

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE
CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

1

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND
INFRASTRUCTURE

----- X

September 15, 2025
Start: 10:20 a.m.
Recess: 12:51 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Selvena Brooks-Powers, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Joann Ariola
Chris Banks
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Mercedes Narcisse
Julie Won

OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ATTENDING:

Alexa Avilés
Shaun Abreu

A P P E A R A N C E S

David Do, Chair and Commissioner of the New York City Taxi and Limousine Commission

Sherryl Eluto, General Counsel and Deputy Commissioner of Legal Affairs at the New York City Taxi and Limousine Commission

James DiGiovanni, Deputy Commissioner for Policy and Community Affairs at the New York City Taxi and Limousine Commission

Eric Beaton, Deputy Commissioner for Transportation Planning and Management at the New York City Department of Transportation

Rick Rodriguez, Assistant Commissioner for Intergovernmental Affairs at the New York City Department of Transportation

Fernando Mateo, Founder and Spokesman for the New York State Federation of Taxi Drivers

Dr. Paul Tallaj, Chief Medical Officer for the New York State Federation of Taxi Drivers

Jenice Hernandez, self

Jeremy Moskowitz, Voyager Global Mobility

Leroy Morrison, President for New York City Commuter Van Association

Dinara Zhanpeissova, Independent Drivers Guild

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Andrew Greenblatt, Policy Director of the
Independent Drivers Guild

Michelle Dottin, self

Arjun Lal, for-hire vehicle driver

Bhairavi Desai

Mohammed Mohammed, Uber and Lyft driver

Richard Chow, New York Taxi Workers Alliance
member

Adalgisa Payero-Diarra, President of Union de
Taxistas de New York

Hector German

Zach Miller, Vice President of Government Affairs
for the Trucking Association of New York

Jose Altamirano, President of the Livery Base
Owners Association

Jose LeBron, President of New York Independent
Drivers Union

Peter Mazer, General Counsel to the Metropolitan
Taxicab Board of Trade

Eman Rimawi-Doster, Senior Community Organizer
for the Disability Justice Program at New York
Lawyers for the Public Interest

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Raul Rivera, TLC driver advocate

Christopher Leon Johnson, self

Anwaar Malik, self

Khalid Khattak, Uber and Lyft driver

Larbi Aitaabou, self

Liakat Ali, member of the Independence Drivers Guild

David Obeissant

Sonam Lama, member of Independent Driver Guild

Pedro Acosta, driver

Manje Kamel Zegrar, TLC driver and FHV driver

Lisa Rosa, TLC rideshare driver

Desmond West, owner of Royal Roads Transportation

Paul Bader, self

Kevin Zhang, driver

Jacky Lin, Independent Drivers Guild

Corey Bearak, Amalgamated Transit Union

Michael Simon, self

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 5

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning. This is a
3 microphone check for the Committee on Transportation
4 and Infrastructure. Today's date is September 15,
5 2005. Location is the Chambers. It's recorded by
6 Ginelle Yearwood.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning, and
8 welcome to today's New York City Council hearing for
9 the Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure.

10 If you would like to testify, you must
11 fill out a testimony slip with one of the Sergeant-
12 at-Arms.

13 At this time, please silent all
14 electronic devices.

15 No one may approach the dais at any time
16 during this hearing.

17 Chair, we are ready to begin.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you, and
19 good morning and welcome to this—oh, excuse me.

20 [GAVEL] It's been a little while. Good morning and
21 welcome to this hearing of the Committee on
22 Transportation and Infrastructure. My name is Selvena
23 Brooks-Powers, and I am the Chair for this Committee.

24 Today's hearing will focus on the Taxi
25 and Limousine Commission and its oversight of New

2 York City's licensed driver's vehicles and commuter
3 vans. The TLC oversees more than 200,000 licensees
4 who together complete nearly 1 million trips each
5 day. Most of these rides now occur in for-hire
6 vehicles, particularly through high-volume apps such
7 as Lyft and Uber. An often overlooked part of our
8 transportation network is TLC licensed commuter vans.
9 These vehicles carry up to 20 passengers, serve
10 transit deserts, and provide essential connections to
11 public transit. Many New Yorkers choose them for
12 their reliability and ability to bridge gaps in
13 existing transit systems. However, the licensed
14 commuter van industry has struggled since the
15 pandemic with over 500 licensed vans in 2014, down to
16 less than 40 a decade later. While the industry is
17 slowly rebounding, illegal, unregulated vans compete
18 directly with licensed operators and pose a danger on
19 our roads. Many of these vans aren't simply
20 unlicensed. They also ignore other safety regulations
21 that govern licensed vans, such as having a licensed
22 driver, having adequate insurance coverage, and
23 undergoing required inspections. Unlicensed vans also
24 illegally pick up passengers at bus stops or in bus
25 stops, undermining the City's public bus network.

2 Today's hearing will take a hard look at these
3 realities and how the City can balance fairness,
4 safety, and access across our transportation system.

5 Serious challenges also face the FHV
6 industry. FHV drivers have raised concerns about the
7 lack of access to restrooms while driving. Because
8 there are so few designated relief stands in
9 Manhattan, drivers are often forced to travel into
10 Brooklyn or Queens, which not only adds to
11 congestion, but also cost drivers more and reduces
12 the time they can spend serving riders.

13 In addition to the oversight topic, the
14 Committee will also consider several pieces of
15 legislation. Intro. Number 115, sponsored by Council
16 Member Avilés, requiring the Office of Technology and
17 Innovation to develop a mobile app mapping all
18 electric vehicle charging stations in the city. The
19 app would provide real-time information, such as
20 charging level, connector type, e-bike compatibility,
21 and station availability.

22 Intro. Number 139, sponsored by myself,
23 which expands the size of the TLC board from 9 to 11
24 members by adding two licensed driver
25 representatives, ensuring that the voices of those on

2 the road every day are directly included in decision
3 making.

4 Intro. Number 1000, sponsored by Council
5 Member Brannan, which would allow for-hire vehicles
6 to park in commercial meter zones for up to 30
7 minutes, up to four times per day.

8 Intro. Number 1346, sponsored by myself,
9 which would require DOT to conduct the study of the
10 commuter van industry every four years, examining
11 ridership, service areas, and areas of conflict with
12 buses and pedestrians.

13 Intro. Number 1347, also sponsored by
14 myself, which directs the TLC, working with NYPD and
15 DOT, to develop a comprehensive enforcement checklist
16 for illegal commuter vans. This would allow maximum
17 penalties to be applied when unlicensed vans are
18 caught violating multiple rules at once.

19 Intros 1346 and 1347 are the result of
20 numerous meetings I have convened with our Commuter
21 Van Working Group, which includes commuter van
22 operators, TLC, DOT, NYPD, taxi stakeholders, and
23 transit unions. The goal of this group has been to
24 craft comprehensive legislation that will help this
25 industry, while also strengthening existing transit

2 systems. I thank all working group members for their
3 contributions and am excited for this opportunity to
4 hear our co-drafted legislation.

5 Today's oversight topic and legislation
6 addresses critical questions. How do we ensure
7 drivers have the facilities they need to do their
8 jobs with dignity, how do we protect passengers from
9 unsafe and illegal operators, and how do we ensure
10 our transportation network remains reliable,
11 equitable, and resilient in the face of change?

12 Before we begin, I would like to thank my
13 Staff and the Committee Staff for their hard work in
14 preparing for today's hearing, Renee Taylor, my
15 Chief-of-Staff; Julian Martin, my Director for
16 Legislation and Budget; Mark Chen, Senior Legislative
17 Counsel; our new Legislative Counsel Theodore Miller;
18 Kevin Kotowski, Senior Policy Analyst; John Basile,
19 Senior Policy Analyst, and Saiyemul Hamid, Financial
20 Analyst.

21 I now ask Committee Counsel to swear in
22 the Administration.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL CHEN: Thank you. I'm
24 Mark Chen, Counsel to the Committee on Transportation
25 and Infrastructure.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 10

2 Our first panel will be from the Taxi and
3 Limousine Commission, David Do, Commissioner and
4 Chair; Sherryl Eluto, General Counsel and Deputy
5 Commissioner of Legal Affairs; and James DiGiovanni,
6 Deputy Commissioner for Policy and Community Affairs.
7 Also from the Department of Transportation, Eric
8 Beaton, Deputy Commissioner for Transportation
9 Planning and Management.

10 I will now administer the oath. Please
11 raise your right hands.

12 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
13 whole truth, and nothing but the truth before this
14 Committee and to respond honestly to Council Member
15 questions?

16 ADMINISTRATION: Yes.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL CHEN: Thank you. You
18 may begin when ready.

19 COMMISSIONER DO: Good morning, Honorable
20 Chair Brooks-Powers and Members of the Committee on
21 Transportation and Infrastructure. I'm joined today
22 by Taxi and Limousine Commission General Counsel
23 Sherryl Eluto and Deputy Commissioner for Policy and
24 Community Affairs James DiGiovanni, as well as Eric
25 Beaton, the Department of Transportation's Deputy

2 Commissioner for Transportation Planning and
3 Management, as well as Rick Rodriguez, Assistant
4 Commissioner for Intergov Affairs.

5 The for-hire transportation sector has
6 been rapidly changing, and my testimony today will
7 provide a snapshot of the state of the industry,
8 important developments since the last hearing and
9 address the five bills on the agenda. Our sister
10 agencies, the Department of Transportation, the
11 Office of Technology and Innovation, will discuss
12 these bills in more detail.

13 TLC licensed vehicles continue to move
14 New Yorkers 24 hours a day, 365 days a year. We are
15 not only the city that never sleeps, but the city
16 that never stops moving, made possible by nearly
17 178,000 TLC drivers. Every minute, there are an
18 average of 612 trips, and this has translated into
19 158 million trips through the first half of this year
20 compared to 151 million trips that were completed in
21 the first six months of 2024. As of June, there were
22 cumulatively 121 million ride-hail trips, 24 million
23 yellow taxi trips, and about 12 million for-hire
24 vehicle trips. These trips are more accessible than
25 ever. This June, TLC achieved 50 percent

2 accessibility of the city's active yellow taxi fleet.

3 As Commissioner Christina Curry of the Mayor's Office

4 for People with Disabilities stated, for the

5 disability community, this progress means more than

6 just numbers. It translates into greater

7 independence, reduced isolation, and better access to

8 work, school, health care, and everyday life. If you

9 include the more than 7,400 for-hire vehicles that

10 are also wheelchair accessible, the TLC's 13,000-

11 strong wheelchair-accessible vehicle fleet is by far

12 the most accessible in the nation. The robustness of

13 this overall industry is mirrored in the for-hire

14 vehicle sector. At the beginning of the year, there

15 were 782 bases compared to 728 at the beginning of

16 2024. Trip volumes for livery, black car, and luxury

17 limo bases, as well as high-volume bases, continue to

18 show strong performance in comparison to 2019 levels.

19 Within the for-hire vehicle sector, TLC began

20 implementing the State-authorized COVID-19 Livery

21 Vehicle Recovery Act on April 15th, 2025. The high-

22 volume for-hire vehicle sector also remains in good

23 health. In June, this sector completed approximately

24 20 million trips, a similar number to June 2024. Lyft

25 and Uber continue to dispatch about 20 percent of

trips to electric and wheelchair accessible vehicles, exceeding the current 15 percent Green Rides baseline for 2025.

I mentioned earlier in the year that TLC was in the process of amending its first-in-the-nation driver pay rules for rideshare drivers, authorized by Local Law 150 of 2018. Before these rules were implemented, 85 percent of drivers in this sector were earning less than the equivalent minimum wage. In June, TLC adopted amended rules, reaffirming our commitment to improving the economic security of licensees. For a sample trip of 7.5 miles and 30 minutes, the minimum per trip payment is approximately 29 dollars, an overall increase of approximately 5 percent compared to 2024 rates, and 26 percent compared to 2019 rates. As part of these amendments, TLC updated the per mile rate to account for increases in driver expenses. Crucially, the new rules also limit the ability of Uber and Lyft to lock out drivers from their platforms. Under our new regulations, they must now provide at least 72 hours' notice before denying access, and they must allow these drivers to accept dispatches for at least 16 hours once they're back on. I want to thank the TLC

2 staff, advocates, researchers, and licensees who
3 helped get this rule package to the finish line.

4 Turning to commuter vans, the industry
5 continues its slow but steady recovery. There are now
6 51 licensed vans compared to 38 at the beginning of
7 the year. This progress is partially thanks to Empire
8 State Development's Commuter Van Stabilization
9 Program. Additionally, licensed vans continue to
10 operate safely. Of the 66 safety-related violations
11 issued to commuter vans in Calendar Year 2024, only
12 seven were issued to licensed commuter vans. Only two
13 licensed vans experienced collisions with no reported
14 injuries. This contrasts with the unlicensed vans,
15 which unfairly compete with licensed vans and that
16 are not inspected for safety. TLC continues to
17 conduct joint operations with NYPD and these illegal
18 operators in nine operations in Brooklyn and Queens
19 in 2025, with more in the works. Enforcement lays the
20 foundation for a safe and healthy industry, and we
21 continue to recruit, onboard, and hire new officers.
22 We currently have 114 officers, just this morning
23 initiated another class of 34 cadets.

24 We are also working expeditiously to
25 implement local laws adopted by the Council. Local

2 Law 78, sponsored by Council Member Gutiérrez,
3 mandates that all taxis and FHV's display decals
4 warning of deadly practice of dooring or opening a
5 car door without checking for approaching cyclists.
6 TLC provided this decal to drivers for free, but it
7 wasn't mandatory. I'm happy to inform you that we
8 have secured enough free decals for licensed taxis
9 and FHV's. On September 3rd, we held a public hearing
10 on amended rules to implement this new law. At the
11 same hearing, we also introduced rules to implement
12 Local Law 90, sponsored by Council Member De La Rosa,
13 changing the maximum required personal injury
14 protection or no-fault insurance coverage to 200
15 percent of the State level, or 100,000 dollars. This
16 aligns with Mayor Adams' goal to reduce costs for
17 working families, while also ensuring that for-hire
18 drivers and passengers still have the highest
19 personal injury protection in the state.

