

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS 1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT
AND INVESTIGATIONS

----- X

March 21, 2022
Start: 1:33 p.m.
Recess: 4:47 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING - VIRTUAL ROOM 3

B E F O R E: Amanda Farías, Chairperson
Gale A. Brewer, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Jennifer Gutiérrez
Ari Kagan
Kevin C. Riley
Rafael Salamanca, Jr
Nantasha M. Williams
Marjorie Velázquez
Kalman Yeger
Farah Louis

A P P E A R A N C E S

Alex Paulenoff
Jackie Mallon
Faye Penn
Annie Garneva
Justin Collins
James Parrott
Marco Damiani
Teresa Macchio
Betty Ann Tamaisar
Eli Dvorkin
Carlyn Cowen
Helen Kogan
Dr. Darlene Williams
Bryan Lozano
Michael Roberts
Sheree Ferguson-Cousins
Valerie Payne
Michael Conway
Terrence Byerson
Bishop Mitchell Taylor
Evie Litwok
Rebecca Lurie
Melat Seyoum
Derick Bowers
Anh-Thu Nguyen
Merble Reagon
Sarah Hayes
Kate Krug
Joseph McDonald
Sinade Wadsworth
Lashima Goshine
Diana Caba
Larry Rothchild
Karen Imas
Janice Quarles
Michelle Saenz
Catherine Murcek
Gisele Castro

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

3

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Cloud recording
started.

SERGEANT LEONARDO: Good afternoon, and
welcome to today's remote New York City Council
Hearing for the Committee on Economic Development
joint with the Oversight and Investigation.

At this time, we ask that Council Members
and staff please turn on their video for verification
purposes. To minimize disruptions, please place cell
phones and electronic devices to vibrate or silent.

If you have testimony you wish to submit
for the record, you may do so via email at
testimony@council.nyc.gov. Once again, that is
testimony@council.nyc.gov.

We thank you for your cooperation.
Chairs, we are ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Good afternoon,
everyone. First and foremost, Faye, thank you so much
for your patience, and welcome to this joint hearing
of the Economic Development and Oversight and
Investigations Committees of the New York City
Council. Today is Monday, March 21, 2022. My name is
Amanda Farias, and I have the privilege of chairing
this hearing alongside my Colleague, Council Member

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

4

Gayle Brewer, Chair of the Oversight and
Investigations Committee.

Today, we are also joined by Council
Members Williams, Louis, Velazquez, Kagan, and Yeger.
Thank you to my Colleagues for joining today.

Today's hearing marks the first
opportunity this Council session for these Committees
to hear testimony from the Mayor's Office of
Workforce Development, an office created in 2014 with
the goal of transforming the City's workforce
development strategies by coordinating and improving
the City's many workforce development programs.

The focus of this hearing will be to
check in on how initiatives from the Mayor's Office
of Workforce Development, the Economic Development
Corporation, and the Department of Small Business
Services were progressing prior to the COVID-19
crisis, how those initiatives have adapted to the
challenging circumstances created by the pandemic as
well as what plans lie ahead for the City's various
workforce development programs.

In 2014, the Office of Workforce
Development's Career Pathways Plan outlined a shift
in the City's workforce development strategy from so-

called rapid attachment programs which presented limited opportunities for upward mobility to a system that envisioned city agencies partnering with major industries to ensure that job seekers would be trained in skills sought by employers. This way, job-training agencies could ensure that people who emerge from their programs are able to find quality work. The idea was that this type of system would improve the quality of the City's workforce while at the same time increasing accountability among city agencies that conduct job-training programs.

For the first 5 years of the original Career Pathways Framework Development, the City's economy set records in the number of jobs created and touted the lowest unemployment level since the 2008 financial crisis. In October 2019, the City's unemployment was a very healthy 3.6 percent. Unfortunately, the pandemic hit shortly thereafter and all that growth was wiped away in a matter of months. The year from October 2019 to October 2020 was devastating for the City's economy. Over 550,000 New Yorkers lost their jobs, and by June 2020 the City's unemployment rate hit a high 20.4 percent. Fortunately, as vaccines became widely available and

as the worst days of the pandemic thankfully appear to have receded, these numbers have gradually recovered. By January 2022, the unemployment rate had fallen to 7.3 percent, and the City's economy recovered over 288,000 jobs from the year.

Nonetheless, many New Yorkers are still struggling. In its recent update to the Career Pathways Plan, the Mayor's Office of Workforce Development outlined the impacts of the pandemic upon the City's workforce development infrastructure and how the City's low-income communities suffered the hardest, both from job losses and from the disease.

We hope to hear from the Office of Workforce Development on what it is doing to assist those hardest hit by the pandemic and whether the new administration is shifting its priorities to protect the City's most vulnerable residents at a time where we require all hands on deck to refocus recovery on prepandemic numbers.

In 2020, the Office of Workforce Development updated its work with the 5 industry partnerships contained in the Career Pathways Plan, healthcare, technology, construction, food and beverage, and industrial manufacturing. Each of these

industry partnership working groups developed its own plan to combat unemployment during the pandemic, and we would like to discuss how those have performed today as well.

Additionally, the Mayor's Office of Economic Opportunity developed a data portal in coordination with the Office of Workforce Development to serve as a workforce hub for City employment resources and programs. The portal was designed to serve as a resource for job seekers, but the data contained in the portal suggests that at least 55,000 out of 450,000 participants attended multiple workforce development agency programs since 2017. That means that over 12 percent of the time, the City is duplicating work for job seekers. We would like to unpack those numbers today and see what that means for agency spending.

Finally, the Economic Development Corporation and the Department of Small Business Services have rolled out their own initiatives, both stand-alone and in coordination with each other or the Office of Workforce Development to bring jobs back to the City. EDC has launched several programs since the pandemic hit including a 7.8 million dollar

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

8

cybersecurity bootcamp called Cyber NYC,
entrepreneurship programs in Queens, salary
negotiation workshops specifically for women, and
awarding manufacturing grants to local businesses in
the fashion industry. We on the Committee look
forward to hearing the progress of these programs and
any other programs EDC would like to share with the
Committees here today.

The Committees hope to hear from the
Administration about the progress that has been made
in adapting the Career Pathways framework to help the
City's economy emerge from the pandemic, how the new
Administration is focusing its efforts towards
improving the City's workforce, development
infrastructure, and what, if anything, the Council
can do in its legislative capacity to assist in those
efforts.

Before I turn it over to my Co-Chair, I'd
like to take a moment to thank the Staff on the
Economic Development Committee, Legislative Counsel
Alex Paulenoff, Senior Policy Analyst William
Hongach, and Principal Financial Analyst Aliya Ali
for all their hard work in putting this hearing
together.

With that said, I will now turn the floor over to my Co-Chair, Council Member Gale Brewer, for her opening remarks.

CHAIRPERSON GALE BREWER: Thank you very much, Chair Farias. You are doing a great job as Chair of this Committee and it's great to be with you.

I am Gale Brewer, Committee on Oversight and Investigations, and I think as you just heard we're going to look at some of the City's workforce development system. It is very fractured. I can say that there are 70 distinct programs and 21 different city agencies.

As an example, you've got BYCB with several different programs, particularly for young people but not exclusively, CUNY with their wonderful 7 community colleges that need to be involved with (INAUDIBLE) Parks Department, HRA with many different workforce programs, SBS, I know we'll hear from you soon. We know certainly Workforce One, but also they do construction. We have correction, libraries, disabilities which is often forgotten, incredibly important, DOE, probation, NYCHA, the Mayor's Office of Economic Opportunity, the Workforce Development

Board, and I just came from the National League of
Cities. I think generally around the country nobody
knows what these workforce boards do so I'm sure
there are people on who can talk about it, but it's a
challenge. I don't think it was mentioned in the
blueprint that the Mayor just put out, but I might've
missed it. Of course, there are many more, and
there's state and federal agencies all working on the
issue of what are we doing. Of course, I don't want
to forget EDC which is a big partner. There really
are 21 different places where you can enter the
workforce system. It's job training, it's placement,
it's literacy, ELL, college access, career
exploration, and many other topics. Obviously young
people. There's millions of dollars at stake. New
York alone spent 350 million dollars on workforce
development in FY21, and I think we can all argue
that it could be improved.

I have to say as somebody who's been
around for a long time as you know, I can think of
Barbara Chang, I can think of Amy Peterson, I can
think of Katie, all the people who've headed
workforce in the City of New York and we're still
challenged so my question to everybody, particularly

our beloved Joey Ortiz, who I think this is hysterical that he used to tell us what to do and now we can ask him to implement all his great ideas that he had for the last 20 years, and I love that he could possibly do, and we'll work with you, but the question is how are you as an administration and how are we going to be different to make it work. I think you heard before that the employment is 7.6 percent is double the national rate. We know that the country as a whole has recovered a lot of jobs that it lost during the pandemic, maybe 90 percent. We've recovered only 70 percent. There's lots of reason for that, but we know that New York has the skills and resource needed to have a great city, but we can't do it without a workforce. Our workforce is what sets us apart.

So I talked about the 70 different programs, there's not a lot of coordination. There's no single overarching vision so it really is hard for people seeking jobs to navigate, and, as you heard earlier, the data is not what it should be. There's lots of gaps in the services. The data, as somebody who passed the Open Data Bill and feels very strongly about it, the outcomes of workforce development

programs are not available in a way that is easy for us to understand and to be able to compare different programs. I think you know that. Are we getting our investment?

I read the blueprint. I think the Mayor produced it at Hunt's Point, which was a good place to do it, but I think that, in my opinion, it was obviously well-intentioned and well-read, but there are an awful lot of task forces. I lost track. Almost every single aspect of what we're going to do had a task force attached to it. I have to say I would get rid of some of the task forces and actually do some of the implementation. There's just lots of other aspects that I hope we discuss.

One of the issues is just city government. We're one of the largest employers in the City of New York. How are we working to make sure that people get opportunity and that people who wouldn't normally come to be part of the City get a job and obviously many agencies are looking for employees as we speak.

I hope we talk about talent, not just workforce, because if we talk about coordinating workforce, I fear we're just going to be coordinating

the 21 agencies and not talking about how we can match, which is a thing that Jonathan Boles (phonetic) has talked about for the last, I don't know, 30 years, how do you match the person who needs a job with the industry that needs the person.

Of course, there's the whole issue of public/private, which has been an ongoing discussion. Even Mayor Bloomberg did not figure that out so how do we actually make sure that the public/private relationship works.

Those are some of the overall concepts, and I certainly want to thank the Staff, Senior Policy Analyst Noah Meixler, Senior Counsel CJ Murray, Senior Financial Analyst Jack Kern, and my office, Shula Puder, Leo Bullaro, and Eddie Amador.

With that, I'll turn it back to you, and we will continue the hearing. I do apologize. I had technical problems and I know SBS had some technical problems also so without further ado, I'll turn it over to the Sergeant and continue the hearing. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Chair. My name is Alex Paulenoff, and I'm going to be moderating the

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

14

hearing today. I am Counsel to the New York City
Council's Committee on Economic Development.

Before we begin, I want to remind
everyone that you will be on mute until you are
recognized to speak, at which time you will be
unmuted by the Zoom host. If you mute yourself after
you've been unmuted, you will need to be unmuted
again by the host so please be aware that there could
be a delay in muting and unmuting so just please be
patient.

The first panelists to give testimony
today will be the First Deputy Commissioner of the
Department of Small Business Services Jackie Mallon,
SBS's Deputy Commissioner for Workforce Development
Lucinda Glover, and the New York City Economic
Development Corporation's Executive Vice President
for Initiatives Faye Penn will be available for
questioning as well. I will call on you each shortly
when it is time to begin your testimony.

During this hearing, if Council Members
would like to ask a question of the Administration or
of a specific panelist, please use the Zoom raise
hand function, and I will call on you in order. We
will be limiting the first round of Council Member

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

15

questions to 3 minutes, which includes the time it
takes to answer those questions.

Before we begin testimony, I will
administer the oath. To all members of the
Administration who will be offering testimony or will
be available for questioning, please raise your right
hands now. I will call on each of you individually
for a response. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
whole truth, and nothing but the truth before this
Committee today and to respond honestly to Council
Member questions.

First, Deputy Commissioner Mallon.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I do.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Deputy Commissioner
Glover.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GLOVER: I do.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Executive Vice President
Penn.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT PENN: I do.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you. First Deputy
Commissioner Mallon, you may begin when you're ready.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Thank you
very much. Good afternoon, Chairs Farias and Brewer

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

16

and Members of the Committee on Economic Development
and Oversight and Investigations.

My name is Jackie Mallon, and I'm the
First Deputy Commissioner of the New York City
Department of Small Business Services. From SBS, I am
joined by Deputy Commissioner Lucinda Glover, from
the New York City Economic Development Corporation
Executive Vice President for Initiatives Faye Penn.

I am pleased to testify today on the
City's workforce development programs through the
pandemic and on its plan for the future. At SBS, we
aim to unlock economic potential and create economic
security for all New Yorkers by connecting them to
good jobs, creating stronger businesses, and building
vibrant neighborhoods across the 5 boroughs.

SBS's Workforce Development Division is
focused on equitable and quality employment and
training services leading to economic self-
sufficiency and mobility for New York City's diverse
communities. We work with industry partners to
identify and develop high-quality training delivered
directly to job seekers so they can build the skills
needed for in-demand jobs. The Division also supports
businesses in New York City by offering training

opportunities for new and current employees and by
sourcing candidates for job openings.

SBS operates 18 Workforce One career
centers across the City connecting job seekers with
employment opportunities, providing industry-informed
trainings, and offering a variety of candidate
development services such as resume development,
interview preparation, and job search workshops.

From the outset of the pandemic, SBS
immediately adapted the Workforce One career center
services and training programs to an online model.
Our virtual Workforce One Career Center system was
launched less than 2 weeks after the first confirmed
case of COVID-19 in New York City.

Like many agencies, SBS had to shift its
work to fight the pandemic directly. Efforts focused
on connecting workers to fill critical staffing needs
in nursing homes, community hospitals, and other
essential service providers like grocery stores.

SBS also led recruitment and training for
the Vaccine for All (INAUDIBLE) which connected
employed people in their neighborhoods to help the
vaccination effort on a local level, and we launched

the resource Navigator Training Program to train the
New York City Test and Trace Corps.

As nonessential businesses were forced to
shutter, many New Yorkers found themselves without
jobs either temporarily or long-term. When businesses
started reopening and hiring additional staff, SBS
hosted and participated in virtual hiring events and
delivered career guidance and interview prep support
to job seekers. We also launched the Career Discovery
Program to help job seekers explore options and get
free training in new fields. With Hospitality Hire,
SBS connected workers to the hospitality industry
when challenges arose from worker shortages. SBS
began a 28-week immersive training program called
Future Code for New Yorkers with no previous
professional web development experience to help them
enter a career in tech.

Overall, during the pandemic, SBS served
over 130,000 people, connected 34,000 people to jobs,
and trained over 11,000 New Yorkers, giving them new
skills to advance their careers.

As we enter a new phase of the pandemic,
SBS continues to pivot toward the future and part of
that pivot means keeping what worked. Our virtual

workforce centers are now preferred by many of our job seekers, giving them more flexibility to meet their needs. These new virtual services will be a core part of our work going forward, and, just over a week ago, the Mayor laid out a bold plan to return the City to prepandemic employment levels with a focus on equity and inclusivity to provide opportunity to every New Yorker. Rebuild, Renew, Reinvent: A Blueprint for New York City's Economic Recovery lays out 5 pillars with more than 70 concrete initiatives to create opportunities, connect New Yorkers seeing work, and help speed the recovery.

Some key workforce items from the plan and SBS portfolio include expanding our pilot program that offers modest stipends to low income and traditionally underserved participants in select occupational trainings, partnering with employers in the tech sector to meet their growing workforce needs with local diverse talents, upscaling New Yorkers for in-demand roles in the healthcare sector including our Nurse Residency Program and our programs that help foreign-trained nurses achieve New York State credentials, and bringing financial empowerment mobile units to neighborhoods across the 5 boroughs

offering onsite assistance including free tax prep,
financial counseling, and job training enrollment.

Some of the items in EDC's portfolio
include expanding EDC's Business Development Office,
which serves a single point of contact to city
government and helps businesses grow and prosper.
This office has already created or retained about
3,700 jobs since its launch in January 2020.

Doubling down on life science initiatives
with a billion dollar investment to magnify New York
City's impact on the global life sciences community
bringing more life science businesses to New York
City and ensuring that New York City's growth
benefits local New Yorkers.

Jumpstarting our local green economy,
leading with offshore wind, and building out EDC's
work at the South Brooklyn Marine Terminal which will
bring 13,000 jobs.

Working with local designs and
manufacturing to develop an open restaurant kit of
parts to drive local manufacturing and ease the
transition for small restaurants to the permanent
outdoor dining program.

Working with the tech industry on
diversity in the sector and tech for good.

Supporting and diversifying the film and
creative sectors including through work at the main
New York campus at Bush Terminal with a 500,000
dollar square foot film production studio plus
workforce commitments by Steiner Studios and with a
new 221,000 square foot garment manufacturing hub and
expanding business outreach and upgrading business
technology with the Small Business Resource Network
which has already engaged with 27,700 businesses and
built 242 websites.

At SBS and EDC, we are committed to
fulfilling Mayor Adams' clear and bold agenda to
ensure the city's future economy is built on equity
and inclusivity. We know that working closely with
the City Council is critical to achieving this shared
goal and together we can rebuild, renew, and reinvent
New York City.

I look forward to our continued
partnership and thank you for your time today. We
welcome any questions that you may have.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

22

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, First Deputy
Commissioner Mallon. I will now turn it over to
questions from the Chairs.

Panelists from the Administration, please
if possible stay unmuted during this question and
answer period and a reminder to both Chairs Farias
and Brewer that you will be in control of muting and
unmuting yourselves during this period.

Chairs, feel free to begin when ready.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Chair Farias, go
ahead.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you.

Regretfully, the Mayor's Office of Workforce
Development isn't present today to join us and
discuss the plan, successes, challenges, and the
future planning of our City (INAUDIBLE) am grateful
to have each of you here today from Small Business
Services and EDC so let's just right in.

