

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

December 8, 2014  
Start: 1:25 p.m.  
Recess: 3:03 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES  
Public Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO  
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Maria Del Carmen Arroyo  
Inez D. Barron  
Fernando Cabrera  
Margaret S. Chin  
Andrew Cohen  
Costa G. Constantinides  
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.  
Elizabeth S. Crowley  
Laurie A. Cumbo  
Chaim M. Deutsch  
Inez E. Dickens  
Daniel Dromm  
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.

Mathieu Eugene  
Julissa Ferreras  
Daniel R. Garodnick  
Vincent J. Gentile  
Vanessa L. Gibson  
Daniel G. Greenfield  
Vincent Ignizio  
Corey D. Johnson  
Ben Kallos  
Andy L. King  
Peter A. Koo  
Karen Koslowitz  
Rory I. Lancman  
Brad S. Lander  
Stephen T. Levin  
Mark Levine  
Alan N. Maisel  
Steven Matteo  
Darlene Mealy  
Carlos Menchaca  
Rosie Mendez  
I. Daneek Miller  
Annabel Palma  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan J. Richards  
Ydanis A. Rodriguez  
Deborah L. Rose  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Ritchie J. Torres  
Mark Treyger  
Eric A. Ulrich  
James Vacca  
Paul A. Vallone  
James G. Van Bramer  
Mark S. Weprin  
Jumaane D. Williams  
Ruben Wills

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

3

[pause, background noise and sound check]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay, we're going to get started. We have one ceremonial before we start our stated meeting. So if we could ask Council Member Van Bramer, we have a ceremonial to the Healing Arts Initiative, which is a non-profit organization dedicated to removing barriers to arts and culture. And, very appropriate as he is the chair of our Cultural Committee. So with that, I'll hand it over to our Majority Leader Jimmy Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker, and on this very powerful day, we would like to ask all of the folks from the Healing Arts Initiative to join us at the front of the room. Healing Arts Initiative is a non-profit arts organization that uses art to remove barriers, particularly for those isolated and marginalized New Yorkers facing--there he goes--some very trying circumstances. And we are thrilled to honor a number of folks from the organization. John and Monty, why don't you stand here. It's very, very exciting to have folks here, and I wanted to thank everyone from the organization for being here. John and Monty here are constituents of mine in Sunnyside, and I saw some

1  
2 of Monty's artwork, which was on display at a  
3 beautiful show recently. And this organization is  
4 doing great work in Queens and throughout the city to  
5 make sure that every single person has the ability to  
6 express themselves, and to really have their lives  
7 enhanced through the power of art. And Monty and his  
8 father showed me their artwork. There was a show  
9 displaying Monty's artwork, and lots of his friends  
10 and colleagues. And we wanted to honor this  
11 organization on their 45th anniversary. They were  
12 born the same year I was, and they're doing great,  
13 treat work throughout the City of New York. And I  
14 was very, very touched by seeing Monty's artwork, and  
15 the brochure that accompanied the artwork and his  
16 wonderful, wonderful skill. And it was beautiful,  
17 and we are just so happy that this program is  
18 available to Monty and his classmates. And their  
19 lives are changed and enhanced because of the work  
20 that this organization is doing in such a very, very  
21 special way. So thank you to all the staff, and all  
22 the folks who are here. Thank you to Monty  
23 especially for representing all the students. He's a  
24 fixture in Sunnyside, and we all love him very  
25 dearly. Monty, your artwork touched me, your

1  
2 brochure touched me, and that's why we have to honor  
3 you all here today. So thank you, John, his very,  
4 very dear father, and all the folks. So with that,  
5 we read the Proclamation. We will read the  
6 Proclamation.

7 CLERK: Council City of New York  
8 Proclamation. Whereas, the Council of the City of  
9 New York is proud to honor Healing Arts Initiative  
10 for 45 years of inspiring, healing, growth, and  
11 learning to engagement in the arts for our city's  
12 most underserved populations, and

13 Whereas, since Healing Arts Initiative,  
14 formerly known as Hospital Audiences, Inc. was  
15 established in 1969 this not-for-profit organization  
16 based in Long Island City, Queens has remained  
17 committed to make the arts accessible to all New  
18 Yorkers especially individuals who are isolated and  
19 marginalized due to institutionalization,  
20 hospitalization, disability, and illness, as well as  
21 at-risk youth in low-income neighborhoods. Each year  
22 it serves more than 198,000 underserved individuals  
23 with an array of arts, education, and wellness  
24 programs, and  
25

1  
2           Whereas, today Healing Arts Initiative is  
3 nationally recognized for its work in areas of arts  
4 and healthcare in addition to coordinating live  
5 performances at senior centers, nursing homes,  
6 hospitals, rehabilitation centers, schools and other  
7 social and healthcare facilities. It offers free and  
8 low-cost tickets to cultural events, participatory  
9 arts workshops to foster creative express and audio  
10 description services for blind and visually impaired  
11 theater patrons, and

12           Whereas Healing Arts Initiative also  
13 presents original music and dance performances to mid  
14 to large-scale venues. It recently re-launched its  
15 wheelchair accessible program, which facilitates  
16 group travel and specially designated buses that can  
17 transport ten wheelchairs and an additional 12 non-  
18 wheelchair riders. This is the only transport option  
19 in New York City for large numbers of wheelchair  
20 users, and

21           Whereas, Healing Arts Initiative's art  
22 studio program serves as a hub for artists living  
23 with mental and emotional challenges. With dedicated  
24 studio instructors, participants engage in a wide  
25 range of creative endeavors and have unparalleled

1  
2 opportunities for community inclusion and personal  
3 development. This year studio artists presented at  
4 the Outsider Art Fairs in New York and Paris, the  
5 NADA Fair in Miami, and the White Columns Gallery and  
6 Frieze Art Fair in Manhattan, and

7           Whereas, in April 2014, Healing Arts  
8 Initiative arts partnered with the New York Mets to  
9 present its first Developmental Disability Awareness  
10 Day at City Field, an event that offered artist with  
11 mental and developmental disabilities the chance to  
12 show their works in front of a large crowd. More  
13 than 100 works were exhibited behind the bullpen.  
14 Rewards were presented on the field before the game,  
15 and the Mets defeated the Cardinals--

16           COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: [interposing]  
17 Fair enough, that's---

18           CLERK: --[interposing] And whereas, the  
19 arts have long been recognized for their power to  
20 bridge differences connecting individuals of  
21 different backgrounds and experiences through the  
22 shared experience of art, literature, and dance.  
23 Thus, healing communities as well as individuals.  
24 Healing Arts Initiative has proven this again and  
25

1  
2 again, and has earned the gratitude of all New  
3 Yorkers with its excellent work.

4 Now, therefore, be it known that the  
5 Council of the City of New York proudly honors  
6 Healing Arts Initiative in celebration of its 45th  
7 Anniversary. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the  
8 entire Council; Jimmy Van Bramer, the Majority  
9 Leader, Council Member 26th District Queens.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you  
11 very much, Mr. City Clerk, and I think Joshua Kelly  
12 is going to speak on behalf of the organization.

13 JOSHUA KELLY: Thank you, Council Member.  
14 It's sort of strange to accept an award with a somber  
15 tone, and we appreciate the gravity of the situation.  
16 We don't diminish that at all. We do want to thank  
17 the Council for everything you're doing to recognize  
18 us here today. We love being in Long Island City.  
19 It allows us to serve all five boroughs in the city,  
20 and HAI goes into nursing homes. We go into group  
21 homes, rehabilitation centers. We work with the  
22 Veterans Administration. Wherever there is a barrier  
23 to access in the arts, we are there to knock that  
24 barrier down. We know we've been very like-minded in  
25 that mission. So it's great to be here today. Thank



1  
2 you to the Speaker and to the Administration, the New  
3 York City Department of Cultural Affairs, and the New  
4 York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene for  
5 allowing us to do what we do. Thank you very much.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Than you very  
7 much, and while the-- [applause] While the day is  
8 very full of emotion for all of us, we still want to  
9 recognize your work, and the difference you're making  
10 in Monty's life, and the lives so many other  
11 individuals with wellness disabilities and other  
12 challenges. So you are changing the world for the  
13 better every single day, just as we in the Council  
14 have taken a stand today to try and make the world  
15 better. So thank you all very, very much, and now I  
16 think we'll get closer and take a picture, and thank  
17 you all so very much.

