

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

April 5, 2017
Start: 1:46 p.m.
Recess: 4:00 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:
Jimmy Van Bramer
Majority Leader

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker
Inez Barron
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim Deutsch
Rafael Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Daniel Garodnick
Vincent Gentile
Vanessa Gibson
Barry Grodenchik
Corey Johnson

Andy King
Peter Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory Lancman
Brad Lander
Stephen Levin
Mark Levine
Alan Maisel
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
Daneek Miller
Bill Perkins
Donovan Richards
Ydanis Rodriguez
Deborah Rose
Helen Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Mark Treyger
Joseph Borelli
Eric Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul Vallone
Jumaane Williams
Ruben Wills
Steven Matteo
Jimmy Van Bramer

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lieutenant Commander John Russo

Chief Robert Boyce
Chief of Detectives NYPD

Monsignor Sullivan

Catholic Charities

Rosemary Welch

Reginald Oles

Gregory Bishop

Rabbi Eli Cohen
Executive Director of Crown Heights Jewish
Community Center

MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Good

afternoon, everyone. We are about to begin. If Council Member Eric Ulrich would join me here at the front. We have a very important ceremonial that Council Member Ulrich will be leading in honor of Lieutenant Commander John Russo so if everyone associated with this ceremony would come forward at this time including Lieutenant Commander Russo and any and all members who would like to join in this ceremonial. Now I will hand this over to Council Member Ulrich for this very, very important proclamation presentation.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you,

Majority Leader Van Bramer. I want to thank you and our Chair of our Public Safety Committee, Vanessa Gibson and I see Council Member Vinny Gentile is here, Margaret Chin and so many others to honor in a very special way not only one of New York's finest but a man who also happens to be my constituent reside of Howard Beach, Lieutenant Commander John Russo. Let me just read a quick little synopsis of why we are honoring him today. So as many of you know, unfortunately on August 2nd of last year on a hot summer day in broad daylight, 31 year old young

1 woman, also a constituent of mine, Karina Vetrano,
2 went out for an afternoon jog. Unfortunately, she
3 never returned home. She was found several hours
4 later in the weeds in Howard Beach by her father and
5 the dozens of police and first responders that were
6 in search of her and she was killed unfortunately.
7 And for many months there was a profound sense of
8 sorrow and grief that swept over not only that
9 community but throughout the entire city of New York
10 and people were just absolutely insistent that we
11 catch the killer. Lieutenant Russo actually, who
12 works for the Chief of Detectives Voice, who is here
13 with us, thank you Chief for being here, we will have
14 you say a few words in just a few seconds. Also was
15 I believe mentally preoccupied with this case because
16 it happened in his own backyard, it really could have
17 happened to anybody, well the case was finally
18 solved. We believe that it will be solved and the
19 person who was responsible for that heinous crime was
20 arrested and he has been indicted and his trial will
21 start in the near future and hopefully there will be
22 justice brought about and some closure not only for
23 the family of Karina Vetrano but for the community at
24 large and the people of the City of New York. So we
25

1
2 are here to honor in a very special way Lieutenant
3 Commander John Russo for his outstanding
4 contributions to solving this case and to
5 apprehending the killer and making sure that he is
6 brought to justice and that Karina did not die in
7 vain and that that crime does not go unsolved. You
8 know, he is just one of so many fine detectives in
9 the New York City Police Department that keep our
10 community safe, keep our families safe and I know
11 that he is accepting this award not only on his own
12 behalf but on behalf of the entire Detectives Bureau
13 at the NYPD. Before I hand it over to our honoree
14 today, I would like to make sure that the Chief Of
15 Detectives, Chief Boyce, can say a quick word after
16 the proclamation is read. We will have the Chief say
17 a few words and then we will hear from Lieutenant
18 John Russo. So we will read the proclamation.

19 CLERK: Proclamation, Council City of New
20 York. The Council of the City of New York is proud
21 to honor NYPD Lieutenant Commander John Russo for his
22 stellar career in law enforcement and his excellent
23 recent work that lead to the arrest of an alleged
24 killer. And whereas, every hour or every day the men
25 and women of the NYPD work together to enforce our

1
2 city's laws, keep our neighborhoods safe and protect
3 their fellow 8.3 million New Yorkers. Whether
4 safeguarding the public or property, they commit
5 themselves to their daily duties that often require
6 extraordinary risks that few others fully comprehend.
7 It is a privilege to pay tribute to Lieutenant
8 Commander Russo for he is truly one of New York's
9 finest. After his graduation from the Police Academy
10 in 1998, he was assigned to the 17th Precinct. The
11 following year, he was assigned to the Precinct's
12 Plain Clothes Anti-Crime Unit. In 2001, he became a
13 White Shield Investigator for the 17th Precinct
14 Detective Squad. In that role, he responded to and
15 worked at the World Trade Center and landfill
16 recovery sites. And whereas remarkably, even before
17 his promotion to Sergeant in 2002, he has made more
18 than 130 arrests. Between 2003 and 2009, he
19 continued to hone his expertise in other roles
20 including First Precinct Field Intelligence Officer
21 and as a representative for the Intelligence Division
22 known today as the Intelligence Bureau for the newly
23 formed Manhattan South Grand Larceny Initiative. In
24 that role, he helped develop the first video library
25 used to compare images of wanted perpetrators and

1 arrested perpetrators for intelligence purposes. In
2 2008, he was promoted to Lieutenant and assigned to
3 the 9th Precinct. The next year he was transferred
4 to the 13th Precinct Detective's Squad and became a
5 commanding officer. He later acted as the Detective
6 Bureau Investigative Coordinator and as a liaison to
7 the Chief of Department and Palace Commissioner's
8 Office. In August 2012, he was promoted to
9 Lieutenant Commander of Detectives. And whereas,
10 over the years, Lieutenant Commander Russo has
11 received five awards for exemplary police duties, was
12 named Police Office of the Year twice in 2000 and
13 named Detective of the Year in 2002. From the start,
14 he has demonstrated the incredible tenacity that
15 every detective needs for successful investigations.
16 That tenacity continues to help him now. And
17 whereas, on August 2, 2016, a woman went for a run
18 near her Howard Beach home and then went missing.
19 Several hours later her body was discovered in the
20 marsh. In the weeks that followed, the shocked
21 community offered hundreds of tips yet the crime
22 remained a mystery. Thanks to Lieutenant Commander
23 Russo's dogged determination, the alleged killer was
24 arrested on February 2nd. Now therefore be it known,
25

1
2 that the Council of the City of New York gratefully
3 honors NYPD Lieutenant Commander John Russo for his
4 outstanding service to the City of New York, to the
5 NYOD and his follow residents of Howard, Beach
6 Queens. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the
7 entire Council, Jimmy Van Bramer Majority Leader 26th
8 District Queens, Eric A. Ulrich Council Member 32nd
9 District Queens, Vanessa L. Gibson Chair Public
10 Safety Committee.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you very
12 much. Thank you. Before we here from Lieutenant
13 Commander Russo, I would like to ask our Chief of
14 Detectives for the NYPD, the very honorable Chief
15 Boyce, to say a few words.

16 CHIEF BOYCE: Thank you so much, Eric.
17 Thank you all for being here this afternoon. As you
18 can read from the proclamation, John is not an
19 overnight sensation. He has worked really hard in
20 his career, skilled and very disposed that delivered
21 a great crime reduction to this city. In this six
22 month investigation of Karina Vetrano, the homicide
23 of Karina Vetrano, I don't think there was a day we
24 passed, me and John, as well as scores of other
25 detectives and other supervisors where we haven't

1
2 talked about this. Always looking for investigative
3 leads or whatever we can do and we went through
4 several hundred of them. This is one of the toughest
5 cases I've ever been involved in. So John rightfully
6 so has taken the lead on this and I know he in his
7 own modesty, he would like to thank everybody
8 involved in the case because everybody did plug into
9 this case. Everybody in the police department solves
10 a singular case, not one person. But John, because
11 he is what he is, was able to bring this to fruition
12 so I salute him. Just to let you know on every day
13 he does for me, every day he comes in about five
14 o'clock in the morning, goes to the overnight and
15 informs everybody in the police department what is
16 going on. He is what we call Rock Star in NYPD.
17 Congratulations John, good for you.

18 [applause]

19 LIUETENANT COMMANDER JOHN RUSSO: Thank
20 you. Members of the Council, Council Member Ulrich,
21 Speaker, I want to thank all the members of the City
22 Council and all the members of the city for this
23 award. It is an honor. I am humbled to be part of
24 this. Like the Chief said, all the members of the
25 police department put their life on the line with the

1
2 members of all the other first responding agencies in
3 this city every day for this city and we appreciate
4 awards like this. It makes everyone humbled. I
5 especially want to thank the members of Queens South
6 Detectives who for six months before this case was
7 solved lived this case everyday along with the family
8 of Ms. Vetrano who was killed. Thank you. My family
9 thanks you. I want to thank my family who through
10 the course of this investigation and my almost 20
11 year career has every day supported me in my role in
12 the police department and my support of the Chief.
13 This is a great relationship. I look forward to
14 continuing it for many years. Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Let's all get
16 together and take some photos.

17 [pause]

18 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
19 very much, Lieutenant Commander Russo.

20 [pause 00:10:25 - 00:13:13]

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We are going to
22 move on to the next ceremonial. We've got Catholic
23 Charities celebrating 100 years. So we are here
24 joined by our incredible friend Monsignor Sullivan

25

1
2 and the other members of Catholic Charities please
3 come.

4 [applause]

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And as many of
6 us, everyone on this Council knows, Catholic
7 Charities is an incredible invaluable partner not
8 only with us but with communities across the city
9 with the city as a whole and I particularly want to
10 thank them for all the work they are doing with our
11 immigrant communities but obviously they do so much
12 more than that and so on the 100 years, I definitely
13 wanted to at least have them join us here in the
14 Chamber to receive all the accolades that are
15 definitely deserved and very much appreciated by each
16 and every one of us. Before we hear from our great
17 representative, we would like to have the Clerk read
18 the proclamation.

19 CLERK: Council, City of New York
20 Proclamation. Since 1919, Catholic Charities of the
21 Arch Diocese of New York has been providing help and
22 creating hope in countless lives in a wide range of
23 areas including protecting and nurturing children and
24 youth, feeding the hungry and sheltering the
25 homeless, strengthening families and resolving

1
2 crises, supporting the physically and emotionally
3 challenged and welcoming and integrating immigrants
4 and refugees. And whereas long before most
5 government safety nets began, laymen and women,
6 clergy and nuns stepped in to serve those in need.
7 They began working along but found strength working
8 together and a century ago the Arch Diocese of New
9 York was incorporated. Today, they represent a
10 federation of over 90 agencies from Staten Island to
11 Sullivan County serving non-Catholics and Catholics
12 alike. And whereas, the history of Catholic
13 Charities mirrors the history of our nation. After
14 the Civil War, left thousands of children orphaned
15 and abandoned, Catholic groups stepped in becoming
16 the largest caretakers of children in need. During
17 the Great Depression, Casita Maria was founded to
18 help the unemployed find housing and jobs while the
19 Catholic Youth Organization offered services to
20 children. In the Cold War era, Catholic Charities
21 broadened their mental health services. In 1958, a
22 group of nuns opened Little Sisters of the Assumption
23 Family Health Services in East Harlem. Home For
24 Children began a residential treatment center for
25 children with serious emotional disturbances.