Workforce Development's founding
document, the Career Pathways Program that I
mentioned earlier in my opening, originally called
for establishing industry partnerships in 6 sectors
of the economy. Like I said, tech, healthcare, food
service, accommodation, construction, retail,

industrial manufacturing. Has Workforce Development established effective industry partnerships in all 6 sectors, and, if not, which sectors do we think or we feel post-pandemic still need industry partners.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Thank you for the question. Yes, you are correct. Tech, healthcare, manufacturing industrial, food service, and construction, we have established effective industry partnerships. I can give you some examples of what we consider successes.

In tech, we've trained over 400 folks a year for jobs in tech as a result of models that were built by the Tech Talent pipeline (INAUDIBLE) Council and those jobs are having people earn over 75, 80,000 dollars a year which is a great success. We also did the CUNY 2x Initiative working with the CUNY system to double the number of computer science graduates into jobs, also those same high-paying jobs.

In healthcare, we launched the Nurse Residency program which served over 2,800 new graduate nurses and helped them to both attach to a job and stay on the job which, timing, we were incredibly lucky with that because we had started it

up before the pandemic and it was really crucial
during the pandemic.

In food service, we've launched a few
apprenticeship programs focusing on trying to fill
the gap in terms of line cooks.

In industrial manufacturing prior to the
pandemic we had the CNC machinist apprenticeship and
currently now working advanced manufacturing.

I guess what I'm saying is we found it be
very effective to work with industry to figure out
where the jobs are in terms of the demand, have them
work with us to design the training models, and it's
a practice we will continue.

One of the things that you said, moving
forward, what might be missing. Part of what we have
been thinking about in terms of construction is maybe
expanding to cover climate change and resiliency
efforts and stuff like that. Not quite there yet, but
we're thinking about that.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Awesome. By any
chance, do we have a percentage or an idea of how
many of these jobs are unionized employment versus
just like an apprenticeship model or using employer
curriculum or understanding for the workplace.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: A lot of our focus for construction is on the trades, the unionized trades, and we have invested in pre-apprenticeship and that's union recognized, that we have been successful at connecting people to those jobs.

If you're asking like what percentage of the portfolio of all the things I just said, it's probably a smaller percentage because the other industries are not so unionized although nurses are also unionized, but you know what, I can come back to you probably with more specific number. Trying to do that off the top of my head is maybe not the best way.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Yeah. I mean, there's always the union in any sector so I'd be interested in hearing that number.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: No, it's a great question.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: In terms of like looking at where we are with the pandemic and tourism, would Workforce Development be open to establishing like a seventh partnership in the tourism industry since it employs over 400,000 New

Yorkers and generates upwards of 70 billion dollars
of economic activity each year?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Absolutely
open to looking at anything that works and would help
for sure.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Great. The Mayor's
Office of Economic Opportunity launched a citywide
data platform in 2017 to analyze workforce program
services and outcome data from various city agencies
including yours. It appears that 5 city agencies,
DPR, DYCD, HRA, NYCHA, and SBS currently report data
into that system. As I mentioned, according to the
portal over 55,000 people over 450,000 have
participated in a workforce development at more than
one of these agencies. Do you consider that a good
number, and does this mean that work is being
duplicated in at least 55,000 cases?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I'll be
honest with you. You're a little more familiar with
that data than I am. No, on the surface it doesn't
sound like a good number, and I think you said
specifically they're participating in workforce
programs themselves, because I can say that a lot of
our customers receive public benefits, a good portion

of them, so they're definitely being served by multiple agencies for sure. I honestly don't think have enough on the numbers to give you a better answer.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay. Yeah, my concern around that is having experience working in apprenticeship models and in workforce development in the past, more times than not we have recurring folks and I guess for me it's about what do numbers around retention look like, how are we (INAUDIBLE) people just doing the same types of trainings over were not actually being able to be placed. Finding that out for me would be great just so we can start looking at our actual data.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Supplemental to that is, how many more programs and agencies do you expect to eventually input data into the system because that definitely coordinates with how much we overlap there is or repetitiveness of training or workshops.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: For sure. My understanding of the vision is that all agencies over time will be part of the system, but I don't actually

have the latest and greatest status on that. I'm
sorry.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay. Great. Thank
you. Don't worry about apologizing. I just want to
acknowledge my Colleague, Council Member Salamanca,
has joined us into the hearing today.

Just want to stick on interagency
coordination. According to the Invest in Skills NYC
Coalition, there are at least, as mentioned by Co-
Chair Gale Brewer, at 75 different workforce
development programs in the City run by 21 different
agencies. Who's ultimately responsible for overseeing
the strategic direction of all of these programs.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I think it's
a combination of the Mayor's Office for Workforce
Development on the adult side and the Mayor's Office
of Youth Employment I think it's called on the youth
side.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay, and do we know
what steps the Administration has taken to ensure
that the different agencies communicate, collaborate
on workforce development issues (INAUDIBLE)

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I think
there's a couple of things in the Blueprint that sort

of point to increased coordination. I know, Council Member Brewer, you mentioned you don't like task force, but there's the Future of Workers task force which the intention is to bring public and private partners together to sort of look at the end-to-end challenges meaning K through adult, find the gaps, figure out what needs to be in the short-term, in the long-term, and then there's a portal that will be established that will allow job seekers to get on, put their profile in, get their skills assessed, and then help them navigate to the right solution for them. It will also be available to, as I understand it, to employers so they can find talent. Through those efforts, they'll be more coordination for sure.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: From your experience, have you seen whether like in the past or if there's an administrative plan to collaborate with partners at the state and federal levels to approach more coordination (INAUDIBLE)

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Sure, sure. For example, we are with the Department of Labor, I think, every Friday actually, and they are (INAUDIBLE) located at our Careers Center sites. I want to say also, there's a lot of collaboration

among us as well. We are working really closely with EDC to ensure that we're using our strengths in the best way that we can and complementing theirs but in every case where possible, we try to source candidates from sister agencies like NYCHA and DYCD and HRA so that we are making our training offerings available to everyone that needs them. I hear you on the data, but there is maybe more collaboration than is apparent.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay. Great. Thank you. I want to acknowledge Council Member Riley for joining us.

Measuring success in workforce development and in job training is how we get the best outcomes, right? From my experience, that's how I was able to do lower cost per participant, really figuring out the hours to providing and training for the highest retention and so on. Without adequate metrics and data analysis, it's difficult to systematically compare different workforce development programs and the success of the system as a whole. Under the de Blasio administration, workforce development and the Mayor's Office of Economic Opportunity developed 13 common metrics for

measuring the outcomes of workforce development programs. These metrics include standardized definitions of key terms like full-time job placement, part-time job placement, and academic enrollment. Could you please describe how the 13 measures were settled and which programs currently utilize those metrics?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Can I describe what? How they were what?

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Can you describe how they were settled on, the 13 measures?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I probably cannot because as you said it was an effort led by the Center for Economic Opportunity. I think I can tell you what I think the intent was. It was just as you said, to try to normalize the results from various programs and recognize that sometimes, the ultimate thing is a person gets a job, right, and a good paying job. That's the ultimate success, but sometimes there are steps before that are also milestones, and I think that rather than make it like I did (INAUDIBLE) training and I got a job, boom, it's done. They I think incorporated other milestones so that we can get a clear picture of the path by

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH 32
2 COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

3 which somebody would need to travel in order to get
4 to that end goal. Does that make sense?

5 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Yes.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Okay.

7 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you for that.
8 It's clearly something I'll have to follow up
9 (INAUDIBLE)

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Well, you
11 know your workforce homework. I can tell.

12 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: I worked in it for a
13 while so I'd like to think I know a little bit.
14 Obviously, there's a lot more experts on this
15 hearing.

16 I guess my followups to that are do you
17 think there are any additional programs that should
18 adopt the metrics going forward and, if you can, make
19 any comment as to how do you see the Administration's
20 plan to utilize performance data to evaluate the
21 different programs and inform workforce development
22 investment strategies going forward?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I don't think
24 I'll be able to comment on additional programs. I can
25 so for SBS, I mean we are pretty laser focused on the
outcome is you got into the job you were trained for

and you earn the salary that we were aiming for. I think we don't have any plans to move away from that, and I imagine that others do it the same way, others that invest in the same kinds of investments. I think in terms of the workforce development strategies laid out in the Blueprint, there may be different measures as you look at each individual thing. Faye, if you have anything you want to add to that in terms of your guys' approach.

FAYE PENN: I think everything you said made sense, Jackie, and thank you for the question, Chair Farias.

I think the focus for this administration is really on getting good jobs sustainably that offer benefits that offer a pathway to growth, in addition to getting a job that you have a future ahead of you, and that's something that we'll be looking at.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Great. Thank you. Either one of you can comment if you'd like. What steps is the administration taking to ensure that training programs available through Workforce Development System respond to the shifting needs of the labor market?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Again, we are going to leverage and extend our approach in terms of industry partnerships, and we'll continue to take our lead in terms of the demand that they are raising for us and continue to do that. I don't know, Faye, if you want to add anything?

FAYE PENN: I want to talk a little bit about our sector-driven approach to workforce where we look at expanding and emerging sectors in New York City and sectors that offer a lot of job opportunity at a variety of levels. Two examples of that would include life science and offshore wind, where we're deeply invested in both industries. One of the reasons why these industries are so attracted to us is that there are jobs for people who don't have college degrees, good jobs for people who don't have college degrees, and that is a really important piece as we think about who can access the opportunities. It's not enough to grow industries and to create jobs. The jobs have to be available to New Yorkers in all communities and at all levels, and both of those are examples of industries that will help power our equitable recovery by ensuring opportunity at all levels.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you for that response. I'm just kind of staying on that. What are some tools that the EDC uses to determine which neighborhoods and populations should be prioritized when developing their workforce development programs?

FAYE PENN: It depends. We have assets at EDC that we operate on behalf of the City. To some extent, it's determined by those assets and where they are. An example of how we're very much involving the community in a project is, again, I'm going to go back to offshore wind which is 190 million dollar investment in growing, manufacturing, and R and D and workforce primarily out of the South Brooklyn Marine Terminal and possibly other areas. We have a 5 million dollar commitment from Equinor, who is our leaseholder at South Brooklyn Marine Terminal, to make sure that the job growth, the opportunities are equitably distributed to the surrounding neighborhood, to environmental justice communities, and a real focus on M/WBEs, and so that's one example of that.

We also have a program where, I think this is across the City, called Hire NYC, which requires developers to make sure that they tap local

talent streams, and we provide resources to help them do so. This is a partnership with SBS and other agencies to make sure that folks in surrounding communities participate in all of the economic opportunities associated with our projects.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: That's great. In terms of equity or like equitably distributed resources for workforce development and job training, what does planning look like in terms of that? Whenever I think of a program or I think of a new development coming or a new initiative, a lot of times, at least for communities like mine, I would need a long lead-up to make sure there's local hire, to make sure that people have the right training and credentials to go into those jobs or to go into those fields so what does that look like for the EDC and utilizing their assets and developing these initiatives and rollouts?

FAYE PENN: I know I'm going to be talking a lot about offshore wind, but I feel like it's a really great example of the way that we center equity in our work and so we are currently developing those partnerships with Workforce One, CUNY, SUNY, UPROSE, Department of Education, the New York City Harbor

School, organizations like Opportunities for Better Tomorrow, Nontraditional Employment for Women, Pathways to Apprenticeship and others. I was at a workforce gathering with folks across academia and business and industry and nonprofit CBOs to try to figure out what are the levers and the tools, who needs to be at the table to figure out how to make our workforce opportunities in the offshore wind project as equitable as possible. One of our co-chairs of our Advisory Council in offshore wind is Elizabeth Yeampierre, who leads UPROSE, a community organization in Sunset Park, and we are just in constant conversation with our community to make sure that when these jobs become available that the community will be ready.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Great. Thank you for that response. I have a couple more questions and then I'll yield my time to my Co-Chair. The last thing for EDC, what role will EDC play in implementing the vision laid out by the Mayor's Blueprint, if any?

FAYE PENN: That's a great question. As you know, the Blueprint was just released. Over the next few weeks, we're going to be huddling with our

Deputy Mayor and her team and I'm sure SBS and other agencies in figuring out exactly where we are going to be plugging in, but I can tell you for sure that business development, business attraction, that's a key priority for EDC. We're really expanding our business development efforts to make sure that not only do we keep companies that are here here and growing but also that we attract new ones. Jackie talked about how since 2021 we've been able to retain 3,700 jobs in New York City, and that is just going to continue deepening and growing. Offshore wind is really part of green economy, right, a broader opportunity around green technologies which would focus to some extent on building retrofits, building decarbonization, there's a whole workforce effort there to make sure that as New York City's buildings reach climate goals and decarbonization goals that there's a workforce able to provide those services and trained. We are continuing to engage with the Small Business Resource Network, which was a partnership with New York City, the 5 Chambers of Commerce, the Peterson Foundation, and EDC, which has helped 28,000 small businesses with a variety of recovery resources including digital transformation,

and we'll continue our work around offshore, around life sciences, and other areas that we're already active in.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Great. Thank you. My last 2 questions are more pertaining (INAUDIBLE) My first one is around stipends for low-income program participants. According to the Blueprint, the Administration plans to expand stipends to low-income New Yorkers participating in certain workforce development programs. What are the eligibility criteria for these stipends under the existing program, how large are the stipends currently, what exactly the admin plan to expand the stipend program, and then what kind of stipends are they? Are they financial, childcare, housing, etc.?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Thank you for the question. This is one of my personal favorite parts of the Blueprint just for the record.

The current pilot that we're doing is a pilot with about, I want to say 300 or 400 participants, and we're doing like a random control trial because we had been trying to prove that stipends will result in more people connecting to jobs at the end. As you know, maybe you don't know

'cause I didn't say it but I'll say it now, we have found that many of our successful trainings are immersive and so a lot of people aren't able to participate because they have to work or they have other responsibilities and whatnot so providing them with a stipend removes that barrier, and so we're very excited to see that we're going to be able to expand that.

The current stipends are, I want to say, and we'll get back to you with an exact, but I feel like they're 300 or 400 dollars a week, it's cash that is provided. In addition, most of our programs include transportation and some food as well depending on the program. The plan for expansion at this point is to expand, but we still have some work to do in terms of working out the details and whatnot, but it's from my perspective really an exciting initiative.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you. With an unsolicited recommendation, from what I've found working in workforce if we're going to answer for the lack of women and lack of representation of women in a lot of these fields, especially like construction or any of the other sectors, childcare...

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH 41
2 COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: 100 percent.

4 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Monetary stipends is
5 really important so for an unsolicited
6 recommendation.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I appreciate
8 that. Both of those things are part of the plan,
9 expanding access to childcare and financial stipends
10 so we are excited.

11 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Great. Thank you.

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: One of the proposals
14 in the Blueprint is to expand investments in bridge
15 programs such as the apprenticeship programs, high
16 school equivalency programs, and English programs for
17 speakers of other languages. How much does the City
18 currently spend on these kind of programs and what
19 additional resources does the Administration plan to
20 provide to these kinds of programs going forward?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I do not have
22 the number citywide for you. I don't even think I
23 have it for us. We have at one time or another ran
24 about 7 to 9 what people characterize as bridge
25 programs. I could definitely get back to you with our
investments. In terms of expanding, it's about

meeting people where they are, right, so all the things that you just said. I sort of like to think of not as a bridge and more as like a longer program that meets people where they are and integrates things contextualized English, numeracy where that makes sense, all the things, and so we're working through the budgeting process with OMB and City help but we're pretty confident that we're going to do great things here. We're also very excited about this.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Great. Thank you so much for your response. I yield my time now and hand it over to Co-Chair, Council Member Gale Brewer.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Thank you very much. I have a few overall questions because if we're going to focus on the Blueprint as we're calling it, just to say about the task forces because I think it's good to have the future of workers, but you've got one on commercial corridors, you've got one on public realm, you've got one about industry, you've got one on small business which I think already exists, you've got one on street vendors which I think already exists, you've got a green economy one, and then you have a tech one which might already exist

under (INAUDIBLE) I don't know, and there's probably others that I missed, then there's one on inefficiency in agencies. Those are all the task forces in the Blueprint. That's too many. My question is if it's going to just focus on the future of workers, that one might make some sense, but I understand you're saying that in the future, between EDC and SBS, you're going to sit down and figure it all out, but you also have a couple of Mayors, Deputy Mayors, who one has youth, I think Sheena Wright has youth, I believe that it is Maria Torres-Springer who has the other workforce because that's her background. Even that is a little bit dysfunctional. I guess I want to know a little bit more from your point of view how do you plan to reimagine the system? You cannot have 21 agencies doing this, and I work with Ulysses (phonetic) all the time at 125th Street, I love Ulysses in terms of Workforce One, but the issue is it doesn't necessarily include what CUNY needs to be doing or what the CTEs at DOE need a whole lot of help. I think that what EDC does with life sciences, I know that program well, it's great, but you need to do it with all the other kinds of programs because you cannot just tell somebody to go

get a job in healthcare. They need tender loving care for lack of a better word. They need stipends. They need a whole series of wraparound support services that, to be honest with you, if you don't have something like what EDC is doing with life sciences where you are getting people into those jobs who wouldn't normally be in those jobs, who knows who all these smaller agencies are that are doing life sciences. It's only 10 people in the company so how are you going to know coming out of CUNY that this wonderful company is in a community that you can join. Well, you get the point, how are you going to, between the 2 of you, Jackie and Faye, going to push to get with Joey, with the Deputy Mayors to make it a real workforce system that is reimaged. I have what de Blasio did. I mean it's pathetic. Just as an example in terms of his report, I knew that report, and there were even in life sciences not that many people got the job and future worth, whatever the hell that is, nobody got a job, at block chain center nobody got a job, in CUNY tech nobody got a job so that was a report a while ago so how are we going to do things differently? I'd love to hear it. Thank you very much. Just to start.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: You are very welcome and thank you for the question. As I said, a couple of things. SBS and EDC do work very collaboratively and, for an example, have done so and will do so moving forward as well. We both invest in tech training as an example, right, but our investments are distinct. We did that purposefully because we didn't want to duplicate, and we wanted to leverage each other's strengths and whatnot. Our investments are all around web development and data analysis and so forth, EDC is focused on cyber. We will continue to do that. You asked the question what will we do. In addition to what I said, I think the vision is, task forces are a way of getting input, right, and that's a good thing, and so the Future of Workers task force, as I understand it, is intended to bring the public/private shareholders together and uncover what is needed in the short term, what is needed in the long term, and come out with a K to adult plan on how to organized things. As I said earlier, in addition, a portal for New Yorkers, a talent portal to come on, put your profile in, get your skills in there, get assessed, will help more coordination because it'll put you on a path to what

is a good match for you and will also be open to employers. I don't know if you want to add anything, Faye.

