

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

----- X

April 28, 2025
Start: 10:36 a.m.
Recess: 1:11 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Yusef Salaam, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Diana Ayala
Tiffany Cabán
Robert F. Holden
Rita C. Joseph
Christopher Marte
Chi A. Ossé
Carlina Rivera

OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ATTENDING:

Lincoln Restler

A P P E A R A N C E S

Josh Levin, Director of the Legislative Affairs
for the New York City Police Department

Lola Obe, Chief of Transportation for the New
York City Police Department

Brian O'Sullivan, Commanding Officer of Traffic
Enforcement for the New York City Police
Department

Amber Adler, member of Families for Safe Streets

Dahlia Goldenberg, Associate Director of Families
for Safe Streets

Darnell Sealy-McCrorey, member of Families for
Safe Streets

Eric McClure, Executive Director of StreetsPAC

Andre D. Carroll, Pennsylvania State
Representative

Y. Jennings, self

Andrew, self

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: This is a microphone
3 check for the Committee on Public Safety located in
4 the Chambers recorded on April 28, 2025, by Pat
5 Kurzyna.

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning, and
7 welcome to today's New York City Council hearing for
8 the Committee on Public Safety.

9 At this time, we ask that you please
10 silence all electronic devices, and at no time is
11 anyone to approach the dais.

12 If you have any questions throughout the
13 hearing or would like to sign up for in-person
14 testimony, please see one of the Sergeants-at-Arms.

15 Chair Salaam, we're ready to begin.

16 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: [GAVEL] Good morning.
17 I'm Council Member Yusef Salaam, Chair of the
18 Committee on Public Safety. I want to welcome
19 everyone to today's hearing on the NYPD's Parking and
20 Traffic Enforcement Efforts and related legislation.
21 I'm joined today by Members of the Committee, Council
22 Member Marte, Council Member Holden, Council Member
23 Joseph, Council Member Cabán, and Council Member Ossé
24 on Zoom.

2 Today, we will examine how the NYPD is
3 enforcing parking and traffic laws and addressing
4 public concerns about safety, fairness, and
5 accountability. From reckless driving, driving while
6 intoxicated and impaired, accidents involving serious
7 and fatal injury, to the proliferation of ghost cars,
8 this hearing comes as many New Yorkers question both
9 the effectiveness and fairness of the NYPD's
10 enforcement efforts. In 2024, we saw 274 traffic-
11 related deaths, including 118 pedestrian fatalities
12 and nearly 100 involving e-bikes, mopeds, and other
13 micro-mobility devices, serving as stark reminders of
14 the seriousness of ensuring proper traffic
15 enforcement to maintain safety on city streets for
16 all New Yorkers and to minimize the occurrence of
17 serious and deadly traffic accidents. I think we all
18 agree that we want the NYPD to enforce our parking
19 and traffic laws in a fair and consistent manner, and
20 we look forward to examining relevant statistics to
21 see whether the Department is succeeding or falling
22 short. We intend to explore what can be done to
23 address racial disparities in enforcement. According
24 to the NYPD's Vehicle Stop Report, in 2004, over 85
25 percent of vehicle searches conducted by NYPD

2 involved Black and Hispanic individuals. These
3 disparities have continued even as enforcement has
4 declined in various categories. So, while some call
5 for more traffic enforcement in the interest of
6 safety, others ask whether the enforcement that
7 remains is being applied equitably. We also expect to
8 hear how the NYPD is addressing challenges relating
9 to ghost cars, illegal plates, and enforcement of
10 laws related to micro-mobility devices, issues that
11 are increasingly shaping the flow of traffic in New
12 York City.

13 In addition to today's oversight
14 discussion, we are also considering a number of
15 legislative items. Introduction Number 179, sponsored
16 by Council Member Feliz, would require the NYPD to
17 maintain adequate tow-pound capacity to meet
18 enforcement needs and publish annual reports on
19 towing activity disaggregated by precinct.

20 Introduction Number 1252, also sponsored
21 by Council Member Feliz, which would mandate NYPD
22 verification of license plates and vehicle
23 identification numbers for vehicles with temporary or
24 suspicious plates alongside quarterly public
25 reporting on violations, immobilizations, and tows.

2 Resolution Number 853, which I've
3 sponsored, calling on the State to amend the Vehicle
4 and Traffic Law to allow vehicle identification
5 numbers to be listed on notice of violation when
6 license plates are missing, obscured, or tampered
7 with.

