CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

----- X

October 27, 2025 Start: 10:10 a.m. Recess: 1:36 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - 8th Fl. Hearing Rm. 2

B E F O R E: Chris Banks

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Alexa Avilés Erik D. Bottcher Justin L. Brannan Darlene Mealy Chi A. Ossé

Rafael Salamanca, Jr. Pierina Ana Sanchez

Julie Won

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Wanda Salas Manhattan Together

Maria Roman Manhattan Together/ Metro IAF

Tabitha Ward

Neil Barofksy Federal Monitor

Cesar De Castro Ombudsperson

Kiersten Acevedo
OCC/Independent Mold Analysis

Neil Steinkamp OCC/Ombudsperson

Daniel Greene
Executive Vice President of Property Management
Operations at NYCHA

Elena Tenchikova Vice President of the Office of Mold and Remediation at NYCHA

Heather Beck
Deputy Chief Real Estate Officer of Real Estate
Department at NYCHA

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Reverend Getulio Cruz, Jr. Metro IAF

Reverend Francis Skelly Metro IAF

Yolanda Moore NYCHA Resident

Stephanie Pitts

Christopher Leon Johnson

	4

SERGEANT AT ARMS:

We're going to resume.

Thank you very much.

24

2 CH

1

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Good morning again.

This meeting is called to order. [gavel] morning everyone and welcome to this hearing on Committee of Public Housing of this New York City Council. I'm Council Member Chris Banks, Chair of this committee, and I'm pleased to be joined by my colleagues who will be joining me a little later. Today, we are holding an oversight hearing on updates related to NYCHA's remediation of mold in its developments. It should not surprise anyone when I state that mold is a serious issue. It does not only damage the structures of apartments by eating away at the building materials, but it also causes and exacerbates respiratory conditions for those who encounter the mold. The persistent presence of mold and leak issues in NYCHA apartments led to a lawsuit by tenants against NYCHA known as the Baez case. The court-ordered Consent Decree that came out of the Baez along with federal HUD agreement issued in 2019 spoke to the severity of the situation that NYCHA allowed to fester. In those agreements, NYCHA is held to a set of mandates and matrix to remediate the mold in its developments and track its performance in meeting those goals. However, despite the fact that

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS 1 2 these agreements legally -- are legal mandates, NYCHA 3 has continually failed to meet its obligations. 4 acknowledge that NYCHA has made some progress. instance, the latest monitor's report shows that NYCHA removed mold within five business days of a 6 7 resident complaint at a 24 percent rate in the first 8 two quarters of 2025, compared to a seven percent rate over the same time period last year. However, the HUD agreement's obligations were for NYCHA to 10 11 have a minimum of 95 percent compliance rate by 2021. 12 However, in the year since the HUD agreement was finalized, NYCHA's compliance rate for this 13 14 obligation ranged from four percent to 10 percent and 15 it remains to be seen what the final yearly 16 compliance rate will be this year. Crucially, this 17 drastically low compliance rate is seen across 18 NYCHA's mold obligations and NYCHA's tenants are 19 suffering the consequences. Residents continue facing issues with long wait times on mold and leak 20 repairs, ad hoc band aid fixes that don't treat the 21 root cause, and inconsistent communication from 2.2 2.3 This cannot be allowed to continue. Residents who live with reoccurring mold and leaks in 24 their apartments are constantly under duress.

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

not hard to imagine how coming home to mold and leaks would cause stress, or let alone the breathing problems, the health complications that one would experience. We need to make sure that we are doing our best to remediate these mold and leak conditions in a timely and comprehensive manner so that our residents can live with health and dignity. I look forward to hearing from the administration about their efforts to improve their compliance with their mold and leak obligations. I'm also eager to hear from the Federal Monitor and the mold ombudsman and their teams about the issue and possible solutions presently and moving forward. Finally, I would like to hear from the expert advocates, the residents gathered here today about their experiences with mold and leaks in NYCHA and what needs to be done so that living at NYCHA does not have to be a risk for one's mental or physical wellbeing. I want to also thank my amazing staff, Michael Lambert [sp?], Kyle Graham [sp?], along with the Public Housing Committee staff, Jose, Charles, Carla, Dan, Reiss [sp?], James, and Sierra [sp?] for all the work they put into this hearing. Now we will move as we've done traditionally for pre-panel, and we will now have

2 Wanda Salas come on up. We'll have Maria Roman, and

3 Tabitha Ward. You may approach the dais. Thank you.

4 And Tabitha? Thank you. You have three minutes for

5 your testimony. We thank you for coming out this

6 morning and being a part of this hearing. We'll

7 start with Maria Roman. You may want to press the

button and make sure the light is red, and then you

9 may begin your testimony.

1

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

MARIA ROMAN: My name is Maria Roman. I'm a member of Our Lady of Sorrows Parish, a leader in Manhattan Together Metro IAF, and I've been a resident of Baruch Houses since 1975. In July of 2019 a major leak developed in my kitchen wall, and I called NYCHA many times, but the problem wasn't Through Manhattan Together I learned about the OCC which was created through our lawsuit to help get real mold and leak repairs. I contacted them in March of 2020, and through persistent follow-up, they helped me to get the wall fixed in July of 2020, and this July a smaller leak returned. I reported it to NYCHA, but things didn't start moving until after I called the OCC. NYCHA scheduled plastering and painting after the work was done for July of 2026, but thanks to the OCC's help, the painting, the work

2 was completed on September 23rd of this year. We

3 also know that many NYCHA employees, especially

4 Executive Vice President Daniel Green are working

5 | very hard to improve NYCHA's response.

6 Unfortunately, too many tenants still suffer

7 unnecessarily. The OCC has made a real difference

8 for tenants, but they can't do everything. They need

9 more resources and more authority to hold NYCHA

10 accountable. For example, in my case, NYCHA staff

11 often fails to show up when scheduled. There's still

12 a hole in the staircase in my building from earlier

13 repair work. I have a recurring mold problem around

14 | the tub. A NYCHA employee told me that's because the

15 roof fan on my line isn't working. That was months

16 ago. It hasn't been fixed. No matter how hard I

17 scrub, that mold keeps coming back, and until they

18 fix the fan, it will keep coming back. The OCC has

19 proven that tenants don't have to accept these

20 terrible conditions, but to keep making progress,

21 | they need more resources, more authority to hold

22 NYCHA accountable. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Wanda Salas, you may go. You want to press-- thank you.

2.3

25

2 WANDA SALAS: Chairman Banks and members 3 of the Committee on Public Housing, good morning. name is Wanda Salas. I am a resident of Amsterdam 4 Houses and a leader of Manhattan Together. to share how the OCC and Manhattan Together helped me 6 7 make my home for my first child safe. After the NYCHA annual inspection in 2020, I was told that our 8 floors were to be replaced, and I simply waited and waited like a good tenant. Twice our apartment was 10 11 tested for lead, yet I was never informed it required 12 remediation. When my daughter was born in 2023, I 13 had no idea how dangerous our home was. Later, a 14 contractor who came to look at our ceiling because I 15 reported a crack, pointed to the floor at the 16 possible asbestos there. NYCHA staff had come to do 17 some fixing, never told me that was an issue. 18 when the floor tester came, he simply said, "You will 19 get relocated." I was alarmed and I started packing. 20 Yet, when nothing happened, I visited the office only to be told that another test had to be scheduled. 21 My daughter was nearing crawling age. I 2.2 2.3 repeatedly contacted property management with no result. I was freaking out. I was stressed, 24

desperate, with nothing. It's not good for me. I

2 remember so clearly the stress. Then by grace, I met

12

3 a volunteer from Manhattan Together who guided me

4 through the process and helped me get NYCHA to

5 | finally do the work. I'm so grateful for everybody

6 that said yes and helped me out. Unfortunately, after

7 | the asbestos and lead remediation -- I was very happy.

8 NYCHA left a gap under the bathroom window and the

9 shower panel and model begun to grow. Six months

10 | later the carpenter removed the bathtub panels and

11 | left the walls bare, covered with plastic. The mold

12 | became uncontrollable. I had filters. I was freaking

13 out. I had to keep the door closed. I was so nervous

14 | for my daughter, especially my daughter. Luckily, I

15 | learned about the OCC through Manhattan Together, and

16 | I took my baby across town at night to attend the

17 meeting, because I really needed the help that the

18 NYCHA staff was not giving to me. The OCC was

19 wonderful.

20

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You may continue.

21 WANDA SALAS: I followed-- they followed

22 | up with calls and texts and emails, unlike NYCHA, and

23 | they finished the job, and they even contacted me to

24 | tell me like-- to make sure that the job was done

after the job was done with pictures. They wanted

2 everything, and I felt so grateful that my daughter

3 | could bathe in the bathroom and I didn't have to keep

4 | the door closed. And I was-- I'm just so happy. So,

5 thank you, Manhattan Together. Thank you, OCC. My

6 daughter is safe at home, and now I have two little

7 girls, and they use every space in my apartment.

Thank you.

8

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Tabitha?

10 TABITHA WARD: Good morning, my name is

11 | Tabitha Ward, and today-- even though I do not live

12 | in NYCHA housing, I do live in low-income housing,

13 | and I want to just discuss a solution for the mold

14 and leaks and other repairs that needs to be done in

15 | not only NYCHA housing, but in other low-income

16 | housing where they're receiving federal, state, or

17 | city funding. I record-- today, you will hear

18 different types of solutions and progress reports

19 | from the committees and the different panels that

20 | will come before you and speak today. But I also ask

21 | that the congress, that the-- sorry-- that the

22 | Committee considers also an alternative while they

23 \parallel are discussing their solutions and the things-- their

24 progress and what they are doing. I'm asking that

you consider to allow housing voucher recipients to

because they're directly receiving the housing

24

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

vouchers, they're going to receive that regardless if they make these repairs, regardless to if they do anything about, you know, mold, mildew and leaks. Ιt doesn't matter, they will receive it anyway. It will not cost the city, state, or the federal government any undue burdens or additional financial costs for allowing them to directly receive it, because it'll just require just a couple of changes to the computer systems which will direct that funding onto their benefit cards or into their accounts, and they can pay their rent and pull the money from it. You can include language that states that the landlords have a certain amount of time to respond to mold, mildew, and leaks, and if they don't do this in a certain amount of time, the housing voucher recipient can hire outside people to come in and make these repairs, and they can deduct it from the rent by paying the rent, the balance, and giving the landlord the receipt, the original receipt for whatever repairs that were made.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your testimony. I just have a couple of questions before the pre-panel leaves. And I guess I'll direct this one-- well, I guess I'll direct this to Ms. Roman and

2 Ms. Salas. What has been the most challenging part

3 of getting your mold and leak issues addressed by

4 NYCHA?

2.2

2.3

WANDA SALAS: In my experience, when I reported mold in NYCHA, the staff comes in. They take a picture. Then they come back, and then I have to wait for a schedule, and then I call, and I'm like, okay, and then the person from my bathroom recently they came and after they agreed that there's mold, nothing happened, but OCC was like on it. And by the time NYCHA finally responded, OCC had taken care of it. So, it's the delay, the taking the extra steps and not communicating. So, I cannot plan.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And if you had the opportunity, which you do now, to make a recommendation to NYCHA to improve it's handling of mold and leak complaints, what would it be?

WANDA SALAS: Well, I noticed in the app- I noticed in the app that when I make a complaint I
take pictures, and I do that. So, when I take a
picture, if it's not clear, then send a staff member,
but if it's clear, then give me a call, confirm, and
then make my appointment and communicate. I-- it just
it seems like it takes so long, so just, you know,

would be your recommendation to NYCHA?

