



# sanitation

Kathryn Garcia Commissioner

## Testimony of Kathryn Garcia, Commissioner New York City Department of Sanitation

### Hearing on the FY 2018 Preliminary Budget, Mayor's FY 2017 Preliminary Management Report and Agency Oversight Hearing before the New York City Council Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management

Monday, March 27, 2017  
1:00 P.M.  
City Hall, Council Chambers

---

Good afternoon Chairman Reynoso and members of the City Council Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management. I am Kathryn Garcia, Commissioner of the New York City Department of Sanitation. Thank you for the opportunity to discuss the Department's portion of the Mayor's Fiscal Year 2018 Preliminary Budget, the Mayor's FY 2017 Preliminary Management Report, and to update you on the Department's progress and accomplishments during the past year. I am joined by Dennis Diggins, First Deputy Commissioner, and Larry Cipollina, Deputy Commissioner for Administration and Financial Management.

As you know, the Department's mission is to keep New York City healthy, safe and clean, and we are committed to conducting our operations as sustainably, responsibly and efficiently as possible. Our fleet of over 3,000 vehicles and equipment meets the highest clean air emissions standards. Our organics collection program continues to expand to reach more New York residents. Our recent launch of the commercial organics program and our new commercial recycling regulations that will take effect this summer help to bring businesses in line with our zero waste goals. Together, these and other initiatives have helped the City move forward on a path to achieving zero waste to landfills by 2030.

#### **Preliminary FY 2018 Expense Budget Highlights and Achievements**

In pursuing our agency objectives, the Department's FY 18 Preliminary Budget commits funds to numerous programs, ranging from major capital investments to the implementation of programs vital to our mission. The FY 18 Preliminary Budget proposes to allocate a total of \$1.68 billion in operating funds for the Department to provide the agency's core waste collection and disposal services, street cleaning and snow operations. These funds include:

- o \$1.7 million under the Mayor's CleaNYC initiative to continue Sunday and holiday basket collection service in commercial areas, transportation hubs and BIDs, and to continue supplemental highway ramp cleaning; and
- o \$392.4 million in export tipping fees for the Department to continue its current interim and long-term export operations.

Additionally, the Preliminary Budget allocates \$1.25 million in FY 18 to begin the implementation process for commercial waste zones in New York City. Last year the Department, in partnership with the New York City Business Integrity Commission, conducted a year-long study and determined that establishing commercial waste collection zones could significantly reduce truck traffic and vehicle emissions associated with the private carting industry, and we look forward to working with the Council and a range of stakeholders in developing the implementation plan for this new strategy.

We are proud that New York City continues to be a leader in recycling and sustainability. To bolster our leadership position, the Department is committed to identifying new strategies that will strengthen and increase public recycling awareness and participation. The FY 18 Preliminary Budget allocates a total of \$52.6 million to the Department's Bureau of Recycling and Sustainability for waste prevention, recycling and sustainability programs, including outreach and education, organics and community composting, textiles, electronic waste, harmful household products, reuse and donations, and zero waste schools, in addition to our recycling processing costs.

As you know, the Department continues to expand its voluntary residential organics collection program. Today, nearly one million residents citywide now have access to organics collection service, making our program the largest municipal curbside organics collection program in the country. Just last week, the Department announced its 2017 curbside organics collection expansion plan, which will start in five community boards in Brooklyn later this spring – districts 1 and 16 in May and districts 2, 13 and 15 in June. By the end of 2017, nearly 3.3 million New Yorkers will have regular curbside organics collection service from the Department. We are on track to grow our organics initiatives to serve all New Yorkers by the end of 2018 with either curbside service or convenient neighborhood drop-off sites.

From the inception of our current organics programs in 2012, through March 21, 2017, the Department has collected over 60,000 tons of organic material from participating households, schools and agencies. This includes nearly 18,000 tons from the school program, and over 27,000 tons from residential buildings. During this same period, the Department collected almost 2,000 tons from green market drop-off sites serviced by the Department, over 3,000 tons of Fall leaves, and over 10,000 tons of Christmas trees through our annual January collection program.

Additionally, all New York City schools participate in recycling, and this year we launched the first 100 Zero Waste Schools in Manhattan and Brooklyn to target intensive outreach to students, educators and staff to divert all recyclable or compostable materials from these schools within five years.

In FY 17, the Department also began a targeted outreach program in community districts having the lowest recycling diversion rates by dedicating outreach personnel to help building management, staff and residents increase recycling participation. In addition, the Department and NYCHA have partnered to launch recycling collection service to all NYCHA developments. In the past year the Department has worked closely with NYCHA to complete the first phase of NYCHA Recycles!, and I'm proud to say that as of the end of last year *all NYCHA residents* have access to recycling services. We are working with NYCHA to continue to develop new approaches for resident outreach and engagement to increase recycling diversion at NYCHA developments. As part of this effort, we have worked with GrowNYC to develop the

“Environmental Ambassador” program that trains and supports NYCHA residents interested in helping their neighbors to recycle.

Turning now to snow operations, the Department’s proposed preliminary snow budget in FY 18 is approximately \$87.6 million. The adopted snow budget for FY 17 is \$88.1 million, though our estimated expenditures now stand at approximately \$89.4 million to date for this snow season. Although Winter Storm Stella this month was less severe than anticipated by meteorologists, it still produced a heavy mix of snow, ice, sleet, heavy winds and frigid temperatures that required full mobilization of plowing, de-icing and hauling operations. The official total snowfall accumulation for the City during the 2016-2017 snow season currently stands at 30.5 inches.

### **Ten-year Capital Budget Highlights**

The Department’s preliminary ten-year capital strategy includes approximately \$303.5 million for projects in FY 18. The capital ten-year plan also includes funding for the construction of new garages to serve the community districts of Bronx 9, 10 and 11; Staten Island 1; Brooklyn 3; Manhattan 6 and 8; and Manhattan 11. In addition, the plan includes funding in all years of the plan to achieve proper replacement cycles on the Department’s fleet of more than 2,200 rear-loader and dual-bin collection trucks.

The FY 2018 Preliminary Budget also allocates \$26.6 million in capital funds to continue construction of the Department’s marine transfer stations in accordance with the City’s approved Solid Waste Management Plan (SWMP). The Department expects to open the Hamilton Avenue marine transfer station later this year, pending the completion of a service contract for the transport and disposal of waste from that facility. Construction of the Southwest Brooklyn MTS is also underway and we expect it to be completed by the end of 2018. Construction of the East 91<sup>st</sup> Street MTS continues with expected completion by the end of 2018, and construction of the alternate ramp on East 92<sup>nd</sup> Street will begin in 2019.

The completion of these facilities is the final step in implementing the City’s comprehensive Solid Waste Management Plan, a fair and equitable five-borough plan to sustainably export waste from the city by rail and barge. The initiatives outlined in the SWMP will together reduce truck traffic in and around New York City by more than 5 million miles per year, reduce greenhouse gas emissions by 34,000 tons per year and contribute to a more equitable distribution of waste management infrastructure in New York City.

### **Mayor’s FY 2017 Preliminary Management Report**

The Department considers the Mayor’s Management Report (MMR) to be an important management tool. Since the Department, by its nature, is very service-oriented, the information contained in the MMR assists Department managers in regularly evaluating and monitoring agency programs, goals and objectives, especially in key service areas.

Continuing our emphasis on street cleanliness, in the first four months of FY 17 the Department achieved a citywide average scorecard rating of 96.1%, compared to 94.4% during the same period last year, and the highest for the same four-month period in more than seven years since FY 10. Incidentally, there has never been a same four-month period during any fiscal year since the scorecard program began in 1975 that was higher than 96.1%.

As a result of our ongoing focus on zero waste programs, the curbside and containerized recycling diversion rate increased from 16.1% during the first four months of FY 16 to 16.8% during the same period in FY 17. This is a positive sign of strong growth in both our traditional recycling programs and our expanding organics pilot collection program.

