

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

October 13, 2016
Start: 1:37 p.m.
Recess: 3:08 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
The Speaker of the Council
LETITIA JAMES
The Public Advocate

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Inez E. Dickens
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Daniel R. Garodnick

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson
David G. Greenfield
Barry S. Grodenchik
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Randi Herman
First Vice President
Council of School Supervisors and
Administrators

Herman Merritt
Director
Council of School Supervisors and
Administrators

John Khani
Assistant Director
Council of School Supervisors and
Administrators

Mitra Lutchman
Legislative Liaison/Retiree Chapter
Council of School Supervisors and
Administrators

Gabriel Gallucci
Associate Political Director
Council of School Supervisors and
Administrators

Joan Malin
President and CEO
Planned Parenthood of New York City

Rabbi Mark Kaiserman
Invocation
The Reform Temple of Forest Hills

2 [sound check]

3 [pause]

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: ...device, cell phones,
5 pagers, please silence those at this time. Any food
6 and beverages, please remove from the chamber. Thank
7 you.

8 [pause]

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Hello. Okay,
10 we're gonna get started. Our first one is...
11 [interpose, background comments] is Danny Dromm.
12 Danny Dromm has a Proclamation to CSA, proclaiming
13 National Principal Month; if the CSA reps can come
14 up. And where is the Council Member? Oh, okay; here
15 he is. [laugh] I just... Alright, Council Member
16 Dromm.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Well thank you
18 very much Speaker Mark-Viverito; it is indeed a
19 pleasure and an honor to be able to present this
20 Proclamation in honor of National Principals Month to
21 the Council of Supervisors and Administrators who
22 represent our principals in our New York City public
23 school system.

24 You know when I first started teaching, I
25 was told that a principal could walk into a classroom

1
2 and in about two minutes size up what's going on, and
3 I think the same thing is true when you walk into our
4 New York City public schools -- you walk in the door,
5 you get the atmosphere of a good welcoming feeling in
6 that school because you know that there is good,
7 strong leadership in that school and I have to say
8 that sometimes myself, I've been a little bit guilty
9 of when I talk about educators I say teachers and not
10 inclusive of our administrators and oftentimes our
11 administrators, our principals and assistant
12 principals don't get all the recognition that they
13 deserve. And our leaders are fighters in our schools
14 for reform, they are leading the movement, they are
15 improving our test scores in the city and for that
16 they also deserve to be congratulated. And they are
17 the hardest working and maybe the least recognized in
18 our public school system, but that's why we wanted to
19 do this Proclamation for all of you here today. So
20 I'm gonna ask the City Clerk to read the Proclamation
21 and then we're going to hear from the Vice President,
22 Randi Herman.

23 [cheers, applause]

24 CITY CLERK: Council, City of New York
25 Proclamation. In observance of October as National

1
2 Principals Month, the New York City Council is proud
3 to honor our city's hardworking principals for their
4 outstanding work as educators, motivator and
5 advocates for educational excellence. And whereas,
6 principals are among the hardest working yet often
7 least recognized individuals in education; they are
8 expected to be educational visionaries, instructional
9 leaders, assessment experts, disciplinarians,
10 community builders, public relations experts, budget
11 analysts, facility managers, special programs
12 administrators, and guardians of numerous legal,
13 contractual and policy mandates and initiatives as
14 well as being entrusted with the education and
15 development of our young people.

16 And whereas, in addition to performing
17 the vital role in successfully implementing the Every
18 Student Succeeds Act (ESSA), a principal is the
19 mobilizing force behind any school reform efforts;
20 with vision, dedication and determination, they set
21 the academic tone for their schools and work
22 collaboratively with teachers to develop and maintain
23 high curriculum standard, development mission
24 statement and set performance goals and objectives

1
2 for schools to achieve educational excellence
3 throughout the year.

4 And whereas, the New York City Council is
5 committed to supporting middle level and high school
6 principals, assistant principals and other school
7 leaders across the five boroughs for their excellent
8 achievements in promoting high professional
9 standards, focusing attention on school challenges,
10 strengthening confidence in public education, and
11 upholding the role of the principal both in and
12 outside of the school.

13 And whereas, recognizing the profound
14 impact that school principals and assistant
15 principals at all grade levels have upon the success
16 of New York City elementary and secondary school
17 students, the City Council encourages all New Yorkers
18 to take this opportunity to reaffirm our appreciation
19 for their incredible and enduring contributions.

20 Now therefore be it known, that the
21 Council of the City of New York designates October
22 2016 as National Principals Month and gratefully
23 recognizes the Council of School Supervisors and
24 Administrators for their extraordinary work that
25 ensures that every child has access to a high quality

1
2 education. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the
3 Entire Council; Daniel Dromm, Chair, Education
4 Committee.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very
6 much. [applause, cheers] And Randi, before I let
7 you speak, I wanna tell you -- see how many Council
8 Members joined in here, because they do take this
9 very seriously and they know when the principals are
10 here, you gotta be on time and show up. [laughter]
11 So we are also joined today by Herman Merritt, the
12 Political Director -- Herman; [cheers, applause] John
13 Khani -- thank you John for being here; Mitra
14 Lutchman, who is a retired principal; and Gabriel
15 Gallucci, the Associate Political Director.
16 [background comments] Thank you for joining us
17 today. Randi.

18 RANDI HERMAN: Wow. On behalf of our
19 6,000 active CSA members who are in our schools right
20 now, this is incredible and we appreciate it very
21 much. We've been at this as a union since 1962; this
22 is the first Proclamation we've gotten [cheers,
23 background comments, applause] from the City Council
24 in honor of National Principals Month and we are most
25 appreciative.

1
2 Representing our retired CSA members, our
3 principals; as you mentioned, you have Mr. Herman
4 Merritt, Mr. John Khani and Mr. Mitra Lutchman --
5 they represent over 10,000 CSA retirees across the
6 country. Great leaders make great schools and we
7 thank you for your acknowledgment and for your
8 support over the years. Thank you so much.

9 [background comment, applause, cheers]

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you so
11 much. [background comments, laughter, applause]
12 Thank you so much. [background comments] One more
13 Proclamation for today and it's gonna be done by
14 Laurie Cumbo for Planned Parenthood celebrating its
15 100th anniversary. [cheers, applause] So whoever
16 the reps for Planned Parenthood are, if you can come
17 up, and I'll pass the mic to -- where's Laurie?
18 [background comments] Council Member Cumbo -- okay...
19 oh. [background comments] Alright.

20 [background comments, cheers]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Hello everyone.
22 Hi, my name is Laurie Cumbo; I am the City Council
23 Member for the 35th District and also Co-Chair of the
24 Women's Caucus with Helen Rosenthal, representing
25 Manhattan, and we are all here today wearing

1
2 different shades of pink and purple, because there
3 are so many dynamic and incredible things going on
4 today, but I am proud to present Planned Parenthood
5 with this Proclamation for over 100 years of service
6 [cheers, applause] to the United States of America.
7 Planned Parenthood has been a valuable resource for
8 millions of people throughout the past century and
9 without it, our country as we know it would not be
10 what it is today. Because of Planned Parenthood, 1.5
11 million people per year receive sex education;
12 because of Planned Parenthood, over 1 million women
13 per year receive pregnancy tests; because of Planned
14 Parenthood, hundreds of thousands of women receive
15 prenatal care, pap smears, cervical cancer screenings
16 and breast exams. In other words, Planned Parenthood
17 is saving lives every single day. [cheers, applause]
18 Not to mention, almost 80% of Planned Parenthood
19 patients have incomes at or below 150% of the federal
20 poverty level; without Planned Parenthood, these
21 women, our women's economic status may have prevent
22 them from having access to these important
23 privileges.

24 I would like to thank and congratulate
25 Joan Malin, President and CEO of Planned Parenthood

1
2 of New York City. [cheers, applause] I'd also like
3 to thank Katie Danziger, the Board Chair of Planned
4 Parenthood of New York City. [cheers, applause] And
5 I wanna thank a few other people for their tireless
6 advocacy. I'd like to thank Elizabeth Adams,
7 Director of Government Relations of Planned
8 Parenthood of New York City. [cheers, applause]
9 Lastly, I'd like to thank the following members of
10 the City Council -- Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito,
11 [cheers] the entire Women's Caucus, the... [cheers]
12 that's right... [laughter] the incredible men that
13 stand with us today and they are fighting for
14 reproductive rights every single day and there are
15 two men that absolutely had to be here or they could
16 not go home -- Council Member Dan Garodnick and
17 Council Member Brad Lander, [cheers, applause] and
18 I'm so proud to serve with all of you. Planned
19 Parenthood, you are what makes New York and this
20 nation a great place and we are so appreciative of
21 your service that has impacted the lives of everyone
22 -- myself included -- I thank you so much and this
23 Proclamation is presented to you. Thank you.
24 [cheers, applause, background comments] If the Clerk
25 could read the Proclamation at this time.