18 [pause]

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,  
20 can I have your attention, please? At this time,  
21 please place all electronic devices to vibrate. All  
22 electronic devices to vibrate. Will all non-Council  
23 employees with the exception of the Clergy on the  
24 floor, please leave the main floor of the chambers.  
25 Thank you.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

10

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please rise for  
the Pledge of Allegiance.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

[Pledge of Allegiance]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Roll call.  
Please be seated.

CLERK: Arroyo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.

CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER [off mic]

CLERK: Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

CLERK: Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

CLERK: Cohen.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: [off mic] Here.

CLERK: Constantinides.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

CLERK: Cornegy.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

CLERK: Crowley.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

CLERK: Cumbo.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [off mic]

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

CLERK: Deutsch.  
COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.  
CLERK: Dickens.  
COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: [off mic] Here.  
CLERK: Dromm.  
COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.  
CLERK: Espinal.  
COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: [off mic]  
CLERK: Eugene.  
COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.  
CLERK: Ferreras.  
COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: [off mic] Here.  
CLERK: Garodnick.  
COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [off mic]  
CLERK: Gentile.  
COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: [off mic]  
CLERK: Gibson.  
COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.  
CLERK: Greenfield.  
COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: [off mic]  
CLERK: Johnson.  
COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.  
CLERK: Kallos.  
COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

STATED MEETING

12

1  
2 CLERK: King.  
3 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [off mic] Present.  
4 CLERK: Koo.  
5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.  
6 CLERK: Koslowitz.  
7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.  
8 CLERK: Lancman.  
9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic]  
10 CLERK: Lander.  
11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.  
12 CLERK: Levin.  
13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [off mic]  
14 CLERK: Levine.  
15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.  
16 CLERK: Maisel.  
17 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Here.  
18 CLERK: Matteo.  
19 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: [off mic]  
20 CLERK: Mealy.  
21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [off mic]  
22 CLERK: Menchaca.  
23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.  
24 CLERK: Mendez.  
25 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

CLERK: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Here.

CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic] Here.

CLERK: Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [off mic] Here.

CLERK: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

Here.

CLERK: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

CLERK: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

CLERK: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.

CLERK: Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: [off mic]

CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

CLERK: Ulrich.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: [off mic]

CLERK: Vacca.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [off mic]

CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

CLERK: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

CLERK: Weprin.

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.

CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic]

Here.

CLERK: Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Present.

CLERK: Ignizio.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: [off mic]

CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: [off mic]

Here.

CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I'm here.

[pause]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please rise for  
the Invocation delivered by Reverend Peter Heltzel,  
Associate Pastor of Theology, New York Theological  
Seminary, 475 Riverside Drive in New York.

1  
2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Rise, please.

3 REVEREND HELTZEL: Let us pray. God, oh,  
4 merciful one, whose glory is in all the world. We  
5 commend New York City to your merciful care. While  
6 being guided by your providence may we dwell secure  
7 in your peace. Grant to Mayor de Blasio wisdom and  
8 strength as he governs New York City in ways of  
9 wisdom and light. Energize Public Advocate James, as  
10 she advocates for the homeless and hurting,  
11 especially our children of color. This day we pray  
12 that your Holy Spirit would fall upon Speaker Mark-  
13 Viverito, and each member of the City Council of New  
14 York and their staffers blessing them with the spirit  
15 of wisdom, charity, and justice. That with steadfast  
16 purpose they may faithfully serve in their offices  
17 and promote the wellbeing of all New Yorkers. We  
18 thank you, Oh, Lord, for their public service, hard  
19 work and long days and sleepless nights. Fill them  
20 with a love of truth and righteousness and make them  
21 ever mindful of their calling to serve this city with  
22 a deep reverence of you, our Creator and our  
23 Redeemer. We commend to your compassionate care all  
24 those who are in any way afflicted or distressed in  
25 mind, body, or estate. Particularly the family and

1  
2 friends of Eric Garner. I can't breathe. We can't  
3 breathe. God can't breathe. Saint Paul says when  
4 one member suffers all suffer together. If one  
5 member is honored, all rejoice together. Oh, God,  
6 make and mold our broken hearts into a citywide  
7 movement for real police reform working for the  
8 restoration of a broken Criminal Justice System.  
9 Gracious God, look with compassion on the whole human  
10 family in New York City. Take away the arrogance and  
11 hatred, which infects our hearts. Break down the  
12 walls that separate us. Unite us, elected officials,  
13 labor unions, community groups, and faith leaders in  
14 the bonds of love. That through our work of  
15 collective action to build a more beloved city, that  
16 New York City could shine as a beacon of hope to New  
17 York State, to the nation, and to the world. We pray  
18 this, oh, God in your holy name. Amen.

19 COUNCIL MEMBERS: [chorus of amen]

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be  
21 seated. A motion to spread the Invocation? Council  
22 Member Levine.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam  
24 Public Advocate, I would indeed like to make a motion  
25 to spread the Invocation in full upon the record.



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Messages and papers from the Mayor.

[pause]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Adoption of Minutes, Council Member Treyger. Motion that the Minutes of the Stated Meeting of November 13th be adopted as printed. Messages and papers from the Mayor.

CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication from City, County, and Borough Offices.

CLERK: M-202 Proposed Maritime Lease.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Landmarks, Public Siting, and Maritime Uses.

CLERK: M-203 through M-210 on page 2, Bay Station Licenses.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Transportation.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and Communications.

CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call Ups.

CLERK: None.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
Chambers.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We will now hear  
from Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Good afternoon,  
and buenas tardes, Madam Public Advocate, and to all  
my colleagues, I want to thank Reverend Heltzel, and  
all the clergy that have joined us here today in  
spreading your love and prayers to this body. I'd  
like to ask my colleagues and everyone that is here  
to please rise.

[pause]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So 11 times, 11  
times Eric Garner cried for help, and 11 times his  
cries went unheard. I can't breathe. I can't  
breathe.

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I  
can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe.

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I  
can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I  
can't breathe.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I  
can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I  
can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I  
can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I  
can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I  
can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I  
can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I  
can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We needed to  
start today and begin this session by making note of  
the ongoing debate related to Eric Garner's death.

1  
2 We are clearly at a crossroads in this city, and in  
3 this nation. And the spontaneous and not so  
4 spontaneous actions that we have seen erupt reflect  
5 that. We have seen this past month and throughout  
6 history the effects of the justice system that  
7 predictably buckles when a shield is involved, and  
8 unarmed Black, Latino, or Asian is left dead. What  
9 happened to Eric Garner was not justice. The law  
10 enforcement fears the communities they are sworn to  
11 protect. That is not justice. When communities of  
12 color cannot always trust the police to work with  
13 them when the color of your skin or where you lives  
14 makes you a target. When it becomes clear that it's  
15 becoming a crime in this city to simply be who you  
16 are, that is not justice. A system that produces  
17 this much pain is clearly broken. We understand as  
18 representatives that are on the ground everyday that  
19 the overwhelming majority of police officers serve  
20 our city with great honor and distinction and  
21 demonstrate respect for members of our community.  
22 But still, we must be clear that those officers who  
23 violate that sense of respect and trust must be held  
24 accountable for their actions.

1  
2 I'm proud that this City Council has a  
3 history of taking the lead on police community  
4 relations, and on the demand for reform, and  
5 accountability. And we're going to take the steps  
6 needed to uproot the systematic bias so engrained in  
7 our society to make sure that tragedies like these do  
8 not happen again. That families like Garner and all  
9 others that have borne this pain don't have to go  
10 through that again. This Chamber has led on the  
11 issue, and will continue to do so moving forward, and  
12 with that I ask my colleagues for a moment of  
13 silence.