**Closing Remarks**

In closing, I wish to thank Chair Reynoso and the Council for continuing to work with us as a close partner and for your support and commitment to our programs and policies. We look forward to working with all interested parties to finalize the budget in the coming few months. I am now happy to answer your questions.

**TESTIMONY OF HARRY NESPOLI**

**PRESIDENT UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSOCIATION,  
LOCAL 831, INTERNATIONAL BROTHERHOOD OF TEAMSTERS  
BEFORE**

**NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE  
MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE HEARING  
ON  
FY2018 PRELIMINARY BUDGET**

**HON. ANTONIO REYNOSO  
CHAIRPERSON**

**MARCH 27, 2017**

Good afternoon Chairperson Reynoso, members of the committee and all others here today. I want to thank you for this opportunity to be heard here today. I am especially pleased to be here, because I have come here to say thank you.

I have been president of the Uniformed Sanitationmen's Association for nearly 15 years and more often than not I have come to these budget hearings seeking your help. Whether we needed to expand our headcount, purchase new trucks for our fleet; provide separate shower and locker rooms for our union sisters; or provide a new piece of equipment to help with snow removal on smaller, narrow streets and cul-de-sacs, this Council and this Administration has been there for us.

Thanks to the benefit of new equipment our members were able to stay ahead of the recent snowstorm.

Yet even with our headcount of 6,300, we are reaching a point where we simply don't have the numbers to handle the increased workload. We need more people.

Let me explain, over the course of the past few years our day-to-day responsibilities have continued to expand. For example:

- Under NYC Clean program the Council has provided \$2.6 million for the pick-up of commercial baskets and additional street clean-ups
- Our members now perform clean-ups of some highway ramps and underpasses
- Beyond regular residential pick-ups we now are responsible for recycling; composting; and e-waste pick-ups

Our members work very hard, and we are proud of the work we perform every day. The men and women of our department remain ready to respond and clean-up in the aftermath of a blizzard, a hurricane, a tornado and, hopefully, a ticker-tape parade to two.

We will need the necessary headcount to do the job right!

Finally, if there is one overriding issue of concern it is to provide adequate locker room and shower facilities for our women members. As you know we have more than 170 women in our department; and by the way, more than 7,000 women participated in the most recent exam.

Women have been with our department for so long now some have reached 20 years and are eligible to retire.

Yet, nearly all of those women have never had adequate shower or locker room facilities. This Council has recognized the problem, and has provided the department with funding to correct this inequity. We need to provide these women with the dignity and respect they earn every day.

Thank you.



The City of New York  
**BUSINESS INTEGRITY COMMISSION**  
100 Church Street · 20th Floor  
New York · New York 10007

Daniel D. Brownell  
*Commissioner and Chair*

**Testimony of Commissioner Daniel D. Brownell of  
the New York City Business Integrity Commission before  
the Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management of  
the New York City Council on the Fiscal Year 2018 Preliminary Budget and  
the Mayor's Fiscal Year 2017 Preliminary Management Report**

**March 27, 2017**

Good afternoon, Chair Reynoso and members of the City Council's Sanitation and Solid Waste Management Committee. I am Dan Brownell, Commissioner and Chair of the New York City Business Integrity Commission, or BIC. Joining me today are Deputy Commissioner of Legal Affairs and General Counsel Noah Genel and our Budget and Finance Director Jennifer Hoo. Seated just behind us is BIC's Director of Policy Salvador Arrona. Thank you for inviting us to testify today.

**Intro. 1268 - Heating Oil Industry Oversight**

First, I will update you on our efforts to provide effective oversight to the troubled heating oil supply industry through Intro. No. 1268, which would place that industry under BIC regulation. As you know, in November 2015, the Manhattan District Attorney announced indictments against nine companies and 44 individuals in the heating oil supply industry in connection with a wide-scale fraud called "shorting." Through the shorting schemes, unscrupulous heating oil supply companies cheated consumers of heating oil by charging the customers for more oil than they actually delivered. This committee held a hearing on Intro. 1268 last September. Since then, we have met with many groups who represent the victims of



the shorting schemes, including REBNY, the Archdiocese of New York and the Diocese of Brooklyn/Queens, the NYC Co-op and Condo Board, as well as various business and environmental groups, such as the Environmental Defense Fund, the Waterkeeper Alliance and the Better Business Bureau. All of those organizations are deeply concerned by the wide reach of the fraud and want to know what our government is doing to correct this.

You should also know that the City agencies who currently perform some measure of oversight – DCA, FDNY, DCAS and DEP – have been working with us to set up a more comprehensive and collaborative plan to effectively and fairly regulate this industry. But the reality is that unless Intro. 1268 becomes law to establish a robust licensing structure under BIC, there is nothing that City agencies can do to remove the bad actors from this industry. Local and federal prosecutors have brought cases against the industry numerous times over the last 30 years, yet the fraud persists. Piecemeal prosecution clearly is not the answer here; regulatory oversight is.

Many of the individuals and companies indicted as a result of the shorting schemes in November 2015 have now pleaded guilty, and the DA's office has collected several million dollars in forfeiture and restitution, much of which the City should receive as perhaps the biggest victim of the fraud. Also, several of the company owners who stole the oil have received jail sentences, the longest of which to date is three to nine years in state prison. One of those owners, Charles Cuneo, serves as a prime example of what is wrong with this industry and why effective oversight is essential to stop the continued victimization of heating oil consumers.

In 1998, the Manhattan DA's Office indicted two large heating oil supply companies and many of their owners and employees for cheating their customers. Cuneo, a driver at the time, was one of those indicted. He eventually pleaded guilty to grand larceny for his role in the fraud

and went to prison as a result. After his release, Cuneo got right back into the industry, this time as a co-owner of a new heating oil supply company called 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue Transport, Inc.

Once BIC and the NYPD started the most recent criminal investigation into the heating oil supply industry, we caught Cuneo and his drivers at 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue cheating their customers just as he had done in the 1998 case. The difference was that Cuneo had graduated from driver to company owner, and was now directing the fraud. He recently pleaded guilty to the charge of enterprise corruption (a high-level felony) and will be going back to state prison.

We cannot allow the heating oil supply industry to be a training ground for fraudsters. If the licensing structure proposed in Intro. 1268 were to become law, people like Charles Cuneo would be driven from this industry in New York. Probably just as important, anyone else who might initially contemplate engaging in such fraudulent activity would think again, knowing that it could end their careers. Unfortunately, of the 13 heating oil supply companies recently indicted in November 2015, all but 2 of those companies continue to operate in the City. They not only have their own customers but also make deliveries for other companies. Any customer who takes a delivery from any one of those companies is at risk of being defrauded.

In January 2017, Crain's New York Business magazine published an expansive article about another pervasive heating oil scheme, called "blending." Blending is a cost-cutting scam in which heating oil supply companies secretly and illegally add significant amounts of untreated waste oil into regular heating oil before deliveries. Not only does this mixture burn less efficiently, but it also damages building boilers and emits dangerous pollution into the City's air. Ironically, as shown in a current civil lawsuit based on this same scheme, the buildings most often targeted for this practice are located in the least wealthy areas of the City, where incidences of respiratory problems are the highest.

You should also know that based on information we receive from our sources in the industry, the practice of blending continues. The companies that do this know that if they are caught, they currently face no serious consequences. Unfortunately, the consequences for the rest of us are dire. Not only must consumers pay more for this compromised oil, but we all have to breathe the polluted air that results from burning it.