CITY CLERK: Council, City of New York

Proclamation. On October 16, 1916, Margaret Sanger, Ethel Byrne and Fania Mindell opened the first birth control health clinic in the United States at 46 Amboy Street in Brownsville, Brooklyn, New York. At that time this was a truly groundbreaking act, for it was founded on the belief that women should have the information and care they need to live strong, healthy lives and fulfill their dreams. Nine days later the founders were jailed and the clinic was shut down, but a movement was born; new clinics known as Mothers' Health Centers opened in Manhattan and the Bronx and within a few years they would all become branches of Planned Parenthood of New York City.

And whereas, for the last 100 years Planned Parenthood has provided essential health care services to millions of women, men and people worldwide, helping to empower individuals to make informed decisions about their own health care and transforming the way they live, love, learn and work.

And whereas, today Planned Parenthood of New York City continues to be a leader in providing sexual and reproductive health care services,

1 including contraception, abortion, HIV testing, STD
2 testing and treatment, breast and cervical cancer
3 screenings to more than 64,000 New Yorkers every year
4 regardless of immigration status, gender identity or
5 ability to pay. It also serves another 25,000 New
6 Yorkers annually through educational programs, to
7 youth, caregivers and immigrant communities.
8

9 And whereas, at this special milestone we
10 not only reflect upon Planned Parenthood's incredible
11 legacy of service, but reaffirm our support for its
12 continued success in the years ahead.

13 Now therefore be it known, that the
14 Council of the City of New York, including all
15 members of its Women's Caucus, honors Planned
16 Parenthood of New York City in celebration of its
17 100th anniversary and it's ex... [interpose, background
18 comment, cheers, applause] and it's extraordinary
19 commitment [laughter] to ensuring that all New
20 Yorkers have access to the reproductive and sexual
21 health care they need and deserve. Melissa Mark-
22 Viverito, Speaker for the Entire Council; Laurie A.
23 Cumbo, Co-Chair Women's Caucus; [cheers] Helen
24 Rosenthal, Co-Chair Women's Caucus, and the members
25

1 [cheer] of the Women's Caucus. [cheers, background
2 comments]
3

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright.

5 JOAN MALIN: Okay, thank you so much.

6 I'm Joan Malin and I'm the President and CEO of
7 Planned Parenthood of New York City. [cheers] It is
8 an honor to be here today to accept this Proclamation
9 from the City Council on behalf of our 100th year
10 anniversary.

11 For 100 years we have been part of the
12 fabric of this incredible city; people come here to
13 build their lives and their futures and people come
14 to Planned Parenthood for the very same reasons -- to
15 lead healthy lives and fulfill their dreams.

16 Planned Parenthood of New York City, once
17 a single birth control clinic in Brownsville, now
18 serves more than 64,000 New Yorkers a year, with five
19 health centers -- one in each borough -- [cheers] we
20 provide comprehensive sexuality education to another
21 25,000 youth, adults and professionals; many programs
22 supported by the New York City Council, and I thank
23 you all for that tremendous support. And over the
24 past 100 years we've changed and adapted to make sure
25 that we meet the needs of the communities we serve.

1
2 From one clinic in Brooklyn, Planned Parenthood is
3 now in every state, serving 2.5 million patients
4 every year and 72 million people at Planned
5 Parenthood online in a year. It is almost impossible
6 to imagine a world without Planned Parenthood.

7 We are 100 years strong and only getting
8 stronger and we could not have done this without you.
9 Thank you to the City Council. You are a leader for
10 progressive change to ensure that all New Yorkers
11 have access to sexual and reproductive health care,
12 which frankly is in stark contrast to many places
13 around the country. You have held crisis pregnancy
14 centers accountable for misleading women about their
15 health care options, making sure that emergency
16 contraception is available to all who need it, when
17 they need it; you have protected access to our
18 clinics and helped us to open our beautiful new
19 health center in Queens just over [cheers] ago --
20 yes. [cheers, applause] Your support helps us make
21 good on our promise of care, no matter what, and
22 you've stood with us not just in good times, but in
23 bad times as well. When Planned Parenthood came
24 under attack in the summer of 2015, you all stepped
25

1
2 up and showed us tremendous support; we were and
3 continue to be so grateful.

4 Planned Parenthood of New York City is
5 indebted to the Speaker, to Council, Melissa Mark-
6 Viverito, who has been a champion for reproductive
7 health; we are strongly grateful to the co-chairs of
8 the Women's Caucus, Laurie Cumbo and Helen Rosenthal,
9 and Chair of the Health Committee, Corey Johnson, who
10 have time and time shown their support and dedication
11 to protecting and advancing reproductive rights.

12 Thank you to all of you.

13 We know there's still much more to do and
14 that we will be here for many more years to come;
15 with your partnership, Planned Parenthood of New York
16 City will remain a resource for all New Yorkers,
17 regardless of their race, gender, ability, ethnicity,
18 age, immigration status, or income; we are there for
19 everyone, no matter what. Our vision has always been
20 to work towards a world where people have full
21 control of their bodies and destiny. As we celebrate
22 100 years of health care, education and activism, we
23 are proud to launch our second century with as much
24 passion, courage and conviction as our first to make

1 this vision a reality. Thank you very much.

2 [background comments, cheers, applause]

3
4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Well thank you so
5 much; it means a lot to have you here and **[inaudible]**
6 be able to support, so let's move on to another 100
7 years. [background comments] Right? [cheers,
8 applause] Alright.

9 [background comments]

10 [pause]

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: ...get started; if
12 all the men can come up. There's only 14 women, so
13 it's gonna be a big group, unfortunately. Alright,
14 the men can come up -- I think they wanna take a
15 photo with the men in pink, the men in pink.

16 [background comments] Yes. Alright. Yes, the men
17 in pink. [background comments] This is one time
18 when I'll say it's okay for women, you've gotta get
19 off the floor. [laughter, background comments]

20 Yeah, we support the men. [background comments]

21 Alright. [background comments]

22 [pause]

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Could I have your
24 attention please? Quiet on the floor please, quiet
25 on the floor. [background comments] Quiet please.

1 [gavel] [background comments] At this time, please
2 place all electronic devices to vibrate, all
3 electronic devices to vibrate. Will all non-Council
4 employees, non-Council employees please leave the
5 main floor of the chambers? [background comments]
6 There is additional seating upstairs in the balcony.
7 Thank you.

8 [pause]

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
10 chambers please. Everyone please have their seats.
11 Thank you. Please clear the aisles. [background
12 comments]
13

14 All rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

16 [background comments]

17 [collective Pledge of Allegiance]

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

19 Thank you. Roll call.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron. Borelli.
21 Cabrera.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 19

2 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

7 [background comment]

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here... [crosstalk]

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Eugene here.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. [laughter]

25 Ferreras Copeland. [background comments] Garodnick.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.
COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.
COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.
COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik.
COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson. Kallos.
COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: King.
COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.
COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.
COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman. Lander.
COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin. Levine.
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.
COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

21

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present.
3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.
5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Present.
7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.
9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I'm here [sic].
11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.
13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.
15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.
16 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.
17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose. Rosenthal.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.
19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca.
20 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.
21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres. Treyger.
22 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.
23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.
24 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.
25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo. Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet
in the chambers. All rise for the invocation.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The invocation
will be delivered -- quiet in the chambers -- will be
delivered by Rabbi Mark Kaiserman, The Reform Temple
of Forest Hills, located at 71-11 112th Street,
Forest Hills, Queens, New York. Quiet in the
chambers.

RABBI KAISERMAN: Yesterday was Yom
Kippur, the holiest day on the Jewish calendar, so
needless to say, I'm quite tired. It is a day that
speaks of repentance and regret, holiness and hope.
Our prayers are often directed to fate as to what is
in store for the year to come, yet we know truly our
future is also defined by our own actions and our

1 intentions. As this Council meets, they will be
2 confronted with many things out of their control, God
3 give them the strength to recognize the potency of
4 their responses. Let God's will not be our shield
5 but our inspiration; let "it was meant to be" not be
6 our credo but inspire us as to what we can do next.
7 Oh God shelter and safeguard our public servants,
8 watch over our community, the City of New York, and
9 all those who seek a better future and let us all
10 find the power to weather any storm because we know
11 tomorrow's possibilities are endless and we work
12 together. Amen.

14 [background comments]

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.
16 Motion to spread the invocation by Council Member
17 Karen Koslowitz. Quiet in the chambers.