20 Lastly, I want to bring to attention to
21 the bills on the agenda. Introduction 139 of 2024,
22 sponsored by Chair Brooks-Powers, increases TLC's
23 Board of Commissioners from 9 to 11, requiring the
24 two additional Commissioners to hold valid TLC
25 driver's license. Since this proposal alters the

2 composition of the Commission, we have asked the Law
3 Department to review this bill for any legal
4 concerns. Respectfully, we are opposed to this for
5 many years, as asking for Commissioners to regulate
6 the very industry they make a living from is not
7 appropriate, given the Commission regularly considers
8 items relating to penalties, driver pay, safety
9 standards, and other topics that directly impact
10 licensed drivers and the riding public. Commissioners
11 must be impartial, which could be challenging for a
12 licensee. As such, we encourage the Council to fill
13 the existing vacancy on the Commission with a
14 candidate who has had past TLC-related experience,
15 rather than an active licensee. We already have one
16 such experienced Commissioner, Commissioner Paul
17 Bader, who brings his years of service to this role.
18 We appreciate the goal of ensuring that drivers'
19 views are considered in TLC decision-making, and we
20 are always ready to work with you to ensure drivers
21 have an opportunity to make their voices heard. Since
22 this legislation was first introduced, we have
23 invested heavily in understanding the driver
24 experience, from surveying nearly 7,000 drivers to
25 guide our driver pay rules, to the Medallion Relief

2 Program, to establishing the Owner-Driver Resource
3 Center and Drivers Protection Unit. TLC has made
4 drivers a priority. I won't pretend to know what it's
5 like to be a full-time driver, but I underwent the
6 TLC's licensing process myself and periodically drive
7 taxis and FHV's to better understand drivers' needs
8 without collecting fares or tips.

9 Introduction 1347 of 2025 requires the
10 TLC, Department of Transportation, and Police
11 Department to develop a checklist of laws, rules, and
12 regulations for officers' use during commuter van
13 enforcement operations. Enforcement across all
14 sectors is a top concern for TLC, and our van
15 enforcement figures reflect that. In 2025, TLC issued
16 113 summonses to unlicensed commuter vans,
17 significantly more than the 59 issued in 2024.
18 However, this bill would make enforcement against
19 unlicensed vans more difficult and likely impede
20 future progress. Our trained officers already check
21 for all applicable violations. Requiring them to go
22 through a lengthy physical checklist during a stop
23 will add unnecessary time and steps as more illegal
24 vans pass by. In effect, the administrative burden
25 would outweigh any real gains.

2 Intro. 115 of 2024, sponsored by Council
3 Member Avilés, requires the Office of Technology
4 Innovation to create a mobile application that
5 provides users with real-time information about
6 electric vehicle charging stations. Our Green Rides
7 initiative has increased charging demand for its TLC
8 drivers, and more than 300 new charger plugs have
9 been added to New York City since our Electrification
10 in Motion report was released. But a new City-run
11 application would be incredibly costly and duplicate
12 tools that already exist. EV owners can already
13 access a myriad of charging apps. There are
14 government tools like the Alternative Fueling Station
15 Locator by the U.S. Department of Energy, and maps
16 like Waze, Apple, and Google Maps list charging
17 stations. A duplicative app would require continuous
18 funding and resources to maintain with little
19 additional utility.

20 Intro. 1000 of 2024, sponsored by Council
21 Member Brannan, allows for for-hire vehicles to park
22 or stand in commercial parking meters for a limited
23 time. We understand that relief areas are vital in
24 the working condition for our licensees, which is why
25 we are working with the DOT and driver advocacy

2 groups to expand the existing 112 relief stands,
3 which allow drivers to park for up to one hour. This
4 is a top priority for this Administration, and we're
5 always looking for commitment and space from
6 community stakeholders. I encourage the members of
7 this Committee to recommend additional locations to
8 both TLC and the DOT. At the same time, the
9 Administration also recognizes that more dynamic curb
10 management must not jeopardize access to commercial
11 delivery trucks or parking meter operations. As TLC
12 does not regulate signage, parking meters, or curb
13 management, we defer to the DOT's position on this
14 bill.

15 Intro. 1346 of 2025, also sponsored by
16 Chair Brooks-Powers, requires the DOT to study
17 commuter van service and produce public report every
18 four years. The Administration believes that a report
19 would be useful for future policymaking and helpful
20 for evaluating the industry's recovery. I want to
21 thank the members of the Commuter Van Working Group,
22 which is convened by the Chair, who helped develop
23 this bill. Since this legislation requires action
24 from a separate agency, we again defer to the DOT.

2 Thank you for considering my testimony.

3 As always, it's an honor to be invited to this
4 chamber to discuss the work of the TLC. I look
5 forward to working with all the esteemed Members of
6 this Committee to develop legislation that ensures
7 New York City continues to have the safest and most
8 well-regulated for-hire industry. I'm happy to answer
9 any questions.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Good morning,
11 Chair. Thank you for the opportunity to testify. I'm
12 Eric Beaton, Deputy Commissioner for Transportation
13 Planning and Management at the New York City
14 Department of Transportation. As the Commissioner
15 mentioned, we wanted to add comments on two bills.

16 First, Intro. 1000 of 2024. As TLC
17 stated, we recognize the critical role that relief
18 stands play in the health of delivery drivers. As
19 mentioned, we are working with TLC to expand the
20 number of locations for these relief stands. DOT is
21 tasked with also making sure our streets function
22 safely and efficiently. Part of this work is
23 recognizing the need for a more dynamic curb. In
24 recent years, we have implemented strategies to
25 modify parking regulations to reflect current usages.

2 As truck deliveries continue to grow across the city,
3 this proposal weakens the efforts to better manage
4 congestion on our streets. As written, Intro. 1000
5 would displace delivery vehicles access to the curb
6 and increase the potential for these vehicles to
7 double park. Additionally, Intro. 1000 would require
8 challenging re-engineering of existing payment
9 systems in coordination with NYPD and the Department
10 of Finance, which would create significant fiscal
11 implications. We look forward to working with the
12 sponsors, the TLC, and all the stakeholders to
13 identify additional relief stand locations.

14 Intro. 1346 of 2025. As TLC stated, the
15 commuter van industry serves an important facet of
16 our urban transportation system as we address safety
17 and mobility for all users of the public right-of-
18 way. Since DOT provides a final recommendation to TLC
19 on approval or rejection of requested commuter van
20 authority and territory, we acknowledge the need to
21 continue studying the evolution of commuter van
22 service and operations. Our research estimates that
23 commuter vans serve up to 70,000 riders daily who
24 rely on them, especially in minority and low-income
25 communities, largely in the outer boroughs. In 2018,

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 22

2 DOT produced a citywide commuter van study to better
3 understand the industry and its impact on the
4 transportation network. This study provided insights
5 to guide policymaking with recommendations that have
6 already been implemented, including waiving the
7 requirement for petitions and signatures before a new
8 van authority can be recommended by DOT. Since then,
9 there have been some changes to the industry's
10 landscape. Local Law 7 of 2017 capping the number of
11 commuter van licenses to 735 and the growth of the
12 for-hire vehicle industry. A new study may have some
13 modest benefits that assist TLC in making policies.

14 We look forward to working with the
15 Committee and TLC to identify integral study goals
16 that best suit this involving sector. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
18 We've been joined today by Council Members De La
19 Rosa, Narcisse, Hanks, Ariola virtually, and Banks.

20 And we will hear a statement from Council
21 Member Avilés.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you so much,
23 Chair Brooks-Powers, for putting Intro. 115 on the
24 agenda today.

25

2 This legislation I've introduced during
3 the last legislative session as a result of receiving
4 many complaints from EV drivers in my District who
5 struggle to find the right charger for their vehicle.
6 As you may know, there exists a hodgepodge of
7 accessible information on where to find chargers, the
8 best of which might be the City's FLO, which lists
9 all the official NYC DOT chargers. However, this app
10 excludes all private chargers. For example, if there
11 was a ChargePoint charger nearby, you would then need
12 to download a separate app just to view ChargePoint
13 chargers and so on for each private entity, including
14 sometimes those for specific manufacturers such as
15 Tesla. There also exists EVOLVE NY chargers run by
16 New York State, which are at the moment and can be
17 viewed on the Electrify America app, which would also
18 require a separate application. All of this is
19 further complicated by no federal standards for
20 charging ports or charging speed. Some vehicles might
21 require J1772 port, others a NEMA 14-50, and so on,
22 with eight or more possible ports, not all of which
23 are available in any one charger, public or private,
24 and all of which charge at different speeds. Will it
25 take me about a half an hour to charge or six hours

2 to charge at any particular location? Drivers may
3 have to log in to multiple apps simply to find which
4 system has a charger available for them within a
5 particular timeframe that is needed. You might also
6 use an app like PlugShare, which is the most
7 comprehensive to date, but you might show up at a
8 charger that fits your needs only to find out that
9 it's located on private property, or that it's
10 reserved for hospital staff only, or you therefore
11 are unable to charge. So, of course, over time most
12 drivers will adapt to these conditions, but at a time
13 when we are, at least in this city, trying to
14 increase the adoption of clean energy technology, on
15 behalf of drivers and fleets, we not only want to
16 create a user-friendly system, but also build in
17 flexibility also, so that we can include e-bikes in
18 this nascent class of vehicles desperately needing
19 access for safe charging stations. Our city has the
20 resources to develop a comprehensive app, or at
21 least, I understand as the Administration said, it
22 currently has it, level it up quite significantly, so
23 that you don't need 16 apps to figure out where you
24 can actually charge your vehicle in this city. As we
25 look to electrify our trucks as well, this may be

something we may also want to consider as we vision a city that is moving towards net zero. So, if we are serious about clean air, helping to make adoption of this technology less daunting for residents, for the drivers, it seems like this would be something we should integrate as a City and really look towards, because currently it is a hodgepodge of systems that doesn't work, and we can do better. So thank you so much. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

Again, thank you for your testimony today.

Jumping into it, I'm going to start with commuter vans. According to TLC reports, as of 2024, there were 12 authorized commuter van buses, which operate 38 licensed vehicles with 59 commuter van drivers. I understand, based on your testimony, that we are up to now 51 licensed vans now. This is still very far from the 48 bases, 534 vehicles, and 289 drivers a decade ago. Do you have updated numbers on authorized commuter van bases and drivers for 2025 to go along with the 51 licensed vans?

COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you so much, Council Member, for the question. You know, making

2 sure that our commuter vans continue to provide vital
3 resources to their communities that they serve is
4 incredibly important to this Administration. What we
5 know is that, through our work, through your work,
6 and through the State's work, we have been able to
7 get the commuter van industry towards a path to
8 recovery. With the Commuter Van Stabilization
9 Program, 11 million dollars was given to the commuter
10 van industry to help them get towards licensure. That
11 means helping them get insurance and helping them
12 also add new technologies to their vehicles. What we
13 know is that commuter vans grew from, since the
14 beginning of this Administration, from 31 to now 51
15 licensed commuter vans. To your specific question, we
16 have also increased the number of commuter van
17 drivers and authorities as well, from the 12 that you
18 said to 16 today.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So, 16 bases?

20 COMMISSIONER DO: Associations, yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay. And then
22 how many drivers?

23 COMMISSIONER DO: 59 drivers. Excuse me,
24 69 licensed drivers.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Besides the
3 Commuter Van Stabilization Program you testified
4 about, what else is being done to revitalize the
5 industry?

6 COMMISSIONER DO: We continue to not only
7 work with you, Council Member, but also the
8 stakeholders. From Hector Ricketts to Leroy Morrison,
9 we're always on conversations with them at the State
10 level as well to continue to ensure that the commuter
11 vans have a pathway forward. In addition to that,
12 like I've told you, Council Members, that we have
13 also built in more enforcement to illegal commuter
14 vans. But I think a restorative approach, getting
15 illegal commuter vans to licensed commuter vans is
16 incredibly important to me and to you as well.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
18 that. And do you collect data on commuter van usage
19 such as route geography, volume, and rider
20 demographics?

21 COMMISSIONER DO: So, no, but in 2017,
22 Council Member, we did the first commuter van study.
23 And with your bill, we will again do an additional
24 study to see the needs and flow for the commuter van
25

2 industry, including the routes that are most popular.

3 I don't know if Eric, if you wanted to add?

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Do you know
5 whether unlicensed operations have similarly declined
6 or have their operations been expanding at the
7 expense of the licensed commuter vans?

8 COMMISSIONER DO: So, we don't keep track
9 of unlicensed commuter vans because they're not
10 within our license structure, right? And so, we know
11 who are licensed and what type of vehicles and
12 associations and drivers are licensed, but we do not
13 have the data on unlicensed commuter vans.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So, even when
15 your agents go out and may cite them for violations
16 for being unlicensed, you don't keep that information
17 stored anywhere?

18 COMMISSIONER DO: What I can say is that
19 we have done nine operations with the NYPD and that
20 there have been 119 summonses issued to unlicensed
21 commuter vans and only a very small fraction of that
22 goes to licensed commuter vans. And so, there have
23 been 119 up from 59 last year in terms of violations.
24 So, we have doubled the enforcement on illegal
25 commuter vans.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Pivoting to
3 the unlicensed commuter vans. Unlicensed commuter
4 vans are seen throughout the city and target the same
5 market as licensed vans, but operate without the
6 safety and consumer protection safeguards that TLC
7 licensed commuter vans are bound by, such as
8 insurance and inspection requirements. Do you have an
9 estimate of how many unlicensed commuter vans in any
10 way are operating in the city?

11 COMMISSIONER DO: Beyond our enforcement
12 numbers, I do not know the universe of illegal
13 commuter vans. But what I can say is that we are
14 advertising and making sure that unlicensed commuter
15 vans know that there is help, that there is a 40,000-
16 dollar program to help get insurance for unlicensed
17 commuter vans so that they can go into the regulatory
18 scheme so that it not only protects our passengers
19 with proper insurance, but also the technology to
20 ensure that they are operating safely and
21 efficiently.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Do you know
23 whether they operate in the same neighborhoods as
24 licensed vans or along the same routes?

2 COMMISSIONER DO: Indications from the
3 data shows that they are operating in competition
4 with licensed commuter vans.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: According to
6 an article by the New York Times, as of 2019, nearly
7 three-quarters of commuter van drivers in the city
8 were operating illegally. However, TLC has previously
9 stated that the number of licensed commuter vans in
10 operation is unknown. Why is it so hard to track how
11 many unlicensed vans operate in the city?

12 COMMISSIONER DO: It would be incredibly
13 complicated for the TLC to look at the number of
14 commuter vans across various corridors. We would have
15 to have someone at a location and just to identify
16 these in a survey format, and we have not done that
17 in the past, Council Member. And so, you know, it
18 takes a lot of intensive resources, and we just
19 haven't done that.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And what can
21 we do to get a reliable estimate? Has TLC tried to
22 coordinate with stakeholders or people in the
23 community serviced by these vans to identify or
24 estimate the number of unlicensed vans?