### **Zone Collection and Trade Waste Safety Group**

BIC has also been involved in the City's planning efforts to establish a zone collection model for the City's commercial waste collection. In late September 2016, New York City Department of Sanitation Commissioner Kathryn Garcia held the first of what will be many meetings of various groups to discuss those plans. I know that Commissioner Garcia just testified and brought you up to date on this. While most of the next steps are waiting for the procurement of a consultant to help guide the process, BIC and DSNY have moved ahead to form the Zone Collection Safety Working Group to focus on improving overall safety in this dangerous industry. In addition to members of City government, the group includes trade waste industry participants, union leaders and environmental and other advocates.

We have been holding monthly meetings since the early fall with the immediate goals of establishing standard trainings for industry workers and minimum requirements for safety equipment for the industry. The meetings have been very productive, and I expect we will establish significant standards for the industry. DSNY has provided the group with their best people in the areas of training and safety, which has been a real asset. The thing I like best about the meetings is that even though the participants come from various groups in the City – ones who are sometimes in opposition to one another regarding certain trade waste issues – it has been

their collective commitment to improve industry safety that has dominated the tenor of the discussions.

### **BIC working together with the industries we regulate**

As I have said many times now, the City's trade waste industry has made real strides over the past 20 years, since the creation of BIC's predecessor commission. With BIC oversight in place, the trade waste industry has become largely a vibrant, competitive and fair one. Much of the credit for this must go to those in the industry itself who have worked hard for these improvements after so many decades of suppression under mob control. As one great example, the industry just presented its second trade waste industry safety symposium last week, which focused on truck driver and helper safety. There were about 150 attendees. We anticipate that the third symposium, which will likely be in the fall, will center on demonstrations of the latest trade waste collection truck safety equipment.

We continue to work collaboratively with leaders from the trade waste industry, taking to heart the belief that since running such companies in this City is difficult enough, they should not also have to labor under unnecessarily burdensome regulations from BIC. We told you a year ago that we revived the Trade Waste Advisory Board to improve communication between BIC and the industry. The Trade Waste Advisory Board is comprised of members from BIC and representatives from the industry, and we meet monthly to discuss pending issues and initiatives. For us, it provides a space to fine-tune potential new BIC regulatory measures and policies; we like to solicit the group's input before we implement them. The industry's members' candid responses have helped us devise better, more effective measures. For them, I think these meetings offer a place to voice their opinions about existing BIC regulations and seek assistance with industry-wide concerns or problems.

One result of these meetings is that we are considering how to update and modify some of BIC's regulations to ensure that our regulations evolve as the industry changes. For instance, it seems clear that enforcing a two-year maximum term for contracts between business customers and their trade waste collector is an outdated requirement. While it served a purpose years ago, it is now an unnecessary burden on trade waste companies who need to have more long-term certainty as to who their customers will be.

It also seems unnecessarily burdensome to require landscaping companies operating in the City to go through the same registration process with BIC as trade waste licensees and those who collect solely construction and demolition debris. The potential for corruption among landscaping companies, which are generally smaller businesses, has never been of great concern. In sum, we should stop conducting extensive background investigations on them, which would greatly reduce the fees that they pay.

We are also working on streamlining and shortening all of our applications. Ever since starting at BIC, I have heard the complaints that our applications are too long and onerous to complete. In response, we have taken a fresh look at our applications with an eye toward asking only the questions we think are necessary for the thorough backgrounding that we perform. While some will likely argue for even more revisions, we have significantly trimmed the questions and documents we require, which will make the process more customer-friendly without sacrificing thoroughness.

### **Hunts Point Markets Advisory Board**

Last fall, we formed the Hunts Point Markets Advisory Board, which will meet on a quarterly basis at Hunts Point. The second meeting is this Wednesday. As with the trade waste industry, our aim is to work much more collaboratively with the market co-ops and businesses.

Even though we have greatly loosened our enforcement in the Hunts Point markets over the past couple of years, we know that our relationship with them, while improved, could be better. As with the trade waste industry, we know that the better our relationship is with those we regulate, the more effective we will be as regulators.

As you know, the City's Economic Development Corporation is in the process of implementing significant changes in the infrastructures for both the meat and produce markets, and some restructuring within the seafood market. City government and the markets share the goals of having clean, modern, transportation-accessible wholesale food markets run by vibrant businesses that are open to all. These markets are one of New York's great legacies that the City is working hard to update and revitalize. We plan to play our role by supporting those efforts as we move forward.

#### **Update on BIC's operations**

Since this is a PMMR hearing, we want to provide you with some operations information. While the processing of all types of applications is important, during fiscal year 2016, BIC prioritized first time applications in order to allow new businesses to enter the marketplace without undue delay to the licensing process. This resulted in significant improvements in the completion time for new trade waste and wholesale market applications. At the end of the first quarter of fiscal year 2017, BIC reduced the number of pending waste hauling applications by 40% compared to the same period in fiscal year 2016, and the average age of a pending new application dropped by 55% during this period. You should also know that with regard to determinations on subcontract applications, we have maintained, and even improved, our pace from fiscal year 2016, averaging one day from the time of receipt to decision. We approve the overwhelming majority of subcontract applications.

With respect to wholesale market applications, the average time to approve a new public wholesale market application decreased by 34% in the first quarter of fiscal year 2017 compared to the first quarter of fiscal year 2016. During the same period, the average age of a pending new public wholesale market application decreased by 37%.

In the area of enforcement, BIC's efforts targeting unlicensed carters contributed to a 27% decrease in the number of carting complaints received in the first quarter of fiscal year 2017 compared to the first quarter of fiscal year 2016. In the first quarter of fiscal year 2017, the number of violations issued to public wholesale market businesses decreased by 40% compared to the first quarter of fiscal year 2016. This is due to stricter compliance with BIC rules and regulations in this industry.

We also want to provide you with an update on our efforts to modernize the way in which carters submit information to BIC. I already described for you how we are streamlining our applications. To further improve our efficiency, we are also moving ahead to make electronic BIC applications a reality. Completing and submitting applications electronically will make the filing process easier for the industry and will make it easier for BIC to process them. Once this system is completed for the trade waste industry, we intend to do the same thing for the public wholesale markets.

Yet another technological innovation BIC has launched this past year has been our online portal, which allows carters to log in at any time to easily and efficiently update the information on their customer registers. Historically, this information was submitted to BIC via excel spreadsheets. The data was not standardized and there were varying degrees of formats, leading to major problems in accurately collecting and using the data. The online portal should help to eliminate those issues.

## **Conclusion**

In closing, I want to thank you, Councilmember Reynoso, for all that you have done regarding your sponsorship of the pending legislation relating to the heating oil supply industry. You have been a great champion for BIC, both in backing us in our regulatory efforts, while also challenging us to be more flexible and open to the concerns of the industries we regulate. As the City moves forward with the anticipated significant changes to the trade waste industry in terms of the adoption of a zone collection system and an increasing focus on better recycling, this committee could not be run by a better chairman.

That is a summary of the main issues and projects we have been engaged in at BIC. We look forward to answering your questions.



Testimony of New Yorkers for Responsible Waste Management  
to the  
Joint Hearing on the Mayor's Preliminary Budget for FY2018  
by the  
Committees on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management and Finance

Monday, March 27, 2017 – 1 p.m.  
Committee Room at City Hall

My name is Kendall Christiansen; I am Executive Director of **New Yorkers for Responsible Waste Management**, a trade association comprised of more than fifty companies that provide waste and recycling management services for New York City's commercial and industrial businesses, as well as the Department of Sanitation.

As you consider the Department of Sanitation's budget request for FY2018, the purpose of this testimony is to question the efficacy of the Department's plan to award a multi-year contract worth as much as \$8 million to a team of consultants for the purpose of planning how to restructure – a polite term for “blowing up” – the commercial waste services system that has served New York City well for decades, and attempt to replace it with an idealized hypothetical model of a system of districts and exclusive franchises that has been considered and rejected several times in the past.

