

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

Thursday, December 5, 2024

Start: 2:51 P.M.

Recess: 4:49 P.M.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Adrienne E. Adams, Speaker
Amanda Farías, Majority Leader

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Adrienne E. Adams
Joann Ariola
Alexa Avilés
Diana I. Ayala
Chris Banks
Joseph C. Borelli
Erik D. Bottcher
Justin L. Brannan
Gale A. Brewer
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
Tiffany Cabán
David M. Carr
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Eric Dinowitz
Amanda Farías
Oswald Feliz
James F. Gennaro
Jennifer Gutiérrez

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING
COUNCIL MEMBERS (CONTINUED)

Shahana K. Hanif
Kamillah Hanks
Robert F. Holden
Crystal Hudson
Rita C. Joseph
Shekar Krishnan
Linda Lee
Farah N. Louis
Kristy Marmorato
Christopher Marte
Darlene Mealy
Julie Menin
Francisco P. Moya
Mercedes Narcisse
Sandy Nurse
Chi A. Ossé
Vickie Paladino
Keith Powers
Lincoln Restler
Kevin C. Riley
Carlina Rivera
Yusef Salaam
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Pierina Ana Sanchez
Lynn C. Schulman
Althea V. Stevens
Sandra Ung
Inna Vernikov
Nantasha M. Williams
Julie Won
Kalman Yeger
Susan Zhuang

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

A P P E A R A N C E S

INVOCATION - Delivered by: Reverend Dr. Richard Griffiths, Lead Pastor, Bronx Bethany Church of The Nazarene located at 971 East 227 Street, Bronx, NY 10466

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

4

SERGEANT MORENO: This is a microphone check for the Stated in the Chambers, recorded by James Marino on December 5, 2024.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Please find your seats!

Good afternoon, Ladies and Gentlemen, we are getting ready to start, please find your seats!

AUTOMATION: RECORDING IN PROGRESS.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: (SHUSHES CHAMBER) Keep it down, please. Thank you so much. At this time, will all non-council employees who are the floor, please make your way upstairs to the balcony. All guests, to minimize disruptions, please place all electronic devices to vibrate or silent mode. Thank you so much for your cooperation.

(PAUSE)

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Folks, once again, in order to minimize disruptions, please place all electronic devices to vibrate or silent mode. Thank you so much, you're good to go.

(PAUSE)

MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Good afternoon, and welcome to the Stated Meeting of December 5, 2024. I am Majority Leader, Amanda Fariás, and I would like to thank you for joining us. If you would like to

2 follow along, the Agenda for today's meeting is
3 posted on our website.

4 On behalf of the body, I welcome the members of
5 the public who have joined us here today. During
6 Stated Meetings, only members of the Council may
7 speak. Members of the public shall remain silent. If
8 you wish to express support of any remarks, you may
9 make the silent approval gesture.

10 I want to remind my colleagues that decorum is to
11 be respected at all times. Insulting each other is
12 not appropriate, all remarks are to be addressed to
13 the Chair, and members shall not speak unless
14 recognized by the Chair. It is essential that even if
15 we disagree, we treat each other with respect.

16 CITY CLERK: Please join us for the Pledge of
17 Allegiance.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise!

19 ALL: [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE]

20 (PAUSE)

21 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Roll call?

22 CITY CLERK: Council Member Abreu?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Present

24 CITY CLERK: Council Member Ariola?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Here

2 CITY CLERK: Council Member Avilés?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Presenté

4 CITY CLERK: Council Member Ayala?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Here

6 CITY CLERK: Council Member Banks?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Here

8 CITY CLERK: Council Member Bottcher?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Here

10 CITY CLERK: Council Member Brannan?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: (NO MIC) Here

12 CITY CLERK: Council Member Brewer?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here

14 CITY CLERK: Council Member Brooks-Powers?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Present

16 CITY CLERK: Council Member Cabán?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Present

18 CITY CLERK: Council Member Carr?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Here

20 CITY CLERK: Council Member De La Rosa?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Here

22 CITY CLERK: Council Member Dinowitz?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Present

24 CITY CLERK: Council Member Feliz?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: (NO RESPONSE)

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

7

2 CITY CLERK: Council Member Gennaro?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: (NO MIC) Here

4 CITY CLERK: Council Member Gutiérrez?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Presenté

6 CITY CLERK: Council Member Hanif?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Here

8 CITY CLERK: Council Member Hanks?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Present

10 CITY CLERK: Council Member Holden?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here

12 CITY CLERK: Council Member Hudson?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Present

14 CITY CLERK: Council Member Joseph?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Present

16 CITY CLERK: Council Member Krishnan?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Here

18 CITY CLERK: Council Member Lee?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Here

20 CITY CLERK: Council Member Louis?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Present

22 CITY CLERK: Council Member Marmorato?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Present

24 CITY CLERK: Council Member Marte?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Here

2 CITY CLERK: Council Member Mealy?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: (NO RESPONSE)

4 CITY CLERK: Council Member Menin?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Here

6 CITY CLERK: Council Member Moya?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: (NO RESPONSE)

8 CITY CLERK: Council Member Narcisse?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Here

10 CITY CLERK: Council Member Nurse?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: (NO MIC) Here

12 CITY CLERK: Council Member Ossé?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Present

14 CITY CLERK: Council Member Paladino?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Here

16 CITY CLERK: Council Member Powers?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: (NO MIC) Here

18 CITY CLERK: Council Member Restler?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Here

20 CITY CLERK: Council Member Riley?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Present

22 CITY CLERK: Council Member Rivera?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present

24 CITY CLERK: Council Member Salaam

25 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Present

2 CITY CLERK: Council Member Salamanca?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present

4 CITY CLERK: Council Member Sanchez?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: (NO RESPONSE)

6 CITY CLERK: Council Member Schulman?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Here

8 CITY CLERK: Council Member Stevens?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Here

10 CITY CLERK: Council Member Ung?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Present

12 CITY CLERK: Council Member Vernikov?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Here

14 CITY CLERK: Council Member Williams?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Present

16 CITY CLERK: Council Member Won?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Present

18 CITY CLERK: Council Member Yeger?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here

20 CITY CLERK: Council Member Zhuang?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: (NO RESPONSE)

22 CITY CLERK: Council Member Sanchez?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: (NO MIC) Present

24 CITY CLERK: Thank you

25 Council Member Borelli?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Present

3 CITY CLERK: Council Member Zhuang?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: Here

5 CITY CLERK: Thank you

6 Council Member Fariás?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: Present

8 CITY CLERK: Speaker Adams?

9 SPEAKER ADAMS: I feel like I need to be running
10 in the door, I am present, present.

11 (PAUSE)

12 CLERK: Majority Leader, we have a quorum.

13 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you, we will now
14 have today's Invocation, which will be delivered by
15 Reverend Dr. Richard Griffith, Lead Pastor of Bronx
16 Bethany Church of The Nazarene, which is located at
17 971 East 227 Street in the Bronx.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise!

19 REV. DR. RICHARD GRIFFITH: Good afternoon, it's a
20 privilege to be a part of this convening today and
21 open this time of critical dialogue and legislation
22 with an invocation of prayer. Thank you to Speaker
23 Adams, Majority Leader Farias, and my councilman from
24 the Bronx, honorable Kevin Riley, for this
25 invitation.

1 Would you please bow your heads as we look to the
2
3 Lord in prayer? Let us pray.

4 Lord Jesus, your word says to pray in the spirit
5 on all occasions with all kinds of prayers and
6 requests and to be alert, always praying for the
7 Lord's people. And this, Living God, is an occasion
8 to seek you. Thank you, Lord God, for the miracle of
9 today in breathing the breath of life into our lungs.
10 Thank you for these council members who are here
11 today as representatives and advocates chosen by your
12 people and allowed by you. Thank you for their
13 commitments to and passion for your beloved people.
14 We thank you for the residents of this city, its
15 richness and its diversity. Help us to see the beauty
16 of difference in how you've called your people to
17 unity amidst our diversity. Lord, we pray that the
18 matters at hand today would transcend partisanship
19 and emphasize humanity, that hearts would be filled
20 with unity and marked by postures of collaboration
21 and peace; true shalom that comes from you and is
22 accessible to us.

23 This chamber wrestles with the complexities of
24 the human condition. Grant this council your wisdom,
25 which you have promised to give generously to anyone

2 who asks of you without finding fault. When asked of
3 you, give them your acumen to listen and to discern
4 both the immediate and long term effects of each
5 issue and decision. Give this assembly the courage to
6 be compassionate. We pray that justice and mercy and
7 compassion would be the priorities that would
8 saturate this convening and each discussion.

9 Lord, we pray that your kingdom, the kingdom of
10 God, would be their benchmark. We pray for humility
11 and patience and also decisiveness for those things
12 that are both urgent and important. Help your people
13 today who carry heavy loads and great
14 responsibilities.

15 Today I come against apathy and indifference, but
16 I pray for true servant hearts, hearts that are more
17 interested in caring than being correct.

18 Lord, we remember those who are often forgotten,
19 the widow, the immigrant, the fatherless, the
20 impoverished, and the imprisoned, many of whom are
21 exploited and are experiencing pure poor and inhumane
22 living conditions. Cause this council to plead their
23 cases and to act to transform their realities.

24 I bring before you each representative, their
25 support staff, and their families, and pray that you

2 would bless them and overshadow them with your
3 presence and love. Lord, we look to you for their
4 covering and protection.

5 Now to the King eternal, immortal, invisible, the
6 only God, be glory and honor forever and ever. We
7 pray these things in Jesus' name. Amen.

8 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, I would now
9 ask Council Member Kevin Riley to spread the
10 Invocation in full upon the record.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you, Majority Leader.

12 I want to begin by thanking Reverend Dr. Richard
13 Griffith for his powerful and heartfelt invocation.
14 His prayer reminds us of the profound responsibility
15 we carry in this chamber and the faith that guides
16 us... guides so many of us in serving our community.

17 As the Lead Pastor of Bronx Bethany Church of The
18 Nazarene, Dr. Griffith is a true advocate for the
19 people of the Northeast Bronx. His church has been a
20 sanctuary for community dialogue, opened up the door
21 to host one of my office monthly community
22 conversations, and provides critical resources for
23 our residents.

24 Through his compassion and dedication, Dr.
25 Griffith, where we like to call him Revie Richie,

2 exemplifies faith and action, whether mentoring
3 youth, addressing the congregation, or strengthening
4 our neighbors. His call today for unity, equity, and
5 humility reminds us that our work is not just about
6 policies, but about the people - the New Yorkers, we
7 are privileged to serve every day. Thank you,
8 Majority Leader, and I would like to thank
9 Reverend... excuse me, Reverend, Dr. Richard Griffith
10 for being here today, and I make a motion for
11 unanimous consent to spread the Invocation in full
12 upon today's Record. Thank you.

13 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, we will now
14 have the Adoption of Minutes by Council Member
15 Crystal Hudson.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: I make a Motion that the
17 Minutes of the Stated Meetings of November 13, 2024
18 and November 21, 2024 be adopted as printed.

19 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you.

20 Messages and Papers from the Mayor?

21 CLERK: None.

22 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Communications from City,
23 County and Borough Offices?

24 CLERK: M 80, Comptroller's Report.

2 SPEAKER ADAMS: Received, Ordered, Printed and
3 Filed.

4 CLERK: M 81, Commissioner of Elections
5 Recommendation?

6 SPEAKER ADAMS: Rules, Privileges, and Elections.

7 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Petitions and
8 Communications?

9 CLERK: None.

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Land Use Call-ups?

11 CLERK: None.

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you. We will now
13 have Communication from Speaker Adrienne E. Adams.

14 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you, Madam Majority Leader,
15 and good afternoon, everyone.

16 Today, the Council will vote on the Department of
17 City Planning Zoning for Housing Opportunities
18 Citywide Text Amendment with modifications estimated
19 to create over 82,000 new homes over 15 years as part
20 of an agreement to invest \$5 billion into the
21 Council's City for All Housing Plan. This represents
22 a major step forward for the City to confront our
23 housing crisis.

24 This council has consistently shown the
25 importance of it playing a constructive role in

1 advancing housing solutions across this city. We
2
3 recognize the severity of the decades in the making
4 housing crisis, the impact it's having on working and
5 middle class New Yorkers, and the urgency required of
6 us to advance bold solutions that match the scale of
7 this challenge.

8 Since 2022, we have approved the development of
9 more than 27,000 units of affordable housing through
10 the Land Use process, with more than half being
11 affordable homes. This includes major projects, like
12 Innovation Queens, that many doubted our ability to
13 chart a successful path forward to advance at all.
14 Today there is another step forward by this council
15 to advance meaningful housing solutions that lower
16 costs to make our city affordable and ensure housing
17 as a stabilizing force.

18 Throughout the public review process for DCP's
19 citywide Zoning Text Amendment proposal, we heard the
20 voices of residents across the city, including those
21 who are concerned about what it could mean for their
22 neighborhoods. Our modifications to the zoning
23 reforms balance respect for neighborhood character,
24 because not all districts are alike. With the
25 citywide need to build more housing, especially

1
2 affordable homes, our modifications prioritized
3 creating the greatest number of homes while
4 maintaining the fair housing principle that every
5 neighborhood contributes in a plan that could be
6 approved.

7 This council has led efforts to make housing more
8 affordable, especially at the deepest levels needed
9 by most New York New Yorkers. We have championed the
10 importance of homeownership through support for
11 existing homeowners and the expansion of
12 opportunities to own a home for more working class
13 New Yorkers to stay in our city.

14 We are proud of what we were able to secure
15 through the Council's City for All Housing Plan in
16 conjunction with modifications to the citywide Zoning
17 Text Amendment.

18 City for All was formulated with the input of
19 council members, advocates, and most importantly, New
20 Yorkers who made their housing concerns and
21 challenges abundantly clear to us.

22 While we recognize the importance of zoning
23 reform to build more housing, especially amidst the
24 housing shortage, we knew more was needed to keep New
25

1
2 Yorkers housed and address growing housing
3 insecurity.

