

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND
FRANCHISES

----- X

December 3, 2025
Start: 11:07 a.m.
Recess: 11:54 a.m.

HELD AT: 250 BROADWAY - 8TH FLOOR - HEARING
ROOM 3

B E F O R E: Kevin C. Riley, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Shaun Abreu
David M. Carr
Francisco P. Moya
Yusef Salaam

A P P E A R A N C E S

Michelle Craven, Associate Deputy Commissioner
for Cityscape and Franchises at the New York City
Department of Transportation

Alan Sullivan, Co-CEO of JCDecaux New York

Gabrielle Brussel, Chief Government and Community
Relations Officer at JCDecaux

Ed Wallace, Counsel for JCDecaux

Adam Lake, Climate Group

Larry Giannechini, Deputy Director for Program
and Operations at Public Art Fund

Betsy Plum, Executive Director of Riders Alliance

Todd Dale, Rothkrug Rothkrug and Spector

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning. This is a microphone test on Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises in Hearing Room 3, recorded by Taisha Sherman (phonetic). Today's date is December 3rd, 2025.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning, and welcome to the New York City Council Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises.

At this time, can everybody please silence your cell phones.

If you wish to testify, please go to the back of the room to fill out a testimony slip.

At this time and going forward, no one is to approach the dais. I repeat, no one is to approach the dais.

Chair, we are ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: [GAVEL] Good morning, everyone, and welcome to a meeting of the Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises. I'm Council Member Kevin Riley, Chair of the Subcommittee.

Today, we are holding three public hearings on Authorizing Resolution 1157 of 2025 related to extending the Coordinated Street Furniture Franchise; two special permit requests in the

acquisition site selection application all related to Herkimer-Williams proposal; and 18-15 Francis Lewis Boulevard commercial overlay application.

Please note that the application for MTA 125th Street and Lexington Avenue rezoning, which appear on today's calendar, will be voted on tomorrow morning at a separate Zoning Subcommittee meeting before the Land Use Committee meets. I want to also note that the Eagle Street City map application, which had previously been noticed for this meeting, will also not be on our agenda as it was not called up or introduced at the Council.

This meeting is being held in hybrid format. Members of the public who wish to testify may testify in person or through Zoom. Members of the public wishing to testify remotely may register by visiting the New York City Council's website at www.council.nyc.gov/landuse to sign up and, for those of you here in person, please see one of the Sergeant-at-Arms to prepare and submit a speaker's card.

Members of the public may also view a livestream broadcast of this meeting at the Council's website.

When you are called to testify before the Subcommittee, if you are joining us remotely, you will remain muted until recognized by myself to speak. When you are recognized, your microphone will be unmuted.

We will limit public testimony to two minutes per witness. If you have additional testimony that you would like the Subcommittee to consider or if you have written testimony that you would like to submit instead of appearing in person, please email it to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Written testimony may be submitted up to three days after the hearing is closed. Please indicate the LU number and/or project name in the subject line of your email.

We request that witnesses joining us remotely remain in the meeting until excused by myself as Council Members may have questions.

Lastly, for everyone attending today's meeting, this is a government proceeding and decorum must be reserved at all times. Members of the public are asked not to speak during the meeting unless you are testifying.

The witness table is reserved for people who are called to testify, and no video recording or photography is allowed from the witness table.

Further, members of the public may not present audio or video recording as testimony. They may submit transcripts of such recordings to Sergeant-at-Arms for inclusion in the hearing records.

Just want to state for the record we've been joined by Council Member Abreu and remotely by Council Member Moya.

I will now open the public hearing on Authorizing Resolution 1157 of 2025 regarding the Coordinated Street Furniture Franchise. The Administration is seeking to extend the franchise for an additional three years and eight months.

For anyone wishing to testify regarding this proposal remotely, if you have not already done so, you must register online by visiting the Council's website at council.nyc.gov/landuse.

For anyone with us in person, please see Sergeant-at-Arms to submit a speaker's card.

If you prefer to submit written testimony, you can always do so by emailing it to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

I will now call the applicant panel for this proposal which consists of Michelle Craven, the Associate Commissioner of Franchises at the Department of Transportation. Good morning.

Counsel, can you please administer the affirmation?

SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Good morning. Can you please turn on your microphone?

Thank you. Raise your right hand.

Do you swear to tell the truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony today and in response to Council Member questions?

MAX BOOKMAN: I do.

SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Just want to state for the record we've been joined by Council Member Salaam.

