

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

Thursday, March 7, 2024

Start: 2:11 P.M.

Recess: 3:19 P.M.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Adrienne E. Adams, Speaker
Amanda Farías, Majority Leader

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Adrienne E. Adams
Joann Ariola
Alexa Avilés
Diana I. Ayala
Chris Banks
Joseph C. Borelli
Erik D. Bottcher
Justin L. Brannan
Gale A. Brewer
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
Tiffany Cabán
David M. Carr
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Eric Dinowitz
Amanda Farías
Oswald Feliz
James F. Gennaro
Jennifer Gutiérrez

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING
COUNCIL MEMBERS (CONTINUED)

Shahana K. Hanif
Kamillah Hanks
Robert F. Holden
Crystal Hudson
Rita C. Joseph
Shekar Krishnan
Linda Lee
Farah N. Louis
Kristy Marmorato
Christopher Marte
Darlene Mealy
Julie Menin
Francisco P. Moya
Mercedes Narcisse
Sandy Nurse
Chi A. Ossé
Vickie Paladino
Keith Powers
Lincoln Restler
Kevin C. Riley
Carlina Rivera
Yusef Salaam
Rafael Salamanca, Jr
Pierina Ana Sanchez
Lynn C. Schulman
Althea V. Stevens
Sandra Ung
Inna Vernikov
Nantasha M. Williams
Julie Won
Kalman Yeger
Susan Zhuang

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

A P P E A R A N C E S

INVOCATION:

Invocation delivered by Rev. Luisa Celeste
Martinez, Grace United Methodist
Church, located at 125 West 104 Street, New
York, N.Y. 10025

2 SERGEANT POLITE: Today's date is March 7, 2024.
3 Today's Stated Meeting is being recorded in the
4 Chambers by Keith Polite.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Quiet on the floor please,
6 quiet on the floor, please. Ladies and gentlemen, at
7 this time please place all electronic devices, all
8 electronic devices to vibrate or silent mode.

9 Madam Majority Leader, it's all yours.

10 AUTOMATED: Recording in progress

11 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Good afternoon, and
12 welcome to the Stated Meeting of March 7, 2024, I am
13 Majority Leader Amanda Farías, and I would like to
14 thank you for joining us. If you would like to follow
15 along, the agenda for today's meeting is posted on
16 our website.

17 On behalf of the body, I welcome the members of
18 the public who have joined us here today. During
19 Stated Meetings, only members of the Council may
20 speak. Members of the public shall remain silent. If
21 you wish to express support of any remarks, you may
22 make the silent approval gesture.

23 I want to remind my colleagues that decorum is to
24 be respected at all times. Insulting each other is
25 not appropriate, all remarks are to be addressed to

2 the Chair, and members shall not speak unless
3 recognized by the Chair. It is essential that even if
4 we disagree, we treat each other with respect.

5 CITY CLERK: Please join us for the Pledge of
6 Allegiance.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise!

8 ALL: (PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE)

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Roll call?

10 CITY CLERK: Council Member Abreu?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Present

12 CITY CLERK: Council Member Ariola?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Present

14 CITY CLERK: Council Member Avilés?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Presenté

16 CITY CLERK: Council Member Ayala?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Here

18 CITY CLERK: Council Member Banks?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Here

20 CITY CLERK: Council Member Bottcher

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEr: Present

22 CITY CLERK: Council Member Brannan?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here

24 CITY CLERK: Council Member Brewer?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

6

2 CITY CLERK: Council Member Brooks-Powers?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Present

4 CITY CLERK: Council Member Cabán?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Present

6 CITY CLERK: Council Member Carr?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Present

8 CITY CLERK: Council Member De La Rosa?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: (ABSENT)

10 CITY CLERK: Council Member Dinowitz?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Here

12 CITY CLERK: Council Member Feliz?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Here

14 CITY CLERK: Council Member Gennaro?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here

16 CITY CLERK: Council Member Gutiérrez?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Presenté

18 CITY CLERK: Council Member Hanif?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Here

20 CITY CLERK: Council Member Hanks?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Present

22 CITY CLERK: Council Member Holden?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here

24 CITY CLERK: Council Member Hudson?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Present

2 CITY CLERK: Council Member Joseph?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Present

4 CITY CLERK: Council Member Krishnan?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: (NO RESPONSE)

6 CITY CLERK: Council Member Lee?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Here

8 CITY CLERK: Council Member Louis?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Present

10 CITY CLERK: Council Member Marmorato?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Present

12 CITY CLERK: Council Member Marte?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Present

14 CITY CLERK: Council Member Mealy?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: (NO RESPONSE)

16 CITY CLERK: Council Member Menin?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Here

18 CITY CLERK: Council Member Moya?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: (MEDICAL)

20 CITY CLERK: Council Member Narcisse?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Present

22 CITY CLERK: Council Member Nurse?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: (NO RESPONSE)

24 CITY CLERK: Council Member Ossé?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Present

2 CITY CLERK: Council Member Paladino?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Present

4 CITY CLERK: Council Member Powers?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: (NO MIC) Here

6 CITY CLERK: Council Member Restler?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Here

8 CITY CLERK: Council Member Riley?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Present

10 CITY CLERK: Council Member Rivera?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present

12 CITY CLERK: Council Member Salaam

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Present

14 CITY CLERK: Council Member Salamanca?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present

16 CITY CLERK: Council Member Sanchez?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Present

18 CITY CLERK: Council Member Schulman?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Here

20 CITY CLERK: Council Member Stevens?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Here

22 CITY CLERK: Council Member Ung?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Present

24 CITY CLERK: Council Member Vernikov?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Here

2 CITY CLERK: Council Member Williams?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'm here.

4 CITY CLERK: Council Member Won?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: (PARENTAL)

6 CITY CLERK: Council Member Krishnan?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Here

8 CITY CLERK: Council Member Yeger?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here

10 CITY CLERK: Council Member Zhuang?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: Here

12 CITY CLERK: Council Member Borelli?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: (NO RESPONSE)

14 CITY CLERK: Council Member Farías?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: Present

16 CITY CLERK: Speaker Adams?

17 SPEAKER ADAMS: Present

18 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you, we will now
19 have today's Invocation, which will be delivered by
20 Reverand Luisa Celeste Martinez of Grace United
21 Methodist Church, which is located at 125 West 104
22 Street, Manhattan.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise!

24 REVERAND LUISA CELESTE MARTINEZ: Let us pray.

25 Almighty God, from whom all heart and mind are open

1 on this day, purify our thoughts, so that together we
2 could work (INAUDIBLE) and harmoniously for the
3 resolution of many projects for the betterment and
4 development of this great city - that of all the sons
5 and daughters of you represent. Allow us, Lord, that
6 in this month that we celebrate Women's History, all
7 united we may raise the banner of (INAUDIBLE), unity,
8 and development for this city where so many women of
9 courage play a role of mother, daughter, wife,
10 sister, working arm in arm for a more just,
11 harmonious, and prepared society. O Lord, bless each
12 of the representatives present here and the community
13 they work for. O God, bless all who labor in this
14 place; help them, Lord, so that every day they can be
15 better citizens willing to serve better for thy, and
16 who they have been elected for. Lord, we ask all this
17 in the name the Father the Son and the Holy Spirit,
18 Amen. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE) In the name of the
19 Father the Son and the Holy Spirit Amen.

