

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND  
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

----- X

March 4, 2021  
Start: 2:09 p.m.  
Recess: 4:46 p.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing, Virtual Room 2

B E F O R E: Antonio Reynoso  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Antonio Reynoso  
Justin L. Brannan  
Fernando Cabrera  
Margaret S. Chin  
Costa G. Constantinides  
Chaim M. Deutsch  
James F. Gennaro  
Francisco P. Moya  
Kevin Riley  
Helen K. Rosenthal

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Edward Grayson  
Commissioner  
Department of Sanitation

Salvador Suelo  
First Deputy Commissioner  
Department of Sanitation

Gregory Anderson  
Deputy Commissioner for Policy and  
External Affairs  
Department of Sanitation

Tok Oyewole

Justin Wood

Eric Goldstein

Phoebe Flaherty

Emily Bachman

Christine Datz-Romero

Justin Green

Ceci Pineda

Carlos Castell Croke

Anna Sacks

Marisa DeDominicis

Wylie Goodman

Kate Peterson

Catie Savage

Clare Mifflin

Henry Lee

Leslie Woodruff

Jane Selden

Josh Tjaden

Ina Lee Selden

Travis Tinney

Peter Moses

Rebecca Dengrove

Dexter Thomas Payne



3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: PC recording is up.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Cloud recording is  
5 under way.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Backup is rolling.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Sergeant Jones, please  
8 take us away.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS JONES: Good afternoon,  
10 everyone and welcome to today's remote New York City  
11 Council hearing on the Committee of Sanitation and  
12 Solid Waste Management. At this time would all  
13 panelists please turn on their videos. To minimize  
14 disruption, please place electronic devices to  
15 vibrate or silent. And if you wish to submit  
16 testimony you may do so at [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov).  
17 And again, that is [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov). And  
18 thank you for your cooperation. And Chair, we are  
19 ready to begin.

20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. Just  
21 from using my, my bike pump like my gavel today.  
22 [gavel] Thank you all for being here today. I'm  
23 sorry. My name is, ah, Council Member Antonio  
24 Reynoso. I want to start off by just recognizing  
25 that we've been joined by Council Members Chin, ah,

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
2 WASTE MANAGEMENT

6

3 Council Member Constantinides, ah, Council Member  
4 Moya, Council Member Cabrera, and Council Member  
5 Chin, I don't remember if I said Council Member Chin,  
6 and our newest council member, Council Member  
7 Gennaro. It is a pleasure to have you here, sir. We  
8 love all the council members, but the new ones always  
9 get a little more love, you know [laughs]. Thank you  
10 so much for being here. Ah, I am the chair of the  
11 Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management.  
12 Today we will hear from the Department of Sanitation  
13 on its fiscal 2020 preliminary budget, which total is  
14 1.74 billion dollars. This is 32.1 million dollars  
15 less than fiscal year 2021 adopted budget of at least  
16 1.77 billion. I want to begin today's hearing by  
17 thanking our sanitation workers for the incredible  
18 sacrifices they have made on behalf of our city over  
19 the past year. These workers, who very rarely  
20 receive any accolades bestowed upon them, bestowed  
21 upon other uniformed agencies, are absolutely  
22 essential to the health and safety of our city and to  
23 even [inaudible] selflessly into this work in the  
24 face of a pandemic that we know, that we knew very  
25 little about at the time. Sanitation workers faced  
an uphill battle with lack of sufficient PPE and

3 inconsistent health guidelines and received zero  
4 compensation for working in harm's way. The city  
5 would never be able to repay the debt we owe these  
6 workers. But I think there's a lot more we can be  
7 doing and I am calling on the mayor and governor  
8 again to compensate our frontline workers for the  
9 sacrifices during the pandemic. I along with many  
10 New Yorkers are deeply disappointed in the sanitation  
11 services of our city has received over the past year.  
12 It's impossible to look at our streets and say we're  
13 delivering the services residents have come to  
14 expect. I want to be clear, though, this is not the  
15 fault of DSNY and I want to commend Commissioner  
16 Grayson for stepping into the breach under very  
17 difficult circumstances. The mayor and his, and his  
18 team, and his team [inaudible] to level, to level  
19 cuts, I apologize, to level cuts in the previous  
20 fiscal year so drastic it led Commissioner Garcia,  
21 one of our best public servants, to resign in  
22 protest. These cuts were not just to one area of the  
23 department's work, but gutted both the basic cleaning  
24 services critical to making our city livable, a  
25 livable place, as well as the environmental programs  
that are essential to combating climate change.

3 We've now had a year to assess the impacts of these  
4 cuts and reflect on whether this is the direction we want  
5 our city to take. I expect there are very few New  
6 Yorkers who believe we should continue along the  
7 path, and yet today we're presented with a  
8 preliminary budget that barely [inaudible] address  
9 our filthy streets or getting serious about the  
10 dangerous impact of our current waste system, that  
11 our current waste system has on the environment. The  
12 mayor is continuing to reduce head counts using  
13 budget tricks to outsource work that's currently  
14 being done by unionized sanitation workers to private  
15 low-wage employers. This is not sustainable and we  
16 should all be outraged that our leaders have left  
17 our city in such a poor state. This budget does not  
18 reflect the council's priorities or those of many New  
19 Yorkers. Furthermore, it does nothing to move us  
20 towards the mayor's own goal of diverting human waste  
21 to landfills by 2030. Our leaders simultaneously pay  
22 lip service to climate change, being the greatest  
23 crisis of our time, while cutting the very programs  
24 that would address it, undermining public trust and  
25 allowing the crisis to deepen. New Yorkers have  
stepped up, though I want to applaud the many



1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
2 WASTE MANAGEMENT

9

3 community organizations and volunteers who have  
4 sprung into action to help close the gap. These  
5 efforts are receiving very little support from the  
6 city and are not a long-term solution for handling  
7 the waste, ah, the waste of 8-1/2 million people. I  
8 look forward to having a discussion with you today,  
9 Commissioner, and I hope you can give us an honest  
10 assessment on the resources DSNY needs to keep our  
11 streets clean while implementing the sustainability  
12 programs that will help us achieve a green waste  
13 processing system in New York City. I will now turn  
14 it over to our committee counsel to go over some  
15 procedural items and swearing the witnesses, and then  
16 we will hear testimony from DSNY. Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. I'm  
17 Nicole Abene, counsel to the City Council's Committee  
18 on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management. Before we  
19 begin, I want to remind everyone that you will be on  
20 mute until you are called on to testify, at which  
21 point you will be unmuted by the host. I will be  
22 calling on panelists to testify. Please listen for  
23 your name to be called as I will periodically  
24 announce who the next panelist will be. We will  
25 first hear testimony from the administration, which

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

10

2 will be followed by questions from the council  
3 members, followed by testimony from members of the  
4 public. I will now administer the oath to  
5 Commissioner Grayson, First Deputy Commissioner  
6 Salvador Suelo and Deputy Commissioner Gregory  
7 Anderson. Please raise your right hands. Do you  
8 affirm that your testimony will be truthful to the  
9 best of your knowledge, information, and belief, and  
10 that you will answer council member questions  
11 honestly? Commissioner Grayson?

12 ACTING COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: I do.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. First  
14 Deputy Commissioner Suelo?

15 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SUELO: I do.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. And  
17 Deputy Commissioner Anderson?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I do.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Um, you  
20 may begin with ready.

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Just before we  
22 begin, I want to acknowledge that we've been joined  
23 by Council Members Riley and Council Member Deutsch.  
24 Thank you.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

11

2 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Good morning. Ah,  
3 good morning. I've been here a long time, I'm sorry.  
4 Good afternoon, Chair Reynoso and members of the City  
5 Council Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste  
6 Management. I'm Edward Grayson, commissioner of the  
7 New York City Department of Sanitation and I thank  
8 you for the opportunity to discuss the department's  
9 portion of the mayor's fiscal year 2022, I'm sorry,  
10 ah, fiscal year 2022 preliminary budget and the  
11 fiscal year 2021 preliminary May's management report,  
12 and our current programs and operations. With this,  
13 with me this afternoon are First Deputy Commissioner  
14 Salvador Suelo and Gregory Anderson, deputy  
15 commissioner for policy and external affairs. I am  
16 pleased to be here in front of the committee for the  
17 first time in my formal appointment as commissioner  
18 since the end of December. This month marks one year  
19 since New York City became the epicenter of the worst  
20 public health crisis our nation has faced in more  
21 than a century. The COVID-19 crisis has taken a  
22 devastating toll on our families, our communities,  
23 and upended everyday life. Sadly, like many agencies  
24 and partners in government, the department has also  
25 been personally affected by this terrible illness.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
2 WASTE MANAGEMENT

12

3 Since our first case nearly one year ago we have lost  
4 eight employees who had confirmed COVID-19 cases.

5 Nearly 20% of the Department of Sanitation employees  
6 have tested positive for the virus and hundreds more  
7 were out sick last March and April before widespread  
8 testing was available. We continue to advocate with  
9 the state to open up access to COVID-19 vaccines for  
10 all of our frontline central sanitation employees who  
11 have demonstrated their dedication and resolve over  
12 this very difficult year. Our preliminary FY22

13 budget, while we are still in an unprecedented and  
14 uncertain fiscal time, the proposed FY22 department  
15 preliminary budget will ensure that the department  
16 can continue its core operations necessary to keep  
17 New York City healthy, safe [inaudible]. The

18 preliminary budget includes 1.739 billion in expense  
19 funds for the department. Our FY22 budgeted head  
20 count is 9503 employees, which includes 7381 full-

21 time uniform and 2122 full-time civilian positions.  
22 In addition, the department's proposed FY22 capital  
23 budget is 184.7 million. Of this amount, 131.8  
24 million is allocated to facility construction and  
25 rehabilitation, 8.3 for information technology  
projects, and 44.6 million to replace equipment and

3 vehicles. Together the November plan in the  
4 preliminary budget includes almost 44 million in  
5 savings for fiscal years 21 and 22, including 18.6  
6 million dollars due to the continued suspension of  
7 curbside organics for FY22, 13.2 million in lower  
8 projected costs for the Freshkills landfill closure  
9 and post-closure maintenance, 12.4 million in  
10 additional revenue from the sale of environmental,  
11 environmental attributes associated with Freshkills  
12 landfill gas, 4 million from the privatization of  
13 [inaudible] facilities, and 1.9 million to reduced  
14 street sweeping frequency associated with alternate  
15 side parking. While the vaccine does offer a light  
16 at the end of the tunnel for the COVID-19 crisis, the  
17 financial toll on our city is far from over. The  
18 cuts that we have taken over this last year and will  
19 continue to take in the future have required tough  
20 choices and we do not take them lightly. However, I  
21 am pleased to report that the FY22 preliminary budget  
22 includes funding from some programs that help us make  
23 progress towards the zero waste goals, including 2.2  
24 million to reinstate our special waste sites and safe  
25 disposal events and a full 3.5 million for our New  
York City Compost Project partners. I would like to

3 take this opportunity to thank Chair Reynoso and many  
4 of you for your leadership and efforts this last  
5 summer to restore funding for community composting  
6 and food scrap drop-off sites. Snow fighting is a  
7 core component for the department's mission and this  
8 critical work has come front and center this winter.  
9 National Weather Service observations in Central Park  
10 measured 26 inches in February alone, the eighth  
11 snowiest February in New York City recorded history.  
12 In total, we have activated for 12 winter weather  
13 events and received a total of almost 39 inches of  
14 snow so far for this season, and there's still a few  
15 weeks of winter left. I am proud of the dedication,  
16 resilience, and perseverance that our workforce has  
17 shown, working long hours on split shifts for more  
18 than three straight weeks. Our employees and their  
19 families are true public servants. We know that  
20 every snowstorm brings its unique challenges, yet  
21 despite our head count reduction this winter season I  
22 believe the men and women in this department, as  
23 always, rose to the occasion during each of these  
24 snow events to ensure our streets remain safe and  
25 passable. I know the tough and often brutal  
conditions they face in storms, having been out there

2 myself earlier in my career, and I cannot thank them  
3 enough for their service. To date, this winter  
4 season the department has used over 450,000 tons of  
5 road salt, 520,000 gallons of calcium chloride, and  
6 202,000 gallons of liquid [inaudible] to de-ice the  
7 city's roadways. We also have about 217,000 tons of  
8 road salt on hand at our 43 sites citywide and  
9 contracts in place to deliver an additional 279,000  
10 tons if necessary. While we hope that we are out of  
11 the woods for the remainder of the season, we remain  
12 ready to fight whatever Mother Nature gives us for  
13 the rest of March. The current FY21 snow budget is  
14 1.14 million dollars, ah, 101.4 million dollars, I  
15 apologize, and the preliminary FY22 snow budget is  
16 89.9 million. At the cornerstone of the city's long-  
17 term solid waste management plan, the city's  
18 comprehensive is, is our solid waste management. It  
19 calls for the creation of eight railroad barge waste  
20 transfer stations, together with the use of existing  
21 energy from waste facility in New Jersey that shifts  
22 waste export from long-haul trucking to a sustainable  
23 and reliable network of marine and rail transfer  
24 stations equitably distributed throughout the five  
25 boroughs. Today all nine long-term facilities are

3 fully operational and the plan has reduced truck  
4 traffic associated with waste transport by more than  
5 60 million miles per year, including more than 5  
6 million miles in and around New York City. It has  
7 slashed greenhouse gas emissions associated with  
8 waste transport by more than 34,000 tons annually and  
9 has created a more equitable distribution of waste  
10 management infrastructure in New York City. These  
11 nine facilities also create new waste transfer  
12 capacity that has allowed the city to permanently  
13 reduce permanent capacity of privately operated  
14 transfer stations in historically overburdened and  
15 minority communities, predominantly located in three  
16 neighborhoods in Brooklyn north, southeastern Queens,  
17 and south Bronx. In accordance with Local Law 152 of  
18 2018, New York City's waste equity law, the  
19 department implemented reductions in its permanent  
20 capacity at 22 transfer stations in overburdened  
21 communities in a 12-month period, ending September  
22 30, 2020. The reductions implemented pursuant to  
23 this law cut permanent capacity in these communities  
24 by over 10,000 tons per day. The commercial waste  
25 sector also plays an important role in achieve our  
zero waste goals. Commercial waste zones will create



3 a safe and efficient collection system for commercial  
4 waste that provides high-quality, low-cost service to  
5 New York City businesses while advancing the city's  
6 zero waste and sustainability laws. The new system  
7 is expected to reduce commercial waste truck traffic  
8 by more than 50%, eliminate millions of miles of  
9 truck traffic, cutting air pollution and reducing the  
10 time it takes for workers to complete their routes.  
11 It is also expected to nearly double the commercial  
12 diversion rate for recyclables and organic waste.  
13 The impact of the current COVID-19 crisis on our  
14 city's businesses has dramatically affected the  
15 private carting industry and we believe that the  
16 business community and the carting industry must  
17 begin to recover and stabilize before embarking on  
18 this transformative effort. Nonetheless, the  
19 department remains firmly committed to implementing  
20 this program and fully realizing its benefits for all  
21 New Yorkers, though we must take the right  
22 precautions to do so sensibly. Following a six-month  
23 delay due to the pandemic, the department began the  
24 competitive process procurement, ah, the procurement  
25 process, by issuing part one of a request for  
proposals in November of 2020. Part one of the RFP

3 requested information from potential awardees to  
4 determine their ability to perform in accordance with  
5 specific business, character, financial, and  
6 licensing requirements. Submissions for part one  
7 were received by February 19 of 2021. This spring is  
8 promulgating several rules to implement the program,  
9 including rules governing customer service,  
10 operations, health and safety, recycling organics  
11 collection, and other administrative requirements.  
12 By late spring the department will also issue part  
13 two of the RFP to the select zone awardees. We  
14 anticipate the transition period to the new zone  
15 system to begin in 2022 and last up to two years.  
16 Before the COVID pandemic crisis an estimated 1.2  
17 million New Yorkers faced food insecurity. However,  
18 due to the economic devastation caused by COVID-19 we  
19 estimate that this number has grown over to 2 million  
20 before stabilizing around 1.6 million, as the city  
21 began to reopen. One year later as families continue  
22 to struggle to make ends meet, many New Yorkers,  
23 especially our older neighbors and those with health  
24 conditions, remain stuck inside their homes and  
25 apartments, unable to safely shop at their  
neighborhood supermarket or eat meals in group

3 settings. They deserve the dignity of knowing where  
4 their next meal will come from. Last March at the  
5 request of Mayor de Blasio the department was tasked  
6 with meeting an interagency team dedicated to keeping  
7 our city fed and safeguarding the food supply chain  
8 during the public health emergency. Many of those  
9 programs continue to operate under the leadership of  
10 the Mayor's Office of Food Policy. DSNY continues to  
11 operate with GetFoodNYC emergency home feeding  
12 delivery program to deliver meals directly to New  
13 Yorkers who need them, cannot leave their homes due  
14 to the pandemic, and cannot afford private delivery  
15 options. Many of our colleagues at the department  
16 stepped up to support the effort to feed New Yorkers  
17 in this past year, including recycling outreach  
18 staff, attorneys, contract specialists, and our  
19 operations managers. I'm incredibly proud of their  
20 efforts and what they were able to do. Through the  
21 emergency programs established to date, the city has  
22 distributed more than 200 million meals to hungry New  
23 Yorkers through the emergency home food delivery  
24 program alone. DSNY has delivered 125 million meals.  
25 The department is currently funded for 366 million  
dollars for emergency feeding initiatives in FY2021.