You may now begin your testimony. I'll just ask that you please restate your name and organization for the record. You may begin.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Okay.

Well, good morning, Chair Riley and Members of the Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises. I am Michelle Craven, Associate Deputy Commissioner for Cityscape

and Franchises at the New York City Department of Transportation. Thank you for the opportunity to testify on Resolution Number 1157-2025, which would authorize the New York City Department of Transportation to enter into a coordinated street furniture franchise for the installation, operation, and maintenance of coordinated street furniture in the Boroughs of the Bronx, Brooklyn, Manhattan, Queens, and Staten Island. This Resolution would authorize DOT to seek permission from the New York City Franchise and Concession Review Committee, or FCRC, to enter into a new, non-exclusive, sole-source franchise agreement with JCDecaux Street Furniture New York LLC, the City's current coordinated street furniture franchisee, for three years, eight months, and 24 days, expiring on March 22nd, 2035. The new franchise agreement would consist substantially of the same terms as the existing coordinated street furniture franchise agreement, and it would additionally be consistent with all the terms and conditions set forth in Resolution Number 1004-2003, the original authorizing resolution underlying the existing agreement.

To provide some background, in 2006, DOT awarded a 20-year franchise to Somoza Inc. for the construction, installation, and maintenance of bus stop shelters, new stands, automated public toilets, or APTs, and public service structures. In 2015, the FCRC approved a change of control to JCDecaux North America Inc., making JCDecaux the new franchisee. Subsequently, in 2023, the City Council approved an authorizing resolution permitting a five-year extension to the current franchise agreement, and the FCRC approved this extension along with other amendments to the franchise agreement. With the five-year extension, the current franchise agreement will expire on June 26, 2031, 25 years after its commencement, matching the maximum term permitted by Section 363 of the City Charter.

Three weeks ago, the Subcommittee held a hearing on Resolution Number 1109-2025 regarding the City's franchise agreement with CityBridge LLC for the installation and maintenance of public communication structures. That franchise is managed by the City's Office of Technology and Innovation and is currently scheduled to expire on March 22nd, 2030. If the Council approves this resolution, it will

amend the authorizing resolution for the public communication structure franchise by authorizing OTI to amend and extend the franchise for five years. With that extension, the City's public communication structure franchise would expire on March 22nd, 2035.

The City is interested in exploring the possibility of combining the coordinated street furniture and public communication structures franchises into one consolidated franchise. This consolidation would potentially allow for greater capital investment and sustained revenue for the City. Approval of Resolution Number 1157-2025 in conjunction with Resolution Number 1109-2025 would make the two existing franchises coterminous, thereby providing the City with the flexibility to explore that option. Approval will also provide stability during the three-year, eight-month, and 24-day period. JCDecaux will continue to maintain the existing street furniture to their current standards. In addition, it will provide revenue stability, as JCDecaux will pay the City a guaranteed minimum plus a revenue share of advertising for a total of approximately 200 million dollars from 2031 to 2035. Further, JCDecaux will continue to provide millions

of dollars per year in overseas advertising for no additional cost, which will aid the City by promoting tourism.

In conclusion, the Administration supports this Resolution, which would allow DOT to seek permission from the FCRC to enter into a new franchise agreement for coordinated street furniture. I would be happy to answer any questions.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much, Michelle.

Just a few questions I have.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: So the redesigned bus shelters and the new stands are a big improvement. We appreciate that in the community, but they have significant operational issues. I'm seeing them in the Bronx. Specifically in my District, they have been turned into encampments so we have individuals who don't want to use the New York City shelter system that are usually sleeping there, spending time, usually have all their belongings inside these shelters right now. So, I guess the question I want to ask you is, what is DOT and the company that has

this franchise doing to ensure that the proper use of these bus shelters are actually happening?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: So when we become aware of homeless encampments in bus shelters, we reach out to the City's Department of Homeless Services to try to work with the people at the shelters to move them into the shelter system. I don't know if I'm aware of specific locations in the Bronx, but if you want to send me locations in your District, we'd be happy to work with DHS and try to do something about it.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. So is there like a time period like you contact DHS? Do they automatically go out there? Do they kind of...

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: As far as I know, they automatically go out there is when we contact them, but I certainly can talk to them more about the situation.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. So, my team can reach out to you.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Yeah, you can reach out to me, you can reach out to our Bronx office, whatever.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. Thank you.

