

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH  
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATION

----- X

March 18, 2019  
Start: 1:33 pm.  
Recess: 5:15 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: PAUL A. VALLONE  
Chairperson

RITCHIE J. Torres  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams  
Inez D. Barron  
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.  
Peter A. Koo  
Brad S. Lander  
Mark Levine  
Carlos Menchaca  
Keith Powers  
Donovan J. Richards  
Carlina Rivera  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Jumaane D. Williams

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

James Patchett, President & CEO, New York City  
Economic Development Corporation

Alia Conbeer, Senior Vice President for Strategy at  
ECD

Jackie Mallon, First Deputy Commissioner at the  
Department of Small Business Services

Jessie Laymon, New York City Employment and Training  
Coalition

Joey Ortiz, Executive Director, New York City  
Employment and Training Coalition

Bryan Loznano, Tech NYC

Jessica Centeno, Center, Executive Deputy Director,  
Employment Opportunities

Justin Collins, Workforce Field Building Hub  
Workforce Professionals Training Institute

Andre Ward, Associate Vice President, Employment  
Services and Education, Fortune Society

Frank Cicio, CEO & Founder, IQ4 Corporation.

Lilianna Paula McKenna

Caroline Iosso, Director of Community and Government  
Affairs OBT Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow Frank

Vanessa Silverls, Founder and CEO, BUPeriod.

Donna Lynn Bradley (sic) Workforce Development  
Professional and Technologist, CEO and Co-Founder of  
The Urban Wild

Lowell Herschberger, Director of Career and  
Education, Cypress Hills Local Development  
Corporation

Larry Rothchild, Director of Workforce Development  
Saint Nick's Alliance, North Brooklyn

Kevin Gardner, Professor, and Director of Structural  
& Biology at Advanced Science Research Center, CUNY

Sean Parasram, Operations Analyst at Curator

David Yang, Co-founder and CEO, Fullstak Academy

Ro Gupta, CEO and Co-Founder of Carmera, Street  
Intelligence Platform

Suma Reddy, Co-founder and COO, Farmshelf

Sarah Block, Senior Manager, Per Scolas

Keith Kirkland, CEO and Co-Founder of WearWorks

Ian Costa, S&L Aerospace



3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Good afternoon. I am  
4 City Council Member Ritchie Torres, and I chair the  
5 Committee on Oversight and Investigations. I am  
6 honored to join COUNCIL MEMBER Paul Vallone who  
7 chairs the Committee on Economic Development and  
8 co-leading a hearing on New York Works, the Jobs  
9 Plan of the de Blasio Administration. We are also  
10 joined by a number of Council Members including  
11 Council Member Koo, Council Member Richards,  
12 Council Member Yeger, Council Member Treyger,  
13 Council Member Menchaca, Council Member Rosenthal,  
14 Council Member Adams. I also want to—before we  
15 begin, I want to thank the dedicated investigators  
16 in the Oversight and Investigations Unit, which is  
17 staffed by some of the most talented professionals  
18 with whom I've ever had the pleasure of working.  
19 Thank you to the Council's Chief of Investigations,  
20 Steve Pilnyak; Deputy Chief Jennifer Smith,  
21 Investigators Haley DeQuaker and Justin Kramer.  
22 Also thank you to my own staff, my Chief of Staff  
23 Angel Vasquez and my Deputy Chief of Staff Raymond  
24 Rodriguez, and I also want to thank the Grassroots  
25 Coalition, Our Jobs Our Future for inspiring the  
City Council to look into the Mayor's Jobs swing.  
(sic) We are all New Yorkers, but not all of us  
live in the same New York. The inequality in our  
lived experience is best captured in the words of  
Charles Dickens: It was the best of times. It was

3 the worst of times. It was the age of wisdom. It  
4 was the age of foolishness. It was the epoch of  
5 belief. It was the epoch of incredulity. It was the  
6 season of light. It was the season of darkness.  
7 It was the spring of hope. It was the winter of  
8 despair. We had everything before us. We had  
9 nothing before us. Who exactly is the 'we' in this  
10 famous quote? Who has everything before us and  
11 nothing before us? Perspective matters as much in  
12 New York City in 2019 as it did in Victorian London  
13 in the 1840s. For some New Yorkers our city is  
14 boundless, bright and shining field of opportunity,  
15 but for far too many others, that field is bound on  
16 all sides by poverty, by lack of economic and  
17 educational opportunity and reigned in darkness.  
18 For underserved New Yorkers, New Yorkers in  
19 poverty, those seemingly forgotten or cast aside by  
20 the capitalist machine, the promise of the American  
21 dream, the promise of upward mobility is too often  
22 a promise not kept. The question of who gets to  
23 participate and who does not is visceral and real.  
24 The dream is out of reach for the underserved, and  
25 the economically underprivileged, and yet  
crucially, cruelly signifiers of that dream  
skyscrapers that block the sun or illumine the  
distance like mythical mountains, national bank  
chains that consume neighborhood storefronts, even  
golf courses are all around them so close they can  
almost touch it. I speak form personal experience.

3 As a child growing up in NYCHA housing watching  
4 Donald Trump's golf course get built with the  
5 assistance of city funding and subsidies as my own  
6 home crumbled and continues to crumble in its  
7 shadow. Dickens visited New York in 1842 and might  
8 have been peering in my window when he wrote that  
9 New York is a place "where the two extremes of  
10 costly and luxury living, expensive establishments  
11 and improvident waste are presented in daily and  
12 hourly contrast with squalid misery and hopeless  
13 destitution. Dickens could be talking about the  
14 New York of today and the New York of today is why  
15 we are here to discuss the New York Works Jobs  
16 Plan. The New York Works Job Plan is a plan born  
17 out of a lofty political goal of creating 100,000  
18 more permanent good paying jobs over ten years in  
19 order to give people "chance at middle class  
20 stability." Whether people have pre-existing  
21 skills or not, in order to confront deep inequity  
22 in the city. The Mayor sees these extremes of deep  
23 inequity, and we know he likes to cite Dickens as  
24 well. The goal of elevating New Yorkers into the  
25 middle-class with the promise of 100,000 good  
paying jobs is indeed a noble one, but as a Council  
we must hold others in government accountable for  
the pretty promises they make. This is our moral  
imperative. Economic justice is the issue of our  
time. Who gets to participate in the American  
Dream? On this very day March 18<sup>th</sup> 51 years ago

3 while speaking at a rally of Sanitation workers,  
4 Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. recognized the  
5 centrality of economic justice when he said, Now  
6 our struggle is for genuine equality, which means  
7 economic equality for we know now that it isn't  
8 enough to integrate lunch counters. What does it  
9 profit a man to be able to eat at an integrated  
10 lunch counter if he doesn't have enough money to  
11 buy a hamburger. Projections and not tracking  
12 might be acceptable in other cities, but not in our  
13 city. As Professor Raj Chetty says, either  
14 something creates more jobs or it doesn't. We need  
15 more than press releases, Power Points and  
16 projections. We need jobs, real jobs for real  
17 people in the real world, and we need those jobs to  
18 go to the very underserved New Yorkers who were  
19 promised those jobs. With that said, I will hand  
20 it off to the Chair of the Economic Development  
21 Committee Paul Vallone.

18 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Good afternoon  
19 everyone. Thank you to my co-chair Ritchie Torres.  
20 We've also been joined by Council Member Inez Barron.  
21 It's a privilege to join forces today on this crucial  
22 topic and it feels like we've been extending our EDC  
23 hearings quite a bit, but these are critical times,  
24 and we need to do that. So, as Chair Torres has  
25 mentioned today, this is really born out of a



3 comprehensive study that was conducted by the  
4 Council's Oversight and Investigation's Unit to  
5 determine how the city's EDC evaluates its job  
6 creation but specifically the Oversight  
7 Investigations Unit focused on the New York Works  
8 Jobs Plan, which as Council Member Torres said, the  
9 office was created in 2017 shortly after the State of  
10 City Address where the Mayor called for the creation  
11 of 100,000 permanent good paying jobs for New Yorkers  
12 over a period of ten years. While we on this  
13 committee have conducted oversight hearings on  
14 several topics related to job creation on the past,  
15 today's hearing is going to be a bit different. Our  
16 rolls as an oversight body requires us to hold city  
17 agencies accountable for the programs they create as  
18 well for the taxpayer funds that they spend in  
19 pursuit of those programs. That is precisely today's  
20 goal. In the two years since the Mayor's  
21 announcement of his plan to create these 100,000 jobs  
22 we have begun to get a better picture of EDC's  
23 tracking of its effort in support of that goal.  
24 Unfortunately, the picture it paints is at best  
25 uncertain and at worst woefully inaccurate. Not  
because the jobs are definitively not being created,

3 but because the agency supporting job creation relies  
4 on projections rather than actual data in measuring  
5 the success of its programs. EDC's strategy in  
6 evaluating its job creation efforts ends with the so-  
7 called final city action, which ranges from anything  
8 from a rezoning to the opening of a new facility. As  
9 a practical matter, it appears it does not track the  
10 actual jobs that the finance assistance programs  
11 create. Instead, it relies on complex projections  
12 for those job creation numbers, projections we are-  
13 which are inherently imperfect and not reflective of  
14 the real data that is often about. Over \$1 billion of  
15 city funds have already been spent in support of this  
16 program. With that amount of financial commitment, we  
17 expect the agency tracking that program to at least  
18 supply the public with the real numbers regarding its  
19 success. We are here today to shed light on EDC's  
20 methodology in evaluating the New Yorker Works  
21 Program, as well as to see what the Council could do  
22 to Enright the ship and ensure that EDC gets back on  
23 track with respect to its job creating and retention  
24 metrics. With that said, I would like to thank the  
25 Economic Development staff, Legislative Counsel Alex  
Paulenoff; Policy Analyst Emily Forgione, and Finance

2 Analyst Alia Alie as well as Co-Chair Torres and, and  
3 its oversight and investigations team for all of  
4 their tireless hard work in putting this hearing  
5 together. Truly thankful for all the work, and now  
6 we'd like to swear in our President Patrick so he can  
7 begin his testimony.

8 LEGAL COUNSEL: Would you all please  
9 raise your right hands. Do you affirm or affirm to  
10 tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the  
11 truth in testimony today, and to respond honestly to  
12 Council Member questions?

13 JAMES PATCHETT: I do.

14 LEGAL COUNSEL: You may begin.

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do we have a copy of  
16 the President's testimony?

17 LEGAL COUNSEL: We do.

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: You may say it.

19 JAMES PATCHETT: I do.

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do we have a copy of  
21 the President's testimony?

22 JAMES PATCHETT: Thank you. [coughs] Good  
23 afternoon Chairs Vallone and Torres and members of  
24 the Committees Economic Development and Oversight and  
25 Investigation. My name is James Patchett, and I am

3 the President and CEO of the New York City Economic  
4 Development Corporation also known as EDC. Thank you  
5 for the opportunity to testify today on New Yorker  
6 Works, the vision and strategy document that outlines  
7 Mayor de Blasio's commitment to creating 100,000 good  
8 paying jobs. I'm joined today by my colleagues Alia  
9 Conbeer, our Senior Vice President for Strategy at  
10 EDC and Jackie Mallon, First Deputy Commissioner at  
11 the Department of Small Business Services. After my  
12 testimony, we're happy to answer any you have. EDC is  
13 a self sustaining non-profit organization the drives  
14 and shapes New York City's economic growth. We use  
15 city resources to create a bridge between city  
16 agencies, private businesses in local communities in  
17 three key ways. By owning and managing over 66  
18 million square feet of real estate, which we're  
19 constantly upgrading and improving to maximize  
20 economic impact. By building neighborhood  
21 infrastructure to ensure that communities remain  
22 affordable and finally, by investing growth  
23 industries that have the potential to create good  
24 paying jobs for all New Yorkers. Today by many  
25 metrics New York's economy is thriving. Our  
unemployment rate is 4%, a record low, and we are

3 home to 4.5 million jobs, a record high. Our Metro  
4 GDP is \$1.5 trillion. This means that if the Metro-  
5 Metropolitan area were a country, it would be among  
6 the 20 largest national economies in the world just  
7 behind Spain and Canada. We remain the financial  
8 capital of the world, and are home to more Fortune  
9 500 companies than any other city in the North  
10 America, and our tech sector also continues to soar.  
11 Since 2007, the amount of venture capital funding,  
12 which supports the growth and expansion of early  
13 state businesses has ballooned 1400%. We are proud  
14 to contribute to the city's economic vibrancy and  
15 recognize the historic nature of the current moments.  
16 However, we know these numbers don't paint the  
17 complete economic picture. Beneath the surface there  
18 are alarming economic realities that cannot be  
19 ignored. The unemployment rate for New Yorkers  
20 without a college degree is almost double that of the  
21 working age population as a whole. Nearly 95% of the  
22 country's income gains are claimed by the top 1% of  
23 households, and over the past 10 years, the  
24 percentage of New Yorkers earning middle-income wages  
25 dropped from 46% to 43% impacting a quarter million  
people. Along with this rising inequality there is

3 tremendous disruption driven by-by technology. It is  
4 changing the way businesses operate and the skills  
5 New Yorkers need to secure jobs of the future. The  
6 impact-impact of technology is being felt across the  
7 city in places like manufacturing hubs and the back  
8 offices of major financial firms. This technological  
9 revolution comes at time of increased affordability  
10 challenges and global competition. The role of the  
11 city is to make strategic investments needed to  
12 prepare all New Yorkers for the jobs of the future.  
13 That is why in 2017, the Administration announced New  
14 York Works, a vision that outlined Mayor de Blasio's  
15 commitment to create 100,000 good paying jobs by  
16 2027. This plan is not just about job creation. We  
17 know the city already does this well. The plan is  
18 about making good paying jobs even more accessible to  
19 New Yorkers. Our goal is simple: To make this city  
20 a fairer place for all. New York Works-Works has  
21 three objectives. First to invest in the creation of  
22 middle-class jobs. We know that today middle-class  
23 life is 30% more expensive than it was 20 years ago.  
24 Raising a family, paying rent and taking personal  
25 time off become harder when one feels squeezed  
financially. Second, we want to ensure these jobs

3 area accessible to all New Yorkers. Some evolving  
4 industries most notably the tech sector have excluded  
5 women and people of color from accessing good paying  
6 jobs. The numbers speak for themselves. In 2017  
7 Facebook reported that only 3% of employees work in  
8 tech jobs identified as Hispanic, but New York knows  
9 diversity is our greatest strength. In a city with  
10 3.3 million immigrants and more than 200 languages  
11 spoken, we have the tools to change the status quo,  
12 and finally, to prepare for the jobs of the future.  
13 Automation could impact 60% of occupations based on  
14 technology that just exists today. For workers in  
15 these positions we need to ensure that there are  
16 pipelines to new industries with long career ladders.  
17 This sizable investment in our middle class shows how  
18 seriously this admin-administration takes income and  
19 equality. By all measures this plan is ambitious.  
20 100,000 jobs are enough to provide one for every  
21 household in Orlando with a family supporting income.  
22 Here we define good paying jobs as those that pay  
23 \$50,000 or more or provide a reliable pathway to the  
24 middle class. We chose \$50,000 because it is  
25 significant—it's a significant threshold for  
affording life in New York City. Today the median

3 household income in New York City is \$56,000. This—  
4 the plan outlines in broad strokes the actions the  
5 Administration will take to achieve this goal. Jobs  
6 will only be counted if they are created as a direct  
7 result of one of the following city actions:

8 Selling, leasing or developing and tenancing city-  
9 owned property; providing financial and tax  
10 incentives that help businesses acquire property,  
11 construct and renovate facilities and invest in  
12 equipment, making capital investments in large scale  
13 infrastructure that directly helps businesses start  
14 and grow. Using land use tools to update zoning, and  
15 directly financing industries that have high  
16 potential for growth. These actions are critical to  
17 advancing our goals in the five strategic sectors  
18 identified last year: Tech, life sciences and  
19 healthcare, industrial manufacturing, the creative  
20 and cultural sectors and space for the jobs of the  
21 future. The industries outlined in the plan were  
22 carefully selected because they continue to grow and  
23 have tremendous potential to create good paying jobs.  
24 I would now like to go through each of the tools the  
25 city has deployed as a part of New Yorker Works, and  
share examples of actions we have taken to create



3 more pathways to middle class. First, I'd like to  
4 talk about how we are activating city-owned property  
5 to reach our targets outright in New Yorker Works.  
6 The city has a vast portfolio of properties that  
7 include community facilities, industrial and  
8 commercial space and parks. Since the plan was  
9 announced we've made targeted investments, and many  
10 of them to spark growth in 21<sup>st</sup> Century industries.  
11 Last May EDC unveiled over 500,000 square feet of new  
12 industrial space at the Brooklyn Army Terminal.  
13 Along the Brooklyn-South Brooklyn Waterfront. This  
14 new space will provide a home for over a thousand new  
15 jobs many of which will be in modern manufacturing.  
16 We want to continue strengthening our industrial  
17 ecosystem, which today employs over 500,000-530,000  
18 New Yorkers and provides many access point into good  
19 paying jobs. Moreover, the campus' on-site Workforce  
20 1 Industrial and Training-Industrial and  
21 Transportation Career Center has helped hundreds of  
22 city residents get jobs with bad tenants and other  
23 Brooklyn based businesses. In October of 2017, EDC  
24 and the New Culture Group broke ground on Corporate  
25 Commons 3, 330,000 square feet office building on the  
west shore of Staten Island. The facility is setting

3 aside 20% of its space for medical office tenants and  
4 includes space for a charter school, continuing adult  
5 education a 40,000 square feet organic rooftop farm,  
6 and a new social enterprise restaurant. Corporate  
7 Commons 3 is anticipated to create 2,500 jobs and  
8 provide more space for Staten Island businesses to  
9 expand locally. Providing financial impact  
10 statements is another valuable tool we have  
11 leveraged. In June of 2017, EDC helped facilitate  
12 the expansion of York Studios, a local TV and film  
13 production company, which is set to build a first  
14 rate facility in Soundview. The first phase of the  
15 project will consist 170,000 square feet of space  
16 that will include five production stages.

17 Development of this campus was done through the New  
18 York City Industrial Development Agency also known as  
19 IDA. We gave the campus conditional tax benefits  
20 over the next quarter century in order to unlock \$50  
21 million in private investments and bring 400 good  
22 paying jobs to the Bronx. Last February EDC helped  
23 C. Kenneth Imports an importer and distributor of  
24 tropical produce and African, Caribbean and Latin  
25 foods, renovate its Hunt Point-Hunts Point  
warehouse. In 1981, CKI partnered with Haiti Foods,

3 Korea and grew to become an importer and exclusive  
4 distributor of Haitian Food products in the Northeast  
5 United States. The project, also and IDA  
6 transactions cost roughly \$5.6 million and will CKI's  
7 facility to expand to 40,000 square feet to meet  
8 growing business demands. The additional space will  
9 also—also allow the company to create—to increase its  
10 headcount. We have made significant capital  
11 investments that will spark more economic growth in  
12 neighborhoods around the city. September 2017 we  
13 announced or plan for Bronx Point, a waterfront  
14 development that will include a new waterfront  
15 esplanade that will seamlessly connect the existing  
16 Mill Pond Park in a—in a dynamic public plaza along  
17 Exterior Street. This development, which sits at a  
18 gateway location in a lower Concourse neighborhood is  
19 part of the Administration's \$200 million investment  
20 to strengthen the area's infrastructure., and right  
21 now the de Blasio Administration is investing more  
22 than \$180 million in Coney Island to shore up the  
23 neighborhood's infrastructure, build new streets and  
24 upgrade the sewer system to support future new  
25 affordable housing and economic development. This  
historic infrastructure investment will support the

3 new 4,500 homes and 500,000 square feet of commercial  
4 space projected to be built in the neighborhood. We  
5 are no longer going to accept that the neighborhood  
6 streets flood when it rains, and that some of the  
7 water pipes date back to the 19<sup>th</sup> Century. We've  
8 used our land use-use tools to shape our  
9 neighborhoods and business districts. In September  
10 of 2017, the City Council in partnership with Council  
11 Member Richards approved the Downtown Far Rockaway  
12 Redevelopment Project, the neighborhood's first  
13 rezoning since 1961. This include \$288 million in  
14 investments to bring new commercial space and small  
15 business support, affordable housing options, open  
16 space, transit, infrastructure and community  
17 facilities to the area. These investments are  
18 designed to both strengthen the neighborhood and  
19 spark job creating in an important business district.  
20 And in August of 2017, the City Council approved the  
21 Greater East Midtown Rezoning an action that  
22 encouraged the creation of new and expanded  
23 commercial space, and ultimately more jobs. The city  
24 conservatively estimated that this rezoning will  
25 create at least 400 new jobs in the neighborhood. In  
addition, the new rezoning will crate more than \$40

3 million in public improvements to the streets,  
4 pedestrian plazas and sidewalks in the neighborhood.  
5 And finally, we have directly invested in supported  
6 industries that have the highest potential for  
7 growth. In December 2016, Mayor de Blasio announced  
8 LifeSci NYC a 10-year \$500 million initiative to  
9 establish New York as the global leader in life  
10 sciences research and innovation. Since New York  
11 Works was announced, we have built our momentum of  
12 the successful initiative. This includes initiating  
13 the third phase of development of the Alexandria  
14 Center for Life Science, the city's first  
15 collaborative space for life science research,  
16 development and commercialization. This new  
17 facility would include 500,000 square feet of space,  
18 which will be home to close to 1,500 jobs. We also  
19 have launched an internship program that prepares a  
20 diverse range of New York students for careers in the  
21 life sciences sector. We wanted to help students  
22 like Ahmanor (sp?) Rashid the only child of working  
23 class immigrant parents who went to Hunter College  
24 for his master's in biology. This past summer  
25 Ahmanor interned at Lucerna an R&D company working to  
visualize and study R&A. After his internship, he

3 told EDC that he felt like he was working on the  
4 front line of a new technology and practicing the  
5 science he imagined doing his whole life. And last  
6 November, the city teamed up with the Brooklyn Navy  
7 Yard to bring Local Bite, a food service kiosk run by  
8 NYCHA residents to Building 77. This space provides  
9 graduates of NYCHA's successful food business  
10 Pathways program a place to jump start their  
11 companies and well their creations. Business owners  
12 at Local Bites will rotate every two months giving  
13 many program graduates a chance to participate. One  
14 entrepreneur at Local Bites told AMNY-AM New York  
15 that she serves so many customers she often runs out  
16 of food stock. It is important to emphasize that  
17 while New Yorker Works is a roadmap for job creation,  
18 it was developed in close collaboration with the  
19 Mayor's Office of Workforce Development. Through the  
20 Career Pathways Plan for Workforce Development, the  
21 Administration is shifting towards investing in more  
22 in more resources and expanding access to career  
23 track jobs and fast growing industry sectors with  
24 better job quality. Last year alone, \$350 million was  
25 spent in adult Workforce Development programs that  
helped a dozen agencies operate in nearly 100

3 programs. One program is CUNY 2X Tech, an initiative  
4 to double the number of New Yorkers graduating with  
5 tech bachelor degrees from public houses by 2022.

6 This will equip even more New Yorkers with the skills  
7 and experience they need to compete for entry level  
8 jobs in the field. Since the launch of CUNY 2X Tech,  
9 graduate degrees in tech had increased by 50%.

10 Partnerships with CUNY are critical. The University  
11 system consistently ranks as one of the most

12 successful institutions in helping low-income  
13 students enter the middle-class. Nearly half of

14 CUNY's student population comes from the households  
15 earning less than \$20,000 per year. Nearly 40% comes

16 from such households at senior colleges while close  
17 to 53% come from such households at the community

18 colleges. My colleague Deputy Commissioner Mallon  
19 can also discuss the thousands of New Yorkers trained

20 and hired through SBS's industry partnerships  
21 including the tech talent pipeline. In less than two

22 years we have made great progress in seeding job  
23 opportunities and ensuring we stay on track to reach

24 our goal of 100,000 good paying jobs. We know the  
25 status of New York Works because we track it. In

2018, we released the Progress Update, which is the

3 first of the annual updates the Administration has  
4 committed to publishing. In its report, we  
5 highlighted that the city has led the groundwork to  
6 create nearly 19,000 good paying job as well as  
7 further diversify the economy. As of today, we know  
8 these partners have created several thousand real  
9 jobs for real New Yorkers, and are on track to create  
10 the full 19,000 as more projects come to a close.  
11 While New York Works acknowledges that the critical  
12 investments the administration has made helps  
13 stimulate job growth among them affordable housing,  
14 transportation, education and public safety. These  
15 are not counted because they lead to job creation  
16 indirectly rather than directly. New York City's  
17 economy is as strong as it's ever been and New Yorker  
18 Wake-Works only makes it stronger. With this  
19 roadmap, we will made Mayor de Blasio's unprecedented  
20 commitment to create 100,000 good paying jobs and  
21 provide new pathways to the middle class, and by  
22 doing so, we are already great city fairer and  
23 stronger. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you, Mr.  
25 Patrick-President Patrick for your testimony. You  
are an expert on testifying before the City Council



3 so-[laughter] and you're-you're so good at it that we  
4 -we invite you with great frequency.

5 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes, second business day  
6 in a row.

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, every  
8 prescription depends on a diagnosis, and New York  
9 Works purports to be a prescription a solution to a  
10 problem. What-what problem are we attempting to  
11 solve with, of course, in the state of New York.

12 JAMES PATCHETT: I would say it's two  
13 challenges. One challenge is ensuring that we are  
14 thinking about what the jobs of the future are going  
15 to be because unless we're competing in the jobs of  
16 the future, we have a risk of being left behind as a  
17 city, and corresponding we are people being left  
18 behind and not having those jobs and at the same time  
19 it's about creating accessibility to those jobs. We  
20 recognize the many of the industries of the future  
21 have not historically been well represented among the  
22 communities that make up New York, and so also part  
23 of the plan is focused on over time creating pathways  
24 so that we're both creating the jobs of the future an  
25 also making those jobs increasingly accessible to  
everyday New Yorkers .

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, as you noted,  
4 the number of jobs in New York City has risen to 4.5  
5 million a record high. The unemployment rate has  
6 fallen to 4%, a record low. Since 2014, the economy  
7 has created—I'm sorry--[background comment]—has  
8 created over 300,000 jobs. So we know that the  
9 economy is succeeding at job creation.

10 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Where the economy is  
12 failing is on the issue of equity, equitable growth,  
13 equitable job creation. New York City's gilded  
14 economy has left behind the poorest New Yorkers, New  
15 Yorkers without a college degree or a high school  
16 diploma. New Yorkers without pre-existing skills.  
17 New Yorkers in neighborhoods like Brownsville,  
18 Brooklyn, of Belmont in the Bronx, and so the problem  
19 is not a lack of job creation per se, the problem is  
20 a lack of job creation specifically for low-income  
21 New Yorkers, a lack of opportunity, a lack of equity  
22 and so the purpose of our hearing is to examine  
23 whether New Yorker Works is working for low-income  
24 New Yorkers.