3 We will continue to work with the mayor's office, our  
4 partner agencies at OMB, and others as necessary to  
5 assess the cost associated with this effort and  
6 ensure that adequate funding is available to provide  
7 food for those in need during this crisis.

8 Throughout the crisis the department has continued to  
9 provide essential trash and recycling collection  
10 services for millions of New Yorkers. This is a  
11 testament to the dedication and commitment of our  
12 sanitation workers, uniformed officers, trades men  
13 and women, and the other essential staff. We all owe  
14 the hard-working employees of the department and all  
15 other essential workers a debt of gratitude for their  
16 efforts during the past 12 months. They are New  
17 York's pandemic heroes. In closing, I wish to thank  
18 Chairman Reynoso and other members of this committee,  
19 as well as other members of the council, for  
20 continuing to support our essential workers, the  
21 programs, and the work. You are critical advocates  
22 as we work to keep New York City healthy, safe, and  
23 clean, and I thank you for this opportunity to  
24 testify this afternoon, and my staff and I are now  
25 happy to answer your questions.

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you,  
3 Commissioner Grayson. I'm going to ask, ah, a few  
4 questions, ah, to give time for my colleagues, um, so  
5 they won't have to sit here for a couple of hours.  
6 Um, I can do that. The department has reduced its  
7 uniform head count considerably over the past year,  
8 with cuts to core services, including litter basket  
9 service, lot cleaning, organic material collection,  
10 e-waste collection, and others. This leaves DSNY  
11 with only 7381 uniform budget positions as of  
12 preliminary time. Are other agencies, especially  
13 uniform agencies, taking such a large head count, ah,  
14 such large head count cuts like Sanitation? How do  
15 you compare our cuts to the rest of the uniformed  
16 agencies, Commissioner Grayson?

17 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Thank you, Chair.  
18 I appreciate the question. Um, we have definitely  
19 saw the head count reduction and I know and you're  
20 fully versed in where those, ah, services were  
21 reduced that corresponded with those head count  
22 reductions. Um, at this point in time I couldn't  
23 tell you how we are in comparison to other large  
24 agencies and uniform head count agencies, as I'm not  
25 fully familiar with all of their programmatic needs.

2 But I can tell you that the cuts that we have seen  
3 that you've referenced are still in place and we are  
4 trying to build a plan to adapt to that head count  
5 moving forward.

6 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And are we gonna  
7 get a new academy class? Are we looking to hire, ah,  
8 hire our head count, um, I guess, at this point,  
9 Commissioner Grayson?

10 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Um, I'm still  
11 working with, and so is my team, we're working with  
12 OMB, ah, on the timing of classes and the feasibility  
13 of classes, and the reality of the budget. Ah,  
14 that's why we, it's good to have these hearings.  
15 It's good to, to air all this out. At this point in  
16 time we're still working with the administration to  
17 figure out what services we are still moving forward  
18 with and what a hiring programmatic will be. I can  
19 tell you that from the department's purview we are  
20 definitely interested in hiring and the process of  
21 hiring as we work with external challenges such as  
22 our employees, our frontline workers, our sanitation  
23 workers are critical service providers. We're the  
24 first line of defense. They all, ah, need commercial  
25 driver licenses and part of our hiring process is

2 being able to train them, and given, ah, the COVID-19  
3 pandemic, while we have a robust training potential,  
4 ah, we still have to work around with our state  
5 partners at the DMV to get everybody a license. So  
6 these are all discussions that are going on and we're  
7 working with timing, like definitely as we move  
8 forward with the administration with OMB's input we  
9 will definitely get you that information once I have  
10 it. I'm not trying to be aloof. I just, I'm trying  
11 to work through some logistical challenges and work  
12 with the administration on the realities of the  
13 budget.

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, thank  
15 you for that. We, we see the city at this point,  
16 Commissioner, and we're extremely concerned. Ah, we  
17 now know that there's some cleanliness indicators  
18 that show a significant decrease compared to the same  
19 period just a year, 2020. Ah, with indicators  
20 pointing towards the climate cleanliness ratings, how  
21 is it the department is able to impose further  
22 cleaning reductions to street sweeping. Um, so I  
23 just want to like really understand how an already,  
24 you know, situation that is not in a good place can  
25 be, you know, we're gonna extend that or we're gonna

2 do more, um, and I actually have people in my  
3 district asking to go back to four days, right, to go  
4 back to the original, um, and who would have think it  
5 that alternate side of the street parking would be,  
6 ah, something that folks are clamoring to get back  
7 because our streets are so dirty, but in this, ah,  
8 proposal there seems to be even more cuts to it. Can  
9 you, can you explain that?

10 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Yeah, that's a  
11 great point and I thank you for bringing it up, and  
12 right now we have this, ah, we are doing the reduced,  
13 ah, alternate side parking. And like you said,  
14 Chair, ah, totally interesting observation that in  
15 the course of the confluence of what's going on with  
16 the city's response to COVID how, ah, something that  
17 I know myself, moving my car two times a week, you  
18 know, when I used to park in Queens, um, was always  
19 annoying and yet now we're clamoring, a lot, a lot of  
20 communities are clamoring to get more sweeping back  
21 because we're down to the one time a week, because  
22 now we see, we recognize the importance of street  
23 sweeping, of being out there on a proactive cleaning  
24 program, that coupled with the reduction in litter  
25 basket service, so that's one of the challenges. One



2 of the challenges is, is that right now it is a  
3 myriad of, a confluence of circumstances between the  
4 litter basket collection, the reducing of speed that  
5 was done as a COVID precaution to give people the  
6 opportunity to limit their exposure to [inaudible] so  
7 we are still working to try to find out where we're  
8 going to land. There is an active, ah, a real active  
9 search to find out how we will, ah, adjust ASP  
10 citywide. There are clearly, while you are 100%  
11 right, these scorecard indicators have decreased in a  
12 lot of places in the city. There are other areas of  
13 the city where the frequency of sweeping that  
14 exceeded one time, we can honestly take an open look  
15 at and say perhaps it was able to sustain itself. I  
16 also think, Chair, that it is of note to notice about  
17 general cleanliness definitely what would easily be  
18 considered a true and, and, and reality check is the  
19 makeup of what is now visible litter. Sadly, like  
20 many of the constituents you represent and many of  
21 the city that you represent were talking to your  
22 fellow, ah, colleagues at the council and to us and,  
23 and our community partners. Um, one of the other  
24 things that's happened is the waste, the litter  
25 stream has also changed to now sometimes include PPE,

3 masks and gloves, which is definitely going to take  
4 even the most, ah, consummate New Yorker, who may or  
5 may not be able to walk past what would be a top of a  
6 coffee cup in the curb line, but for, automatically,  
7 when you see a mask or a set of gloves somewhere on  
8 the floor you actually naturally become hyperaware  
9 given what we've all been through in the COVID  
10 pandemic. That doesn't mean what do I want to do. I  
11 understand that we have to look together to what  
12 we're gonna do with sweeping, but for right now that  
13 reduction in sweeping, which then does cascade to a  
14 reduction, sadly, on the head count side, as you, as  
15 you pointed out. Ah, we have to assume that for the  
16 start of the budget, as we're planning, that that,  
17 that restriction that is there for a safety-based  
18 COVID limit people's reality of leaving their homes  
19 while we're still trying to get safe, we're leaving  
20 it in place. We're still working with, with  
21 everyone, yourself included, to try to get what the  
22 finalization of that is, but for right now we're  
23 assuming that we're only gonna remain on the one time  
24 a week and in a tough decision budget we're leaving  
25 it in right now as a proposal on how we would move  
forward, clearly looking for more input with all the

2 stakeholders 'cause we agree with you. We've  
3 certainly seen the scorecard come down and everyone  
4 can look around the city, and certainly we're having  
5 real discussions on where we'll go with street  
6 cleaning and sweeping in general.

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Ah, it's, it's  
8 just, ah, you know, I, I hear what you're saying.  
9 You have limited resources, um, and, you know, the  
10 alternate side of the street parking reduction was  
11 done, again, as a safety measure to make sure that  
12 we're [inaudible], but with the news coming down from  
13 the federal government that everyone that wants to be  
14 vaccinated will have the opportunity to be vaccinated  
15 by May makes it so that starting July 1, ah, we won't  
16 necessarily need to keep people in their homes as a  
17 safety precaution, um, and because we no longer keep  
18 in their homes out of safety we should assume or  
19 resume business as usual when it comes to the  
20 cleanliness of our streets, and at this point for  
21 that not to be in the budget it's, it's a huge  
22 problem, Commissioner Grayson. So I'm just going to  
23 be very clear that I think it's unacceptable that the  
24 city would even consider maintaining only one day a  
25 week, um, ah, or this reduced streets, ah, street

2 sweeping service, um, when we're moving into the next  
3 budget. At this point I feel like they're, they're  
4 OK with a dirty city so long as they're saving a  
5 couple of bucks, and that's just not, that doesn't  
6 sit well with me. So I will be, ah, fighting through  
7 the budget negotiating team and with you and the  
8 mayor's office to try to reinstate ASP, um, that  
9 existed before. And, look, if you have some  
10 [inaudible] that you think the reduction is actually  
11 working and the cleanliness is being maintained, then  
12 absolutely. You could, you could do away with those.  
13 But in the district that I represent, um, and many  
14 council members that are actually on this Zoom, they  
15 are letting me know very clearly that their streets  
16 are dirty and they need more street sweeping to  
17 happen. Ah, so just want to make sure that you're  
18 aware of, of, ah, you know, the discussions that I'm  
19 looking to have with you moving forward.

20 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Absolutely, Chair.

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: OK. Thank you.

22 The mayor announced that he would be launching an  
23 initiative to bolster street and sidewalk cleanliness  
24 where, ah, and, and you know, which, which kind of,  
25 you know, it's just backtracking. The mayor cuts the

2 budget significantly and then finds money, um, and I  
3 don't know where he found money, but finds money and  
4 decided, decides to give it to the Department of  
5 Sanitation because he sees that the city got out of  
6 control and the cleanliness is out of control, and  
7 then it's clear this is a money issue, it's a  
8 resource issue, um, and not an effort issue. I know  
9 you're doing more with less, Commissioner, and I, and  
10 I want to thank you and applaud you for the work that  
11 you're doing [inaudible], the sanitation workers as  
12 well, but we're, we're, it's a reality. This  
13 initiative, what did it do? Where did it go? Did it  
14 actually help, um, or we just putting a Band-Aid on a  
15 bigger problem here?

16 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Um, Chair, you're  
17 not, just to be clear, the, the initiative we're  
18 talking about, is that the [inaudible] the State of  
19 the City with the expanded funding for the 10,000,  
20 um, possibly bringing on additional community-based  
21 resources?

22 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Ah, let me see.

23 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: I just want to  
24 make sure [inaudible].  
25

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Counsel, or, so  
3 Jonathan or Nicole, which, ah, the initiative I'm  
4 talking about was, ah, midway through the, the year,  
5 the commissioner, ah, the mayor brought up, ah, an  
6 initiative that he was going to implement to address  
7 this issue of cleanliness in our city. OK, thank  
8 you.

9 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: OK, I got you, I  
10 got you, Chair. So that, that midyear, um, that  
11 midway restoration was for us, for DSNY, was, ah, the  
12 restoration of, ah, a set number of basket trucks  
13 that had been restored that had been previously cut.

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: OK.

15 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Ah, and, and, and  
16 the last time, when we spoke last, you know, the last  
17 time you chaired this committee together, to talk  
18 about street cleanliness issues, ah, we, in that we  
19 talked about how those basket trucks had been put  
20 back to the places that were heavily targeted, ah, at  
21 that time by COVID-19 and that we were looking at the  
22 metrics on street cleanliness, um, and that, and that  
23 service restoration. There was also a component of  
24 that to engage community-based organizations to  
25 potentially come out and help with street cleaning.

3 Um, to the effect that that happened we have not  
4 coordinated that effort and as you know well from the  
5 feedback of your, of your colleagues, um, we have,  
6 we've been able to restore that basket service and  
7 every community board that we, that we worked in, um,  
8 certainly appreciated it, and we've been talking to  
9 our local stakeholders and we would like to continue  
10 that service, ah, throughout and so far we plan to.  
11 Ah, that's a part of what we've submitted in this  
12 plan. Ah, we would definitely look to expand basket  
13 service if there's any way that funding can, and  
14 we're continuing to work on what funding will become  
15 available, um, to, to do that, but as far as the, the  
16 community-based cleaning that would come in from  
17 private organizations, um, that has not materialized  
18 for us. So I cannot give you a metric on that.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So, um, I'm gonna  
19 allow for my colleagues to ask, ask questions and I  
20 just want to end my, ah, my first round of  
21 questioning with, ah, a dirty city is a public health  
22 crisis in itself. Ah, while I, I agree that we're  
23 dealing with COVID and we have to be very smart about  
24 how we're, how we're budgeting considering the crisis  
25 we're in, ah, the Department of Sanitation should be

3 one of the few departments that should have been  
4 spared or, ah, we should have had a, a more, more  
5 nuanced conversations about how these cuts would  
6 work. Ah, just a reduction in service is not an  
7 appropriate, ah, an appropriate action during a  
8 public health crisis that can now bring about another  
9 public health crisis. Um, I'm, I'm very, I was, I  
10 was disappointed with the cuts that the mayor was  
11 making because I thought they were just, ah, there  
12 was no newer view, it was just a slash to, to, to  
13 meet a goal as opposed to really understanding how  
14 our city moves and how our city operates. Ah, the  
15 Department of Sanitation has been doing a great job  
16 and it's because it's been well resourced. Once we  
17 start cutting that we dive into a bigger problem.  
18 So, ah, look, I'm looking forward to having a, a  
19 different type of conversation than last time. I  
20 think our budget is not as bad, or is not projected  
21 to be as bad as they, as originally thought, and if  
22 money is coming in from the federal government I want  
23 to make sure the Department of Sanitation is front  
24 and center as one of the first agencies that gets all  
25 of their money restored, um, at least, ah, into last  
year's, ah, ah, equivalent to last year's budget.



2 So, again, Commissioner Grayson, thank you for your  
3 time. I'm gonna ask more questions after my  
4 colleagues speak, um, and I'm gonna allow for, um,  
5 Counsel Abene, I, I think you're gonna, you're gonna  
6 call through the council members?

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yep, so I'll now call  
8 on council members in the order that they used the  
9 Zoom raise hand function. Um, and so if you have  
10 questions please use the Zoom raise hand function  
11 now. Each council member will have five minutes and  
12 we'll start with Council Member Cabrera, followed by  
13 Council Member Chin. Council Member Cabrera?

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so  
16 much, and thank you to the chair. Chair, thank you  
17 for your leadership, your passion. In all the years  
18 that I've been serving in this committee, ah, you  
19 never cease to carry the banner, ah, for what is  
20 right in this community. So thank you. Thank you so  
21 much. And Commissioner, congratulations, your first  
22 preliminary budget hearing. Ah, but it's in a bad  
23 time. Ah, and so with that I feel for you. Ah, I  
24 also want to thank, ah, our Sanitation Department  
25 workers. They did a phenomenal job in my district

2 during, ah, the snow, ah, the [inaudible] in the  
3 city, especially right here in the Bronx. But I want  
4 to address, ah, the issue of the assignment of work,  
5 sanitation workers. Ah, do you happen to know how  
6 many sanitation workers we have assigned to the  
7 Bronx?

8 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Ah, ah, yes, I  
9 will, hold, just give me one second 'cause I have a  
10 sheet here with the entire citywide breakdown. But  
11 in the, we have, I have a great, yes, ah, hold on one  
12 second, and if anything I can, ah, hold on, ah,  
13 Commissioner Anderson, do you have that grid easily  
14 in front of your desk?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Actually, I have  
16 it. I'll spare you the time. I'm looking at it,  
17 'cause my time is clicking. The Bronx only has 764  
18 workers. That's it. Compare to Manhattan that has  
19 1137, Staten Island [inaudible] they only have 105,  
20 105, that's it. Queens has 1651 sanitation workers  
21 and Brooklyn 1704. Here's my concern about the  
22 Bronx. Number one, we're very spread out, especially  
23 in the east side, in the mid, north, and the east  
24 side of the Bronx. It's not like Manhattan where  
25 you can do quick pickups, so it's a lot easier to do

2 pickups, as you know, you're a veteran, ah, as  
3 compared to the Bronx, and we are having our trucks  
4 go not once but twice, ah, out to do, once they're  
5 full, twice by the same crew, which [inaudible]  
6 borough happens to have, and we have more tonnage. I  
7 don't know why, but we have more tonnage of garbage  
8 coming out of the Bronx than any other borough. So  
9 I'm just very confused when you have the tonnage and  
10 you have the, the spread, it takes them longer to do  
11 pickups and we have so much fewer to the point that  
12 you know, like I know, that when we have snow taking  
13 place that you're always gonna have, you're always  
14 sending sanitation workers to come to the Bronx to be  
15 helped because there's not enough of them, and we're  
16 feeling the effects here in the Bronx. As a matter  
17 of fact, I had the news call me, [inaudible] they  
18 called and they say we notice, because, you know, the  
19 [inaudible] around here, it is news stories that have  
20 come out of this, ah, and I, I'd like to understand  
21 why, ah, do we have such a disparity?