2 COMMISSIONER DO: I think part of the bill
3 that you're proposing, Council Member, will help us
4 get towards that number and identify not only overall
5 needs of the commuter van industry, but also the
6 number of unlicensed commuter vans.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: TLC also
8 reported that in 2023 it seized four commuter vans,
9 all of which were returned after a hearing with OATH.
10 What kinds of violations warrant seizure of a
11 vehicle? Does TLC seize unlicensed vehicles?

12 COMMISSIONER DO: So, we do seize
13 unlicensed vehicles. Commuter vans are a little bit
14 more complicated than other types of for-hire
15 vehicles that are operating unlicensed. Within the
16 commuter van space, we not only have to get one
17 guilty conviction and then catch them in the process
18 again. Oftentimes, these are plated in other states,
19 like Pennsylvania, for example, and it becomes very
20 complicated when they re-register it, because then we
21 have to start all over again to get another guilty
22 verdict so it is very complicated. And because of
23 past court precedent, we are not able to seize these
24 vehicles on the initial stop.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Moving to
3 enforcement, what type of coordination exists between
4 TLC, DOT, and NYPD or other agencies to ensure that
5 parking, traffic, and ride-hailing rules are
6 followed?

7 COMMISSIONER DO: Yeah. So, we regularly
8 work with the Citywide Traffic Task Force at the NYPD
9 to do commuter van operations. We do it across our
10 city in both Brooklyn and Queens on Flatbush Avenue,
11 Downtown Flushing, Main Street, and then also Jamaica
12 Avenue. And so we regularly work with them to ensure
13 that commuter vans are not operating illegally within
14 a variety of different corridors. In addition to
15 that, on unlicensed activity, we also work with the
16 Port Authority at the two airports to ensure that our
17 for-hire vehicles, especially the unlicensed ones,
18 are not taking advantage of tourists and other
19 residents of New York City. We do a variety of
20 different operations, and throughout all of 2025 so
21 far, we've had 3,000 summonses issued to unlicensed
22 for-hire activity.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
24 that.

2 How is TLC monitoring shared curb and
3 pickup drop-off zones for commuter vans? And how does
4 TLC interact with DOT and MTA in terms of managing
5 the intersection between bus lanes and routes and
6 pickups, drop-off zones?

7 COMMISSIONER DO: So we have an amazing
8 relationship with the DOT. The DOT is the expert on
9 curb management, and they have consistently been able
10 to partner with us not only in 2017, but also regular
11 partnerships with my team to ensure that that our
12 for-hire vehicles are not impacting our streets in a
13 negative way. But I'll turn it over to Eric to talk a
14 little bit more about the DOT role in managing our
15 curb.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. And as
17 the Commissioner said, we work very closely together
18 on these issues. And what we try to see is places
19 where there's a lot of pickup and drop-off activity
20 happening, we want to provide designated curb space
21 so that they're not doing it in the middle of the
22 street, blocking buses, blocking bus stops, blocking
23 bus lanes. So, in places like downtown Jamaica, we've
24 created spaces where commuter vans can have separate
25

2 pickup and drop-off that is different from where the
3 where the buses are stopping...

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But those
5 areas downtown are often taken up by cars that are
6 parked there, (INAUDIBLE) from the local courthouse
7 and surrounding entities.

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. And
9 that's where the partnership with NYPD comes in.
10 Obviously, we're not the enforcement agency against
11 that behavior, but we work with NYPD. And when we see
12 that happening, we reach out to them and ask them to
13 focus in places. So, certainly if you're seeing
14 things, we're happy to help coordinate that with NYPD
15 as well.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
17 that.

18 Looking to equity, safety, and consumer
19 protection, what mechanisms are in place to address
20 complaints or safety violations specific to commuter
21 vans? And two follow-ups to that would be are
22 response times tracked by vehicle type or complaint.
23 And on average, how long does it take for TLC to
24 respond to passenger complaints for FHV's or commuter
25 vans?

2 COMMISSIONER DO: Yeah. So, in the last
3 fiscal year, TLC received 23,000 consumer complaints.
4 That's a lot of complaints. And 18,000 of them were
5 deemed to be prosecutable at OATH. And so our
6 prosecuting attorneys look through the case, look at
7 the complaining witness, and look at the evidence to
8 ensure that we can win at OATH. In those instances,
9 right, we also let our consumers know, be it a
10 bicyclist, a pedestrian, or another roadway user,
11 that we're taking this on and that they may have to
12 be a witness in front of OATH. In many of those
13 instances, we look at the universe as a whole. And
14 what took us maybe 45 days to 60 days previously, we
15 have gotten down to 15 days through looking at the
16 data and being more efficient. And so overall, we
17 have been doing a better job and making sure that
18 complainants get a resolution within a timely manner.
19 I think when you talk to our bicyclists and other
20 roadway users, when they file complaints, they are
21 incredibly proud of the work that the TLC does
22 because we're incredibly responsive and we follow up
23 with resolutions to every single case, and we are an
24 enforcement agency so that helps as well.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 36

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. I'd
3 like to acknowledge we've been joined by Council
4 Members Won and Abreu.

5 I'm going to pause with my questions and
6 allow my Colleagues to ask their questions, starting
7 with Council Member Avilés followed by Council Member
8 Narcisse.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you, Chair.
10 Thank you to the Administration for being here.

11 So, I guess I'd like to first start with
12 who designed the FLO app?

13 COMMISSIONER DO: I think I'll turn it
14 over to the DOT.

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. So, the
16 FLO app is designed and provided by FLO, the company
17 who is our current partner in the curbside charging
18 pilot.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: And who is
20 responsible for its maintenance?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So, that is
22 part of the agreement between us and FLO and Con Ed,
23 that FLO, as the operator of the system, maintains
24 and runs that app.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Great. Thank you.

3 And what is the total cost to the City to operate the
4 system?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: We will have
6 to get back to you on the exact cost. We're in the
7 process of transitioning from the Con Ed-led pilot to
8 the City. The initial pilot was at no cost to the
9 City, and we have to look at what it costs now.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: I'm sorry, can you
11 say that last part again?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So, we
13 recently took over the operation from Con Ed, just as
14 their contract was ending, and so it's been a
15 negotiated acquisition with FLO, and so I'll have to
16 get back to you on the details of that contract.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Got it. We'll
18 follow up. Has the adoption of the technology changed
19 since its implementation?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: What we've
21 seen is a very strong increase in usage. When we
22 first implemented these, we were seeing, you know, in
23 the range of 15 to 25 percent utilization, which is
24 still very strong by national standards. Today, we
25 see locations all over the city that are at 90

2 percent or more, which is functionally, someone is
3 leaving as someone else is entering so it's just very
4 high demand for these locations.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Got it. And how is
6 the City thinking about incentivizing adoption of
7 safe charging for other types of vehicles like e-
8 bikes and trucks?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah. We do
10 believe in the whole ecosystem. So as we're talking
11 here about the FLO (TIMER CHIME) pilot, we've also
12 been expanding EV charging in our lots and garages,
13 both level 2 and fast charging, as well as working
14 towards ways to charge e-bikes and other things in
15 safe ways so that's something that's still in
16 development, but we very much recognize the need and
17 want to think of it as a comprehensive system, not
18 as, you know, lots of people digging things up
19 separately. And then, yeah, as one of the mitigations
20 for congestion pricing, there is money to convert
21 trucks to cleaner fuel and electric, which builds on
22 our existing clean trucks program.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Is there a
24 percentage of allocated money from the congestion
25 pricing?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: There's a
3 specific amount. I don't have it in front of me, but
4 we can get that to you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Okay. I mean,
6 would you agree, based on the current state of
7 affairs, multiple apps, various charging speeds,
8 hodgepodge, private, public, that there is an
9 opportunity for either the City or an entity to
10 actually provide a comprehensive app that could tell
11 you, give you some more usable information around
12 where you could use our charging stations?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: And it's
14 definitely a growing and evolving sector, so it's one
15 we're paying a lot of attention to. When I use an EV,
16 I usually use the PlugShare app and find it to be
17 helpful in collecting both the public and private. I
18 think what we want to do is make sure that we're
19 doing our job well, which is installing these and
20 providing good information. I think what we don't
21 want to do is be duplicative with services that
22 others are providing.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: It's a good
24 opportunity for...

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 40

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Council
3 Member, I'm going to ask you to wrap up.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Can I just say one
5 thing?

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: One last
7 question.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you for
9 that. I I just want to say for the record, if our
10 City is truly prioritizing New Yorkers, drivers,
11 consumers, we would just reject autonomous vehicles.
12 We should not be piloting ways...

13 CHAMBERS: (APPLAUSE)

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Hello. Hello.
15 [GAVEL] You will be removed from the Chamber if you
16 cannot conduct yourselves accordingly. Please use the
17 hand gestures to show support and do not clap.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you, Chair.
19 I'm sorry. I didn't mean for all that, but I just
20 really wanted to make the statement.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: If you could
22 wrap up, please.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: So, I would just
24 say if we want to really care about New Yorkers,
25 piloting ways to get rid of jobs instead of improving

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 41

2 conditions like we are talking about here, is where
3 our Administration should be focused their resources
4 so thank you, Chair. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

6 Next, we'll hear from Council Member Narcisse
7 followed by Council Member Abreu. I just ask everyone
8 to please be respectful of the time. We do, as
9 always, have a lot of public signed up to testify,
10 and we want to make sure we're able to hear everyone.
11 Thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: I'm going to do
13 my best. Good morning, and good morning, Chair. Good
14 morning, Commissioner, and all the panelists here.

15 For the commuter van, right? I'm having a
16 problem with that because if I go on Flatbush right
17 now, there's a sea of vans going around and
18 disorderly conduct. I mean, some of them by King's
19 Plaza. I have constant complaints. People are getting
20 out of the van. They're peeing on people's lawn.
21 They're doing all kind of those things. This is not
22 quality of life. There's many of them, that's small
23 business operators, that just want to make a living,
24 a good living, right? So for me, my question to you,
25 what's the cap? What do you imagine the cap should

be? Because right now, we have about 51 licenses. How many you kind of imagine that the number should be?

COMMISSIONER DO: Well, I think, let me just first address Council Member Narcisse, the quality-of-life issues. When and if there are any issues with commuter vans, please let me know and my team know, and we will send out TLC police officers with NYPD to make sure that they're not operating in there. Oftentimes, when they see us, they will disperse, but then they'll come back, and so we want to make sure that illegal commuter vans are not operating in your neighborhood.

On the other side, right now, there are 51 licensed commuter vans, like you mentioned, Council Member, and what that means is that we want to make sure that there is a space and an ability for them to get towards licensure, right? This is 51. There is no cap to that. If a driver would like to use a commuter van and be licensed by the TLC, they can. I think the upper cap is about a little over 700, and so there's still a lot of room for licensed commuter vans. But that's why we support Chair Brooks-Power's legislation to do a (TIMER CHIME) commuter van study so that we can understand where

2 and how these commuter vans should operate, and they
3 should not be operating in an illegal manner. And we
4 support them getting towards the pathway to
5 licensure.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Let me be clear.
7 There's some great folks. I know they're trying to do
8 their business. That's why they're licensed. But the
9 unlicensed ones, they are the ones that actually
10 don't want to be licensed because there is no
11 enforcement. And without enforcement, it's a free for
12 all. And this is New York City. We cannot run the
13 city on a free-for-all aspect. So we need to
14 regulate. We need to make sure we create structure.
15 And the community is kind of overwhelmed with not
16 having enough enforcement to make sure, and then
17 create a path for those that want to be legal and
18 work and functioning in New York City. So let's do
19 our very best to do that. And thank you, Chair. And
20 I'm looking forward because enforcement is the key
21 right now to make sure that we have structure for
22 that. Thank you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Thank you, Chair.
24 And thank you to the Department of Transportation for
25 being here today. I'm here to take this opportunity

2 to raise a matter of deep concern for my District,
3 the stalled Riverside Drive Viaduct Project. The
4 completion of this project is now years off the
5 timeline, and the condition of the half-completed
6 project is taking a major toll on the neighborhood.
7 It is unacceptable for a neighborhood to be left in
8 limbo for years, and it is unacceptable for the City
9 to sign a contract and not enforce the terms. Over
10 and over, my office has tried to get information and
11 schedule public meetings on this issue to no avail,
12 and therefore I am here today. Instead, my
13 constituents have been stonewalled, misled, and
14 ignored. Today, I'm here to demand accountability. My
15 first question, when does DOT consider a contractor
16 to have walked off a project, and is it DOT's
17 position that the contractor on this project is still
18 completing the terms of the contract that's required?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Council
20 Member, thank you so much, and I just want to say at
21 the top, while I'm unfamiliar with the details, I'm...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: I've been in touch
23 with your office on this matter, and if you don't
24 know, your staff definitely knows.

2 COMMISSIONER DO: I'm going to make sure
3 that after this we follow up, and it is unacceptable,
4 and I apologize for the lack of communication.

5 As to the specifics, I'm totally
6 unprepared to get into the details on the Viaduct
7 project. I'm happy to personally come back to you and
8 get the follow-up you deserve.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: There hasn't been
10 work done on this project for months. I live right
11 across the street from this project. A lot of my
12 neighbors have been talking about this project, and
13 we haven't seen any single work done in the last
14 year. As early as May of this year, we had a meeting
15 with your office and some residents in our
16 neighborhood, and it seemed as though the project was
17 going swimmingly, only for us to learn recently that
18 workers have appeared to have walked off the project.
19 We want to know, since when did DOT have that
20 information that they walked off the project? When
21 will it enforce the terms of the contractor so that
22 another vendor can come and complete the project? Our
23 community should not (TIMER CHIME) be left without
24 this transparency and having follow-up on this
25 question would mean a lot to my constituents. Thank

2 you very much, Chair, and thank you very much,
3 Commissioner.