25 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, I want to start  
4 with tracking versus projection. When the Mayor  
5 announced that he would create 100,000 good paying  
6 jobs over the course of ten years, the general public  
7 took it to mean that the Mayor would, in fact, create  
8 100,000 real jobs for real people in the real world  
9 anyone who heard the Mayor's State of the city would  
10 come away believing that those 100,000 jobs are  
11 actual jobs or would be actual jobs in ten years, but  
12 anyone who believes that is operating under a false  
13 impression because with the exception of one category  
14 of city action, the job numbers contained New York  
15 Works' Plan as well as in the update our projections,  
16 not actual jobs created correct?

17 JAMES PATCHETT: I hate anyone who  
18 watched the Mayor announce, but also know that the  
19 mayor was in office through 2021, and that this was a  
20 10-year effort, meaning that the mayor would not be  
21 in office for the entire duration of the plan. So,  
22 what w said from the outset and what I say today is  
23 that we will take a number of actions during the  
24 remainder of this Administration, which will set us  
25 on the pathway to create 100,000 jobs. No one every  
suggested, in fact to the contrary we said we would

3 seek to create approximately 40,000 of those by the  
4 end of 2021. So to that end it was our objective to  
5 take actions such as the Greater East Midtown  
6 Rezoning that would set us on a pathway to create  
7 those specific jobs.

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But I do want to be  
9 clear the—the numbers in your jobs plan are  
10 projections, not actual jobs created?

11 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, to be clear, we  
12 set a frame, which was originally a framework for  
13 100,000 jobs. They weren't projections at the time.  
14 It was a framework and a plan to create 100,000 jobs.  
15 As we take specific actions we'll have specific jobs  
16 that have been created.

17 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Are you tracking  
18 whether those jobs are created as a general  
19 proposition?

20 JAMES PATCHETT: We are creating in as  
21 much specificity as possible—we're tracking as much  
22 specificity as possible.

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Are you tracking the  
24 jobs you create or are you simply projecting?  
25

2 JAMES PATCHETT: We are tracking the jobs  
3 to the best of our ability by category. Again,  
4 there-

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] So  
6 there are--there are--

7 JAMES PATCHETT: [interposing] -there are  
8 cases where we know the specific number of jobs.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: In--in the vast  
10 majority of your categories are you tracking or are  
11 you projecting? It's a simple question.

12 JAMES PATCHETT: It's not really a simple  
13 question. It's just--let me just step back for a  
14 second. So, when we take rezoning action, the city  
15 doesn't own the property. We don't know the specific  
16 tenants that will necessarily be there. What we know  
17 is when we take the action to approve the zoning, and  
18 we know when the building is complete for  
19 construction. We don't necessarily have a  
20 relationships with all of the tenants that are there.  
21 In that circumstance what we do is we take the best  
22 estimates available and at any given point in time.

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, it's an  
24 estimate. It's not an actual like--

2 JAMES PATCHETT: In the case of the  
3 Greater East Midtown Rezoning, we're not going to put  
4 chip in everyone's head who goes into work in East  
5 Midtown.

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] So,  
7 I'm not—I'm not--

8 JAMES PATCHETT: [interposing] Could I  
9 just finish?

10 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But let me—let me—  
11 I'm—my question is not about the ease or the  
12 complexity of project—of tracking. Tracking is a  
13 complicated undertaking. I'm just simply asking are  
14 you tracking or are you projecting in the vast  
15 majority of these categories?

16 JAMES PATCHETT: I'm just distinguishing  
17 between different categories. Again, in the case of  
18 East Midtown, we have an estimate at the outset of  
19 the number of buildings and, therefor, jobs will be  
20 created. We have very detailed data about the  
21 specific—the number of people who work in different  
22 types of building by industry and by square foot. As  
23 the East Midtown Rezoning rolled out, we'll know the  
24 buildings that have actually been constructed and the  
25 number of square feet that those buildings create.

2 We don't know those today, but we'll have a lot  
3 better information about that overtime. In fact,  
4 today we're aware of three-large scale buildings that  
5 are going to be created in that district are being  
6 planned, which far outpace our initial projections,  
7 but we won't know until they're up and constructed  
8 the actual number of people working in there, and at  
9 that point in time you're right, there are going to  
10 be estimates based on the best available data. In  
11 other circumstances--

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] But  
13 you count those jobs before those jobs actually  
14 materialize?

15 JAMES PATCHETT: We--we don't--we count  
16 them as being--taking the action that's necessary to  
17 create them over time as the--as the--

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Does  
19 the action immediately create those jobs, or does it  
20 lay a foundation?

21 JAMES PATCHETT: Can you ask the question  
22 again?

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Does the action  
24 immediately create those jobs, or...?  
25

2 JAMES PATCHETT: Because rezoning needs  
3 an economy, will it create jobs? Is that question  
4 you asked?

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: At what point do you  
6 count a job under the New York Works Plan?

7 JAMES PATCHETT: Again, within 10 years,  
8 we're talking about jobs that will actually be  
9 created, people in states with actual jobs. Because  
10 the Mayor's Administration ends in 2021, we're not  
11 going to try to take credit for things that we do in  
12 2022 and 2024 because that's not under our purview.  
13 So, between now and 2021, we're going to take actions  
14 that lay a pathway where we can specifically  
15 ultimately connect those to direct jobs. So, will we  
16 have actual jobs of 100,000 by the end of 2021? No,  
17 and that's never what we said. What we said was  
18 we'll take actions that will create a pathway to  
19 creating those jobs, and during the course of our  
20 tenure we'll be able to provide specific information  
21 about the actual jobs and actual places, but we won't  
22 be able to give you specifics about what's going to  
23 happen in 2024. We're going to have to rely on the  
24 best available data that we have. We have a human  
25 economist. We have comprehensive datasets. We have



3 detailed data about specific locations. In some  
4 cases we have specific contracts where people report  
5 to us the exact number--

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Sorry,  
7 I want to--I want to ask, are you tracking the number  
8 of jobs that your specifically creating for low-  
9 income New Yorkers?

10 JAMES PATCHETT: I'm sorry. I'm just--  
11 you're--how you're asking. You mean am I--in other  
12 words, are you asking just to use the East Midtown  
13 example, Am I tracking the number of those jobs that  
14 will go to low-income New Yorkers in that case?

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yes. Well, can--have  
16 you tracked the number of jobs that you've created  
17 thus far for low-income New Yorkers. Could you tell  
18 me how many jobs that you've created for low-income  
19 New Yorkers?

20 JAMES PATCHETT: I think again to step  
21 back, we will be tracking the specific number of jobs  
22 and the types of jobs that we are creating. We're  
23 not going to check the demographics of the particular  
24 individuals who get those jobs prior to it, but we  
25 are going to target specific programs with those  
jobs.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But-but the point is  
4 to

5 JAMES PATCHETT: [interposing] So for  
6 example, can I--can I just finish?

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yeah, go ahead.

8 JAMES PATCHETT: So for--for example, we  
9 have a new program as a part of our cyber security  
10 effort, which will train a thousand people who are  
11 only required to have high school degrees in  
12 partnership with La Guardia Community College, and  
13 the Cyber Skills of Tomorrow. We're only paying those  
14 providers once they receive actual jobs in cyber  
15 security. Those jobs are going to pay an average  
16 starting salary of \$65,000 a year. These are in  
17 partnership with La Guardia Community College. We  
18 have a certain type of individual that we're seeking  
19 to--seeking to train through that program. We are  
20 expecting to be overwhelming low-income New Yorkers.  
21 I can't tell you standardly today the exact number  
22 of--

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] So,  
24 you can't answer that question. Let's move on

25 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay.

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: The definition of  
3 jobs and good paying jobs--

4 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --under New York  
6 Works New York Works is quite different from the  
7 actual meaning of those words in the English  
8 language. So, a job need not pay \$50,000 a year to be  
9 counted as a job under the Mayor's Jobs Plan. Is  
10 that correct?

11 JAMES PATCHETT: Either-either they do  
12 have-receiving \$50,000 as a starting salary or be on  
13 a pathway to receiving \$50,000.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Does a job in real  
15 time need not pay \$50,000 a year to be counted as a  
16 job under the Mayor's Job Plan. Is that correct?

17 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, what we said at  
18 the announcement and in the Jobs Plan from the very  
19 beginning was that it was either paying \$50,000 at  
20 the outset or on a pathway and the reason that that  
21 was important was to-was to your very point.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So the answer is  
23 yes. Okay.

24 JAMES PATCHETT: Was that we would need  
25 to be--

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: We're going to—we're  
3 going to explore these issues in greater detail as  
4 the question proceeds. So—

5 JAMES PATCHETT: I look forward to it.

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And one other  
7 questions, what is a job? My understanding is one  
8 need not have an actual job to be counted a receiving  
9 job under the Mayor's Jobs Plan. Is that correct?

10 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So apprenticeships,  
12 educational opportunities, training opportunities,  
13 those are not counted as job under your plan?

14 JAMES PATCHETT: They're not created as  
15 jobs until like—in the case of apprenticeships we're  
16 counting the number of people who are actually—like  
17 take an example--

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Are you counting  
19 apprenticeships toward the goal of 100,000 projected  
20 jobs?

21 JAMES PATCHETT: We're counting  
22 apprenticeships that lead to them receiving--

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay, you are  
24 counting apprenticeships?

25 JAMES PATCHETT: Oh, yeah.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Are you counting  
4 apprenticeships toward the goal of 100,000 projected  
5 jobs?

6 JAMES PATCHETT: Not enrollment in and of  
7 itself.

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: What about  
9 internships? Are you counting internships toward the  
10 goal of 100,000 protected jobs? So, you're only  
11 counting apprenticeships? Why are you counting  
12 apprenticeships?

13 JAMES PATCHETT: That's, yeah that's just  
14 not what I said. I mean apprenticeship is when  
15 you're working at employer receiving a salary and the  
16 apprenticeships that we are focused on are jobs that  
17 are going to lead to them having good quality  
18 training programs. Jackie, can you talk about the  
19 healthcare apprenticeship, please?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Sure. The  
21 apprentices are designed with employers to be a  
22 combination of--of on the job training and education.  
23 So when they start--

24 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: [interposing] Could  
25 you just identify for the record just so we know who  
you are.

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I'm sorry,  
3 what?

4 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Could you say for  
5 the record, please, your name.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I'm-I'm  
7 sorry. I am Jackie Mallon, First Deputy Commissioner  
8 at SBS.

9 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you, Jackie.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Sorry. So,  
11 they're employed on day one. A couple of examples if  
12 they are useful to you is a nurse residency program  
13 that we recently announced and it started and we'll  
14 have 225 people by the beginning of April in jobs at  
15 hospitals, 28 hospitals throughout the city. We've  
16 also started an apprenticeship for CNC Machinists  
17 with 11 different employers. That's been going on  
18 for the last—since last year. Are you good?

19 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes. I just—I just—I  
20 mean I'm just not sure why you would think an  
21 apprenticeship had at an employer wasn't a job.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do you regard an  
23 apprenticeship as a permanent job?

3 JAMES PATCHETT: It is. They lead—they-  
4 they-look, they are on the job and being educated and  
5 trained simultaneously while being paid.

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Internships are not  
7 counted nor educational work?

8 JAMES PATCHETT: And even I've done the  
9 internships. Trainings alone are not counted. If  
10 we—if we have a specific training in partnership with  
11 an employer that leads to a job because of the skills  
12 training that we're doing that is specific to that  
13 type of job, and they wouldn't have access to that  
14 job set other—that opportunity otherwise, we count  
15 that job, but that's exactly what I think the premise  
16 of your introductory remarks were, which is we have  
17 to train people. We can't just create jobs that pay  
18 \$100,000 a year and expect those to go to the types  
19 of populations we're all trying to serve. We have to  
20 do the—we have to do—foster work in partnership with  
21 real residents of New York City in partnership with  
22 employers to get people into those jobs.

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Can you define what  
24 qualifies as a good paying job under the Mayor's  
25 Fund?

3 JAMES PATCHETT: As-as-as I said, in my  
4 remarks it's 50—it's focused on \$50,000 per year or a  
5 someone who has a near-term pathway at \$50,000 per  
6 year.

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And just—so New  
8 York—New York Works defines a Pathway to a job as  
9 though it were it were an actual job without  
10 necessarily tracking whether the Pathway leads to an  
11 actual job? What does it mean to have a Pathway to a  
12 job as opposed to an actual job?

13 JAMES PATCHETT: That's right. To be  
14 clear, you know, you have to have an actual job. The  
15 definition of whether or not it's good pay is either  
16 you're receiving \$50,000 a year at Year 1 or if you  
17 are—if you are on a pathway to receiving that within  
18 the first few years of your employment. Again,  
19 because we want jobs. We didn't want to construct a  
20 plan where if you were in an industrial job say, and  
21 you were making \$45,000 a year, year 1, we would not  
22 want to disincentive creating those jobs as a part of  
23 the plan. So, we want to make sure that there's some  
24 opportunity for people who start with lower skillsets  
25 for instance an apprenticeship to build up to higher



2 paying jobs over time. That's the way we reach the  
3 population.

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, if I'm an—if I'm  
5 an entry level employee in an industry where the  
6 median salary is \$50,000 a year am I considered on a  
7 pathway to a good paying job?

8 JAMES PATCHETT: That depends on the  
9 specific, and that's a very general question. Sorry.

10 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, if I'm an entry-  
11 level employee

12 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --who is not making  
14 \$50,000, but the median salary is \$50,000 within the  
15 industry--

16 JAMES PATCHETT: [interposing] It  
17 depends.

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --and I'm in one of  
19 the industries that that you're targeting--

20 JAMES PATCHETT: [interposing] Not  
21 comparing--

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Would I be  
23 considered--

24 JAMES PATCHETT: Not necessarily. It  
25 depends on the occupation that you're in, and whether

2 you're specifically on a pathway to making that--that  
3 salary within the first couple of years of your  
4 employment.

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, we're in year 2  
6 of the Jobs Plan, correct?

7 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And as of today of  
9 the 100,000 projected jobs, how many are on the  
10 Pathway and how many are jobs that pay \$50,000 or  
11 more?

12 JAMES PATCHETT: I can--I'm happy to give  
13 you a specific breakdown. I don't have those  
14 specific numbers in front of me.

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: That's an important  
16 question. I mean--

17 JAMES PATCHETT: Sure. I'm happy to get  
18 it to you.

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: You don't have that  
20 number?

21 JAMES PATCHETT: I'm not saying I don't  
22 have it. I'm saying--just--just again to step back,  
23 this is--we're doing annual updates in this plan.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Right.

25 JAMES PATCHETT: And I--we'll be doing it--

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But how many--?

3 JAMES PATCHETT: [interposing] I know you  
4 want to have that--

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But I--but I--I want  
6 to--I want to--if I'm in a town hall--

7 JAMES PATCHETT: -Uh-hm.

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And a constituent is  
9 asking me how many jobs has the city created under  
10 the Mayor's Jobs Plan, I should be able to answer  
11 that question.

12 JAMES PATCHETT: Right. So, I'd say of  
13 the 19,000, we believe we're at--we're about 3,000 of  
14 those actual jobs people working today, but I want to  
15 be clear. We're doing annual updates. We did our  
16 best prepare for this hearing because you're holding  
17 it today, and for the New Yorker Times article that  
18 was associated with those hearings, so we provide the  
19 most current information. We set up this plan to  
20 report as we do in all of our other City Council  
21 circumstances to report on a Fiscal Year basis. So,  
22 we will have a comprehensive update at that time  
23 though we--though most of the employers that we're  
24 dealing with are very small employers. So, we can't  
25 just expect them to respond to out of nowhere to

3 requests from the city for specific updated  
4 employment information. So, we'll have a  
5 comprehensive update for you at the end of the Fiscal  
6 Year as we always plan to do.

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: You said we believe  
8 that we created 3,000 jobs with that.

9 JAMES PATCHETT: Again, we didn't—that  
10 is—I'm doing my best to give you an estimate today  
11 and for this hearing, for purposes of this hearing,  
12 and we'll provide a comprehensive and specific  
13 estimate as a part of our update—our annual update  
14 when it's available in June as it was always planned  
15 to be.

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I'm going to provide  
17 you with a hypothetical. Suppose as a result of the  
18 New York Works Plan I obtain a job as a lighting  
19 designed in the theater industry with a starting  
20 salary of \$35,000 a year. The median salary is  
21 \$56,000. Would I be considered on a pathway to  
22 \$50,000 for a good paying job?

23 JAMES PATCHETT: Yeah, I—I understand.  
24 Could you—could you just clarify?

25 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, as a result of  
the New York Works program--

2 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Suppose I become a  
4 lighting designer in the theater industry earning a  
5 salary of \$35,000 a year below the threshold for a  
6 good paying job, but the median salary of the  
7 industry is \$56,000.

8 JAMES PATCHETT: Yeah.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Would I be  
10 considered on a pathway to a good paying job under  
11 New York Works?

12 JAMES PATCHETT: It really depends on the  
13 specific circumstances. Sorry.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, what are those  
15 circumstances that would determine whether I'd be  
16 considered on a Pathway?

17 JAMES PATCHETT: I mean it was a really  
18 specific example of a lighting designer. I'm happy  
19 to try to--

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] But--  
21 but explain generally what--what determines whether  
22 you qualify on a Pathway?

23 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, it's what I--what I  
24 said previously. It is either that you are--either  
25 you're paid \$50,000 at the outset or the job or that

2 we-based on the best information we have believe  
3 you're on a near-term Pathway to earning more than  
4 \$50,000 a year.

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I'm sorry. Can you  
6 repeat yourself?

7 JAMES PATCHETT: Sure. Either you're  
8 earning \$50,000 at the outset, or you're on a near-  
9 term Pathway in our best estimation to be paid that  
10 level.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, if I'm a  
12 lighting designer, and I'm on a near-term Pathway to  
13 earning \$56,000--\$50,000, would I be considered?

14 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay. I would. So,  
16 at what point does EDC count me as receiving a  
17 \$50,000 job? When I'm making \$35,000 or when I'm--  
18 when I actually reach \$50,000? At what point do you  
19 count me?

20 JAMES PATCHETT: So, as I said, this is a  
21 10-year plan.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: It's a simple  
23 question, and you just--at what point if I'm--if I'm--if  
24 I'm earning \$35,000 a year and I'm on a Pathway--

3 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --to a good paying  
5 job, at what point do you count me as receiving a  
6 good paying job? When I'm making \$35,000 or when  
7 I'm--when I actually reach \$50,000? At what point do  
8 you count me?

9 JAMES PATCHETT: So, what we said at the  
10 outset was that we would be counting people who were  
11 either receiving \$50,000 or who were on a Pathway.  
12 So, in that sense we would be counting--

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, you count me as  
14 receiving a \$50,000 job when I'm making \$35,000 a  
15 year?

16 JAMES PATCHETT: I mean that is a--I don't  
17 know about--it's--I mean under your hypothetical  
18 example, I could--you could have said \$1.00. I mean,  
19 I think the reality is we have to have a really  
20 credible belief based on our specific data that we're  
21 going to have you a Pathway to \$50,000 a year. That  
22 is what we--what we always said from the outset of the  
23 plan was that it was not necessarily--like if you're  
24 making \$48,500 a year, but we have demonstrable  
25 evidence that we believe you'll be at \$50,000 within

3 a few years, then we will--then we'll count it as a  
4 Pathway to \$50,000.

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: What if I were a  
6 CUNY student enrolled in the CUNY 2X Tech program,  
7 would I as a CUNY student be counted as receiving a  
8 good paying job even though I'm not being paid and  
9 don't have a job?

10 JAMES PATCHETT: So, at this point in  
11 time, we are confident that the fact that we're  
12 doubling the Computer Science faculty at CUNY will  
13 lead to more good paying jobs for those students. I  
14 think it's a critically important program. It's  
15 actually one of the things we're most excited about,  
16 about the plan.

17 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Well, it sounds like  
18 a wonderful program, but I'm asking if I were a  
19 student were in the program--

20 JAMES PATCHETT: [interposing] So--

21 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --would I be--would I  
22 be counted as receiving a good paying job under the  
23 Mayor's Plan?

24 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes, so--

25 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: It's a yes or no  
question.



2 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, sure. So, we're  
3 not counting you as having received the job at the  
4 time that you receive the training. We're waiting  
5 until graduation, and then we'll track the placements  
6 in partnership with CUNY.

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do you track whether  
8 I graduate?

9 JAMES PATCHETT: Yeah, for our specifics,  
10 absolutely.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do you track whether  
12 I graduates become employed?

13 JAMES PATCHETT: Yeah, as I said, we're  
14 work in partnership with them at graduation, actual  
15 graduation rates and placement rates.

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do you track all the  
17 graduates whether all the graduates become employees,  
18 become employed with a good paying job?

19 JAMES PATCHETT: CUNY is tracking them,  
20 we're going to--

21 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: CUNY is tracking  
22 them?

23 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Does CUNY share the  
25 data with you.

2 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay.

4 JAMES PATCHETT: But at this point that  
5 program is very early. I mean they haven't graduated  
6 yet. So, we're thrilled that we are now going to be  
7 training an additional 1,000 people in computer  
8 science skills at City University system because  
9 they're exactly—I'll wait until you're finished

10 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay.

11 JAMES PATCHETT: Because those are  
12 exactly the types of—

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Can we share this  
14 with the public?

15 FEMALE SPEAKER: Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay. So we have a—  
17 like one of the documents that you provided to  
18 Oversight and Investigation, right, indicates the  
19 progress that--indicates that EDC has counted 2,450  
20 good paying jobs under the CUNY 2X Tech Initiative.  
21 Can we give them a copy of the document?

22 JAMES PATCHETT: No, I have it.

23 FEMALE SPEAKER: Yes. Tab 2, page 4.

24 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes. So, again, we sent  
25 that progress that they—we said, those are—those are

2 where we've taken the actions we believe will create  
3 those number of jobs, but we are providing more  
4 specifics on the actual number.

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Are  
6 all those 2,450 people you're—you're counting  
7 presently employed in good paying jobs?

8 JAMES PATCHETT: No, so it's just again,  
9 a step back—

10 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yeah.

11 JAMES PATCHETT: --as we go back to the  
12 very beginning, and we were having the same  
13 conversation, which is the Mayor will be in office  
14 until 2021. Definitionally, we have to take actions  
15 that will create a Pathway over a long time. We're  
16 about two years into this plan. As you point out,  
17 people are going to be in school at CUNY until they  
18 graduate, and when they graduate, and when they  
19 graduate, then they will be placed in jobs.

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But the criticism  
21 here is that you are counting Pathways as jobs  
22 without tracking whether those Pathways, in fact,  
23 become jobs.

24 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay, and my response  
25 is—

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: That's the poor  
3 criticism.

4 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay, Okay, well I hear  
5 the poor criticism, and my response is we are  
6 providing estimates when we initiate the programs,  
7 and then when we know the number of people actually  
8 in the jobs, we'll report that as well. So, it--

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, the question of  
10 jobs for whom? But obviously, when the Mayor  
11 proposes an affordable housing plan, the question is  
12 affordable for whom? Similarly, when the Mayor  
13 proposes a jobs plan, the following question that  
14 comes to mind is jobs for whom? For whom does New  
15 Yorker Works truly working. I want to share with you  
16 a quote from one of your predecessors, Sal Pinsky  
17 (sp?) that addresses the question of jobs for whom.  
18 "When we measure the success of this plan and really  
19 when we think about solving the fundamental problem  
20 our society is facing, mainly keeping the pathway to  
21 the middle class open, it's not about creating  
22 100,000 jobs that pay \$50,000 a year, but creating  
23 100,000 jobs that pay \$50,000 a year that will go  
24 into this underserved population." Do you agree--  
25 agree with Mr. Pinsky's comments?

3 JAMES PATCHETT: I have spoken to him a  
4 number of times about the plan. He thinks what we're  
5 doing is exactly the right thing to be doing. I  
6 don't want to put words in his mouth, but I think we--  
7 we talk quite frequently. I think--

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do agree with his  
9 comments here?

10 JAMES PATCHETT: Do I agree with his  
11 comments? I mean I think that's a pretty narrow set  
12 of those comments, but I think broadly speaking we  
13 all agree this will be a success if we effectively  
14 get New Yorkers into these jobs. It doesn't mean  
15 necessarily that every job--

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] But  
17 I'm not going to-- Do you agree with his comments or  
18 not? I'm wasn't clear on--

19 JAMES PATCHETT: I'm sorry. Would you  
20 repeat?

21 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] That  
22 we should be targeting jobs to those in greatest  
23 need, to those who are underserved?

24 JAMES PATCHETT: We should absolutely be  
25 targeting jobs to those with the greatest need if  
that's the question. Yes.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, how many of  
4 those projected 100,000 jobs will go to those without  
5 pre-existing skills?

6 JAMES PATCHETT: As many as we possibly  
7 can achieve.

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And what's that  
9 number?

10 JAMES PATCHETT: I don't think we know  
11 today?

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: You don't know.  
13 Okay. How many of the projected 100,000 jobs are  
14 going to those without a high school diploma? Do you  
15 know the answer to that question?

16 JAMES PATCHETT: Again, I just want to  
17 take a step back. Again, I just want to take a step  
18 back. As an example, our entire Cyber Security  
19 Initiative is spoken--

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] You're  
21 not going--you're not here to answer the questions you  
22 want to answer. You're here to answer the questions  
23 that I'm asking. I'm asking: How many of the  
24 projected 100,000 jobs are going to those without a  
25 high school diploma? If you don't know the answer,  
we can move on.

2 JAMES PATCHETT: I think to your point,  
3 we'll know more over time.

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But you don't know  
5 now. Even though equity is at the core of this plan,  
6 you cannot tell me how many people are going to  
7 benefit from the job—how many—whether the lowest  
8 income New Yorkers are going to benefit or the extent  
9 to which they will benefit from the is Jobs Plan?

10 JAMES PATCHETT: I think, Council Member,  
11 I appreciate the—the direction of your question, and  
12 it's a critically important direction to go in your  
13 question, and if you're looking for a gotcha on that,  
14 obviously, you can get it. This is a plan for 10  
15 years. I can't even tell you every single of the  
16 100,000 jobs that we're going to create over that 10-  
17 year period, and if I were trying to, it would be  
18 foolish to do that.

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] So—so—

20 JAMES PATCHETT: [interposing] I think I—  
21 But can—can I finish since—

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Go ahead, please, go  
23 ahead, go ahead.

24 JAMES PATCHETT: So, you're—you're right.  
25 That's—I think I can tell you that I share the

2 fundamental objectives of this Council, and I think  
3 many of your colleagues would agree that our work is  
4 targeted on reaching the most vulnerable populations  
5 as effectively as we can. This plan is not a—is not  
6 a replacement for other citywide efforts. It's not a  
7 replacement for our education system, which is a  
8 comprehensive solution. It's not a replacement for  
9 even our—our—our college system. What it is, is it's  
10 a targeted effort to do our best to create the jobs  
11 of the future while making them accessible.

