

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS AND
DISPOSITIONS

----- X

August 4, 2021
Start: 2:21 PM
Recess: 2:57 PM

HELD AT: HYBRID HEARING - Chambers/Virtual
Room 1

B E F O R E: Kevin C. Riley,
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Barron
Peter A. Koo
I. Daneek Miller
Mark Treyger

A P P E A R A N C E S

Kate Lemos McHale
Landmarks Preservation Commission

Anthony Fabre
Landmarks Preservation Commission

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS 3

2 (UNKNOWN: 00:00:03): Pc recording is on.

3 SERGEANT LUGO: Chambers recording is rolling.

4 Uh, it's started.

5 SERGEANT KOTOWSKI: Good afternoon, and, welcome
6 to today's remote New York City Council hearing of
7 the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings and
8 Dispositions.

9 At this time, would council staff please turn on
10 their video? Please place electronic devices on
11 vibrate or silent.

12 If you wish to submit testimony, you may do so at
13 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. That is
14 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

15 Thank you, Chair, we are ready to begin.

16 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Good afternoon, I am Council
17 Member Kevin Riley, Chair of the Subcommittee on
18 Landmarks, Public Sitings and Dispositions.

19 I am very pleased to be joined, in person for the
20 first time as Chair, by my colleagues Council Member
21 Koo, Council Member Barron, and Council Member
22 Treyger.

23 Today we will be hearing two designations of
24 historic landmarks. We then expect to vote on these
25

2 items and two accelerated two UDAAPs we heard at our
3 meeting on June 15th.

4 But, before we begin, I want to say a few words
5 about our Hybrid Hearing format in continuing COVID
6 precautions.

7 We are together... We are together today in
8 council chambers, because the governor has lifted the
9 COVID state of emergency, restoring the normal
10 operations of the New York State Open Meetings Law.

11 For members of the public, who are comfortable
12 attending in person, we have invited testimony to be
13 presented here in chambers.

14 Capacity here is very limited, due to the social
15 distancing protocols, while all who wish to testify
16 will be heard. Mindful, that many people are still
17 more comfortable testifying remotely, we have also
18 invited people to join us via, uhm, via Zooms.

19 Members of the Public who wish to testify via
20 Zoom or asked to register for today's hearing, if you
21 registered to testify and are not yet signed in to
22 the Zoom, please sign in and remain signed in until
23 your... Until after you have testified.

24 If you wish to testify remotely, and have not
25 registered, please go to www.council.nyc.gov/land-

2 [use](#). Once again, that is www.council.nyc.gov/land-
3 ... excuse me [/land.use](#) to sign up now.

4 Please do not sign in to Zoom unless you plan to
5 testify. You can watch the hearing on the New York
6 City Council website.

7 All people testifying remotely will be on mute
8 until they are recognized to testify. Please confirm
9 that your mic is unmuted before you begin speaking.

10 Public testimony for all witnesses, other than
11 applicants, will be limited to two minutes per
12 widths.

13 If you have written testimony you would like the
14 subcommittee to consider in addition to or in lieu of
15 appearing before the subcommittee, or if you require
16 an accessible version of a presentation given at
17 today's meeting, please email

18 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Please indicate
19 the Land Use number or project name in the subject
20 line of the email.

21 As with any meeting that involves a remote
22 component, there are many... There may be extended
23 pauses if we encounter technical problems. We ask
24 that you please be patient as we work through these
25 issues.

2 I now open today's public hearing on our first
3 item.

4 LU 820 is an application submitted by the
5 Landmarks Preservation Commission, pursuant to
6 section 3020 of the New York City Charter and
7 sections 25 25-303 of the Administrative Code of the
8 City of New York for the designation of Holyrood
9 Episcopal Church - Iglesia Santa Cruz, located at
10 Manhattan (Block 2176, Lot 30) as a historic
11 landmark.

12 The site is located in council district
13 represented by Council Member Rodriguez.

14 Our first panel is Kate Lemos McHale and Anthony
15 Fabre testifying on behalf of the Landmarks
16 Preservation Commission.

17 This panel will be testifying remotely, so I ask
18 that these witnesses now be unmuted and the counsel
19 administer the affirmation.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Can the applicants please
21 raise their right hand and state their name for the
22 record?

