

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON STATE AND  
FEDERAL LEGISLATION

----- X

May 12, 2014

Start: p.m.

Recess: p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers  
250 Broadway - Hearing Room,  
16th Fl

B E F O R E:  
KAREN KOSLOWITZ  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Inez Dickens  
Brad S. Lander  
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.  
Ben Kallos  
Alan N. Maisel  
Antonio Reynoso

## A P P E A R A N C E S

Mario Merlino  
Assistant Commissioner  
Veterinary and Pest Control Services  
Division of Environmental Health  
New York State Department of Health and  
Mental Hygiene

Corinne Schiff  
Director of Special Projects  
Division of Environmental Health

Reesa Weinstock  
Executive Director & General Counsel  
Animal Care and Control of New York City

Michelle Villa-Gomez  
Legislative Director  
ASPCA

Edita Birngrant  
Campaign Director  
Friends of Animals

Jane Hoffman  
On Behalf of New York City Bar  
Association

President/Chairman of the Board  
Mayor's Alliance for  
New York City's Animals

2 CHAIRPERSON KAREN KOSLOWITZ: The Meeting  
3 on State and Federal Legislation is about to begin.  
4 Good morning and welcome, my name is Karen Koslowitz,  
5 I am the Chairperson of the State and Federal  
6 Legislation Committee. Today, we will be considering  
7 the Mayor's message. First, I would like to  
8 introduce the members of the committee that are  
9 present at this time. Council Member Brad Lander,  
10 Council Member Alan Maisel, and Council Member Ben  
11 Kallos and my committee Danielle, and um, am I right?  
12 [LAUGHING], you were looking at me, and Billy Martin,  
13 I should know that by now.

14 The committee will hear and vote on  
15 legislation to amend current state laws to allow New  
16 York City to increase dog license fees to support  
17 Animal Population Control and create incentives to  
18 licensed dogs. Dog licensing in New York City is  
19 currently regulated under state law. Chapter 115 of  
20 the Laws of 1894, before my time, [LAUGHTER], sets  
21 the dog licensing fee for spayed and neutered dogs in  
22 the City of New York at \$8.50, which has been the  
23 base fee for nearly 40 years. Chapter 115 permits  
24 the City to set its own licensing fees for  
25 unsterilized dogs in addition to the base fee, making

2 the total cost \$34 to license an unsterilized dog.  
3 The proposed legislation would allow The City of New  
4 York to set its own base fee by local law, provided  
5 that the licensing fee for an unsterilized dog is at  
6 least 85% greater than the base fee. This  
7 legislation would also increase fines with failure to  
8 license a dog from \$10 - \$75 for a first offense and  
9 would allow the City to set the late fee, the  
10 licensee currently set at \$2.00. This legislation  
11 also specifies how money collected from fees and  
12 penalties can be allocated detailing how such funds  
13 are to be ear-marked to implement the law. Fund  
14 animal shelters provide public education are  
15 responsible pet ownership and subsidize the animal  
16 population and control fund to support spay/neuter  
17 programs. The legislation would provide the  
18 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene with sole  
19 authority to carry out the provisions of the act.  
20 Current law permits private entities to issue  
21 licenses on behalf of the City and authorizes that  
22 they collect a dollar fee. However, the proposed  
23 legislation would expand who can process license  
24 applications and changes the collection fee to 10%  
25 the total fee. If passed, this legislation will

2 provide much needed funding to our City Shelter  
3 system, in addition to reducing the number of  
4 unwanted and abandoned cats and dogs. It will also  
5 provide Department of Health and Mental Hygiene with  
6 the opportunity to expand and enhance its dog  
7 licensing program which currently has low  
8 participation rates. I would like to, uh, any of my  
9 colleagues have any comments? Well that's a good  
10 start, I don't even have any questions because this  
11 seems really something that we need. I mean, not to  
12 raise fees, but since 1940, is outrageous. I mean,  
13 there's nothing, nothing, that hasn't had its fee  
14 raised. So with that, does it take a vote? No, we  
15 have wit...wait I'm sorry we have testimony, I'm sorry,  
16 I'm so eager.

17 **[UNDISTINGUISHED MAN'S VOICE 00:05:17]**

18 CHAIRPERSON KAREN KOSLOWITZ: Well, they,  
19 they were nice enough to come. So I think I'm gonna  
20 call upon them. Corinne Schiff and Mario. Ok.