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

with my partner Matt Cipolla who could not be here today and sends his apologies. We were appointed to be the Federal Monitor under the HUD agreement in February of 2024 about 20 months ago. Of course, we're not the original monitor, we're the successor. Guide Post had that role for about five years previous going back to February of 2019 when the monitorship was first-- the HUD agreement was first executed. When we got to NYCHA, of course, the first thing we did was to do a comprehensive overview of the different requirements under the HUD agreement, and first and foremost was mold. We knew that the-as we just heard from the first resident panel, is just top of mind for residents. The scourge of mold, its impact, as well as the very, very long delays that residents experience in getting their mold remediated. And you know, we took a look at the statistics and it was dire. As you mentioned in your introductory comments, Chairman Banks, you know, eight percent response rate as far as timely response to mold when it's supposed to be 95 percent is about as dire as it could be, and we saw struggles across the board. As we look, though, one of the things that was somewhat -- a little bit encouraging was the

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

fact in the previous five years, it's not as if nothing was being done. The first monitor, my co-pal [sic] at NYCHA had been putting in work and laying a foundation for necessary reform, but it wasn't yet being translated in the data, and then as we saw on the resident experience. And so we focused on how could we bring some of these-- this effort to the surface and start seeing it, results. And as, again, as Chairman Banks as you mentioned in your introductory comments, we are starting to see some of that success. An increase from eight percent to 28 percent which is the most recent statistics of how often NYCHA responds timely to mold under the terms of the HUD agreement is an extraordinary increase in a relatively short period of time. Is it enough? Of course not. It's still unacceptably low, and one of the things you heard from the residents, for the 72 percent who are not getting that timely response, it is cold comfort to hear the 28 percent, you know, are-- there is that compliance. But it is a sign of progress. And you don't turn a supertanker around instantly, and the key thing is to build on that success, take a look at what has led to this, because the fact is for the first time we really do see a

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

path towards compliance that had not existed before. And our focus -- and I think one of the things that has helped bring this progress and what we need to maintain our focus on is right in line with what the residents were talking about, efficiency and accountability. Because the reality is is that the portfolio of NYCHA structures is well past its expiration date, and the plumbing of NYCHA, those pipes, they're not getting younger, and they're going to continue to fail at increasing rates until they're replaced. But that is a problem that is not a billion-dollar problem. It is a tens of billion dollar problem, and that money doesn't currently exist. So, a lot of what we do, and I think a lot of what my co-panelists do, is that bridge between today and the eventual need to replace those pipings, to find that money and do the necessary infrastructure and structural improvements. And so a couple of areas that we detailed in our testimony and in our most recent report of how do you address that inbetween, that repair and maintenance that is so necessary is again focusing on the idea of efficiency and accountability. So, for example, things like dashboards so that NYCHA could have a better sense of

1 2 how it's deploying its assets, and then 3 accountability to make sure that the people are doing 4 the necessary work so they get it right the first 5 time and don't have to keep coming back. The idea of pilots and certain projects to attack this 6 7 extraordinarily long backlog, as the resident mentioned, getting a date mid to late 2026. And so 8 things like the Restore and Renew program which I know all of the people on this panel really push 10 11 NYCHA, and NYCHA to its credit has accepted, which is 12 just being launched in the Sotomayor Houses. idea of having a squad team of dozens of temporary 13 skilled trades to deal with some of the worst 14 15 performing assets to get those out from under the 16 backlog to free NYCHA resources to do all the other 17 work it needs to get done. The rolling out of the 18 leak standard procedure, this is a really important 19 development, and it's something that's been a long 20 time coming, and we've all pushed very hard, but this will mean that now maintenance workers and skilled 21 2.2 trade workers, they're going to have the necessary 2.3 training and tools to do the job and to do it well. It's also going to give us additional data so we can 24

measure and make sure there's a level of

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

accountability, including measuring performance in one of the HUD agreement requirements that hasn't been measured in the first seven years, which is NYCHA's obligation to remove standing water. And overlying all of this-- and again, what you heard so much on that resident panel, resident communication. There is nothing worse from an efficiency perspective as well as an emotional perspective than when an appointment is made and it's not kept, either because NYCHA worker doesn't show up, or because the resident is not home because they didn't get adequate communication to know to be there to get repair done. And we detail in our testimony as well as in our most recent report, the numerous efforts that we're doing and are starting to have success in those areas. Chairman Banks, there has been some level of success, but it is fragile. Only with continued focus, attention from this committee, from those here at this panel doing oversight, and NYCHA itself is there going to be a path forward? It has to be maintained, and above all, the budget has to be protected. of this news out of Washington about potentially draconian budget cuts to public housing, it's hard ot overstate just how devastating that will be, not just

effort and with sustained budget, we do believe that we can get NYCHA and keep NYCHA on the right path 6

forward. Thank you. 7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you [inaudible] opening statement. We'll now move to the ombudsman.

CESAR DE CASTRO: This works. The OCC and ombudsperson model has worked and continues to What the Baez plaintiffs, NYCHA, and Special Master McGovern proposed, U.S. District Judge Wiliam H. Pauly, then Loretta Presca [sp?] and Special Master James Francis have implemented works. For the first time ever, as far as we know, a comprehensive independent resident-centered resource to have mold and leak conditions backed by a Federal Consent Decree is available to all NYCHA residents. NYCHA's complete buy-in, this collaboration and collaborative approach with mechanisms to ensure NYCHA's accountability has made a difference in the lives of thousands. We're helping individuals and systemically making a difference. Change is incremental. In a world of instant gratification, it

appropriately responded to our inquiries, requests

and orders. Afterall, it is required to do so by the

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

very terms of the consent decree, and for the most part, my orders are unappealable. It's been clear since 2019 when we became operational that NYCHA has not just responded with the bare minimum of effort, it's dedicated substantial resources to the matters brought to the OCC and to myself. It created OMAR [sic] and the MRU whose staff have been responsive and dedicated to resolving our cases as they arise. Yes, the Ombudsperson Call Center and this model is working, but we're unknown to the majority of NYCHA residents. My esteemed colleagues at Jenner and Block [sic] diligently performing their oversight functions are pretty well-known, but our office in many respects, the boots on the ground as it relates to mold and leaks, remains foreign to NYCHA residents. Even this body, the City Council, recognized that in 2020 when it passed the Provision of Information to tenants of NYCHA regarding the mold ombudsperson. That would have required the Mayor to designate an office or an agency to distribute information regarding our role. My understanding is that it was returned unsigned by Mayor de Blasio in 2021. So, outreach has been left to the Baez plaintiffs, NYCHA, and us. While conditions remain

difficult for NYCHA residents in a variety of 2 3 aspects, many if not all of which the monitor is tasked with overseeing, conditions remain difficult 4 for residents facing leaks and mold. Need for capital repairs remains dire. Many buildings need 6 7 full rehab and massive capital repairs such as the replacement of piping, replacement of roofs, repairs 8 of façade damage, all which lead to leaks and mold. That we cannot order. The ombudsperson has no 10 11 authority to order those capital repairs, but we work on a case by case basis to help residents and ensure 12 13 that NYCHA employs its best efforts to address 14 tenants leaks and mold while helping NYCHA uncover 15 opportunities for systemic reform in pursuit of 16 transformational, organizational, and cultural 17 We are, like Mr. Barofsky said, a bridge. 18 Thank you, Chairman Banks. Thank you to the Public 19 Housing Committee. Thak you for the invite. 20 the first time e have been asked to appear before 21 Thank you to the rest of the Council, others in attendance here or via live feed and NYCHA residents 2.2 2.3 and tenant advocate groups in attendance as well. name is Cesar de Castro. In 2019 I was appointed at 24 the recommendation of the parties to the Baez 25

These paragraphs create the ombudsperson. In turn, we

created the OCC to handle resident complaints and the

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

systemically failed to comply. We do not have a

team of workers and contractors. Our job is to

24

steadily declined from 2019 to 2023. There was an

uptick in 2024, and we believe that 2025 will be

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

similar to the 2024 numbers. We've seen the average amount of time to resolve mold and leak complaint be reduced from 1090 days on average to 70 days. That's still not in compliance with the Baez and HUD monitor benchmarks, but quite an improvement by NYCHA. biggest challenge is not getting NYCHA to respond to our directives. Our biggest challenge is not getting residents to trust us. Our biggest challenge is not getting residents to allow access to their apartments when NYCHA is scheduled to do work. One of our biggest challenges is helping residents deal with scheduling delays, as you heard in the prior panel, and helping them navigate mold and leak issues when their building is in desperate need for undergoing-desperate need or actually undergoing capital But our biggest -- our biggest challenge by far is awareness. Making sure that we are serving all of the residents that we can. The reality is we are not. People do not know about us, or they forget about us. So, people do not call. In 2022, we conducted a survey, 96 percent of those residents surveyed were not aware of the OCC. Every time I meet with a resident association that point is I focused a great deal of effort this underscored.

2	past year on outreach. I've met with resident
3	associations, public officials, including members of
4	this body. I've appeared in the media. We've been
5	trying to create multiple pipeline channels to help
6	as many residents as we can. When we increase
7	outreach, our cases grow. We intend to continue
8	outreach channels including mailers to residents
9	which we found is very effective, and NYCHA has
10	agreed to do that. we need this Council. I've
11	presented to some members of the Council as I've
12	mentioned individually, and I'm happy to meet with
13	any member of the Council or your staff. But what we
14	see as NYCHA's biggest problems are first, as we've
15	discussed, NYCHA has chronic infrastructure issues.
16	Second, many or most of its buildings are in need of
17	substantial capital improvements, and NYCHA will need
18	to relocate those residents if the money comes
19	through for that to actually happen. Third, its aging
20	backlog of mold and leak work orders. It has to
21	attack them, and it has, and I'm sure they will be
22	addressing how they are attacking that. Fourth,
23	dealing with and solving scheduling delays, that is a
24	big issue. Fifth, handling leaks. The majority of
25	Baez is leak related, but it has learned that as

NYCHA as learned from its approach to mold-- what did they do for mold-- which they've gotten their numbers down. Develop and launch a standard procedure. Train everyone appropriately, then launch and implement that procedure. We saw results with the mold standard procedure, results I'm sure NYCHA will talk to you about in the next panel. Hopefully, the same is going to happen with the leak standard procedure. And sixth, root cause investigations. NYCHA must get to the root causes of tenant mold. That will certainly lead to more cases, more calls to the OCC undoubtedly, but it will also lead to the identification of additional capital needs, and they need to get better at that. So, I'm back where I started. The ombudsperson and the OCC, this process Working collaboratively with NYCHA and works. holding them accountable has worked. It's allowed us to serve thousands of New Yorkers, but we know there are so many more that could use our help if they only knew about us. We're optimistic from the progress that's been made that with continued oversight, collaboration with NYCHA and the accountability that's baked into the Baez revised consent decree

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

2 that sustained and lasting change will be made case

3 by case. Thank you.

2.2

2.3

Opening statement. I'm actually going to begin by first acknowledging we've been joined by Council Member Bottcher. And now I'll go into my line of questions, and I'll be going back and forth between the ombudsman and the Federal Monitor. The HUD agreement required a 95 percent compliance with mold remediation timeframes by January 31st of 2021. What is NYCHA's current compliance percentage for this benchmark?

NEIL BAROFSKY: It's a-- it's what we called a blended rate, because there's different components. So, NYCHA has different times for which to respond to different things. So, clean-up, for example, has to be within five days. Simple repairs, stuff that can be done by a maintenance worker has to be done within seven days, and complex repairs usually something a skilled trades worker-- skilled tradesman, that takes-- that's 15 days. So, it's-- there are three different components, and then that all goes into a blended rate which shows that number. And yes, as we discussed earlier, it was just an area

of just stagnation. I mean, the numbers dropped
during year two of the monitorship and stayed in the
single digits up until last year, but what but
this a lot of what the progress that we're seeing
comes from that initial response time. So, up until
last year, it would take NYCHA on average about nine
days after someone could call in a complaint, not to
the OCC, but directly to NYCHA. They've been able to
manage to get that down to manage to get that down to
three days. And so, if you're getting someone a new
apartment within three days instead of nine days, not
surprisingly, everything contracts, right? You're
able if the person is in there, they can clean it
up when they go in and inspect or shortly thereafter.
If it's something that can be done simple, a stuck
window right, the maintenance worker can do that and
get that in within that seven day window, and you car
get the skilled trade scheduled. So that's part of
the reason why you're seeing the improvement in
numbers. And the second is, you know, as you have
more resources available from some of these projects-
- we talk about Restore and Renew, it's not the only
one. Now you're freeing up resources as some
dedicated resources attack the backlog, the 60,000+.

2 That frees up the regular daily maintenance workers,

3 caretakers, those who are in the apartments every

4 day, to more quickly address the concerns as they

5 arise.

1

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, to your knowledge, has NYCHA achieved 95 percent compliance, and what are some of the most significant barriers to

compliance you've identified?

NEIL BAROFSKY: So, I think we're nearing or at peak right now at 28 percent. So, they have not come close to 95 percent. I mean, part of the barriers are-- I mean, number one, as my co-panelist just said, it's sticking the little finger in the I mean, and here that sort of metaphor works, because of the water aspect of it. NYCHA needs an enormous amount of capital improvements. A pipe that is way too old and is leaking eventually needs to be replaced. An entire building line of old pipe needs to be replaced, but until NYCHA can get the money in capital resources to go in, open up that building, replace that pipe, relocate the resident because you can't live in that apartment while that's happening, they're band aids, right? They're necessarily band aids, and I don't mean that in any way, shape or form

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

as a criticism. These are necessary important band aids, but that band aid is going to come off, and so it just creates this resource suck of constantly repairing and band aiding something that needs to be completely replaced. And that's not NYCHA's fault, riaht? It's not NYCHA's fault that it's been the disinvestment in public housing, not just in NYCHA, but across the country. And so that is one of the big challenges. And with any type of backlog, it's just-- it's really hard to get into some of those older areas. But again, what I really have to commend NYCHA for is it's-- it is an almost-- it is a seemingly impossible task, but is one that they are taking on, and they're putting the resources, they're putting the commitment. They're working with us. They're working with the ombudsperson, and that's why you're seeing this type of success. And there really is -- I understand all of the resident frustration and share it, but there is a can do attitude at NYCHA that my understanding has not always been there, and the current management -- and I know Dan Greene is going to be speaking to you next, and it is a can do attitude. And it's not just, by the way, in mold. It's really across the board. There's been a notion

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

at NYCHA that certain aspects of the HUD agreement are unattainable, cannot be met, and then there's people who come in and say yes, we can. And again, I'm going off a little bit, but one of the things I would point to is response rate to rats, right? There is a response rate, a two-day response rate to rats that was in the HUD agreement, and what -- the general sense at NYCHA for years was that was an unattainable standard. In the last year and a half or so since we've been there, they've shattered it. They beat it consistently. They find a way. And so, again, I hear the resident frustration. I share the residents frustration, but the folks at NYCHA, they're really working hard on this and being creative and open to the solutions and things like Restore and Renew, this new project, is open where again, they were open to it. We've discussed it. We're launching it, and now we're going to see if it works, and my hope is if it works, we can then work with NYCHA to find additional funding to expand it, because once you get that backlog-- once you release-- get that backlog and get out from under these tens of thousands of old work orders, that 95 percent is going to be attainable. I truly believe that.