23 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Kate Lemos McHale

24 ANTHONY FABRE: Anthony Fabre

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the
3 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in
4 your testimony before the subcommittee and in answer
5 to all council member questions?

6 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: I do.

7 ANTHONY FABRE: I do.

8 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. You may begin your
9 presentation.

10 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Thank you, Chair Riley, and
11 good afternoon, uhm, subcommittee members. It's nice
12 to see you back in your chambers. Hopefully our,
13 uhm, slideshow can be shared on the screen.

14 Great, thank you. Uhm, thanks for the
15 opportunity to present the Holyrood Episcopal Church
16 - Iglesia Santa Cruz, which was designated on May 18,
17 2021 as in individual landmark.

18 Next slide, please.

19 Holyrood Episcopal Church - Iglesia Santa Cruz
20 is architectully significant as a sophisticated
21 Gothic Revival design by the architectul firm of
22 Bannister and Schell -- and historically and
23 culturally significant as an important social and
24 religious anchor for the Washington Heights Latino
25 Community -- for the past 40 years.

2 Built in 1911 to 16, the church has remained an
3 important institution within the neighborhood, its
4 congregation changing to reflect the influx of
5 residents from the Dominican Republic, Puerto Rico
6 and other Spanish-speaking places starting in the
7 1960's.

8 By nine... By 2012 in recognition of its role in
9 this community the church changed its name to add the
10 Spanish translation, becoming Holyrood Church -
11 Iglesia Santa Cruz.

12 At the public hearing on March 23rd, three people
13 spoke in support of designation, including Reverend
14 Luis, uh, Barrios, priest in charge of Holyrood-
15 Iglesia Santa Cruz, who has been, uhm, a tremendous,
16 uhm, champion of designation and of all the
17 humanitarian programs, uhm, going on at the church.

18 Uhm, and we also heard support from
19 representatives at the New York's Landmarks
20 Conservancy and The Historic District's Council.

21 We had no testimony in opposition to designation
22 and, additionally, received a letter of support from
23 Manhattan Community Board 12.

24 Next slide, please.

2 Sited on the corner of West 179th Street and
3 Fort Washington Avenue, the freestanding church is
4 located directly across from the George Washington
5 Bridge Bus Station. And the landmark site consists
6 of the entire (INAUDIBLE 00:07:33).

7 Next slide, please.

8 As New York City's population, uhm, increased
9 dramatically in the late 19th century, the Episcopal
10 Bishop, Henry C. Potter, encouraged the establishment
11 of additional parishes within the diocese.

12 Holyrood parish was established in Upper
13 Manhattan in 1893 by William O. Embury.

14 In 1895, the congregation built up its first
15 church -- pictured here on the left -- uhm, in a...
16 in a country lake setting on the corner of Broadway
17 and 181st Street.

18 In 1911, the congregation bought property on Fort
19 Washington Avenue for the present day church, which
20 is shown on these maps, uhm, with the kind of green
21 triangle. Uhm, and the first service was held there
22 in 1913 in the partially constructed sanctuary --
23 which, you can see in the 1913 map on the right.

24 Next slide, please.

2 Holyrood's new church was designed by Bannister
3 & Schell, a firm that designed a broad range of
4 buildings in New York City, including many religious
5 properties. Completed in 1916, and dedicated in
6 1917, Holyrood Church became one of the most
7 impressive and beautiful churches in the
8 neighborhood.

9 Next slide, please.

10 Holyrood Church quickly gained a reputation for
11 inclusiveness and humanitarian causes. In 1919,
12 shortly after the new church was dedicated, the
13 congregation welcomed Gustav Carstensen as its new
14 rector. And, he's shown here. He has previously
15 resigned from his former parish, because it did not
16 welcome Black children, uhm, from a nearby orphan
17 asylum to worship at the church. Uhm, but at
18 Holyrood, he was known in his day for very
19 progressive, and often came to support causes that
20 were unpopular with some of his fellow clergy in the
21 diocese. And, as was noted in his 1941 obituary,
22 under his leadership, Holyrood became one of the
23 leading churches in Washington Heights. And, its
24 ministry and outreach programs continue to champion
25 inclusiveness to this day.

