CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

----- X

October 15, 2025 Start: 10:36 a.m. Recess: 11:11 a.m.

HELD AT: 250 BROADWAY - 8TH FLOOR - HEARING

ROOM 3

B E F O R E: Sandy Nurse, Acting Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Amanda Farías Christopher Marte Yusef Salaam

OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ATTENDING:

Darlene Mealy

APPEARANCES

Jacob Kotler, Project Manager at New York City Housing Preservation and Development

Justin Donlon, Project Manager at New York City Housing Preservation and Development

Devin Perera, Deputy Director of Operations, Division of Special Needs Housing at New York City Housing Preservation and Development

Wayne Finley, President of BluFin Development

LaQuisha Kellum-Smith, self

Janique Edwards, Acting Board President for 2149-53 Pacific Street HDFC

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: This is a microphone check for the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings and Dispositions recorded in Hearing Room 3 on October 15, 2025, by Nazly Paytuvi.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning, and welcome to today's New York City Council Hearing.

 $\label{eq:SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Will the Zoom Host} \\$ please start the webinar?

ZOOM HOST: Webinar started.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you, and welcome to today's New York City Council Hearing for the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings and Dispositions.

At this time, please silence all electronic devices.

No one may approach the dais at any time during this hearing.

Chair, we are ready to begin.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you.

[GAVEL] Good morning. Welcome to a meeting of the

Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings and

Dispositions. I'm Council Member Sandy Nurse, and

I'll be Acting Chair of the Subcommittee today. I am

joined today by my Colleagues, Majority Leader Amanda

Farías and Council Member Salaam.

Before we begin today's agenda, I will remind everyone that this meeting is being held in a hybrid format for members of the public who wish to testify remotely. We ask that you first register online, and you may do so now by visiting...

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning, and welcome back to today's New York City Council Hearing for the Committee on Landmarks.

At this time, please silence all electronic devices.

No one may approach the dais at any time during this hearing.

Chair, we are ready to begin.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: [GAVEL] Good morning again. Welcome to our new hearing rooms.

Welcome to a meeting of the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings and Dispositions. I'm Council Member Sandy Nurse, and I'll be the Acting Chair of the Subcommittee today. I am joined today by my Colleagues, Council Member Salaam, Majority Leader Farías, and Council Member Mealy.

2.2

2.3

Before we begin with today's agenda, I will remind everyone that this meeting is being held in a hybrid format. For members of the public who wish to testify remotely, we ask that you first register online, and you may do so now by visiting www.council.nyc.gov/landuse to sign up, and then sign into the Zoom and remain signed in until you have testified.

For anyone with us today in person and wishing to testify, if you have not already done so, please see one of our Sergeants to fill out a speaker's card, and we will call your name at the appropriate time.

For anyone wishing to submit written testimony on the items being heard today, we ask that you please send it via email to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov, including the land use number and/or project name in the subject line of your email. Video and audio testimony will not be accepted.

I remind members of the public that this is a government proceeding, and that decorum shall be observed at all times. As such, members of the public

2.2

2 shall remain silent unless and until called to
3 testify.

2.2

2.3

The witness table is reserved for people who wish to testify. No video recording or photography is allowed from the witness table.

Further, members of the public may not present audio or video recordings as testimony, but may submit transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant for inclusion in the hearing record.

We will now hold a public hearing for a Pre-Considered Land Use Item for the 2149-2153
Pacific Street Article XI request, which is an application for a 40-year Article XI property tax exemption retroactive to April 1, 2018, under Section 577 of the Private Housing Finance Law, to facilitate the rehabilitation of three existing buildings at the site for a total of approximately 24 affordable housing units. This exemption will replace an existing real property exemption, which is set to expire in 2032, and will be retroactively terminated. The project is located in Council Member Meely's District in Brooklyn.

Appearing today on the proposal on behalf of the City's Department of Housing Preservation and

Development are Devin Perara, Jacob Kotler, and
Justin Donlon.