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But I'm measuring  
13 the plan against the Mayor's own words. The Mayor  
14 promised us the fairest big city in America.

15 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: CHAIRPERSON TORRES:  
17 He promised us jobs that would give people at chance  
18 at the middle-class

19 JAMES PATCHETT: Yep.

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Jobs that will raise  
21 the floor for working people.

22 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, these are the  
24 expectations that the Mayor himself has set with his  
25 own rhetoric. Do you know the—and I represent one of



2 the poorest Council Districts in the city. The  
3 median level of educational attainment, as I've said  
4 to you before, is less than a high school diploma.

5 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do you the  
7 percentage of New Yorkers without a college degree?

8 JAMES PATCHETT: Do I know the percentage  
9 of New Yorkers who do not have a high school degree?

10 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yes or without a  
11 college degree. Yes.

12 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay. [background  
13 comments] Okay. I don't know off the top of my head.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, it's 63% of New  
15 Yorkers--

16 JAMES PATCHETT: Right.

17 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --who have no  
18 college degree. Like the vast majority, and I want to  
19 know whether that plan is primarily serving the 63%  
20 of New Yorkers who are left behind by the economy.

21 JAMES PATCHETT: Right, which is-which is  
22 why the investments in training that are a part of  
23 this plan are so foundational.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But here's my  
25 frustration. CHAIRPERSON TORRES: We're not tracking

3 the number of jobs we're creating for underserved New  
4 Yorkers, nor can you project the number of jobs that  
5 we are creating for underserved New Yorkers. So, if  
6 we're not tracking to the benefit of low-income New  
7 Yorkers and we're not projecting to the benefit of  
8 low-income New Yorkers, there's no reason to believe  
9 that this plan will actually work to the benefit of  
10 low-income New Yorkers.

11 JAMES PATCHETT: I think we are doing a  
12 comprehensive set of things that will serve low-  
13 income New Yorkers and ensure-- Again, the programs  
14 we have talked about whether it is the Nursing--the  
15 Nursing apprentice program, our Cyber Security  
16 skills, our CUNY 2X Tech Program, our CUNY ASAP  
17 Program, those are going to serve thousands and  
18 thousands of New Yorkers and get them the skills that  
19 they need for the jobs of tomorrow. We have to  
20 simultaneously make sure we have relationships with  
21 those employers. We have to make--create a  
22 relationship between the employers and the people who  
23 are providing the education. I mean, we're not in,  
24 you know, we're not in the Soviet Union. We're not--  
25 we can't make employers hire people. We have to work  
with them if we're going to--

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] But  
3 we're just—we're not advocating Totalitarianism.

4 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes. I think—I think—I  
5 think this is where we have a comprehensive strategy  
6 here. I think it is a—a comprehensive plan. It has  
7 an extensive amount of training as a part of it. It  
8 will create good jobs for people. Whether or not I  
9 can specify to you today the precise amount of people  
10 who will be without high school degrees as a part of  
11 this plan, doesn't undermine the fact that  
12 fundamentally this plan is going to create good jobs  
13 for people who are would otherwise not have access to  
14 them. I mean I think you would, you would apply for  
15 any of the--

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But we're not  
17 tracking to that effect and we're not projecting to  
18 that effect.

19 JAMES PATCHETT: JAMES PATCHETT: You  
20 would apply many of the specific elements of this  
21 plan as that--

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I—I do.

23 JAMES PATCHETT: --and I think that's  
24 what's critically important about it.

25 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: It is.

3 JAMES PATCHETT: It's the set of  
4 strategies that were put in place as a part of this  
5 effort whether it's the investment in the Brooklyn  
6 Amy Terminal and the Brooklyn Navy Yard. Whether  
7 it's investments in our CUNY system or our Workforce  
8 Development system or whether it's investments in the  
9 cyber skills of the future, those are all really  
10 important to creating an economy that works for  
11 everyone, and that's why we need to work in  
12 partnership with the Council on going forward.

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, you cannot tell  
14 me the number of jobs that are going to those without  
15 preexisting skills, those without a college degree,  
16 those without a high school diploma. Can you at  
17 least tell me the number of jobs that will go to  
18 actual New Yorkers as opposed to commuters or recent  
19 transplants?

20 JAMES PATCHETT: We're going to create  
21 the jobs--

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Is  
23 that something you can tell me?

24 JAMES PATCHETT: What' that?  
25

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Can you tell me the  
3 actual number of jobs that will go to—that will go to  
4 New Yorkers as opposed to commuters?

5 JAMES PATCHETT: I—I think as—as you  
6 know, we—we are precluded from—from—from preventing  
7 people--

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I'm not—I'm not  
9 asking about preventing. I'm asking can you tell me  
10 the number of jobs that will go to New Yorkers rather  
11 than commuters?

12 JAMES PATCHETT: We are going to make  
13 every effort to ensure that the vast--

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Okay,  
15 so you--

16 JAMES PATCHETT: --vast majority of these  
17 jobs--

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: You can't tell me.

19 JAMES PATCHETT: --go to current New  
20 Yorkers.

21 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So a New Jersey  
22 resident or a Connecticut resident would count the  
23 same under your Jobs Plan as a New York resident?

24 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.  
25

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yes. Okay. I want  
3 to focus on the neighborhood level. As I noted  
4 before, New York City's economy has been growing and  
5 has been creating jobs, but the economic growth in  
6 job creation has spread unevenly across  
7 neighborhoods.

8 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: We are all New  
10 Yorkers, but not all of us live in the same New York.  
11 The numbers are stark. Even though New York City has  
12 an overall unemployment rate of 4%, some  
13 neighborhoods struggle, as you know, with  
14 substantially higher rates of unemployment, some even  
15 in the double digits. Here are a few examples. I  
16 represent Belmont, Crotona Park East and East  
17 Tremont, which has an approximately 15% unemployment  
18 rate, more than triple the citywide average.  
19 Brownsville and Ocean Hill have an approximately 14%  
20 unemployment rate. Howard Beach and Ozone Park, 10%  
21 unemployment rate.

22 JAMES PATCHETT: Yep.

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Does the New York  
24 Works Plan specifically target these high need  
25 neighborhoods for job creation?

2 JAMES PATCHETT: It's not a neighborhood  
3 by neighborhood strategy, but we have plenty of  
4 neighborhood specific strategies. As I talked about,  
5 our specific efforts in Downtown Far Rockaway, which  
6 is also a high need area. We're specifically working  
7 in areas of East New York with the Council Member  
8 there. We'd be happy to work with you if there are  
9 specific Initiatives you'd like to see for job  
10 creation in your neighborhood. As I said, it's a  
11 framework. We have a--

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] So, I  
13 take it you're not targeting high need neighborhoods  
14 specifically for job creation?

15 JAMES PATCHETT: I didn't say that. No,  
16 it's to the contrary. We are targeting a lot of high  
17 need neighborhoods. We're targeting areas in Sunset  
18 Park in partnership with Council Member Menchaca.  
19 We're targeting Downtown Far Rockaway in partnership  
20 with Council Member Treyger. We're targeting Jamaica  
21 in partnership with Council Member Adams, and we  
22 would be thrilled to if there are Council Members who  
23 have other specific Initiatives in their  
24 neighborhood, we'd be very happy to work with them.

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: CHAIRPERSON TORRES:

3 I want to—you brought up earlier, as we've  
4 established the job numbers in the Jobs Plan are  
5 projections rather than actuals, and you brought up  
6 categories of action. There are five categories of  
7 action that the city uses to create jobs. One is  
8 city-owned property. Two is capital investment.  
9 Three is land use tools. Four is direct financial  
10 investment and support. Five is financing and tax  
11 incentives. When the—I want to—I'm going to ask  
12 about tracking as opposed to projection—

13 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --on each category.  
15 When the direct action is city-owned property, do you  
16 track the actual number of jobs created?

17 JAMES PATCHETT: -we will be in our  
18 regular update. Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: You will be?

20 JAMES PATCHETT: We'll be providing a  
21 regular update in June.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] You're  
23 committed to tracking the actual jobs—the number of  
24 jobs created when it comes to city-owned property?



3 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, it depends on the  
4 specific circumstance. When it's—so, we are going to  
5 be signing leases so we would—as you're talking  
6 about, it's included in the report when we—when we  
7 open the building. So, in the case of the Brooklyn  
8 Army Terminal, we opened a half a million square  
9 feet, which is accessible to tenants. As those  
10 tenants actually sign leases and move in, we'll have  
11 much specific estimates of the number of jobs that  
12 are actually created. So, we'll be providing updates  
13 with specifics above and beyond the numbers that were  
14 provided in the initial estimate.

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: CHAIRPERSON TORRES:  
16 So, you're not projecting, you're actually tracking  
17 the actual number of jobs on the direct action of  
18 city-owned property?

19 JAMES PATCHETT: Yeah, we'll be going  
20 certainly beyond the level of specificity that you  
21 have in the—

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Are you offering  
23 more specific projections or are you going to do  
24 actual tracking of the actual number?

25 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, it—it depends on  
the specific case. So, again, in the—in the case

3 where we're changing the zoning, and have no direct  
4 city relationship with the particular

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: CHAIRPERSON TORRES:  
6 [interposing] I mean Category 1, city-owned property.

7 JAMES PATCHETT: I'm sorry.

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I'm going to  
9 categorically like over.

10 JAMES PATCHETT: [interposing] We'll, you  
11 see, that it's—with city-owned property there are  
12 cases where it's city-owned property where we are the  
13 landlord, and it's other cases where someone else is  
14 the landlord and we're—they're doing a full building  
15 on our site. So, it's just two different  
16 circumstances. Where we're the—where we're the  
17 landlord, we'll have leases within individual tenants  
18 and we'll have a much more level of specificity about  
19 their employment over time. So, it just varies on  
20 the specific circumstance, and we'll be providing  
21 more detailed updates about that over time.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And when the direct  
23 action is capital investment, do you track the actual  
24 numbers of jobs created?

25 JAMES PATCHETT: When the direct action  
is--?

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Capital investment.  
4 These are—I'm quoting your category verbatim.

5 JAMES PATCHETT: It—it varies based on the  
6 particular circumstance, the particular project. We  
7 do the best we can.

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, we're under the  
9 impression that you simply project rather than track  
10 the number of jobs created. When the direct action  
11 is land use, do you track the actual number of jobs  
12 created?

13 JAMES PATCHETT: So, in the case of land  
14 use, we will, you know, as I--Yeah, probably the best  
15 example is East Midtown, but I want to just again  
16 take the example—example of the—so the Tech Training  
17 Center. The Tech Training Center, which is in  
18 Council Member Rivera's district we approved it in  
19 partnership with her through ULURP and the Council  
20 last year. We are closing on construction of that  
21 within the next week or so. It's going to take two  
22 years to build that out. So, we will have an estimate  
23 at the outset of the number of people we believe will  
24 actually work so--

25 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] You  
believe. So, you're projecting that?

3 JAMES PATCHETT: No, no, no. Let me  
4 finish, please. I have to finish the sentence at  
5 least.

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay.

7 JAMES PATCHETT: At the outset we will  
8 estimate—we will estimate that we think there will be  
9 about 600 people working there. Once the building is  
10 actually up and running, we'll have much more  
11 specific data. So, we—we project at the outset, and  
12 then we have more details over time. It takes in New  
13 York City a minimum of two years to build a building,  
14 and so that's where we are--

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, this is the  
16 first time we're hearing of this in months of  
17 conversation, but I appreciate the commitment to  
18 greater specificity and projection. When the direct  
19 action is financial investment and support, do you  
20 track the actual number of jobs created?

21 JAMES PATCHETT: Right. So, in that case,  
22 again it depends on the specific action--

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay.

24 JAMES PATCHETT: But in—but in--

25 Everything depends on a specific action.

2 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, it's because--  
3 there's literally--

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] It's a  
5 complicated world I guess.

6 JAMES PATCHETT: --hundreds of different  
7 programs that are part of this plan as you know. So,  
8 you know, in that case typically what we'll track  
9 we'll--we'll employ--what are partners will be required  
10 to track is the number of companies that are served  
11 and the number of--number of employees that are part  
12 of that company. So, we'll be tracking specifically  
13 the number of companies there that--that are created  
14 and grow as a part of that. We--we will then have to  
15 apply based on information from our partners, an  
16 estimate of the exact number of people that those  
17 employees, that those companies will employ over  
18 time. So, we'll have specifics on companies, and I  
19 also, and heard something--

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: With suggestions on  
21 the employees. Okay.

22 JAMES PATCHETT: But a little bit of  
23 projecting about relating to companies.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay. Now when the  
25 direct action is financing and tax incentives, our

3 understanding is that you actually track rather than  
4 project the number of jobs created. Is that correct?

5 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, and that's the  
6 criteria. So that's the one case where are there  
7 were actually providing financial resources to--  
8 directly to companies, and where, therefore, like  
9 we're actually saying, you're--you're receiving a tax  
10 benefit from the city. In exchange, you should  
11 absolutely be required to--

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] So,  
13 how is that different when you're receiving capital  
14 funding from the city? You're receiving operating  
15 funding from the city. You're receiving a zoning  
16 approval. In all those cases we have leverage while  
17 you're able to track the number of actual jobs  
18 created when it come to tax incentives, but not when  
19 it comes to everything else.

20 JAMES PATCHETT: -We're not providing-I  
21 mean, so, you know, let's just--let's just take a--so  
22 in the case of our tenants at our location, there  
23 are--we have hundreds of tenants across our industrial  
24 assets. The vast majority of them are small  
25 businesses, small mostly industrial businesses. You  
know, we have the--this--this company at the Brooklyn

3 Navy Yard called CatBird. They employ 90 people.  
4 They make jewelry. It's a women owned organization.  
5 It's locally based. It's a fantastic company.  
6 We're—we know the number of employees that they have.  
7 We speak regularly with them. We also, but we also  
8 don't want to burden these types of small businesses  
9 with having to provide comprehensive extensive  
10 updates to the city. That doesn't mean that they  
11 shouldn't be in these spaces across the city.

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, you're concerned  
13 about a burden on small businesses?

14 JAMES PATCHETT: In some case we  
15 absolutely are. I mean again these—in the cases of  
16 industrial companies, I know you know this from your  
17 own district. Many of these businesses if there were  
18 not city industrial assets, they would be leaving the  
19 city altogether. So, that's a fundamentally important  
20 thing for us to do especially if our collective  
21 mission is to create jobs that have real pathways.  
22 So, we have to have—we have to balance this. If we  
23 were giving, you know, discretionary subsidies to he  
24 companies, there's no question that that we should be  
25 requiring them to--

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Can I  
4 ask, are they small businesses that receive tax  
5 incentives?

6 JAMES PATCHETT: Are there—are there?  
7 There are some, yes.

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And the small  
9 businesses that receive tax incentives do report on  
10 the number of jobs created?

11 JAMES PATCHETT: It depends on the  
12 particular circumstance, but for the most part if  
13 it's discretionary tax incentive, that is the case.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But small businesses  
15 can and do report on the actual number of jobs  
16 created. I want to—I want to read a quote. I want  
17 to see if you agree with this. Ultimately, these  
18 projections are based on assumptions that are  
19 difficult to verify before the projects have been  
20 completed. In order to truly measure the impact of  
21 these projects, we would have to track the movement  
22 and subsequent activity of businesses into the  
23 immediate—immediately surrounding area with direct  
24 association to the infrastructure itself including  
25 annual employment numbers. I that way we can isolate  
employee growth directly caused by these improvements



3 and better home projections for future projects. Do  
4 you agree with that aforementioned quote?

5 JAMES PATCHETT: It seems reasonable.

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yeah, so, the quote  
7 comes from an EDC document provided to the Council  
8 related to a project in the New York Works Plan  
9 called Freight NYC, and it appears under a section  
10 entitled Verifying Job Growth. Do you agree that  
11 tracking annual employment numbers will help isolate  
12 employee growth directly caused by city action, and  
13 better home projections with future projects?

14 JAMES PATCHETT: Sorry, can you just ask  
15 the question again?

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But do you agree  
17 that tracking annual employment numbers will help  
18 isolate employee growth directly caused by city  
19 action, and better home projections with future  
20 projection--projects?

21 JAMES PATCHETT: Alright and we--and we--we  
22 do track that, and again, I'm not sure what you're  
23 getting at.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Well, you don't  
25 track. You mostly project. In four out of five

3 categories you are projecting the number of jobs  
4 created not greater.

5 JAMES PATCHETT: [interposing] No, with  
6 all due—with all due respect, we are projecting now,  
7 and over time we'll have more detail. I mean when  
8 the building isn't built yet, it's naturally a  
9 projection. What we're saying in our report is --

10 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] But  
11 you're counting now before verifying whether those  
12 projections become actual jobs.

13 JAMES PATCHETT: We're—we're saying that  
14 we have taken the actions necessary to create the  
15 jobs. That's what our mission is. (sic)

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But you are counting  
17 jobs—you're counting before—you're counting projected  
18 jobs before those jobs materialize into real jobs.

19 JAMES PATCHETT: But, you know, as—as we  
20 said at the outset, the Mayor unless—unless there's a  
21 change in the law again, the Mayor is not going to be  
22 in office after 2021. This was always a 10-year  
23 plan. So, naturally, if there are going to be jobs  
24 created in years 5 and 6 and 7 of the plan, those are  
25 going to be projections, not actual jobs that are  
created by the end of the plan. We're still going to

3 take the actions that are necessary and over time  
4 during the duration of this administration--maybe the  
5 future administration will do the same--we'll provide  
6 as much specificity as we possibly can about the  
7 actual jobs created, but not every one of those jobs  
8 is going to be created by the end of 2021.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I want to go back to  
10 you brought up the burden of reporting for small  
11 businesses. Don't employers typically know the  
12 number of employees they hired?

13 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Don't employers  
15 typically know the salaries of those employees?

16 JAMES PATCHETT: They do.

17 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And don't employers  
18 typically know the salary of those employees?

19 JAMES PATCHETT: They do.

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And don't employers  
21 typically know, the educational attainment and--and  
22 skill level of the employees?

23 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, as you know, they  
24 certainly are not allowed to know the previous salary  
25 of those employees.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: No, the educational  
4 attainment and skill level of the employees and the  
5 current salary, what they're actually—if you're my  
6 employee and I'm paying you a salary, I know the  
7 salary I'm paying you. So, if—if employers typically  
8 know these basic facts about their employees, then I  
9 don't quite understand why reporting these facts to  
10 the city would—would be the prohibitive burden that  
11 you seem to think it would be.

12 JAMES PATCHETT: I'm not saying that.  
13 I'm just saying—I mean it just really varies by the  
14 particular circumstance. I mean again in many of  
15 these circumstances we'll have a great level of  
16 detail and specificity about the exact number of  
17 employees actually working at these companies. I  
18 just don't—I'm sorry. I just don't accept the  
19 premise that we don't know or have the specifics  
20 about individual employers, even small businesses.

21 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Look, my concern is  
22 we're mostly projecting rather than tracking. We can  
23 only know what we track.

24 JAMES PATCHETT: Today, we are  
25 projecting.

CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Hold on.

3 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay, sorry.

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --and if we are not  
5 tracking the real world impact of the Jobs Plan, the  
6 question is how do we evaluate the effectiveness of  
7 the plan? How do we know which programs are worth  
8 pursuing, and which should be discontinued? How do  
9 we know which projections are accurate?

10 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: How do we know any  
12 or how many jobs are created? How do we know whether  
13 city dollars are being spent efficiently? How do we  
14 know whether the plan is fostering not only growth  
15 but greater equity?

16 JAMES PATCHETT: How do we know any or  
17 how many jobs are created? How do we know whether  
18 city dollars are being spent efficiently? [background  
19 comments]

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: In order to assess  
21 the dollar amount spent on each projected job, we  
22 have to know the full cost of the Jobs Plan. What is  
23 the full cost of New York Works?

24 JAMES PATCHETT: So, we've—we've spent to  
25 date a little over \$300 million.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Over \$300 million?

4 JAMES PATCHETT: A little over \$300  
5 million, yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do we know the cost  
7 per job?

8 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, so, in the  
9 aggregate our current estimate is it will be about  
10 10, a little over \$10,000 per job, but we have a lot  
11 more work to do. A lot of those are investments in  
12 infrastructure. So, you know, if we're, as we are  
13 doing, renovating an entire building at the Brooklyn  
14 Army Terminal, yes we believe that will create 2,500  
15 jobs. So, if you do the simple math on that, that's  
16 \$40,000 a job but looking at it another way, we'll  
17 have a building that is owned by the city that's been  
18 renovated for the—and will be up and available for  
19 people for the next 50 years. So, that's an  
20 investment in infrastructure that the city owns.  
21 Many infrastructure investments the city puts money  
22 into don't necessarily create jobs. They're  
23 important for other reasons.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But New York Works  
25 Plan states that the city has committed over \$1.1  
billion to date. Over \$250 million will be committed

3 in November 2017 and January 2018 budgets.

4 Additional investments toward creating 100 jobs will  
5 come over the next 10 years.

6 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Does the \$1.3  
8 billion committed thus far reflect the full cost of  
9 the Jobs Plan?

10 JAMES PATCHETT: So, what--again, our  
11 rough estimates are that we anticipated being  
12 slightly over a billion dollars total--

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yes.

14 JAMES PATCHETT: --is what you  
15 referenced, and separately what I--what the real level  
16 of specificity we have is a little bit of over \$300  
17 million spent to date. We'd be happy to provide a  
18 breakdown to you of that if that would be helpful.

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And does that one--  
20 that over billion dollars that you intend to spend,  
21 does that reflect the full cost of the plan?

22 JAMES PATCHETT: You know it--as I said, we  
23 don't necessarily know.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES:

25 and the current salary is what they're  
actually--if you're my employee and I'm paying you a

3 salary, I know the—the salary I'm paying you? So,  
4 if—if employers typically know these basic facts  
5 about their employees, then I don't quite understand  
6 why reporting these facts to the city would—would be  
7 the prohibitive burden that you seem to think it  
8 would be.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: The reason I asked  
10 does that include the cost of the tax incentives that  
11 we hand out?

12 JAMES PATCHETT: I don't have those  
13 specific breakdown in front of me, but we believe  
14 it's a comprehensive set of—of investments, but that  
15 being said there are some tax incentives that have  
16 not been included in that estimate because we don't  
17 know the—

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But there are  
19 businesses that receive as-of-right tax incentives  
20 separate and apart from UF Works.

21 JAMES PATCHETT: Yeah.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, I'm asking does  
23 the \$1.1 billion for New York Works include the  
24 dollar amount spent on the tax credits.  
25



3 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay so as-as of right  
4 tax exemptions are not part of the Jobs Plan. So, we  
5 don't count those.

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But you use-are you  
7 using-when you use those tools, do you count that as  
8 a direct city action?

9 JAMES PATCHETT: As-of-right. No.

10 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: No. Okay. Do you  
11 anticipate needing any new funding over the next 8  
12 years?

13 JAMES PATCHETT: What's that?

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do you anticipate  
15 needing any new funding over the next 8 years?

16 JAMES PATCHETT: Needing new funding, not  
17 necessarily to meet the objectives. I think that  
18 there other important job creation initiatives that  
19 we all might like to pursue together. It doesn't-we  
20 can meet the objectives with our current funding, but  
21 I-yeah there could be job creation opportunities in  
22 your districts and other places in the city where we  
23 need them. We definitely need a partnership with the  
24 Council to make us--

25 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: You're in for a  
billion dollars. Is that capital, operating?

2 JAMES PATCHETT: It's primarily capital.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: It's part—is it  
4 primarily what percentage? What dollar amount? Is  
5 it almost all capital?

6 JAMES PATCHETT: Almost all capital.

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Almost all capital.

8 So, if almost all of the \$1.3 billion is going toward  
9 capital infrastructure then almost none of it is  
10 going toward actual programs aimed at closing the  
11 skills gap, or connecting New Yorkers to good paying  
12 jobs, low-income New Yorkers to good paying jobs?

13 JAMES PATCHETT: You know, we are making  
14 a significant investment in that as well. I mean  
15 separately to your point there is, you know, there  
16 are Workforce Development efforts that are outside of  
17 my purview that are important to connect people to  
18 all types of jobs.

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And under—  
20 underfunded, but—

21 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay, that are outside  
22 of my purview that are important to connect people to  
23 all types of jobs.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay. So there's  
25 the money, there are allocations for various

3 initiatives. There's money for tech, healthcare and  
4 life sciences, industrial, creative and cultural  
5 space for the future of jobs, and then there's a  
6 section entitled Connecting New Yorkers to Good Jobs,  
7 and in a budget document EDC provided to the Council  
8 that's connected, it indicates the funding for  
9 "Connecting New Yorkers to good jobs" accounts for  
10 only \$27 million out of \$1.3 billion. Is that--?

11 JAMES PATCHETT: It's just the cat-  
12 characterization. I'm sorry. I just don't have  
13 this--could you share with me.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yeah, can we provide  
15 the document?

16 FEMALE SPEAKER: That's Tab 3, EDC 0031  
17 to 32 in that binder. Sorry.

18 JAMES PATCHETT: [off mic]

19 FEMALE SPEAKER: Yes.

20 JAMES PATCHETT: That's why I haven't  
21 seen this before. What is the--?

22 FEMALE SPEAKER: So, Tab 3 and it's Bates  
23 Stamped EDC 0031.

24 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay.  
25

3 FEMALE SPEAKER: And The section  
4 Connecting New Yorker to good jobs is on EDC 32.  
5 [pause]

6 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, I've got that.  
7 Okay. So, we know that the average salary of the  
8 25,000 jobs is \$150,000. Oh, okay. I see. Okay.  
9 Sure.

10 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: The funding is \$27  
11 million.

12 JAMES PATCHETT: It's listed here. Yeah,  
13 this is a--this is. I mean this--this was the--an  
14 initial budget I think from what? Early 2017.  
15 [background comments] This is from 2000--early 2017,  
16 one of the many document your team requested in the  
17 discovery. Process is a part of this. So, it's more  
18 than a year and a half old. Happy to provide more  
19 specifics.

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay. So, I have a  
21 question about your methodology. Whether the manner  
22 in which--more questions about it.

23 JAMES PATCHETT: Yeah.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Does the manner in  
25 which you are projecting counting jobs align with the  
goal of equitable middle-class job creation?

3 When projecting jobs for a given project,  
4 my understanding is that you will discount jobs that  
5 neither pay \$50,000 nor offer a pathway to \$50,000.  
6 Is that correct?

7 JAMES PATCHETT: Correct.

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, your projections  
9 exclude jobs that are below the middle class? Do  
10 your projections—how do your projects—how do you—how  
11 do you—how do your projections treat those jobs?

12 JAMES PATCHETT: We do not exclude those.

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: You do not?

14 JAMES PATCHETT: No.

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, if—if you're  
16 willing to exclude jobs below the middle-class why  
17 not discount jobs above the middle-class?