1 Catholic Charities was an innovator when many
2 children with developmental delays were
3 institutionalized and forgotten. Kennedy Child Study
4 Center was one of the first organizations to provide
5 special education services. The Guidance Institute
6 pioneered the first day camp for children with
7 disabilities. And whereas during the 1960s, '70s and
8 '80s, more than 50 new Catholic charities, affiliated
9 agencies developed to address growing needs. In
10 1969, Covenant House opened its doors on the lower
11 east side to help homeless and runaway youth. In
12 Harlem, Create began its fight against drugs,
13 unemployment and rising housing costs. The 1980s
14 were particularly challenging with the emergence of
15 AIDS and crack-cocaine and the
16 deinstitutionalizations of persons with mental
17 illness. Catholic Charity agencies mobilized to
18 provide more than 40 percent of all group homes in
19 New York City along with foster care, adoption and
20 preventative services. Nazareth Housing, Incarnation
21 Children Center, St. Francis Residences and Beacon of
22 Hope House were established to serve the most
23 vulnerable populations. New Hope Manor, Catholic
24 Charities Community Services of Orange County, and
25

1
2 fellow affiliated agencies offered a fresh start for
3 the chemically dependent. And whereas, throughout
4 this history, Catholic Charities have supported
5 immigrants fleeing poverty and depression. Tolentine
6 Zeiser assisted the influx of Southeast Asian
7 immigrants and refugees. Mercy Center began offering
8 English as a second language and after school
9 programs for Spanish speaking new arrivals. Project
10 Irish Outreach formed after the first national
11 legalization for undocumented immigrants in 1986.
12 Catholic Charities remains a leader in this area
13 today working with government agencies, service
14 providers and individuals to make sure immigrants
15 receive counsel and services they need. Catholic
16 Charities has also addressed many crises of our time
17 from 9/11 to Hurricane Sandy. And whereas, at this
18 special milestone, we not only reflect upon the rich
19 history of Catholic Charities but also reaffirm our
20 faith in its equally promising future of providing
21 help and creating hope for vulnerable New Yorkers
22 regardless of religion. We wish it continued success
23 in the years ahead. Now therefore be it known, that
24 the Council of the City of New York gratefully honors
25 Catholic Charities of the Arch Diocese of New York

1
2 for 100 years outstanding service and enduring
3 contributions to New York City. Melissa Mark-
4 Viverito, Speaker for the entire Council.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All right. On
6 behalf -- I don't know if people have also seen the
7 new proclamation that we are unrolling but obviously
8 I signed this on behalf of all of us and this Council
9 to all of the workers, all those employed by Catholic
10 Charities, all of you doing work in our communities
11 on behalf of our constituents and behalf of our city.
12 We deeply appreciate you and the 100 years of service
13 that you have been providing. So Monsignor, thank
14 you so much for your partnership and would love for
15 you to say a few words.

16 MONSIGNOR SULLIVAN: Thank you. So let
17 me first say thank you to Melissa, the Speaker, the
18 other members of the City Council who are here, the
19 Public Advocate who is here. Let me begin by saying
20 our partnership with New York City is so very, very
21 critically important for the sake of New Yorkers in
22 need and especially these days when there's a lot of
23 tension, a lot of rhetoric. You know, sometimes
24 those who are elected officials are not held in high
25 esteem. I have to tell you, in the parts of the city

1
2 where Catholic Charities work, we find our City
3 Council members are must in touch with the people
4 there who put in extraordinary long hours. Quite
5 frankly, the only people I know around this town who
6 work harder than our City Council members are the
7 staff of Catholic Charities. [applause] So I want to
8 thank you. Our partnership is a privilege and we
9 look forward to continuing. I also want to recognize
10 in addition to our wonderful staff, which quite
11 frankly is dominated by staff from our Immigration
12 and Refugee Services which is critically important in
13 this time. I want to mention that we have trustees
14 who are here who have joined us today from Catholic
15 Charities, our central Catholic Charities, but also
16 from our affiliated agencies. I just want to say
17 again a word of appreciation. When you celebrate a
18 centennial, you have to look back a little bit but we
19 don't want to look back. We want to launch the next
20 century of providing help and creating hope for New
21 Yorkers in need. Thank you got recognizing us.
22 Thank you.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

24 [off mic talk]

25

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We have one more
3 ceremonial. We have one more ceremonial. We would
4 ask all of those that are here for that ceremonial
5 while receiving the proclamation to please join us up
6 here. This is by Council Member Williams who will be
7 issuing a proclamation to Health and Hospitals
8 Cooperation and St. George's University for the
9 success of their joint program, City Doctors, that
10 seeks to attract and educate the best and brightest
11 students to become doctors committed to urban
12 hospitals. We all know and value, I have a public
13 hospital in my district, Metropolitan Hospital, know
14 the incredible important, how important that
15 institute is to my constituents and so we really
16 value our public health systems the same we value our
17 public education system. But with that, Council
18 Member Williams, thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I
20 know we are almost ceremonial'd out. I got the last
21 one. I am proud to be here. I am son of Spice
22 parents which means my parents are both from Grenada
23 and we are to present a proclamation to St. George's
24 University School of Medicine in Grenada and HHC. St
25 George University was founded as an independent

1 school of medicine in 1976, 4700 students, top center
2 of international education drawing students and
3 faculty from 140 countries to the Caribbean island of
4 Grenada. The University's more than 17,000 graduates
5 include physicians, veterinarians, scientists, public
6 health and business professions across the world.
7 They partnered as mentioned with New York City Health
8 and Hospitals to launch City Doctors, a scholarship
9 program designed to attract and educate the best and
10 brightest students to become doctors. We have some
11 of those students here: Sandy Lee, Eric Behart (SP),
12 did I say that right, Gregory Hotch, you got to help
13 me out, okay, David Roy, Husna Chaik (SP). I also
14 have family, she couldn't be here today, Chrissy
15 Joseph, who graduated from there. I have a
16 constituent, Anika Kings Douglas, who actually was
17 the Director of a Capstone Program there and she is
18 now married to someone we know very well, Christian
19 Hilton from -- used to be at the Council. I visited
20 they medical school. It is a very beautiful place.
21 I am also joined here by my mom here today and my
22 aunt and my uncle. With that we have a few folks who
23 want to speak. We have the Counsel General Rosemary
24 Welch first then Dr. Reginald Oles, who is the
25

1
2 President Chief Executive Officer, and then we are
3 going to have very briefly Greg Bishop although I am
4 a son of Spice, he was actually born, he got my by
5 one, he was born in Grenada. So the Counsel General.

6 ROSEMARY WELCH: Thank you, Council
7 Member.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Oh, sorry. We
9 will now have the clerk read the proc.

10 CLERK: Council, City of New York,
11 Proclamation. NYC Health and Hospitals serves more
12 than 1 million New Yorkers each year and are critical
13 providers of culturally confident patient centered
14 primary care and whereas medical schools today are
15 not producing enough primary care physicians to meet
16 society's needs. The Association of American Medical
17 Colleges predicts a shortage of 46,000 to 90,000
18 physicians by 2025. St. George's University is
19 committed to helping alleviate the shortage and
20 whereas NYC Health and Hospitals in partnership with
21 St. George's University Grenada has launched City
22 Doctors, a scholarship program designed to attract
23 and educate the best and brightest students to become
24 doctors committed to serving in urban hospitals. The
25 demand for primary care physicians, especially in

1
2 urban areas, is expected to increase as the current
3 physician workforce ages and retires and whereas City
4 Doctors scholarships enable students to complete
5 clinical training and in some cases launching their
6 post-residency careers in an urban environment. To
7 date, St. George's Medical School has contributed
8 more than 14,000 physicians to the global physician
9 workforce with students, graduate, faculty from over
10 140 countries who have practiced in every state in
11 the United States and whereas the scholarship
12 commitment of \$1.5 million this year will allow 15
13 students, most from the five boroughs, to complete
14 their medical education with a commitment to return
15 to work and serve in the communities they know best.
16 And whereas, the scholarship recipients have been
17 selected based on their academic excellence and
18 financial need and will receive either partial or
19 full scholarships to pay for medical school tuition
20 for periods of up to four years with some
21 scholarships valued at more than \$200,000 each and
22 whereas in return for their scholarships for each
23 equivalent year of tuition they received, students
24 have committed to provide one year of service as a
25 primary care attending physician at one of 11

1 hospitals within the city's public health system.

2 And whereas, the New York City Council commends the

3 City Doctors Program for supporting future

4 generations and encourage other medical schools

5 within our five boroughs and across the United States

6 to expand access to primary and preventive care to

7 those who need it most. Now therefore be it known

8 that the Council of the -- the New York City Council

9 is proud to honor City Doctors and St. George's

10 Medical School and the medical students who have

11 received support through this program and who have

12 committed to work in the New York City Public Health

13 Network. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the

14 entire Council, Jumaane D. Williams, Council Member

15 44th District Brooklyn.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I forgot to

17 mention Greg Bishop is a Commissioner of Small

18 Business Services and also medicine is always

19 personal to me. My mom is a pharmacist. My late dad

20 was a physician. He was not lucky enough to be

21 educated here. I believe before it was built, he was

22 educated right here so this is a very personal thing

23 for me. Counsel General?

1
2 ROSEMARY WELCH: Thank you, Council
3 Member Jumaane. Ladies and gentlemen, I'm very
4 honored to be her today and it is with my deepest
5 pleasure and privilege to congratulate the New York
6 City Council Member Jumaane Williams for recognizing
7 and acknowledging the tremendous work that St.
8 George's University along with City Doctors
9 Scholarship Organization are doing here in New York
10 and in Grenada and Caribbean as a whole. It is
11 noticeable the great impact this institutions are
12 having on the lives of persons here in New York and
13 Grenada. I would also like to emphasis how St.
14 George's University has also impacted on the economy,
15 our economy of Grenada by establishing such a top
16 center international educational unit which draws
17 students and faculty from more than 140 countries to
18 Grenada. I would also like to congratulate all the
19 awardees. Therefore, on behalf of the government and
20 people of Grenada, (??), I want to once again
21 congratulate Counsel Member Jumaane and the St.
22 George's University and the city support doctor
23 scholarship for this proclamation that he has given
24 to the organization. Thank you.

1
2 REGINALD OLES: Let me also add the
3 thanks of St. George's University to all of the
4 councilmembers for this designation. This happens to
5 be actually St. George's University's 40th
6 anniversary. We are the original international
7 school in the Caribbean and in addition to our 14,000
8 alumni it is interesting that our University Medical
9 School, 75 percent of our graduates go into primary
10 care. In contrast to about 30 percent of US medical
11 school graduates, our graduates are twice as likely
12 to work in underserved areas and see twice as many
13 Medicaid patients as the average US grad. So I would
14 argue that our university has not only trained large
15 numbers of physicians but is probably doing more to
16 address our country's true health care needs than
17 many other medical schools in the world. I would
18 also point out that we've had a long-standing
19 partnership with the City of New York and the public
20 hospitals in New York from our very beginning and as
21 a result today, four percent of all the practicing
22 doctors in the City of New York are our alumni which
23 is a very large number of physicians. So I would
24 particularly like to call attention to our students
25 who after all are the heart and soul of our school.

1
2 We have just a small sample of the City Doctor
3 recipients here today. These young men and women are
4 committed to in return for their scholarship to
5 return to the city and provide primary care for the
6 citizens of this city and I am very proud of them.
7 Thank you.

8 [pause]

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. That
10 ends ceremonials.

11 CLERK: Ladies and gentlemen, we ask at
12 this time if you are none council staff to please
13 make your up to the balcony. Once again, non-council
14 staff please make your way up to the balcony. All
15 Council Members please find your seats. Thank you.

16 [pause]

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Everyone please take
18 your seats, please take your seats. May we have
19 order in the chamber.

20 CLERK: Ladies and gentleman, can I
21 please have your attention? Can I have your
22 attention please? Quiet on the floor, please. Quiet
23 on the floor. At this time, please place all
24 electronic devices, all electronic devices to
25 vibrate. Will all non-council employees, non-council

1 employees please leave the main floor of the chamber.
2 We need the floor of the chambers cleared now. Thank
3 you. There is additional seating upstairs in the
4 balcony. Sergeants, please start checking
5 identifications. Thank you.
6

7 [pause]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: May we please have
9 quiet in the chambers. May we please close the
10 doors. All non-council staff please go to the
11 rotunda. All members please take your seats. Quiet
12 in the chambers. Please close the door in the back.
13 Thank you. I would now like to call Council Member
14 Julissa Ferreras-Copeland for a presentation.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
16 you all. While we have been man, many months of work
17 still to do and our Speaker will be with us for many,
18 many months, this is the last time that we will be
19 celebrating her birthday here in this chamber and as
20 it has been tradition, we have her cake from Corona,
21 a wonderful Dominican bakery. It is a diet cake. So
22 help me in wishing her a very happy birthday as it
23 has been our tradition.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Please join me in
25 singing happy birthday to the Speaker.