2 Uh, next slide, please.

3 During the 20's and 30's, the neighborhood
4 attracted a large number of Greeks, Irish, and Jewish
5 people who settled there in increasing numbers --
6 many escaping political turmoil in Europe.

7 In the 1950's and 60's, the area began to attract
8 a large population of Spanish - speaking people, uhm,
9 with many coming from Puerto Rico and Cuba.

10 By the 1980's, Dominicans became the dominant
11 Spanish - speaking cultural group in northern
12 Manhattan.

13 Political changes beginning in the 1960's finally
14 allowed people to leave the Dominican Republic after
15 years of repression. They settled in Washington
16 Heights, uhm, where the cost of housing was more
17 affordable, and public transportation was available
18 to where they worked.

19 The Dominican Day Parade began in 1981 in
20 Washington Heights celebrating their culture and
21 contributions to the city.

22 And, by 2000, the Latino population represented
23 75 percent of the population in Washington Heights
24 and Inwood, with Dominicans making up the majority of
25 those residents.

2 In 2018, the neighborhood was officially honored
3 as Little Dominican Republic.

4 Next slide, please.

5 In response to the growing Latino community in
6 the neighborhood, in the 1960's the Holyrood Parish
7 starting offering, uh, Spanish - Language Services.
8 Additionally, the church has provided facilities for
9 the Dominican Women's Development Center, an
10 independent nonprofit, that advances gender equality,
11 social justice education, and similar causes.

12 Today the parish has become actively involved in
13 many humanitarian programs, and is particularly known
14 for its new sanctuary program -- offering a safe
15 haven and help for immigrants in need.

16 The parish has also recently added services for
17 the hearing impaired.

18 The church just celebrated its 125th anniversary,
19 and has continued to serve as an anchor in resource
20 to the residents of the predominately Latino
21 community.

22 Uh, recently, the church included Iglesia Santa
23 Cruz as part of its name to express its dual
24 identity. The Medieval English word, Holyrood and
25

2 the Spanish Santa Cruz both translate to "Holy
3 Cross".

4 Next Slide, please.

5 The architectural design of the church is a
6 Gothic Revival style that was often preferred by the
7 Episcopal Church, with its 19th century interest in
8 English Medieval architecture. The front - facing
9 gable terminates a tall (INAUDIBLE 00:12:14) with
10 buttressed side aisles and a clear... And, clear
11 story windows. Tall pinnacles frame the main window
12 and extend far beyond the parapet, creating a
13 striking appearance in the skyline.

14 Articles written about the new building when it
15 opened reported that its design was inspired by the
16 Hereford Cathedral in England, which is shown here on
17 the right.

18 Uh, next slide, please.

19 Dominating the entrance façade, is an impressive
20 tall-arched stained-glass window with delicate stone
21 tracery.

22 Filigree Gothic Details in terracotta at the
23 front façade, contrast dramatically with the more,
24 uhm, robust quarry faced stone along the south
25 façade.

2 A narrow parking lot, to the north of the
3 building, was originally intended to accommodate a
4 small chapel that was never built.

5 Minor alterations, including signage, replacement
6 doors, uh, window protectors covering historic
7 windows and tracery, uhm, and the installation of
8 ramps for universal access.

9 Uhm, but today... Uh, next slide, please...

10 Holyrood Church - Iglesia Santa Cruz, is remarkably
11 intact with excellent integrity of design and
12 materials with outstanding example of a Gothic
13 Revival Church; has served Washington Heights since
14 its construction over a 100 years ago, and continues
15 to serve the diverse, predominately Latino community
16 offering services and programs in Spanish, as well as
17 English.

18 During the past 40 years, it has expanded its
19 community outreach and continues its tradition of
20 humanitarian and culturally diverse programs.

21 The Landmarks Preservation Commission recommends
22 the city council vote to uphold its designation,
23 thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you Kate.

2 I just have one question. Uh, given the age
3 of... of the building and the intricacy of its
4 materials -- including the stain-glass windows -- can
5 you describe the current condition of the building,
6 and if the congregation may need to pay for any new
7 major restoration work going forward? If so, what
8 technical and financial help is available to them?

9 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Sure, and it's a great
10 question. This church actually has been going
11 through a lot of, uhm, renovations already. They
12 have received grants from The New York Landmarks,
13 uhm, Conservancy. They've done a lot of work, uhm,
14 to restore the roof. And, they're currently doing
15 some more work, uhm, on the building and below. And,
16 also, to make a space where they offer, uhm, a food
17 kitchen, uhm, more available. And, they are working
18 with our grants program, uhm, for that as well.