Last August, based on a single set of studies from an initial team of consultants, the Commissioner of DSNY announced the city's unilateral decision to proceed with such a planning process. Unfortunately, no public hearings were held; no attempt to consult with either the industry or the city's business community was made; and no comprehensive review of the benefits and impacts of that decision were conducted.

Because DSNY has limited experience with the commercial waste system, it determined to hire outside experts (for up to \$8 million, but could be more) to spend at least two years developing a plan for a new system, followed by probably two years of discussions with the Council as to whether that new system should be adopted or not. As we all know, the city has way too much experience with such experts.

Given that the current open-market system isn't broken – it daily meets the city's core objectives of keeping the city clean, customers well-served and prices competitive – we encourage the Council to consider better uses of that \$8 million than proceeding down a path that is most likely to produce a bunch of reports that will sit on shelves. No evidence has been produced from the initial reports to suggest that districting and franchising is the only method by which the current system can be improved; in fact, evidence from other cities suggests that higher prices are the most likely consequence of a franchising system, with some cities using franchise fees primarily to raise revenues. As we currently operate, customers are free to negotiate rates, a feature that will be lost after the city spends this \$8 million to franchise

commercial waste, thereby leaving customers with “take-it-or-leave-it” pricing and services for decades to come.

A better suggestion: \$8 million could be used to fund collaborative projects with the industry that immediately address the city’s newly-adopted environmental objectives, including zero waste by 2030 and reducing greenhouse gas emissions by 80% by 2050.

As the city’s budget for waste export services continues to soar – according to the IBO’s recent report, \$360 million (\$45 for each New Yorker) will be necessary in FY2018, even as waste generation has remained constant – we can suggest specific investments that would be much more productive than funding a team of consultants to first learn about the city’s sophisticated system for handling more than four million tons of waste, recyclables, and organics every year, and then devising idealized models that inevitably will fail at dealing with New York City’s never-ending complexities.

Finally, I’d like to note that this industry is proud to employ thousands of New Yorkers who have experienced various barriers to employment such as having less than a high school education and having had to re-enter the workforce after being incarcerated. Most of the workforce lives in the neighborhood around the businesses that perform commercial waste in NYC. These jobs pay 2-3 times the minimum wage in most instances and can lead to a career path in which a person, in the course of a few years, could go from being an entry level worker to a driver or supervisor with jobs that pay on average, \$70,000 per year with a number of jobs actually paying six figures. Many of our workers stay within the industry for multiple decades.

We look forward to working with the Council to consider an alternate path that will achieve the city’s goals without destroying competition, forcing small companies out of business, risking hundreds of good working-class jobs. The locally-owned companies that already provide the city with highly effective and efficient waste-managed related services deserve better than what DSNY is currently proposing. The businesses that rely on our services expect better, too.

And in the process, the Council can direct \$8 million for better purposes.

Thank you for your consideration.



**TO:** New York City Council Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management  
**FROM:** James Harris, Director of Government and Community Affairs, Brooklyn Botanic Garden  
**DATE:** March 27, 2017  
**RE:** Preliminary Budget Hearing – Sanitation & Solid Waste Management

---

Good afternoon, I am James Harris, the Director of Government and Community Affairs at Brooklyn Botanic Garden. Thank you for giving me an opportunity to present testimony on behalf of BBG and the New York Botanical Garden.

The NYC Compost Project was founded in 1993 as a partnership between the NYC Department of Sanitation (DSNY) and the City's four botanical gardens. It originally focused on backyard composting and has now grown to include community composting, urban farming, and organics recovery initiatives.

Together, the citywide teams work to rebuild NYC's soils by providing New Yorkers with the knowledge, skills, and opportunities they need to produce and use compost locally. Although we are a multi-county program, we reach people neighborhood by neighborhood. In Brooklyn, the NYC Compost Project is hosted by Brooklyn Botanic Garden; in the Bronx, the NYC Compost Project is hosted by New York Botanical Garden; in Queens, the NYC Compost Project is hosted by Queens Botanical Garden; and on Staten Island, the NYC Compost Project is hosted by Snug Harbor Cultural Center & Botanical Garden.

In each Borough, we work to expand NYC's composting footprint through education, outreach, and community food scrap drop off sites. We provide technical assistance to schools, community gardeners, block associations and greening organizations to expand our respective Borough's composting footprint and build community around composting. NYBG provides ongoing technical assistance and training to 96 sites across the Bronx; BBG reaches 80 sites across Brooklyn.

We also provide advanced training opportunities through Master Composter classes – at Brooklyn Botanic Garden, for example, the eight-week Master Composter Certificate Course has trained nearly 300 borough residents since the program's inception. This type of in depth practical training at each of our institutions creates enthusiastic and knowledgeable compost ambassadors that take on leadership roles in their community, NYC schools, and local organizations.

We also engage our communities through outreach events, such as the NYBG's annual Pumpkin Smash at Lehman College. This past November more than 1800 children and adults participated in the Take Me or Break Me stations to smash, sling, and take home more 7,500 pounds of pumpkins and gourds repurposed from NYBG's Halloween displays. Community partners taught participants how to grow squash, cook with pumpkins, and turn food scraps into compost. With technical assistance from the NYBG team, Lehman composted the smashed pumpkins with leaves from their campus and distributed 115 cubic yards of it back to the community for greening projects.

Also, in the Bronx, in honor of Mandela Day, NYBG's Compost Project staff brought together 15 Haitian youth from Global Potential and interns from GrowNYC. They assisted at La Finca del Sur Urban Farm on East 138th Street and Grand Concourse to reset compost bins and apply compost. Master Composter Dany Nelson, who volunteered with NYBG that day, wowed everyone by conducting the tool safety training in both English and Creole.

Collectively, through the partnership with NYC Botanical Gardens, we staff over 20 community food scrap drop-off spots each week and process over 350,000 pounds of organics a year. The finished product is used at our gardens or shared with local community organizations, such as, community farms.

The NYC Compost Project partnership with NYCs Botanical Gardens provides a unique way for each of our institutions to serve our respective boroughs out in communities, while reinforcing our strong environmental conservation message. We are honored to be part of this valuable program and to support the Department of Sanitation's Zero Waste Goal. We welcome your support for the NYC Compost Project and ask that you further leverage this valuable partnership by supporting our request for a \$40 million increase in the cultural affairs budget. These funds would be split equally between the Cultural Institutions Group institutions and the Cultural Development Fund groups and will allow the City's Botanical Gardens as well as our colleague institutions to continue to train, educate and welcome children and families to our institutions all across the five boroughs.



## **TESTIMONY OF THE MANHATTAN SOLID WASTE ADVISORY BOARD**

### ***City Council Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management Preliminary Budget Hearing Monday March 27, 2017***

Good afternoon, Chairman Reynoso and members of the Sanitation and Solid Waste Management Committee. My name is Sarah Currie-Halpern, I am Chair of the Manhattan Solid Waste Advisory Board (the Manhattan SWAB) and I am testifying on our behalf regarding the Department of Sanitation's (DSNY) Fiscal Year 2018 (FY18) preliminary budget.

The Manhattan SWAB would like to thank Mayor de Blasio for his leadership on bringing waste policy to the forefront of the Administration's agenda. NYC is currently the world's most wasteful Megacity, producing almost 12 million tons of trash a year, with approximately 83 percent of residential waste going to landfill.<sup>1</sup> This is not sustainable, nor in line with the City's environmental goals. Therefore, we ask the City Council to support the full-funding of DSNY's FY18 budget on waste prevention, reuse, and recycling. Specifically, the Manhattan SWAB would like to highlight the following areas which we believe are crucial to achieving the City's goal of Zero Waste to landfill by 2030 (0 X 30):

#### **1) Research**

0 x 30 can only be achieved if New Yorkers are aware of why waste is a problem and are given the right tools to help achieve this ambitious goal. Recycling is not new for New Yorkers, yet our residential recycling rate has barely broken 20 percent since the curbside program went into effect. DSNY currently uses their waste characterization studies to understand the participation rate among communities across the city. We suggest they add a market research and community survey component to identify the factors leading to waste behaviors and the optimal, local methodologies to achieve behavior change. Without market research to understand current behavior and program performance, it will be difficult for DSNY to design, deliver and measure the effectiveness of campaigns and services.

