wanna thank those who worked on
7 this -- Amy Levitan, Brian Paul, Roger Mann and my
8 staff members -- Joy Simmons and Ndigo Washington,
9 and I wanna thank everyone for looking at this and
10 considering the benefits as we talk about affordable
11 housing. Thank you so much.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Minority Leader
13 Steven Matteo.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you, Madame
15 Public Advocate. I just wanna say a few words in
16 support of the land use items on the agenda for the
17 Landmark Colony Project in my district. I wanna
18 start off by thanking Chair Greenfield and Chair
19 Richards and my colleagues on the Land Use Committee
20 for supporting this critical project, James Lloyd and
21 the Land Use Division for their work, New York City
22 EDC staff, past and present, particularly Elaina
23 Benares [sp?] for her help. I suspect there's a
24 property like Landmark Colony in every borough; maybe
25 in every council district, an abandoned historic site

1
2 that deteriorated from blight but that seems to
3 stubbornly resist any attempts to be redeveloped or
4 revitalized. Landmark Colony has been in decay for
5 so long it even has its own urban legend haunting its
6 crumbling buildings. But someone saw in these ruins
7 a potential jewel; that person was my predecessor and
8 current Staten Island Borough President, Jimmy Oddo.
9 I am proud to have helped him shepherd this project
10 to today's vote, but make no mistake; it was his
11 vision, his persistence and his tenacity that brought
12 us to this point. Though it may appear this project
13 began with an RFEI in 2012, it really started about
14 17 years ago with Jim's efforts to find purpose for
15 the historic buildings under a former Staten Island
16 farm colony that were crumbling, frequently
17 vandalized and replete with graffiti. As his chief
18 of staff for 10 years, time and again we would ask
19 the City to construct fences to keep out vandals and
20 drug addicts or to clean the buildings, only to
21 witness the degradation to continue. We flirted with
22 many potential developers, only to see their
23 proposals fall through, including a 2007 plan that
24 came so close to turning the site into a technology
25 campus, but after many swings and misses we finally

1
2 hit a home run on this project. The proposal on
3 today's agenda will transform the site into 350 units
4 of senior housing, 17,000 sq. ft. of commercial
5 space, as well as a central green space and accessory
6 parking. The old carriage houses and other
7 structures will literally get a new lease on life
8 after being restored and rebuilt and will become home
9 to seniors who are personally invested in their
10 upkeep. The proposal is the ideal mix of future use
11 and the preservation of these magnificent structures;
12 most importantly, it helps meet a critical need for
13 senior housing on Staten Island; so many borough
14 residents will be able to live their sunset years
15 close to their home community and families.

16 So as I said before and I said this in
17 the committee, this is the right project at the right
18 time and the right place and I just wanna finally
19 thank my staff, my Chief of Operations, Peter Spencer
20 and my Chief of Staff, David Carr for their hard work
21 and I urge my colleagues to support this project.
22 Thank you.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations.
24 Council Member Garodnick.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you,
3 Madame Public Advocate. I rise today to speak on
4 Int. 0632, a bill that would protect grocery workers
5 from layoffs at the hands of a new grocery store
6 owner for 90 days. I believe this is a well-
7 intentioned effort and I have great respect for the
8 bill sponsor and I agree that we should all ask
9 ourselves why it is that grocery workers have so few
10 rights today; they should have rights, they should
11 have protections and certainty in their jobs; that of
12 course is what unions are for and we should support
13 efforts that these workers organize and to demand
14 fair wages and other protections, but with this bill
15 we are interjecting our local government into private
16 enterprise in a way that we should not be doing; we
17 are going too far and without a clear rationale that
18 can be more broadly applied. Why, for example are we
19 protecting workers only for 90 days; why not 6 months
20 or a year or more? Why are we limiting ourselves to
21 this industry; why not protect the workers at our
22 local pizza shop or those at any mom and pop
23 establishment in the city or even the financial
24 services industry? If you buy a supermarket with 100
25 workers and you believe that you can make it survive

1
2 and turn a profit but only with 90 workers, we should
3 let you do that without interference. Obviously it
4 is in a new owner's interest to take enough time,
5 maybe even 90 days or more to determine who they need
6 to keep before making big decisions, but setting
7 specific timeframes and restrictions and
8 micromanaging particular business sectors should not
9 be the domain of government. And by the way, New
10 York City is losing a lot of supermarkets; this is a
11 constant issue in each of our districts; the result
12 is food deserts in areas of the city that are
13 woefully underserved. As we pass this bill, let us
14 not forget that we are creating an additional burden
15 on supermarkets here and making it less appealing for
16 a new owner to pick up a struggling supermarket and
17 as a result, that will make it even less likely that
18 they will survive. The intent of this law is
19 admirable, but I believe it is the wrong way to go
20 about it; as a result, I will be voting no. Thank
21 you.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
23 Reynoso.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you.
25 First and foremost, I wanna just give a shout-out to