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Okay, I already mentioned about the testifying. So first I'm going to pass it to Council Member Mealy for her opening remarks before I turn it over to the panelists.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Good morning, Chairs and my Colleagues. I just want to let you know about this Article XI for, I quess, 17 years this has been going on, or more, about 10 or 15 years. It went through another administration, I was in office, it went through another administration, I'm back in office, it's still here, and I just hope my community is watching this, I ask them to watch this. Anyone else would love to have 40 years to not pay taxes on their house. And here it is, this City, I just found out about that law, y'all saying that y'all are going to retroact it for 17 years. When the City has taken people's homes for one year's taxes, and now we're going to give someone who probably has a connection with somebody in the Mayor's Office or whoever, to give them 40 years. I said 25 would be good, I don't know when this Administration started doing 40 years, 20 to 25 I could see, because no other entity in this

2 city, and that's regular average people, cannot have 3 their taxes probated back for years. And here it is, 4 we, as this City government, is going to give this to a development. We don't know if after they get the 5 tax abatement for 17 years back taxes, and then give 6 7 them 40 more years, how do you know they're not going 8 to knock down these three buildings in which one is 9 totally vacant, no one, I have tried to speak to everyone in that building, they only have one 10 11 individual that I even put a police complaint in, 12 that let me see what is needed to be done with this 13 building. So I just ask this community and my Colleagues to consider this. Not 40 years. 25 years 14 15 would be good, and now that we have this legislation 16 for 17 years to be back taxes to be paid, with this 17 money right now that we are... well we just discussed 18 it now, that we're going to vote on. Please know this is so injustice to this city in which people are 19 20 losing their homes for 2,000 dollars' worth of taxes 21 and now we're giving a big entity that have resources 2.2 and we're going to give them 40 years to not pay 2.3 taxes. Just think of that. How many of you do not want to pay taxes on your own home? And here it is, 24 25 we're giving entities. And I think about so many

JACOB KOTLER: Yes.

1	DISPOSITIONS 10
2	SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Mr. Donlon.
3	JUSTIN DONLON: I do.
4	SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: Thank you.
5	ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: You all may
6	begin.
7	JACOB KOTLER: We have a presentation.
8	ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Can we get the
9	presentation up?
10	Ready to go?
11	JACOB KOTLER: Yeah. Okay. So I'm Jacob
12	Kotler. I'm the HPD Project Manager that's been
13	working directly with 2149-53 Pacific Street, which
14	is located in the Ocean Hill neighborhood in
15	Brooklyn. Next slide, please.
16	So just a high-level overview of the
17	building's history and ownership. The City gained
18	title to the property back in 1988 through an in rem
19	tax foreclosure, and it was in 1993 where a moderate
20	rehab was last completed to the building. The
21	building was conveyed to the HDFC back in 1992
22	through the TIL program, and there are 24 units
23	total. Currently, there are 20 that are occupied by

shareholders, three that are occupied by rental

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 tenants, and there's one vacant unit. Next slide,
3 please.

So, here's a breakdown of the units that 4 I described, as well as an overview of the average 5 housing cost. So, there's one-, two-, and three-6 7 bedroom units inside of these buildings. The average cost for a one-bedroom, 595 dollars. Two-bedroom is 8 581 dollars a month, and then three-bedroom is 600 dollars a month. So looking at the average, which is 10 11 around 581 dollars for these housing costs, this is 12 quite low compared to the rental market in the area. 13 It's about 20 percent AMI with these current housing 14 costs, and that's relative to the neighborhood, which 15 is around 90 percent AMI. Also want to note that the 16 building has been operating at a loss with its income 17 less than the actual expenses that have been incurred 18 by the building. And for our projects, we like to see 19 buildings have at least, like, 5 percent above what 20 they would expend on expenses, so 1.05 income-to-21 expense ratio is what we call that. And then the ANCP

So, an overview of some of the financial and physical issues that this building has been

program through HPD, which helps convert co-ops, the

standard is 1.1. Next slide, please.

25

2 experiencing. So as noted, these arrears started 3 around 2018. Right now, they stand around 322K, and 4 this is with a partial tax exemption that the building already has, which is known as the DAMP 5 exemption, and that is set to expire, as was noted, 6 7 in 2032. And just an overview of some of the building 8 needs, part of the reason it's working with HPD, building envelope, window replacements, boiler upgrades are needed, plumbing and storm line 10 11 improvements are needed, as well as new electrical 12 breakers. And a really important part of our 13 discussions with the building have been related to 14 the building's cash flow, so how much money is 15 available for their accounts and reserves after 16 paying for any debt and any operating expenses. You 17 know, there hasn't been a maintenance increase of 18 this building in some time, and it's been hard for us 19 to identify the last time it actually did occur. And 20 based off of some of the calculations that we've 21 worked on, looking at what the building's year one 2.2 cash flow might be, and that's the cash flow after 2.3 construction has been completed the first year afterwards. So, without any maintenance increases, it 24

would be negative 43,940, and this is factoring in

2.2

2.3

please.