#### **2) DSNY Programs**

The Manhattan SWAB fully supports these existing DSNY programs and would like to see DSNY receive additional funds in the upcoming fiscal year to expand the geographical reach and frequency of each of the following programs:

- The City's reuse programs such as donateNYC, community 'Stop n Swaps', and re-fashionNYC are at the front line of waste prevention by giving New Yorkers a chance to donate or obtain used items
- The Organics Collection Program to collect food scraps and yard waste is already the largest of its kind in the U.S., making a big impact in reducing waste and methane emissions which contribute to climate change, deterring rodents and creating compost and renewable energy. It is important to note that diverting food waste and other organics from landfill has by far the greatest impact on reducing greenhouse gas emissions (GHGs) of NYC's waste streams.
- The NYCHA Recycles! program was long-overdue and is crucial in offering recycling to all City residents
- Public Space Recycling should be expanded and intensified. We understand that contamination rates are high in existing public space recycling bins but over time and as New Yorkers see more recycling bins as they are out and about, this will likely decrease. For years the City has taught, encouraged and expected three different waste disposal behaviors from its residents:

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www1.nyc.gov/assets/dsny/about/inside-dsny/annual-and-monthly-statistics.shtml>



source-separate refuse from recycling one way at home, separate it a different way while in a commercial establishment, and don't separate it at all while out on the street. The City took the important step to standardize the separation of refuse and recycling in residential and commercial buildings, but what message does it send to New Yorkers and visitors to only provide one litter basket for all trash on the streets and in most plazas and parks all while we are a city working to achieve Zero Waste? These public spaces are exactly where the City should be promoting its Zero Waste goal.

### **3) Zero Waste Education and Outreach**

Providing recycling at the litter basket is a first step in raising the 0 x 30 profile; beyond that, the City must have a clear, consistent, and easy to understand message on zero waste and a robust public awareness, education, and outreach program to execute that message. We encourage DSNY to work closely with both the NYC Department of Education and the charter and private school systems on zero waste education for K-12. All children and their parents should be taught the negative environmental impact of our consumption and disposal habits and how to change them.

We also support City funding for a high-profile media campaign featuring a compelling message and coordinated branding around the 0 x 30 initiative, similar to the NYC Department of Transportation's Vision Zero campaign. Such a campaign should include billboards and bus ads as well as television, print, and online ads. Targeted outreach should reach audiences critical to success of the residential Organics Collection Program as well as the updated recycling rules and new organics laws for businesses. Messaging should encourage New Yorkers to perform Zero Waste behaviors such as buying second-hand and recycled while pointing out the potential benefits to them including saving money.

### **4) Enforcement**

After significant education and outreach has been conducted to inform businesses of their responsibilities to source-separate recycling and, for some, organics, DSNY must send out well-trained enforcement officers to ensure that these businesses are compliant. Since the FY16 budget, funding of DSNY civilian enforcement has been reduced in all five boroughs, this is not a solution to better compliance of recycling rules nor more contamination prevention. We hope to see an increase in enforcement budget beyond FY17 levels, enabling the Department to effectively enforce new and existing sanitation rules and laws, and explore new enforcement strategies that reward good actors and penalize bad actors.

### **5) Save as You Throw**

The greatest decrease in the City's waste tonnage will likely be achieved by using financial incentives to encourage behavior change. The U.S. EPA has for decades considered "Save as You Throw"- which incentivizes residents to save money by producing less refuse- to be one of the most effective methods for increasing diversion rate and reducing overall waste generation. Save as You Throw is included in the New York State long range plan *Beyond Waste*, and in Mayor de Blasio's *One New York*. The Manhattan SWAB has and continues to strongly recommend that the City implement an incentive program such as Save as You Throw, and we are eager to see the results of the DSNY study on how to implement such a program here.

In conclusion, DSNY's efforts for waste reduction, reuse, and recycling have a lot of room to grow in order to reach their full potential, so we ask the Council and the Mayor to fully fund DSNY's FY18 budget. Without increased and reapportioned funding for waste prevention and management, the City will not reach its zero waste goal.

Thank you for this opportunity to speak with the Committee, the Manhattan SWAB looks forward to the



Committee's leadership on keeping zero waste at the forefront of the City's public policy agenda.

**The Manhattan Solid Waste Advisory Board**

Chair: Sarah Currie-Halpern; Vice-Chair: Laura Rosenshine; Secretary: Jacquelyn Ottman; Assistant Secretary: Christina Ciambriello

Members: Emily Bachman, Robin Barton, Margot Becker, Kathleen Ceccarelli, Maggie Clarke, Debby Lee Cohen, Naomi Cooper, Phillip Corradini, Christine Datz-Romero, Helena Durst, Leslie Faulkner, Stephanie Gitter-Feldman, Katherine Hanner, Tony Hillery, Christine Johnson, Nicholas Knoll, Matthew Krumholtz, Dan McSweeney, Debra Menich, Kate Mikuliak, Mutale Nkonde, Diane Orr, Jennie Romer, Brendan Sexton, Marc Shifflett, Shien-ru Tsao, Meagan van Harte

The Manhattan SWAB – a non-profit, non-governmental organization – is a joint creation of the City Council and the Borough President, dedicated to increasing recycling, reducing solid waste, and advancing solid waste policy in New York City. The Board is composed of waste and recycling industry experts and concerned citizens, nominated by sitting Board members or Council Members and appointed by the Manhattan Borough President's Office.

**TESTIMONY OF JACQUELYN OTTMAN,  
GREEN MARKETING EXPERT AND AUTHOR**

***City Council Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management  
Preliminary Budget Hearing March 27, 2017***

Good afternoon, Chairman Reynoso and the members of the Sanitation and Solid Waste Management Committee. My name is Jacquie Ottman. I am a native New Yorker, and a member of various sustainability organizations. But today I am here representing myself.

I have 40 years of experience working on high profile advertising and marketing campaigns including the original "I Love New York". For the past 30 years, I have been focused exclusively on advising Fortune 500 companies and the US EPA's Energy Star label on strategies for green marketing.

I am in total support of funding the various waste reduction and outreach efforts outlined in the Department of Sanitation's (DSNY) Fiscal Year 2018 (FY18) preliminary budget. But I think that should represent just the beginning.

The City is making enormous investments in personnel, infrastructure, public-private partnerships, and education and outreach efforts to support our most ambitious goal of diverting Zero Waste to landfill by 2030. In order to maximally leverage these efforts, I believe we need to launch a massive awareness and branding campaign.

For a fraction of the \$370MM that the City spends to export our waste, a highly impactful campaign could be developed that among other things, would positively reinforce our residents in establishing the new daily habits and trigger the changes to our consumption culture that are necessary to align us with zero waste.

At the same time, we would be reinforcing our efforts to address climate change given that 42% of all greenhouse gas emissions are associated with the production, consumption and disposal of goods and food. (EPA 2009)

In developing such a campaign, I am excited by the specific opportunities that I see to tap into the creativity and environmental passions of our City's Millennials, who represent the bulk of the talent in our marketing agencies today. They can be enlisted very cost effectively to create the viral videos, hashtags, images and more that can make the daily, and sometimes unseemly aspects of sorting our waste, downright cool.

So, in planning for this year's budget, I encourage you to look for opportunities to support efforts by the DSNY and other City agencies and groups to find creative ways to provide New Yorkers with the daily positive messages and reminders that are necessary to achieving our zero waste by 2030 goal.