[singing]

[pause]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: The Speaker invites everyone -- please take your seats. The Speaker invites everyone downstairs after the Stated Council Meeting to --

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you so much. Very appreciate it. Happy to be celebrating my 48th birthday.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: All rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

[Pledge]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: All quiet in the chambers. All rise for the invocation. The invocation will be delivered by Rabbi Eli Cohen, the Executive Director of the Crown Heights Jewish Community Council at 387 Kingston Avenue in the Borough of Brooklyn. Quiet in the chambers please.

RABBI COHEN: Madam Speaker, our former council member public advocate and all the councilmembers. Before I begin, I wasn't sure about the protocol. Since we are having (??) this week if we could maybe bring the four cups of wine into the chamber here today and especially given the special

1 occasion of the Speaker's birthday maybe it would
2 have been a good idea but to continue with my
3 remarks. On Monday evening, tens of thousands of
4 children in New York City will be asking their
5 parents why is this night different from all other
6 nights of the year and their parents will be
7 responded by telling the story of the Jewish people
8 beginning with we were slaves to pharaohs in Egypt
9 and the Lord took us out. We tell of the Exodus, the
10 arrival in the Promised Land, the dispersal of the
11 Jews throughout the world later in history, the
12 persecution generation after generation but all in
13 the end the Holy One saved us from the hand of the
14 oppressors. So above all on this night, we cherish
15 freedom, freedom of worship and freedom to be who we
16 are for every resident of this great city. We're
17 told that there are four children at the Seder, as
18 the Passover dinner is called: the wise, the wicked,
19 the simple and the one who does not know how to ask.
20 The rebellious child is included at the table but we
21 speak directly and harshly to him. An important
22 lesson. Protect every citizen, preserve the dignity
23 of those who have strayed, keep them at the table but
24 all the while we must be sure to keep the streets
25

1 safe for those who live and work in the city and for
2 those who patrol the streets to keep us safe. This
3 time is also special in that tomorrow night and
4 Friday we will celebrate 115 years since the birth of
5 the Lubavitcher Rebbe Rabbi Schneerson. The Rabbi's
6 leadership continues to resonate from the world
7 headquarters at 770 Eastern Parkway in Crown Heights,
8 Brooklyn. Thousands of communities around the world
9 ever once asked at a gathering such as this we should
10 fulfil an act of charity by placing a coin in the
11 charity box. This [inaudible] needs no reminders of
12 the importance of charity. The Council has been very
13 supportive of our Crown Heights Jewish Community
14 Council work in caring for the elderly and for
15 families for many years. More recently, through the
16 Elie Wiesel Holocaust Initiative, we are giving
17 special care to those who survive the unthinkable
18 Holocaust of two generations ago. Through the
19 Council's Domestic Violence Initiative, we work to
20 educate our community to prevent abuse and suffering
21 in families. The Rebbe teaches us to believe and to
22 have optimism, to believe in redemption. The world
23 will soon come to a place, a time of peace, a time
24 without wars, a time where we all pursue knowledge in
25

1
2 the pursuit of happiness. Now we pray. That mindful
3 of the lessons of Passover freedom and of hope that
4 this Council be guided by wisdom in its
5 deliberations, that its members be blessed with
6 health and good fortune for themselves, their
7 families and their constituents and that all of New
8 York City see all of God's special blessing of
9 harmony, safety, good fortune and a bright future.
10 Happy holiday to everyone.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you Rabbi Cohen.
12 It was an honor and a privilege to represent you as a
13 former member of the City Council. Now we turn over
14 to the current member of the City Council
15 representing the Crown Heights Community, Council
16 Member Laurie Cumbo.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. Today
18 is a proud day that we have the honor to open the
19 floor up to Rabbi Eli Cohen, an incredible spiritual
20 leader and staunch advocate for lifting up all people
21 regardless of background and culture. Rabbi Cohen
22 serves as the Executive Director of the Crown Heights
23 Jewish Community Council also known as the CHJCC,
24 whom provided today's invocation. We are just days
25 away from the beginning of Passover which begins at

1
2 sunset in Monday, April 10, and will conclude at
3 nightfall Tuesday, April 18. Quite an exciting time
4 in our district. Rabbi Cohen is born in Manchester,
5 England. He pursued Rabbinic studies in New Jersey
6 and at the Central Lubavitch Yeshiva in New York for
7 eight years receiving rabbinical ordination in 1980.
8 Soon after their wedding in 1982, he and his wife,
9 Uhodis (SP), and I am so proud that he recognized his
10 wife today as we are on the heels of Women's History
11 Month, shortly after their wedding worked for three
12 years in the founding of a Chabad outreach program in
13 San Francisco, California. For 18 years, Rabbi Cohen
14 served as the Director of Chabad at New York
15 University building a vibrant Jewish communal and
16 religious life on the NYU campus and providing
17 spiritual guidance to the students, faculty and
18 staff. I just want to say personally what I am so
19 proud of the work of Rabbi Cohen is that he continues
20 to provide assistance to all the residents of Crown
21 Heights of every ethnic group and creed. He
22 continues to be that voice, that person that we all
23 call on for leadership, he is that voice that we call
24 on in times of challenge to be the voice of calm and
25 to be the voice of unity. He represents the Crown

1
2 Heights Community and he represents it proudly and to
3 the broader New York City community and beyond. We
4 are proud to have. You are certainly a beacon of
5 light in our community and I also want to thank you
6 very personally for the work you've done in
7 eliminating the cycles of gun violence in our
8 community. You can always be counted on to address
9 all issues and to be that face no matter what the
10 issue is in Crown Heights and beyond. Thank you so
11 much for your service.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amen. Adoption of
13 minutes, Council Member Crowley?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I motion that
15 the minutes of the Stated Meetings of February 15,
16 2017 and March 1, 2017 be adopted as printed.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: So moved. Messages and
18 papers from the Mayor?

19 CLERK: None.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Communication from
21 city, county and borough offices?

22 CLERK: None.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Petitions and
24 communications?

25 CLERK: None.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Land Use call-ups?

CLERK: M492, sidewalk café.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Roll call.

CLERK: Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes.

CLERK: Borelli?

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

CLERK: Cabrera?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

CLERK: Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

CLERK: Cohen?

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I vote aye and
with permission I would like to vote aye items on the
general calendar?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I vote aye.

CLERK: Constantinides?

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

CLERK: Cornegy?

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote aye and I
would like to vote on all land use call-ups and all
matters on the general orders calendar.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes. How do you vote?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I started by saying I voted aye. I did it backwards. It's the first time. I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Quite the chambers please.

CLERK: Crowley?

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye.

CLERK: Cumbo?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.

CLERK: Deutsch?

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

CLERK: Dromm?

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

CLERK: Espinal?

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Ferreras-Copeland?

CLERK: Garodnick?

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

CLERK: Gentile?

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I vote aye on all Land Use call-ups and ask permission, Public Advocate, to vote on all general orders?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I vote aye.

CLERK: Gibson?

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.

CLERK: Grodenchik?

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

CLERK: Johnson?

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

CLERK: Kallos?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

CLERK: King?

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye.

CLERK: Koo?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

CLERK: Koslowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

CLERK: Lancman?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

CLERK: Lander?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

CLERK: Levin?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

CLERK: Levine?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

CLERK: Maisel?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

CLERK: Mealy?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.

CLERK: Menchaca?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

CLERK: Mendez?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

CLERK: Miller?

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Affirmative.

CLERK: Perkins?

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye.

CLERK: Greenfield? Richards?

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

CLERK: Rodriguez?

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

CLERK: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

CLERK: Rosenthal?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye and with permission I would like to vote aye on all call-ups and resolutions and with permission I'd like to vote on all coupled general orders. I vote aye on all.

CLERK: Salamanca?

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I would like

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

to vote aye on all call-ups and with permission I would like to vote on all call-ups general orders and resolutions?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I vote aye.
Thank you.

CLERK: Torres?

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I vote aye.

CLERK: Treyger?

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I vote aye.

CLERK: Ulrich? Vacca? Lancman?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Yeah, sorry. I would like to vote aye on all call-ups and with permission I would like to vote on all couple general orders and resolutions?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: I vote aye.

CLERK: Vallone?

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye and permission to vote on all matters on today's calendar?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you.

CLERK: Williams? Wills?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I would like to on
3 all call-ups and coupled general orders?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I vote aye.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

7 CLERK: Matteo? Van Bramer?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

9 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito?

10 [off mic - inaudible]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Today's Land Use call-
12 ups are adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 0
13 in the negative -- quiet in the chambers please. As
14 we know hear from the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I would like to
16 ask my colleagues to stand and also --

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: All rise.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: -- say welcome
19 back since it's been a bit of time since we've seen
20 each other. Unfortunately, is been a month full of
21 loss. So I want to acknowledge and take a moment
22 before we really start on our agenda to take a moment
23 to acknowledge those who have passed away recently
24 here and around the world as well. Obviously we all
25 know and unfortunately (??) age 44 year old, 14 year

1
2 veteran of Bronx EMT services, a first responder was
3 killed last month in the line of duty. She leaves
4 behind five children and our thoughts are with them
5 at this tragic time. A constant reminder of how
6 first responders put their lives on the lines for us
7 so we thank her deeply and her family for the service
8 that she has provided to our city. Gilbert Baker,
9 the creator of the rainbow flag, an internationally
10 known symbol of LGBT rights since the late 1970s also
11 has recently passed away on March 31 at the age of
12 65. Journalist and husband of former Council Member
13 Ronnie Eldridge, Jimmy Breslin, who many in this room
14 knew very well in print if not in person, died on
15 March 19th at the age of 88 and leaves behind an
16 enduring legacy in the form of years' worth of his
17 quintessentially New York columns. And, Timothy
18 Caughman, a 66 year old Chelsea resident, was a
19 victim of a shocking reprehensible racially motivated
20 attack, a hate crime. The New York Police Department
21 acted quickly to apprehend his attacker and we look
22 forward to justice being served in memory of this
23 innocent New Yorker. Rhetoric that surrounds us
24 these days doesn't help and I believe has fueled
25 these incidents that we see happening. Finally David

1
2 Rockefeller, philanthropist and banker who gave so
3 much to this city in so many ways, passed away on
4 March 20th at the age of 101. All of these
5 individuals contributed in their own important ways
6 to what it means to be a New Yorker and we thank them
7 for all that they gave to this city during their
8 lifetimes. Our thoughts are with them and our
9 thoughts are with our counterparts in major cities
10 also the globe who have also experienced tragic loss
11 in the past few weeks. We offer our support to those
12 who have lost their lives in the March 22nd
13 Westminster in London as well as those killed by the
14 suicide in St. Petersburg just two days ago. So I
15 ask that we all -- that you all join me in a moment
16 of silence to commemorate all these passing and all
17 these lives.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you my
19 colleagues.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Please be seated.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I would also like
22 to note and I really want to thank Majority Leader's
23 Jimmy Van Bramer's resolution calling upon President
24 Trump to fully fund the arts including any aid, any
25 age, IMLS, and CPB. Let's remember that threatening

1
2 our arts and culture means threatening our very own
3 civilization so I want to applaud his leadership. He
4 has been incredibly staunch in this. He is our
5 fighter here in the Council on behalf of arts and
6 culture and will be hearing more about that
7 resolution in today's hearing. And I want to ask,
8 before I talk about the agenda, I know my colleagues
9 you have indulged me in the past but you know that I
10 utilize my platform to really raise the voice of my
11 Puerto Rico, which a lot of times issues that are
12 affecting the island aren't really given any sort of
13 mainstream coverage, and so I wanted to talk about
14 two very important things that are happening on the
15 island as we speak. First of all, I want to send a
16 direct message to the President of Puerto Rico's
17 Senate, Thomas Rivera Schatz, who last week did a
18 despicable thing by revoking the rights and
19 protections of the Senate's transgender employees.
20 So here we go. [Inaudible] Thomas, you should be
21 ashamed of yourself. [Spanish] Additionally, as we
22 speak, in the University System of Puerto Rico the
23 students are having an assembly to make a decision as
24 to whether or not they are going to go on strike. As
25 people know, there is an unelected fiscal control