4 So I'm going to just ask the questions on
5 the record. You don't have to answer them, but I
6 would like answers to them. Is it DOT's position that
7 the contractor on this project is still completing
8 the terms of the contract that's required? If the
9 answer is yes, how is that possible when the timeline
10 has been indefinitely halted? The vendor has told
11 residents that they are no longer working, and
12 residents have not seen any work in months. If the
13 answer is no, how is it possible that a contractor
14 has been allowed to stop work on this project
15 entirely with no consequences? What enforcement
16 actions has DOT taken to hold this contractor
17 accountable? Why has the City chosen to let a vendor
18 abandon a critical infrastructure project without
19 penalty? If you are negotiating with the vendor, when
20 will DOT either compel this vendor back to work or
21 move to terminate the contract and assign it to
22 another contractor? There seems to be a clear
23 enforcement issue here. My office was told in front
24 of constituents as recently as May that everything
25 was going swimmingly with this project and there was

2 no issues with completion. I'm going to be reaching
3 out to the Comptroller to request further
4 investigation. Thank you so much, Chair.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Do you have
6 any answers for any of the questions?

7 Is the Manhattan Borough Commissioner
8 here at all?

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: No,
10 they are not.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: They are not?
12 Okay. I'm requesting that the answers to the
13 questions be submitted to Council Member Abreu and cc
14 my office before the week is out.

15 Okay. With that, we have no further
16 questions.

17 We will be moving to the public. Thank
18 you again to the agencies for your testimony and
19 participation today.

20 I now open the hearing for public
21 testimony. I remind members of the public that this
22 is a government proceeding and that decorum shall be
23 observed at all times. As such, members of the public
24 shall remain silent at all times.

2 The witness table is reserved for people
3 who wish to testify. No video recording or
4 photography is allowed from the witness table.

5 Further, members of the public may not present audio
6 or video recordings as testimony, but may submit
7 transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant-at-
8 Arms for inclusion in the hearing record.

9 If you wish to speak at today's hearing,
10 please fill out an appearance card with the Sergeant-
11 at-Arms and wait to be recognized. When recognized,
12 you will have two minutes to speak on today's hearing
13 topics: Oversight, TLC, commuter vans for-hire
14 vehicles, and licensing in New York City's evolving
15 transportation landscape; Intro. Number 115, a local
16 law to amend the Administrative Code of the City of
17 New York in relation to the creation of a mobile
18 application that provides information about electric
19 vehicle charging stations; Intro. Number 139, a local
20 law to amend the New York City Charter in relation to
21 adding two commissioners to the New York City Taxi
22 and Limousine Commission Board; Intro. Number 1000, a
23 local law to amend the Administrative Code of the
24 City of New York in relation to permitting the use of
25 commercial parking spaces by for-hire vehicles;

2 Intro. Number 1346, a local law to amend the
3 Administrative Code of the City of New York in
4 relation to requiring the Department of
5 Transportation to study the commuter van industry;
6 Intro. Number 1347, a local law to amend the
7 Administrative Code of the City of New York in
8 relation to enforcing violations against unlicensed
9 commuter vans.

10 If you have written testimony or
11 additional written testimony you wish to submit for
12 the record, please provide a copy of that testimony
13 to the Sergeant-at-Arms. You may also email written
14 testimony to testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72
15 hours of this hearing. Audio and video recordings
16 will not be accepted.

17 Also, I ask that everyone silence their
18 phones. We're going to call the first panel.

19 Leroy Morrison, Jeremy Moskowitz, Dr.
20 Paul Tallaj, Fernando Mateo, and Jenice Hernandez.

21 Again, you have two minutes. We ask that
22 you please adhere to the time constraints, and you
23 may begin when ready. Just be sure to turn on the
24 mic.

2 I'm just going to repeat the names again
3 to make sure we have the correct people at the dais.
4 Leroy Morrison, Jeremy Moskowitz, Dr. Paul Tallaj,
5 Fernando Mateo, and Jenice Hernandez.

6 GERMAINE ZAYAS: Germaine Zayas, Executive
7 Director of the New York State Federation of Taxi
8 Drivers. Germaine Zayas, Executive Director of the
9 New York State Federation of Taxi Drivers.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm sorry. I'm
11 having a hard time hearing you. Can you talk up
12 please?

13 GERMAINE ZAYAS: Germaine Zayas, Executive
14 Director of the New York State Federation of Taxi
15 Drivers.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Got it. You
17 can begin.

18 GERMAINE ZAYAS: Our CMO and our Chairman
19 are going to be reading statements into the record.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So who's
21 testifying? Is it Fernando? Okay, so the two of you.
22 If you're not testifying and you weren't called, you
23 don't need to be at the dais.

24 GERMAINE ZAYAS: (INAUDIBLE)
25

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, so if
3 you can leave the dais please. Thank you.

4 FERNANDO MATEO: Honorable Chairman, thank
5 you for having us here. My name is Fernando Mateo. I
6 am the Founder and Spokesman for the New York State
7 Federation of Taxi Drivers. We're here to address two
8 very crucial issues that are affecting not only our
9 drivers but approximately 200,000 drivers in New York
10 City. We believe that parking for 30 minutes in the
11 city, anywhere in the city, other than bus stops, no
12 standing zones, and emergency areas, drivers should
13 be allowed to park. Our drivers are suffering from
14 severe health issues from prostates to diabetes to
15 high blood pressure. You name it, they have it. When
16 you have to go to the bathroom, you've got to go.
17 There's no way that you can drive a half a mile or a
18 quarter of a mile trying to find a relief space where
19 you can relieve yourself. So we are asking the City
20 Council to understand that parking for 30 minutes
21 anywhere in the City of New York is very important to
22 our drivers. We don't need special permits. We don't
23 need signs that indicate that we can park there. All
24 we need is for the enforcement agencies to look at
25 the license plate number of the vehicle and

2 understand that if that vehicle is there, it's
3 because they're using a restroom. We'd also like for
4 you to understand that we transport a lot of ADA
5 passengers and a lot of the times, I'm sorry, a lot
6 of the times buses will drive by and issue a summons.
7 I'm sorry. I just don't want to speak while you're
8 speaking.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I can still
10 hear you.

11 FERNANDO MATEO: Okay. Okay. Thank you.
12 (TIMER CHIME) Thank you. So the MTA buses are issuing
13 fines to drivers that are dropping off disabled
14 people. Sometimes they're not able to drop them off
15 two or three blocks away so we'd like to address that
16 issue. And most importantly, every time a driver gets
17 out of his vehicle to use a restroom, he's issued a
18 115-dollar fine, which basically wipes out his entire
19 earnings for the day. So it would be very important
20 to all of the drivers that the City Council instruct
21 the TLC, the driver, the City agencies necessary so
22 that drivers can park for 30 minutes anywhere in the
23 city where trucks are able to park to load and
24 unload.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

3 Thank you.

4 FERNANDO MATEO: You're welcome.

5 DR. PAUL TALLAJ: (INAUDIBLE)

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Please turn
7 your mic on.

8 DR. PAUL TALLAJ: Good morning, Honorable
9 Chairwoman and Council members. I have two
10 testimonies that are both in there, one of my own and
11 then one of a fellow New Yorker.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Whatever you
13 can't do today, you can just submit in the written
14 testimony.

15 DR. PAUL TALLAJ: My name is Dr. Paul
16 Tallaj. I'm a general surgeon trained in Flushing,
17 New York, Chief Medical Officer for the New York
18 State Federation of Taxi Drivers. I care for
19 professional drivers across New York City and see
20 firsthand the preventable medical harm caused by the
21 simple lack of reliable bathroom access and the fear
22 of being ticketed for addressing basic human needs.
23 This is not theoretical. New York City itself has
24 acknowledged that public restrooms are scarce and
25 often unusable. Earlier this year, the Council voted

to create a citywide strategy to add public bathrooms because today there's roughly one public toilet for every 7,800 residents, about 1,100 total. Many park bathrooms are closed or unsanitary even during posted hours. That makes just find a bathroom unrealistic for a workforce tied to the curb for about 10 to 12 hours a day. When drivers can't find a restroom, they do only one thing they can. They hold it or they dehydrate on purpose. Medically, both are very dangerous, and urology guidance is very clear. From a both male and female perspective, regularly delaying urination can increase the risk of urinary tract infections, it can cause bladder dysfunction, and have other arms of health. For women specifically, it can cause abnormal irregularities in menstrual periods, pelvic floor strain, and cause hemorrhoids and incomplete emptying compounds that risk even greater. I don't even want to get started on what would happen for drivers that are pregnant. Dehydration increases kidney stone formation, and we see elevated rates of hypertension and cardiometabolic disease in taxi and for-hire drivers. Condition worsened by long sedentary shifts and inconsistent hydration. You've already set a

2 precedent by requiring residents to allow bathroom
3 access to delivery workers when they are picking up
4 orders, and I applaud you for that. (TIMER CHIME)

5 Drivers who move people deserve parity when facing...

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: If you could
7 wrap up, please?

8 DR. PAUL TALLAJ: An urgent need. For
9 these reasons, I urge you to adopt three targeted
10 health protective measures. One, allow TLC licensed
11 vehicles to park for up to 30 minutes citywide. Two,
12 require establishments to provide emergency restroom
13 access to TLC licensed drivers. And three, create a
14 clear, codified safe harbor from tickets, especially
15 for those elderly and disabled.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

17 FERNANDO MATEO: Why is it that you're
18 cutting us short when you held the hearing here and
19 you allowed...

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Excuse me.

21 [GAVEL]

22 FERNANDO MATEO: And you allowed this to
23 go on and on and on.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Excuse me.

25 [GAVEL] Excuse me.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 56

2 FERNANDO MATEO: It's like you wasted our
3 time.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Please remove
5 him.

6 FERNANDO MATEO: This is what our drivers
7 look like.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Please remove
9 him. Thank you.

10 FERNANDO MATEO: This is what our drivers
11 look like. You're very (INAUDIBLE) and I did not come
12 (INAUDIBLE)

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Please remove
14 him out of the Chamber. Thank you.

15 FERNANDO MATEO: Very impolite, very rude.

16 DR. PAUL TALLAJ: We do have two more
17 testimonies that are...

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: You can submit
19 the rest in writing, please. Thank you.

20 DR. PAUL TALLAJ: This is the testimony to
21 the...

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm sorry. You
23 can submit that in writing. Thank you.

24 JENICE HERNANDEZ: Good morning, Council
25 Members. My name is Jenice Hernandez. I'm here on

behalf of my dad, Jose Hernandez. He's one of the drivers who is currently fighting kidney disease due to so many years working on the road. It's my first time speaking. So, dialysis is what keeps him alive right now. Due to all of this, it's not only affecting him because it's life-threatening, but it's also effective to us as a family where we can no longer spend family vacations together. Everything is limited around his disease now. I just hope that this is taken seriously so that this doesn't happen to other families because it's very hard to see a family member slowly deteriorating. During his taxi services, he spent a lot of time on the road, so it was very hard for him to find bathrooms or restaurants who would open the door for him when he needed to use the bathroom. I just hope there's a change where this doesn't happen to other drivers in the future. So, if you guys can help with that, that would be great. The testimony is written down. I changed a couple of words because I'm a little nervous. This is my dad. (INAUDIBLE) constantly seeing this every day and it's very helpful so I just hope this helps. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you very
3 much for your testimony, and you can submit the full
4 testimony in writing.

5 JEREMY MOSKOWITZ: Hi. My name is Jeremy
6 Moskowitz from Voyager Global Mobility. We, with our
7 two brands, Buggy and Fast Track, are the largest
8 weekly rental for TLC drivers. As a weekly rental
9 company, we only succeed and thrive when drivers are
10 earning and survive. They can return the car anytime
11 they want, anytime the industry isn't working for
12 them. First, I just wanted to applaud the Council for
13 pushing through the PIP bill, and I wanted to ask
14 that you not take your foot off the pedal. We know
15 that there's a looming insurance crisis. American
16 Transit is completely insolvent and is going to be
17 screwing over thousands and thousands of drivers. At
18 the same time, the TLC has seemingly abdicated its
19 responsibility to solve this. They point the finger
20 at the State. The State points its finger back. In
21 that circus, I would ask the Committee to keep the
22 pressure on and continue to find common-sense
23 solutions to the insurance crisis.

24 I wanted to talk today also about 139 or
25 135, the composition of the council. I actually think

2 that it would be a great opportunity to push that all
3 seat holders, all commissioners, hold a TLC license.
4 Not necessarily that they be historical drivers, but
5 every commissioner should have to go through the TLC
6 process. I, myself, am not a full-time driver. I have
7 a TLC license. I know what it takes. I took the
8 course. I took the test. I know the rules. The people
9 who are regulating hundreds of thousands of drivers
10 should also, I think, be able to pass the test and
11 should know the rules that they're regulating. I
12 would push that all commissioners, after they're
13 nominated, have, let's say, three months, which is
14 what it takes to get your TLC license. But that's the
15 direction I would like to go. I think that there is
16 an overall lack of industry knowledge and expertise
17 on the commission itself. Commissioner Do (TIMER
18 CHIME) brings great knowledge, but as a whole, he
19 said himself, there's only one commissioner...

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

21 JEREMY MOSKOWITZ: Who has experience. So
22 thank you very much.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so
24 much. Thank you to the panel.