8 Resolution Number 854, sponsored by
9 myself, in support of Senate Bill 7621 and Assembly
10 Bill 7979, which would require intelligent speed-
11 assisting technology in vehicles driven by repeat
12 traffic violators.

13 This hearing is an opportunity to examine
14 how enforcement prioritizes traffic and parking
15 enforcement, how priorities have changed in recent
16 years, and the Department's vision is for a safer,
17 more just traffic enforcement system going forward. I
18 thank everyone here today for participating in this
19 important conversation, and I look forward to a
20 thoughtful and robust discussion.

21 I now turn to Counsel to administer the
22 oath.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL KINGSLEY: Thank you,
24 Chair. Today for NYPD, we'll be hearing from Josh
25

2 Levin, Director of Legislative Affairs, Inspector
3 Brian O'Sullivan, and Chief Lola Obe.

4 Can you please just raise your right hand
5 and affirm the following, that you affirm to tell the
6 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth,
7 and to answer honestly to Council Member questions?

8 ADMINISTRATION: (INAUDIBLE)

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL KINGSLEY: Seeing you
10 all nod your heads in yes, you may go ahead. Thank
11 you.

12 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Good morning, Chair
13 Salaam, Members of the Council. My name is Josh
14 Levin, and I am the Director of the Legislative
15 Affairs for the New York City Police Department. I'm
16 joined today by Chief of Transportation Lola Obe and
17 Inspector Brian O'Sullivan, also from the
18 Transportation Bureau. On behalf of Police
19 Commissioner Jessica Tisch, we thank you for the
20 opportunity to speak about the work that the
21 Department is doing every day to ensure the safety of
22 millions of people moving about the city and to
23 improve their quality of life.

24 Now, central to this mission is traffic
25 enforcement. The Department's Traffic Enforcement

2 Agents, or TEAs, write approximately 8 million
3 summonses a year. The deployment of TEAs and their
4 enforcement activity is data-driven, with the goal of
5 both preventing traffic accidents and addressing the
6 violations that inconvenience and frustrate New
7 Yorkers as they go about their daily lives. So, for
8 example, our Vision Zero High Visibility Corridors
9 Initiative identifies on a rolling basis the traffic
10 corridors with the highest concentrations of
11 collisions, injuries, fatalities, and we surge
12 Traffic Enforcement Agents and other officers to
13 conduct enforcement and provide a visible deterrent
14 to those who might otherwise drive irresponsibly.
15 This strategy is working. In those corridors,
16 collisions year-to-date are down 16 percent, and
17 collisions resulting in injury or death are down 11
18 percent.

19 Now, more broadly, our traffic
20 enforcement across the city is yielding tremendous
21 dividends. There have been 51 traffic fatalities so
22 far this year, compared to 76 at the same time last
23 year, a 33 percent decrease. We also focus on
24 particular types of traffic violations. Our Bus Lane
25 Task Force deploys Traffic Enforcement Agents and tow

2 trucks to conduct enforcement against cars improperly
3 using bus lanes. Last year, we issued 260,081 bus
4 lane summonses, and year-to-date we have issued an
5 additional 68,142 summonses. 4,319 vehicles were
6 towed from bus lanes last year, and 1,550 have been
7 towed year-to-date.

8 We also have taken aggressive enforcement
9 action against cars parked in bike lanes, and in
10 response to this recurring problem, we issued 61,125
11 summonses last year, and 16,839 this year.

12 Additionally, the Department towed 221 vehicles from
13 bike lanes in 2024, and an additional 56 so far this
14 year.

15 The key in all of this is to be
16 responsive to what the people of the City of New York
17 are telling us, and one particular concern, again and
18 again, is the reckless and unlawful operation of
19 mopeds, scooters, e-bikes, and other micromobility
20 devices, and the Department has formulated a new,
21 comprehensive plan to address this issue. Using data
22 drawn from 3-1-1 complaints, DOT statistics, and our
23 own TrafficStat, we are deploying Quality of Life
24 teams and Citywide Traffic Task Force personnel to
25 those locations where misuse of the micromobility

2 devices is most prevalent and at the times when
3 violations are most likely to occur.