19 So, the... The historic sites... Uh, sorry
20 the... Now I'm forgetting the precise name of the
21 grant, but The New York Landmarks Conservancy, uhm,
22 is an excellent, uh, source for things this.

23 And, uhm, and our grant program, while smaller,
24 and it would be limited to work that would done on

2 its, uh, on any part of the church that's not in
3 religious use.

4 Uhm, but, we also... Uhm, understanding the
5 needs of churches, is... Is a really important part
6 of how we work with them in our... In our many, uhm,
7 designated churches. We really understand that for
8 churches, their main priority is often their mission.
9 Uhm, and, so, keeping their buildings intact, uhm, is
10 something that we work with them very carefully and
11 have... Have a lot of expertise in our staff to
12 give, uhm, guidance through that.

13 ANTHONY FABRE: Kate, uhm, the... It's the Sacred
14 Sites Funds, uhm...

15 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Thank you... (CROSS-TALK)

16 ANTHONY FABRE: (INAUDIBLE 00:15:53) Conservancy.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you Kate. Thank you
18 Anthony.

19 Uhm, before we move on, I just want to see if my
20 colleagues have any questions?

21 No? Okay.

22 Thank you for your testimony on this item.

23 Before we move on to the public testimony, I'm
24 going to ask LPC to remain to pres... To be present
25 for the next item.

2 I now open the public hearing on LU 821, an
3 application submitted by The Landmarks Preservation
4 Commission pursuant to Section 3020 of the New York
5 City Charter and Section 25-303 of the Administrative
6 Code of the City of New York for the designation of
7 Educational Building located at 70 Fifth Avenue in
8 the Manhattan as an historic landmark.

9 The landmark site is located in the district
10 represented by Speaker Johnson.

11 Kate Lemos McHale and Anthony Fabre will present
12 on behalf of the Landmarks Preservation Commission.

13 I remind them, that you are still under oath. And,
14 you may begin.

15 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Thank you very much Chair
16 Riley.

17 Uhm, and, I'll just start as the slides come back
18 up.

19 Uhm, thank you for the opportunity to present the
20 Educational Building 70 Fifth Avenue in Manhattan,
21 which was designate on May 18th, 2021 as in
22 individual landmark.

23 Next slide, please.

24 The Educational Building, 70 Fifth Avenue, was
25 constructed between 1912 and 1914. Commissioned by

2 George Arthur Plimpton, a successful book publisher
3 and philanthropist, this 12 story office and loft
4 building housed the national office of the National
5 Association for the Advancement of Colored People, as
6 well as a remarkable group of tenant organizations
7 that shaped American thought on society -- including
8 several that remain active and influential today.

9 At the public hearing on May 23rd... On, excuse
10 me, March 23rd, fifteen people testified in favor in
11 the designation including representatives of the New
12 School, uh, who owns the property, Speaker of the New
13 York City Council Corey Johnson, New York State
14 Assembly Member Deborah Glick, State Senator Brad
15 Hoylman, Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer,
16 Manhattan Community Board 2, The Armenian Bar
17 Association, Historic Districts Council, J. Rosamond
18 Johnson Foundation, The New York Landmarks
19 Conservancy, Victorian Society of New York, and
20 Village Preservation.

21 No one spoke in opposition to designation. Some
22 Speakers also testified in support of further
23 landmark designations in Union Square. And, the
24 commission also received more than eighty-five
25 written submissions in support of the designation.

2 Next slide, please.

3 The Educational Building, 70 Fifth Avenue,
4 occupies an "L" shaped lot on the southwest corner of
5 West 13th Street Greenwich Village. The landmark
6 site is its full tax lot shown here.

7 Uh, next, please.

8 The NAACP is one of the oldest and largest civil
9 rights organizations in the United States. Founded
10 in New York City in 1909, it sought to fight racism
11 through legal and educational means.