2 We'll call up the next panel. Leroy
3 Morrison, Andrew Greenblatt, Michele Dottin, Arjun
4 Lal, Dinara Zhanpeissova.

5 Please adhere to the two-minute time
6 limit. You may begin when you take the mic off of
7 mute.

8 LEROY MORRISON: First, I want to say good
9 morning to Madam Chair and her Staff. Thank you so
10 much for having this hearing on behalf of New York
11 City Commuter Vans. My name is Leroy Morrison. I'm
12 the President for New York City Commuter Van
13 Association. And Madam Chair, there's a lot of work
14 that needs to be done, and we really appreciate what
15 you did for commuter vans. We've been going through a
16 lot, but with these bills that you're doing now, it
17 should help the commuter van industry because we've
18 been around for over 40 years, going through a lot of
19 problems. Whenever New York City's in crisis, they
20 call on commuter vans. But what we want to do is feel
21 that we should be treated like a first-class citizen
22 in New York City and in America. Commuter van, we
23 have insurance problems. I went out and we raised
24 over 55 million dollars for the next five years so
25 they could bring back the commuter vans in New York

City. But with these legislation that you're doing now, it will help the commuter van industry and it'll help us move forward, and we thank you for the great work. We only have a couple minutes, but we've been fighting the insurance crisis for over decades. A lot of these for our industry also, if they would have come alongside us, we have great bills in Albany, but there was no support. We have bills passed, but when it's supposed to be the Governor sign it, there's no one there to help the Governor say, hey, listen, look, we have American Transit. That's the only insurance company in New York City. And also the assigned risk is not the way to go about it. Commuter van in Queens are paying 40,000 dollars a year, in Brooklyn, it's 45,000 dollars a year. So what we did, we come up with captive insurance. We come up with risk retention group for all for our industry, black cars, limos, for-hire, but there's no one there to help us. They seem to pull back. So what we're saying here, let's come together as one for-hire industry. And also City DOT need to give us more stops. They take down the commuter stops, they don't put them back up so it leave the ridership in the street. You know (TIMER CHIME) I'm sorry. Thank you, Madam Chair.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

3 DINARA ZHANPEISSOVA: Okay. Chair, Council
4 Members, my name is Dinara Zhanpeissova, and I
5 represent Independent Drivers Guild. I'm a woman, an
6 immigrant, and Uber and Lyft driver in New York City.
7 I've been driving for the past eight years, and I'm
8 here to support Intro. 1000 bill. Drivers like me
9 spend 10 to 12 hours behind the wheel. And yes,
10 there's a few legal places to stop, but nowhere near
11 enough for the size of our workforce. Most of the
12 time restaurants refuse us, saying that we have to
13 order something. Coffee shops, they lock their
14 bathrooms, buy a drink for the code, daily groceries,
15 they just kick us out. Parks, they're too crowded and
16 they close very early. So what happens? Accidents.
17 I've been there. To avoid it, I dehydrate myself. I
18 don't drink water, coffee on purpose just to get
19 through my shift. That's not healthy, not fair, and
20 not what is world world-class city should be putting
21 its workers through. The other day near LaGuardia
22 airport, I saw the sign. (INAUDIBLE) drivers, no
23 urinating, no dumping. Cute, right? But when you give
24 thousands of drivers only a few legal options, what
25 do you expect? Sometimes I see bottles of urine left

2 on the street. Businesses wash down their sidewalks
3 because of the smell. And let's be honest, tourists
4 already say New York smells like a pee. Intro. 1000
5 is not rocket science. It gives drivers a legal
6 (INAUDIBLE) to stop for 30 minutes, grab a food,
7 stretch, and yes, use a bathroom like normal people.
8 The City makes some money, sidewalk stays cleaner,
9 drivers get dignity. Everyone wins. Council Members,
10 I know you care about the city. Please do the right
11 thing, pass Intro. 1000. Give us health, dignity, and
12 give to the city clean streets. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

14 ANDREW GREENBLATT: Good morning, Chair
15 Brooks-Powers and Members of the Committee. My name
16 is Andrew Greenblatt and I'm the Policy Director of
17 the Independent Drivers Guild, or IDG. Thank you for
18 this opportunity to testify in support of Intro.
19 1000. As a non-profit affiliate of the Machinist
20 Union, the IDG represents more than 140,000 Uber and
21 Lyft drivers throughout the state and hundreds of
22 thousands of more across the country. Our drivers
23 need to find a safe and legal place to take a break.
24 This isn't just a matter of convenience, it's a
25 matter of health, safety, and basic dignity. The

80,000 FHV drivers in the city have only 31 relief stands. That's one relief stand for every 2,500 drivers. I want to correct something the TLC said. They gave a higher number, and the number that they gave includes all of the relief stands that are only available to yellow cab drivers and not available to other FHV drivers. So, it's one for every two and a half thousand drivers. It doesn't work. Now the DOT testified today that they're working on it. The first time we met with them on this issue was 2019. They told us they would work on it. It is six years later, and they've added exactly zero relief stands in six years. At this rate, over the next hundred years, they'll add zero relief stands. This is not a solution to this problem. Intro. 1000 is a commonsense solution. It would permit FHV drivers to use underused space. You see this empty space all the time when you're driving through the city. The drivers would be charged for this, so the DOT also talked about how this would cost money for them to fix the meters, the meter apps. Actually what it is is revenue positive. We're talking about putting revenue into the treasury and giving drivers the dignity they need. Intro. 1000 is a win-win for

2 everybody. It would improve the driver's health,
3 reduce (TIMER CHIME) traffic congestion on bridges
4 and tunnels, and shorten wait times for passengers.
5 We urge you to pass this legislation.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

7 MICHELE DOTTIN: Good morning. My name is
8 Michelle Dottin. I'm here to support Intro. 1000,
9 requesting that it be passed, allowing basic human
10 decency to enable FHV drivers to stop for 30 minutes,
11 four times a day, to get some food, use the restroom,
12 and stretch their legs, to avoid possible illnesses
13 caused by delayed release of bodily functions.
14 Drivers are not asking for too much, just the ability
15 to be treated with some compassion and empathy in
16 their daily stresses. Yes, stress happens when they
17 had to worry about a ticket. They had to take a
18 chance to stop somewhere illegal with no other
19 choice. Intro. 1000 will alleviate that additional
20 stress, allowing them peace of mind and human
21 compassion for their daily needs without being
22 ticketed. FHV drivers are being treated like an ATM.
23 They are faced with the possibility of having to
24 purchase an electric vehicle by 2030 with a lack of
25 charging stations and hours off the roads, causing

2 them valuable fears. Reconsideration of the 2030 end
3 time should be made. Then, like another monkey on
4 their back, here comes the possibility of AVs taking
5 away their jobs, leaving them with new debts from the
6 purchase of electric vehicles and no way to feed
7 their families. We want the focus to be on the
8 workers, not the billionaires lavishly spending the
9 money that workers help them earn, like the man who
10 himself buried himself in a precious car. How
11 selfish. Let's think about the ripple effect on the
12 economy. The thousands of jobs lost, the domino
13 effect on small businesses who rely on the support of
14 these businesses, and also the safety of the riders.
15 Trafficking, sex trafficking (TIMER CHIME) as well.
16 I'd like to also say I agree with Intro. 139,
17 however, there must be a licensed driver.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

19 Thank you.

20 ARJUN LAL: Hello. My name is Arjun Lal.

21 I'm a for-hire vehicle driver. I'm from Greece, and
22 I've been representing drivers who operate with app-
23 based trips. I'm here today to voice a strong support
24 for Intro. 1000. Thank you to the Council for the
25

2 opportunity to speak on behalf of the thousands of
3 drivers who keep the city moving.

4 I've been driving across all the five
5 boroughs for years. Early mornings, late nights,
6 weekends, holidays. I've spent time away from my
7 family, time away from my friends to drive and to
8 move New York. I take pride in my work, but every day
9 one serious issue continues to affect us, the lack of
10 access to restrooms and legal places to stop. Let me
11 give you an example. One night around 10 p.m. just
12 before Christmas, I was working in midtown Manhattan,
13 New York City, and suddenly got hit with a terrible
14 stomach ache. It was the night before Christmas, so
15 there was no public restrooms, nowhere I could stop
16 to park legally. I had no choice but to drive all the
17 way to Queens to find a bathroom. I lost time. I
18 missed rides. There were people traveling that could
19 have been revenue. It was all for a basic human need.
20 This just isn't my story. It happens to drivers every
21 single day. Some are even ticketed 100 dollars for
22 pulling over briefly. That's a full day's pay gone.
23 Intro. 1000 matters. It would provide drivers with
24 safe, legal places to stop. It would protect their
25 health, reduce illegal parking, improve traffic flow

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 68

2 and bring in revenue through meters instead of fines.

3 We are not asking for special treatment. We're asking

4 for basic dignity. We're all humans. We're essential

5 workers. We keep the city moving doing everything

6 that the city has gone through. We deserve to do our

7 job safely and humanely. Intro. 1000 is a safe,

8 smart, and simple solution. Please vote to pass this

9 bill. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

11 Thank you to this panel.

12 The next panel we'll hear from will

13 include Bhairavi Desai, Richard Chow, Mohammed

14 Mohammed, Adalgisa Payero-Diarra, and Hector German.

15 You can begin as soon as you're ready by

16 turning on the mic, and we ask everyone to respect

17 the two-minute limit. Thank you.

18 BHAIRAVI DESAI: Good morning, Madam Chair

19 and Members of the Council. Thank you for having this

20 hearing today. Also, Madam Chair, I'd like to thank

21 you for the invitation to serve on the Commuter Van

22 Roundtable. Really appreciate the two bills that are

23 on the table today and do support them.

24 With regards to Intro. 1000, it was

25 really stunning to hear the Administration say that

their answer is, quote, we're going to work to increase stands. Drivers have been hearing that ad nauseum for like decades in this city. Even when there were less than 10,000 yellow cabs operating, there were not enough stands for the drivers to take a break. Now imagine when the number of operating vehicles on any given day is over 80,000, by no means are we close enough to the number of stands that drivers actually need. They're serving 158 million passengers in just the first six months of this year alone. They are critical to the economic fiber of this city. They bring in revenue every single day, and they do it at the expense not only of their financial security, because they begin every day at a negative, paying the expenses, but they continue to do it at the expense of their health and safety. Having enough stands is the least that the City can provide to the men and women who work in this industry. But the bill needs to be amended. It should say that these spots would be available to TLC drivers. We don't want to see this bill become a Trojan horse, where in the future, AV companies, it may be Waymo today, Uber itself has said they expect their prototype in another four to five years to come

2 in and use these spaces as a means to basically do
3 mechanic on their vehicle. These spaces should be for
4 all TLC drivers that are operating TLC licensed
5 vehicles.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. And
7 I do have a quick question for you regarding Intro.
8 139. Just wanted to get your perspective on that.

9 BHAIRAVI DESAI: Sure. So, I mean, I think
10 the concern would be that you're adding two
11 commissioners. It would be 11. The Mayor's Office
12 would then have the majority. They would have six,
13 and the Council would have five. Now, I remember the
14 days when Rudolph Giuliani was mayor, and we could
15 barely get near TLC without the threat of being
16 arrested. It's an important balance between the
17 Council and the Mayoral Administration, no matter who
18 that mayor is going to be. So, I think that
19 increasing the number is, I think it's going to throw
20 off what the actual goal of the legislation is.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And just to be
22 clear, the intent was to try to give drivers more of
23 a voice in terms of the direction of regulations and
24 things that impact their day-to-day life. So, is
25 there amendments to this bill that you think would be

2 appropriate to keep the balance that you speak of,
3 but also keep the spirit or the intent of the bill?

4 BHAIRAVI DESAI: Yes. I think if you just
5 keep the number the same, but you have the
6 requirement that at least some of those members must
7 be licensed drivers, you know, active drivers, I
8 think then you do address the spirit and at the same
9 time maintain the important checks and balances
10 between the Council and the Administration.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

12 MOHAMMED MOHAMMED: My name is Mohammed
13 Mohammed. I used to drive yellow cab and green cab
14 since 2003, and now I'm driving Uber and Lyft since
15 2010. I support Intro. 1000. Just I have three
16 objections regarding this bill. The only objection I
17 have first is the waiting time. It should be 90
18 minutes, not 30 minutes. 30 minutes is proposed to
19 serve Waymo in future coming up, not the drivers. And
20 secondly, to ensure the drivers have reserved that
21 spot and that will be achieved to keep that spot to
22 the driver to boot any other cars or any other
23 vehicle or towing away if it's not commercial vehicle
24 or TLC cars. Thirdly, all TLC drivers should get the
25 benefit for that bill, yellow cab, green cab, all TLC

2 drivers. We have to talk here about the drivers, not
3 the vehicle. So the driver, if he needs a break, he
4 needs more than 30 minutes. We have to keep in our
5 mind Manhattan is too crowded. If I park my car 30
6 minutes, it's not enough to go have a break or line
7 in for a bathroom, or if I'm going to a hearing even
8 here. I have 188 (INAUDIBLE), I can't park there in
9 my spot. All the parking have taken by the New York
10 City, I mean the New York City vehicle or police car
11 or other vehicle. So also, it's very hard for the
12 driver to find his own spot. The City never give
13 ticket for the police car who park in our spot. This
14 should be fixed. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
16 that. And we see that in Queens also with folks in
17 the commuter van designated spots as well, and it's
18 definitely, you know, problematic in terms of that.

19 RICHARD CHOW: Hello. Good morning, Madam
20 Chair and City Council Member. My name is Richard
21 Chow. I'm New York Taxi Workers Alliance member. I'm
22 a yellow cab driver. Most of the yellow cab driver
23 working in the city, most of the time, the traffic is
24 very bad and very hard to find the parking spot, to
25 the break time, to go to the restroom or lunch or

2 dinner. Yellow cab driver, FHV driver need more
3 relief stand and then permit to use the commercial
4 parking spot. So up to 30 minutes for four times a
5 day so we're going to avoid the ticket. Every time I
6 went to the bathroom and come back, I get a ticket,
7 115 dollars, so this unfair. So, a lot of driver has
8 a problem with the, they cannot go into on time to
9 the bathroom, get a kidney stone problem. They're
10 creating the kidney stone problem. Myself a few
11 months ago, I have a kidney stone problem. I've
12 diabetes, high blood pressure, so many health issue.
13 So driver need more, the parking spot to go to on
14 time, go to the restroom, avoid visit to the doctor
15 office so those drivers are going to be more
16 healthier. Thank you so much for listening.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

18 It's good to see you.

19 RICHARD CHOW: You're welcome.

20 ADALGISA PAYERO-DIARRA: Good morning. My
21 name is Adalgisa Payero-Diarra. I'm the President of
22 the UTANY, Union Taxi of Drivers in New York City.
23 I'm here today in support of Intro. 1000, the bill
24 that will be allowing drivers to park at commercial
25 parking spot. As a female driver, we face constant

2 difficulties when it comes to using the restrooms
3 while working. We face the hardship of getting
4 tickets just to use the restroom or grab something to
5 eat. It is important that Council Members today
6 approve this bill, giving the 200,000 TLC drivers a
7 relief to be able to eat or use the restroom or just
8 take a break to stretch the legs without encountering
9 a parking violation that will affect the income of
10 that date and also create a hardship for our family.
11 Also, I want to take everyone that is here supporting
12 this bill and also plead with our Council Members
13 regarding Waymo's autonomous vehicles being tested in
14 our city and how this can destroy the thousands of
15 lives of all these men and women that are here and
16 their family. Please say no to Waymo and keep our
17 city safe. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

19 HECTOR GERMAN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
20 LANGUAGE) Please sign the bill 1000.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
22 Thank you to the panel.

23 The next panel we will hear from will
24 include Zach Miller, Jose Altamirano, Jose LeBron,
25 Peter Mazer, Eman Rimawi-Doster.