4 We successfully secured a historic \$5 billion
5 commitment towards key investments, and with this
6 funding we will make homes more affordable and
7 preserve existing affordable housing - including
8 NYCHA and Mitchell-Lamas, support homeownership,
9 protect tenants, strengthen our city's housing
10 agencies, invest in the sewer, street, and open space
11 infrastructure of communities, and encourage
12 neighborhood rezoning plans that can produce more
13 housing in the coming years.

14 This is the type of comprehensive housing plan
15 and level of investment that New Yorkers require to
16 address their wide ranging housing needs. And yet we
17 know there is so much more to do.

18 Advancing solutions to difficult problems isn't
19 easy, but it can be done when we unite behind the
20 common goal to focus on what is best for New Yorkers
21 and the future of our communities and the city that
22 we all love.

23 I thank Chairs Salamanca and Riley for their
24 leadership, and Housing Chair Sanchez, and other
25 members who supported this major effort.

1 I thank Department of City Planning Director
2 Garodnick and his staff, as well as the City Hall
3 Housing staff who partnered so closely with me, my
4 office, and the entire Council to negotiate this
5 agreement. The contribution of \$1 billion from the
6 state by Governor Hochul was also very critical. And,
7 of course, I thank the many, many New Yorkers who
8 made their voices heard regarding their housing
9 challenges, this is who we do this work for.
10

11 On December 1st, a fire blazed through an
12 apartment building in Council Member Menin's
13 district, one person was killed and six firefighters
14 were injured. Our hearts are with the victim's family
15 and loved ones as they grieve this horrible tragedy.

16 My thoughts and prayers go out to the family,
17 friends, and community of Zvi Kogan, a Chabad rabbi
18 who was killed on November 24th in the United Arab
19 Emirates. His death was felt right here in New York
20 City, as many of his loved ones and family members
21 reside in Crown Heights as well as in the Chabad
22 communities across the city and around the world. May
23 his memory be a blessing.

24 November 30th was Barbados National Day, which
25 celebrates the country's independence from Britain

1 after over 360 years as a British colony. The Bajan
2 community has contributed so much life and culture to
3 New York City, and I wish Bajans across our city a
4 wonderful day of celebration.
5

6 We observed world AIDS day on December 1st. This
7 day is an opportunity for us to reaffirm our
8 steadfast commitment to people living with HIV and
9 AIDS and remember those we have lost to AIDS related
10 illnesses. Established in 1988, World AIDS Day served
11 as an important reminder about the importance of our
12 united mission to eradicate HIV and AIDS.

13 December 2nd was Special Education Day, which
14 commemorates the signing of the Individuals with
15 Disabilities Education Act into law in 1975. It is
16 critical that we provide students with disabilities
17 with the effective and sustained services they need
18 to succeed.

19 Additionally, December 3rd was International Day
20 of Persons with Disabilities, a day to honor our
21 disability community and advocate for further
22 accessibility. Approximately one in four people in
23 New York have a disability. To access our full
24 potential as a society, it is imperative that we push
25 for increased accessibility and prioritize inclusion

1 so that people with disabilities can participate
2 fully in our society and lead independent lives with
3 dignity and respect.
4

5 On Tuesday, December 10th, the Council will host
6 our annual Hanukkah celebration right here in the
7 Chambers and we invite all New Yorkers to attend.

8 Now let's move into our Stated Agenda.

9 First, as I mentioned, we'll vote on the
10 following Land Use items:

11 City of Yes Zoning for Housing Opportunity, a
12 citywide Zoning Text Amendment to modify residential
13 height, density, parking requirements, affordability,
14 urban design, and other aspects of zoning regulations
15 with the goal of increasing housing development
16 across all neighborhoods.

17 In response to robust community engagement, the
18 Council is modifying the proposal in three primary
19 ways:

20 First, to make new housing development more
21 contextual with existing neighborhoods, particularly
22 for blocks of small homes.

23 Second, to increase the amount of affordable
24 housing that will be created and make sure it reaches
25 lower incomes.

1 And third, to protect existing homeowners and
2 tenants. Specifically, the Council is reducing
3 applicability of ADUs, particularly in flood prone
4 areas and restricting ADUs to homes that are owner
5 occupied. The Council is limiting transit oriented
6 development in certain areas with small homes and
7 different transportation needs. Additionally, the
8 Council is protecting open spaces on campus
9 developments and preserving rear yards of row houses
10 and semidetached houses.
11

12 The Council is also introducing a parking scheme
13 which is responsive to the different needs of
14 communities while prioritizing housing development.
15 It eliminates parking mandates where residents have
16 short commutes, reduces them where commute times are
17 longer - or cross neighborhood commuting is a
18 challenge, and preserves requirements where residents
19 have few public transit options and parking is likely
20 to be provided by housing developers at that level
21 anyway.

22 An important and historic modification by the
23 Council creates affordable housing incentives in low
24 density areas, bringing inclusionary zoning citywide
25 for the first time in New York City. This will ensure

1
2 that the creation of affordable housing is possible
3 in every part of the city, and we thank our staff
4 members, particularly Perris Straughter, Anne
5 McCaughey, Brian Paul, William Vidal, Chelsea
6 Kelley, Deborah Kerzhner, Arthur Huh, Ryan Cote,
7 Caroline Antonelli, Dana Leventhal, and the entire
8 Planning and Land Use Division.

9 (APPLAUSE)

10 SPEAKER ADAMS: We'll also vote on the following
11 Finance items:

12 A Preconsidered Resolution, sponsored by Council
13 Member Justin Brannan, authorizing a 40-year Article
14 XI tax exemption for the preservation of one rental
15 building in Council Member Dinowitz's district.

16 A Preconsidered Resolution, sponsored by Council
17 Member Justin Brannan, authorizing a 2.5 year Article
18 V tax exemption for the preservation of two rental
19 buildings in Council Member Salaam's district.

20 A Preconsidered Resolution, sponsored by Council
21 Member Justin Brannan, authorizing a 40-year Article
22 XI tax exemption for the preservation of two rental
23 buildings also in Council Member Salaam's district.

24

25

1
2 And a Transparency Resolution approving new
3 designations and changes of certain organizations
4 receiving funding in the Expense Budget.

5 Next, we will vote on the Mayor's appointment of
6 Muriel Goode-Trufant to the position of Corporation
7 Counsel.

8 Today, we also vote on the following pieces of
9 legislation:

10 The first two bills are part of Aging Committee
11 Chair Crystal Hudson's Age in Place 2.0 legislative
12 package:

13 Introduction 1022-A, sponsored by Council Members
14 Jennifer Gutiérrez and Crystal Hudson, would require
15 the commissioner of the Department for The Aging to
16 conduct a three-year study on naturally occurring
17 retirement communities - or NORCS - and neighborhood
18 naturally occurring retirement communities or N-NORCS
19 in New York City.

20 The study would identify potential NORCS and N-
21 NORCs, assess the needs of older adults, evaluate
22 necessary improvements, and collect data on
23 demographic trends and health outcomes.

24 Introduction 1054-A, sponsored by Chair Hudson,
25 would require the commissioner of The Department for

1 The Aging to submit a 10-year Aging In Place Plan
2 that would focus on assisting older adults with aging
3 in place throughout New York City. We thank our staff
4 members Christopher Pepe, Chloe Rivera, and John
5 LaRosa.
6

7 Next, we will vote on two bills sponsored by
8 Council Member Jim Gennaro, Chair of the Committee
9 Environmental Protection and Resiliency and
10 Waterfronts Committee that will address sewer,
11 flooding, and other infrastructure concerns.

12 Introduction 814-A would require the Department
13 of Environmental Protection, or DEP, to update the
14 Sewer Backup Prevention Plan by 2025 and conduct
15 regular updates thereafter. The bill would also
16 require DEP to provide timely notice to residents and
17 complainants when it determines that certain sewer
18 backups have occurred. We thank our staff members
19 Brad Reid, Andrew Bourne, Ricky Chawla, and Austin
20 Malone.

21 Introduction 815-A would require DEP in
22 consultation with the Department of Buildings and The
23 Office of Long Term Planning and Sustainability to
24 create and regularly update an interim flood risk
25 area map identifying areas at risk of flooding due to

1
2 10-year rainfall events and sea level rise, as well
3 as coastal flood areas with a one percent or greater
4 chance of flooding in any year. Thank you to our
5 staff members Brad Reid, Nick Widzowski, Andrew
6 Bourne, Ricky Chawla, and Austin Malone.

7 Introduction 850-A, sponsored by Council Member
8 Rafael Salamanca, would require the Department of
9 Housing Preservation and Development - or HPD - to
10 submit biannual reports to the Council regarding City
11 financed affordable housing development projects
12 involving the disposition of City property. Thank you
13 to our staff members, Elliot Heisler, Austin Malone,
14 Jose Conde, Andrew Bourne, Dirk Spencer, and CJ
15 Murray.

16 The following bills are all sponsored by Council
17 Member Pierina Sanchez, chair of the Committee on
18 Housings and Buildings. They are critical bills that
19 will complement the passage of the modified zoning for
20 housing opportunity Citywide Text Amendment.

21 Introduction 654-A would implement a renewed
22 version of the J-51 Tax Abatement Program for
23 rehabilitation and renovation projects of certain
24 multiple dwelling buildings as authorized by the
25

1
2 state. Thank you to our staff members Taylor Zelony
3 Mark Chen, and Audrey Son.

4 Introduction 1127-A would establish a Basement
5 and Cellar Dwelling Unit Legalization Program in
6 certain community districts. The program would
7 include an application process for building owners to
8 receive authorization for temporary residents for
9 units, inspection by the Department of Buildings of
10 such units, and provision of technical assistance and
11 outreach by the Department of Housing Preservation
12 and Development. Thank you very much to our staff
13 members Austin Malone, Andrew Bourne, Jose Conde,
14 Dirk Spencer, and Brad Reid.

15 And Introduction 1128-A would allow for the
16 construction of ancillary dwelling units and
17 establish eligibility and design requirements in one
18 or two-family dwellings. Requirements would include
19 ADUs to have separate utilities and entrances from
20 primary dwellings to meet standards for light,
21 ventilation, and emergency access to units and to
22 include means of fire prevention. Finally, this bill
23 would prohibit basement and cellar ADUs and flood
24 hazard areas. Thank you to our staff members, Austin
25

2 Malone, Andrew Bourne, Jose Conde, Dirk Spencer, and
3 Brad Reid.

4 Thank you very much for your attention, I now
5 turn it back over to our majority leader.

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, Speaker Adams

7 We will now move into Discussion of General
8 Orders, and I would like to recognize Council Member
9 Rafael Salamanca, followed Council Member Riley, then
10 Council Member Sanchez.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you, Majority
12 Leader.

13 Housing is the most important pillar to the
14 health of our communities and the city, yet the
15 severe shortage of our homes across the five
16 boroughs, especially ones that are most affordable,
17 is leaving working and middle class New Yorkers in an
18 impossible struggle to secure housing.

19 In an increasingly unaffordable city, New Yorkers
20 are spending more than their paycheck on housing than
21 they can afford. The historic 1.4 percent housing
22 vacancy rate is a sounding alarm, which makes clear
23 that we must significantly build more housing,
24 reforming our city's outdated zoning while making
25 meaningful housing and neighborhood investments

1
2 present a major opportunity to make our city more
3 affordable for every New Yorker.

4 Holistically, we know that not one council
5 district alone can build its way out of a housing
6 crisis. It takes a true action plan that includes
7 every district's participation in confronting this
8 issue.

9 The Council can advance an important step towards
10 this goal by approving our modifications to the
11 Housing Opportunity Citywide Zoning Text Amendment,
12 which is expected to build more than 80,000 new homes
13 over the next 15 years. This reform plan maintains a
14 core principle that for equitable development, every
15 part of the city must create new housing.

16 At the same time, we fully understand that
17 neighborhoods across our city have distinct
18 characteristics with diverse needs that must be
19 respected. That is why modifications account for
20 differences across neighborhoods and establish
21 stronger requirements for more deeply affordable
22 housing to match the greater need amongst New
23 Yorkers.

24 The Council also recognizes that our communities
25 have significant housing and infrastructure needs

2 that cannot be met solely by producing more housing
3 through zoning changes. That is why the Council
4 fought to secure an historic \$5 billion in
5 investments to help address these many other needs
6 through our City for All Housing Plan. For the
7 residents of NYCHA, Mitchell-Lamas, and other
8 existing affordable housing developments, we secured
9 \$2 billion to preserve and create more of these
10 homes.

11 Throughout the public review process, many
12 residents and their council members highlighted the
13 lack of sufficient infrastructure in their
14 neighborhoods which led to flooding, battered roads,
15 and lack of open space. To address these
16 vulnerabilities, the Council secured \$2 billion
17 towards strengthening communities infrastructure.

18 The funding commitments we secured for the City
19 of All also include reinforcements for tenant
20 protections that can help prevent displacement,
21 housing assistance to combat homelessness, and
22 support for housing agencies to help New Yorkers
23 access housing, advance the development of affordable
24 homes, and inspect buildings to ensure safety.

1
2 Ensuring housing and housing security for our
3 constituents and all residents is a fundamental to a
4 thriving city. New Yorkers need stable, affordable
5 homes, and the Council is moving to address this
6 crisis through a comprehensive plan that pairs
7 investments and housing solutions together with
8 zoning reforms. I'm confident that this thoughtful,
9 carefully negotiated agreement, though with diverse
10 community concerns in mind, is the right step for our
11 city. Now is the time for action and our shared
12 contributions to solve our housing crisis and what
13 will ensure that New Yorkers today and tomorrow can
14 succeed. Thank you.