21 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you. Reverend Dr.
22 Luisa Celeste Martinez was born in the Dominican
23 Republic to a Methodist family, shaping her career,
24 spiritual journey, and civic engagement. She
25 graduated from University Henrique Ureña and the

2 Universidad Central del Este in the Dominican
3 Republic, she then received a Master's in Theology
4 from the New York Theological Seminary. She has been
5 a pastor at the Church of All Nations, the First
6 Spanish United Methodist Church and Saint Stephen's
7 since the late 90's, and started as an elder in Grace
8 United Methodist Church in 2002. She resides in
9 Harlem and is a proud mother of two children. After
10 retiring, she returned to service at Grace Methodist
11 Church and United Methodist Church of Co-op City in
12 the past year, and has continued volunteering in
13 communities across upper Manhattan and the Bronx.

14 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE) I would now like to make
15 a motion to spread the Invocation on the record.

16 Okay, Adoption of Minutes?

17 CLERK: None

18 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Messages and Papers from
19 the Mayor?

20 CLERK: None

21 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Communications from City,
22 County and Borough Offices?

23 CLERK: Preconsidered M 29 and M 30, Council
24 Budget?

25 SPEAKER ADAMS: Finance.

2 CLERK: M 31 Comptroller Report?

3 SPEAKER ADAMS: Received, Ordered, Printed and
4 Filed.

5 CLERK: M 32, Tax Commission Report?

6 SPEAKER ADAMS: Received, Ordered, Printed and
7 Filed.

8 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Petitions and
9 Communications?

10 CLERK: None

11 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Land Use Call-ups?

12 CLERK: M 33?

13 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on Call-up vote. I now ask
14 that the clerk take a rollcall vote on today's Land
15 Use Call-Ups.

16 CLERK: Council Member Abreu?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Aye

18 CLERK: Council Member Ariola?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Aye

20 CLERK: Council Member Avilés?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Aye

22 CLERK: Council Member Ayala?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye

24 CLERK: Council Member Banks?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Aye

2 CLERK: Council Member Bottcher

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Aye

4 CLERK: Council Member Brannan?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye

6 CLERK: Council Member Brewer?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye

8 CLERK: Council Member Cabán?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Aye

10 CLERK: Council Member Carr?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Aye

12 CLERK: Council Member De La Rosa?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: (ABSENT)

14 CLERK: Council Member Dinowitz?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Aye

16 CLERK: Council Member Feliz?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Aye

18 CLERK: Council Member Gennaro?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Aye

20 CLERK: Council Member Gutiérrez?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: (NO RESPONSE)

22 CLERK: Council Member Hanif?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Aye

24 CLERK: Council Member Hanks?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Aye

2 CLERK: Council Member Holden?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye

4 CLERK: Thank you

5 Council Member Hudson?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Aye

7 CLERK: Council Member Joseph?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Aye

9 CLERK: Council Member Krishnan?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Aye

11 CLERK: Council Member Lee?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Aye

13 CLERK: Council Member Louis?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye

15 CLERK: Council Member Marmorato?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Aye

17 CLERK: Council Member Marte?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Aye

19 CLERK: Council Member Mealy?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye

21 CLERK: Council Member Menin?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Aye

23 CLERK: Council Member Moya?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: (MEDICAL)

25 CLERK: Council Member Narcisse?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Aye

3 CLERK: Council Member Nurse?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: (NO RESPONSE)

5 CLERK: Council Member Ossé?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Aye

7 CLERK: Thank you

8 Council Member Paladino?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: (NO RESPONSE)

10 CLERK: Council Member Powers?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: (NO RESPONSE)

12 CLERK: Council Member Restler?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Aye

14 CLERK: Council Member Riley?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Aye

16 CLERK: Council Member Rivera?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye

18 CLERK: Council Member Salaam

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Aye

20 CLERK: Council Member Salamanca?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye

22 CLERK: Thank you.

23 Council Member Sanchez?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Aye

25 CLERK: Council Member Schulman?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Aye

3 CLERK: Council Member Stevens?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Aye

5 CLERK: Council Member Ung?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Aye

7 CLERK: Council Member Vernikov?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Aye

9 CLERK: Council Member Williams?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye

11 CLERK: Council Member Won?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: (PARENTAL)

13 CLERK: Council Member Yeger?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye

15 CLERK: Council Member Zhuang?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: Aye

17 CLERK: Council Member Brooks-Powers?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Permission to vote

19 on Land Use Call-ups and all items on the General

20 Orders Calendar?

21 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: I would like to

23 vote aye on all, and I would also like to extend my

24 congratulations and wishes to the Vallone family in

25 honor of the late Paul Vallone and... (CROSS-TALK)

2 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Sorry... Majority Whip,
3 you are out of order with... speaking out of order.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Yes. I vote aye on
5 all, and again, thank you.

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you.

7 CLERK: Council Member Gutiérrez?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: (NO RESPONSE)

9 CLERK: Council Member Borelli?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: (NO RESPONSE)

11 CLERK: Council Member Farías?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIÁS: I vote aye on all.

13 CLERK: Speaker Adams?

14 SPEAKER ADAMS: I vote aye.

15 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Today's Land Use Call-ups
16 are adopted by a vote of 44 in the affirmative and 0
17 in the negative.

18 We will now have Communications from Speaker
19 Adams.

20 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you, Madam Majority Leader,
21 and Good afternoon, everyone.

22 Before we begin, I want to acknowledge the loss
23 of a New Yorker who died during a fatal fire in
24 Council Member Sanchez's district in the Bronx. We
25 also wish a speedy recovery to the firefighter who

2 was injured while responding bravely to the fire. Our
3 hearts are with their loved ones during this
4 difficult time.

5 March 6th, is the Independence Day of Ghana when
6 we commemorate the country's independence from the
7 United Kingdom in 1957. Ghanaian communities, I wish
8 you a happy Independence Day.

9 Tomorrow is International Women's Day, yes, we
10 can clap for that. (APPLAUSE) As a historic women
11 majority - and the men who get it - New York City
12 Council, we truly have prioritized policies and
13 solutions to confront some of the greatest challenges
14 facing women across our city. Women are the backbone
15 of our communities, and when women are safe, healthy
16 and have access to opportunity, we all succeed. It
17 will remain a pillar and focus of our work in this
18 legislative body to prioritize equitable outcomes for
19 all women in this city, happy International Women's
20 Day.