18 [background comments]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Motion to
20 spread the invocation in full upon the record. And I
21 just wanna say that we are very lucky in Forest Hills
22 [background comment] to have Rabbi Kaiserman lead his
23 congregation, who consists of hundreds of people who
24 belong to The Reform Temple of Forest Hills and I
25 thank him very, very much for his leadership. And I

1
2 also wanna recognize Phyllis Rosenberg, a past
3 president of The Reform Temple of Forest Hills.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you Council
5 Member. Adoption of Minutes. Council Member Dromm.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Motion that the
7 Minutes of the Stated Meeting of September 14, 2016
8 be adopted as printed.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
10 Messages and papers from the Mayor.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: M 449, submitting
12 Laurie Hawkinson for appointment to the Art
13 Commission.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules, Privileges
15 and Elections.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
17 from City, County and Borough Offices.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: M 450 and 451, Third
19 Party Transfer Program.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Housing and
21 Buildings.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: M 452, recommending
23 John Flateau to the Board of Elections.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules, Privileges
25 and Elections.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 25

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: M 453, recommending
3 Jose Araujo to the Board of Elections.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules, Privileges
5 and Elections.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
7 communications.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-
10 Ups.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: M 454 and 455, ULURP
12 items.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on Call-
14 Up Vote. Roll call.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Roll call. Quiet
16 in the chambers please.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Borelli.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I vote aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I would like to
22 aye on all call-ups and with permission, I'd like to
23 vote on all call-ups, general orders and resolutions.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I vote aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin.
COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.
COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.
COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.
COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.
COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.
COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.
COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.
COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.
COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.
COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene.
COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 27
2 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Aye.
3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.
5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.
7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I'd like to vote
9 aye on all call-ups and with permission, I'd like to
10 vote on all coupled general orders and resolutions.
11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you Madam
13 Public Advocate. I vote aye on all. Thank you.
14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.
16 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.
17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.
19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.
20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.
21 COMMITTEE CLERK: King.
22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: King.
23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.
24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.
25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Johnson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Permission to
vote on items on the call-up calendar and general
order calendar.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I vote aye on
all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I would like to
vote on all land use call-ups and with permission,

1
2 I'd like to vote on all coupled general orders and
3 resolutions.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you and I
6 vote aye on all.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye. I would
22 like ask permission to vote on all general orders.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye and
25 congratulations to United Here Local 100 for getting

1
2 the bill that they were supporting, the Food Service
3 Workers Retention Act being on the floor and with the
4 support of the Speaker [sic] and everyone, hopefully
5 we'll pass today. Aye.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye on all
17 call-ups and I ask permission to vote on all general
18 order calendar items.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye on all.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I vote aye.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Permission to vote
on all... [interpose]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Thank you. And I
also want to commend Council Member Daneek Miller for
having a great day with his legislation. I vote aye
on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

[background comments]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We too wanna
recognize Unite Here and congratulations in advance.
We also wanna recognize students [background
comments] from the Brooklyn Collaborative School,
uhm... [cheer] just... shhh... right? I believe they're

1
2 from Brownsville, New York -- no... right? No? Okay,
3 well welcome anyway. [laugh]

4 Today's Land Use Call-Ups were adopted by
5 a vote of 48 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative...
6 quiet in the chambers... as we now hear from the
7 Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito.

8 [background comments]

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madam
10 Public Advocate. I wanna ask my colleagues to rise.

11 [background comments]

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise to your
14 feet.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We rise today to
16 take a moment of silence for the untimely passing of
17 Brooklyn District Attorney Ken Thompson.

18 Ken was an outstanding public servant, an
19 unabashed champion for true criminal justice reform.
20 He was only able to serve the borough for a short
21 time, but his initiatives to make the court system a
22 fair place for Brooklynites have evolved the District
23 Attorney's Office for the better and will continue to
24 resonate well into the future.

1
2 I send my deepest condolences to District
3 Attorney Thompson's family and to those among us who
4 knew him today. This is not only a loss for
5 Brooklyn; it's a loss for the City of New York.

6 I also wanna note -- we have... just to
7 say, you know we have partnered with the District
8 Attorney on many issues and this Council has really
9 been also fighting on criminal justice reform, so he
10 was a true partner with us, hand in hand, on trying
11 to make the system more fair, so he is very much a
12 loss to us all.

13 I also wanna note, obviously, of the
14 devastation of Hurricane Matthew across the
15 Caribbean, particularly Haiti, obviously Florida,
16 North Carolina and a lot of the southeastern coast
17 was affected by Hurricane Matthew, but the true
18 devastation really was the incredible death and the
19 destruction in Haiti as well. So any staff who is
20 interested, we are looking to support those efforts
21 and we would encourage people to support.

22 We'd like to take a moment of silence for
23 all those that we've lost.

24 [moment of silence]

25 Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Continuing our commitment to a greener [background comments, shhh] and more efficient New York, today the Council will vote on a package of green building legislation. This legislation is another important step toward meeting our goal of reducing citywide green house gas emissions 80% by 2050.

Int. 1160, sponsored by Council Member Costa Constantinides will require owners of midsize buildings to install electrical sub-meters in tenant spaces allowing tenants to monitor their own energy consumption and adjust usage habits as necessary.

Int. 1163-A, sponsored by Council Member Dan Garodnick, will require owners of midsize buildings to benchmark their buildings' annual energy and water usage and report that usage information back to the City.

And Int. 1165, sponsored by Council Member Donovan Richards, would require lighting system upgrades in midsize buildings so they are in compliance with the standards for new systems set forth in the updated New York City energy conservation code.

1
2 Each of these pieces of legislation will
3 be hugely helpful in ensuring that New York City
4 meets its emissions goals and the reporting measures
5 in particular will provide us with a significant
6 amount of information on how sustainably our city's
7 buildings are operating.

8 Staff -- I wanna thank Sarah Gastelum,
9 Jose Conde, Guillermo Patino, Meagan Chen and Jenn
10 Wilcox. I'm gonna ask Costa Constantinides to say a
11 few words, followed by Council Member Garodnick and
12 then Council Member Richards. Costa.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you
14 Madam Speaker.

15 As we move forward towards the goal of
16 reducing carbon emissions by 80% by 2050, [background
17 comments] we must consider all pathways to get there.
18 Over 70% of our city's carbon emissions come from
19 buildings and encouraging sustainable energy
20 consumption habits will decrease these emissions.
21 Int. 1160 will reduce our energy uses and help combat
22 the effects of climate change.

23 Currently, buildings over 50,000 gross
24 square feet are required to have installed electrical
25 sub-meters in tenant spaces by 2025. This bill would

1
2 expand these requirements to buildings over 25,000
3 gross square feet. Sub-metering tenant spaces will
4 encourage occupants to use energy more efficiently
5 and help make better, responsible energy consumption
6 choices. Combined with Int. 1163, this policy will
7 stimulate over \$100 million in economic activity and
8 will save \$35 million per year in energy costs.

9 These policies combined will reduce greenhouse gas
10 emissions by 60,000 metric tons per year, the
11 equivalent of taking 12,000 cars off the road. I am
12 proud that this policy will reduce the demand on
13 power plants; this will especially impact my
14 district, where over 50% of the city's power is
15 generated in Western Queens.

16 I wanna thank Mayor de Blasio, of course,
17 our bold environmental Speaker, Melissa Mark-
18 Viverito, our Chair of the Housing and Buildings
19 Committee, Jumaane Williams, for their partnership on
20 this legislation. And then staff -- I'd like to
21 thank Winton [sic] Wilcox, Meagan Chen, Jeff Baker
22 and my Legislative Director, Nick Widzowski. Thank
23 you.

24 [background comments]
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
3 much Madam Speaker.

4 I am very pleased the City Council today
5 is voting on Int. 1163, which will expand the list of
6 buildings required to be benchmarked for energy and
7 water [background comments] efficiency, from all
8 buildings 50,000 square feet and above, to all
9 buildings 25,000 square feet and above. New York
10 City currently requires owners of buildings that are
11 at least 50,000 square feet to submit information
12 about their water and energy use to a benchmarking
13 tool. Benchmarking -- essentially, evaluating data
14 as compared to a set standard -- can be a useful tool
15 in helping building owners identify where there may
16 be inefficiencies in their utility usage; it gives
17 them ability to understand how much water and energy
18 they use and the information to know whether that
19 measures up to how much they should be using to run
20 their building sustainably. With roughly 70% of all
21 greenhouse gas emissions in the city coming from
22 buildings, we need this data to manage the challenge.
23 This bill will give us even more information to help
24 us promote energy efficiency initiatives, and I'm
25 happy to report that as a result of our efforts in

1
2 this process, utility companies will now
3 automatically populate energy data for the smaller
4 newly impacted buildings so that this requirement
5 does not become a burden.