1
2 my good friend, Daneek Miller over his legislation
3 that he's passing, but I'm going to have to disagree
4 on support for that legislation and 10,000 sq. ft., I
5 challenge anyone to find a bodega or a grocery store
6 that is 10,000 sq. ft. or larger; in my neighborhood,
7 these are actually called supermarkets. In
8 Williamsburg and Bushwick these supermarkets were
9 present when no one wanted to offer services or food
10 choices to poor neighborhoods of color; we are not
11 talking about an A&P or a Pathmark, multimillion
12 dollar corporation, we are talking about mostly
13 first-generation immigrant-owned businesses,
14 predominantly Dominican-owned; not Wal-Mart, but
15 Associated and Key Food. When Bushwick was burning
16 and no one wanted to live in Williamsburg, these
17 businesses were present. We have to start
18 establishing the difference between a Wal-Mart and a
19 small business. I think that we can look out for the
20 best interests of all, including workers in a lot of
21 the work that we do here, but this bill does not do
22 that and I'm going to encourage my colleagues to vote
23 no on Int. 0632-B. Thank you.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
25 Vacca.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I want to agree
3 with my colleagues; I think 0632 is very misguided
4 and when it was originally discussed in leadership, I
5 voiced my views on this. This is unprecedented and
6 it's a precedent-setting measure that I think in
7 future years the Council will regret. The reality is
8 that we don't even do this in government. Do we tell
9 a principal who's taking over a failing school in
10 this city, you have 90 days and you cannot remove
11 anyone, even though your school is going down the
12 tubes? We hold you accountable, but no one's to be
13 removed for 90 days. No, we don't do that. Do we
14 tell agency commissioners, you're a new agency
15 commissioner, but for 90 days you're new and you
16 can't do anything that you want to do, you can't fire
17 people; you have to transition them for 90 days; do
18 we do that? No. Are we gonna see legislation in
19 this chamber to do that? No. But we seem to have
20 selected one industry that we think we should do this
21 to and Councilman Reynoso raised the point that I
22 want to echo; as a Bronx councilman, I've had fights
23 in my district to keep supermarkets; you know what
24 we're seeing, supermarkets are leaving places like
25 the Bronx; we're getting these chain drug stores all

1
2 over the place; we can't keep supermarkets, the
3 entire South Bronx has a lack of supermarkets; we
4 should be encouraging supermarkets and in the
5 previous Council we legislatively tried to do that
6 and incentivize it. This measure is interference
7 101, it is something that we do not need; it is
8 absolutely uncalled for, it's precedent-setting and I
9 urge my colleagues to vote no.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 Council Member Kallos.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Good afternoon.

13 I first just wanna thank our Speaker, because we
14 actually have debate in our body and I think that's a
15 good thing.

16 I want to congratulate Council Member
17 Miller, a huge supporter of the Grocery Worker
18 Retention Act; I actually did my undergraduate study
19 on supermarket turnover and what the industry finds
20 is when people come in; when you get rid of people,
21 that actually costs a lot of money; as all of us
22 know, whenever we have turnover in our staffs, that
23 takes a lot of time and money from us and there is a
24 public interest in supermarkets specifically, as the
25 precedent was set by the previous Council. So any

1
2 time a supermarket goes out of business, we end up
3 with a food desert; when a food desert happens, we
4 have no access to healthy food in neighborhoods and
5 people have a public health consequence and we see
6 rising numbers in obesity. The best thing we can do
7 is provide stability, about 90 days of stability and
8 what this means is that when a new owner comes in and
9 they might have that instinct to fire everyone
10 because, as our society tends to work, we always
11 blame the workers instead of the leadership; somehow
12 new leadership will change things as long as you
13 blame the workers, but here we're protecting the
14 workers so that a person does have a chance to get to
15 know what's happening and I think my colleagues have
16 made some salient points, but one thing I will say is
17 as appointed and elected officials come and go, we
18 have a very strong civil service that stays
19 regardless and they do not get fired, regardless of
20 which administration we have and those are the people
21 who keep our city running; we need to support our
22 workers in our supermarkets and we need to support
23 our communities because a new person coming in from
24 nowhere buying a supermarket, firing all the
25 employees who work and live in that community and

1
2 then taking the risk of it going belly up leaves all
3 of us in a position where we have supermarkets going
4 out of business, including on the Upper East Side and
5 we need to protect our neighborhoods and the access
6 to healthy food. Thank you.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
8 Council Member Espinal.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I'm gonna speak
10 on Int. 0632-B and I'm just gonna echo a lot of what
11 Garodnick, Reynoso and Vacca have said. You know
12 while I am sympathetic to the plight that some of
13 these workers go through after an ownership change, I
14 have serious reservations about this bill and the
15 negative effect that I believe it will have on these
16 small supermarkets, many of which are owned by small
17 business owners and immigrants. These small business
18 owners scrap and save for years to make owning a
19 grocery store a reality and to ask them to carry
20 these employees and continue paying rent for three
21 months; it's just not fair, especially in a city
22 where the price of just owning and operating a
23 business is going too high. So I also encourage my
24 colleagues to vote no on Int. 0632-B.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
3 Council Member Lander.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madame
5 Public Advocate. I also am speaking on Int. 0632-B
6 and I also appreciate the robust debate, which is
7 good to have in the body. I'm strongly supportive of
8 it and I think it's important to recognize really why
9 we're doing this and what the risk is and to do that
10 I wanna make one slight correction to what Council
11 Member Vacca said... [interpose]

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: this is not
14 unprecedented, this is not the first industry we've
15 done it for; we did it for building service workers,
16 the Displaced Worker Retention Act, and the reason we
17 did it is as following: firms were going around
18 bidding to undercut existing firms who clean
19 buildings with the sole goal of saving money by
20 getting rid of workers who may have been covered by a
21 union contract or may have just had seniority through
22 step increases; obviously you can clean those
23 buildings a lot more cheaply if you fire those
24 workers and hire workers who either aren't unionized
25 or all come in at entry level wages or you're willing

1
2 to pay less and that's not what we wanna see and it's
3 not what we wanted to see in building service work
4 and it's not what we wanna see in our grocery stores
5 either; we want to make it possible and I think there
6 are more things we can do to strengthen and improve
7 the Fresh Program; actually, Council Member Menchaca
8 and I were asking some questions at a hearing the
9 other day, but it is not right to achieve those
10 savings simply by firing an incumbent workforce and
11 bringing in a cheaper and lower paid workforce, and
12 all this bill does is give those workers 90 days to
13 prove their worth so they have a chance to continue
14 to be hired there. We're actually losing
15 supermarkets in my district as well, it might
16 surprise you to learn; we lost one in Windsor
17 Terrace; we're losing them in Park Slope. In Windsor
18 Terrace the owner agreed, despite the fact that this
19 law wasn't in place, to hire the incumbent workers
20 back and is having great success so far; it is not an
21 unreasonable burden on the owners, it simply makes
22 sure that we don't offer a pathway to the low road to
23 encouraging people to run a business model that's
24 based on firing incumbent workers and hiring people