2 You can begin once you come off of mute.

3 We ask that everyone adhere to the two-minute rule.

4 ZACH MILLER: Good morning, Chair Brooks-
5 Powers. Thank you for holding this hearing. My name
6 is Zach Miller. I am the Vice President of Government
7 Affairs for the Trucking Association of New York. I
8 do have full written testimony submitted, but there
9 are just a couple of points that I do want to make. I
10 do want to start off by saying this is Truck Driver
11 Appreciation Week, and the challenges that our
12 professional truck drivers face are very similar to
13 the challenges that our FHV drivers face in terms of
14 how long they are on the road, what they need in
15 terms of places to rest, and in terms of human
16 dignity. We agree with that. Our challenge with
17 Intro. 1000 as it is written is we see it creating
18 more conflict between our professional drivers rather
19 than coexistence. We do believe there is a pathway to
20 work together on curb solutions that do provide that
21 dignity for everybody, but Intro. 1000 as written is
22 not it. There are a couple of points I do want to
23 make in terms of what is happening in the commercial
24 loading zones right now because we did poll our
25 members about this. They are saying that they see

2 loading zones blocked by non-commercial vehicles
3 about 35 percent of the time. There is trash,
4 construction equipment, and debris that also
5 obstructs access. Specialized fleets face longer
6 distances between zones and destinations, adding to
7 inefficiency, and our drivers regularly receive
8 summons for bus lane, bike lane, and double parking
9 violations that stem from a lack of accessible legal
10 space. This does increase the drivers getting idling
11 tickets as well as criminal summons for blocking
12 traffic. It takes, on average, about 15 to 30 minutes
13 for a truck driver to find a place to park, which
14 again adds to congestion and inefficiency. Another
15 thing we would like to see added to any bill moving
16 forward is a reporting requirement related to how
17 many loading zones there are, how many are added year
18 over year, where they are, and (TIMER CHIME) their
19 usage patterns. As always, we're happy to continue to
20 work with the Council and DOT on solutions.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
22 that, and I appreciate the fact that you put a
23 caveat, like if it was to move forward, what could
24 help to make it a more responsible bill, so thank you
25 for that.

2 JOSE ALTAMIRANO: Good morning, Chair.

3 Pleasure to be with you. My name is Jose Altamirano.

4 I'm the President of the Livery Base Owners

5 Association. We represent about 250 livery bases

6 serving communities across New York City, especially

7 in areas underserved by traditional transit. I want

8 to address several of the bills today. Starting with

9 Intro. 1000, we are in favor. Our drivers often can't

10 find places to legally park to use restrooms during

11 long shifts. This is not optional. It impacts their

12 safety, their health, and dignity. Our bases have

13 bathrooms. Our community car service have bathrooms.

14 Another additional solution could be giving TLC

15 parking in front or near the bases so that drivers

16 can be able to use the facilities there as well.

17 In regards to Intro. 1346, we support the

18 study in principle. Liveries fill many of the same

19 gaps commuter vans are intended to address, serving

20 neighborhoods where public transit is sparse or

21 inconvenient, but a similar effort, the Blackhorn

22 Livery Task Force, was done already and its findings

23 have largely gone unimplemented. TLC studies need to

24 result in real policy changes, particularly regarding

25 licensing cap and operational flexibility to allow

2 the sector to scale. The current system caps FHV
3 licenses and places high-cost burdens, making it very
4 difficult for newcomers, especially immigrant
5 drivers, to enter or transition. We urge the Council
6 to expand livery vehicle licenses, offer financial
7 support or subsidies for EVs, and simplify licensing
8 process so more drivers can be onboarded.

9 In regards to Intro. 0139, adding two
10 additional commissioners, we respectfully oppose.
11 Increasing the number of commissioners sounds good in
12 theory, but in practice it adds a lot of bureaucracy.
13 It risks slowing decision-making. We also would like
14 to say that we like the spirit of the bill and we
15 would, if within the current nine, two of them could
16 be licenses, we would definitely be in support of
17 that.

18 In regards to Intro. 0115, we are in
19 favor (TIMER CHIME) and just want to make sure that
20 the vehicles, and there's a plan because a lot of
21 these vehicles are very expensive for our drivers
22 because of the additional...

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

24 JOSE LEBRON: (INAUDIBLE)

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Can you turn
3 the mic on, please?

4 JOSE LEBRON: Sorry. Hello. Good morning.
5 My name is Jose LeBron. I'm the President of NYIBU.
6 That's New York Independent Drivers Union. My visit
7 today, I'm so younger on the driver industry, only
8 two years. Only two years and my kidneys are working
9 so, so bad. Just that because we have to work a lot
10 of hours to do the money and then we don't have any
11 way where we can stop and go to the bathroom. That is
12 for me, but I'm a younger man, and I think about
13 that's old people that are old men that are working
14 every day, working so hard to get the money to their
15 house. This is a problem because the City doesn't
16 know who we are. We are the driver. We are the people
17 that move the economy of the country and then we
18 don't know why we have that arrangement about the
19 authority. When someone that have (INAUDIBLE) stop
20 anywhere, they are haunting us. They are fighting
21 against us. I don't know why. We are here because
22 this bill is too much important for the life of the
23 driver and the driver is some, I don't know how to
24 say this. If one time all the driver be organized and
25 stop in the city, the city will get in chaos. But

2 anybody want to see that and they are haunting to us.
3 The problem is not only about this bill, and this
4 bill is too much important. That's why I'm here. The
5 problem is the people that have to be taking care of
6 us and are in arrangement with us. When we want, when
7 we talk about the MTA and we watch in DOT and we talk
8 about the TLC, I was hearing David Do talking some
9 beautiful words about us but that is not the truth.
10 That is not the truth because when we work and I want
11 only to say this and when we work and one customer
12 pay 100 dollars, we only get 35 dollars.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

14 Thank you, sir.

15 PETER MAZER: Good morning. My name is
16 Peter Mazer, and I'm General Counsel to the
17 Metropolitan Taxicab Board of Trade, a 73-year-old
18 association representing owners and operators of
19 licensed medallion taxicabs. We operate a full-
20 service driver center that has provided services to
21 more than 15,000 drivers in traffic court, OATH, and
22 criminal courts and provided a variety of other
23 services to them all at no charge. Ten years ago, our
24 taxicabs were moving about a half a million
25 passengers a day. Then Uber and Lyft came along and

2 then we hit a pandemic and we were down to very close
3 to zero. Over time, we have seen ridership slowly
4 return, but it is not at the levels that we had
5 previously experienced. Yet to many New Yorkers, cabs
6 remain an essential service. More than half of our
7 cabs are accessible to persons with disabilities. We
8 receive no subsidy, and we provide over 2 billion
9 dollars to the MTA in surcharges and fees. There are
10 still many challenges facing this industry today as
11 we embark on a slow gradual return. They include the
12 high cost of insurance, the high cost of vehicles
13 coupled by the lack of available financing. Lenders
14 have little confidence in large part because
15 unlicensed operators and others are breaking the law,
16 depressing drivers' and owners' incomes with
17 enforcement virtually non-existent. Today, you are
18 considering a bill to promote strict enforcement
19 against violators in the commuter van industry. We
20 would like to see that expanded to include
21 enforcement against violators affecting the taxi and
22 for-hire industries as well, illegal activity at the
23 airports, and other transportation hubs are major
24 concern. Finally, I would like to address one of the
25 bills to add two driver representation to an expanded

2 TLC board of commissioners. The Administrative Code
3 already provides for an advisory board with owner and
4 driver representation. This advisory board has not
5 met for years and should be reconstituted. I would
6 also point out that TLC commissioners serve an
7 adjudication's role. Hearing (TIMER CHIME) appeals of
8 license revocation cases and having licensee
9 representation on the board with these functions may
10 present a conflict of interest. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so
12 much.

13 EMAN RIMAWI-DOSTER: Hi. Good afternoon.
14 Yeah, it is good afternoon. Okay. To the Committee on
15 Transportation and Infrastructure, thank you so much
16 for allowing me to share my testimony. My name is
17 Eman Rimawi-Doster, and I am a Senior Community
18 Organizer for the Disability Justice Program at New
19 York Lawyers for the Public Interest. I'm also an
20 Access-A-Ride customer and a lifelong New Yorker, and
21 for the record also, I am disabled. I am not the ADA
22 community, not sure what exactly that means. Yes, the
23 MTA started a pilot program with electric vans for
24 the Access-A-Ride paratransit dedicated service to
25 reduce greenhouse gas emissions, but only 15 electric

2 vehicles have been put in the service as a key part
3 of the MTA's goals to decrease emissions by 85
4 percent by 2040. And while the MTA and the TLC are
5 two different entities, they are partners. The MTA's
6 Access-A-Ride on-demand pilot program, which is in
7 phase three, needs TLC vehicles to be healthier, not
8 only for disabled customers who use them, but also
9 for the drivers who drive them and for our
10 environment. So there is a solution. We hope that the
11 work with the City Council to pass the legislation
12 requiring the TLC to issue a request for proposals,
13 an RFP, for a full accessible zero-emission vehicle
14 model that can be integrated into the city's huge
15 for-hire vehicle and taxi fleet. Accessible EVs would
16 be paratransit riders, taxi riders, and users of
17 major rideshare apps alike. Second, the bill that New
18 York Lawyers of the Public Interest is working on,
19 S5552 or A6635, to establish the Green Accessible
20 Transition Authority, or GATA, would provide
21 financial support for for-hire vehicle drivers and
22 paratransit service to purchase these accessible
23 electric vehicles. The legislation was introduced in
24 May 2025 and aims to incentivize drivers (TIMER
25 CHIME) to operate... and I'll submit the rest of it.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

3 Thank you to this panel.

4 I just want to remind people, if we could
5 keep all comments contained to the hearing topic of
6 today and the pieces of legislation.

7 Thank you to the panel again.

8 The next panel will include Raul Rivera,
9 Christopher Leon Johnson, Anwaar Malik, Guan Lin
10 (phonetic), and Khang Chihui (phonetic).

11 You can start once you come off of mute.
12 I ask that everyone keep their comments restrained to
13 the two minutes and also stay on topic.

14 I'm going to just call the names again,
15 make sure that everyone is still here. Raul Rivera,
16 Christopher Leon Johnson, Anwaar Malik, Guan Lin,
17 Khang Chihui, Khalid Khatak, Larbi Aitaabou.

18 Raul, you can begin once you come off
19 mute. Please adhere to the two-minute rule.

20 RAUL RIVERA: Good afternoon. My name is
21 Raul Rivera. I'm a TLC driver advocate, currently not
22 driving, but I do have 23,000 trips with Uber and
23 Lyft. My license, according to everybody else, is
24 suspended or deactivated, which is a lie. I'm in the
25 process of renewing. It's about 500 dollars to renew

the license. I want to touch on Intro. 139. Intro. 139 comes from a petition that we drafted in 2018 to reform the Taxi Limousine Commission, a petition that you have. We spoke to your Policy Director, Jack Siegenthaler. He knows about that bill and others that we have. We shared that petition with you. We wanted you to sign that petition. It doesn't have all the answers, but it's a start, it's a tool. And the most important thing is to reform the TLC, an agency that's 50 years old, that has 12 suicides under their belt. We shared the list, we have a list of the drivers, and that's what we need. We don't need bathrooms, there's bathrooms everywhere. Somebody could get a bottle and use that. It works fine for me. We want the reform of the TLC. I spoke to the Commissioner. I had meetings with him. Mayor Adams signed our petition to reform the TLC, many others. Richie Torres, Jumaane Williams, everybody. I don't know why it's so hard to call for the reform of an agency that's 50 years old, that's 50 years old. We're driving a vehicle. We're not driving a rocket ship. It's ridiculous that you can't stand up or anyone to stand up and call for the reform of the TLC. Mateo was here, Mateo was not even a taxi

2 driver. He's an entrepreneur, it says it right on his
3 website. He's never done a trip in his life. He can't
4 give us a press conference. We're trying to give him
5 a chance. Everybody gets a chance with me, everybody,
6 until you lose that chance. I think we gave you a
7 good chance. I think an illegal alien coming from
8 across the border has an easier chance to have a
9 meeting.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

11 RAUL RIVERA: Finally, I say...

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
13 Raul.

14 RAUL RIVERA: If you support Zahra
15 Mandani, you support an anti-Semite.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
17 Rahul. [GAVEL] That's it. Thank you. Next.

18 RAUL RIVERA: Yeah, you're good at that,
19 cutting people off.

20 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Yeah. Hello. My
21 name is Christopher Leon Johnson. Thank you, Chair
22 Brooks-Powers. First off, I want to make a statement
23 both to the IDG forward slash Justice for App Workers
24 and the TWA forward slash the Worker Justice Project,
25 Los deliveristas. You two non-profits, you two

2 organizations have direct access to the Chair of the
3 City Council. Not like Raul Rivera. You guys both
4 have direct access to the Chair of the City Council.
5 The issue I see here with both of these
6 organizations, I'm getting sick of it. I think you're
7 getting sick of it too, is that these two
8 organizations are divided of what's happening here.
9 Because all it's about is, I'm president of this, I'm
10 president of that, titles, salaries, all the stuff
11 like that. You two organizations are both getting
12 unfairly deactivated, all four of you guys, WJP, TWA,
13 even Raul Rivera, all you organizations, IDG, Justice
14 for App Workers. All you guys are getting
15 deactivated, unfairly deactivated by Uber. Just like
16 this past Friday, they had a rally saying that we had
17 to stop unfair deactivation. I support that. I
18 support Intro. 1332 by Justin Brannan. Not the
19 hearing for that, but I'm here to show my support for
20 that bill. I was able to testify with Julie Menin
21 here. So put that on record, I support Intro. 1132 to
22 stop unfair deactivations of the deliveristas. But I
23 support every bill to stop unfair deactivations of
24 everybody in this room. But you organizations right
25 here, both IDG and TWA and Workers Justice Project

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 88

2 and Justice for App Workers need to come together and
3 come together with the Chair, and say that fuck Uber,
4 fuck Lyft, fuck DoorDash, fuck Grubhub, and fuck all
5 these, I'm sorry about that, sorry on language.
6 Forget all these organizations, y'all need to stick
7 together. Stop being divided, stop worrying about
8 salaries, and come together at the table and say we
9 gotta fight back against the apps. So I'm here to
10 show my support to all you guys here, but stop the
11 division, stop the bullshit, all right? Stop it,
12 okay? Thank you so much...