15 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you, Council
16 Member. I would like recognize Council Member Riley,
17 followed by Council Member Sanchez, then Council
18 Member Brewer.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you, Majority Leader.
20 As the chair of the Subcommittee on Zoning and
21 Franchises, I am honored to cast my vote today in
22 favor of the City of Yes Zoning for Housing
23 Opportunity, a transformative step forward in
24 addressing New York City's housing crisis.
25

1 This plan is more about numbers. Although, the
2 anticipated 82,000 new homes and \$5 billion in
3 critical investments are monumental, it's about
4 providing hope and opportunity for New Yorkers who
5 have been struggling to find stable, affordable
6 places to live. It's about uplifting families who
7 deserve not just housing, but homes and neighborhoods
8 that welcome them, support them, and allow them to
9 thrive.
10

11 This initiative is a key pillar of our City for
12 All Plan, which reflects the Council's unwavering
13 commitment to advocacy and collaboration. Every
14 borough is part of this effort, ensuring that
15 solutions are shared, equitable, and tailored to the
16 unique character of our communities. We are making a
17 promise today, no matter where you live in this city,
18 we are working to build a future where affordability
19 is no longer out of reach, and every New Yorker has a
20 place to call their home.

21 I want to thank Speaker Adams, the Department of
22 City Planning, my Council colleagues, especially the
23 Land Use team, and the tireless advocates who helped
24 shape this proposal. This vote represents not just a
25 comprehensive plan, but proves that by working

2 together, we can build a city that supports its
3 neighbors, invest in its people, and creates a legacy
4 of inclusion and equity for generations to come.
5 Thank you, Majority Leader.

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you, Council
7 Member.

8 I would now like to recognize Council Member
9 Sanchez.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you, Majority
11 Leader.

12 We are in the throes of a housing crisis, an
13 affordability crisis with a near zero citywide
14 vacancy rate for the most affordable housing. If you
15 lose your affordable home today, you will not find
16 another tomorrow. That is why our vote today,
17 colleagues, to overhaul the City Zoning Code to
18 enable the creation of a little more housing in every
19 neighborhood, paired with \$5 billion in investments
20 that our speaker negotiated on this council's behalf,
21 is so important.

22 Our actions here today will aid tens of thousands
23 of New Yorkers. Colleagues, I urge you to think big
24 picture as you cast your votes today.

2 A no vote is no to \$5 billion for more deeply
3 affordable housing, housing vouchers stabilizing over
4 20,000 families, expanded homeownership
5 opportunities, stabilization of Mitchell-Lamas
6 infrastructure, neighborhood planning, all secured by
7 our speaker.

8 A no vote is no to 80,000 more homes in the next
9 10 years. This isn't about any one of us as
10 individuals or even our own political calculus. It
11 isn't even about the community that we might
12 represent. A yes vote today is a vote for all New
13 Yorkers.

14 I want to thank all of our advocates, to our
15 speaker, for your extraordinary leadership in getting
16 us to this point, and to all the staff who worked to
17 get City of Yes and City for All to the point it is
18 today. Colleagues, let's do the right thing.

19 And I will mention that I have three bills that
20 are also companion bills to City of Yes: 1127 and 28
21 make accessory dwelling units safer for all, and 654
22 reestablishes the J-51 tax incentives, which will
23 save a 166,000 families living in our co-ops and
24 condos across the city thousands of dollars each year

1
2 so they can green their homes. Thank you so much,
3 Majority Leader.

4 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, Council
5 Member. I would like to recognize Council Member
6 Brewer.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much.

8 This particular City of Yes doesn't impact a huge
9 amount really, really developed areas like the Upper
10 West Side, but what it does is it brings, as you
11 heard earlier, housing to all different communities
12 and makes a difference.

13 When different people are mixing in communities,
14 it makes our city a much stronger place. So it's
15 about the people. When you get an apartment, and it's
16 part of a community, and you're different, that is a
17 positive in my world.

18 Number two, I'm really concerned about
19 preservation in this City of Yes, plus the funding
20 does address preservation. I can tell you that I've
21 got about three large buildings right now, single
22 room occupancies, to be purchased. They need to be
23 part of the discussion.

24 Number three, is I feel strongly that these
25 regulation should not stymie the continuation of the

2 work that the Landmarks Preservation Commission does
3 in the future. We should keep that in mind. I want to
4 mention that just the other day, I released the fact
5 that on the Upper West Side, in like a 20 or 30 block
6 area, the bad news is that there were 630 brand new,
7 very expensive units, only 68 of them were
8 affordable, and they were in two buildings. Everybody
9 else was, uh, market, and it could have been
10 different if City of Yes existed.

11 I want to congratulate everyone, uhm, for the
12 work they've done, the staff, Speaker Adams, City
13 Planning, and the Council.

14 And I just want to mention a big idea - I keep
15 mentioning, Warr's Island is the last piece of open
16 land in Manhattan. I'd love to see an affordable co-
17 op and rental program there of Mitchell-Lama. Thank
18 you very much.

19 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Recognizing Council
20 Member Gennaro, followed by Council Member Banks,
21 then Council Member Ariola... (CROSS-TALK)

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I vote...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you, Madam...

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I vote, yes, uh...
25

2 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: We haven't gotten to
3 votes yet, but we will get to it.

4 (BACKGROUND NOISE) Quiet, please.

5 Recognizing Council Member Gennaro, followed by
6 Council Member Banks, then Council Member Ariola.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you, Madan Majority
8 Leader. I think the speaker did a great job in
9 talking about... I got, uh, I got, two bills, 814-A
10 about, uh, sewer backups, I think that... I think the
11 speaker covered that very well. And I want to keep my
12 remarks brief. It's a long meeting.

13 Uh, 815-A, about the flooding maps, uh, just a
14 little, more detail. There are two separate maps, uh,
15 one is, you know, coastal flood map - and we know all
16 about the need for that from Sandy - and also so
17 called inland flood hazard area maps. Those are
18 critical for the very intense rainstorms that we get
19 now.

20 So it's two separate, uh, mapping initiatives
21 that will provide great benefit, particularly with
22 the inland flood areas, because heavy rains, this
23 is... this is what is happening, uh, it will help
24 inform, you know, DEP stormwater management planning,
25 and also, you know, critical to today, it will be,

2 uh, the inland flood mapping maps, and the
3 information that it provides, will be a very
4 important resource for mapping the appropriate and
5 safe placement of ADUs.

6 So, there are many applications to these, uh, to
7 these maps, and together these bills represent a
8 proactive approach in dealing with the growing
9 impacts on climate change and severe storms in our
10 city. Thank you very much.

11 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, recognizing
12 Council Member Banks, followed by Council Member
13 Ariola.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Thank you, Madam Majority
15 Leader.

16 It's not just... it's not enough just to say
17 that New York City is in a housing crisis. The real
18 crisis is regarding the lack of affordability and the
19 pathways to homeownership. My district has seen an
20 increase in affordable housing over the last 15
21 years, but it still remains nearly impossible for my
22 constituents to become homeowners.

23 Homeownership is the cornerstone of stability,
24 uh, community building, social engagement, and
25 fostering economic growth in our community.

1
2 Unfortunately, the City of Yes plan does little to
3 ensure the future of housing will be affordable and
4 offers no meaningful solution to improve
5 homeownership. Most importantly, my vote today
6 reflects the wishes of my constituents.

7 Time and time again, I hear from my constituents
8 that they need more parking. While I appreciate the
9 efforts made during the negotiations to protect
10 parking requirements, I must echo the concerns of my
11 constituents that the increased development will
12 further strain already limited parking.

13 City of Yes lacks the nuance to avoid harm in my
14 district, which despite being home to multiple subway
15 lines, it is also filled with transportation deserts,
16 making cars necessary.

17 All four community boards in my district
18 disapproved of this proposal. The people I represent
19 and serve have said it - made it clear in their
20 opposition. My constituents fear the proposal would
21 irreparably change the character of their
22 neighborhoods, opening the flood gate for developers
23 to build and construct with no concern for their
24 interests, and destroy generations and families that
25

2 will be uprooted, and the years of rich history, uh,
3 (TIMER CHIMES) that will be erased.

4 Voters sent me to City Hall to listen to them,
5 and I'm listening to them.

6 (APPLAUSE)

7 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you. Quiet on the
8 floor, please.

9 Okay, Council Member Ariola, followed Council
10 Member Williams, then Council Member Carr.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you.

12 In Queens County, 12 out of 14 community boards
13 voted against the City of Yes. So a no vote is not
14 against housing, affordable housing, affordable
15 housing for all. It is a no against long term
16 consequences for the people of this city. It is a no
17 against virtually unchecked buildings and allowances
18 the for the renewal.... and a no against community
19 lack of input, as well as our lack of input on
20 massive developments in neighborhoods that we
21 represent. It is a no, because we don't need to push
22 our infrastructure past the breaking point. It is a
23 no against chaos. It is a no for districts like mine
24 who are flood prone neighborhoods that already lack
25 vital infrastructure.

1 The City of Yes will only add to the heavy
2 burdens residents face every day. Even in the worst
3 case scenario, it can create life threatening
4 situations during weather emergencies. But just on
5 moon tides in my communities, we would be absolutely
6 underwater. We don't have the infrastructure, and I
7 know that the Mayor has promised money for
8 infrastructure, but why are we putting the cart
9 before the horse? Why are we putting the housing up
10 and then worrying about the infrastructure? We need
11 to have the infrastructure in place before we build
12 the housing. That's what's important.

14 I appreciate the work that the Speaker's Office
15 and my colleagues did - and the Land Use Division. I
16 appreciate the fact that modifications were made. But
17 I can't go on a "what if" when my constituents, like
18 Council Member Banks said, are telling me, we don't
19 trust the system. We don't want the character of our
20 neighborhoods to change. (TIMER CHIMES) We do want
21 more affordability.

22 So I strongly urge my colleagues to support
23 future legislation that I will be introducing, which
24 would exempt flood zones...

2 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Council Member, your time
3 has expired...

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: and inland flooding areas
5 from the City of Yes, thank you.

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, Council
7 Member. I would now like to recognize Council Member
8 Williams, followed by Council Member Carr.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. Today, we
10 face a defining moment for our city, a moment to
11 choose bold action to address a housing crisis that
12 is squeezing families, stifling opportunity, and
13 holding New Yorkers back.

14 Let me start by saying this, I heard you. I heard
15 the concerns about maintaining the character of our
16 neighborhoods and balancing growth incrementally with
17 fairness. That's why I've worked tirelessly with
18 Speaker Adams, the Admin, community leaders, and my
19 colleagues to ensure that the City of Yes for Housing
20 Opportunity is not just a policy, but a promise.

21 This promise says we can tackle a housing crisis
22 that has left us with a rental vacancy rate of just
23 1.41 percent, the lowest since 1968, and half of
24 renters burdened by skyrocketing rents. But it also
25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 43
2 says we can do it responsibly with our communities at
3 the heart of every decision.

4 Over the past months, I convened many focus
5 groups in Southeast Queens to dig into the original
6 proposal. Based on that feedback, we fought for and
7 secured key amendments to protect the character of
8 our neighborhoods. For example, parking requirements
9 for larger buildings in lower density districts of my
10 council district will remain unchanged, because cars
11 are a necessity in our transit desert. Accessory
12 dwelling units have been scaled back, ensuring the
13 detached ADUs don't overwhelm our communities, and
14 any homeowner adding one must live on-site to
15 maintain our home ownership culture.

16 We even refined the scope of town-centered and
17 transit oriented development near low density
18 neighborhoods to avoid overburdening infrastructure
19 near Long Island Railroad Stations.

20 These revisions matter. They show that the City
21 of Yes doesn't mean yes at any cost. It means yes to
22 thoughtful, balanced growth. And with the Council
23 securing \$5 billion for housing related investments
24 and homeownership opportunities, including \$2 billion
25 for sewer infrastructure, public space, and other

1
2 infrastructure improvements, this plan is not just
3 about zoning changes, it's a comprehensive strategy
4 (TIMER CHIMES) to meet the needs of New Yorkers.

5 The families of Southeast Queens and all of New
6 York New York deserve thriving communities that
7 aren't overburdened. Thank you so much to the Land
8 Use Division, uh, for all your hard work.

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Recognizing Council
10 Member Carr, followed by Council Member Yeger, and
11 Council Member Feliz.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you, Majority Leader.

13 Colleagues, when I spoke at the Subcommittee on
14 Zoning and Franchises a couple of weeks ago on City
15 of Yes, I talked a lot about the fact that the public
16 will of so many of our constituents was being ignored
17 in City of Yes, that our infrastructure needs were
18 already not being met at current levels of
19 development, and that we had an opportunity to do
20 more housing the right way that was respectful of
21 neighborhood character.

22 And having spoken about that, and knowing that
23 other colleagues are doing and will do the same here
24 today, I want to focus a little bit on what I believe
25 to have been the insufficient environmental review

1
2 that this administration did with respect to City of
3 Yes.

4 At the hearing we held on October 21st, the
5 Administration testified in response to my
6 questioning that this is a text amendment, not a
7 mapping amendment, and the environmental review was
8 done accordingly. But I believe that City of Yes is a
9 Mapping Amendment masquerading as a Text Amendment.
10 It is a mapping action; therefore, the environmental
11 review was not done.

12 City of Yes seeks to change minimum lot sizes
13 across residential districts, especially in R-1's.
14 It's seeking to map transit oriented development
15 zones across our city without actually changing the
16 underlying zoning.

17 This is a mapping action in all but name, and
18 that's why I believe that this text amendment, so
19 called, is incredibly vulnerable to legal action. And
20 I believe that this environmental review did not even
21 get to the... scrape the top of the iceberg of how
22 many housing units it will actually create, far more
23 than the 109,000+ that it capped out at according to
24 the study.

2 So I believe that this text amendment will not
3 survive a legal challenge, and one is likely to be
4 forthcoming.

5 And I just want to remind colleagues that we
6 still have an opportunity to disapprove. The only
7 thing that's off the table here today are new
8 modifications. So let's vote down City of Yes, and
9 then one of us can put forward a motion to disapprove
10 after we're successful. And I urge my colleagues to
11 vote no, Thank you. (TIMER CHIMES)

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Recognizing Council
13 Member Yeger, followed by Council Member Feliz, then
14 Council Member Ayala.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Madam President.