21 The evening of May 10th... and I do have my
22 glasses on... the evening of March 10th marks the
23 start of Ramadan for our Muslim communities. As our
24 Muslim neighbors fast from sunrise to sundown, I want
25

1 to extend my best wishes as you observe the blessed
2 month, Ramadan Mubarak.
3

4 This year, National Equal Payday falls on March
5 12th, symbolizing just how much more women across our
6 nation must work to earn what their male counterparts
7 earned in the last year. In New York, for every
8 dollar that a man makes, women earn an average of
9 .77¢, the disparity is even wider for women of color,
10 with Asian women making .69¢; Black women making
11 .63¢; and Latino women making .49¢ for every single
12 dollar that a man makes - this makes no sense.

13 Despite the progress we've made, obviously there is
14 more work needed for us to close this gap. Women keep
15 our city running, but are still not paid equally for
16 our equal labor. The Council has focused on pay
17 equity and addressing systemic issues within our own
18 municipal workforce for years now - that work
19 continues. And as we approach National Payday, I look
20 forward to our continued work together to finally
21 achieve pay equity for all of us.

22 On March 17th we will be celebrating St.
23 Patrick's Day. The Council hosted a tremendous St.
24 Patrick's Day celebration right here in Chambers last
25 night, and many of us marched together in Sunnyside

2 and Woodside last weekend for the 25th annual Saint
3 Pat's for All Parade in Queens and street co-naming
4 celebration. I look forward to once again marching
5 down 5th avenue next week for the Annual St.
6 Patrick's Day Parade.

7 Before we continue, I'd love to tell everybody
8 that it's time to get ready to spring forward and
9 lose that hour - wake up, wake up, wake up! Daylight
10 Savings Time will begin on March 10th, so remember to
11 take your nap on Saturday, colleagues, and set your
12 clock ahead one hour this Sunday.

13 Now let's move on to our Stated Agenda.

14 First we will vote on the following Finance
15 items:

16 The Council's Fiscal Year 2025 Proposed Operating
17 Budget includes \$75.5 million for Personal Services
18 and \$24.3 million for OTPS or Other Than Personal
19 Services.

20 Next, we will vote on the following Land Use
21 items:

22 230 Kent Avenue Rezoning will facilitate a new 8-
23 story, mixed-use residential, commercial and
24 community facility building in Council Member
25 Restler's district. It will feature 40 housing units,

1 including approximately 12 affordable units, and 20
2 bicycle parking spaces. The Council is modifying the
3 application to strike MIH Option 2 and remove the Con
4 Edison utility property from the rezoning area.
5

6 Timbale Terrace, a UDAAP approval in disposition
7 for city-owned property to facilitate the development
8 of a 19-story building in Council Member Salaam's
9 district. It will include 330 affordable housing
10 units, 97 units of supportive housing, and a ground
11 floor community facility theater for community
12 programs, offering a permanent home to the Afro-Latin
13 Jazz Music and Arts Center. There will also be
14 private outdoor recreation space for tenants, a green
15 roof, a laundry room, a fitness center, and 75
16 parking spaces.

17 A new 547 seat primary school in Council Member
18 Dinowitz's district.

19 The Council will also vote on Landmark
20 designations:

21 Joseph Rodman Drake Park & Enslaved People's
22 Burial Ground, a park in Council Member Rafael
23 Salamanca's district that contains two colonial era
24 cemeteries - Hunt-Willett-Leggett Cemetery for early
25 settler families, and an Enslaved People's Cemetery

1
2 for those forced to labor for those families in Hunts
3 Point of the Bronx.

4 The Larkin, Levin & Company Office Pavilion, a
5 minimalist structure in Council Member Cabán's
6 district that was originally part of a factory that
7 manufactured women's coats in the late 1950's.

8 And the Modulightor Building, named for the
9 architectural lighting company that architect Paul
10 Rudolph founded with his business partner, Ernst
11 Wagner in 1976. The Modulightor Building, in Council
12 Member Power's district, is a unique and
13 distinguished example of late 20th century modern
14 design. It contains commercial space, an expanded
15 duplex apartment, and two floors used for exhibitions
16 and events.

17 Today we will also vote on the following
18 resolutions:

19 Resolution 202, sponsored by me, calling on the
20 New York State Legislature to pass, and the Governor
21 to sign, legislation to increase the wages and
22 improve the working conditions of home care aides. It
23 is vital that support these essential workers and
24 advance their well-being, particularly amidst the
25 grown of New York's home care workforce that provides

1 care for patients throughout our state. It is
2 important to note that the state controls labor
3 regulations and Medicaid reimbursement rates that
4 impact the wages and working conditions of home care
5 aides. The State Department of Labor's regulation
6 limits pay to 13 hours, even when long, grueling
7 shifts can extend for as long as 24 hours. That is
8 why we are passing this resolution today - to call on
9 the Governor and the State Legislature to act on
10 existing legislation and proposed changes that can
11 improve these conditions. We look forward to working
12 with them to strengthen and support this vital
13 workforce. We thank our staff members Elizabeth Arzt
14 and Nicholas Connel (phonetic).

16 We will also vote on the following pieces of
17 legislation:

18 Introduction 172, sponsored by, Majority Leader
19 Amanda Farías, would amend Local Law 33 of 2024 to
20 clarify that any driver of a for-hire vehicle with an
21 approved tablet in their vehicle, would receive of
22 minimum of 20% of the gross revenue it generates. The
23 bill would also set the fee for the interior
24 advertising company license at \$500.00. We thank our

1
2 staff members Mark Chen, Kevin Kotowski, John Basile,
3 and Connor Mealy.

4 Introduction 1-B, sponsored by me, would
5 designate the Animal Care Centers of NYC facility in
6 the borough of Queens as the Paul A. Vallone Queens
7 Animal Care Center, named for former Council Member
8 Paul Vallone, who was a colleague and dear friend of
9 mine and many others in this body.

10 Former Council Member Vallone was a passionate
11 advocate for animals and their care, and he advanced
12 many bills to support their well-being while he
13 served here in the Council. This includes his bill
14 establishing Local Law 123 of 2018, which requires
15 the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to ensure
16 that full service animal shelters are operated in all
17 five boroughs.

18 Council Member Vallone's legislation was the
19 culmination of a multi-generational effort that
20 started over two decades ago under his father, who we
21 call Speaker One, Speaker Peter Vallone, Senior, and
22 it continued with his brother former Council Member,
23 Peter Vallone, Junior.

24 We thank our beloved Vallone family for their
25 dedicated public service to our city and New Yorkers

1 overall and your long-standing commitment to the
2 welfare of precious animals. This renaming is a
3 fitting tribute, and I'm so proud that we can
4 continue to honor Council Member Vallone's memory and
5 legacy in his, mine, and your home borough of Queens.

6 We are all so grateful to the entire Vallone
7 family for sharing Paul with our entire city. I want
8 to acknowledge that members of the Vallone family are
9 right here in Chambers with us today, including his
10 wife Anna-Marie Vallone and their beautiful children.

11 (APPLAUSE)

12 Former member, Peter Villone, Junior was here
13 earlier this morning for the vote, and we also
14 appreciate all of our friends at Animal Care Centers
15 of New York City, and everyone who made this
16 important legislation possible. We thank our staff
17 members Sara Liss, Christopher Pepe, Sarah Sucher,
18 and Mahnoor Butt.