FAYE PENN: As Jackie said, we will work together and we will continue to do so. I also just want to emphasize the value of talking to industry, to understand how to, I know you don't love the task force, Chair Brewer, but it is really important. When we talk about training people for any number of roles, making sure that industry is at the table to make sure we fully understand their needs so that when we talk about tech training or any other type of training that people are being trained in very specific ways that enable them to get a job in these growing sectors where there's a lot of opportunity.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: I mean, like what you do with life sciences, are you planning to do something where people do get, if needed, stipends or people do get support? Are you going to do that at EDC with other industries where you need to bring in students like from CUNY? Is that something that you're planning?

FAYE PENN: We'll evaluate that idea for other industries. Our new president just started last

week, and we are having all kinds of updates and briefings and that's an idea that we will be surfacing as sharpen our plan going forward.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: But just to be clear, we do that in most of our programs today at SBS.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: I know, but you're 2 agencies out of the 21...

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: (INAUDIBLE) trying to look at this as a more systemic, and I understand that's Joey's problem and somebody else's problem and it's not yours, but you guys have been around for a while and I know sometimes people are afraid to make suggestions and be bold, but we are trying to be bold because I do think as hard as you work there's just, and you'll hear from the many people who are testifying today, there just needs to be a bolder response to getting us back but also to do it differently, to not be the same, and obviously I'm a big CUNY supporter. Do you have any suggestions? I know you may not work with CUNY, I don't know if you work with CUNY.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: We work a lot
with CUNY.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: All right,
(INAUDIBLE) the 7 community colleges, they need to
get funding to be able to have the, they can't get
any kind of support now, maybe from the state's
budget, but right now if you're taking a course to
get a certification, you're not matriculating, you
get no money, you have to pay for it yourself, and
that is the plumber, the electrician, the healthcare
worker, and so on so are you thinking about that? Why
hasn't that happened in the past? CUNY is the jewel
to make workforce possible in the City of New York so
what are you doing with CUNY?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I 100 percent
agree with you. The majority of our investments in
training are with CUNY. I don't know if you heard me
a little bit earlier..

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: I heard you.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: On CUNY 2x,
it was a 20 million dollar investment, it involved 7
colleges aiming at doubling the number of computer
science students into tech jobs.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: I got that. That's different than certifications, which is what I'm talking about though.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Well, yeah, that's one part. Like I said, separate and distinct, we work with many community colleges to do training in healthcare, in transportation, in food service, like it's the majority partner, multiple schools.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: (INAUDIBLE) on that one. I want the one that I just described. You can do yours, but you have to think bigger, you have to think about there's just so many folks out there and we need plumbers, electricians, technology and so on. We need these people, and nobody in the City is saying this is how we're going to get there. You guys are doing great, but you're not thinking big enough. Maybe that's not your job. I got it. It's a big problem.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I don't think I understand your question. I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Okay. We need plumbers, we need electricians, we need people in addition to the suggestions that you have made. When they go to CUNY, you have to pay to get that

certification. You cannot get any kind of government
unless the state perhaps comes up with it. Kathy
Hochul has suggested it so every single one of the 7
community colleges would like that kind of funding so
that they could pay for the students' tuition to go
to certification classes. These are not matriculated
so...

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I understand.
Continuing, I gotcha.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Okay, but that has to
happen. That has to be part of your task force. That
would make a huge difference in people getting jobs.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I hear you.
Okay. I look forward to working on that.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: I don't think you
need a lot of task force discussion because between
Joey and the groups, this is all laid out. It just
needs funding, and it does need coordination. That's
what I think we're trying to say. The other thing is
we talked a little bit about the talent portal. I was
wondering if you have some suggestions as to how it
actually could be used, would somebody be able to go
to SBS, EDC, CUNY, DOE, CTE, and so on and be able to
access it? Is that the concept? 24 hours a day, 7

days a week? Virginia does that so I'm just wondering
how would it look to you?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: As I
understand it, as a job seeker you would get your
profile set up in there, you would get your skills
assessed and then the system itself would help you
navigate based on your skills, your interests,
whatever, whatever your next thing would be, a
training, a direct connect to a job, whatever the
case may be. That's how I understand it.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: And you could go
through a nonprofit as well as a city agency? You
could do it anywhere?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: That's how I
understand it.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Okay. Do you know how
long it would take or how much it would cost to build
it?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I do not.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Okay. Could somebody
get back to us with that information?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: For sure.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Okay. Then the issue
of stipends, we talked about that earlier. That's an

excellent idea. Would it be across, you've got
childcare, you've got housing, you've got different
kinds of stipends because without all of the above
we're not going to be able to work as we know and
women are out of the workplace more than generally so
what's the list? I know that you have some that you
mentioned that you're already talking about in terms
of the (INAUDIBLE) programs. Example, I believe in
the last couple of months the ELL classes are 200 or
400 percent of capacity just to give you an example.
Just give us an example of some of the bridge
programs that you think should be funded, and should
they be 24 hours a day for childcare, etc.? What's
your big goal and dream for bridge programs?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: From my
perspective, I think I said this earlier. I think of
not so much a bridge program as much as a longer
training that meets somebody where they are, and so
for example we do foreign-born nursing training so
that they can get to the (INAUDIBLE) and so embedded
in that is contextualized English so that folks who
are further away who in the past couldn't succeed and
couldn't get into the training, we've included that.

1 In our tech training, we recently
2
3 launched Future Code. It's modeled after a
4 traditional boot camp, but it's a longer training
5 because it accommodates people who haven't had the
6 exposure to tech or who haven't any practical
7 experience which is required oftentimes to get into a
8 boot camp, etc.

9 We've done bridges, or again elongated
10 trainings that include bridge components, in
11 bilingual medical assistants. To me, any training
12 that we have developed with industry that we know is
13 reflective of an in-demand job and is successful is
14 connecting people to those better careers, once we've
15 figured out how to do that (INAUDIBLE) better add in
16 a bridge, what people call a bridge, but like move it
17 back and make sure it accommodates people who are all
18 but for a fundamental things, it could represent a
19 path to them. I hope that makes sense.

20 CHAIRPERSON BREWER: It does. Another
21 Deputy Mayor so it's back to my problem of you've got
22 to figure out this coordination. Maybe that's what
23 your task force is going to do. We'll see.

24 In terms of people with disabilities, I
25 guess this is mostly for EDC. What steps has EDC

taken, if any, to help the City's workforce development agencies better prepare individuals with disabilities for tech jobs because it's a natural to have people with disabilities work in technology. Also, I believe that the federal government has a 7 percent goal, if not mandated, and I don't know if it is mandated, for persons with disabilities to get jobs with city contractors and subcontractors. I don't think the City is there. I don't even know if we have a goal so if you could talk about individuals with disabilities.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Were you accidentally remuted from your last part?

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Asking EDC.

FAYE PENN: Thank you, Chair Brewer. This is a great question. We agree the training for those with disabilities is key, and we are going to get back to you to discuss any disability focused programs at EDC.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay. Even how they work in the City workforce.

Then my last question, because I know people want to talk, I could go on much too long. The City of New York has a big workforce. I don't know if

1 it comes under DCAS, it comes under other agencies,
2 but I have not heard of an agency that doesn't need
3 staff, all kinds of staff, so what are we doing, I
4 don't know if it's in SBS, I don't know if it's in
5 EDC, what are we doing as a city to recruit for these
6 positions. Of course, the agency's heads are told I
7 don't want to work full-time. It's hard. This
8 pandemic has created havoc, and then of course the
9 private sector says oh you can work part-time, no
10 problem. You're caught in between. I got it because I
11 hear about it all day. I hear it from your
12 Commissioners and I hear from outside, 'cause I hear
13 everything. Now my question is, just generally
14 though, how are we recruiting for city agencies
15 sometimes having specialized needs? Who's in charge
16 of that and who's doing it?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I think it's
19 a combination of the individual agencies and DCAS as
20 well.

21 CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Because it's not
22 working. That's why I'm concerned.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: It's a hard
24 market. You are right, but it's getting better.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: From your mouth to
God's ear because I can tell you right now I get
complaints from Commissioners who are not able to
recruit so I'm just saying we need to do better.
Again, maybe it's different kinds of offerings,
there's lots of situations, but as we're out there
recruiting people for different positions we have to
not forget about the City of New York.

All right, I'll stop there. Now, I guess
we go back to the moderator. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Chair Brewer.
I'm going to turn it back to Chair Farias for
additional questions.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Sorry. Once we have a
lot of back and forth, more questions come to the
brain. Thank you, Chair Brewer.

Just a couple of followups for some of
the items that she asked. How are we utilizing our
career and technical education schools, the data that
we're collecting, and the dearth of employment that
we're seeing citywide to continue programs for job
training, and this initially came up when you were
discussing your partnership or the way you work with
CUNY and the different types of, are there

apprenticeship models or vocational training that
they have in each of those (INAUDIBLE)

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I'll speak to
a portion of your questions as it relates to SBS, and
you said CTE specifically, yeah?

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Yeah.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: We have
through our healthcare industry partnership
(INAUDIBLE) the past few years. There's some kind of
a weird echo. Sorry. I hope you can hear me.
Developed a work-base learning model, new model with
the CTE schools for people on a CNA track in
healthcare and in addition District 79, which is not
CTE, school has a partnership with us. They're on
site in our West Farms Center. Hopefully, you're
familiar with that because it's not so far from you.
we're working with people who want to connect to high
school equivalency and integrating job training where
possible and so forth. As for the broader plan, I
don't have the answer for that. Sorry. We can get
back to you.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Sure. Thank you. Are
we evaluating community-based organization metrics or
like our programmatic metrics that are met, like cost

per participant, to see where we're having the best uses of funding, like the best practices or what needs to be replicated or maybe even what needs to no longer be funded?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I think that is part of the plan. We certainly do that for our programs. I think EDC does the same, and I imagine that that is something that's done across the City for the central offices.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: You'd be surprised. Lastly, I just thought of a data demographic collection question. How are we evaluating some of this demographic numbers that we're collecting, like sex, gender, like all of those things, and prioritizing the evaluation of budgetary and training dollars towards filling some of the gaps and demographic goals that we have citywide?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I'm not totally clear on your question. Are you saying how are we ensuring that we're getting to everyone that needs our help?

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Yeah, or evaluating like this industry needed x amount of BIPOC community members (INAUDIBLE) we have data showing that we

filled those gaps that are now exceeding. Do we
backtrack or do we stabilize or do we keep investing
in it?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: To the degree
that I can answer for SBS, I will share with you that
there are certain industries where there's not enough
representation from the BIPOC community for example.
It's a fantastic industry. It's really good in terms
of wages and career trajectory and so forth and so a
lot of our efforts have been on, and the industry
might be among the first to say that, they're sort of
hungry for more diversity, and so a lot of our
training investments have evolved so that, I
mentioned this program Future Code, which is aiming
increasing the number of Black and LatinX web
developers so where we can, and I think you
referenced, pretty familiar with construction and the
tracking of that industry and all the efforts over
the years and that continues and so forth and so
where we see an industry that needs more diversity,
we are making efforts in tailoring those investments
so that we are successful in connecting people into
those kinds of jobs. I hope that makes sense and
answers your question.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Yeah, it does. I'm just trying to get a better sense of, not only for BIPOC community members, but also LGBTQ+ (INAUDIBLE) persons with disabilities, so on and so forth, like just trying to gauge how we are actually being more reflective and proactive than reactive.

I'm done, Alex. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: (INAUDIBLE) It seems like Chair Brewer has additional questions.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: It's just the issue of technology, and another agency to add to it is DoITT of course. One of the concerns, of course, is just broadband and access low-cost quality, so when you're thinking about the students you're working with or the programs you're working with, who comes in to think about how they can make sure that they can access the portal? Are the libraries open? How do you use the technology that's available so that it's affordable to you and fast enough. Who's thinking about that? Is that what Matt Fraser's going to be doing? Was it ever part of your past? How does the whole tech world play a role? Obviously, it is what makes jobs possible, not only the jobs themselves,

the training that goes into it, but the access. Who's
thinking about the expansion of broadband (INAUDIBLE)

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: DoITT, Matt
Fraser. That's right.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: You have to think
about that, but in the past it never came up?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: No,
absolutely it did, and it has been on our minds, and
I can give you an example like at the beginning of
the pandemic there was a lot, like everybody, all the
folks had to pivot and there were not enough laptops
for people in our programs and so we worked together
with private industry and were able to get some and
deliver them and fill the gaps there so we're
thinking about it all the time and working with all
kinds of partners to bridge those gaps.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Okay. One other
question for EDC. I know that you do work hard to try
to find companies that will work with young people
and work with people who need jobs that might not
normally think about that as a career, but you have
to work with those companies. They're not necessarily
going to take somebody who they don't see as a
perfect fit so in the future how are you going to be

more expansive. I think the only way to do it is to have programs like what you do with life sciences because you can get 10 people to sign up for Google and they need 15,000 people, but you still want to get people from CUNY, you want to get people from your CTE programs, you want to get people who aren't normally applying for those jobs so what kind of different outreach are you going to do to talk to these companies about taking, not everybody's Jamie Dimon who wants to different with Barbara Change, that's a different world, but for those that don't necessarily support this kind of expansion, what kind of (INAUDIBLE) program is EDC going to do to reach out to those companies because it's retail work, it's one, one, one.

FAYE PENN: You're definitely right about that. It is a hand-in-hand situation, and it requires deep relationships with industry and deep relationships with individual companies and also on the other side with educational providers. I'm just going to go back to offshore because it really is, as we've really deepened our thinking about equity, this is an example of the way we will work now and going forward. I want to talk a bit, if I could, about our

partnerships with CUNY Central and Kingsborough Community College. There is 10 million dollars for capital costs across the CUNY system to train folks for the offshore wind industry and nearly half a million specifically for offshore specific training programs at Kingsborough Community College, and this will train roughly 150 people in roles like the crew transfer vessel training. This is an example of an industry where we have everybody at the table so it's a lot easier to make those calls and to bridge those conversations when industry was in on the ground floor and the community was in on the ground floor. Everybody's in it together. As we look toward other areas like the green economy where there's a shared vision, that's going to be another opportunity, I mean a broader green economy, to create closer relationships at the outset so those sort of one-to-one conversations are just naturally built in.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Like every single HVAC company, you should be in touch as an example? All right. Thank you very much. All yours.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Chair Brewer. Any additional Members have questions, please use the Zoom raise hand function now. I see no hands raised.

We will now move on to the public portion of the hearing.

Thank you to Members of the Administration for your testimony, and now we will move on. Our first 3 panelist from the public will be Annie Garneva followed by Justin Collins and then James Parrott. Miss Garneva, you may begin when the Sergeant announces the timer.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Can the host please unmute Annie Garneva.

ANNIE GARNEVA: Apologies. I'm just trying to coordinate all our members in the background so just give me one second. You were having technical difficulties and now I'm having technical difficulties.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Whatever you say, Annie, is going to be fabulous so just go ahead.

ANNIE GARNEVA: I know. I apologize. We put a lot of stock into this hearing so I just want to make sure that...

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: And I do appreciate it very much.

ANNIE GARNEVA: Okay, thank you. Good morning to everyone. Thank you, Chairs Farias and Brewer, for this opportunity to testify before you.

My name's Annie Garneva, and I'm the interim CEO for the New York City Employment and Training Coalition. Founded in 1997, we are the largest city-based workforce development association in the country with over 200 members providing jobs for over 600,000 New Yorkers, many of whom you'll hear from today. Our members create jobs and connect underserved people such as New Yorkers of color, New Yorkers with multiple barriers to employment, and low, moderate incomes as well as hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers across the City. Our coalition prioritizes supporting job seekers who've been left out of the economic recovery due to systemic and historic marginalization and connecting them to opportunities so they support their families and help their communities thrive.

As many of you know, the economy's been undergoing rapid and dramatic changes bolstered by automation and the pandemic's push toward a digital landscape, requiring workers to remain lifelong learners and design their own career pathways, thus

making traditional ways of training and education obsolete. Today's labor market demands that workers constantly upgrade their skills and learn new ones in order to remain competitive. Unfortunately, the current underfunded and siloed workforce system that we've talked about today, which is made up of hundreds of programs and organizations across 21 agencies are financed through combination of public and private funders, is willfully inadequate in supporting the growing demand and complexity of training, upscaling, and finding employment for millions of New Yorkers as well as workers and business owners.

Our workforce service providers and their advocates have done a herculean job of supporting New Yorkers, especially in the face of increased need over the last 2 years, and have been willing and eager to collaborate with the City for years.

Unfortunately, we previously have not seen the action and new investments that we feel are necessary to make progress for New Yorkers, particularly around the de Blasio administration's Career Pathways and New York Economic and Workforce Development strategies.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Keep going a little
bit more, Annie. Just go ahead a little bit more.

ANNIE GARNEVA: Thank you so much. We
commend the Adams' administration for laying out a
vision for a long-term approach and investing people
and break some barriers. We also commend and thank
the Administration for making workforce development a
key pillar of the economic recovery, which is new for
(INAUDIBLE) economic plan so definitely want to
highlight that as a great step forward as well as for
integrating active equity and community center plans.