1
2 at much lower wages, so I encourage my colleagues to
3 vote aye. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: council Member
5 Dromm.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very
7 much, Madame Public Advocate. I too wanna speak in
8 favor of 0632-B. I have seen personally the
9 detrimental effects of what happens when these...
10 [interpose]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: small supermarkets
13 close their doors or lock out their immigrant
14 employees; we had such a situation at the trade fair
15 in Jackson Heights about two years ago, when one day
16 two weeks before Christmas the employees arrived at
17 work only to find out that they had been locked out
18 of the doors and when the new owner came in and took
19 over the supermarket, he would not rehire those
20 workers, even though they had never done anything
21 wrong. I totally agree with this legislation; I'm
22 proud to be a co-sponsor of it and nothing in this
23 law says that the workers have to be kept on past the
24 90-day limits; this is just a protection to give them
25 an opportunity to be able to advance themselves and

1
2 to prove their worth to the new owners as what
3 should've happened in this Jackson Heights immigrant-
4 owned supermarket. Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
6 Johnson for a vote. No? Oh. Council Member
7 Lancman.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Yeah, I just
9 wanna make it clear, as others have at this point,
10 that there's nothing unprecedented about this bill at
11 all; not only do we provide the same recognition for
12 building service workers here in New York City, but
13 there's federal legislation called the WARN Act,
14 there's state versions which prohibit the termination
15 of employees when there's a plant closing or a
16 business closing for a certain period of time, so
17 it's not unprecedented and if you consider the
18 important role that food service workers play in our
19 communities in making sure that the food that we
20 purchase and eat is safe, it makes sense to me that
21 we should give these employees that measure of
22 protection, both for themselves but also for the
23 benefit of us as consumers. So I don't have any
24 problem with extending this concept beyond building
25 service workers to supermarket workers and I think as

1
2 the years go by we will actually look at extending
3 these protections to other segments of the workforce
4 where it is appropriate. So I'll be voting aye and I
5 urge all my colleagues to do the same.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
7 Seeing none other... Council Member Treyger.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,
9 Madame Public Advocate. I would just like to quickly
10 just paint, you know, a true picture; in Bensonhurst,
11 in my colleague, Council Member Gentile's, in our
12 community...

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: there's a
15 supermarket on 18th Avenue, Waldbaum's, that the
16 workers there found out about their future closing
17 through the media, through no proper official
18 notification or notice. I would also add that food
19 is not just any other item; it is something that is
20 absolutely critical towards serving the needs of our
21 constituents. So I would just say then, also with
22 regards to schools, a new principal cannot just come
23 in and fire people; that's why we have unions, and so
24 I think that this is something that we should be very
25 mindful of; that food is not any other type of

1
2 commerce; this is critical to meet the needs of our
3 people; these workers should not find out through a
4 press release or through a newspaper article that
5 they're being fired, especially during the Christmas
6 season. Okay and I just wanted to echo those
7 comments and Daneek Miller I think is doing this from
8 a good place in his heart. Thank you very much.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
10 Council Member Steve Levin.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
12 much, Madame Public Advocate. I just want to voice
13 my support for... [interpose]

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: for Int. 0632-B
16 and speak to portions of the bill that specify what
17 an owner can do if they determine that the staffing
18 level needs to be changed as per a new business model
19 and so I want to encourage my colleagues to take a
20 look at that in the language of the legislation
21 because it does provide for an opportunity; if an
22 establishment needs to downsize to support their
23 business plan, they may do so. In addition, I want
24 to mention that it's my understanding that this
25 legislation, that the sponsor of this bill was able

1
2 to engage in meaningful dialogue with the grocery
3 store industry and companies that represent grocery
4 establishments and they were able to have meaningful
5 dialogue in the development of this legislation and
6 so, you know we have to at times stand up for those
7 workers whose interests are not looked out for by the
8 marketplace and we need to ensure that they are able
9 to have a fighting shot at making it here in New York
10 City and so therefore I am proud to co-sponsor this
11 bill and I encourage my colleagues to vote aye.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Seeing none
13 other... Council Member Williams.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I
15 was sitting here listening and it was... I understood
16 the opposition that I heard, but it seemed to me that
17 many of those opposing voices would've made more
18 sense if this was in perpetuity. The fact that this
19 is only 90 days might make some people uncomfortable
20 because they wanna move faster, but it seems to me
21 that we have a duty to try to protect folks while
22 respecting businesses' rights and I believe that this
23 bill does that; all it does is provide a time period
24 so people can get their bearings and try to prove
25 their worth in the business and try to give people

1
2 some ability to bargain, and the fact that it also,
3 to my understanding, allows an opportunity; if
4 businesses feel they don't need that many people, to
5 actually let some of the people go. So it seems like
6 we found the sweet spot on this one and I'm a little
7 confused as to some of the opposition, particularly
8 the fact that this is just a temporary measure and I
9 believe as the city, we should allow those type of
10 measures so people are not crushed in times such as
11 these, but provide a little breathing room and so I'm
12 proud to support this legislation and congratulate
13 all those who sponsored it.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Any others?
15 Seeing none, let's move on to the Report of Special
16 Committees.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
19 Standing Committees.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
21 on Civil Service and Labor, Int. 0632-B, grocery
22 industry to retain eligible employees.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
24 coupled on general order.

25

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
3 on Education, Int. 0771-A, Department of Education to
4 report on student health services.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
6 coupled on general order.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 0952-A, Department
8 of Education to report information regarding health
9 education.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
11 coupled on general order.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 0957-A, Department
13 of Education training and sexual health education.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15 coupled on general order.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
17 on Finance, Int. 0798-B.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
19 coupled on general order.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 1007-A, Metrotech
21 BID.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
23 coupled on general order.