We need to encourage the visibility of our small businesses and help non-profits reach the public about their services. How does the City work to ensure opportunities for non-profit organizations and small businesses to advertise their services on bus shelters and newsstands?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: So currently, the way the franchise is set up, 77 and a half percent of the panels are managed by JCDecaux, 22 and a half percent are managed by New York City Tourism. I know Decaux has done work in recent years to try to get small business, this is particularly sort of in the outer boroughs to, you know, where they have local customer traffic to get them to advertise more. And I believe New York City Tourism also was working with small businesses to use that 22 and a half percent of their panels. DOT is not really directly involved in the advertising piece of it, but we'd be happy to speak to New York City Tourism or Decaux about expanding small business advertising.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Maintenance on the entire street furniture system is an ongoing concern in my District and citywide. What can you tell us today about how the City handles these issues, and do

you have any data on response or resolution times for complaints, for example?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: So, we receive complaints via 3-1-1, from elected officials such as yourself, and we have a team, a small team of inspectors who go out into the field and do their own inspections and report back on any issues. We submit directives to JCDecaux every day for anything that we see out there, and there are certain mandated time periods in the agreement for when they need to respond, and we track those consistently and do sort of weekly summaries.

So, I have a lot of data, probably more data than you'd ever want to see, but if you have specific questions, obviously we could follow up. And if you have particular concerns, you can reach out to our office, our Bronx office, our intergov team, anybody that, you know, please forward things our way because we will get you out there.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Do you have like a compliance rate for JCDecaux when it comes to this?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: I can double check, but it's well over 90 percent. I mean, they're very good at responding. If there's a failure

in getting to places, it's usually because we're unaware of the situation, so if you make us aware, they will go out.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay.

What proactive measures does the franchise agreement require to maintain these structures, and is there any maintenance scheduled for bus shelters?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: So, they're required to go twice a week to clean the shelters, and you know, they go twice a week. That's the basic standard, and then obviously when we see complaints, we send them out. I think while they're out there, they look to see if there are any sort of broken pieces, if there are any issues with the shelters, and they will repair them.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: What are like common issues you see on shelters?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: I mean, it's trash. Sometimes we see broken glass. Sometimes it's intentional. Sometimes someone's driven into a bus shelter. Those are probably the biggest. Oh, and graffiti.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. And when there's glass, you guys send them out immediately?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Yes, they have to go out. They have to clean up the glass in the first 24 hours.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: It has to be within 24 hours. Okay.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: The new piece might come in a few days later, but they have to go out...

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: But they have to clean up the glass. And who do you guys send out? Do you guys go out, or Sanitation goes out, or?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Well, we send Decaux to tell them.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Decaux will come out. Okay.

All right. That's usually a common, I guess, issue you would see. I guess in my District, I have one right around the corner from my house, so when I'm going to the train, I usually would see that.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: But I can say it has been taken care of very fast.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Okay. Well, that's good.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: I just didn't know the time period that you guys would have to do it.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: If we are going to extend this franchise agreement, we need to address the operational issue we just discussed so I'm looking forward to, you know, hearing back from you guys when you have a little bit more data, and I'm looking forward to hearing from JCDecaux as well.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Okay. And if you have particular locations of concern, again, feel free to send them our way, and we can make sure our team goes out and checks a little more frequently.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Another question. Do you guys, because I know in my district, there was like a senior center on the corridor of Boston Road.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: I think it's on Boston Road between Fenton and Seymour, but they took away

the bus stop. I believe they put it back, but there's no, like, shelter there. So, I guess my question is, do you guys determine the locations on where you actually put these shelters, or for the record, could you explain how do you determine the locations?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Sure. I guess, was there a shelter there originally? Do you know?

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: There wasn't a shelter. There was a, would the bench be considered the shelter, just the bench?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: No, just the bench would not be considered.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: So no.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Okay. So, there's two things happening, I think, too, because there's been the bus network redesigns which have happened, and the Bronx already did theirs, and we ended up relocating a number of bus shelters at obsolete bus stops to bus stops with high ridership.