21 MARIO MERLINO: Merlino, Mario Merlino.  
22 Uh, good morning Chairwoman Koslowitz, and members of  
23 the Committee, my name is Mario Merlino, I am the  
24 Assistant Commissioner for Veterinary and Pest  
25 Control Services in the Division of Environmental

2 Health at the New York City Department of Health and  
3 Mental Hygiene. To my right is, uh, Corinne Schiff,  
4 who is our director of special projects in the  
5 Division of Environmental Health. Thank you for  
6 inviting me to testify in support of the Council's  
7 home-rule message in support of A2046 and S5048  
8 Legislation that would enhance shelter services in  
9 New York City by allowing the City to set the  
10 license, the dog license fee. The department has  
11 pursued this legislation because its enactment would  
12 enable the department to modernize its dog licensing  
13 program, increase proportion in dogs that are  
14 licensed and raise critical revenue to support the  
15 animals cared for in the City's animal shelters and I  
16 will briefly go over a few, uh, key reasons, um, for  
17 our support of the bill. Uh, New York City should  
18 have first bullet -

- 19 • New York City should have the same  
20 authority the same as other New  
21 York City localities. The New York  
22 State Agricultural Markets Law that  
23 directs localities to issue dog  
24 licenses and authorizes them to  
25 charge an amount they see fit. Uh,

2 but New York City is different from  
3 all other municipalities in that it  
4 is governed by an unconsolidated  
5 law enacted in 1894 and not this  
6 agri-markets uh, statute. The 19...  
7 the 1894, 1894 law mandates that  
8 the City issue dog licenses, but  
9 prohibits the City from  
10 establishing the license fee. This  
11 legislation would establish a  
12 uniform approach to dog licensing  
13 around the state.

14 The licen...SECOND BULLET

- 15 • The license fee was intended to  
16 fully support animal care and  
17 control activities but no longer  
18 uh, covers even the cost of issuing  
19 the license. A license for altered  
20 dogs in New York City, uh, cost dog  
21 owners only \$8.50, an amount that  
22 has not changed since 1974, uh and  
23 it is now, as you can see, from the  
24 graph at the bottom of my written  
25 testimony, one of the lowest of any

2 major city in the country. Uh, the  
3 revenue generated by dog licensing  
4 was intended to help defray the  
5 costs of the Animal Care and  
6 Control Program because it has  
7 remained at \$8.50 for 40 years it  
8 no longer even costs the issuing of  
9 the license. This legislation  
10 would allow the New York City  
11 Council working with the Department  
12 of Health, to set an appropriate  
13 dog license fee.

14 Third bullet -

- 15 • New York City will seek local  
16 legislation to raise revenue and  
17 enable improved animal care  
18 services. If the legislation is  
19 enacted, New York City will seek  
20 local legislation to set a  
21 reasonable license fee and generate  
22 revenue needed to support  
23 improvements underway in the City  
24 Animal Shelters. Uh, thanks to the  
25 City Council, the Department has



2 increased the budget for New York  
3 Animal Care and Control, the non-  
4 profit under contract to operate  
5 the animal shelters already by more  
6 than two-thirds and by 2015, by  
7 77%, improving veterinary care and  
8 shelter maintenance. These  
9 enhancements make sheltered animals  
10 more likely to be placed in new  
11 homes. Obtaining a license will be  
12 easier for dog owners. The  
13 legislation will make it easier for  
14 dog owners to obtain licenses in a  
15 variety of ways. Um, the  
16 legislation would provide added  
17 incentives with third-parties that  
18 issue licenses and we will work to  
19 facilitate licensing at point of  
20 sale such as veterinary clients and  
21 pet events. The city will improve  
22 online licensing, streamlining it  
23 to enable dog owners to certify the  
24 spay/neuter status of their dog and  
25

2 two, if they wish, to purchase  
3 multi-year license.

4 Thank you for allowing me to testify and  
5 we will take any questions that you have.

6 CHAIRPERSON KAREN KOSLOWITZ: Questions?

7 Yes, Council Member Kallos.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BEN KALLOS: Uh, thank you  
9 to our Chair for our leadership and, uh, thank you  
10 for uh, this amazing, uh, legi...legislation. What can  
11 the City do to encourage more for adoptions, and...and  
12 discourage, um, mills, and other uh, sources of  
13 animals...

14 MARIO MERLINO: Well I,...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BEN KALLOS: ...with, with  
16 regards to licensing?