6 The City and building owners are natural
7 partners in the effort to setting our sights higher
8 towards greener utility usage practices and I look
9 forward to continuing this partnership in the future.

10 I wanna thank you Madam Speaker and my
11 colleagues, as well as Committee Counsel Jenn Wilcox,
12 of course the Chair of the Committee, Costa
13 Constantinides, and I look forward to passing the
14 bill today. Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Good afternoon.
16 I'm proud to stand here today with Speaker Melissa
17 Mark-Viverito and colleagues to continue our push to
18 make New York a greener, more sustainable city by
19 combating climate change and preserving our coastal
20 neighborhoods for our future generations.

21 Nature continues to provide evidence of
22 how important it is that we take this responsibility
23 seriously. We just witnessed another serious storm
24 ravage Haiti and the states of Florida, Georgia and
25 South Carolina; this is why energy conservation is so

1
2 important today. We are too wasteful in New York, so
3 we must cut our consumption everywhere that we can.
4 My bill Int. 1165 will reduce the size threshold that
5 mandates lighting upgrades in buildings from 50,000
6 square feet to 25,000 square feet. This lower
7 threshold will include over 10,000 more buildings and
8 ensure that they are in compliance by January 1, 2025
9 with the standards for new systems set forth in the
10 New York City energy conservation code.

11 In conjunction with the current mandate,
12 buildings will be required to have interior lighting
13 controls, light reduction controls and motion
14 sensors; they will also be mandated to comply with
15 the standard for tandem wiring, exit signs, interior
16 lighting power requirements and exterior lighting.
17 Calling for voluntary reductions will not get us
18 sizable results; turning lights off is a simple
19 commonsense measure and this legislation accomplishes
20 this goal while also saving business owners from
21 unnecessarily large electricity bills. Energy
22 efficiency is the new standard and we all have to
23 play or part as good stewards of God's green earth.

24 I'd like to thank Mayor de Blasio,
25 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, both Chairs Costa

1
2 Constantinides and Jumaane Williams, Jennifer Wilcox,
3 and Meagan Chen in our legislative division, and my
4 Director of Legislation, Jordan Gibbons and all the
5 advocates including Climate Works for All, who have
6 proven their dedication to the environment time and
7 time again. Thank you.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. Next
9 we're gonna be voting on an addition to the Food
10 Service Worker Retention Act, which will extend
11 additional employment protections to food service
12 workers in the city. Int. 1011-A, sponsored by
13 Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez expands the Food
14 Service Worker Retention Act to require that when an
15 owner or operator of a venue changes food service
16 contractors, that new contractor must retain existing
17 workers for a period of 90 days. At the end of those
18 90 days workers will be evaluated and offered
19 continued employment if their work is deemed
20 satisfactory.

21 I wanna thank on the staff side here --
22 Matt Carlin, Rob Newman, Gafar Zaaloff, Kendall
23 Stephenson, and ask Ydanis to say a few words.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
25 Speaker for your strong leadership, helping us to

1 pass this bill and other important bills in our city.
2 With the passage of this law today, workers will be
3 able keep their jobs when new management comes in for
4 at least 90 days, a period where they can show their
5 worth in the job and show the new manager that they
6 are the most capable person for the job. It also
7 means that if they are not going to be retained, they
8 will have a period to find a new job while still able
9 to earn a paycheck for three months. This bill is
10 about protecting working families, ensuring that they
11 have greater peace of mind when turnover occurs in
12 the workplace. I am especially proud because as a
13 city are continuing to expand these rights across
14 multiple industries -- first, building service
15 workers, then grocery store workers and today food
16 service workers. The rights of workers are what
17 hold... keep a strong working class and middle class
18 driving in New York City and I'm proud to stand with
19 these hardworking -- with all hardworking New Yorkers
20 as we support this bill. Thank you.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. The
23 next package of legislation is gonna increase the
24 demographic information gathered on forms
25 administered by several City agencies; these bills

1
2 will better recognize the diversity of New Yorkers
3 and allow City agencies to better serve residents.

4 Int. 251-A and 552-A, sponsored by
5 Council Member Danny Dromm, allow for the addition of
6 questions regarding ancestry and languages spoken and
7 sexual orientation and gender identity, as well as
8 the development of a manual and training program for
9 agency staff who will be administering the surveys.

10 Int. 551-A, sponsored by Council Member
11 Margaret Chin, will give participants the option to
12 self-identify multiracial ancestry or ethnic origin
13 in City forms.

14 The Mayor's Office of Operations would
15 then be required to conduct an annual review of all
16 forms that collect demographic information completed
17 by persons seeking the services and are within the
18 administering agency's authority to amend. Each
19 agency that provides a survey would also be required
20 to evaluate its provision of services in
21 consideration of the data collected and submit a
22 report to the council on any new or modified services
23 developed based on the data.

24 I wanna thank Smita Deshmukh, Andrea
25 Vazquez and Brad Reid, who helped with this

1
2 legislation, and I'll ask Council Member Dromm to say
3 a few words, followed by Council Member Chin.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very
5 much Madam Speaker.

6 Demographic data collection may not seem
7 like the sexiest issue, but is extremely important.
8 In order to determine how well the City is serving
9 our diverse populations, we need to ask whom
10 precisely the City is serving. This is a key
11 question for policymakers and funders alike, and
12 without data, communities are left without a critical
13 advocacy tool. Essentially, this package of bills
14 will require the modernization of demographic forms
15 to enhance the design, delivery and development of
16 city services.

17 In particular, Int. 251-A will require
18 that the Department of Social Services, the
19 Administration for Children's Services, the
20 Department of Homeless Services, the Department of
21 Health and Mental Hygiene, Department for the Aging,
22 Department of Youth and Community Development, and
23 the Department of Education [background comments]
24 collect data [background comment] on the City's top
25 30 ethnicities and languages. This includes the

1
2 disaggregation of the Asian category into Chinese,
3 Korean, Indian, Pakistani, Bangladeshi, and so on.
4 The bill also means that Arab, Dominican and Guyanese
5 New Yorkers, among many others, will be able to
6 identify themselves on such City forms.
7 Significantly, this bill provides for a write-in
8 option to aid in the identification of emerging
9 communities.

10 Int. 552-A will require the collection of
11 data on sexual orientation and gender identity. This
12 means that for the first time lesbian, gay, bisexual,
13 transgender, and queer and questioning New Yorkers
14 will be able to see themselves reflected in City-
15 collected demographic data. The legislation also
16 provides for a valuable training component to ensure
17 that staff interacting with individuals filling out
18 forms will do so in a sensitive and informed way.

19 As a 25-year veteran schoolteacher and
20 someone who came out in a very public way during the
21 Children of the Rainbow Curriculum Debate, I am very
22 happy that we were able to ensure the inclusion of
23 the Department of Education. The DOE will be
24 tremendously helped in its efforts to combat
25

1
2 homophobia and transphobia and strengthen its
3 programming to LGBTQ students and their families.

4 Thank you Speaker Mark-Viverito,
5 Committee Chairs Kallos and Levin, Committee Counsel
6 Brad Reid and Andrea Vazquez, Rachel Cordero and
7 Laura Popa for all your work through the long process
8 of negotiating Int. 251-A and 252-A. I also wanna
9 thank Council Member Chin, my partner, for her
10 efforts on Int. 551-A and my Counsel, Sebastian
11 Maguire.

12 With the passage of these bills, New York
13 City's LGBTQ and diverse ethnic communities will be
14 able to finally say now we count. Thank you very
15 much.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Madam
17 Speaker. Good afternoon. I'm the proud sponsor of
18 Int. 551-A and Reso 472. This bill and resolution
19 are part of a package of bills that I worked with
20 Council Member Danny Dromm to modernize our City's
21 data collection forms to allow New Yorkers to
22 accurately identify their race, ethnicity, gender
23 identity and sexual orientation. These bills are not
24 just about checking off boxes on government forms;
25 these bills are about reflecting the diversity of our

1
2 great city; this effort is about recognizing the
3 people that make our city great -- people like my
4 former Chief of Staff, Yume Kitasei -- Yume, like
5 more than 320,000 New Yorkers is multiracial; she is
6 proud of the rich heritage passed down by both her
7 mother and her father, and like any other New Yorker,
8 she expects to have her full identity recognized by
9 her city. Multiracial New Yorkers deserve to be
10 counted and so do the dozens of Asian Americans and
11 Pacific Islander ethnic groups living in our city.
12 This legislation will ensure that they are also
13 counted and recognized for who they are. This
14 legislative package will ensure City agencies can
15 collect data accurately; it will give us the tools to
16 make policy and deliver culturally competent City
17 services to specific ethnic groups.