14 [pause for a moment of silence]

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, my  
16 Colleagues.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

18 [background noise]

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And I know that  
20 after a statement like that I want to be clear that  
21 we have a commitment to do the work that we need to  
22 do in terms of oversight, and making solid and  
23 substantive recommendations, policy recommendations  
24 that we do expect this Administration to embrace.  
25 But at the same time, there is other of business that

1  
2 I would like to proceed on, and hopefully in the  
3 sense of the spirit that we're in, we could try to  
4 get through this as quickly as possible. There are  
5 some other important, very important matters that we  
6 wanted to at least bring up. And I don't want that--  
7 So today, the Council is going to voting on  
8 legislation to change the City's Energy Code. State  
9 Law has empowered New York City to create our own  
10 energy Code, and Introduction 550-A sponsored by  
11 Council Member Jumaane Williams by request of the  
12 Mayor will do just that. This bill increases energy  
13 efficiency standards and updates all policies to  
14 create a more efficient and sustainable New York  
15 City. [coughs] I would like to thank Jeff Baker, Ed  
16 Atkins, Jim Wilcox, Raju Qadri [sp?], Jose Conde, and  
17 Regina Aguilar [sic] for their work on this  
18 legislation. And not sure if Council Member Jumaane  
19 Williams would like to say a few words.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I would like to  
21 thank the Mayor and the Speaker and my colleagues for  
22 quickly passing Intro 550-A, a bill that will update  
23 the City's Energy Conservation Construction Code.  
24 When enacted, the code revisions will yield and  
25 energy savings of almost 18.2% to building owners

1  
2 across the city. It will bring us one step closer to  
3 achieving the Mayor's One City Built to Last,  
4 transforming New York City's building for a low  
5 carbon future. It makes our code more stringent than  
6 the State's. Again, I want to thank the Mayor and  
7 the speaker. And I want to thank the Speaker and  
8 this body for doing so much to recognize that Black  
9 lives matter, and making sure that was a part of the  
10 Stated Meeting today. So thank you for your  
11 leadership on the Energy Conservation Code.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,  
13 Council Member. Today, we are also voting on a major  
14 piece of legislation that will help affirm the basic  
15 human rights of transgender New Yorkers, and will go  
16 a long way in addressing disparities faced by  
17 transgender individuals. Introduction 491-A  
18 sponsored by Council Member Johnson will allow  
19 individuals to change the gender marker on their  
20 birth certificate by having a medical or mental  
21 health professional file an affidavit or affirmation  
22 stating that the changed designation more accurately  
23 reflects the applicant's identity. This new policy  
24 removes the outdated requirement to undergo  
25 convertive surgery prior to changing the gender

1  
2 designation on one's birth certificate. This undue  
3 burden, which has been faced for far too long, has  
4 been a roadblock to transgender New Yorkers seeking  
5 employment, health care, or public services.

6           Additionally, Council Member Johnson has  
7 sponsored a companion bill, Introduction 492-A, which  
8 will create an advisory board made up of transgender  
9 advocates and other experts who will ensure this new  
10 policy is implemented appropriately, and gauge the  
11 need for any further policy changes on this matter.

12 I'm extremely proud that this Council is taking  
13 action on legislation such as this, and leading the  
14 way to creating a more inclusive and equal New York  
15 City for all. I would like to thank Dan Hafetz,  
16 Crystal Pond, Lyle Frank, and Terzah Nasser for their  
17 work on this bill, and Council Member Johnson would  
18 like to say a few words on it.

19           COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam  
20 Speaker. Today is a difficult day for all of us in  
21 this body, and I want to start before I talk about  
22 these three important pieces of work in this  
23 legislation by saying that I stand in solidarity with  
24 my colleagues and that Black lives matter.



1  
2 Today, we're taking up two pieces of  
3 legislation that will make a tremendous difference in  
4 the lives of transgender New Yorkers. Transgender  
5 people comprise one of the most disenfranchised  
6 communities. And the statistics reflecting this  
7 reality is astounding. According to the National  
8 Transgender Discrimination Survey, 40% of transgender  
9 people have faced harassment when presenting identity  
10 documents that did not match their gender identity or  
11 expression. The current process for amending the  
12 gender marker on birth certificates is antiquated  
13 from 1971, and does not recognize the reality of a  
14 large majority of transgender individuals who were  
15 born in New York. Having such a critical document  
16 that correctly reflects your gender identity is a  
17 basic human right that too many transgender people  
18 have been denied for far too long.

19 This policy is an incredibly important  
20 improvement over the 1971 policy. It would bring New  
21 York City in line with New York State, the federal  
22 government, and a handful of other states. But it  
23 would also go farther than others by providing an  
24 expansive pool of medical and mental health  
25 professionals who can attest to an individual's

1  
2 gender. Moreover, it moves beyond the idea that  
3 transgender people need treatment in order to have  
4 basic rights. Birth certificates are living  
5 documents that are used in many contexts to prove  
6 identify, age, and citizenship. They are often the  
7 only form of identification that low-income New  
8 Yorkers have when applying jobs or public benefits.  
9 Currently, individuals must present proof of sex  
10 reassignment surgery to change the birth certificate,  
11 presenting an insurmountable barrier for the vast  
12 majority of transgender native New Yorkers who do not  
13 undergo surgery and are, therefore, prevented from  
14 having accurate birth certificates.

15 Many transgender people face  
16 discrimination, harassment, and in some cases  
17 violence just for expressing who they are. The  
18 Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender Community Center  
19 has noted that transgender people are at risk for  
20 substantial social stigma, and development  
21 disruptions. Creating a cascade of life-long  
22 difficulties with health, educational attainment, and  
23 economic productivity. Birth certificates can be a  
24 foundational trigger for this negative cascade.  
25 Without a birth certificate that accurately reflects

1  
2 their gender identity, transgender people are  
3 routinely forced to disclose their transgender  
4 status, resulting in increased difficulty accessing  
5 critical services, and opportunities for employment,  
6 educational opportunities, and financial services  
7 like lines of credit, medical and life insurance  
8 policies, marriage licenses, driver's licenses,  
9 Social Security benefits and other benefits. They  
10 are denied healthcare. They are denied jobs and they  
11 are denied other services, and face daily situations  
12 that are uncomfortable, embarrassing, and even  
13 threatening. It is appalling what these individuals  
14 go through just because of who they are. We have a  
15 chance to help start to reverse that situation, which  
16 is why I urge this Council to adopt these two pieces  
17 of legislation.

18           The kinds of stories and experiences that  
19 I've heard over the years and the stories that we  
20 heard two weeks ago at the Health Committee hearing  
21 on Introduction 491 reflect these harsh realities.  
22 One young transgender man, who I believe is here with  
23 us today, shared at the hearing transitioning as one  
24 of the most private things that a person can go  
25 through. But being a transgender person often feels

1  
2 like having to disclose this private information to  
3 everyone around you. I have heard from people whose  
4 lives have been impacted in so many ways beyond just  
5 access to services and benefits. People are taunted,  
6 abused, stigmatized, outed, and have their privacy  
7 invaded in countless ways.

8 I want to thank the Speaker for her  
9 unconditional support from the beginning of this  
10 process. I want to thank the staff, Dan Hafetz,  
11 Crystal Pond, Crilhien Francisco, Terzah Nasser, Lyle  
12 Frank, Laura Popa, Matt Gewolb, and my Legislative  
13 Director, Louis Cholden-Brown. I want to thank Mayor  
14 de Blasio for having Dr. Mary Bassett prioritize this  
15 and get it done within the first new of the new  
16 Council and the new Administration. And I want to  
17 say that today in light of everything we're seeing,  
18 we have the opportunity to correct an injustice that  
19 has stood for far too long. And start to help some  
20 of those disenfranchised New Yorkers that exist in  
21 our city. I look forward to seeing this passing. I  
22 ask all my colleagues for their full support on both  
23 bills. Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you very  
25 much Council Member. And before I concluded, I want

1  
2 to take a minute to acknowledge the passing of two  
3 great leaders in this city. So I ask my colleagues  
4 to rise again. So yesterday, former Bronx Council  
5 Member Madeline Provenzano passed away. For 19  
6 years, Madeline was Chief of Staff to her predecessor  
7 Michael De Marco, and succeeded him when he was elected  
8 to the State Supreme Court. Madeline served from  
9 1998 also becoming term limited in December 2005.  
10 Her successor in the 13th District is our own Jimmy  
11 Vacca. Council Member Provenzano was most proud of  
12 the funding she was able to bring to her district for  
13 many after-school programs, computer labs, and the  
14 opening of the first library in Morris Park. And so  
15 our thoughts and prayers go out to her and her  
16 family.