17 MARIO MERLINO: Uh, with regard to  
18 licensing...well I think the, the licensing is  
19 important for two, two big reasons. One is uh, it  
20 will help...having a dog license is the best way to  
21 ensure so that if your pet, if it, if it separated  
22 from you, returns to you. It's a, a uh, um, uh, AC&C  
23 has a program called "Free Ride Home". They'll  
24 actually um, bring your pet directly, uh, back to  
25 your house, uh, if the pet gets lost so uh, it's an

2 important component in comp...compared to not having  
3 pets wind up at the shelter and the other thing I  
4 think it does, um, probably the most important thing  
5 it does it provides um, critical funding for both the  
6 shelters and for spay and neuter programs in a  
7 differential, uh, that we collect for on unaltered  
8 dogs is, is 100% of that is used for um, spay and  
9 neuter services um, that we contract with the ASPCA  
10 and TOBIES Fund to provide. And so those spay and  
11 neuter services are you know, reducing the, the  
12 population of unwanted dogs and homeless dogs and,  
13 and uh, cats that will wind up at the shelters.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BEN KALLOS: Thank you  
15 very much, again, anything that we can do to  
16 encourage adoptions and uh, keep, take care of our  
17 animals, is, is huge, and, and, to quote the Price is  
18 Right, "Please spay and neuter your pets."

19 MARIO MERLINO: I agree.

20 CHAIRPERSON KAREN KOSLOWITZ: Thank you  
21 very much. You have?...No. Thank you, any other  
22 questions? Anybody else? We've been joined by  
23 Council Member Espinal and Council Member Dickens.  
24 Uh, Reesa Weinstock and Michelle Villa-Gomez?

25 [PAUSE 00:12:08 - 00:12:58]

2 REESA WEINSTOCK: Good morning Chair  
3 Person Koslowitz and members of the Committee on  
4 State and Federal Legislation, my name is Reesa  
5 Weinstock, I'm the Executive Director of General  
6 Counsel of Animal Care and Control of New York City.  
7 I'm testifying in support of both bills and the  
8 proposed legislative efforts to address the current  
9 efficiencies with respect to licensing OF dogs in New  
10 York City. A valid dog license is one of the  
11 smartest and responsible decisions a dog owner can  
12 make. Having taken in 11,726 dogs into our care in  
13 2013 AC&C welcomes this legislation. A valid license  
14 would have enabled us to more efficiently and quickly  
15 identify the owner of a lost or stray dog. Every  
16 legislative effort to help AC&C to get more animals  
17 out of the shelter system sooner, or that enables  
18 City Council to increase financial support for THE  
19 services AC&C provides will serve to improve the  
20 health and welfare of the pets and people of New York  
21 City. Let me take a few moments to explain a little  
22 about AC&C in order to put our perspective on this  
23 legislation into better context. AC&C is one of the  
24 largest animal welfare organizations in the North  
25 East and unique in the animal welfare community of

2 New York City because we are the only organization  
3 that takes in and cares for more than 30,000 animals  
4 each year in the five boroughs. AC&C was established  
5 in 1995 as a 501C-3 Not-For-Profit organization,  
6 dedicated to rescuing, caring for and through  
7 adoptions to the public, and certain rescue groups,  
8 finding loving homes for homeless and abandoned  
9 animals in New York City. Through a contract with  
10 the City of New York and DOH, AC&C operates five  
11 facilities, one in each borough, that are open  
12 admission, meaning that each center accepts any  
13 animal that comes through its doors, regardless of  
14 the behavior they are exhibiting, the condition  
15 they're in, or their medical status. We are the only  
16 not-for-profit animal welfare organization in New  
17 York City that is open admissions. We receive  
18 animals of all kinds at each of these locations,  
19 primarily cats and dogs but also rabbits, snakes,  
20 birds, reptiles, and, on occasion various farm  
21 animals. As part of our contract with the City, AC&C  
22 seeks to find homes for stray dogs, cats and rabbits.  
23 Of the 30,000-plus animals the AC&C took in last year  
24 11,726 were dogs. These numbers include owner  
25 surrenders, owner request for euthanasia, strays,