18 JAMES PATCHETT: I mean I think—

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Why not focus on the  
20 jobs that advance equity?

21 JAMES PATCHETT: That is what we're  
22 focused on. You know, I think the—the—we don't think  
23 we should. I think that as we all know, the economy  
24 is naturally creating a lot of jobs, many of them at  
25 the high end and many of them at minimum wage level.  
We want to be creating jobs that are significantly

3 above the minimum wage level, which fortunately now  
4 is \$15.00 an hour, but is in many cases not enough to  
5 make a family get by on, and so we're focused on jobs  
6 that pay at least the level. If someone makes  
7 \$110,000 a year, we're not going to exclude that job  
8 as from a part of the plan. It should still be a  
9 part of the plan, but we just need to focus as much  
10 as we possibly can in partnership with you on  
11 ensuring that the people who get those jobs even  
12 those great paying jobs go to people who from non-  
13 traditional backgrounds, people who otherwise might  
14 not have gotten those jobs.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But I think as you  
15 rightly point out, the economy naturally produces  
16 inequality in job creation.

17 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And so the question  
19 is, is your Jobs Plan solving or subsidizing the  
20 inequality? What is the highest paid job included in  
21 your projections? Do you know?

22 JAMES PATCHETT: I-I—we don't have a  
23 specific breakdown, but I meant there's a largely-  
24 what do we have? Okay, and we've—I think it might be  
25 in this giant binder.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But do-do you count  
4 jobs that pay over \$200,000, \$300,000, \$400,000, half  
5 a million?

6 JAMES PATCHETT: We're not anticipating  
7 creating jobs at that income level as part of this  
8 plan.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Which income level?

10 JAMES PATCHETT: I mean it's--

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: \$200,000 or  
12 \$300,000?

13 JAMES PATCHETT: Right. We're not  
14 anticipating creating--if there are jobs created at  
15 that income level they're a very, very minimal par  
16 but again, you know, part of this is about creating  
17 jobs in, you know, East Midtown as a part of our  
18 comprehensive efforts there. Some of those jobs may  
19 be at higher income levels. We're not excluding  
20 those from the plan. We do also think it's important  
21 to have a competitive central business district--

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, there's no--  
23 there's no upper limit to the jobs that you count?

24 JAMES PATCHETT: --There is a very  
25 intentional effort to target the jobs.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] But  
4 there's no upper limit? Okay. [interposing] But  
5 there's no upper limit. Okay. So, suppose HQ2 had  
6 gone forward. You're much happier and suppose Jeff  
7 Bezos who has the net worth of \$138 billion moved  
8 into HQ2. Since there's no upper limit, would Jeff  
9 Bezos be counted toward the goal of 100,000 projected  
10 jobs?

11 JAMES PATCHETT: Um—

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Sounds like yes.

13 JAMES PATCHETT: I didn't say that.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: There's no upper  
15 limit that would prevent him from being counted  
16 towards your goal.

17 JAMES PATCHETT: I mean, it's—I mean I  
18 think it's an interesting question whether or not  
19 that Amazon project would have been an important  
20 addition to the Jobs Plan. I believe it would have  
21 been. I believe the work we were doing in  
22 partnership with our Workforce Development partners  
23 would have made it transformational for many low-  
24 income communities of color.

25 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] With  
respect, I'm not commenting on Amazon. I'm



3 commenting on the manner in which you're projecting.  
4 I'm not—we can't comment on the merits of Amazon.

5 JAMES PATCHETT: So it would have had to  
6 be a new job. So, we would have only counted people  
7 that were actual new jobs and so---

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Well,  
9 it's new to New York City.

10 JAMES PATCHETT: But just a relocated job  
11 doesn't necessarily count.

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES:

13 So, let's now let's go with the Amazon  
14 hypothetical. Would you have counted the Amazon jobs  
15 under New York Works Plan?

16 JAMES PATCHETT: Absolutely.

17 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And how many of  
18 those jobs? Out of the 25,000?

19 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, specifically what  
20 we were doing was as you know we had a framework for  
21 an agreement. The Council had a number of concerns  
22 about that agreement, which led to it not moving—

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: CHAIRPERSON TORRES:  
24 [interposing] I'm looking for a number, President  
25 Patchett. Like how many of the jobs will you have  
counted? It's a straightforward question.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] I'm  
4 looking for a number, President Patchett. Like how  
5 many of the jobs will you have counted? It's a  
6 straightforward question.

7 JAMES PATCHETT: No, it's actually not.  
8 We never had a--no, it's actually not. We never had  
9 an opportunity to complete our actual arrangement,  
10 our contract with that--

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing]  
12 According to documents you provided to the City  
13 Council, you would have counted 22,800 out of the  
14 25,000 jobs.

15 JAMES PATCHETT: Alright, that-that was--  
16 we were planning a potential of including that many,  
17 but it was not going to be in any reports yet because  
18 we hadn't actually completed having them.

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] No,  
20 I'm--I'm speaking hypothetically. If it had gone  
21 forward, you would have counted 22,800 out of the  
22 25,000 jobs.

23 JAMES PATCHETT: Again, as you know--as  
24 you know, we produced hundreds of documents as a part  
25 of this. That was not a number that I approved or  
specifically agreed to. It was a number that was

2 being held as a placeholder until we had actually  
3 concluded the agreement with them. We had an 8-page-

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] So,  
5 rather than dwell--

6 JAMES PATCHETT: --commitment--can I just  
7 finish--

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Sure.

9 JAMES PATCHETT: --we had an 8-page term  
10 sheet with that that we had agreed to. We were going  
11 to do hundreds of pages of contracts with them to  
12 actually determine the actual number of jobs that  
13 were created, and how many of those would have been  
14 above \$50,000 a year.

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do you suspect most  
16 of the jobs would have counted toward \$100,000 the  
17 Amazon deal.

18 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay. So, we know  
20 that the average salary of the 25,000 jobs is  
21 \$150,000

22 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Since your plan  
24 excludes the low-end jobs, the average salary of the  
25 counted jobs would have been higher than \$150,000.

3 So many of those jobs would have been about \$200,000,  
4 \$300,000, \$400,000, a substantial number of them. Do  
5 you think jobs above \$200,000, \$300,000, \$400,000 are  
6 accessible to low-income New Yorkers, the  
7 constituents that I represent in Belmont or East  
8 Tremont?

9 JAMES PATCHETT: I think we miss the  
10 historic opportunity to bring those jobs to New York  
11 City and to create a real pipeline to create the—to  
12 get those jobs to people to who you represent and  
13 everyone represents. I think it was a huge missed  
14 opportunity for the city. I think we were in very  
15 close conversations with Workforce Development  
16 provider to create a real plan whether it was  
17 pursuit, whether it was the Employment—the Employment  
18 and Training Coalition, who I know is here today.  
19 There was La Guardia Community College. We could  
20 have created an enormous amount of job opportunities  
21 for people from every part of New York City, and I  
22 believe that was an historically missed opportunity.

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Mr. Patchett, I have  
24 more questions, but I want to allow my Co-Chair to  
25 weigh in so—

3 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you. Good  
4 afternoon everyone. Just as a matter of housekeeping  
5 we have about six panels registered to speak. We  
6 have about 13 Council Members that have signed in and  
7 different ones will be asking questions. So, we  
8 appreciate your patience with the panels and those  
9 who are out there to ask questions, your input is  
10 critical to today's hearing. We've been joined by  
11 Council Members Deutsch, Powers, Cornegy, Salamanca,  
12 Lander, Kallos and Levine, and we will get to the  
13 questions of the Council Members, remaining Council  
14 Members that have signed up. Good afternoon,  
15 President Patchett.

16 JAMES PATCHETT: Hi.

17 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: We've had a few  
18 hearings together over the last couple of years. I  
19 guess I have a unique perspective of being at those  
20 hearings with you and hearing EDC's mission and plan  
21 throughout those hearings. To me after hearing the  
22 testimony that's been written and said and the  
23 questions by my Co-Chair, it seems that that Mayor's  
24 plan is really based solely on the success and the  
25 existence of EDC. What you put forward today is all  
of the things we've spoken about over the last year

3 and a half of what EDC's mission statement is, goals  
4 and different plans throughout the city, and now  
5 we're repackaging that as the Jobs Plan. That's not  
6 fair to what a jobs plan should be. I don't think  
7 it's right on a Mayor to put forth a plan that is  
8 based solely on the existence of what EDC is already  
9 doing. If you're going to put forward a plan to  
10 create 100,000 jobs--

11 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

12 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: --which is in short  
13 what my Co-chair is saying not you individually, then  
14 you have to be accountable for that plan. You can't  
15 just say well this group is doing so wonderful. All  
16 the things they do with creating 100,000 jobs. That--  
17 what we're trying to find out today is those who are  
18 striving to get the job, those that are struggling to  
19 maintain in the middle-class, which is the shrinking  
20 body in this city is how this Administration and how  
21 this city is going to assist them, stay there and  
22 there and obtain those jobs, and I haven't heard this  
23 testimony that we're going to do that. In fact, at  
24 the very end of your testimony, you're saying there's  
25 about 19,000 good paying jobs and 3,000 that you can  
actually account for.

3 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

4 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: That's nowhere near  
5 the 100,000 and I understand the 10-year plan is  
6 going to be beyond whatever the next Mayor is. It's  
7 not the information that we can give to a city to say  
8 this is our Job Works Plan. This is what we're going  
9 to do. Your testimony states exactly the mission  
10 statement that's listed online for what the EDC does,  
11 but this plan outlines in broad strokes the actions  
12 the Administration will take to meet this goal. Well,  
13 let me remind everyone here the five points that are  
14 listed here is exactly what the Economic Development  
15 Corporation's mission statement is. Selling, leasing  
16 and developing tenant property; providing finance and  
17 tax incentives; making capital investments in large  
18 scale infrastructure; using land use tools to update  
19 zoning, directly financing industries. Well, that's  
20 the EDC. None of that has anything to do with the  
21 Mayor that's in office now and the mayors that are  
22 going to come in afterwards. So, to me is there  
23 testimony today or something that you can outline for  
24 us separate from what EDC is doing of an individual  
25 Job Works Plan that we can take away from today's  
hearing?

2 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes. [coughs] Council  
3 Member I appreciate the question. Actually, I think  
4 the--the--

5 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: There's a little  
6 conversation going on.

7 JAMES PATCHETT: Yeah, okay.

8 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: If you could please  
9 take that phone call outside, sir. We're actually  
10 having a hearing here. Sorry, Mr. Patchett. [pause]  
11 When you're ready because we're all here waiting for  
12 you. It's very important you complete that call.  
13 [pause] When you're ready because we're over here  
14 waiting for you. It's very important you complete  
15 that call. [pause]

16 JAMES PATCHETT: Sorry. Okay. [coughs]  
17 So the--thank you. So, I think that it's a really  
18 important questions and you're right. This is work  
19 that EDC folks design every single day. This was an  
20 opportunity to bring together the umbrella of city  
21 agencies together as a part of this plan. It wasn't  
22 just EDC. It was also the Brooklyn Navy Yard. It  
23 was the Mayor's Office of Media and Entertainment.  
24 It was our partners at SBS.



3 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: But even the  
4 Brooklyn Navy Yard we just had a hearing together on  
5 that, and the accountability from that project alone  
6 success aside because it's clearly a success--

7 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

8 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: --just kept only  
9 going back and forth as to who was actually  
10 accountable to the city for what's happening and what  
11 we can calculate at the Brooklyn Navy Yards or the  
12 East Midtown Rezoning or Hunts Point or the Westside  
13 Revitalization Project--

14 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

15 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: --or the Marine  
16 Project that we just announced \$500 million to re-  
17 shore the shores of-of Downtown City. Those are  
18 projects coming from EDC.

19 JAMES PATCHETT: Yeah.

20 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: The success of  
21 Brooklyn Navy Yards, and the tenants that they're  
22 bringing in there, I don't see how the Mayor can take  
23 accountability for that tenant creating those jobs  
24 for his Jobs Works Plan. I'd like to see a plan that  
25 is based on a specific goal that we can create that's  
going say here's a plan that's going to create these

3 100,000 new jobs because that's what we were told.

4 Not the success of an economy of New York City and  
5 all the work that EDC is doing, and that's where us  
6 fighting to maintain and get to the middle-class,  
7 strive to be in the middle-class. Small business  
8 that's looking for those assistants and--and let me  
9 just add, and let me just ask that question, too.

10 So, based on these jobs' perspective, how many do you  
11 envision to be brand new jobs versus jobs that would  
12 be additional jobs off of existing businesses and now  
13 succeeding or maybe a plan or a financial assistance  
14 you're providing? So, if I go from a company from 5  
15 to 15 that's 10 new jobs. If I have a new company  
16 that's five--that's five jobs. How much of that  
17 breakdown do you envision?

18 JAMES PATCHETT: Oh, of you're saying how  
19 much of it is in new companies versus additional jobs  
20 at existing companies?

21 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Right, so the--the  
22 preservation and enhancement of--it so that--

23 JAMES PATCHETT: [interposing] So, so  
24 this is--this plan is almost exclusively new job  
25 creation not preserving existing jobs. So, it  
brought about--

3 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: It brought about  
4 the growth of a company.

5 JAMES PATCHETT: Yeah, growth of--growth  
6 of a company absolutely. So, if you're--if you're a  
7 company and this is what many of our industrial  
8 development efforts are targeted toward, which is you  
9 have a company and you have 20 people today, but you  
10 need a bigger space to grow your company of 50  
11 people, you're running out of space. Frequently what  
12 we'll do is help finance a larger new location for  
13 yourself. So that's what we'll--that's what we'll do  
14 as a part of our--our IDA efforts. But, I do want to  
15 take a moment and step back and say, you know, I  
16 really--I really do believe this is one of the most  
17 ambitious job plans of any that I've ever reviewed.  
18 Most job plans if you look at them they take  
19 advantage of--they take account of just what's  
20 natural--naturally occurring in the economy or they  
21 are based on temporary jobs that are being created as  
22 a result of infrastructure investments, which is  
23 construction job. And Construction jobs are an  
24 important part of the economy, but they're--you know,  
25 when they're an infrastructure project the city or  
any municipality is investing in, they're temporary

2 jobs. So, this is really above and beyond what I  
3 have ever seen a municipality do, which is a real  
4 effort to actually shift the number of jobs that are--  
5 that exist in New York City by 100,000 and really  
6 make efforts to make those jobs accessible to  
7 everyone.

8 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Everyone wants  
9 those jobs. I mean no one here is saying we  
10 shouldn't create 100,000 jobs.

11 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: It's a matter of  
13 identifying those jobs with actual data--

14 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: It's a matter of  
16 identifying those jobs with actual data--

17 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

18 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: --that these 200  
19 were created here, these 600, we're expecting 1,000  
20 to come in here in Queens. Is there even a borough  
21 breakdown on the amount of jobs that have been  
22 created?

23 JAMES PATCHETT: I don't have it in front  
24 of me, but I--we absolutely can provide that.

3 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: No, that's the type  
4 of, you know, whether we're from Queens—each Council  
5 Member would be very concerned of their constituents  
6 and what that role of these jobs would be doing. Not  
7 in an esoterical hole. What is the coordination  
8 then? We have the Mayor's Office of Workforce  
9 Development. We have the New York Jobs Work Plan,  
10 and we have EDC. I mean I can't remember the last  
11 time the Workforce Development Team came in front of  
12 one of our committee hearings since 2016 or 2017, and  
13 they're the Workforce Development. What is the  
14 coordination between your office, Workforce  
15 Development, and creating this plan?

16 JAMES PATCHETT: We worked regularly with  
17 them. You know, I can't speak for the Office of  
18 Workforce Development. They do really important work  
19 in thinking—in creating pathways for people to access  
20 these jobs. I think we try to integrate as  
21 effectively as we can, but certainly the broader  
22 Workforce system serves hundreds of thousands of  
23 people every year, and that's a much broader set of  
24 agencies. We really focused on the tools that we had  
25 within Economic Development to directly impact

2 people, relationships with employers, leasing space.  
3 As you said, the tools that we have available to us.

4 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: CHAIRPERSON

5 VALLONE: See that's--that's what this is really  
6 about. I think it's about the success of--of EDC and  
7 not so much of the creation of a new plan, and I  
8 think that it's unfortunate that the Mayor is taking  
9 credit or trying to unleash a new plan that's  
10 basically been--already existed through what you are  
11 doing and what EDC is already doing. We have Council  
12 Members that I'd like to donate the rest of my time  
13 so that they can be heard, and I thank you for  
14 hanging in here from the length of the beginning of  
15 the hearing. Council Member Barron. We have.  
16 Council Member Barron and I think we also--Council  
17 Member Rosenthal is here. I want to make sure the  
18 folks that are here, Council Member Treyger and  
19 Council Member Yeger if we can go. So maybe.  
20 Council Member Barron if you can lead us off with the  
21 questions.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Mr.

23 Chair and thank you to the panel for coming. I  
24 believe Deputy Mayor Glen said that the plan was  
25 projected to cost about \$1.35 billion almost entirely

3 in capital spending. So, is that still the case?  
4 \$1.35 billion almost entirely in capital spending?

5 JAMES PATCHETT: So, we've—we've spent to  
6 date a little over \$300 million or spent or committed  
7 over \$300 million as a part of that. That was an  
8 initial projection. We don't, you know, that—those  
9 level of resources certainly should be sufficient.  
10 You know, as I mentioned earlier, you know many of  
11 those are comprehensive investments in  
12 infrastructure. So, you know, again, it's not  
13 specific to, you know, actual—it's not about paying  
14 companies. It's about building infrastructure that  
15 is owned by the city whether that's renovating half a  
16 million square feet at the Brooklynn Army Terminal  
17 or—the million square foot building we renovate at  
18 the Brooklyn Navy Yard.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, it is almost  
20 entirely in capital spending?

21 JAMES PATCHETT: That's correct.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, we're putting  
23 that money into capital spending, but without any  
24 assurances that the businesses that operate in that  
25 space are committed to X number of jobs in the  
programs that they operate?

2 JAMES PATCHETT: You know, I think you  
3 know these are over-those-those businesses you're  
4 talking about are overwhelmingly small industrial  
5 businesses. So, we certainly work very closely with  
6 them. They're largely neighborhood based local  
7 employers who otherwise might not be able to build  
8 their business at all or certainly stay in New York  
9 City. We, you know, I think we-whether or not that  
10 particular employer succeeds that space is available  
11 for the next 50 years for the city of New York and  
12 we'll own it. The-the city will receive rent from  
13 those spaces. We'll have-we'll receive income as a  
14 result of it.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Well, we know  
16 that there are many under and unutilized commercial  
17 spaces that are presently existing in recent mixed  
18 use developments.

19 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, there's no  
21 guarantee that I can see that, in fact, those jobs  
22 will be created within a given time period.

23 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm. Well, the-the  
24 jobs that we're talking as a part of this jobs Plan  
25 will be created within the next 10 years. Many of



3 them in the near term. The largest infrastructure  
4 Investments are in properties that are available for  
5 lease right to small industrial companies. You know,  
6 I mean there's the project we've been working on  
7 together in your district, which is much smaller but  
8 it, you know, is an important opportunity to-to  
9 improve what was a small industrial hub, and making  
10 the existing businesses there more successful with  
11 better infrastructure. You know there are smaller  
12 opportunities, and there are larger opportunities,  
13 but those are all important in essence.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, if we're  
15 trying to create jobs that will have people who,  
16 workers who have skills that will keep them in those  
17 positions moving forward, we're looking then perhaps  
18 at a lot of tech jobs and other high skilled jobs  
19 that require those types of abilities. What  
20 relationship—I—I know that you have a plan with CUNY.

21 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But what's the  
23 plan that you have with DOE so that as students  
24 graduate with a diploma that they are, in fact, job  
25 ready, 100% job read.

JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

3 COMMISSIONER BARRON: Not the ratio that  
4 we have now whatever that percentage is.

5 JAMES PATCHETT: Right, and we—

6 COMMISSIONER BARRON: So, what's the  
7 relationship with DOE?

8 JAMES PATCHETT: Yeah, I understand.

9 COMMISSIONER BARRON: Yeah, that students  
10 prepared then?

11 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes, here's—there's no  
12 question that the Department of Education is  
13 foundational to getting people into good jobs in the  
14 city of New York. There's just—there's—there's no  
15 doubt about that. We meet regularly with the senior  
16 leadership of DOE who's planning their—their—their  
17 future pipelines whether it's Computer Science For  
18 All or otherwise, but, you know, I'm not going to  
19 speak for the Department of Education. That is a far  
20 more comprehensive effort. What we're seeking to do  
21 is make sure that DOE is the best informed about what  
22 the skills that are necessary for tomorrow's jobs are  
23 and that's part of what this effort is about. Just  
24 to talk about for CUNY for a moment, what we're  
25 seeking to do with our CUNY efforts is bring in  
adjunct professors who are actual—actual largely

2 employees in the tech industry who are going in and  
3 teaching computer science classes to people in CUNY.  
4 That way we know that the skills that they're  
5 learning will be the skills that those very employers  
6 are looking for. That's the model we'd like to see  
7 at CUNY and certainly we'd like to see that model at  
8 DOE. It's part of the Computer Science For All  
9 Initiative. It's part to of our CUNY ASAP efforts  
10 where we're seeking to reach 25,000 students a year  
11 to get them actually through their—actually to  
12 graduating from their degree so that they, you know,  
13 they don't end up spending years and years in the  
14 CUNY system with no degree to show for it. That's a  
15 comprehensive effort, but, you know, the Jobs Plan is  
16 not about K to 12. It's about getting people post  
17 high school into job opportunities.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I disagree. I  
19 think it is about K to 12.

20 JAMES PATCHETT: Oh, yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I think that's  
22 where it has to get its foundation, and that's where  
23 we have to make sure that they're developing the  
24 skills that will, in fact, get them into these jobs  
25 that—that you say are good paying jobs ,but that's

2 the next part of my questioning and yes, I'm glad you  
3 referred to CUNY ASAP. It's a national model and  
4 it's really been very successful, and I'm—I'm not  
5 going to take too much more time because I know my  
6 colleagues have questions as well. Why not have CUNY  
7 hire professors not as adjuncts. There's a big  
8 problem with CUNY relying on adjuncts to conduct  
9 these programs. Why not sit down and have CUNY hire  
10 full-time instructors in these areas. It's a big  
11 problem that we have with CUNY using adjuncts in  
12 excess.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Absolutely.  
14 I think CUNY 2X does include the—the fundamental time  
15 faculty in the Computer Science Department.

16 CHAIRPERSON BENJAMIN: Can you pull the  
17 mic a little closer? I'm having problems.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Better?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That's better.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MALLON: Okay. CUNY 2X  
21 does include the funding and full-time faculty in the  
22 Computer Science Departments as well as advisors for  
23 students, and the—and the tech in residents core,  
24 which are the adjuncts.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, I would  
4 love to get the-the numbers on that as well--

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:  
6 [interposing] Wait.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --and just  
8 finally to say that \$50,000 at point in the near  
9 future is a good paying job belies the fact that  
10 people are living in New York City and \$50,000 a  
11 family of--how many are you saying? What is that  
12 projection? \$50,000 a family of one.

13 JAMES PATCHETT: Wait, wait. This is for  
14 the job. We're not looking at the household  
15 composition.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Well, I think that  
17 that needs to be included in factoring good paying  
18 jobs because if it's family of 3 or 4 or 5 with  
19 \$50,000 That's not adequate, and in terms of the--in  
20 New York City it's \$100--\$96,000 I think is 100% of  
21 the AMI. So, why would we be satisfied with people  
22 making about half of that for a family of 3 and say  
23 that that's a good paying job? So, I--I take--I take--I  
24 differ with you on \$50,000 for a family of 3, 4 or 5  
25 being a good paying job. So, I take--I different with

2 you on \$50,000 for a family of 3, 4 or 5 being a good  
3 paying job.

4 JAMES PATCHETT: Right.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Especially when  
6 that may not be what the salary is at the time the  
7 person gets the job--

8 JAMES PATCHETT: That's fair.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --but it's in  
10 what you all the near future, and how long, how many  
11 years is that to get to \$50,000 that you're  
12 accepting?

13 JAMES PATCHETT: So, just to address your  
14 question.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes.

16 JAMES PATCHETT: So, median income in the  
17 City of New York is about \$56,000 a year. The  
18 statistics you're quoting are Metro Area, but in the  
19 city.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Median income for  
21 a family of?

22 JAMES PATCHETT: I think it's--it's either  
23 three of four, but we can get you the specifics, but  
24 the--the--but we--there's extensive research from Pew,  
25 which suggests that people--middle income jobs are

3 those that are above two-thirds of the median income,  
4 which is what led us to focus on that level, but  
5 you're right. It's an important question. All of  
6 these are important questions. We're doing our best  
7 to pick a level of income that's a clear target that  
8 we can—that we can seek to achieve jobs over that  
9 level. That's—that's our focus as part of this plan.  
10 It's not—you're right. There's no magic number for  
11 what's a good job and what isn't a good job in New  
12 York City. We felt having a clear target would at  
13 least direct us in our efforts around the plan.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you to the  
15 panel. Thank you to the chairs.

16 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Council Member  
17 Rosenthal.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.  
19 Thank you, Chairs for this hearing. Thank you Mr.  
20 Patchett, and—and to your staff for all the hard work  
21 that you've done. I especially appreciate that you  
22 mentioned Catbird which is woman owned business  
23 that's just terrific. So, glad to know that the city  
24 had something to do with them, or is helping them  
25 along, and that—that gets to my two questions. First,  
before 2017, it--so before the creation of this plan,

3 how does yes EDC track the—not just the jobs created  
4 for the investments that we've made, but the hurdles,  
5 the challenges that EDC has found along the way, sort  
6 of since the beginning of this Administration that  
7 maybe changed the way you thought about it for 2000—  
8 year 2012–17 report?

9 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay, thank you for  
10 that. So, you know, I—I was not at EDC before 2017  
11 as you know, but I think certainly what—what we found  
12 and what I felt was that it was important to have a  
13 unifying strategy for what Economic Development meant  
14 in the de Blasio Administration. I think we—we—we  
15 saw what Economic Development meant in the previous  
16 administration, and for understandable reasons it was  
17 focused on recovering from September 11<sup>th</sup> and then  
18 getting out of the financial crisis. So, those were  
19 times when the city was in some ways facing  
20 existential threats about the future of the economy,  
21 but fast forward to where we were in 2017, we're  
22 looking at a different set of issues. The set of  
23 issues we've been talking about today, which is not  
24 just creating jobs. But it was about how do we  
25 create the right kind of jobs, and that really I  
think was what led us to the focus of this plan, as



2 opposed to just job creation for job creation's sake,  
3 which really is not the moment we're in in New York  
4 City.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: You know, when  
6 I worked at OMB, and we were trying to come up with  
7 unfortunately when we had to make cuts to the city's  
8 budget, we would and going through all the agencies,  
9 you'd see things that were quite small.