24
25

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 1030-A, increasing
3 the amount to be expended annually in nine business
4 improvement districts.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
6 coupled on general order.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered
8 Resolution 0957, organizations to receive funding.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
10 general order.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
12 on Housing and Buildings, Int. 0049-A, notice by
13 Department of Buildings.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15 coupled on general orders.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
17 on Land Use, Land Use 0299, Reso 0959 and Land Use
18 0300 and Reso 0960, sidewalk cafés.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled to be
20 filed pursuant to letter of withdrawal.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Land Use 0315 and Reso
22 0961 and Land Use 0316 and Reso 0962, sidewalk cafés.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
24 general order.

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Land Use 0318 and Reso
3 0964, landmark designation, Mount Morris Park.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
5 general order.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Land Use 0321 and Reso
7 0965, zoning resolution, Staten Island.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Couple on general
9 order.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Land Use 0322 and Reso
11 0966 and LU 0323 and Reso 0967, zoning resolution and
12 map, Staten Island.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
14 general order.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Land Use 0324 and Reso
16 0968, disposition of one city-owned property, Staten
17 island.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
19 general order.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Land Use 0325 and Reso
21 0969 and Land Use 0326 and Reso 0970, zoning map
22 amendment and UDAAP, Brooklyn.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
24 general order.

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: General order calendar
3 is a resolution appointing various persons,
4 Commissioner of Deeds.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Did you do 0326
6 Land Use; I didn't hear that one?

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: It was Land Use 0325
8 and Reso 0969... [crosstalk]

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh got it, 0326,
10 got it. General order calendar, the Commissioner of
11 Deeds, coupled on general order.

12 And at this time I ask for a roll call on
13 all items on the coupled general order calendar.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
17 explain my vote.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I
20 just wanna commend all of my colleagues who have
21 bills that are being voted on today and I just want
22 to also say that in addition to all of the
23 information that I gave you about the Van Sinderen
24 Plaza project, the rents are protected for 60 years.
25 I vote aye on all.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 68

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
4 except 0632.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Congratulations to
7 my colleagues and I vote aye on all.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I abstain on LU
10 0325 and 0326 and aye on the rest of the general
11 orders calendar.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on
14 all.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on all.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Abstain on
21 0952-A and aye on everything else.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Congratulations
24 to all of my colleagues; in particular to Council
25

1
2 Member Barron for 60 years of affordability and I
3 vote aye.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Permission to
6 explain my vote.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I want to thank
9 and congratulate Council Member Laurie Cumbo, Council
10 Member Vanessa Gibson and Council Member Corey
11 Johnson on their landmark sex education, health
12 education legislation today; for the first time, LGBT
13 students, non-gender [sic] students will be included
14 in this legislation, which will give them age-
15 appropriate and... [interpose]

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: gender-appropriate
18 sex education in our public school system; this is
19 huge and I congratulate them and thank them for the
20 job that they've done. I also wanna thank Aysha
21 Schomburg, who was insistent upon making sure that it
22 was LGBT-inclusive as well and congratulations to
23 Council Member Daneek Miller on his piece of
24 legislation. I vote aye.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote no on
Int. 0632-B and vote aye on the rest.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I request
permission to vote on all Land Use Call-ups and all
the items in the agenda today..

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: and I vote yes on
all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: I vote
aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: No on 0632-B
and aye on the rest.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
explain my vote, quickly.. [crosstalk]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yeah. Yes.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madame
3 Public Advocate. I wanna thank Chair Danny Dromm for
4 his leadership on all the education matters that we
5 deal with certainly around sex health education,
6 truly important. I wanna thank Council Member Laurie
7 Cumbo for her leadership, as well as Council Member
8 Corey Johnson for his commitment and leadership...

9 [interpose]

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: as well. And
12 truly wanna thank Council Member Daneek Miller for
13 leading the conversation on the Grocery Workers
14 Retention Act; I appreciate all of my colleagues
15 raising very valid concerns, but I do think that this
16 is something that is reasonable that we are asking
17 for in a period of transition trying to protect as
18 many jobs as possible even if for 90 days; these are
19 the same residents that we represent that will be
20 coming to us about employment opportunities and so
21 anything that we can do to retain employment for as
22 long as possible during a period of transition is
23 certainly something we should be willing to do, so
24 I'm proud to have been a sponsor of this bill and I
25 will be voting aye on all and thank you so much,

1 Council Member Daneek Miller for your leadership.

2 Thank you, Madame Public Advocate.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: May I explain
5 my vote?
6

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you. I
9 want to congratulate my colleagues on their
10 legislation; also want to congratulate Council Member
11 Barron and Council Member Matteo on important
12 achievements in their respective districts in the
13 land use world. Want to also take the opportunity to
14 welcome my new Communications Director, Stephen
15 Snowden, who is a military combat veteran in Mosul,
16 Iraq, after which he joined Obama for America and
17 most recently he was a reporter for Reorg Research,
18 welcome him onboard. And I will vote aye on all with
19 the exception of 0632-B, where I'm voting no. Thank
20 you.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you,
6 Madame Public Advocate. I apologize I wasn't here
7 when the Speaker spoke earlier, but I wanted to speak
8 very briefly regarding Int. 0771-A, a bill that I
9 hope to pass today that will require the Department
10 of Education to report... [interpose]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

12 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: to the City
13 Council on key statistics [background comment]
14 regarding student health services. One of our
15 primary responsibilities to students in New York City
16 schools is to ensure that they're healthy and well
17 cared for; if we want them to succeed academically,
18 if we want them to succeed in life, we have to ensure
19 they are provided adequate health and mental health
20 services. Unfortunately we receive too little
21 information about the health services that our kids
22 are receiving throughout our school system; we in the
23 City Council know anecdotally that some schools in
24 our district are better prepared than others to
25 deliver healthcare services, but we currently lack

1
2 comprehensive data that is needed to optimally
3 address this issue. By requiring comprehensive data
4 collection and annual reporting from the Department
5 of Education, this bill will provide critical
6 information needed to help improve health services in
7 schools across all five boroughs... [interpose]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Our school
10 healthcare practitioners [background comment] are
11 dedicated, compassionate men and women who work hard
12 every day for the sake of our city's youth. This
13 bill seeks to aid them in their efforts by
14 identifying resource gaps and finding areas for
15 improvement; they want nothing more than to perform
16 their duties; with the necessary data at hand, the
17 City Council can better deliver resources and
18 allocate budget dollars on schools that need it most.