the Article XI exemption without the maintenance increases. And then the maintenance increases that we have discussed with the building, which would provide about 331K in cash flow for that year one. And this is, again, something that's been actively discussed with the building, understanding the need for these maintenance increases in order to improve their income and long-term financial stability. Next slide,

So, the building came to HPD requesting this full Article XI tax exemption to help the building maintain financial stability for the next 40 years. And a part of this process would be regulating the building through a regulatory agreement. This has various provisions to try to maintain affordability as well as try to allow the building to have some financial stability. So, there's things called a flip tax, which relate to sales so a portion of those sales, 10 percent, would go back to the co-op. There are reserve requirements, so a certain amount of funds need to be set aside into reserve each year. Again, this is there to help the building's financial stability. We also have income and sales, so price restrictions to make sure that it's focused on

2.2

2.3

100 percent AMI.

housing low- to moderate-income folks. And then any rental that may still be in the unit upon vacancy needs to be sold. And in our regulatory agreement, we do have a whole formula that sets the max sale price. So this is a breakdown of what those sale prices might look like compared to market comps in the neighborhood. So 439K for the one-bedroom compared to 516K. Two-bedroom, 549K compared to 687K. And then three-bedrooms would be around 645K compared to 695K. And just want to note that the calculations for a sale price are based off a 7 percent interest rate. And just to note, if I didn't call on it, but the max income restrictions per our regulatory agreement are 120 percent AMI, and sale prices are set relative to

And that concludes my presentation.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Thank you so much.

Can you back up a couple slides? I actually had one question. I know you can't. Can the slide person back up? I don't know where they are, but can they back up two slides? I'm sorry, can you go forward one?

piece?

2.3

د ے

Can you just reiterate the cash flow

JACOB KOTLER: Yeah. So, we've been talking about necessary maintenance increases to improve the building's income. So, the main variable that we look at is cash flow, so these are funds available for the building to set aside into their reserves or their accounts after paying for necessary operating expenses, electricity, utilities...

ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Sorry. I guess I meant what is the increase from the maintenance fee?

JACOB KOTLER: Yeah. So we've discussed about the 63 percent increase, and this would be phased over three years. So we've discussed like a 25 percent increase, which would happen around next year. The following year would be 18 percent, and then the year after that would be 11 percent.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: To bring it up to the full 63? Sorry, I can't do math.

JACOB KOTLER: Yes, exactly.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. We already talked about the breakdown of owners and renters.

2.2

2.3

Do you have any information you can share on the average income for the existing residents?

JACOB KOTLER: I mean, based off of

discussions with the building, I would say it's probably around 30 percent AMI or less for the folks, but we don't have a definitive number on their incomes.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. So, the current rent is not too far off from what they're actually able to pay.

And what are the plans that you have for those residents during the actual rehab work?

JACOB KOTLER: Well, it's in terms of like safety precautions or anything?

ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Do you need to relocate them?

JACOB KOTLER: No relocation is required.

We typically require that for any substantial or gut rehabs, but most of these repairs can happen with folks in place, and there'd also be a tenant protection plan per DOB requirements so measures would be taken to make sure that folks are safe.

2.2

2.3

ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. And then what's the kind of timeline in terms of outreach or lead time before work begins?

JACOB KOTLER: Can you clarify that?

ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: What kind of outreach or lead time will be given to the residents before work begins?

JACOB KOTLER: As far as I understand, the building has been pretty well aware of these repairs and the work that's been involved with us, HPD. So a Board Resolution needs to be passed in order to actually approve the loan. That would happen prior to our closing. So no matter what, it'd be a couple months in advance of any work starting that folks in the building would be aware.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. I just want to recognize Council Member Marte has joined us.

Council Member Mealy, do you have any questions?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes. How much the loan is going to be?

JACOB KOTLER: The loan right now is a little over 2 million.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: 2 million.

If this goes through, you're going to pay back the taxes 17 years, and then the Article XI will kick in, and then you're going to get a 2-million-dollar loan, right, to do repairs.

JACOB KOTLER: To do repairs, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: And you're HPD,

right?

JACOB KOTLER: Mm-hmm.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So what makes this building, these buildings, any different from any other co-op? Because I've known co-ops have went under. Some of my co-ops, they took it over when HPD didn't help them, and they took it over with my help. So what makes this one so different than any other ones?

DEVIN PERERA: So thank you, Council

Member Mealy, for your earlier comments. I just want
to clarify that. We have an open...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: HPD?