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Do you plan to require any updates to the mold and leak action plan, or are you aware of any such plan by NYCHA to update this action plan?

NEIL BAROFSKY: You know, we're continue- I think that's a-- as far as requiring an update
versus continually working with them in details--

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Right.

NEIL BAROFSKY: I mean, these action plans are important, and I don't mean to take away from them, but they have a tendency sometimes to become an academic exercise. Like-- and just to, you know, build on my co-panelists, you take a look at something like leak standard protocol, I want their resources there. I want NYCHA focused on rolling that out, on training that, on coming up with the necessary components, because that is what is going to translate into meaningful impact for residents. When NYCHA-- you know, when NYCHA workers pull out their smart phone and see, okay, this is exactly what I do for this type of leak, and is able to have that-- the training to do that, and then can enter into the data so that NYCHA could see, okay, this is the trend here. This is what's going on in this

building. This is what's going on on this building line, this plumbing line. We can see, okay, here is how NYCHA is responding within 48 hours. Are they meeting the standard or not? These are the types of things that are going to unlock future reform. are the type of data that's going to give new paths, new ideas to be creative, and to me, that is really the key. And it worked with the mold standard protocol. I think it's going to work with the leak standard protocol. We've all put a lot of effort into it. NYCHA's put a lot of effort into it. way behind schedule. It's too late, but it is being rolled out in projects like that, and then being super smart about it and really learning from the data, seeing what can be improved, and I will say, we have really good partners in this, and that's what really gives me the most hope in NYCHA with the ombudsperson, you know, for the residents.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Can you share more about the collaboration between the monitorship team and NYCHA's mold remediation unit, and what does data look like day-to-day in a big picture? Who is driving the policy shifts and the

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

3

4

-

5

6

7

8

9

10

1112

13

14

15

16

17

1819

20

21

22

23

24

25

broader initiatives to improve mold remediation like the standard procedures or the IT updates?

NEIL BAROFSKY: We are-- we work hand-inhand, and so our team is structured. We have a mold team that's on our team. It comprises of different members of the monitorship team. We have attorneys at Jenner and Block [sp?] who are day-to-day working with their NYCHA counterparts. We have Turner and Townsend who's one of our vendors and construction experts, and we try to bring the different skills of this different set together. So, for example, Turner and Townsend is working on a data project right now to try to deal with the -- not just the -- you know, with the backlog and how to-- is there a smarter way of dealing with the backlog? And we'll deal very closely with NYCHA. We actually get the data from NYCHA. We'll analyze the data. We will share it with them. We will give them recommendations going forward, and then they will, you know, hopefully execute. When you're talking about resident communication, right, which is such an important part, we have an organizational change group of the monitorship. And Turner and Townsend is part of it. We also have Quadell [sp?] which is a public housing

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

best practices of other housing agencies? What can we do within the exiting IT framework? You know,

expert that works on our side. What do we know of

moving away from what hasn't worked, which we know

6 hasn't worked as far resident communication,

7 brainstorming new ideas, using-- something as simple

8 as getting and using and updating email, changing the

9 content. These are all these little tiny things that

10 don't sound like a big deal. You know, one of the

11 | things that we help work with NYCHA to bring about,

just as an example, when someone calls to get a

13 | repair, the wait time can be brutal.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yes.

NEIL BAROFSKY: It's one of the things we talked about. How about a call back, right? I call somebody when I'm doing, you know, whatever it is, Verizon or, you know, Con-Ed. You know, they'll say, you know, push one to get a call back, and now NYCHA does that. And so those are small things, because we'd hear residents, hey, after 25 minutes, I got to go and hang up, and then have to call back some other time, and the meanwhile NYCHA doesn't even know to deal with the problem. Now, they can schedule a call back and you lose that frustration. These are like a

and I frankly hadn't realized those numbers which is,

3

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

_ _

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

19

18

20

21

22

23

24

25

you know, two or three percent of NYCHA residents know about this important resource.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Has NYC

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Has NYCHA ever disputed or pushed back on any of your findings regarding mold and leak compliance?

NEIL BAROFSKY: No. I will-- well, let me say that. Yes, because it is a partnership and a dialogue.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

NEIL BAROFSKY: And we have a lot of We have a lot of good ideas and sometimes our ideas. ideas are not so good, to be honest with you. But that's what a partnership is. It's a back and forth collaboration. And we want NYCHA to push back on us. We don't want NYCHA to just reflexively say, well, thank you -- thank you, Monitors, that's a great idea, we're going to do it, and then we end up wasting resources or wasting time. And so there is pushback. I consider it to be a healthy level of pushback, of the type of pushback that we want in a partner. Sometimes there's disputes, of course, but we haven't had a single dispute that we haven't worked out. look, and sometimes I would say the areas where there is a little bit of frustration is there's just not

1	COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS 45
2	enough resources to do something that we want to do.
3	And that's just a reality of disinvestment. But I
4	will say Restore and Renew, going back to that, whic
5	is launching in Sotomayor, they found a way, right?
6	This was one where there wasn't enough resources and
7	we work with them collaboratively to find the
8	resources, and we got there. So, I would say,
9	healthy amount of pushback. I haven't had single
10	instance where NYCHA has refused to do something or
11	refused to engage, or found a different way to solve
12	a problem.
13	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. What
14	specific recommendations have you made to NYCHA to
15	improve their performance to remove mold in a timely
16	manner?
17	NEIL BAROFSKY: So, a lot of the ones
18	that we're talking about, you know, in my testimony
19	and now, because again I think the key thing here is
20	that where NYCHA fails, it's not because of a
21	conscious or deliberate indifference, right?
22	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.
23	NEIL BAROFSKY: It's because of how do
24	you find a way to squeeze more juice out of the

lemon? And so a lot of our recommendations are about

increasing efficiency, working within existing 2 3 programs. So, again, something like streamlining resident communication. That's a whole set of 4 recommendations that we have. You're constantly 5 working them with dashboards. We don't do as much 6 7 formal recommendations as perhaps the prior monitor 8 did, because -- and it sort of goes back to your question about action plans. We don't want to get caught -- and this is not in any way a criticism of 10 11 the former monitor. They did a tremendous job. 12 we-- our approach is trying to be more collaborative. 13 So, we identify problems and then try to work 14 together to get to the solution. So that's usually 15 iterative. We really almost always prefer to build 16 on and improve an existing thing than creating a new 17 thing, just because it's more timely and more 18 efficient. And so we don't necessarily have -- okay, 19 here's these 10 recommendations that you need to do. 20 It's much more, again, to go back to an example--21 there's a problem with resident communication. 2.2 could all agree there's a problem with resident 2.3 communication. Let's brainstorm ways to make it better. So, we might say, hey, how about this, and 24 NYCHA's response would be like, well, that's a good 25

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS 47 idea, but we think if we use this path forward, that 2 3 might be more efficient. And it's just my experience 4 as a monitor when you can get to that level of trust that I think that we've achieved now. It's taking a little while. 6 7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right. 8 NEIL BAROFSKY: You get that type of 9 efficient back and forth, and that's really what we're trying to execute now. 10

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, I'm glad you put an emphasis on communication. As you heard through the pre-panel, that's number one, and that can go a long way to helping to ease the stress that a lot of NYCHA residents have to deal with when they have to deal with these issues.

NEIL BAROFSKY: It's heartbreaking. I mean, it's just-- listening to the first panel, it's just-- if your heart doesn't break when you hear-- CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Most

definitely.

NEIL BAROFSKY: the idea of two babies at home, it's just-- you know, it's just heartbreaking.

And we all-- that's why we're all here.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

reports to the court. It's on the docket. It's on

25 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: right.

Baez is leaks.

pandemic and after. We were developing certain -- we

2.2

2.3

cases are.

were seeing trends in certain developments. And we with NYCHA got together and I had meetings with each development's maintenance staff and their property management team to say, you have to understand what we are, who we are, what we're doing here in our oversight efforts, and also we are the boots on the ground with respect to calls to us. We saw an increase in responsive time in those developments. So, we do track it, and we know where the most mold

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: The most chronic, okay. The independent mold analysis semi-annual report from early this month noted that your team is focusing on identifying and tracing the source of plumbing leaks from above. Can you share more about that and how specifically you're working with NYCHA to address that issue?

CESAR DE CASTRO: Well, so, that goes to my point about root cause.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

CESAR DE CASTRO: You have to trace. You have to find the root cause of whatever mold or leak is happening. Now, the Independent Mold Analyst job is—they're out in the field. They're doing the

work. They're in the apartments. They are training
NYCHA workers. Sometimes they're doing also
oversight and quality assurance to make sure people
know to trace that leak, to trace a building line and
identify maybe if there's something larger going on
in a particular development. And so we do that,
because we are talking to residents in a very simple
way. If you think about it, if someone were to call
us today and say there is a leak from above,
obviously we know what the apartment above would be
and we try to be proactive and engage, at least have
NYCHA engage with that resident above. Certainly,
there's sometimes issues, communication issues which
I know you're going to probably ask questions about
communication. But which is a huge focus. It is
about communicating with the resident's neighbors,
right? We as if I'm a NYCHA resident, I should not
have to go and trace the line and knock on all the
doors of all of my neighbors to say, hey, what are
you doing? Why is water flowing down here? That is
not appropriate and residents shouldn't have to do
that. And so that's part of how, you know, every
single case and we act on a case by case basis

2 involves that. We end up trying to see what's going

3 on in the apartments around it.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Before I ask my next question, we've been joined via Zoom by Council

Member Chi Ossé. When it comes--

CESAR DE CASTRO: [interposing] I'm sorry. I'm sorry. If Ms. Acevedo can jump in.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yes, you may.

CESAR DE CASTRO: She had something she wanted to add.

ACEVEDO: I was just going to add to that. We also do-- we cluster. So that's where we use our data and technology to identify different apartment lines all throughout NYCHA where we see a higher rate of works being created and high rates of work orders being created with no work being done. So, we have the ability to use data to find situations where a resident might have had their work order inappropriately closed. And we do outbound outreach to those residents and just check in, and what we have found is that there are situations where the resident might have had their work order closed because they can't have the work done in their apartment, right? They have the symptom of a leak,

2.2

2.3

on.

meaning there's water coming down, but NYCHA can't fix a leak in their apartment. It's coming from floors above. So, their work order gets closed, but then they're left with water damage which can lead to mold and a series of other issues, and sometimes there's a hole in their wall because NYCHA was trying to trace it. And so that's an area where we've been very effective in helping residents because we're able to open up a case and ensure NYCHA's able to create additional work orders, and we're able to ensure that they work on the communication to improve

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] And let me-- since we're talking about orders. How many orders have you issued against NYCHA's since the November 2019, and how many of these orders has NYCHA fully complied with, and has NYCHA ever refused to comply with an order?

CESAR DE CASTRO: No refusals. So, the way we-- the way our ordering system works is-- the consent decree says I can order the following things, and as the ombudsperson I can issue these orders.

Now, we create the OCC out of the powers of the ombudsperson. So, the way that we approach it is

2 that-- and we discussed this with NYCHA is that in

55

3 | our system-- which as I said is completely

4 transparent to NYCHA. So, if I am looking at a

5 particular case today, NYCHA can see that we're

6 looking at that particular case. But we have

7 communication within those, for lack of a better

term, tickets or orders, work orders.

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

CESAR DE CASTRO: And so in their communications to NYCHA, NYCHA provide me with an update on this ticket in two days, five days or today, or what happened today. Now, we consider those orders. They have to be complied with. NYCHA has been totally fine with us not having to issue a formal order. Super cost-effective in the sense that, you know, as a lawyer acting as an oversight, I could approach this like a judge and say okay-- and I did this early on-- issued sort of decisions. are cases that we want you to do, these 200 case, 500, 100. We did that. It's cumbersome. It doesn't make much sense, and it doesn't help the resident. It does help the resident, but it's quicker to do it So, I can't give you a number, because it's within. so many, because we are in cases daily, and any time

So, let's say tomorrow I were to find that

25

court.

2 | they are ignoring so and so's apartment and I issue a

3 | fine, they could then appeal to the Special Master

4 and to the district court judge and say that was

5 unfair or whatever their point. We've never had to

6 go there. We've never even been close.