22 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: It's a very good  
23 question. I understand your point. So the uniform  
24 sanitation worker head count, um, is usually, for  
25 years, is deployed upon the number of daily truck

2 assignments that we send out. Now, we have had, we  
3 had an assignment, we an attrition reduction from the  
4 programs from last year that was through retirement.  
5 When the sanitation workers then retire, um, we are  
6 not in full control as to where they retire from. My  
7 point is, is that the head count of totality assigned  
8 to the Bronx is not binary to the amount of trucks we  
9 can run in the Bronx, because also throughout the  
10 department's history what we do is we deploy  
11 sanitation workers assigned to other zones on a daily  
12 basis as needed in to pick up refuse and recycling  
13 throughout the, all the five boroughs. I agree with  
14 you that the Bronx right now has a head count that  
15 it's had lower than before. Um, and if we get a  
16 chance to do some hiring we may be able to fill those  
17 positions because that's where they've been attrited  
18 from, if we get, build back up into a certain, and  
19 again we're still working towards that. But you're,  
20 but the observation you made on the totality of head  
21 count is 100% correct and just so you know, and I  
22 know that you're very, you're a big supporter of  
23 Sanitation and the men and women on sanitation in the  
24 Bronx, and I cannot thank you enough for that. I  
25 hear about it all the time, and I want to tell you

2 that we, the sanitation workers of the Bronx are some  
3 of the hardest workers that we have. The high  
4 density, the high density, just to touch on the  
5 tonnage, the high density in places like western  
6 Bronx...

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

8 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: ...[inaudible] and  
9 Manhattan, and in Brooklyn north are why some of  
10 those districts do more than one load of trucks.  
11 It's not, it's just because of the high density of  
12 the area and they load up the truck and then they go  
13 offload and come back. It is not a disparate way  
14 that we handle it. We handle it similarly in all  
15 high-density areas and have been for my entire  
16 career. But I will agree with you, sir,  
17 wholeheartedly, hard-working men and women of the  
18 Bronx and I totally understand your, your, your point  
19 here today that when we get into a chance of  
20 reallocating resources and moving head count around  
21 that we should be looking at the Bronx. Totally  
22 understood.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Mr. Chair, 30  
24 seconds?

25 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Absolutely.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so  
3 much. So if there is high density, it would seem to  
4 me, and thank you, Commissioner, for acknowledging,  
5 ah, that, that we're having difficulties here. But  
6 if we have a higher density it would seem to me that  
7 we should assign more trucks. I, I'm a little  
8 confused and, and maybe the chair could explore this  
9 because I don't have the time, why, the NYPD, if they  
10 see they need more police officers they're able to  
11 dispatch them and assign them on a permanent basis  
12 here. Why can't we do that when we see that there's  
13 such a great need here, and I'm with the chair, that  
14 one of the last places we should be cutting, and we,  
15 we have to call attention to the administration, is  
16 the sanitation workers. We need them. There's three  
17 to one attrition, it's not gonna work with the  
18 Sanitation Department. And I know you're with me and  
19 I know you can't say that out loud, but myself and  
20 the chair, and I know my colleagues will say that out  
21 loud and help you out in that respect because, ah,  
22 this, this is a health issue at the end of the day.  
23 This is, this is, this is a concerning issue. It's a  
24 quality of life issue that many of our constituents  
25 are, I've never had so many complaints in all these

2 years I've lived in the Bronx, since 1988, never had  
3 so many complaints about the garbage, ah, situation,  
4 it's just bad. And I know you just got in and I'm  
5 sorry you have to carry now this leadership, but  
6 you're it and so with that I've run out of time.  
7 Thank you, Mr. Chair, I really appreciate the time.  
8 Thank you, Commissioner.

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Council  
10 Member Cabrera, and if you have any other questions I  
11 will have a second round if necessary.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you, thank  
13 you, greatly appreciate it.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Now we'll hear from  
15 Council Member Chin, followed by Council Member  
16 Brannan.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. Ah,  
19 thank you to the chair and, ah, thank you,  
20 Commissioner. Um, it's been a tough year [inaudible]  
21 ah, also thank God for our sanitation workers. Ah, I  
22 am really glad to hear, ah, the commercial zone, ah,  
23 it's gonna move ahead, um, even though it got delayed  
24 and, um, that will really help in terms of, you know,  
25 many community, especially the district that I

2 represent, ah, with the, ah, commercial carting  
3 company. Um, and the other good news that you shared  
4 with us that I'm glad to hear, ah, the community  
5 composting, um, the money was, you know, put back for  
6 that. I think that's really, ah, important. Ah,  
7 personally I see the difference, 'cause even for  
8 myself, ah, we have a composting site, ah, at the  
9 Bowling Green, ah, area near the subway. Every  
10 Tuesday morning my husband bring [laughter] bring our  
11 food scrap there and it, it's really, you know, our  
12 garbage has lessened. And I think that's something  
13 that we would need to really spend more money on to  
14 really promote that kind of program across the city,  
15 because a lot of the garbage is food garbage, food  
16 waste garbage, and we really gotta work on that, and  
17 so that's something that we have to continue, ah, to  
18 fight for more money. The other thing is that, ah,  
19 that I, I agree with the chair is that there should  
20 not be a budget cut because the whole thing with  
21 collecting garbage, especially in certain area, um,  
22 like where I represent, where the streets are very  
23 narrow, but the residential population is growing.  
24 So every day you walk by tons of garbage during  
25 garbage pickup day, the next day and in the evening



2 garbage out, and with the recyclable it takes up the  
3 whole block. And, you know, my constituents are  
4 asking for more pickup. But we have budget cuts.  
5 Ah, we, you know, we're just hopeful that it doesn't,  
6 the pickup time doesn't, you know, get less. But we  
7 definitely need more, and those programs are really,  
8 um, important, and I see, you know, that we wanted to  
9 hire more worker, you're talking [inaudible] program  
10 we can have more resources, but the same time you're  
11 taking a hit, ah, on your staff, um, to do this work  
12 and last, my last question is why is Department of  
13 Sanitation taking care of emergency food program? I  
14 know, you know, [inaudible] Garcia the czar, she was  
15 in charge so that's why your agency, you know, got  
16 involved. But that should not be your job, right?  
17 You, you focus on what you do. Emergency food should  
18 be somewhere else. And I, I wanted to see, to hear  
19 from you, like how is that, you know, taking away  
20 from the work that, that you are supposed to be  
21 doing, ah, to keep the city, you know, clean and, and  
22 healthy?

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And can I just  
24 follow up with that, ah, Council Member Chin. A lot  
25 of the budget, this budget is being cut 33, about 33

2 million this go-around, but a lot of that, it's a,  
3 it's a funny numbers game because we're getting an  
4 increase in money for food work...

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah.

6 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Right? Which is  
7 being attributed to the, to the cut here, or to the  
8 increase, um, so in reality there's a larger cut to  
9 sanitation services than we can even see that is  
10 being, um, is kind of, not intentionally, but it's  
11 being hidden by the increase in the amount of money  
12 we're getting for the food work. So the Department  
13 of Sanitation's budget is actually being cut a lot  
14 more and the service portion of it is being cut a lot  
15 more. So, ah, Commissioner, you could, ah, answer  
16 those questions for Council Member Chin.

17 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Absolutely. And  
18 Council Member Chin, I, I appreciate the question.  
19 Um, I'm gonna start with the last one first and just  
20 say that why you're right. First off, I am not the  
21 food czar and it's a great question. Um, what does  
22 the Department of Sanitation have to do with  
23 emergency food? Well, one thing I can say about this  
24 department and why they picked my predecessor to jump  
25 in is that this department has a long-standing

3 history of standing up emergency responses and a  
4 great team of people who are very aware of contract  
5 procurement and working with the interagency  
6 [inaudible] that came out of OEM to try to put this  
7 up very quickly. So in the wake of that, ah, and we  
8 couldn't be prouder of what they've been able to do  
9 when the, over, like I said in my testimony, over 200  
10 million meals delivered, um, we are, there is a path  
11 forward for the Department of Sanitation as the  
12 program realistically is, you know, going to be taken  
13 over solely by the Mayor's Office of Food Policy. As  
14 it stands right now, we still have resources  
15 dedicated and contracts that are still ongoing DSNY  
16 managed into FY22 which is why we're still in play  
17 and we continue to work with the Mayor's Office of  
18 Food Policy and we do see a path out. I want you to  
19 know that our frontline staff, the men and women, ah,  
20 picking up garbage, ah, and recyclables and plowing  
21 snow at no time did they take their eye off the ball  
22 of what their core function was to deliver food. We  
23 did ancillary support with some of the frontline  
24 workers just with transporting and helping out, but  
25 for the most part this was our incredible team of

2 administrators, lawyers, contractors, the incredible  
3 staff of the recycling unit that we [inaudible]...

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

5 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: ...who, who stepped  
6 in because the recycling programs had, you know,  
7 scaled back with what was going on with the budget  
8 and we can't thank them enough. And I think that  
9 that's why we're involved in food. And with regard  
10 to the extra put outs and the tonnage increases of  
11 COVID you're 100% right. We saw tonnage go up. We  
12 saw people change their behavior at the curb and how  
13 they set it out, particularly as people had more  
14 deliveries or had more boxes to put out and stops got  
15 bigger and the sidewalk space, particularly in your  
16 district, certainly becomes a scarcity on a  
17 collection day with all this extra material out. And  
18 I cannot thank our workforce enough for trying to  
19 step up. But I agree with you. We all have to look  
20 at the changing landscape with all this additional  
21 tonnage. When does that behavior normalize with a  
22 path forward in recovery? Do we go back to a sense  
23 of normalcy that we're all hoping for? Do people get  
24 out more and then thus generate less at home? Do the  
25 small businesses and the restaurants, as their

2 [inaudible] pick up and then also reduce the size of  
3 what was out at the curbs? And we look forward to  
4 having this dialogue with all of you, hearing that,  
5 those thoughts out and continuing a path forward.  
6 But I thank you for acknowledging our work on food,  
7 and you're right, we're trying to get out of it as  
8 well, and there is a path forward with the right  
9 agency to handle that at the Mayor's Office of Food  
10 Policy.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Well, yeah, I mean,  
12 and I, because I chair the Committee on Aging. I  
13 want the money back for our seniors to the Department  
14 for the Aging [laughter]. You know, that's one  
15 thing.

16 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Understood.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: But the whole thing  
18 with the recycling program, I think like there need  
19 to be more resources allocated towards that, because  
20 I don't think that that's gonna change. People are  
21 still gonna order a lot of stuff online and those  
22 boxes, we need to make sure that they are compressed.  
23 I mean, it's like, recyclable [inaudible]. And the  
24 organic program, I mean, that's the future. We're  
25 talking about climate change, we got to do that, and

2 we got to put the, the money, ah, into your agency to  
3 make sure that you can fulfill this mission. I mean,  
4 your, your outreach, you know, where we did the whole  
5 bag giveaway, I mean, your teams are fantastic. I  
6 mean, that's why people are using these, you know,  
7 sanitation orange reusable bag. And, you know, cut  
8 back on plastic bag. Ah, but we need more of those  
9 education and outreach. So that's why your, your  
10 budget, we need to really advocate, Chair, to make  
11 sure that we put the resources back, ah, to the  
12 Sanitation Department. Thank you. Ah, I'll come  
13 back later for more questions.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you, Chair.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair.

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Ah, thank you,  
18 Council Member Chin.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ah, next we'll hear  
20 from Council Member Brannan, followed by Council  
21 Member Riley.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you,  
24 Counsel. Thank you, Chair, for this, ah, important  
25 hearing. Commissioner Grayson, it's good to see you.

2 Um, you know, I always say, ah, DSNY workers easily  
3 have the most thankless, demanding, important job in  
4 our city. Ah, we leave our trash outside and we  
5 expect it to disappear. We don't notice when it does  
6 disappear, but we start screaming when it doesn't.  
7 Um, I really do consider, ah, DSNY workers everyday  
8 heroes and, um, something that, ah, Chair Reynoso and  
9 I have been fighting for is to, ah, get DSNY workers  
10 a spot at the front of the line for the vaccine. I  
11 think it's insane, um, that at this point, ah, you  
12 guys are, ah, not considered priority, ah, for the  
13 vaccine. That's something, we're not gonna give up  
14 until we get that right. Um, getting to the budget,  
15 in, in a 90 billion dollar budget it's not often that  
16 you feel cuts immediately, ah, but we certainly felt  
17 the cuts last year pretty immediately. It was night  
18 and day, ah, when the mayor cut our corner baskets  
19 down to three times a week. In my district I had it  
20 at seven times a week. We felt that, we saw that, we  
21 smelled that, um, right away, immediately, um, and we  
22 had to scramble to use my discretionary funds to  
23 restore some of those cuts. And I share, ah, Chair  
24 Reynoso and what some of my colleagues are saying,  
25 that sanitation services are not something that I

2 think any of us consider, um, superfluous. So we're  
3 fighting to make sure that the sanitation budget is  
4 where it needs to be, and where cuts need to be made  
5 I think they should be made with, um, you know, with  
6 a surgeon's blade and not with a skive. Um, so  
7 that's something we're gonna be looking at this year.  
8 I had one question, it's something that, ah, came to  
9 my attention and concerned me. I understand the  
10 administration is planning to outsource and replace,  
11 ah, DSNY workers currently assigned to, ah, Sunday  
12 overage at, at all the garages. Now what would  
13 happen if we're hit with a storm or some other type  
14 of emergency situation that requires, ah, rapid  
15 response or cleanup? Are these outside contractors  
16 gonna prepare the fleet for snow removal or sand the  
17 streets and that kind of stuff?

18 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Thank you for your  
19 question and your support. Um, no, so right now we  
20 are, we are working and, and trying to finalize a  
21 proposal and, as you saw it as a budget line item on  
22 a potential reduction, ah, you know, in all the  
23 documents submitted for the prelim budget that the  
24 post, that man are, these are manned by sanitation  
25 workers that work at each one of our, ah, garage



3 locations would be, ah, reduced and eliminated in  
4 some cases and replaced with the, ah, citywide  
5 requirements contract, ah, security staff. Those,  
6 ah, those, that, that potential option, those workers  
7 would not be able to take our trucks out, respond,  
8 and do some of the things that our sanitation workers  
9 who currently hold that role do for the City of New  
10 York.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: OK, so how would  
12 that work, then? If these guys are, if, if, if the  
13 administration wants to outsource these guys and  
14 replace the workers with, who are currently assigned,  
15 would then your guys come in if, if something  
16 happened? How would that work?

17 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: We, we would be,  
18 so in, in that case, like responding to something  
19 that Sanitation would normally be called to do on a  
20 Sunday, we would definitely be delayed in responding.  
21 Ah, we may have to call, ah, we may have a limited  
22 bandwidth, have to go do an investigation to see what  
23 resources would be needed, and then call in  
24 additional staff. So what I, what concerns me about  
25 the proposal on response time from what we have is  
that our response would be delayed. However, we are

2 still working with OMB on what the final, so, you  
3 know, final construct of what the design is. That is  
4 looking at it line item, ah, the post that watches  
5 the building also then does mixed and double use,  
6 being replaced with a, with a security guard and not,  
7 from a private firm, and doesn't account for any  
8 other personnel that we may bring in then on standby.  
9 So it is still a case in point. But your point is,  
10 is more than, than heard. Right now, and just so I  
11 could address it, right now we would be delayed in  
12 responding to anything that happened on a Sunday if  
13 that plan were to go forward.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: And what are  
15 they saying, what would this, what would this save  
16 the budget?

17 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Ah, right now, ah,  
18 the cursory analysis that's been done is that it  
19 would be 4 million dollars in the budget, and the  
20 reason why it was included is because it is an  
21 overtime program and while there are definitely  
22 challenges to work out from limitation to make sure  
23 that we have some continuity of coverage on Sundays,  
24 ah, it doesn't impact direct head count. So it was a

2 list of, it was part of the list of various DSNY  
3 programs that wouldn't further reduce our head count.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: OK.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you.

7 Yeah, I mean, obviously I'm not in love with that. I  
8 understand we need to tighten our belts a bit. I  
9 mean, 4 million dollars in a 90 billion dollar  
10 budget, when we start, start, um, you know, standing  
11 on the, the edge of outsourcing stuff is really, um,  
12 something we, we need to take a serious look at. So,  
13 but I appreciate it, Commissioner. Thank you. Thank  
14 you, Chair.

15 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Council  
17 Member Brannan. I just want to thank Council Member  
18 Brannan for helping lead the way to recognize the  
19 front [inaudible], ah, work that is being done by the  
20 Department of Sanitation and the fact that they're  
21 not allowed to get the vaccine at this moment, I  
22 think is extremely disrespectful and unacceptable.  
23 So, thank you for taking the, ah, lead on that,  
24 Council Member Brannan. I'm happy to, to be

2 partnering with you on that. Um, and I believe it's,  
3 ah, Council Member Riley's turn to ask questions.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you, Chair  
5 Reynoso. And I, I believe my question was answered.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: And I appreciate  
8 it, ah, Commissioner Grayson, we had an amazing  
9 conversation, ah, regarding, ah, the quality of life  
10 issue that, that's going on, um, especially after the  
11 pandemic. Um, and, and Sanitation, I think we need  
12 to reimagine, um, how we view our sanitation workers,  
13 especially, um, during this pandemic with the upkeep  
14 of trash in our communities and, and the lack of  
15 resources that you've, you've had, um, during this  
16 pandemic and, and how hard you guys have been  
17 working. So I thank you so much, and just wanted to  
18 put that out there. My question was answered  
19 already, Chair. So thank you so much for giving me  
20 the time to talk.

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Council  
22 Member Riley.

23 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Thank you.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Now, now we'll hear  
25 from Council Member Deutsch.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Ah, thank you.