However, as I've spoken about, the
workforce ecosystem is highly underfunded and
persistently has employment barriers, especially for
low access communities. For this reason, I won't go
into the variety of background, I'll kind of cover
the 3 main recommendations that we have for the
system, and you'll hear from our members about how
they would scale up those new investments.

First of all, we urge the City to
immediately invest in recovery through a 250 million
reemployment program. This would include wage
subsidies and training aligned to in-demand sectors

that have either been stable or are growing as well as making sure that wage subsidies are available to small businesses and New Yorkers in order to maintain new jobs. The City should specifically target, of course, low-income communities of color.

Second, we hope that the City will invest 100 million dollars and baseline that annually, and that's new money, not old money, into specifically growing out talent development programming, especially 20 million dollars for bridge and (INAUDIBLE) programs to make sure that training programs are accessible and don't really leave out people with low literacy, numeracy rates. That 100 million in new funding should go for flexible funding streams to create new programs and kind of ensure that collaboration and partnerships happen within programs, which current contracts make that very difficult.

Lastly, since we've spoken so much about investments during today's hearing, we hope that a new permanent workforce development fund is created so that we can have sources of money coming in from the economic development side as well as to get more buy-in from the employer community, whether that's

through a new tax levy or some kind of new financial commitment from employers looking to participate in the workforce system and really create new pots of funding since, as we've seen, it's just completely underfunded at the money.

Thank you to the City for a Blueprint that's really exciting for everybody and a new vision. Thank you for Council pushing that forward. We really hope to see now implementation plans, timelines, and really numbers and financial commitments. Thank you so much.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Garneva. If any of the Members have questions for the panelist, please use the Zoom raise hand function now or, of course, if either Chair has a question, feel free to ask it now.

Seeing no hands raised, we're going to move on to the next panelist. Next, we will hear from Justin Collins followed by James Parrot and then Marco Damiani. Mr. Collins, you may begin when the Sergeant calls the timer.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

JUSTIN COLLINS: Good afternoon, and thank you for the opportunity to speak. My name is Justin

Collins, and I represent Workforce Professionals Training Institute, WPTI. We increase the effectiveness of people, programs, and organizations that are committed to generating pathways out of poverty through employment. Our 3-tiered approach strengthens capacity at all levels of the workforce development system, incorporating professional training and skill building for individual workforce professionals, capacity building for programs and organizations that provide job training, placement, and wraparound services, and system building to create linkages, foster research, and influence funding and best practice priorities. We serve 80 percent of New York City's CBOs providing workforce services and their staff, a community that's overwhelmingly made up of women, people of color, and disproportionately women of color. I just want to say we echo the Coalition's ask for 250 million dollars for reemployment programs which are going to play a critical role in the City's recovery in terms of connecting displaced workers to reemployment. We also support an investment of 100 million in workforce training programs annually, including 20 million for bridge and free apprenticeship programming, 15

million to support development and scaling of new programming and required digital infrastructure, and the development of a workforce fund. We want to ensure that workforce providers are at the table at every step of the way regarding decisions being made regarding the City's economic recovery.

I want to emphasize a few key areas where we believe the City must place it's focus, it's investment, and it's efforts. Those include capacity building, digital transformation of workforce development, and then also support of the Just Pay Campaign to ensure fair wages for human services professionals.

Most notably, as the City emerges into a changed economy where workers need to be prepared for an increasingly digital labor market, we need real investment in digital infrastructure for workforce development and also upscaling and training and capacity building for workforce professionals and organizations so they can effectively harness and use this technology to support the job seekers that they work with.

As the City emerges from...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

JUSTIN COLLINS: Thank you very much. I
will also be submitting in writing.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Justin, what do you
mean by digital infrastructure? What is that? I mean
I know what I think it is, but what is it to you?

JUSTIN COLLINS: Absolutely, so right now
since the pandemic began we've been delivering
services remotely by and large, but it's not just
being able to serve clients remotely. It's things
like digital data infrastructure so people can
collect, analyze, and share intake and outcomes data
and engage in data-driven employer engagement. Those
require things like learning management systems and
CRM systems which will allow people to reach their
job seekers and track their job seekers and really
reach clients virtually at any time from any device
anywhere for both synchronous live virtual training
but also asynchronous training, which is going to be
increasingly important for folks with busy schedules,
childcare needs, etc., and workforce professionals
really need the skills to affectively utilize that
software if they want to make the most of it. Because
right now, we're emerging in a complicated and
increasingly digital world and not only do the job

seekers need to develop the skills to advance in that work but the people who serve them need to develop those skills as well.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: All right, I got it.
Thank you.

JUSTIN COLLINS: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: That needs to be part of an expanded portal in many different ways. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you. We'll next hear from the next group of panelists. Next up is James Parrott followed by Marco Damiani and then Teresa Macchio. Mr. Parrott, you may begin when the Sergeant announces the time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

ALEX PAULENOFF: It appears that James Parrott's having some technical difficulties. Can we try again to unmute him?

Well, we will move on to the next panelist and circle back to James Parrott in a few minutes once we sort out his tech issue.

Let's hear next from Marco Damiani followed Teresa Macchio and then Betty Ann Tamaisar.

Marco Damiani, you can begin when the
Sergeant announces the time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.
Marco, you're still on mute.

MARCO DAMIANI: Is that good now?

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Yes, we can hear you.

MARCO DAMIANI: Okay, thank you. Good
afternoon. I'm Marco Damiani, CEO of AHRC of New York
City and member of the New York City Employment
Training Coalition Inaugural Policy Council. AHRC is
the largest nonprofit in New York State providing
services and support to people with developmental
disabilities and the families including nearly 5,000
people throughout the City. We partner with
corporations such as Salesforce, Etsy, and
(INAUDIBLE) and government entities such as the MTA,
DYCD, New York City DSS, the Mayor's Office of People
with Disabilities, and have helped thousands of
people with disability become gainfully employed. We
have significant DYCD contracts.

There have been countless challenges and
pain points, especially during the pandemic. Fighting
across 21 agencies, lack of flexibility, difficulty
with data metrics, and underfunding. The workforce

ecosystem has been woefully underfunded and under-supported for decades. This especially impacts those from communities that have been historically marginalized and disinvested, in particular, in our case, people with disabilities.

We now face difficulty delivering services due to additional infrastructure and curriculum needs. We need to upgrade and build new programs reflective of those sectors that are strong in the COVID economy.

We really want to see the 250 million dollars for COVID reemployment programs become an essential investment to ensure progress in vital workforce initiatives.

I also want to share that for the past 3 and a half years, AHRC of New York City has had an incredibly successful public/private partnership with New York City DSS, piloting an inclusive internship program. With funding from a foundation, we've now placed over 100 interns with a wide range of disabilities in placements throughout HRA and Department of Homeless Services. Of those people, 30 are now employed, 17 in city government. This model works. We have a manual prepared to guide other city

agencies in accomplishing this goal. This program is powerful. Proof of concept is readily replicable and is scalable throughout New York City. This is the kind of creative partnership we believe is great for government, good for people with disabilities, and we really encourage the Council to work with our community to expand initiatives like this one. Thank you very much for your time today. We appreciate the opportunity to provide testimony.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Mr. Damiani.

If any Council Members have questions, please use the Zoom raise hand function now.

Seeing no additional questions, we will now move on to the next panelist. Next, we'll hear from Teresa Macchio followed by Betty Ann Tamaisar and the Eli Dvorkin. Teresa Macchio, you may begin when the Sergeant announces the time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

TERESA MACCHIO: Good afternoon. My name is Teresa Macchio, Director of Partnerships at the American Management Association. The AMA is a nearly 100-year-old nonprofit global leader in talent development based in New York City.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Excuse me, Teresa.

TERESA MACCHIO: Yes?

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Your audio is coming
in very choppy. You might want to try adjusting your
microphone.

TERESA MACCHIO: (INAUDIBLE) My speaker's
100 percent. I'm sorry. (INAUDIBLE) Is that any
better?

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Still a little bit
choppy.

TERESA MACCHIO: It could be my firewall.
I apologize. COVID has caused major disruption in the
workforce and companies needed to be agile as they
struggled with staff recruitment and retention,
training, (INAUDIBLE) engagement and, most
importantly, servicing their customers.

AMA would like to be part of New York
City's workforce development recovery where currently
members work in silos and there's no one system with
accountability and tracking.

For example, workers who complete career
in IT and healthcare would benefit greatly from AMA's
soft skills to round out their competencies and
provide management communication, project management,

and leadership skills, but we are not connected in a system.

AMA receives no funding from New York City. Our courses are typically paid for by the employer or they are self-funded. NYC ETC's proposed 258 million dollar budget for reemployment could be used for rescaling and upscaling new and existing employees.

Since March 2020, AMA pivoted to remote training and provided impactful professional development for more than 1,500 New Yorkers and more than 25,000 employees across the country. In the last decade alone, AMA has trained 10 million people to do their jobs better and align with company goals.

AMA supports NYC ETC's recommendation of a 250 million dollar COVID reemployment program with subsidized employment and employer engagement. These funds will help employers pay for AMA's 160 plus courses in managerial skills, women's leadership, communication, project management, finance, diversity equity, inclusion, and belonging, and critical thinking to motivate and direct reports and teams.

These crucial skills are both necessary and transferable across all sectors in the Mayor's

plan for recovery. Tech, life sciences and
healthcare, industrial and manufacturing, creative
and cultural, and...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Macchio.

Any of the Council Members have any questions, please
use the Zoom raise hand function now.

Seeing no hands raised, we will move on
to the next panelist. Next, we will hear from Betty
Ann Tamaisar followed by Eli Dvorkin and then Katie
(INAUDIBLE) Betty Ann Tamaisar, you may begin when
the Sergeant announces the timer.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

BETTY ANN TAMAISAR: Thank you, Committee
Chairs and Members. Chairs Farias and Brewer, Eileen
Torres, the BronxWorks Executive Director, extends
her regards.

My name is Betty Ann Tamaisar, and I am
the Director of Workforce Development at BronxWorks.
Throughout the pandemic, BronxWorks has pivoted to
meet the employment and wraparound service needs of
Bronx residents.

In 2021, our workforce development
department engaged over 10,000 persons, providing

them with employment and support services inclusive of job readiness, occupational skills training, job placements, and free tax prep services and one-on-one financial counseling services. Our city funders currently include HRA, DYCE, HPD, and the Department of Consumer and Worker Protection.

During the first wave of the pandemic, BronxWorks focused on providing emergency aid to those who lost their jobs during the pandemic. We have subsequently refocused our employment services to provide intensive, short-term training to Bronx residents who seek high-demand, well-paying jobs. We continue to collaborate with Bronx-based and citywide employers in several sectors to meet their demands for highly skilled and highly motivated employees.

BronxWorks is encouraged that Mayor Adams has created an economic blueprint to help our city and its 5 boroughs move forward as we strive to rebound from COVID. We appreciate his decision to marry workforce development and economic development activities. This marriage should yield positive results for job seekers and job-hiring institutions alike.

BronxWorks supports the effort of the New York City Employment and Training Coalition to put some dollars in the Mayor's plan. We support the Coalition's proposal to add substance to the plan by establishing a 250 million COVID reemployment plan and provide at least 100 million to support innovative training efforts. We also support the Coalition's proposals for investments and wraparound services that will ensure high rates of employer's participation and (INAUDIBLE) These wraparound investments will help support a stable, productive, and healthy, physically and mentally, workforce efforts.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: I have a question quickly. You're a great program. Setting aside what you and Annie have come up with, which is important, what is it that would help, obviously money, but what exactly should that money be used for for your amazing staff? Is it technology? Is it skill building for the residents? What is it that would really turn the tide in terms of getting people employed for long-term sustainable jobs?

BETTY ANN TAMAI SAR: Obviously, I think adult education and, of course, stipends, right, so we need to get people from point A to point Z and when you look at past plans, there's really no plan to do that. We have to figure out how do we get individuals educated and skills up so they can assume all these great opportunities everyone talks about, and that is not a huge challenge for us. Adult basic education is definitely one and then stipends. As people come into job training programs and things like that, they still have families to support, they still have children to feed, they still have pay their rents so they need, that stipend will kind of help to help them financially as they try to get themselves on the road to self-sufficiency.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Okay, and do you work with some of the community colleges in the Bronx, the great community colleges?

BETTY ANN TAMAI SAR: We have partners (INAUDIBLE) and Bronx community colleges on different initiatives related to training and (INAUDIBLE)

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Okay, thank you.

BETTY ANN TAMAI SAR: Thank you so much.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you. We will next move on to the following group of panelists. Next we will hear from Eli Dvorkin followed by Katie (INAUDIBLE) and then Carlyn Cowen. Eli Dvorkin, you can begin when the Sergeant announces the time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

ELI DVORKIN: Good afternoon. My name is Eli Dvorkin, and I'm the Editorial and Policy Director at the Center for Urban Future, an independent research organization focused on building a more equitable economy in New York City. Thank you so much for the opportunity to testify today.

I'd like to focus my brief remarks on 4 key steps that city government should take to make the city's workforce development system stronger and more effective.

First, city leaders should focus on scaling up the city's most effective workforce programs. New York's exemplary nonprofit career training organizations serve no more than a few dozen to a few hundred New Yorkers each year. As part of a larger reemployment program, the City should launch a 100 million dollar competitive grant program designed to enable effective organizations to partner, scale,

and build accessibility into their programs, ensuring that all New Yorkers can gain access to what's already working.

Second, expand support for bridge models, which provide crucial on-ramps into effective training. Too many New Yorkers struggle to gain entry to the best-in-class job training programs out there due to gaps in literacy, math skills, and digital fluency. New bridge programs can open doors to effective career training and career connections among organizations where few exist today.

Third, start hundreds more apprenticeship programs, especially in high wage fields that are insufficiently diverse such as technology, finance, advertising, and the green economy. Apprenticeships are a proven model for launching individuals without college potential into family-sustaining careers, and the city's home to just a handful outside the building trades and has made too little progress in recent years. The city should partner with CUNY, training providers, and industry to launch at least 100 new apprenticeship pathways in growing fields and commit to training 5,000 residents annually for apprenticeships by 2025 while drawing on

underutilized Empire State Apprenticeship Tax Credit
to help fund this training.

Four, integrate workforce development
into future rezonings. To date, very few workforce
investments have resulted from rezonings. The Council
should integrate investments in local hiring and
training networks in the rezonings from the very
start, ensuring that the infrastructure exists to
help local residents benefit economically from new
development.

For these and much more, please check out
our website, nycfuture.org, and thank you for the
opportunity to testify today.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Mr. Dvorkin.
Do any of the Chairs or any Council Members have
questions for this panelist?

Seeing no questions, we will move on to
the next panelist.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Can I ask one
question, Alex? I'm sorry. One quick question.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: There is a real push
as you have been saying (INAUDIBLE) for the last 30
years to do the, what's the job, get the industry to

suggest it, and then the city workforce to provide,
and that's sort of what you're saying because that's
been disconnected forever. In the innovation economy
and the tech startups, we hear about this all the
time, the creative, the innovative, it is what I
think EDC, I keep saying, is doing with life
sciences. What specifically should the City be doing?
Is it the apprenticeship? Is it some other way to get
people into these industries? What specifically would
(INAUDIBLE) You made 4 general excellent suggestions,
but is there something more specific?

ELI DVORKIN: Yeah, thank you so much,
Chair Brewer. It's great to see you as always. I
would add 2 quick points. One is I think the first
point that I made about scaling up what's already
working is really important. There's, I think, an
underappreciation of we don't need to reinvent the
wheel, we have programs that have demonstrated
exactly what you're talking about, taking New Yorkers
and helping them train for careers in fast growing
industries. To me, the real issue is that even the
largest of these programs is serving a few hundred
New Yorkers a year when we should be serving
thousands, and most of those programs either struggle

to access city dollars or don't actually apply for city funding in the first place because the rules are just too restrictive so really my first recommendation to achieve what you're saying is to create a competitive race to the top style competitive challenge grant that would actually invest in those programs that are delivering those results because the issue is not that we don't know it's working. It's that we really haven't scaled what's working.

To your second point, Chair, I would say apprenticeships are a proven pathway. The City in the last administration set a goal of launching 450 new apprenticeship programs. I'm not so sure the City's reached that goal frankly, and yet that's a very, I think, modest goal relative to the opportunity to help thousands of New Yorkers prepare for fast growing careers through apprenticeship models, and the City can help to facilitate that by bringing employers to the table together with training providers and with CUNY's community colleges who stand at the ready to help implement those training, but as you wisely pointed out that training can't be funded using federal Pell dollars for instance.

There's a huge opportunity again around scale, to take those programs that are working, or, in this case, to help pilot new initiatives aligned with those fast growing careers that lead to good jobs and to put some city resources behind that.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Thank you.

ELI DVORKIN: Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Sorry. I just want to jump in really quickly and, one, reiterate yes, yes, yes, apprenticeships and apprenticeship models. We see them working in other cities and other countries. We definitely need to be investing more into that.

I just have a quick question around preparation. Have you seen at least for the City, are we preparing at the bare minimum base foundation and requirements to make participants either more competitive or setting them up for success going into our apprenticeships or into our job trainings? What I've found personally, like I worked in the transit sector, I had a registered apprenticeship with the Department of Labor and Auto Diesel Mechanic, and a lot of people don't get licenses anymore, and that is a minimum requirement to a lot of fields throughout our City but also fields obviously in the transit

sector. Is there a feeling out there that we are at minimum preparing our future workforce or (INAUDIBLE) coming into our workforce?