2 returns and animals brought in by the police. Of  
3 this number 6,436 were stray dogs and we were only  
4 able to reunite less than a quarter with their owner  
5 through a dog license, micro-chip or some other lost  
6 and found efforts. In just the past four months we  
7 have taken in close to 2,000 stray dogs and that  
8 number will continue to climb all year round. A dog  
9 license enhances AC&C's chances of finding the owner  
10 of a lost dog, thereby reducing the length of that  
11 dog's stay at the shelter. This in turn, reduces the  
12 burden on the shelter system in terms of capacity to  
13 care, personnel time and space, as well as the cost  
14 of caring for another animal. The license is one of  
15 the most effective sources of information that our  
16 customer care officers rely on to reunite a lost pet  
17 with their family. Additionally, if our field  
18 officers are able to identify an owner through a  
19 current dog license found on a stray dog's collar,  
20 then that dog may be able to get what we call "a free  
21 ride home" from one of our drivers, rather than being  
22 added to the already crowded shelter population.  
23 Unfortunately, many of the stray animals in our care  
24 arrive with no license and remain unclaimed.  
25 Consequently, there is never a shortage of dogs or

2 other animals available for adoption at AC&C. But  
3 even more unfortunate is that unclaimed dogs that  
4 become ill or show signs of behavior concern become  
5 at risk of euthanasia. AC&C strongly supports this  
6 legislation because the impact of a dog license has  
7 on our ability to reduce just one dog's length of a  
8 stay by immediately identifying their owner and that  
9 could mean one less dog at risk in the shelter. The  
10 number of animals at AC&C takes in is staggering and  
11 requires a steady source of resources to ensure that  
12 each of these animals may receive the optimum care  
13 and optimum chance at adoption or placement,  
14 including being returned to their owner. Through  
15 significant additional funding over the past two and  
16 a half-years City Council has enabled AC&C to make  
17 more good changes and steady improvements across the  
18 entire organization. We've expanded our staff from  
19 135 to 215, extended hours and days of operations at  
20 the shelters, receiving centers, call centers and in  
21 the field, improved the adoptions process, upgraded  
22 facilities and most importantly, increased the number  
23 of live outcomes from the shelter system. This  
24 translates to a live release rate of 82% in 2013 but  
25 we continue to be faced with the challenges of 30,000

2 animals arriving and staying at AC&C. Additional  
3 funding is essential to not only maintain, but to  
4 continue to drive improvement. Securing funding  
5 through shelters through higher licensing fees and  
6 making it easier for dog owners to obtain licenses,  
7 can help ensure that AC&C's efforts can continue to  
8 expand and improve providing greater protection to  
9 the health and welfare of all pets and people in New  
10 York City. The proposed dog license legislation  
11 helps promote responsible pet ownership and community  
12 involvement. AC&C has been ensuring dogs adopted  
13 from our shelters are licensed, as well as altered,  
14 micro-chipped and vaccinated for nearly two decades.  
15 We welcome the support of the City Council to  
16 encourage the same of all dog owners and third  
17 parties throughout the City. Thank you for the  
18 opportunity to testify and I am happy to take any  
19 questions.

20 CHAIRPERSON KAREN KOSLOWITZ: Any  
21 questions? Council Member Maisel?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ALAN N. MAISEL: I  
23 just wanted to uh, confirm what you said about  
24 all animals. Last year I rescued a Yellow-  
25 Bellied Eastern Woodpecker and I brought it to



2 the Linden Boulevard, uh, facility, and they  
3 took very, very good care of the bird and I  
4 wanted to thank you. It is my first  
5 opportunity to thank uh, Animal Control.

6 REESA WEINSTOCK: Ok, thank you very  
7 much.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ALAN N. MAISEL: The  
9 other thing I just wanted to mention, it's not  
10 really directed to you, but we're now in the  
11 middle of May. The legislature uh, adjourns  
12 sometime on June 20<sup>th</sup>, whatever the day of the  
13 week that happens to be. Um, with the crush  
14 of business that has to be for the  
15 legislature, um, this legislation, as  
16 important as it is, should have been done in  
17 January/February, or maybe just after the  
18 budget, um, I think this bill is going to get  
19 crushed in the effort to get it out of Albany,  
20 so um, it really needs to be done, but  
21 un...unfortunately, I think it's going to end  
22 having to wait until next year. Um, I would  
23 hope that we do something in Albany to make  
24 sure that, uh, the Kavinaugh-Serrano Bill gets  
25 some attention.

2 CHAIRPERSON KAREN KOSLOWITZ: Maybe we  
3 can write a letter of a um,...

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ALAN N. MAISEL: Well  
5 we, uh, I think the City should be in touch  
6 with uh, Senator Serrano...