Typically, the typical process for siting bus shelters, particularly now, is, you know, I don't know if you remember, we had a conversation the last time we were here about new sites, and so I sent a

letter to the City Council. We took some requests from Council Members. There's a number of siting criteria that we look at. We inspect the sites physically to see if they meet the siting criteria, and then we try to match those with bus stops that have high ridership, particularly in the City's priority investment areas, and so we've worked with our Transit Development Team to try to figure out the highest ridership places that also match up with sites that meet our siting criteria, which is typically like pedestrian clear path, making sure there's enough room for pedestrians to walk, making sure it's clear from fire hydrants and street trees, that kind of thing. And so that's how we've been approaching the installation of new shelters. Oh, I was going to say, we sent a list of our first 87 locations to the Council a couple months ago.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: So I do remember that conversation. Do you have a list of the recommendations that you guys actually went after?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Yes. So, it's not very clean, but we could send one over.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. And what percentage of, I guess, bus stops have shelters? Do you know that?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Somewhere in the neighborhood of 20 percent.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: 20 percent?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: There's about 15,000 bus stops or so, yeah.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: I'm happy to say, though, the first 87 that we sent over, 31 are in the Bronx.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. Well, I'm happy to hear that.

Council Member Salaam or Abreu?

Okay. There being no more questions, thank you, Michelle, for your testimony.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Okay. Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Oh sorry, Council Member Salaam has a question.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: So I'm listening to the testimony, and one of the questions I had was, are you able to tell us where this 20 percent is?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: It's all on Open Data, actually. You can see where all the bus shelters are, but we could send you more information if you need it.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Is there a push to get to 100 percent?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: We would love to get to 100 percent. I think the two issues, well the main issue there, frankly, is that not every bus stop can accommodate a bus shelter, because a lot of bus stops have sidewalks that are too narrow, or there are other obstructions like driveways or things that, you know, where we just can't put a bus shelter. The other piece, obviously, is just funding. The original contract authorized 3,500 shelters were allowed to go up to 3,850 based on the old ULURP that was done as part of this franchise, and then at this point the City is investing in new shelters, but you know, it's a matter of resources.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Because one of the things that I've been observing in our Districts is that the actual bus stops have actually been growing, and parking spaces are being depleted because of that, and I'm just wondering, that's the reason why I

asked that question in terms of, are we able to get to 100 percent, or is there a push for that? Because we do see that the bus stops are becoming larger, and of course we want to make sure that the folks, especially in inclement weather, get the opportunity to be a part of that 20 percent.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Right, of course, and I mean, DOT recently announced that we're planning to invest in bus stop seating at every bus stop. I think it's 875 bus stops a year for the next 10 years to try to get seating. Obviously, in inclement weather without the roof, that's not ideal, but I mean, we would love to have, I would personally love to have bus shelters everywhere.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Do we have a number in terms of how much it would cost to bring it up past the 20 percent, maybe the 50 percent?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: I mean, we could put some estimates together, yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Yeah, I'd like to see that.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: All right. Thanks.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: And just to add on to that, I think it'd be ideal because as the new administration is coming in, we're talking about, you know, affordability, you know, free bus services, I guess, to encourage more people to utilize, you know, the buses. Having a bus shelter there would be ideal. So, of course, we would love to get to 100, everybody would love it, but the further we could get, I think, would be more ideal to fit into that agenda. So, if we could kind of prepare that, and we could start having those conversations, you know, next, you know, administration.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Okay. We can look into that.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thanks, Michelle.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER CRAVEN: Thanks.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. We're going to go into public testimony.

I'm going to call on Alan Sullivan, Ed Wallace, and Gabrielle Brussel.

Sure, you want to sit right there just to make sure? Okay.

Okay, Gabrielle, you want to begin? Oh, you guys can start, however you want to.

ALAN SULLIVAN: Hello. Is that working?

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes.

ALAN SULLIVAN: Good morning, Chair Riley and members of the Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchise. My name is Alan Sullivan, and I am the Co-CEO of JCDecaux New York, the street furniture franchisee, which provides New York City with bus shelters, automatic public toilets, and newsstands, which make up the street furniture franchise. I'm joined today by my colleague, Gabrielle Brussel, who is the Chief Government and Community Relations Officer at JCDecaux, and is the day-to-day contact and manager of the street furniture franchise. We're here with our partners at DOT to testify in support of Resolution 1157, which authorizes DOT to continue the street furniture franchise work for three and three-quarter years, thereby making the street furniture franchise coterminous with the proposed expiration of the LinkNYC Public Communications Structures Agreement. This coterminous expiration would allow the City to explore a combined franchise, allowing for greater capital investment and reduced street clutter by combining structures with sustained revenue for the City.

