

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

----- X

April 16, 2019  
Start: 1:29 p.m.  
Recess: 2:53 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: ANTONIO REYNOSO  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Margaret S. Chin  
Fernando Cabrera  
Paul Vallone  
Costa Constantinides  
Rafael L. Espinal Jr.  
Chaim M. Deutsch

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Bridgette Anderson, Deputy Commissioner  
Bureau of Recycling and Sustainability

Gregory Anderson, Assistant Commissioner  
for Policy and External Affairs  
Bureau of Recycling and Sustainability

Eric Goldstein  
Natural Resources Defense Council

Melissa Iachan, Senior Staff Attorney  
New York Lawyers for the Public Interest

Adriana Espinosa, Director  
New York Program at New York League of  
Conservation Voters

Jordan Christiansen  
Citizen's Campaign for the Environment

Jenny Romer, Lawyer, Founder  
Plasticbaglaws.org  
Coordinator, Bag-it NYC Campaign

Jacqueline Ottman, Chair  
Manhattan Solid Waste Advisory Board  
(MSWAB)

Tousif Ahsan, Civic Engagement Coordinator  
NYPIRG

Shin Ra Ta (sp?)  
NYC business owner

Miriam Gordon, Program Director  
Upstream

Matt Gove  
Surfrider Foundation

Debbie Lee Cohen, Executive Director,  
Founder  
Cafeteria Culture

Paul Darby  
Novamont

Dana DeBlasio  
National Supermarket Association

[background comments]

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Testing. Testing one two. Testing one two. This is a test for the Committee on Sanitation. Today's date is April 16th, 2019. The meeting is being recorded by Rafael Perez.

[background comments]

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. I don't have a hammer. No? No gavel. Okay.

[gavel]

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Good afternoon.

First, I want to thank everyone for their patience as we moved from City Hall to the sixteenth floor. The zoning and franchise hearing was going over. So, again, I appreciate all your patience. I want to thank the Sgt. at arms who is activated this room and less than five minutes. So I want to thank Raf Perez. Thank you so much for your help. Also--  
Yes.

[applause]

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Also, so I want to congratulate and happy birthday to Council member Fernando Cabrera of the committee. So thank you so much.

[applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: We got him some nice birthday presents.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Exactly. So, the Department of sanitation has given you to burn instead of one. Congrat--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: And a birthday lottery ticket.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And a birthday lottery ticket.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Hey. Chaim.

[background comments]

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yes. And Council member Chaim Deutsch's birthday was yesterday. Turned-- Yes. So congratulations.

[applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: All right.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: A lot of birthdays, so I just want to thank everyone again. Now we are in a festive mood, so the mood is up. So, good afternoon and thank you for being here today. I am Council member Antonio Reynoso, the chair of the committee on sanitation. Welcome to the hearing on introduction sponsored by Council members Brad

Lander, Margaret Chin, Treyger, and myself to enact a fee for carryout paper bags. The Department of Sanitation estimates around 10 billion, billion with a B, single-use bags or some 100 tons-- 100,000 tons of paper and plastic bags are used and discarded in the city per year costing the city roughly 12 million per year and sanitation costs, but these costs go far beyond dollars and cents. Bags cause a measurable harm in our environment. When introduced into our waste stream, plastic bags clog recycling machines and can contaminate recyclable materials. When plastic bags are not properly disposed of, they can clog sewers and storm drains, as well as accumulate in the oceans where they threaten marine life. And many of these bags are simply ending up in landfills where they contributed to the ever-growing crisis of climate change. We simply cannot wait any longer to take bold action on climate. Our solutions need to match the urgency of the problem. The bill we are hearing today is a meaningful first step in moving our city towards a green future. New York State has taken the important step of banning the use of single use plastic bags, although I want to know that they were late to the party. The city Council took action

on bags years ago, only to have the governor swooped in and block the law. We are glad they've made the decision to join the fight against climate change. The state has also authorized municipalities to pass local legislation requiring vendors to charge a five cent fee for paper bags. The bill we are hearing today is New York City's opting in-- New York City opting into that fee. Banning plastic bags alone can lead to consumers to simply switch to paper bags and will likely achieve very little reduction in overall waste. It also can increase costs for retailers as paper is more expensive than plastic and the city-- and for the city as paper is heavier than plastic bags and would increase the costs of recycling facilities or shipment and landfill. According to DSNY, the city currently captures about 25 percent of all paper bags in recycling. Between the different sources of paper bags, grocery bags-- Grocery bags have the highest capture rate of 45 percent. This means that more than half of the paper grocery bags in the city are being sent to landfill. As a city, we need to take zero waste goals seriously. We cannot achieve zero waste if we simply change to the use of single-use plastic bags to single-use paper

bags. We need to encourage the use of reusable bags. Ultimately, this is a small change in how we carry goods from place to place that will have a major positive impact on our environment. I understand the perception that this is an additional financial burden for city residents and hope that people don't end up paying the fee. Rather, we are urging people to switch to reusable bags like these beautiful orange ones from the Department of sanitation which the city will be distributing in the coming months. While it is critically important that we all recycle, we must remember that it is the last of the three R's, the first to being reduce and reuse. We must go much further towards actually reducing the amount of waste we'll create. As New Yorkers, we need to challenge ourselves to think long and hard about our consumption habits, keeping in mind that our decisions have real-world consequences for the future health of our planet. Today's hearing is merely the start of a much broader conversation that I want us to have in the coming months about how we can truly get serious about reducing the amount of waste we create. An incremental approach will not suffice and if we're going to be successful in saving our planet,



we have to think big and we have to take bold, progressive action now. I look forward to hearing from DSNY, and other interest groups and individuals about this important bill. I would like to acknowledge that we have been joined by Vallone, Espinal, Deutsch, Chin, Cabrera, and Lander. And now I want to invite Council member Chin to give an opening statement followed by Council member Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair Reynoso in this important hearing and I am excited to join the dictation committee. A few years our counseling box on environmental for me that is impossible. One councilman and I passed legislation to dramatically plastic baggie ways, we were working against a well-funded misinformation campaign by the plastic bag industry who sought to hide the true cost of plastic bags for New Yorkers. But we then, as we know now, that plastic bags are not free. There is a cost and unfairly, by low income communities, to deal with the facts transporting thousands of tons of plastic bag waste every year. I am pleased after preempting our local law, the state is allowed is measure to limit the use of plastic bags. Finally, we can see the future were clogged drains, polluted

water, and parkland riddled with not biodegradable bag waste is not the norm. Our work is not over yet. To ensure that those flimsy plastic bag is not merely replaced by paper, worse yet, a thicker plastic bag, we must act to impose a modest fee on these and other single-use bags. Neither paper nor plastic waste is good for the environment, especially when it's New Yorkers that pay the cost of transporting this is waste, including negative health effects, that leave our children most at risk. Our legislation mandates multilingual education so that all communities and small businesses will be prepared. A dedicated fund to distribute free reusable bags like this till low income New Yorkers and exemptions for residents on snap and the special supplemental nutrition program. We have already seen others states and countries set a global model to fight plastic pollution. It's time for New York to do the same and thanks to my colleague, Brad Lander, and I had diverse coalition of advocates for your partnership all these years, I look forward to today's hearing and hope my colleagues will join us in support of this crucial environmental measure. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Council member Chin. Council member Brad Lander?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Chair Reynoso. Happy birthday, Council member Cabrera. Congratulations, Council member Chin and Reynoso and all the other sponsors. This is a really good day. Since that day about three years ago that this Council passed a bill to put a five cent fee on bags, New Yorkers have spent approximately 30 billion single-use plastic bags to landfills. About 300,000 pounds of solid waste. That's the opportunity that we have lost, but I am going to focus today on what we have gained, which is a chance to move forward with a really strong legislation and I am, as Council members Chin and Reynoso said, the fact that the state took action here and to ban plastic bags statewide is a great step forward, but we have both a real challenge and an opportunity. We cannot allow people to switch just from throw away carry out single-use plastic bags to throw away carry out single-use paper bags. Unfortunately most of them don't get recycled. They are heavier by weight which means more of them actually would be on garbage trucks moving through low income communities of color