4 Now, I want to take a moment to comment
5 on the bills under consideration today. Intro. 179
6 would require the Department to operate our tow
7 pounds with enough capacity to tow vehicles at a rate
8 necessary to deter illegal conduct and to report on
9 towing and tow pound capacity. The NYPD fully
10 appreciates the significance of adequate tow capacity
11 and of the need for increased tow facilities. Since
12 the State budget compelled us to close our final
13 Manhattan tow facility in 2021, we are determined to
14 find appropriate facilities for a new Manhattan tow
15 pound. It should come as no surprise that it is a
16 challenge to find sufficient tow space on an island
17 that constitutes one of the densest urban
18 environments in the world. We intend to meet the
19 challenge, and we hope to repurpose already existing
20 Department facilities in Manhattan to accommodate a
21 tow facility. We look forward to working with Council
22 on crafting a version of the bill that will best
23 achieve our shared goals.

24 Intro. 1252 would require the Department
25 to confirm the validity of license plates and vehicle

2 identification numbers of all vehicles summonsed for
3 a traffic or parking violation or bearing temporary
4 plates. We appreciate that the intent of this bill is
5 to improve traffic enforcement, and again we share
6 that intent, but the bill, as drafted, will have the
7 opposite effect. When it comes to traffic enforcement
8 across New York City, efficiency is crucial. Our TEAs
9 will typically write a summons in under a minute.
10 Forcing TEAs to check the validity of every plate
11 when issuing a traffic or parking summons will
12 dramatically slow down the summons process, resulting
13 in an overall sharp reduction in enforcement.
14 Moreover, the benefits of this approach are limited.
15 Most vehicles we summons do not have fraudulent
16 plates. In short, the bill, as written, would impose
17 major costs that far outweigh the limited benefits.
18 It's not even close on this one.

19 So, when it comes to improving
20 enforcement against cars with fraudulent plates, the
21 answer lies in the legislation contemplated in the
22 Chair's Resolution Number 853, which will allow us to
23 write summonses to the VIN, and the answer also lies
24 in the targeted enforcement against cars with ghost
25 plates and fraudulent plates that we can conduct and

2 do conduct with our partners at the MTA and the Port
3 Authority Police. In 2025 alone, these operations
4 have resulted in 9,144 summonses, the seizure of 910
5 ghost vehicles, and arrests of 267 ghost car drivers.
6 The answer does not lie in the bill as currently
7 drafted, and we strongly oppose it.

8 So, thank you for the opportunity to
9 speak to these critical issues, and now we look
10 forward to answering any questions you have.

11 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. I'd like
12 to note for the record that we've been joined also by
13 Council Member Restler.

14 So, I'm going to start my line of
15 questioning with street safety. In recent years,
16 pedestrians and bicyclists have faced increasing
17 dangers when navigating city streets. Many factors
18 likely contribute to the city's ongoing issues with
19 street safety, including the proliferation of e-
20 mobility devices and mopeds, but also increased
21 incurrences of dangerous driving practices such as
22 speeding or disobeying traffic signs. Can the
23 Department speak to any trends in traffic deaths and
24 injuries that have occurred in recent years?
25 Specifically, how do the current rate of traffic

2 deaths and injuries compare to what the city
3 experienced prior to the pandemic and prior to
4 implementing the Vision Zero initiative?

5 CHIEF OBE: Good morning. So, I just
6 wanted to speak to, just address one of the things
7 you had mentioned about fairness and also just speak
8 into what we see and then I'll touch on the
9 fatalities. So, foundationally for us at the
10 Transportation Bureau for TrafficStat, this is where
11 we start and this is where we are in 2025 as an
12 organization. In February of 2024, working with our
13 partners in the DOT, we identified, along with the
14 DOT, nine traffic corridors in 33 precincts. The
15 identification at that time was based on a look-back
16 window of four years of KSI, KSI being killed, these
17 are corridors where people were killed or severely
18 injured. In January 2025, we maintained the same nine
19 corridors and added six additional for a total of 15
20 citywide corridors. This time, those 15 corridors run
21 along 50 of our 78 patrol precincts with an addition
22 of 17 patrol precincts to the original 33, identified
23 in 2024. For precincts that are outside of these
24 identified corridors, their task is clear. Identify
25 high visibility corridors with the highest KSIs,

2 again, where people are killed or seriously injured,
3 and that's where there's three E's. We emphasize
4 three E's during TrafficStat or just in our business,
5 it's all about the three E's and the three E's are
6 education, enforcement and engineering, partnering
7 with the DOT. I believe that these corridors and the
8 results on these corridors have been very promising.
9 In 2024 alone, along nine citywide corridors,
10 collisions were down. Total collisions down 12
11 percent, total injuries down 16 percent. We were down
12 seven fatalities in 2024 again along those nine
13 corridors.