Founded over 60 years ago, JCDecaux invented the concept of free public service in exchange for advertising rights. Over 25 years ago, we introduced the concept of coordinated structures to beautify the streetscape to optimize revenue to the City by having one advertising vendor. Since 2015, JCDecaux has proudly installed and maintained New York street furniture through its frontline union workforce. In partnership with the City, JCDecaux has worked to upgrade and expand the reach of the program to meet the City's changing needs. Our structures provide free public service messaging in the City and free New York City tourism promotional advertising space around the world with proven results. If the Council approves the resolution before you, this will ensure the continuation of the high-caliber operation of the program and the payment of significant revenue to the City, whilst also creating options for the City to expand street furniture services by making the two streetscape franchises coterminous, thus permitting the City to decide in its sole discretion to issue a comprehensive streetscape RFP, which we believe will enable the franchisee to provide more bus shelters and other services.

On behalf of JCDecaux, we thank you for your time today and are very happy to answer any questions you may have.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much, Alan.

So, I guess I'm going to go back to that question that I was asking DOT regarding the visibility of small businesses and non-profits. So to encourage the visibility of small businesses and help non-profits reach the public about their services, how does JCDecaux work to ensure opportunities for non-profit organizations and small businesses to advertise on the bus shelters and newsstands?

ALAN SULLIVAN: Thank you very much, Council Member. So on top of everything that Michelle said, which I don't necessarily need to repeat, with respect to outreach of small businesses and local businesses, we have a dedicated local sales force that their job is to actually go out in all of the neighborhoods and engage with local small businesses to see if they would like to advertise on our shelters and negotiate with them the affordable rates for them to be able to take the opportunity to advertise their businesses.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Is there like an online link that small businesses can kind of go to?

ALAN SULLIVAN: The JCDecaux website is very easy to find.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Oh, so you could go on the website?

ALAN SULLIVAN: Yeah, you can go on the website and all of our contact details are there and then there is an opportunity to ask about advertising opportunities which we will then follow up with.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Can you explain the discount rates?

ALAN SULLIVAN: The discount rates...

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: For a non-profit or a small business?

ALAN SULLIVAN: Well, for a number of non-profits we don't charge.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay, that's good.

ALAN SULLIVAN: So, we have a number of pillars which are aligned with the United Nations that support non-profit organizations and they are able to avail themselves of that opportunity.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: That was my next question so that's good.

So the franchise, LinkNYC was here just a couple of weeks ago and they have a program to help small businesses and not-for-profit businesses advertise on their kiosks. I want to know if you guys have a similar program to that?

ALAN SULLIVAN: So just going back to the non-profits, we have taken over 3,300 panels so far on free... pardon?

GABRIELLE BRUSSEL: Just this year.

ALAN SULLIVAN: Just this year, sorry, for free advertising for the non-profits.

On the local side of the business, we have people on the street knocking on the doors every day to try and find affordable solutions for small businesses.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: So outside of non-profits or small businesses, what other I guess entities come and want to advertise on these bus shelters?

ALAN SULLIVAN: We have a long tail of advertisers that advertise in across all five boroughs. The vast majority of the brands that you would see are well-known national brands, but also we have a lot of regional and local brands whether it's

dentists, medical lawyers and the like so a very varied advertiser base.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: I brought up a question to DOT about the operational usage of these shelters. My concern is the encampments, I guess people vandalizing the shelters. Thank you for doing an amazing job because you always, anytime I see any vandalization, you guys are sending them out but have you seen an increase in encampments in the shelters and do you have any insight on how you know we could possibly you know limit that I guess?

ALAN SULLIVAN: First, I'd say thank you very much for your very kind comments. It is something that we as an organization take very very seriously so thank you for that.

Unfortunately, yes, we have seen an increase in housing instability that has meant that there are more incidences of people using the bus shelters for the purpose that they were not intended. What I will say is that working with DOT and the process that Michelle already outlined, as soon as the person suffering instability is vacated from the shelter it is a huge priority for us to be able to get out immediately to ensure that that shelter is

fit for purpose as quickly as possible for the for
the bus riding public.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. All right.

No more questions just going to add on to
what Council Member Salaam stated to DOT as we are
transitioning into a more affordable New York City to
just if you guys could project that number of what
that does look like to get more shelters into New
York City. I know the capacity somewhere in front of
residential houses or capacity and size but if you
could just give us something that we could kind of
work with, that would be appreciated.

ALAN SULLIVAN: Yeah. We will absolutely
do that. And one of the one of the advantages of the
last amendment was the introduction of a narrow
shelter which has somewhat mitigated the issue in
terms of location but, as ever, we take our direction
of locations from DOT.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you.

One second.

Sorry, Alan. We didn't cover narrow
shelters. Can you just discuss that a little bit
more?