and we would pay more to tip them into landfills since they would weigh more than plastic bags. So, better not to have them in our trees and storm drains. They are not made from petroleum, but still lots of problems presented. There is also, though, a really nice opportunity here. There are many ways in which the single-use carryout bag is a symbol of the kind of bad habits that we have gotten in as a species. And we are not thinking as stewards of the planet and the ways that we need to suppose waste that we just don't need is a really good example. Everyone is capable. Everyone across-- it doesn't matter your race, your income, your family size, your religion, your age, or whether you even care about the environment are not, everyone is capable of bringing reusable bags to the store when you go shopping. On a daily basis we remember our wallet and our keys and our Metro cards. Usually, when it's raining, we can remember an umbrella. We are capable of remembering to bring reusable bags when we shop and not to need to send billions and billions of bags to landfills just because we have gotten into graceful, careless habits. And that's what this five cent fee helps us all to. And my dad is clear. We

waited a long time to adopt, but as a result, we've got data from Washington DC and California and I landed in Israel and many countries in Africa, as well. A modest fee helps the vast majority of people across all those lines of income and race and class and gender and age and religion and family size and ideology to remember to bring reusable bags when we go to the store. We all can do it and, when whales start doing it, we will be contributing to a significant reduction of solid waste in our city. It is really a great day. I want to say a big thank you to the folks that have been partners in helping get us here, all the council members have been big supporters. Council member Espinal has been a big champion in getting rid of plastic. Council members on this committee. Vallone, Chin, Reynoso, Cabrera are all big supporters. The Department of Sanitation has been a great champion in this work and we are grateful for your partnership and the advocates who have been fighting with us every step of the way. Plasticbagloss.org and NRDC and citizens committee for the environment and citizens committee for New York City and NILPE and New York league of conservation voters and citizens committee for New

York City. It is a dynamite coalition and partnership that has not given up and sometimes, when you don't give up, eventually, you get there. So it's a good day. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Council member Lander. Congratulations, again. Now we have Deputy Commissioner of my favorite office within the Department of Sanitation, Recycling and Sustainability, the Bridgette Anderson, and we also have Assistant Commissioner for Policy and External Affairs, the Gregory Anderson. It doesn't sound as good, but we have to swear you in, Greg. So, you are going to go ahead and do that.

LEGAL COUNSEL: Please. Razor right hand. Do you have firm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony today and to answer Council member questions honestly?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I do.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yes.

LEGAL COUNSEL: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Okay.

Thank you and good afternoon, Chair Reynoso, members

of the Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management. I am Bridgette Anderson, Deputy Commissioner for the Bureau of Recycling and Sustainability for the Department. I am here with Gregory Anderson, no relation, a very nice guy. [laughter] Assistant Commissioner for Policy and External Affairs. First, we would like to mention Council member Chin to the committee. Very excited to work with you on matters related to our important work to keep New York City healthy, safe, and clean. Thank you for this opportunity to testify today and to comment on the reduction of paper carryout bag use in New York City as contemplated by the pre-considered introduction under consideration today. I will provide some opening remarks, after which we are happy to answer your questions.

New York City residents, commuters, and visitors use and discard approximately 10 billion single-use carryout bags annually. These bags make up about two and a half percent of our waste stream and, on average, the department collects more than 1700 tons of single-use carryout bags per week. That's over nine-- 91,000 tons of plastic and paper carryout bags every year. These products,

particularly light weight single-use plastic carryout bags, are a major contributor to Marine and roadway litter. Single-use plastic bags often end up blowing into the streets and onto the branches of trees creating unsightly street litter. When rain carries them into catch basins, they pollute the cities surrounding waterways posing a threat to marine animals that often mistake these bags as a food source. Additionally, carryout bags contained in metal, glass, and plastic loads delivered to the city's recycling contractor, Simms Municipal Recycling, often jam the sorting equipment at their facility, causing processing delays during the cleaning and repair of the sorting equipment. They are, quite literally, a blight on our city. Reusable carryout bags, like the ones we've provided for you here today, can be used dozens or hundreds of times, can be made from nearly 100 percent recycled products, and to not litter our trees, parks, waterways, and beaches. We are here today to celebrate strong and far overdue action to reduce the use of single-use carryout plastic bags in New York State and to take these measures further by reducing the use of single-use paper bags, as well. City and



state governments have taken the lead across America to address the proliferation of single-use carryout bags. Several other jurisdictions in New York and across the country, including Washington DC, San Francisco, Seattle, Los Angeles, Chicago, Dallas, and many others have also passed form legislation to curtail the distribution of carryout bags. In 2016, the state of California became the first state in the nation to enact a statewide ban on single-use carryout bags and a 10 cent fee on paper, compostable, and reusable bags. The city of New York, an international leader and urban sustainability, is pleased to join these others cities and the state of California by supporting the passage and enactment of today's bill that will help to increase the use of single-use paper bags reducing disposal costs and contributing to our goal of sending zero waste to landfills by 2030. New York City has supported meaningful single-use carryout bag reform for years as part of our conference to send zero waste to landfills. In 2008, the city enacted local law one which required retailers who offer single-use plastic carryout bags to provide collection and recycling programs. That law was

preempted by the state film plastic recycling program which, though less aggressive than the city's law, did make plastic bag recycling available in large chain and retail stores across the state. In May 2016, the city Council passed a local law 63 of 2016 after more than two years of consultation with advocates and stakeholders on all sides of the issue. Local law 63, which was later modified by local law one of 2016, imposed a five cent fee on almost all carryout bags including both paper and plastic provided by most stores in New York City. The law included exemptions for certain types of bags and for bags provided to SNAP and WIC recipients. It also required the Department of Sanitation to conduct outreach about the fee and distribute reusable bags to residents across the city. In particular, to residents in low-- in households below 200 percent of the federal poverty line and in certain precincts. The city carryout bag fee would have reduced the use of carryout bags by 60 to 75 percent based on the experiences of other jurisdictions that imposed a similar fee. However, just before the sea was to take a fact in February 2017, New York State lock to the implementation of the city's carryout bag fee.

The state law and validated the city law and placed a temporary moratorium on the enactment of additional carryout vaccines in New York City. While leaving similar legislation in place in Suffolk County and the town of Long Beach, among others. Two weeks ago, as part of the 20/20 budget, the state legislature passed a nearly total ban on single-use plastic carryout bags with the strong support of the governor. After two years, following the blocking of the city law, where excited to see the state take strong and comprehensive action. Moreover, the budget legislation, which the governor signed last Friday, allows individual counties and municipalities to opt into a five cent fee on paper bags bypassing local legislation. Like the 2016 city law, the state law minimizes hardship on low income and fixed income individuals by exempting recipients of SNAP and WIC from the five cent fee. They opt in provision essentially shifts the responsibility for imposing a fee onto local governments rather than the state. The paper carryout reduction fee, as required under the state bill, must be collected by businesses and remitted to the state-- New York State Department of taxation and finance. 40 percent of all monies

collected in each locality will be returned to the fiscal officer of that locality to purchase and distribute free reusable bags with priority given to distribution in low and fixed income communities. The department is pleased that the sponsors, the Chair, and this committee have so quickly moved to act on this important policy. The committee's pre-considered introduction before us today will minimize the negative environmental impacts associated with paper carryout bags. The bill requires city retailers to charge a five cent fee per paper carryout bag to most consumers at the point-of-sale and requires retailers to itemize each bag fee on the customer's receipt similar to the five cent bottle bill fee in place since the early 1980s. The law would take effect on March 1st, 2020 concurrent with the effective date of the state plastic bag ban. The department strongly supports this legislation which will reduce single use carryout bag consumption in the city. This bill not only encourages bag reduction, but also promotes responsible reuse to achieve our goal of diverting materials from the city's waste stream and reaching zero waste. In implementing this bill, the department will conduct

robust outreach to cover businesses notifying them of their obligations to collect the paper bag fee. The department will also conduct intensive outreach to residents and neighborhoods across New York City ensuring that every New Yorker who wants a reusable bag can have one. Already, we have distributed more than 475,000 bags and we will continue to do so. Any New Yorker who wants a reusable bag can fill out our zero waste pledge [NYC.gov/zerowastepledge](http://NYC.gov/zerowastepledge) and we will mail them a bag. We are also seeking organizations to partner with the department to expand our reach and to help us distribute reusable bags in neighborhoods across the city. Lastly, this effort to reduce the use of single-use products is just one in a series of steps that this administration has taken. In less than three months, on July 1st, we will begin enforcement on the city's phone ban. Just last week Mayor DeBlasio signed an executive order requiring city agencies to develop plans to eliminate the use of single-use food-service products including plates, straws, cups, trays, and cutlery by the end of the year. We will work with our partner agencies to help them switch to reusable or compostable alternatives and we will ensure that supplies of