7 CHAIRPERSON KAREN KOSLOWITZ: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ALAN N. MAISEL: and  
9 Kavinaugh to find out where the bill is and  
10 uh, um, because if it hasn't even gone before  
11 the Agricultural Committee, um, then it's  
12 unlikely that it's going to get some  
13 attention. We have to, really have to make a  
14 push just to make sure it happens.

15 CHAIRPERSON KAREN KOSLOWITZ: I will call  
16 them to find out exactly where it is. Anybody else?  
17 Next.

18 MICHELLE VILLA-GOMEZ: Good morning I'm  
19 Michelle Villa-Gomez, New York City Legislative  
20 Director for the American Society for the Prevention  
21 of Cruelty to Animals. On behalf of the ASPCA and  
22 its over 70,000 New York City supporters, I'd like to  
23 thank the Committee on State and Federal Legislation  
24 and Madame Chairwoman Kaslowitz for holding this  
25 hearing to discuss legislation at the state level

2 which would impact New York City's animals and the  
3 people that care for them. The ASPCA supports the  
4 Mayor's message requesting that the State Legislature  
5 pass A2046 Introduced by Assembly Member Kavinaugh  
6 and S5048 by Senator Serrano, which would amend  
7 current laws relating to Animal Control of the Animal  
8 Population Control Fund and licensing animals in New  
9 York City. The ASPCA advocates for programs that  
10 provide incentives to the public to spay/neuter their  
11 companion animals. We have previously supported  
12 legislation at the state and local level that allow  
13 the city to raise the license fee for an unaltered  
14 dog with the differential going to fund the animal  
15 population control program, which provides low-income  
16 New Yorker's access to spay/neuter services. We have  
17 also advocated for mandating licensing at point of  
18 transfer. For example, adoption or sale, as well as  
19 authorizing veterinarians, Humane Society, shelters,  
20 pet shops, boarding and grooming and training  
21 facilities to sell dog licenses. This bill would  
22 accomplish those objectives. The proposed  
23 legislation aims to modernize New York City's  
24 outdated dog licensing laws and establish a dedicated  
25 revenue stream for its animal population control

2 program. Specifically, it would allow New York City  
3 to set its based-dog license fee and it would create  
4 revenue for the animal population control fund with  
5 three-quarters of each monetary penalty collected for  
6 violations being designated to the fund. This  
7 legislation presents New York City with an  
8 opportunity to easily invest in its animal care and  
9 control program. However, in order to maximize on  
10 the potential revenue, we must continue to work to  
11 increase compliance with the dog licensing  
12 requirement. According to the Fiscal Year 2013  
13 Mayor's Management Report 83,000 licenses were issued  
14 less than in Fiscal year 2012, when it issued 93,000.  
15 Failure to implement an effective dog licensing  
16 program has resulted in the loss to the city of  
17 millions of dollars in revenue annually. Pending  
18 legislation would increase those revenues further if  
19 we continue to work, uh, to encourage compliance.  
20 The ASPCA, um, has been working with the Department  
21 of Health and the City Council, um, to help uh,  
22 increase access dog licensing and education about dog  
23 licensing and we will continue to do so. And as  
24 mentioned by the Department of Health's testimony um,  
25 we are also part of um, the Spay/Neuter Animal

2 Population Control Fund. We've been providing low  
3 cost spay/neuter um, in the five boroughs and we will  
4 continue to supplement these efforts. Um, we look  
5 forward to providing helpful and creative input when  
6 the Council considers restructuring the licensing  
7 protocol fee schedule. Um, we want to work with the  
8 Council and the Department of Health to ensure that  
9 the new based dog license fee is reasonable so that  
10 it doesn't result in another barrier to licensing.  
11 Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON KAREN KOSLOWITZ: Next Jane  
13 Hoffman and Edita Birnkrant.

14 EDITA BIRNKRANT: Good morning, um, my  
15 name is Edita Birnkrant, and I'm the Campaign's  
16 Director for Friends of Animals. Um, we are an  
17 international profit animal advocacy organization  
18 founded in New York in 1957. FOA has um, helped lead  
19 the effort to curve the pet overpopulation crisis by  
20 continually running the first nation-wide low-cost  
21 spay/neuter program for cats and dogs. Since our  
22 founding, we have facilitated over 2.6 million  
23 spay/neuter surgeries through this program and we  
24 work to promote pet adoptions at our city shelters  
25 and educate the public on responsible pet ownership.