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. and what is the average time NYCHA takes to comply with your order, and what percentage of the time does NYCHA meet deadlines set in your orders?

CESAR DE CASTRO: Average time, I don't think we have an actual metric on that, unless you tell me--

ACEVEDO: So, we handle it from an incremental approach. So, at the time in which we complete intake with the resident, NYCHA has one business day to respond and react to that, and we have a report that tracks their compliance with that, and they've always been in compliance with it.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What--

KIERSTEN ACEVEDO: [interposing] From there it goes on to they have seven days to ensure that we get plan in place, a certain number of days to ensure that any inspections are in place, and then scheduling and so on.

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. And--

2.2

2.3

CESAR DE CASTRO: [interposing] There have also have been certainly times where we have issued a directive or an order, especially early on when we said we want this apartment finished in two weeks, and they have come back and said-- I mean, and again, it's collaborative. We're going to do it. We don't think two weeks is-- this is the reason.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

CESAR DE CASTRO: So, then that moves.

Sometimes they can do it faster, but other times—
and then it's okay, you need to move this person.

Can you find a way to move this resident and their family, and they're often very, very responsive. So, I don't think they've ever not responded to our order.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How many times have you ordered like-- well, an emergency transfer due to mold conditions and what type of outreach is done so that these tenants are aware and that the ombudsperson exists.

CESAR DE CASTRO: Well, usually, if we're ordering it, the tenant knows, because they're in communication with us.

2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: With you, okay.

CESAR DE CASTRO: So, yeah. Looks, it's no-- it's no mystery that NYCHA's had a trust issue with its tenants. I mean, it's working super hard to rebuild that trust. And so when tenants trust us to provide the information that we are getting from NYCHA, they know what's happening. In terms of, you know, moving people is not unusual. My power is to recommend that someone be prioritized for a move. can't say move them. However, they often do move people. We work-- and look, most of our cases are complex cases where there's a lot happening. of things -- sometimes you have -- as you heard from a panel, not only lead. So, sometimes they need to come in-- and asbestos as well. There's remediation of asbestos that has to happen. We have to move someone out, and then there's going to be mold. so, you know, in terms of our numbers, helping move-do we have a number?

KIERSTEN ACEVEDO: We have some information in our report regarding relocation, some of which is not there.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

23

24

25

2	KIERSTEN ACEVEDO: The one thing to note
3	that I think is one of our most important levers is
4	that NYCHA sometimes we will seek feedback from the
5	Compliance Department or the Environmental Health and
6	Safety Department as to whether a resident needs to
7	be moved, or whether it's the resident's preference
8	because of any health-related issues that they are
9	faced with. And sometimes, when either of those
LO	answers are yes, NYCHA is able to relocate a resident
11	very quickly, within 24 hours in a hotel
12	accommodation. Typically, a hotel accommodation will
13	allow for up to two weeks. That isn't always ideal
L4	for some residents, and others it is, depending on
L5	the size of the family and whether they have pets.
L6	But we have found that that is often a way in which
L7	we aware able to have a resident relocated so that
L8	the necessary emergency-related work can be
L9	performed, and then they can be brought back into
20	their apartment for the remaining repairs.
21	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Does NYCHA
22	consistently provide residents with written

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

CESAR DE CASTRO: They're required to.

statements, including your contact information?

slightly different process, but largely the same as

question for NYCHA.

1	COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS 63
2	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright. Well, you
3	do have data showing
4	CESAR DE CASTRO: [interposing] All in
5	our reports.
6	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: All in our reports.
7	CESAR DE CASTRO: And are there specific
8	developments that are more chronic, problematic? Are
9	you
10	CESAR DE CASTRO: [interposing] Same
11	answer. We can pull it. It's not hard. We can look
12	at our data in real time anytime.
13	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yeah, we will love to
14	if you can provide the specific developments in
15	RAD/PACT where you're getting chronic calls.
16	CESAR DE CASTRO: Sure.
17	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Do you find that the
18	repairs being made at the PACT developments are
19	solving the mold condition, or is it a reoccurring
20	condition?
21	CESAR DE CASTRO: Sorry, just making a
22	note.
23	KIERSTEN ACEVEDO: For the most I'm
24	sorry, can you repeat the question?

private developers, it's a smaller universe.

3 and faster, because they're dealing with a much

smaller universe of residents. But each development 4

is different. 5

1

2

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, and I quess we'll get a clear picture based on the amount of calls that are coming in and what particular development.

CESAR DE CASTRO: Yeah, with time certainly, and you know, -- and again, that's why we say people need to know about us, right? If we get calls and people know about us, and we can help residents, and we can have-- and we can have difficulties helping residents, complex cases, that's all great, because guess what we get? Data.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right. Well, is it NYCHA's responsibility to notify the developer, you know, to-- or to make sure that-- holding the developer accountable to make sure that they are making the tenant aware or the tenants aware that the OCC exists?

CESAR DE CASTRO: Yes, I think-- I mean, I think that's a better question for NYCHA, but yes, and it's part of their requirements as a developer.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Okay.

in groups to try to say will— can I come to talk to your groups? It was— I didn't get a lot of responses. A lot of— and those that I did, I went to all the different, you know, NYCHA tenant association meetings that anybody wanted me to go to, I would go. A lot of people just either were non-responsive or maybe was old contact information. So, that's another thing that we intend to try to redo

this year. We only did it a year ago.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Before I allow my colleague, Council Member Bottcher, to ask his questions, this is to the Monitor. Do the ombudsperson and the Federal Monitor work together to help NYCHA to address mold conditions, and if so, what does that collaboration and division of responsibility looks like specifically when it comes to RAD/PACT developments?

NEIL BAROFSKY: RAD/PACT it doesn't really exist for us when it comes to mold, because once-- once a development goes into RAD/PACT, under the terms of the HUD agreement our oversight ends.

Generally speaking, almost everything that we've

2 spoken about today, we try to do in collaboration 3 with them.

1

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

NEIL BAROFKSY: So, just as an example, and I keep coming back to this, but when we did our push for Restore and Renew, this is something that we, you know, we involve them in, you know, because again, they have such an expertise on -- as boots on the ground with the residents, and just -- and data, and there's such an important and necessary partner And so when we see issues in the mold phase, it's just a routine thing for us to consult with They're a gut check to make sure that we're They've been doing this longer than we have, and so it is-- it is formal and informal. have, you know, individual residents who reach out to us, you know, we steer them towards the OCC, and so I just think it's -- it's sort of a constant ongoing collaboration. And if we're going to be pushing for something in the mold and leak space, we're going to check it, right, because it would be crazy for us not to, but also because they're-- you know, again the level of expertise-- the level of resident perspective is so invaluable to our work. You know,

2.2

our work with residents is more intentional but outside the daily course. You know, we do site visits. We'll do townhalls. We have them coming up in Sotomayor, but their level of resident interaction really surpasses ours, and so it just— it's a really valuable and important perspective for what we do, invaluable really.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Now, I would allow my colleague, Council Member Bottcher to ask his questions.

Thank you, Chair. You had testified earlier about the-- historically, a lack of a can do attitude at NYCHA. When we talk about the substandard conditions that NYCHA tenants live in across the city, how much of that is due to the funding shortfalls that they've been experiencing and how much of it is due to this lack of a can do attitude that you said that NYCHA has had historically?

NEIL BAROFSKY: So, the can do
historically really predated our involvement in
February of 24. It's something that I had heard of.
Maybe we see it in pockets, certainly in areas, but
from the senior management perspective, I don't think

necessary so that when you're doing the work, they do

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

it correctly. They don't hve to come back two or thre There's the accountability. Not every NYCHA worker is an ideal worker either because they're not adequately trained and don't do the work, or because they're a bad apple and they're not particularly good at their jobs. And so a lot of the work, the efficiency work, what we call efficiency is about bringing accountability so there's better ways to measure who the workers are that are not pulling their weight, and then seeing, okay, is this a training issue where we can get this person trained and they can be more efficient, or is this someone who needs to move on to another job. These are all the types of things that can be done within the existing budgetary framework that can have significant and material improvement, but at the end of the day, if you don't fix the pipes, you're not going to be able to stop the leaks, and if you can't stop the leaks, you're not going to stop the mold. And it's just a-- you know, it is just a really big challenge and it has to happen. And so we used-you've heard us use the word bridge a couple of times, because ultimately that's a lot of what we do is that bridge towards the eventual capital

replacements that just have to happen sooner or later. You know, if there's ever going -- if these problems are every going to be fully and adequately So, it's a little bit of both, but I want addressed. to be clear, we do not encourage can't do on a daily basis at all, in fact, the exact opposite. And it's hard. I mean, like I-- it is really-- you know, I've spent most of career in or around government, and I can't think of another agency that has to deal with something as difficult as the underfunding that NYCHA has to deal with, and having to go to work every day knowing that there are solutions but not being able to execute them because the money is not there, particularly when it comes to something as fundamental as hundreds of thousands of New York City residents having safe, sanitary, you know, dignified way of life and being able to constantly beat back that pessimism that has to come when you know you just don't have the funding to do what you do. really do commend the NYCHA people that we deal with on a daily basis. Are they perfect? No. room for improvement? Absolutely. But fundamentally it is in most instances working together towards a

1

2

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS 74
2 path of— and sometimes really trying to achieve what

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

seems unachievable.

COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Council Member Bottcher. Right on time. This is to the Monitor. You mentioned NYCHA's remediation of standing water hazard been measured. Can you say more about that?

NEIL BAROFSKY: One of the requirements in the HUD agreement is that any standing water must be removed within 48 hours. That has never been measured, and the reason why it hasn't been measured is there has to be-- it's sort of an IT solution, the collection of data. And so one of the first things we did when we came in was taking a look at the agreement and looking at where NYCHA was on all the requirements, and we found there was a number of requirements that had never been addressed for whatever reason, and this was one of them. And so-and one of the real priorities for us as monitors is that we wanted to fix that. We wanted to make sure that every single thing in that agreement is being measured and reported on, because frankly, the reality is -- and again this is not a criticism, it's

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

just a realty-- when things are not measured, when there's no publication about them in the reporting, there's less of a tendency to direct resources to solve the problem. And you know, and this is a number of different areas. This included the lack of measurement of metrics with respect to individual heating failures in apartments. So, NYCHA had been measuring what happens when a boiler goes out and 30 apartments go out, but hadn't been measuring what happens when a radi -- as we heard earlier in our first panel-- when a radiator breaks. And so that's something that we're now doing. Pest populations and by development was something that was not being measured that is now being measured. This is kind of the last one. And so what has to happen is with the leak SP, which we've been talking about a bunch, and with the IT rollout of that, now we're going to know exactly how long from when a complaint is made about standing water to when its remedied, and we'll have that data and then we'll be able to measure NYCHA's performance. We know that they're doing -- they're meeting their metrics on addressing certain leaks, and so that's good news. And now we're going to see once this is launched-- and again, it's a slow

CESAR DE CASTRO: Just have to put in the person power to learn about that issue. For example, just in when we created the system and how calls are

Right.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS:

2.2

2.3

24

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: right.

heard we don't have the money to do this.

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CESAR DE CASTRO: But let's try to work on a solution. Now, that attitude has to translate down to the individual developments and to the workers, and that's a challenge.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Well, obviously, one of the recommendations from the pre-

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS 78 panel was to have an expansion, because they see the 2 3 necessity. They see the need. 4 CESAR DE CASTRO: I mean, if the question was could we expand, --5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Right. 6 7 CESAR DE CASTRO: you know, it would be pretty easy to do it. Yes, we could easily expand if 8 it was hey, you're now going to handle heat, for example. Yeah, we would have to do some work to sort 10 of learn. 11 12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And heating has been 13 a problematic area at NYCHA. Even this morning when 14 I was driving in I was dealing with heating issues 15 and some RAD/PACT developments, particularly. 16 many virtual inspections has the OCC conducted and 17 that has been-- and has that been a useful tool? CESAR DE CASTRO: I'll let Ms. Acevedo 18 19 answer that one, but what I do want to say before she 20 does is that when we were asked to sort of pitch whether we'd be interested in becoming the 21 ombudsperson, and we as a team made our presentation, 2.2 2.3 part of our presentation. Part of our presentation

was, look, we have to do things more efficiently.

they don't need-- we don't need a team of 100 people

24

because we all know that's what cause this large

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

backlog in part that NYCHA is faced with, and so we've done over 500 at this point. I don't have the specific number in front of me. But we found them to be tremendously successful and helpful. We use them for a variety of different reasons, some of which residents don't always communicate the whole picture to us. One example that is a resident will tell us that they have a recurring issue in their bathroom, but what they won't say is that that issue is affecting a wall, and on the adjacent side of the wall, maybe the hallway or the kitchen from the bathroom is also impacted. And so sometimes the specific work order task, the repair task, won't always be created to account for those additional rooms that are impacted. So, that's a way that we're able to ensure that the resident's apartment is restored. And another way is for prioritization or possible relocations. If we're able to a virtual inspection and we run through that resident's entire apartment, in minutes we're able to send a link, and that can go to the maintenance worker or the superintendent, and in many times has gone, you know, to the executives in Omar [sp?] or Dangary [sp?].