16 Whenever this body does one size fits all rules,
17 we fail. Whatever the topic is, whether it's
18 sanitation, whether it's zoning, this city is too
19 large, too complicated, too complex, too diverse, too
20 underdeveloped in some places, too overdeveloped in
21 others. For us to do a one size fits all plan, for
22 the top of the Bronx at the bottom Staten Island, it
23 just can't be done.

24 And it's irresponsible and lazy to tell New
25 Yorkers that it can, and we do that frequently, not

1 just on this topic, but on many topics - on planning
2 roads, on planning bike lanes, planning sanitation.
3 We do it all the time and we really shouldn't. It is
4 a big city, and we should treat it like that.
5

6 A lot's been said here in this body and this
7 floor today and in the last couple of days weeks
8 about this great gift of \$5 billion - this phantom \$5
9 billion in monopoly money that we've been granted -
10 \$5 billion that is not \$1.00 planned for in the
11 City's budget, not \$1.00 planned for in the state's
12 budget - \$5 billion a promise, the promise that, buy
13 the burger today and gladly pay you, next year,
14 Tuesday.

15 There is not a single penny planned for, but we
16 are guaranteeing that we will pass this. You can't
17 get your vote back. Understand, colleagues, you
18 cannot get your vote back. You vote for this, that \$5
19 billion isn't there, magically becomes \$2 billion,
20 you don't get to come back here and say, give me my
21 vote back. One time chance to do it right.

22 As Council Member Carr said, we have a chance to
23 vote this down, vote down the modification, send it
24 back to City Planning. We can do a plan that we can
25 disapprove this one, vote for an actual plan that

2 does this in a real way, and does it in conjunction
3 with the City Budget so that we can actually achieve
4 the monies that we think we're getting. And I urge
5 colleagues... my colleagues to do that.

6 I also wish to associate myself with the remarks
7 of Council Member (TIMER CHIMES) Banks, they are
8 wise, and I appreciate them very much. Thank you,
9 Madam President.

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Recognizing Council
11 Member Feliz, followed by Deputy Speaker Ayala, then
12 Council Member Hudson.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you, Majority Leader.

14 For years, and years, and years our city has been
15 in a housing crisis, a housing crisis with real
16 effect on New Yorkers, including cramped apartments,
17 housing instability, and even worse, homelessness.

18 We can only resolve this housing crisis by making
19 it easy to build, removing obstacles that get in the
20 way and prevent new homes from being built. And
21 that's exactly what we are doing today.

22 Building housing should not be challenging,
23 shouldn't be difficult, and we must think about every
24 highly restrictive and overly complicated rule that
25

1
2 gets in the way of us getting out of this housing
3 crisis.

4 This City of Yes is a great start. It's not
5 perfect, but it's a great start and it goes a long
6 way. I proudly represent District 15 in the Bronx,
7 which has proudly built some of the largest amounts
8 of affordable housing in the entire city. But as we
9 all know, District 15 cannot resolve this housing
10 crisis alone.

11 So I encourage everybody to vote yes. I want to
12 congratulate all of my colleagues, including Speaker
13 Adams. As we all know, Speaker Adams is a tough,
14 principled, and effective negotiator. So
15 congratulations, Speaker Adams, and everybody else.

16 Also, before I conclude, I just want to emphasize
17 how proud I am of the many homeownership
18 opportunities included in this bill. When New Yorkers
19 move up the economic ladder, they want to own their
20 own home. And if New York City does not offer those
21 opportunities, we're gonna lose these New Yorkers to
22 other nearby cities and states. We should want to
23 keep these New Yorkers, and we need to invest in
24 them. And that's exactly what we're doing today,
25 including \$41 million for down payment assistance

2 programs, creation of new Mitchell-Lama programs, and
3 many other initiatives.

4 So I'm very proud, and I'm strongly encouraging
5 everybody to vote yes on the City of Yes.

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, recognizing
7 Deputy Speaker Diana Ayala.

8 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: Sorry, I broke the mic,
9 sorry.

10 Good afternoon, everyone. I just wanted to say a
11 few words about my vote to approve the City of Yes
12 for Housing Opportunity.

13 Housing is a fundamental pillar of safety and
14 stability for our city and its neighborhoods. It
15 unlocks the ability for people to pursue opportunity,
16 something that I know personally from my own
17 experiences of homelessness and housing insecurity.

18 This plan was the result of listening to the
19 needs of everyday New Yorkers who are facing growing
20 housing and economic pressures. We heard from working
21 families and residents who are struggling to find a
22 home, to afford rent, or cost to maintain their
23 homes, and in some cases, to live with the dignified
24 conditions that we all deserve.

1 As part of our negotiations, the Council secured
2
3 \$5 billion in commitments for our City of All Housing
4 Plan that will benefit our communities and entire
5 city.

6 New Yorkers are relying on us to deliver this
7 investment. We cannot fail them. As council members
8 representing all corners of this diverse city, we
9 see, hear, and feel the impact of this housing
10 crisis. We know, whether it's from our constituents
11 or even our own family members, how hard it is now
12 for New Yorkers to make ends meet. Too many of the
13 hundreds of thousands of residents living in NYCHA
14 developments do not have their apartments maintained
15 at the level of quality that they deserve to be safe.
16 Many New Yorkers are unhoused or on the brink of
17 homelessness and need better access to CityFHEPS
18 vouchers that can help them gain stability. That is
19 why the Council pushed for a comprehensive housing
20 plan to help alleviate many of the challenges that
21 the zoning cannot address now.

22 Working alongside New Yorkers, we put forward a
23 plan to deliver greater housing security, deeper
24 affordability, and the neighborhood investments
25 needed. I am especially proud that our City for All

2 Plan prioritizes funding to support our public
3 housing residents. We were able to secure \$2 billion
4 in additional capital investments that support
5 repairs of NYCHA tenant apartments and makes the
6 5,000 vacant public apartments available to New
7 Yorkers. (TIMER CHIMES)

8 The funding will also support increased
9 affordable housing development and preservation of
10 privately managed apartment buildings, including
11 Mitchell-Lamas and HDFCs... (CROSS-TALK)

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Deputy Speaker...

13 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: I am also... I'm... I'm...

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Your time has
15 expired... (CROSS-TALK)

16 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: going to take a point of
17 privilege as the deputy speaker to finish my remarks.

18 I am also excited (BACKGROUND NOISE) that we will
19 deliver... (CROSS-TALK)

20 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: We can come around on
21 second round if you'd like, but please wrap up,
22 Deputy Speaker, we appreciate it.

23 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: I would ask, again, for a
24 point of privilege, which I never request, because I
25 never give remarks.

1 But, I am also excited, and I am wrapping up, I
2 am also excited that we will deliver the \$400 million
3 in funding for CityFHEPS vouches, including for use
4 in buildings converted from homeless shelters to
5 permanently affordable housing.
6

7 We cannot forget the \$2 billion infrastructure
8 investment that we were able to secure, which will go
9 towards necessary improvements for flood mitigation
10 of our stormwater drainage and sewer systems, street
11 upgrades, and open spaces. All of these investments
12 will have tangible lasting impacts on our communities
13 and New Yorkers, and we cannot afford to throw this
14 generational opportunity.

15 With the City of All Housing Plan, we are all
16 investing in the people of our city. Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Recognizing Council
18 Member Hudson, followed by Council Member Ossé, then
19 and Council Member Hanks.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you, Majority
21 Leader, and good afternoon all.

22 Today's vote on the City of Yes Zoning for
23 Housing Opportunity is certainly a controversial one,
24 but the reality is that some communities are doing
25

1
2 their part to address the housing crisis and others
3 are not, and that's the real controversy.

4 While every neighborhood and district is
5 different, we can't keep relying on the South Bronx,
6 Western Queens, or Northern and Central Brooklyn
7 alone to build us out of this crisis. We need
8 everyone to do their part.

9 This first of its kind citywide text amendment
10 does the bare minimum in creating more opportunities
11 to build housing, including the deeply affordable
12 housing this body so passionately cares about. It
13 gives communities and developers alike new options to
14 consider when planning a new project. And let me be
15 clear, these options are just that, options.

16 Nothing considered in this zoning text amendment
17 requires developers or homeowners to build anything.
18 But with City of Yes, we create an option for more
19 affordable housing units via universal affordability
20 preference or UAP, an option to remove unnecessary
21 and costly parking mandates that could create a
22 financially feasible pathway to increase
23 affordability beyond MIH, and an option to build ADUs
24 that can provide older family members the opportunity
25 to age in place.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 55
2 In my experience, the people who've complained
3 most about housing proposals are those who have
4 housing. If we don't maximize our opportunities to
5 build, rents will only continue to rise and push out
6 long time community residents, especially older Black
7 and brown New Yorkers who live on fixed incomes.

8 I'd like to commend the speaker, her staff, and
9 especially the Planning and Land Use Division for
10 securing \$5 billion for more deeply affordable
11 housing and homeownership opportunities,
12 infrastructure investments, and tenant protections.
13 Thank you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you, recognizing
15 Council Member Ossé, followed by Hanks.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you, Majority Leader.

17 I wasn't going speak today, but, you know, I've
18 been hearing a lot of, uh, statements from some
19 people, not all people, about their opposition to
20 this. It's wild to hear those same people who are
21 pushing back against the development of new homes are
22 the same people who aren't even against rent
23 stabilization, could cause eviction, banning forced
24 broker fees, and a plethora of other initiatives that
25

1 keep affordability, uh, or protect affordability here
2 in this city.

3
4 Let's talk about the facts. Over the past 40
5 years, the City has added more jobs than we have
6 homes. The vacancy rate, as we've heard today, is at
7 1.4 percent. I represent Bed-Stuy where I saw the
8 largest displacement of Black people and an influx of
9 new residents compared to every other community
10 within the city.

11 When people are moving into our city to apply and
12 work in those new jobs that we've added, they're
13 competing for the same homes of working class New
14 Yorkers, of workers who are working for New York
15 City, which adds to the skyrocketing in our rents.

16 What we're doing here today is not easy, but it's
17 necessary. We need to build in this city. We need to
18 build affordability in this city. We need rent
19 stabilization in this city. We need so much more to
20 protect the working class New Yorkers that exist
21 within the five boroughs.

22 Every single community needs to do their part,
23 and the speaker's assistance here in pushing a City
24 for All Plan, and adding \$5 billion, that's a lot of
25 money to go towards affordable housing development,

1
2 to go towards infrastructure development is a
3 necessary step - not the end all be all, but a
4 necessary step in putting us where we need to be and
5 making the city affordable.

6 We cannot, as a body and government, sit idle and
7 let the City become more and more unaffordable
8 because of those who have continued to say no for
9 decades.

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, Council
11 Member. I'd now like to recognize Council Member
12 Hanks, followed by Council Member Restler.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Thank you, Majority Leader.

14 I'd like to also to associate my comments with my
15 colleague, Council Member Banks.

16 The City of Yes for Housing Opportunities set out
17 to be a solution for our city's housing and zoning
18 changes. However, it falls short of achieving its
19 stated goals in boroughs like Staten Island, as it
20 fails to adequately address the unique needs of
21 boroughs like my own.

22 So if you ask me to come up with a plan that
23 provides 5,000+ units of housing, which includes over
24 30 percent of affordable units, I can provide that to
25 you. It's not a matter of not doing our part. It's

2 a... in this housing crisis, it's about doing our
3 part with respect of our districts and our individual
4 needs.

5 And, so I, you know, our borough's unique
6 infrastructure, flood zone, uh, prone areas, limited
7 public transportation, a lot of this plan just
8 doesn't go far enough.

9 And I want to express my gratitude to the civic
10 associations, urban planners, builders, advocates,
11 or, you know, builders associations that added their
12 invaluable insights and make sure that Staten
13 Island's voice is heard.

14 I was 27 years old when I purchased my home - 27.
15 I have two children living at home, regrettably, over
16 the age of 23 that I would love to move out, making
17 over \$55,000 a year. Does the City of Yes address the
18 affordability issues so we can produce the next
19 generation of homeownership?

20 But homeowners should not be discriminated
21 against because we've purchased our homes or we live
22 in boroughs that are not Manhattan, not the Bronx,
23 and not Brooklyn.

24 So I want to commend the affordability and
25 homeownership incentives that Speaker Adrienne Adams

2 has done with our leadership in ensuring that
3 affordable housing modifications were made in this
4 proposal, but as I am (TIMER CHIMES) two parts an
5 advocate, I am a representative, and this is what my
6 constituents asked me to do. So vote no.

7 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Recognizing Council
8 Member Restler, followed by Council Member Marte.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you so much, Madam
10 Majority Leader.

11 You know, mayors and their administrations, they
12 can propose whatever they want. But it is up to this
13 council, the City Council, to determine what laws are
14 adopted and what zoning changes are made.

15 This body recognizes the extreme housing
16 emergency and affordability crisis that our city is
17 facing. Thanks to the tremendous leadership of our
18 speaker, Adrienne Adams, we are embracing a plan to
19 expand housing in every neighborhood across New York
20 City. And thanks to the tremendous leadership of
21 Speaker Adrienne Adams, we are accomplishing so much
22 more.

23 This zoning modification adopted by... when
24 adopted by the Council will ensure we create truly

1
2 affordable housing through the speaker's City for All
3 plan.

4 The speaker negotiated a historic \$5 billion
5 investment in new affordable housing that is actually
6 affordable to working families in tenant protections,
7 in improvements at NYCHA, in infrastructure
8 investments to meet the needs of growing communities,
9 and so much more.

10 In my district, as a result of this plan, there
11 will be more affordable housing in new buildings that
12 go up and less parking spots in our transit rich
13 community. That makes sense.

14 This plan will create just about a 100 units of
15 new housing per council district per year for the
16 next 15 years.

17 Come to the 33rd district today, there are dozens
18 of projects underway that are bigger than a 100 units
19 right now. My district has generated more new housing
20 than any other council district in New York City over
21 the last 15 years. We are doing our part. It has not
22 been easy, but it has been necessary.