18 First I want to thank our Speaker,
19 Melissa Mark-Viverito, for her unwavering support. I
20 also wanna thank my legislative partner, Council
21 Member Danny Dromm, as well as Council Members Kallos
22 and Johnson. Lastly, I want to thank the staff --
23 Andrea Vazquez, Rachel Cordero, Smita Deshmukh, and
24 Laura Wang from the Legislative Division. I also
25 wanna give special thanks to Yume Kitasei, as well as

1
2 my Legislative and Budget Director Vincent Fang and
3 Council Member Dromm's Legislative Director Sebastian
4 Maguire for their hard work on this legislative
5 package and I urge my colleagues to vote in favor of
6 this bill. Thank you.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

8 Finally, the Council will be voting on two pieces of
9 legislation regarding the New York City Police
10 Department.

11 Int. 728-B, sponsored by Council Member
12 Dan Garodnick, is a major step in enhancing
13 transparency for the NYPD. This legislation will
14 require the NYPD to publish its Patrol Guide on its
15 website and to post all updates to the guide within
16 24 hours of the effective date of any amendment.
17 Council Member Garodnick.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you
19 again Madam Speaker. I'm very pleased that the
20 Council today is voting on Int. 728, which as you
21 noted, will require that the NYPD publish its Patrol
22 Guide and subsequent amendments on the department
23 website.

24 The Patrol Guide spells out all the rules
25 that police officers must follow in carrying out

1
2 their duties. These rules cover a variety of
3 different protocols -- for school safety agents,
4 bicycle collisions, handcuffing students arrested
5 within school facilities, photography in the New York
6 City transit system, and more. If the average New
7 Yorker wanted to check the NYPD Patrol Guide, they'd
8 have to FOIL it, they'd have to buy it for \$50 at a
9 local private patrol store or download an unofficial
10 and likely inaccurate or outdated copy off a third
11 party website. None of these options is acceptable
12 or necessary.

13 During the past couple of years there
14 have been many well-publicized instances of
15 supposedly routine police interactions turning
16 harmful or even fatal, including in our own city.
17 Thought these interactions are not representative of
18 the NYPD as a whole, they have raised serious
19 concerns about the relationships between Police
20 Departments and the communities they serve,
21 especially communities of color. This bill will
22 bring increased transparency and accountability to
23 NYPD policies and practices, because New Yorkers will
24 be able to know what to expect in interactions with
25 officers and will be better equipped to speak out if

1
2 procedure is not followed. And for the officers
3 themselves, they will not be unfairly criticized for
4 doing, in many cases, what they are taught and
5 trained to do. There is no reason for secrecy here;
6 the rules governing our officers are extensive, they
7 are carefully crafted, they are learned and tested
8 and the general public should be able to access them.
9 This bill is a simple way to help build the trust
10 that some feel is lacking between police and
11 communities.

12 So I thank you Madam Speaker, Chair
13 Gibson and all of my colleagues and I encourage you
14 to vote for this bill today. Thank you.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. And
16 Int. 959-A, sponsored by Council Member Mark Levine,
17 will require annual hate crime reporting from the
18 NYPD to be disaggregated by the motivation of the
19 assailant, including the race, nationality, sexual
20 orientation, and any disability held by the victim,
21 as well as the demographics of the assailant
22 themselves. The NYPD would then be required to
23 report that data quarterly and annually and to post
24 the data on their website; this is sponsored by
25 Council Member Levine. For both these bills I wanna

1
2 thank Deepa Ambekar and Beth Golub for their work on
3 it, and Council Member Levine will say a few words.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you Madam
5 Speaker.

6 Hate crimes are not just a heinous attack
7 on individual victims; they are an attack on the
8 values that we share as New Yorkers, and that's why
9 the public has an interest in seeing that we attack
10 this scourge and that we can monitor our progress
11 towards reaching that goal. But surprisingly, in an
12 era of copious reporting of crime data by the NYPD
13 through CompStat, we do not report publicly on a
14 regular basis the incidents of hate crimes in New
15 York City. This is particularly important because
16 hate crimes, perhaps more than any other category of
17 crime, fluctuates based on current events -- in the
18 Middle East, in other parts of the United States and
19 because of other causes -- and so we need to know on
20 a regular basis what are the trends in hate crime and
21 I'm pleased that our bill, Int. 959, will do that
22 with quarterly reporting to the public on hate
23 crimes, broken down by every category animus [sic],
24 from race to ethnicity, immigration status, sexual
25 orientation, gender, gender expression, religion, and

1
2 other categories, and for the first time it will
3 report on the demographics of the arrestee. I'm
4 pleased that we are bringing this bill to a vote
5 today and I ask my colleagues to support it. Thank
6 you. [background comments] Can I just thank very
7 briefly your wonderful team who worked hard on this
8 -- Deepa Ambekar, Brian Crow, the entire Legislative
9 Division and my own Amy Slattery, for their hard work
10 on bringing this bill to fruition. Thank you.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. And
12 finally, as we get closer to the election and
13 continue to see an unacceptable rise in Islamophobic
14 rhetoric around the country, I wanna commend Council
15 Member Daneek Miller for his resolution declaring
16 support for Muslim communities, affirming the
17 religious pluralism of the United States and urging
18 all residents to stand together for peace and
19 understanding and invite him to say a few words about
20 the resolution.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Madam
22 Speaker.

23 Again, I'd like to thank Speaker Melissa
24 Mark-Viverito and the 31 other members who co-
25 sponsored Resolution 1230, declaring support for the

1
2 Muslim community, affirming religious pluralism in
3 the United States and urging all residents to stand
4 together for peace, justice and understanding.

5 As the Muslim community continues to push
6 back against the outlandish rhetoric of certain
7 candidates, it is our duty as elected officials from
8 the most diverse city in the world to say enough; the
9 hate and xenophobia we have heard of in the past
10 days, particularly has been hurtful; there has been
11 no doubt this increased violence to Muslims has been
12 because of this such rhetoric. And instance of
13 Islamophobia, it has increased five times greater
14 than the days immediately following September 11th,
15 and in fact, the highest number of attacks on Mosques
16 has been seen since this has been recorded. So the
17 passage of this resolution is not an end to what we
18 see today, but it is an affirmation by this body and
19 by all of those advocates and all of those -- I wanna
20 thank everybody who came out and stood with us on
21 this resolution; it is an affirmation that we as a
22 city stand together and that we are stronger together
23 than we are apart.

24 I'd like to thank everybody; my
25 colleagues for signing on, I'd like to thank again

1
2 the Speaker for her support and the advocates. I'd
3 like to thank Mr. Greg Rose and the Legislative staff
4 for putting this together and I look forward to its
5 passage. Thank you so much.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
7 Member. Just two quick reminders -- tomorrow is --
8 right? -- the deadline to register to vote, so I
9 definitely would encourage that that information get
10 out there. And again, to remind that we are
11 encouraging people, staff to make contributions
12 towards the relief efforts for Haiti and that you can
13 have a donation automatically deducted from your
14 paycheck. And I wanna thank Council Member Eugene
15 for all the work he's been doing on this issue, so
16 we're obviously encouraging support for those
17 efforts, so that if you wanna participate, you can
18 really do so through your employee self-service
19 portal or by contacting the payroll off, and I know
20 that on the Mayor's side, they're also doing the same
21 thing, so there is a call out to City employees to be
22 supportive of these efforts, 'cause we've just been
23 hearing the horrific numbers of the deaths and the
24 devastation that has resulted, so thank you to all my
25

1
2 colleagues and that's it for communication from the
3 Speaker.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 Discussion of general orders. Seeing
6 none. Report of special committees.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
9 standing committees.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
11 on Civil Service and Labor, Int. 1011-A, food service
12 workers.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Give me one
14 second. Amended and coupled on general orders.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
16 on Finance, Int. 1282, various business improvement
17 districts.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
19 general orders.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
21 on General Welfare, Int. 552-A, data regarding sexual
22 orientation.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
24 coupled on general orders.

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
3 on Governmental Operations, Int. 251-A, data
4 regarding ancestry.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
6 coupled on general orders.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 551-A, data
8 regarding multiracial identification.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
10 coupled on general orders.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
12 on Housing and Buildings, Int. 1160, sub-meters in
13 tenant spaces.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
15 general orders.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 1163-A, energy and
17 water efficiency in certain buildings.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
19 coupled on general orders.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 1165, lighting
21 systems in certain buildings.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
23 general orders.

24

25

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
3 on Land Use, LU 453 and Res 1251, property tax
4 exemption.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
6 general orders.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: LUs 475 and 476, zoning
8 amendments.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Approved with
10 modifications and referred to the City Planning
11 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70(b) of the Rules of
12 the Council and Section 197(d) of the New York City
13 Charter.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 477 and Res 1252,
15 off-street parking garage.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
17 general orders.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 478 and Res 1253,
19 zoning amendment.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
21 general orders.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 480 and Res 1254 and
23 LU 481 and Res 1255, Rockaway Beach Hotel.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
25 general orders.