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, excellent. Thank you. I probably should have known that. Did not

email. It's on our website. They can call directly

2.2

2.3

24

25

to us.

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

know that. Well, I represent the northwest Bronx, but selfishly, you know, I also have a lot of family that lives in NYCHA. And so my question today is relating to a lot of the constituent complaints that I hear, but also from family members who live in public housing, I hear a lot from them about this issue of scheduling appointments, you know, getting their units inspected and having, you know, professionals or tradespeople come in and do the actual work. They don't schedule. They said that they're going to show up this day and they're going to break my-- that's how they interpret it. They're going to break my locks whether I'm there or not. This isn't fair. I was working. I was at childcare. There's all the many reasons. And so my question for you with respect to mold, but also with respect to lead remediation and the other issues that you have oversight on, how's satisfactory do you find NYCHA's process for responding to work requests from tenants and sending these trades? Do you see their process for engaging with residents and scheduling that work as sufficient to meet the requirements of the monitorship on the one hand? And second, as

2 respectful to the tenants in terms of how they work

3 out.

1

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

NEIL BAROFSKY: So, this is an enormously significant issue, and we have -- you know, a part of our team and our organizational change team, a work stream that is exclusively dedicated to resident communication around these issues, because for so many reasons. There's the obvious reason of just how frustrating and debilitating it is when some-- you know, when you finally get to your appointment day and somebody doesn't show. But there's also extraordinary efficiency harm on both sides, right? If a NYCHA worker doesn't show, that's again, incredibly disruptive for a resident who has taken a day off from work, given up a day of pay to sit in an apartment and not have their problem fixed. But it's also a huge problem for NYCHA when they show up to an apartment and the resident isn't home because the communication had broken down to a point where the resident doesn't know to be home, right? Didn't get a reminder. Didn't get notice. It's just-- it's such an obvious area of loss of resources. has been a real focus of work, and we are seeing improvement since we've worked with NYCHA to have a

be repainting your mold situation. We're going to be

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

doing a lead inspection, whatever it is, with the work order number. And so now, the resident A, has a better idea of what's coming; B, it gives them an opportunity and information we've provided in the communication. If you can't make it, here's what you I got buzzed. You know, here's how you respond. Here is now-- and even there, before the-- if it was a skilled trade, a resident would get maybe two different numbers to call, or different areas. Now, it's a single point of contact for them to call. And when they call that number -- we talked about this a little bit before. If you're on hold and it's a 45minute wait which was before where residents would just give up. Now, at least there's a callback option, and I will say also, the amount of time that you're on hold has shrunk significantly. So, this is an area of concern. It's -- we're all well aware of We're all working towards fixing it. We're not there yet, but this is also an area where we don't have, you know, a monopoly on good ideas, and there's been a lot of experimentation and trying to get there, but it is an area of enormous focus for our team and I know for NYCHA as well.

CESAR DE CASTRO: Because we take a-- you know, it's the same perspective, right? Is that okay?

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: That's okay. Go ahead.

2.2

2.3

the calls so, you know, we're the-- we're the ombudsperson call center. So, the reason people are calling us is that-- are those reasons. So, we're getting the calls already where they missed an appointment or we've been waiting two weeks or a month or whatever that is. And so our job is to communicate with NYCHA and to make sure and ensure that doesn't happen again. So we don't really have that as much of a problem when people call us. So, I think if you-- if people have an issue with how we're handling cases, it's usually because they're unhappy with the work that was done, or sometimes the scheduling is way out, and that's a big problem, and

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

we're trying to assist them by getting NYCHA to do the work a little bit earlier. So, you know, an example of sort of collaboration and communication -so, since we were appointed in 2019, so it's been a number of years, and we've been pushing communication, communication, can't be missing appointments. People stay home from work. They're losing money, literally losing money that they're going to use to pay rent. So, pushing that, and so the reason this has to be collaborative -- we're sitting at the Jefferson Houses and we're talking about rolling out our OCC, and that's where we were going to start. It's going to be a sort of roll out incrementally. And we were talking about all these issues of communicating with the resident. You can't just show up and say hey, I have to be in here. hey, nobody called you yesterday? Like these kinds of issues. That birthed what we call-- had different names -- these resident communication associates which we deal with a lot, or ambassadors. So, this is a new position that NYCHA created so that their only job is to communicate with the residents regarding-you know, they can talk to you more about it regarding repairs and other things. For us, it was

3 there, and we have someone else to communicate. 4 what that then means is an RCA is going to call you.

coming, and NYCHA knows we're doing that as well, and

We're going to call you to remind you that they're

7 we're making sure that something's going to happen.

We've also talked to over 30,000 residents. We've had 8

100,000 calls. All these kinds of recommendations

come because of experience. So, we're having the 10

11 experience and it helps inform our strategies and it

12 helps NYCHA inform their strategies and how they

communicate better, because they have embraced at 13

14 least with us that that is a problem and they're

15 trying to fix it.

5

6

16

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Are there also

17 texts sent out?

leave me a voicemail.

CESAR DE CASTRO: There are texts. mean, there's-- it depends. You know, how does the resident want-- from our perspective it's how do we communicate with the resident? What do they want? So, you know, I like people sending me texts. don't want people leaving me voicemails, for example. I would tell that to the OCC and people would not

federal government, and we'll sit there and we'll

again, it's very collaborative process.

2.2

2.3

discuss— you know, ultimately, you know, it's their decision. We don't control their budget, but what we'll do is we'll say hey, maybe we can reallocate some of these resources over here as opposed to over there. NYCHA does, you know— it can find resources. You know, a lot of the times it— they apply— you know, NYCHA's applying for a lot of grants and a lot of funding, and so, you know, we try to suggest push, prod, beg, plead for certain areas. You know, here's some resources that are coming in that maybe weren't expected. You know, could we please think about funding a program to deal with this issue. So,

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, thank you for your testimony, guys, today, and my final comment overall of the testimony, I would-- glad to see an expansion definitely be taken into consideration seriously. Knowing the-- some of the problematic issues that continue to occur at NYCHA, especially around heating. So, look forward to further conversations and dialogue on possibly having that happen. Thank you. Thank you for your testimony today, guys. Now we will hear testimony from NYCHA, and I will turn it over to our Committee Counsel to

Authority's efforts to prevent and remediate mold

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

91

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

across our portfolio. We recognize that mold is an issue of very great concern to our residents, and it's top priority for the Authority. It's top priority for me. The majority of NYCHA's buildings are more than half a century old, and they have been underfunded by the federal government for decades. The Authority's approximately 149,000 apartments collectively suffer from an \$80 billion in major capital needs, and the reality is that this lack of investment has led to many of the chronic leak and moisture issues which are the root causes of mold. Recognizing the capital needs deficit, in 2019 we rolled out a state-of-the-art program to address mold, in partnership with the court-appointed, independent entities and the Federal Monitor. has enabled us to establish strong procedures and operational responses to mold. We prioritize a rapid response to mold and do our best to complete moldrelated repairs efficiently, to benefit residents and to improve their quality of life. In fact, there's been an entire systemic shift within our organization to ensure that mold is prioritized and addressed. And our partners both within and beyond the organization, the Ombudsperson Call Center, NYCHA's Compliance

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Department, and Federal Monitor are helping us make sure that the resident experience matches the larger organizational transformation that is taking place. Our success in tackling mold is measured by fewer occurrences, fewer reoccurrences, and reduced response times. NYCHA is seeing about a 20 percent less new mold complaints since 2022, and the reoccurrence rate dropped from 30 percent to 10 percent from 2019 to today. And we're now responding, on average, within two days to mold complaints. These are very encouraging signs of progress, and evidence that we're on the right path, although we acknowledge that there's still so much work to do, and this will continue to be challenging without significant capital investment. Leading the work to address mold is our Office of Mold Assessment and Remediation. Or I'll refer to them as OMAR, which spearheads comprehensive infrastructure and repair projects and updates operational procedures. OMAR works closely with our external partners who are helping us make progress in this vital area, including the Federal Monitor, the mold and data analysts who are independent, and the mold ombudsperson. I would like to walk you through a few of the specific initiatives

21

2.2

quality assurance inspections. As part of the

mold in apartments. It involves enhanced tools and

accountability via photo documentation and follow-up

strategies as well as staff training and greater

25 holistic Mold Busters regimen, staff work though a

approximately 30 percent of older tickets are

similarly no longer needed, and we are working with

24

1 2 the OCC to close them out. Our Mold and Leaks 3 Scorecard is a key tool for fighting mold. It's a 4 visual and assessment tool that we developed with the 5 OCC that rates the performance of every NYCHA development on a refresh basis and helps us direct 6 our resources effectively. Additionally, we have 8 improved the way we work by updating standard procedures related to how we inspect roof fans and how we address mold, leaks, and moistures. I'm going 10 11 to talk about capital investments. We are already 12 executing an extensive capital portfolio that 13 leverages funding from the City, State, and federal 14 government, but we are always seeking opportunities 15 to expand this work. For instance, with our Building 16 Line Initiative, we are replacing entire plumbing 17 systems in select building lines that are failing and 18 leading to pervasive leaks. The program is not only 19 reducing mold but also upgrading residents' kitchens 20 and bathrooms. And our Comprehensive Modernization, 21 PACT, and Trust housing preservation programs include 2.2 new plumbing systems in their scope of work. We are 2.3 also addressing roofs and facades at some locations

These major investments, which benefit from City

through these and other capital funding sources.

24

partners have resolved work orders in an average of

six days. Now I'll speak to NYCHA's larger

24

25

2 transformation efforts. A s part of NYCHAs 3 transformation efforts, the Authority is improving 4 the ways we work to become a better landlord for 5 residents. For example, we are scheduling and completing repairs, including mold-related work, more 6 7 efficiently through our Work Order Reform initiative. We expanded the types of automatic notifications and 8 reminders residents receive about upcoming skilled trades repairs, and we made it easier for residents 10 11 to reschedule them, and this has meant fewer missed 12 appointments for mold-related work, and thus faster 13 completion of the work. We are along with that, we 14 ware fostering enhanced communication. We also 15 partner with residents in other ways to combat mold, and that includes providing education that includes 16 17 providing educational materials on how to prevent and 18 report mold. Resident have several channels for 19 reporting mold, including not just customer contact 20 center in the My NYCHA App and website. Additionally, 21 the independent court appointed Ombudsperson Call Center can assist residents with problematic mold and 2.2 2.3 leak repairs. To date, OCC has served nearly 32,000 residents. The result of our partnership and our 24

multi-prong approach to address mold are tangible for

NYCHA's stakeholders including the City Council, the

Baez court appointed entities, the ombudsperson,

24

dampers have been replaced, and that's still ongoing.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

The goal is 95,000. Well, that's not the goal, that's what our obligation is. That's really going to improve ventilation and ventilation reduces mold. That was one of the major findings of the independent mold analyst in the early days of Baez. So, you see the next slide here shows the-- slide three. After completing roof fan installation, you can see the conditions, and I've seen worse than that of those They get clogged. The air cannot flow out of the bathroom. The moisture remains in the bathroom, and that causes a mold condition. So, what we do is we clean the vents, and now we're replacing the vents with better more modern technology so there's better flow of air through those vents into those bathrooms. Note, because those bathrooms don't have windows. those bathrooms really need those vents to air out. The next is Operation Mold Clean-up. You did see some staff-- so, Operation Mold Clean-up we really want to make sure that mold is remediated quickly. That's my number one focus right now is getting to that five days, and Operation Mold Clean-up addresses the backlog of mold removal and molders [sic] and paint work orders. So, for mold removal, we've addressed 98 percent of them. We've closed 17,805

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

out of 18,116. We track this every single day, and we're pushing hard to get it down as low as we can. 94,000-- 94 percent, excuse me, of mold-resistant paint work orders have also been closed, and that's critical for addressing recurrence. That actually acts as a sealant and helps prevent mold from regrowing. Operation Dry Out is an initiative that addresses backlog plumbing and tub enclosure work orders that are more then 200 days old. 89 percent of these older work orders have been addressed for the plumbing work orders, and another 79 percent of the tub enclosure work orders-- we heard one of the residents earlier who told the story about a tub enclosure. I don't want residents going to take a shower in areas protected by plastic. We should get those tub enclosures done as quickly as possible. The next slide, slide six, is our enhanced oversight We created this program to work with program. developments that are struggling with the mold requirements. We bring a specialized team, including OCC and IMA, the Independent Mold Analyst, to the properties to improve their performance. We work with them over an intense 30 to 60-day period, and that enables us to get them caught up on their

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

inspections, assist them with mold cleaning, retrain their staff, and do some outreach to residents as well, and that program is ongoing. The next is the Building Line Initiative. Building Line Initiative is a pilot, but it's growing. This is slide seven. We have completed one. We're almost complete with our second-largest one at Thompkins [sp?], and then we're going to be doing more and more in 2026, Red Hook East, another in Red Hook East, Carlton Manner, and then new BLI projects to be determined in early Slide eight-- we're almost done here-- is our Building Line initiative which is just -- we just talked about it, but this is just going to show some of the metrics on that for the one that we completed. And then finally, maintenance care. So, maintenance care, I think-- I save it at the end there. So, now, NYCHA has to do-- we have to inspect our apartments, 100 percent of our apartments every single year. we have to get into every single NYCHA apartment every single year now, and what we're noticing is we don't was escalations only coming from outside entities. We want our maintenance workers to be escalating these things before they even reach places like the OCC so that we are taking this upon

\sim	
_	

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

questions.