23 This plan ensures that every city council
24 district steps up.

1 I'd like to thank the speaker and her team for
2 negotiating a great deal for New Yorkers, for my
3 constituents. I am grateful especially to Faiza and
4 Jeremy and Mandela for their work on this.
5

6 I'd also like to thank the team at DCP who have
7 been great partners to us, Dan and Genevieve, Clem,
8 (INAUDIBLE), and the whole team over there.

9 This is a really good day for the City Council
10 and for the people of New York City. Thank you so
11 much.

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, just a
13 reminder to keep quiet on the... in Chambers, thank
14 you so much.

15 I would now like to recognize Council Member
16 Marte, followed by Council Member De La Rosa.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: The real estate industry
18 shouldn't run this city. Working people should.

19 I represent neighborhoods like the Lower East
20 Side in Chinatown, where unchecked market rate
21 development has led to skyscrapers that sit empty,
22 drive up speculation, and causes rent to sky rise and
23 displace immigrant communities that have been rooted
24 there for generations.
25

1 The City of Yes is a yes to only the real estate
2 developers. It's a plan to put our trust in
3 developers, the same ones that evict us, destroy us,
4 and displace our communities.
5

6 We are now giving them the green light saying
7 that, yes, their market value matters more than
8 immigrant communities. Yes, people don't need to see
9 the sky when they leave their house. Yes, the Real
10 Estate Board of New York can be better planners than
11 the community who have lived there and built those
12 communities. Yes, we can build market rate housing to
13 alleviate our affordable crisis - which I don't
14 believe in trickledown economics.

15 Yes, because an immigrant community is trendy
16 now, and, yes, because a developer only sees that as
17 a profit to make it on the backs of those people who
18 live there.

19 We are saying yes to a plan that the Mayor
20 created, a mayor who's embedded with corruption
21 scandals. We are saying yes to what he wants to do to
22 our city, the shadows of this plan will cast over our
23 city - and it isn't just literally.

24 Today, they darken the future of our most risk
25 neighborhoods. But tomorrow, the fight against

1 displacement will continue. Working people will
2 continue to light their way, to organize against
3 eviction, to unify around community plans like the
4 Chinatown Working Group Plan.
5

6 Just as there has always been backdoor deals
7 broken in darkness, there will always be neighbors
8 organizing to fight for a brighter future. Thank you.

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, recognizing
10 Council Member De La Rosa.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much.

12 I would like to thank Speaker Adams, my
13 colleagues, Chair Salamanca, Chair Riley, Council
14 Member Sanchez, and, of course, the Land Use staff,
15 and all of the staff for engaging in days of public
16 testimony and negotiating a package that looks to
17 address the needs of everyday New Yorkers who
18 desperately deserve the opportunity for dignified
19 housing.

20 The revisions put forth by the Council shape a
21 more inclusive plan, while accompanying the proposal
22 with financial support to preserve existing
23 affordable housing.

24 Housing is the number one need in District 10,
25 the community that I represent, with over 90 percent

1
2 of our constituent cases that come into our office
3 concerning housing in some capacity or another.

4 We are witnessing the stark reality that one in
5 eight public school students are unhoused or lack
6 permanent housing options.

7 We have a choice today, a choice to make a
8 difference. Every day, we work to support families
9 displaced by fires struggling to find a home in a
10 time of crisis, homeless students lacking safe after
11 school accommodations, and families cramped into
12 apartments on the verge of losing their own homes.

13 We repeatedly, in District 10, have arrested the
14 worst landlord on the Worst Landlord List, who has
15 made it impossible for tenants to live in the
16 buildings he owns through sheer neglect.

17 We take this housing crisis seriously. The work
18 doesn't stop today, it merely begins.

19 In District 10, we all remember the Inwood
20 Rezoning. After a traumatic process, there were hard
21 fought concessions that were put in place to protect
22 parts of Inwood's current zoning. Those protections
23 will remain in place under this City for All
24 proposal.

1 While I have heard the concerns about the depth
2 of affordability, metrics like the Universal
3 Affordability Preferences and area median incomes
4 will not always match our community's financial
5 realities, but we are fighting to stop displacement
6 caused by predatory market forces. (TIMER CHIMES)
7 This means... this means that the challenges are met
8 by the \$5 billion to secure tenant protections, legal
9 support to fight harassment...
10

11 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Council Member, your time
12 has expired.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: preservation and
14 vouchers across the district.

15 No single policy will solve the complex housing
16 issues and the deep systematic barriers that exist,
17 but we must act, and today I look forward to joining
18 this council in acting, so that we can make a
19 reality, the City for All, thank you.

20 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you. I would now
21 like to recognize Council Member Holden.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Majority
23 Leader.

24 The City of Yes threatens to change the very
25 character of too many communities in New York City,

1 particularly in Queens. And that's why it was
2 mentioned earlier that 12 out of the 14 community
3 boards voted against the City of Yes.
4

5 Now as a 30-year member of a community board in,
6 uh, Five in Queens, I know the neighborhoods in and
7 out because I've done my work as a volunteer. And I
8 also did my work of mapping the entire community in
9 our, uhm, zoning, uh, adjustments in the 1980s and in
10 the early 2000s. I went door to door, and many of
11 my... we had 75 volunteers that went around to
12 protect the housing stock, to protect... going in our
13 backyards and able to feel the sun on our faces. It's
14 so important that it's not a one size fits all, like,
15 was mentioned by my colleagues, Council Member Banks,
16 Hanks, Marte and Yeger.

17 This is, uh, this is something that threatens the
18 very character of our neighborhoods. And it's really,
19 uhm, it's really egregious that we're turning over
20 many of the decisions to developers.

21 So most of our accomplishments will be totally
22 eliminated. The City of Yes is a developer's dream
23 and a neighborhood's nightmare. This is all this is.

24 And a guarantee of \$5 billion is just, again,
25 it's not worth the paper that it's printed on. So

2 it's really, like my colleague, Councilman Yeger
3 said, monopoly money.

4 Let's not give away our vote. Let's turn down the
5 City of Yes, because it's really a rush job for
6 developers. Thank you.

7 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Recognizing Council
8 Member Abreu.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Thank you, Madam Majority
10 Leader.

11 Today's vote isn't about achieving anyone's
12 perfect vision. It's about realizing a shared one.

13 This bill isn't exactly what any of us might have
14 drafted alone, but that's the beauty of democracy,
15 negotiation, compromise, and progress. And progress
16 is exactly what this represents. What we're voting on
17 today isn't just a policy, it's a lifeline. A \$5
18 billion commitment to affordable housing and
19 infrastructure is not just transformative, it's
20 historic.

21 New York City is in the midst of a housing
22 crisis, and the urgency couldn't be clearer. Too many
23 of our neighbors are teetering on the edge, trying to
24 make impossible choices between rent, groceries, and
25 other essentials. This proposal takes a step toward

1 ensuring that every New Yorker can have what we all
2 deserve, the stability and dignity of an affordable
3 home.
4

5 By passing this plan, we are building a stronger,
6 fairer, and more inclusive city, one that truly meets
7 the needs of its people and prioritizes their well-
8 being.

9 I commend Speaker Adams and her extraordinary
10 team for their vision, leadership, and hard work in
11 delivering this landmark achievement for our city.

12 For these reasons, I urge my colleagues to vote
13 aye. Thank you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you, seeing no one
15 else signed to speak, I now call on Speaker Adams to
16 close the discussion of General Orders.

17 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you, Madam Majority Leader.

18 Hearing all of my colleagues and the feedback on
19 this unprecedented legislation that we're voting on
20 today, I've said this before, and I'm going to say it
21 again, this council, and my colleagues have heard me
22 say this many times, this council cannot be the body
23 that says no to people that need a place to live.

24 It is our responsibility as elected
25 representatives, respecting our districts as diverse

1
2 and unique as each one is, to represent our districts
3 as well as the entire city of New York, all of the
4 good with the bad and everything in between. We are
5 to represent our *entire* constituency with the respect
6 and dignity that they all deserve.

7 I don't know about you, but I am tired of the
8 homelessness rate going up. I am tired of my
9 community going south, because their city is
10 unaffordable for them to live in. I am tired of
11 watching, daily, people on the brink of eviction and
12 other means of losing their homes - as one of my
13 colleagues said, not have another place to look
14 forward to moving into, because it's just not
15 affordable.

16 We cannot do nothing. *We cannot do nothing.* This
17 proposal, when it was delivered to us, certainly was
18 not perfect. It was not perfect months ago, it is
19 definitely not perfect today. But, the modifications
20 put forth by the efforts this council, and members of
21 this city who sat in these chambers for almost 15
22 *hours*, under the leadership of Chair Kevin Riley, to
23 give their thoughts, their opinions, their tears,
24 their blood, their sweat, their thoughts and their
25 opinions to this body to compile the modifications

2 and help us to deliver the product that we are
3 delivering today, this is not the proposal that was
4 delivered to us, as some of my colleagues has
5 presented and think that this is the proposal that
6 was presented to us.

7 We have created modifications that will create a
8 City for All. This cannot be the council that turns
9 their back on homelessness. This cannot be the
10 council that turns their back and continues to say,
11 scrap it, let's move ahead, let's do something,
12 because I tell you that will never happen! It hasn't
13 happened in 20 years, and it's not going to happen
14 today if we say no to people who need some place to
15 live, and are looking for this body to deliver it!

16 It is incumbent upon us to do our due diligence
17 to the people of this city, the people that are
18 looking to us to be their leaders.

19 And I know that advancing solutions to these
20 difficult problems certainly isn't easy, but it
21 definitely becomes possible... (CROSS-TALK)

22 UNKNOWN: You're a bullshitter!

23 SPEAKER ADAMS: if we unite... (CROSS-TALK)

24 UNKNOWN: You're a bullshitter! (UNINTELLIGIBLE)

25

2 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: We will have silence in
3 the...

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: the common...

5 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: gallery (GAVEL SOUND) ...
6 (CROSS-TALK)

7 UNKNOWN: (SHOUTING)...

8 SPEAKER ADAMS: The common good... (CROSS-TALK)

9 UNKNOWN: (CONTINUES SHOUTING)...

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Sergeants, please remove
11 him from the gallery...

12 UNKNOWN: (CONTINUES SHOUTING)...

13 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: There will be no
14 interruptions...

15 UNKNOWN: (CONTINUES SHOUTING)...

16 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: from the gallery!

17 UNKNOWN: You are selling out our people

18 (CONTINUES SHOUTING)...

19 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Please be quiet as you
20 are moving out and being removed from the floor...

21 UNKNOWN: (CONTINUES SHOUTING) (UNINTELLIGIBLE)

22 absolute bullshit, they're gonna sue and stop it!

23 Bullshitters! (CONTINUES SHOUTING)

24 (CHATTER THROUGHOUT CHAMBERS)

25

1 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Can I please have silence
2 in the Chamber?
3

4 UNKNOWN: (CONTINUES SHOUTING)

5 (CHATTER THROUGHOUT CHAMBERS)

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Colleagues, can I please
7 have silence in the Chambers?

8 SPEAKER ADAMS: Colleagues, I will conclude.

9 As we all know, as we see, our job is not an easy
10 one, but we were not elected to stand before our
11 colleagues and our constituents to fail them.

12 There are differing opinions, which we must
13 respect, there are differing ways in which we lead
14 our constituents, which we must respect - and we do.

15 We must unite behind the common good and focus on
16 what is best for every New Yorker and for the futures
17 of the communities that we love.

18 I don't know about you, I want my grandchildren
19 to live in New York City. I want my children that
20 have left New York City to come back to the city that
21 they love.

22 Thank you for your attention, Majority Leader,
23 thank you, for your attention, colleagues.

24 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you, Speaker Adams.

25 Will now have Communication from the Clerk.

2 CLERK: Thank you, Madam Majority Leader.

3 Speaker Adams, there were two communications from
4 the Office of Management and Budget, M 82 and M 83,
5 budget modifications.

6 SPEAKER ADAMS: Finance.

7 CLERK: Thank you.

8 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you. Report of
9 Special Committees?

10 CLERK: None.

11 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Report of Standing
12 Committees?

13 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Aging,
14 Introductions 1022-A and 1054-A, Aging in Place?

15 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and Coupled on General
16 Orders.

17 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Environmental
18 Protection and Resiliency and Waterfronts,
19 Introduction 814-A, sewer backups?

20 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and Coupled on General
21 Orders.

22 CLERK: Introduction 815-A, flood risk map?

23 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and Coupled on General
24 Orders.

25

2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Finance,
3 Preconsidered Resolution 677, organization funding?

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

5 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 197 and Resolution 685
6 through Preconsidered LU 199 and Resolution 687, tax
7 exemptions?

8 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

9 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Housing and
10 Buildings, Introduction 654-A, tax abatement program?

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and Coupled on General
12 Orders.

13 CLERK: Introduction 850-A, disposition of City
14 property?

15 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and Coupled on General
16 Orders.

17 CLERK: Introductions 1127-A and 1128-A, basement
18 legalization and Ancillary Dwelling Unit program?

19 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and Coupled on General
20 Orders.

21 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Rules,
22 Privileges and Elections, M 79 and Resolution 688,
23 approving the appointment of Muriel Goode-Trufant,
24 Corporation Counsel?

25 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

2 CLERK: On the General Order Calendar, LU 81 and
3 Resolution 689, City of Yes Zoning for Housing
4 Opportunity?

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

6 I now ask that the Clerk take a roll call vote on
7 all of the items coupled on today's General Order
8 Calendar.

9 CLERK: Council Member Gutiérrez?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: I vote aye.

11 CLERK: Thank you

12 Council Member Restler?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Aye

14 CLERK: Thank you.

15 Council Member Powers?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I just want to extend my
17 gratitude to our speaker, and I align myself with
18 many of the comments that she just made right now.
19 And I also want to thank my colleagues, Council
20 Member Rafael Salamanca, Council Member Riley,
21 Council Member Sanchez for helping lead us through
22 this process, and Council Member Riley for sitting
23 through days of hearings, and, of course, to my
24 predecessor and friend, Dan Garodnick, and his team
25 for all of their amazing work here as well.