12 The national office leased offices at 70 Fifth
13 Avenue for almost ten years, from February 1914 to
14 June 1923. Initially located on the 5th floor, it
15 moved to the 6th floor in 1919. This was an
16 especially important chapter in the association's
17 early development in history during the post-
18 reconstruction area, when racists Jim Crow laws and
19 practices buttressed discrimination and segregation.
20 The NAACP grew nationwide during this period, and
21 watched a series of effective campaigns against
22 segregation, race discrimination, and mob violence,
23 particularly the horrendous practice of lynching --
24 which escalated following the revival of the Ku Klux
25 Klan in the mid 1910's.

2 The Director of Research and Publicity, the
3 prominent African-American sociologist, W. E. B. Du
4 Bois, seen in the... on the right here, in his
5 office at 70 Fifth Avenue, was a founder of the
6 organization and editor of its influential journal,
7 The Crisis.

8 Next, please.

9 Du Bois founded The Crisis in 1910, and was
10 editor until 1934. This popular, self-supporting
11 magazine, which had a paid circulation of more than a
12 100 and (INAUDIBLE 00:20:22)... 100 Thousand by
13 1919, had offices on the building, and continues to
14 publish today.

15 This influential publication continued monthly
16 columns and news reports about NAACP activities, as
17 well as contributions from noteworthy artists and
18 writers associated with the Harlem Renaissance.

19 Next, please.

20 In 1920 and 21, Du Bois and Augustus Granville
21 Dill, operated an independent publishing company, Du
22 Bois and Dill, which published The Brownie's Book,
23 the first magazine specifically written for young
24 African-American readers. Du Bois wanted to be...
25 them to be proud of their race and knowledgeable

2 about their history and achievements. Published
3 monthly, the pages were filled with positive imagery
4 and stories by notable Black authors.

5 Langston Hughes, for instance, made his debut in
6 the Brownie's Book in 1921. In various issues of the
7 magazine, he contributed a poem, a play, a short
8 story, and non-fictions pieces.

9 Next.

10 One of the most import figures in the national
11 office was James Weldon Johnson, a former diplomat
12 and skilled tactician, he organized the memorable
13 silent march down Fifth Avenue in 1917, to protest
14 violence against Black people in Saint Louis and
15 Memphis -- and, as Field Secretary -- oversaw the
16 establishment of hundreds of new local branches --
17 including many in southern states. In 1920, he was
18 appointed Executive Secretary making him the first
19 African-American to lead the NAACP.

20 Next, please.

21 Under Johnson's leadership, Dyer bill to make
22 lynching a federal crime was passed by the US House
23 of Representatives in 1922, but was blocked by a
24 filibuster in the senate.

2 Though nearly a century would pass before a
3 similar law would finally win passage, the NAACP's
4 campaign played an important role in confronting the
5 issue and raising the association's national profile.

6 The NAACP and The Crisis Magazine moved to 69
7 Fifth Avenue at the northeast corner of 14th Street
8 in July of 1923. That building, which is, uhm, shown
9 in this photograph, uhm, was later demolished, and it
10 was the location of the NAACP office when it hung the
11 now famous banner, "A Man was Lynched Yesterday" from
12 a window in 1936 as part of the organizations
13 continued campaign against the atrocity of lynching.

14 And, 70 Fifth Avenue is visible in this
15 photograph to the south -- just below that green
16 arrow.

17 Uh, next, please.

18 In the years leading up to World War I, The
19 Educational Building attracted a great number of peace
20 advocates. So many that newspapers called it the
21 "Peace Building".

22 Plimpton, the building's owner, was a trustee in
23 the World Peace Foundation and The Church Peace Union
24 -- now the Carnegie Council, which was active at 70
25 Fifth Avenue for several decades.

2 He also provided office space at no charge to the
3 New Yorker branch of the Women's Peace Party, founded
4 in 1915 by suffragettes Jane Addams and Carrie
5 Chapman Catt.

6 Tenants with similar interests including the
7 American Neutral Conference Committee, The League to
8 Enforce Peace, The New Yorker Peace Society, and The
9 Emergency Peace Federation.

10 Another noteworthy group associated with the
11 building was the American Committee for Armenian and
12 Syrian Relief, now called The Near East Foundation.