10 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: But it's the  
12 accumulation of all those things that gets you to the  
13 number you're trying to get to.

14 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And it strikes  
16 me that you're doing the same thing. I happen to  
17 know some of the education programs that you have  
18 that are training programs, that are internships, and  
19 it's like this accumulation of a lot of little  
20 programs that's getting you, you know, to where you  
21 want to go. Is that a fair--?

22 JAMES PATCHETT: Yeah, absolutely. I  
23 think that's a--that's a really great point. You  
24 know, you talk about it. It's like Catbird, right?  
25 Catbird is a 90-personish company--

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah.

4 JAMES PATCHETT: --who's operating out of  
5 the Navy Yard manufacturing jewelry, and I think  
6 it's--and--and, you know, we have many training  
7 programs and in some cases serve like our machinist  
8 program is 45 people. But those are really important  
9 businesses and programs to support, and so, you know,  
10 the--and they take a really long time to be effective,  
11 right? So, you know, hopefully Catbird will continue  
12 to grow and be successful. It's a wonderful woman-  
13 owned business. But we have hundreds and hundreds of  
14 small businesses like that, which in the aggregate  
15 make up critical businesses that form the fabric of  
16 economic development across the city and there's--  
17 there's--there's no question that it's a lot of small  
18 efforts. There's, you know, there's--there's no  
19 single big thing that we're doing that is what really  
20 is creating job creation. It's a series of efforts  
21 working often, you know, directly in communities  
22 with--directly with elected officials to make up a  
23 comprehensive strategy for the city.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah, that's  
25 really exciting, and then are there criteria that you

3 use that would result in a red flag that would cause  
4 you to pause-

5 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --and ooh,  
7 perhaps we should calling back some money, or I don't  
8 know if it's created the same way the Amazon deal is  
9 where there's no call-back. You don't' give it out  
10 until the job is there.

11 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --but where  
13 you might say we're not going to continue that tax  
14 abatement program.

15 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes, absolutely and I  
16 think that's really important. So, we-across the  
17 board yes. I think one of the-the best examples of  
18 that are-is in the case of our programmatic  
19 investments. So, where we are seeking to serve a  
20 certain number of companies every year. So, we're  
21 not giving money to companies. We're working  
22 frequently with a not-for-profit. Sometimes a for-  
23 profit operator who is running an incubator or  
24 something to effectively bring on, you know, bring  
25 companies in and see them grow. They have to report  
to us regularly about the number of companies that

3 are coming in, how-how successful-how successful they  
4 are, and we keep very close track of that. In some  
5 cases those programs are very successful and they  
6 meet and exceed our expectations. In other cases,  
7 they don't and that's why our contracts allow us to  
8 terminate them if they're not---if they're not  
9 successful. So, in certain cases we're expanding and  
10 building on our existing programs because they're  
11 serving far more companies than they originally  
12 anticipated, and in other cases they're not meeting  
13 their targets and we absolutely have the ability to--  
14 to cut off the contract.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: It would be  
16 great if there were a way to--I don't know if you have  
17 to anonymize the information--

18 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --but if you  
20 could report on that--

21 JAMES PATCHETT: Right.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --kind of  
23 finding, I think that would be really interesting--

24 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --from an  
oversight perspective.

3 JAMES PATCHETT: Absolutely. No, I think  
4 that's right. I think, you know, collectively  
5 something like 96 or 97% of our—our efforts are in  
6 compliance, but those 3% are really important and  
7 they tell us a lot and we'd be happy to share that  
8 specific information also for a conversation around  
9 how we can continue to do our work better in  
10 partnership with the Council.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great and  
12 lastly I know that the Deputy Mayor—Deputy Mayor  
13 Thompson is working on some worker cooperative ideas,  
14 which you know, is something that I really believe  
15 in. I think we pitched to you to try to include some  
16 worker cooperative training programs in your  
17 \$100,000—100,000 jobs program.

18 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I don't think  
20 it ended up being included, but could you envision  
21 working withy the Deputy Mayor to support his effort  
22 around job creation in the Worker Co-op?

23 JAMES PATCHETT: Absolutely. I mean this  
24 is something you've been a leader on and talking  
25 about it for a long time. You're right, Deputy Mayor  
Thompson is also focused on this as something that

2 could really move the needle in terms of empowering  
3 workers and making sure that they have more, you  
4 know, obviously equity in the business. So, the  
5 success of the business doesn't go to the owners. It  
6 goes to the employees who are the owners. I think  
7 it's—it's a really important model and he's forward  
8 thinking about this as you are. So, we'd love to  
9 find a way to work together on it through EDC.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That's great  
11 to hear because you can imagine utilizing city-owned  
12 space--

13 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes, uh-hm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --as  
15 incubation. I mean they're always looking for--

16 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: -- you know,  
18 space, and if the city end up coming up with a  
19 specific industry that they end up contracting for,  
20 you could see a really nice synergy.

21 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes, it's a good  
22 concept. We should work on it together.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great. Okay,  
24 thank you very much. Thank you, Chair. .

2 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Council Member  
3 Treyger.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank to the  
5 Chairs for this very important and I would say timely  
6 hearing. Welcome, President Patrick, Commissioner.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: This is from the U.S.  
8 Census. So, for New York City for the population of  
9 16 years and over the unemployment rate is at 7.8%.  
10 Are you aware of that figure?

11 JAMES PATCHETT: The working-the-the  
12 unemployment rate in the aggregate for the city is  
13 about 4%. What specific stats.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: This is from the  
15 U.S. Census. This our American Fact Finders, very  
16 publicly-their information. It says for 16-sorry.  
17 For New York City ages 20 to 64 it says 7.4%.

18 PATRICIA JEWETT: I don't think that's  
19 current.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I-I will be  
21 happy to share this with you, and I'll go down the  
22 list.

23 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: For-for Brooklyn  
25 for ages 20 to 64, the number is 7.8% unemployment

2 rate for again the ages 20 to 64, and for the zip  
3 code of 11224, which includes the Coney Island  
4 Peninsula, for the ages 20 to 64 the number is 12.2%.  
5 Let me break it down also for you in terms of  
6 demographics. For New York City according to my  
7 analysis when looking at ages 20 for—for Black or  
8 African-American alone, we have figures of about 11-  
9 11.5%. In Brooklyn, we have 11.2%. For Black and  
10 African-American alone in 11224, the number is 20.7%  
11 almost double. When you look at it for Hispanic or  
12 Latino origin in New York City 9.5%. For Brooklyn,  
13 9.8%. For zip code 11224 18.8%, approximately  
14 double. What should the city be doing that it's not  
15 doing now to turn these numbers around for my  
16 district?

17 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm. [coughs] So,  
18 right. So, the City—I'm not sure if that's the most  
19 current information, but your point is absolutely  
20 correct, which is that that is employment rate is  
21 certainly higher in lower income areas and among, you  
22 know, people—in the population of people of color  
23 than it is among other populations, and those are  
24 concerning things that we need to collectively work  
25 to address. I think the Jobs Plan is certainly a



3 part of that effort, but it's also, you know, a much  
4 more comprehensive effort. It's about Workforce  
5 Development. It's about as-as Council Member Barron  
6 was saying, it is about K to 12 education. It's-it's  
7 really a comprehensive effort because what you need  
8 is people who are prepared for the jobs that are  
9 available that in order to access those jobs. You  
10 know, today I think another challenge is not just  
11 people who are unemployed, but people who are under-  
12 employed, people who are trying to work, but want to  
13 work more than-more than 20 hours or 30 hours and  
14 were seeing people, you know, even in the economy of  
15 today people who are-they're not being given full-  
16 time employment or and are getting part-time  
17 employment at minimum wage. So, even if they are  
18 working and technically employed, they are not a part  
19 of the system and I think and they're certainly not  
20 able to support their families. I think when you look  
21 at the statistics behind unemployment, some of the  
22 more concerning statistics to me in addition to the  
23 ones you cited are people who, as I said, who are  
24 underemployed or who have given up looking for  
25 employment because they've been looking for so long.  
And those are populations that really need to be

3 looked at carefully, and that's—and that is, you  
4 know, fundamentally the—should be the objective of  
5 Workforce Development.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: --but I  
7 specifically would like to know what should the city  
8 be doing now that it's not doing to turn these  
9 numbers around to my district? I'm not sure if I  
10 heard an answer embedded in that explanation.

11 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay. Sure. So, I as I  
12 said, I appreciate the—the question. You know, I  
13 think that this is—addressing that issue is—is  
14 absolutely and New York Works is certainly targeted  
15 towards helping with that. I don't think it  
16 comprehends—it's—it's—it is not a solution to  
17 fundamental inequities that have been in case for  
18 some time—in place for some time in the city and  
19 across this country. We need to continue to invest  
20 more in education. We need to continue to invest in  
21 more in our CUNY system, in our Workforce Development  
22 efforts, but it's also, you know, a lot of the  
23 efforts the Mayor has around paid sick leave,  
24 Universal Pre-K, further investments in our education  
25 system. Those are foundational things that make it  
possible for families to be successful in the city.

2 When you had Universal Pre-K maybe you had more time  
3 to invest in yourself whether it's in training or  
4 going or actual time to go find a job. Those--those  
5 investments are also important.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So, again I-I  
7 appreciate your, you know, description of--of what you  
8 believe is currently taking place, but let me get  
9 more specific. In the case of my district in terms  
10 of Super Storm Sandy for example--

11 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: --I do want to  
13 publicly thank the Administration for opening up a  
14 critical Workforce 1 center in Coney Island, which  
15 has been eye-opening for us in many different ways.  
16 First of all, there is a better connection to  
17 employment opportunities that could exist for  
18 residents who are interested in work, but the data  
19 has been sobering. The data that I received from the  
20 Workforce 1 Center in--informed my budgetary  
21 allocations in my district, and I'll be very  
22 specific. I want to give a shout out for--to  
23 Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow, OBT, which I  
24 think might be in the audience or should be here--  
25 where we had to partner with them to provide free

3 high school equivalency courses in my district with a  
4 full suite of wraparound services. We provide meals,  
5 connections to childcare, case management. You name  
6 it, but that team out of my discretionary pot of  
7 money and the Speaker's support because what we found  
8 with Workforce 1 is that a number of residents coming  
9 inside the Workforce 1 Center did not have the  
10 adequate education credentials for the work that's  
11 happening today.

12 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And so, I've  
14 said this probably many times. I'll keep saying this  
15 that residents in my district should not just witness  
16 the recovery, they should be active participants in  
17 it as well. But with all of these federal  
18 investments in terms of recovery dollars, the city  
19 should have attached to them-to them education and  
20 training programs to make sure that that residents in  
21 neighborhoods obtain those jobs, and retain those  
22 jobs. Because I would point out to my colleagues  
23 that employment figures are good to have, but is the  
24 employment sticking?

25 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: How long are  
3 they being employed for?

4 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And I'm going to  
6 give you another concrete example in my district,  
7 and I want to be clear that this was a decision made  
8 by the Bloomberg Administration not by the current  
9 Administration, but it gives you a highlight of what  
10 I'm talking about. Do you know off hand how much  
11 money the city gave for example to build the  
12 amphitheater in my district in Coney Island? Again,  
13 this was a decision made by the prior Administration.

14 JAMES PATCHETT: \$45 million.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I'm—I'm told it  
16 was in excess of \$50, \$54, \$55 million.

17 JAMES PATCHETT: Somewhere around \$50 is  
18 right, sounds about right.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Correct.  
20 Correct. Do you know how many local residents in my  
21 district are working at the amphitheater right now?

22 JAMES PATCHETT: Not enough?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Not many, and  
24 the few that they hired initially, they complained  
25 that there were some employment issues or, you know,

3 they needed to advance their soft skills to more  
4 advanced skills, and they didn't have time to provide  
5 the training.

6 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So, I'm just  
8 giving my colleagues kind of a small example. Here we  
9 invest over \$54 million for a-to a private developer  
10 to build a concert amphitheater with no real  
11 guarantee that local residents get hired, and those  
12 that-the few that did, did not hold onto the job  
13 because the city didn't give them adequate time to  
14 train and prepare them to retain the job And again,  
15 this was the Bloomberg Era Administration. I'm not  
16 faulting the current administration, but this is  
17 where we have to do better. So, when I asked the  
18 question about what are we not doing now, I think  
19 there needs to be significant expense programic  
20 investment-programming investments. As my colleague  
21 Council Member Barron pointed out, it can't just be  
22 capital. We need bridge programming. We need to  
23 build up our education capacity. We need to make  
24 sure that we-we- You know the Navy Yard is an  
25 example of something where I think is very innovative  
and unique where their program brings folks in and

3 works to advance their skills to more advanced  
4 skills, and connects them to—to better paying jobs,  
5 but that program and that type of approach and vision  
6 has to be customized and—and expanded throughout  
7 neighborhoods that need help the most. It can't be  
8 just centralized in just too few parts of New York,  
9 and my and the Chair pointed out very eloquently and  
10 powerfully in the beginning of this hearing, Chair  
11 Torres, that 63% of New Yorkers—is that correct that  
12 do not have a college degree? That—that is a- as the  
13 education chair, and I'm sure my—as the Higher  
14 Education Chair, that's a very powerful sobering  
15 figure. We have a lot of work to do to build  
16 capacity here in the city, and a part of this I think  
17 Jobs Plan can't just be about—because the question is  
18 as—as—as my Chair—Chairs mentioned, jobs for who? In  
19 the case of Coney Island, a lot of these Works  
20 projects in the past were not many from my—from my  
21 residents, and so if many of these jobs require a  
22 college diploma or even more, then a significant  
23 portion of our city is not eligible to receive that  
24 job, and that's—that's—it's unacceptable. So, we need  
25 to make sure that we're investing in efforts to build  
education capacity, to expand Bridge programming, and

3 I don't think that's EDC's portfolio, but I do  
4 believe the EDC I think has an obligation to the tell  
5 the Mayor and work with our city partners to say hey,  
6 if we're going to do some activity here, and—and EDC  
7 I know pretty well plans in advance. They don't  
8 just, you know, come in one day and say let's do  
9 something. You know, you—you know about things more  
10 than a month or sometimes a year in advance. There  
11 must be simultaneous efforts to build capacity in  
12 those neighborhoods especially with the figures that  
13 I read off earlier, which I'll be happy to share with  
14 you afterwards. This is I think a critical component  
15 I think to this hearing, and to the vision for New  
16 York City. We must build our capacity in our  
17 neighborhood so our residents can obtain good paying  
18 jobs and retain good paying jobs, and with that,  
19 Chairs, I will turn it back. Thank you for your  
20 time.

21 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you, Council  
22 Member Treyger. Council Member Yeger.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Mr.  
24 Chairman. Mr. President, good afternoon. In the  
25 100,000 that were anticipated over 10 years I believe  
you testified that a certain number of those jobs



2 were to have been created through the Amazon deal.

3 Is that correct?

4 JAMES PATCHETT: Not initially.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I'm sorry.

6 JAMES PATCHETT: Not initially.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Not initially, but  
8 in your recent calculations say as of six months ago.

9 JAMES PATCHETT: We were—we were thinking  
10 we would include them if they came to fruition.

11 Obviously, they did not.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: How many do you  
13 suppose would have been included in the 100,000?

14 JAMES PATCHETT: I think, you know, the  
15 Chair referenced a number of slightly over 20,000. I  
16 mean it was clearly—we weren't counting on it until  
17 it was done obviously for good reason.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Right so, my  
19 understanding of the plan is that was to be  
20 approximately 25,000 jobs--

21 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: --to have been  
23 created?

24 JAMES PATCHETT: That's right, 25, to  
25 40,000.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: And--and as we sit  
3 here today how many jobs are being created by Amazon  
4 in the city?

5 JAMES PATCHETT: Amazon today has about  
6 5,000 jobs in New York City.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: And in the Long  
8 Island City area where there is a plan by Amazon, how  
9 many jobs are going to be created there by Amazon?

10 JAMES PATCHETT: There are--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: [interposing] As  
12 we see that today, are there jobs?

13 JAMES PATCHETT: Zero. Zero job.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Zero. Okay, how  
15 helpful was this Council in getting you from 25 to  
16 zero?

17 JAMES PATCHETT: I--I think it's--

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: President Patrick,  
19 you're under oath.

20 JAMES PATCHETT: Yeah, alright, it was--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: [interposing] I  
22 mean I can take you off the hook if you want and I'll  
23 get the direction.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I actually want to  
25 hear an answer to that question.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Okay, alright,  
4 then the Chair rules.

5 JAMES PATCHETT: I—I think—I think—I don't  
6 want to speak specifically to the Council. I think—I  
7 think very highly of a lot of members in the Council.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: As do I.

9 JAMES PATCHETT: I think the dialogue was  
10 poisoned and full of misinformation, and I think it  
11 was a huge missed opportunity. I think—I think there  
12 were a lot of very important and legitimate questions  
13 that the Council was asking, and they were re-asked  
14 by a lot of people. I think at the end of the day,  
15 70% of New Yorkers thought it was a good thing  
16 because they saw jobs for them, and if we had done it  
17 right, it would have—they worked very closely with  
18 this Council, and a lot of the people that believe  
19 who are represented here today to create pathways for  
20 every—for New Yorkers into those jobs, and there was  
21 a real opportunity to do that, and I think it's a  
22 huge missed opportunity.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: When a job is  
24 created at \$48,000 or \$52,000 or \$50,000, is it  
25 anticipated that for the duration of that job for the

2 lifetime of its existence, it would remain at that  
3 number.

4 JAMES PATCHETT: It typically goes up  
5 over time.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Typically?

7 JAMES PATCHETT: Yeah, almost all of it.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Right, well if  
9 your Council Member stays where it is usually, but  
10 every other job right--

11 JAMES PATCHETT: [interposing] Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: --over time it  
13 keeps on going up.

14 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: And not every  
16 person who graduates high school or college their  
17 first job is \$112,000 a year, \$120,000, \$130,000,  
18 \$82. It's usually on the lower end.

19 JAMES PATCHETT: That's correct.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Is \$50,000 a year  
21 a good salary for somebody coming out of either high  
22 school or college?

23 JAMES PATCHETT: Absolutely, I believe  
24 so.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Okay, what do you  
3 think if you know, or if—if there's some of number  
4 that you can look at and tell us is the typical  
5 salary for somebody walking out of high school with a  
6 high school diploma, not going to college and getting  
7 a job in New York City.

8 JAMES PATCHETT: I think it's, yeah, I  
9 mean I think largely those folks with a minimum wage  
10 job. So, that would be about if they're working  
11 full-time \$30,000 a year.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: And if somebody  
13 was to leave a CUNY school with a bachelor's degree  
14 in liberal arts and sciences, and just to have their  
15 first job out of college, what do you think that  
16 salary would be?

17 JAMES PATCHETT: I think if you have a—if  
18 you have a—if—if you have a degree—I mean I don't  
19 have the specific statistics. I don't want to—I  
20 don't want to cite them. I don't know if you know  
21 them but I--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: But I think that  
23 \$50,000 would be a good job for somebody coming out  
24 of high school, coming out of college with a  
25 bachelor's degree in New York City today?

2 JAMES PATCHETT: I-I would think so.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I think a lot of  
4 what you heard-I don't want to characterize what-what  
5 other members have said. They can speak for  
6 themselves, but I heard a lot of-an agreement  
7 generally and broadly speaking without getting into  
8 specifics of that there is an obligation by  
9 government to incentivize the creation of jobs, but  
10 that has to be done responsibly, and that there has  
11 to be a bang for the buck with the city as a whole,  
12 and for the community in specific. In the creation of  
13 25,000 in Amazon, did you see any zip code having  
14 been excluded from the plan, if you will, where  
15 anybody from a certain zip code wouldn't necessarily  
16 be qualified for a job?

17 JAMES PATCHETT: Absolutely not.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Just with these  
19 kinds of jobs that would be available for kids,  
20 today's kids moving through high school and then  
21 going into our CUNY system and coming out with a  
22 degree--

23 JAMES PATCHETT: absolutely.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: With upward  
25 trajectory and mobility.

2 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes, they would have  
3 enormous opportunities as a part of that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: And today, remind  
5 me you gave a number today, how many jobs do we  
6 anticipate are being created there?

7 JAMES PATCHETT: Where?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: At Long Island  
9 City by Amazon?

10 JAMES PATCHETT: Zero.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Zero. Okay, thank  
12 you, Mr. Chairman.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,  
14 Brooklyn colleague of mine, and neighbor. So, the-  
15 the chair has-has put me in charge for a minute, and  
16 I happen to be the next Council Member to ask  
17 questions, and so I want to say thank you for-for  
18 being here as well, and join my other colleagues in  
19 the work that you're doing. The work that you're  
20 doing in Sunset Park and Red Hook the-I think one of  
21 the largest producing job centers in the city. It  
22 has been a telling-it has been a telling-just  
23 somebody taking a call, a reporter taking a call.  
24 It's all good. The work that we're trying to do here  
25 is-is really elevate that-that relationship, and I

3 just want to say and report to the rest of the  
4 committee here that it's been good. We have turned  
5 that ship, and we are—we are connected, which is  
6 where some of my questions are going to come from.  
7 In Sunset Park we are in the middle of a conversation  
8 that you commented on earlier about just fact finding  
9 around Industry City and the rezoning, and so one—one  
10 question that's important about the jobs numbers to  
11 get to 100,000 is—is the relationship that you have  
12 with private re-zonings that are outside of your  
13 control as city-owned property, and one thing that  
14 has arisen in terms of your jobs numbers is that you  
15 include a—what I'm going to call private action with  
16 Willoughby Square, One Willoughby Square about 1,100  
17 jobs that came out of the sale of air rights.

18 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And so what I  
20 really want to do is just kind of build a connection  
21 between the stuff that you're laying out--

22 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --and private  
24 actions.

25 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay, great. Okay. So,  
I think—so I think in—that was a pretty unique case



3 the Willoughby Square case because that was—so if you  
4 look back at what's happened in Downtown Brooklyn  
5 since the rezoning in early 2000s, people expected  
6 that there would be a lot of commercial development  
7 and office jobs in Downtown Brooklyn, which I think  
8 would have been a really good thing for the economy  
9 of Brooklyn because it's helpful to have, you know, a  
10 real central business district in the heart of  
11 boroughs that are not just Manhattan. And I think—I  
12 think for—for residents, people who live in Sunset  
13 Park the ability, the opportunity to commute to jobs  
14 there in Downtown Brooklyn would have been a really  
15 positive thing. Unfortunately, what we saw as part of  
16 the rezoning was it didn't happen. It was almost  
17 exclusively residential developments that occur in  
18 Downtown Brooklyn, and I think we all agree at this  
19 point that that was a missed opportunity. Missed  
20 opportunity to create real jobs in Downtown Brooklyn  
21 and so what—what—what we have done given the  
22 framework of the current zoning is try to have the  
23 tools, use the uses that EDC has available to put our  
24 finger on the scale and push it more in favor of job  
25 creation as opposed to this residential development.  
So, go ahead.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, what's  
4 preventing you from expanding that opportunity?

5 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Because the way  
7 that I believe it, and—and my argument that I'm—I'm  
8 going to continue to make--

9 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --around this  
11 private developer who's—who has an intention of  
12 changing land use. That's a city action essentially.  
13 At the end of the day we take action as a city.

14 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: At the end of  
16 the day we take action as a city.

17 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: It's a private  
19 application, and so what prevents you from enlarging--  
20 enlarging the scope of the work to bring more jobs.

21 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, that brings as a  
23 player to the table to help—help funnel the ultimate  
24 question today, which is to bring low-income New  
25 Yorkers jobs.

3 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, thank you. I  
4 think you're right. We've really enjoyed the  
5 partnership working with you in Sunset Park and Red  
6 Hook. I think it's helpful to—to talk about that in  
7 some, you know, some specificity a little bit just  
8 because, you know, it's easy to point to the jobs  
9 plan of this big thing that, you know, people don't  
10 really see, but when—I think when we work together,  
11 you see 4,000 people coming to work everyday in the  
12 Brooklynn Army Terminal who are primarily small  
13 industrial companies who were being supported as a  
14 result of the work that we're doing together, and  
15 we're excited to continue to build on that together.  
16 You know, when it comes to private applications, I  
17 think we would be happy to have a conversation with  
18 you about how we can be partners in, you know, in-in  
19 getting to an outcome there that leads to job  
20 creation in a way that, you know, that you're  
21 comfortable with because I think the job creation is  
22 important, and I know that you have some concerns,  
23 and we want to work together as the—as the public  
24 sector to ensure that we're creating jobs in the  
25 right way.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Wonderful, and  
3 just to note so that the world who's watching right  
4 not understands we have started those conversations  
5 you and I and--and we're talking a little bit about  
6 what we're doing in Sunset Park, and it's no--its no  
7 secret to you because you've been doing that work--

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Uh-hm. JAMES  
9 PATCHETT:

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --and it's  
11 actually a way to talk to a private developer about  
12 how we work with the city, and it's actually been  
13 really--it's offered us the opportunity to demonstrate  
14 that partnership that we're trying to create. The--  
15 the other components, though, are really important,  
16 and that's thinking about these higher paying jobs in  
17 a neighborhood like Sunset Park--

18 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --that where the  
20 median income is a lot lower in Sunset Park. The gaps  
21 there are education gaps. There's training gaps.  
22 There's language gaps--

23 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --and--and so  
25 talk a little bit about how we can examine

3 displacement in this conversation so that we're not  
4 essentially creating the jobs, but I think the Chair  
5 did a really good job of just pointing the conundrum  
6 here. We can—we can—I have not doubt we're going to  
7 created 100,000 jobs. I think I'll say that now.

8 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: The questions  
10 is how are we going to benefit the neighborhoods, and  
11 that's the question to Industry City right now, and  
12 that's—that's the burden of proof they need to, but  
13 we can do that more with you, and you can offer us  
14 tools because the rezoning for the record is not  
15 necessarily—not necessarily the answer to get us what  
16 we need at Industry City or any other place. We have  
17 other tools, and you created some of those tools.