ALAN SULLIVAN: Beg your pardon?

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: The narrow shelters.

ALAN SULLIVAN: The narrow shelters.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yeah. Can you just discuss that a little bit more?

ALAN SULLIVAN: So, as Michelle identified, there are certain restrictions in terms of clear path, and there are a lot of sidewalks that aren't able to accommodate a full-size shelter so we, in the last amendment as part of that agreement, we introduced a slender shelter that opens up a broader opportunity of locations to be able to site shelters that weren't necessarily capable of being sited before.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. All right. Thank you. You're now excused. Thank you for your testimony.

ALAN SULLIVAN: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you.

We're going to transition to online testimony. The first panel I'm going to call consists of Adam Lake, Larry G., and Betsy Plum.

We will begin first with Adam Lake.

Adam, if you can hear me, please unmute and you may begin.

ADAM LAKE: Ladies and gentlemen of the City Council. Thank you for the opportunity to speak today in support of the NYC Authorizing Resolution related to the Coordinated Street Furniture Franchise Amendment and specifically to express my strong support for JCDecaux. My name is Adam Lake and I am a representative of Climate Group. We're a non-profit organization based here in New York City. Our mission is to create a cleaner, safer, and more inclusive community for all of New Yorkers and today I'd like to highlight how JCDecaux's partnership has significantly contributed to our efforts in fulfilling that mission, especially through their support of our annual Climate Week NYC event which is the largest global climate event of its kind in the world. For many years, JCDecaux has provided our organization with essential advertising space free of charge across their street furniture installations. This partnership has empowered us to amplify our message and showcase the inspiring work of community leaders throughout the five boroughs. They say that when you're tired of London, you're tired of life, but I chose to move to NYC for a reason. In a city as diverse and as vibrant as New York, it's vital to

ensure all voices can be heard, especially when it comes to environmental stewardship and addressing the climate crisis. So, thanks to JCDecaux's generous support, we've been able to utilize their prominent locations for messaging that matters. Messages that unite New Yorkers around the urgent needs to make our city and our world a safer, cleaner, and more enjoyable place. It supports local non-profits that we create a platform for, the community volunteers that we celebrate, and the many artists, creatives, and innovators who join us in our work. And as we look ahead to the challenges posed by climate change, fostering partnerships that promote sustainability and community engagement is paramount. By supporting JCDecaux in this resolution, we support a future where New York City leads the way in innovative climate solutions and public engagement initiatives.

So in conclusion, I urge you members of the City Council to support this resolution. The partnership with JCDecaux is an embodiment of what we can achieve when we unite towards a common goal, making New York a cleaner, safer, and more inclusive city for all. Together we can ensure that our streets not only serve as corridors of commerce but also as

platforms for community engagement, environmental advocacy and resilience. So, thank you for hearing from me today.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Adam.

Next, we'll hear from Larry G.

Larry, if you can, please unmute.

LARRY GIANNECHINI: Good morning. I'm Larry Giannechini, Deputy Director for Program and Operations at Public Art Fund. It's my pleasure to present testimony this morning in support of the authorized resolution related to amendment on coordinated street furniture franchise. As a leader in our field, Public Art Fund brings dynamic contemporary art to a broad audience in New York City and beyond. Because we are a non-profit organization, we rely on visionary partners like JCDecaux to mount ambitious free exhibitions of international scope and impact. These exhibitions offer New Yorkers and visitors to the city powerful experiences with art in the urban environment, surprising and delighting them while providing inspiration and relevance to their daily lives. Since 2017, with our groundbreaking exhibition, Ai Weiwei's Good Fences Make Good Neighbors, JCDecaux has been an incredible partner

for public art with us showcasing the work of 77 artists from over 30 countries across the globe, including nine solo artist exhibitions and two large-scale group artist exhibitions. Their in-kind donation and advertising space on bus shelters across New York makes it possible for us to bring cutting-edge artworks in a diverse range of artist voices to the often-underserved neighborhoods and has garnered over 2 billion impressions to date. New York City is known for its culture and thriving arts community. JCDecaux partners with Public Art Fund to eliminate barriers so that everyone can access amazing art. Together, we are able to offer the public experiences with art that are integrated into the fabric of our city. While waiting for the bus, walking around the city, and going about our daily lives, New Yorkers lives are enriched with these works, and JCDecaux has been a tremendous supporter, offering us hundreds of spaces two times each year to bring exhibitions to all corners of our city. The partnership has also grown beyond New York with its popularity here, allowing us to offer similar programming in Boston, Chicago, and in international cities like Abidjan, Ivory Coast, and Mexico City, Mexico. Art inspires us

all and we know that representation matters, particularly when it comes to engaging with young people. The artists we presented with JCDecaux include immigrants, artists of color, trans and queer artists, emerging artists, women artists, and artists of all ages in the stages of their career. When people walk through the city, they see themselves reflected in these works and they tell us how much art brings them inspiration, restoring their energy and igniting their creativity. JCDecaux has worked closely with us to realize our dreams...