4 Good afternoon, Commissioner.

5 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Good afternoon.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Um, so basically

7 I just want to say that I want to thank the men and

8 women of the New York City Department of Sanitation

9 and as the chair has mentioned, um, he sits on the

10 budget negotiation team, as well as I, as I do. Um,

11 and this is something we fight for each year to

12 increase the basket collections, and this is

13 something we have to continue to do. So we can't

14 always blame it on the mayor. We have to blame it

15 sometimes on ourselves and convince our colleagues,

16 ah, in the committee to make sure that we fund, um,

17 the basic essential needs that New Yorkers need and

18 that is, um, the Department of Sanitation. So we

19 have to continue to, to fight the good fight and to

20 try to see what we can do. But I only have one

21 question. I want to say that you're doing a good

22 job, um, um, having oversight on the Department of

23 Sanitation and as well as the food distribution, so I

24 have, my question is can you take over the vaccine

25 rollout?

2 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Ah, thank you very  
3 much, ah, thank you, um, for those kind words. Ah,  
4 I, I cannot, um, and it's not that, ah, we, we are, I  
5 am committed wholeheartedly to being, ah, doing  
6 everything I can to serve in this role. Um, however,  
7 I think that there are some incredible people who,  
8 throughout city government, who have done an amazing  
9 job trying to meet all the needs of the pandemic.  
10 But, Councilman, I, appreciate that. That's a nice  
11 thing to say. I appreciate it.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you very  
13 much. We're going to continue, um, showing our  
14 support, um, to, to the Department of Sanitation.  
15 Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next will be Council  
17 Member Chin.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah, thank you. I  
20 just had a couple of question about capital. Um, I  
21 know that now with all these outdoor cafe it's very  
22 hard for the Sanitation Department, you know, the  
23 truck is so big. So are there gonna be some more  
24 investment in terms of smaller truck, electric truck,  
25

3 um, that would help the environment? Is that part of  
4 your capital plan?

5 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Great question.

6 Right now our current capital plan, ah, is for the

7 replacement of equipment. We are continuing, now

8 that's a broad statement, but we are continuing to,

9 to look out how to meet the new challenges of the

10 streetscape. I, and we've all seen it this year,

11 with the change in the way the streetscape is, trying

12 to get some smaller pieces in, I know that this

13 committee and all of you have championed our ability

14 to try to get some smaller pieces, particularly for

15 snow fighting, and if we look at the new bike lanes

16 and the new smaller spaces, and as we all try to

17 figure out the landscape of the city and what it will

18 be if outdoor dining and structures and the entire

19 way it all changed, that we've all been growing

20 through together, so while we do have, we clearly

21 have a capital budget, ah, that includes, as I stated

22 in testimony, money for new equipment, we are

23 continuing to work with and trying to make sure that

24 we right size the best usage of that. For right now

25 we are looking for replacement vehicles to keep our

fleet current and inside of that there is definitely

2 going to be discussions on what we could bring in,  
3 and we may be leveraging some of that capital money  
4 to do other pieces. But we're still more, in  
5 negotiations with OMB and the administration to make  
6 sure that we're right sizing to try to grow together  
7 in what the new streetscape will be, and I appreciate  
8 your question on that. It's, it's totally true and  
9 totally needed.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: The other thing is  
11 that I, I didn't get a, um, answer back on my  
12 original question. Ah, I guess the, the whole, um,  
13 organic waste collection, um, and composting are, I  
14 mean, we've got to be also planning for the future.  
15 Ah, so are there things in place that help us, you  
16 know, expand these program? I mean, last year was  
17 totally, you know, cut because of the budget, but we  
18 just can't allow that to continue to happen. I mean,  
19 that, that program, you know, the organic waste  
20 program, need to expand, especially, you know, how do  
21 we get more the apartment buildings to participate in  
22 these program because that is a huge amount of waste  
23 that's in the, the regular garbage that could be  
24 separated out.



2 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Oh, and, and I  
3 apologize for that. I kind of, I guess, went long on  
4 my last answer with you. But yes, um, ah, I agree.  
5 We are committing to moving forward as a future and  
6 we definitely need to have an organics waste, a  
7 robust organics waste collection program to meet the  
8 zero waste goals and to be the sustainable city of  
9 the future. Everything that, that we've talked about  
10 in this committee, what the chair supports, what all  
11 of you have been supportive of, um, there is no  
12 curbside organics program funding in the FY22 plan.  
13 Ah, we, it's, it, we do, we do not have any resources  
14 allocated to that. We were able, thanks to the  
15 support of many, to restore funding for the community  
16 compost, which like we said, that, that is, ah, that  
17 is something that we have to, in the limited pool of  
18 resources that we had to go to we definitely wanted  
19 to continue to work with our community partners,  
20 people that we've had a relationship with for  
21 decades, to try to get that, that ball going and keep  
22 it running, and we definitely want to support what we  
23 can with food waste drop-offs and community compost  
24 partners. That's where our bucket is. But I agree  
25 with you wholeheartedly. We didn't, we do not, this

2 budget currently does not have an organics program  
3 built in for curbside, you know, pickup and/or that  
4 high-rise building program that was in Manhattan and  
5 in parts of the Bronx, you know, in the previous  
6 year. We do not have that and we need to build a  
7 path forward, hopefully if we get federal stimulus  
8 money, if the city does rebound we can get there.  
9 For right now we're playing to what we, what we  
10 believe our state of affairs will be and without some  
11 kind of available resource pool we're not going to be  
12 able to expand that into 22. We have to play on  
13 those, those are the tough decisions that a lot of  
14 agencies had to make and we're moving into FY22 with  
15 the continued suspension of our amazing organics  
16 program that had over 3-1/2 million New Yorkers on it  
17 and was the largest in the world before we had to  
18 suspend it because of the pandemic. And we  
19 definitely...

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: What, what's the  
21 amount of budget? What's the amount of budget for  
22 that?

23 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Ah, almost 19  
24 million dollars.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: 19 million dollars  
3 out of the 92 billion dollar budget? 19 million.

4 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: I, I understand.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: OK. That's good.

6 We, we need to advocate for that, because that needs  
7 to expand. I mean, we're talking about COAs and  
8 climate change and, and we're cutting this program.  
9 And, as you mentioned, it was very successful. We  
10 were looking forward to...

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: ...expanding it and  
13 then it was cut. So Chair, we gotta work on that.  
14 Thank you. Thank you, Commissioner.

15 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Ah, it's, it's  
17 unfortunate that, um, I feel like this administration  
18 has, ah, you know, abdicated its responsibility to  
19 zero, ah, to zero waste a long time ago, but to, um,  
20 ah, climate change and understanding what we need to  
21 be doing to, to ensure that we're fighting against,  
22 um, the, the changes that are happening in our, in  
23 our country and our planet. It's just that, ah, I  
24 was concerned about how long it took for us to move  
25 forward with the program for organics, and then this

2 happens and then it gets completely gutted. Um, I, I  
3 feel like, um, COVID gave the administration an  
4 excuse to move away from, ah, an initiative that it  
5 never really supported in the, on the first, in, in  
6 the first place. Now, I want to be clear that the  
7 position of the Department of Sanitation has never  
8 been that. But this mayor made it very clear through  
9 his policies and positions that he could care less  
10 about zero waste, um, and that the organic program is  
11 something that he is just not prioritize it. Um,  
12 it's extremely unfortunate, um, and now, you know,  
13 Council Member Chin, we're, we're just looking to  
14 restore basic services in the city when it comes to  
15 sanitation, um, which makes it very difficult for me  
16 during the budget negotiating team to ask for more on  
17 top of just getting regular services, so I feel like,  
18 ah, there's a large burden and me and members of  
19 this, ah, this committee, ah, to just get the city  
20 to, to a place where, you know, it's tolerably clean  
21 and, ah, I'm not looking forward to this, this  
22 negotiating session, to say the least. Um, we've  
23 also been joined by Council Member Rosenthal. Ah, I  
24 want to acknowledge her, and I think we're gonna get  
25 to questions, ah, to questions from the general

2 public unless council members have any follow-up, ah,  
3 allow them a round two or, um, if, ah, there are any  
4 questions the, the council members may have. It  
5 looks good, OK. Um, I, I do have a, a question  
6 related to the outsourcing of the Sunday and holiday  
7 security. And for the council members that are on  
8 the, ah, on the Zoom, ah, you know, it's a, it's a  
9 wave to circumvent, you know, paying, ah, sanitation  
10 workers a dignified pay that they've negotiated and  
11 have a contract as a union, looking to outsource  
12 security in a DSNY facility to a private, ah, to, to  
13 private workers. Um, I, I don't know where the mayor  
14 will get the idea that anyone in the council would be  
15 supportive of, ah, taking jobs away from sanitation  
16 workers to give it to a private firm to do security,  
17 on Sunday and holiday security at our sanitation, ah,  
18 garages. Ah, can you please explain that a bit more,  
19 ah, 'cause we've done a lot of work to take the  
20 tertiary street contracts away from folks, um, when  
21 it should have been done by our sanitation workers  
22 and now seeing this it's just a, it's a close  
23 reminder of, of that type of work that has happened  
24 in the past. Can you explain this, ah, outsourcing  
25 of security?

2 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Yes, Chair. Ah,  
3 right now the proposed outsourcing of the Sunday  
4 security is, ah, it's, it was part of a listing of  
5 all of our overtime programs, um, that were, we had  
6 to itemize when we're doing, this is a, a tough  
7 budget, as you well know. Um, you know more than me  
8 as [inaudible] citywide with other agencies as well.  
9 And this is a program that, ah, while would reduce  
10 the amount of sanitation workers that work each  
11 Sunday to secure our facilities, replace them one for  
12 one with a private guard, and, ah, have a 4 million  
13 dollar value at end of that. And it's a straight  
14 line, it's a budget decision, ah, that we're, that  
15 we're, that we're still negotiating and talking  
16 about, but it's in, it made our list of how we would  
17 help do our part to tighten our belts.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I just want, I want  
19 a, an equivalent here. Why not get rid of every  
20 single sanitation worker in the City of New York and  
21 replace them with a private firm to do work, ah, to  
22 do trash collection, right? Ah, it's the same thing.  
23 What we're seeing here is that, ah, to save 4 million  
24 dollars, right, which is nickel and diming at this  
25 point the Department of Sanitation, ah, we're gonna

3 take away roles and responsibilities that the  
4 sanitation workers have done for a long time. And  
5 I'm just, I'm just, ah, you know, they start here in  
6 security and then it will be somewhere else.  
7 Tomorrow it will be, you know, who's cleaning the  
8 trucks. Maybe we can prioritize that work, and, um,  
9 it's just, it's, um, a slippery slope when we start  
10 taking work away from sanitation workers and giving  
11 it to private, ah, firms. So I'm extremely concerned  
12 about that. It's something I'm not going to accept.  
13 I want to be very clear. Um, ah, I'm going to, this,  
14 this budget is going to be something that's gonna be  
15 very difficult for me to vote for. Um, I had  
16 concerns in the last budget over, ah, the amount of  
17 money that was going to policing, but in this budget  
18 the cuts that are happening to the Department of  
19 Sanitation are just unacceptable. And I, I don't see  
20 myself being, ah, being able to move forward with a  
21 budget that does this to the Department of  
22 Sanitation. Um, I see, um, Council Member Rosenthal  
23 wants to ask some questions, so before I continue  
24 with my questions I want to give her the opportunity  
25 to speak. So, Council Member Rosenthal.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thanks so  
3 much, Chair.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Um, I really  
6 appreciate just a, um, probably one quick question.  
7 Um, Commissioner, congratulations, welcome. You got  
8 lucky. You got one of the best council members, ah,  
9 except for Council Members Chin, Riley, Brannan,  
10 anyway. Um, so I just want to follow up on, on what  
11 Chair Reynoso was talking about. So currently  
12 sanitation workers do the security? How does it work  
13 currently?

14 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Currently, ah,  
15 for, so Sunday we, in addition to some other  
16 ancillary cleaning functions that are, ah, you know,  
17 some, some, there are some litter basket collection  
18 trucks that they dispatch, but our facilities, our  
19 sanitation garages and our dispatch locations, ah, up  
20 until now, currently right now in the current program  
21 we have a sanitation worker who mans that facility,  
22 ah, or, you know, covers the shift and he or she  
23 would do perimeter sweeps, make sure that the trucks  
24 are secure. They have a listing of duties and  
25 responsibilities. And they would be the first, if we



2 had to dispatch someone on a Sunday evening, so to  
3 speak, to go address an oil spill because of a motor  
4 vehicle accident or something, like they would be our  
5 first responder, so to speak, out there in  
6 conjunction with some of the supervisory staff.  
7 That's what, that's what we're talking about.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: OK. And, um,  
9 just very bluntly, are those union positions or  
10 management positions?

11 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Ah, they are all  
12 covered by collective bargaining. They're all union  
13 jobs.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: OK. Thank you  
15 very much. Thanks, Chair Reynoso.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, ah,  
17 Council Member Rosenthal. And I just want to follow  
18 up. Would these, would this security firm be able  
19 to, ah, show up emergency-wise to, let's say, an oil  
20 spill, ah, Commissioner Grayson, and do that work  
21 that this, that this, um, ah, current sanitation  
22 worker does? Would they be able to...

23 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: No.

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: ...take on the  
25 responsibility? No, OK.

2 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: No, Chair.

3 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So, OK. I just  
4 want to, ah, I just want to make sure that we, we, we  
5 recognize that. And then the last thing I'm gonna  
6 ask before we get to our panelists, um, I want to  
7 allow for the folks in the general public to speak.  
8 Our lot cleaning is down 57%. We had 1018 lots  
9 cleaned last year and this year 443. Half, half.  
10 And a big part of this is just the sight, right?  
11 It's just everyone seeing all the garbage everywhere,  
12 including in these lots. Um, you know, what, what is  
13 the, what is the current response time, I guess? How  
14 long does it take if I report a, a lot that needs to  
15 be cleaned, how long is it taking this year as  
16 opposed to what it took last year? I just want to  
17 know the difference between, ah, length of time as  
18 for like what, what somebody did in 2020 and what  
19 somebody did in 2021?

20 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Ah, so we have  
21 definitely seen a lag. Ah, Chair you're, you're spot  
22 on with, you know, and we've seen it, so it's, you  
23 know, the, the, compounded with the fact that we  
24 reduced the unit in the last go-around, um, you throw  
25 in the pandemic with, which also, you know,

3 curtailed, ah, some of the administrative functions  
4 with, particularly with cleaning the private lots  
5 where we need a writ and there's an entire  
6 administrative process to go onto private property to  
7 clean something up. So compounded between the cuts  
8 and the delays we're probably up, I believe it is  
9 about 20% of increasing in, in lead time. We used to  
10 be able to soup to nuts get those lots cleaned from  
11 start to finish in somewhere around, you know, 60 or  
12 so days and now we're closer to 80.

13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: 80. So I, I'll end  
14 it with this. Um, Commissioner Grayson, what they're  
15 doing to you is unbelievable. The fact that they  
16 would want us to operate, ah, the Sanitation  
17 Department under these, you know, vicious cuts, um,  
18 and continuing to [inaudible] and have you sit up  
19 here and have to, you know, speak on how you're gonna  
20 do more with less, um, it's just, ah, it's unfair  
21 and, and it's not something that I think this council  
22 is gonna stand for. Um, especially just because you  
23 guys have been, gracefully and professionally, ah,  
24 including the snow removal and just the trash  
25 removal, it's just, ah, when you talk about  
26 departments that have done things right, this is one

2 that we could also point to, to be proud of. Um, and  
3 what they're doing now is, you know, jeopardizing  
4 that record or that reputation, um, to nickel and  
5 dime, dime ourselves. So I'm so sorry that this is  
6 happening and we will not, we will not, I will not  
7 stand for it and I'm looking forward to our next  
8 fight with the mayor on this issue. And, um, I think  
9 Council Member Rosenthal has a couple of questions  
10 left, and then we'll go to our panelists. Thank you  
11 again, Commissioner Grayson.

12 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Sorry. You  
14 just, ah, this usually happens with us, Council  
15 Member Reynoso [inaudible] each other. So,  
16 Commissioner, um, the people who do the Sunday  
17 security, have they ever had an incident? Like do  
18 you have, you know, like over the last year there  
19 have been five incidents that they have had to  
20 respond to and it's blah, blah, blah. Or, um, yeah,  
21 has that, has there, or have there been any break-ins  
22 that they've had to deal with?

23 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Um, so that's a  
24 great question. Yes, we, we definitely have, ah, at  
25 least in, we, we respond to over a hundred or so

3 incidents. Ah, you know, the men and women of the  
4 department who are working the Sunday security  
5 currently, um, will go, you know, for icy conditions,  
6 ah, to pick up a condition to respond to an  
7 emergency, to help, ah, assist PD with blocking off  
8 an area to respond. A lot of times in wintertime if  
9 there is a fire, um, and, you know, when the fire  
10 department has to now hose down a block we now have  
11 to come and respond on a Sunday and add salt, even  
12 though it's snowing. So, yes, clearly, over a  
13 hundred instances routinely, ah, per year we will  
14 have to respond to something like that. And then as  
15 far as, ah, people who walk onto the property or, you  
16 know, ah, unwelcome visitors or, you know, however it  
17 is, I, I don't know that they're always break-ins,  
18 but, you know, sometimes you get, ah, someone who  
19 wanders onto the property. Ah, we have had to engage  
20 them, you know, multiple times, you know, to try to  
21 make sure that they're safe, especially in the  
22 parking lots or the areas that we have that are not  
23 fully secured, because we want to keep them safe,  
24 because a lot of our trucks and equipment can be  
25 dangerous if you don't know what you're doing. Even  
when they're not started there's still things you

2 don't, you know, we don't, we can't have people  
3 touching it if they're not skilled and not trained.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So Council  
5 Member Reynoso, I think it would be interesting for  
6 the committee to get those kinds of stats.