1 board that is making decisions about what is
2 happening in Puerto Rico. They made a decision to
3 cut the University funding by \$450 million which
4 represents half of the University System's budget. I
5 want us to consider and think about what it would
6 mean for this city if there was a decision to be made
7 to cut our CUNY system's budget by half. I don't
8 think we would stand for that. We wouldn't accept
9 it. The University and Public University Systems on
10 the island here in New York City educate the
11 generation of leaders that will run our city that can
12 potentially help Puerto Rico get out of its fiscal
13 crisis instead of having people leave the island
14 because they feel they have to alternative. Asking
15 young people in the public education system have to
16 pay more in order to make up the cost of the cuts
17 that are being imposed is deplorable so [Spanish]. I
18 want to thank my colleagues for giving me that
19 moment. [Applause.] So, today on our agenda, the
20 Council will begin by voting on proposal landmark
21 designations for multiple locations including the
22 135th Street YMCA in Harlem and the United Palace
23 Theater in Washington Heights. Since the 1930s, both
24 facilities have served as major hubs of intellectual
25

1
2 and social life for their respective areas providing
3 beautiful and fully equipped spaces for neighborhoods
4 to become communities. For staff, I want to thank
5 Jeff (??), Amy Levitan, Jeff Capana (SP). The United
6 Palace Theater is located in Council Ydanis
7 Rodriguez's district while the Harlem YMCA is
8 represented by our newest Councilmember Bill Perkins
9 so I would like to invite both of them to say a few
10 words about these historic designation. We will
11 start off with Councilmember Ydanis Rodriguez.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
13 Speaker. I am so proud to speak supporting the land-
14 marking of the Loew's Theater on 175th Street and
15 Broadway also known as the United Palace, a palace
16 that has welcomed great artist such as Adele, Lee
17 Manuel, Pablo Milanes, Aventura, Rita Moreno, Michel
18 Camilo and many others. This theater is one of three
19 wonderful designed by no other theater architect
20 Thomas Lamb. It was built in 1932 for the Loew's
21 Theater Company to show movies in an extravagant
22 environment. It features beautiful owner-architect
23 both indoors and out with things for multiple regions
24 and style. The theater is a treasure in our city and
25 seen as one of the few buildings considered for

1 landmarks in Northern Manhattan. Unique
2 characteristics include Wonder Theatre Pipe Organ
3 that was once used during performance one of five in
4 New York City. The exterior of the building has been
5 [inaudible] architect critics for its many references
6 for artist style from around the world. The theater
7 remains in excellent shape comparable to when it was
8 originally built. Thank you to your support and
9 support of my colleagues.
10

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Councilmember
12 Perkins?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you very
14 much. I want to express my appreciation to this body
15 for the support that you will be giving in making
16 this landmark happen. This institution is a defining
17 moment in the history not only the Harlem community
18 but in many other respect with regards to the
19 African-American community of this country and has
20 been a landmark not just as a piece of property but
21 also in terms of the distinguished individuals that
22 have frequented this place so I'm honored to be able
23 to support this and look forward to my colleagues
24 joining me in that support.

25 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,

1 Councilmember. Our first legislative item today
2 concerns city tree maintenance activity, Intro 1112A
3 sponsored by Minority Leaders Steve Matteo, would
4 require the Parks Department to post on its website
5 information relating to the times, dates, locations
6 and work statuses of various tree maintenance
7 activities. For staff, I want to thank Chris Atori
8 (SP), Patrick Movihill (SP), Kenneth Grace, Jen
9 Wilcox, Annette Atkin. We thank Councilmember Matteo
10 for his work to keep New Yorkers better informed
11 about tree preservation work around the city and
12 invite him to say a few words.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you, Madam
15 Speaker. For those of us who have been working in
16 government for years either an elected officers or
17 staffer, you probably have received a complaint from
18 a constituent about a dangling tree limb, rotten tree
19 stump, broken sidewalk. We know how difficult it is
20 even as someone with access to information from city
21 agencies to get answers about when Parks are planning
22 to prune a certain tree or whether approve a sidewalk
23 at all. The bill Park Committee Chairman Mark Levin
24 and I authored will finally get us and the public
25 answers. By requiring Parks to post information

1 related to tree and sidewalk maintenance on its
2 website, this legislation will provide much-needed
3 public oversight to a program responsible for
4 maintaining 650,000 street trees city-wide. It will
5 bring more accountability and predictability to a
6 process that has been [inaudible] simply arbitrary.
7 This is also extremely important because probably
8 managing our resources reduces the risk of personal
9 injury and property damage from falling branches,
10 loose stumps or broken sidewalks. Our bill will
11 require Parks to post quarterly updates on tree
12 maintenance online including approximate dates,
13 locations and status of scheduled tree pruning's,
14 tree stump removals, tree plantings, related sidewalk
15 inspections and repairs. For the first time, the
16 public will have easy access to inspection ratings
17 for each damaged sidewalk. These ratings represented
18 by numbers between zero and 100 provides clear
19 indication as to whether a damaged sidewalk will be
20 made a priority for repair. Parks will also provide
21 the date of the initial request for repair as well as
22 the total number of requests made for sidewalk
23 inspection and repairs over the previous six months.
24 I want to thank my colleague and partner in this
25

1
2 endeavor, Mark Levine, and his staff for all his hard
3 work and passion on this issue as well as the Speaker
4 for her support and for Parks for productively
5 collaborating with us to get this final piece of
6 legislation. I want to have a special thanks to my
7 Deputy Chief Angela San (SP), to my Chief Operations
8 Peter Spencer and my Chief of Staff David Carr, to
9 Amy Spattery (SP) from Chair Levine's office to Chris
10 Arturi (SP) and the Parks Community Staff and
11 [inaudible]. I also want to sneak in and mention
12 today that we are also voting to create New York
13 Business Improvement District in my district is the
14 second [inaudible - skip in audio] we have created in
15 my district since I took office on the 4th on Staten
16 Island. New Dorp Lane and New Dorp Plaza is one of
17 great shopping areas of our borough with wonderful
18 retail store, restaurants and unique services all
19 with a small town feel. We're all experiencing some
20 dramatic changes in our communities with an influx
21 with big investment and growth. Staten Island's
22 North Shore will be transformed by the empire outlets
23 as well as the mid island with the Boulevard
24 development. These changes can be a good thing.
25 They can revitalize and uplift neighborhoods. I

1
2 believe it is extremely important that at some time
3 we also protect our traditional small corridors and
4 support the businesses and entrepreneurs which are
5 the economic heart and soul of our communities. I am
6 proud of the work we have done and are doing to
7 change the dynamic between small business and
8 government and I thank my colleagues for their
9 support. I particularly want to express my gratitude
10 again to the Speaker, to Finance Chair Julissa
11 Ferreras-Copeland, my staff: Rebecca, Jason, Eric
12 Bernstein from the Finance Committee, New Dorp
13 Merchant Group Chair Maria Esposito and her steering
14 committee, the Staten Island Economic Development
15 Corporation and staff from SBS and City Planning. I
16 urge all my colleagues to vote in favor of these two
17 pieces on legislation today. Thank you.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

19 Council Member Matteo. next we are going to be
20 voting on Intro 564A sponsored by Council Member
21 Jimmy Vacca which would require city agency to review
22 the feasibility of establishing online applications
23 for all permits, licenses and registrations issued by
24 city agencies and to create a plan and timeline for
25 allowing such online applications. I want to think

1
2 Meleka Jubali (SP), these are on the staff side here,
3 Meleka Jubali (SP), ???, John Russell, Jen Wilcox, Ed
4 Atkin, Councilmember Vacca, Chair of the Committee on
5 Technology, and as such understand the value of this
6 legislation so I invited him to speak on the bill.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you, Madam
8 Speaker, members of the council. New York City's
9 agencies offers hundreds of permits and licenses to
10 be filled out. Completing permits is simply a fact
11 of running a business in this city and it is
12 necessary for residents as well who hope to access
13 city services and amenities. While a number of
14 applications have been placed online, several can
15 only be filled out by mail or in person and the
16 applications that are online are distributed across
17 agency websites and not always easily accessed. When
18 it comes to applications, I feel paper and paper
19 pushing must be reduced on a citywide scale and that
20 our online applications should be both simplified and
21 streamlined. This legislation mandates that an
22 office designated by the Mayor determines whether the
23 city can offer all applications online and on a
24 single portal. If such a system is deemed feasible,
25 the legislation we're voting on today requires that a

1
2 plan and timeline be developed. The city has made
3 countless technological advances in the past several
4 years and it is now time we figure out how to bring
5 our outdated permitting and licensing process into
6 the 21st-century. When we do so, we will undoubtedly
7 make the lives of everyday New Yorkers better. I
8 thank you Madam Speaker, members of the Technology
9 Committee and the staff for all their assistance and
10 I hope the members will vote yes.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
12 Council Member. Continuing on, we will be voting on
13 Intro 708A sponsored by Council Member Matthew Eugene
14 which would create a task force to examine the
15 challenges that prevent disconnected youth from
16 enrolling in schools or being employed. The task
17 force would be composed of 25 members including
18 representatives from city agencies and appointees
19 personally chosen by myself and the Mayor and would
20 be charged with reviewing current policies and
21 programs that effect disconnected youth and analyzing
22 potential solutions for the obstacles that these
23 youth confront. I want to thank (SP???), Aisha
24 Shumberg (SP), (??) Nasser, Esha Wright and Jessica
25 Ackerman, Youth Services Committee Chair Mathieu

1
2 Eugene has worked diligently to see this task force
3 commissioned and I invite him to say a few words.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
5 much, Madam Speaker, for giving me the opportunity to
6 speak about Intro 708 which is a very important piece
7 of legislation that will help us better serve some of
8 the city's most vulnerable residents, disconnected
9 youth, those who are not in school, those who are not
10 working. In New York City, we have disconnected
11 youth for a crisis. According to the census, the
12 last census, we had about 172,000 young people
13 between the age of 18 and 24 who are not in school
14 and who are not working and we need to do more to
15 help them. These young people have many challenges
16 in their life. Many have not graduated from high
17 school. They have had contact with our criminal
18 justice system or also the foster care system and
19 many of them lack skill and experiences necessary to
20 find jobs and to keep them. I believe it is
21 [inaudible] to help those young people become
22 prepared for the 21st-century workforce to find job
23 and to improve their lives and improve their
24 communities. Intro 708 would create a disconnected
25 youth task force that would [inaudible] analyze and

1
2 departments that prevent the disconnected youth from
3 pursuing their education or finding a job. The task
4 force would also examine the current policies and
5 programs of disconnected youth, make accommodations
6 as to [inaudible] current program and who and also
7 this is the first step to getting youth who are not
8 working and who are not in school, the services and
9 programs that they need. The task force would have
10 members from city agencies such as DYCD, LBS, SCS and
11 DOE. Other members would include service providers,
12 [inaudible] team of CUNY as well as youth leaders.
13 The task force will assess the obstacles that prevent
14 disconnected youth from pursuing their education and
15 entering the workforce as well as analyze
16 recommendation on how to address the obstacle. Then
17 we will -- the task force will submit report to the
18 Speaker and to the Mayor. I just want now to thank
19 all the members of the Youth Services Committee,
20 especially the Council, (???) the policy analyst,
21 Michael Benjamin and also Ms. Jessica Ackerman and
22 all my colleagues. I thank you for everything that
23 you have been doing and that you do every day of the
24 young people in New York City. Thank you, Madam
25 Speaker for your [inaudible].