plastic products are available in situations where they are necessary. We look forward to ongoing conversations with the council regarding expanding that effort into the private sector and we appreciate Council member Espinal and others for their leadership on this topic. Thank you for inviting the department to share our thoughts with you this afternoon on this important subject and we will gladly answer your questions. Any questions that you may have.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. I'm going to defer my time and allow for the bill sponsors to ask questions first, followed by Council member Deutsch. So, we will start with Council member Chin, then Council member Brad Landen, and then Council member Deutsch. So, Council member Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yes. I just have-- Thank you for the testimony and I just have a brief question. How many of these reusable bags have the Department of Sanitation given out in the last couple years?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: 475,000.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: 475,000?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Great. So, how many more are you producing to give out before the bill is enacted?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: We have about 75,000 already in inventory and we are eager to partner with folks who would like to help us distribute those bags. And, like I said, you can go online and we will mail you a bag. And we do intend to purchase additional bags. We intend to do is similarly scaled distribution of bags over the next year.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. We look forward to doing that with the Department of sanitation. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Council member Brad Lander?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I just-- The Chair spoke in his opening statement to some of these issues of sort of the harms if we don't do this. If people just wind up switching to paper bags without reducing them, but I think it would be useful just to have you guys kind of speak to that on the record so we are clear why we

are doing this. So the data that he gave that a substantial number, you know, even a narrow majority of paper bags don't wind up in the recycling stream, but wind up being taken, you know, as part of regular garbage collection to landfills, that's--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah. So we are-- We do a waste characterization study every few years and what we have learned is that we capture about 45 percent of the grocery and nonfood retail bags and recycling. The paper bags. But that means half of those paper bags are still winding up in landfills being thrown away. Some people do use them, you know, to containerized to carry their trash and then, for carryout bags that are not covered by the sea, they are also ending up primarily in trash and so, this is a problem and this is something we want to reduce. And we have experienced in other cities who have made the switch and issued the fee and they have seen a significant reduction. What's took the call that happens is that, if you do a ban on the plastic bags, there is a significant shift over to paper bags being provided by stores. And so, by instituting a fee, you are then also reducing the use of those paper bags. And that's what we want to



see. And that's been successful in other cities.

So--

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Absolutely. And I saw and Suffolk it's something-- you know, something like more than 1 billion bags saved in the first year. Reduction and--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: use of--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: more than a billion bags in the first year since they put their five cent fee. So we--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: anticipate something even bigger since we are a much bigger place.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON:

Absolutely.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And just to be clear, those 55 percent of paper bags that are winding up in trash collection, we've got to put them on trucks. They're way more than plastic bags. We have to truck them through ways transfer stations and we paid to tip them. Right?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: How much do we pay?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: So,

what-- What would you say was our average [inaudible  
00:26:00]?

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: So, an average tip fee is about 100 dollars a ton, but when you think about a paper bag, it's-- and I don't have the number in front of me, but it's probably something like 20-- 30 times heavier than a thinner plastic bag. So, even just changing one thin plastic bag or two double bagged plastic bags for one paper bag, you're moving something much heavier, so that just immediately increases our cost and that's what we've seen in places like Chicago that implemented a ban on the thin plastic bags a few years ago. What they saw was exactly that substitution effect where you have heavier bags he used instead of the bags and that causes problems in a totally different scale. So, Chicago, what they actually just did over the last year was implement fee on all bags. They actually repealed their band which some jurisdictions have done. Some jurisdictions haven't. But this is what we've seen in San Francisco. They started with

the ban, realized it wasn't comprehensive, added a fee. So that's, you know, what we are proud that we are doing all at once rate here.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Great. Thank you. Yeah. And I just think it's-- You know, I wish that the state had done was done a band and a fee statewide because it's not a situation like, oh, one might be better or the other might be better. The evidence is very clear. Without the fee, you get rid of the plastic, but people just massively switch to paper and then we have all the consequences that you just described and I just, for the record, also-- because I know you have looked at the evidence that once a fee is in place, the significant majority of people across all the different categories that we pay attention to start to bring reusable bags the majority of the time.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Correct. It's a behavior change and what we have found from experiences of other cities is that it-- people are fairly quick to catch on and shift their behavior.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Great. Thank you. Yeah. Those are my questions. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Council member Lander. Council member Deutsch?

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Are you sure you want to hear from me? Okay.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: We love all voices. We empower all.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, firstly, I just want to say that I support zero waste and I also support our environments. But, you know, the few questions that I have is, firstly, it's-- it's not only a financial burden on individuals, but it becomes an extreme hardship. Like I go shopping for my family at times and we go shopping, between me and my wife, for seven people. Right? So, when you walk into the supermarkets, you need to now carry these reusable bags, correct? So I have, I think, about five bags in each pocket, right? And I can't close my jacket. So, my question is is that how do you expect for larger families that need to go shopping for larger families to walk around with 15 of the reusable bags? Again, I support that if someone goes shopping for one individual, it's fine. Or for two or for three.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: But, for larger family, I'm not carrying--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I think you're [inaudible 01:29:11]--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: a bag around.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: over here.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I am not carrying a bag around. You walk around with a cell phone.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I have hand sanitizer in my pocket. I have my wallet in the back. And it's just-- I'm-- honestly, I'm not kidding around. It's a hardship for people to go shopping for larger families to walk around with 15 of these bags in your pockets and, you know, that's number one. Number two is that people that are in apartment buildings, they have many seniors, just like every district across the city that use the bags to throw out there trash in the chute. So, what do you expect them to do, number one. And if you have an answer to that, have you outreach to people living in buildings who are throwing the trash into a chute

to prevent them from throwing loose trash down  
because they can't afford to--

[background comments]

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Well, to  
reiterate, there are some exclusions, right? So  
there are exemptions if you receive SNAP assistance,  
WIC assistance, any future--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I understand--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: program--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: But let's say  
that you are above that threshold.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Right.  
Above that threshold.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Like the  
above.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: This is a  
behavior change and that is something that every city  
that is gone through the switchover to either a ban  
or a fee or a hybrid has had to experience. And we  
are absolutely planning to do outreach to help people  
understand what the best path to manage the new  
reality of shopping, whether you are choosing to use  
paper bags or whether you are using reusable bags.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, again, I live in the building, let's say.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Right? So I live in the building and I have to throw my trash down the chutes. What is your recommendation now?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: You'll use a bag of some kind, if you choose to.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: What bags?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Right? It depends on if you have a stash of bags, if you have--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I don't have--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: there are bags--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I don't have a stash--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: that you purchase.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: of bags.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: There are--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I have nothing--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: There  
area--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: in my house.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I have nothing  
in my apartment and I have trash.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I want to put  
trash--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: So there  
are kitchen--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: into something  
to throw down the chute.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: bags that  
you can purchase. You know, for your trash can.  
That is an option and there will be--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: That becomes,  
now, expensive for people that are right above the  
threshold, especially, who don't get the free bags.  
So there has to be some type of solution for people  
who live in building and that's not a solution to  
tell that that now you have to pay for trash bags,  
which is plastic, too, but now you have to pay for  
trash which are kind of expensive. So the sanitation



have a solution for people living in buildings to throw out there trash? Are you giving away free bags to people who reside in apartment buildings who use those compactors?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: There are-- Not all bags are banned, so there is that option, as well. So you have if you are-- purchase produce, if you purchase bulk goods, there are-- So produce bags that are available. But we are-- Essentially, we are committed to working with buildings to helping people understand what this shift means and what are the best opportunities to change--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: behavior.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I understand, but I just want to know what the solution is. You're going to try to change people's-- the way people use bags and prevent them from using plastic, but what is the solution? That's what I want to know. What is the solution for people who live in the building? I have tons of trash in my house, right? And if you are going to tell me that we have bags-- because we buy meat. We have a couple of bags, you know, and

our apartment, that's not a solution the people that consume a lot of trash. So, what is sanitation doing to prevent people from throwing out loose trash down the chutes and this is just going to bring in more mice, rats, roaches. There has to be a solution. So we are voting on something to ban plastic bags, but there has to be some type of a solution. I haven't heard anything yet.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: So, we're not going to give our free garbage bags, if that's what you're asking.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I know. So what is the solution?