17 I also want to recognize the passing of  
18 Herman Badillo, a real trailblazer of New York City  
19 politics. Edmond served as a member of Congress, as  
20 the Bronx Borough President, and as Deputy Mayor.  
21 Known for so many historic firsts, he was obviously  
22 known for fighting for better access to education  
23 opportunities. But also fought about increasing and  
24 expanding voting rights for many whose barriers have  
25 been put up against. So he has many historic first

1  
2 historic firsts as Puerto Rican civic leader in New  
3 York City. Herman Badillo is placed in history as a  
4 leader who dared to hold doors open, and run for  
5 elected citywide office is a undeniable, and a credit  
6 to him and the community who he championed. So our  
7 thoughts go out to the families of these two  
8 individuals.

9 [Pause]

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And with that, I  
11 conclude communication from the speaker.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Before we begin  
13 discussion of General Orders, on behalf of Council  
14 Member Koo, I would like welcome Flushing High  
15 School. They are in the podium. Their  
16 participation-- They are participating today in  
17 Government Class, and they are led by their teachers,  
18 Mrs. Martha Cruz and Ms. Carolyn Constantinino. We  
19 welcome you to City Hall and today you are certainly  
20 getting a class in civics, and we thank you for  
21 coming to City Hall.

22 For the General Orders, discussion of  
23 General Orders I'm calling up Council Member Weprin  
24 to vote.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Thank you Madam Public Advocate. I would like unanimous consent via the Council to vote now on the General Orders Calendar, please.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Thank you. I'd like to vote aye on all. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Any others on General Orders, discussion of General Orders? Seeing none, Report of Special Committees.

CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Report of Standing Committees.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on Finance Intro 530, Business Improvement Districts.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Pre-Considered LU 153 and Reso 508 through LU 157 and Reso 512, Various Tax Abatements, Council District 17 and 2.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General Orders.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

CLERK: Report of the Committee on Health, Intro 491-A, Sex Designation on Birth Records.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Intro 492-A, Advisory Board on Gender Marker Change.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on Housing and Buildings, Intro 550-A, Energy Code.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land Use, LU 135 and Reso 513, Community Justice Center.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled. To be filed pursuant to letter of withdrawal.

CLERK: LU 138 and Reso 514, Metropolitan Hospital Center.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: LU 152 and Reso 515, UDAAP Brooklyn.



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

33

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
General Orders.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: General Order  
Calendar.

CLERK: Resolution appointing various  
persons Commissioner of Deeds.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on  
General Orders, and at this time I ask for a roll  
call on all items on the Coupled General Order  
Calendar.

CLERK: Arroyo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: [off mic]

CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [off mic]

CLERK: Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Yes, on 550-A.  
No on 491 and 492-A.

CLERK: Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

CLERK: Cohen.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: [off mic]

CLERK: Contantinides.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on  
all.

STATED MEETING

34

1  
2 CLERK: Cornegy.  
3 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.  
4 CLERK: Crowley.  
5 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on all.  
6 CLERK: Cumbo.  
7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [off mic]  
8 CLERK: Deutsch.  
9 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yes, on 550-A.  
10 No on 491-A and 492-A.  
11 CLERK: Dickens.  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.  
13 CLERK: Dromm.  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote aye on all.  
15 CLERK: Espinal.  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye on all.  
17 CLERK: Eugene.  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.  
19 CLERK: Ferreras.  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Aye on all.  
21 CLERK: Garodnick.  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.  
23 CLERK: Gentile.  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.  
25 CLERK: Gibson.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. I want to congratulate Council Member Johnson on passage of his bills today. And I also want to congratulate the 161st Business Improvement District in the Bronx, and congratulate Dr. Cary Goodman and all of the board members for their assessment increase. And all of the work that they do to strengthen the Bronx, the vitality of businesses, and the growth and opportunity that 161st Street brings to the Bronx. I'm looking forward to continuing to work with them, and I congratulate them on passage today. And with that, I vote aye on all. Thanks.

CLERK: Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: [off mic]

CLERK: Johnson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye on all.

CLERK: Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

CLERK: King.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: King. Pass.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Pass.

CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all.

CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye on all.

CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Congratulations,

Council Member Johnson for this important civil rights step for members of the transgender community. I vote aye on all.

CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you. I want to congratulate Council Member Corey Johnson on Intros 291-A and 292-A. These pieces of legislation are going to have a measurable impact on people's lives, which is something we strive to do in this body, and on our better days we do. So I want to congratulate Council member Johnson on taking this

1  
2 momentous step in the lives of the transgender  
3 community. And with that, I vote aye on all.

4 CLERK: Levine.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Permission to  
6 explain my vote.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I also want to  
9 congratulate Council Member Johnson. It's rare these  
10 days that we get to say that New York City is at the  
11 forefront of progressive policymaking, but you've put  
12 us there squarely with this issue. And countless New  
13 Yorkers, transgender and others will benefit from  
14 this. Thank you all. I proudly vote aye.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
16 Chambers, please.

17 CLERK: Maisel.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] I vote  
19 aye on all.

20 CLERK: Matteo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I vote no on  
22 Intro 491-A and aye on the rest.

23 CLERK: Mealy.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [off mic]

25 CLERK: Menchaca.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I also want to thank Council Member Johnson for his work on his bills. These bills represent what we are going to continue to do in this body. And as a member of the LGBT Caucus, I couldn't be prouder. I dedicate my vote to Mr. Bryan Ellicott, and vote is aye on all. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye.

CLERK: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [off mic]

CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic]

CLERK: Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

CLERK: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

Aye.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

CLERK: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye and  
congratulations, Council Member Johnson.

CLERK: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to  
explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Council Member  
Johnson, thank you so much for taking the lead on  
this issue, for bringing it to our public attention,  
our city's attention, and for getting this bill  
passed. I, too, want to dedicate my vote to Bryan  
Ellicott. Thank you very much.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet please.

CLERK: Cohen.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
chambers.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: [off mic]

CLERK: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Permission to  
explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I want to  
congratulate my colleague, Council Member Johnson for

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

making history, and for setting the gold standard of advocacy for transgender New Yorkers. And the beauty of governing here is that as goes New York, so goes the rest of the country. So congratulations. I'm taking my cues from my colleague Carlos. I too, will dedicate my vote to Bryan Ellicott. So there. I vote aye.

CLERK: Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

CLERK: Ulrich.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.

CLERK: Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [off mic]

CLERK: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Once again, congratulations Corey on another amazing piece of legislation. And I want to give a special shout out also to Flushing High School and Peter Koo for bringing them. We get the honors of sharing that high school. And I also want to thank you for having volunteers help me organize the City's great



1  
2 Children's Holiday Parade. And a special thank you  
3 to our Madam Public Advocate for reading at our  
4 Holiday yesterday. Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

7 CLERK: Williams.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: My I please  
9 explain my vote?

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I  
12 am abstaining on Intro 491-A, but I do want to make  
13 sure that you understand that I am doing so as a  
14 sixth gender male who has to understand the privilege  
15 that he has, and that many are not able to. And I  
16 wanted to apologize to Corey Johnson, members of the  
17 LGBT community, and Bryan Ellicott and others who  
18 will benefit from this for not doing due diligence on  
19 questions that I had before this bill was passed.  
20 That was my fault and no one else's. So I do want to  
21 apologize to them for that. I will be voting aye on  
22 all, and I want to congratulate Corey Johnson on his  
23 legislation.

24 CLERK: Wills.  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Abstain on 491 and  
aye on all the rest.

CLERK: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Abstain on all.