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
3 Council Member. For too long the environmental
4 impacts of industry have been felt and distributed
5 disproportionately among New York City's communities.
6 Introductions 886A and 359A sponsored by Council
7 Member Inez Barron, Environmental Protection
8 Committee Chair Costa Constantinides, would require
9 the Mayor to establish an interagency working group
10 consisting of representatives from city agencies
11 relevant to environmental justice. This committee
12 would be charged with conducting an environmental
13 justice study and developing a comprehensive
14 environmental justice plan to more evenly distributed
15 programs and other resources to neighborhoods
16 affected by pressing environmental concerns. I want
17 to thank Samara Swanson, Bill Murray, Johnathon
18 Selzer, Jen Wilcox and Ed Atkin, council Member
19 Constantinides and Barron where prime sponsors of
20 these items and represent district heavily impacted
21 by the disruptions of environmental and climate
22 events. So I am going to ask them to say a few words
23 on the development of this plan to bring justice to
24 affected neighborhoods around the city. I will first
25 call on the Chair of the Committee Costa

1
2 Constantinides followed by Council Member Barron.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank
4 you, Madam Speaker and as we approach Earth Day I
5 want to thank you again for your strong environmental
6 leadership as Washington DC is moving away from
7 environmental justice, we are setting a new standard
8 here in New York City. I ask my colleagues to join
9 us today in supporting Intro 359 and 886 sponsored by
10 Council Member Inez Barron. By passing these bills
11 would not only be the first major city to pass
12 environmental justice legislation since the Trump
13 Administration was inaugurated but will be the first
14 city to pass any environmental justice legislation
15 this substantial. Thomas Payne once wrote that these
16 are times that try men's souls, a sentiment that most
17 of us in the environmental movement and all of us in
18 this room feel today. We in fact are looking at the
19 most fire challenge to environmentalism as we know
20 it, one that threatens to wipe out all the gain that
21 our nation has made. If the Trump Administration
22 has its way, our air will be more polluted, our
23 streams and rivers will be laden with toxic runoff
24 and carbon emissions will be dangerous, even
25 catastrophic levels. All Americans are at risk of

1
2 seeing their quality of life diminish because of
3 these harsh cuts but yet some have always and will
4 even more into the future bear these burdens more
5 than others. From the communities that we represent
6 in Western Queens, Jimmy Van Bramer and I, Astoria,
7 Houses, Ravenswood and Queensbridge sitting in the
8 shadows of some of the largest power plants in our
9 city to EJ communities throughout our entire cities
10 houses pollutants frequently burn in low income and
11 low income communities of color much more than
12 others. Numerous studies have shown that these
13 communities have greater asthma rates, blood lead
14 levels, developmental delays and birth defects that
15 all correlates to the toxins in their immediate
16 environment. While some of these actions have been
17 mitigated by federal and state laws, New York City
18 has never had one single office or process in which
19 EJ communities can learn about the issues that they
20 face and work with the city to address them. That's
21 why the bills today we are passing are so critical.
22 Intro 359A requires the city to undertake a
23 comprehensive study on which communities are the most
24 impacted and make recommendations on how to ease the
25 burden on them and additionally creates a portal

1
2 where any New Yorker can go online and get
3 information about environmental justice and their
4 community. Intro 886, which my colleague will speak
5 to, will work even further to make sure that agencies
6 are working with these effected communities. The
7 forces of obsolete industries look to tear down all
8 the work that we have done to build a greener and
9 more sustainable world. By passing these bills, we
10 will be the first major jurisdiction to respond to
11 Donald Trump's plan with a plan of our own, one that
12 reflects our values, one that protects our most
13 vulnerable citizens and ones that will protect all of
14 us from climate change. We cannot truly address
15 climate change without addressing our EJ communities
16 as it has been said so many times. These are truly
17 New York values. So I want to thank our Speaker,
18 thank Council Member Inez Barron for her strong
19 leadership for over ten years. Thank Samara Swanson,
20 our environmental attorney, who has been working on
21 this for 25 years now. Bill Murray, our policy
22 analyst, Matt (??), Ed Atkin, Jeff Baker, Ramon
23 Martinez, Peggy Sheppard and Cecil Corbin mark from
24 We Act, the League of Conservation Voters, Rebecca
25 Bratsee (SP) from the CUNY Law School and of course

1
2 Nilda Masa (SP) the former head of the Mayor's Office
3 of Sustainability and now Mark Chambers the current
4 head. We look forward to standing up for
5 environmental justice and for those in our
6 neighborhoods that need it most. Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madam
8 Public Advocate. This has been a long time coming.
9 I guess we can draw some parallels to April the
10 giraffe that they are still waiting for that baby to
11 come, well this is finally here. I first want to
12 acknowledge that my intern is here, Shanice Pollard
13 (SP). She is a recent graduate of the University of
14 Albany. She is interning in my office. Her degree -
15 - her major was in economics and her minor was in
16 business and she is interested in going into law. To
17 get to the matter at hand, I have been involved in
18 many justice issues for close to 60 years being
19 involved in justice issues but it was in 1995 when an
20 environmental justice issue came right and sat down
21 in our community or so they thought they would. The
22 Atlas Bio Company wasn't able to get licensed in Long
23 Island for the wood burning incinerators so they
24 thought they would come to East New York and bring
25 their wood burning incinerator and put it next to

1
2 their waste transfer station. It would have released
3 97 tons of carbon monoxide, 47 tons of sulfur dioxide
4 and ten tons of other particulate matter. Needless
5 to say, we organized. We fought. We fought the then
6 borough president who was ready to move it forward.
7 We got the assistance of lots of advocates and the
8 NAACP Legal Defense Fund to fight this issue. So
9 this bill that we are presenting today was initially
10 introduced by my predecessor, my husband, the love of
11 my life, now Assembly Charles Barron and he
12 introduced it about ten years ago and we've now
13 brought it to fruition. And this law will address
14 how citywide agencies will develop a proactive plan
15 for communities to equitably share both the benefits
16 and the burdens of environmental concerns.
17 Environmental justice means, as my colleague
18 Constantinides has said, fair treatment and
19 involvement of all person regardless of color, creed,
20 national origin or income with respect to the
21 development, implementation and enforcement of
22 environmental laws with respect to the equitable
23 distribution of environmental benefits. This law
24 affirms that no group should bear a disproportionate
25 share of the negative environmental consequences or

1
2 receive an equitably low share of environmental
3 benefits. This plan establishes the interagency
4 working group which will be composed of various
5 agencies and provide guidance to providing citywide
6 agencies for promoting environmental justice and
7 provide recommendations for city agencies to bring
8 operations in line with environmental justice
9 concerns. It also establishes an advisory board
10 which will make recommendations to the IWC. This
11 legislation is a model that will be replicated across
12 the nation. I am pleased to see New York in the
13 vanguard of the movement to ensure that as we
14 continue to become aware of ways to protect our
15 environment and correct the harm we have done in the
16 past that all communities will be treated equitably.
17 I am pleased to have brought this legislation to my
18 colleagues and to have gained extensive support which
19 is indicative of your understanding of the impact of
20 this legislation. And finally, I do want to say that
21 the issues that are going to be addressed are climate
22 change, waste disposal, ozone layer depletion, air
23 water and land pollution and we are going to make
24 sure that as citywide initiatives are introduced that
25 they will promote greater public engagement,

1
2 transparency and participation and that agencies will
3 change their programs to provide an environmental
4 justice capital program in the aforementioned
5 activities with the public citing of agencies and
6 facilities in environmentally just areas and will
7 also maintain a disaggregated data for the areas
8 surrounding the facilities to make sure that if any
9 substantial economic, environmental human health and
10 economic effects are impacted it will be analyzed for
11 the surrounding community. And finally, I would like
12 to thank my colleague, the Chair, Costa
13 Constantinides, the Speaker for her assistance in
14 bringing this forward, Ramon Martinez, the city, the
15 Council Staff, Bill Murray, who is a policy analyst,
16 Ed Atkin, Supervisor and Deputy Director, Mark (??)
17 the Legislative Director, my staff and Indigo
18 Washington, Legislative Director, Joy Simmons Chief
19 of Staff, and especially, especially, especially a
20 big shout out to Samara Swanson for her untiring
21 dedication as the Committee Counsel over the course
22 of many years to bring this legislation to fruition.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
24 Member. Yesterday marked equal payday representing
25 the 93 additional days that women must work to meet

1
2 the salary earned by the average man in just one
3 year. Today the Council will pass Intro 1253A
4 sponsored by Council Member Elizabeth Crowley and the
5 Public Advocate Latisha James which would prohibit
6 employers from making salary history inquiries or
7 relying on salary history to determine a prospective
8 applicants salary. Just one underpaid position can
9 send a individual on a course of underpayment for the
10 entirety of their professional life and this
11 consequence has been shown to disproportionately
12 effect women and communities of color. Through this
13 legislation, the City Council is taking action to
14 help break the cycle of pay inequity locally and
15 nationally. We are proud to be one of the first
16 American jurisdictions to take this step. I want to
17 thank staff Zimma Laheylo (SP), Rachel Cordero, (??).
18 While we internally opted this policy voluntarily and
19 it was expanded to all city agencies earlier last
20 year, today's action marks a significant step forward
21 by addressing the issue in the private sector
22 context. I would like to thank Council Member
23 Crowley and Public Advocate Tish James for the work
24 on this essential initiative to bring economic
25 justice to working New Yorkers around the city.

1
2 Public Advocate, thank you for your leadership and
3 you can say a few words followed by Council Member
4 Crowley.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. I want to
6 thank the Mayor's Office. I want to thank the
7 Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito. I want to thank the
8 Civil Rights Committee Chair Darlene Mealy, co-
9 sponsors Elizabeth Crowley, Council Member Cumbo,
10 Council Member Rosenthal, Council Member Ferreras-
11 Copeland, Council Member Lander and Council Member
12 Salamanca. I also want to thank City Council staff
13 members (??), (??), Rachel Cordero, Annette Jawal and
14 from my staff Jason Furman, who is not here today
15 because he just had a baby girl, Michelle Kim and Ty
16 Johnson. I want to applaud and thank the City
17 Council for advancing and voting on this legislation
18 today to ban employers from asking job applicants for
19 previous salary information because when women,
20 particularly women of color, already experience wage
21 disparities asking for their previous salary
22 information only perpetuates that discrimination and
23 being underpaid once should not condemn anyone to a
24 lifetime of inequity because when women are paid less
25 for equal work from one job to the next, not only are

1
2 they cheated in their work salaries but they are
3 proportionately cheated in their retirement benefits
4 so there is a common sense answer. Don't ask your
5 employees for their salary history, just post it,
6 equal pay for equal work. Improving the status of
7 women have lasting effects on all communities
8 including men, children and families and our economy.
9 While this bill is a critical step forward, we know
10 it is not a cure-all and we know that it won't
11 completely close the gender and racial gap in our
12 city. More than ever New York City needs to identify
13 the tools and supports that help women achieve
14 economic security and balance the demands of work and
15 caring for their family and that starts with the
16 passage of this bill ensuring that women are not
17 stuck in a system of underpayment with no recourse.
18 This bill will go a long way in closing the wage gap
19 that has hurt women for far too long. Thank you
20 Madam Speaker and thank the City Council.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you,
22 Speaker. We stand here today on equal pay week still
23 dealing with the substantial wage gap between men and
24 women stretched over a lifetime of work. This
25 disparity leaves women substantially more

1
2 disadvantaged than the average man. A way out of
3 this injustice is to enact this law that prevents
4 gender based wage discrimination. I am proud to
5 support and sponsor this bill along with our Public
6 Advocate, Latisha James, which will prohibit
7 employers from asking about an applicant's salary
8 history. This will reduce the likelihood that women
9 will continue to be discriminated against by prior
10 salary levels. Employers must base the rate of pay
11 on the work of the work required. I would like to
12 thank again the Speaker and Council Member Darlene
13 Mealy, who Chairs the Civil Rights Committee, for
14 their leadership on equal rights. Again, I would
15 like to thank the Public Advocate for advancing and
16 sponsoring this bill and I know that together we can
17 break the cycle of gender pay inequality.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And the final
19 item being voted on today is particularly pressing
20 given the current political climate. Intro 746A,
21 sponsored by Council Member Danny Dromm, would put in
22 place stricter guidelines for providers of
23 immigration assistance services in order to further
24 protect New Yorkers against immigration services
25 fraud and the unauthorized practice of immigration

1
2 law. Providers of immigration assistance services
3 would be prohibited from offering and providing
4 services that should only be providing by an attorney
5 and for making statements that could lead an
6 individual to believe that the provider is an
7 attorney or authorized to give legal advice.