17

18 19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

ourselves. So, these are some of our worst apartments. These are also some of the most voiceless residents, those who are struggling to connect with NYCHA. We escalate them internally through our maintenance workers, and we then aggressively address them as a priority with our planners. So, we've-- since we started this in March, we've had 597 cases that are in progress. We've already resolved 387 cases, and these are internal NYCHA escalations. This is the kind of cultural change that NYCHA needs to bring that can do attitude out to the developments so that everybody is escalating working together to address those repairs

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Before I start my round of questions, I'm going to allow my Council Member, my good Council Member, my good friend Council Member Sanchez to ask her questions.

that are most in need. And now, happy to have any

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you so much, Chair Banks. I actually just wantd to follow up on the question that -- hi, Dan, good to see you.

DANIEL GREENE: Hey, it's good to see you again, yeah.

2.2

2.3

COUNCIL MEMBER SACNHEZ: I'm not sure if you were in the room a few minutes ago when I asked the federal monitorship and the-- I cannot say that word-- the O word that is very long, about the ways that you coordinate with residents to contact. So my specific question was whether you send text message notifications or whether you communicate with residents via text message as well as email and phone.

DANIEL GREENE: So, text messaging is something that we're doing for our pest program right now. We're looking at for rolling it out for other aspects of operations, particularly skilled trades. This year, the past year, we focused a lot on our phone systems and upgrading our phone systems for our planners so that we can better monitor them and they can have call cues and other sort of advancements. We think that text is the next, you know, iteration, but wanted to first upgrade the phone systems to see what impact that has in terms of our skilled trade repairs, and then from there hopefully, you know, we can move to text more broadly. We have a large-- you

2 know, we get across the board for our maintenance

3 | workers. We get 100,000 maintenance work orders a

4 month. We get 35,000 skilled trade work orders a

5 month, so the volume is enormous. However, we do

6 think that that's a good way to communicate. We also

7 have improved email communication which a lot of our

8 residents use email, and they maintain the same

9 email, and that's been very effective for

10 communicating with residents.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. And specifically, how do you confirm appointments with residents?

DANIEL GREENE: So, confirmation is typically done via phone, via phone with residents through our planners. You know, we have a pretty good rapport. Right now, the Monitor mentioned the new dashboard that we built out, so missed appointments has been a major focus for us in the past year. So, we confirm appointments with residents via phone. In the month of September, we missed less than 600 appointments for the first time for our skilled trades, and those are our much-in-need skilled trade plumbers, plasterers, painters, and some trades missed zero apartments in their

you've mentioned planners, but there's-- it's the
Resident Communication Associates, these RCAs who are
the specific folks that are communicating with
residents to confirm appointments, and--

2.3

24

3

1

4

5

6

/

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

24

25

ELENA TENCHIKOVA: [interposing] Sure, I could speak to that. Good afternoon, Council Member. Thank you for asking that question. So, there's kind of like larger communication that happens that NYCHA does in response to mold and leak coordination, and then there's kind of like a very different model that is used when it comes down to our mold response unit team, just because it's a case management system. So, our mold response unit deals with escalated issues, and once they establish contact with the resident, they figure out what is the best means of contacting them, who is the best person to contact, and then we'll work with them through those means. So, we'll use email, phone. We'll use text messaging. So, a variety of platforms and it's lot more of a more frequent touch with our communication until we resolve the issue.

council Member Sanchez: Okay. I-- I'll share with you. I am very annoyed by my baby's dentist, because they call and text and text and call, but you know, it's very effective and it gets us, you know, to the appointment. But very specifically that they, you know, say is you are confirming your appointment, please reply C. you

2 know, that simple kind of change on some of your

3 communications -- you know, I just ask for you to

4 consider that. It won't fix all of the issues, but

5 as you continue to improve your communications with

6 the residents.

1

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

Innovation Team kind of has been looking at this holistically on how to improve communications as part of like the transformation and establishing the neighborhood model, creating the neighborhood planners, making sure that we're set up with automated mailers that go out for reminders, and robocalls.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you so much, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Okay, we're going to begin with work orders and remediation. According to the HUD agreement, NYCHA must remediate mold within five business days or fix mold and root causes within seven days for simple repairs or 15 days for complex repairs, is that correct?

ELENA TENCHIKOVA: Correct.

1

3

4

J

6

7

8

10

11

1213

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What percentage of mold complaints does NYCHA currently remediate within these required timeframes, and does NYCHA have any documented plan with a specific date on when they think they can achieve a 95 percent compliance?

ELENA TENCHIKOVA: Sure. I'll respond to that. I'll start with the seven-day which is to respond to simple repairs. These are repairs that are usually able to be completed within one visit, and we are now at 54 percent. Based on last Monitor's report, most recent were-- through our dashboard receiving as high as 73, so hopefully next quarterly report will show continued progress. And just to give a baseline we're starting at 22 in comparison. I do want to kind of frame this from-this is a hit or miss metric. So one of the ways that I would encourage to look at it is not only progress on how often are we hitting this metric, but how are we doing overall over time, so, average days to complete. And when we're comparing this back to 2020, we were at 170 days, and now we're at 16. So, a lot of progress has happened over time to really prioritize this, and this goes to using data. is using visibility, and really concentrating and

1	COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS 111
2	prioritizing mold in NYCHA. The next one that I'll
3	talk about is the five-day removal. This has
4	improved as the Federal Monitor noted from seven to
5	now 24, and in comparison of like average days that
6	we're seeing progress, we were at like 130 in 2020,
7	and now we're now averaging around 25 days. For 15-
8	day complex which is by far our most difficult metric
9	to hit, because we need to go through the inspection
10	full repair and restoration and pass the QA, we're at
11	now 11 percent going from two. Average days to go
12	through this workflow is 388 was 388 and now down
13	to 252. So, progress is being made, but certainly we
14	have a long way to go which I'm sure we'll talk
15	about.
16	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, let me ask this
17	question again. Does NYCHA have a documented plan
18	with a specific date on when they think they can
19	achieve 95 percent?
20	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: We do not have a
21	specific date where we're going to be able to achieve
22	it.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You said yes or no?

ELENA TENCHIKOVA: No.

23

1

3

4

6

7 8

10 11

12

14

13

15 16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How can residents have confidence that compliance will ever be achieved then?

I will defer this to ELENA TENCHIKOVA: our EVP of Property Management Dan Greene.

DANIEL GREENE: So, we're pushing as hard

as we can with the resources that we have, but as noted in the Monitor's testimony and the Ombudsperson testimony, and as stated by our former Chair, we're not going to repair our way out of this problem. need capital investment in our buildings in order to hit those types of numbers in more of our buildings. We will push and we will improve those numbers even further. We're going to push the inspections so that they're done within -- as quickly as we can, and then we'll get the -- we're going to get the mold cleaning and mold remediation done as quickly as we can. complex plumbing repairs, though, they take time, and the stocks that we're dealing with at places like Queensbridge are nearly 100 years old. So, until-and that's just one example. You can find at Baruch. You mentioned some of our worst impacted sites, Baruch, Jefferson, Red Hook, all of-- the

Queensbridge. All of those need full pipe

repair work.

2.3

1	COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS 114
2	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: [interposing] And I'm
3	happy to break down those if you'd like.
4	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And how many
5	DANIEL GREENE: [interposing] Just want to
6	add one
7	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] How many
8	have been pending more than 15 days?
9	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: Sure. 22,255 more than
10	15 days.
11	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And how many been
12	pending more than 30 days?
13	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: 20,680.
14	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And how many been
15	pending more than 90 days?
16	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: 17,058.
17	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You said 17,000?
18	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: 58.
19	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, what percentage
20	of the units have a second mold complaint been withir
21	the last 12 months?
22	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: I'm happy that you
23	asked that question. That is one of the metrics that
24	we're actually doing well in. The HUD agreement
25	roguines to not have more than 15 percent or we

that this is a really good metric for gatekeeping some of those that fall through the cracks, and from like our investigations, I'm seeing that certainly there is an aging component, but also it's-- was it properly addressed in the initial inspection? And we're able through this tool actually be able to catch those which we're happy about.

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Well, you spoke earlier about NYCHA's roof fan replacement program.

2 ELENA TENCHIKOVA: Yes.

2.2

2.3

earlier from a tenant who's experiencing reoccurring mold in her bathroom, because of the roof fan on her line. Is it— is it working, and NYCHA hasn't fixed it yet? What is the average timeframe for replacing broken roof frames— fans, sorry. And are units with active mold cases prioritized?

ELENA TENCHIKOVA: Sure, I'm happy to talk about that. So, a little-- if I could take a step back to talk a little bit about the ventilation program so it makes--

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Okay, yes.

together. Our ventilation program consists of three phases. The first initial phase was replacing the roof fans. So we did a major push to send out engineers, do asbestos testing, and if it needed to be upgraded to be a direct modern fan, we've updated that, and that resulted in 1,056 buildings across our portfolio. The second part was to like kind of going hand-in-hand to offer as much relief as we can, and also I'd like to add we were doing this all during

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

We actually performed vent cleaning. where we HEPA vacuumed the interior of the lateral duct, and that's where we saw the pictures of like really being able to declutter the dust debris that has accumulated there, and now we're currently in the damper component. As part of the damper program, this is a longer term. Rollout is about three years, and we're cleaning the vents during that time, and we are checking the roof fans again to see if they're working or not and working with the property to update it. Separate and apart, part of our mold inspection will check for CFR [sic] measurements to make sure that the vent is operating. If it's not, then it'll create a child [sic] work order for to check the roof fan and to clean the vent. In this case, we-- as this was being brought up, we checked on our site, and there were two open tickets for the roof fan being out of order. How does that happen after major improvements? Because every so often it used to be maintained. There could be an electrical These roof fans, although we shouldn't be seeing it yet, some of the ones that we may have retained, meaning we verified it, that they weren't just, you know, put in two years ago, may be starting

1	COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS 118
2	to act up or their motor being out of or not
3	working. And that would happen because we're running
4	our motors 24/7 which means, you know, the use of
5	life will be a little bit faster. But with this
6	there, there is a proactive measure of whenever we're
7	responding to proactively check if the vent is
8	operating, and we do prioritize the replacement of
9	those.
10	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And so then how many
11	of NYCHA's public housing apartments are currently
12	with an active mold complaint?
13	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: 23,1 I'm sorry,
14	pardon. My apologies. How many units, right? 11,723
15	units or 8.9
16	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Can you
17	repeat that number?
18	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: percent of NYCHA's
19	overall universe.
20	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, and how many
21	children under 18 live in units with verified mold
22	complaints?
23	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: This one, one second.

DANIEL GREENE: It's about 7,400.

3 leak work orders does NYCHA currently have?

1

2

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

ELENA TENCHIKOVA: 43,387 of which 8,372 or 19 percent are parent, and 35 percent-- 35,015 that are child, or 81 percent.

119

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. And what is the average time to abate a leak after it's been reported?

ELENA TENCHIKOVA: So, we have requirements that to abate a leak within 24 hours, and as the Federal Monitor noted, there's been challenges with the way that we do our reporting. However, through our best efforts of trying to use a proxy measure, we've seen--

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] What's the challenge?

ELENA TENCHIKOVA: It's the way that we record the work orders. We don't actually ask the question of did you abate the flood condition, which now we'll be able to do as part of the leak standard procedures. So, what we currently use is a proxy measure, meaning that if we're responding to it, that we are addressing it. And right now we've seen an improvement from 54 hours to 33 hours.

repair associated with the mold consists of 23,164.

The way that I like to move of it is evaluating into

24

_ .

buckets of mold removal, which is one of our top
priority is to remove the hazard. That currently
consists of about 34 percent or 4,654. We have 3,480
or 15 percent in encapsulation. This is what should
happen as a part two to remediation to help to
prevent it. And then we have the remainder which
would be the root case and the restoration. And that
consists of 15,030 work orders, or 65 percent.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

ELENA TENCHIKOVA: And to give a little bit of context within that universe of that 15,000, about 50 percent of them are for cosmetic paint.

Part of our challenge during COVID and kind of the way that our work orders work, we cannot close the work until we're able to complete the work. So, we cannot close it as tenant not home or refused which means that our work orders stay open. During COVID we suspended our paint, cosmetic paint. So, we continued to respond to making sure to remove mold and encapsulate mold, but all cosmetic paint got suspended during that time which then caused a backlog to grow that now is taking us years to handle.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Just for clarity, I just want to know what is responsible for the delays in closing mold and leak work orders?