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 489, zoning
3 resolution amendment.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Approved with
5 modifications and referred to the City Planning
6 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70(b) of the Rules of
7 the Council and Section 197(d) of the New York City
8 Charter.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 490 and Res 1256
10 through LU 492 and Res 1258 on Page 4 Zoning Map
11 amendment.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
13 general orders.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
15 on Public Safety, Int. 728-B, NYPD Patrol Guide.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
17 coupled on general orders.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 959-B, hate crime
19 reporting.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
21 coupled on general orders.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: On the general order
23 calendar, resolution appointing various persons,
24 Commissioner of Deeds.

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 general orders and at this time I ask for a roll call
4 on all items on the coupled general order calendar.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
9 except 1011-A.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to
12 explain my vote.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: First I wanted to
15 congratulate all my colleagues on passing important
16 legislation today and I also wanted to specially
17 congratulate Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez for his
18 hard work on Int. 1011-A, also known as the Fast Food
19 Worker Retention Act. Fast food workers are among
20 some of the most vulnerable workers in the service
21 industry and by allowing for a 90-day retention
22 period when there is a change in ownership as well as
23 the right of first refusal for current employees, we
24 can ensure a more civility for food service workers,
25 and thank you to all this hard work and thank you for

1
2 all the advocates who supported this bill. And I
3 vote aye on all. Thank you.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on
8 all.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote aye.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Pass.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 60

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Aye.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Vote aye,

9 with the exception of 1011-A, which I vote no and I
10 congratulate my colleagues on passing their important
11 pieces of legislation.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: King.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Madam Public

20 Advocate, may I explain my vote?

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Wait... [background
23 comments, laughter]

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
25 Koo, you have the floors.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah. Thank you.

Demographic information is increasingly becoming a useful tool for our government [background comments] to shape new programs and services for different communities. We use this information to benefit the many diverse immigrant enclaves and communities that make up New York City; it helps identify the needs of specific groups so the City can provide for them more efficiently. By analyzing the 30 most common ancestry groups and languages used in New York City, we will be able to target services to hyperlocal communities; we will be able to recognize where gaps exist in government outreach. This will be of particular use in recognizing and reporting health disparities -- like hepatitis B and C -- that is prevalent within Asian communities and also for recognizing where language access is working and where the City needs to pick up the slack. That said; my office has received many phone calls from [cheer] constituents who fear that this information will be used to pit different ethnicities against each other with regard to specialized high school exams. We must be clear that these surveys are voluntary and anonymous; you don't have to

1
2 participate. The goal of this bill is to offer more
3 comprehensive linguistically competent and culturally
4 sensitive services to our diverse communities. So
5 with all that said, I vote aye.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Aye.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
20 explain my vote.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Madam
23 Public Advocate. And thank you to all my colleagues;
24 the packages of legislation are pretty impressive
25 today. I wanna just call out Council Member

1
2 Rodriguez and 1011-A and the fast food workers being
3 another group of folks that are both represented by
4 our working families and our immigrant communities;
5 I'm proud to be supporting this piece of legislation
6 and let's continue this momentum for other workers
7 out there and so we hear you and we'll come to you
8 very, very soon. Council Members Chin and Dromm, for
9 your bills that will allow us as New Yorkers to
10 represent ourselves through these surveys, both as
11 LGBT and multiracial identities; this is only gonna
12 make us stronger and better. I vote aye on all.
13 Thank you.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye on all.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Rodriguez.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I please
explain my vote [sic]?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I vote aye on
all. I wanna thank all of my colleagues for their
work and congratulate them and wanna give a special
shout-out to Council Member Rodriguez and 1011-A and
all the people who worked on that. It's too often
these type of workers can get lost in the shuffle,
not realizing the huge impact it has on their
families and I think this is continuing some great

1
2 work that we've been doing and it strikes the right
3 balance in trying to make sure that people aren't cut
4 off, for lack of a better word, cut off at the knees
5 right at the time when they need funding the most,
6 and providing new owners the ability to do what they
7 need to do. So I vote aye on all.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: No on 552-A and
10 aye on the rest.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 1011-A, aye
13 on the rest.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes. [sic]

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: As most of you
19 know, today I unveiled the annual Worst Landlords
20 list; in the spirit of Worst Landlords Day I'd like
21 to invite my colleagues to sign onto Int. 1044 and
22 1009 and bills being co-sponsored with Council Member
23 Jumaane Williams. As many of you've seen malicious
24 landlords often allow unsafe conditions to persist
25 for rent-stabilized tenants while undertaking

1
2 construction and improvements; in some circumstances
3 these landlords use construction as a means of
4 charging rent-stabilized tenants higher fees; 1044
5 will address that and 1009 is an important companion
6 bill that I will make this ban on permits for the
7 worst landlords significantly easier to implement. I
8 urge all of my colleagues to sign on.

9 All items on today's general order
10 calendar were adopted by a vote of 50 in the
11 affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0 abstentions,
12 with the exception of Int. 1011-A, which was adopted
13 by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 3 negatives and 0
14 abstentions, and Int. 552, which was adopted by a
15 vote of 49 in the affirmative, 1 in the negative and
16 0 abstentions. And the revised Land Use Call-Ups
17 were adopted by a vote of 50 in the affirmative and 0
18 negative votes. Congratulations Unite.

19 Introduction and reading of bills.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills
21 referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now we're
23 going to move to resolutions. The first resolution
24 is Res 472, a resolution calling on the state and
25 federal government to amend their official forms and

1
2 databases to accommodate multiracial identification
3 in all instances where racial identification is
4 required. All of those in favor say aye.

5 [collective aye]

6 All of those opposed. Any abstentions?
7 The ayes have it.

8 Res 1230, a resolution declaring support
9 for Muslim communities, affirming the religious
10 pluralism of the United States and urging all
11 residents to stand together for peace and
12 understanding and the first speaker is Council Member
13 Menchaca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you.

15 [background comments]

16 So I rise today as an elected official
17 from New York City representing a district diverse in
18 so many ways, including our Muslim brothers and
19 sisters in Sunset Park, a place of religious,
20 cultural and ethnic pluralism. I urge all Americans
21 to stand together for peace (paz) and solidarity
22 (solidaridad). I vow to use my position as an
23 elected leader to stand up against Islamophobia,
24 against xenophobia, against hatred, and against
25 oppression. I vote to promote local laws and

1
2 policies that advance the equity and valued
3 diversity. I stand with my Muslim brothers and
4 sisters. Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
6 Lander.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madam
8 Public Advocate. I just wanna note that in addition
9 to this resolution we're passing here today that
10 there is a letter that many of us have signed on that
11 500 local elected officials all around the country
12 have signed onto organized by Local Progress and the
13 Young Elected Officials Network, local elected
14 officials across the country standing up against
15 hatred, against Islamophobia with our Muslim brothers
16 and sisters at this important time to be doing so and
17 I would urge all members in addition to voting for
18 this resolution to sign onto that letter and make
19 others aware of it as well. Thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Anyone else
21 wishing to speak on 1230? Now to vote. All of those
22 in favor say aye.

23 [collective aye]

24 All of those opposed. Any abstentions?
25 The ayes have it.

1
2 Now Res 1231, a resolution calling upon
3 the United States Department of Housing and Urban
4 Development to exclude New York City and other cities
5 with a housing vacancy rate below 5% from the
6 proposed rule on small area fair market rates.