END

Jacquelyn Ottman is an internationally recognized expert and author of five award-winning books on the subject of green marketing. She began her career developing marketing campaigns for national brands in New York City ad agencies. Since 1989 as founder and principal, J. Ottman Consulting, she has helped to guide the green marketing strategies of over 60 Fortune 500 companies, and the U.S. EPA's Energy Star and the USDA's Certified Biobased labels. In April 2012, she founded WeHateToWaste.com, a curated platform for identifying ways to change consumption culture through the prism of zero waste. She is certified as a Zero Waste Professional by the U S Zero Waste Business Council, and is the Secretary of the Solid Waste Advisory Board to the Manhattan Borough President.





***A PETITION TO  
FUND A CONSOLIDATED SANITATION GARAGE  
FOR THE EL BARRIO & HARLEM COMMUNITY  
MARCH 2016***

March 2, 2016

Commissioner Kathryn Garcia  
NYC Department of Sanitation  
51 Chambers Street  
New York, New York 10007

Dear Commissioner Garcia:

The attached petition lists the first 200 people who are demanding that enough is enough: our community deserves appropriate sanitation facilities that address our health, air and noise quality concerns in addition to housing our community's entire sanitation needs. El Barrio and Harlem should receive the same state-of-the-art sanitation facilities as the rest of Manhattan.

Please take the time to read these comments written by our community members and supporters of environmental justice throughout the city.

Attached you will find petition signatures and comments which attest to the long-standing concerns about the East 99<sup>th</sup> street sanitation garage site as well as the continued concerns with relocating the same problems elsewhere in the community.

Recently, our community was tasked with month after month of community visioning sessions around a proposed rezoning for the Mayor's Housing Plan. When the Neighborhood Plan was finally revealed, recommendations included the relocation of the East 99<sup>th</sup> street location and the need for a new sanitation garage. DSNY's proposed plan just does not meet those clearly stated needs.

Low-income communities simply cannot be continually asked to shoulder and absorb increases in density while simultaneously being told there is **no funding for needed infrastructure**. We hope that the city and the Department of Sanitation will revise its plan for East Harlem, by finding the necessary funding and site for an appropriate solution.

*A Just the Facts: East Harlem* petition/[eastharlemfacts@gmail.com](mailto:eastharlemfacts@gmail.com)/

cc:

Hon. Melissa Mark-Viverito, New York City Council Speaker  
Hon. Inez Dickens, New York City Council  
Hon. Keith Wright, New York State Assembly  
Hon. Robert Rodriguez, New York State Assembly  
Hon. José M. Serrano, New York State Senate  
Hon. Bill Perkins, New York State Senate  
Hon. Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President  
Hon. Bill de Blasio, Mayor of New York City  
Vicki Been, Commissioner, NYC Housing Preservation and Development  
Manhattan Community Boards 10 and 11

## **PETITION TEXT**

East Harlem and Central Harlem residents are getting together and voicing their concerns in **opposition to a new proposal for a sanitation garage at 127th street between Second and Third Avenues.**

The proposal to move the sanitation garage from 99th street only shifts a serious issue from one part of our community to another: trucks will still be out in the open air and the project will not consolidate both garages for district 10 and 11, leaving the two garages just blocks away from each other.

When the Department of Sanitation revealed the proposal, a concerned resident stood up and told her story -- a family suffering from asthma and her worries about the children at the nearby school and park. **The Department of Sanitation's response: Not enough funding to provide the facilities that the neighborhood needs.** Our response: That's not acceptable.

***Lend your voice to the fight for environmental justice and sign this petition! East Harlem & Harlem deserve the same facilities as the rest of Manhattan.***

**State-of-the-art sanitation garages are the new normal downtown,** with an environmentally friendly building and economic development project proposed for Brookdale-Kips Bay and a facility that houses all of the trucks and materials for 3 districts at Hudson Square on Spring Street. For our neighborhood, the city proposes to lease a previously city-owned site -- a failed economic development and urban renewal project -- and build an insufficient facility there.

Over the past few months, East Harlem has been told that the Neighborhood Plan is how our community will receive much needed

resources. Yet, **before the Neighborhood Plan is even finished, the city is moving ahead with a residential development project for the entire block on East 111-112th Streets between Park and Madison avenues that could possibly see over 850 new units in the area.**

***If there isn't enough funding to house our current sanitation needs***, right now, how is East Harlem equipped to deal with increased density due to a future upzoning and current development plans?

We can't let this sanitation garage proposal be the standard for our community as new development continues to move forward. We need to stand up for environmental justice and stand together -- Harlem needs a consolidated sanitation garage now.

***Sign the petition and tell the Department of Sanitation that this proposal isn't right for El Barrio and Harlem!***

- Just the Facts, El Barrio/East Harlem, NYC

At the time of printing, there were 211 signatures. For updated signatures, see: <https://www.change.org/p/kathryn-garcia-fund-a-consolidated-sanitation-garage-in-east-harlem-and-move-trash-trucks-off-our-streets>

Los residentes de East Harlem y Central Harlem se reúnen para expresar su preocupación en oposición a **una nueva propuesta para un garaje de saneamiento en la calle 127 entre Second y Third Avenues.**

La propuesta de pasar el garaje de saneamiento de la calle 99 simplemente cambia una seria cuestión de una parte de nuestra comunidad a otra: los camiones seguirán estando a la intemperie; el edificio no podrá albergar a todas las necesidades de saneamiento del distrito; el proyecto no consolida dos garajes para el distrito 10 y 11, dejando a los dos garajes a sólo unas cuadras de distancia el uno del otro.

Cuando el Departamento de Sanidad reveló la propuesta, un preocupado residente en cuestión se levantó y contó su historia - una familia que sufre de asma y sus preocupaciones acerca de los niños en la escuela y parque cercanos. **Respuesta del Departamento de Sanidad: la financiación es insuficiente para proporcionar las instalaciones que el vecindario necesita. Nuestra respuesta: Eso no es aceptable.**

***¡Hazte escuchar en la lucha por la justicia ambiental y firma esta petición! East Harlem y Harlem merecen las mismas instalaciones que el resto de Manhattan.***

**Garajes de saneamiento de última generación son hoy lo habitual en el downtown, con un edificio amigable con el medio ambiente y un proyecto de desarrollo económico propuesto para Brookdale-Kips Bay y una instalación que alberga a todos los camiones y materiales para los 3 distritos en Hudson Square en Spring Street. Para nuestro barrio, el Ayuntamiento propone arrendar un sitio que previamente era propiedad de la ciudad -un proyecto de desarrollo económico y renovación urbana que fracasó- y construir una instalación insuficiente allí.**

En los últimos meses, al East Harlem se le ha dicho que el Plan de Barrios es cómo nuestra comunidad recibirá recursos muy necesarios. Sin embargo, incluso antes de que haya finalizado el plan, la ciudad está avanzando con un proyecto de desarrollo de vivienda asequible para toda la manzana en las calles 111-112th entre Park y Madison Avenues que podría ver más de 850 nuevas unidades en la zona.

**Si no hay fondos suficientes para albergar nuestras necesidades actuales de saneamiento, en este momento, ¿cómo puede East Harlem funcionar con un aumento de la densidad debido a una mejora en la zonificación?**

No podemos dejar que este proyecto sea la norma para nuestra comunidad mientras el nuevo desarrollo continúa avanzando. Tenemos que defender a la justicia ambiental y estar juntos.