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: And--  
And--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: That's all I want to know.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: And the question on the table today is not whether or not we are banning plastic bags. That's happening March 1st, 2020--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Correct.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON:  
regardless. That was a state law.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Correct.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: So, I think there is sort of two answers. One is as you are generating as much waste as you are saying, you are probably not just using single use plastic bags to dispose of it today. If you are, there are still going to be bags left any time you have take out, for example. Any time you get food delivered. There are several categories of exempt bags [inaudible 00:34:02]--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: People that live on a fixed income above the threshold who cannot afford to buy takeout who cook at home. And one second, Brent. Let me just finish. I just want a solution.

UNKNOWN: I have a solution. That's why I'm--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: No. But you want to testify? We'll swear you in. I--

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So, go ahead. Go ahead. But finish your-- finish your statement and if they're not giving you a sufficed answer, then we'll move on to the next question and you'll talk to them afterwards.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So if there's no solution, just tell me there's no solution right now and you're going to work on it. But I just want to hear if you have any answers because now that it's going into effect, what these people are going to do living in the building. In the apartment buildings.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I think there are several possible solutions.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: And what we want to do is help--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: We're getting that.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: folks understand what might work best for them. So, this is something we are committed to doing and we are happy to talk with you more about that.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Do you know how many people live in apartment buildings in the city that you are going to do outreach to? And you're going to have to visit each apartment to how they consume the trash and how much trash they consume? I mean--

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Can we ask-- So, I'm going to try to help here to find a place or-- Can you talk about other cities that have done this work, what seems to be-- Are these hardships, have they been a significant problem to the city and so much so that an elected official would want to overturn, let's say, a ban on plastic bags or paper bags.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: We have seen that there is a period of time where intensive outreach is required to help people understand, you know, the new reality of either a fee or a ban on bags. But we-- What most cities, in the research we've done, the shift in behavior has been relatively quick and there has been a significant reduction in the use of the bags. So the stats show that people have reduce the use of those bags.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Again, it doesn't answer the question. I'm sorry, Chair. So, people have reduce the amount of bags they are using.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I believe you. And I'm sure you are correct, but when we implement a law that goes into effect, we need to have solutions

beforehand. I have constituents emailing me and calling me to live in apartment buildings to have to throw trash down there chutes.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Now, if they don't have any bags-- They cannot afford to buy takeout. They buy limited amount of meat, right? So they have very few bags, plastic bags, in their apartment. Now, they have a large family. They consume trash. How do they get rid of the trash and throw it down the chute? I want to know.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: They--  
Well, our--

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So, this is going to be the last-- That's the last. We're going to move on. We don't have a clock, but I want to just respect time and allow for councilmembers to ask questions. But, I guess, Council member Deutsch, and I'm not the city, but you're asking for a solution to a problem-- to a problem that you are creating or you are assuming it exists. It's about changing behavior. People learn how to adapt and not use single use plastic bags and supermarkets and so forth. They use these. And figure out another

solution. No one person is going to collapse into financial hardship over the having to purchase a 10 pack of bags in the store. But that's what we are saying. You are going to change behavior. That is what we are asking. And we are-- This is a solution. I want to be clear. We have a solution to a crisis related to climate change and these plastic bags that are a burden on the city of New York where we are paying 12 million dollars to have to recycle them. So, what we're dealing with here is climate change. Long-term we are starting to address an issue in a real way. So I understand your question. They're not going to be able to give you the answer you want because they answer you want is that they are going to give away free bags. The solution is--

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: That's not the answer I want.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: You're gonna (sic)-- They're going to have to buy bags.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: No.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Deutsch, they're going to have to buy bags.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay. So I just want to end off by saying that I am not-- I'm

not saying that we should not-- that we should use plastic bags and I support the environment, but-- and it's not something I'm making up.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: You can't be-- You can do both.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: And-- And it's--

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Right? That's what we're trying to say.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: And it's not something that I am making up that people in buildings-- I'm just asking that people who live in apartment buildings who feel it's an issue, since I am not making this up, should please email and call their elected officials and voice their concerns to their respect is elected officials and let them know if you have a problem getting rid of the trash if you live in an apartment building in getting the trash down the chutes. So, if you have any issues, please reach out to your elected officials and let them know your concerns. This way, everyone knows that I am not making this up. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. Council member Brad Lander?



COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I'll just put a few things out for my colleague. Council member Deutsch, first of all, I have some websites where you can buy the single use bags for about a penny each. One penny each. So for people who really are committed to using the small single-use back size plastic bags for their disposition down the chute instead of one of the larger kitchen size plastic bags that, you know, that people often put in their kitchen bags, about a penny each you can get a 500 rules for 50 bucks that will probably last you the whole year. About a penny each. Los Angeles County actually did a survey after they got rid of plastic bags and they found that households had to spend on average about 15 dollars a year on trash bags just like people have to spend, you know, a little money on all their household needs so that we could avoid-- but what is really clear is the way the system currently works, there is like 100 single-use plastic bags for every one that gets used to get thrown down the chute and the waste is just too much. So, but finally what I would say is the state has already caused this problem. So we are debating today whether to put a five cent fee on

paper bags. The state has already banned the plastic bags that people need to put down their chute. So the challenge that your constituents will be facing that they won't get them for free in very large volumes from the store has already been created by the state legislation. There are these very reasonable alternative products that people can use. Hopefully they'll actually be able to reduce waste overall and also have things in recycling and composting. It's not nothing, but it's a pretty modest sacrifice for the gains that we will be making as a city.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Council member Vallone?

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you, Chair. So, I am of the belief we are not saving the human species with another fine, so I defer and change my comment to other councilmembers. I am not a big fan of those fines. No one in my district is a big fan of the fines. I have not gotten one phone call that says, hey, thank you for fining me another five cents. No one is in opposition to plastic bags. I have an issue with brown bags. I have an issue with another five cent fee. I have issue-- My

seniors, my veterans, my homeowners, they just-- they are done. So, why could we not have started this with a band? Why did we have to go immediately to a fine?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Started--

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Why couldn't we roll this out by saying no use of brown paper bags in the city of New York? Why did we have to include a fine like other jurisdictions have done?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: There were multiple years of negotiations about how to handle single-use carryout bags in New York City and there were discussions of bans, there were discussions of fines and where the 2016 legislation ended up was a consideration of-- and I guess fine wouldn't be the word I was use. A fee. And--

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Call it what you want. It's five cents.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Correct. Yep. And at the state level, there was a determination that the direction they wanted to take was to do a ban on single-use plastic bags and then allow for a fee by local jurisdictions on paper bags. And--

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Well, then we took that-- We took that upon ourselves.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yes. So I think--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yes.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: And this goes back to the conversation that we had with Council member Lander earlier. What we have seen in other jurisdictions and we are trying to avoid this is that just a ban on single-use plastic bags is not enough because that causes the substitution effect. That causes people to use heavier bags in very large volumes. And that's not consistent--

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I--

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: with our--

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I don't think that's enough. And can--

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: our zero waste policy.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: agreed to disagree. I just don't believe that's the answer. I don't believe the answer anymore is constantly adding a fine or a fee to get people to do something. Our

kids, our leaders, and our schools-- our schools are recycling. They use the brown paper bags. They take them. They separate them. They are taught by their parents, their teachers, their leaders to take those steps. That's what we are-- That's what we should be doing. We should be bringing change voluntarily by doing it the right way and, if it didn't work over a period of time, you say, you know, we tried. It didn't work. We didn't do that. And we're not doing that here. And with a largest city in the world and with the best city in the world, and we can do better. I don't think we have to start with a fine. And I would disagree with this the first time. Plastic bags are different. There's no one on this planet is going to argue that we should use plastic bags. Brown paper bags, we're going into a different animal here and a recyclable animal.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I would say--

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: And that's going to be my point.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yep. I think that-- Thank you for that point and I would say that we have been-- we've had a recycling

program and we have been aggressively working towards maximizing the recycling of paper for three decades now and what we are looking for now is to focus on the reduce part of our waste management goals and we have learned from other jurisdictions that a modest five cent fee does induce behavior change that reduces the use of these paper bags and you don't-- the goal is not to have people spend five cents on paper bags. The goal is to have them switch to use reusable.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I get that. But we have never banned in New York City. So, we are jumping to something without trying something else. Just having a recycling program is one thing. Another thing is to say we are, as of August 1, banning brown paper bags and we're going to try this on a trial basis. Different type of rollout period. We are not doing that. So my opposition is to that. Not to and the not-- the goal. We all want to be zero waste. I think we should have taken steps before we did it. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. Can you clarify-- because Council member Vallone is asking why did the city not look too bad as opposed

to another fee. Does the state give us the authority to ban paper bags if we wanted to?