ELI DVORKIN: Thank you so much for the question. I think you're hitting on a major challenge. I mean my answer would be I don't think we are sufficiently preparing folks even to be able to enter into that kind of effective training and, frankly, my Colleague, Katie (INAUDIBLE), is speaking next and can speak to this as well because part of this I think is around a need to invest in bridge programs like we've been talking about. The City Council funded a really innovative bridge program in partnership with Goodwill to be able to help prepare more New Yorkers to transition into high quality technology training programs, but the reality is that many of the City's most effective training programs and apprenticeship programs for that matter are incredibly selective. Training programs are accepting as few New Yorkers as get into NYU for example, and the reason in part is because we have a million working-age New Yorkers without a high school diploma as you know. There are other folks, working-age adults, who lack some of the literacy or numeracy or

digital skills to be able to succeed in those training programs so in part I think the answer would be investing in much stronger bridge pathways so that more New Yorkers can even gain entry to the high quality but really intensive career training that works, and that would include some of those wraparound supports as well including childcare and other supports that are needed to be able to make full-time, say 16 or 17-week commitment, work for working New Yorkers. Unfortunately, to answer your question, I think there are not nearly enough New Yorkers that are actually ready even today for the training that can lead to good jobs, let alone able to access those good jobs right away. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Mr. Dvorkin. Actually, since Katie (INAUDIBLE) is not here at the moment so we're going to move on to the following panelist, Carlyn Cowen, followed by Kristine Borok and then Ian (INAUDIBLE). Carlyn Cowen, you may begin when the Sergeant announces the time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

CARLYN COWEN: Good afternoon, everyone. My name is Carlyn Cowen, pronouns they/them, and I'm the Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer at the

Chinese-American Planning Council, CPC. Thank you,
Chair Farias and the Council Members, here today for
the opportunity to testify. CPC is the nation's
largest Asian-American social services agency
providing services from daycare to senior services
and everything in between for 60,000 Asian-American
immigrant and low-income New Yorkers each year. We
have for a long time done workforce training programs
for our community members, among others including
construction, hospitality, and retail programs, that
have really helped our community members completely
change the lives of themselves and their families.
These programs were incredibly necessary for our
immigrant community member pre-pandemic but since the
beginning of the pandemic, the need for these
programs has drastically changed. Within the first 6
months of our pandemic, during our Wellness Surveys
to community members, we learned that 50 percent of
our community members had lost jobs or income. By a
full year in, that number moved up to 70 percent of
our community members having lost jobs or income or
hours during the pandemic. What this means to us is
that we need to radically re-envision how workforce

development training is done to support our community members during this time.

What does that look like? We are proud members of NYC ETC and support all the recommendations that you've heard from them and their members today. In particular, we want to focus on a couple of things. Because we serve immigrant community members and approximately 2/3 of Asian-Americans are English as a second language learners in New York City, we often find that adult literacy programs are actually the first step to workforce training programs for all those community members so having those programs for immigrant community members that are integrated with language access is key for us. Expanding apprenticeship programs and bridge programs makes that also more possible as well.

Additionally, making...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

CARLYN COWEN: Programs are not siloed so that we can really integrate them. Our staff have such creative ideas of how to support our immigrant workforce development attendees, and breaking down those silos will really help with that.

The rest I've outlined in my written
testimony. Thank you for your time.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Cowen. Do
either of the Chairs or any of the Council Members
have a question for this panelist, please use the
Zoom raise hand function now.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: She's fabulous all by
herself.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Cowen.
We'll move on to the next panelist. Next, it looks
like both Kristine Borok and Ian (INAUDIBLE) are not
present so we're going to move on to Helen Kogan
followed by Dr. Darlene Williams and then Bryan
Lozano. Helen Kogan, you may begin when the Sergeant
announces the timer.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

HELEN KOGAN: I'm wondering why you can't
see me.

ALEX PAULENOFF: We hear you loud and
clear.

HELEN KOGAN: Good afternoon. It is my
pleasure to be here. I am the Executive Director for
NPower New York. NPower creates pathways to economic
prosperity by launching digital careers for young

adults from underserved communities and military
vets. The impact of the pandemic on daily life has
elevated the need for access to technology. This has
shown a disparate impact on low-income communities
limiting their access to education, healthcare, and
employment opportunities. In addition, the pandemic
has further illuminated the digital divide. All
students that come to NPower are unemployed or
underemployed, 71 percent are black or Latinx and
over 1/3, almost 40 percent now, are women. Our
programs provide tangible results improving the
shared economic prosperity of our students' families,
communities as well as helping local companies find
diverse tech talent. NPower is a free program
offering technical training, credentialing, career
readiness, wraparound services, paid internships, and
job placement into middle skills careers. This year
alone, we will train 200 students in New York. During
the pandemic, we continued to recruit to our
capacity, and our graduation rate last year was 89
percent and almost 80 percent of last year's grads
were placed into jobs. This stunning outcome as our
last class just graduated 3 months ago. The typical
preprogram wage of a young adult entering our program

is 8,500. The average annual wage for the first job after NPower is 55,000.

We cannot do this alone. We need the support of our local government to invest in programs like ours. Otherwise, we will see even deeper generational slip into poverty, lack of access to good jobs, and a disconnect from the digital community.

Workforce development providers are being called on to aid in the City's economic recovery efforts. Investment in skills training and programs like NPower that are working to close the digital skills gap and providing support services is critical to providing our historically underfunded workforce systems, adequate resources to serve the needs of both the workers and businesses that hire them. Without increased resources, our sector cannot maximize their efforts to aid in the city's economic recovery.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

HELEN KOGAN: Our organizations are relatively small, together we serve hundreds of thousands of clients. Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

96

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Kogan. If either of the Chairs have any questions for this panelist, please use the Zoom raise hand function now.

We will move on to our next panelist seeing no hands raised. Oh, go ahead, Chair Brewer.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: I just have a quick question for NPower. Helen, thank you. Where do you get your jobs because I know your program, when it started, but where are your best success rates and you obviously wraparound, just to give me a little sense because the tech industry is hiring, but they're not always hiring the types of folks we want to get to be a more diverse sector so if you could just talk a little bit about, because it's not just training and the job, there's more that goes into.

HELEN KOGAN: Absolutely, so we work very holistically with our partners. A lot of the corporate partners that fund our programs like the Citibank, Bank of America, Google, they also hire our graduates so we believe in operating in an ecosystem. They also volunteer for our program, but our job isn't really to get all of our students into Google, although that would be amazing, our job is to move

the needle and improve the lives of all of our students. Some are Google ready and some folks aren't, and it doesn't matter because after they graduate they will find a good job. Our lowest salaries on average are around 40,000, and again the midrange is 55, and those jobs and wages impact the families and the communities of the folks that attend our program.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: All right. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you. We'll move on to the next panelist. Next up is Dr. Darlene Williams followed by Bryan Lozano and then Michael Roberts. Dr. Darlene Williams, you can begin when the Sergeant announces the time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

DR. DARLENE WILLIAMS: Good afternoon. My name is Dr. Darlene Williams, and I am the President and CEO of OBT where our mission is to break the cycle of poverty and equity through education, job training, and employment. We focus on meeting individuals where they are and help them meet their goals. Throughout the COVID-19 pandemic, we encountered numerous challenges in our funded programs through the citywide budget shortfalls. OBT

received 300,000 dollars less compared to our previous years, forcing us to reduce the number of full-time counselors serving our community. We serve high-need populations such as homeless and disconnected youth age 16 to 24, individuals with disabilities, and immigrants. 96 percent of our participants are people of color. Losing a counselor affects our wraparound support services which directly impacts our participants in detrimental ways. We strongly believe that we can recover from COVID and empower New Yorkers to succeed and urge the Mayor to invest 250 million dollars in key workforce development initiatives including:

One, increasing on New York City's ability to successfully skill and upskill but providing wraparound support. We need to better understand the barriers to workforce participation such as childcare, mental health, food insecurity, transportation, and more.

Two, we want to improve how we evaluate and use our program data. Increased funding will ensure that we're able to better meet the needs of our participants and our employer partners.

Three, expand our ability to offer New Yorkers sector-based programming in healthcare, technology, masonry, childcare, climate-based careers, and more.

Four, digital literacy. Because tech skills are essential for all workers, we need to make bold investments that empower participants to use an array of technology services in a fluent matter so that they're equipped.

Thank you on behalf of everyone at OBT for giving us this opportunity to testify for the needed investment that supports New York City's ability to thrive in a post-pandemic economy. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you. If either of the Chairs have a question, feel free to ask it now. Otherwise, we'll move on to the next panelist. Okay, next up we have Bryan Lozano followed by Michael Roberts and then Sheree Ferguson-Cousins. Bryan Lozano, you can begin when the Sergeant announces the time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

BRYAN LOZANO: Thank you, Chair Farias, Chair Brewer, and Members of the Committee, for

hosting this important hearing today. My name is Bryan Lozano and I'm representing Per Scholas. We advance economic equity through tuition-free rigorous training for careers in tech while connecting our graduates to leading businesses in need of talent. Over the past 25 years, we've trained over 8,000 New Yorkers and partnered with over 500 businesses. This year, we plan on training over 800 New Yorkers, the largest in our history. (INAUDIBLE) the City, the City Council, and our founders, Per Scholas has been able to make our programs more accessible for New Yorkers. Since the start of the pandemic, we've trained nearly 1,000 learners remotely and mobilized our resources to provide technology to those in need. Along with remote courses, we've implemented a new satellite classroom partner where we partner with community-based organizations in neighborhoods that have been underinvested in career-ready workforce programming. We launched 2 successful pilot programs with Commonpoint Queens the Jewish Community Center of Staten Island. This new model utilizes our broader workforce ecosystem and allows us to reach wider geography, avoid onerous commutes, and make our instruction accessible to those whom childcare,

employment, and other obligations constrain their flexibility. New Yorkers need programs Per Scholas. Over the past few years, we've developed multiple pathways into our programs including bridge training with (INAUDIBLE) and a new cybersecurity bridge program we're launching later this year. These pathways are crucial, but there's still more work to be done and programming to be invested in. We know that for every 1 seat we provide in our programs, we have 6 interested applicants. Our increase in program demand is reflective of the high demand of tech skills in the workforce. (INAUDIBLE) of our graduates have obtained employment during the pandemic are earning a starting salary of 21 dollars an hour.

Per Scholas is a proud member of the NYC ETC, and I encourage the Council to adopt the coalition's recommendations including creating a permanent workforce development fund and committing 100 million annually in new funding toward talent development programs such as bridge programs.

Workforce organizations are vital to the economic recovery of the city, and together we can put New Yorkers back to work. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you. It seems that
Chair Farias has her hand raised so we'll move to the
Chair for first questions.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you for
testifying, Bryan. I just have a quick question
around the cyber classrooms I believe you said it was
called. Have you folks at Per Scholas seen an
expansion in the reach of participants in terms of
like where they live in the Bronx or citywide
actually participating in some of these trainings?

BRYAN LOZANO: Yes. Sorry, it's satellite
(INAUDIBLE) The reason why we did this in the first
place is the recognition that where our programs are
located is incredibly important in terms of the
representation where we have of the city. One example
specifically is Staten Island. There's not many
workforce career ready programs available on the
island and that program we implemented is the first
of its kind. We typically have 1 percent of all of
our learners coming from Staten Island, and now we've
seen a 500 percent increase. Last year, we served a
little over 600 New Yorkers, and this year we're
serving a little over 800, and that increase is
particularly because we've been investing and working

with community-based organizations building these classrooms and giving them on-ramps to do that. We typically have always had a lot of word-of-mouth folks to come into our programs so we're being a lot more intentionality and ensuring that where we're missing, what representation we're lacking, what opportunities and bridges that we can gap, we'll do that with our programming.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay, great, and can you just briefly tell me maybe some of the examples of the satellite trainings that your doing?

BRYAN LOZANO: Yeah, that's a great question. We launched the first 2 pilots with Commonpoint Queens in Elmhurst and the JCC of Staten Island in Mid-Island and Staten Island. We're launching our next classes in the Stanley Isaacs Center Upper Manhattan and also in Cypress Hills with the Cypress Hills Development Corporation. The classes that we're specifically hosting there is our foundational class, the IT Support class, where the minimum requirement is to be 18 and up, have a high school diploma or equivalency, had to have no technical background. It's been important for us, that program is about 50 percent of the classes we

provide because it's our only on-ramp and it's, for us, how we build careers for folks who don't have any tech backgrounds or even experience in technology.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay, so it's mostly or all IT support?

BRYAN LOZANO: Right now, it's all IT support, but this year we're launching our first cybersecurity classes with Commonpoint in Elmhurst as well as the Stanley Isaacs Center in Upper Manhattan.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay, and what has direct employment, like job placement, look like?

BRYAN LOZANO: Our KPIs are 85 percent graduation rate, 80 percent certification rate, and 80 percent placement rate within 1 year of graduating. We've hit those KPIs as the pandemic was happening and we continue to do so, and our satellites are adhering to the same exact KPIs for success. The first 2 pilots have been incredibly successful. I think we've had 100 percent placement rate so far, but it's just one program. We do this at scale, but it's been really interesting to see because the point of doing satellite for us is also not just to broaden the geography and access but also maybe to scale 2 organizations working with Elmhurst

together to be able to hopefully make that a more
cost-effective way for us to invest in learners.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Great. Last question.
What's Per Scholas' length of tracking? Is it 6
months, 9 months, a year?

BRYAN LOZANO: Two years.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Two years.

BRYAN LOZANO: Our typical investment for
learners is it's obviously not just after they do the
12 to 15-week program, for us, a lot of our other
Colleagues mentioned this, it's not about the first
job, it's about a career so for a lot of (INAUDIBLE)
coming in with 0 years of experience, that first job
is often like a smaller contractor position for 3 to
6 months moving up to the next job and the next job
and the next job.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Sure. Thank you so
much.

BRYAN LOZANO: You're welcome. Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: I also have one other
quick question, Bryan, and thank you for the many
years of your service but also for the program that
we love. We are talking a little bit about 21
agencies, silos, etc. I think if you scale up

certainly with more funding, you could do even more jobs because they're out there. Two questions. What would you need to scale up? Second, is there a silo? I'm obviously asking somewhat of a redundant question, but how would you break down some of those silos because your students need them. Then, of course, would it be possible at some point to have enough wraparound services, bridge programs, whatever, to have non-high school degree individuals (INAUDIBLE)

BRYAN LOZANO: All great questions, Chair Brewer. I would say first and foremost it's going to just be we need more investment, period. Right now, (INAUDIBLE) costs Per Scholas about 8,000 dollars per learner to come into our systems and hoping to scale that down by expanding it with satellite. A lot of the recommendations NYC ETC provides, especially when it comes to investments, the workforce ecosystem is everything that we would recommend. Yes, for sure, I think there can be a lot of opportunity for a lot more coordination, especially in the workforce ecosystem. The way that we see it is this is an ecosystem. We're working with folks that are coming straight from digital illiteracy all the way to

1 career programs. We don't want to lose anybody that's
2 coming throughout that pipeline so the idea is, even
3 as organizations, we're working together a lot. Like
4 a part of the satellite model was to demonstrate that
5 we can work together in partnership as 2
6 organizations serving communities in need so I think
7 there can definitely be a lot more coordination among
8 that, and I think the other thing that's going to be
9 important here is opportunities for pathways for
10 further employment. We obviously work with employers
11 similar to a lot of our other Colleagues and build
12 those relationships, but I think there's even more
13 opportunity to even do pathways to employment when
14 possible. I think there's also opportunities there as
15 well.
16

17 CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Thank you.

18 ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Mr. Lozano.

19 Next, we will hear from Michael Roberts followed
20 Sheree Ferguson-Cousins and then Valerie Payne. Mr.
21 Roberts, you can begin when the Sergeant announces
22 the time.

23 SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

24 MICHAEL ROBERTS: Thank you. I'm so glad
25 to have this opportunity to speak to Chairwoman

Brewer and Chairwoman Farias. Today, I really want to talk about income eligibilities that are creating an equity and access issue for many working poor young people. The income levels that are used for people that enter city and state programs are so low and antiquated that most working poor families cannot get into these programs so when people talk about retention and completion, we're not getting the right candidates into the pipeline to be successful and complete. The barriers that come in abject poverty are huge, and an 8-week bridge program cannot rectify all of that. There's mental health issues, there's domestic violence, there's placement, housing. Most bridge programs are made for a different young person and a different young adult. CYD, Comprehensive Youth Development, has been working for 27 years with transfer schools across New York City and high schools and older youth. We were lucky enough to run a pilot on private money where we partnered with CUNY and the (INAUDIBLE) Community College Department of Development and did a medical assisting program, and we found in the first (INAUDIBLE) on private money 80 percent of students completed everything and got jobs and as we moved to DYCD and (INAUDIBLE) funding based

on those barriers and criteria they asked for were in the 60 percentile.

I also feel that's an equity issue. We're not allowing those workers that really could take advantage of these job placement programs to be a part of it. I'm asking that you look at those barriers, you look at the history of it, we will send a paper to you with all that about the poverty indicators you see in New York City. That is a big recommendation which I think would help us get more young people, the right young people, into the pipelines we're looking for for all the jobs that are being created right now. Employers tell me they can't find the workers, right? We're not getting them the widest pool and it has to start earlier in our high schools. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Mr. Roberts. If either of the Chairs have a question for this panelist, please feel free to ask it now.

Seeing no questions, we're going to move on to the next panelist, Sheree Ferguson-Cousins, followed by Valerie Payne and then Michael Conway. Miss Ferguson-Cousins, when you may begin when the Sergeant call time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

SHEREE FERGUSON-COUSINS: Thank you. I am Sheree Ferguson-Cousins, the AVP of Workforce Development at Goodwill Industries of Greater New York and Northern New Jersey. We a local nonprofit that has helped New Yorkers connect to employment for over a century. Goodwill is committed to supporting the city job recovery efforts in the wake of the pandemic. Our bridge tech program aligns with the City's workforce development plans to create 100,000 jobs by 2027 in an equitable way through local hiring. Our 5-week full-time programs provides New Yorkers across the 5 boroughs with literacy and numeracy skills needed to get prepared for advanced technology training programs and to connect to in-demand tech jobs. I know Per Scholas spoke briefly. Our bridge program currently moves people into Per Scholas cyber and desktop support. Receiving referrals for our bridge program has been challenging due to the pandemic. The program is designed to serve job seekers with HPD workforce development contracts. Mandatory participation in these programs was suspended which has diminished the pool of candidates. In addition, we are unable to refer

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

111

unvaccinated clients (INAUDIBLE) partners require participants to be vaccinated. This affects our ability to support New Yorkers who are seeking advanced training. To combat these challenges, we transformed our operations into a hybrid model and expanded recruitment efforts, embracing the opportunities created by offering hybrid. For example, without transportation a barrier, we are serving people from all 5 boroughs. We also offering online job fairs, work readiness workshops, and (INAUDIBLE) Goodwill strongly believes in the importance of bridge programming, and additional funding would allow us to expand this innovative program model to other sectors. Expanding bridge programming will result in more New Yorkers completing advanced training with the skills and credentials needed to succeed in a job and put them on a career pathway of upward mobility and high earning potential. Removing barriers is part of Goodwill's mission, and a critical component of our bridge program is the wraparound support provided to all students. We must ensure that all...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

3 SHEREE FERGUSON-COUSINS: Programs have
4 access to comprehensive, 360-degree wraparound
5 supports. Thank you.

6 ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Ferguson-
7 Cousins. If any of the Chairs have a question for
8 this panelist, please ask it now.