19 I'd like to thank my colleagues who co-
20 sponsored this legislation and I wanna thank Chair
21 Dromm for his leadership and for hearing this bill,
22 and with that I vote aye on all.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
24 Council Member Vacca for a vote.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye on all
3 except I vote no on 0632-B.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to
7 explain my vote.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Just wanna take a
10 moment to reflect and say thank you to everyone who
11 helped make this particular moment possible with
12 regards to health education in our schools. Having
13 health education in reproductive health, gender
14 identity; all the things that all of us hope that the
15 1.1 million children would receive every year has
16 been something that I think many of us have been
17 working for for years; I remember meeting with Danny
18 backing 2012 when I was but a candidate and I am glad
19 that we have Danny as our chair of the Education
20 Committee; glad that we have Laurie as our chair of
21 the Women's Issues Committee who has introduced this
22 legislation and helped make it pass and this is what
23 a City Council should look like and I just wanna
24 thank all of us who are a part of it and I vote aye
25 on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Congratulations to everyone today and I vote aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I want to congratulate Council Members Cumbo, Johnson and Gibson on their legislation, particularly on the issue of reproductive and sexual health education; with two kids in the public school system and with a wife who works at Planned Parenthood New York City, I know from firsthand anecdote that we're falling quite short of our obligations to what we're doing, but it is good to have data in addition to human experience and so I think it's great that we're gonna have this

1
2 legislation to make sure we really know what's going
3 on in all our schools and I wanna thank the Chair and
4 the Council Members for making sure so we can
5 continue to push for and improve policy over time,
6 and I also wanna congratulate Council Member Miller
7 on the Grocery Worker Retention Act. I vote aye on
8 all.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
12 explain my vote.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you. First
15 I wanna congratulate my colleagues, Council Member
16 Matteo, Council Member Barron, Council Members
17 Johnson, Cumbo and Gibson, as well as Council Member
18 Miller and everybody else that has bills today, but
19 in regards to my previous comments on Int. 0632-B, I
20 wanna point my colleagues to Page 3, Subsection 2; it
21 says "a successor grocery employer shall retain each
22 eligible grocery employee for the transitional
23 employment period and accept as provided in Paragraph
24 3 of this subdivision, a successor grocery employer
25 shall not discharge an eligible grocery employee

1
2 retained pursuant to this section during the
3 transitional employment period without cause." And
4 then Subsection 3 details "if at any time during the
5 transitional employment period a successor grocery
6 employer determines that it requires fewer eligible
7 grocery employees than were employed by the incumbent
8 grocery employer, such successor grocery employer
9 shall retain such eligible grocery employees by
10 seniority within each job category," which shows
11 that, you know, that's a meaningful accommodation to
12 a potential successor employer if they deem that they
13 need to downsize; I just wanted to put that in for
14 the record. Thank you very much and I vote aye on
15 all.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Vote aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Aye.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye on all
23 and all Land Use Call-ups.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca.

[background comments]

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Congratulations to all my colleagues; I vote aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Congratulations to my colleagues on this important legislation, as well as retaining some of the benefits that they have for the communities in Staten Island and particularly in East New York, Brooklyn and I am thankful for all the members for their robust debate and conversation over what I think is such important legislation as the Grocery Worker Retention legislation, but I think that it was thoughtful legislation; all parties were involved and I'm happy that it's being passed this afternoon, so thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And how do you vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye on all... [crosstalk]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madame Chair.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

2 [background comments]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye on
7 all, with the exception of Int. 0632-B. Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: First just
11 wanted to welcome my new intern, Felicia Thomas from
12 Brooklyn College. Also wanted to congratulate
13 Minority Leader Steve Matteo on a job well done on
14 Landmark Colony; took 40 years to get this done and
15 it was an honor to work with you on this project and
16 the Land Use staff. Also wanted to congratulate my
17 colleague... [interpose]

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Council Member
20 Miller [background comments] on a very timely bill
21 for Southeast Queens; we both share, well technically
22 share a supermarket that recently closed and you know
23 honestly, when I went in there the other day to shop,
24 I thought of the bill and said you know what, I was
25

1
2 able to look at these young people in the eye and say
3 we did everything we can to keep your jobs for you
4 and that's what this bill is all about, so I wanted
5 to congratulate him on a job well done. With that
6 being said, I vote aye on all.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye on all and
9 permission to exceedingly quickly explain my vote.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I just wanna
12 congratulate Council Member Miller with this piece of
13 legislation; as I sat outside at the press rally..
14 [interpose]

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: the truth of
17 the matter is; businesses succeed when they treat
18 their workers well and I think that this time we had
19 to legislate something, but you know, all of our
20 efforts to treat our workers well and make sure that
21 they are given their fair due as employees I support
22 a 100%, so I just wanna thank Council Member Miller
23 for carrying this bill. So aye on all.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I'd like to first welcome my new Legislative Director, Anna Scaife, today is her first day with my office. I'd also like to congratulate Council Members Cumbo, Johnson and Gibson, as well as the Chair of Education Committee, Danny Dromm for sending a message that just because it's not on the Regents doesn't mean it's unimportant and I've been a big, big supporter of making sure that whatever's not being tested doesn't mean that it doesn't matter to our everyday communities, so... [crosstalk]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: congratulations and kudos for your leadership. [background comments] And as well as to my colleague, Council Member Daneek Miller for standing up not just for workers, but for communities and for the stability of communities as well. And with that I vote aye on all. Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Excused to
8 explain my vote.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I
11 just wanted to reiterate; I mean my notations come
12 from me having owned a business, a restaurant...