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: So the state law takes action specifically on plastic bags. It also says that the cities and counties across the state can implement a fee, if they choose. It is sort of unclear on other actions that you can take regarding paper bags. It clearly doesn't restrict us from requiring that people recycle those paper bags, which has been required since the recycling law took effect back in the early nineties. And, you know, as Commissioner Anderson said, that has been in effect for 30 years. We are still on the recycling 45 percent.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I guess what I am talking about is the authority. Are we preempted by the state to have been paper bags? So they didn't let us ban paper-- plastic bags. If we were to go through the process, another very difficult process in the Council to ban paper bags, does this new authority that's given to us by the state allow us to do that? Does it give us that authority?

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: We are not preempted from banning paper bags.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. So that's what I wanted to-- that's the question, I guess, folks were asking. Or that Council member Vallone was asking. I have a couple more questions. Does the fee on paper bags having-- happen concurrently with the plastic bag-- the plastic ban?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: In the pre-considered bill, the paper bag fee would go into effect on the same day as the--

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: state plastic bag ban.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Great. And what can community groups do if they want to get bags and start the process of giving them out in churches, places of worship, and so forth?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yep.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: They--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: They should contact the Department of Sanitation or call 311 and they will be routed to us and we have a team of folks who will actively distribute bags to these groups and we welcome local groups helping us distribute bags.



CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. Thank you.

We've also been joined by Council member Costa Constantinides who is also one of the newest members of the Sanitation and Solid Waste Committee. Welcome, Costa. And I think we're-- Do you have any questions, Costa, or-- I think we're good. Thank you so much for your time and your testimony. Thank you. We have three panels. So we're going to go with Eric Goldstein, Melissa Iachan, Adriana Espinosa, and Jordan Christiansen. First group. We're going to put a two-minute clock. Thank you, sir. So, I'm sorry. We have a whole bunch of bags. Are those for like-- Can we just give them away? All right. So can we just start the process of every one at least taking one bag in the aisle?

[Background comments]

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Oh, good. Good.

Keep the--

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Mr.

Chair, don't use them to throw the garbage down the chute.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: No. No. Imagine seeing the orange bags the city's truck. No. But we can-- Yeah. Start giving the moment and then leave

the rest there and we will figure it out. We will send them to Deutsch's house. [Laughter] Melissa, do you want to start?

MELISSA IACHAN: Sure. Good morning. Or actually afternoon. My name is Melissa Iachan and I'm a Senior Staff Attorney in the Environmental Justice Program and New York Lawyers for the Public Interest. NYLPI has advocated and litigated for environmental justice in New York City for more than two decades. NYLPI's environmental justice program has long focused on the detrimental effects of the city's waste management system. And I have worked in the area of waste regulation for more than five years. NYLPI has been a member of the Bag-It Coalition for several years and we strongly supported the BYOBag bill that the council passed a few years ago. So we are encouraged to see the city finally on the precipice of seeing meaningful reduction in harmful waste streams like disposable bags. Thank you to Chairman Reynoso for holding this hearing into the sponsors of this important bill. Council members Lander and Chin. In a special welcome to the Sanitation Committee to Council members Chin and Constantinides. We are thrilled that the state has passed a ban on

plastic bags which are a scourge to our environment on many levels. However, all precedent indicates that to truly reduce single-use disposable bag used by consumers, the state law should be accompanied by a fee on another single use bags such as paper bags. Thanks to the pre-considered intro bill being heard today, New York City has the opportunity to join other green cities in ensuring that the state wide plastic bag ban be accompanied by a single use paper bag fee to truly reduce our waste as a city, as well as continue the efforts to reduce our carbon footprint. As we heard, plastic bags alone make up about two percent of the city's residential waste stream according to DSNY and single-use carryout bags account for one point seven tons of residential garbage each week. This amounts to 91,000 tons of plastic and paper carryout bags each year, costing the city a whopping 12.5 million dollars annually to dispose of this material. Single-use bags are a particularly harmful part of our waste stream despite making up a relatively small portion of it, largely due to harmful byproducts in the high amount of fossil fuel based energy use in manufacturing these bags, greenhouse gas emissions

from the production, transport, and ultimate disposal of high volumes of these bags, plastic bags detrimental effect on machinery that both putrescible and recycling facilities, the litter and visual-- I am not even halfway done. The litter and visual clutter from the lightweight plastic and paper bags that are blown out of garbage trucks and dumpsters ending up in our streets, parks, trees, and waterways. Communities of color and low income communities who have historically borne the brunt of our waste processing systems can attest to the particularly harmful side effects of having seemingly never ending amounts of plastic and paper bags in our waste stream. Not only do they require more diesel truck trips through their neighborhoods, but because these polluting trucks queue and idle in their neighborhood streets on their way to dumping, and these lightweight bags litter the sidewalks, streets, parks, and playgrounds far more often in these communities than in communities where garbage trucks idling are not such a frequent site. Residents of these neighborhoods are more enthusiastic than ever to adapt to their habits and, in fact, reusable bag giveaways over the past few years have been more

successful in these communities than others. And the rest of the city should follow suit. I'm just going to skip ahead and say I know you have heard and will hear even more supportive statistics. There are some stats in my written testimony. So I won't go through all of it here. Suffice it to say that today's pre-considered intro proposing to impose a modest five cent fee on single-use and carryout paper bags in combination with the recent statewide ban on single-use plastic bags has the potential to drastically improve our city's environmental record, reduce greenhouse gas emissions, and bring us significantly closer to our goal of achieving zero waste. We strongly support this legislation and, again, thank the Sanitation Committee, the city Council, and DSNY for being here today to ensure that we enact the most sensible and effective policies to create for a greener and cleaner New York City for all our residents. So thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. Thank you for cutting--

MELISSA IACHAN: For the--

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: it short.

MELISSA IACHAN: For the full story, you can see the written testimony.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. And it'll-- And the full testimony will be written into the testimony, for sure. Into the state--

LEGAL COUNSEL: Record.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Record. Thank you. Geez.

ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Good afternoon, Chairman Reynoso. Welcome, too, Council members Chin and Constantinides. We're glad to have you here. And of course to Council member Lander. My name is Eric Goldstein from the Natural Resources Defense Council. While plastic bag litter and pollution is properly been receiving a lot of attention recently, the problems associated with billions of paper bags used by New York City residents should not be overlooked. The manufacturer, transportation, and disposal of paper bags are indeed significant. Processing rigid stands of timber into flexible, printable, smooth, glossy or absorbent, paper requires intensive chemical and mechanical effort after a tree is harvested. The virgin pulp and paper industry is one of the world's largest generators of hazardous air

pollution, surface water pollution, sludge, and solid wastes. The transportation of timber and finished paper products hundreds of miles from forests to retail outlets consumes large amounts of energy and is one of the many aspects of paper production that has significant adverse environmental consequences. For this and other reasons, jurisdictions have sought to discourage the use and disposal of both paper and plastic single-use carryout bags. From California to Chicago to Washington DC, localities are rightly adopting policies that encourage the use of reuse of bags by placing fees or restrictions on paper bags, as well as plastics. And that is what the Council wisely did in 2016 until it was preempted by state law. The proposed legislation-- and this is important-- includes significant protections to ensure that the impacts of this bill don't fall adversely on low income New Yorkers. Consistent with state law, the new statute would exempt all SNAP and WIC food stamp shoppers from having to pay the five cent fee. Of course, we hope these shoppers will, over time, bring reusable bags, even if they are not required to pay the fee for paper bags. The state legislation also authorizes the city to obtain two

out of every five cents collected for the purchase of paper bags at point-of-sale and to use such funds for the acquisition and distribution of reusable bags with priority given to low and fixed income communities. This provision will help ensure that every New Yorker who needs help will have access to reusable carryout bags at no additional cost. And that is even without or even before the provisions that were discussed by the sanitation department to make these beautiful orange bags available to New Yorkers. So, we support this legislation strongly. We think Council members Chin and Lander along with the other sponsors and, you, Chairman Reynoso for advancing it. We think that the questions raised by Council member Deutsch can be addressed and we would be happy to do so. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. Thank you. I just texted him and he says, yes. He still wants an answer. So, we'll see. [laughter] but thank you. Appreciate it.