[background comment, pause]

CLERK: Ignizio.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: I vote no on  
491-A, and aye on all others.[Pause]

CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to  
explain--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: --my vote. I  
just wanted to congratulate and thank Council Member  
Johnson as well, and say that I think making sure  
that every New Yorker including our transgender  
family members have all the dignity, all the respect,  
and all of the power that they deserve in their life  
just as any other New Yorker. It's so important and  
the work that Council Member Johnson has done today.  
And with the passage of this that unfinished business  
of the Civil Rights Movement more broadly speaking is  
one step closer to being completed. We have got to

1  
2 do everything we can for the transgender community in  
3 New York City who are still victims of so much  
4 violence and oppression and discrimination. And I  
5 think Corey for that, and Bryan has gotten three  
6 shout outs already. I'm happy to be a fourth, but I  
7 want to dedicate my vote to Rocky Sanabria, who we  
8 were--

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet  
10 please.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: --who we were  
12 proud to honor in this Council. Rocky is a now 16-  
13 year-old young man who at the age of about four  
14 realized that he was transgender. And has done such  
15 amazing things, and we honored Rocky when he was 13  
16 or 14 in this Council. And a Woodside resident in  
17 high school now in New York City, out, proud and  
18 transgender. Rocky is an inspiration to me, as he is  
19 to so many others, and I dedicate this vote to Rocky  
20 Sanabria.

21 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

22 [Pause]

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So Flushing High  
24 School in the balcony, you've seen government in  
25 action as we take a vote. We welcome you on behalf

1  
2 of Council Member Vallone and Council Member Koo.  
3 You certainly have gotten a lesson today on the First  
4 Amendment, the Fourth Amendment, and a number of  
5 issues. And so, thank you again for coming. And  
6 now, we will announce the results.

7 [Pause]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All items on  
9 today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a vote  
10 of 45 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative, and one  
11 abstention with the exception of Intro 491-A, which  
12 was adopted by a vote of 39 in the affirmative, 4 in  
13 the negative, and 3 abstentions. And Intro 492-A,  
14 which was adopted by a vote of 42 in the affirmative,  
15 2 in the negative, and 1 abstention. Introduction  
16 and Reading of Bills.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are  
18 referred to committees as indicated on the Agenda.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: There are no  
20 resolutions today. We will immediately go to General  
21 Discussion leading with Council Member Andy King.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: This afternoon I  
23 rise with my colleagues first in solidarity to say  
24 thank you to each and everyone of us who made a  
25 commitment to stand up and fight for justice. The

1  
2 inequities that have occurred to so many New Yorkers  
3 and so many young me of color throughout the history  
4 of this great country was deplorable. But today we  
5 all took a stand, and had our voices heard loud not  
6 only throughout New York but across this great state  
7 to say that we are coming together as City and State  
8 legislators to make a change. To make a change in  
9 policy, to use the job that we've been hired to do  
10 making sure that all New Yorkers are safe. So I'm  
11 asking everyone please to be on board with the  
12 Attorney General Eric Schneiderman's request to help  
13 us fill the gap of saying that he will be the special  
14 prosecutor.

15           And to legislation that is passed in  
16 Albany, and however long that takes, but at least we  
17 know we plugged in that gap. We understand the  
18 relationships that DA's have with police departments,  
19 and it finds it difficult to prosecute police  
20 officers. I'm not mad at you, but communities cannot  
21 suffer because of that relationship. So I'm asking  
22 us all to continue to fight. To continue to stay  
23 strong, and let's move legislation that changes the  
24 culture. And help our Mayor on his end to deliver,  
25 to hold the Police Department accountable. If we

1  
2 violate the public trust, we are held accountable as  
3 elected officials. So if NYPD officers violate the  
4 public trust, they must be held accountable. If that  
5 means termination, then so be it. With termination  
6 in the Eric Garner case, we ask that that officer be  
7 terminated. As well that the policies define that  
8 any other agents that are on the scene who do not  
9 help. Who do not stop such aggressive action, that  
10 they be held accountable, so that they be held  
11 accountable, too.

12 Madam Speaker, thank you again for  
13 leading today's conversation, and I want us to be  
14 free to express this conversation to the BLAC members  
15 and everybody. Thank you for today's one unity, one  
16 united Council. Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
18 Please, quite in the chambers. We are still in  
19 session. Council Member Richards.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I just want to  
21 add and thank the Speaker for her leadership on this  
22 particular issue, and all the members obviously of  
23 the BLAC. And just to add my two cents here that  
24 until we get back to community policing, we will  
25

1  
2 continue-- Unfortunately, continue to deal with  
3 these issues that we see in our particular--

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --communities.

6 I just want to bring your attention to a bill today  
7 that I'm going to introduce, Intro 578. Yesterday,  
8 the New York Times ran a story on how energy  
9 efficiency may be the key to saving trillions of  
10 dollars a year in the U.S. Did you know that  
11 everyday New Yorkers and businesses can do something  
12 very simple to be energy efficient, which won't cost  
13 them a dime. And it's simple: Turn their lights  
14 off. In 2013, the City of Lights, Paris passed an  
15 illumination ban that has yielded them close to \$260  
16 million annually, and cut the equivalent of 250,000  
17 tons of carbon a year.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
20 Chambers, please. We are still in session. If you  
21 are exiting, please be quiet. Refrain from  
22 conversation. We apologize. Council Member  
23 Richards.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: If Intro 578 is  
25 enacted in New York City, nearly 40,000 buildings in

1  
2 New York turning their lights off can be equivalent  
3 to closing down one power plant. The savings we  
4 incur can be reinvested into renewable energy, which  
5 would enable us to create good green jobs for low-  
6 income residents across the city. Intro 578 will set  
7 us on a path of being more energy efficient.

8 Buildings classified under BMM pursuant to the New  
9 York Building Code will be prohibited from keeping  
10 their lights on in the interior and exterior of their  
11 buildings after midnight. An owner of a landmark  
12 building 20 stories or higher would be able to apply  
13 for a waiver from the Landmarks Commission and the  
14 Environmental Protection Committee or Council-- The  
15 Department of Environmental Protection.

16           Lastly, building owners for security  
17 circumstances would be able to apply for a waiver as  
18 well from the Commission and the Department of  
19 Environmental Protection as well. Temporary seasonal  
20 displays will be able to remain illuminated until  
21 midnight or until the last person exist the building  
22 as well. We are not looking to kill the Christmas  
23 here, as you can see. I also want to note that small  
24 stores are exempted from this bill as well. This  
25 commonsense measure will enable the city to produce



1  
2 savings that will create green jobs and not waste  
3 energy unnecessarily. I just would like to thank my  
4 Committee Council Samara Swanston, Bill Murray, Laura  
5 Popa, Jeff Baker for all their hard work and urge the  
6 Council to sign, my colleagues to sign onto this  
7 bill. Thank you, Madam Public Advocate.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
9 Council Member Koo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Madam  
11 Public Advocate and Madam Speaker. It has been a  
12 very painful last few days for many years,  
13 particularly for the family and friends of Eric  
14 Garner. My thoughts and prayers are with them during  
15 this very trying time. I am a person of faith. So  
16 in a word it can be truth or an injustice. I lean  
17 heavily on my faith or seek refuge in it so to get  
18 through on some days. While this doesn't bring Mr.  
19 Garner back nor it changes the grand jury's decision,  
20 I pray that his family is able to find peace one day.  
21 As a member of the Black Latino and Asian Caucus, I  
22 am committed to working with my colleagues in this  
23 administration to repair relationships between the  
24 Police Department and the communities they serve,  
25 particularly those of color. We must take thoughtful

1  
2 approaches to this matter, and focus on instituting  
3 reforms that will produce tangible results, and be  
4 careful not to over-regulate a department that has  
5 help reduce crime through unprecedented levels.