8 Providers would be required to give their customers
9 comprehensive contracts that detail their duties and
10 limitations, disclose that they are not authorized to
11 give legal advice or representation and include the
12 new Consumer Bill of Rights which the bill directs
13 the Department of Consumer Affairs to create. This
14 bill would also require DCA to provide periodic
15 reports to the Council with information regarding the
16 number, type, source and results of complaints filed
17 against providers as well as the Departments efforts
18 to affirmatively investigate providers. DCA would
19 also be required to provide outreach and education to
20 communities regarding common scams used by providers
21 and how to report them as well as DCA services in
22 this context. Unscrupulous providers often misusing
23 the title notario, are dangerous and indefensible for
24 out immigrant communities and I am proud to represent
25 a Council dedicated to defending the rights of our

1
2 most vulnerable. I really want to thank on the staff
3 Indiana Porta, Valkeys Mirig (SP) and Rachel Cordero
4 and I thank Council Member Danny Dromm for his
5 leadership on all issues regarding immigration and
6 other matters and to our Chair of our Immigration
7 Committee Carlos Menchaca as well. On this
8 particular bill it definitely sets forth necessary
9 safeguards. We remind any New Yorker in Need that
10 they can visit our Council website,
11 council.nyc.gov/immigrantresources for information on
12 free and low cost legal services available throughout
13 this city and with that ask the led sponsor Council
14 Member Dromm to say a few words.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you so much
16 Madam Speaker. It has been a true honor to work with
17 you on so many issues regarding our immigrant
18 communities over the last eight years and I deeply
19 appreciate your leadership on all of these issues. I
20 would also like to thank Council Member Espinal,
21 Menchaca and Lancman in your help advancing this
22 crucial measure. Since the bill was introduced in
23 2015, the situation has gone from difficult to dire.
24 Trump seems determined not only to break Obama's
25 record but of deportations but also to scapegoat our

1
2 immigrant families extract from what he is doing to
3 our country. Proposed Intro 746A represents a very
4 tangible way the city can affirm its commitment to
5 remaining a sanctuary city. Scammers are praying
6 upon the fears of immigrants desperate for assistance
7 navigating complex immigration laws, a huge problem
8 in my district and throughout the city. This
9 legislation tightens requirements for immigration
10 service providers, increases penalties for violators
11 and mandates coordination among relevant agencies.
12 Crafted with input from leading experts, Intro 746A
13 puts New York City at the forefront of the fight for
14 justice for our immigrant communities. I would like
15 to recognize some of those experts, the New York
16 Immigration Coalition, the American Immigration
17 Lawyers Association, Make The Road New York, Legal
18 Services New York, Catholic Charities, NYLAG,
19 Immigrant Justice Corp., the Urban Justice Center and
20 Cardozo Law. I also want to thank Consumer Affairs
21 Committee Council Balkis Neharig (SP) and policy
22 analyst Israel Martinez. Special thanks to Catalina
23 Cruz, now Chief of Staff to Council Member Julissa
24 Ferreras-Copeland, for working on this when she
25 serves as counsel for the Immigration Committee. I

1
2 extend my deepest gratitude to current Immigration
3 Committee counsel, Indiana Porta, for making sure we
4 ended up with the strongest bill possible and finally
5 let me also thank Sebastian McGuire, my counsel, for
6 all of his hard work on this legislation. Thank you
7 very much.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
9 Member and finally I want to definitely give a shout-
10 out to our Finance Division. We just issued our
11 report, response to the budget and I definitely want
12 to thank them for all the hours that they put into
13 our budget hearings, into the feedback [applause],
14 into all the feedback from members, processing all
15 the ideas that came out of the hearings. Obviously,
16 this is a lot, a lot of work and the Finance Chair, I
17 want to thank Julissa Ferreras-Copeland as well, the
18 Finance Division led by Latonya McKinney. I want to
19 thank all the Finance Division staff for all their
20 great work and with that I end communication from the
21 Speaker.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you, Madam
23 Speaker. Before we move on for a vote, I would like
24 to call on Council Member Eric Ulrich.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Madam Public

1
2 Advocate, I would like unanimous consent to vote on
3 all matters on the general order calendar?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Okay. I vote aye
6 on all with the exception of 1253A Intro. Thank you.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. Now calling
8 Council Member Rosie Mendez?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you, Madam
10 Public Advocate. I would like the opportunity to
11 vote on the general order calendar and on
12 resolutions?

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye on
15 all. Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. Returning
17 to the calendar, discussion of general orders.

18 Seeing none. Report of special committees?

19 CLERK: None.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Reports of standing
21 committees?

22 CLERK: Report of the Committee of Civil
23 Rights Intro 1253A, perspective employee salary
24 history.

25 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and

1
2 coupled on general orders.

3 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
4 Consumer Affairs Intro 746A, unauthorized practice of
5 immigration law.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
7 coupled on general orders.

8 CLERK: Report of the Environmental
9 Committee Protection, Intro 359A, environmental
10 justice study.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
12 coupled on general orders.

13 CLERK: Intro 886A, environmental justice
14 issues.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
16 coupled on general orders.

17 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
18 Finance, Intro 1454, New Dorp bid.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
20 general orders.

21 CLERK: Pre-considered Reso 1431, expense
22 budget.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
24 general orders.

25 CLERK: Pre-considered LU 599 and Reso

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 71
2 1435, Bronx View at Serviam Heights.
3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general
4 orders.
5 CLERK: Pre-considered LU 600 and Reso
6 1436, Casa Cecelia.
7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
8 general orders.
9 CLERK: Report of the Committee on land
10 Use LU 579 and Reso 1437 through LU 581 and Reso
11 1439, various landmark designations.
12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
13 general orders.
14 CLERK: LU 582 and Reso 1440, Lake
15 Cortelyou Taylor House.
16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Motion to
17 disapprove.
18 CLERK: LU 593 and Reso 1441, United
19 Nations Hotel.
20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
21 general orders.
22 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Parks
23 and Recreation, Intro 1112A, tree maintenance work.
24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
25 coupled on general orders.

1
2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
3 Technology, Intro 564A, online submission of permit
4 applications.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
6 coupled on general orders.

7 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Youth
8 Services, Intro 708A, task force on disconnected
9 youth.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
11 coupled on general orders.

12 CLERK: On the general order calendar,
13 resolution appointing various person Commissioner of
14 Deeds.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
16 general orders and at this time I ask for a roll call
17 on all items on the coupled general order calendar.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Quiet in the chambers
19 please.

20 CLERK: Barron?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye on
22 all.

23 CLERK: Borelli?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
25 except Reso 1493, Intro 359, 886A and 1253.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

CLERK: Cabrera?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Cabrera?

CLERK: Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Congratulations to all my colleagues on their important legislation. I vote aye on all. Thank you.

CLERK: Constantinides?

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: With congratulations to all my colleagues on all the bills they are passing today, I vote aye.

CLERK: Crowley?

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on all.

CLERK: Cumbo?

PUBLIC ADVOATE: Cumbo?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye.

CLERK: Deutsch? Dromm?

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all.

CLERK: Espinal?

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: With congratulations to Inez Barron and Costa and our Madam Public Advocate and Danny Dromm, I vote aye. Today is a great day of resisting Trump.

CLERK: Eugene?

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland?

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: With permission, I would like to vote aye on all land use call-ups and I vote aye with congratulating all my colleagues today.

CLERK: Garodnick?

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

CLERK: Gibson?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member Gibson?

CLERK: Greenfield?

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you. I vote aye. Congratulate all my colleagues. I wish all who are celebrating a Happy Pesach and an enjoyable Easter.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Happy Pesach to you.

CLERK: Grodenchik?

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye and I want to add my comments, add to Mr. Greenfield's comments wishing everybody a joyous Easter and a Happy Passover and I would ask that my colleagues and all New Yorkers keep in mind those people in Syria, those lives were taken by absolute butchery and I think that it is important that in the greatest city in the greatest country in the world, still the

1
2 greatest, that we remember these atrocities and we
3 look to the future, to a better future in hopes that
4 they never occur again. Thank you, Madam Public
5 Advocate.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. Amen.

9 CLERK: Johnson?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Permission to
11 explain my vote, please?

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I vote aye on
14 everything and I congratulate my colleagues. I want
15 to today reiterate a remark the Speaker made about
16 Timothy Caughman who was constituent in my district.
17 I know Madam Public Advocate you were at his funeral
18 services along with the Mayor. He lived on West 36th
19 Street between Chelsea and Hell's Kitchen on the far
20 West Side in transitional housing facility. He was a
21 friendly face in the neighborhood. Someone who was
22 smiling and knew small business owners and walked up
23 and down 8th Avenue and 9th Avenue and in reading
24 about his life, his going around collecting cans and
25 recycling them, he would use that money to pay for

1
2 bus tickets to go down to watch Congressional
3 hearings in Washington and had a Twitter account and
4 an online social media presences that was sunny and
5 bright and uplifting and he was heinously and
6 viciously and racially attacked on a random night in
7 the neighborhood that he called home by a white
8 supremacist that came here from Baltimore with the
9 sole intention and mission of killing black men. I
10 think it is important that we say that in recognize
11 that that even in 2017 these things are still
12 happening and they are not happening in other places,
13 they are still happening here in New York City. It
14 is important to talk about that racism. It is
15 important to talk about the root of that racism. It
16 is important for us to remember the life of someone
17 born and raised in Southeast Queens who lived on the
18 West side of Manhattan who was a great genuine,
19 wonderful New Yorker. Rest in peace Timothy
20 Caughman.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you, Corey for
22 dispelling the media's notion that he was homeless.
23 He was not homeless. In fact, he was rich and he was
24 loved and the church was packed with his friends and
25 family. Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Kallos?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

CLERK: King?

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Congratulations to everyone who passed laws today to improve the City of New York and I vote aye on all.

CLERK: Koo?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you. Today we vote on the landmark designation of the Bond Street Community Church which is in the heart of my district. The church was built in 1892 and it is one of Flushing's most historic buildings. A particular note are the Tiffany stained glass windows which are original to the building and framed with [inaudible] arches. When completed, the church was reported as one of the most beautiful churches on Long Island and in my opinion still is. The historic building is a mere two blocks from New York City's second business and pedestrian intersection and serve as a reminder of Flushing's rich religious history. The almost 125 year old structure has been at risk for demolition in

1
2 the past and a landmark designation will ensure that
3 this architecturally and culturally significant
4 church will remain in and continue to serve our
5 community for generations to come. I would like to
6 thank the Land Use Division, [inaudible], Amy, Julie,
7 John, Jeff, Dillon and James [inaudible] and the LPC
8 for working with the many [inaudible] including Linda
9 Mendel in our community who have pushed for
10 preserving this historic structure. I vote aye on
11 all.

12 CLERK: Koslowitz?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye and
14 I wish my colleagues a Happy Passover and a Happy
15 Easter.

16 CLERK: GIBSON?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: With my warmest
18 congratulations passing legislation today, I vote aye
19 on all and certainly want to wish everyone a Happy
20 Passover and Easter holiday. God bless you all.

21 CLERK: Lander?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: With
23 congratulations to Council Members Constantinides and
24 Barron on the great environmental justice legislation
25 today and thanks to the Public Advocate on her

1
2 legislation, I vote aye on all except I abstain on
3 Land Use 582 and Resolution 1440.

4 CLERK: Levin?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I want to
6 congratulate all my colleagues on passing this very
7 important legislation today. With that, I vote aye
8 on all.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

10 CLERK: Levine?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

12 CLERK: Maisel? Mealy?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I want to
14 congratulate all my colleagues on their great
15 legislation. Thank you Public Advocate for bringing
16 forth this legislation for women and it is happening
17 all over the world all across the board with men also
18 but it is affecting mainly women. I want to let all
19 my colleagues know have a blessed holiday, Passover,
20 all God's blessings and I vote aye on all.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Maisel?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

24 CLERK: Menchaca?

25 COUNCL MEMBER MENCHACA: I want to vote

1
2 aye on all and also congratulate my colleagues on a
3 very important set of legislation including and
4 really lifting the voices of our environmental
5 justice communities in our neighborhoods. Thank you.

6 CLERK: Miller?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye on
8 all.

9 CLERK: Perkins?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

11 CLERK: Reynoso?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

13 CLERK: Richards?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to
15 explain my vote?

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Just want to
18 congratulate both Council Members Costa
19 Constantinides and Inez Barron on groundbreaking
20 legislation that is going to have a huge impact not
21 only for the city but I think the country will look
22 to this legislation eventually. I want to thank
23 secondly thank my legislative intern, Camille Bekart
24 (SP), who is heading back to Paris this week. She
25 came here six months ago with the belief that I would

1
2 remain the Chair of Environmental Protection for some
3 reason but I ended up changing and obviously Costa
4 took over the committee but I want to thank her
5 because she actually stayed and remained and worked
6 in the office despite the changes that she came here
7 for and I am sad to see her go. I expect to hear
8 great things, many practices that you learned here
9 happening back down in Paris now. So God speed and
10 thank you for your commitment not only to this city
11 by to my district and I want to thank you from the
12 bottom of my heart. Thank you. Farewell. And I vote
13 aye.