ADRIANA ESPINOSA: Good afternoon. My name is Adriana Espinosa. I am the director of the New York City program at the New York League of Conservation Voters. NYLCV represents over 31,000



members in New York City and we are committed to advancing a sustainability agenda that will make our people, our neighbor's, and our economy healthier and more resilient. NYLCV enthusiastically supports the pre-considered introduction on paper bags which aims to reduce the number of single-use bag waste in New York City. Carryout bags are not free. Every New Yorker pays when our trees, streets, playgrounds, beaches, and waterways become littered with bags. Taxpayers shall out 12 million dollars a year to truck these disposable bags to landfills at a time when we could use these dollars for so many other things. We have become a disposable society. Whether it is grocery bags, shopping bags, utensils, cups, or take-out containers. We use them once and we throw them out. The average disposable bag-- The use of a disposable bag is average just a few minutes, but the toll on the environment lasts for decades. It's time for New Yorkers to stand up and say enough is enough. We can and must do better. Now that New York State has acted and banned single-use plastic bags, we need New York City to tackle paper bags so that we don't substitute one kind of bag for another. Switching from plastic to paper

creates a different set of issues. Compared to plastic, paper bags are more carbon intensive to produce and much heavier. While easier to recycle, soiled paper bags cannot be recycled and most people do not divert them to composting. They are much more expensive for retailers. All this adds up to good reasons why we should move away from single-use bags and on to reusable bags. The pre-considered bill by Council members Chin and Lander would place a five cent fee on each paper bag provided to a customer. Customers who bring their own bags will not be charged. Customers who do not take a carryout bag will not be charged. Customers who pay using public benefits such as SNAP and WIC will not be charged. Implementing a fee on paper bags would encourage New Yorkers to bring their own reusable bags. It's not about penalizing shoppers. It's about providing a signal that bags are not free to our society and encouraging consumers to bring their own. Almost done. Banning thin plastic bags, coupled with placing a fee on all other carryout bags is the gold standard for policy and addressing carryout back waste. This is a policy that is already in place and successful when many jurisdictions across the country

including state wide and California and locally in Seattle. A fee will cost shoppers to take a positive. A decision that the register will go a long way to the dent on the 10 million single-use bags that we use a year. We think Council members Chin and Lander for their longtime leadership on this important issue and we look forward to working with you and the entire city Council on a paper bag fee legislation in New York City, the top priority for my organization and a future score card bill. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.

JORDAN CHRISTIANSEN: Hello. My name is Jordan Christiansen and I am representing Citizen's Campaign for the Environment. So we've worked for over 10 years throughout the state and the country to reduce plastic pollution and, first off, I want to thank you and, specifically this committee, for your previous leadership on this issue. I don't think we would be sitting here talking about a New York State plastic bag ban without you and we would like to thank you for so quickly tackling the issue of paper bags after the budget came out. So, we are here to strongly support the additional fee on paper bags

and, of course, and a successful bring your own bag law doesn't want you switching from plastic to paper. The real goal is to go disposable to reusable and we aren't seeing the sort of consumer behavior change that we would like to see even in other municipalities in New York that only had plastic bag bands. So we started about 10 years ago on Long Island and in Westchester with municipalities banning plastic bags and, by and large, we weren't seeing the sword of reusable bag increases that we were hoping for. Justin increases in waste. And people are going to the check out and they are still getting free bags. There is no real incentive to do any better. At the same time, in Suffolk County, in the first year of their plastic and paper bag fee, we have already seen an 80 percent reduction in both plastic and paper. And one of the things that we were a little surprised by is not only that it increased reusable bags, but also it very greatly increased, number one, people who just choose not to take a bag because you have to get the question "do you need a bag" for the first time. And that's what we want to see with paper. We don't just want to see, you know, people packaging paper without thinking about it. It

also greatly reduces the amount of sort of double bagging and excessive bagging. So even if people are choosing to pay the five cents, which we absolutely hope that no one does, you are still going to see a far decrease in the sword of single-use bag behavior. So we don't even need to take the lessons of Honolulu and Chicago in San Francisco that we talked about previously. We can just look at the rest of the state and see that the ban/fee combo is absolutely the best way to move forward and we urge you to move forward quickly so that we can set this into law and, hopefully, have other counties and cities around the state follow your lead.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the panel? Council member Constantinides.

COUNCILMEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Chairman Reynoso, thank you for your gracious welcome today. I am very glad to be back. I'm back on the sanitation committee after my brief hiatus. [Laughter] But wanted to thank all of you for your strong advocacy for cleaner, greener sustainable New York City and planet. So thank you all for all that you do and I would like to be added as a cosponsor to

the bill, if I can, if I'm not already. Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I also want to thank you for the work you do. Very rarely do we have meetings or hearings related to how the city Council is quickly moving forward with like an environmental issue and then you guys need to catch up to us when it came to like how we pushed it. So this is a day to celebrate and really talk about how members, especially the leadership-- I want to give Corey Johnson and a lot of love for the fact that he thought this was an issue that was important that we need to address urgently. And it wasn't up for discussion. So I really appreciate that and thank you for your continued fight and hopefully you guys also see this as something-- We don't need to be out there in the hot summer days trying to fight for the five cents. It's actually going to happen hopefully. So, thank you. Thank you.

PANEL: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. So we have Jacqueline Ottman. [inaudible 01:01:42] is here. There she is. Tousif Ahsan. I ha-- I think. Yes. She is. Shine Ray Sow and the Jenny Romer. Yeah.

And before we start with this panel, I chose the one to, again, acknowledge the work that Jenny Romer has done. Introduced me to the issues of bags and their harm-- Well, and how harmful they are in a serious way and has been in the front lines of this work. So I just want to thank you for the work that you've done.

[applause]

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Personally. And we would love for you to start with your testimony if you can. Thank you.

JENNY ROMER: Thank you for asking me to testify. And I wanted to specifically thank you, Chair Reynoso and Council members Chin and Lander for really listening to me and really having good conversations about the intricacies of these laws over the last few years. So thank you for that.

My name is Jenny Romer. I am a lawyer and I am a national authority on carryout bag policy. I am the founder of [plasticbaglaws.org](http://plasticbaglaws.org) and the coordinator of the Bag-It NYC coalition that was mentioned earlier. I have provided pro bono counsel to Council members Lander and Chin regarding the bag policy and, in that capacity, I helped develop the

five cent carryout bag fee in 2016 that was overturned by the state. And today your committee is considering legislation that would really get New York City back on track to implement an effective carryout bag law. How I got involved with bag laws was volunteering for two years with the San Francisco Board of Supervisors on redrafting their original plastic bag legislation to address the paper bag loophole. So this is déjà vu. So I worked with that to add a 10 cent, minimum 10 cent, fee in that case on all carryout bags, paper and thicker bags qualifying as reusable, as well as compostable. And we didn't see a significant increase in reusable bag use in San Francisco until after about 10 cent fee was in place. I have been researching bag laws for over a decade and I have found that the best legislative practice is to include a fee on all available check out bags. To date, 376 carryout bag laws have been adopted in the United States. Data from those laws shows that including a fee component is incredibly effective in changing consumer behavior by encouraging customers to bring their own bags and straight bans like what would be in place if this fee were not to be adopted resulting customers simply



switching to the bag that is available for free. I worked with a group at NYU of scientist to put together a summary of all the effectiveness data that we know of. It's available on my website [plasticbaglaws.org](http://plasticbaglaws.org) and with Governor Cuomo's statewide ban on plastic bags, it was a monumental step forward to address single-use plastic, but the ban was a disappointment in that among other things that failed to include a fee component on paper and I urge you to opt in to the paper bag fee. Thanks a lot.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Jenny. You want it?