2 Friends of Animals strongly supports the resolution  
3 in support of Bill A2046 and S5048, pertaining to the  
4 licensing of dogs in New York City. We support  
5 passage of these bills in the Senate and Assembly and  
6 will urge our New York members and supporters to do  
7 so as well. New York City should have the same  
8 authority to set the license fee as other New York  
9 localities and this legislation would enable that.  
10 The current dog license fee for altered dogs in New  
11 York City is \$8.50, an amount that has not changed  
12 since 1974. This very low rate is one of the lowest  
13 fees in the state and of any major city in the  
14 county. As a comparison, Philadelphia's fee is \$16,  
15 San Francisco's fee is \$21 and Miami's fee is \$27.  
16 It's necessary to increase the fee so that New York  
17 City will no longer lose money on its State-mandated  
18 licensing program and this legislation would allow  
19 the New York City Council to do so. The dog license  
20 fee was intended to support animal care and control  
21 activities, but as the fee has remained the same for  
22 nearly 40 years, it no longer even covers the cost of  
23 issuing the license. An increase is long way  
24 overdue. Local legislation to raise the license fee  
25 will generate a much-needed revenue to support

2 ongoing improvements in our City's animal shelters.

3 In doing so, we can ensure better veterinary care,  
4 shelter maintenance and in turn, increase adoptions.

5 This legislation will also make it easier for dog

6 owners to obtain licenses by allowing private

7 providers to keep 10% of the license fee, rather than

8 the current one dollar. Instead of only obtaining

9 licenses from the City, veterinarians, pet shops and

10 others could sell licenses to dog owners. The bill

11 would also change the law to allow dog owners to

12 certify that their dog has been sterilized in order

13 to be eligible for the lower license fee for altered

14 dog instead of requiring documentation from a vet or

15 a notarized statement. The licensing requirement

16 would also change current law for dog owners with

17 unlicensed dogs to impose a fine instead of criminal

18 penalties and seizures of their dog. Thank you.

19 JANE HOFFMAN: Hello my name is Jane

20 Hoffman and I am here to testify on behalf of the New

21 York City Bar Association, which, uh, is in support

22 of this legislation. I think that DOH, AC&C, Friends

23 of Animals and the ASPCA has set forth the case so I

24 am not going to bore you with reading my testimony,

25 which you have in front of you, um, we are in support

2 of this, um, Home Rule - to allow us to set our own  
3 dog licenses. I'd also like to say that I also have  
4 on another hat, I am the President for the Mayor's  
5 Alliance for New York City's Animals and we work very  
6 closely with AC&C and actually DOH on dog licensing,  
7 lost and found and we are also strongly in support of  
8 this legislation, thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON KAREN KOSLOWITZ:: Thank you.  
10 Since there is no other testimony, um, this meeting  
11 is adjourned.

12 VOICES: We have to vote.

13 CHAIRPERSON KAREN KOSLOWITZ: Oh vote.

14 [LAUGHTER]

15 CHAIRPERSON KAREN KOSLOWITZ: There's a  
16 press conference downstairs that is in my mind.

17 [LAUGHING] I'm sorry, um, okay. Call the roll.

18 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

19 Roll call vote, Committee on State and Federal  
20 Legislation, pre-concerted M Council Member  
21 Koslowitz.

22 CHAIRPERSON KAREN KOSLOWITZ: I vote Aye.

23 CLERK: Dickens

24 COUNCIL MEMBER INEZ DICKENS: Aye

25 CLERK: Lander



2 COUNCIL MEMBER BRAD S. LANDER: Aye

3 CLERK: Espinal

4 RAFAEL L. ESPINAL, JR.: Aye

5 CLERK: Kallos

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BEN KALLOS: Aye, please  
7 remember to spay and neutily...[LAUGHTER] or neuter  
8 your pets.

9 CLERK: Maisel

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ALAN N. MAISEL: Aye

11 CLERK: By vote of six in the  
12 affirmative, zero in the negative and no  
13 abstention[sp], item has been adopted.  
14 Members please sign the committee report.  
15 Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON KAREN KOSLOWITZ: Thank you.  
17 I'm gonna hold the vote open for another uh, half  
18 hour since uh, some of our colleagues are not here.  
19 They may be at the press conference so I'm gonna hold  
20 it open so they can vote. Thank you and thank you  
21 for being here and testifying.

22 CLERK: The following vote in Committee  
23 on State and Federal Legislation pre-concerted M  
24 Senate Number 5048 Assembly 2046 has been adopted by  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATION

a vote of six in the affirmative, zero in the  
negative, no abstentions. Thank you.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 14, 2014