13 Next, please.

14 The American Civil Liberties Union also traces its
15 beginnings to The Educational Building. Initially
16 called The National Civil Liberties Bureau, it was
17 founded in New Yorker by The American Union Against
18 Militarism, which was a pacifist group headed by
19 Lillian Wald and Crystal Eastman. Uhm, and evicted
20 following raids by The Justice Department in 1918, it
21 was soon relaunched as the ACLU. Today, this
22 organization, of course, has offices in every state
23 and more than a million members.

24 Next, please.

2 Another notable tenant was the National Board of
3 Review founded in 1909. For several decades films
4 that gained its approval were accompanied by the
5 screen label "Passed by the National Board of
6 Review".

7 This organization also sponsored publications
8 devoted to film criticism, uhm, such as shown here.
9 Uhm, Films in Review is... is now, uhm, still in
10 print, and is the oldest periodical of its kind in
11 The United States.

12 Next, please.

13 The Plimpton family sold 70 Fifth Avenue
14 (BACKGROUND NOISE 00:24:56) in 1946. Uhm, in
15 subsequent years it had several owners including the
16 educational publisher Prentice Hall and real estate
17 developer Jack Brouse (SP?).

18 Uh, next, please.

19 The building's architect was Charles A. Rich,
20 formally of the noted firm Lamb and Rich. Uhm, and
21 it's an understated example of the Beaux Arts style,
22 the white brick, and possibly the capstone
23 elevations, display a tripartite configuration
24 consisting of a three story base, an eight story
25 midsection, and a two story crown.

2 Most of the original neoclassical ornament is
3 well preserved, including the door surrounds,
4 pilasters, composite capitals, relief panels,
5 keystones, rounded pediments, and an extensive
6 terracotta cornice.

7 Next, please.

8 In reference to Plimpton's publishing company and
9 the various educational tenants, the door surrounds
10 that face West 13th Street display cartuccias that
11 frame small images of open books, while sun bays, on
12 the uppermost floors, have iron grills with gilded
13 book reliefs.

14 Next, please.

15 The New School for Social Research acquired 70
16 Fifth Avenue in 1972. A significant institution with
17 close associations to Greenwich Village, it was
18 founded in 1919 as a progressive center for adult
19 education and now incorporates five colleges.

20 The building was sensitively renovated in 2005 to
21 6, and is currently part of the Sheila C. Johnson
22 Design Center at the Parsons School of Design/The New
23 School.

2 And, the award winning renovation, uhm, that is
3 pictured here, modified the show windows on the first
4 floor and enlarged the West 13th Street entrance.

5 Uhm, next, please.

6 The well preserved Educational Building is
7 historically significant as the former national
8 office of the NAACP in the early 20th century, as
9 well as the many significant organizations that
10 advance social justice and equality.

11 The legacy carried on for almost 50 years by The
12 New School, uhm, we're very glad to have their
13 support for designation and the Landmarks
14 Preservation Commission recommends the city council
15 vote to uphold this designation. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you Kate.

17 This building's a prime example of the power of
18 individual landmarks. It is beautiful, artic...
19 architectully significant, and perhaps, most
20 importantly, historically significant to the city and
21 the country as a whole.

22 At over a 100 years old, can you explain why only
23 now this designation is being considered?

24 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: That is a good question. Uhm,
25 and... And, we would... were asked through our

2 designation process as well. Uhm, and I think, uhm,
3 it is an incredibly significant building in terms of
4 its history. Uhm, I think maybe at first it hadn't
5 stand... stood out as much for its architecture.
6 Uhm, but it is a very handsome Beaux Arts style
7 building.

8 And, as we expanded our research, we are very
9 grateful to Village Preservation and the many
10 advocated that sent us letters about it and helped
11 reveal its history. And, as we did more research as
12 well to... to really uncover the depth of the, uhm,
13 significance in this building, it was... it is
14 really important to have designated. And, we're...
15 we're really pleased to be here today.

16 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Kate.

17 I would like to see if my colleagues have any
18 questions?

19 There being no more council member questions,
20 this panel is now excused.

21 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you both.

23 We will now vote to approve the two individual
24 landmarks that we heard, and the two accelerated
25 UDAAPs we heard at our June 15th meeting.

2 In addition to these landmark designations, we
3 will vote to approve pre-considered Land Use 813, the
4 TBK1002-Riseboro UDAAP and Article XI... Excuse me
5 and R XI.