13 [interpose]

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: unfortunately I
16 failed miserably, but I believe that I probably would
17 have been as a business owner slightly miffed at this
18 piece of legislation... [interpose]

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me,
20 Council Member. Sergeant at Arms; can you ask the
21 individuals in the vestibule to please remain quiet?
22 Thank you. Go ahead.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: and although I
24 would've found it uncomfortable, I think that
25

1
2 uncomfortableness is definitely outweighed by the
3 need to protect these workers and the fact that it is
4 not in perpetuity; that it is for a limited time
5 period and there is a provision in there that if all
6 of these workers are not needed you can release them.
7 As I said before, I think it definitely provides a
8 sweet spot protecting business owners' interests as
9 well as making sure that there's a lifeline for many
10 of these workers so they're not cut off on the knees,
11 so I want to vote aye on all, with the exception of
12 Land Use Nos. 0322, 23 and 24, which are abstained,
13 and I just wanna say congratulations.. well not
14 congratulations; I'm sorry to see Paola Martinez go
15 from my office; she is my District Manager and
16 scheduler and Friday will be her last day; I wanna
17 say congratulations for everything she did for me and
18 we're going to miss her.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Freedom.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 0632-B, yes
22 on the rest.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye on
3 all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. All
5 items on today's general order calendar were adopted
6 by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative
7 and 0 abstentions, with the exception of Int. 0632-B,
8 which was adopted by a vote of 40 in the affirmative,
9 7 negative and 0 abstentions and Land Use 0325 and
10 0326 with accompanying resolutions, which was adopted
11 by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative
12 and 1 abstention. And Int. 0952-A, which was adopted
13 by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, 1 negative and 1
14 abstention. And Land Use 0322, 0323 and 0324 with
15 accompanying resolutions, which were adopted by a
16 vote of 46 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and
17 1 abstention. The revised Land Use Call-Up vote is
18 47 affirmative, 0 negative.

19 And now on to Introduction, reading of
20 bills.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
22 referred to committees, as indicated on the agenda.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now
24 discussion of resolutions in the following order:
25 Reso 0909, a resolution calling on the United States

1
2 Department of Housing and Urban Development to
3 support New York City's application for National
4 Disaster Resilience Competition funding, followed by
5 Reso 0923, a resolution adopting the rule amendment
6 of the Procurement Policy Board to raise the
7 micropurchase limit for the procurement and award of
8 construction contracts to \$35,000, and Reso 0938, a
9 resolution calling on the State Legislature to pass
10 and the Governor to sign Senate 6087, the New York
11 Restoration of Honor Act, and finally, Reso 0939, a
12 resolution calling upon Congress to pass and the
13 President to sign Senate 1766 and H.R. 3068, the
14 Restore Honor to Service Members Act and we will
15 begin with Council Member Chin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. First I
17 wanted to thank Manhattan Borough President Gale
18 Brewer and Council Member Mark Treyger, Chair of the
19 Committee on Recovery and Resiliency for sponsoring
20 this resolution with me.

21 New Yorkers from Rockaway [sic] to Staten
22 Island to Lower Manhattan will forever remember
23 Superstorm Sandy; people watched their homes and
24 livelihoods swept away... [interpose]

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: they will never
3 recover the time, energy and resources spent in the
4 aftermath, but we can be ready the next time we face
5 a natural disaster like this. The funding from the
6 National Disaster Resiliency Competition will inject
7 much needed resources into our city's infrastructure,
8 especially in Lower Manhattan and help our coastal
9 areas from future storms.

10 I want to thank Bill Murray and Brad Reid
11 for the hard work on this resolution and I thank my
12 fellow Council Members for your support. Thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
14 Council Member Rosenthal on Reso 0923.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: The City much
16 do everything in its power to increase access to City
17 contracts for minority- and women-owned businesses
18 (MWBEs), no stone can be left unturned and no effort
19 is too small. Although we face many barriers because
20 of the New York State General Municipal Law contract
21 requirements, one tool that the City does have is to
22 allow City agencies discretion for micropurchase
23 contracts. In 2013, the threshold amount to allow
24 for City agency discretion in construction contract
25 micropurchases rose from \$5,000 to \$20,000 and in

1
2 just two years the City increased the amount of money
3 awarded to MWBEs by over \$3.8 million and over 3,300
4 of these contracts were awarded to MWBEs. I thank
5 Public Advocate James and Speaker Mark-Viverito
6 [bell]... really... for their commitment to do even more
7 to assist MWBEs' increased access to City contracts.
8 Thank you... [crosstalk]

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
10 Council Member. And now on Reso 0938 and 0939-A,
11 Council Member Van Bramer. Quiet in the chambers.