14 CLERK: Rodriguez?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

16 CLERK: Rose?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to
18 explain my vote?

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I would like to
21 congratulate Minority Leader Matteo on his
22 legislation and Council Member Barron and
23 Constantinides. This environmental justice bill has
24 been a long time coming and this week is equal pay
25 week, a week set aside each year to mark when a woman

1
2 earns the same salary for a man in the previous
3 calendar year. We cannot end the Tale of Two Cities,
4 we cannot end wage inequality without addressing the
5 gender pay gap. This bill would offer new tools to
6 combat the gender pay gap by banning all employers
7 from inquiring about a job applicant's prior salary
8 and using it to set future wages. Salary history has
9 become an important issues in the fight to end the
10 gender wage gap because this practice seemingly
11 innocuous on its face, perpetuates the wage gap that
12 many women and people of color face. Why? Because
13 it assumes that prior salaries were fairly
14 established at their previous employers. However, if
15 you face a pay gap or lost wages at your last job due
16 to bias or discrimination by basing your salary on
17 what might have been unfair, your new employer's now
18 continuing that cycle when prior history is critical
19 in salary setting. If woman or person of color
20 starts his or her career with a pay gap, it is likely
21 to follow them throughout their history and
22 negatively affect the impact of their retirement.
23 There is a reason why poverty rates among women is
24 3.5 percent higher than men and that poverty rate for
25 women 65 and older is 4.8 percent higher than that

1
2 for men 65 and older and that nearly 2.9 million
3 women in this country 65 and older live in poverty
4 twice as many times as men. Let's end it. What
5 should matter most to an employee is what a position
6 of worth to their organization not what a person made
7 in his previous or her previous last job. Thank you.
8 And I vote aye on all.

9 CLERK: Cabrera?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Before I vote, I
11 just want to express how it is a hallelujah moment
12 and how happy I am to hear that Race to Age is an
13 agreement that came through when race to age at the
14 state level so this is a good day for our young
15 people and with that I vote aye on all. Thank you so
16 much.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

18 CLERK: Torres?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

20 CLERK: Treyger?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: With
22 congratulations to my colleagues and wishing everyone
23 a very happy and blessed Passover and Easter, I vote
24 aye on all.

25 CLERK: Vacca?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye on all.

CLERK: Williams?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Excuse me, may I explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: First, I want to introduce my new Legislative Director, Mike Toomey, who is in the back there. Most of you know Nick Smith left for the dark side in administration, the Mayor's side.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Why's it got to be the dark side?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Hey... so I want to welcome Mr. Toomey here as well as I do want to comment I do know the Assembly right now is contemplating voting on a 421A extension. I don't know if they can hear me, it is a terrible bill and I hope the Assembly decides not to vote on it or at the very least still allow the City Council to be able to play its role in making sure it fits neatly with what we are trying to do. I think Como is failing us. It will be worse cuts than Trump if he does that, not sure what he is going to do as he runs in 2020 and of course I don't believe the IDC helped us at all but

2 that is a whole other story. I vote aye on all. I
3 do want to congratulate my colleagues. I
4 particularly want to congratulate my colleagues,
5 Council Member Crowley and Tish James. I was proud
6 to stand with them yesterday to commemorate Equal Pay
7 Day. I am ashamed and it is absurd that we still
8 have to do that. My understanding of New York City
9 is women get at least 89 cents for every dollar.
10 That is disgusting that that seems to be the
11 benchmark of what's good. I can't understand why in
12 2017 we even have to continue to do that. But
13 whatever I can do to continue to push, I will and
14 with that I vote aye on all.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

16 CLERK: Matteo?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 359, 886
18 and 1253. Aye on the rest.

19 CLERK: Van Bramer?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

21 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito?

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye on
23 all.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: As we tally the votes,
25 I neglected to recognize representatives and students

1 from the Bronx Community College. I apologize on
2 behalf of Council Member Gibson who are here
3 celebrating their 60th anniversary. Thank you. All
4 items on today's general order calendar were adopted
5 by a vote of 50 in the affirmative, 0 negative and 0
6 abstentions with the exception of Intro 1253A which
7 was adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 3
8 negative and 0 abstentions and Intro 359A which was
9 adopted by a vote of 48 in the affirmative, 2
10 negative and 0 abstention and Intro 886 which was
11 adopted by a vote of 48 affirmative, 2 negative and 0
12 abstentions and LU 582 and Reso 440 which is adopted
13 by a vote of 49 in the affirmative, 0 negative and 1
14 abstentions. On the revised Land Use call-ups are 50
15 in the affirmative and 0 in the negative.

17 Introduction and Reading of bills.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills have
19 are referred to Committee as indicated on the agenda.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: And now discussion of a
21 resolution which reads as follows. An amended
22 resolution calling upon President Donald Trump to
23 fully fund the Corporation for Public Broadcasting,
24 the Institute of Museum and Library Services, The
25 National Endowment for the Arts, The National

1
2 Endowment for the Humanities and not to eliminate or
3 diminish any of these agencies in any form. We are
4 going to call upon the sponsor, Council Member Van
5 Bramer.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
7 very much. First of all, let me just thank Madam
8 Speaker for her very kind remarks early in this
9 meeting. I am indeed proud to serve with the Speaker
10 who truly understands the importance of arts and
11 culture and the humanities. Let's be very clear.
12 President Trump's proposed budget is an unprecedented
13 and vicious assault on the arts, the humanities,
14 libraries, the free public media and his declaration
15 to make American Great Again is a fraud. You cannot
16 make anything great by crushing its soul and by
17 eliminating funding for the arts, the humanities,
18 libraries, and public broadcasting in this country.
19 This is a direct assault right at the heart and soul
20 of who we are as a people so this resolution I am
21 proud to stand by and introduce and ask council
22 members to support, calls on the President to abandon
23 this ridiculous façade that he will fund a wall by
24 paying for it by destroying the arts and culture and
25 the soul of our country. Please support this

1 resolution today and please resist every single day.
2
3 Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you, Council
5 Member. Any other speakers? Seeing none, all of
6 those in favor say aye?

7 COUNCIL BODY: Aye.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: All of those opposed?
9 Any abstentions? The ayes have it. Now moving on to
10 general discussions, beginning with Council Member
11 Gibson.

12 COUNCIL MEMEBR GIBSON: Thank you very
13 much Madam Public Advocate, Madam Speaker. Good
14 afternoon to all of my colleagues. I want to draw
15 your attention to three important bills that I am
16 proud to introduce today, all of which will bring
17 fairness, equity and justice to many young people and
18 New Yorkers involved in the criminal justice system
19 today. Certainly, keeping in line with the recent
20 announcement by our Mayor and Speaker and Chief
21 Justice Lippman and many others as the city seeks to
22 roll out a ten year plan to close Riker's Island.
23 The first bill is Intro 1541 which would permit the
24 Department of Corrections to delay the transfer of an
25 individual given less than \$10,000 bail for up to

1
2 four hours and no more than 12 hours. This is a
3 simple and commonsense procedural change that will
4 have a far reaching impact. Many individuals are
5 able to post bail within 24 to 48 hours and this bill
6 will give families and loved ones the chance to keep
7 their loved ones out of prison and save the city
8 unnecessary spending and transportation in taking
9 detainees who will post bail the following day. I am
10 also proud to introduce two other bills also aimed at
11 reducing the incidents of wrongful convictions,
12 reforming the police interrogation and eyewitness ID
13 procedures are not issues new to this Council. Last
14 year, many of you joined me in a resolution asking
15 for the State Legislature to enact similar
16 protections nationwide. Governor Como announced his
17 intention to enact these reforms in his State of the
18 State and I also understand a version of these
19 reforms will likely be included in the recently
20 hopefully passed State budget. This is good progress
21 but we are New York City and we certainly can and
22 should do better. Both Intro 1542 and 43 will go
23 beyond the prospective state statutes and expand the
24 type of crime in which required full length video
25 interrogation and strict eyewitness identification

1
2 procedures will be required. Once enacted, this will
3 apply to NYPD's dealings with all suspects arrested
4 and will decrease the number of wrongfully convicted
5 individuals and make sure those who are actually
6 dangerous stay off of our streets. I urge you to
7 consider these three important pieces of legislation
8 and look forward to working with all of my
9 colleagues. Thank you very much.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. Council
11 Member King?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you, Madam
13 Public Advocate. I have the pleasure today to
14 introduce two pieces of legislation the first is
15 requiring the promulgation of test lead water in our
16 child care facilities. I have recently had a scare
17 in my district at the public school I attended as a
18 child as well as where my granddaughter attends today
19 where elevated levels of lead were discovered and
20 found in a number of locations throughout the school
21 building. While I am happy to announce today that
22 DOE has and successfully have remediation efforts
23 that were successful, I still want us to be concerned
24 and diligent at the place where our children play,
25 learn and while the DOE is on notice and increasing

1
2 protocol for water testing is prevalent, this bill
3 will ensure the same scrutiny at child care
4 facilities in our communities. I would like to thank
5 the Speaker on her support of this legislation to
6 help move this forward. Also, I am introducing a
7 resolution in support of Bronx Assembly member Marcos
8 Crespo's bill, A42099, which establishes the New York
9 City College Debt Program. Since I out this request
10 in, the Assembly has just put in a one house budget
11 resolution study on how the state's Higher Education
12 Service Cooperation would do this so it looks more
13 like a study how to implement the full version of
14 this bill and how it works so to all of us stay
15 tuned. And while we are on the subject of Albany, I
16 just want to say before time runs out that I am proud
17 of my representative Assembly Member and Speaker of
18 the House Carl Heastie, who worked tirelessly to
19 raise the age that was made a reality so our
20 community is grateful. We are thankful and happy
21 holidays to everyone. God Bless. Thank you, Madam
22 Public Advocate.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member Steve
24 Levine also known as Daddy Levine?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you very

1
2 much, Madam Public Advocate. Today my colleagues, I
3 am introducing Resolution 1433 which calls on the New
4 York State Legislature to pass and the Governor to
5 sign Assembly bill 528 which is sponsored by Assembly
6 Member Linda Rosenthal. This bill would amend the
7 New York State insurance law to expand health care
8 coverage to include In Vitro Fertilization. Becoming
9 a parent is a joyous occasion but for many the
10 pathway to becoming a parent is marked by
11 frustration, loss and high medical bills. Fifteen
12 percent of heterosexual and same sex couples seek out
13 and use IVF. The treatment can be time consuming and
14 very expensive. Just one cycle of IVF can cost
15 between 12 and \$17,000 not including the cost of
16 related hormonal medications woman may also need to
17 take and many couples must go through multiple cycles
18 of treatment. However, according to a 2016 survey
19 only 19 percent of large employers cover IVF and even
20 companies that do sometimes have outdated insurance
21 policies that fail to cover same sex couples. Today
22 is my daughter Francis's two month birthday. My wife
23 and I would not have had her if it wasn't for IVF and
24 there is simple no way we would have been able to
25 afford the many thousands of dollars for the multiple

1
2 cycles that we needed if our city insurance, Emblem
3 GHI, didn't cover it. Luckily for us, and thanks to
4 the City and GHI Emblem, they did. Ultimately
5 however, there is a strong disparity in the use of
6 fertilization assistance limiting the number who have
7 access to this necessary treatment. Eight states
8 including California and Illinois currently require
9 coverage of IVF and it is time that New York joined
10 them in leading the way for healthy families so I
11 would like to thank the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito
12 and Ramon Martinez as well as our drafter, Emily
13 Rooney, and my Legislative Director Julie Barrow for
14 their work in this Resolution. All individuals
15 deserve access to health care that permit them to
16 become parents if and when they choose to start a
17 family including IVF treatment in their health
18 insurance law will make these services more
19 accessible and affordable allowing families
20 struggling to conceive to receive the necessary
21 treatment. So on behalf of my wife Anne and I hope
22 that you will join us on this Resolution and thank
23 you very much for your consideration.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Sorry and thank you,
25 Council Member Levine. Council Member Barron?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
3 Public Advocate. I want to call my colleagues
4 attention to the fact that in the killing of
5 Amali (SP) Graham, Officer Haste got away as far as
6 I'm concerned with murder. He got away scot-free.
7 There was not an indictment. There was no penalty
8 that was opposed upon him and he even benefited
9 because from the time that he killed Amali (SP)
10 Graham by bursting into his house without a warrant,
11 shooting him in his own home while he was unarmed,
12 his salary increased by, I think, \$30,000. SO as far
13 as I'm concerned he got away with murder and there
14 were no consequences that were brought to bear
15 because he was able to resign before action was
16 implemented. I think that calls attention to the
17 fact that we need to look at the regulations that
18 allow that to happen and see what can be done about
19 that. Additionally, I want to call your attention to
20 the fact that a jury settled a case against the city
21 where they paid the city's settlement -- the city has
22 to pay \$2.5 million to the family of Otonso Bovell
23 (SP) I believe it was 2008, he was shot in the back.
24 The officer who shot him said that he was falling and
25 as he was falling the gun discharged. The jury's