19 Introduction 17-B, Sponsored by Council Member
20 Justin Brannan, would require the installation of
21 electric vehicle charging equipment in open parking
22 lots and parking garages with 10 or more spaces that
23 are licensed by The Department of Consumer and Worker
24 Protection. It also sets future requirements for all
25

1
2 other lots and garages with ten or more spaces. The
3 existing public charging network for electric
4 vehicles throughout New York City is small, which
5 poses a barrier to accelerating electric vehicle
6 adoption. This bill aims to rectify that shortage in
7 our city. We thank our staff members Taylor Zelony
8 and Andrew Bourne.

9 Introduction 4-A, sponsored by Council Member
10 Alexa Avilés, would require cruise ships with shore
11 power capability to connect to shore power systems
12 when docked whenever shore power is available and is
13 safe and practicable to do so. This requirement would
14 be enforced by the New York City Economic Development
15 Corporation or EDC, which administers the two cruise
16 terminals in New York City. EDC would also be
17 required to create an regularly update community
18 traffic mitigation plans in the neighborhoods around
19 each terminal in consultation with The Department of
20 Transportation, the Police Department, and members of
21 the public who reside in the neighborhoods
22 surrounding cruise terminals. We thank our staff
23 members Alex Paulenoff, David Seitzer, and William
24 Hongach.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 27
2 Thank you for your attention, colleagues. Now I
3 would like to turn it back over to our Majority
4 Leader.

5 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, Speaker Adams.

6 We will now move into Discussion of General
7 Orders.

8 I would like to call on and recognize Council
9 Member Restler, followed by Council Member Avilés,
10 and Council Member Gennaro.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Great, thank you so much,
12 Majority Leader. I just wanted to speak briefly about
13 a ULURP item we are voting on today at 230 Kent; 230
14 Kent is a... there's a lot of excitement around it.
15 It's a small development, it's only about 40 units,
16 but it's a good project. The gentleman who is a
17 neighborhood person who grew up in South
18 Williamsburg, who owns the site, put \$6 million into
19 remediation of this site before there was any promise
20 of a rezoning or new development. That was a real
21 contribution to cleaning up our community that I
22 deeply value, and as a result, I'm very happy to
23 support this rezoning. I'm proud that District 33 has
24 generated more new units of housing than any other
25 district in the city of New York over the last 15

1 years. And with this ULURP, we will continue to lead
2 in helping to address housing supply and this housing
3 crisis. Thank you so much, and I hope my colleagues
4 will consider supporting it.
5

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: I would now like to call
7 on Council Member Avilés followed by Council Member
8 Gennaro.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you so much. After a
10 tremendous amount of work on behalf of the community
11 of Red Hook, I'm proud to be voting today on a piece
12 of legislation that will mean significant air quality
13 gains for communities in the decades to come. Today
14 we will vote to pass Intro 4, a bill that will
15 require cruise ships coming to New York City to plug
16 in to clean shore power system, where it already
17 exists in Brooklyn - and where it will exist in
18 Manhattan. It also requires that contracted entities
19 come up with a traffic mitigation plan that will
20 hopefully prevent the sort of nightmare from
21 occurring that happened in Red Hook this summer - a
22 direct result of the EDC and cruise operators having
23 no plan at all. I want to thank the Speaker for her
24 support, Council Member Bottcher for being a
25 steadfast ally and coprime sponsor, Majority Leader

1 Fariás in her role Chair of Economic Development, and
2 of course, community members who have kept up the
3 heat since the Mayor signed this project without our
4 involvement. I'd like to thank some of them by name
5 in particular, Adam Armstrong, Carolina Salguero
6 (phonetic), Victoria Alexander, Susan Povich, Carly
7 of the Red Hook Business Alliance, Matias Caldwell
8 (phonetic), Kiki Valentine, Daisy Conroy and the rest
9 of the PS 15 PTA, Jasmine (INAUDIBLE) of Pacific
10 Environment, the Team at Red Hook Initiative, New
11 York City Earth Justice Alliance, are Community Board
12 Six, and so many others who fought for clean power -
13 clean shore power.
14

15 As the community will tell you, our fight is not
16 over; we know already that improvements can be made
17 in this bill - particularly with regards to
18 enforcement. We know we will have a long road ahead
19 of us making other necessary air quality gains for
20 our communities, like regulating last mile industry,
21 but we are organized, and I'm confident that we will
22 continue to make progress together.

23 I'd like to send a message that not only will
24 require this industry to decarbonize, (TIMER CHIMES)
25 but that we will not accept false solutions. Clean

2 air for all of New York City residents and clean
3 water. Thank you so much for your support.

4 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you so much,
5 Council Member Avilés. I would now like to recognize
6 Council Member Gennaro.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you, Madam Majority
8 Leader. I don't ordinarily rise when I speak, but
9 when I am talking about the Vallones and the Vallone
10 family, I think it's appropriate to do that. And I
11 want to add my voice to the chorus of the Speaker and
12 those who spoke this morning at the Health Committee.
13 I was hired by Speaker Vallone in the summer of 1990.
14 And I got to know him very well, and he became like a
15 second father to me. Many people from that era know
16 that Peter Vallone, Senior had a retreat group, and I
17 have been... I don't ordinarily mix worlds, but I am
18 going to do it now - that myself and my father and
19 brother and my son were privileged to go on religious
20 retreats with Vallone and that group. And, Charlie, I
21 am looking forward to this year's retreat. And when I
22 started here, Paul was in college, and to think what
23 we have... what this family has suffered and everyone
24 who knew him by extension, it is such a fitting thing
25 what we do today to name this facility for Paul who

1 was such a really great guy. And I served with him
2 for 10 months when I won that special election, but I
3 have known him for 30 years; I knew him much more
4 through retreats than I do here. So, you know, to
5 really have an opportunity to get to know him like I
6 did was... the enrichment that he brought to me as a
7 person and everything that he will always mean to the
8 City, and now with his name on this great edifice
9 that protects animals, what a fitting thing. So, I
10 love the Vallone family, and Judge Vallone and Anna-
11 Marie, and everybody, so great to see you here, and
12 (TIMER CHIMES) God bless.

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Seeing no one else on the
15 roster, uh, Report of Special Committees?

16 CLERK: None.

17 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Reports of Standing
18 Committees?

19 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Economic
20 Development, Intro 4-A, cruise terminals?

21 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and Coupled on General
22 Orders.

23 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Finance,
24 Preconsidered M 29 and Resolution 258, and
25

2 Preconsidered M 30 and Resolution 259, Council
3 Budget?

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

5 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Health,
6 Introduction 1-B, Paul Vallone Center?

7 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and Coupled on General
8 Orders.

9 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Housing and
10 Buildings, Introduction 17-B, electric vehicle
11 equipment?

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and Coupled on General
13 Orders.

14 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land Use, L U
15 13 and Resolution 260 and L U 14 and Resolution 261,
16 Timbale Terrace?