12 [background comments]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
14 very much, Madame Public Advocate and it is indeed a
15 privilege to be able to speak on this very personal
16 issue with my husband in the chambers. In July of
17 1989 an 18-year-old young man enlisted for service in
18 the United States Navy; he served with distinguished
19 service in California, Texas, Spain and Turkey during
20 the first Gulf War as a military linguist; he was
21 very proud to serve his country and he did so
22 honorably. That man is my husband, Dan Hendrick and
23 the only thing that was different than [sic] him than
24 so many others is that he was a young gay man and
25 tragically, when it was discovered that he was a gay

1
2 man in October of 1992, he was removed from the
3 military for no other reason than the fact that he
4 was gay and that is an absolute disgrace, but the
5 truth is that what happened to Dan has happened to
6 over 100,000 Americans, over 100,000 LGBT service
7 members were removed since World War II till the end
8 of Don't Ask, Don't Tell simply because they were gay
9 and many of them, many of them were removed with a
10 less than honorable discharge, which means that two
11 this day they cannot access the benefits that every
12 other veteran is entitled to; many of them literally
13 have a stain on their records that has impacted their
14 entire lives, again, simply because of who they were
15 born to be; nothing to do with their military
16 service. So it is essential and I wanna thank
17 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito and our Chair Eric
18 Ulrich who was at my wedding [bell] with Dan, who
19 believe in this issue of justice and it is so
20 important that this Council take a stand and support
21 not only my husband, but every single veteran who was
22 removed simply because they were gay despite the fact
23 that they served their country honorably and with
24 great, great honor and the bills that we're
25 supporting, both Senator Hoylman in the State Senate

1
2 and Senator Gillibrand and Congressman Rangel in the
3 House would restore these benefits to these LGBT
4 veterans now so that they can have both the dignity
5 and the benefits that they so rightfully deserve;
6 their service is honorable, their sacrifice is
7 something that we all should be grateful for, every
8 single one of us and while this hits home very
9 personally for me and my husband Dan, it is so
10 important to those who have served that we get this
11 right once and for all in this country. Thank you
12 very much.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We thank you
14 husband for his service. Seeing any others? None.
15 And now for a vote, beginning with Reso 0909, it's
16 the resolution calling upon the United States to
17 support the New York City application for National
18 Disaster funding. All those in favor say aye.

19 [collective ayes]

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Any opposed? Any
21 abstentions? The ayes have it. And Reso 0923 to
22 increase the micropurchase limit for the procurement
23 and award of construction contracts. All of those in
24 favor say aye.

25 [collective ayes]

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those
3 opposed. Any abstentions? The ayes have it. And
4 now Reso 0938, calling upon the State Legislature and
5 the Governor to sign the New York Restoration of
6 Honor Act, Senate 6087. All those in favor.

7 [collective ayes]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Any opposed? Any
9 abstention? The ayes have it. And now finally, Reso
10 0939-A, calling upon Congress and the President to
11 sign the Restore Honor to Service Members Act. All
12 of those in favor.

13 [collective ayes]

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those
15 opposed. Any abstentions? The ayes have it.

16 And now to general discussion, beginning
17 with Council Member Barron.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madame
19 Public Advocate. Yesterday we celebrated the
20 birthday of Dr. Martin [background comments] Luther
21 King... [interpose]

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: known as the
24 Prince of Peace, who decided to use a tactic of
25 nonviolence to address the hatred, horrors and

1
2 unjustices of violence perpetrated during the Civil
3 Rights Movement. Dr. King targeted the issues of
4 poverty, racism and materialism... [interpose]

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: as our Speaker
7 noted in her comments. The popular memorializations
8 of the life of Dr. King by and large always focus on
9 his 1963 "I have a dream" speech, perhaps because it
10 is within the acceptance range and less intrusive
11 into an examination of the systemic flaws of this
12 country, so people are comfortable with that, but
13 Dr. King did not stop his work in 1963 and should not
14 be frozen there.

15 In 1968 he called out the U.S. for its
16 involvement in the aggressive involvement in the war
17 in Vietnam and was labeled an extremist. But one of
18 Dr. King's quotes is, "The time is always right to do
19 what is right." So when Assembly Member Barron
20 interjected his comments during Governor Cuomo's
21 State of the State... [interpose]

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: it was
24 [background comments] the right thing to do and it
25

1
2 was right to raise issues around CFE, homelessness
3 and the special prosecutor.

4 In 2012, Governor Cuomo said CFE is done;
5 this was in stark contrast to the fact that the state
6 had not fulfilled its mandated payments to New York
7 City. Governor Cuomo's proposed budget still does
8 not address it and has made an appearance New York 1;
9 he again did not respond to the question about CFE
10 settlement. Secondly, while Governor Cuomo is
11 ordering the police to remove homeless when it is
12 cold to shelters, even against their will, Governor
13 Cuomo offers no initiatives to restore the Advantage
14 Program which subsidizes rent for low-income
15 families, yet he offers billions in tax breaks to
16 corporations [bell] for multiple years. Special
17 prosecutor for only one year, we believe that it's
18 beyond one year that we will be persecuted by the
19 police. Additionally, the Governor is proposing...

20 [crosstalk]

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member,
22 could you bring your comments to a close?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I certainly will...

24 [crosstalk]

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Additionally he
3 is proposing to shift costs from CUNY from the state
4 to the city..

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhhh...

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: that is totally
7 unacceptable. President Obama is highlighting what
8 it is that is important with people having post
9 secondary education, so we cannot bear that and we
10 will not tolerate that.

11 Finally, Dr. King said, "Our lives begin
12 to end the day we become silent about things that
13 matter," these are things that matter and we must
14 raise our voice. Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
16 Council Member Williams.