JACQUELINE OTTMAN: Sure. Good afternoon, Chair Reyno-- Ah. Turn on the button. Good afternoon, Chairman Reynoso and members of the Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste. Thank you for your leadership on this effort over these many years. I am Jackie Ottman, Chair of the Manhattan Solid Waste Advisory Board, the MSWAB. It's a volunteer citizen's advisory board dedicated to helping New York City achieve its zero waste goals. We advise the Manhattan borough president, city Council, city administration, and others on policies

and programs regarding the development, promotion, and operation of city's waste prevention, reuse, and recycling programs. We are aboard comprised of solid waste management industry professionals, waste reduction and diversion consultants, sustainability professionals, and concerned citizens who were appointed by the Manhattan borough president's office for-- Out of respect for everyone's time, I'm just going to cut to the chase here. We applaud the legislation introduced by Council members Lander, Chin, Treyger, and Reynoso and under consideration today because it is designed with the goal of reducing the number of single use paper bags in the waste stream by placing a five cent fee on such bags, thus incentivizing customers to bring their own reusable bags or not take a bag at all. For example, such fees have shown to be a major driver in encouraging people to reduce the use of such bags. For example, Washington DC's five cent charge on paper and plastic carryout bags went into effect in 2010 and is led to a 60 percent drop in overall single bags and a corresponding drop in bag litter. Fees at the point of sale are important because they make consumers more mindful about whether they need a

bag for their purchase. In addition, it is, of course, expected that some portion of consumers will still use paper bags as an alternative and pay about five cent fee. These paper bags, as well as many of the exempt bags, represented important messaging opportunity. They are natural billboards. MSWAB recommends that they be printed as appropriate with messages to support recycling, organic stove version, and reuse in New York City. We urge the city Council to consider requiring or at least incentivizing such communications as an important component to the outreach efforts around New York City zero waste programs. Thank you for the opportunity to submit this testimony.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: You say the communication on the backs?

JACQUELINE OTTMAN: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. Maybe we can do a competition and we can figure out a way to--

JACQUELINE OTTMAN: It can be totally voluntary and something that is altruistically provided--

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Oh. I see.

JACQUELINE OTTMAN: by retailers and the manufacturers.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: All right. Encouraging them, not only the city. And before Bradley, there was one more birthday that we haven't celebrated and we just found out that-- or I just found that local law 19, New York City's recycling law, turned 30 years on Sunday, April 14th. So it's another birthday that is significant.

[Applause]

JACQUELINE OTTMAN: Okay. Terrific.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Whoever sent me that now, thank you very much. It's a good start. But thank you--

JACQUELINE OTTMAN: Great.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: for your testimony.

JACQUELINE OTTMAN: You're welcome.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thanks.

TOUSIF AHSAN: Thank you so much, Council members. My name is Tousif Ahsan. I am the civic engagement coordinator at NYPIRG and I will be delivering this testimony on behalf of our environmental policy director, Liz Moran. NYPIRG is a nonpartisan not-for-profit research and advocacy

organization, consumer protection, environmental preservation, public health, healthcare quality, higher education affordability, and governmental reforms are our principal areas of concern. The full written testimony has been submitted for the record, so I am going to abridge it because many of the points have already been made. Like many of the advocates and councilmembers here, we applaud the governor's decision to include a plastic ban bag in the budget. However, it does not go far enough because, as we've seen, without a paper bag fee, customers tend to switch over to paper bags which have their own adverse effects on the environment. Often, people mistakenly think that paper bags are a better choice for our environment, but this is a myth. Negative environmental impacts of paper bags include:

- Paper bag production may require hazardous chemicals that create algae blooms contaminating drinking water and contributing to acid rain.

- Paper bag production wastes clean water. It takes a gallon of water to produce a single paper bag.

-Paper bags are resource intensive. The production of paper bags involve clear-cutting forests around the globe which is one of the lead causes of climate change.

-And it also takes large amount of fossil fuel based energy to and transport paper bags because they are so heavy.

Many of the advocates hear of spoken to Hal paper bag fees around the country of worked, so I am not going to repeat that point, but I am going to raise it again. They worked around the country. I am also going to end with the concern that people have raised about low income communities disproportionately being impacted by this fee and I am here to refute that. Lower income communities adjust to the fee effectively. In Richmond, California, customers of a discount grocery store chain increase their rate of being reusable bags by 48 percentage points. Plastic bag fees immediately reduce curbside litter and immediate reductions and litter were observed in San Jose, California, Austin, Texas, and Ireland. And the air quality and public health are improved by a reduction of waste disposal as a ways processing facilities are

disproportionately located near low income communities. These communities suffered the most from their presence due to toxic byproducts in the air and waste. And, of course, as councilmembers have mentioned, those who qualify for low income programs are exempt from this. New York is heralded as an environmental leader in both the state and the country and that is why we need to follow up with this paper bag fee in order to follow through on that reputation. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. If we were going to make a horror movie about bags, NYPIRG would be in the front lines as the writers group that we would need for that. I--

TOUSIF AHSAN: Yeah. We can promise you that much.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah. You know. He scared me. But we have one more testimony?

SHIN RA TA: Yes. Hi. My name is Shin Ra Ta and I'm a-- I have my own business [inaudible 01:11:45] and what we do is we design and manufacture compostable packaging. And I think that a lot of my concerns are we're talking about plastic bags and we're talking about paper bags, but we're missing the

point of compostable packaging. Compostable packaging is made from a plant-based resin and I think where this lies is that I do think that there should be a five cent fee implemented on packaging as a whole, but I think that what we are looking at is that there is a whole bigger conversation about the type of marketing that you can put on the types of packaging which then can sort of like lend itself in creating another conversation to the end-user. And so, what we do on our compostable packaging is, basically, we put education on it. So as our stores and our business is a kind of purchase from us, they then give out to their consumers which then they have the possibility of being a mother be educated in such a short amount of time and become aware of something different. And at that point kind of move forward with some sort of agenda on their own and I think that if you had to pay a five cent fee for a bag, you would then be more proactive and possibly be purpose saying it to, you know, recycle your food waste. You know, and then you wouldn't be-- It wouldn't be as easy for you to be sort of like tossing things in the trash. So, that's it.



CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. And I agree. And it is about building habits and culture and I always go back to Metro card. It was a big deal when they were going to start charging the one dollar fee. I have had the same Metro card for, I think, like four years. So, it's just habits and we can change people's habits where we're the-- we're human that way, as well. So, thank you so much for your testimony, as well. I think we had one more panel to go before we are done. So, again, thank you for your testimony. Mariam Gordon, Matt Gove. I think I-- Paul Darby and Debbie Lee Cohen.

[Background comments]

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Is there anyone else that wants to testify that hasn't submitted an appearance card? No? Okay. Thank you. Do you want to start?

MATT GOVE: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.

MATT GOVE: All right. Some testimony, but it's pretty boring so I won't just jump through some things here. My name is Matt Gove. From Surfrider Foundation and I'm here representing the New York City chapter of Surfrider which is all

volunteers located right here in New York City. I wanted to take the chance to thank those volunteers. You may have met Patrick Timon. He has been doing a ton of work on this. Nikita Scott, John Conklin. I mean, this has been going back five or six years, as you guys know. And I just want to thank also the Chair and everybody here. You guys are kind of the dream team of bags here in New York City. So we are excited. Very excited. We work across the country and have been working on bag laws for about 10 years and we just came out with the toolkit working with Jenny and the main point of the toolkit is like you have to have a fee. So I think everyone has got that down. That has to happen. The governor only got us halfway here, so we've got to finish the deal. You've heard everything else, some just going to say last time I was in DC, I was there for a trip. I was in my old neighborhood and I-- actually, I used to live there when the bill passed in 2009 and it was amazing. So, I was like, oh, I wonder what it's going to be like. And I was in line. There was about 10 people in front of me and I realized I was the only one without my bags because I was traveling. So I stuck all my food in my luggage [laughter], but

I was amazed that I was the only person in the whole line without my bags. So, it's real. It happens. People figure it out and we are going to figure it out in New York City thanks to you guys is leadership. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. And you have the Surfrider Foundation?