6 As Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. said,  
7 Injustice anywhere is a threat to justice everywhere.  
8 We are caught in an inescapable level of this  
9 reality, tied to a single garment of destiny.  
10 Whenever a person is threatened, it affects all  
11 indirectly. Life is a precious and beautiful thing.  
12 I hope this sentiment prevails in the mind of every  
13 single person in this city. Thank you very much.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
15 Council Member Greenfield to vote.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you. I  
17 vote aye on all with the exception of 491-A and 492-A  
18 where I vote no. Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
20 Council Member Johnson.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I thank you  
22 Madam Public Advocate. I rise today because I think  
23 it is important that all of us regardless of our race  
24 acknowledge what has gone on in our city over the  
25 past five days since the decision to not have an

1  
2 indictment came down from the grand jury. I rise  
3 today just to simply state that I stand in solidarity  
4 with my colleagues here in the Council and all New  
5 Yorkers of every race in their frustration over what  
6 is going on in our city and across the country. And  
7 I really believe that you can be critical of the  
8 ultimate decision, and you can also be respectful of  
9 our men and women in uniform. Those things are not  
10 mutually exclusive. The vast majority of police  
11 officers put themselves in harm's way day in and day  
12 out, and they deserve our respect.

13           But, when something goes wrong in our  
14 city, and it is caught on video, and everyone can see  
15 it, we have to acknowledge that. And I, as an  
16 elected official who is not a member of color, cannot  
17 imagine what it is like for my colleagues in this  
18 Council, primarily young men of color. And for young  
19 men of color in this city, and what they have to go  
20 through everyday. And it is important to acknowledge  
21 that. I was at Riker's Island last week for a tour,  
22 and it is devastating what is going on. And the vast  
23 majority of people there are men of color. Our  
24 criminal justice system in this country and in our  
25 city is broken, and we have to change it. We can

1  
2 legislate, but ultimately we have to change the  
3 hearts and minds of New Yorkers so that these  
4 incidents stop. And I stand in solidarity with the  
5 members of this body, and I rise today to say that  
6 Black lives matter. Thank you very much.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 Please, quite in the Chambers. We are still in  
9 session. All items on today's General Order Calendar  
10 were adopted by an amended vote of 46 in the  
11 affirmative, 0 negative, and one abstention with the  
12 exception of Intro 491-A, which was adopted by a vote  
13 of 39 in the affirmative, 5 in the negative, and 3  
14 abstentions. And Intro 492-A, which was adopted by a  
15 vote of 43 in the affirmative, 3 negative, and 1  
16 abstention. Continuing the general discussions,  
17 Council Member Kallos.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I would just like  
19 to start by acknowledging and following suit with  
20 many of my colleagues who have already spoke a lot  
21 about Martin Luther King's legacy, and that injustice  
22 anywhere is a threat to justice everywhere and that  
23 continues. I echo my colleagues, the city, the  
24 nation, and the world that Black lives matter. I  
25 rise today to thank my wife for her love and support

1  
2 on our one-year wedding anniversary. [cheers and  
3 applause] And as a sponsor for Introduction 574, a  
4 bill that would create free universal e-hail app to  
5 allow New Yorkers to e-hail any of the 13,637 Yellow  
6 cabs or 6,000 green cabs that may--

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
8 Quiet in the Chambers. Please quiet in the Chambers.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: --participate.  
10 City taxis need an app of their own to compete, and  
11 New Yorkers should be to e-hail a cab in the rain  
12 without having to worry about surge pricing. Instead  
13 of making new technologies illegal or regulating them  
14 out of business, the city must modernize to be able  
15 to compete. Washington, D.C. and Chicago have  
16 already proposed e-hail city apps, and this  
17 innovation will make New Yorkers' lives easier and  
18 provide a new source of revenue for our taxi drivers.  
19 I look forward to working across industries and  
20 agencies to make it easy for anyone to e-hail a cab  
21 and get where they're going in a New York minute.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations,  
23 Council Member. Council Member Danny Dromm.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you, Madam  
25 Public Advocate. Before I start, I want to say that

1  
2 I also support my colleagues, and I want to state  
3 very, very clearly that Black lives matter. May I  
4 also congratulate Corey Johnson for his successful  
5 legislation for our transgender community. Today, I  
6 wanted to rise to speak about Intro 573. We the  
7 human beings [cheers and applause] of New York are  
8 guardians of our--

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
10 Excuse me.

11 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet.  
12 Do not shout out. [sic] [gavel] Everyone, quiet  
13 please. Quiet please.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: We, the human  
15 beings of New York are the guardians of our animal  
16 companions, both wild and domesticated. Whenever  
17 cruelty and endangerment is so clearly documented and  
18 brought to our attention, we must act. This bill is  
19 simply that, government stepping in to correct a  
20 great injustice. Views in society evolve on issues  
21 from civil rights to environmental protection and  
22 animal issues are not different. The longevity of  
23 horse carriages is no defense to the overwhelming  
24 evidence of animal cruelty and endangerment that has  
25 been, and will continue to be presented to us. It is

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

not appropriate for any living creature outside of a motor vehicle to be in the middle of New York City traffic. It was never okay, but what has changed is the increasing compassion and caring we have animals.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet, please.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: For us to pretend that horse draw carriages are okay because it looks pretty or to certain tourists is part of a tradition is unacceptable. We need to protect good jobs that do not rely on such odious practices. This bill generously extends to these drivers options to help them transition to jobs that do not abuse animals. When confronted with the extensive and heartbreaking evidence of animal abuse, opponents of this humane proposal have no substantive response. It is our duty as a body of elected leaders to respond. I hope that you, my fellow leaders, will be on the right side of history, and support Introduction 573. Thank you very much.

[cheers and applause]

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet in the Chambers, please. [gavel]

[background comments]

1  
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. We  
3 have a practice in the City Council if you agree.  
4 Thank you. Council Member Gibson.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Sorry. Thank  
6 you, Madam Public Advocate. I want to call attention  
7 to Reso 502, which would support State legislation  
8 that would ensure there is an equal number of  
9 employers and union representatives on the New York  
10 City Deferred Compensation Board, which has not  
11 happened for quite a while. This is an opportunity  
12 to really make sure the board that oversees the  
13 program is responsible for protecting the rights of  
14 many who invest in the program does have an equitable  
15 representation of employees and union members. And I  
16 also want to join with all of my colleagues just in  
17 unison in certainly expressing my condolences and  
18 prayers obviously to Eric Garner's family, to Akai  
19 Gurley, and so many others that we speak their names.  
20 Of the continuous slap of injustice, the broken  
21 Criminal Justice system that we have is continuously  
22 perpetuated by every instance where an African-  
23 American unfortunately is killed.

24 It is a sad state of affairs. This is a  
25 national conversation, and every day that we have



1  
2 life, and we wake up with an opportunity to serve, we  
3 must be committed to justice, and fairness and one  
4 system of justice for all. We continuously say  
5 accountability and what that really means, taking a  
6 life and accepting responsibility for that action. I  
7 am committed to working with all of my colleagues to  
8 make sure that legislatively on a policy level we do  
9 everything possible We are sick and tired of going  
10 to funerals mourning the loss of so many young men of  
11 color in this country. It must end and it must end  
12 today. I thank you all for your leadership. I want  
13 to thank the Speaker and everyone who collectively--  
14 We are here wearing black because we are mourning the  
15 loss of lives across this nation. And I, too, say  
16 all lives matter, Black lives matter. Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
18 Council Member Levine.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam  
20 Public Advocate. I want to call my colleague's  
21 attention to a piece of legislation I'm pleased to be  
22 introducing today, No. 576, which addresses the  
23 increasing practice of landlord buyouts of rent  
24 regulated tenants. These transactions occur in the  
25 shadows. They are not reported on. The City gathers

1  
2 no information on them, and often they occur under  
3 exploitative circumstances in which tenants may be  
4 tied up in Housing Court with no attorney facing  
5 bogus charges. Or, perhaps tenants are worried about  
6 their immigration status, and they wrongly feel that  
7 they may be in jeopardy because of it. The result is  
8 that tenants far too often take buyouts at levels  
9 that are far, far, far below what we're allowing to  
10 replace their housing. And this bill would require  
11 that all landlords who complete such agreements  
12 report on them to HPD within 45 days. Failure to do  
13 so would result in a fine, and it would require that  
14 HPD report back to us the City Council on this trend  
15 as whole. So that we can begin to grapple with the  
16 public policy implications. Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
18 Rodriguez.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.  
20 First, I would like to congratulate the passing on  
21 New Yorkers that have been taking the street in a  
22 peaceful manner protesting the decision of the jury  
23 in State Island. Especially the high school students  
24 and the younger students who may be the future  
25 leaders or our society. Many of them who are Black

1  
2 and Latino. Many of them who are part of this  
3 movement because they believe that there is something  
4 wrong in this society where after many cases for  
5 Leona Burn [sic] to Juan Rodriguez, Antonio Diallo  
6 [sic]. Every time when this does happen, we cannot  
7 promise ourselves or other people that are going to  
8 see those cases weeks or months after. So we have to  
9 continue working with the Governor, Mayor de Blasio,  
10 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, the President. The  
11 Justice Department has to act now. And we have do  
12 reform in order to avoid similar situations from  
13 happening in the City or throughout the nation.