2 I proudly vote, yes, and look forward to seeing
3 this in action in the future.

4 CLERK: Thank you.

5 Council Member Abreu?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Aye

7 CLERK: Council Member Ariola?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Permission to explain my
9 vote?

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: First, I'd like to disclose
12 for the record on the Transparency Resolution that my
13 son works for DSNY.

14 I'd like to speak to the Corporate Counsel
15 nominee. In her capacity as acting Corporate Counsel,
16 and prior as the managing attorney for Corporate
17 Counsel, Muriel Goode-Trufant, has held back hundreds
18 of experienced and extremely qualified firefighters,
19 teachers, police officers, and sanitation workers,
20 and thousands of other city workers from returning to
21 their jobs that they love, after they won court
22 cases, and she continues to unlawfully have them
23 removed from their jobs.

24 Time and time again, lawsuits against the City
25 have been won by city workers who refused to take the

1 COVID vaccine due to medical and religious reasons.

2 And time and time again, Trufant, following in the

3 steps of her predecessor, Sylvia Hinds-Radix, has

4 continued to waste taxpayer dollars on appeals

5 instead of giving the workers the court ordered back

6 pay and allowing them to regain their livelihoods.

7 In her own words, Ms. Trufant stated that her...

8 at her confirmation hearing that she wants to make

9 certain that should the City have another pandemic

10 like we had with COVID, that we would be able...

11 as... able to keep the whole public safe.

12 This means that she would be more than willing to

13 impose lockdowns and mandates, which have been

14 dispelled by former commissioner, Ashwin Vasani,

15 himself, and it has been proven that it was

16 ineffective and admittedly a political weapon rather

17 than a public safety measure.

18 It's time to end the politicizing of families and

19 their careers. Under Trufant's leadership, this will

20 not happen. For these reasons, I cannot support her

21 confirmation, and I urge my colleagues to do the

22 same. Therefore, I am a no on Land Use item 181 City

23 of Yes, Intro 1127-A and 1128-A, M 79 and

24

25

1
2 accompanying Resolution 688, and an eye on all the
3 rest. Thank you.

4 CLERK: Council Member Avilés?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Permission to explain my
6 vote?

7 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Today, we're voting on
9 City of Yes for Housing Opportunity, and after
10 significant back and forth with the Administration, I
11 will be casting a yes vote today.

12 While the Mayor, through his initial proposal,
13 failed to create a sufficient plan for affordable
14 housing, I am proud to have worked alongside my
15 colleagues and Speaker Adams to ensure significant
16 capital investments through our City for All package.

17 My vote today is an acknowledgment of the \$2
18 billion committed to maintaining our parks and public
19 infrastructure, an acknowledgment of the \$2 billion
20 allocated to affordable housing preservation and
21 development, and of the 187... or excuse me, for the
22 commitment to expand CityFHEPS that will create
23 additional housing for our homeless neighbors, and
24 the \$200 million commitment to reduce vacancy rates
25 in NYCHA.

2 While this is a major win for the Council, I want
3 to acknowledge that this is only a piece of the work
4 we need to continue to engage in to create a more
5 just and livable city for working class New Yorkers.

6 I will continue to fight on behalf of my
7 constituents to ensure that they and their families
8 can grow and prosper in our communities without fear
9 of displacement, Thank you, Speaker Adams.

10 And with that, I vote aye.

11 CLERK: Council Member Ayala?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote aye.

13 CLERK: Council Member Banks?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Permission to explain my
15 vote?

16 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: This has been an extremely,
18 tough vote when it comes to LU 181 and Resolution
19 689.

20 However, my vote today will be a no on the Text
21 Resolution, but it's not an objection to housing.
22 It's a call for us as lawmakers and the
23 Administration to go back to the drawing board and
24 tackle the issues with a more nuanced community based
25 approach.

1 Of course, the city needs more housing, but the
2 housing should reflect the wishes of the communities
3 that are already here, the ones we represent, and not
4 cater to desires of outside interests and their idea
5 of what the city should look like.
6

7 The affordable housing crisis is not to be solved
8 by... should not be solved by a one size fits all
9 approach. The neighborhoods I represent each have
10 their own unique needs and challenges, and my
11 constituents have made it clear that they do not want
12 to see their communities fundamentally changed
13 without real consideration for their input.

14 I want to emphasize that I appreciate the support
15 and commitments that we're given in the City for All,
16 and I applaud my fellow council members, Land Use,
17 Speaker Adams, for their efforts in bringing about
18 investments in critical aspects of the city - such as
19 NYCHA developments, Mitchell-Lama, and Pathways to
20 Homeownership, which are near and dear to me.

21 However, I still cannot approve the City Text
22 Amendment Number 3, as I believe that the zoning code
23 changes would be detrimental to my district. My
24 constituents feel the same and I must stand with
25 them.

2 Aye on all except Intro LU 181 and Resolution
3 689. Thank you.

4 CLERK: Thank you.

5 Council Member Bottcher?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Congratulations, Speaker
7 Adams, Chairs Riley and Sanchez, aye on all.

8 CLERK: Council Member Brannan?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye

10 CLERK: Council Member Brewer?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye

12 CLERK: Council Member Brooks-Powers?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Permission to
14 explain my vote?

15 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: The City of Yes
17 For Housing Opportunity has led to meaningful and
18 much needed conversations around housing disparities
19 in our city.

20 My community members have fought to protect the
21 characteristics of the communities they have come to
22 love and safeguard them from the climate risk and
23 vulnerable infrastructure we see today.

24 Thanks to their advocacy, the final proposal
25 excludes ground floor and basement ADUs in coastal

1 and inland flooding zones, limits the transit
2 oriented development radius near Long Island Railroad
3 stations, and preserves full parking requirements in
4 nearly all of our district, key safeguards for our
5 community.
6

7 This proposal will enable more working class
8 families to access homeownership opportunities and
9 therefore build generational wealth. It will help New
10 Yorkers preserve their homes through homeownership
11 assistance and access more affordable units across
12 our city.

13 Importantly, these negotiations have also secured
14 much needed commitments for investments in
15 infrastructure and climate resiliency.

16 For a district like the one I represent, which
17 faces chronic flooding and crumbling infrastructure,
18 these commitments will be important for ensuring that
19 any future development is sustainable and equitable.

20 These concessions were important to get me to
21 where I am today. I would like to acknowledge the
22 tireless work of Speaker Adams and her office,
23 especially Jeremy John, Faiza Ali, Perris Straughter,
24 and the entire Land Use Division, throughout this
25 process to craft a plan that better

2 reflects the diverse needs of communities across our
3 city.

4 Today, I will vote yes, recognizing that while no
5 plan is perfect, this amended version represents a
6 step towards addressing our city's housing crisis
7 while prioritizing the needs of our community. Thank
8 you. And if it wasn't clear, I vote aye. Thank you.

9 CLERK: Thank you.

10 Council Member Cabán?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Permission to explain my
12 vote?

13 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you.

15 I want to take the time to give everyone who
16 worked so hard on this their flowers. Thank you,
17 Speaker, the speaker's team, Council Land Use,
18 Council Finance, Council Member Sanchez, and everyone
19 else who threw down to fight for City of Yes and the
20 City for All commitments.

21 This is an important step towards ending the
22 housing crisis in all of our backyards. Today's vote
23 is for City of Yes and, uh, New York's housing crisis
24 is dire. And going forward, we're gonna need to do
25 more of that. We need social housing in all of our

2 backyards. Yes, we need some higher density housing
3 in all of our backyards. We need supportive housing
4 in all of our backyards.

5 Let's keep building, preserving, rehabilitating,
6 and individualizing housing for every New Yorker.

7 Our goal is, and should be, a home for every New
8 Yorker, no matter who you are, no matter what your
9 needs are, no matter your circumstances.

10 So today, I vote aye on all. Thank you.

11 CLERK: Council Member Carr?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Permission to explain my
13 vote?

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you, Majority Leader.

16 I just want to take a few minutes to also talk
17 about the appointment of Muriel Goode-Trufant as the
18 next Corporation Counsel.

19 My colleague, Council Member Ariola, uh, spoke
20 articulately about the issues concerning the
21 separation of some of our city workers, uhm and the
22 failure of them to be returned to office.

23 Unfortunately, uhm, she has been one of the main
24 obstacles, uh, to their return, and these are good
25 civil servants.

1
2 But on top of that, she has articulated some
3 other standards that I think are troubling. One of
4 them we heard about earlier today, which is with
5 respect to IESPs for nonpublic school students. She
6 seems to be one of the architects of the current
7 proposal, which would essentially force parents to
8 give up their children's rights in order to get
9 services come January - services they should have
10 been getting and have been getting for years, and
11 should have been getting since the start of the
12 academic year.

13 And she has also articulated a troubling standard
14 with respect, uhm, to our constitutional rights,
15 claiming that Local Laws, uhm, and other acts of
16 legislative bodies should only be struck down as
17 unconstitutional if they can be proven beyond a
18 reasonable doubt that they violate the Constitution.

19 Frankly, I think our constitutional rights should
20 be a lot more accessible than that, and I think
21 that's the standard that the courts and the state
22 have applied, regardless of the parties of the
23 judges, uh, who are sitting and hearing our cases.

24 And so, unfortunately, she seems to be part of
25 the effort to continue to appeal the noncitizen

2 voting ruling, which is a plain text reading of the
3 New York State Constitution that voters in this state
4 must be citizens.

5 And so I think that those of us who care about
6 our constitutional rights, particularly those that
7 may have been recently added by a recent proposition,
8 should hope for a more accessible standard from
9 somebody, uh, who's gonna be serving as our
10 Corporation Counsel. And that's why I cannot support,
11 her nomination.

12 And so, with that said, I will be voting no on M
13 79, with the accompanying resolution 688; LU 181 with
14 accompanying Resolution 689 (TIMER CHIMES), as well
15 as Introductions 1127-A and 1128-A, and aye on the
16 rest.

17 CLERK: Thank you.

18 Council Member Sanchez?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Aye on all.

20 CLERK: Thank you.

21 Council Member De La Rosa?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Aye on all.

23 CLERK: Council Member Dinowitz?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Aye on all, with the
25 exception of LU 181 and Resolution 689.

2 CLERK: Council Member Feliz?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Permission to explain my
4 vote?

5 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: I want to congratulate
7 Speaker Adams on this historical legislation, uh,
8 Speaker Adams, also Chairs Salamanca, Riley, Sanchez,
9 and, of course, the speaker's entire team, including
10 Jeremy, Faiza, and everyone else.

11 I've said it many times, and I'll say it again,
12 we in the Central Bronx neighborhoods of Fordham
13 Road, East Tremont, Belmont, we're proud of being the
14 neighborhoods that have built some of the largest
15 amount of affordable housing units in the entire
16 city.

17 We're proud of that, but we cannot resolve this
18 housing crisis alone, and we shouldn't be expected to
19 do so either. Every single community needs to help.
20 The housing crisis affecting our city is a serious
21 one, and, of course, every district is unique, but
22 everybody needs to help. So vote aye.

23 CLERK: Thank you.

24 Council Member Gennaro?

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: I vote aye on all with
3 the exception of LU 181 and Resolution 689, on which
4 I vote no.

5 CLERK: Council Member Hanif?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Permission to explain my
7 vote?

8 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: I vote aye on all.

10 I am proud to vote aye on the City of Yes for
11 Housing Opportunity Proposal, which includes
12 significant modifications secured by the Council,
13 including an unprecedented \$5 billion investment to
14 fund the city... the Council's City for All housing
15 plan.

16 This transformative plan will help our city
17 address the housing crisis that is pushing too many
18 New Yorkers to the brink of displacement.

19 The City of Yes for Housing Opportunity Zoning
20 changes will help alleviate the affordable housing
21 shortage, while the comprehensive City for All
22 investments will directly address the most immediate
23 issues facing homeowners, renters, and those
24 experiencing homelessness.

1
2 Together with the implementation of the newly
3 passed FARE Act (The Fairness in Apartment Rental
4 Expenses Act) these steps will make it easier for New
5 Yorkers to lay down roots in all five boroughs.

6 This milestone also reflects the lessons we
7 learned from the Gowanus rezoning in my district. The
8 targeted investments in deep affordability and
9 neighborhood infrastructure - ranging from sewer and
10 street upgrades, to flood mitigation, and new open
11 spaces - will not only support equitable development,
12 but also lay the foundation for sustainable and
13 resilient growth across communities in our city.

14 I want to thank Speaker Adams, my fellow council
15 members, especially Council Members Sanchez and
16 Restler, whom I was proud to join in helping shape
17 the final proposal, my constituents, and all the
18 advocates who have worked tirelessly to bring us to
19 this moment.

20 I ran for city council to be a pro housing
21 legislator, and I'm proud to deliver on that
22 commitment today. Thank you.

23 CLERK: Council Member Hanks?
24
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: I vote aye on all, with the
3 exception of Land Use item 181, with the accompanying
4 Resolution 689.

5 CLERK: Council Member Holden?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye on all exception of LU
7 181 and accompanying Resolution 689, M 79 and
8 Resolution 688, and Introductions 1127-A and 1128-A,
9 of which I vote no.

10 CLERK: Thank you.

11 Council Member Hudson?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Aye on all.

13 CLERK: Thank you.

14 Council Member Joseph?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Permission to explain my
16 vote?

17 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you, Majority
19 Leader.

20 Today I cast my vote in favor of moving forward
21 with the City for All housing plan, a transformative
22 step in addressing one of the most pressing crisis
23 our city faces, housing.

24 With \$5 billion in commitment from the City,
25 alongside \$1 billion funding from Governor Hochul and

1
2 the state of New York, we are delivering on an
3 unprecedented investment to ensure New York City
4 becomes more affordable and accessible for all who
5 call it home.

6 This plan is not just about constructing new
7 buildings. It's about constructing a better future
8 for working and middle class New Yorkers.