6 This application was submitted by HPD, pursuant
7 to Article 16 of the General Municipal Law and
8 Section 577 of the Private Housing Finance Law
9 requesting approval of an urban development action
10 area project, waiver of the area designation
11 requirements, and the requirement of Sections 197-c
12 and 197-d of the New York City Charter, and approval
13 of a real property tax exemption for property located
14 at 135 Menahan Street (Block 3306, Lot 53), in the
15 Brooklyn Council District represented by Council
16 Member Darma Diaz.

17 These actions would facilitate the rehabilitation
18 of a vacant 6-unit building for rental with families
19 with annual household incomes up to 120% of AMI, with
20 rent set at 60% of AMI.

21 We will also vote to approve reconsidered Land
22 Use application, TBK1002 MBD-UDAAP and Article XI tax
23 exemption. This application was also submitted by
24 HPD, pursuant to Article 16 of the General Municipal
25 Law Section 577 of the Private Housing Finance Law

2 requesting approval of an urban development action
3 area project, waiver of the area designation
4 requirements, and the requirements Sections 197-c and
5 197-d of the New York City Charter, and approval of a
6 real property tax exemption for properties located at
7 970 Anderson Block, uhm, excuse me Anderson (Block
8 2504, Lot 70) and 1105 Tinton Avenue, (Block 2661,
9 Lot 52) Borough of The Bronx.

10 The properties are located in the council
11 districts represented by Council Member Gibson and
12 Ayala.

13 Counsel, please call the roll.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Uh, Chair, before we call the
15 vote, uhm, I'm just waiting to confirm that no one
16 signed up to testify for the Landmarks items. And,
17 uhm, maybe the meeting can stand at ease while we
18 check. And, then, we can close the hearing. And,
19 I... Then I will call the vote.

20 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay.

21 Are there any more members of the public who wish
22 to testify on LU 820, and... or 821?

23 Seeing now that the public hearings on LU 820 and
24 LU 821 are now closed.

25 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair.

2 Just to continue on with the vote for a vote on
3 Land Use items 813, 814, and what we heard today,
4 uhm, 820 and 821.

5 But, uhm, sorry, Chair, we're pausing to confirm.

6 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: No problem.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Alright, proceeding with the
8 vote, since no one signed up to testify on the public
9 hearing items, again for Land Use 813, 814, 820, and
10 821.

11 Chair Riley?

12 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Aye on all.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Koo?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Barron?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to explain my
17 vote?

18 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Permission granted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

20 Uhm, voting yes on Land Use 820 and 821, the land
21 marking items, and I am voting no LU 813 and 814.

22 Uh, I've listened to the hearing that we had
23 previously on those items, and I note that there are
24 no designated income bands for the eligibility to
25 apply. It says, "Up to 120%", which is rather high

2 in the areas where these, uh, projects are located.

3 And, it does not have designate, uhm, a number of
4 apartments at each of those income bands that would
5 be below 120.

6 And, also, for LU 814, there's still an open
7 issue as to the number of units that would be able to
8 be co-op units. I think it's a... Question is, I
9 read that they would be offered, but there's not a
10 definitive number yet.

11 And, I also recall that when I asked them about
12 an elevator in that, uh, the response that came back
13 was that it's cost prohibitive. It would be 1.3
14 million dollars for an elevator. And, I think that
15 in the 21st century, in 2021, when we're talking
16 about increasing accessibility and providing
17 affordable housing, there needs to be a way to make
18 sure that a six story walk up can include an
19 elevator. And, it's not being done in this project.

20 Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Treyger?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I vote aye.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: LU's 820, 821, 813, and 814
24 are approved and recommended through a Land Use
25 Committee.

2 And, the final vote is for 820 and 821, 4 in the
3 affirmative, no negative, no abstentions.

4 And, for 813 and 814, 3 in the affirmative, 1
5 negative, and no abstentions.

6 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank concludes today's
7 business.

8 I remind you that if you have written testimony
9 on today's items, you may submit it to
10 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov, once again, that's
11 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Please indicated
12 the Land Use number or the project name in the
13 subject heading.

14 I would like to thank applicants, members on the
15 public, my colleagues, subcommittee counsel, Land Use
16 staff, and the Sergeant At Arms for participating in
17 today's hearing.

18 This meeting is hereby adjourned.
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date August 11, 2021