7 Seeing no speakers, all of those in favor, say aye.

8 [collective aye]

9 All those opposed. [background comments]

10 The ayes have it.

11 And now to general discussion, beginning
12 with Council Member Chaim Deutsch.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you Madam
14 Public Advocate. Today I'm introducing Int. 1298,
15 bill [background comment] that will speed up cleanup
16 process [background comments] after inclement
17 weather. This will be accomplished with the help of
18 New York's strongest, our sanitation workers, without
19 interfering with the usual trash and recycling pickup
20 schedule. Heavy winds and rain can cause tree limbs
21 to fall onto the sidewalk or the street and even snow
22 can weigh down loose branches over time. After
23 calling 311, it can take numerous weeks for felled
24 branches all over the city to be removed by the New
25 York City Parks Department's Forestry Division; at

1
2 times these branches can be taken up much-needed
3 parking spots as well as causing a hazard to
4 pedestrians, motorists and bike riders. My
5 legislation would authorize the New York City
6 Department of Sanitation to assist in these cleanup
7 efforts. DSNY workers are very familiar with the
8 neighborhoods they serve, traveling the same routes
9 several days each week; they're already equipped with
10 the necessary equipment and have assisted with tree
11 removal when called upon in the past, including after
12 Hurricane Sandy. The extra assistance for the Parks
13 Department will enable a quicker and more efficient
14 cleanup process after a storm. Streets and parking
15 spots with fallen limbs will be opened up faster,
16 allowing residents of New York City to return to
17 their daily activities with minimum interruption.
18 Harry Nespoli, the President of Local 831, the
19 Sanitation Workers Union, has expressed his full
20 support for this bill, welcoming the opportunity to
21 assist in these efforts when needed. I also want to
22 acknowledge my colleague, Councilman Andy King for
23 his work on the effort to streamline the tree removal
24 process and I thank him for his support and co-

1
2 sponsorship of Int. 1298. I encourage my colleagues
3 to sign on to support Int. 1298. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
5 Council Member Garodnick.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
7 much Madam Public Advocate. I'm pleased to introduce
8 a bill today that would require noise mitigation
9 plans to be filed with the Department of
10 Environmental Protection and made publicly available
11 on their website and posted conspicuously at
12 construction sites. All construction sites today
13 must have a noise mitigation plan associated with
14 their work. These plans contain information such as
15 location, scope of work, timing of the project,
16 construction devices used at the site, and what, if
17 any, mitigating materials are required for the use of
18 those devices. However, these plans are not
19 currently publicly available to neighbors of
20 construction sites who wish to stay informed of what
21 kind of noise that they can expect. On top of that,
22 the plans aren't even required to be filed with the
23 DEP, meaning that any DEP official looking to inspect
24 the plan for compliance must go to the site in person
25 and even then they may be directed to a construction

1 office if the plan is not kept at the site. This
2 clunky system is counter to the way most departments
3 throughout the City have been modernizing, making
4 significant amounts of documentation and records
5 available online for public perusal. I would note;
6 it's very much like today's vote to put the Patrol
7 Guide of the New York City Police Department online.
8 Publishing noise mitigation plans and requiring them
9 to be filed with DEP would accomplish several goals
10 in one fell swoop; it would bring noise mitigation
11 into line with the rest of the process of filing
12 documents and publishing information for construction
13 projects; it would add transparency and
14 accountability for people affected by construction
15 noise; and it would allow DEP to be a more efficient
16 enforcer when there are questions about the level of
17 noise that is produced by a site.
18

19 So I encourage my colleagues to take a
20 look at this bill and help me and the rest of us to
21 bring noise mitigation into the 21st century and I
22 thank you for your time.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
24 Council Member King.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I rise just to say
3 thank you to all the men today who wore the color
4 pink; as an ambassador for the American Cancer
5 Society Real Men Wear Pink campaign, I understand
6 firsthand how this disease has an impact, as I lost a
7 sister-in-law and currently dealing with a family
8 member with Stage IV breast cancer. But equally, we
9 just lost a great man in DA Ken Thompson to this ugly
10 disease, so I ask us all to continue to do all that
11 we can to bring awareness to ourselves and our
12 community, make a donation any time you can to help
13 fight cancer, and to all our brothers in here scared
14 to wear pink, it's okay, do some pushups; you'll be
15 alright. Thank you very much.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
17 Strong men wear pink. Thank you. And your family
18 member's in our prayers. Council Member Eugene.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
20 much Madam Public Advocate. I would like to take
21 this opportunity to thank the Speaker, Madam Public
22 Advocate and the entire City Council, as well as our
23 colleagues from the federal and state government, in
24 addition to community leaders, religious leaders,
25 union organizations and countless numbers of friends

1
2 and advocates who have reached out to me and my
3 office in the aftermath of the hurricane that brought
4 devastation upon Haiti last week. I cannot thank all
5 of you enough for your kindness and spirit of
6 humility [sic] during this time that has resulted in
7 a tremendous loss of human life and tens of thousands
8 of people being left homeless.

9 I can never forget how these very
10 institutions stood up behind me in 2008, when Haiti
11 was crippled by a horrific tropical storm and also in
12 2010, when a good portion of the country was crushed
13 by a horrific earthquake, and I will never forget how
14 the City Council **[inaudible]** passed a resolution that
15 I introduced in the chamber, calling for the federal
16 government to designate **[inaudible]** for Haiti. To
17 all my current and past colleagues, I want to thank
18 you for your support of Haiti in time of greatest
19 need. As most of you may be aware, I'm establishing
20 a joint task force with mission and it is to
21 implement a vastly improved and permanent emergency
22 response to system in Haiti. The task force would be
23 comprised of people from government, a wide range of
24 organizations and medical institutions and this task
25 force will address many issues and will implement an

1
2 emergency response plan that saves lives and
3 mitigates damage to **[inaudible]** [bell] and personal
4 property. I would like also to send my thoughts and
5 my prayers to the family members of DA Ken Thompson
6 and also I want to ask my... [interpose]

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member,
8 please conclude your remarks.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: to ask my
10 colleagues to support Res 1246 to have the government
11 to send resources into Caribbean... [crosstalk]

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you Council
13 Member. Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: to fight the Zika
15 virus.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you Council
17 Member... [crosstalk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
19 much.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
21 Council Member Levine.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you Madam
23 Public Advocate. I am excited that today; along with
24 Speaker Mark-Viverito and eight of my colleagues,
25 we're introducing a package of bills known

1 collectively as the Street Vender Modernization Act.
2 Street vendors add character and flavor and vibrancy
3 to our neighborhoods, a line of work which is a
4 source of livelihood for thousands of our fellow New
5 Yorkers, especially immigrant New Yorkers; it's a
6 pathway to business ownership, but we haven't updated
7 the rules around street vending in any major way
8 since the 1980s, and the result is a dysfunctional
9 system in which enforcement is inconsistent in which
10 there's a thriving black market in vendor permits, in
11 which there is not significant or adequate health and
12 safety oversight -- we are introducing a package of
13 bills to change this; it features the creation of the
14 first ever Street Vendor Enforcement Unit which will
15 target hotspots in the city, particularly highly
16 congested areas, and it will slowly seek to drain the
17 black market in permits by gradually increasing the
18 number of vendors who can come under the legal regime
19 and be subject to health and safety inspections as
20 permitted vendors. It's a balanced approach that
21 works for commercial districts, that works for
22 immigrant entrepreneurs and will keep this thriving
23 sector alive for many years to come. Thank you.
24
25

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
3 Council Member Williams.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.
5 First, I also wanna add my voice to those offering
6 condolences to Ken Thompson; if we look back at his
7 entire body of work, we'll find a successful and
8 impressive man who was committed to social justice,
9 so my prayers are with him and his family. To my
10 Jewish brothers and sisters who finished celebrating
11 Yom Kippur, I hope you had an easy and meaningful
12 fast. It was fantastic to see the display of Italian
13 heritage on display in the parade and across the
14 nation; my hope is one day we can celebrate that
15 without celebrating the man who is now a nameless
16 representative of that day. I also want to piggyback
17 and thank Council Member Eugene for his leadership in
18 dealing with issues around Hurricane Matthew. Just
19 wanna add that folks, please, we're collecting
20 medical supplies, personal hygiene products and
21 water; please do not send any clothes; no need to
22 empty your closets, clothes are not what is the
23 biggest need right now.

24 I wanna call on my colleagues to support
25 Int. 1306; it is a bill called the Credit

1
2 Nondiscrimination Act and the bill would outlaw the
3 practice of creditors discriminating the issuance of
4 credit based on protected classes, such as race,
5 gender and sexual orientation; it would require
6 creditors to disclose to applicants how their rate is
7 calculated; it would require the City's Commission on
8 Human Rights to conduct outreach regarding the right
9 not to discriminate against, to perform credit
10 discrimination investigations for a period of one
11 year. It was inspired by an article shown that
12 Honda's creditors paid a \$24 million settlement to
13 resolve a class action alleging discrimination in the
14 issuance of credit on the basis of race. The suite
15 alleged that black and Asian borrowers routinely were
16 overcharged interest rates.

17 For the last few minutes, I just want to
18 make sure to put on the record and say thank you to
19 the Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito for again sharing
20 her personal stories and I hope she knows -- I just
21 want her to know I know she's empowered a lot of
22 people who are still going through some pain; she
23 showed a lot of strength and a lot of courage and I
24 wanna say thank you for that and we should all be
25

1
2 proud of the leadership you have shown us. Thank
3 you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
5 Council Member Cornegy.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you Madam
7 Public Advocate. There is an information gap that
8 the City of New York has to fill to protect small
9 businesses. My bill, Int. 1293, will require
10 landlords to register commercial leases with the City
11 Department of Finance indicating specific information
12 -- the lease length, cost and assignment of
13 responsibility for property taxes and maintenance of
14 the leased premises. The bill will also require City
15 Department of Finance to submit annual reports to the
16 Mayor, Speaker and Comptroller indicating common
17 terms of commercial leases and how those terms vary
18 citywide and between business improvement districts.