1
2 evidence, the jury heard evidence, ballistic evidence
3 which said that that could not have happened that he
4 could not have been falling, he had to have bene
5 standing when Otonso Bovell (SP) was shot in the
6 back. That is Inspector Shell who is the Inspector
7 at the 75 Precinct. He is the person again who has
8 gone through the system and proved his financial
9 standings, his position, his authority and with
10 Inspector Shell he was never even subjected to a
11 departmental hearing. The DA at the time, Charles
12 Heinz, did not conduct any investigation either. So
13 we are calling for perhaps a special prosecutor that
14 now exists when police kill unarmed people to look
15 into this case even though the case happened prior to
16 the special prosecutor being instituted. We think
17 this rises to the statute of looking into that and
18 bringing charges against Inspector Shell of the 75
19 Precinct which is in my district. I call your
20 attention to that and look for your support in that
21 because we cannot allow for officers to kill unarmed
22 people to get away with those killings and have no
23 consequences. Thank you.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member

25 Williams?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

First, I would like to tell my colleagues to please sign-on to Intro 1556. I am introducing a bill that would increase penalties for those found guilty of tenant harassment. First time offenders, current penalties are 1,000 to 10,000. This will raise it from 2,000 to 10,000. Repeat offenders within five years between 2,000 to 10,000. This will increase it from 4,000 to 10,000. I would also like to associate myself with the comments of Council Member Barron both on the murder of Amali Graham and Inspector Shell. I also want to mention as my colleague Council Member Johnson did on the death of Timothy Caughman. It was a terrorist act. It was horrendous. I was appalled at the response of the administration. Many of the institutions in the city including the Daily News, I expected the Post to be the rag that they are but the Daily News put this man's record for what they thought was a housing condition. It was days before I heard a comment, I'm still waiting for the police department or someone to mention what they are doing to help this community. I believe if it was a member of another community there would have been immediately a response just

1
2 trying to calm that community down. As a black male,
3 to see someone come up from Maryland with the
4 distinct purpose of killing a black man. When I
5 think about the last word of Timothy Caughman as he
6 asked what are you doing, it is a very emotional
7 thing to think about and then to have no response for
8 so long and still waiting to hear that perhaps this
9 community too has lives that matter and we should at
10 least say to them that we have something to help
11 protect them whether it is institutions, whatever it
12 is, and this is not to say that the police department
13 didn't do an excellent job in going after and finding
14 out who he was and saying who he was, I understand
15 that, but I think the black community deserves to be
16 spoken to with concern and saying that we too are
17 protecting and we are doing everything we can. It
18 could have been said any number of times and lastly
19 in connection to people often talk about how you
20 protest, whether it is sitting down for a pledge,
21 whether it is shutting something down, they often
22 invoke Dr. Martin Luther King's name and they do it
23 in vain. He was murdered yesterday violently. It is
24 often not about how you protest it is about that
25 you're protesting at all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member Miller?

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam

Public Advocate. And as we celebrate, observe pay

equity, I would like to thank you and the Speaker for

your leadership around this issue that has been very

important. So today, I along with my colleagues will

be introducing Intro 1536. I am proud to have worked

with these colleagues to bring forth this

legislation. It will bring accountability and equity

to our many city public servants. This legislation

will ensure that the city is in compliance with the

United States Civil Rights Act by requiring that the

Department of Citywide Admin -- Services to publish a

report each year to include gender, race, ethnicity,

national origin, initial salary and current salaries

of city employees so that we can be certain that

women and minorities are paid equally for their

contributions in running our city. In 2015, EEOC

commission ruled against the city in a lawsuit

brought by administrator managers, most of whom are

women of color, who proved their salaries had been

frozen and did not receive the same opportunities for

promotions as their male counterparts in violation of

1964 Civil Rights Act. DCAS is already in the

1
2 process of creating the online portal for this system
3 which will track new applicants that have taken exams
4 but this only is the beginning in helping those in
5 applying for a career in city -- with the city. For
6 a city that prides itself on being a place of
7 opportunity, we need to do more than we have been
8 doing and as we continue to reduce the pay gap
9 between women and men in our municipal workforce.
10 But, public sector jobs do not only support working
11 families they create transportation, education,
12 health and business opportunities for the residents
13 that they support and they serve. It has been a
14 pleasure for me to work with DCAS in my community and
15 throughout the city to promote these various
16 opportunities within city government. But I also
17 want to ensure that remains a place of opportunity.
18 So what I can say in my experience here in the
19 Council and my experience as a labor leader in
20 particular as a civil servant that while it creates
21 opportunity and is reflected in the many thriving
22 communities of color throughout our city that once
23 you leave outside of the ranks of civil servant,
24 service which is merit based test taking, it no
25 longer reflects the rank and file nor the community

1
2 that it served meaning those managerial opportunities
3 no longer exist when they are public tests taking or
4 exams. Also there is no transparency and also often
5 reflecting nepotism and continuing to perpetuate the
6 old boy network that we see. This bill will not only
7 bring accountability and transparent to the system
8 but it will also help to ensure these workers that
9 they are being treated fairly. I want to thank my
10 colleagues, Council Member Cumbo, Crowley, Williams,
11 Kallos, Rosenthal and Rodriguez who are also
12 sponsoring this legislation and ensuring that our --
13 that we set the template here in city government that
14 we are treating our workers first before we ask
15 anyone in particular on the private sector side which
16 needs a lot of work and we applaud your leadership.
17 But we have to start it at home here. So I ask my
18 colleagues to support Intro 1536. Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. I apologize
20 Council Member Menchaca but Council member Williams
21 would like to do a brief introduction.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you,
23 Madam Public Advocate. I just was remised to again
24 to thank the Counsel General of Grenada Rosemary
25 Welch who spent the day with us today, thank you for

1
2 being here, much appreciated. Thank you.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member
4 Menchaca?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I will always
6 yield to my brother from the Bronx. Just kidding,
7 Brooklyn. So we are here in a very interesting
8 moment now and actually Chair Williams Committee on
9 April 9th will be hearing a whole bunch of housing
10 bills. I am talking and speaking on behalf of 1549
11 to mend the administrative code of the City of New
12 York in relationship to repeated acts of harassment.
13 Tenant harassment by landlords should have penalties
14 proportionate to the harm it causes. Single
15 instances of harassment should not be considered an
16 isolation when they are forming a pattern of repeat
17 violations. We all know this. We see it in our
18 district offices with the caseload that comes in on a
19 weekly basis. When landlords exhibit a pattern of
20 repeated harassment, both of the individual tenants
21 and the multiple tenants in the same building we need
22 the legal tools to hold them, the landlords
23 accountable and to secure justice. The legislation
24 introduced today will increase our ability to fight
25 repeated interruptions of essential services,

1
2 interruption of an essential service for an extended
3 period of time or in a way that substantially impairs
4 the habitability of the dwelling. It takes into
5 account any prior interruption of an essential
6 service in impairing the habitability of multiple
7 dwellings in a building. Harassment takes many forms
8 frivolous court proceedings against tenants and other
9 entitled to occupy a unit are addressed by this
10 legislation. Repeated baseless or frivolous court
11 proceedings are addressed too. I urge my colleagues
12 to give this legislation careful consideration at its
13 upcoming hearing on April 19 and to pass it as part
14 of the wrath of tenant protection bills. It is far
15 too common for these harassment -- for this -- for
16 those who are harassed to avoid penalties that match
17 the severity of the repeated actions. This
18 legislation will help end that shortcoming and it
19 will discourage those who think they can get away
20 with it to stop with the little risk they face today.
21 Thank you so much.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member Chin?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Madam
24 Public Advocate. Good afternoon. I want to draw my
25 colleagues attention to Intro 1533, legislation that

1
2 will ensure greater transparency when communities
3 face changes to urban renewal plans. Since 1949, New
4 York City has adopted over 150 urban renewal plans
5 with 65 of them still active throughout all five
6 boroughs. Generally, the city uses these renewal
7 plans to leverage federal funding to make necessary
8 improvements in various neighborhoods. However,
9 there is very little transparency in the designation
10 and subsequent expiration of these renewal plans. In
11 the Low East Side Waterfront on my district, the
12 urban renewal plan expired in 2007 without any
13 community input or opportunity to extend the plan.
14 Intro 1533 will require the Department of Housing,
15 Preservation and Development along with the
16 Department of City Planning and any other relevant
17 agency to notify the effected community board,
18 borough president and council member before an urban
19 renewal plan expires. It also creates an urban
20 renewal database which will allow any New Yorkers to
21 access public records like application numbers,
22 approval dates pending application and development
23 within the area. I want to thank all the Council
24 staff that worked on this bill and I encourage my
25 colleagues to sign-on to Intro 1533 to ensure greater

1
2 transparency throughout the urban renewal process.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. And our
4 last speaker is Council Member Laurie Cumbo.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Public
6 Advocate. Want to join in today to ask my colleagues
7 to support Intro 1536, recording of pay and
8 employment equity data. Today I am introducing
9 legislation that will increase transparency by making
10 pay and employment data for the public sector more
11 readily accessible. As a city, we must lead by
12 example, eliminating the practices that have hindered
13 our collective progress towards our truly equitable
14 workforce that reflects our diverse population all
15 the way from the mail room to the board room. The
16 women and minorities represent the majority of our
17 city's employees which actually makes us the majority
18 they are not afforded the opportunities to advance
19 their careers. For the first time through this
20 legislation, we will have access to data that will
21 clearly show the discriminatory pattern of wage
22 suppression and subjective promotion based on gender
23 and race. Women of New York deserve a transparent
24 process when it comes to pay equality and we will
25 continue to organize and raise our voices until our

1
2 city pays us what we are worth. I urge you all to
3 sign on. This legislation has been in the making for
4 over two years and I want to thank the dynamic women
5 of CWA 1180 who had the courage to bring this issue
6 forward because it is through their courage and their
7 tenacity that we are going to make sure this becomes
8 a national issue where people all over the world will
9 recognize that pay equity is not simply a woman's
10 issue. Pay inequality effects husbands, it effects
11 brothers, it effects sons, it effects grandparents.
12 It effects everyone so this is a very important issue
13 and I want to thank all of my colleagues that came
14 out yesterday for the 11th Annual New York City Equal
15 Pay Day. It was an incredible feeling. There were
16 so many women out there but there were also a lot of
17 dynamic men who stood on the steps with us right here
18 from the City Council and I look forward to working
19 with the de Blasio Administration, Speaker Melissa
20 Mark-Viverito and this Council to pass legislation
21 and implement initiatives that will advance women's
22 economic equality. Thank you so much and I look
23 forward to your support.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: And to close, Speaker
25 Melissa Mark-Viverito. Happy Easter and Happy

1
2 Passover.

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
4 Public Advocate and so again thank you to all my
5 colleagues. I want to definitely say that I want to
6 add my voice to comments that have bene made by
7 Council Member Johnson as he was paying tribute and
8 speaking about Timothy Caughman and the person that
9 he was and obviously the comments that Council Member
10 Williams has made about the -- what he believes --
11 what he has indicated about the lack of attention
12 that is being paid in terms of addressing the
13 community at large by the NYPD. Definitely would
14 encourage that to happen and, you know, so it -- and
15 also to Council Member Grodenchik for reminding us
16 about the horrors that are happening in Syria, those
17 images of those children is just an incredible
18 atrocity that is happening over there. So again,
19 thank you to all my colleagues for your work. Thank
20 you for the cake earlier today and with that we
21 adjourn.

22 [gavel]

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Stand adjourned.
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 30, 2017