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

14 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: And enjoy your
15 day.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

17 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Thank you,
18 Brooks-Powers. Enjoy your day. I support Intro. 1132.
19 Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

21 Next.

22 ANWAAR MALIK: Okay. My name is Anwaar
23 Malik. I'm going to start off by saying every driver
24 needs a break and parking to take better care of
25 their health. We're not asking for a lot, just to be

2 allowed to work more safely by taking breaks without
3 stress. Drivers worry about drinking water because
4 they would have to use the restroom, and that
5 ultimately takes a toll on their health. Kidney
6 failure, other organ failures, diabetes, and so much
7 more. I've seen countless, like probably at least two
8 dozen drivers with diabetes in this industry, get it
9 because of this industry. You guys have the power to
10 pass this bill, and don't let another driver go
11 through health issues under your watch. The, what do
12 you call it, quote from Dr. Sarah Battistich,
13 Director of IDG's Worker Healthy Living Program. She
14 says, one of the trademarks of a modern society is
15 regular access to clean water and sanitary bathrooms.
16 Denying access to these basic services can create a
17 public health issue. Without easy access to clean
18 restrooms, people run the risk of contracting bladder
19 and urinary tract infection, as well as bowel
20 problems. For-hire vehicle drivers keep our city
21 running. Ensuring that drivers have access to
22 facilities to eat, rest, and use the bathrooms is
23 about treating them as the essential workers they are
24 and will be a powerful step towards treating them

2 with the dignity and respect they deserve. All for
3 it, for Intro. 1000.

4 The second stress is about Waymo, self-
5 driving cars. How much time do I have left? You guys
6 gotta watch out for us, for (TIMER CHIME) all the
7 taxi drivers.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

9 ANWAAR MALIK: Thanks.

10 KHALID KHATTAK: I think it's afternoon
11 already, so good afternoon to everybody. My name is
12 Khalid Khattak, and I am an Uber and Lyft driver.
13 There are so many other concerns, of course, that we
14 face on a daily basis, but one of the main concerns
15 is the bathrooms and the parking areas for the Uber
16 and Lyft drivers, and all the other, of course, the
17 yellow cab, green cab, and all the other drivers.
18 Besides that, one of the guys just gave testimony
19 saying that he had to go to Queens. I don't know if
20 he went there once or twice, but in my case, I always
21 either try to go to Queens or Brooklyn to be out of
22 the city so at least I can use a restroom in peace
23 without worrying for getting a ticket for 150-some
24 dollars. Or parking, even if I have to go and get me
25 something, there is no room or there is no specific

2 areas for us to park. Besides that, besides going to
3 the bathroom or getting something to drink or eat, we
4 have so many, of course, that's what makes America
5 great because there are all different races,
6 different nationalities, different religions under
7 just one roof all the time. We have guys that would
8 like to take a prayer break. Earlier, a brother
9 mentioned, one of the drivers mentioned that 30
10 minutes is not enough, he was asking for 90 minutes.
11 I won't go to that extent to have a 90-minute break
12 because taking a 90-minute break, that means I'll be
13 losing money if I'm on a 90-minute break. So at
14 least, if not 30 minutes, we also would like to
15 extend this if we have some religious obligations
16 instead of standing on a sidewalk and doing our
17 religious obligations. If we have the time, 40
18 minutes, maybe 45 minutes, we go and at least (TIMER
19 CHIME) utilize that time towards our prayer as well.
20 And I'm in full support of the Intro. 1000. Thank
21 you.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so
23 much.

24 LARBI AITAABOU: Good afternoon, I just
25 want to apologize for the Chamber. It's 210 years old

2 and people with profanity coming and saying, this is
3 such a disgrace to people coming here. And
4 disrespecting a 210 years old building. If the
5 building can speak, it would throw you out. But the
6 subject of today is an issue that it's been for far
7 too long, something that is devastating to drivers,
8 including myself. When I started driving in 2007, I
9 faced tickets left and right. I was not familiar with
10 the ticket system in New York City until I got the
11 ticket on my mail, and it was quite devastating. You
12 work the whole day, you're about to make 200, 300
13 dollars to go home and then you hit with 115 dollars
14 tickets, if not even more tickets in the mail that
15 you don't know about. One of the issues that
16 everybody is addressing today is the bathroom, but
17 this is not about the bathroom only, right? This is
18 about human dignity, right? If I need to use the
19 bathroom right now, I can just close this mic and go
20 to the bathroom. But if I'm driving my vehicle and I
21 cannot park my car, you know the stress that's going
22 to cause me? Because the fear that I will have to
23 have to pay the City 115 dollars on a daily basis
24 just for me to use the bathroom, that's unacceptable.
25 And I said this again and again, we need to pass this

2 bill. And Chairwoman, you've been in this Chamber for
3 a long time, and you understand the struggle that
4 drivers are going through on a daily basis. So this
5 is not a fact that I need to put on the table for
6 you, because you understand the struggle already. But
7 what is important is that this bill, Intro. 1000,
8 passed yesterday before today. And I thank you for
9 your time.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
11 that.

12 CHAMBERS: (APPLAUSE)

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Please refrain
14 from clapping or you'll be removed from the Chamber.

15 Thank you to the panel.

16 We'll now hear from the next panel, which
17 will be Shrazo (phonetic), Sharif maybe, Toybayev
18 (phonetic), Liakat Lia, Henry Zhu (phonetic), Rangui
19 Ji (phonetic), Fong Meng (phonetic). Okay, I'm going
20 to try this again. Shrazo Toybayev, Henry Zhu, Rangui
21 Ji, Fong Meng, Zio Langpeng (phonetic), Sonam Lama,
22 David Obeissant, Pedro Acosta, Zio Langpeng, Zio
23 Langpeng, Manje Kamel Zegrar.

2 You may begin when you come off of mute.

3 I just ask that you adhere to the-two minute rule.

4 You may begin.

5 Please turn the mic on.

6 LIAKAT ALI: Okay.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: There you go.

8 LIAKAT ALI: Good afternoon, Chair,
9 Council Members. My name is Liakat Ali. I'm a proud
10 member of the Independence Drivers Guild and have
11 been a full time for-hire vehicle driver in New York
12 City for over two decades. I come before you today
13 not just a driver, but as a father, a provider, and a
14 human being asking for dignity. There are over
15 100,000 active FHV drivers in New York City. Most of
16 us work 10- to 12-hour shifts, often without a legal
17 place to stop and use the restroom. For drivers with
18 medical conditions, especially diabetes or prostate
19 issues, which are common among men over 50, timely
20 access to restroom is not optional. It's a matter of
21 health and survival. Holding urine for extended
22 periods can lead to urinary tract infections, kidney
23 damages, and also chronic conditions. Ignoring these
24 needs put our long-term well-being at serious risk.
25 We are not asking for a special treatment. We're

2 asking for the right to briefly park on metered
3 commercial parking zones so we can access restrooms
4 without fear of tickets or harassment. But parking
5 alone is not enough. We also urge the City to mandate
6 that restaurants allow FHV drivers access to their
7 restrooms. Currently most restaurants restrict
8 restrooms to paying customers. And many of us are
9 turned away even when we offer to pay. I am 58 years
10 old and I need to stay healthy so I can continue
11 driving for at least another five, six years to
12 support my five members family. I pay taxes, I follow
13 the rules, but the City must recognize our humanity.
14 This bill is not just about parking, it's about
15 public health, worker dignity, and basic human
16 rights. Please stand with us. Pass this bill on
17 humanitarian grounds. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

19 DAVID OBEISSANT: Good afternoon, my name
20 is David, David Obeissant. Thank you for everyone who
21 speak before me. I think this bill already passed. I
22 don't have to repeat everything people already said.
23 One thing to you what I'm gonna put on the table
24 right now is S, T, and B. The S is safety. I think
25 New York City is gonna be the most safety city in the

2 world. But for us drivers, we all, every day, we try
3 for safety. Now, I think the most important thing for
4 us is those driver who speak before me, I think they
5 mention about the safety issue now. The second word
6 is T, the time. For most of 10 or 15 years, I think
7 the DOT and the Commissioner was working on those
8 data. Then don't give a special detail about those
9 data. That's time limit now. And the third one is
10 about when you said safety and time. Now, I don't
11 know what gonna be the next gonna be doing now,
12 because they try to put our job on jeopardy now, to
13 board some Uber driver on the city. I don't know how
14 those safety is gonna be an issue for us. And looking
15 forward, anyone who's driving need some time. And the
16 time is for ourself and for our family. We bring so
17 many, so much money on the table for the City. I
18 think we didn't deserve those little bill like this
19 one. Like I said before, this bill already passed. I
20 don't have to repeat all those things. Thank you for
21 the safety. Thank you for your time. And thank you so
22 much.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

24 SONAM LAMA: Hello. Good morning,
25 everyone. My name is Sonam Lama. I'm a proud member

2 of Independent Driver Guild, a driver advocate, an
3 FHV driver. I'd like to thank your Chair Committee
4 Honorable Council Member Selena Brooks, your Staffs
5 and your Colleagues for giving this opportunity to
6 testify. I also don't want to miss some of the
7 Council Members who has been a fighter behind us.
8 Pedro and I, we have been reaching out to all the
9 City Council Members, and we did email you as well,
10 however we didn't get it. But most of the City
11 Council Members did respond to us and we went there.
12 And I think now we have nine co-sponsors for this
13 bill. They were all amazing. They welcomed in their
14 office and they gave us a very good hospitable
15 because they know that we are fighting for basic
16 needs. I'm a driver advocate. I always walk with my
17 members. Yesterday I slept around 2 a.m. and woke up
18 around 5 a.m. I had a very bad like food that I ate
19 during midnight, and guess what? Today I'm happy
20 because I'm inside this room because I get to get a
21 good bathroom and I use three times. This is the real
22 example because I lead myself as an example and I
23 give you a fair example what happened. And it's not
24 about something that we are asking or looking to
25 chase. It's just the basic things that we're asking

for in front of Chairwoman. I know you are a champion for people like us. We were here when we celebrated the festival and our lunar commercial parking stuff. We saw you. I was very happy. And just wanted to just let you know that as a TLC vehicle, we pay commercial license fee, we pay commercial registration, and we do pay commercial, what do you call it, the insurance as well, but we excluded to park in commercial parking space. All we asking for 30 minutes, not more than that. And definitely it's gonna help a lot of drivers. Drivers cannot afford (TIMER CHIME) to get diabetes or kidney issues, and please do support Intro. 1000. Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

PEDRO ACOSTA: Hello. Good morning everybody. Thank you for giving me the opportunity to talk about this so important bill. My name is Pedro Acosta, and I have been driving for more than 25 years already. I am here to support strongly the Intro. 1000. It's something that we need for our health. And I want to remind you that we are essential workers. And we have contributed to the City more than a billion dollars in 2018 when they implemented the congestion tax so we have been

putting to the City a lot. Remember, we are servicing every day more than 27,000, almost 28,000 dispatch trip by the MTA SSRI. Most of those trips are for people with elderly people or people with disabilities who come from different boroughs to the city. So we need to be in the city so when they call back to get back to the town, to the boroughs, we have to be in the city. So if we don't have access to the bathroom, we have to be going out from the city to Brooklyn or to Queens to use the bathroom. So we need to have access to those commercial spaces here in the city so we don't have to be out when somebody needs our service. I want to remind you, like my brother Sonam told you, we pay commercial insurance. We pay the average of 8,000 dollars insurance every year while regular insurance is about probably 1,500 dollars, I mean, yeah, 2,000 dollars a year. We pay also a commercial registration, which is about 476 dollars every year when a regular registration is maybe 120 every two years. So we also pay a commercial license to TLC. Without it, we cannot do this work. So we need this to pass, and we encourage you (TIMER CHIME) to help us do this. Thank you very much. Bye bye now.

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

3 Next.

4 MANJE KAMEL ZEGRAR: Good afternoon,
5 everyone. My name is Manje Kamel Zegrar. I'm a TLC
6 driver and FHV driver since 2017. I advocate for
7 driver too, and thank you for the opportunity to give
8 us to speak today. This bill is actually essential to
9 the driver, like driver is essential to the city. I
10 totally 100 percent agree with all my fellow drivers.
11 This bill will protect us, not only us, our health
12 too. I will take the opportunity to speak about since
13 my fellow drivers said everything I want to say, and
14 I still have one minute so I would like to speak
15 about another issue, which is a robot taxi. And this
16 Waymo is coming here to the city and they're going to
17 take... obviously, they're going to take our jobs. So I
18 drive EV, Tesla car for a year, and I always use
19 self-driver to see when is the extermination of our
20 driver and when our family is going to starve because
21 the Waymo. But the truth about, I want to know, who
22 did give the test and approved for these cars, where
23 those cars, I'm going to say this because I know New
24 Yorkers care about their pets and their kids. So me
25 driving self-driving, I have noticed that those car,

2 I'm talking about Tesla that often 30 dollars to do a
3 test in New York City, does not recognize dogs, does
4 not organize stroller. So if you see somebody
5 crossing intersection with dog, the car does not see
6 the dog. I drive Tesla, I was going to bring those
7 documentations so you see exactly what I'm talking
8 about, but I can bring more evidence to show.

9 Stroller too. It's like if two people crossing (TIMER
10 CHIME) and having stroller, you see just two people
11 crossing.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

13 MANJE KAMEL ZEGRAR: You are very welcome.
14 Thank you for the opportunity.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Yes. Thank
16 you. Thank you to this panel.

17 The next panel we'll have will include
18 Jacky Lin, Kevin Zhang, Lisa Rosa, Desmond West, Paul
19 Bader, Jimo Uli (phonetic), and I'm sorry, I cannot
20 read the last name.

21 You can get started. Just come off of
22 mute. Ask everybody adhere to the two-minute rule.

23 If you have testimony that goes over two
24 minutes, you can always submit written testimony to
25 be a part of the record. Thank you.