17 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

18 CLERK: L U 21 and Resolution 262 through L U 23
19 and Resolution 264, Landmarks Designations?

20 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

21 CLERK: Preconsidered L U 29 and Resolution 265,
22 school facility?

23 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

24 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Rules,
25 Privileges and Elections, M 22 and Resolution 266,

2 appointment of Amy E. Millard, Conflicts of Interest
3 Board?

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

5 CLERK: M 23 and Resolution 267, appointment of
6 Milton L. Williams as a member of the New York City
7 Conflicts of Interest Board?

8 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

9 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Transportation
10 and Infrastructure, Introduction 172, for-hire
11 vehicle drivers?

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

13 CLERK: General Orders Calendar, L U 11 and
14 Resolution 268 and L U 12 and Resolution 269, 230
15 Kent Avenue rezoning?

16 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

17 I now ask that the clerk take a rollcall vote on
18 all of the items coupled on today's General Orders
19 Calendar.

20 CLERK: Council Member Paladino?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Aye on all.

22 CLERK: Thank you

23 Council Member Abreu?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Aye

25 CLERK: Council Member Ariola?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Aye

3 CLERK: Council Member Avilés?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Aye on all.

5 CLERK: Council Member Ayala?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye

7 CLERK: Council Member Banks?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Council Member Bottcher

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Permission to explain my
11 vote?

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: I want to thank and
14 congratulate Council Member Avilés for her leadership
15 on the cruise ship emissions bill, not just for her
16 community, but for our community on the west side of
17 Manhattan, which also has a cruise ship terminal.
18 This is an example of government responding to the
19 needs of residents and responding to changing
20 conditions out in the world. Much as like we're
21 responding to lithium ion batteries, public policy
22 catching up with things that are happening out in the
23 world, this is public policy catching up with
24 something that's been going on for a long time. The
25 fact that one cruise ship docked per day can admit as

2 much as 34,000 diesel trucks. That's been going on
3 for a long time, so today I'm so proud of the City
4 Council and my colleague, Council Member Avilés, and
5 all the cosponsors and all the City Council staff who
6 contributed to this. I vote aye.

7 CLERK: Council Member Brannan?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: With love to the Vallone
9 family, I vote aye.

10 CLERK: Council Member Brewer?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye

12 CLERK: Council Member Cabán?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Permission to explain my
14 vote?

15 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. I just want to
17 take a moment to acknowledge and send a lot of love
18 and solidarity to the Vallone family. Your entire
19 family is an institution in Astoria, Queens which I
20 have the privilege of representing. So, just thank
21 you, again, for being a part of our communities. This
22 is a great honor, and I'm really proud to vote aye,
23 and aye on the rest of the Calendar as well. And
24 congrats to my sister, Council Member Alexa Avilés,
25 on passing her bill. Thank you.

2 CLERK: Council Member Carr?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Permission to explain my
4 vote?

5 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: Permission granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you, Majority Leader.

7 I just want to say a couple of brief words in
8 memory of our former colleague Paul Vallone. I want
9 to extend my condolences to the entire Vallone
10 family, and my congratulations on the passage of this
11 well-deserved honor. My tenure as a member only
12 overlapped with Paul's for about a month, but I know
13 from being Chief of Staff to my predecessor, Steve
14 Matteo, that he was a treasured colleague to Steve
15 and to all the colleagues that he served with during
16 his 8-year tenure here. Paul became a treasured
17 colleague to those of us who are serving now through
18 his role at the Department of Veteran Services. He
19 will be sorely missed, and I couldn't be prouder to
20 be voting yes on this piece of legislation to the
21 name the center in his honor. Thank you, and with
22 that said, I vote aye on all.

23 CLERK: Council Member De La Rosa?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: (ABSENT)

25 CLERK: Council Member Dinowitz?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Aye on all.

3 CLERK: Council Member Feliz?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Aye on all.

5 CLERK: Council Member Gennaro?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: I vote aye, and I wish to
7 be associated with the remarks of Council Member
8 Bottcher about Introduction 4. The bill by Council
9 Member Avilés is truly historic, and it's really
10 going to be great for New York City. This is... Bills
11 just don't get bigger than this. This is really a big
12 deal. And I should have asked to explain my vote,
13 sorry, but I just carried away. It's a great bill,
14 and I think I voted already, right? I voted aye?
15 Okay, I vote aye.

16 CLERK: Council Member Gennaro?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: I vote aye.

18 CLERK: Thank you, sir.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Okay, for the third time.
20 Okay.

21 CLERK: Council Member Gutiérrez?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: I vote aye.

23 CLERK: Thank you

24 Council Member Hanif?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Aye

2 CLERK: Council Member Hanks?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: I vote aye.

4 CLERK: Council Member Holden?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I vote aye on all.

6 CLERK: Council Member Hudson?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Aye on all.

8 CLERK: Council Member Joseph?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Aye

10 CLERK: Council Member Krishnan?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Sending much love to the
12 Vallone family, I vote aye on all.

13 CLERK: Council Member Lee?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Permission to explain my
15 vote?

16 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Aye on all.

18 I just wanted to say to Anna-Marie, Lea, Catena,
19 and Charlie, we loved your father. He will be dearly
20 missed, and was a mentor to many of us, including
21 myself, and his memory will live on. And I just
22 wanted to say, we love you, we miss Paul, and we know
23 that he lives on through your family and the love
24 that you guys have and show for everyone in the
25 community, so thank you.

2 Oh, did I vote? Aye on all, sorry.

3 CLERK: Thank you.

4 Council Member Louis?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Much love to the Vallone
6 family, I vote aye on all.

7 CLERK: Council Member Marmorato?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Council Member Marte?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Aye on all.

11 CLERK: Council Member Mealy?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: May I explain my vote?

13 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I want to give much love to
15 the Vallone family. I served with him before, and it
16 is befitting to have a name over the animals that he
17 always loved. And his beautiful smile, that's one
18 thing you can always count on, his smile. Good or
19 bad, we'd look at each other and have votes, but
20 after, we always spoke, we always had fun, and he
21 always had that beautiful smile. So, I thank you for
22 sharing him with this city - and your father, his
23 father, all the Vallone family. We love you, and we
24 wish you all the best. I vote aye on all, thank you.

25 CLERK: Council Member Menin?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Aye on all.

3 CLERK: Council Member Moya?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: (MEDICAL)

5 CLERK: Council Member Narcisse?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you, Madam

7 Speaker, for the Vallone sanctuary, and love to the

8 Vallone family. (INAUDIBLE) Council Member Avilés,

9 thank you so much for. I vote aye.

10 CLERK: Council Member Nurse?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: I vote aye on all.

12 Congratulations, Council Member Avilés.

13 CLERK: Council Member Ossé?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSE: I vote aye on all.

15 CLERK: Thank you.

16 CLERK: Council Member Powers?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: With lots of love to the

18 Vallones. I know Paul is smiling down on us. I vote

19 aye.