***¡Firma la petición y dile al Departamento de Sanidad que esta propuesta no es adecuada para El Barrio y Harlem!***

- ***Just the Facts, East Harlem, NYC***

Gisela Soto  
New York, NY 10035

Nancy Giunta  
New York, NY 10035

Sophie Giloppe  
New York, NY 10035

Netra Sreeprakash  
New York, NY 10035

Teresa Candori  
New York, NY 10035

Chantal Stevens  
New York, NY 10035

Angela Salazar  
New York, NY 10035

Jurgen Lebac  
New York, NY 10035

DJ Jaffe  
New York, NY 10035

Eleonora Zilanti  
New York, NY 10035

Derrick Taitt  
New York, NY 10035

Michael Shafland  
New York, NY 10035

Lisanne Franco  
New York, NY 10035

Pamela Proctor  
New York, NY 10035

Akemi Kochiyama  
New York, NY 10035

Rupert Huelsey  
New York, NY 10035

Joel Chernov  
New York, NY 10035

Marie-Cecile Charlier  
New York, NY 10035

Robert Zwaschka  
New York, NY 10035

---

***I live in the area and people living uptown are taxed at the same rate as downtowners so we are entitled to the same considerations and benefits. We are already short changed with the general upkeep of our streets.***

***Lynette Osborne, New York, NY***

---

Matt Nolan  
New York, NY 10035

Margot Pollans  
New York, NY 10035

Jerry Wolf  
New York, NY 10035

Robin Rivera  
New York, NY 10035

Kenneth Hollar  
New York, NY 10035

Tina Bristol  
New York, NY 10035

---

***March 2016***

---

***Harlem sanitation garage petition***

Lazarus Ramos  
New York, NY 10035

Heather Jackson  
New York, NY 10035

Thomas Matta  
New York, NY 10035

Phil Kelly  
New York, NY 10035

Rebecca Mercer-White  
New York, NY 10035

Jennifer Blodgett  
New York, NY 10035

Barrette Palmer  
New York, NY 10035

David D'Alessio  
New York, NY 10035

Shawn Hill  
New York, NY 10035

Nicole Risafi  
New York, NY 10035

Nilsa Cadiz  
New York, NY 10035

Miguel Mejia  
New York, NY 10035

Adrian Pesnell  
New York, NY 10035

Magdalena Rodriguez  
New York, NY 10035

Dietmar Postl  
New York, NY 10035

Mitra Rastegar  
New York, NY 10035

Timberly Leite  
New York, NY 10035

---

***This definitely needs to be rethought on density and environmental grounds alone, not to mention the blatant discrimination evidenced in substandard facilities because we are still less affluent than SoHo and other districts...the City is shoving gentrification, massive housing increases and still dumps not just this garbage garage, but every half way, drug program, etc. on us...NO TO THIS GARAGE unless it is state of the art and combines environmental amenities to offset the added fumes to what is already the heaviest exhaust belt of the city and has highest asthma rate in the country.***

***No slipping projects past the citizens until the re plans have been submitted for extensive review and we residents get some real amenities in tradeoffs. We are not second class citizens, but tax paying New Yorkers who deserve better.***

***Alida W. Morgan, New York, NY***



Magda Teter  
New York, NY 10035

Yana Domuschieva  
New York, NY 10035

Kelsea Snell  
New York, NY 10035

Cristina Buffone  
New York, NY 10035

Celinda Harris  
New York, NY 10035

Monifa Foster  
New York, NY 10035

Rebecca Smith  
New York, NY 10035

Mary Reilly  
New York, NY 10035

Mirta Feliciano  
New York, NY 10035

Deborah Riddy  
New York, NY 10035

Chris Colon  
New York, NY 10035

Lonene Crawford  
New York, NY 10035

Conor Gleason  
New York, NY 10035

Mikayla Holzwarth  
New York, NY 10035

Melissa Gellert  
New York, NY 10035

Juanita Moore  
New York, NY 10035

Alex Quan-Pham  
New York, NY 10035

Cassandra Henderson  
New York, NY 10035

Joseph Rienti  
New York, NY 10035

---

***As an environmental law professor, I read about exactly this kind of environmental injustice all the time. It is incredibly disheartening to see it in my own neighborhood. This is a world class city, and it should live up to this reputation by providing ALL of its citizens with the best environmental services possible. Inadequate funding is a cop out response that suggests a lack of willingness to expend the effort and creativity needed to come up with a viable solution for this neighborhood.***

***Margot Pollans***

---

Utara Jones  
New York, NY 10035

Mary Sanchez  
New York, NY 10035

Erika Donovan Estedes  
New York, NY 10035

Patricia Arbelaez  
New York, NY 10035

Jennifer Elliott  
New York, NY 10035

Russell Wagner  
New York, NY 10035

---

***March 2016***

***Harlem sanitation garage petition***

Lynn Lewis  
New York, NY 10035

Tracy Mann  
New York, NY 10035

Marie Winfield  
New York, NY 10035

Alvin Johnson  
New York, NY 10035

Carmen Morales  
New York, NY 10029

Tamir Soto  
New York, NY 10029

Kai Clarillo  
New York, NY 10029

Octavia Felder  
New York, NY 10029

Y. Andre Vital  
New York, NY 10029

Marina Ortiz  
New York, NY 10029

Juan Nunez  
New York, NY 10029

Alicia Pearlman  
New York, NY 10029

Tyhessia Blanchard  
New York, NY 10029

Lynette Osbourne  
New York, NY 10029

Maria Rizzieri  
New York, NY 10035

Lydia Butler  
New York, NY 10035

D Kodah  
New York, NY 10035

Konrad Pust  
New York, NY 10035

---

***I believe in environmental justice. We don't see garbage trucks lined up in my neighborhood on the Upper West Side. My fellow residents in East Harlem merit the same services and quality of life.***

***Michele Burger, New York, NY***

---

Ingrid Li  
New York, NY 10029

Brenda Davis  
New York, NY 10029

Bryce Klatsky  
New York, NY 10029

Leo Lauer  
New York, NY 10029

Nilsa Orama  
New York, NY 10029

---

***March 2016***

---

***Harlem sanitation garage petition***

Amin Deroui  
New York, NY 10029

Judith Escalona  
New York, NY 10029

Raj Holder  
New York, NY 10029

Wilberte P.  
New York, NY 10029

Minerva Gonzalez  
New York, NY 10029

Rosa Lopez  
New York, NY 10029

Wei Carmen  
New York, NY 10029

Jahaida Feliciano  
New York, NY 10029

Siobhan O'Herron  
New York, NY 10029

Christine Mendoza  
New York, NY 10029

Dan Ross  
New York, NY 10029

Wilfredo Rochez  
New York, NY 10029

Maria Medina  
New York, NY 10029

Diahann Moyler  
New York, NY 10029

Karin Griffin  
New York, NY 10029

Gloria Bonilla  
New York, NY 10029

Elsa Gonzalez  
New York, NY 10029

Hector Bautis  
New York, NY 10029

Richard Clivilles  
New York, NY 10029

---

***Our East Harlem community should not carry the burden of increased building, residents and waste without increased FUNDING for an state of the art facility to adequately address the needs of all this growth.***

***My East Harlem community should NOT have the lion's share of the garbage and certainly NOT an open air facility!***

***Kamala Redd, New York, NY***

---

Shirell Wilson  
New York, NY 10029

Christopher Brennan  
New York, NY 11356

Carol Johnson  
New York, NY 10029

Kelly Lau  
New York, NY 10029

Hannah Haas  
New York, NY 10029

Alicia Williamson  
New York, NY 10035

---

***March 2016***

***Harlem sanitation garage petition***

Aniana Gerardo  
New York, NY 10029

Lynette Osborne  
New York, NY 10029

Danny Lopez  
New York, NY 10029

Aida Martinez  
New York, NY 10029

Rogério Simoes  
New York, NY 10029

Ricardo Alvarado  
New York, NY 10029

Alida W. Morgan  
New York, NY 10029

Rytchell Alfred  
New York, NY 10029

Jennifer Cosme  
New York, NY 10029

Eeron Redhead  
New York, NY 10031

Elisia Abrams  
New York, NY 10027

Michele Burger  
New York, NY 10023

Melissa Cantiello  
Brooklyn, NY 11215

Friederike Williams  
New York, NY 10037

Anna Loizeaux  
Pleasantville, NY 10570

Jessica Cuevas  
New York, NY 10029

Stephanie Gee  
New York, NY 10029

Ismael Nunez  
New York, NY 10029

Kisha Fenty  
New York, NY 10029

---

***To whom it may concern, Spanish Harlem already has been neglected for too long. Our area just started to gentrify & change for the better. Last thing we need is to take steps back & bring all these sanitation trucks to our area. It's soar to the eye already & we too have kids and families that want to enjoy the neighborhood. Why not in the Columbus Circle area? Precisely, why us?***