17 [background comments]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I
19 too wanna talk about the legacy of Dr. King 'cause we
20 celebrated him yesterday and I know that many people
21 who espoused him yesterday and the things that he
22 tried to do for this country who today will go back
23 to lambasting and fighting against everything that he
24 fought against and I think Dr. King would be dismayed
25 and probably say didn't I die for this already, if he

1
2 came back for one day and see all the things that we
3 are fighting and so the next time people wanna
4 discuss about why someone's protesting, why someone
5 is disrupting the peace, why is someone interrupting
6 people driving trying to get to work, I hope they
7 remember the praise that they heaped upon Dr. King;
8 he was a radical, he had disrupted leadership and he
9 used love and nonviolence as a weapon, but he used it
10 very well and so sometimes I'm taken aback by the
11 people I hear invoking his name while pushing back
12 against everything that he stands for; I'm proud that
13 I try to follow in his disruptive leadership ways in
14 trying to move us forward in progress, and if we
15 listen to the words that he said, particularly as he
16 got close to the end of his life, we would hear all
17 the things and the worries that he had about perhaps
18 he brought people from the dream to a nightmare and
19 he was going to Washington to get his check or that
20 riot's a language unheard; these are also the words
21 of Dr. King we tend to hang on to just a few words,
22 but he was much more than that and I hope that we
23 continue not to sanitizing, but to continue to push
24 forward in what he asked for; we have not reached
25 there yet, we have a long way to go, but just

1
2 remember that, when people are protesting, nothing
3 has happened in this country without protests;
4 without disruption, so as long as it's for a good
5 cause, I hope we continue. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
7 Council Member Crowley.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Good afternoon.
9 Today I call on my colleagues to co-sponsor a
10 resolution that I have introduced that calls on the
11 State Legislature to pass and for the Governor to
12 sign a bill that will equalize the amount of per-trip
13 taxes imposed on taxis and for-hire vehicles that
14 operate in New York City. The use of smartphone app-
15 based for-hire services continues to grow and it's
16 quickly becoming the first choice for outer borough
17 residents who often, because of where they live, do
18 not have the opportunity to jump into a yellow cab.
19 These outer borough customers unfairly end up paying
20 the most in taxes; furthermore, the increase in usage
21 for these for-hire vehicles causes the lines between
22 taxicabs, black cars and livery cars to be blurred,
23 yet all riders are subject to a different tax, with
24 livery cab passengers paying no tax at all.
25 Establishing parity across the board will give

1 customers the fairest price and could potentially
2 generate more money for the MTA and more resources
3 dedicated to handicap accessibility. So again I ask
4 my colleagues to co-sponsor this resolution I am
5 introducing today. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 Council Member Cumbo.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. The
9 35th Council District and all of New York City joined
10 over the weekend, unfortunately, to bid farewell to
11 Ellen Norman, the wife of Rev. Clarence Norman, Sr.;
12 she passed away on January 6th, 2015 [sic], almost
13 five months after the late great Rev. Clarence
14 Norman, Sr. and we wanna bid farewell to her; she was
15 the presiding First Lady of First Baptist Church for
16 over 50 years.

17 I wanna call your attention to another
18 issue that is very important to me, as well as
19 members of this Council. Reported rapes are on the
20 rise in New York City; despite an overall downward
21 trend in felony crime, 2015 saw a 6.3% increase in
22 the number of rapes reported up to 1,439 from 1,354
23 of the year prior. Of the 1,439 reported rapes last
24 year, 166 were committed by strangers, up from 117 in
25

1
2 2014 and 14 took place in for-hire vehicles like
3 taxis, up from 10 in 2014.

4 I wanna draw your attention to the fact
5 that 98% of rapists will never spend a day in jail or
6 prison, rape culture is perpetuated in every aspect
7 of our society, perhaps because it is so important to
8 society to protect men when it comes to issues of
9 rape against women. It is imperative that we stop
10 teaching young women and members of the LGBTQ
11 community how to not get raped and we move forward as
12 an administration and body by saying that we have a
13 zero tolerance for rape, whether it is in a
14 playground, a school, a cab or a home. We must move
15 forward with enforcement, legislation, policy,
16 resources and important messaging to make sure that
17 every woman [bell] feels safe in the City of New
18 York.

19 I wanna thank all of my colleagues that
20 have stood with me on the steps of City Hall to bring
21 this message loud and clear to all of New Yorkers and
22 we must continue to do more to make sure that all
23 women, particularly our girls, the vast majority are
24 the most vulnerable to issues or rape, that they feel
25

1
2 protected and that they know that this city will
3 protect them. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now to close,
5 the Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madame
7 Public Advocate. I just wanna just kinda touch on a
8 little bit of something that Jumaane had raised,
9 'cause I did find it fascinating and I did send out a
10 lot of tweets yesterday that you know as we talk
11 about the legacy of Dr. King and those of us that
12 really believe in true equality and justice for every
13 single person that lives in this world, to see
14 republicans actually issuing statements in honor of
15 his memory, republican party and individuals actually
16 who have voted on cutting back food stamps, who
17 actually support the decision of the Supreme Court
18 that limit voting rights; something that Dr. King was
19 very, very strong and steadfast about. When we see
20 that kind of hypocrisy that exists, it's really
21 something that we cannot stand for; that is why the
22 work we do each and every day in this Council is so
23 important 'cause we are enacting changes, we're
24 implementing policies, we're implementing laws that
25 are gonna have an impact on people's lives for the

1
2 better and that is the true legacy of Dr. King. So
3 that was really, as we say in Spanish, **[01:44:52**
4 **Spanish]**; that was like over the top to really see
5 that blatant level of hypocrisy and there are those
6 in the Twitter universe and social media universe
7 that really were calling it out and it's important to
8 not forget that there are those who actively strive
9 each and every day to roll that clock backwards and
10 it is our responsibility to be vocal, to be diligent
11 and to be steadfast in the work that we do to truly
12 achieve equality and justice. So I wanna thank all
13 my colleagues for their support in the work that we
14 do; we have a lot of work yet ahead and thank you all
15 for a successful session today, and that's it.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, Madame
17 Speaker, you're ab... [crosstalk]

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We're adjourned.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: you're absolutely
20 right; it is so much more than a dream.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh if I could...
22 yes, and I can say we... the next Stated Meeting
23 actually was originally on the 4th of February; it is
24 now on the 3rd, the day before; please take note, we
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

just issued that today, so February 3rd will be the
next Stated Meeting. Thank you all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
February 3rd.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 1, 2016