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I agree.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [inaudible]  
9 step, but...

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Every, every  
11 time...

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...you know, to  
13 find about those hundred or so, even if it's a draft,  
14 you know, that's why they use the word draft, it  
15 doesn't have to be exact. But, you know, that sounds  
16 like two a week, which is not unsubstantial. Um,  
17 yeah, just, yeah, OK. Thank you very...

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah, we'll follow  
19 up, and Commissioner Grayson, if you can do that,  
20 just, ah, the type of incidents that they've had to  
21 respond to, um, that, and I want to be clear, it  
22 sounds to me and obviously Council Member Rosenthal  
23 that these are situational, a situation where we  
24 might not be able to respond anymore, where we might  
25 not be able to attend should we move this to private

2 firms. Um, and if we are going to attend to them it  
3 would mean that we're still using sanitation workers  
4 and are just spending twice as much money. I just  
5 don't understand managerially outside of someone that  
6 does not work, someone that is not from the  
7 Department of Sanitation looking at this budget line  
8 and thinking that they can cut it. Um, or, you know,  
9 you're being forced to do this. So, um, again, I  
10 think there's a lot of, a lot of nonsense out there  
11 that we need to, we need to get to the bottom of and,  
12 um, and we will. Again, I want to be very clear,  
13 Commissioner Grayson, that this is not a reflection  
14 on you or the department. Um, our frustration lies  
15 almost exclusively with the administration. Um, OK,  
16 so now...

17 COMMISSIONER GRAYSON: Chair...

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. So now  
19 we're gonna go to our panelists. Um, Counsel, are  
20 you, you're gonna take it away?

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: [inaudible]

22 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Right, right.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Um, so we'll now turn  
24 to testimony from members of the public who have  
25 signed up to testify. I'd like to remind everyone

3 that unlike our in-person council hearings we will be  
4 calling on individuals one by one to testify. Once  
5 your name is called a member of our staff will unmute  
6 you and the Sergeant at Arms will set the timer and  
7 announce that you may begin. Your testimony will be  
8 limited to three minutes. We'll begin testimony with  
9 Tok Oyewole, followed by Justin Wood, followed by  
10 Eric Goldstein. You can begin after the sergeant  
11 begins the timer.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

13 TOK OYEWOLE: OK. Um, good afternoon.  
14 My name is Dr. Tok Oyewole and I'm testifying on  
15 behalf of the New York City Environmental Justice  
16 Alliance. Founded in 1991, NYCEJA is a nonprofit  
17 citywide membership network linking grassroots  
18 organizations from low-income neighborhoods and  
19 communities of color in their fight for environmental  
20 and climate justice. For decades NYCEJA has led  
21 efforts for comprehensive policy reforms to address  
22 the disproportionate burden of New York's solid waste  
23 system on a handful of environmental justice  
24 communities. The impacts of the solid waste system  
25 on, um, I'm sorry, yeah, the, the impacts of the  
solid waste system are greatest in the few low-income



3 communities and communities of color where truck-  
4 dependent transportations are clustered, causing  
5 higher proportions of health consequences such as  
6 asthma, heart disease, and various cancers. We're  
7 here today to advocate for adjustments in the city  
8 budget allocation for the upcoming fiscal years  
9 pertaining to solid waste and composting that we  
10 think would dramatically improve equity for  
11 environmental justice in frontline communities and  
12 ensure the city's commitment, ah, to its stated  
13 goals. Some of these changes also pertain to the  
14 Committee on Land Use. As our colleagues in the Save  
15 Our Compost Coalition, ah, will share at this  
16 hearing, we're proposing a moderate budget proposal  
17 of 14.75 million dollars for the upcoming, ah, fiscal  
18 year for a few, um, purposes pertaining to organics,  
19 ah, that will gird us for full implementation of a  
20 mandatory organics collection processing budget in,  
21 ah, the subsequent fiscal year. The current request  
22 is inclusive of community composting and food scrap  
23 drop-off programs at 7 million, including  
24 compensation for this work, ah, zero waste goals at a  
25 million, multi-family building collection, and  
processing pilot to implementation program, ah,

3 inclusive of NYCHA at 2 million, an analysis of  
4 organics programs towards implementing citywide  
5 curbside, ah, compost collection at, ah, \$250,000,  
6 um, and, you know, that analysis ideally to be  
7 completed by the end of 2021, and, um, municipal  
8 agency composting at a million. Um, and budget  
9 allowing, which I'll talk about shortly, ah,  
10 reinstating and expanding curbside organics  
11 collection. Um, today I'll, I'll highlight, um, the  
12 creation of new composting sites and others in our  
13 coalition will talk about other issues. So in order  
14 to compost the growing volume, um, of food scraps  
15 generated, ah, by the drop-off program and build  
16 capacity for localizing organic waste, ah, processing  
17 and green jobs the city should fund the construction  
18 of community composting sites throughout the city on  
19 parks and/or other city land to provide equitably  
20 siting, ah, sited composting resources throughout the  
21 city. Even with limited drop-off sites compared to  
22 pre-COVID times the current processing sites are  
23 facing capacity issues. Ah, currently there are a  
24 number of composting sites I won't list now, but, um,  
25 the city should partner with nonprofits to build  
community composting sites throughout the city with

2 at least six new sites, two in the Bronx, one in  
3 the...

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

5 TOK OYEWOLE: Um, I'll, I'll finish  
6 quickly by saying, um, you know, we should, ah,  
7 composting locally, um, will enable us to save funds  
8 on exporting recyclable materials out of the city in  
9 the long term. Ah, we, we need to, um, preserve the  
10 Lower East Side Ecology Center and Big Reuse, and,  
11 ah, I must say that even though we're not making a  
12 huge push for mandatory organics in light of the  
13 budget constraints, this will change it for allocated  
14 federal funding. Um, we have until 2030 to curb  
15 greenhouse gas emissions to prevent global warming  
16 above 1.5 degrees Celsius so we must advance bold and  
17 hard-hitting solutions at every chance that we get.  
18 Um, and separate from organics we're asking for 4  
19 million for staffing of the commercial waste zones,  
20 um, ah, law. Thank you so much.

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Dr.

22 Oyewole.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I, I would say  
25 that, um, Commissioner, or former Commissioner

2 Garcia, who is now running for mayor, is actually  
3 using, or stating that the, ah, mandatory organics  
4 work would actually be a benefit to the city as a  
5 cost-saving measure and a job-producing measure.  
6 That's something she would implement should she  
7 become mayor. Um, so, it's interesting what, you  
8 know, some, some leaders think versus others as to  
9 why they [inaudible] like a valuable asset for the  
10 City of New York. So very interesting. But thank  
11 you, Dr. Oyewole.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next  
13 we'll, ah, invite Justin Wood to testify, followed by  
14 Eric Goldstein, followed by Phoebe Flaherty.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

16 JUSTIN WOOD: Hi. Ah, thank you, Chair  
17 Reynoso and members of the committee, and to the  
18 Commissioner and, ah, Deputy Commissioners of  
19 Sanitation. My name is Justin Wood. I'm the  
20 director of policy at New York Lawyers for the Public  
21 Interest. Um, thanks for the opportunity to testify  
22 today and for your consistent leadership on the  
23 critical issues of racial equity, worker safety,  
24 sustainability, and green jobs in the city's solid  
25 waste system. We really no longer need to be here

3 debating the clear and present danger posed by  
4 greenhouse gas emissions, including those from solid  
5 waste, which is fully within the city's control,  
6 unlike some other, um, energy systems and things that  
7 contributed to, ah, emissions. The recent extreme  
8 weather crisis in Texas and the midwest is just the  
9 latest graphic reminder. And we're really worried  
10 that, ah, amidst this, this COVID budget, ah,  
11 situation that we're abandoning our efforts to  
12 transform both the commercial and residential waste  
13 systems to sharply reduce climate emissions, local  
14 air pollution, and the safety hazards caused by an  
15 outdated system that exports far too much waste to  
16 landfills and incinerators in environmental justice  
17 communities. So while recognizing the challenges  
18 that we face in this budget, we urge you to embrace  
19 and negotiate for two bare minimum, ah, proposals to  
20 address this. First is continuing with the full and  
21 robust implementation of the commercial waste zone  
22 law passed by the council in 2019, including a  
23 transition to zero emissions, private sanitation  
24 truck fleets, and major investment in recycling  
25 infrastructure. Ah, the historic transition to a far  
more efficient and accountable zone system will

3 benefit workers, EJ communities who have been among,  
4 among the hardest hit by the pandemic and the  
5 unemployment crisis, and will improve service and  
6 transparency for businesses, reduce emissions, and  
7 stimulate local investment by increasing recycling,  
8 and make the streets safer and cleaner for all New  
9 Yorkers. And so, ah, similar to New York City  
10 Environmental Justice Alliance and, ah, other  
11 partners in Transform Don't Trash New York we really,  
12 ah, urge the, um, administration and council to  
13 commit to a 4 million dollar, um, budget to negotiate  
14 and implement the contracts underpinning the new, ah,  
15 commercial waste zone system, hire the necessary  
16 staff, with the expectation that that system can  
17 become self-sustaining in the future. And then  
18 second, we want to echo, um, the urgent call, ah, to  
19 include a modest 14 million dollar budget for  
20 organics, residential organics recycling, um, this  
21 year. This proposal would support vital in-city  
22 composters, double the reach of the popular food  
23 scrap drop-off program, um, and thank you to the  
24 council for restoring, um, that program at a, at a  
25 small but meaningful level this year, restart compost  
education in public schools, and begin piloting

2 innovative technologies and outreach programs to  
3 ensure that the majority of New Yorkers living in  
4 multifamily buildings will soon have an accessible...

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

6 JUSTIN WOOD: ...easy way to recycle their  
7 food scraps. Um, this would lay the groundwork for  
8 what we really need, which is a citywide mandatory  
9 organics program and we urge you to include this  
10 funding and create these jobs in this year's budget,  
11 and look forward to working with you on the details.  
12 Thank you very much.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will  
14 be Eric Goldstein, followed by Phoebe Flaherty,  
15 followed by Emily Bachman.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

17 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Good afternoon. Ah,  
18 thank you, Chairman Reynoso. Thank you, Council  
19 Member Chin, and members of the committee. I'm Eric  
20 Goldstein, from the Natural Resources Defense  
21 Council. The failure to deal sustainably with the  
22 city's organics, that's food waste and yard waste,  
23 has been one of the biggest disappointments on the  
24 environmental front during the full eight years of  
25 the de Blasio administration. When the mayor took

2 office the administration pledged that New York City  
3 would become a national leader on organics handling.  
4 In fact, exactly the opposite has happened. And this  
5 is not the fault of Commissioner Grayson or  
6 Commissioner Garcia, but the nation's largest pilot  
7 project for curbside food waste collection was itself  
8 scrapped last spring. The community composting  
9 operation that has been so successful in handling  
10 food waste sustainably, teaching kids about nature,  
11 and, ah, returning finished compost to neighborhoods  
12 that residents use in their street trees, in their  
13 plants, and the community gardens, was also zeroed  
14 out during last year's pandemic budget. And only an  
15 outcry by diverse constituents across the city and  
16 last-minute intervention by this council, for which  
17 we're most appreciative, ah, was able to resuscitate  
18 at least a portion of those operations, although the  
19 number of sites now operating is less than two-thirds  
20 of what had been there originally. And even the  
21 composting program at the city's public schools, so  
22 essential to teaching the next generation about  
23 climate and to reduce, ah, ah, to, ah, identify  
24 sensible waste, reduced food waste, even this program  
25 has had its funding slashed. In this year's proposed



2 budget the bad news for most of these environmental  
3 programs continues. Why is it so difficult for  
4 government officials, budget officials, to think and  
5 plan for the long term, even when the long-term  
6 dangers and opportunities are so apparent.

7 [inaudible] reported the same for compost coalition.

8 We join our colleagues in urging restoration of 14.7  
9 million dollars for all of these programs. Three in  
10 particular I'd like to mention. One is Grow NYC's  
11 zero waste programs, which have been the mainstay of  
12 New York City composting since the very beginnings of  
13 collection at the popular green market sites. These  
14 have been some of the highest performing sites in  
15 terms of tonnage in, in the entire city. But this  
16 whole program is zeroed out in the mayor's  
17 preliminary budget. Private funding is unlikely to  
18 be available and Grow NYC deserves and New Yorkers  
19 need the council to fund the Grow NYC operations and  
20 at the fiscal FY20 level, which was approximately 2.5  
21 million dollars. The second additional priority  
22 funding need is to open new community composting  
23 sites in underserved communities that still do not  
24 have convenient drop-off locations. The same is true  
25 for NYCHA developments. This is simply a matter of

3 fairness and equity. All New Yorkers have a right to  
4 convenient access to food waste composting and the  
5 council needs to right this wrong by providing  
6 additional funding to establish and expand these  
7 sites. Finally, there is the need for restoration of  
8 composting and recycling...

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

10 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: ...in all New York City  
11 public schools, beginning in September, when we hope  
12 and expect the schools will be back to more or less  
13 normal operations. It's so important to teach young  
14 children about nature and the climate crisis and to  
15 get them in the habit of separating their food waste  
16 from ordinary trash. We're counting on the City  
17 Council, which has historically been a leader on city  
18 environmental issues, to step in and re-priority  
19 these essential sanitation programs for which all,  
20 from which all New Yorkers will benefit. And oh yes,  
21 in my written testimony I outline the critical need  
22 for 4 million dollars in funding to continue the  
23 commercial waste zone implementation which you,  
24 Chairman Reynoso, are very, very familiar with.  
25 Thank you for your attention.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Eric.

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Next will be Phoebe  
4 Flaherty, followed by Emily Bachman, followed by  
5 Christine Datz-Romero.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

7 PHOEBE FLAHERTY: Hi, good afternoon, and  
8 thanks for the opportunity to testify. I'm Phoebe  
9 Flaherty, an organizer at Align. Um, we coordinate  
10 the Climate Works for All Coalition and Transformed  
11 on Trash Coalition that led to passing Local Law 97  
12 and Local Law 199 commercial waste zones. Um, and,  
13 you know, we all know we're still in the middle of  
14 the pandemic and, ah, New York's black and brown  
15 environmental justice communities are bearing the  
16 brunt of the impact from the virus and that kind of  
17 downturn, um, so we're here to join the chorus and  
18 call on the city budget to prioritize investment in  
19 job creation for communities that have been hit the  
20 hardest by this pandemic. Ah, the Climate Works For  
21 All Coalition created an equitable recovery report,  
22 which is a road map to creating 100,000 good green  
23 jobs for New York City's black and brown communities  
24 and move us out of the pandemic, um, and this by  
25 investigate 16 million dollars over the three years  
to create 100,000 jobs and, you know, we believe this

3 is the comprehensive plan we need to move our city  
4 through the crisis and towards equity and climate  
5 justice. Um, and we know that, you know, we have to  
6 take steps to move us there and so we've developed  
7 some interim budget priorities, many of which, ah,  
8 the folks on, who've already testified today, have  
9 mentioned. Um, so within the city's 2020 budget we  
10 are calling for an investment of 17 million for  
11 public waste management, including 4 million for the  
12 implementation of commercial waste zones, um, and 13  
13 million to expand organics collection, and so I know  
14 folks have spoken to, um, previously to what those  
15 numbers would go twos, um, you know, for expanding  
16 organs. It's, it's going to go towards laying the  
17 groundwork for, ah, the cost-effective citywide  
18 mandatory organic waste recycling system, um, by  
19 doubling the capacity of community groups drop-off  
20 program, um, and piloting new technology, um,  
21 etcetera, and, you know, DSNY will also need 7  
22 million to expand community drop-off composting plus  
23 6 million to initial food scrap collection from  
24 larger residential, ah, government buildings this  
25 year. Um, and we're also advocating for an  
investment of 4 million dollars to staff up for the

2 implementation of commercial waste zones, as others  
3 have mentioned as well. Um, additionally within the  
4 Climate Works For All equitable recovery report we're  
5 asking for additional funding for retrofitting school  
6 buildings and installing solar on schools and  
7 expanding, um, clean transportation, viewing this as  
8 a collective, um, ask coming from the coalition. Um,  
9 and we believe these investments are what are  
10 necessary to, you know, invest in New York's  
11 [inaudible] frontline environmental justice  
12 communities and address inequities of the pandemic  
13 and move us out of the COVID crisis, ah, while  
14 addressing the climate crisis. Um, so thank you for  
15 your time and consideration today.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next  
17 we'll hear from Emily Bachman, followed by Christine  
18 Datz-Romero, followed by Justin Green.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

20 EMILY BACHMAN: Thank you. Um, thanks  
21 for this opportunity to testify in support of  
22 increasing funding for composting in fiscal, the  
23 fiscal year 22 budget. My name is Emily Bachman and  
24 I'm the compost program manager at Grow NYC, where  
25 we've been running food scrap drop-off sites, like

3 the one behind me, since 2011. We pop up at green  
4 markets, subway stations, and community gardens to  
5 collect household food scraps from New York City  
6 residents, and we partner with New York City Compost  
7 Project host sites to make compost locally. First, I  
8 just want to be clear that the preliminary budget  
9 leaves overall funding for composting at just 13% of  
10 fiscal year 20 levels and it does not fully restore  
11 funding for community composting. As Eric stated  
12 earlier, the 3.5 million proposed for community  
13 composting does not include Grow NYC, which operates  
14 the largest food scrap drop-off sites in New York  
15 City. Our funding has historically been included in  
16 the recycling outreach line of the budget and our  
17 fiscal year 20 funding for composting was about 2.5  
18 million. Our DSNY funding is 80% lower this year and  
19 is completely missing from the proposed budget. So  
20 with this year's smaller budget we have been very  
21 happy to reopen 15 of our 76 former food scrap drop-  
22 off sites, to hire 20 compost coordinators and  
23 drivers, engage 118 volunteers, and collect over 17  
24 tons of food scraps for composting every single week.  
25 The response from the public has been awe-inspiring,  
truly. On average, collections at our reopened sites

3 are 30% higher today than they were before COVID.