19 As Chair of the City Committee on Small
20 Business, my office is inundated with calls from
21 constituents that have found it difficult to glean
22 necessary information from landlords before they
23 enter into a lease. As a legislator, I believe that
24 when our city regularly loses businesses to predatory
25 landlords we should process the data necessary to

1
2 diagnose and enhance business improvement districts.
3 Int. 1293 is essential because it provides
4 transparency to an otherwise shrouded process and
5 that transparency is necessary to protect the small
6 businesses of New York City. I invite all of my
7 colleagues to sign on to bill No. 1293 to protect
8 small businesses. Thank you.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
10 Council Member Cumbo.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I rise
12 today as a lifelong lover of the arts. For the past
13 33 years the Percent for Art program has operated
14 successfully, creating vibrancy and public art
15 throughout the City of New York, and while it has
16 been operating for the last 33 years, it also has not
17 changed its budget; nor how the artwork is disbursed
18 throughout the City of New York. So I'm calling on
19 all of my colleagues to support a package of cultural
20 legislation that was introduced today in order to
21 keep the New York City Department of Cultural Affairs
22 Percent for Art program going, but also to expand it
23 so it keeps up with modern day times as well as
24 finances.

1
2 I also want to acknowledge today that it
3 was announced that 21 of the Chibok girls in Nigeria
4 were finally returned back to their families, and I
5 just wanna say this is so exciting because after over
6 900 days, so many people gave up and said that it was
7 hopeless, but for those that remained and continued
8 to raise their voices, it shows what we can do when
9 we work collectively, both near and far. Those young
10 ladies are going to need a lot more assistance and we
11 feel confident and prayerful that the remaining young
12 ladies will be returned home.

13 I also want to bring my condolences to
14 the family of Zymere Perkins, the 6-year-old boy who
15 was tragically beaten to death; my district, at
16 Church of the Open Door, led by Rev. Mark V. C.
17 Taylor, conducted the funeral as well as all of the
18 repass events that took place and we just wanna wish
19 Zymere Perkins a peaceful life as he transitions on
20 and for the rest of us, we must continue to fight for
21 accountability to make sure that there is never
22 another Zymere Perkins.

23 I also wanna thank all of those that
24 participated in Go Purple Day, in order to raise
25 important information about domestic violence

1 awareness. This is a critical issue that remains and
2 continues to impact so many of our families and we
3 saw that through the life of Zymere Perkins.

4 I also wanna bring, as many have said,
5 [bell] my condolences to almost over a thousand
6 people that have died as a result of Hurricane
7 Matthew... [interpose]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member;
9 could you bring your comments to a close?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: yes, ma'am...
11 particularly in Haiti. A thousand lives, if you can
12 imagine that, is a tragic loss and I certainly want
13 to share my condolences in regards to District
14 Attorney Ken Thompson... [interpose]

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: who was an
17 incredible leader and when we think about all that he
18 accomplished, it reminds all of us to be kind, for
19 everyone you meet is fighting a hard battle...

20 [interpose]

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: my condolences to
23 his family.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
3 Vallone.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: **[Italian]**, which
5 is a thousand thank yous to everyone who helped
6 celebrate the Italian cultural evening we had with
7 the Speaker this week; we co-hosted that with Council
8 Member Gentile and we had wonderful food and events
9 and honorees, and thank you to the Council Members
10 who marched at the Columbus Day Parade, another
11 wonderful celebration of all the Italian Americans,
12 and we have Res 1248, which is for the 70th
13 anniversary of the Italian Republic, so would like to
14 have my fellow Council Members support on that and
15 thank you, Madame Advocate.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
17 Lander.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madam
19 Public Advocate. I'd like to call my colleagues'
20 attention to Int. 1301, which Council Member Johnson
21 and Rodriguez and I are introducing; it would
22 authorize and direct the City to establish a benefits
23 fund for drivers of for-hire vehicles, which would
24 really make New York City a pioneer in focusing on
25 the needs of independent workers who don't have

1
2 access to health care or other benefits. I encourage
3 people to sign on.

4 I too wanna express my sorrow about the
5 loss of Ken Thompson, a friend and a real visionary
6 leader; a lot has been written on the work he was
7 doing in criminal justice reform, but he was also
8 working with us on street safety and reckless driver
9 accountability and so many other things.

10 And then finally, just add my voice of
11 solidarity and appreciation to the Speaker for her
12 courage in speaking up; it is hard to imagine that a
13 silver lining will come from the dark well of bile
14 that is this campaign, but if it does, it will be
15 because people show some courage and step up and help
16 others feel safe to do the same, and that is really
17 meaningful in these dark times, so thank you Madam
18 Speaker.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
20 Levin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you Madam
22 Public Advocate. I too want to commend and
23 acknowledge the Speaker's bravery in speaking up and
24 letting her experience be known.

1
2 I wanna acknowledge Council Member
3 Mathieu Eugene and the work that he has been doing
4 and offer my condolences and solidarity with the
5 people of Haiti and all of the victims of Hurricane
6 Matthew, both in Haiti and here in the United States.

7 And then I wanna say a few words about
8 District Attorney Ken Thompson. You know over the
9 last couple of years DA Thompson exonerated 21
10 individuals who had their freedom taken from them;
11 these individuals did not commit the crimes that they
12 were convicted of; collectively they served over 300
13 years in prison; some of these people had their
14 entire livelihoods taken from them for over 20 years.
15 And DA Thompson showed amazing compassion and
16 commitment to justice in taking on these cases and
17 acknowledging that the system sometimes fails and
18 when the system fails, we as a society suffer; when
19 one person is robbed of their freedom everybody bears
20 responsibility and everybody as a society suffers and
21 DA Thompson took on that responsibility with gusto
22 and determination, and that is a very moving and
23 worthwhile legacy for somebody to have; that they
24 gave people [bell] who had their freedom robbed from
25

1
2 them back their freedom and we wish his family all of
3 our condolences and much love. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
5 Council Member Barron.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madam
7 Public Advocate. I want to extend my condolences to
8 the family of District Attorney Ken Thompson, to his
9 family and loved ones and say we continue to lift
10 them up in our prayers as they go through this
11 difficult time.

12 And I want to express also condolences to
13 the victims of Hurricane Matthew, both in Haiti and
14 here in the United States and other places where
15 there was loss of life and encourage all of us to do
16 what we can to support the efforts in Haiti so that
17 they make a real difference.

18 And to add my voice to that of my
19 colleague who recognizes that yes, 21 more girls have
20 been released from the clutches of the Boko Haram and
21 that we've still got work to do to make sure that the
22 others are released and reunited with their families.

23 And finally, encourage those persons who
24 perhaps have been subjected to sexual assault at any
25 point to be encouraged, not be discouraged, hold your

1
2 head up, 'cause we know that even though these
3 incidents may have happened years or decades ago,
4 they're still an impact and we have to be able to do
5 what we can to support them. So thank you very much.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And finally,
7 Council Member Treyger.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you Public
9 Advocate. I also wanna begin by commending the
10 Speaker for her courage and for really being a
11 consistent force for basic humanity and sanity
12 throughout this entire process.

13 I also want to extend our heartfelt
14 thoughts and prayers with all impacted by Hurricane
15 Matthew, of course the United States and particularly
16 in Haiti and I hope that our government can do more
17 than just send thoughts and prayers; we're in a
18 position of incredible resources in our federal
19 government and that we need to help a country that's
20 in dire need.

21 And I just wanna also extend my heartfelt
22 prayers and thoughts with the family of DA Ken
23 Thompson, his family, his friends, his staff. I'll
24 never forget the town hall meeting he held in Coney
25 Island where he announced a unit called the

1
2 Immigration Protection Unit, and he made it crystal
3 clear to our diverse community that justice must
4 reach every New Yorker regardless of what language
5 they speak, the color of their skin, their gender,
6 orientation, and their economic class, and those
7 words will always be with us and again, he had a
8 profound impact I think on the office in his short
9 tenure and we hope that his family and his friends
10 have strength during this very difficult time. Thank
11 you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We too want to
13 acknowledge and thank Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito
14 for her bravery; we all stand in courage, all women,
15 to the family of Zymere Perkins, to all of those who
16 lost their lives as a result of Hurricane Matthew,
17 and of course, to my good friend, Ken Thompson, rest
18 in peace. Speaker, for final remarks.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Just wanna thank
20 all my colleagues for the support they've been
21 expressing in different ways; appreciate it deeply.
22 With that, I hope everyone has a great rest of their
23 day.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We stand
25 adjourned.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 26, 2016