14 Enforcement was up. Total movers along
15 those nine corridors were up about 88 percent. Vision
16 Zero movers that we focus on were up along those nine
17 corridors. Same thing that we see in 2025. 2025 year-
18 to-date 1/1 through 4/20 along 15 citywide corridors,
19 total collisions are down, total injuries are down.
20 Fatalities, unfortunately, eight versus three are up
21 by five. I just want to reference something we've
22 seen in the media in the confines of the 61 precinct
23 in Brooklyn South. This collision happened on
24 Saturday, March 29th, where a woman and her three
25 kids crossing the street were killed by a speeding

2 driver in Ocean Parkway, one of the 15 identified
3 corridors. Mom and two kids were killed, leaving a
4 third child in critical condition. These are the
5 types of drivers that we target when we focus on
6 Vision Zero enforcement, such as speeding, which is
7 what we see, and fail to yield enforcement along
8 those corridors. So, I just wanted to just touch on
9 that. That's what we speak to foundationally.

10 For fatalities in general, when you look
11 at 2025, what we see so far, total fatalities 52
12 versus 79. We're down in pedestrians, but see a spike
13 in this category. I'll speak to that very quickly.
14 Traditional bike fatalities are down. Motorized two-
15 wheel scooter fatalities are down 8 versus 17. Motor
16 vehicle occupants are down 11 versus 24. Highway
17 fatalities are down 8 versus 14. Truck-related
18 fatalities are even, 12 versus 12.

19 What's troubling to us and what we see
20 right now is pedestrian fatalities, and I'll give you
21 just a quick snapshot. This year alone, again, 1/1
22 through 4/20, we have 32 versus 36 fatalities in this
23 year to date. We're down by four. So, 32 of the 36,
24 so 32 pedestrian fatalities versus 36 total. That
25 accounts for about 61 percent of our fatalities. What

2 we see mostly is 30 versus 33. That's on street
3 levels, outside crosswalks, nine versus seven on
4 highways, two versus two. The worst times that we see
5 is during the day shift with about 14. The worst
6 days, Friday with 10. The worst boroughs, Brooklyn
7 with 12. And the types of vehicles, truck/bus. We
8 have nine e-bike, one motor vehicle. We have 22 with
9 one leaving the scene.

10 Contributing factors, and this is where
11 we focus our summonses, for the most part is driven
12 by failure to yield to pedestrian and also by
13 speeding. What we see that's troubling is an uptick
14 in our senior fatalities. We say seniors, older adult
15 pedestrian fatalities. Those are people who are 60 or
16 older, and we have 14 versus 12. In that category,
17 we're up by two. So, age group again from 62 by 95,
18 and locations where there's pedestrians are struck
19 mostly, again, intersections, mid-block, and we had
20 one on the highway.

21 What is the plan? So, we know that two
22 contributing factors drive fatalities, and that's,
23 again, speeding and fail to yield. Speeding
24 enforcement to match that is up 20 percent. Year-to-
25 date, we have 34,306 versus 28,646 from last year.

2 And some of the criticism that we get is, oh, the
3 Police Department, we're reactive to when things
4 happen. What I just mentioned about Ocean Parkway,
5 one of the things we do is we stay there because it
6 is one of our 15 corridors, and one of the things
7 we've done so far is to have an initiative on Ocean
8 Parkway. So since 3/31 through 4/25, we've written on
9 that corridor alone 3,972 parking summonses, 3,272
10 moving summonses, and, again, focusing on the right
11 types of summonses. We have 740 for speeding, 62 for
12 fail to yield, 136 for red lights, 76 vehicles were
13 towed, 70 summonses were issued, mostly for reckless
14 driving and operating motorized scooters and three
15 others, 17 arrests of which five were DWI, 9 vehicles
16 were seized, and 37 truck summonses were issued just
17 for that initiative for Ocean Parkway.

18 But overall, for fail to yield summonses,
19 again, because we see that this is a contributing
20 factor for our pedestrians, we're up 14,302 fail to
21 yield summonses versus 326 from last year. We also
22 focused and have trained our officers on writing out
23 summonses, and that's Admin Code 19-190, and that's
24 for fail to yield right away. Year to date, we have
25 1,071 summonses that have been issued and two arrests

2 made. Hazardous violations are up 10 percent. Vision
3 Zero movers are up 17 percent. Moving violations are
4 up 5.3 percent. DWI arrest is also up 18 percent,
5 1,225 versus 1,042. VTL 511 arrests for suspended
6 licenses up 24 percent, 9,237 versus 7,453.