DEVIN PERERA: HPD. We have an open application process, so you can go to Multifamily Rehabilitation Program, an HPD website, and you can submit an application. We have a number of projects.

19 DISPOSITIONS 1 2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: When did they get 3 this application put in? 4 DEVIN PERERA: I'm sorry? 5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: When did they put in the application? 6 7 DEVIN PERERA: Jacob, do you know when the application was? 8 9 JACOB KOTLER: Like around 2018, I want to 10 say. 11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I didn't hear you. 12 DEVIN PERERA: Around 2018, we believe. So 13 anyone in the city can apply. Our program is meant to 14 help rehabilitate and stabilize low-income 15 properties. We provide loans and tax exemptions in 16 exchange for regulatory agreements to keep sales prices and rents and maintenance affordable to all 17 18 residents. It's an open process. Anyone can apply. 19 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes. I just asked, 20 what makes these buildings any different from anyone 21 in this whole city? DEVIN PERERA: So, this building applied 2.2 2.3 to our program.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: How many others has

25 applied?

2.2

2.3

DEVIN PERERA: Buildings in our pipeline, which are... this is an average building in our

4 pipeline to receive a tax exemption.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Please talk up. I can't hear.

DEVIN PERERA: It is typical for buildings in our... applicants in our pipeline to receive Article XI tax exemptions.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: How did you choose this one since it was already in tax trouble? How did HPD choose this development out of all the other ones that have almost 20 years in the tax arrears? So how did HPD choose this one?

DEVIN PERERA: We are working with multiple projects at any given time.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: And y'all felt this one is not too much enough that you can help them? I just want to understand.

DEVIN PERERA: We're working with many projects on Article XI tax exemptions. This is just one of many.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes, and I'm asking, what criteria is it that you choose different co-ops that are in trouble to give them Article XI?

2.2

2 DEVIN PERERA: Depending on...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: 40 years to not pay taxes. And this project did not pay taxes for 17 years. So why did you choose this one? That's all I want to know.

DEVIN PERERA: My understanding is that their back taxes started accruing since 2018, which is about six years ago.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: 2018. Do you know I was in office, then got out of office, and now I'm back in office, and this still is going on? Why didn't you do it eight years ago? Why didn't it pass eight years, HPD?

DEVIN PERERA: I can't speak to what happened eight years ago. I know that they applied to us shortly after.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: In 2018.

DEVIN PERERA: And it's... (BUZZER)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Somebody just said that the AMI was going to be 100 percent after this is all done. True? You just stated that in this.

JACOB KOTLER: I mentioned 100 percent

AMIs is the standard for setting the sale price, but

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

DEVIN PERERA: We'd be happy to connect.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay. Thank you.

And I just want the City to know, 40 years of taxes, who would not want that? And this is so almost boqus that we are doing this to this just one, three buildings, when this city is in a crisis, they have lost their homes over a one year not paying taxes, so I'm so glad you came here today. Thank you.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you, Council Member Mealy, and maybe you all could just follow up with us and confirm that the building is only vacant in one unit, just so we can just get it on the record.

Do any other Council Members have questions?

COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: I have a question. ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Council Member Marte.

COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Has HPD spoken to every tenant in the building, just because with the potential financial hikes, we want to make sure that no tenant is evicted without understanding how much

2.2

2 it's going to increase, especially in the next three
3 years?

management company and the board, the board who is the legal representative for the HDFC Co-op, and we send out notices prior to closing. I just want to make it very clear that the increases that are being required are not there to pay back HPD debt, they are to make sure that the building can afford to pay their operating expenses. And as part of that, we are offering this building, along with other buildings in our pipeline, tax exemptions that run the length of the loan for the rehab projects that we are, the rehab loans that we are issuing.

COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: And were these notices sent to every single tenant, or just the management?

DEVIN PERERA: These notices get sent out prior to closing, which is a few months away. They will get sent out to every resident.

COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: All right. Thanks.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you,

24 | Council Member Marte.

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

I'll just say that I think that preserving low-income co-ops and ownership opportunities is incredibly important. I think the Council has a lot of consensus on opportunities for homeownership. We're talking about a 12 percent increase here on units that people are paying about 600 dollars for, which is pretty golden right now. And it seems, from my understanding, what you're saying, that the money that would be generated is actually going back, or the savings goes directly into repairing those buildings to improve the quality of living in those units. And whatever gets sold would still be, even though I find it personally wild that a one-bedroom would cost like 400,000 dollars in the world, it's still pretty damn good for what is on the market. So, I'm just putting that from my perspective on the record.