9 City for All will produce over 80,000 new homes,
10 while deepening affordability, preserving existing
11 housing, bolstering home ownership, and strengthening
12 our neighborhoods' infrastructure.

13 But more than that, City of All is a testament to
14 what we can achieve when we center our people and our
15 policies and prioritize equity and sustainability in
16 our growth.

17 I've heard loud and clear - loud and clear the
18 voices of those in my community who are concerned
19 about what the impact of these zoning changes will
20 have on their neighborhoods. I remain committed to
21 working with you to deliver on the promises - a
22 little more housing everywhere - while defending the
23 character of places where I grew up and where so many
24 of us have invested so much.

1 As someone deeply committed to the well-being of
2 our communities and to my own district, I'm
3 especially encouraged by the investment this plan
4 makes to support tenants, protect homeowners, and
5 improve NYCHA developments, preserve the character of
6 our neighborhoods, and more.

8 These actions are not only essential to
9 addressing immediate needs, but also laying the
10 groundwork for long term stability.

11 The housing crisis we face is vast and complex.
12 It demands ongoing attention, innovation, and
13 collaboration. We must continue to push for policies
14 that go beyond zoning reform and address the root
15 causes of inequity in housing. This means doubling
16 down on affordability, protecting tenants from
17 harassment and displacement, and expanding pathways
18 to homeownership. It means ensuring every community
19 has the infrastructure, parks, schools, and transit
20 system needed to grow sustainably. It means
21 recognizing housing as a fundamental right (TIMER
22 CHIMES) and using every tool at our disposal to
23 deliver on that promise.

24 I thank all who worked on this. Thank you,
25 Majority Leader.

2 CLERK: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Aye on all.

4 CLERK: Thank you

5 Council Member Salamanca?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

7 CLERK: Council Member Krishnan?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Permission to explain my
9 vote?

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: I want to commend
12 Speaker Adams for her leadership, uh, in bringing
13 City for All and working with our colleagues to bring
14 this to a vote today, uh, as well as commend my
15 colleagues, Chairs Sanchez, Salamanca, and Riley, and
16 the Land Use staff here, for bringing City for All
17 forward.

18 This proposal, City for All, as modified by the
19 Council, reflects three fundamental principles:

20 One, that the housing crisis we face is the most
21 urgent crisis in the city because it connects to
22 every other crisis around us. And it's important to
23 address it thoughtfully, deliberately, and with the
24 focus on affordability, which this plan does.

25

1 Two, that in addressing the housing crisis, it's
2 not enough just to create more housing, but to
3 protect people in their homes. That's exactly what
4 the funding for the Anti-Harassment Tenant Protection
5 program does. And as a legal services lawyer that
6 worked... as one of the legal services lawyers who
7 worked with city government to create this program
8 nine years ago, I know personally how important it is
9 to keep tenants in their homes through this program
10 and how it works to fight displacement.

12 Third, that in the efforts to address the housing
13 crisis, we must not create the false conflict between
14 housing and green space. And as the Parks chair, I
15 see clearly how this City for All proposal does
16 exactly that - building housing, focusing on
17 affordability, but not fostering a false conflict
18 between that and green space. That's why I'll be
19 voting for it.

20 With that, I vote aye on all. Thank you.

21 CLERK: Thank you.

22 Council Member Lee?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Permission to explain my
24 vote?

25 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: So before I start, I just
3 wanted to recognize, uh, the efforts of DCP, Chair
4 Garodnick, his team, as well as our Land Use Division
5 for all their time and effort and energy into this,
6 uh, proposal and for answering our many, many
7 questions along the way. So thank you for that.

8 Every neighborhood... I just want to say, every
9 neighborhood faces its unique challenges. I'd like to
10 thank and commend Speaker Adams' efforts to address
11 many of these challenges.

12 While the most recent amendments to the City of
13 Yes have alleviated some of my most dire concerns,
14 there still remain issues that can significantly
15 impact my parts of Queens, Eastern Queens, and other
16 parts of the city.

17 Passing this plan may result in unintended
18 consequences, such as increasing housing density and
19 transit deserts in areas with aging infrastructure.

20 The proposal of ADUs, like basement apartments
21 and garage conversions, will place further strains on
22 areas that are not fit for additional density.

23 Solving the housing and affordability crisis can
24 only be done through equitable and fair measures that
25 serve the unique needs of all New Yorkers.

1 The decisions we make today in changing zoning
2 will have impacts that will be felt for generations,
3 and we must value the crucial and informative
4 perspectives of the people and communities we have
5 been elected to represent. And my communities have
6 been very loud and clear.

7 This is a complicated endeavor that requires more
8 nuance, time, and thorough planning to incorporate
9 the realities of our diverse neighborhoods throughout
10 the city.

11 Therefore, I'm voting no on LU 161 (sic)
12 (***Transcription note: LU 181**), Resolution 689, Intro
13 1127, and Intro 1128, and aye on all the rest.

14 CLERK: Thank you.

15 Council Member Louis?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: I want to commend Speaker
17 Adams, Jeremy, and the entire Land Use Division for
18 their tireless efforts around City for All.

19 I vote aye on all, except LU 181 and accompanying
20 Resolution 689, and Introduction 1128.

21 CLERK: Thank you.

22 Council Member Marmorato?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: I vote aye on all with
24 the exception of M 79 and Resolution 688, LU 181 with
25

2 the accompanying Resolution 689, and Introduction
3 1127-A and 1128-A, thank you.

4 CLERK: Thank you

5 Council Member Marte?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: I vote aye on all, except
7 LU 181 and Resolution 689.

8 CLERK: Thank you.

9 Council Member Mealy?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: May I explain my vote?

11 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: So ordered.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I want to thank the speaker
13 and the whole body, Land Use, for all that they have
14 done. But, I was thinking of... I have the most
15 community boards in the whole city, and every last
16 one of them has voted no. And before this was even a
17 major, major issue, I did numerous of meetings with
18 my community. My community is a well-informed
19 community.

20 And to think about it... my district is double
21 parking, triple times. And to think now developers
22 have absolute power to not do any parking whatsoever,
23 I feel this body is taking our own power away from
24 ourselves.

25

1 We can't negotiate with the developers. They can
2 do whatever they want. And then to think about, I
3 asked numerous times, where about what about houses
4 of worship? If you're gonna take houses of worship
5 and put it on a back burner, something is wrong with
6 this city, because we should be founded on some kind
7 of faith to make sure that our houses of worship are
8 taken care of first.

9 So with that, I just, uhm, said I will be voting
10 on all except 1127-A, I vote no. I vote no on 1128-A.

11 And to think about it, I asked the Land Use
12 numerous times if we're gonna change our garages into
13 housing, have we talked to the insurance company to
14 see if our... those little extra adjectives (sic) to
15 our homes can be insured?
16

17 I still have not gotten that information as of
18 yet. Please consider that. I feel we can do better
19 for this city.

20 And I vote, uh, I abstain on M 79, Resolution
21 (TIMER CHIMES) 688, no on LU 181 and Resolution 689.

22 And I thank everyone who had numerous meetings,
23 but I feel we could do better.

24 And to think about 12 years ago, I was in
25 office...

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 99

2 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Council Member, your time
3 has expired...

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: and I put in \$3.5, and when
5 I came back, they still did... (CROSS-TALK)

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Council Member, your time
7 has expired.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: not do it, so the \$8
9 million... (CROSS-TALK)

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Your time has expired on
11 the floor.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Great...

13 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you, Council Member
14 Mealy.

15 CLERK: Council Member Lee for clarification?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Sorry, I gave the wrong
17 number - LU 181, not 161, thank you.

18 CLERK: Thank you.

19 Council Member Menin?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Aye on all.

21 CLERK: Council Member Moya?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

23 CLERK: Council Member Narcisse?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: I vote aye, except LU
25 181 and accompanying Resolution 689, thanks.

2 CLERK: Thank you.

3 Council Member Nurse?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Permission to explain my
5 vote?

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Thank you, Majority Leader.

8 I just want to thank my community members who
9 took the time to wrestle with this very, very
10 challenging proposal.

11 I also want to echo the accolades for Land Use.
12 You guys are the best. Thank you for coming out to my
13 district and making yourself available for town
14 halls.

15 I want to thank the speaker, and her team, uh,
16 Council Member Sanchez for your leadership, and
17 everybody who worked to really shape and pull
18 together the City for All plan.

19 And just to say that I, you know, I recognize
20 this process has been very, very difficult for my
21 community, and I acknowledge that at the heart of a
22 lot of their concerns there is deep distrust in our
23 government. They don't feel protected from
24 speculation. They don't feel protected from
25 harassment. They don't feel protected from people who

2 want to steal their properties. They don't feel
3 protected from slumlords, and we really need to do
4 more to protect and defend them. And I believe the
5 investment that was secured starts to address these
6 concerns.

7 And we have a lot more to do, but, you know, I
8 think it's really a shame to hear some members here
9 today diminish this \$5 million (sic) investment for
10 our communities as monopoly money. Because while some
11 of those members might see homeowner down payment
12 assistance funding or, uh, funding to help, you know,
13 elders keep their apartments and their buildings up
14 to code, or free legal support for tenants and
15 homeowners - you might see that as nothing, but I can
16 guarantee that there are people in your districts who
17 damn well need that support, and I think that kind of
18 characterization is foolish.

19 I do want to thank the BASE (Basement Apartments
20 Safe for Everyone) Coalition for their advocacy work
21 and really fighting for the ADUs and basement
22 conversions and helping us take meaningful steps to
23 create safe, habitable basement level apartments.

24

25

2 And lastly, (TIMER CHIMES) I just want to thank
3 my team for helping me navigate this difficult
4 process.

5 I vote aye. Thank you.

6 CLERK: Thank you.

7 Council Member Ossé?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: I vote aye on all.

9 CLERK: Council Member Paladino?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Permission to explain my
11 vote?

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Well, once again, we're
14 here, and it's the tale of two cities.

15 I'm gonna tell you something. We did this wrong.
16 I said it from the beginning, this was like a freight
17 train that got rushed through.

18 I appreciate the hard work and the efforts that
19 the Land Use Committees did; I appreciate the
20 negotiations that happened, but they happened way too
21 late. It's as simple as that.

22 The process was a mess from day one. And then in
23 the final days, last week, two weeks ago, we rushed
24 through negotiations and compromises in order to get
25 this passed.

2 I fear that this body is now going to spend years
3 trying to make sense of what we are about to do with
4 carve-outs and fixes and clarifications, all because
5 we didn't take the time - the time - to do this right
6 or to listen, listen carefully to what the people are
7 telling us.

8 I come from a district in Northeast Queens, and
9 in Queens, as it was earlier stated, four... Uh, 12
10 out of 14 rejected this particular City of Yes plan.

11 And it's not because anybody here is a NIMBY or
12 they don't want it. That's not it at all. What it is,
13 is this was not planned properly.

14 For example, infrastructure experts tell us that
15 we can barely sustain housing as they as it currently
16 exists. Flooding is a major problem in this city.
17 Sewers are overwhelmed as it is, and the electrical
18 grid is at a breaking point. And we continue to
19 strain it even more with the electrification mandate,
20 adding thousands of new households to these systems,
21 without first considering local infrastructure going
22 to a result... which is going to result in a in a
23 disaster.

24 You know, we've been told we're in a housing
25 crisis. This is not the case. What we have here is

2 (TIMER CHIMES) an affordability crisis that is not
3 limited just to housing, but adding density isn't
4 going to lower the cost of living. It never has.

5 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Council Member, your time
6 has expired...

7 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Just one more second,
8 please?

9 You cannot give me one example of a large city
10 that has gotten more affordable and has gotten less
11 dense. It is... it just does not exist.

12 And there are other ways, but my time is up. But
13 there are ways that we could have fixed this without
14 rushing it through the way we did. I know a lot of
15 hard work in, but I have to agree with my district,
16 and I must vote no, most definitely no on LU 181 with
17 accompanying Resolution 689, M 79 with accompanying
18 Resolution 688, Introductions 1127-A, no, 1128-A, no.
19 Thank you.

20 CLERK: Council Member Riley?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Yes

22 (LAUGHTER)

23 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Please, quiet on the
24 floor.

25 CLERK: Council Member Rivera?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Permission to explain my
3 vote?

4 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you.

6 I just want to thank the speaker for being a
7 housing champion, for seeing that all of our
8 neighborhoods are indeed distinct.

9 Countless hours have been put in with our fellow
10 public servants (BACKGROUND CONVERSATION) working
11 tirelessly even before our last vote to get this
12 right, because all council members were heard, and
13 all deserving... all are deserving of a plan and
14 opportunity to address our collective housing
15 shortage. And to get here, I'm very thankful to City
16 Planning, and the Mayor's Office, HPD for their
17 collaboration, but a very, very special thank you to
18 the City Council team for their hard work during
19 negotiations.

20 We've worked diligently to get to this moment.
21 I'm proudly voting aye on the City of Yes. And we
22 have and must continue to consider that our vacancy
23 rate is less than 1.5 percent. Rents are at
24 astronomical levels. (BACKGROUND CONVERSATION)
25 Working class New Yorkers are telling us they are

2 leaving because of high housing costs and the
3 inability to own and keep their home.

4 And we are on track to lose additional seats in
5 congress after the next census (BACKGROUND
6 CONVERSATION) because of out-migration.

7 We are addressing this now as a City of Yes and
8 the unprecedented investments secured by this
9 council.

10 (BACKGROUND CONVERSATION) Rezoning are
11 challenging. Believe me, I know. But I believe it's
12 our responsibility to take a much longer view of what
13 our constituents need to survive and thrive now and
14 for future generations.

15 And with this plan, we are addressing the fact
16 that this city is woefully behind in housing
17 production. With this plan, we will produce more
18 housing than all rezonings under the last two mayoral
19 administrations. This is the largest housing unit
20 creation in recent history, and the Council brought
21 it forward.

22 It is time to move forward to support a City for
23 All. With that, I vote aye on all.

24 CLERK: Council Member Salaam?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Yes

2 CLERK: Council Member Schulman?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Permission to explain my
4 vote?

5 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Thank you, Madam Chair.