18 JAMES PATCHETT: Right, absolutely and I  
19 think it really comes—it comes down to continuing to  
20 work on our training efforts and our, you know, the  
21 Workforce 1 Center we have at the Brooklynn Army  
22 Terminal, and complementing that with the training  
23 programs that we're building out in partnership with  
24 OBT and FIT and others located there because we want  
25 to expand on those efforts there, and if there are—I  
think the part—the way to do this partnership

3 correctly is to ensure the people can come into the  
4 campus and--and understand the jogs that are available  
5 from employers there and that they have access to  
6 real training programs that will get them into those  
7 jobs, and you know that I am committed to working  
8 with you and your community partners to ensure that  
9 we have the absolute best training available there,  
10 and I think that's--that should be the gold standard,  
11 and we-- You know, think that the Brooklyn Navy Yard  
12 has a good reputation for their workforce training  
13 efforts on site and, you know, we want to continue to  
14 raise the bar at the Brooklynn Army Terminal and  
15 other job focused locations. Then there are other  
16 circumstances where it's about a citywide effort  
17 because it's not a particular largescale campus, but  
18 it's an industry where we know where the job  
19 opportunities are. And in some cases that a little  
20 bit harder because we don't have a sing set of  
21 employers to point to, but it is an incredible  
22 opportunity to think comprehensively with employers  
23 and community organizations together.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And I'm going  
24 to skip the questions about some of the other pieces  
25 because I'm also super excited about worker

2 cooperatives like Helen Rosenthal especially since  
3 most of the properties in the city are in Sunset Park  
4 per capita. So, we'll talk later about day laborers  
5 as well, and think about how we support that industry  
6 that's growing and expanding, and they're expanding  
7 with many new needs as well including immigration  
8 issues, and it would be great to have EDC and SBS  
9 thoughtful-have thoughtful tools to create within  
10 your shops to address those issues, and-and so,  
11 that's just an idea that I think you're-sounds like  
12 you're open to that. One of the things that is  
13 happening at Brooklynn Army Terminal is the-the  
14 Future Works Tech Shop, and we didn't see that in the  
15 updates, and this is part of your near milestone  
16 updates, and so, what would happen with that?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Right.

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I got an update, but  
19 I wanted to give you opportunity to-to tell the  
20 committee.

21 JAMES PATCHETT: Great. Thank you. So,  
22 unfortunately-so Tech Shop we were really excited  
23 about the-the opportunity there is at the Brooklynn  
24 Army Terminal, and it was a space that was going to  
25 be dedicated to training for people on actual

3 machines. So, we have, you know, the most current-  
4 the most current equipment for doing industrial  
5 manufacturing-in-in the city, laser cutters and, you  
6 know, the most current scanners and wood working  
7 tools. We thought it was going to be an incredible  
8 hub for the community. Unfortunately, our proposed  
9 operator of that space went bankrupt right around the  
10 opening. So, that was really unfortunate, and we  
11 were excited about the possibility. The good news,  
12 though, is that in the interim we were able to re-  
13 secure the space. We kept control of all the  
14 equipment. That's one of the advantages of making  
15 these investments in public space is we get to  
16 control the infrastructure and the equipment. So,  
17 even if the operator doesn't stay in place, we still  
18 have the space—we still have the location. So, in  
19 this case in the interim we were able to run our  
20 Machinist Program out of it last year, and we  
21 trained, you know, dozens of people on machines who  
22 might not have otherwise had that opportunity, and  
23 now—and now we're relaunching it in partnership with  
24 an organization that was previously named Staten  
25 Island Maker Space. I guess now they'll just be  
called Maker Space, and they are fully launching in



3 May of this year, and we're excited to see the  
4 fantastic level of programming we originally  
5 anticipated.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: What are the  
7 job numbers connected to that? Updated job numbers.

8 JAMES PATCHETT: I don't have—I don't  
9 have the number in front of me, but I'm happy to  
10 share it with you. I don't think it's a significant  
11 change from what we originally anticipated.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay. So, at  
13 the end of last session this committee passed three  
14 Local Laws to improve transparency about EDC  
15 projects. You're well aware of them, 220, 221 and  
16 222, and it required advanced notice to impacted  
17 communities about upcoming-upcoming projects, and  
18 reporting on what measures EDC takes to recover the  
19 financial systems from under-performing third  
20 parties. How many jobs are required from those third  
21 parties in order to be in compliance with their  
22 project agreements.

23 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So, what steps  
25 has—has EDC taken to improve that compliance with  
these job creation requirements.

3 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes. I think that's-  
4 that's a really important point. We worked closely  
5 with the Council [coughs] on those important bills,  
6 and it's-it's, you know, fundamentally transport-  
7 transparency is really important to us, and I think  
8 the opportunity to work in partnership with you to  
9 create the new tracking system is really important,  
10 and I think it also makes the point that there are a  
11 series of comprehensive reports that we provide  
12 regularly to the City Council on job creation and  
13 other efforts. You know, we're narrowly talking about  
14 the New York Works Plan, but as Chair Vallone pointed  
15 out earlier, you know, it's really-a lot of is just  
16 fundament work that EDC does, and we report all of  
17 this information regularly to City Council through  
18 the legislation that we worked collaboratively to-to  
19 put together at the urging of the Council in its  
20 previous configuration. [coughs] So, transparency-  
21 transparency is important to us. We are absolutely  
22 in compliance with those new-the new Local Laws that  
23 were passed.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And how are you  
25 doing that?

JAMES PATCHETT: How are we doing that?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yes.

4 JAMES PATCHETT: We have a--yes, so we  
5 have a--we have a--we have a--a dedicated group  
6 internally who reaches our regularly across EDC to  
7 collect all of the information that's necessary in  
8 those reports. Those reports are generally targeted  
9 towards the end of the Fiscal Year. So, part of the  
10 reason why talking about this timing of this hearing  
11 somewhat awkward is that we try to align all our  
12 reporting around the same timeline so we don't have  
13 to go ask the same questions of businesses and people  
14 internally, you know, multiple times a year. So,  
15 everything is aligned towards the Fiscal Year and we  
16 have a group that's--that focuses exclusively on this  
17 and it takes quite a comprehensive effort, but it's  
18 important because we certainly care about  
19 transparency.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And so, you're  
21 saying that those numbers did reflect in the update  
22 to the New York Works Plan, or that's going to come  
23 later or yes. Sorry,

24 JAMES PATCHETT: We're doing an annual  
25 update of the New York Works Plan at the end of the  
Fiscal Year--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay.

3 JAMES PATCHETT: --which is our plan and  
4 then we will also be providing these regular updates.  
5 Much of the information overlaps between the two.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: The last point.  
7 Everything you just said--

8 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --the work that  
10 you're doing to create these teams to go-go out is  
11 making it less of an impossible task to be asking  
12 large private developers who want to rezone--

13 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --who keeping  
15 coming and telling me that there's no way for them to  
16 get what you're getting--

17 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --because we've  
19 made it law.

20 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And I just want  
22 to let--I--I think that's important because rezonings  
23 create the appearance of jobs and with private--  
24 private developers it's a different thing than  
25 keeping you accountable, which is what we're trying

3 to do here, but—and—and so you partnering with us  
4 might change that game, and I think all rezonings  
5 should be paused until this gets figured out so we  
6 can bring this to the private developers who dangle  
7 carrots of jobs in front of us so we can actually see  
8 what we're actually looking at. And so, just thank  
9 you for that because it's important that everyone is  
10 held accountable not just government. We're  
11 partners in this, and that will—that will continue  
12 our conversation about what's happening in Sunset  
13 Park. Thank you.

14 JAMES PATCHETT: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you, President  
16 Patrick. My final round of questioning.

17 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay, so we'll take this  
18 then.

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Even—even though we  
20 have 30 more pages of questions, I'm actually only  
21 going to—I'm going to—but I appreciate our spirited  
22 exchange. Obviously I cross-examined you pretty  
23 aggressively for the lack of tracking, but you said  
24 there is an ongoing commitment to improving the  
25 specificity of projections--

JAMES PATCHETT: Absolutely,

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --and the accuracy  
3 of projection. I have just a final round of  
4 questions about the methodology for projections when  
5 it comes to business development programs,  
6 oscillators, incubators, community space. The  
7 relevant article here is in Tab 6-16-Tab 16. I  
8 apologize about that.

9 JAMES PATCHETT: Tab 16.

10 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, the EDC's  
11 methodology for these programs assumes participating  
12 businesses will have an 85 to 87% success rate based  
13 on an article from the National Business Incubation  
14 Association, NBIA. It seems to me incubation is a  
15 little like baseball. You strike out most of the  
16 time like 85 to 87% seems like suspiciously high a  
17 success rate for incubators.

18 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay, and think we have  
19 to base that on information. Right now that's what  
20 we're assuming. I think we will know. We'll have  
21 much better information, to your point as these get  
22 off the ground. You're right. I mean many start-ups  
23 don't succeed. I think we'll have better information  
24 over time, and we will continue to update on that--

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] But  
3 the 87% success rate sounds suspect.

4 JAMES PATCHETT: I understand your point,  
5 yeah.

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And the article on  
7 which it is based, is from 13 years ago from 2006.

8 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And the study cited  
10 in the article is from 22 years ago, 1997. So, we're  
11 basing assumptions on a study that is more than 20  
12 years old, four presidents ago.

13 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: You would agree that  
15 a 1997 study is out of date.

16 JAMES PATCHETT: Right. I mean I think we  
17 have—what's much more important that this study is  
18 the actual results of our incubators and  
19 accelerators. We pick what we believe to be the  
20 absolute best operators, and we will continue to  
21 refine the specifics as we go over time. Generally  
22 speaking, notwithstanding the percentage assumptions,  
23 we substantially over-performed the number of  
24 business that are actually served through our  
25 programs as opposed to what we are assuming at the

2 outset. So, while, you know, you can certainly point  
3 individual assumptions, but I think you have  
4 legitimate questions about it and we should continue  
5 to discuss what really matters, and I think that's  
6 the point of the hearing--

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] I  
8 think that's--

9 JAMES PATCHETT: --is what the outcomes  
10 are, and we will see that through specific reporting,  
11 and we will update that over time.

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I agree that the  
13 most important factor are the results of the  
14 incubators, but the--but basing the short-term  
15 projections on 20-year-old studies me as problematic,  
16 and the article on which the projection is based  
17 indicates the following: It says about the study--  
18 "Complicating matters is the wording of the NBIA  
19 statistic not to mention its age. So, the very  
20 article that EDC cites is actually critical of the  
21 study. Also, EDC's methodology for these programs  
22 also apply to 6.7% in employment each year for  
23 program graduates, and a 3.4% in incubator growth  
24 rate for program participants citing a study of  
25 incubator effectiveness. But the study that EDC cites



3 the Boon or Boondoggle Study, found that it has  
4 approximately 58% success rate. The study shows out  
5 of 18,426 businesses—actually, I'm moving ahead of  
6 myself. I'm sorry. So, the study indicates EDC  
7 assumed a 6.7% increase in employment each year, but  
8 the study only indicates that that 6.7% was a one-  
9 time increased in employment growth. Yet, EDC assumes  
10 that it happens each year.

11 JAMES PATCHETT: I mean, I'm not familiar  
12 with that specific element of methodology. What I  
13 can tell you is that we base it on the best  
14 information we have at the time. I think what's to  
15 your point what we will have is [coughs] what we—what  
16 we will have is contractual requirements for each of  
17 our operators to—to actually tell us how many  
18 businesses get served through these programs, and our  
19 experience has been that they out-perform what their—  
20 what our initial projections are, but we will know  
21 more, significantly more over time, and we'll report  
22 that. You may be right that our assessments are  
23 aggressive in some areas, but I can tell you other  
24 areas where we have already well exceeded what we  
25 originally assumed. You know, as an example our  
Apprenticeship program, you know, we originally

3 assumed we'd create 450 jobs as a part of that. The-  
4 the Nurses Program alone already has 500 participants  
5 that know about, and that's just one element of our  
6 Apprentices Program. So there are really areas where  
7 we will exceed our efforts and there will be areas  
8 where we will fall short of our efforts, but we're  
9 confident that in the aggregate we will create  
10 100,000 jobs.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Now, we have to  
12 learn from experience. I'm going to cite two examples  
13 of-of incubators that failed. The first is Pilot  
14 Works at EDC backed, pitched an incubator in Brooklyn  
15 that "Abruptly shuttered in October 2018 leaving 175  
16 local food vendors without a kitchen." The second is  
17 the Harlem Garage Business Incubator that opened in  
18 2013 with "\$250,000 in funding provided by EDC, and  
19 closed in 2016." Do you factor in the success and  
20 failure rates of these incubators and others like  
21 them in your methodology in your projections?"

22 JAMES PATCHETT: We make conservative  
23 assumptions across the board so that we will be able  
24 to exceed our-our initial projections, but again,  
25 there are--

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Well,  
3 an 87% success rate is not exactly a conservative.

4 JAMES PATCHETT: I mean--

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So do you adjust  
6 that in light of your own experience with incubators?

7 JAMES PATCHETT: Absolutely.

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: You do. Okay, and so  
9 what kind of adjustments have you made?

10 JAMES PATCHETT: Sorry, what's your point?

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do you--if you have--  
12 with your--do you adjust your assumptions about the  
13 success of incubators based on your own experience  
14 with incubators?

15 JAMES PATCHETT: We do, the vast majority  
16 of our incubators. I--I don't have a specific number,  
17 but I would bet more than 87% have been very  
18 successful-- I mean you did cite two examples. I can  
19 cite many other examples including our Digital Health  
20 Marketplace. It's been wildly successful. We're  
21 increasing the participation in that program. Our  
22 Jamaica Feast Program, which is the kitchen  
23 incubator, which will--which we are looking to  
24 increase because it's been so successful. Our efforts  
25 in, you know, our efforts in tech incubators that had

3 been very successful. Our bio-incubators are already  
4 exceeding our expectations. I mean across the board  
5 we generally do quite well, but it really in the  
6 particular, and we will have specific numbers of the  
7 companies served. I mean there are circumstances  
8 where people go out of business. It happens, but  
9 again, if we're doing this in EDC or city-owned  
10 assets, we continue to own the infrastructure. So  
11 it's an opportunity for us to still control the  
12 space, and create a long-term opportunity for-for  
13 someone. That's why in the case of the-our Virtual  
14 Reality and Augmented Reality CBO, it's located at  
15 the Brooklyn Navy Yard. We're making an investment  
16 in that. We think we'll create 750 jobs, but at the  
17 end of the day, if it doesn't work out, we renovated  
18 at the Brooklyn Navy Yard. Another company will go  
19 there and create jobs even if the particular effort  
20 doesn't work out. Although it's modeled on our NYC  
21 Media Strategy, which has been wildly successful and  
22 far exceed our expectations.

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I don't want to  
24 dwell on this, but if you have extensive data about  
25 our experience with incubators, then why not base the  
projections on your own experience rather than a 20-

3 year-old study that-- We can go back and forth all  
4 day about this. I think that's all I think of. I  
5 think we've-we've exhausted. Actually, I do want to--  
6 you and I were going back and forth about the meaning  
7 of tracking--

8 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --and there are--  
10 there are five categories of city action. There's  
11 clear tracking of actual jobs created in one of those  
12 categories, tax incentives. When I asked you about  
13 the rest of them, you did indicate that there's a  
14 commitment to improving the projections, refining  
15 your projections. Can you commit to tracking in the  
16 remaining four categories in the same manner that you  
17 do a tax incentive. When I think of the last actual  
18 discussion, you said it's on a case-by-case basis,  
19 but can you do it on a categorical basis?

20 JAMES PATCHETT: I-I won't do it on a  
21 categorical basis only because again, in cases of  
22 zoning actions we're-we're never going to know the  
23 exact number of people that are in those buildings.  
24 However, I will commit to you as is to--in --in June  
25 and in subsequent--and our annual updates every year  
to providing a--not just a projection, but our best

3 estimate at the time based on the best data we had at  
4 the time of the number of people currently employed  
5 in those jobs, and that will be based on the best  
6 data we have available. In some cases, it may be the  
7 number of companies served and the information we  
8 have about those. In some cases it might be based on  
9 the buildings that we know have completed and have  
10 leased up although we did have relationships with  
11 particular employers. In other cases, we knew the  
12 exact number of employees in the categories that are  
13 above and beyond the incentives, but that provide  
14 very similar information.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do we—the jobs—  
15 obviously. I take your point. That jobs created as  
16 a rezoning are the hardest the track.

17 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: What about the  
19 remaining categories? Is there a commitment to—like  
20 is there a middle ground rather than--

21 JAMES PATCHETT: [interposing] Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --it might be  
23 impractical. Let's stick with that it's impractical  
24 to track all five categories, but it seems  
25 unreasonable to only track the one category.

3 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes.

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Can we go to two?  
5 Can we go to three? Can we got to four categories?

6 JAMES PATCHETT: Yes, and we will do  
7 that.

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: For which? Every  
9 category except rezoning or--

10 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, we'll--even in  
11 rezonings, we'll provide--

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing]  
13 Improve projections, but--

14 JAMES PATCHETT: Well, I mean more  
15 specific data about, again what we did--what we did  
16 initially was we said we changed the zoning, and we  
17 know it's going to take several years for the  
18 buildings to come online. Even for that case what we  
19 will do is we will go through building by building of  
20 the actual buildings that have been constructed, and  
21 are--are not just projections, but are numbers of  
22 people who are actually employed in those buildings  
23 at that time. So, it's not just a projection. It's  
24 an estimate based on the best current information. In  
25 other cases we'll have real specific numbers in other  
categories. I--I will provide for you a comprehensive

3 report at the end of the Fiscal Year and the Council  
4 and the public and we're committed to doing that. You  
5 know, I don't think we can productively in this  
6 conversation go line item by line item through and  
7 tell you how exactly we'll do it, but I guarantee it  
8 will be with the best data we have, and it will not  
9 just be a projection of what will happen in the  
10 future. It will be our best information about what  
11 is happening at that time and the number of people  
12 who are actually employed at that time.

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Because what I'm  
14 asked by my constituents how many jobs have we  
15 created under the plan, I want to be able to answer  
16 that question.

17 JAMES PATCHETT: I understand.

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you, President  
19 Patrick.

20 JAMES PATCHETT: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Oh, Council Member  
22 Menchaca has--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing]  
24 One--

25 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --one final  
question. No other questions.



3 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Follow-up  
4 question. Sorry. It's a marathon. Thank you for  
5 your stamina. The Willoughby Project that I  
6 mentioned earlier, that is not on city-owned  
7 property, but you list a fair amount of jobs. How  
8 many jogs for the Willoughby?

9 JAMES PATCHETT: It's about 1,000 and--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing]  
11 1,100--

12 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: -- specifically  
14 up to. So, how are you going to track and hold  
15 Willoughby Square accountable for those jobs on a  
16 non-city-owned property?

17 JAMES PATCHETT: Right, so, in that case  
18 we were--it was--it's--it's certainly more challenging  
19 to your point, but we will--we have a relationship  
20 with the developer and we are in--and we have a  
21 contractual relationship with them, the city does,  
22 and so we'll use those means to most--as effectively  
23 as we can track the specific number of people who are  
24 actually employed there.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And what's the  
contractual relationship with the developer.

2 JAMES PATCHETT: The city has lease in  
3 that building, and then there's the--the air right  
4 sale, which is a different mechanism. We're just  
5 changing the zoning.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Got it. Okay.  
7 I'll follow up on that--

8 JAMES PATCHETT: Okay.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --later and  
10 then the last one says--I know there's a lot of folks  
11 that have been waiting to testify. The engine of  
12 this work is not just CBC. It's all these partners  
13 that you have in the back, you're non-profits, and I  
14 just say thank you to them because they're--they're  
15 part of this network, the mesh of--of economic engine--

16 JAMES PATCHETT: Uh-hm.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --equitable  
18 economic engine for the city. So thank them.

19 JAMES PATCHETT: Thank you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: We thank you.  
21 Bye.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you. We're  
23 going to call up the next panel. Jessie Laymon from  
24 the New York City Employment and Training Coalition;  
25 Joey Ortiz from the New York City Employment and

3 Training coalition; Bryan Loznano from Tech NYC;  
4 Jessica Centeno from the Center for Employment  
5 Opportunities. Yeah, we're going to have to—since we  
6 have eight panels, we're going to have a 2-minute  
7 clock for each witness.[background comments/pause]  
8 Anyone can begin.

9 JOEY ORTIZ: I'll start. Good afternoon,  
10 Council Members and colleagues. Thank you for  
11 holding this hearing doing the necessary oversight on  
12 the city's ability to effectively invest and to  
13 addressing income inequality and chronic poverty in  
14 New York through employment and training services.  
15 My name is Joey Ortiz. I'm joined by my colleague  
16 Jessie Laymon and I'm the Executive Director of the  
17 New York City Employment and Training Coalition.  
18 NYCTC is association representing the expertise of  
19 over 150 community-based organizations that annually  
20 provide job training and employment services to more  
21 than 500,000 New Yorkers from higher need communities  
22 and marginalized populations. [coughs] In order for  
23 the city to continue to remain competitive at the  
24 national and global level, NYCTC believes that New  
25 York City rightfully should invest resources in  
creating new jobs and attracting ne employers to the

3 city. However, a major focus of these investments  
4 should be our city's most valuable resource and that  
5 is its people. Our competitive edge as a city is the  
6 incredible diversity of skills, and experiences of  
7 New Yorkers. It is here that we believe that the city  
8 must increase investment to meet our shared goal of  
9 ensuring that local talent is developed to meet the  
10 needs of all employers and industries. Today, we're  
11 here to urge the City Council to make four  
12 recommendations: Recommendation 1: Focus the plan to  
13 create 100,000 new jobs for current New York  
14 residents who need it most. Out of the 100,000 new  
15 jobs there should be a clearly stated and tracked  
16 goal of hires from target populations such as  
17 populations that—excuse me—such as public housing  
18 residents, people on other public assistance,  
19 students and graduates of CUNY institutions,  
20 residents of the highest poverty and highest  
21 unemployment neighborhoods including those with 10%  
22 unemployment or higher. Additionally, residents I  
23 neighborhoods in responsive developments occurred  
24 should be targeted for targeted for new investments  
25 in job training. Recommendation 2. To achieve these  
goals of financial investment should be spent on

3 increasing the local community Workforce Development  
4 capacity and infrastructure, which can include new  
5 programs, investment in programs that work and  
6 supporting collaborative networks. Recommendation 3:  
7 The city still needs to deliver on its promise to  
8 invest \$50,000 in Bridge Programs [bell] in FY 2020  
9 in order to create long-term changes for the most  
10 vulnerable populations within New York City. [coughs]  
11 Recommendation 4: In addition to these New York  
12 Works specific proposals, we propose that going  
13 forward the city incorporate Workforce Development as  
14 a core focus of its future economic development  
15 initiatives and individual development agreements via  
16 the following proposals: (a) For economic development  
17 projects and missions--

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] I'm  
19 going to ask you to just quickly summarize if you  
20 can, sir.

21 JOEY ORTIZ: I'll try my best. For  
22 economic development projects and initiatives  
23 sponsored by the city and its entities, all RFP  
24 contracts should include language requiring the  
25 private sector partners to detail how they implement  
and invest in pipeline connecting local workers

3 training and jobs. The other two recommendations are  
4 on the record. I want to thank you all for providing  
5 us the opportunity to speak here today, and taking  
6 our concerns and recommendations into consideration  
7 and we look forward to working with the City Council  
8 to make sure that the needs of New York City's job  
9 seekers are addressed by all city agencies through  
10 this process and future city budgets. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Jessie.

12 JESSIE LAYMON: So, I'd just like to pick  
13 up and underline the three recommendations that—that  
14 Joey listed that specifically relate to New York  
15 Works, and how I think they address some of the  
16 questions that you and your colleagues asked  
17 President Patrick earlier today. That first  
18 recommendation, as he listed that the New York Works  
19 Plan when they released the update, we recommended  
20 that they release a specific goal of how many of the  
21 100,000 jobs will go to people from these higher  
22 needs communities like residents of public housing,  
23 people on public assistance and so on. We understand  
24 other jobs will be created for other people, but we  
25 need to have a specific target because you get what  
you measure, and if we are measuring that, and if EDC

3 is focusing on the populations of highest need, that—  
4 that feeds into our second recommendation, which is  
5 that they need to make a serious financial  
6 contribution under the New York Works Plan to  
7 programs that provide targeted job training  
8 assistance for people that are lacking the skills to  
9 get jobs in these new group sectors. Council Member  
10 Torres raised the point about alarming the small  
11 portion of the money so far committed is going to  
12 programs that really help people get that educational  
13 and other skills assistance. We think that could be  
14 substantially higher, and then that finally speaking  
15 to the third recommendation, the New York Works Plan  
16 needed to be tied better from the beginning and still  
17 could be if it—if there's a real focus on this to the  
18 overarching Career Pathways Plan that the  
19 Administration has connecting people with skills  
20 deficits to good jobs, and in particular the Career  
21 Pathways promise of funding \$60 million of Bridge  
22 Programs is something that the New York Works Plan  
23 briefly mentions in the original out-program, but  
24 there's no money from the New York Works Plan  
25 associated with funding bridge programs. We don't  
believe that all \$60 million of the promised Bridge

3 program money needs to come from EDC or it needs to  
4 be under New York Works, but we think EDC has a role  
5 to play here if ultimately you want to get some of  
6 the people who would need Bridge Programs into jobs  
7 in the sectors that EDC is targeting under New York  
8 Works. There should be some money from New York  
9 Works [bell] funding Bridge Programs tied to those  
10 sectors. So, I hope that makes it clear how these  
11 things are all--

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] That  
13 was well done.

14 JESSICA CENTENO: Hi. My name is Jessica  
15 Centeno. I'm the New York State Deputy Executive  
16 Director for the Center for Employment Opportunities  
17 otherwise known as CEO. We're here today to  
18 highlight the needs of some of the low-income New  
19 Yorkers specifically those with criminal convictions.  
20 We're certainly being left behind by our workforce  
21 policies. Our program has two core components:  
22 Transitional Employment and we also put people into  
23 jobs immediately. We operate over 30 work crews in  
24 New York City that provide a variety of general labor  
25 services through New York City's Council Community  
Clean-Up Initiative. In 2018, alone New York City,



3 CEO in New York City enrolled 2,300 individuals, made  
4 1,000 job placements with nearly 200 businesses, and  
5 are participants earned 720 workforce credentials.

6 Those who had one credential started a job at \$14.50  
7 and hour. Those who had more than three credentials  
8 started their jobs at \$19.50 per hour. Clearly, we  
9 have to keep track of our data in order for us to  
10 continue to receive funding from our funding sources.

11 Over the last decade we've invested substantially in  
12 our job training efforts quadrupling the number of  
13 trainings we offer. We've developed work based  
14 learning partnerships, and apprenticeships with Vice  
15 Media and Action Carting Environmental. Most  
16 recently we've expanded some of the training  
17 partnerships with CUNY through New York State DOL  
18 funding. Despite that funding, we primarily cover a  
19 majority of our training including Bridge programming  
20 to qualify individuals to participate in trainings  
21 with CUNY through private philanthropy. The city has  
22 slowly shifted its Workforce Development strategy from  
23 rapid attachment to low-wage jobs for a more nuanced  
24 system that includes upskilling New Yorkers.

25 However, many populations with high unemployment  
rates especially individuals with recent criminal

3 convictions are being left behind. If we do not  
4 substantially invest in Bridge Programs, economic  
5 inequality will continue to widen. There are several  
6 steps the city can and should take and I'm going to  
7 mention three. First, economic development and  
8 municipal projects must contain significant  
9 investments towards workforce training and pipelines  
10 to employment. [bell] Second the Mayor and the City  
11 Council should devise a streamlined process to  
12 release that \$60 billion of Bridge funding, and also  
13 the city should provide paid transitional work  
14 opportunities for every person leaving incarceration,  
15 and unemployed justice-involved youth. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you.