20 CLERK: Council Member Restler?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Permission to explain my

22 vote?

23 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Even when you disagreed

25 with Paul, he was never disagreeable. I never heard a

2 person say a negative thing about him. He's just a
3 profoundly decent man, and may his memory inspire us
4 all and be a legacy for us to follow. This is a
5 beautiful tribute today to his memory, and I'm proud
6 to vote aye on all. Thank you

7 CLERK: Thank you.

8 Council Member Riley?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Aye on all.

10 CLERK: Council Member Rivera?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye.

12 CLERK: Council Member Salaam?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: I vote aye on all.

14 CLERK: Council Member Salamanca?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

16 CLERK: Thank you.

17 Council Member Sanchez?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: With love to the Vallone
19 family, I vote aye on all.

20 CLERK: Council Member Schulman?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: permission to explain my
22 vote?

23 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: It's very rare that a
25 piece of legislation is a labor of love; voting on

2 making the new ACC facility plan for Queens after
3 Paul Vallone is a labor of love, and with that I vote
4 aye on all.

5 CLERK: Council Member Stevens?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Aye on all.

7 CLERK: Council Member Ung?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Sending much love to the
9 Vallone family, I vote aye on all.

10 CLERK: Council Member Vernikov?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Aye on all.

12 CLERK: Council Member Williams?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Adding my love as well
14 to the Vallone family. As a Queens girl, I proudly
15 vote aye on all.

16 CLERK: Council Member Won?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: (PARENTAL)

18 CLERK: Council Member Yeger?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President, may I be
20 excused to my vote?

21 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you.

23 What has been said about Paul, I never really
24 like to talk about how long I know somebody, because
25 it makes me feel old. For the last couple weeks, I

1 was thinking about how long I knew him, and I came to
2 work here 30 years ago this year - when I was three -
3 (LAUGHTER) as you know... We talked about that
4 before. But, we really became close during the
5 Speaker's 98' race. Paul, Peter, Perry, and they're
6 all incredible, each of their own ways, but Paul was
7 a giant in thought. He had a giant heart. He was
8 somebody who can be counted to do it's right for this
9 body, which he loved, and for the City for, for his
10 neighborhoods that he represented with great love. He
11 got there on a second time, in the second try, and
12 this city was much better served because he was here.
13 He really could've done anything, he didn't have to
14 be in public service. I think he had to, because he
15 was a Vallone, and that's just kind of the way it is,
16 but he really didn't have to. He was just so smart
17 and so beloved, and could've really done anything.
18 But, he gave his entire life to this city. Really he
19 did, as every Vallone has done. I vote aye proudly on
20 Introduction 1. I did not think that Intro 1 at this
21 session would have that name on it, Madam Speaker.

22
23 I vote on all, with the exception of M 29 and 30
24 and Resolutions 258 and 259. Thank you.

25 CLERK: Council Member Zhuang?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: I vote aye.

3 CLERK: Council Member Borelli?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all.

5 CLERK: Council Member Farías?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: I would like to also be
7 associated with Speaker Adams and my colleagues'
8 remarks about Paul. He was actually the previous
9 Chair of the Committee on Economic Development, and
10 was always super helpful, and loving, and open, and
11 wonderful - and literally, I probably called him too
12 much, but a call away, any time I needed advice on
13 how to tackle our really big committee. And he was
14 always genuinely happy to see my growth and to be
15 supportive and want to do more all of the time. So, I
16 didn't think I was going to get that emotional up
17 here, but he is going to be greatly missed. And I
18 vote aye on all.

19 CLERK: Speaker Adams?

20 SPEAKER ADAMS: You know, I wasn't going to go
21 off script, but this is a moment in time that I don't
22 think we're going have again to commemorate this
23 giant of the City Council.

24 Anna-Marie, Paul inspired me, and I'm looking at
25 all of the text messages that Paul has sent me over

1 the past... I mean I can go back and back and back,
2 and some of the most recent ones from the day that I
3 was reelected for this, my final term in office on
4 the 7th November, and he says, "So, very proud, Boss,
5 sending congratulations and love your way always,"
6 and then on, same month, Thanksgiving Day, the 23rd,
7 "Happiest of Thanksgivings to you and your family on
8 this day of giving thanks. We all give thanks for you
9 and your courage, your spirit, faith, and love of
10 your family, and your leadership, love from the
11 Vallone family." And, then on December 28th, "Good
12 morning, Boss, I'm sure you're enjoying this precious
13 week of family time," that was Christmas week, "I
14 would love to be a part of your section to support
15 your reelection as Speaker." And, then, one of the
16 last texts was the last time that he stood here on
17 January 3rd, and we spoke about the picture he and I.
18 He sent that picture to me, "So very proud to be
19 there with you today and every day, Boss." That's
20 Paul was to me. I wasn't his boss, he was mine,
21 because I learned so much from him - as a steward of
22 council and my super colleague, Speaker One, who I
23 consider another father figure for me, who tells me
24 whenever I check on him, "Baby, just sing something
25

1 for me, anything." Vallones, you're very special. We
2 are so honored, and I am so honored to close this
3 vote today by voting aye on all - particularly with a
4 jubilant, yet heavy heart, that our beloved Paul will
5 stand forever through the work that he did in the
6 precious animal that he loved. Thank you, Council
7 Member Schulman, for your dedication and your push to
8 make sure that this got done the right way. Thank you
9 colleagues, I vote aye on all.
10

11 (APPLAUSE)

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: All items on today's
13 General Order Calendar are adopted by a vote of 48 in
14 the affirmative, 0 in the negative, and 0
15 abstentions; with the exception of M 29 and 30, with
16 accompanying Resolutions, which was adopted by a vote
17 47 in the affirmative, 1 in the negative, and 0
18 abstentions.

19 Introduction and Reading of Bills, Speaker?

20 SPEAKER ADAMS: All bills have been referred to
21 committees as indicated on today's Agenda.

22 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you.

23 We will now move into the Discussion of
24 Resolutions. Would anyone like to speak on any of our
25 resolutions?

2 Seeing none, we will now have a voice vote on
3 today's resolution. If you wish to vote against or
4 abstain from today's resolution, please notify the
5 Legislative Documents Unit by email or by approaching
6 the dais.

7 I will now read today's resolution into the
8 record.

9 Preconsidered Resolution 202, Resolution calling
10 on the New York State Legislature to pass, and the
11 Governor to sign, legislation to increase the wages
12 and improve the working conditions of home care aides
13 to support these workers and ensure essential growth
14 of New York's vital home care workforce.

15 Would all those in favor say aye?

16 IN FAVOR: Aye

17 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: All opposed say nay?

18 OPPOSED: (SILENT)

19 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Any abstentions?

20 ALL: (SILENT)

21 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: The ayes have it.

22 We will now move into General Discussion. I would
23 like to recognize Council Member Riley, followed by
24 Marte, then Lee.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you, Majority Leader.