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you for your testimony. Your time has expired.

LARRY GIANNECHINI: And bring these important voices to the forefront. Thank you so much for this opportunity.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Larry.

Last, we'll hear from Betsy Plum.

BETSY PLUM: Thank you, Chair. Good morning, everyone. My name is Betsy Plum. I am the Executive Director of Riders Alliance. We are New York's grassroots organization of bus and subway riders. Well over a million New Yorkers rely on the bus every single day. Yet, most still wait without

even the simplest comforts. Bus shelters are fundamental infrastructure that protect riders in the rain, in the heat, in the cold and they also signal that our City values the people who keep it moving. According to a recent study, over half of the city's hottest bus stops are in just six City Council Districts, including in your District, Chair Riley, which I know is a concern that that you share with us. This is what we are working to remedy, but still too often bus riders are left uncovered, unseated, and unseen. We share the goal of 100 percent of bus stops having shelters. We would love to work towards that, and I think the recent mayoral election really brought welcome visibility to bus riders but we have a long way to go and consistency in what riders can expect is essential. This is why we support the amendment before you in Resolution 1157. Riders know JCDecaux not simply as an advertising company but as a service company. Their work succeeds only when the shelters that they build and maintain truly serve riders. Advertising revenue may sustain the franchise and provide income to the City, but the core function is delivering and upholding infrastructure that people rely on every single day and which many more

New Yorkers should have access to. The extension also creates a smart opportunity. Aligning the bus shelter and LinkNYC franchise timelines allows the City to develop a coordinated moderate vision for a unified street furniture system. And as we look ahead, again, to what will be the most pro-bus mayoralty in decades, this is exactly the moment to embrace how franchise revenue can be returned to riders through more shelters, more services, and better on-street infrastructure. To put (TIMER CHIME) a finer point on it, as we understand it this extension includes new payments from JCDecaux to the City. Those funds should be fully dedicated to...

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you for your testimony. Your time is expired.

BETSY PLUM: Expanding and improving services for bus riders. Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Betsy.

There be no question this panel is excused.

There be no other members of the public who wish to testify or Authorizing Resolution 1157 of 2025 regarding the Coordinated Street Furniture

Franchise, the public hearing is now closed, and the item is laid over.

I will now open the public hearing on items 436, 437 and 438 relating to the Herkimer-Williams Development Proposal that we heard two weeks ago. This proposal involves the redevelopment of four blocks in the Broadway Junction area of East New York in Council Member Nurse's District. The proposed development consists of four buildings with over 1 million square feet that will consist of almost 1,000 residential units, commercial uses, light industrial uses, and possible community facility spaces. The site will also include 20,000 square feet of newly publicly accessible open space.

On November 20th, we held a public hearing to discuss the development proposal, but at the time the special permit and the site selection request had not yet been called up by the Council.

For anyone wishing to testify remotely regarding the special permit and site selection request, if you have not already done so, you must register online by visiting the Council's website at council.nyc.gov/landuse.

For anyone with us in person, please see one of the Sergeants-at-Arms to submit a speaker's card.

If you prefer to submit written testimony, you can always do so by emailing to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

There being no members of the public who wish to testify on LU items 436 through 438 regarding the special permits and site selection acquisition relating to Herkimer-Williams Development Project, the public hearing is now closed and the items are laid over.

I will now open the public hearing on LU item 439 regarding the 18-15 Francis Lewis Boulevard Commercial Overlay Proposal. The applicant is seeking to map a commercial overlay over an existing R3-2 residential zoning district to make an existing dental office a conforming use.

For anyone wishing to testify regarding this proposal remotely, if you have not already done so, you must register online by visiting the Council's website at council.nyc.gov/landuse.

For anyone with us in person, please see one of the Sergeants-at-Arms to submit a speaker's card.

If you prefer to submit written testimony, you can always do so by emailing it to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

I will now call the advocate panel for this proposal, which consists of Todd Dale.

Counsel, can you please administer the affirmation.

SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Could we post Mr. Dale on the screens?

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Todd Dale?

TODD DALE: Yes. Hello.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: All right. Here we go.

TODD DALE: Here we go.

SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Hello. Could you please raise your right hand and state your name for the record.

TODD DALE: My name is Todd Dale.

SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Do you swear to tell the truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony today and in response to Council Member questions?

TODD DALE: I do so swear.

SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL VIDAL: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. You can now begin. I just please ask that you restate your name and organization for the record. You may begin.

TODD DALE: Sure. Good morning, Chair and Committee. My name is Todd Dale. I'm here on behalf of Rothkrug Rothkrug and Spector for this particular application. This application is seeking a Zoning Map Amendment to establish a C1-2 commercial district overlay within an existing R3-2 district that will encompass Block 478 Lot 35 in Queens, rezoning the site to an R3-2/C1-2 district. If you could move to the next slide, please.

Lot 35 within block 478, 1815 Francis Lewis Boulevard, is a triangular parcel bounded by 18th Avenue, 160th Street, and Francis Lewis Boulevard located in Community Board 7's District. The lot has approximately 2,990 square feet. I'm sorry there's a little typo there on the screen, but it is 2,900 square feet and it does encompass this entire block. The current zoning is R3-2 with no special district. The site is currently developed

with a two-story building that contains medical office use with multiple tenants. Next slide, please.

The area is characterized by a mix of uses, residential and commercial. Residential is primarily in the interior blocks to the east and the west of the site, and along Francis Lewis, there is primarily commercial and community facility development including a gas station and an auto repair facility to the north of the site and medical office to the west and then a restaurant and a bank to the south of the site. Next slide, please.

I think we can actually, next slide. I think it's one more after this and then next slide, please.

So, this proposal is seeking to connect an existing C1-2 commercial overlay that is immediately north and south of the site to create a continuous C1-2 overlay. The C1-2 overlay that's existing north and south of the site has been there since the establishment of the zoning map in 1961 and this block which is in between. This action would essentially extend the commercial overlay to create a consistent overlay that runs through the site. The

result of this would allow the current use to be as-of-right. Next slide, please.

So as noted, this existing building at the site is a two-story building that contains currently medical office use. It was developed pursuant to Board of Standard Appeals actions that predate the current zoning resolution 1961. The grant allowed for the development of the building and for the use in what was at that time an area F residential district. And the use has been continuous for the past 65 years as office use pursuant to the grant. As a result of this action, no change in use of the existing building is proposed and no change to the bulk of the building is proposed. What it would do is it would create a consistent mapping of this commercial overlay on Francis Lewis Boulevard and allow the existing and historical use of the building to be as-of-right. It would allow the property owner who has owned the site for over 30 years to avoid returning to the Board of Standard Appeals for costly and timely extensions of variance and allow for consistency with tenants and leases and financing with respect to banks.

I'm happy to answer any other questions that the Committee may have about this particular application.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you so much. I just have two questions. Do you have plans on extending the existing dental office?

TODD DALE: There are no plans to change the building whatsoever. The existing dental office there is one of a few tenants that are in there. The grant of the Board of Standard Appeals in '60 allowed office use. It's primarily been medical office use but it allowed professional office or medical use. There's no plans to change the building whatsoever or to change the uses and, as noted, the owner has owned this site for 30 years and just wants to continue it, and this would allow them to continue use of the building as-of-right.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Although you testify that there's no plan for a new development at this time, do you think there may come a time that you may develop a mixed-use building that includes both the dental office and residential usage above it?

TODD DALE: I don't believe that there is as there's no intent to do that and I don't believe

that there would be an intent going forward. As noted, the development along Francis Lewis is primarily commercial and community facility, and the existing building is developed in a fashion where it is designed for office use and not residential use. Any change to the building would require a review of the permitted bulk of the building and, at this point, you know, because they haven't analyzed it, I'm not sure any additional floor area could be added to this particular building.

CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Okay. Thank you so much.

There being no questions for this panel, this panel is excused.

There being no other members of the public who wish to testify on LU Item 439 regarding the 18-15 Francis Lewis Boulevard Commercial Overlay Proposal, the public hearing is now closed and the items are laid over.

That concludes today's business.

I would like to thank the members of the public, my Colleagues, Subcommittee Counsel, Land Use and other Council Staff, and the Sergeant-at-Arms for participating in today's meeting.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

47

2 This meeting is hereby adjourned. Thanks.

3 [GAVEL]

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 14, 2025