17 BRIAN LOZANO: My name is Brian Lozano,  
18 and the Manager of External Affairs for TechNYC. I  
19 want to thank the Chair and this committee for the  
20 opportunity to testify today. Tech NYC is a non-  
21 profit association with the mission of supporting the  
22 tech industry in New York through our increasing  
23 engagement between our more than 720 member  
24 companies, New York government and the community at  
25 large. Tech NYC works every day to foster a dynamic  
and diverse and creative ecosystem ensuring New York

3 is the best place to start and grow a tech company.

4 Today, New York City is tech ecosystem is stronger

5 than ever, and New York has become a global hub for

6 innovation. The New York ecosystem now boasts more

7 than 330,000 jobs and 7,000 start-ups and tech has

8 become a significant impact on our city's economic

9 wellbeing. The New York Works Plan announced by

10 Mayor de Blasio almost two years ago recognized the

11 importance of the tech ecosystem to New York and the

12 employment opportunities the ecosystem provides.

13 Since the plan was put into effect, we have seen the

14 city make important strides toward helping New

15 Yorkers obtain the skills they need and inspire job

16 growth. In the program's first two years the city

17 has partnered with NYU and Columbia to launch NYC

18 Media Lab creating a hub for virtual reality and

19 augmented reality technologies to Brooklyn Navy Yard.

20 The Media Lab will lead to the creation of 750 jobs

21 and includes a workforce development center CUNY—

22 CUNY's leading college in the Bronx. Tech NYC

23 recently visited the VRAR Lab in Lehman College, and

24 we were incredibly impressed with the faculty and

25 those trainings students are receiving. As a part of

New York Works Plan, New York City Tech Talent

3 Pipeline is also part of Hunter and Lehman College to  
4 launch CUNY 2X Tech, which aims to double the number  
5 of CUNY students graduating with a degree in the  
6 technical field in 2022. This partnership is vital  
7 to ensuring New Yorkers are getting the skills  
8 necessary to work and thrive in tech. In addition,  
9 these initiatives the city has taken steps to make  
10 New York City a capital cyber security industry, and  
11 help New Yorkers get the sector specific training. We  
12 look forward to supporting the plan, and make sure  
13 industries work and supplement the city's efforts. As  
14 the ecosystem continues to grow, it's important to  
15 ensure New Yorkers of all backgrounds have the  
16 ability and skills necessary to access good paying  
17 tech jobs. New York Works Plan represents an  
18 innovative step forward, and we—we look forward to  
19 supporting it. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you for your  
21 testimony. The third panel will consist of Justin  
22 Collins, [bell] Angel Ward from the Fortune Society,  
23 Lilianna Paula McKenna, and Caroline Iosso from the  
24 Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow; Franc Cecile  
25 from—from Cyber Security Workforce. [background  
comments]

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay. My eyes are  
4 aging so—

5 MALE SPEAKER: That's okay. [background  
6 comments/pause]

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: You may begin.

8 JUSTIN COLLINS: Good afternoon and thank  
9 you for the opportunity to speak. My name is Justin  
10 Collins, and I represent the Workforce Field Building  
11 Hub at the Workforce Professionals Training Institute  
12 OR WPTI. The Hub serves as a convener of key  
13 stakeholders across the workforce development system  
14 in New York City and beyond to identify key  
15 challenges and develop solutions and best practices  
16 for the field. We appreciate the City Council's  
17 willingness to convene a hearing on the Mayor's New  
18 York Works Plan and on the progress the city has made  
19 with regard to that agenda. In reading the 2018 New  
20 York Works Update, we are please to see that the city  
21 has focused significant on redevelopment city-owned  
22 property to support job creation as well as investing  
23 in growing industries to foster additional job growth  
24 across multiple sectors. While we applaud the city's  
25 desire to create jobs through a variety of  
development projects and targeted investments, this

3 is only one part of the strategy for addressing the  
4 workforce needs of disadvantaged New Yorkers. As was  
5 mentioned by the city itself in the 2018 New York  
6 Works Update, too many of our fellow New Yorkers  
7 continue to struggle with a rapidly changing job  
8 market squeezing out the city's middle class and  
9 rapidly increasing rents. Beyond that, the city's  
10 most disadvantaged communities face even more dire  
11 challenges, struggling with unemployment and under-  
12 employment in a city in which a career resulting  
13 economic mobility is increasingly out of reach.  
14 These challenging circumstances underscore the  
15 importance of a strong workforce development  
16 ecosystem in addition to job creating and economic  
17 development to ensure that all New Yorkers have  
18 access to the economic opportunities that have found  
19 the city for more than a century. It was in response  
20 for this pressing need for a strong workforce  
21 development ecosystem that the hub released our  
22 Workforce Agenda Report in September 2018 in which we  
23 outlined the key issues facing the workforce system  
24 and the key steps that should be taken to ensure that  
25 New Yorkers are prepared for and have access to the  
in demand Career Pathways that can help them advance

3 economically. We're happy to provide copies of the  
4 report at any point if the Council is interested.

5 While New York Works does address the issue of job  
6 creation, it does not yet address the issue of how  
7 workers are trained for and connected to these jobs.

8 While the city has addressed some of this in its

9 Career, existing Career Pathways Network overseen by

10 the Mayor's Office of Workforce Development, the two

11 strategies, job creation and Workforce Development

12 appear disconnected. Namely, the city needs to

13 directly align its Career Pathways' framework and

14 initiatives with the job creation strategies outline

15 in New York Works, and give this work the financial

16 support requires. Furthermore, the city needs to not

17 only increase--significantly increase its investment

18 in Career Pathways and Workforce Development, but

19 better engages organizations and professionals in the

20 workforce field when designing RFPs and developing

21 programs in order to harness their expertise and

22 build stronger programs. [bell] Furthermore, and I

23 just have two more key asks--

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Wrap up as soon as  
25 possible.

JUSTIN COLLINS: What's that?

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: As quickly as  
4 possible.

5 JUSTIN COLLINS: As quickly as possible  
6 absolutely. The city can support better data  
7 infrastructure in order to foster information sharing  
8 and analysis across organizations. We've seen  
9 progress with regard to the development of common  
10 metrics, but it doesn't yet include all city  
11 administrative workforce programs, and has not yet  
12 systematically informed the implementation of the  
13 work set forth as part of New York Works, and in then  
14 the last ask is we ask the city to increase support  
15 for Bridge Programming consistent with the Mayor's  
16 2014 promise to provide \$60 million additional  
17 dollars annually for this work by 2020. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you.

19 ANDRE WARD: Good afternoon. My name is  
20 Andre Ward and I'm the Associate Vice President of  
21 the Employment Services and Education at the Fortune  
22 Society. I am testifying today on behalf of the 70-  
23 70 million Americans or 1 in 3 adults with a criminal  
24 record. It is no secret that people with conviction  
25 histories face significant barriers to employment  
that compromise individuals, families and a



3 community's ability to reach a pace of economic  
4 stability, safety and ultimately hold cycles of  
5 poverty and re-incarceration. First, let me begin by  
6 thanking the New York City Council Oversight  
7 Committee and Economic Development Committee and  
8 various Council Members for convening this this  
9 important hearings. The Fortune Society provide  
10 advocacy and home sick services for the 7,000 people  
11 affected by the Justice System annually. We provide  
12 innovative employment services to approximately 700  
13 people each year through various license  
14 certifications and green building maintenance,  
15 environmental remediation training. In addition to  
16 that, we offer education services to support basic  
17 literacy, numeracy and learning areas fundamental to  
18 success in the workplace. We urge the city to adopt  
19 public policy that affords long-term necessary  
20 investments to strengthen the workforce services that  
21 public sector funders and employers and the  
22 community-based organization provide to all New  
23 Yorkers so that every person may achieve self-  
24 sufficiency for themselves and their families. The  
25 2017 New Yorker Works Plan to create 100,000 new  
middle-class jobs in growth sectors across New York

3 City is commendable and certainly necessary. It is  
4 our belief that without the direct sustainable  
5 investments in the skill development in New Yorkers  
6 themselves these jobs will continue to be  
7 inaccessible to most residents. By further the  
8 employment access gap, growing economic inequality  
9 will persist. We encourage the New Yorker Works Plan  
10 and to identify ways to collaborate and [bell] and  
11 connect with the Mayor's 2014 Career Pathways Plan  
12 provide access to training and jobs for all New  
13 Yorkers. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you so much.

15 FRANK CICIO: My name is Frank Cicio from  
16 IQ4 Corporation. IQ4 is a technology company that's  
17 been working to solve the skills gap and employment  
18 challenge that has resulted in unemployment and  
19 retention for millions of our students and learners  
20 in general. During the past eight years IQ4 has  
21 developed the technology standards and models that  
22 resulted in improving solutions that can mobilize  
23 industry education by massively scaling virtual  
24 apprenticeship programs and internships to create  
25 global opportunity awareness, accelerate workforce  
readiness and level the playing field for all

3 students in college and high schools. Two years ago  
4 we contracted—we were contacted by the New York City  
5 EDC to explore how IQ4 support could help solve that  
6 challenge here in the city. During this process, the  
7 EDC realized the ability to skill student development  
8 using an applied learning and academic learning  
9 curriculum would be a game changer. However, up to  
10 this point IQ4 had not engaged with a global brand  
11 that had the vision to support Launch and Drive, the  
12 transformational solution. On October 2<sup>nd</sup>, EDC  
13 formalized and selected a group of operators to  
14 launch Cyber New York City. IQ4 was selected to  
15 develop 8,000 students through the program. The  
16 level of detail and support provided by the EDC to  
17 help young emerging technology companies like IQ4 was  
18 unprecedented, and exactly what the city, our country  
19 and the world needs to solve the skills gap  
20 challenge. This effort take vision, commitment,  
21 passion and the ability to execute in order to make  
22 it work. The EDC continues to work with IQ4 and our  
23 4,600 mentors to ensure successive program engaged in  
24 New York City's business, education and public  
25 communities to support this initiative. The program  
includes the resources and funding to—to ensure

3 continued self-sustaining model long-term for every  
4 single one of our students pursuing great careers for  
5 all of us to transform the economy. Thank you, New  
6 York City and EDC and the hard work and vision. Just  
7 to follow up on some of the metrics that you had  
8 requested before and we had to share this directly  
9 with President Patrick. But 100% of those students  
10 and we've had now a thousand students already have  
11 gone through the program at CUNY and at SUNY. 100%  
12 now have baseline awareness in cyber security  
13 threats, and their impact on corporate ecosystems.  
14 98% of these students never took the cyber security  
15 course before. Fifty percent of the alumni now are  
16 participating in an internship program in cyber.  
17 Forty-three percent of the alumni are women, 25% of  
18 the alumni have graduated, and had gotten cyber  
19 security jobs of which they've never had a cyber  
20 security background, and 20% of the alumni who took  
21 an internship were in non-technical positions. So,  
22 there you go. [bell]

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you for  
24 providing that.

25 CAROLINE ISSO: Good afternoon. My name  
is Caroline Iosso, and I am the Director of Community

3 and Government Affairs for Opportunities for a Better  
4 Tomorrow, OBT. Thank you guys so much for having  
5 this hearing. Thank you for—to Council Member Torres  
6 and Vallone and fellow members of the Council. I'm  
7 pleased to present testimony on the New Yorker Works  
8 Jobs Plan. Founded in 1983, OBT is one of New York  
9 City's largest providers of workforce development and  
10 education services for Opportunity youth ages 17 to  
11 24 and adults who are disconnected from education  
12 and/or employment. We serve over 4,000 youth and  
13 adults annually across six sites in Brooklyn and  
14 Queens. OBT is a member of New York City Employment  
15 and Training Coalition, and we're a partner and  
16 invest in Skills New York City, a citywide coalition  
17 working to make Workforce Development an economic  
18 priority and achieve policy change that streamline  
19 the Workforce Development system through significant  
20 sustained state and local investment. The 2017 New  
21 York Works Plan is commendable, but without direct  
22 and sustainable investments in skills development,  
23 these jobs will continue to be inaccessible to most  
24 New Yorkers including those New Yorkers that we serve  
25 everyday. As the workforce development organization  
with a 36-year long history of training New Yorkers

3 for a variety of jobs and careers, we've seen the  
4 consequences of this lack of investment. The reality  
5 on the ground is as follows: We've seen an increased  
6 need for basic skills support. So, over the past  
7 five years, OBT has seen the shifts in who are high  
8 school equivalency programs serves. Our incoming  
9 students are now scoring lower in literacy and in  
10 numeracy. Students are also taking longer to pass  
11 the task compared to the GED. At OBT we've seen that  
12 the amount of time it takes someone to prepare for  
13 the task exam has increased from five months to 12-to  
14 between 12 and 18 months, and we've seen increased  
15 barriers faced by the youth and adults that we serve.  
16 While we've always served youth and with barriers to  
17 employment, there have been increases in the number  
18 and in the degree of need. [bell] Wow. [laughter] I  
19 will say that we support the following initiatives  
20 for investment in system alignment: 10% of all  
21 Economic Development investments should go to  
22 workforce development, programming for new Yorkers  
23 and drawing from every level of education in skill  
24 including \$60 million for Bridge programs, and New  
25 York must invest in creating a range of jobs beyond  
the technical, which can be responsive-responsive to

3 our businesses growing, as well as to the range of  
4 skill and interest in communities. Thank you so  
5 much.

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Alright, thank you  
7 so much for your testimony. We have Larry Rothchild  
8 from the Saint Nick's Alliance, Lowell from Cybercell  
9 LDC, and if I mispronouncing it, I apologize. Ardelon  
10 from Onsite IQ, Samia from the Urban Wild.

11 [background comments/pause] Vanessa Siverls (sp?) or  
12 Siverls yeah.

13 VANESSA SIVERLS: I'll answer to that.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you.

15 [background comments/pause]

16 VANESSA SIVERLS: Hi. My name is Vanessa  
17 Silverls, and I am the founder and CEO of BUPeriod. A  
18 public benefit corporation and a lifestyle brand to  
19 empower women through menstrual health by providing  
20 educational workshops and developing a smart  
21 menstrual pad wearable that will inform women in real  
22 time what risk indicators are in their menstrual  
23 cycles to help them manage difficult periods. I  
24 discovered Futureworks Incubator in 2017 when I was  
25 in the in the 1776 Incubator at Brooklyn Navy Yard. I  
asked around the various incubators which one would

3 be best for me to get started with prototyping. The  
4 new lab, which is also located at the Brooklyn Navy  
5 Yard, recommended Futureworks as well. I decided to  
6 apply and it was one of the best decisions I've made  
7 for my start-up. Every workshop provided has been a  
8 gateway to invaluable start-up information, amazing  
9 pitch opportunities and a plethora of connections  
10 from networking. They even welcomed my prototype  
11 made of bounties, thick paper and wires, and was  
12 still able to guide me about the process to get to  
13 the end prototype goal. It was due to Futureworks  
14 that I am now in one of Brooklyn's highest esteemed  
15 organizations, Pratt Institute of Technology, the  
16 Brooklyn Fashion and Design Accelerator whose sole  
17 purpose is to educate, mentor and guide textile  
18 fashion and tech fusion companies to be as  
19 sustainable minded as they can with their business  
20 models. Futureworks also introduced my cohort to  
21 BLIP, the Brooklyn Law Clinic, which I am now  
22 partnering for pro bono legal services. Today, I am  
23 happy to announce that we are accepted into the  
24 Cornell Jumpstart R&D Program for our first official  
25 prototype look and feel. BUPeriod's Smart Pad will  
go from bounty stick paper and wires to a full



3 ergonomic prototype model so that we can move forward  
4 to face two of material research for the pad. So, I  
5 humbly think and what NYCDC second news and the  
6 Futureworks hardware incubation Program as I truly  
7 believe that [bell] the collaborative will help bring  
8 New York City to the forefront of start-up and small  
9 business innovation, and just really quickly. One of  
10 my interns is here now for Futures and Options, which  
11 is another program where the city pays high school  
12 students to work the start-ups. It's not who you  
13 know. It's not what you know. It's who you know,  
14 especially in this world, and when we don't have a  
15 lot of money getting started, free labor and they're  
16 getting skill is an equal exchange, and so Incubators  
17 and Accelerators I believe will help bring New York  
18 City to where it needs to be and beyond to beat out  
19 Silicon Valley.

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you for your  
21 testimony. Thank you.

22 DONNA LYNN BRADLEY: Hello. I'll try to  
23 keep this within the two minutes. My name is Donna  
24 Lynn Bradley (sic). I'm a Workforce Development  
25 professional and technologist and now CEO and Co-

3 Founder of The Urban Wild. We're a non-profit start-  
4 up based in New York dedicated to making--

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Can  
6 you put on the call.(sic)

7 DONNA LYNN BRADLEY: Oh. Dedicated to  
8 making sustainable agricultural technology more  
9 accessible to areas that are affected by water and  
10 food scarcity. I came here today to advocate for the  
11 efficacy--efficacy and the need for funding for  
12 workforce development agencies like mine and the ones  
13 that I've worked for and come from, and in order for  
14 me to explain why I feel like there's investing that  
15 needs to happen in these programs, I have to explain  
16 a little bit about my background. I'm the daughter  
17 or first generation immigrant born into a single  
18 parent household who grew up under the poverty line  
19 for the majority of my--my childhood. I'm a Brooklyn  
20 native born and raised in Coney Island, and I moved  
21 to Sunset, and saw first hand how the wealth gap  
22 completely undermined my family and my neighborhood's  
23 ability to progress. The only way I saw the ability  
24 to create a future for myself and my family was to  
25 begin working as soon as I possibly could. This  
pushed me to graduating at 16 years old, going to

3 college and working multiple jobs, and eventually  
4 having to drop out to make ends meet. My job—my—my  
5 mom as well at that point was actually also working  
6 two jobs as well. So, our goal is to get a home for  
7 ourselves, and to launch a business. That way we  
8 could sustain ourselves in the long run. My pursuit  
9 of opportunity went on for years until after many  
10 dead ends, I found job training program called Per  
11 Scholas, and that meant that I could go to school for  
12 up to six months for coding, and came out with a job  
13 that was actually gainful employment, and was able to  
14 then be responsible for tracking job placements of  
15 students who were disconnected from the organization.  
16 In the last three years I've helped hundreds of  
17 students secure job placements. In 2018 alone I  
18 managed to connect 65 out-of-school, out-of-work  
19 students with over 115 jobs in New York, and  
20 employers ranging from MIT, Swipe it Forward, DOE,  
21 OATH, Tumbler, CNBC and more. It's nowhere near the  
22 number of jobs that are needed to reach these goals  
23 that the NYEDC has set, but these students are people  
24 of color who were or previously disconnected from  
25 work or college and had no prior tech skills. By end  
of 2018 the student population I served achieved and

3 average of \$65,000 per year in earnings and over  
4 \$2,500 per contract for Bridge employment. All this  
5 to say that I I've seen the efforts of workforce  
6 development agencies who are actually in tune with  
7 their communities had an immense impact on my life  
8 and my students and on my peers. [bell] I graduated  
9 from a boot camp in 2017 and had the privilege of  
10 becoming s technologist to develop apps, website and  
11 products that have a direct impact on our lives for  
12 start-ups and non-profits, and now I'm gainfully  
13 employed as Project Manager at a tech company, but  
14 lastly, I've achieved my dream of launching a  
15 workforce development non-profit, which will kick off  
16 it's first training program this summer. The final  
17 points that I want to make—I know I'm out of time—is  
18 that please place this investment into stipends to  
19 support the students as they go through these  
20 programs because they don't have the ability to make  
21 it through sometimes if they don't have any-any  
22 income. Please invest in the workforce development  
23 agencies like mine and particularly smaller ones that  
24 represent the communities that they're serving.  
25 Please make equitable opportunities for youth, which  
means that understanding that they need to have

3 additional support coming out of these programs  
4 because it is a long haul to get into these jobs.  
5 And then lastly, please understand that in order to  
6 support this gap between this inequity and inequality  
7 is understanding that there is a resistance by the  
8 companies you're hoping that these students get  
9 placed in to hire these diverse students [bell]  
10 knowing that it means that you have to understand  
11 that there's CBOs and non-profits that are willing to  
12 support them through that. Thank you.

13           LOWELL HERSCHBERGER: Thank you for this  
14 opportunity. My name is Lowell Herschberger. I'm  
15 with Cypress Hills Local Development Corporation in  
16 East New York. I head up the Job Programs there. We  
17 have a continuum of adult education, internship and  
18 skills training programs, and let me just kind of  
19 summarize basically two points I'd like to make. You  
20 know residents come to me at—at literacy levels of 7  
21 or 6, you know, on average, 7.2 for literacy and 6.2  
22 for math, and there's a huge gap between that skill  
23 level and the skills that are needed for these  
24 100,000 jobs. So, I—I know from the question earlier  
25 that you know that, and—and Bridge programs and just  
absolutely essential for this—the skills gap and then

3 the second thing I'd like to put a plug in for the  
4 Transportation sector. [coughs] That is one sector  
5 that we've had some experience with that has been  
6 really effective in getting people jobs without the  
7 educational gains. We've had—it didn't happen by  
8 accident. It's because there's a deep industry CBO  
9 partnership that pays attention both to the hard  
10 skills needed as well as the industry specific stock  
11 skills, and so investing in these partnerships really  
12 is an amazing way of transitioning many adults into  
13 living wage employment without the long haul of—  
14 based on the literacy gap that we see.

15 LARRY ROTHCHILD: I'm Larry Rothchild.  
16 I'm the Director of Workforce Development for Saint  
17 Nick's Alliance in North Brooklyn. Saint Nick's  
18 Alliance serves over 1,300 clients a year doing adult  
19 education, skills training, job readiness training  
20 and direct employment. We provide skills training in  
21 construction, Certified Nursing Assistant, IT,  
22 Bilingual Customer Service Bank Teller, CDO and  
23 Environmental Remediation. While we see many barriers  
24 to employment with our clients, those soft skills are  
25 helping that we are providing, but while all training  
participants on career pathway to success, we have

3 not experienced consistent placement in jobs starting  
4 at \$50K or more, the exception being those that land  
5 union jobs in construction, which is not a guarantee  
6 for our graduates when they graduate the training.

7 Our entry level graduates in IT and Certified Nursing  
8 Assistants start around \$18 an hour, and we find that  
9 employers value the experience in addition to the

10 industry recognized certs. While we boast strongly

11 for—in construction—in construction at 27% in the  
12 first year, that still does not equate—equate to the

13 \$50K jobs for the majority that we serve. We are  
14 working with our employer partners to offer advanced

15 certifications and a future leading to career pathway  
16 development and increased wages, but what we really

17 need is we need more internship and apprenticeship

18 opportunities, paid opportunities. Right now through

19 our DYCD funding we only have enough for about half

20 of the participants that we serve, and we find that

21 this—this is probably the most critical piece that we

22 needed, really paid internship and apprenticeship

23 opportunities to give our—our young adults and adults

24 the opportunities to be successful especially in IT

25 and out there. Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you for your  
4 testimony, and for your passion. Thank you. Kevin  
5 Gardner, LifeSci NYC; Shazam from LifeSci NYC  
6 Internship; Richard Robbins, Upper West Side  
7 Strategies, LifeSci—also LifeSci NYC, LifeSci NYC;  
8 Sarah Satori, LifeSci NYC. LifeSci NYC well  
9 represented. [background comments/pause] Please  
10 proceed.

11 KEVIN GARDNER: Good afternoon. My name  
12 is Kevin Gardner. I'm here today as a proud CUNY  
13 professor. I serve as the Director of Structural  
14 Biology at CUNY's new Advanced Science Research  
15 Center located in Harlem. I'm also on the faculty of  
16 City College of New York where I teach biochemistry  
17 every fall to about 70 undergraduates. Combined with  
18 my prior work at UT Southwestern Medical Center in  
19 Dallas, I have over 20 years expertise in conducting  
20 biomedical research, educating trainees and working  
21 with biotech companies. Three of these discoveries  
22 have been commercialized including a new cancer drug  
23 now in clinical trials just up the street at Memorial  
24 Sloan Kettering. This led to my involvement in  
25 starting two biotech companies. As a researcher,  
educator and entrepreneur, I know the importance of



3 these three fields for the successful development of  
4 new biotech companies. As such, I gladly accepted an  
5 invitation to join the Advisory Council of LifeSci  
6 NYC when it was founded in 2017. LifeSci NYC and  
7 NYED Initiatives are already making meaningful impact  
8 on the students who I work with on a daily basis.  
9 I'll start with the students I teach at CCNY. They  
10 are outstanding, and I think they are an absolutely  
11 under-attached resource for our city. Like many of  
12 them, I want to find ways to translate interest in  
13 science and the positive effects on human health.  
14 Complement the relatively few routes for our students  
15 to learn this first hand, LifeSci NYC's Internship  
16 Program, which you'll hear about more from a few  
17 speakers, has created real world opportunities for  
18 local students to work in area companies. Demand for  
19 this program is absolutely impressive. Now in it's  
20 third summer, over 800 applicants are competing for  
21 about 80 spots. I'm particularly proud that CUNY  
22 students have made up over half the programs'  
23 participants to date. Given that almost all of them  
24 are local and interested in staying here for good  
25 jobs post-graduation, this is not standing long-term  
investment for our hometown students and employers.

3 Next I turn to NYC EDC's E-Lab NYC Program, which  
4 targets students later in their careers as they  
5 complete their Science PhDs and post-docs giving them  
6 skills that are absolutely needed to function in the  
7 business world. [bell] This program—I'll summarize  
8 quickly. Now in its seventh year, it achieves those  
9 amending MBA curriculum combining formal coursework,  
10 small group exercises and mentoring. I'm a veteran of  
11 this program having gone through it together with the  
12 post-doc in mind, Dr. Laura Moda made it to form a  
13 small tech biotech company that we started in Harlem,  
14 Opta Watches (sic), Incorporated. I'll close by  
15 noting that New York's competitive spirit was my key  
16 in—was key in my decision to move back here in 2014.  
17 As with Dallas, I love the fact that New York doesn't  
18 like to be second at anything, and it seems both  
19 cities to see homegrown—homegrown discoveries and  
20 trainings forced to leave and develop traditional  
21 bio-tech hotspots elsewhere. Changing the status quo  
22 is audacious goal, but one that makes a lot of sense  
23 for the city scientifically and economically. I'm  
24 proud to be a part of this effort, proud to be part  
25 of the city with the bold vision behind it. Thank  
you for your time.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you.