7 I'm voting no on LU 181 and accompanying
8 Resolution 689, City of Yes.

9 Coming from a working class family, I have been
10 and will continue to be an advocate for affordable
11 housing, and I want to thank the speaker and the Land
12 Use staff for the enormous amount of work they did on
13 the modifications to the original plan.

14 I have several reasons for voting no, including
15 the rapid speed in which the proposal was advanced,
16 which from my perspective, did not provide enough
17 time for on the ground granular interaction with the
18 communities I serve.

19 New York City zoning laws have not been updated
20 since 1961. And while there's great importance to
21 updating the city zoning, the massive implications of
22 any zoning revisions should be heavily weighed and
23 discussed before being finalized.

24 In addition, about 50 years ago, a well-known
25 urban planner, Robert Moses, significantly reshaped

2 the infrastructure and urban landscape of New York
3 City. However, in recent years, it was determined
4 that a lot of the projects implemented by Mr. Moses
5 resulted in fractured neighborhoods, restricted
6 access to open space, and other issues with a
7 negative impact on New Yorkers.

8 Changes made now to the city's zoning will be in
9 effect for many years to come, and I want to make
10 sure that 50 years from now we don't find ourselves
11 in the same position of having to fix unforeseen
12 consequences as we are with regard to what Robert
13 Moses did.

14 While I won't be here in 50 years, my niece and
15 nephew will be, and for them and the many
16 constituents who made their voices loud and clear
17 about the City of Yes, I'm voting no, and aye all the
18 rest.

19 CLERK: Council Member Stevens?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Permission to explain my
21 vote?

22 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I would like to like to
24 first start off by saying, thank you, to the speaker
25 and her team, the Land Use team, Chair Riley for all

2 their hard work and everything that they did to get
3 us to this moment today.

4 But today's decision is a challenging one as
5 housing and inequalities persist across the city. The
6 promise of City of Yes was to create equity for
7 communities citywide. However, this plan still falls
8 short of that truth today. The housing crisis cannot
9 be addressed with a few districts carrying the burden
10 of building all the affordable housing.

11 The West Bronx, specifically District 16 has
12 carried more than its fair share in addressing the
13 city's housing needs. Long before I was had the honor
14 of representing District 16, this community
15 consistently stepped up.

16 True equality demands all districts across the
17 city contribute their fair share. However,
18 understanding the complexities addressing the New
19 York City housing crisis, I've decided to vote yes. I
20 recognize the halting and advancement of housing
21 development will only deepen this crisis and harm the
22 communities that I fight so hard to serve.

23 However, my vote comes with a commitment that I
24 will continue to fight for *genuine* equity in housing

2 throughout the city with my time here at city
3 council.

4 With that, I vote aye and all. Thank you.

5 CLERK: Thank you.

6 Council Member Ung?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: I vote aye on all except for
8 LU 181, Resolution 689, which I vote no, thank you.

9 CLERK: Council Member Vernikov?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: No on LU 181, with
11 accompanying Resolution 689, no on Intros 1127-A and
12 1128-A, and no M 79 and accompanying Resolution 688,
13 aye on all the rest, thank you.

14 CLERK: Thank you.

15 Council Member Williams?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Permission to explain my
17 vote?

18 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'll be brief.

20 I just wanted to note that as a result of the
21 modifications, over 70 percent of my district, uh,
22 is exempt from ADUs and TODs. And I just wanted to
23 state that, because I think there's a lot of
24 misinformation. And while I truly do value, uhm, my
25 community, uhm, I cannot rest my decisions based off

2 of a lot of misinformation that I even heard here
3 today.

4 And I just wanted to take this time to really
5 thank, again, the Land Use Division. I wanted to call
6 them out by name, Perris, Brian, and Arthur, uh, who
7 has been fielding tons of my questions and concerns
8 for over the last year. I really appreciate it. I
9 really appreciate you helping me to understand what
10 we're voting on today.

11 And so, with quite difficulty, because this was
12 not an easy choice, this is not an easy vote, it's,
13 it's a very difficult vote. So with difficulty, I
14 vote aye on all. Thank you.

15 CLERK: Council Member Won?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: I vote aye on all except, I
17 have to take time to thank Pierina Sanchez, the
18 hardest pregnant mom out here who has been working
19 her butt off to see this through. So, I give her a
20 big shoutout - she's almost due.

21 And, thank you to Ralph, the speaker, and
22 everybody else. Thank you.

23 CLERK: Thank you.

24 Council Member Yeger?

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President, may I be
3 excused to explain my vote?

4 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you very much.

6 Well, my time is, almost coming to a conclusion
7 here. Hold your applause.

8 (LAUGHTER)

9 You know, I, uhm, the last, uh, six years, 11
10 months, five days, I've had the privilege of sitting
11 in the same seat and, uh, I get a chance from time to
12 time to look up at the top in President Lincoln's
13 words, "A government of the people, for the people"
14 *For the people*, you know, I think about that, we are
15 representative of the communities that we serve, and
16 we're here, and we are of and by the people, but
17 we're also supposed to be for the people. It's for
18 the people that we represent, and today as I sit
19 here, uh, the three council members who represent
20 parts of the district, that I will be serving when I
21 travel a little bit north, all voted no today. They
22 come from very different and diverse political
23 backgrounds and parties, uhm, but they all voted no
24 along with myself, and it's four of us, and it's
25 because we know our neighborhoods. And we know that

2 you can't build your communities by building us
3 together with the rest of the city. It just can't be
4 done. I've said this many, many times.

5 We... the idea that we don't build housing
6 because we didn't pass City of Yes is just not
7 truthful. As Madam Speaker indicated earlier, just in
8 the last couple of years, we've passed and built or
9 approved 27,000 units of housing here in this
10 council.

11 Thousands of units of housing get built every
12 single year. And at every single meeting of this
13 body, we approve zoning changes. We can approve
14 zoning changes when they're done intelligently, in
15 consultation with our community, where the council
16 member can go and look at the plot of land and say
17 that makes sense or that doesn't make sense. That's
18 how you build your city. You do it by community -
19 community, by community, by community. Not a bunch of
20 folks come down to Lower Manhattan and decide by fiat
21 how the rest of the city is gonna be. I can't vote
22 yes on something that's going to, in my estimation,
23 destroy the city.

24 I do have renewed faith in humanity, though, that
25 so many of my colleagues do believe that \$5 billion

2 (TIMER CHIMES) is actually real. It's phantom because
3 it's not budgeted. It's not allocated. It's not
4 appropriated. That's why it's phantom.

5 So I vote no on LU 181 and Resolution 689, as I
6 am required to do by the people who hired me to be in
7 this body.

8 I vote no on Introductions 1127 and 1128, and I
9 will abstain on M 79 Resolution 688. While I do
10 understand that, uh, attorneys represent the
11 interests of their clients and they take guidance
12 from their clients, in that case... in this case
13 Administration, I can't give the Corporation Counsel
14 my aye vote, uh, in light of my fundamental
15 disagreement with the legal positions that she's
16 taken. Thank you very much, Madam President.

17 CLERK: Council Member Zhuang?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: Aye on all except Land Use
19 181 and Resolution 689, and I want to abstain on M 79
20 and Resolution 688.

21 CLERK: Thank you.

22 Council Member Borelli?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all except Land
24 Use 181 and 689, M 79 and the Reso 688, Introduction
25 1127-A and 1128-A, thank you.

2 CLERK: Thank you, Council Member.

3 Council Member Fariás?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIÁS: I vote aye on all, and for
5 the public and the press, my statement will be
6 online.

7 CLERK: Speaker Adams?

8 SPEAKER ADAMS: Aye

9 (PAUSE)

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: All items on today's
11 General Order Calendar have been adopted by a vote of
12 51 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative, and 0
13 abstentions; with the except of M 79 and Resolution
14 688, which was adopted by a vote of 41 in the
15 affirmative, 7 in the negative, and 3 abstentions;
16 and LU 181 with accompanying Resolution 689, which
17 was adopted by a vote 31 in the affirmative, 20 in
18 the negative, and 0 abstentions; and Introduction
19 1128-A, which was adopted by a vote of 41 in the
20 affirmative, 10 in the negative, and 0 abstentions;
21 Introduction 1128-A, which was adopted by a vote of
22 40 in the affirmative, 11 in the negative, and 0
23 abstentions.

24 We will now... Oh, moving on to the Agenda,
25 Introduction and Reading of Bills, Speaker?

2 (PAUSE)

3 SPEAKER ADAMS: All bills have been referred to
4 Committee as indicated on today's Agenda.

5 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, there are no
6 Resolutions on today's Calendar, so we will now move
7 into the General Discussion.

8 I would like to recognize Council Member
9 Williams, followed by Council Member Marte, Council
10 Member Cabán, then Council Member Nurse.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you, I just wanted
12 to quickly acknowledge, uh, students who are here
13 from CUNY Hostos, it's the political science
14 (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

15 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Council Member... can we
16 pause the clock as well? Folks, if you are leaving
17 (PROTESTORS SHOUTING) Chambers, you have to leave
18 quietly.

19 Thank you, you can continue, Council Member
20 Williams.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you, so much,
22 Majority Leader.

23 I just wanted to quickly acknowledge CUNY Hostos
24 Community College class, it's a political science
25 American government course. They're here today with

2 Professor Chang, Michel Portela, Abhinaya Jeyanathan
3 (phonetic), and Dofi (phonetic) are all here today.
4 They've been here all day listening to us. When I was
5 a fellow in my grad program, I got to spend some time
6 at Hostos. I know Hostos is located in, uh, Council
7 Member Rafael Salamanca's office, so I just wanted to
8 shout him out and thank the students for being here.
9 Thank you.

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, what a great
11 day to come see government in action.

12 Uh, recognizing Council Member Cabán, followed by
13 Council Member Nurse.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. Today I have the
15 privilege of introducing a resolution, uh, alongside
16 a number of my queer colleagues, uh, that honors the
17 late, great Cecilia Gentili. I've said this before,
18 but Cecilia was everything and she did it all. She
19 was a fearless leader, a trans icon, an author, an
20 actress, a pioneering advocate for the dignity and
21 freedom of sex workers, and so much more. And
22 especially at a time where we are going to see the
23 ramping up of the oppression, the repression, and the
24 discrimination against not just queer people but
25 other already marginalized, uh, identities, I think

2 about her more and more. And I'm not alone in that.
3 We did our, you know, meetings in every single
4 borough, yes, including Staten Island, meeting with
5 queer folks and organizations and social workers and
6 academics and advocates and, uh, community members,
7 and there wasn't a single one of these conversations
8 where her name wasn't brought up. We go out to
9 actions, we meet with, uh, queer community members
10 who are just trying to take care of each other and
11 protect one another, and her name and her spirit, and
12 her... and her impact always comes up, and that's
13 pretty, pretty incredible.

14 I know that there were plenty of people who
15 brought her spirit and her energy to D.C. just
16 yesterday, when Queens own first out trans, uhm,
17 lawyer argued in front of the Supreme Court. She was
18 unabashedly vocal about just justice in general, and
19 her energy was infectious. She was profoundly funny
20 and sharp. She was unapologetically herself. I loved
21 the way that she came in hard with just profanity
22 laced everything, but it was always the truth. And I
23 love the joy and the love that she brought to the
24 other people in her world. I really, really miss her.
25 And, you know, I think that now is an incredible time

2 not just to honor her, but to say rise in power, to
3 say that your memory should be a joyous, bawdy,
4 hilarious, visionary, fearless revolution, and that
5 this resolution (TIMER CHIMES) may serve as a
6 testament to that revolution. So I hope my colleagues
7 will sign on, thank you.

8 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Recognizing Council
9 Member Nurse, followed by Council Member Sanchez.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Thank you, Majority Leader.

11 I'll keep it short, feeling the vibe in the room.

12 I just... I'm just talking about two bills today
13 I'm introducing, uh, Reso 683 calls on the state to
14 pass the End Toxic Home Flipping Act sponsored by
15 Assembly Member Catalina Cruz, and state Senator
16 Julia Salazar. This is a bill that comes, uh, largely
17 from the concerns of my community where we are seeing
18 large corporations and private equity firms
19 purchasing homes, slapping some sheetrock and paint
20 on it, and making massive profits. So I hope you all
21 will read this and sign the bill or respond to the
22 bill.

23 I'm also introducing Introduction 1135 with
24 Council Member Gutiérrez. This bill would require
25 third party grocery delivery services to pay their

2 delivery workers a fair wage. I hope you will
3 consider signing on to the bill. Thank you all.

4 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you. Recognizing
5 Council Member Sanchez.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you, Majority
7 Leader. Hi, everyone, things were happening, so I
8 left.

9 But I just wanted to take a moment to thank all
10 of my colleagues, and Julie for your beautiful
11 compliment. I want to turn that to my team, I think
12 we're collectively "the hardest working pregnant
13 woman out there". (LAUGHS) So Sam, Ben, Gerard,
14 Karla, Kim, Maria, Paola (phonetic), Felix, and
15 (INAUDIBLE), thank you.

16 And, uhm, I just... I'm sorry to keep everyone,
17 but somebody really special is leaving my team, and I
18 wanted to give her her flowers. My chief of staff,
19 Sam Cardenas, who has been with me since my primary
20 election in 2021, she's been incredible. She's helped
21 to build our team. She's done so much for this city
22 and for our district, and I'm truly gonna miss her.
23 But all the best to you, you are incredible, and
24 you're a force of nature, and we love you. Thank you,
25 Majority Leader.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you. Seeing no one else signed up to speak, I will now call on Speaker Adrienne E. Adams to close today's Stated Meeting.

SPEAKER ADAMS: I just want to say, I love Pierina Sanchez. I love, love, love, love, and respect, admire, embrace - I don't know if I could do all that with what she is doing right now and still be a part of everything, live. I just have to give my love to her right now.

Thank you, colleagues, the Stated Meeting of December 5, 2024 is hereby adjourned.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 10, 2024