9 Seeing none, we'll move on to the next
10 panelist. Next up is Valerie Payne followed by
11 Michael Conway and then (INAUDIBLE) Miss Payne, you
12 may begin when the Sergeant announces the time.

13 SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

14 VALERIE PAYNE: Good afternoon. Thanks so
15 much for allowing me to testify today. Pleased to be
16 here. My name is Valerie Payne. I'm the Executive
17 Director of Rebuilding Together New York City and an
18 Executive Committee Member of the New York City
19 Employment and Training Coalition. Rebuilding
20 Together New York City provides critical home repair
21 and accessibility modifications to low income
22 homeowners, reskilled individuals for careers in
23 construction, and provides opportunities for New
24 Yorkers to revitalize community spaces.

25 I agree with many of the points my
Colleagues have made here today and wholeheartedly

support the New York City Employment and Training Coalition's recommendations. As we discussed, there are way too many New Yorkers that are not being supported and are unable to compete in our own labor market, and we need a new public agenda that intentionally connects economic and workforce development. However, we are not starting from scratch. we have many local assets upon which to build highlighted in the recent Blueprint for Economic Recovery, we have new leadership in the Mayor's office, and a strong network of workforce development organizations, the members of the New York City Employment and Training Coalition.

Specifically, I want to offer my support for the recommendation to commit 250 million dollars to launch an expansive re-employment program to support the millions of New Yorkers who remain unemployed and fund new program innovation and development with at least 100 million in new funding per year.

Rebuilding Together New York City's Careers in Construction program is part of the solution. We're alongside new and pathways to apprenticeship, although we are far younger. We

provide a pre-apprenticeship certificate training designed to reskill individuals for careers in construction and we serve those hardest hit by the pandemic. We recruit and serve students from all 5 boroughs. After the pandemic forced us to quarantine, we were able to relaunch 3 months later providing our training online...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

VALERIE PAYNE: Thank you for your time. I appreciate the opportunity to testify and I'll submit my written testimony which is a little bit longer. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Payne. If either of the Chairs have a question for this panelist, please feel free to ask it now.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Not a question, but if you'd like to continue on, Valerie, you can.

VALERIE PAYNE: Awesome. Thank you so much. Our program is free and graduates earn a financial stipend which has been discussed today. We also are a direct entry provider and provide industry-recognized and required certifications including OSHA 30, site safety training, flagger, and scaffold. Demand for our program is high. We are in

the process of developing a shorter program for individuals currently employed in non-union construction jobs who are interested in becoming an apprentice and joining one of the trades. We are incredibly grateful to have received support from DYCD, NYCHA, and former City Council Members Mark Treyger and Alicka Ampry-Samuel. With additional support and funds, we could easily triple our efforts and reskill many more New Yorkers in incredibly well-paying apprenticeships with career advancement opportunities, continuing education, amazing benefits, and a variety of trade unions. As you probably know, the construction industry is scaling up and on track again to add jobs over the coming years. I'll stop there. Thank you so much for listening and for your support.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Payne.

Next, we'll move to Michael Conway followed by Terrence Byerson and then Bishop Mitchell Taylor. Mr. Conway, you may begin when the Sergeant announce the time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

MICHAEL CONWAY: Good afternoon. I'm Mike Conway, Executive Director and Co-Founder of Stacks

and Joules. Stacks and Joules provides technology workforce training for the building automation system industry. These are vital tech jobs, essential in meeting the mandates of Local Law 97 because they enable the optimization of energy use in buildings. There's huge unmet demand for these jobs. Since 2019 with a grant from NYSERDA, we have fully trained 121 public, CTE, and transfer high students, and they've earned over 170 industry recognized certifications, 96 paid internships, and 5 have secured jobs right out of high school. We're currently working with another 80 students across three schools including one cohort of all young women. We also partner with the venerable Henry Street Settlement in supporting adult cohorts through a second grant from NYSERDA. Our first cohort of 21 adults have so far earned over 65 certifications and 17 have secured a variety of jobs. We partner with a growing group of building automation companies and professionals. It is they that guide our curriculum and validate our quality through our hiring.

It's important to note that we do not impose prerequisites on our access to high tech training. Bridging systemic barriers to these

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

117

important well-paying jobs can require doubling down
so please don't totally discount doubling up.

Strategic partnerships compound investments. With
your support for increased reliable funding, we can
expand our proven program to serve overlooked,
underappreciated talent in every borough. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Mr. Conway. If
either of the Chairs have a question for this
panelist, feel free to ask it now.

Seeing no questions, we will move on to
the next panelists. First up is Terrence Byerson
followed by Bishop Mitchell Taylor and then Evie
Litwok. Mr. Byerson, you may begin when the Sergeant
announces the time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

TERRENCE BYERSON: Good afternoon,
everybody. My name is Terrence Byerson, and I am the
Community Relations Manager for STRIVE. I'd like to
thank the Council Members for having me here tonight
to discuss what STRIVE does. STRIVE is a workforce
development organization located on the east side
of Harlem. We've been here since 1984. Our main
objective is to help individuals with all types of
barriers to receive training as well as get them

gainful employment. When I say barriers, I could be talking criminal justice, housing insecurity, educational, any barrier that one may have that may preclude them from getting training and receiving jobs.

During the pandemic, we reached out to over 5,000 of our past alumni. We pivoted with hot spots and also with laptops for our current students. We currently have 3 programs running. We were awarded 2 contracts by the DOL, 1 for the re-entry community called our Fresh Start program for individuals just coming home and the Future Leaders program which is a program geared toward 18 to 24-year-old youth that's been affected by the criminal justice system. Like all of our programs, we provide training. We provide wraparound services as Speaker Brewer said earlier we cannot just get a person a job and then they go home and they have food insecurity or they have issues with mental health so we try to provide all wraparound services for all of our participants so that when they do get the job, there are no barriers to preclude them from going to work. We provide clothes, we provide (INAUDIBLE) information that they may need in order to help them remain successful. We

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
2 COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS 119

3 are currently, like I said, running 2 new programs,
4 and I am in agreement with anything NYC ETC is...

5 SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

6 TERRENCE BYERSON: Is projecting. Thank
7 you.

8 ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Mr. Byerson.
9 If either of the Chairs have a question for this
10 panelist, feel free to ask it now.

11 CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Terrence, this is
12 Gale. I have a question which is when you do the
13 wraparound services, because you have the same issue,
14 Fortune has the same, all the different programs have
15 the same issue so do you coordinate. I mean I worry
16 about the silo situations so how does that work
17 either with the other folks who are working with
18 people who have been incarcerated, how do you find
19 the employers, how does the City help you, etc.? I
20 just want to know about making sure that everybody
21 gets the support they need, not just a job, but how
22 does that actually work?

23 TERRENCE BYERSON: Definitely, we do work
24 with other community-based organizations like
25 Fortune, like Exodus, like GOSO so we do have
partnerships with them and we also use each other so

it is a chain because we're all in the same business so we want everybody to be able to succeed. If you can't succeed with STRIVE, you may be able to succeed with the Fortune Society based on your schedule so we do have great partnerships with those organizations, especially because we're all in the same area. We're right across the street from Exodus and GOSO so, yes, we do, and we have a dedicated team of about 5 job developers and employee specialists at STRIVE that go out there and create relationships with certain organizations, like we have a great relationship with Mt. Sinai Hospital, we have a great relationship with Northwell Health so our employee specialists and job developers create those relationships for our participants so that if there are any problems or anything that we can handle they know that we're there to help them succeed.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Thank you.

TERRENCE BYERSON: You're welcome.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Mr. Byerson.

Next we will hear from Bishop Mitchell Taylor followed by Evie Litwok and then Rebecca Lurie. Bishop Mitchell Taylor, you may begin when the Sergeant calls the timer.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

BISHOP MITCHELL TAYLOR: Good afternoon to the Council and to the Committee on Economic Development on today. Thank you. My name is Bishop Mitchell G. Taylor. I'm the Cofounder and CEO of Urban Upbound. Urban Upbound was founded in 2004 as East River Development Alliance, affectionately known as ERDA, to break cycles of poverty, intergenerational poverty in public housing neighborhoods and other low-income communities. We provide underserved youth and adults with the tools and resources needed to achieve economic prosperity and self-sufficiency through 6 comprehensive integrated programs, including workforce development, one-on-one financial counseling, youth development both academic and vocational, income supports, tax preparation, community revitalization through business innovation, financial inclusion, all anchored by the Urban Upbound Federal Credit Union. We believe in giving people a hand up, not a hand out, and in order to best serve our neighbors it is critical that we are physically present in the communities that we serve. That's why we run job and empowerment centers at Queensbridge, Astoria,

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS 122

Ravenswood, Far Rockaway, East Harlem, Brooklyn, and
a new center opening this year in Flushing. We
appreciate the City Council and the Administration
for the funding that allows us to serve over 15,000
New Yorkers annually. Our communities have been among
the hardest hit during the pandemic (INAUDIBLE) have
always been disproportionately affected by the crisis
and systemic discrimination, residents have lost jobs
and whatever savings they had incurring debt to be
able to sustain themselves. Our efforts and
assistance made a difference, but there is so much
more to do, and we'd like to do it in partnership
with the Council. Urban Upbound has been a pioneer in
the field of workforce development, social services.
Our services were rooted in the MDRC's Jobs-Plus
model years before the City established the first
Jobs-Plus site that was launched by our Cofounder,
Debra-Ellen Glickstein. We are convinced past
administrations...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

BISHOP MITCHELL TAYLOR: Thank you so much
for your time.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

123

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Bishop Mitchell Taylor. If either of the Chairs have a question for this panelist, feel free to ask it now.

Seeing no questions, we'll now move on to Evie Litwok followed by Rebecca Lurie and then Melat Seyoum. Miss Litwok, you may begin when the Sergeant announces the timer.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

EVIE LITWOK: Good afternoon. Thank you for the opportunity to speak today. My name is Evie Litwok. I am a formerly incarcerated lesbian and the Executive Director of Witness to Mass Incarceration. My constituents are incarcerated and formerly incarcerated people. Prior to my incarceration, I had a 30-year work history with 12 years on Wall Street and 10 in the non-profit world. I didn't get a single response from the 200 job applications I submitted. As a result, me and, like me, hundreds of formerly incarcerated people are starting small businesses. I went to non-profits serving formerly incarcerated people, got a resume, employment training, practice interview, and a few job opportunities. Cobbled together, these services did not offer me a long-term solution. The 30 years of re-entry programs have not

reduced recidivism nor have they resulted in long-term employment. This one-size-fits-all transactional model does not work and if it's the same as used for employment training, it will not work.

We propose a transformational model which creates an economic ecosystem led by and for formerly incarcerated businesses. We've developed the first of its kind online directory listing formerly incarcerated people and, by way of explanation, the Association for Enterprise Opportunity revealed black business owners have a median net worth that is 12 times that of black wage earners. However, black business owners only earn 1/10 of the income of white business owners. Just to understand further, white men own 2.875 million small businesses, black women own 41,250. The (INAUDIBLE) project is a multiyear initiative of 6 phases. We believe the model will reduce recidivism and create the long-term employment in (INAUDIBLE) businesses and apprenticeships. However, there's another caveat. It needs to be run by formerly incarcerated people. We have a shared experience which makes us trusted messengers, family, and community. My parents are Holocaust survivors.

They came to this country stateless, starving with 2
dollars and 50 cents...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

EVIE LITOWK: I have one paragraph. May I?
Yes? I watched as they and their fellow survivors
helped each other rebuild their life. They had a
shared experience no one could understand and they
built community because of their shared suffering.
The formerly incarcerated community has a shared life
experience and when we need each other, we are
family. Let us build the infrastructure so that we
can allow thousands of small businesses to begin the
process of creating wealth for our community. Thank
you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Litwok.
If either of the Chairs have a question for this
panelist, feel free to ask it now.

Seeing no questions, we will move on to
the next panelist. Next up is Rebecca Lurie followed
by Melat Seyoum and then Derick Bowers. Rebecca
Lurie, you can begin when the Sergeant calls the
timer.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

REBECCA LURIE: Greetings, and thank you.
What an honor it is to testify for you, Council
Member Farias and Council Member Brewer. Really a
pleasure. Thank you for having me.

I run a program with CUNY School's Labor
and Urban Studies Community and Worker Ownership
project (INAUDIBLE) teach, learn, and network for
skills and economic development that is centered in
community engagement, worker power, and deep
democracy. There is a level of awareness I want to
interject here that workforce development as it
evolved asks our programming to solve deeper
programs' problems of generational injustices and
unequal distribution of resources, and I can go on
about that but my time is limited.

I want to talk about the silos of the
workforce programs from business development and the
potential of a job guarantee. Council Member Brewer
referred to 70 programs and 21 agencies. I want to
add the fact that beyond the short order work of our
workforce development programs requiring a 90-day
deliverable, we have multiple means in our city to
support businesses and our workers, not least but
most important here, straight up economic development

and also far from least our public education system.

I have over 35 years of working in our city's workforce, first as a union carpenter and then teaching workers in the union's apprenticeship program and several pre-apprenticeship programs. I understand severely how much it gets driven by industry and what they need. Certified apprenticeship has that baked into the job descriptions, pay, and titles to advance from novice to expert in companies. When I was running a culinary program in Queens, we were advised to not accept people who were looking to start their own business. We were told the outcomes of business startups would not let us meet our milestones. Small businesses and even micro-businesses (INAUDIBLE) entrepreneurs need broadening support as was just spoken by an earlier speaker. The training for worker and the training for business owners needs to be blended. Every worker going through training for a particular job...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

REBECCA LURIE: I'll just finish. Thank you. Can also learn how these businesses work so people who move through our training programs can consider a level of self-employment where they are

creating a few good jobs in their small companies.
Self-employment is one of the largest growing aspects
of work today. Worker (INAUDIBLE) the model. When
workers are also the owners and work collaboratively
to run the companies they are part of. We need to
incorporate cooperative business training to serve
the fact that self-employment may well mean folks can
start companies with support from our workforce
programs. Supporting business development with social
goals should be a fundamental aspect of City-
supported economic development. The apprenticeship
model pays people as they enter work. This can be
supported with a financing model where the business
is rewarded with a wage subsidy or paid job guarantee
that will subsidize engagement as beginners develop
in their position. I sit on EDC's Offshore Wind
Advisory Council and want to add that we need to
understand the long-term changes in the market will
not answer the short-term demands of the workforce
development programming.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Rebecca, you have to
summarize because we've got too many more people. Go
ahead.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

129

REBECCA LURIE: Thank you. I hope that
with a job guarantee giving people a paycheck now,
they can earn while they learn and help us with
creating what will really be an innovative green
economy for generations to come. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Lurie.
Next, we'll move to the next panelist, Melat Seyoum,
followed by Derick Bowers and then Anh-Thu Nguyen.
Melat Seyoum, you may begin when the Sergeant
announces the timer.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

MELAT SEYOUM: Thank you, Alex. Good
afternoon, Honorable Chairperson and Distinguished
Members of the New York City Council Committee on
Economic Development. My name is Melat Seyoum. I'm
the Worker Co-op Policy Advocate for the New York
City Network of Worker Cooperatives, also known as
NYC NOWC. We are the local trade association
representing worker cooperative businesses and
democratic workplaces in New York City Metropolitan
area. I am here alongside my Colleagues from the
Democracy at Work Institute, the Working World's
Workers Justice Project, and the NYC NOWC Advocacy
Council Member representing 9 other organizations

that make up the Worker Cooperative Business Development Initiative, WCBDI. Asking New York City Council to continue supporting the expansion of worker ownership in next year's budget and formally into the future.

Since the inception of the initiative, we have created over 175 new cooperative businesses and approximately 1,000 new jobs that are not only providing higher hourly wages but also building wealth and assets for individuals who are overwhelmingly BIPOC women and immigrants. We have also seen firsthand how the initiative has served to bolster our sector, strengthening existing cooperative businesses and creating new ones which are overwhelmingly immigrant and women owned. The initiative partners have collectively worked to create a comprehensive ecosystem of support for cooperative businesses that not only ensures the creation of new worker cooperatives in low-income areas but also technical assistance needed to sustain businesses and create jobs as well as the education and outreach needed for communities, interested entrepreneurs, and allied organizations.

We ask the City Council to enhance our funding to 5,012,000 in order for our initiative to double down on the essential long-term economic recovery for cooperative businesses that would be needed to claw ourselves out of this crisis.

We thank the City Council for the opportunity to testify. We hope that you will consider our budget priorities and recommendation during this year's budget negotiation process. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Melat. If either of the Chairs have a question for this panelist, feel free to ask it now.

Seeing no questions, we will move on to the next panelist. Next up we have Derick Bowers followed by Anh-Thu Nguyen and then Merble Reagon. Derick Bowers, you may begin when the Sergeant announces the time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

DERICK BOWERS: Thank you to Chair Farias, Chair Brewer, and Members of the Committees. Thank you for allowing me to testify today. My name is Derick Bowers. I'm the Director of Social Enterprise

in New York City for the Center for Employment
Opportunities, also known as CEO.