DANIEL GREENE: I could speak-- I mean, there's-- a lot of it is on NYCHA's end. You know, a lot of it has come down to staffing and the amount of work orders that we have to handle. Some of the older work orders, it becomes about getting access. So, we did last year is we started a new program with OCC, because they see the same data that we do. We share all of our data openly. It's incredibly transparent. And what we want to do is reach out to thse residents through OCC to determine if work is still needed.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

DANIEL GREENE: Some of those older tickets. And approximately 32 percent of them-they've reached out to a population of about 8,000 so far, they've made positive connections with, and about 32 percent of that 8,000 are stating they no longer need the water--

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

DANIEL GREENE: So, either NYCHA might have done it and didn't document it, or maybe it was

2 painting and they might have done it themselves or 3 they just don't-- some residents just don't want--4 just don't want painting. So, that would indicate, 5 if you extrapolate that out, there is probably a high percentage. I can't say it's 32 percent. 6 I don't 7 know if that's statistically accurate, but a high 8 percentage of those older tickets that are probably no longer needed. However, mold work orders out of all the work orders at NYCHA have the strictest 10 11 closure rules of any work order unless you physically 12 get access to the apartment. The verification 13 project has been a way to work with the Baez 14 plaintiffs in a way that might be a slight change to 15 that to be-- I've been at the door of many apartments 16 where if you look on our work order logs, 19 attempts, 20 attempts, and the residents get 17 18 frustrated. They're like, why are you coming back 19 These are the stories that you hear about again. 20 NYCHA going into apartments and taking pictures, and 21 hwy are they here. This is really annoying. It's a 2.2 friction. It's annoying for the residents, for us to 2.3 be in their apartment when we don't need to. we need to do is find a way to improve that to make 24 sure that we're meeting the intention of making sure 25

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

that the work is getting done, but also not doing-keeping things open indefinitely which causes a lot of confusion, resource. We direct our resources in the less sufficient ways, because we have to send a staff person up there to verify it, and that person could be in another apartment doing repairs. So, that's something that I think, you know, that we want to continue to work on with OCC, and as part of the Restore and Renew Initiative, verification will be a big part of that as well, because there we're trying to tackle the entire backlog at particular developments. So, at Sotomayor when we leave, they should have zero mold and leak work orders left over, and part of that is making sure that we verify with the resident they still want and need the work, and if they don't want it, then we want to redirect those resources, the residents who so badly need the work, those with temp sinks, missing walls, all those terrible things that we see every single day in our apartments. So, we're really trying to work with OCC to use data to prioritize -- and communication to prioritize our resources.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How many of these units are currently offline due to mold?

DANIEL GREENE: That's an interesting

okay.

right page here. So, I don't think we actually have like a tally for mold. I can say, like at certain developments, like Ingersoll Houses, where we have significant roof issues—

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] So, you

don't have a tally of how many units are offline?

question. So, I don't-- let me just pull up to the

DANIEL GREENE: Of how many have been--well, we have-- we have a total number that are offline, but not due to mold-- not due to mold.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Not due to mold,

DANIEL GREENE: We have 48 cases where we've removed residents from apartments due to mold and 10 have been returned to the original unit, 20 made a permanent unit transfer and 18 are ongoing. So, that number seems a little bit low to me. We do relocation on a daily basis. One of the things we didn't talk about here is how really relocation has been transformative in NYCHA through lead, through asbestos.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

DANIEL GREENE: And for mold. So we
relocate residents pretty much on a daily basis. For
lead alone, we're relocating around 200-300 residents
a month for lead abatement, and on top of that, we're
relocating probably 60 to 80 per month for asbestos
abatement, and then as part of that as well, we also
have a number of cases per month for mold. We want
to get residents out of uninhabitable conditions. We
work with hotels. We have a great relocation
program, and then we want to move folks out. We also
move folks to other hospitality units or we try to
facilitate permanent transfers pursuant under our
TSAP rules if we can do that to get the uninhabitable
unit offline, treat it as a vacant apartment, restore
it, and then allow that resident to have some relief
and live in a better apartment. So, relocation has
been transformative. We could also provide you after
this hearing the number that are offline due to like
repair issues.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yeah, if we could get that number, I appreciate it. Thank you.

DANIEL GREENE: That's no problem.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Before I go forward with my questions, let me just recognize Council

have completed upgrades had on mold reoccurrences?

2.2

2.3

pretty significant impact. We see a 54 percent reduction in poor ventilation complaints, and 32 percent reduction in the bathroom-related for poor ventilation, and one of the key indicators of why we see-- we attribute seeing a reduction in the new volume of cases coming in for mold is certainly the strong-- standard procedure which identifies root causes and does the remediation, but of course, the ventilation upgrades, that was massive.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right, okay. Well,
NYCHA's phase one mold and leak action plan from 2020
indicated that there would be a phase two mold and
leak action plan forthcoming. Has such a phase two
plan ever been developed or published, and if so,
when can we find it, or if not, why not?

ELENA TENCHIKOVA: Yeah, we've been working with the Federal Monitor on drafting it, so it's in initial stages.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright.

ELENA TENCHIKOVA: I don't think we have a date that we could commit to yet, though.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. When it comes to the ombudsperson in OCC, how many ombudsperson

the OCC?

2 ELENA TENCHIKOVA: Yeah.

2.2

2.3

DANIEL GREENE: I'm going to answer the [inaudible] and then refer to you. But correct me if I'm wrong. Every mold receipt that the resident receives, because after they receive their inspection you get a mold receipt— has the OCC's phone number on it. There's also multiple, like— it's basically built into the NYCHA structure. So, Elena can talk about it more detailed, but we try to get— I talk about it all the time. You know, we want people to know about it. Go ahead.

thank you, Dan. I'm going to just echo that and say that we build in OCC contact information just about any avenue that we have where we're interfaced with residents. So, we do this through CCC. We do this through issuing through the mold receipt whenever we finish an inspection. We issue a mold receipt that indicates the ombudsperson call center contact information. We also had a whole mold campaign that we've done as part of our Mold Action Plan.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

ELENA TENCHIKOVA: And we've developed content, printed material, web page, as well as

1	COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS 131
2	testimonials. We include OCC through it all. My
3	team, the Mold Response Unit team is present in
4	communities and we certainly have a stronger presence
5	during family days where we issue those handbooks
6	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Okay.
7	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: and promote, again,
8	OCC, and we'll take in cases and
9	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Thank
10	you.
11	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: [inaudible] work with
12	them.
13	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Does the outreach
14	apply to Section 9 residents as well as PACT
15	residents?
16	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: It does.
17	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, what has
18	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: [interposing] The
19	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: been the specific?
20	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: I'm sorry. OCC
21	applies to PACT locations as well.
22	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. And what
23	specific outreach has been done.
24	ELENA TENCHIKOVA: If I may call in

our partners to use so there's consistent messaging.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS:

Okay.

DANIEL GREENE: For example, the team,

the MRU team, they're so effective working with the

25

2.3

135

OCC that we expanded them out to work our court cases

3 which apply like also HPD violations. So, we

4 actually have them now working on court cases

5 | throughout the city to ensure--

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Okay.

DANIEL GREENE: that we were responding

in that measure. The maintenance cares program that I mentioned is also an OCC-style program and that we're escalating internally and tracking internally

desperate need of repair, relocation, or do that

cases within operations that we believe are in

13 | internally. We've seen OCC data models which I work

14 directly with independent analysts on several of the

15 tools that they've built. They're extremely

16 | impressive. We've now worked with internal teams at

17 NYCHA to build out similar dashboards to cover other

18 areas of repair. For example, on skilled trades

19 data, maintenance work orders where we've used

20 similar screens and breakdowns of data to help with

21 performance. The scheduling tool that was built by

22 | the Federal Monitor is very similar to what we-- OCC

23 tools. So, though we don't have the OCC call center,

24 the OCC model we've used throughout the agency to

6

7

8

10

workers are skilled trades who I oversee. They work

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

on mold every single day. Every maintenance worker works on mold. Caretaker X's works on mold. another craft at NYCHA. So, in terms of our skilled trades, our current rundown, and this is our -- this does not include vacancies. These are budgeted headcounts. Some trades get impacted by civil service vacancies. So, brick layers, they're going to do a lot of the concrete work on the ceilings and the bathrooms around mold. There's in Brooklyn-well, I just got it by borough which is easier. So, brick layers in Manhattan, we got 13. We got 16 in the Bronx, got seven in Queens, Staten Island, and 18 in Brooklyn. For carpenters who are doing the tub enclosure work which is critical to leaks in the bathrooms, they actually are responsible for installing the tub enclosures. Cabinets also get molded, the wooden cabinets, and those also are a big scope for carpenters, and windows. So, we have 76 carpenters in Manhattan. We have 64 in the Bronx. We have 33 in Queens, Staten Island and 72 in Brooklyn. Plasterers-- so, I'm going to-- plasterers is another major trade. This is a trade that -- we have big plaster needs in our developments, but this is a trade that is unique to NYCHA. There really is

not plaster anywhere like-- anywhere else in the

city. So it's a very hard trade for us to hire, but

in terms of plasters, 78 Manhattan, 63 in the Bronx,

seven in-- sorry, that's 29 in Queens, Staten Island

and 72 in Brooklyn. And lastly, I'll just do the

1

8

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

7 plumbers unless you want me to get into any others.

But the plumbers, obviously critical to leaks. So, in

9 Manhattan we're budgeted for 35 plumbers. Bronx

10 | we're budgeted for 36, 13 in Queens and Staten

11 | Island, and 43 in Brooklyn. It's not-- this also

12 does not include the supervisors who are not

13 mechanics but oversee the plumbing work. So, that

14 staff-- we added staff under work order reform, but--

and we're always trying to get a few more people here

16 and there, but honestly, it's not enough to meet some

17 of the requirements that we talked about in here.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, how many-- how many additional workers does NYCHA need to meet the benchmarks.

DANIEL GREENE: As many as NYCHA can afford. That's how many that we need. You know, we need a lot more, especially plumbers, and painters are a big one, too, because painters do a lot of the mold cleaning under the NYCHA rules.

2

3

4

5

6 7

8

10 11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

2.2

2.3

24

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, what are you doing to address the staffing shortage?

DANIEL GREENE: What we're doing -- well, NYCHA's had a budgetary-- a little bit of, you know, budgetary challenge right now. We still are struggling with rent arears that accrued post-COVID. We also have the threats of the funding cuts at the federal level which are certainly very concerning as we follow the news, and so this here, we're not going to be adding any more. It's not in our plans to add any more, other than the Restore and Renew initiative which is adding 32 trades to address those high work order sites, and that will be very helpful. on overtime. You know, we are budgeted for overtime, and this year I'm proud to say we're on budget for overtime. But we use overtime extensively every single day for our plumbers. This year, we're focusing our overtime on leak repairs, on mold, on lead, and in addition to that we do a lot of work on turnovers which is also essential for getting residents to live in decent, safe, and sanitary apartments, given the number of transfers that we have.

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS 140
CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright, okay. Thank
you.

DANIEL GREENE: Sorry.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What training do workers receive on mold remediation, and how often is the training updated and who provides the actual training?

ELENA TENCHIKOVA: Sure. Our training is provided by Environmental Education Associates called EEA. When it comes down to our inspectors, they receive a five-day training that evaluates building science, like how-- what is mold, why is it important? It provides an overview on root causes and restoration methods. Our standard procedure has 30 root causes as well as 14 remediation plans. it's not simple. It's not just, you know, a few. And they also learn the hand-held, how to be able to work and document the work. They will learn how to use the tools, how to identify mold conditions, and come up with remediation. So, that's -- that's one. Our most popular titles that get trained in that are our superintendents, property maintenance supervisors, our assistant property maintenance supervisors. We've-- in 2022 expanded it to

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

maintenance workers in order to improve our response to perform immediate initial inspection. And then there's, of course, you know, spin-offs like obviously my team at OMAR is all trained in that. that performs inspections and they have various titles. And for skilled trades, anybody that is performing remediations get remediation training. are about 4,100 trained under remediation, and so that would be your maintenance workers. That would be your caretaker X's [sic] that would perform mold removal. That would be your skilled trades that are doing this work. And there they will also learn about the importance of mold, proper remediation practices, proper containment, proper PPE to make sure to respond to it accordingly.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Now, just to move onto some budget questions. What was NYCHA's budget for mold and leak remediation for FY24 and what is the budget also for 2025?

ELENA TENCHIKOVA: I could tell you on 2025 right now. We could go back on 2024, if that's okay. don't have it in front of me. But we have about \$20 million in operating right now. We have 116 staff members on my team, and we have a \$55

2 million federal capital budget over the next five

3 years if all goes well.

2.2

DANIEL GREENE: And I want make one point. That does not include the money that we spend on our skilled trades. Our staffing for skilled trades—

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] And how much is that?