7 So, it's not just all about enforcement.
8 We also focus on education, too. And when I say
9 education, I'm going to highlight one particular
10 precinct in Queens, the 109 precinct. We are data-
11 driven. We have our TrafficStats, and I'll speak to
12 that a little as to what we do. When we see stats
13 like that, where we see a spike in pedestrian
14 injuries specifically in the senior community, right
15 away we partner with our Uniformed Members of the
16 Service in the Community Affairs Bureau and just have
17 somewhat of an initiative in that on certain
18 identified corridors. So, year to date in the 109
19 precinct, for instance, this is exactly the types of
20 things that we saw. Year to date, there were 113
21 versus 103 pedestrian injuries. 36 of the 113 were
22 for pedestrians, and those were mostly seniors, and
23 we saw the same type of pattern in 2024. So, we task
24 the command partners, that's the engineering
25 department with the DOT, to conduct massive and

2 consistent education and outreach throughout that
3 community, also tapping into the Community Affairs
4 Bureau, as well as our local precinct, and follow up
5 with enforcing traffic summonses along those
6 corridors to change driver behavior. Special thanks
7 to the Community Affairs Bureau again for
8 coordinating the outreach work in the 109 precinct.
9 We identified for that initiative, so a lot of
10 initiatives around the city where we see some type of
11 spike, and this is how we respond. So, three
12 problematic intersections were identified. The
13 outreach work was done over three days, and a lot of
14 it just concluded with traffic safety overview,
15 discussions on crossing safety, Vision Zero flyers in
16 English and Korean. We also gave out pens, jacket
17 reflectors, whistles, and reflection tapes were also
18 distributed. My point here is that the focus is not
19 just in enforcement like I mentioned, but just one of
20 the three E's, but also in education. In this case,
21 we really wanted to keep our seniors safe.

22 The engineering component is our officers
23 have to prepare traffic intel reports. So far, we
24 have about 570 year-to-date, and these traffic intel
25 reports are given to the DOT, and it's a combination

2 of enforcement type of recommendations, roadway
3 designs, or roadway hazard. So just very, very
4 quickly, this is just foundational for us.

5 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. How does
6 the Department respond to concerns regarding what
7 many perceive as an increased disregard for traffic
8 rules shown by cars, e-bikes, mopeds, and bicycles
9 alike?

10 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So, I just want to make
11 sure I'm understanding the question correctly. The
12 question is, what is the Department's feelings about
13 the public's perception of what's going on with
14 micro-mobility vehicles, or what are we doing?

15 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Yeah, it's really all
16 of it. Not just the public concerns, but what's
17 happening as we see the disregard for traffic rules
18 shown by cars, e-bikes, mopeds, and bicycles.

19 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Yeah, certainly. There
20 are so many factors that go into something like New
21 York City that we're constantly trying to keep our
22 eyes on, but we are seeing stuff like the belief of
23 lawlessness and people disobeying traffic signal
24 indicators. That has knock-on dangerous effects, both
25 for the person doing the driving as well as the

2 pedestrians who are trying to walk around, like we
3 saw in Ocean Parkway. And so this Police Department
4 is committed to addressing those things that are
5 inconveniencing and/or putting people's lives at
6 harm. This Police Commissioner, as you know, is very
7 dedicated to addressing quality-of-life issues, and
8 so the Quality-of-Life Teams are addressing some of
9 those things. Noise complaints, e-bikes, mopeds, etc.
10 That is on top of the work that our Transportation
11 Bureau already does, targeted in these specific
12 quarters. And by the way, specifically in regards to
13 the public, these things are, again, data-driven. If
14 you look at a heat map of New York City, you can see
15 where the things are happening based off 3-1-1
16 complaints, and that's where we respond to, and so we
17 hear these things. The Police Commissioner is
18 certainly aware of these things, and you know, I
19 think, how committed this Police Commissioner is to
20 increasing the quality of life for everyday New
21 Yorkers.

22 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: What is the current
23 strategy for addressing safety concerns that relate
24 to the dangerous use of micro-mobility devices, such
25 as e-bikes and scooters? You know, are there

2 precincts also where collisions or fatalities
3 involving two-wheel vehicles are particularly
4 concentrated? And if so, what is being done to
5 address the issue in those locations?