CEO is a non-profit organization that was
founded in New York City in 1996. It provides
comprehensive employment support to individuals who
have recently returned home from incarceration
including transitional work and daily pay. CEO
believes that every person returning from
incarceration should have the opportunity for full
participation in society and be provided the support
needed to achieve social and economic mobility. At
CEO, we know that a job can prevent a return to
incarceration, and many returning citizens,
especially those who have limited work experience,
need stronger supports and on-ramps into the world of
work. Achieving our vision of economic mobility
requires city investment and incentives to create
more high quality jobs for individuals coming home
from incarceration. As a member of the New York City
Employment and Training Coalition, we urge the next
administration to adopt an inclusive growth
blueprint.

Specific to job seekers with past
convictions, we also recommend the following. One,

invest in transitional jobs during re-entry as a
bridge to permanent employment.

Two, invest in alternatives from
incarcerations and in re-entry services.

Three, provide financial incentives to
businesses that hire individuals coming home from
incarceration.

Four, create procurement structures at
the federal, state, and local levels that require
government contractors and agencies to hire certain
position of workers with a conviction history or who
have experienced incarceration.

Five, eliminate structural regulations
that prevent individuals with felony convictions from
accessing work sites. Despite recognition that a key
purpose of the workforce system is to help people
reconnect to the labor market, many recently
incarcerated individuals are shut out of the
workforce training and its training programs due to a
variety of policy and systemic barriers.

The following changes can address the
primary barriers that keep them from accessing these
training programs, which facilitate access to high

quality jobs. One, increase workforce funding for stipends and support...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

DERICK BOWERS: Support people while they're in training programs.

Two, expand eligibility criteria for apprenticeship programs and fund pre-apprenticeships that facilitate training and access to ensure equitable access to opportunities.

Finally, end incarceration labor programs that financially exploit individuals while they are incarcerated. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Mr. Bowers. If either of the Chairs have a question for this panelist, feel free to ask it now.

Seeing none, we'll move on to the next panelist. Next up is Anh-Thu Nguyen followed Merble Reagon and then Sarah Hayes. Anh-Thu Nguyen, you may begin when the Sergeant calls time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

ANH-THU NGUYEN: Good afternoon, Chair Farias, Chair Brewer, Council Members. My name is Anh-Thu Nguyen. I'm Director of Strategic Partnerships at Democracy at Work Institute or DAWI.

I'm testifying as both a member of the Worker
Cooperative Business Development Initiative, WCBDI,
and NYC ETC. We've seen best practices and inspiring
transformation through integrating worker ownership
with worker workforce development creating better
jobs, improved industry standards, and economic
stability and mobility for working families. I will
share 2 New York City success stories that have
become national models for high-road businesses and
workforce development.

First, Cooperative Homecare Associates
which has been based in the South Bronx for 37 years.
It is the largest worker cooperative in the country
and has positively transformed home healthcare, a
traditionally low wage, high turnover industry where
the vast majority of workers are BIPOC immigrant
women. Linking job quality and industry standards to
worker ownership and continuous investment in an
embedded on-the-job training and skills development
program. This workforce development model operates on
a seamless continuum from recruitment to training,
certification, placement, and employment producing
incredible workforce development results. For
example, out of 630 job seekers enrolled annually

with DHC's training program, 94 percent graduate with reportable credential, 85 percent are employed as home health aides. Of those, 68 percent remain employed after 1 year. All program graduates are guaranteed a job with CHCA if they wish. In comparison, according to the National Benchmarking Project, similar low-income training programs on average secure employment with only 29 percent (INAUDIBLE) of those, 38 percent remain employed after 1 year.

Another example, at DAWI we partner with the CUNY Institute of Mexican Studies to incubate and demonstrate another model for workforce development and social entrepreneurship (INAUDIBLE) consulting. We work together to identify promising entrepreneurial graduates with barriers to employment and want to develop their careers as non-profit service providers, providing wraparound services as they build their business, connect with clients, and build at emerging young professionals and worker/owners.

We urge City Council to continue investing..

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

ANH-THU NGUYEN: In worker cooperatives and the workforce development ecosystem in New York City through enhancing WCBDI's funding to 5.012 million for fiscal year 23, establishing a dedicated and permanent workforce development fund that provides sustainable long-term funding for employment and training programs across our agencies and initiatives and funding a new training program innovation development program with at least 100 million dollars in new funding per year that includes worker cooperatives as part of workforce development innovation and training. Thanks for the opportunity to speak about this (INAUDIBLE) worker coops is an innovative workforce development strategy. Looking forward to working together.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you. If either of the Chairs have a question for this panelist, feel free to ask it now.

Seeing no questions, we'll move on to the next panelist. Next up is Merble Reagon followed by Sarah Hayes and then Kate Krug. Merble Reagon, you may begin when the Sergeant calls time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

MERBLE REAGON: Thank you very much to the Committee Chairs and the Council Members of the opportunity to talk today. I am Merble Reagon, Executive Director of the Women's Center for Education and Career Advancement. We are an organization organized in 1970 and for the first 40 years we developed programs and services including college degree programs, small business programs, skills training for over 25,000 women. In recent years, we're better known for our research and technology development related to workforce development. In the written testimony, I'll go into more detail about the women's center and our partners.

We have developed something called, which is our 6th New York City self-sufficiency report since the year 2000. It's called Overlooked and Undercounted 2021: Struggling to Make Ends Meet in New York City. Since the year 2000, the cost of basic needs on average across New York City boroughs have increased 113 percent while median earnings have increased by only 58 percent.

We think that the report highlights the importance of ensuring that New York City's evolving

workforce development plans in the wake of the pandemic be laser-focused on addressing both the historic wage inequality for women and people of color and the economic realities of what New York City's working families actually need to make ends meet. The evidence in the report supports initiatives already underway to address wage inequities such as the Just Pay campaign to support fair wages for human services workers under contract with New York City and New York State and the New York City Salary Range Law which we commend the New York City Council for passing and hope that enforcement will also be supported. The...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

MERBLE REAGON: Thank you. There's more information in the written testimony.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Reagon. If either of the Chairs have a question for this panelist, feel free to ask it now.

Seeing no questions, we'll move on to the next panelist. Next, we will hear from Sarah Hayes followed by Kate Krug and then Joseph McDonald. Miss Hayes, you may begin when the Sergeant calls time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

SARAH HAYES: Good afternoon. I'm Sarah E. Hayes, Deputy Director of (INAUDIBLE) Economic Empowerment Program at Sanctuary for Families, New York City's largest provider of services exclusively for survivors of domestic violence and related forms of gender violence. We thank the Committee on Economic Development and it's Chair, Council Member Amanda Farias, and Council Member Brewer, for the opportunity to speak today.

Sanctuary is immensely grateful for the City Council's steadfast support of our work over the years and its unwavering commitment to addressing issues facing gender-based violence survivors. When former Mayor Bill de Blasio announced the Career Pathways Initiative in late 2014, we were thrilled. His Jobs for New Yorkers task force literally spoke our language, calling for an unprecedented full system shift toward a career pathways model, and the Career Pathways Report noted how the City's workforce development funds were overwhelmingly allocated to programs that connect job seekers to entry level positions with low wages and limited advancement prospects while only a small percentage supports training programs that could provide skills that lead

to career track jobs with opportunities for advancement. For over 4 years, running a pioneering career training program for domestic violence survivors with virtually very little public funding, we finally felt like we were being heard and, yet, since the landmark Career Pathways Report in 2014 and even in the wake of the October 2019 Comptroller's report identifying domestic violence as the leading cause of family homelessness in NYC, no RSP has been released identifying domestic violence survivors as a priority pop for workforce funding. The City Council and some of its individual members have allocated a few small discretionary grants to EEP and the program was awarded a substantial 3-year grant from the Manhattan District Attorney's Criminal Justice Investment Initiative several years ago which is now expired. However, many appeals to the administration for systemic funding of this work have gone unanswered. EEP helps clients break down barriers that have long kept the door to the 21st century economy closed.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

SARAH HAYES: Just a little bit more. For poor women. The 4-month career readiness program

delivers advanced office technology training leading to stackable certifications in Microsoft Office along with structured English and math literacy training. During COVID, we transformed this training for virtual delivery and provided over 200 participants with new laptops, hot spots, and internet service plans to facilitate participation, bridging the digital divide since March 2020.

Overall, in the past decade, it's delivered digital trainings to over 1,000 women and 950 graduates to date, obtaining over 550 jobs. Solid placement numbers, but it's wage outcomes are really what stands out and in the last 3 years graduates have earned over 12 million in aggregate wages. Clients have secured nearly 100 job placements in the past 14 months with average salaries of 43,000 dollars per year, and the first program placements in early 2022 are averaging over 55,000 dollars. Additional information can be found in the submitted testimony.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Hayes. If either of the Chairs have a question for this panelist, feel free to ask it now.

Seeing no questions, we will move on to the next group of panelists. Next, we will hear from Kate Krug followed by Joseph McDonald and then Sinade Wadsworth. Kate Krug, you may begin when the Sergeant calls the time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

KATE KRUG: Good afternoon, everyone. My name is Kate Krug. I'm the Executive Vice-President at Nontraditional Employment for Women, or NEW. Thank you, Chair Farias and Brewer, Speaker, Council Members, and Staff who put this hearing together. I also want to thank SBS and Jackie Mallon for her continued commitment to women and construction and a keen focus on climate change, childcare, and bridges to pre-apprenticeships, meeting women where they're at.

I'm here today representing NEW as a member of the New York City Employment Training Coalition, and we're requesting increased investments in key workforce development initiatives like the 250 million for COVID re-employment programs. The workforce ecosystem in New York City is need of a stronger economic support to help New Yorkers facing employment barriers and those with impeded access to

economic opportunities, especially New Yorkers from communities that have been historically marginalized and disinvested like the low-income black and brown women and women facing childcare concerns, women that NEW supports and serves.

This has been paralleled by an increased need and demand for workforce services from both New Yorkers, employers, and small businesses. NEW will leverage its 44 years of vital work preparing low-income women for high-paying careers in skilled trades and continue to provide wraparound services such as increasing access to childcare to enhance access to construction education and careers. As many of you know, NEW's programming transformed the lives of women across New York City by providing pathways to careers in the building and construction trades. These careers offer financial security with wages starting at 19 dollars per hour and access to middle class wages, benefits through unions, opening doors to stability and resources for women and their families. The Bureau of Labor Statistics finds that unionized women make on average 23 percent more than women without a union.

As a member of the New York City
Employment Training Coalition and leader in workforce
development opportunities such as a founding member
of the Green Economy Network, we turn to you now and
we're looking for tangible new investments,
implementation plans, and an equal seat at the table
to help New Yorkers. Thank you for your time.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Krug. If
either of the Chairs have a question for this
panelist, feel free to ask it now.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: I do have a quick
question, Kate, and congratulations on everything
that NEW has done and will do. Again, back to this
issue of, if you can't figure it out, nobody can, in
terms of wraparound for your members and so on so are
there still gaps in services that you would like to
see filled. Obviously, I think I know, you know all
the issues that need to be addressed so the question
is the biggest change probably is the construction
apprenticeship program in terms of money. All the
others are great. Yours is the best in terms of
having a middle class career, union, and so on for
the women you serve. So are there gaps that a less
siloed workforce ecosystem could address?

KATE KRUG: I think working together to face the (INAUDIBLE) that childcare services, being able to create a voucher system, a cash assistance program, a stipend program to leave it in the hands of those that we're serving to make the decisions and have their own autonomy to help them figure out how they can access their training and education opportunities and then of course their placement opportunities and not just focusing that on construction where it's nontraditional hours and have all these other layers to it but also, as you said, bringing it to the larger workforce development ecosystem and really helping to remove that barrier of the childcare burden that's kind of stopping people from being able to access just opportunities.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: All right. Thank you.

KATE KRUG: Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Krug.

Next, we will hear from Joseph McDonald followed by Sinade Wadsworth and then Lashima Goshine. Joseph McDonald, you can begin when the Sergeant calls time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

JOSEPH MCDONALD: Good afternoon. I'm Joseph McDonald, Co-President of the Institute for

Career Development, a 105-year-old non-profit workforce development provider that helped more than a quarter of a million New Yorkers with disabilities transform their lives. Throughout our history, we've adjusted our focus periodically to capitalize on new opportunities to support New Yorkers with disabilities. We have recently made one of those adjustments. Working with the renowned non-profit consulting firm, the Bridgespan Group, we've identified a major gap in serving people with disabilities in New York City that, if filled, could enhance career opportunities earlier in life. That gap exists in the transition from school to career, during which school-based supports end and career opportunities have not yet arisen. We are focusing on youth with disabilities while they are on high school to better prepare them to make the jump to college or vocational training and to start their careers. Our approach is to work within public schools to create long-term individualized holistic career plans for and with students with disabilities, their families, and their communities to increase graduation and employment. While ICD is making the initial investments to launce this pilot program, scaling its

impact to help more New Yorkers with disabilities will depend on growing support from a network of partners including government agencies. For that reason, we're pleased to testify today in support of NYC ETC's recommendation that a permanent workforce development fund be created to provide sustainable long-term funding for employment and training programs. Two elements of this proposal that are crucial. First, that it be permanent, and, second, that it be flexible and provide support across agencies and initiatives. For the work that we do to be most effective, it's components cannot be siloed. All too often, city funding is unnecessarily difficult to apply for and restrictive in its application. The result is that service providers lose time and money working to weave together various strands of funding for different purposes from different sources to be able to provide services in a holistic way that sees, serves, and preserves the dignity of people with disabilities seeking employment. A permanent centralized workforce development fund that recognizes the need to support holistic career services for young people with

disabilities would be an incredible economic engine
for New York City. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Mr. McDonald.
If either of the Chairs have a question, please ask
it now.

Seeing no questions, we will move on to
the next group of panelists. Next up will be Sinade
Wadsworth followed by Lashima Goshine and then Diana
Caba. Sinade Wadsworth, you may begin when the
Sergeant calls time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

SINADE WADSWORTH: Good afternoon,
everyone. My name is Sinade Wadsworth. Can you hear
me?

ALEX PAULENOFF: Yes, we can hear you.

SINADE WADSWORTH: My name is Sinade
Wadsworth. I'm a representative for the New York City
District Council of Carpenters and a student and
graduate of Nontraditional Employment for Women 10
years ago.

Thank you, Chair Farias and Gale Brewer
and the Speaker of the Council and Members of the
Council who put this hearing together. I also want to
thank you for your longstanding commitment to NEW as

well as for your continued support for gender equity
for New York City's tradeswomen like myself.

I am here today representing NEW as a
member of the New York City Employment Training
Coalition, and we're requesting increased investments
in key workforce development initiatives like 250
million for the COVID re-employment program. The
workforce ecosystem in New York City is in need of
stronger economic support to help New Yorkers face
the employment barriers and those with impeded access
to economic opportunities, especially New Yorkers
from communities that have been historically
marginalized and disinvested like the low-income
black and brown women that NEW supports and serves.

This has been paralleled by an increased
need and demand for workforce services from both New
Yorkers and employers and small businesses. NEW will
leverage its 44 years of vital work preparing low-
income women for high paying careers in the skill
trades towards enhancing access to such careers among
historically marginalized communities.

As many of you know, NEW's programming
transforms the lives of women across New York City by
providing pathways to careers in the building trades,

especially for women like myself who grow up in
NYCHA, and I can say that this career has changed my
life for the better. These careers have offered
financial security with starting wages at 19 dollars
per hour. The Bureau of Labor Statistics finds that
unionized women make on average 23 percent more than
women without a union. As a member of the New York
City Employment Training Coalition and a leader in
workforce development, opportunities for low-income
black and brown...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

SINADE WADSWORTH: women in New York, we
turn to you now, we are looking for tangible new
investments, implementation plans, and equal seats at
the table to help New Yorkers. Thank you so much for
your support now and thank you so much for your
continued support in the future.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Wadsorth.
If either of the Chairs has a question for this
panelist, feel free to ask it now.

Seeing none, we'll move on to the next
panelist. Next up is Lashima Goshine followed by
Diana Caba and then Larry Rothchild. Lashima Goshine,
you may begin when the Sergeant calls time.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

152

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

LASHIMA GOSHINE: Good afternoon. My name's Lashima Goshine. On behalf of Jewish Home (INAUDIBLE) Manhattan or the New Jewish Home Manhattan, I want to thank you, Chair Farias and Brewer and the Members of the Committee on Economic Development and Committee on Oversight and Investigations for the opportunity to testify today.

I work at the New Jewish Home as a program manager for its geriatrics career development high school program, a workforce development training program for underserved young people in New York City. I love my job because GCD transforms lives, both the life of young people and older adults. We do this by creating a pipeline of highly trained healthcare workers. The New York City Council is already a part of this transformation through discretionary funding allocations. We are so grateful to you and hope to count on your continued support.

GCD exists to bridge the gap between geriatric care job openings and underserved young people. The staffing shortage is now a full-blown crisis. Meanwhile, young people are disconnected from school and work at alarmingly high rates. GCD

prepares young people for living wage jobs in
healthcare. GCD provides hands-on experience, paid
internships, job training, and courses in healthcare
certifications aligned with the needs of the
healthcare industry. Each year, GCD serves
approximately 225 participants ages 14 to 24 at no
cost to them. GCD currently partners with (INAUDIBLE)
public high schools to serve students in grades 10 to
12 through a 3-year after school, out of school time
program. GCD also trains young adults ages 18 to 24
who are not in school and unemployment through a 3-
month full-time program. Of our nearly 1,000 program
graduates since 2006, 90 percent are currently
employed, enrolled in postsecondary programs, or
both. GCD also builds pathways to college for
hundreds of young people. As a 2000 graduate from
GCD's high school program, I can personally attest to
its power. I graduated from (INAUDIBLE) High School
on time. As a GCD graduate, I was a certified nursing
assistant right out of high school. Working as a CNA
caring for older adults enabled me to important work
but also broadening my understanding of career
opportunities in the healthcare field. Today, I have

a Masters in public health. I learned a lot through
the...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time.

LASHIMA GOSHINE: And becoming a
professional leader. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Goshine.
If either of the Chairs have a question for this
panelist, please ask it now.