14 I also would like to invite all my  
15 colleagues on another topic to support Intro 573 in  
16 which my colleague Council Member Danny Dromm and I  
17 we are the primary sponsors. We want to take the  
18 horses out of the street. And as we know, in 1947,  
19 when this industry was regulated, we didn't have so  
20 many trucks, ambulances, and cars in the street. New  
21 York's population wasn't even-- it wasn't even close  
22 to what New York's population is today. We believe  
23 that New York City cannot be behind cities in Utah,  
24 Florida, New Jersey that has already been acting  
25 banning the carriage horses from the street. Thank

1  
2 you to all the advocate groups. I would just like to  
3 thank the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito for allowing  
4 us to move on this bill. And what we can promise is  
5 that in this hearing everyone will have voice. Those  
6 against or for they will be invited, and everyone  
7 should be able to contribute. And at the end of the  
8 day, we want to come out with a process where it  
9 should be a win-win situation, good jobs for those  
10 men and women that have been dependent on the  
11 industry and taking the horses out of the streets.  
12 Thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
14 Rose.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you, Madam  
16 Public Advocate. And today, I rise out of gratitude  
17 to the Speaker of this body, and my very special  
18 committed colleagues. I am not going to ready  
19 prepared statement because I think today our actions  
20 and our voices were proof enough that what we did  
21 today will resonate and will serve as a catalyst for  
22 reform. And ensure that will not stop until justice  
23 is a reality for everyone. But I stand today to ask  
24 my colleagues to support Reso 505, which will urge  
25 the Public School Athletic League to provide a

1  
2 medical professional and an ambulance for high school  
3 football games as well as practices. Because on  
4 September 1st, 2014, Mile Kirkland Thomas a Curtis  
5 High School Varsity team player died after collapsing  
6 at a Monday morning football practice. An ambulance  
7 arrived after the incident, and Miles Kirkland Thomas  
8 was pronounced dead upon his arrival at the hospital.

9           If a medical professional was present  
10 during the practice, young Miles would have received  
11 immediate attention, which could have possibly saved  
12 his life. This was also the case for a 15-year-old,  
13 Saint Joseph-by-the Sea student Nicholas  
14 Dellaventura, who died after suffering from heat  
15 exhaustion during practice on July 23rd, 2013. Both  
16 losses could have possibly been prevented by the  
17 presence of an able-bodied medical professional at  
18 their practice sessions. Current PSAL Rules only  
19 require EMTs or an ambulance on standby for games,  
20 but not for any practices. Yet, it seems as though  
21 many student athletes are sustaining many of their  
22 athletic injuries during practices, and rarely during  
23 the actual games. So I urge you to sign on and  
24 support Reso 505, which will not only aid in the  
25 reduction of other young athletes sustaining serious

1  
2 injuries. But would also prevent the potential loss  
3 of life from not receiving necessary immediate  
4 medical attention. Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
6 Council Member Treyger.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you. I'll  
8 begin by saying that any nation that claims it is a  
9 democratic nation made up of laws must recognize that  
10 it is only as strong as the faith that people have in  
11 both its political and legal systems. And while  
12 there is no question much more has to be done across  
13 the nation to improve police community relations, let  
14 us also understand that there are political leaders  
15 who quietly condone quota systems that I believe  
16 unfairly pit community against police and vice versa.  
17 That only target the most petty offenses. And we  
18 must understand that petty offenses do nothing to  
19 advance safety, but rather feed distrust, and feed  
20 government coffers. So we must understand this  
21 system from all angles that there must be improved  
22 community relations. But we also have to understand  
23 that there is a system in place that unfairly pits  
24 officers verse our communities, and that system must  
25 change. But I'm also here to introduce Intro 580

1  
2 that would for the first time in New York history  
3 establish an infrastructure taskforce, and a report  
4 card grading system that would take into account the  
5 input of academia, engineers, members of labor  
6 community organizations, hold hearings across the  
7 five boroughs to for the first time take a hard look  
8 at New York City's aging antiquated infrastructure.  
9 And assign grades with policy recommendations back to  
10 lawmakers here at the City Council and to the Mayor.  
11 When we talk about affordable housing, resiliency,  
12 sustainability, you will get nowhere if you do not  
13 address the infrastructure crisis that exists in New  
14 York City. Again, I urge my colleagues to please  
15 support Intro 580. Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
17 Council Member Levin.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very  
19 much, Chair and Madam Public Advocate and my  
20 colleagues. I do want to call your attention to two  
21 resolutions that I am introducing today. Resolution  
22 503, which would call on the State Legislature of New  
23 York to pass and the Governor to sign Assembly Intro  
24 2819, introduced by Assemblyman Keith Richter [sp?]  
25 of the Housing Committee. Which would establish a

1  
2 hospitality gift fund for the homeless in New York  
3 City. In addition, Resolution 504 calls on Governor  
4 Cuomo and Mayor Bill de Blasio to approve a Fourth  
5 New York/New York Agreement, a New York/New York IV,  
6 which would create permanent supportive housing in  
7 New York City. This is a vital resource for those  
8 neediest New Yorkers that need permanent supportive  
9 housing. It is a very successful program going back  
10 30 years for the previous three New York/New York  
11 Agreements between the State and the City. New  
12 York/New York III will be running out this coming  
13 year, and the New York/New York IV is absolutely  
14 essential and urgent.

15 My colleagues, I also want to speak for a  
16 moment on the tragedy of the death of Eric Garner,  
17 and I think that it's important first to recognize  
18 that Eric Garner was a father of six, and a well  
19 loved member of his community. His life was cut  
20 short for no reason at all, and we have system in New  
21 York City-- As Council Member Treyger just said,  
22 where we have the police pitted against the community  
23 because of a system of policing based on a broken  
24 windows philosophy that I do not believe serves the  
25 interest of our communities and serves the interest



1  
2 of our city. I think that it is time that we take a  
3 deep look at ourselves and our system, and change our  
4 system where necessary so that we can avoid any other  
5 tragedy like this. And so, that no other family in  
6 our city has to go through this type of tragedy ever  
7 again. Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
9 Council Member Eugene.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very  
11 much, Madam Public Advocate and my colleagues. Today  
12 I want to draw your attention Resolution 500, which  
13 asks for the State of New York to include swimming  
14 lessons and water safety education for all K through  
15 12 public school students. Further, this resolution  
16 requires that where a school does not have a pool and  
17 it is not within ten miles of the pool where such  
18 lessons can take place, water safety education and  
19 dry land stroke be taught the place. The number of  
20 young people who suffer drowning deaths each year is  
21 too high. New York City is home to a number of free  
22 and low-cost places where people can go to swim  
23 including public beaches, recreation centers, without  
24 the pool and centers within the pool. Give that the  
25 city presents so many opportunity to give the

1  
2 children access to water, and that swimming is a  
3 healthful activity in which we all want our children  
4 to safety take part. I hope that you will join me in  
5 asking that the state to create and support this bill  
6 and mend it and put our young people through water  
7 safety education. And I want also to ask my  
8 colleagues to support Resolution 501 in which we ask  
9 that New York City also recognize the one Youth Day.  
10 It is very important that we take a moment of repose  
11 to recognize the importance of the activities to our  
12 young people. And also, the importance of our young  
13 people because we have a moral obligation to provide  
14 for our young people all the opportunities they need  
15 to become part in our positive [sic] cities and also  
16 to give back to the community.