But I think we are now going to move into testimony if there's no other questions from Council Members.

Okay, so thank you panelists for coming today.

Counsel, are there any of the members of the public who wish to testify on this item?

2.2

2.3

SUBCOMMITTEE COUNSEL HUH: We have one person in the room with us signed up to testify, and then we have two online witnesses that I'm aware of to testify after that.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you. We will now dismiss the panel.

And Wayne Finley. You may come forward.

Okay, when you're ready to begin, you can either pull the mic close and then turn on the little button. You have about two minutes.

WAYNE FINLEY: Good morning, Councilwoman
Nurse and Members of the Subcommittee. My name is
Wayne Finley, and I am President of BluFin
Development. We are a family-owned real estate firm
that my brother, daughter, and I operate. While our
firm engages in development work, in this case, we've
served as the property manager and rehabilitation
consultant to the co-op shareholders at 2149 through
2153 Pacific Street. The shareholders of these
buildings have achieved the dream of homeownership
and do their very best to keep the property
affordable and well-maintained. Despite their best
efforts, the building is experiencing financial
distress, which is also now impacting their ability

Τ	23
2	to properly maintain it. We, as a management company,
3	conducted a full building needs analysis, and it is
4	critical that we replace the roof, windows, boiler,
5	and very importantly, we must also replace a number
6	of electrical panels in the building. It has been a
7	pleasure to work with the project managers at HPD's
8	Preservation Unit to help put together a
9	rehabilitation plan, the financing for which we are
10	ready to almost immediately close on. The final piece
11	of this puzzle is an Article XI tax exemption, which
12	we are humbly requesting the City Council to approve.
13	I'd be happy to answer any questions, and thank you
14	for this hearing today.
15	ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you. Any
16	questions?
17	How long have you all been managing this
18	building?
19	WAYNE FINLEY: We've been managing the
20	building since 2019, I believe.
21	ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay.
22	WAYNE FINLEY: 2018.
23	ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Well,

hopefully with this new conditions put on the

building, there can be better efforts made to sustain

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

LAQUISHA KELLUM-SMITH: Hi. I'm LaQuisha
Kellum-Smith. First of all, good morning,
Councilwoman Nurse and the Members of this
Subcommittee. I've resided in this Co-op 2149-53
Pacific Street HDFC for about 14 years, and I just
joined the Board of Directors because I really care
about the neighborhood, I care about my neighbors.
And that's about all I have to say. But thank you for listening to us today.

 $\label{eq:ACTING CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you.} \\$ Thank you for testifying.

Next up, we have Janique Bradley.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

3 JANIQUE EDWARDS: Good morning, Acting 4 Chair Nurse and members of the subcommittee. My name is Janique Edwards, and I'm currently serving as the Acting Board President for 2149-53 Pacific Street 6 7 HDFC. So, I've been a resident and a shareholder at 8 21 Pacific Street for over nine years. In 2016, I joined the Board as a treasurer to help my neighbors, many of whom are elderly, manage the corporation and 10 11 protect our homes. Over the years, our community has 12 worked tirelessly to keep the HDFC stable and 13 thriving with invaluable support from Blufin Management. Together, we've built a sense of 14 15 community and a safe, affordable place where our 16 neighbors look out for one another. So as the Acting 17 President, my goal is to preserve that stability and 18 affordability, especially for our senior 19 shareholders. We've done everything possible to keep 20 maintenance costs manageable, but increasing expenses 21 and deferred maintenance on major building systems 2.2 are creating challenges we just can't afford to 2.3 ignore. Through this HPD program, we have identified our most critical repair needs and worked diligently 24 to refine a realistic budget to address those. The 25

2	final step in this long process is the approval of a
3	tax exemption through an Article XI, which will allow
4	us to move forward with the essential repairs and
5	continue offering affordable homeownership
6	opportunities. We're deeply grateful for the
7	Council's ongoing commitment to supporting affordable
8	housing in this city, and we respectfully ask for
9	your approval of this exemption within the near
10	future. Thank you so much for your time and for your
11	consideration.

 $\label{eq:acting chairperson nurse: Thank you so } \mbox{\ensuremath{\texttt{much.}}}$

Not seeing any other members of the public who wish to testify regarding the Pre-Considered Land Use Item for a project known as 2149-2153 Pacific Street, Article XI. The public hearing is now closed, and the item is laid over.

And that concludes today's business.

Thank you to everybody, Staff, and all people who
testified. This meeting is hereby adjourned. [GAVEL]

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 25, 2025