1 Good afternoon, colleagues. I am proud to be
2 introducing Resolution 251. This resolution will
3 empower the New York State Education Department to
4 support the New York City Parks Department's need for
5 more lifeguards. The Department of Parks and
6 Recreation maintains and operates 91 pools, including
7 79 outdoor swimming pools, and 12 indoor swimming
8 pools dispersed across facilities throughout the five
9 boroughs. In 2023, the Parks Department hired 650
10 lifeguards to monitor beaches and public pools. That
11 was short of the 1,400 lifeguards the department had
12 on staff before the pandemic, and a 100 fewer than
13 the 900 employed in the summer of 2022. The
14 increasing shortage of lifeguards has led to closed
15 beaches and pools during a time when we need to be
16 investing our city's vibrance. I had the pleasure of
17 joining the YMCA's Legislative Breakfast at this past
18 Somos Conference, and discussed the partnerships
19 related to the improving swim safety, swim access,
20 and drowning preventions. A solution that was raised
21 and often is, calls on city agencies to empower our
22 community partners equipped to carry out work that
23 extends beyond department limits. The lifeguard
24 crisis is an issue that extends beyond the Department
25

1 of Parks and Recreation and significantly indicates
2 our need to bolster this workforce with motivated
3 cohorts equipped to boost low staffing numbers and
4 improve our current human capital lifeguard index as
5 soon as possible.
6

7 By enabling the New York State Education
8 Department to allow physical education credit for
9 high school seniors who have their lifeguard
10 certification in New York City, ages 17 and up, this
11 bill will work to resolve current and future
12 shortages by encouraging students to pursue this
13 opportunity.

14 In addition to the resolution I'm introducing
15 today, I am grateful to the Legislative Document
16 Division for their work to align bill reintroductions
17 for the new (TIMER CHIMES) session. I urge my
18 colleagues sign onto Resolution 251 to help end our
19 lifeguard crisis in addition to the bills I have
20 reintroduced today. Thank you, Majority Leader.

21 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, Council
22 Member. I would now like to recognize Council Member
23 Marte, followed by Lee and then Sanchez.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: I'm excited to reintroduce
25 the amended version of the No More 24 Act today.

1
2 Since its introduction, and an 8-hour hearing in
3 2022, this bill has gained massive moment and
4 support. Introduction 615 addresses the concerns
5 brought up in the hearing while meeting the urgent
6 plea of thousands of immigrant women of color who
7 demanding an end to the 24-hour work day. Patients
8 needing 24-hour care deserve split shifts - like
9 those that exist in every other city in New York
10 State - 8 hours, 12-hour shifts are the norm in
11 places where the workforce is majority white. But,
12 here in New York City, our Dominican, Chinese,
13 Hattian, Puerto Rican and many other immigrant women
14 are forced to work inhumane conditions that rob them
15 of their wages, of health, of their time with their
16 families, of their ability to sleep at night. Twenty-
17 four shifts are only here New York City. So, it's our
18 responsibility to protect the thousands of home
19 attendants subjected to these conditions. If we truly
20 are a council that champions workers' rights,
21 immigrant rights, women's rights than our course of
22 action is clear - We must end this egregious practice
23 of 24-hour shifts. I look forward to working with all
24 my colleagues to pass the No More 24 Act. Thank you.

1 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, Council
2 Member. I would now like to recognize Council Member
3 Lee, followed by Council Member Sanchez, and then
4 Council Member Brewer.
5

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Thank you. Good afternoon,
7 Madam Speaker, Majority Leader, and colleagues.

8 Over the past few years, our city been hit huge
9 by an increase in vehicle thefts. Kia and Hyundai
10 designed and sold car models... So, if you guys have
11 a Kia or Hyundai pay attention... sold car models
12 without a basic safety feature. Those weaknesses were
13 publicized on social media, and exploited to a
14 devastating effect. During a three-year period,
15 thefts of these car models soared nationwide by a
16 1,000%, despite a decreasing trend in other major
17 crimes being measured.

18 I have personally heard the fears of many
19 (INAUDIBLE) residents, from officers in my district,
20 uh, about this concerning uptick, and the need for
21 enhanced safety measures to protect vehicle owners.
22 Particularly in transit deserts, like Eastern Queens,
23 where so many community members rely on cars to get
24 around, we must ensure that the infrastructure is in
25 place to protect their methods of getting to work and

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

school in order to keep our city moving. To that end, I am proud introduce Introduction 610, which establishes a vehicle theft prevention program in the NYPD. The Department would be tasked with distributing and assisting with the installation of steering wheel locks, and software updates, and conducting public outreach and education.

Kia and Hyundai are facing considerable lawsuits and have recently started public efforts to help secure these flawed products, and it's my hope that this legislation will prod them into more robust cooperation and coordination with our city, so that we can prevent further damage.

And, no joke, I don't know how many you guys remember the Club where you extend the thing on the steering wheel with the lock and key? Apparently that's the best way to prevent your cars from being stolen, so we gotta go back to that. So, it's one of the best ways, one of the best ways, apparently.

So, with that, thank you, and I hope to get all of you to sign on.

MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, Council Member. I like to recognize Council Members Sanchez,

1 followed by Brewer, followed up by Council Member
2 Krishnan.
3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you, Majority
5 Leader.

6 I am pleased to introduce Introduction 652 today,
7 which aims to establish and operate a pilot program
8 that would offer mental health services at no cost to
9 families when children have experienced emergency
10 removals. Communities have long voiced concerns about
11 ACS's practices, noting an unequal level of scrutiny
12 particularly impacting Black and Latino families who
13 disproportionately face these separations.

14 This issue was highlighted in a recently filed
15 federal class action lawsuit underscoring the
16 detrimental effects of emergency removals on
17 children, with Black children accounting for 51% and
18 Latinx children accounting for 38% of removals,
19 despite their much lower representation in the
20 population. The majority of investigations for these
21 removals are concentrated in specific communities
22 like Williamsbridge, Baychester, Soundview,
23 Parkchester, Hollace, East New York, and others.

24 While this pilot program won't address the root
25 causes of the problems in our child welfare system,

1
2 it does address an urgent need for mental health
3 supports. Thank you so much to Council Member
4 Stevens, Council Member Menin, Council Member Ossé,
5 Council Member Gutiérrez, Council Member Lee, Council
6 Member Joseph, Council Member Hudson, Council Member
7 Nurse, and the Public Advocate for introducing 652
8 with me, thank you.

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, Council
10 Member. I would like to recognize Council Member
11 Brewer, followed by Council Member Krishnan, and
12 finally Council Member Gennaro.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you.

14 I do want to... I didn't say earlier, I think Amy
15 Millard will be a great Conflict of Interest Board
16 member.

17 And, also, I want to thank the staff, because
18 they've done a lot of work on getting all these re-
19 introduced bills on the Agenda.