***Ricardo Alvarado, East Harlem, NY***

---

Caitlin Reilly  
New York, NY 10031

Kamala Redd  
New York, NY 10026

Katie Schank  
Philadelphia, PA 19130

Jessica Gjoza  
Brooklyn, NY 11223

Lisa Lamb  
New York, NY 10030

Eric Carabetta  
New York, NY 10026

---

***March 2016***

***Harlem sanitation garage petition***

Nancy Simpson  
New York, NY 10022

MH Dold  
New York, NY 10039

Bogdan Lupu  
New York, NY 10026

Venkatesh Mani  
New York, NY 10037

Holley Drake6  
Queens, NY 11435

Karen Garfin  
New York, NY 10075-1260

Helaine Eisenberg  
New York, NY 10128

Ricki Spinner  
New York, NY 10128

Erlinda Brent  
New York, NY 10128

Franca Gioia  
New York, NY 10028

Andres Lizarraga  
New York, NY 10026

Vanessa King  
New York, NY 10037

Sara Firebaugh  
New York, NY 10027

Alice Huang  
New York, NY 10037

Sarah Smith  
New York, NY 10039

Vanessa Fitt  
New York, NY 10026

Karen Zechowy  
New York, NY 10026

Laura Lesser  
New York, NY 10031

Violeta Sacara  
New York, NY 10026

---

**I live very close to the 127th street site  
and I am concerned about the open air  
stench, uncontrolled litter, and increased  
pollution. An environmentally friendly  
garage is needed to house this operation.  
Do the right thing!**

*Barrette Palmer, New York, NY*

---

Elizabeth Dunn  
New York, NY 10037

Stacey Moore  
New York, NY 10037

Eric Williams  
Washington, DC 20010

Chito Quijano  
Glendale, CA 91204

Bernard Tarver  
New York, NY 10031

---

**March 2016**

**Harlem sanitation garage petition**

Evelyn Morgan  
New York, NY 10030

Pamela Armstrong  
New York, NY 10128

Leah Simmons  
Boston, MA 2472

Elaine Martinez  
New York, NY 10033

Renee K  
New York, NY 10001

Benjamin Ndugga-Kabuye  
Brooklyn, NY 11216

Terri Tildon  
New York, NY 10026

Betty Davis  
New York, NY 10030

Mary Boncher  
New York, NY 10039

Rebecca Lewis  
New York, NY 10030

Marly Rubin  
Carroll Park, PA 19096

Greg DeMasi  
Concord, CA 94524

Jenny Akchin  
Jackson Heights, NY 11372

Gary Williams  
New York, NY 10037

Ray Cornbill  
New York, NY 10128

Suzanne Ventura  
New York, NY 10026

Premilla Dixit  
Highfalls, NY 12440

South Bronx Unite  
Bronx, NY 10454

Sabrina Ladson  
New York, NY 10473

Kate Abell  
New York, NY 10011

---

**Another example of environmental racism. Along with superfund sites and the federal government's dismissive relationship with communities like Harlem we have local policy makers disregard overlapping with austerity measures to devastate how people can live.**

**Benjamin Ndugga-Kabuye, Brooklyn, NY**

***If below 99th Street doesn't want it why is it acceptable to be relocated to Harlem. Upper Manhattan & the Bronx have been documented as having some of the HIGHEST rate of Asthma hospitalizations among youth in NYC.***

**Deborah Riddy, New York, NY**

---

Edith Russell  
New York, NY 10039

Michelle Winfield  
New York, NY 10010

Jules Hollander  
Brooklyn, NY 11237

---

**March 2016**

***Harlem sanitation garage petition***

Michael Barnes  
New York, NY 10030

Francine Marable  
New York, NY 10032

Brodie Enoch  
New York, NY 10039

Darian Clark  
New York, NY 10030

Kathy van Vorhees  
New York, NY 10075

Elaina Watkins  
New York, NY 10026

Naylin Rivera  
New York, NY 10001

Steve Bloom  
New York, NY 10026

Scire Simmons  
New York, NY 10002

Janet Ovalles  
Bronx, NY 10462

Tiffany McFadden  
Bronx, NY 10456

Felicia Bradford  
New York, NY 10032

Kathleen Webster  
New York, NY 10012

Concerned Citizen  
New City, NY 10956-2406

Claude Winfield  
New York, NY 10010

Julia Li  
New York, NY 11201

Karen Wynn  
Mount Vernon, NY 10553

Ray Delgado  
New York, NY 10935

Jennifer Hadlock  
New York, NY 10038

Adam Weber  
Hood River, Oregon 97031

---

***For decades, our neighborhood has suffered from being a dumping ground for anything that's not desirable or permissible in other areas of the city. Our neighborhood has an unproportionate amount of drug rehab clinics, and busloads of homeless people are carted on a daily basis to our footsteps and dumped here, on express buses from Randall's Island.***

***A major open-air sanitation truck facility is NOT what the neighborhood needs. Furthermore, Harlem already suffers from heavy traffic congestion and we do not need to add even more traffic congestion caused by sanitation trucks moving in and out of a large facility.***

***We need to create and improve an environment that attracts new businesses and residents alike. We do NOT need to add facilities that would cause odor or unsanitary conditions, which are not environmentally friendly, and which would not be tolerated in other neighborhoods.***

***Dietmar Postl, New York, NY***

---

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

[ ]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_

in favor  in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

I represent: DEPT. OF SANITATION

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

[ ]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_

in favor  in opposition

Date: 3/27/17

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: JACQUELYN A. OTTMAN

Address: 315 E 69 Street NYC 10021

I represent: Self

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

[ ]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_

in favor  in opposition

Date: 3-27-17

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Kendall Christensen

Address: 151 Maple St Brooklyn

I represent: New Yorkers for Responsible Waste Management

Address: \_\_\_\_\_



**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_  
 in favor  in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Name: FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DENNIS DIGGINS  
(PLEASE PRINT)

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

I represent: DEPT. OF SANITATION

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_  
 in favor  in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Name: DEPUTY COMMISSIONER LARRY CIPOLLINA  
(PLEASE PRINT)

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

I represent: DEPT. OF SANITATION

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_  
 in favor  in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Name: Brendan Sexton  
(PLEASE PRINT)

Address: 134 Sullivan St.

I represent: Manhata SWAB

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_

in favor  in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: COMMISSIONER RICHARD GARCIA

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

I represent: MARTIN LUTHER KING JR. MUSEUM

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_

in favor  in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: HARRY NESPOLE

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

I represent: President Unfined/Sealed Union

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_

in favor  in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: JAMES HARRIS

Address: 1000 WASHINGTON AVE BRKLYN, NY

I represent: BROOKLYN BOTANIC GARDEN

Address: SEE ABOVE

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_  
 in favor  in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Noah Gene

Address: 100 Church St. 20th Fl.

I represent: Deputy Commissioner of Legal Affairs

Address: + General Counsel @ BIC

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_  
 in favor  in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Dan Brownell

Address: 100 Church St. 20th Fl.

I represent: Commissioner + Chair BIC

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_  
 in favor  in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Jennifer Hoo

Address: 100 Church St., 20th Fl.

I represent: Director of Budget + Finance BIC

Address: \_\_\_\_\_