4 Collections are 20% higher in the south Bronx, 55%

5 higher in the Upper West Side, 60% higher in Bed-Sty

6 Brooklyn, 145% higher in Carroll Gardens. This

7 growth is both encouraging and alarming. We are

8 thrilled to see New Yorkers commitment to composting,

9 but severely limited in our ability to meet existing

10 demand due to budget cuts. Meanwhile, our private

11 sector fundraising efforts are consistently met with

12 rejection due to potential donors' beliefs that

13 residential waste management in New York should be

14 publicly funded at the municipal level. We support

15 the Save Our Compost Coalition's request for 14.75

16 million dollars, which includes 2.5 million for the

17 Grow NYC compost program. And while still much less

18 than pre-COVID funding we believe that funding at

19 these levels would dramatically increase access to

20 composting for all New Yorkers this year while

21 setting us back on track towards establishing a

22 universe curbside composting program in the near term

23 and, ah, just to finish up, I, I want to say we're

24 incredibly thankful to the City Council and the

25 Department of Sanitation for your support over the

years, and we just sincerely hope to see renewed

2 commitment to our city's zero waste goals reflected  
3 in the Department of Sanitation budget for fiscal  
4 year 22 so we can continue collaborating on this  
5 work. Thanks.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will  
7 be Christine Datz-Romero, followed by Justin Green,  
8 followed by Ceci Pineda.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

10 CHRISTINE DATZ-ROMERO: [inaudible] has  
11 offered community-based composting for the last 30  
12 years and the lockdown, ah, due to the COVID, um, ah,  
13 crisis is the first time in our history when we had  
14 to pause our collection operations. Fortunately, we  
15 were able to open up drop-off locations again last  
16 July thanks to the budget restorations spearheaded by  
17 the City Council. We are very grateful for this  
18 restoration. Since then we have, ah, seen a steady  
19 increase in participation in, ah, organics diverted  
20 from the landfill. One record month, breaking month,  
21 is following the next record-breaking month. Just  
22 like Emily was, ah, saying in January alone we  
23 collected and processed over 130,000 pounds of  
24 organics, serving thousands of households, ah,  
25 through 10 drop-off locations in lower Manhattan.



3 Keeping community-based composting programs well  
4 funded will allow us to bridge the gap until the city  
5 is in a position to implement citywide organics  
6 collection from each city household. As part of the  
7 Save Our Compost Coalition we call for the investment  
8 into composting programs in the amount of 14.75  
9 millions, including 7 millions to support not only  
10 the existing network of our community-based  
11 composting network, but to expand that network to at  
12 least half, ah, six additional composting processing  
13 sites in the boroughs. Ah, because we need to ensure  
14 local processing of food scraps and create green  
15 jobs. We also, I would also be remiss to not call  
16 out the urgent need to continue our policy work, and  
17 again I want to thank, ah, Chairman Reynoso, who held  
18 a, ah, City Council oversight hearing together with  
19 the Parks Department to really move the needle to  
20 make sure that both the Lower East Side Ecology  
21 Center and Big Reuse will continue to have a space in  
22 city parks, ah, to continue our, our sustainability  
23 work there. Um, I briefly want to also talk about  
24 the other recycling program that has disappeared due  
25 to budget constraints last year, and that's e-waste  
collection. Um, disposing of unwanted electronics is

2 illegal in New York City, in New York State, and, um,  
3 the service reductions that, ah, the, um, that were  
4 installed last year really, ah, left New York City  
5 residents with very few options for disposal of their  
6 old gadgets. We heard a lot about dirty streets.  
7 Well, if you walk around I'm sure you have also  
8 witnessed, um, e-waste, um, being dumped on street  
9 corners illegally, which is really, um, not where we  
10 should be heading. Um, I listened to Commissioner  
11 Grayson the other day, ah, at the Brooklyn Swap,  
12 where he announced that at least safe events and, ah,  
13 special household waste collection sites are coming  
14 back in the new fiscal year, which I think is a step  
15 in the right direction. And again, ah, I want to  
16 thank the City Council for their support of our  
17 program. Ah, we've been running...

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

19 CHRISTINE DATZ-ROMERO: ...an e-waste  
20 program [inaudible] and, ah, we cannot, ah, afford to  
21 walk away from sustainability programs that address  
22 our climate crisis. And I'd like to, ah, thank the  
23 City Council for all their support. Thank you.

24

25

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will  
3 be Justin Green, followed by Ceci Pineda, followed by  
4 Carlos Castell Croke.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6 JUSTIN GREEN: Hi, good afternoon, ah,  
7 City Council. Ah, thanks so much for having us. Um,  
8 I'm here to recommend that the City Council budget  
9 include 14.75 million, ah, as recommended by many  
10 other, ah, environmental organizations on this call  
11 to expand composting throughout the city. Um, we're  
12 really thankful to City Council and Department of  
13 Sanitation for their support of our work in the past,  
14 um, and DSNY's commitment to environmental, ah,  
15 innovative environmental programming, um, really  
16 makes the, I think, ah, this Department of Sanitation  
17 stand out nationwide in terms of its approach prior  
18 to COVID. Um, we're also really thankful the City  
19 Council for, ah, your efforts to support Big Reuse  
20 and Lower East Side Ecology Center effort to continue  
21 our, our long-standing community composting sites,  
22 ah, located on Parks land. Um, we appreciate that  
23 effort and hope we can, ah, are successful. Um, Big  
24 Reuse, the organization I am the executive director  
25 of, is part of the city's composting program. We

2 operate two community composting sites, ah, compost,  
3 ah, a thousand tons of residential food waste and  
4 parks waste every year. We give that compost out to  
5 the community to 200 community groups for greening  
6 activities and parks. Um, we've worked with the, ah,  
7 current food scrap drop-off effort where we're  
8 hauling from 30 food scraps drop-offs throughout the  
9 city and, ah, soon to expand, um, with our other  
10 partners to reach every community board, um, in the  
11 city, um, and that's due to our close work with the  
12 Department of Sanitation and City Council funding.  
13 Um, we're requesting the additional funds to, as  
14 everyone has stated, um, to expand that effort. The  
15 effort has been so successful we are overwhelmed with  
16 the amount of, of participation and need to add both,  
17 ah, hauling capacity, um, composting capacity, and  
18 distribution, ah, programs that we had had before.  
19 Um, so that's funding not only our efforts but those  
20 of the Botanical Gardens and Grow NYC and, ah, Earth  
21 Matter on Lower East Side. Um, we also would like  
22 the addition of community composting sites throughout  
23 the city. Um, there are, Bronx currently does not  
24 have, um, similar sites that, that we have in Queens  
25 and Brooklyn, um, eastern Queens also, southern

2 Brooklyn. There are a number of areas that could use  
3 community composting sites to compost locally and  
4 provide compost to those [inaudible] and the, ah,  
5 community gardens that desperately in need of soil  
6 amendments. Um, and I guess most of all I think we  
7 would like to see, or Big Reuse would like to see is  
8 a return to, ah, curbside composting collection. Um,  
9 the amounts named in the budget is, in terms of  
10 savings of 19, 20, 25 million are so minuscule in the  
11 overall scheme of things that it seems it clear we  
12 should return to...

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

14 JUSTIN GREEN: ...curbside composting  
15 collection as soon as possible, and I think with, um,  
16 making it mandatory and save as you throw we will  
17 soon, we would see, um, optimized collection routes  
18 and scaled, ah, composting sites that would reduce  
19 the cost and make it, ah, efficient and affordable.  
20 So, we ask strongly that we look at that and return  
21 to curbside composting collection as soon as  
22 possible. Thank you for your time.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will  
24 be Ceci Pineda, followed by Carlos Castell Croke,  
25 followed by Anna Sacks.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

3 CECI PINEDA: Good afternoon. My name is  
4 Ceci Pineda and I'm the executive director at the  
5 [inaudible]. We're a youth-powered composting  
6 project that collects food scraps by bike and compost  
7 them at our partner gardens. I'm testify today to  
8 urge the Department of Sanitation to increase the New  
9 York City Compost Project's fiscal year 22 budget  
10 allocation to 14.75 million. Um, we were founded in  
11 2013 in part due to a lack of public composting  
12 options in our neighborhoods and eight years later we  
13 find our mission increasingly relevant. Last year we  
14 collected the largest amount of residential organic  
15 waste since launching, more than doubling our  
16 previous record in 2019. Residential organic waste  
17 collection and processing is a public good. It  
18 creates a surplus of social, economic, and ecological  
19 benefits. And it's our opinion that this service  
20 should be fully managed and overseen by the city.  
21 However, as Council Member Reynoso also stated,  
22 currently our organics collection and processing  
23 functions off the service and labor that isn't  
24 compensated by the city. Um, even at the start of  
25 this fiscal year before city-funded food scraps drop-

3 offs reopened, we implemented our contactless food  
4 scraps drop-off. This significantly increased the  
5 labor demand on our youth drop-off managers, whose  
6 incomes are sustained by donations from our neighbors  
7 who use our drop-off service. New Yorkers understand  
8 the great importance and need to responsibly manage  
9 the resources we use. Composting is one of the most  
10 accessible tools to do so and that's in part why we  
11 see hundreds of volunteers show up to support  
12 responsible waste management. And anyone today whose  
13 eyes opening, open to the suffering of the climate  
14 crisis carry a profound desire to rise and take the  
15 magnitude of actions demanded to address it. I wish  
16 the city budget and Sanitation's budget would also  
17 recognize and reflect this responsibility. This  
18 upcoming fiscal year has an immense opportunity to  
19 advance efficient, just, and accessible [inaudible]  
20 to collect and process residential organic waste, all  
21 the while creating great opportunities for local  
22 employment. And in our experience, um, benefits from  
23 organic, from, from these systems significantly  
24 amplified, um, when initiatives are hyper-localized,  
25 use zero to low emissions technologies, and include  
an environmental justice analysis. Um, we urge the

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
WASTE MANAGEMENT

96

2 Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste to deeply  
3 consider the ecological, climate, and social justice  
4 crises in structuring their budget for this upcoming  
5 fiscal year and increase the, um, budget for the New  
6 York City Compost Project to 14.75 million and, as  
7 others on this call have also shared, for community  
8 composting and, ah, the food scraps drop-off program,  
9 for new compost processing facilities for multi-  
10 family building collection and processing pilot, um,  
11 to also pilot your, ah, zero waste schools programs,  
12 ah, for composting in, um, municipal agencies and  
13 facilities, and also for a feasibility study on  
14 citywide curbside composting. Um, we urge any pilots  
15 to center and prioritize low-income New Yorkers...

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 CECI PINEDA: ...and environmental justice  
18 communities that have historically been deprioritized  
19 in city organics recycling programs. Um, thank you  
20 for your time and as fellow sanitation workers we  
21 deeply appreciate and respect your service.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will  
23 be Carlos Castell Croke, followed by Anna Sacks,  
24 followed by Marisa DeDominicis.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.



2 CARLOS CASTELL CROKE: Ah, good  
3 afternoon. My name is Carlos Castell Croke and I'm  
4 the associate for New York City programs at the New  
5 York League of Conservation Voters. NYLCV represents  
6 over 30,000 members in New York City, and we are  
7 committed to advancing a sustainability agenda that  
8 will make our people, our neighborhoods, and our  
9 economy healthier and more resilient. I'd like to  
10 thank Chair Reynoso and all the City Council members,  
11 um, on the committee for the opportunity to testify  
12 today. NYLCV supports a fiscal year 22 budget, um,  
13 that secures progress as, ah, on many of the  
14 environmental transportation and public health  
15 priors. Mayor de Blasio has committed to OneNYC and  
16 beyond. Our city is on the precipice of the road to  
17 recovery from the COVID-19 pandemic and it is  
18 incumbent upon our elected leaders to invest our tax  
19 dollars and climate action solutions as a rebound  
20 from this crisis and not lose ground. Last year the  
21 city made substantial cuts to programs that were  
22 originally implemented to make progress on our  
23 sanitation-related climate goals. The city was  
24 already behind schedule on meeting its zero waste  
25 goal of reducing the amount of waste we send to

2 landfills by 90% by 2030, before these cuts. So we  
3 implore the city that, we implore that the city take  
4 bold action to drastically reduce waste over the next  
5 nine years. First, we must ensure that the  
6 Department of Sanitation has the funding they need to  
7 properly implement commercial waste zones. This  
8 program, which was established as Local Law 199 of  
9 2019, will reduce emissions and improve safety for  
10 workers and pedestrians by requiring commercial  
11 carters to operate within waste zones instead of  
12 rushing to cover long gratuitous routes. We ask that  
13 the Department of Sanitation receive 4 million to  
14 fully fund the staff, consultants, and data  
15 management needed to implement this program. The  
16 fiscal year 22 budget must also include the 14  
17 million in funding for composting programs across the  
18 city that will start to bring us back towards our  
19 zero waste goals. This money will include doubling  
20 the current funding for New York's food scraps drop-  
21 off program, providing additional funding to large-  
22 scale compost sites, such as Big Reuse and Lower East  
23 Side Ecology Center, reinstating the in-school  
24 composting educational program, and exploring a  
25 multifamily building collection pilot program. This

3 14 million in funding will set the city up to take  
4 aggressive waste reduction actions in the near  
5 future. Initially the City Council should also pass  
6 Intros 1942 and 1943, sponsored by Council Member  
7 Powers and Reynoso, respectively. Ah, these bills  
8 would establish community compost recycling drop-off  
9 sites to equitably serve New York City's residents by  
10 establish and enforcing good recycling habits and  
11 reducing waste. Then, very soon after this, the city  
12 needs to introduce legislation to create a citywide  
13 curbside composting program and ensure that this  
14 program is fully funded. This initiative will  
15 ultimately save the city money, put organic materials  
16 back to use as fossil and soil amendments, instead of  
17 treated as waste, reduce emissions from landfills and  
18 put us back on track with these zero waste goals.  
19 Achieving zero waste and carbon neutrality will  
20 require financial commitments from the city in this  
21 and future budgets, and we look forward to working  
22 with the council to achieve this goal. Thank you for  
23 the opportunity to testify.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next  
25 we'll hear from Anna Sacks, followed by Marisa  
DeDominicis, followed by Wylie Goodman.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

3 ANNA SACKS: Hi. My name is Anna Sacks  
4 and I am testifying as a member of the Save Our  
5 Compost Coalition. According to the DSNY waste  
6 characterization study from 2017, 34% of New York  
7 City's residential waste consists of material that is  
8 suitable for composting. You would think that as a  
9 result composting would receive comparable funding  
10 from the city. But last year we as a city spent 2.86  
11 million on composting, which we only won because of a  
12 hard fight, and thank you, Reynoso, for your support  
13 and other members of the committee. But we spent  
14 over 400 million exporting our trash to landfills and  
15 incinerators located mostly in environmental justice  
16 communities. We no longer have curbside composting.  
17 We no longer have composting at schools. We no  
18 longer have all of the food scraps drop-off sites  
19 because of the limited budget, and Big Reuse and the  
20 Lower East Side Ecology Center, which is two of our  
21 largest, ah, community composting sites, are set to  
22 be evicted by June by the de Blasio administration's  
23 park leadership. New York City's residential waste  
24 system, including composting, needs to be fixed and  
25 now is the time to set the groundwork for a better

2 system. We are asking for a modest 14.75 million for  
3 New York City's composting system, realizing the city  
4 is facing a fiscal crisis. We need to continue  
5 composting and expand it, and we also need to  
6 understand how post COVID we can make composting more  
7 successful and more cost-effective. For this we need  
8 funding for studies and pilots, which must be  
9 publicly fund. Community composting creates local  
10 green jobs, reduces the waste sent to landfills and  
11 incinerators, and the finished compost replenishes  
12 New York City soil and it's also a way of, um,  
13 building a more resilient climate that can absorb  
14 more rainwater. Please do not treat sustainable  
15 waste management as a luxury. Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next  
17 we'll hear from Marisa DeDominicis, followed by Wylie  
18 Goodman, followed by Kate Peterson.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

20 MARISA DEDOMINICIS: Good afternoon,  
21 council members. I'm speaking today in support of  
22 the Save our Compost budget request and as a member  
23 of the Save Our Compost and the ED of Earth Matter  
24 New York, a nonprofit organization located on  
25 Governors Island. We're contracted by the Department

2 of Sanitation's New York City Compost Project and  
3 we're in a position to assert the success of  
4 community compost efforts as part of the city's waste  
5 management solutions since 2012. Our New York State  
6 Department of Environmental Conservation component  
7 facility processes 800 tons of organic material  
8 annually. We're one of several facilities with a  
9 proven track record of reducing waste exportation and  
10 creating invaluable soil amendment in New York City  
11 for New York City. The 2017, ah, community component  
12 report shows the pie chart that says that we can  
13 compost 31% from the waste stream, but that 99% is  
14 going into the waste stream. I'm here today to  
15 respectfully request that this committee ensures that  
16 there is a decrease in the amount of organic waste  
17 going to incineration and landfills in 2022. I urge  
18 you to allocate additional composting funding as the  
19 budget priority in the following three areas. One,  
20 invest in infrastructure. Ensure Big and Lower East  
21 Side have permanent homes in parks. Advocate,  
22 allocate additional land and resources to create six  
23 additional compost facilities located strategically  
24 in all the boroughs to increase the local compost  
25 processing capacity in educational hubs. These