2 LISA ROSA: Good afternoon, everyone.

3 Thank you for this hearing and thank you for having
4 me. I'd like to start off with a joke that I would
5 always say. In New York, you either have 90 jobs or
6 90 roommates. I happen to have 90 jobs. And with that
7 being said, I've been a TLC rideshare driver for a
8 little bit over 10 years. I've always had an
9 entrepreneurial spirit. I've been a concierge for
10 residential high rise luxury buildings in New York
11 City for 20 years. I've always had a love for TLC
12 driving because it's always been a security blanket
13 for me. When I became a mom for the first time, it
14 allowed me to have flexible hours. When I wanted to
15 pursue anything entrepreneurial, it allowed me to do
16 so. When I would work for employment and I was being
17 treated unfairly for whatever reasons, I always had a
18 security net so that you know what, I didn't really
19 need the job so it always was my escape route to just
20 still be able to make ends meet. Just last week, I
21 was wrongfully terminated from my concierge position.
22 I was making top pay. You know, we were fighting to
23 go union and for them to unionize, I was terminated.
24 Right now, I'm fighting that case as well. But you
25 know what, if I didn't have the TLC opportunity, I

2 wouldn't be able to pay my bills off of unemployment
3 with a cap of 500 dollars. You know, 500 dollars, I
4 go to the supermarket, I buy three items and that's
5 already half my bill right there. Like, let alone pay
6 a bill, pay rent, you know. You know, let's not
7 forget, we're the ones that keep everyone going. We
8 take you places. You know, we were here when the
9 world was shut down. We were here during COVID. We
10 were here when we didn't know what the virus was. We
11 were here. We were still moving. We were out there.
12 We didn't know what we were dealing with and we were
13 there. We didn't have any relief. You know, we were
14 still paying our fees, still paying insurance. Right
15 now, I'm paying 5,000 dollars a year for insurance.
16 (TIMER CHIME) You know, when I go outside just for
17 the day, you know, it's like a battlefield out there
18 and we're under attack.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. I
20 just ask that if you could submit the rest of your
21 testimony in writing. And just to be clear, is there
22 a piece of legislation that you are supporting?

23 LISA ROSA: Yeah, I want to say no to
24 Waymo. I need my job. I need job security. I need
25

2 parking. I need release. I have perimenopause. I have
3 a deep bladder.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Anything in
5 terms of the legislation being heard today, support
6 or no support? Do you?

7 LISA ROSA: 1,000 percent support
8 (INAUDIBLE).

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
10 Thank you so much.

11 LISA ROSA: You're welcome. Good morning,
12 Mrs. Chairwoman. My name is Desmond West. I'm the
13 owner of Royal Roads Transportation, a commuter van
14 that operates in Brooklyn. I want to also say thank
15 you to the Governor for bringing in the Commuter Van
16 Stabilization Program. And I want to commend you for
17 trying to bring the commuter van up to standard where
18 it's supposed to be. But we cannot make progress
19 without enforcement. That is a key to bring back the
20 illegals back to being legal. Because there's a lot
21 of guys out there that once they test the waters of
22 being illegal, it is more profitable being illegal
23 than being legal even with the subsidy that they get
24 from the Governor. So the only way that they can come
25 back into the fold is through enforcement. Right now

2 on Flatbush Avenue, there's only three legal vans and
3 over 250 illegal vans. The DOT Commissioner state
4 that they made enforcement, nine enforcements through
5 the year on commuter vans. This is the ninth month.
6 That means there's only one enforcement per month.
7 But there was only one enforcement on Flatbush for
8 the whole year so far. And these guys, when the
9 enforcement come, they don't leave because there's
10 only one or two or three cars. They can work around
11 that. They have their cell phone that they mobilize
12 each other and come back. If they know where the
13 police are working, they detour them and come back
14 around because there's not enough enforcement out
15 there to stop them. So I want to commend you and the
16 Governor for what you're doing, but we need more from
17 TLC (TIMER CHIME) and NYPD.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

19 PAUL BADER: (INAUDIBLE)

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Please turn
21 the mic on.

22 PAUL BADER: Certainly, of course. I
23 should be used to this by now. Nice to see you again,
24 Madam Chair. My name is Paul Bader. I'm a lifelong
25 New Yorker. I'm a former driving instructor in the

2 City of New York. I'm a former truck driver in the
3 City of New York. I'm a former taxi driver in the
4 City of New York. And I have the honor of being the
5 official designee of the City Council Delegation of
6 Queens, as you know, to be the Queens Commissioner on
7 the TLC at the current time for the next few years,
8 but I want to make it clear that today I'm speaking
9 on behalf of myself individually, not on behalf of
10 the TLC, which was earlier represented by our Chair.
11 I'm here to speak on all five issues quickly as I
12 can. Some take a little more time than others.

13 Relative to Local Law 1347, which was
14 referenced earlier, which had to do with enforcing
15 violations of unlicensed commuter vans. Personally,
16 yes, I am in favor of that. And as it also has been
17 said earlier, we would like to see that expanded. We
18 have major problems, particularly at the airports
19 relative to, in spite of the fact we have 100,000
20 plus licensed vehicles picking up passengers, we
21 still have a huge problem at the airports with
22 unlicensed cars and drivers who are very aggressive
23 in going after, particularly international travelers
24 who arrive in the city, to a particular problem of
25

2 JFK more than LaGuardia. But if we could wrap that
3 in, that would be a big advantage.

4 Local Law 1346, to relation required
5 study, is also something that corresponds with that.
6 And yes, of course, I'm in favor of that.

7 The 115, which has to do with an app. I
8 think that this is going to be very important. We are
9 going to have to see what we're going to do relative
10 to the increase in the number of EVs that are used
11 for for-hire vehicles (TIMER CHIME) particularly. But
12 I think that the challenge is going to be, and
13 addressed in this app, is the differentiation between
14 an EV charging station for a taxi.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm just going
16 to ask you to wrap up. If you could submit the rest
17 of your testimony in writing.

18 PAUL BADER: Don't I get two minutes, I
19 thought, for each piece of legislation?

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: No, you get
21 two minutes for the whole. Thank you, Mr. Bader, but
22 you can submit the rest of the writing.

23 PAUL BADER: I have nothing. Can I speak
24 on the other two quickly, please?

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: No, because I
3 want to respect everyone's time. It's the same rules
4 for everyone here. But we can get it in writing. I
5 appreciate you testifying. Thank you, Mr. Bader.

6 PAUL BADER: Wow.

7 KEVIN ZHANG: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: You're going
9 to translate?

10 JACKY LIN (INTERPRETER): Yeah. Hello,
11 everyone. I'm a ride-hailing driver and I have come
12 here today to support the Intro. 1000 bill and
13 strongly urge the passage of this bill at the
14 hearing. I'm grateful for the opportunity to speak.
15 As you all know, it is extremely difficult to find a
16 legal parking spot in New York City, especially
17 Manhattan. It is particular challenging for ride-
18 hailing drivers as there are insufficient areas for
19 them to park and rest. Only a few designated spots
20 are available for ride-hailing drivers, but there are
21 thousands of ride-hailing vehicles in New York City.
22 As a result, the drivers face significant issues when
23 it comes to resting, buying food, eating, and using
24 the restroom. Once when I was in Manhattan, I
25 suddenly experienced severe stomach pain and needed

to use the restroom. However, I couldn't find a legal parking spot after walking several blocks. I finally found a public restroom. I circled around the area nearby the restroom for three times and I still couldn't find a legal parking spot. In the end, I had no choice but to find a parking spot and then walk to the restroom. When I returned, I had a 115-dollar ticket that was placed on my windshield. The ticket was extremely. A single parking spot costing the equivalent of my entire daily wage minus the expenses. Not only did I waste money but I also wasted my time. Drivers cannot get proper rest, and the inability to use the restroom for an extended period poses risks to their health. Not having a legal parking spot available when needed can lead to severe physical health issues. Our ride-hailing drivers ensure the smooth functioning of the city, and it is not only fair that they also enjoy a normal working environment. Intro. 1000 is a smart and straightforward idea that will benefit all New Yorkers and ride-hailing drivers in the city. I am grateful for the Committee and ask you to support this bill. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 110

2 JACKY LIN: Then my turn?

3 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Give me your
4 name.

5 JACKY LIN: Jacky.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Go ahead.

7 JACKY LIN: Good afternoon, Councilman. My
8 name is Jacky and I'm a for-hire vehicle driver and
9 organizer with Independent Drivers Guild. I'm here
10 today to speak on behalf of thousands of drivers who
11 face real-life challenges every day, especially
12 around something as basic as parking and taking a
13 break. In places like Manhattan, drivers have nowhere
14 to stop, no access to restrooms, or even a place to
15 grab a quick coffee without the risk of a 115-dollar
16 ticket. These fines don't only hurt our wallets, they
17 punish us for trying to meet basic human needs. No
18 one should have to choose between their health and
19 their jobs. This is more than an inconvenience, it's
20 a matter of dignity. Drivers need safe, legal spaces
21 to pause without fear of fines. We are working long
22 hours to support our families, and the system makes
23 that harder than it needs to be. We are deeply
24 concerned about the expansion of autonomous vehicles
25 testing in our cities as well. Companies like Waymo

2 are not here to share the road, they are here to
3 replace workers. They put thousands of drivers'
4 livelihood at risk. As a City, we should be
5 protecting jobs, not paving way for their
6 elimination. You know the saying, you give them an
7 inch, they take a mile. That's exactly what Waymo and
8 the other autonomous vehicle companies are going to
9 do.

10 And finally, I want to raise another
11 issue about accidents involving passengers who are
12 dooring cyclists. Even though it's affecting the
13 drivers in a way of them not being able to buy
14 insurance afterwards. It's not the driver's fault,
15 it's the passenger's fault. They're the one that
16 opened the door without having to look on what
17 happens afterwards. And with the current TLC rules,
18 drivers are often penalized if they are locking
19 drivers in the vehicles while they do so. It's
20 clearly not their fault. So, a single incident can
21 lead to a TLC insurance company blacklisting the
22 drivers and not able for them to buy TLC insurance,
23 even regular insurance. They have to fall back on New
24 York State insurance, which is extremely expensive. A
25 loss that nearly impossible for drivers to recover,

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 112

2 because they have no more jobs after that. They
3 cannot join to another insurance company at all for
4 at least five years. (TIMER CHIME) Well, thank you
5 very much for your time.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

7 Next, we will hear from Corey Bearak.

8 Thank you to the panel.

9 COREY BEARAK: I'm ready to go.

10 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

11 COREY BEARAK: Thank you. Amalgamated
12 Transit Union thanks the Majority Whip Selvena
13 Brooks-Powers and the Council Committee on
14 Transportation and Infrastructure for this
15 opportunity to share ATU's ongoing concerns on the
16 impact of vans that operate illegally on MTA bus
17 service, particularly for the residents of Southeast
18 Queens. This afternoon, I'm representing Luis
19 Salzade, the ATU Local 1056 President and Business
20 Agent and ATU New York State Legislative Conference
21 Board Financial Secretary. I also deliver this
22 testimony on behalf of Conference Board President Tom
23 Mason and ATU Local 726, 1179, and 1181, all of our
24 members serve the riding public. ATU remains
25 concerned about efforts that would effectively allow

vans to replace bus public transit, especially in Southeast Queens. We frequently testified how vans licensed and unlicensed illegally and unsafely operate along bus routes and deprived the MTA of revenue that it can reinvest in bus service. This de facto privatization of bus service in Southeast Queens especially impacts students, our seniors, working people, and bus riders who benefit from the Fair Fares program. Public transit serves as a lifeline for many New Yorkers to shop, see their doctor, attend worship services, visit family members, and do many of the things that enrich their lives. Working families need safe, equitable, and efficient transportation. More often than not, including in Queens, that means reliance on our existing bus public transit system operated by the MTA. Illegally operating vans, unlike MTA buses, remain ADA inaccessible and foster more congestion along bus routes and at already heavily congested bus and subway transit hubs. These vans are often raced along city streets, putting all at risk and causing many pedestrian accidents. ATU made these and other points at meetings of the Commuter (TIMER CHIME) Vans Working Group...

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 114

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you. Your time
3 has expired.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
5 Corey. You can submit the rest in writing.

6 I just have a follow up question for you.
7 Can you please state whether or not ATU is in support
8 or opposition of the two commuter van bills being
9 heard today?

10 COREY BEARAK: Yes, I can. That was what I
11 was going to say next before being cut off, that we
12 support Intro. 1346 and 1347. But on 1347, we
13 recommend that the study also includes enforcement.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Got it. Thank
15 you so much, Corey.

16 COREY BEARAK: (INAUDIBLE)

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sorry.

18 COREY BEARAK: And we'll submit the whole
19 document in writing.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Perfect. Thank
21 you.

22 Next, we'll hear from Michael Simon.

23 MICHAEL SIMON: Well, thank you so much.
24 Can you hear me?
25

2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Yeah. If you
3 could talk a little bit louder, that'd be helpful for
4 me.

5 MICHAEL SIMON: Okay. I will try. I wasn't
6 expecting to be called right now, but let me put
7 things together. Okay, so in the 1930s or so, they
8 created the medallion to ease congestion, and that
9 meant that if you wanted to be a taxi, you had to be
10 a medallion instead of just having a car. And then at
11 some point after that, they made an allowance for a
12 base, a base with cars that weren't taxis. The
13 creation of bases was not meant to be added taxis.
14 These cars were summoned from the base to the
15 passenger, picked you up, dropped you, and then the
16 car coming back to the base. These cars were not
17 given the right to cruise, which is the basic problem
18 with what's going on right now, because if you
19 cruise, you need a place to park and you need a place
20 to go to the bathroom. It was a clear distinction
21 between the base form of transportation and cruising
22 taxis. That distinction became blurred when the City
23 Council okayed the use of black cars to wander, to
24 cruise, looking for an e-hail like taxis, using an
25 app like a street hail instead of returning to the

2 base where, by the way, the base had provided
3 bathrooms. Let's go back to the 1930s when the
4 aldermen issued medallions under Mayor Fiorello
5 LaGuardia and let's say that the e-hail was available
6 then as now. Would aldermen have created a category
7 of licenses called high volume for-hire vehicles
8 along with taxi medallions if medallions were able to
9 use the e-hails as well? I sincerely think no. Easing
10 congestion was the primary motive back then as it is
11 now. Why would they have created more vehicles or an
12 extra class of vehicles when medallions were able to
13 do it? Because the City approved the use of black
14 cars to cruise, that is why there is such an ongoing
15 issue about those drivers going to the bathrooms. The
16 base should be providing bathrooms to the drivers.
17 And once the car drops off the fare, they should be
18 heading back.

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you so much. Your
20 time has expired.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

22 CHAMBERS: (INAUDIBLE)

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sergeants, I
24 ask that you remove anyone that is making noise at
25 this time in the Chamber.

2 If we have inadvertently missed anyone
3 that has registered to testify today and has yet to
4 be, and has yet to have been called, please use the
5 Zoom hand function if you are testifying remotely and
6 you will be called in the order that your hand has
7 been raised. If you are testifying in person, please
8 come to the dais.

9 Hearing none, I thank everyone who took
10 time out today to come and testify. For those who
11 have been unable to testify or was unable to provide
12 their entire testimony, we encourage you to submit it
13 in writing to testimony@council.nyc.gov. And again,
14 we thank everyone for their participation in today's
15 hearing.

16 This hearing is now closed. [GAVEL]
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date September 18, 2025