20 I want mention Kathy Goldman who died yesterday
21 at 93. She was a leading advocate on food and hunger
22 issues. In 1971, she created the first summer meals
23 program, and a year later, the first school breakfast
24 program in the city of New York. She was the leading
25 advocate on that, and also for improving lunch in

1 schools - still an ongoing issue. She started the
2 Community Food Resource Center, which has morphed and
3 is now a multimillion dollar organization. She
4 started the Community Kitchen in Harlem, which also
5 has a new kitchen, and is very much a go-to place for
6 people who need food. And she was the first person in
7 the city to talk about food insecurity. I want to
8 mention the work that she's done. She was honored
9 recently and did a White House Champion of Change in
10 the past, and we will miss her very much, but her
11 legacy lives on. Thank you very much. Kathy Goldman,
12 rest in peace.

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you. I would now
15 like to recognize Council Member Krishnan, followed
16 by Council Member Gennaro.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Thank you so much,
18 Majority Leader. Today I am proud to introduce
19 legislation, Intros 607, 608, and 609 to The Back
20 Home Act.

21 As we all know, the housing crisis is the most
22 urgent crisis we face in this city. And if we are to
23 solve it, one of the most effective ways to do so is
24 to protect tenants and to protect their homes - to
25 keep people in their homes. But, we see all over the

1
2 city landlords deliberately destroying buildings to
3 vacate tenants from their homes, remove buildings
4 from rent stabilization, and turn them into market
5 rate luxury buildings - or after large fires
6 prolonging or delaying repairs, to keep tenants out
7 of their homes.

8 Intros 607, 608, and 609 will address this issue
9 by doing a few different things creating a
10 comprehensive system to get tenants back home as
11 quickly as possible when they are vacated; to make
12 sure that when they're vacated, they are relocated in
13 their own communities, not halfway across the city or
14 other parts of the borough, far from their schools,
15 far from their original home - that when they are
16 vacated, the City works with them to get back in as
17 quickly as possible, to get their belongings, because
18 they're vacated often on short notice, overnight,
19 with no notice whatsoever. I have seen this as a
20 housing lawyer in tenants that I have represented
21 vacated from their homes. A large fire in Jackson
22 Heights on 89th street before - tenants are often
23 out in these situations for months, but really years.

24 This legislation will also require HPD to
25 initiate legal action against the landlord if the

1
2 landlord refuses to do the repairs to bring tenants
3 home. And, finally, when a vacate order is lifted,
4 and tenants are able to return home, The Back Home
5 Act requires that landlords notify tenants of their
6 right to move back in and reoccupy their homes, and
7 are given the ability to do so, rather than the
8 apartments being re-rented other people at much
9 higher rents. This is an essential way we have can
10 solve our housing crisis. I want to thank my
11 cosponsors who have joined us in this legislation,
12 Council Member Avilés, Council Member Restler,
13 Council Member Brewer, Council Member Gutiérrez,
14 Council Member Schulman, Council Member Ossé, and
15 Council Member Rivera. And, again, if we are to solve
16 this housing crisis, we must take seriously the issue
17 of (TIMER CHIMES) protecting tenants and their homes,
18 thank you.

19 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you, Council
20 Member. I would like to Council Member Gennaro,
21 followed by Council Member Nurse.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you. I am standing
23 again, so look out.

24 I think this is as good a time as any to let
25 members who may not know what this body and what this

1 city owes to Peter Vallone, Senior. Once upon a time,
2 the Council used to have kind of like an older
3 brother, so to speak, called the Board of Estimate.
4 Has anyone ever heard of the Board of Estimate?
5

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Well, you know, The Board
8 of Estimate was composed of the Mayor, of the
9 Comptroller, and what was then called the City
10 Council President, and the borough Presidents.
11 Borough presidents has one vote, the citywides had
12 two votes, and they controlled the Board of
13 Investment, the City Budget, land use, contracts,
14 franchises, water rates. And ,you know, no one knows
15 this better than Gale. (LAUGHTER) And this was ...
16 And Peter, Senior believed that that body was
17 unconstitutional, because you had the borough
18 presidents of Brooklyn having the same voting
19 strength as the borough presidents of Staten Island.
20 They made a federal case of it, it went all the way
21 to the Supreme Court, and in March of 1989, the way
22 the City governs itself was stuck down as
23 unconstitutional by a 9 to 0 vote, which created the
24 New York City Charter Revision Committee. We had to
25 invent a new way to govern ourselves. And during that

1 process, the Council went from 35 seats to 51 to make
2 it more inclusive or racial, ethnic, and language
3 minorities. And all the powers, just about all them
4 that were on the Board of Estimate, we got. And, so,
5 this is something that ,you know, Peter Vallone did
6 for this city. And he became the first Speaker. Up
7 until then, the legislative leader was known as the
8 Vice Chairman. I don't know why they called it Vice
9 Chairman, but that's what it was. And one of the most
10 endearing things about Peter Vallone, Senior is that
11 he is the only person (TIMER CHIMES) on earth who
12 still calls me "kid", and I really appreciate that.

13 (LAUGHTER)

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, Council Member
15 Gennaro. I would now like to call on Council Member
16 Nurse.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Thank you, Majority Leader.

18 Today I am reintroducing The Stop Illegal
19 Evictions Act, Intros 621, 622, 632 (*transcription
20 note: 623), and Resolution 246, which will create
21 stronger penalties and disincentives to finally end
22 illegal evictions in New York City. My district is
23 one of the top five districts hardest hit by illegal
24 lockouts and evictions. And I have seen them in
25

1 action - I have personally been to eviction
2 blockades, and stood by as tenants had their
3 furniture thrown out or slept in cars. I can tell you
4 there is little to no enforcement and that there is
5 no real threat of accountability to discourage this
6 illegal behavior. These bills are simple, they
7 increase existing fines, create new penalties, and
8 make it easier for all lawful occupants to get back
9 into their homes. With these new bills, New York City
10 will send a clear message that you will face steep
11 penalties if you try to lock out your tenants.

13 We are also announcing, well, I'm not, but the
14 City Council Data Team launched today a new data
15 dashboard showing illegal evictions across the City.
16 The Council dashboard will update regularly, and show
17 illegal lockouts throughout the City - how many NYPD
18 summons were issued for illegal evictions as well as
19 how many enforced evictions occurred. According to
20 this data, there have been over 6,000 illegal
21 eviction cases filed across the City since February
22 of 2023, and those numbers are only increasing. And
23 with those numbers, we are seeing that the NYPD only
24 issued 88 summons during this time. So, even though
25 illegal evictions are a Class A misdemeanor, an

2 arrestable offense, there is very little
3 accountability.

4 I want to thank the City Council Data Team for
5 working with us since last year. And I also want to
6 thank many advocates, Take Root Justice, Neighbors
7 Together, Vocal New York, Mobilization for Justice -
8 who is also on strike for a fair contract, Right to
9 Counsel New York City, Churches United for Fair
10 Housing, MET Council on Housing, Saint Nicks
11 Alliance, Housing Rights Initiative, and more. Thank
12 you very much.

13 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you so much.
14 Seeing no one else to speak, I will call on Speaker
15 Adams to close today's Stated Meeting.

16 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you. Majority Leader. The
17 Stated Meeting of March 7, 2024 is hereby adjourned.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 20, 2024