Seeing none, we'll move on to the next
panelist. Next up, we'll hear from Diana Caba
followed by Larry Rothchild and then Karen Imas.
Diana Caba, you may begin when the Sergeant calls
time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

DIANA CABA: Good afternoon, Chairs Brewer
and Farias and all Committee Members. Thank you for
the opportunity to provide testimony. My name is
Diana Caba, and I am the Assistant Vice President for
Policy and Community Engagement at Hispanic
Federation, a non-profit organization seeking to
empower and advance Hispanic communities through
creating programs (INAUDIBLE) advocacy. Our testimony
today is also informed by over 38 Latino non-profit
organizations in all 5 boroughs and contributed to

the development of La Gran Manzana: the Road Ahead
for New York City's Latino Community. (INAUDIBLE) a
blueprint with recommendations on how the New York
City Mayor and Council can improve the lives of
nearly 2.5 million Latinos who call New York City
home. New York City's economy has been significantly
shaken by the pandemic. The COVID-19 lockdowns cost
Latino families their jobs and their businesses. For
the poorest of New Yorkers, the loss of employment
meant long lines at community food banks and concerns
over being evicted from their homes. The economic
recovery from this crisis will require a significant
investment from the City. Much of our recovery will
depend on addressing immediate concerns such as jobs,
small business support, hunger relief, and
importantly affordable housing with eviction
protection. It will be especially important to craft
an economic recovery agenda that reaches (INAUDIBLE)
all 5 boroughs, expands loans and grants for
businesses hurt by COVID-19, helps individuals and
families stay in their homes, and support worker
sense of stability and security by investing in
wraparound services including childcare, internet and
computer access, transportation, food security,

mental health, and financial empowerment, and
empower, provide security, and increased ability to
learn and earn.

HF's network of Latino non-profits is
committed to continue to serve as a connector and a
resource for workers and businesses in New York City
and helping them access government support and
providing those in need with educational, technical,
and social assistance programs.

Just to further elaborate, increasing
(INAUDIBLE) funding opportunities for community-based
workforce development programs that provide
wraparound services to meet the increased need and
demand for workforce services for both New Yorkers
and employers, especially small businesses, is
critically important. This includes funding adult
literacy and immigration...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time expired.

DIANA CABA: The needs of immigrant job
seekers, encouraging guarantees of city-funded
workforce development programs, to work with all
community members (INAUDIBLE) increasing training and
employment opportunities for green jobs, jobs that
require visual skills, remote employment options,

increasing access to childcare and addressing transportation issues and so on and so forth. Thank you for consideration. More recommendations are outlines in our written testimony. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you. If either of the Chairs have a question for this panelist, feel free to ask it now.

Seeing none, we will move on to the next panelist. Next up is Larry Rothchild followed by Karen Imas and then Janice Quarles. Larry Rothchild, you may begin when the Sergeant has called time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

LARRY ROTHCHILD: Good afternoon. I'm Larry Rothchild, Director of Workforce Development at St. Nicks Alliance. St. Nicks Alliance supports over 13 members of our community each year with adult education and skills training and job placement. Just since the pandemic, we've really expanded our skills training to both adults and disconnected youth. We trained and placed over 320 in the last year in some critical areas, in green training, construction, HVAC, environmental (INAUDIBLE), urban greenscaping, healthcare, PCT, CNA, HHA, and technology. We've added data analytics, IT helpdesk support, and

customer service, and we've also added a big digital literacy for all. What we're looking for, we're in support of NYC ETC's proposal for the 250 million dollars employment programs with subsidized employment and employer engagement. There's 2 areas that are a big focus to us.

We see a big need for internships. We do have internship support in a lot of our programs, but we're limited by DYCD allotments, often a 50 percent allotment, and we find that internships would be beneficial to all of our participants in building industry experience, both adults and young adults so we'd like to see a growth there.

Then, as mentioned as others, training stipends is really critical as our participants try to get through trainings that vary in length from about 7 weeks to 12 weeks or longer, and we feel that training stipends would be very critical for them to build their career pathway to success so we're advocating for those areas that build on the support that we're providing through transformational coaching, workplace success, job readiness, and supportive services.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Mr. Rothchild.
If either of the Chairs has a question for this
panelist, feel free to ask it.

Seeing none, we will move on to the next
panelist. Next up, we'll hear from Karen Imas
followed by Janice Quarles and then Michelle Saenz.
Karen Imas, you may begin when the Sergeant has
called time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

KAREN IMAS: Thank you, Chair Farias,
Chair Brewer, and Council Members. I'm Karen Imas
with the Waterfront Alliance, an organization of
1,100 plus alliance partners committed to resilient
and revitalized waterfronts. We look forward to
working with this Council and the new Administration
to ensure that New York Harbor and the city's 520
miles of waterfront are central to the economic
recovery and well-being of New Yorkers, and we're
heartened to see the city's new Economic Development
Blueprint acknowledges the role that climate
resilient infrastructure and offshore wind can play
to generate new pathways of opportunity for New
Yorkers.

First, we are pleased to see offshore wind highlighted so prominently in the City's new blueprint and encouraged by recent investments that position South Brooklyn Marine Terminal as a major regional offshore wind hub. New York City is home to extraordinary educational institutions that are positioned to train this workforce but they will need additional resources, partnerships, and technology to create these pathways of opportunity. This means starting with the youngest students such as vocational high schools including the Harbor School and up through higher educational institutions like La Guardia Community College, Kingsborough, and CUNY Maritime. These homegrown institutions have the potential to create the next generation of researchers, scientists, engineers as well as trade workers that are critical to offshore wind growth.

Next, we urge this Council and the Administration to consider the maritime sector more broadly beyond offshore wind as a workforce drive. The maritime sector is rapidly evolving and changing with growing interest in ferry transit, cleaner vessel, supply chain, and moving goods on the water. Blue Tech, for example, is the advanced technology

sector for maritime industry and much like NYC ETC
has invested in strategies for various tech clusters
like Fintech and Biotech and will encourage the same
level of attention to the Blue Tech sector through
partnerships, incubators, and startup competitions.
We also commend the administration for acknowledging
coastal resilience projects of the Economic
Development Plan. Infrastructure jobs focused on
coastal and climate resilience projects are on the
rise from landscape, architecture to coastal
engineering to building (INAUDIBLE). We can do more
to lift up the City's working families through bold
climate adaptation...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time.

KAREM IMAS: And infrastructure
investments needed for future climate risk. I've
submitted more detailed testimony with more
information. Thank you for the opportunity to testify
today.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Imas. If
either of the Chairs have a question for this
panelist, feel free to ask it now.

Seeing no questions, we'll move on to the
next panelist. Next up is Janice Quarles followed by

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

162

Michelle Saenz. Just a reminder to anybody who is remaining who has still not heard their name called or who signed up to testify who has not had a chance to testify, please use the Zoom raise hand function, and we will see about adding you to the list. Next up is Janice Quarles. You may begin when the Sergeant calls time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

JANICE QUARLES: Good afternoon. Thank you, Committee Chairs and Members, for holding today's hearing on workforce development. My name is Janice Quarles and I'm an independent workforce development services consultant.

I have worked with award-winning non-profit organizations like the Brooklyn Navy Yard Corporation, the Hope Program, (INAUDIBLE) Workforce Development Corporation among other institutions. I was pleased to learn of Mayor Adams' Rebuild, Renew, Reinvent initiatives, and as we look ahead to the future, I believe Mayor Adams' vision will guide much of our work. I am glad this administration is looking at workforce development as an intricate part of the city's economic recovery. Indeed, an adequate trained, skilled, and motivated workforce is one of

the foundations for the success of New York City economy as we look ahead. I want to express my support for the proposal of the New York City Employment Training Coalition to add monetary commitments to the vision put forth by Mayor Adams and Deputy Mayor Torres-Springer. The Coalition is correct in calling for additional dollars to support New York City's workforce development ecosystems and to improve coordination with regard to existing funding streams, but perhaps there has been one item overlooked by the Coalition concerning the skillsets of frontline workforce development professionals. In prior years, the focus of these individuals on the frontline has been to provide job seekers with skills training that connect the newly trained to employment and place them on the road leading to a career pathway, but COVID-19 has forced us to rethink and retool the efforts of the frontline workforce development professionals. In this recovery period, our long...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time.

JANICE QUARLES: Placement and career pathway challenges are still present. The new challenges lie with how to incorporate coaching and

mental health supports into the work the frontline workforce development professionals provide. In the years ahead, those of us in the field must be more than trainers and connectors. We must have the capacity to recognize the mental health challenges facing those we engage, (INAUDIBLE) into screening and diagnosis capacity of frontline professionals and provide them with coaching, counseling, and referrals to help those we serve.

In closing, as such a critical component of our workforce development efforts in the future will lie with incorporating as mental health support infrastructure that has a specific workforce development focus, it is my hope that this administration recognizes the need for a dedicated mental health resources as a revamp, reshape, and a rest of our workforce development ecosystems. Thank you.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Quarles. If either of the Chairs have a question for this panelist, feel free to ask it now.

Seeing no questions, we're going to move on to the next panelist. Next up is Michelle Saenz followed by Catherine Murcek. As a reminder to any

remaining panelists, if you have not testified and you still wish to do so, please raise your hand now. Michelle Saenz, you may begin when the Sergeant calls time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

MICHELLE SAENZ: Thank you all for this opportunity to testify. I am Michelle Saenz, Senior Project Officer at The Working World. We are a non-profit CDFI that specializes in providing financing and technical assistance to worker cooperatives. We are also a part of the Worker Cooperative Business Development Initiative which you heard a little bit about today already. (INAUDIBLE) a very important to our organization and many others as we've grown to meet the need and demand for this type of work.

One of The Working World's main area of focus here in New York City is cooperative conversions, which means taking an existing company and transitioning it to worker ownership usually through the buyout of the current owner. We usually meet with a business owner or a group of workers and facilitate the (INAUDIBLE) process. From having those initial conversations with stakeholders to evaluating the company to financing the purchase and then

providing the necessary support and training to the
new worker owners so that they can be successful
business owners.

As a result of this initiative, we've
been consulting with businesses across all 5 boroughs
in all kinds of sectors from manufacturing to
childcare to retail. In the coming months and years,
some of these businesses will be functioning worker
cooperatives that will change the lives of
(INAUDIBLE) worker owners giving them a new voice in
their workplace and a share in the profits of the
company.

This pandemic has shown us just how
vulnerable the economy is. As we emerge out of this
pandemic, we can't just return to business as usual.
We need an economy and an approach to economic
development and recovery that centers people first.
Worker cooperatives are a solution to that, and the
solution is thriving here in New York City. Thank you
all for your time.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Saenz. As
a reminder, if anyone wishes to testify and still has
not done so, please raise your hand now. If not, we
will hear from our final panelist, Catherine Murcek.

Actually, we have one more afterwards. Catherine Murcek followed by Gisele Castro. Catherine Murcek, you may begin when the Sergeant calls time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

CATHERINE MURCEK: Thank you so much for the opportunity to testify. My name is Catherine Murcek. I'm a worker owner at Samamkaya Yoga Back Care and Scoliosis Collective and a member of the Advocacy Council coordinated by NYC NOWK who you heard from earlier which is a partner organization of WCBDI which you also just heard about. You've heard about how City Council support of our community of democratically run businesses helps to protect and create jobs for women, immigrant workers, and communities of color across the 5 boroughs and in a wide array of industries. I'm testifying today to urge you to help NYC with a just recovery by continuing to support the great work of WCBDI by enhancing their funding to 5.01 million and to also support commercial rent stabilization for small businesses across the City. My co-op, Samamkaya, is a beautiful little studio in Chelsea specializing in therapeutic applications of yoga and with a mission of making yoga accessible to all bodies. My 19 other

worker owners and I have been democratically running the same space for 7 years, which we had to borrow money to build to our very specific needs, and we're so grateful that we've weathered this storm so far and we're able to hold on to our physical space due to a variety of factors. We weren't eligible for financial relief from the City but we did access PPP loans, and we were one of the few lucky small businesses I know of who were able to negotiate our rent. However, I think the fact that we're a cooperative had a major impact on our resilience. When we had to shut our doors, we banded together, repivoted, decided how to change our pay and fee structures, we divided the labor of figuring out what to do, we discussed together how to keep the studio afloat while still allowing teachers who needed the work most to keep teaching online. Also, as members of the worker co-op community, we had access to certain small grants specific to worker co-ops and technical support from WCBDI partners. One of the grants we received was from NYC NOWK's Cooperative Sustainability Fund that awarded us funds to pay for 10 sessions with a consultant from another co-op and

these sessions have been crucial to help us with some
communication challenges...

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time.

CATHERINE MURCEK: Distribution of... I'll
wrap it up really quick. Distribution of labor
challenges that we were facing during the difficult
transition to working online and really happy to say
we were able to reopen our physical space. We have
both in-person and virtual classes now. While we're
still grateful to still be afloat, our future is
still uncertain because our new lease is going to
raise the rent gradually over 10 years to get back to
market rate, which is already too high and our space
is very small. We have limited opportunities for
growth. A fair and just system of commercial rent
stabilization would help to protect our business and
help all small businesses in the City plan for the
future. I have a lot more in my written testimony.

In conclusion, please enhance (INAUDIBLE)
funding and support commercial rent stabilization to
ensure a just recovery in NYC. Thank's so much.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Murcek.

Next, we will hear from final panelist, Gisele

Castro. Miss Castro, you may begin when the Sergeant calls time.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Time starts now.

GISELE CASTRO: Good afternoon, everyone. This is an absolutely pleasure to be here, and thank you so much for this opportunity. I want to thank Chairmember Gale Brewer and also Chairmember Farias. It's so great to see everyone.

I am Gisele Castro, the Executive Director of Exalt Youth. We work with young people who are court-involved, ages 15 through 19, and we focus as an organization on 3 very specific areas which is criminal justice avoidance, academic progression, and employability through our career exploratory model. As an organization, we have been designed to create a culturally relevant and culturally responsive curriculum to ensure that our young people are making economic advancement. It is important for me to note that within our internship model or internship component, Excel has raised all of our funding through fundraising dollars to service and to provide our young people a stipend of 16 dollars an hour to 18 dollars an hour, and we have over 600 internship providers. It is exciting to hear

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS

171

and the officer understand this new initiative which
is to advance many people throughout New York City.
My focus are teenagers, and I did submit testimony
which gives a stronger overview of the organization
and what we have done and the impact, but I would say
that although we work with 15 through 19, we have a
core component for our graduates, and as an
organization which has developed an alumni division
and an alumni component to look at what is workforce
development (INAUDIBLE). We have partnered with
Trinity Wall Street (INAUDIBLE) certification. We
work very closely with CUNY, and also as an
organization last year, we just launched an endowment
to make sure that those young people who are
interested in vocational training and also are
interested in going to college so they have the
economic access to do so. We want to thank everyone.
I will pause because I now that we all have been
sharing our unique experiences.

SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Thank you so much.

GISELE CASTRO: Thank you so much. My time
expired as I was wrapping up and saying thank you and
closing out. Once again, congratulations, and I'm

very happy to have had the opportunity to speak this
afternoon.

ALEX PAULENOFF: Thank you, Miss Castro.
We will now turn it back to the Chairs for closing
remarks.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you so much,
Alex. Thank you to everyone who came today with
public testimony. I know that each of you are doing
all of the good work in our communities with what you
got and I hear the call for more investments. It is
truly the only way that we actually prepare our
communities for meaningful employment while being
able to meet them where they're at. Know that you
have allies in myself and Chair Brewer. I quickly
want to shout out Council Member Kalman Yeger who has
stood this entire hearing. Thank you for sticking it
out with us. Thank you to Commissioner Jackie Mallon
of Small Business Services and Executive Vice
President for Initiatives of Economic Development
Corporation Faye Penn for showing up and testifying
today. I look forward to working together and
following up on our partnerships that can bolster
workforce development in the city. Our priority is to
create a citywide agenda on workforce, and I hope to

hear from and work with our Office of Workforce
Development in the future. I'll turn it over to Chair
Brewer to close.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: I want to thank Chair
Farias for having a great partnership and for
understanding this topic personally, professionally,
and I know that she and I know Joe McDermott, and we
both learned a lot from him over the years. I
certainly want to thank Council Member Yeger who has
not missed one minute of this hearing, and it is,
again, much appreciated.

I would say that this is a community of
professionals and certainly the fact from the folks
who have the coordination of all, Annie, thank you
very much for making that happen. The work that you
did to bring everybody together is phenomenal, and
Employment and Training is a wonderful organization,
and we can rely on you. It's not every industry that
has such an organization so congratulations. Thank
you very much. A lot of work went into this.

Second, I think as I said earlier, this
is the right time to be discussing this. Not only are
we coming out of the pandemic, but there is in
Washington whether it's the current legislation that

has passed or hopefully even more infrastructure,
there is so much money available. I just chaired a
discussion on that topic in Washington last week, and
there's just grant after grant after grant to apply,
but you have to be matching, you have to be ready,
you have to have the sustainability locally to be
able to do that so I think this is the time to do it.
Fortunately or unfortunately, the good news is that
there is a blueprint. The bad news is it just needs a
whole lot of work. It needs funding as you need
earlier, but it also needs some kind of not just
coordination but I think a redo. As I said, I don't
want it to be called the Office of Workforce, because
that just means you're going to coordinate 21
agencies. (INAUDIBLE) the Office of Talent or figure
out something that you have fewer agencies, more
streamlined, and some of the issues that were brought
up today get satisfied so that people have the kinds
of jobs they need. There are jobs out there. There
are 1 million people without high school degrees. We
heard that today and we know it and there are people
who have language challenges. For goodness sake, this
is the time to make those problems, those challenges,
those barriers go away. This is not rocket science.

We really need to take the challenge and I hope in the City Council we can be a partner and that we can end up at the end of 2 years or 4 years with not just a blueprint but actual recovery that gives people the opportunities that they deserve.

Thank you very much to the staff. You really have been phenomenal, and we look forward to working with you. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Right before we close, I'd just like to acknowledge Council Member Jennifer Gutierrez who made it, but you're seeing us out. Thanks for coming. I will now use my fancy gavel (INAUDIBLE) to close us out. [GAVEL] Thank you everyone.

1	COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATIONS	176
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 24, 2022