4 SEAN PARASRAM: Hello. My name is Sean  
5 Parasram. I'm an Operations Analyst at Curator, and  
6 I'm extremely grateful to the Council for giving me  
7 the chance to speak on my experience with the LifeSci  
8 NYC internship from last summer. I wanted to start  
9 off by posing the question that's very familiar to m  
10 and probably to everybody else. What do you want to  
11 be when you grow up? I've always been jealous of the  
12 people who could answer that question without  
13 hesitation, and for myself about a year ago it was a  
14 pretty terrifying question. At that point, I was two  
15 months away from graduating from the NYU Tandon  
16 School of Engineering, and I really learned so much  
17 there. I knew I had a passion for data, and how  
18 things worked, and I also know that I wanted to help  
19 people, and I was interested in health care and  
20 biotech, but I still wasn't sure how to blend the two  
21 or where I'd exactly end up. I thought I had to  
22 compromise on the experience that I wanted or that I  
23 would have to move some place else in order to find  
24 it and hopefully not Jersey. But that was because I  
25 didn't know about the opportunities in the life  
sciences that had already existed in the city, and

3 the LifeSci NYC Internship Program really opened my  
4 eyes to it. When the program matched with Curator, a  
5 medication management company in based in Lower  
6 Manhattan, I was upfront with them about my varying  
7 interest, and what was supposed to be a marketing  
8 internship exposed me to strategy, sales and product  
9 development. I saw first hand how a growing business  
10 was run, and met people that continued to inspire me  
11 everyday. I loved it so much so that at the end of  
12 the summer I knew that my time there wasn't over, and  
13 more importantly, they—they agreed. I started full-  
14 time two weeks later. Now, every so often my CEO will  
15 ask me what do I want to be when I grow up, and  
16 instead of being scared, I'm excited. I see it from  
17 the lens of possibility as opposed to intimidation,  
18 and I really have to thank the LifeSci Program for  
19 that. The program could have solely been an  
20 internship matchmaker to the Life Science students in  
21 the city, and it would have been an incredible  
22 opportunity for rich sharing, and it actually did so  
23 much more. From the week of prep leading into the  
24 internships, the professional and social events  
25 throughout the summer, they cultivated a network of  
young professionals. [bell] I will close by saying

3 that I'm really grateful to the program, and for you  
4 for hearing this and I hope to see it continue and  
5 look forward to contributing as much as I can. Thank  
6 you.

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Powerful testimony.  
8 Thank you.

9 SARAH SATORI: Okay. Hi, good afternoon.  
10 My name is Sarah Satori, and I'm a Lead Scientific  
11 Chemist (sic), and it's my pleasure to be here today  
12 to talk about my experience with the LifeSci NYC  
13 Internship program last summer. The impacts made on  
14 me by the LifeSci Internship Program has been  
15 tremendous. Towards the completion of my Master of  
16 Science in Chemistry at Saint John's University in  
17 the winter of 2018, all searches for research  
18 positions in the life sciences brought results that  
19 were located out on the far end of Long Island or  
20 across the river in New Jersey. Most positions  
21 offered to chemists at graduation are jobs in quality  
22 control at pharmaceutical labs or lab technicians in  
23 industrial academic labs. It was a major  
24 disappointment to find out that at that time there  
25 were no research positions in the life sciences open  
to recent graduates in the five boroughs of the city.

3 However the LifeSci NYC Internship Program connected  
4 me Kenos (sp?) a Biotech Tech company in Brooklyn  
5 that works on the future of healthcare by developing  
6 additives for disinfectants that colorize the  
7 surfaces on which they're applied, and which fade  
8 after the contact time of the disinfectant has been  
9 met. This technical internship position at Kenos gave  
10 me the perfect avenue to use the skills I had earned  
11 my Masters Degree in a creative position exactly where  
12 the knowledge and expertise in chemistry were needed.  
13 Were it not for the program, up and coming companies  
14 like Kenos would not have had the resources to  
15 connect with ambitious new graduates like me. I'm an  
16 international student who worked in Hong Kong. I  
17 also knew my clock was ticking. An internship was a  
18 fantastic opportunity, but I that without a full-time  
19 job I would not be able to practice in my field for  
20 longer than the internship period. The LifeSci NYC  
21 Internship Program gave me the intensive 40 boot camp  
22 training and 10-week internship in needed to hone my  
23 skills in communication, teamwork, professionalism,  
24 creative research independence, of course, and  
25 experience working full-time as a scientist that I  
otherwise would never have received so quickly. With

3 this in hand, and the internship under my belt, I  
4 knew that I would be starting off on a better foot no  
5 matter where I worked full time. I also knew that  
6 the program advocated for my full-time employment,  
7 and knew that I desired to work in the city. At the  
8 end of my internship [bell] Kenos offered me a full-  
9 time position. I'm sorry. I'll just close now. It  
10 was a real dream come true to be able to continue  
11 doing what I love in the city that I love. Finding  
12 the LifeSci NYC Internship program connected me to  
13 experts and start-ups in New York City in a wide  
14 array of files in the life sciences through events  
15 held before, during and after the internship period.  
16 The program also connected me to my peers-to peers in  
17 my field in the form of fellow inters who had the  
18 same desires as I did to work on the cutting edge  
19 research in the multi-faceted files of the life  
20 sciences in the emerging life science sector in New  
21 York City. Now, I'm part of the community of  
22 students and recent graduates that I still keep in  
23 contact with who all have the same dreams and goals  
24 of working full time at the epicenter of life science  
25 R&D in New York City. Without the LifeSci NYC  
Internship Program, I would not be where I am now

3 able to work in the city that I love, as fulfilled as  
4 I am with the opportunities continue growing in my  
5 career like you, and Amanor (sp?) worked in the same  
6 building as me, and I saw his little blurb in the  
7 booklet. So, I thought I'd mention that. [laughter]

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you.

9 MALE SPEAKER: Thank you so much. I  
10 thought I had three minutes. So, I'm going to hit  
11 the highlights in two minutes. Thank you. My  
12 company Upper West Strategies was selected by EDC to  
13 development the Management of LifeSci NYC Internship  
14 program. I want to tell you both about the success of  
15 this program, and conclude with two suggested  
16 opportunities for the city. First, science student by  
17 and large with them don't know what industry jobs are  
18 available and what skills they need for these jobs  
19 and colleges don't know how to help them. We've  
20 found great interest in this program. In our first  
21 year of running the program, last year we had over  
22 500 applicants. This year we're expecting over a  
23 thousand. Last year we had 81 students interning at  
24 41 companies in range of different roles. We also  
25 want to reach the thousand of other students that we  
can't directly place into internships. We--this fall



3 did over 50 visits to campuses in all five boroughs

4 where we met with thousands of students. We create

5 applicants for the program, but also provide career

6 advice to over a thousand students conducting

7 interview workshops preparing student for not just

8 for our program, but for any job in the industry.

9 Applicants to the program get access to a database of

10 all the internships, which allows not just to pick

11 their internship, but for all the other students to

12 see their range of jobs available and the skills and

13 experience they need. We've created a Meet-Up group

14 of over 400 members and host frequent career panels.

15 We're doing one tonight on the business of bio-

16 pharma. We also recognize the divide between

17 industry and academia. We created what we call Idea

18 Lab to try to bring the two closer together to make

19 sure that universities are preparing students for

20 industry jobs. Diversity is critical for us. Last

21 summer 42% of our interns were CUNY students, 47%

22 female, 36% first generation college, 59% of those

23 eligible qualified for Pell or TAP grants indicating

24 that they come from low-income families. 37%

25 identified as African-American, Hispanic or two or

more races. One huge challenge us that a lot of

3 students want R&D jobs like—like Sarah mentioned.

4 Yet, there's the Catch 22 that you need experience to  
5 get experience and companies don't have the bandwidth  
6 to train them, and we need universities to have more  
7 funding to be able to give lab training to students  
8 on campus. Also, we require that all students are  
9 paid because we don't want student to miss out on the  
10 opportunity. [bell] We have a subsidy budget that's  
11 only enough to cover 35 or 40 students a year, and we  
12 could easily double that at small companies that  
13 can't afford to pay the students. A number of  
14 students--and we have the stats in my printed page--  
15 receive fuller part-time offers at the end of the  
16 summer including nearly half of the students who are  
17 graduating.

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] So if  
19 you could summarize.

20 MALE SPEAKER: So, to conclude, you know,  
21 great opportunities. This is a fabulous program.  
22 Really commend New York City for doing it. It would  
23 be great to have additional subsidies to be able to  
24 put more students into jobs. It would also be able  
25 to—it would be great for the universities to get

3 funding to offer the training programs that they  
4 really want to—to offer. Thank you very much.

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you for your  
6 testimony. Thank you. The next panel David Yang  
7 from Full—is it Fullstack Academy? Yukan Yang from  
8 Fullstack. Natasha from Smarter Grid. Laura Gupta  
9 from Chemala—Chemela? Okay. I mean lets do it.  
10 Ardalyn (sp?) from Onsite IQ; Suma Reddy from Farm  
11 Shelf; Sarah Block Per Scolas. I just want to figure  
12 out who's here. Is—is Jay from Align here? Teba  
13 from NYC EDC? Keith from WearWorks. He's not. Ian  
14 from Aerospace Metals. Okay, so to work on us. Okay.  
15 You may begin.

16 DAVID YANG: Yes, sir. Hi, dear esteemed  
17 Council Members. Thank you for your time today, and  
18 for your service to all in the city. My name is  
19 David Yang. I'm the Co-founder and CEO for Fullstack  
20 Academy, an accelerated training school headquartered  
21 in Downtown Manhattan and operating since 2013.  
22 Fullstack Academy has trained over 2,500 people in in  
23 tech careers here in the city, and our graduates work  
24 everywhere here in the city. On a personal level, I  
25 come from a family of educators, and I deeply believe  
in the ability of education to grow individual

3 community and economy. I'm here to provide support  
4 on behalf of the Mayor's Jobs Plan and two programs  
5 that have come from it, the Web Development  
6 Fellowship created by the Tech Talent Pipeline and  
7 Cyber NYC project created by the NYC Economic  
8 Development Corporation. The Web Development  
9 Fellowship over the last year and a half has  
10 graduated over 70 New Yorkers into New York City  
11 Companies. One key requirement for this program is  
12 that a candidate's highest previous salary be under  
13 \$50,000, that 70 person stories of New Yorkers  
14 previously employed as dishwashers, care service  
15 drivers or retail clerks are now working at tech  
16 companies like BlockRock and Google, and improving  
17 the economic realities of the their family. The  
18 Cyber NYC Project is one of the most visionary I have  
19 seen in terms of economic development and something  
20 that could really only happen here in New Yorker. We  
21 believe strongly in the stated goal of making New  
22 York City the number one talent pool for Cyber  
23 Security in the world, and through that process  
24 created an abundance of opportunity for New York  
25 City's residents. Our participation in this program  
is to develop a cyber security boot camp that would

3 train over 1,000 graduates in the next three years to  
4 see the new generation of people in the Cyber  
5 Security Talent Pool. For both projects from the  
6 initial proposal into every stage of development  
7 process. My consistent observation is that there is  
8 a focused energy from the Mayor's Office on ensuring  
9 that the program provides opportunity to the people  
10 and communities that need it most. Accessibility  
11 informs every part of the program design. For  
12 example, students often drop out of training for non-  
13 educational reasons like family illness. In these  
14 programs a case manager is assigned to students to  
15 help coach them (sic) and resolve challenges that  
16 prevent them from continuing with their training.  
17 This is allowed us to recruit students from under-  
18 represented backgrounds while also keeping our  
19 graduation levels very high. When the Cyber Security  
20 Group became part of Cyber NYC, they created a  
21 collaboration between Fullstack and La Guardia  
22 Community College [bell] to leverage both of our  
23 organizations' abilities to reach across a diverse  
24 array of NYC residents. In that way, you know, we're  
25 really focused on partnering with organizations

3 across and beyond Manhattan working with libraries,  
4 community outreach groups--

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] If you  
6 could do your best to summarize.

7 DAVID YANG: Okay.

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: If you could do your  
9 best to summarize or conclude so--

10 DAVID YANG: You know, I would like to  
11 say just Council-Councilman Torres like we really  
12 believe a lot in your measurement of results, and  
13 they are also looking to invest in that, and we track  
14 everything from missions, economic career placement  
15 to tell two stories: A positive return for our tax  
16 dollars in the investment, and that those funds go to  
17 those who need it most, and diversity in our student  
18 demographics, attainment of previous salary, and that  
19 they are from the divers backgrounds of previous  
20 educational attainment. Thank you so much.

21 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you.

22 RO GUPTA: Thank you, Chair Vallone and  
23 Chair Torres. My name is Ro Gupta. I'm the CEO and  
24 Co-Founder of Carmera, Street Intelligence Platform  
25 founded in 2015 in Brooklyn. Specifically, we build  
high definition maps that act like virtual railroad

3 tracks for autonomous vehicles to operate safely. It  
4 is unusual to be doing what we do in New York City.

5 The vast majority of our industry is located in areas  
6 like Silicon Valley and robotic centers like

7 Pittsburgh. We decided we wanted to base our company  
8 in New York in part because the city presents

9 challenging—challenges we wouldn't see elsewhere.

10 The density, complexity, environmental conditions and  
11 general diversity of the boroughs has been an

12 advantage for us in testing the robustness of both

13 our technology and our policy for the benefit of our  
14 automotive customers around the world. As we say

15 around the office: If we can make it work in

16 Midtown, we can make it work in Mountainview. Along

17 the way we have had a lot of help from local

18 institutions with the EDC there from the very

19 beginning when a gentleman named David Gilford first

20 described the urban tech hub concept to me. Since

21 then we have benefitted greatly from Urban Tech NYC

22 implementers like Sandra Holder of EDC's coalition

23 (sic) Horowitz of New Lab to name a couple. We've

24 worked closely with them to help us understand how to

25 create a holistic tie to public framework for job

creation, talent development, technology validation

3 and data sharing. while EDC President James Patrick  
4 not all leaders within the city of New York have  
5 continued their steadfast commitment to urban tech  
6 companies like ourselves. For that, we are very  
7 grateful, but more importantly, we're seeing results.  
8 Carmera now has over 40 employees with our Brooklyn  
9 Office having tripled in size over the last year,  
10 recruiting local talent including from schools like  
11 CUNY and Cornell Tech for critical high and middle-  
12 school jobs of the future in areas like machine  
13 learning, Internet of things, computer vision and  
14 others. We have raised over \$25 million in capital  
15 with our last round being led by Google Ventures out  
16 of their New York Office, and we intend to continue  
17 hiring and growing aggressively due in large part to  
18 the welcoming [bell] environment EDC has established  
19 for us here. In closing, we hope the city continues  
20 to be seen as a high-highly desirable place to build  
21 and grow companies of the future, and we are  
22 committed to doing our part to do so inclusively and  
23 to support EDC in our mission to nurture the next  
24 Carmera. Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Great. Thank you  
for that.



3 SUMA REDDY: Hi, Council. My name is  
4 Suma Reddy, and I'm the Co-founder and COO of the  
5 Farmshelf. Thank you for having me today. On behalf  
6 of Farmshelf, a participating company in New Labs  
7 Urban Tech Program, I'm pleased to provide my support  
8 for the EDC led New York Works Plan. We're an early  
9 phase start-up that builds bookshelf size indoor  
10 farms for restaurants, cafeterias and food halls, and  
11 providing leafy greens, herbs, micro-greens onsite.  
12 We're also an impact to Rain Company meaning we  
13 reduce food miles for food we—food feed—food waste,  
14 and water consumption by 90% compared to traditional  
15 farming. We joined New Lab and the Urban Tech  
16 Initiative in January of 2017. At that point we had  
17 raised \$1.2 million, had a rough sided prototype and  
18 only three employees. Our CEO, a plan specialist and  
19 electrical engineer. The Urban Tech Program has been  
20 absolutely integral in helping us accomplish our  
21 goals inside. Since then, we have been able to  
22 increase our monthly total to \$5.2 million (2) have a  
23 beta product roll-out or 30 beta farms and (3)  
24 increase our workforce to 25 employees. We're  
25 supportive of New Yorker Works because it's worked  
for us. New Labs is an incredible space to work, and

3 we're expanding into more of the Brooklyn Navy Yard.

4 In January we built a factory in Building 280 to  
5 begin manufacturing our products right in Brooklyn.

6 In addition to restaurants, we're working at schools.

7 In 2018, we began working with Brooklyn Borough

8 President Eric Adams to write unit curriculum and

9 training for students of the Brooklyn Democracy

10 Academy in Brownsville. We hope one day some

11 students will become technicians for us. Our 25-

12 person workforce has grown to include engineers,

13 scientists, plant specialist and designers. Of that,

14 72% of this workforce is from non-dominant identity,

15 women, people of color, LGBTQ, veterans, and four

16 actually no have college degree. To spotlight one,

17 Dominique whose parents are from the U.S. Marines

18 [bell] has a high school degree is the best performer

19 in our Fabrication Team. So, for our goals for our

20 company we hope to continue and develop and grow in

21 New York City. We're a big supporter of incubators,

22 accelerators and EDC's New York Supports Plan. Thank

23 you.

24 SARAH BLOCK: Good afternoon, Council

25 Members and thank you for this opportunity to speak

with you this afternoon. My name is Sarah Block, and

3 I'm a Senior Manager at Per Scolas, A non-profit  
4 workforce development organization founded in the  
5 South Bronx nearly 25 years ago. We provide tuition  
6 free training and career services to 500 New Yorkers  
7 each year preparing them for successful careers in  
8 technology. Per Scolas is a proud member of the New  
9 York City Employment Training Coalition and a partner  
10 in the Investment Skills NYC Campaign. To this  
11 initiative Per Scolas and other training providers  
12 seek to partner with the Council and the Mayor's  
13 Office to help the most vulnerable New Yorkers obtain  
14 the academic credentials, experience and technical  
15 skills required to advance into skilled training,  
16 secure entry level work and access long-term economic  
17 mobility. This significant advancement provides  
18 that as a city we can ensure that all jobs seeking  
19 New Yorkers have equal access to opportunities that  
20 can put them on pathways into the middle-class. At  
21 Per Scolas we believe that much of our city talent is  
22 hidden in plain sight. People in overlooked  
23 communities who may lack the opportunities, but not  
24 the motivation or intellectual curiosity to join the  
25 ranks of New York City's growing tech sector. Per  
Scolas students come from demographic groups starkly

3 under-represented in the tech industry. More than  
4 90% of our students are people of color; 30% are  
5 young adults and one quarter are women. Historically,  
6 80% of our graduates are placed into tech positions  
7 within—within one year of completing the program,  
8 often within four months where they earn livable  
9 wages and opportunities for career advancement. To  
10 enroll in our programs, applicants have to have at  
11 least a high school diploma or equivalent and be able  
12 to score a 10 on the math and literacy sections of  
13 the test result basic education, a proven indicator  
14 that candidates have the basic skills needed to  
15 complete our program and gain and retain employment.  
16 However, we recognize this requirement is a barrier  
17 for many who are interested in our program. In the  
18 past few years alone nearly one-third of applicants  
19 were turned away because they were unable to achieve  
20 this score. Many candidates have faced other  
21 obstacles, too, such as unstable housing, lack of  
22 affordable childcare, and serious legal issues. In  
23 order to create an alternative pathway to enrollment  
24 for these candidates, Per Scolas has worked  
25 diligently with partnering organizations to develop

2 successful and sustainable Bridge Programming. [bell]  
3 Ooh, two minutes are up already. I thought was three.

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do your best.

5 SARAH BLOCK: [laughs] Basically, in  
6 short, we join other coalitions members in asking  
7 that the city deliver on its promise to invest \$60  
8 million in Bridge Programs in this year's budget in  
9 order to create long-term changes for the most  
10 vulnerable populations in the-within New York City.  
11 Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you for  
13 telling your stories. Thank you for coming. The  
14 next panel and the last panel is Teeva (sp?) from NYC  
15 EDC, Keith from WearWorks, an Ian from Aerospace  
16 Metals, and this will be the final panel.  
17 [background comments/pause] Please start.

18 TEEVA JAHAD: Good afternoon everyone.  
19 It's a great honor for me to be here and speak on  
20 behalf the New York City's high school and college  
21 students. My name is Teeva Jahad. I was born and  
22 raised in Baghdag, Durach (sp?) until my family and I  
23 came to New York City in 2006 in search of a brighter  
24 future. I recently graduated from a dual degree  
25 program at New York University with a Bachelor's in

3 Biomolecular Sciences, and a Masters in  
4 Biotechnology. As a college student, finding an  
5 opportunity in the life sciences in New York City was  
6 extremely challenging. This was namely due to the  
7 limited number of opportunities present and companies  
8 willing to train young talents. As a result, many  
9 well accomplished students apply for out-of-state  
10 interim-internship programs and jobs. Three years  
11 ago I was nervous about how I was going to get my  
12 first job. Finding a job in the field that I am  
13 passionate about seemed daunting. It was an  
14 understatement to say that the opportunities for  
15 newly graduated students in the life sciences here  
16 New York were and still are scarce. In 2017, our  
17 Mayor launched New York Works, which among many  
18 things is an initiative to cultivate New York City as  
19 a hub for life sciences, research and innovations.  
20 Through the plan, Sci-Fi NYC Internship program, I  
21 was privileged to take my first step into the  
22 industrial field by earning a summer internship  
23 opportunity at Delmatics, a woman's health company.  
24 This experience has enable me to develop my  
25 professional skills in an amazing work environment.  
Alongside the program's other resource-resources

3 including workshops that focus on helping students  
4 successfully brand themselves to earn great jobs. My  
5 experience with the internship program was so helpful  
6 that that I felt the need to inform my peers that  
7 such an opportunity has made itself available, and  
8 that they should take advantage of it. For many this  
9 program has transformed beyond just a summer job. It  
10 has helped students develop [bell] true  
11 professionalism in this once inaccessible industry.  
12 To conclude, I would say that the program has proved  
13 to be a critical-critical gateway to my career I the  
14 life sciences and industry. Shortly after  
15 graduation, I was offered a senior technician  
16 position at a fantastic company here in New York  
17 City. Due to this initiative I was able to earn a job  
18 that I am passionate about in the city that I love.  
19 We're currently in the third year of this 10-year  
20 plan and I personally think that we're on the right  
21 path to promoted prosperity, growth and opportunity.  
22 Thank you again for the opportunity to speak to you,  
23 for your undivided attention and for your continued  
24 service and support.

25 KEITH KIRKLAND: Good afternoon. My name  
is Keith Kirkland, and I'm the CEO and Co-Founder of

3 WearWorks, and at WearWorks we build products and  
4 experiences that communicate information through  
5 touch. Navigation is inherently visual, and that  
6 creates a huge challenge for the 21 million blind and  
7 visually impaired people living in the United States.  
8 Our first product Wayband is a wearable, Haptic and  
9 navigation device that gently guides you just to a  
10 destination using only vibration without the need for  
11 any visual or audio use at all and back in 2017 we  
12 used it to help the first blind person run the first  
13 15 miles of the New York City Marathon without  
14 assistance. That's feat garnered us worldwide  
15 attention and acclaim. We worked with, been written  
16 about, been featured on and exhibited by places like  
17 the Design Museum, the New York Times for the  
18 Discovery Channel, the Verge, Dropbox. We're current  
19 resident at the Brooklyn Fashion Design Accelerator,  
20 Pratt, Rutgers, NDIC and the Fashion Institute of  
21 Technology and Columbia have all offered their  
22 support. I also teach high school students designing  
23 for people with disabilities at Pratt, and I'm also  
24 an adjunct professor at City Tech College and their  
25 emergency Media and Technology Program teaching  
topics and topics and perspectives. But back in 2015



3 before all the acclaim and the accolades we were  
4 recent graduates who had a weird idea. We thought  
5 that we could communicate information through your  
6 skin, and we approached the Future Works Program with  
7 this idea, and ultimately that program gave us our  
8 first \$10,000 in funding. I'm jumping around a bit  
9 to kind of save a bit of time. The New York City  
10 Economic Development Corporation and the second year  
11 kind of took a huge risk with us. We were obviously  
12 their moon shot plan. There were six companies that  
13 they could choose, 70 companies in this space. Most  
14 of the companies had the thing that they said that  
15 they were going to make. We had a video and CO with  
16 vibration motors glued to it that talked about hey  
17 can you feel the direction going this way? So, not  
18 only did we get the 10K, which is salvation when  
19 you're in a start-up. We also got space to work  
20 from. [bell] We got access to understanding how  
21 business works, manufacturing, legal and IP, and we  
22 got clout because NYC EDC and Microsoft are partners  
23 and all of a sudden no one knew just what haptic  
24 meant. You know, they still didn't know what it  
25 meant. They gave us a bit of space and listened to  
what we had to say. So, for us if there was no

3 Future Works, there would probably now WearWorks, and  
4 that's why programs for—like this are important.

5 Everyone can often look back and see how obvious—see  
6 the obviousness of our success, but if you can look  
7 forward and see the potential of a non-obvious group  
8 of misfits coming together to do something cool, that  
9 might change the world. At the end of the day, we  
10 don't know who is going to solve the energy crisis or  
11 curer for cancer. Obviously, we don't have the guy  
12 who is going to cure cancer, or we don't know who is  
13 going to help sponsor our marathons, and that's  
14 exactly why we need programs and power everyone to  
15 shot their shot. I'm born and raised in Camden, New  
16 Jersey. I know what it's like to not have  
17 opportunities and to have poverty run rampant, and  
18 when people do it, they get really, really creative  
19 in space that does it for humanity. So, thank you  
20 for your time.

21 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Of course, and last  
22 but not least.

23 IAN COSTA: Yeah, the last one. Good  
24 afternoon. My name is Ian Costa. I'm on behalf of a  
25 local Manufacturer S&L Aerospace out of Flushing. I  
myself would have fallen through the cracks with one

3 of your programs 10 years ago, Workforce 1. I had 20  
4 years experience in aerospace, and there was no segue  
5 or vehicle outside of the Department of Education for  
6 actually needing segue through into the United States  
7 and continue my aerospace career. We've taken so far  
8 four of the individuals from the SBS Workforce 1 and  
9 the CNC Machinists. They've worked excellently. We  
10 are very happy. We would like to go for another  
11 callifay(sic). We would like also to try and expand  
12 the program, and maybe assist with other programs  
13 such as diesel, aerospace and other industries.

14 We've heard medical. We've heard tech industries. I  
15 think we're also at the forefront of a transportation  
16 revolution, which will be guided vehicles, et cetera,  
17 but we're also on the cusp of the aerospace industry  
18 and also the commercialization of the space industry.  
19 I feel musk (sic) as well hasten part of the edge or  
20 the—the luster of New York and its ability to be at a  
21 divide with skilled individuals that will actually go  
22 forward into the new industries that haven't even  
23 been created as such and we feel as though this—this  
24 situation is the—it's prevented other people from  
25 falling through the cracks basically, and it's also  
provided a very diverse opportunity to a lot of

3 individuals that had just the inclination or the  
4 mindset or even the passion to follow an engineering  
5 career when they had not prior experience. We have  
6 worked passionately, as I say, and we would like to  
7 advocate—be an advocate towards a wider program  
8 perhaps beyond C&C Machine and beyond diesel  
9 technology, and beyond aerospace. Thank you for your  
10 time.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you for your  
12 testimony. Thank you. An inspiring story. So,  
13 thank you. So, with that, this hearing is adjourned.  
14 It was I thin the flower mark. [laughter] [gavel]

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 4, 2019