

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY

----- X

November 10, 2021  
Start: 12:11 p.m.  
Recess: 12:24 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: Robert F. Holden  
CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS:  
Paul Vallone  
Eric A. Ulrich  
Brad Lander  
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY

3

2 [background comments]

3 CHAIRPERSON HOLDEN: Are we ready?

4 Well?

5 [gavel]

6 CHAIRPERSON HOLDEN: Good afternoon. I

7 am Council member Robert Holden, Chair of the  
8 Committee on Technology. I want to welcome you to  
9 the vote on the proposed Intro 1894-A, local law in  
10 relation to automated employment decision tools,  
11 sponsored by Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo. With a  
12 dramatic increase in working remotely, the use of  
13 automated employment decision tools is more  
14 pronounced than ever. Many companies readily use  
15 such tools to scan resumes for keywords and assess  
16 candidates public profiles for indicators of certain  
17 personality traits. They can also scan video  
18 interviews to evaluate the candidate behaviors and  
19 mannerisms for indicators of professionalism and  
20 characteristics that are beneficial to the position.  
21 Automated employment decision tools can review  
22 applications more quickly than humans and given the  
23 nature of AI these tools can learn from their  
24 mistakes and improve their functions. Intro 1894-A  
25 would require an independent audit be conducted on

2 automated decision-making tools and hiring before  
3 using such tools in New York City. A summary of the  
4 audit shall be publicly available. The bill would  
5 further require, one, to notify candidates or  
6 employees that reside in the city about the use of  
7 such tools, job qualifications, and characteristics  
8 in the assessment of candidates or employees. And,  
9 two, would provide an opportunity to request  
10 additional information such as the type of data  
11 collected, the source of such data, and data  
12 retention policy. I would like to recognize that  
13 committee members have joined us: Council member  
14 Yeger and Council member Lander and Council member  
15 Vallone and that is it. And is Laurie Cumbo--

16 UNIDENTIFIED: Yeah. She's coming up.  
17 She is on her way out. She has a statement.

18 CHAIRPERSON HOLDEN: Okay. So, we're  
19 just waiting on Majority Leader Cumbo who will make a  
20 statement on her bill.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I saw her in the--  
22 Oh. My mic is hot. I saw her in the members lounge.

23 CHAIRPERSON HOLDEN: You want to say  
24 something?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: No. No. I was  
3 just telling you that I had seen Laurie in the  
4 members lounge.

5 CHAIRPERSON HOLDEN: Okay.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: But then I realize  
7 that my mic was hot.

8 [Background comments]

9 CHAIRPERSON HOLDEN: Okay. I would like  
10 to turn it over to Majority Leader Cumbo who will  
11 make a statement about her bill.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so much,  
13 Chair Holden. Thank you so much for hosting today's  
14 meeting. Today, that Council will vote and hopefully  
15 pass Intro 1894-A, a bill that regulates automated  
16 employment decision tools. A job advertised online  
17 today can attract dozens to hundreds to thousands of  
18 applications, mainly due to the amplifying effects of  
19 the Internet. The Bureau of Labor Statistics noted  
20 in a research publication online that, in 2018,  
21 Americans at large have had to submit at least six  
22 applications to obtain one job interview. The user  
23 resumes that were received were given an opaque  
24 process. This is why my bill will require audits  
25 that will serve to clear the fog around these

2 processes and help eliminate implicit bias and  
3 discrimination in the hiring process. Intro 1894-A  
4 would reduce any potential bias built into the  
5 automated screening tools used by employers to decide  
6 what resume is afforded the attention of an  
7 interview, reducing the use of discriminatory metrics  
8 to determine what candidate will succeed at the job.  
9 Finally, the bill mandates notification to the  
10 applicant should and employer use any such employment  
11 decision tools. By encouraging decision and  
12 awareness that these tools are used in evaluations,  
13 it will inform more New Yorkers that need to be aware  
14 of this new frontier of employment and hiring. I  
15 want to thank Irene Byhovsky, counsel to the  
16 Committee on Technology for all of her efforts on the  
17 bill, my staff, Jason Hur, as well as Jeff Baker,  
18 Technology Committee Chair Robert Holden. I also  
19 want to thank Chief of Staff Jason Goldman and  
20 Speaker Corey Johnson. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON HOLDEN: Thank you Majority  
22 Leader Cumbo about. I will now ask the clerk to call  
23 the role.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: William Martin,  
25 Committee Clerk. Role call vote Committee on

1 COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY

7

2 Technology. Proposed Introduction 1894-A. Chair  
3 Holden?

4 CHAIRPERSON HOLDEN: I vote aye.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I vote aye.

7 Congratulations.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council member Lander  
10 votes aye. Council member Vallone?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Yeger?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Mr. Chairman, can I  
14 be excused to explain my vote? Mr. Chairman?

15 CHAIRPERSON HOLDEN: I'm sorry. Thank  
16 you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Okay. Thank you.

18 I would vote for this bill, but I have a problem with  
19 one piece of it. Not the content, not the purpose,  
20 not the intent, but, as I stated on the floor of this  
21 Council many times, I have a concern, as do many, I  
22 believe, about weaponizing the agencies of this city  
23 with their ticket books to run around the city  
24 terrorizing small businesses. So, if this bill had,  
25 as a first violation, a warning instead of at least a

1 COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY

8

2 \$500 penalty, I would be fine with it because the  
3 intent of the bill is right and righteous, but I  
4 can't vote in good conscience for a bill knowing that  
5 any agency in this city is going is simply take our  
6 laws and weaponize them as they have done and  
7 continue to do in an environment where the city has  
8 really turned its budget into not based on taxation,  
9 but based on how many penalties can they assess on  
10 the businesses of the city. So, for that reason them  
11 for that reason alone, I respectfully vote no on this  
12 bill. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of three in  
14 the affirmative, one in the negative, and no  
15 abstentions, the item has been adopted by the  
16 committee.

17 CHAIRPERSON HOLDEN: We are going to  
18 hold the vote open for five minutes. Thank you.  
19 Thank you, everyone.

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

21 [Background comments]

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Continuation roll call.  
23 Committee on Technology, proposed Introduction 1894-  
24 A. Council member Ulrich?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye.



2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Final vote  
3 on proposed Introduction 1894-A is four in the  
4 affirmative, one in the negative, and no abstentions.  
5 That is a full committee, Mr. Chair.

6 CHAIRPERSON HOLDEN: The hearing is now  
7 adjourned. Thank you.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date \_\_\_\_\_ December 6, 2021 \_\_\_\_\_