2 facilities will create the green jobs for many of the  
3 skilled volunteers who dedicate and donate thousands  
4 of hours to compost neighbor organics in their small  
5 community and parks right now. The suspension of the  
6 curbside program allows for the exploration of  
7 innovative, 24/7 staff systems where residents can  
8 walk to collectively shared bins. The EMZ bin, or in  
9 other systems may be a good way to service our  
10 densely populated urban settings, such as NYCHA or  
11 Chinatown. And finally compost education for  
12 everyone, in schools, for residents, offices, the  
13 Parks Department. Please increase funding to grow  
14 New York City and other composting organizations  
15 trained to provide the education necessary to ensure  
16 the success of New York City composting. Thank you  
17 so much for this opportunity to share my views and  
18 your support of the reinstating of the partial budget  
19 from last year.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will  
21 be Wylie Goodman, followed by Kate Peterson, followed  
22 by Catie Savage.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

24 WYLIE GOODMAN: Hello. Thank you,  
25 Sanitation and Solid Waste committee members,

2 particularly Chair Reynoso and members Constantinides  
3 and Gennaro, and Queens-based DSNY Commissioner  
4 Grayson [inaudible]. My name is Wylie Goodman. I am  
5 the chair of the Queens Solid Waste Advisory Board  
6 Organizing Committee. However, to be clear, I am  
7 testifying today as an individual Queens resident,  
8 not in my formal role. In the same way that City  
9 Bikes changed transportation behavior by bringing  
10 biking to the neighborhood level, we need to change  
11 New Yorker's waste behavior by bringing waste  
12 collection to the neighborhood level through a  
13 community-led organic waste collection and  
14 processing. With cuts to DSNY's budget to fund that  
15 formerly went to organic voluntary curbside  
16 composting, New York City Compost Project partners  
17 and Grow NYC food scraps drop-off sites, much of this  
18 work is being done now by women-led and BIPOC-led  
19 nonprofits and small businesses. But these are not  
20 dispersed equally across the city and in Queens we  
21 lack these services entirely. For this reason I  
22 strongly urge an amended FY22 DSNY budget that  
23 restores the 14.75 million already noted to increase  
24 the capacity of local neighborhood-based composting  
25 collection and processing as well as e-waste waste



2 recycling in partnership with organizations such as  
3 Big Reuse, Queens Botanic Garden, and Grow NYC, among  
4 others. This is not because our highly value,  
5 valuable and respected unionized workforce cannot do  
6 the work, but because when waste is exclusively  
7 handled through what might feel to many as an  
8 anonymous city agency it allows the public's out of  
9 sight, out of mind, ah, mindset around waste to  
10 continue. To change behavior New Yorkers need to see  
11 people who look like them going the extra mile to  
12 separate the 22% to 40% of our waste that includes  
13 organics and [inaudible] for doing so by being given  
14 locally produced compost they can use to amend street  
15 tree beds, rain gardens, community gardens, and even  
16 feed their houseplants. Similarly, similarly we need  
17 to change the behavior of the next generation for New  
18 Yorkers by restoring funding for zero waste schools  
19 focused on organics and repair clinics, which teach  
20 you the skills they need to repair and reuse, the  
21 latter of which we have never had, to my knowledge.  
22 Without such programs, youth will continue to feel  
23 disconnected from the materials they use, rather than  
24 see themselves as active contributors through a  
25 circular economy and potential future workers in a

2 well-paid green workforce, which they easily could be  
3 if they were taught early and often. We know the  
4 economic fallout from COVID-19 has had devastating  
5 impacts on the city's budget, requiring across-the-  
6 board cuts, including at DSNY. But given the urgency  
7 of mitigating climate change in the most populous and  
8 diverse city in the nation, we cannot continue  
9 pouring money traditional, into traditional trash  
10 collection practices while cutting funds for  
11 prevention, reuse, and recycling that will in time,  
12 and if fully supported, reduce the cost long-term  
13 waste export to our city and ensure we no longer are  
14 complicit in the land filling and incineration of  
15 waste...

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 WYLIE GOODMAN: ...and environmental  
18 justice [inaudible] nationwide. Thank you.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will  
20 be Kate Peterson, followed by Catie Savage, followed  
21 by Clare Miflin.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

23 KATE PETERSON: Hi. My name is Kate  
24 Peterson and I have lived in Astoria, Queens for more  
25 than a decade, and I'm testifying today because I

2 would like the City Council to ensure that New York  
3 City has the sanitation services that they need by  
4 restoring the budget and by specifically restoring  
5 the budget to litter basket collection service to at  
6 least the levels of fiscal year 2020. Um, as Chair  
7 Reynoso said today, a dirty city is a public health  
8 crisis in itself. In June of last year I asked  
9 people in my neighborhood to join me. Um, we started  
10 emptying overflowing litter baskets in my  
11 neighborhood, and at that time I thought that it  
12 would call attention to a problem that could be  
13 solved. As you might guess by that timeline, ah, it  
14 only grew worse in July with the major budget cuts  
15 and, ah, we really don't have a plan going into the  
16 next year, so we're going to be seeing the exact same  
17 thing. Um, the pandemic has changed human behavior.  
18 We're using our public spaces differently and  
19 assuming that we can follow a similar plan that we  
20 did before with an extremely reduced budget is, ah,  
21 very short-sighted. Um, as a result of the  
22 conditions in our neighborhood for the past eight  
23 months, I have rallied volunteers. We spent over a  
24 thousand hours picking up litter off of our public  
25 sidewalks, and we've had over 70 clean-ups. Um, I

2 want to shout out to all of Astoria for being amazing  
3 and to come out during a pandemic and pick up trash.  
4 Um, however, this is not something that we should  
5 have to do in order to have sanitary living  
6 conditions. Um, throughout our work I've also  
7 connected with many other litter clean-up groups  
8 across the city, some of whom are here today and, ah,  
9 I have really learned that the situation that we're  
10 facing now with these budget cuts is that we are  
11 exacerbating a state of inequity in sanitation. And  
12 if we continue with this path we are going to have,  
13 um, areas that have higher income will have cleaner  
14 streets and other areas will not, and that is not  
15 what we deserve for New York City. Um, so because  
16 I'm in a situation where I've been able to devote the  
17 time needed to this issue, I recognize that I have  
18 the privilege and I want to use my voice to advocate  
19 to make sure that services are being given to  
20 everybody in New York City who, um, everybody  
21 equally. Um, the last thing I wanted to bring up is  
22 that I'm concerned maybe the data is not being  
23 tracked properly in terms of what the actual  
24 conditions on our sidewalks is. Um, in August of  
25 last year the sidewalks in my community district

2 received a 100% approval rating from the mayor's  
3 scorecard system. Um, I don't know what sidewalks  
4 they visited, but, ah, yeah, I can't imagine how they  
5 got to 100%. If you looked in my apartment from  
6 outside a window you might think it was 100% clean.  
7 But, ah, once you get inside it's very clearly not.  
8 So, ah, I would, I would urge City Council to  
9 consider, ah, whether the data is being captured  
10 properly. If it's not, to figure out how it could be  
11 captured properly, because if that's the data that we  
12 are relying on to create a budget we are, um, we are  
13 not doing it accurately. Um, and the final thing I  
14 want to say is that if we continue last year in the  
15 same vein that we did, I mean, continue next year...

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 KATE PETERSON: ...in the same vein we did  
18 this year, um, I'm concerned that people will not  
19 want to continue to live in what I consider the most  
20 amazing city in the world and I'm concerned people  
21 will leave my neighborhood in Astoria, which is the  
22 best neighborhood in New York City, so, thank you.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will  
24 be Catie Savage, followed by Clare Mifflin, followed  
25 by Henry Lee.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

3 CATIE SAVAGE: Good afternoon. My name  
4 is Catie Savage and I am the founder of the Hell's  
5 Kitchen Litter Legion, a volunteer community clean-up  
6 group started in June of 2020. Over the past eight  
7 months we have hosted 30 group clean-ups with over  
8 275 participants and almost 100 unique volunteers.  
9 Together we pick up litter and empty overflowing  
10 corner baskets, primarily along 10th Avenue in Hell's  
11 Kitchen. Due to the Department of Sanitation budget  
12 cuts the litter baskets along this avenue are only  
13 emptied once every two to three days. This may have  
14 been acceptable last spring during the lockdown when  
15 no one was outside, but once the weather warmed up  
16 the excess trash started to appear. Last week alone  
17 we picked up 325 pounds of loose litter along a 10-  
18 block stretch and emptied 40 overflowing corner  
19 baskets. As we start to enter spring again we need  
20 the drastic service cuts to be restored more than  
21 ever. We cannot normalize seeing trash everywhere.  
22 This is not a job for volunteers. These are basic  
23 city services that must be restored. Also, in my 16  
24 years as a New York City resident I have never once  
25 encountered a syringe on the street until last

3 spring. Just this week I reported six syringes  
4 within three blocks, most of them by schools. Clean-  
5 up groups throughout the city are encountering these  
6 issues as well. As part of the FY21 budget cuts the  
7 DSNY syringe collection unit was eliminated, and it  
8 now takes longer for these conditions to be  
9 addressed. In addition to restored funding for  
10 basket service and syringe collection by DSNY, I urge  
11 council members to restore full fiscal year 2020  
12 funding levels for the NYC clean-up initiative that  
13 supports critical supplemental cleaning services  
14 throughout the city. It's not Department of  
15 Sanitation's job to clean the sidewalks, but we need  
16 those sidewalk spaces to be clean. Our businesses  
17 are struggling and providing support to keep our  
18 streets clean will make our city more attractive to  
19 the visitors we desperately need to help our economy  
20 rebound from the impacts of the pandemic. This  
21 amounts to a modest 5.1 million dollars in funding  
22 that will provide an immediate impact on the  
23 cleanliness of our streets. These programs also  
24 provide jobs to formerly homeless and incarcerated  
25 individuals, so to me this is a win-win, creating  
jobs and keeping our streets clean. I've

2 participated in clean-ups in Manhattan, Brooklyn,  
3 Queens, and the Bronx. And everywhere is dirty. We  
4 all see the same things and we don't deserve to live  
5 in these conditions. Um, it's, it's a huge issue and  
6 it really needs to be addressed. We have to have the  
7 basic city services. We have to have overflowing  
8 baskets emptied. I understand the need to educate  
9 and reduce the waste stream in general, but that  
10 doesn't mean we stop and let the city turn into a  
11 dumping ground. Thank you for your time.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will  
13 be Clare Miflin, followed by Henry Lee, followed by  
14 Leslie Woodruff.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

16 CLARE MIFLIN: Hi, I'm Clare Miflin,  
17 Center for Zero Waste Design and part of the Save Our  
18 Compost Coalition. I fully support the Save Our  
19 Compost funding request for 14.75 million to expand  
20 community composting and to pilot solutions to ensure  
21 all buildings can be set up for future successful  
22 curbside collection. When developing the zero waste  
23 design guidelines we visited over 40 buildings and  
24 know that many of them would not be able to manage  
25 the brown organics bins. It's fine for well-



3 resourced buildings, but many just don't have enough  
4 staff or space. Typically trash is dropped into a  
5 chute, which feeds directly into a compactor and the  
6 black bags. Those bags are 40% full of organic  
7 waste. It's a lot. To collect it in small bins  
8 instead requires more labor and space. Many  
9 buildings have small, unventilated waste rooms.  
10 Others don't have enough staff to move the bins to  
11 and from the curb, it could be 50 of them in a large  
12 building, and keep them clean. It's time to spend a  
13 modest 2 million on pilots to determine the best way  
14 to set up all buildings for successful participation  
15 and to reduce costs for future curbside collection.  
16 Equipment can be installed in buildings that reduces  
17 the volume of organic waste by [inaudible] eliminate  
18 [inaudible] and produces an organic fertilizer. On-  
19 street containers could allow residents in, ah, in  
20 neighborhoods with no space at all to, and under-  
21 resourced buildings to drop off waste curbside. How  
22 these systems are best set up for high participation,  
23 low contamination, and easy management needs to be  
24 tested and evaluated in a pilot. But it's clear they  
25 could save substantial money for the buildings and  
the city. Food scraps are the most problematic part

3 of the waste stream, bringing cockroaches, pest  
4 control chemicals, and asthma to buildings, garbage  
5 juice, rats, and odors to streets, and greenhouse gas  
6 emissions to landfills. Yet separated they can bring  
7 huge benefits to the city, regenerating local soils,  
8 supporting urban agriculture, and street trees,  
9 making the city cooler and reducing flooding. This  
10 can be done in so many ways. All require different  
11 amounts of space and labor with community and  
12 volunteer involvement or using in-building equipment.  
13 So I fully support expanding community composting,  
14 but we also need pilots so when the city restarts  
15 organic collection and makes it mandatory it will be  
16 successful, equitable, and affordable. We need to  
17 ensure that all New Yorkers can participate in making  
18 their city greener, cleaner, and more sustainable.  
19 14.75 million is not a lot, but it could have a  
20 catalytic effect, setting New York City up for zero  
21 waste success and creating a whole host of other  
22 benefits. Thank you all for your time and  
23 consideration.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will  
25 be Henry Lee, followed by Leslie Woodruff, followed  
by Jane Selden.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

3 HENRY LEE: Hi, everyone. I'm Henry Lee.

4 I live on the, ah, the 900, 700 block of 9th Avenue

5 here in Hell's Kitchen and I just want to tell you

6 over the last year what I've seen and experienced,

7 and just, as some people have said, it really is a

8 quality of, of life issue here in the city. It's

9 about the health and safety for everyone. It is my

10 belief that people are gonna leave the city if it's

11 not gonna be livable, and this is what I've seen.

12 I've seen lots of household trash dumped on 9th

13 Avenue between the avenue itself and the bike lane

14 where the bins are meant to be. They are, have been

15 overflowing. A couple weeks I saw someone had

16 renovated their apartment or moved and their garbage

17 got dumped out on the corner, on the sidewalk. It

18 sat there for two weeks. And I know this is the case

19 because there was a very nice Mila, ah, dishwasher

20 that was left in the garbage, and we commented on it

21 several, several times. I also have seen syringes in

22 the street, which was shocking to me. I saw people

23 actually over the summer using drugs in the streets.

24 Ah, this is, this is, to me is a very serious issue.

25 I love New York, ah, but I was really shocked at how

2 bad things have gotten, ah, as, you know, I actually  
3 met Catie Savage, ah, last year and I've tried to  
4 help her a little bit. Ah, she's done an amazing  
5 job. Ah, but I think we all can agree that we  
6 definitely want our city to be livable because I, you  
7 know, I put a little note here. How does the mayor  
8 expect to restart the tourist economy, ah, if this is  
9 a disgusting and dirty city. Ah, anyway, thanks for  
10 letting me speak.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next  
12 we'll hear from Leslie Woodruff, followed by Jane  
13 Selden, followed by Josh Tjaden.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

15 LESLIE WOODRUFF: Hi everyone. Leslie  
16 Woodruff here. I live in Hell's Kitchen, um, and I'm  
17 coming to you from a family perspective. I run a  
18 small group, um, of parents and, um, family members  
19 call Hell's Kitchen Families, and last year was  
20 really tough for all the families in the neighborhood  
21 when our kids were picking up, excuse me, our kids  
22 were actually picking up syringes. That's just  
23 something that goes beyond anything I ever expected,  
24 ah, being a parent. Um, I love composting. We are  
25 big fans. But we need to get down to the basics and

2 get back to the basics. We need our budget from last  
3 year restored so that we can have proper pickups.

4 The waste cans on the corner that are overflowing  
5 constantly, um, the litter begets litter, right? So  
6 the can's overflowing, so sometimes, you know, we're  
7 lucky enough that we've got, um, Hell's Kitchen  
8 Litter Legion in the neighborhood and Catie Savage  
9 and her team of volunteers, who we participate with  
10 the Litter Legion as well. Um, we'll bag up all the  
11 waste and sit it there for collection so that the  
12 garbage can itself is not overflowing.

13 Unfortunately, people just see those bags on the  
14 sidewalk sitting there for sometimes weeks at a time  
15 until they get picked up and that litter, that bag,  
16 begets more little because people just toss their  
17 garbage, or their syringes, or there's human feces.

18 I mean, the things that we see out on the sidewalks  
19 these days are really shocking and families are just  
20 fed up with it. We are not going to continue living  
21 in New York City and paying premium prices to live  
22 here and, you know, it's an amazing city but it's not  
23 just about litter is ugly to look at. It's now  
24 unsafe. I can't even take my child without her  
25 finding something really horrifying on the street.

2 Um, we're adjacent to Times Square, the theater and  
3 tourist district. This is, you know, a heavily  
4 trafficked area in midtown, where we need to have  
5 empty garbage cans. Um, we need to have safe streets  
6 that aren't, you know, cluttered up with gutter  
7 litter. Um, this is to me, this is about Maslow's  
8 hierarchy of needs. I could talk about composting as  
9 well, but until our garbage situation is taken care  
10 of, I, I can't talk about something that's more  
11 actualized. I need the basic services right now  
12 restored. Thank you so much. I really hope that  
13 this will be a high priority.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next  
15 we'll hear from Jane Selden, followed by Josh Tjaden,  
16 followed by Ina Lee Selden.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

18 JANE SELDEN: Thank you for the  
19 opportunity to provide testimony for this hearing.  
20 My name is Jane Selden and I represent the local  
21 climate group 350 NYC. We are testifying today about  
22 refrigerants, powerful greenhouse gasses that are  
23 thousands of times more destructive than CO2.  
24 Refrigerants in use now are mostly hydro  
25 fluorocarbons, or HFCs, and in some older equipment

3 chlorofluorocarbons, or CFCs, often known as freon.