MATT GOVE: Surfrider Foundation.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. You guys have a great story. So, we can talk about that a little later. Okay.

[Background comments]

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah.

MIRIAM GORDON: Chair Reynoso and members of the committee, my name is Miriam Gordon. I'm the program director for Upstream. We are a national NGO whose mission is to and our throw away culture and focus on reduce and reuse. We are-- I am from San Francisco-- A former New Yorker from San Francisco. We are hiring staff here in New York City, so you will be hearing more from us on this issue. But I am pleased to say that I worked with Jenny early on in California. I am a veteran of the plastic bag ban and other waste reduction issues. I first started

working on this in 2006 when I was a mem-- I worked for the state of California and wrote an action plan. Banning single use plastic bags was one of the five top priorities. And then I joined the NGO community in 2007. Worked on the first plastic bag ban/paper fee in San Francisco, my hometown. And together in coalition with others, we have enacted 150 local bag ban/fee ordinances and the statewide California law. So I just want to support the comments that chair Reynoso and Council member lander have made. Without the fee on the paper bags, we are, basically, switching one environmental harm from the petroleum based products to paper products, which is not a good thing to do in the era of climate change. We need our trees. They are essential. This is about reducing and the behavior change and the fee has been-- We have been conducting research on all of the laws enacted worldwide. 53 percent of the world's population lives in a place where plastic bags have been banned or there is a charge and, for those that are collecting data, we can see an 80 percent reduction in the use of single use plastic bags and an 80 percent reduction, on average just looking at all the data-- an 80 percent reduction in

bags in the environment. So, very much support the highest fee possible and I just want to close by saying we are innovating in the bay area and we would like to work with you on new laws because the-- As the-- As Bridget Anderson mentioned, bags are two percent of the waste stream, but what is the rest of what you see in the garbage littering in the streets of Manhattan and in the waste stream? It's mostly food and beverage packaging. We have new policies coming from the bay area. You are going to see a wave this year of policies that tells food service businesses that they can't serve in disposable food where and the started applying the idea of the charge for take-out disposables, like the bag charge, to other kinds of disposables in food service. So, would very much like to work with you on getting to the other 90 percent of the waste stream which is food and beverage packaging. So, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. I appreciate it.

DEBBIE LEE COHEN: Hello. I'm Debbie Lee Cohen, Executive Director and Founder of Cafeteria Culture, founded as [inaudible 01:19:13] schools. At first like to thank you, Chair Reynoso, Council

member Chin and Council member Lander for the incredible work that you have done for the city. You are heroes to our kids and our programs. You really are. And I'm sorry. I'm usually here with a group of at least 10 kids, it's not 200 and we didn't have enough notice to bring them today. So, on the back of my testimony, I copied some videos that you can see so that you can hear the student's voices. We have been working on this issue with our students as part of our Plastic-Free Waters program since 2012 and I just want to-- Rather than read through my testimony, most of the comments I have to make have been made already, but in 2015, we got our first EPA trash-free waters grant, EPA Region 2. It was a discretionary grant and we led the program with eighth graders in East Flatbush, Brooklyn at MS 246 Walt Whitman. We usually start our programs with the Socratic discretion and the very first day, I thought, did we make the biggest mistake ever? We're going to fail with this program because, and Socratic discussion, the students actually equated their plastic bag with Wi-Fi. And, by the end of the discussion-- And even the teacher had been to Washington DC and said, you know, he tried to

convince them otherwise. They all moved to one side, pretty much, except for like two or three. So, the reason why I'm telling this story, and I am here to support the fee into support your quick enactment of it, is that these students change their minds. And they changed their minds over a period of really only two months and why did they change their minds? Because of the why. They began to understand by collecting data on the streets how much, what the percentage was, of their Street litter were plastic bags. And then they went to Jamaica Bay and they saw how much of the litter in Jamaica Bay that was a result of our combined sewer overflow system was also plastic bags. And you can see some of the pictures, excuse me, on the back. And then they also understood the health impacts. Not just for wildlife, but for themselves. And as students begin to understand the impacts of micro-plastics and the toxicity that plastic is toxic, but also the toxicity of our garbage in that we need to reduce our garbage to protect all of our communities and, by replacing paper-- my replacing plastic with paper we are not doing justice to all of our communities that are on

the front line of climate change and are needing our support to really reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.

Good afternoon, Chair Reynoso and members of the Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste. I am Paul Darby. I'm here to speak on behalf of Novamont, who are a world leading company in the center of compostable bio plastics. Our headquarters are in Italy and we have worked with a lot of European cities to help implement curbside organics collection. We've also worked with San Francisco in the city of Brooklyn, Massachusetts. Our US offices based in Connecticut and over the past year I've had the pleasure of working with New York-based businesses such as Commit to Green, plus New York waste managements and environmental groups help promote sustainability and zero waste. We do support the proposed fee on paper carryout bags as a proven tool to help reduce a municipality's bad consumption. Although not in the scope of the current intro, we would also propose a certified compostable plastic bag should openly be permitted as an alternative to the recently banned traditional plastic bag. We suggest that allowing retailers to offer certified



compostable carryout bag at the same fee is a paperback, possibly even on a pilot basis in areas where a DSNY residential food waste collection services offered will be a game changer in the city's organics program. As you are aware, the program faces challenges and gaining participation and has only scratched the surface of the nearly 1 million tons of diverse full organics that are disposed of each year by NYC residents. In many of the cities we work with, the compostable bag is used as an educational communication tool because it can be clearly labeled to be used for food scrap collection and disposed of in a New York City's organics residential recycling program. We have a lot of research based on other big cities to show that making come post about plastic bags widely available at low cost can help significantly increase the residential New York City's food scrap participation rates and organics version. This strategy has already been proven in major cities across Europe, such as Milan, where 80 percent of residential food scraps are diverted from landfill to their anaerobic digestion and composting facilities with less than five percent contamination. These bags are truly

compostable. They break down over time and a compost facility and they also work in back-- and some can also work in a backyard compost unit. Biodegradables cannot be used as an excuse to litter and we would never actually promote these [inaudible 01:23:48] to littering or marine pollution. However, in the worst-case scenario where this happens, some compostable products have been proven to breakdown in soil and marine environments to have a less residents and risk over time than conventional plastics. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And I appreciate your time and thank you for your testimony today and hopefully we will be seeing this pass very soon. We actually have one more person. I didn't want to let them set up there all alone. So, do you guys mind entertaining us for two more minutes? I want to call up Dana DeBlasio. So she'll be on the edge here. There you go.

DANA DEBLASIO: Hello. Good afternoon. Thank you for giving me this opportunity. I am here to testify on behalf of NSA, the National Supermarket Association. NSA is a trade association representing about 400 supermarket owners throughout the five

boroughs and Long Island. We wanted to just make sure we got something on the record today. While we-- We were actually-- NSA was supportive of the ban on the state level and we are also supportive of what the council is doing with the five cent fee. However, where our concerns come in our around the parameters that the state designated with the five cent fee. So, paper bags are more expensive to our stores and we view this very similar to viewing-- or how we view the bottle bill where there is a handling fee that the stores get for having to do this transaction. So, on top of thinking that we should get some percentage, portion of that five cents back to the stores for not only handling this administratively, but also because these bags cost us a great deal more than the plastic bag stayed. And so, we just wanted to make sure we got that on the record. Of course, encouraging folks to not use the paper bags is something we support because we, obviously, don't want to provide a lot of paper bags. So, that's-- Thank you. We appreciate that.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. And we tried to get the-- We tried to get the business is

to keep the money, but the state has changed the way it works.

DANA DEBLASIO: Uh-hm.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So, unfortunately, our hands are tied almost-- literally tied when it comes to--

DANA DEBLASIO: Right.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: that, but I appreciate your testimony and your time. And that's the end of the hearing. So I want to thank everyone and I'm looking forward to the passage of this over the next couple of days. So, this meaning is adjourned.

[gavel] [background comments]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 15, 2019