DANIEL GREENE: So, overall operations, I don't want to say a number off the top. I'll provide it to you as a follow up, but all of our trades are funded throughout the City. So, every— we have inhouse trades. We also have our vendor budget that we use in operations. It's a very high number. I just don't want to misquote it. So, I'll get you the number for 2024 and—

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Is the budget sufficient to achieve compliance?

DANIEL GREENE: I mean, again, the answer-- I would say the answer is no. We want-- we want more funding. We need more funding to address these apartments.

teams work to create their own work order system

2 | ahead of the conversion to make sure they're ready to

3 address work orders, new ones that arise that after

4 conversion, and they are required to put together a

5 plan for the work orders that are transferring from

6 NYCHA to the new property management team. And then

7 | the NYCHA Compliance and Real Estate Department will

8 work with the partner to ensure that they're

9 | following their plan and close out the work orders

10 that are transitioned to them.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Okay. And the work orders that are transitioned over, do they maintain the same work order number that was given initially under NYCHA or does that change in the new system?

HEATHER BECK: I don't think I have that level of detail. I would assume they put them in their own system.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Because we've known situations where some of the RAD/PACT developers haven't had a ticket system for close to two to three years, and so-- and residents have kind of been left in the dark over, you know, those existing work orders that were put in prior to the conversion taking place. So, what is being done to keep the

HEATHER BECK: Thank you for that

_

resident informed about the work orders that are being transitioned over to these new developers?

question and that comment. I think our role after the conversion through our asset management team is really to make sure that the team is conducting the repairs as they planned and outlined, and that they're closing the work orders appropriately. They need to work with the households, each household, to gain access to those units to conduct the work and complete the work order. So, that communication will happen directly through the property management team to that household in a number of ways, and that can look similar to the way that NYCHA does it, but it is direct outreach and engagement with that household. If they're to get in the unit to conduct the work, they need to you know, have access to the unit.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. So, how does oversight look over the PACT when it comes to mold remediation?

HEATHER BECK: Yeah, thank you for that question, and I do think it's important for us to just take--

while the developments are under construction. As

part of their tenancy-- or sorry. As part of their

24

1 COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS 2 maintenance and repairs reporting, they report to us 3 on their leak and mold work orders. Under the PACT 4 agreement, we require that partners are responding to 5 and abating leak and mold work orders within 30 days, and we're able to monitor that through those monthly 6 7 reports. That information is shared--8 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Did the 9 developer or the new management company reports-does a monthly report? 10 11 HEATHER BECK: To us, yeah, and that information's also shared online through our public 12 dashboard. You can see that information kind of 13 14 rolled up in a quarterly basis, but the reports--15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] So, 16 those-- those are existing orders. I mean, existing 17 orders. 18 HEATHER BECK: Requirements. 19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Work orders, yeah. 20 HEATHER BECK: Some of-- the existing

147

work orders that are transitioned are just related to leak and mold. The other work orders are work orders that are created for the project or the development by residents on a monthly basis.

21

2.2

2.3

at all times. As such, members of the public shall

remain silent at all times. The witness table is
reserved for people who wish to testify. No video
recording or photography is allowed from the witness
table. Members of the public may not present audio
or video recordings as testimony, but may submit
transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant of
Arms for inclusion in the hearing record. If you
wish to speak at today's hearing, please fill out an
appearance card with the Sergeant of Arms and wait to
be recognized. When recognized, you will have two
minutes to speak on today's hearing topic. And if
you wish to submit written statement or additional
written testimony for the record, please give a copy
to the Sergeant of Arms. You may also email written
testimony to testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72
hours of this hearing. Audio and video recordings
will not be accepted. So, now we will begin with the
Reverend Getulio, Jr., Getulio. We got you, sir.
Good, Rev. Good to see you. And we also have
Reverend Francis Skelly. Thank you. Two good
Reverends. If you want to you want to flip a coin?
Which you go first. Thank you. You may begin your
testimonv.

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

1

REVEREND GETULIO CRUZ: I'm Reverend

Getulio Cruz, Jr., Senior Pastor Monte Sion Christian Church and Co-Chair of Ban Together, Metro IAF. my congregation live in NYCHA housing along the East River, and we've been organizing for justice in public housing since 1996. And here's the good news, progress is possible. For years, tenants fought just to get basic repairs. NYCHA's response kept getting worse, but we didn't give up. We organized, eventually we filed the Baez versus NYCHA lawsuit, and when the Consent Decree was revised in 2018/2019, things finally began to shift. That decree brought real oversight, Independent Mold Analysts, IMA, Microecologies identified what needed fixing, Independent Data analysts -- Stout showed how to better use NYCHA's resources, and the Ombudsperson Call Center started getting -- which is the OCC -started getting mold and leak repairs done. result, over 31,500 families have received real repairs from the OCC alone, and tens of thousands more have benefited from other Baez-related work. worked hand-in-hand with OCC, IDA, IMA and committed NYCHA staff like Dan Greene and Elena Tenchikova to make this happen. But too many tenants are still

assigned to the Archdioceses of New York. I have

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

ministered in East Harlem for 15 years and in the South Bronx for 20 years. Both parishes have many NYCHA residents. I became a member of Metro IAF in 1994, and in the year 2000 began heavy involvement in issues with NYCHA. I served a parish in Brooklyn for four years where there was no public housing, Sunset Park. When I came back to the Bronx in 2023, a faithful parishioner who always came to church approached me and asked, "Are you still the NYCHA priest?" And then told me about a recurring leak and When I asked did you call the OCC, she responded, "What?" She said she had several tickets and then called the CCC. I gave her the OCC number and received a fruit basket the following Sunday, because the OCC resolved her problem with the leak from above. Another parishioner described the OCC as an answer to prayer when a similar leak from above was taken care of. Reverend Cruz mentioned the Baez case and Consent Decree. Marilel [sp?] Baez was a parishioner of Immaculate Conception in the South The legal proceedings were a difficult journey and finally resulted in a Consent Decree and the creation of the OCC. In retrospect, it might not have been the best acronym since it sounds so much

testimony and your great advocacy. I know you were both involved with the Baez Consent Decree, and I want to know what kind of outreach would you like to

2.3

24

Ritchie Torres has done-- made videos about the OCC.

We've tried all kinds of things, but it doesn't seem

2.3

24

25

to hit the people.

I've referred to the OCC comes back and thanks me.

is one of the things with RAD/PACT, when they're

24

1972 and currently reside at East New York Boulevard

2 In 2020, Boulevard Houses underwent a 3 significant transformation when it converted from Section 9 to RAD/PACT. After the completion of the 4 5 RAD/PACT conversion, major renovations were However, once these renovations were 6 undertaken. 7 finished, tenants at the Boulevard Houses, including 8 myself, began experiencing persistent and severe issues with mold, water leaks throughout the building, as well as serious other problems. 10 The 11 presence of mold and ongoing water leaks has significantly impacted the quality of life for many 12 13 residents here. The issues posed health risks and 14 create challenging living conditions, especially for 15 families and the elderly tenants. To address these 16 problems, the residents of Boulevard Houses with the 17 support of EBC and Metro IAF organized and engaged 18 with the OCC. We have relied heavily on the OCC for 19 assistance. The OCC has proven to be an invaluable 20 resource, helping tenants navigate the process of 21 reporting and resolving mold and water leak issues, 2.2 advocating for necessary repairs and ensuring our 2.3 voices are heard by housing management and city officials. Boulevard Houses has a long way to go 24 before life returns to normal. We continue to push 25

2.3

management to resolve challenges such as plumbing issues, heating problems, security, and are ongoing to push them on the threat of mass evictions, as well as difficulties in communicating between management and residents. However, we are grateful to the OCC for improving our living conditions.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You may continue.

YOLANDA MOORE: We appreciate -- we appreciate the committee's attention to these ongoing concerns and urge continued oversight and support to ensure that all residents of Boulevard Houses and all public housing tenants can live in safe, healthy, and well-maintained homes. Thank you for your time and consideration. Thank you, my favorite Councilman.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I have a question for you, Ms. Moore.

YOLANDA MOORE: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Based on your experience, do you feel like you have seen the-- hold on. I'm sorry about that. Let me go back to my-- Sorry about that. I do apologize. If there is one recommendation you would like to make to NYCHA to improve its handling of mold and leak complaints, what would it be?

and tripled after the renovations. So, I don't have

an answer about anything positive as of yet, but I do

24

1	COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS 161								
2	have positive that OCC's system is working to resolve								
3	those issues.								
4	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And from your								
5	knowledge, has there was there ever a overhaul of								
6	the plumbing at Boulevard Houses?								
7	YOLANDA MOORE: Not								
8	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Was that								
9	part of the work scope?								
10	YOLANDA MOORE: We had no plumbing								
11	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Are you familiar with								
12	the overall overhaul of the plumbing system or the								
13	piping.								
14	YOLANDA MOORE: No overhaul of the								
15	plumbing system was done at Boulevard Houses during								
16	the renovation. We had no plumbing upgrades done,								
17	none.								
18	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And would you say								
19	that has led to the persistent mold and leaking?								
20	YOLANDA MOORE: Absolutely. We believe								
21	so. The tenants believe so, absolutely.								
22	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright, well thank								
23	you so much, Ms. Moore, and thank you for your								
24	advocacy.								

YOLANDA MOORE: Thank you, Councilman.

and the condition of my apartment. Ms. Jones and her

2 team were very-- kept in contact with me throughout

3 the procedure of my apartment being renovated-- being

4 done, not renovated, being fixed for the mold. I am

5 a senior with breathing problems, and it wasn't until

6 Ms. Connie [sic] and the mold system reached out that

7 | my apartment was fully done, and if I can complain

8 about those that don't work, I can complain about

9 those that do work. And the Mold and Response Unit

10 | went beyond their job in helping me get my apartment

11 together.

what would it be?

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. If there was one recommendation you could make to NYCHA to improve its handling of mold and leak complaints,

out and check the apartments thoroughly. I would say to keep in contact with the tenants, because we put in tickets and what they do, they send people out and they put band aids on it, and that's what was happening with me. They kept sending someone out and they wasn't doing the right thing, and then once Ms.—

- the Mold and Response Unit got in touch, it was like everything went into effect. Because I even went to the courts and told the judge how pleased I

2 was with the work that the Mold and Response Unit had

done, because if they don't look out for the seniors,

4 and not only the seniors, those that live in housing,

5 and we have a breathing problem, who else is going

6 to look out for us?

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your testimony.

STEPHANIE PITTS: You're welcome. And I would say that the Mold and Response Unit, one thing I can truly say, they take their job seriously, they really do, and they're concerned about the tenants.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Thank you for your testimony. Alright, so now we're going to—
I'd be remiss if I didn't recognize Council Member
Avilés who has joined us. Now, we'll move on to
Donna Elden [sp?]. Okay, we have actually an in—
person testimony from Christopher Leon Johnson.
Before you begin, Christopher. Just want to read
this clause again. I'm opening up the hearing to
public testimony again. I remind members that—
members of the public that this is a governmental
proceeding and decorum shall be observed at all
times. As such, members of the public shall remain
silent at all times. The witness table is reserved

for people who wish to testify. No video recording

or photography is allowed for the witness table. 3

4 Members of the public may not present audio or video

5 recordings as testimony, but may submit transcripts

of such recordings to the Sergeant of Arms for 6

7 inclusion into the hearing record, and if you wish to

speak at today's hearing, please feel free to fill 8

out the appearance card with the Sergeant of Arms.

Christopher Leon Johnson, you are recognized. 10

11 can-- press--

2

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Oh, yeah, hello, Chair Banks, Chair Avilés. My name is Christopher Leon Johnson. Just want to say here today that I know that NYCHA does their best to mitigate the mold in their developments. People that try to work with NYCHA tell me that they do their best to mitigate the mold in the developments. My feeling is that there's certain developments that are really left behind and like Chelsea and Fulton, because what's going on is that what they want to do is find a way to demolish those two developments. calling on the City Council to make a public statement to make it where that NYCHA makes -- keeps

Chelsea and Fulton public and because there's a lot

2 c

2.2

of things that are going on that— in those developments. Not only with just mold, and that's only part of it. It's the quality of life. It's the smells of the hallways, and our Council Member over there, Erik Bottcher, refuses to address it, because he's down with closing down NYCHA to give to the developers. I'm just saying here today that we need to keep NYCHA public. We cannot prioritize NYCHA and they— that's what I got to say. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your testimony.

CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Thank you.

inadvertently missed anyone that has registered to testify today and has yet to-- have been called, please use the Zoom raise hand function if you're testifying remotely, and you will be called in order that your hand has been raised. If you are testifying in-person, please come to the dais.

Seeing none, I will now close the hearing. Thank you to all the members of the administration and the members of the public who have joined us today to discuss this very important topic. This hearing is now adjourned.

1	COMMITTEE	ON	HOUSING	AND	BUILDINGS	167
2	[gavel]					
3						
4						
5						
6						
7						
8						
9						
10						
11						
12						
13						
14						
15						
16						
17						
18						
19						
20						
21						
22						
23						
24						

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 12, 2025