4 They are found in refrigerators, air conditioners,

5 dehumidifiers, and a host of other machines. If

6 these refrigerants are not recovered before disposal

7 they leak into the atmosphere, contributing

8 significantly to extreme climate damage. The DEC

9 estimates that emissions from HFCs in New York City

10 make up 6% of greenhouse gas emissions, equivalent to

11 4 million tons of CO<sub>2</sub>. 70% come from large

12 commercial air conditioners and stationary

13 refrigeration systems. Over half of these emissions

14 occur at the point of disposal due to trash haulers

15 not following correct recovery and disposal

16 protocols. Inquiries to DSNY in the past reveal that

17 there has been little or no monitoring of commercial

18 haulers regarding recovery and disposal of large

19 refrigerators and air conditioning systems. The good

20 news is that we now have an opportunity to change

21 this. With the introduction of the new commercial

22 waste zone legislation, we recommend that first that,

23 ah, commercial haulers, ah, awarded contracts with

24 the city be required to be trained in safe recovery

25 and disposal of large refrigerant systems and gasses.

Secondly, that the DSNY establish a database for

2 monitoring large systems collected by commercial  
3 haulers, and that the amount of HFC and CFC gasses  
4 collected be tracked. In December of 2020 Congress  
5 passed the American Innovation in Manufacturing Act,  
6 which gave the EPA authority to rewrite refrigerant  
7 management regulations. These are now in the process  
8 of being finalized by the Biden EPA. We urge the  
9 DSNY to establish an office of refrigerant recovery  
10 with adequate capacity to oversee and enforce  
11 refrigerant management, recovery, disposal, and  
12 monitoring of both commercial haulers and residential  
13 collection. We believe that if New York City is to  
14 reach its stated climate goal it is crucial that  
15 adequate funding be included in the Department of  
16 Sanitation of New York's budget to hire personnel to  
17 ensure enforcement, recovery, disposal, and  
18 monitoring of HFCs and CFCs. Thank you.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will  
20 be Josh Tjaden, followed by Ina Lee Selden, followed  
21 by Travis Tinney.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

23 JOSH TJADEN: Hi there. My name is  
24 Joshua Tjaden. I'm an 18-year resident of Astoria  
25 here in Council District 22. I'm submitting



2 testimony as a concerned citizen and volunteer for  
3 the Proud Astorian organization, which Kate Peterson,  
4 who's also here at the, ah, hearing today, um,  
5 organized for us back in June. We're calling for a  
6 full restoration of litter baskets collection  
7 services to at least the fiscal year 20 level in the  
8 mayor's proposed budget for fiscal year 22. Ah, like  
9 the rest of the city, Astoria has experienced a  
10 noticeable and serious increase in the amount of  
11 trash on our sidewalks, on our streets, curbsides,  
12 and in our public spaces. Groups like Grow NYC, Save  
13 Our Compost Coalition, um, Hell's Kitchen Litter  
14 Legion, Astoria Park Alliance, and, us with Proud  
15 Astorian have all organized and improved sanitation  
16 and environmental conditions, but like Kate said  
17 earlier, it shouldn't be contingent upon, ah,  
18 residents of New York City's and these volunteer  
19 organizations to pull weight that the city and  
20 Department of Sanitation should be, ah, pulling  
21 themselves. You know, while this has benefitted our  
22 neighborhoods' morale, we've met strangers, we've  
23 become friends, ah, it's enabled us to become allies  
24 in our efforts to beautify and clean up our streets.  
25 It demonstrates a serious immediate need for an

2 increase in the city funding and resources. Ah, Kate  
3 mentioned, you know, the number of volunteer hours we  
4 put in. It's over a thousand. 250 people have  
5 volunteered. I myself lead a group over at Ditmars  
6 Boulevard. One thing that I would like to echo is  
7 Catie Savage's, ah, call along with her members,  
8 Henry and Leslie, to reinstate the dedicated DSNY,  
9 ah, syringe collection unit. Ah, that funding being  
10 stripped was really short-sighted. Like Leslie  
11 mentioned, it's a serious problem. We've got a lot  
12 of kiddos that are in parks finding syringes. We  
13 actually at Proud Astorian have the sharps boxes that  
14 we've, ah, been allocated. This is a great thing for  
15 us to have, but not every New Yorker is lucky enough  
16 to carry one of these safe boxes. This one's empty  
17 right now, so don't worry. Um, we picked up numerous  
18 syringes every weekend on streets that you would  
19 never before think would have these materials. And  
20 it's not just, ah, medical waste. It's construction  
21 waste, ah, another one of the members on this call  
22 mentioned that as well. You know, objects like  
23 hypodermic needles, broken glass, and metal objects  
24 have all been found on our streets and if the  
25 Sanitation Department were given proper levels of

2 budget funding they'd be removed in a safely, ah, and  
3 more timely fashion. Um, one thing I would also say,  
4 ah, is that, um, you know, building alliances with  
5 other community organizations or elected officials,  
6 small business owners, and like-minded residents, um,  
7 is really...

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

9 JOSH TJADEN: ...great, but we want to see  
10 our neighborhoods clean and encourage mutual respect  
11 for our public spaces. Thank you.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will  
13 be Ina Lee Selden, followed by Travis Tinney,  
14 followed by Peter Moses.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You might need to  
17 accept the unmute. The thing should pop up.

18 INA LEE SELDEN: OK. I'm, I'm here to  
19 advocate for my little street. It's 52nd Street  
20 between 8th and 9th Avenue. I, um, would like to  
21 propose a solution for my street that could be  
22 applied to the entire city with a 55-cent stamp, an  
23 envelope, and a letter from the Department of  
24 Sanitation or the city agency that is responsible for  
25 reminding small business owners that they are

3 responsible for cleaning up their, their sidewalks  
4 and their curbs 18 inches into the street. That is  
5 my understanding of the rule. I learned that by  
6 walking 52nd Street between 8th and 9th with Steve  
7 Belinda and Jesse Boudine. We talked to business  
8 owners and we said we, we reminded that they are  
9 responsible for their curb and the street in front of  
10 their business and they complied graciously and  
11 consistently to this day. This is a simple thing.  
12 The businesses did not seem to be aware that that was  
13 their responsibility. And, ah, the two holdouts, the  
14 big holdouts on our street, um, are the United States  
15 Post Office, which is a disgrace, and the Hampton  
16 Inn, which is also a disgrace, um, and I'd like to  
17 put in, ah, support for smaller vehicles to clean up  
18 the streets. If they can do it in Paris they can do  
19 it here. Um, the curb here is encrusted with dirt.  
20 The, at the end of the street we get, um, an  
21 accumulation of water, which freezes, which means  
22 that the bike lane at the end of the street is  
23 usually frozen over, garbage collects, and the, ah,  
24 the cyclers and the delivery staff from the  
25 restaurants, um, avoid that lane, the bike lane.  
They veer into the traffic and this is a, this is a

2 white bicycle waiting to happen. One of these  
3 bicyclists is going to get killed by a truck or by a  
4 car, not expecting them to move out of the bike lane  
5 between cars and into the traffic lane. And the city  
6 does not need another death of a bicycler. So it's  
7 an urgent problem. It's, doesn't take 1.5 million or  
8 5 million dollars to, ah, to correct. It just takes  
9 a polite reminder, backed up by fines if people don't  
10 comply to clean their streets. Ah, that's it. Easy,  
11 low cost, fast. Thank you very much for the  
12 opportunity.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will  
14 be Travis Tinney, followed by Peter Moses, followed  
15 by Rebecca Dengrove.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

17 TRAVIS TINNEY: Good afternoon. Ah,  
18 thank you to the council, ah, for holding this  
19 hearing, Chairman Reynoso, um, Council Member Chin  
20 and the other council members who have spoken to date  
21 in support of funding for the New York City, ah,  
22 Sanitation Department and sanitation in general. My  
23 name is Travis Tinney. I'm testifying on behalf of  
24 Ace Programs for the Homeless. Ace is a nonprofit.  
25 We do, ah, workforce training for men and women who

2 are overcoming homelessness. In addition to that  
3 training and job placement we employ 75 men and women  
4 who have overcome homelessness with, um, we offer  
5 them full-time employment and benefits, ah, through a  
6 sanitation initiative, the New York City Clean-Up  
7 Initiative. We've seen through this work the first-  
8 hand effects of the cut in sanitation funding. Ah,  
9 we're proud to work alongside them and clean up the  
10 sidewalks and prepare the, the, ah, trash and trash  
11 bins for that pickup. And in the months to come we  
12 anticipate, along with some of these, ah, community  
13 organizations, an uptick in trash there. So we call  
14 for, ah, restoration to previous years' levels of  
15 funding, ah, FY20 level, ah, sanitation funding and  
16 beyond, and as well for the New York City Clean-Up  
17 Initiative funding. Um, we join in, in the chorus to  
18 call for those. Thank you to the council, ah, for  
19 making this a priority. It's important to the  
20 residents. We've had a severe uptick in, in  
21 complaints for this and, ah, complaints of rodents,  
22 quality of life, and safety hazards. So we are very  
23 pleased to see that the council is moving forward to  
24 make calls for this. We're just appreciative of  
25 their general, ah, mindset and demeanor to be in

2 support of these sanitation issues that affects so  
3 many of us, ah, New Yorkers. So thank you for your  
4 time and, um, we, we advocate for restored funding.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next  
6 we'll hear from Peter Moses, followed by Rebecca  
7 Dengrove, followed by Nora Bisrap.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

9 PETER MOSES: Hi. Ah, my name is Peter  
10 Moses. I am a Astoria resident, not as long term as  
11 some others. I've only been here 16 years. Um, also  
12 a small business owner. I'm one of the owners of  
13 Mighty Oak Roasters. And I just wanted to comment,  
14 um, about the litter baskets. Um, just walking  
15 around in my neighborhood, which I love, I've been  
16 here for a long time, ah, it's just disgustingly  
17 filthy, ah, everywhere you go. Um, and, you know,  
18 while I know the group Proud Astorians has a lot of  
19 clean-up, ah, it really shouldn't fall onto us for  
20 that. Um, I, other than other people, I would like  
21 the funding to be increased over the 2020 levels. I  
22 don't think those will be sufficient, ah, with the  
23 number of people who are still working from home all  
24 the time, not traveling, um, and I think that those  
25 trash levels will increase on the streets. I'd also

2 like to call out, um, the e-waste program. Ah, right  
3 now you can't recycle your electronics. Um, if you  
4 look on the DSNY website it tells you to, um, you  
5 know, schedule an appointment, but then you look at  
6 that, you can't, appointments are not accepted right  
7 now due to COVID. It says to look at retailers. If  
8 you've ever tried to navigate Best Buy's website or  
9 Staples, ah, you see there's a lot of caveats on, ah,  
10 recycling electronics. Um, I'm also instructed to go  
11 to the DEC website, which then tells me to learn  
12 about ice fishing. So I'd really like to see the e-  
13 waste pickups, ah, come back. It's been very helpful  
14 over the years. Um, I'd also like to, um, see the  
15 orange DSNY, um, reusable bags distributed to local  
16 businesses as a point for distributing out to the  
17 general public. I know I've picked some up at some  
18 tree waste shredding, ah, before, Christmas tree  
19 shredding, shredding, and that was really helpful.  
20 Um, and I think that's it. You know, I, I just,  
21 beyond the waste baskets, um, I'd like to be able to,  
22 easier to get additional waste baskets in areas that  
23 need them. I've, you know, submitted a request  
24 multiple times for outside my business and on the  
25 avenue that I'm on, ah, to no avail prior to the



2 pandemic, um, so it would be very helpful if we could  
3 increase that. And I just want to say thanks to  
4 Chair Reynoso and, um, too bad Commissioner Grayson  
5 left. Ah, he is my wife's favorite commissioner, so  
6 she was excited to hear me speak. Thank you very  
7 much.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Next will  
9 be Rebecca Dengrove, followed by Jesse Boudine.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

11 REBECCA DENGROVE: Hi, my name is Rebecca  
12 Dengrove. Um, I'm here also as a resident of  
13 Astoria. Um, and I just wanted to reiterate some of  
14 the points that have already been said, emphasizing  
15 the need for curbside organics collection. I think  
16 that's incredible important, as well as the, the  
17 increase of, um, litter baskets, the waste basket,  
18 litter removal, and the issues around waste just  
19 collecting around the city and, um, the importance  
20 of, you know, all of these issues. The refrigerants  
21 is incredibly important. I mean, we're facing a  
22 climate crisis and the urgency just doesn't seem to  
23 be there. And the budget doesn't seem to reflect  
24 the, the necessity around the issue. And all of the  
25 things that I think have been mentioned, um, are

2 extremely critical waste management issues that all  
3 will support the city achieving its net zero goals,  
4 um, and it's just incredibly important this, yeah, I  
5 think it's a, restoring the budget to at least the  
6 pre-2020, ah, levels so that we have the funds to  
7 support proper waste management, waste collection,  
8 and, and just really, really emphasizing the need  
9 for, um, organic curbside waste collection. Um,  
10 composting is incredibly important. It's, will help  
11 divert waste from going to landfills and, you know,  
12 reduce methane emissions and it's just something that  
13 I think a lot of people can get behind and understand  
14 and putting the resources in place for the community  
15 to participate will just make it that much easier,  
16 and so, um, it, it just blows my mind that we don't  
17 have the budget to support it. So I really hope that  
18 the 14.75 million that has been mentioned, um, is  
19 considered and strongly, you know, implemented. Um,  
20 I just don't know what else to say. It's, it's  
21 disappointing and frustrating. So, thank you. Ah,  
22 appreciate the time.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. At this  
24 time we've called on everyone who's signed up to  
25 testify. If we've inadvertently missed you, um, and

2 you signed up to testify, can you please use the Zoom  
3 raise hand function now? OK, I'm not seeing anyone,  
4 so Council Member Reynoso?

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yes.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Oh, hold on one  
7 second. There's, hold on one minute.

8 DEXTER THOMAS PAYNE: Hello, hello, hi?

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Hi, can you please  
10 say your name?

11 DEXTER THOMAS PAYNE: Yes, ma'am. I am  
12 Dexter Thomas Payne. I'm here for Jennifer Sada.  
13 Ah, we are co-founders of the Anti-Litter Project.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: OK, great. You can  
15 proceed with your testimony.

16 DEXTER THOMAS PAYNE: Thank you very  
17 much.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

19 DEXTER THOMAS PAYNE: Ah, it's nice to be  
20 here. Thank you, everybody, ah, for speaking. Ah,  
21 we first started this initiative in June of 2020 and,  
22 ah, as they said before, ah, the pandemic was one  
23 thing, but once it got nice, ah, we really saw the  
24 impact that people being outside had on the streets.  
25 We tried to reduce the litter, ah, by [inaudible]

2 streets, by organizing weekly community clean-ups.  
3 Ah, it was hard at first. We didn't get a lot of  
4 volunteers. But we've been building traction slowly  
5 but surely. We work primarily in the south Bronx,  
6 which has been one of the underserved areas of the  
7 Bronx for a long time. Ah, last week, for example,  
8 we picked up 300 pounds of garbage in a one-block  
9 radius. We have racked up over 500 volunteer hours  
10 and have 20 volunteers, versus the population of the  
11 Bronx. Ah, we hear a lot of things in the street,  
12 like you guys are crazy, you should be getting paid  
13 for this, and we understand that it's a quality of  
14 life issue that affects all of us, and it's  
15 unfortunate that it falls on the residents to now do  
16 something about it. The budget cuts to DSNY are just  
17 downright unfair. There's a lot of other things that  
18 they can take funding from. And, ah, we feel like a  
19 lot of other people do. The syringes are out of  
20 control. The trash is out of control. We need to  
21 allocate funding back to DSNY to give them the help  
22 they need. Ah, the camaraderie that we built into  
23 the volunteer stuff has been really incredible, to  
24 say the least. I've in New York City my whole life  
25 and I've never seen people come together like this.

2 But, um, what we're doing is putting a Band-Aid over  
3 a gash at the moment, and it hurts to say that. And  
4 I want to continue working on cleaning the city, but  
5 I think the city has to help us, too. So we feel the  
6 same way. We demand that the city does something to  
7 help us fix this problem 'cause if they want to keep  
8 it this way no one's gonna want to stay here. Ah,  
9 this job has become a full-time internship. I call  
10 it a job and it's not really a job. It's something  
11 that we take passionately here in the south Bronx.  
12 And we want to continue to clean the streets and show  
13 people that the health and hygiene is important no  
14 matter where you live. So in short, fund Sanitation  
15 and let's do it together. Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. That  
17 concluded public testimony, Chair Reynoso.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Nicole.  
19 Thank you, everyone, for, ah, being here today. Um,  
20 I think that, you know, I hope that the  
21 administration and the Department of Sanitation have  
22 heard our voices and understand how deeply we care  
23 about clean streets, um, and just initiatives that we  
24 should be paying attention to, um, that are gonna  
25 address climate change, um, as well. Ah, thank you

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID  
2 WASTE MANAGEMENT

134

3 for everyone that, you know, hung on there until the  
4 end. Um, and at this point I'm going to adjourn the  
5 meeting. [gavel]

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 18, 2021