17           And to conclude, I want to commend the  
18 Speaker for her leadership, and also my colleagues  
19 for coming together to address this very, very  
20 important crisis affecting not only the Garner  
21 family, but also New York City and to our entire  
22 country. The people are crying for justice. They  
23 are trying for respect. They are crying for human  
24 dignity. It is very important as the New York City  
25 Council to come together and do everything that we

1  
2 can do in order for people to feel safe. No one in  
3 New York City regardless of the color of his skin,  
4 regardless of the social or economic situation or  
5 faith, should not fear to live in New York City.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: We should have  
8 one justice for everyone. Thank you.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
10 Council Member Constantinides.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Than you,  
12 Madam Public Advocate. I'll begin with some remarks  
13 relating to the death of Eric Garner. As we hear the  
14 singing in the hallways, it just makes me proud to be  
15 part of this body that I know is committed to  
16 building a better, fairer, and stronger New York  
17 where every life and every voice is heard and  
18 respected and protected. And as we build that better  
19 New York, I commend our Speaker's and everyone's  
20 leadership today as I pledge to be part of that  
21 solution. As we hear those voices and act on those  
22 voices.

23 I stand to oppose Intro 573 with great  
24 respect to my colleagues Council Member Dromm and  
25 Rodriguez. Just some facts about the industry.

1  
2 There has never been a conviction for animal cruelty  
3 relating to the horse carriages in the history of New  
4 York City. This is a well regulated industry, an  
5 industry that has, this Council has sought to protect  
6 the horse and has done so admirably. This is an  
7 iconic part of New York City. There are 350 families  
8 that depend on this. They are union jobs, windows  
9 into the middle class that we're seeing to set aside,  
10 and they're talking about electric cars or taxi  
11 medallions. That's not what this is about. This is  
12 a way of life for these men and women. You know,  
13 this electric car has narrowed down the streets of  
14 New York City, and frankly, the Central Park  
15 Conservancy doesn't want it there. So Intro 573,  
16 which the intentions are good, I will say that I  
17 strongly oppose this bill, and ask my colleagues to  
18 continue to stand with the hard-working men and women  
19 of this city against this ban. Thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
21 Council Member Cornegy.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Good afternoon.  
23 Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. I want to just  
24 commend my colleagues for the action prior to the  
25 Stated Meeting today. It was a pleasure to be

1  
2 involved in that, and it makes me proud to be a  
3 Council Member in this progressive administration.

4 But I want to bring your attention to a dear  
5 colleague letter that I penned earlier:

6           Many changes to the operation of the NYPD  
7 are being contemplated in the wake of the grand  
8 jury's decision not to bring an indictment in the  
9 chokehold death of Mr. Eric Garner. While we support  
10 the recently announced retraining of NYPD officers  
11 and other proposals, including the body camera pilot  
12 proposed by Public Advocate Letitia James, facts  
13 surrounding this case have made things very clear.  
14 An NYPD ban alone has not stopped the use of  
15 chokehold in the department. And existing local law  
16 is insufficient to secure indictment even when the  
17 violation of the no chokehold policy results in a  
18 death.

19           Intro 574 introduced jointly by Council  
20 Members Lancman, Williams and myself is part of the  
21 answer. This bill would make the use of a chokehold  
22 in making an arrest a misdemeanor crime bringing our  
23 Local Law in line with NYPD policy. This is not a  
24 radical move by any stretch of the imagination.  
25 Rather, it expresses the widespread view of New

1  
2 Yorkers at this moment and uses the power of law to  
3 ensure that the Department's stated intent to change  
4 this translation into action. Please do not be  
5 persuaded by arguments that chokeholds should be  
6 outlawed because the exceptions to the policy may be  
7 needed to keep police officers safe.

8           The NYPD itself explicitly rejected this  
9 argument in 1993. And prior to that time, Department  
10 policy discouraged chokeholds with an exception for  
11 situations involving risk to an officer's life. When  
12 that exception proved to be problematic, and New  
13 Yorkers continued to die, Departmental leadership  
14 moved forward with a full scale ban without  
15 exceptions. A 1993 New York Times article describing  
16 the adoption of the ban, and a recent CCR Rule Report  
17 detailing the high incidents of chokehold complaints  
18 since the ban was attached for your reference.

19 Please I ask for your support and advocacy to pass  
20 and enact Intro 540. This is being circulated right  
21 now. Thank you, Madam Public Advocate.

22           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
23 Williams.

24           COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: First, I would  
25 like to bring my colleagues' attention to three

1  
2 bills, Intro 583, that would require DHS to annually  
3 report to the Mayor and Speaker crime statistics from  
4 city run homeless shelters. Intro 584 would require  
5 DOT to offer email and text message notifications  
6 when major transportation projects occur, which would  
7 include projects that alter four or more blocks or  
8 1,000 feet of the street. And involves a major  
9 realignment of the roadway. Intro 507 is a  
10 resolution declaring January 15th to the 22nd of each  
11 year as Peace Week in the City of New York. This is  
12 in coordination with Life Camp who currently sponsors  
13 this week every year by hosting a series of peace and  
14 advocacy events.

15 I also want to say as we continue with  
16 this conversation about black lives matter, Eric  
17 Garner, Mike Brown, Akai Gurley and so many across  
18 the nation, there are three points that I want to  
19 point out. If we want to have this conversation, we  
20 have to be honest about it, and people have to  
21 understand. The first is that the mention and notion  
22 of white privilege does not make any one person  
23 racist even if you benefit from it. It's just an  
24 acknowledgement of what is. Talking about structural  
25 racism does not mean that we excuse any one person's

1  
2 behavior of violence in the community. They must be  
3 held responsible, but it helps describe a situation  
4 that created so much. And lastly, trying to make the  
5 police better and mentioning ways to do so, and also  
6 holding people accountable, is not anti-police. It is  
7 what we should be doing as legislators.

8           And I think those three things are being  
9 heard differently by people in this conversation.  
10 And my hope is that when we continue this that we'll  
11 have honest acknowledgement of where we are as a  
12 society. And that people will come out of their  
13 corners and come to the middle where most of the  
14 answers are, and understand what people are saying.  
15 Thank you.

16           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And lastly,  
17 Council Member Espinal.

18           COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you, Madam  
19 Public Advocate. I just want to start off by saying  
20 that I was very proud to join my colleagues in  
21 today's demonstrations and movements. And look  
22 forward to continuing working with everyone to make  
23 sure that this is a safe and fair city for everyone  
24 living in it. I want to point your attention to  
25 Intro 573, and just want to say that the carriage



1  
2 drivers do us proud. They are ambassadors for the  
3 City welcoming tourists at Central Park and showing  
4 them the real New York. It is our responsibility to  
5 ensure, of course, that the horses are safe. That is  
6 why five years ago we passed a legislation to make  
7 sure that they are heavily regulated. The  
8 accusations against the iconic industry just do not  
9 stand up to scrutiny. We look forward to a spirited  
10 debate, but I also hope we can soon move on past this  
11 misguided bill, and continue working on creating good  
12 paying jobs. And making sure that the police and  
13 community relations continue to be worked on. Thank  
14 you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you and now  
16 to close, Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam  
18 Public Advocate, and I want to again thank all my  
19 colleagues for their consistency in the work. And  
20 I'm proud to lead this body to work alongside all of  
21 you to make New York City a better place that  
22 respects the rights of all. I think with just the  
23 message today in terms of indicating that Black lives  
24 matter, that transgender lives matter, that all lives  
25 matter, that is what we strive to do each and every

1  
2 day as a legislative body and as an oversight body.  
3 Just to make sure that this City, the policies that  
4 are in place, the agencies that exist are ones that  
5 are respectful of all. And so we are going to  
6 continue to strive to do that, and we will be strong  
7 in that message. So thank you all and to all of my  
8 colleagues and thank you, Madam Public Advocate as  
9 well.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, and I  
11 want to thank those in the balcony for respecting the  
12 rules. We are now adjourned. [gavel]

13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATED MEETING

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 10, 2014