6 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So, I'm going to take the
7 first part of that question, like, what are we doing?
8 I think it's a two-pronged approach, right? There's
9 education and there's enforcement. We're not just
10 stopping and summoning people, right? Although that
11 is a component of it, because sometimes people just
12 only respond to a fine, right, before it gets through
13 to them. But we're also doing affirmative educational
14 outreach. And so, you know, we have this palm card
15 flyer, the Chief mentioned, it's in all the different
16 languages, and we handed out over 70,000 of them to
17 e-bike and micro-mobility operators in a specific
18 corridor. Because if somebody on an e-bike is driving
19 recklessly, it's a danger to themselves, let alone
20 every other pedestrian, and so the goal isn't
21 necessarily enforcement. The goal is compliance.
22 Sometimes you do that with education. And we've done
23 that, right? But we also do, goes hand-in-hand with
24 enforcement to make sure that people actually are
25 complying with these regulations.

2 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. Actually,
3 I was wondering if the palm cards that you're talking
4 about would also be something that Council Members
5 can also get access to so that we can share that
6 information also within our Districts because we see
7 things and we are very concerned about these types of
8 things as well as the people that we serve.

9 CHIEF OBE: We definitely will.

10 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: So, I want to move on
11 to traffic enforcement. Unfortunately, the data
12 appears to show that NYPD traffic enforcement, a key
13 pillar in ensuring safer streets, decreased
14 significantly during the COVID-19 pandemic. In the
15 years prior to the pandemic, the NYPD averaged more
16 than 900,000 summonses for hazardous moving
17 violations. Last Fiscal Year, the NYPD issued only
18 496,000 of such summonses, a slight increase from the
19 prior year, but still well below the pre-pandemic
20 levels. How does the NYPD explain the decrease in
21 traffic enforcement that has occurred in recent
22 years? And have there been specific changes to the
23 Department's policy that have led to this result?

24 CHIEF OBE: Okay. So, I don't see a
25 decrease. I just want to touch really quickly on the

2 hard work that our agents and officers do daily. I
3 can assure you that everyone's plugged in with the
4 three E's I mentioned earlier that we emphasize
5 during traffic safety. Again, education, enforcement,
6 and engineering. We work closely with the DOT as our
7 primary partner and conduct other operations with
8 multiple agencies when we get to those plate
9 operations we'll talk about. The enforcement is
10 there. Traffic agents primarily write parking
11 summonses and manage tow operations, and our uniform
12 officers write parking and moving violations
13 summonses. So, with traffic agents, currently we have
14 about 2,000 traffic agents citywide. They write about
15 8 million parking summonses per year. That's
16 approximately about 4,000 summonses per agent per
17 year. So, speaking to pre-pandemic numbers, I just
18 want to just touch on the fact that they actually
19 currently have capacity for the number of agents that
20 we have. So, in 2020, for instance, we had 1,853
21 agents. They wrote 7-plus million summonses. That
22 amounted to about 18.4 summonses per tour. 2021,
23 again, 1,793 agents. They wrote about 22.3 summonses
24 per tour. 2022, less with 1,533, 24.4 summonses per
25 tour. '23, 1,379, 26.3. 2024, we had 1,339 agents,

2 and they wrote 26.7 summonses per tour. In 2025, we
3 currently have 1,337 agents, and they wrote about
4 26.9 summonses per tour. Now, these are just TEA
5 level twos, not just all of the TEA agents. So, I
6 don't see the decrease. I think that we're actually
7 doing more with less.

8 I also wanted to mention our officers.
9 They're also plugged in, in terms of the moving
10 violations that they write. But, again, when you look
11 at, I mentioned the results along the five corridors.
12 Enforcement, just total. Total movers are up. Total
13 Vision Zero movers are up. Moving summonses that we
14 are concerned about, that actually causes accidents,
15 are up. Speeding summonses, red lights, cell phones,
16 and total Vision Zero summonses are also up.

17 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I think it's about more
18 with less. The percentages of what they're writing is
19 going up, as the Chief mentioned, with less people.
20 And we're also targeting it in specific locations.
21 And so, for example, the moving summonses for e-bike
22 enforcement, 4,558 versus 1,480 over last year. So,
23 that's like a 208 percent increase. So, we're
24 targeting it. So, maybe it's a less overall number,
25 but we're being more efficient and putting it in the

2 places, in these traffic corridors that we've
3 identified.

4 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Similarly glaring is
5 the decrease in arrests for driving while
6 intoxicated. Prior to the pandemic, the city averaged
7 nearly 7,000 DWI arrests each year. A figure that
8 decreased to fewer than 3,000 DWI arrests in Fiscal
9 Year 2022 and has since increased slightly to around
10 3,500 such arrests in Fiscal Year 24. It also must be
11 noted that DWI fatalities tripled between Fiscal Year
12 '23 and Fiscal Year '24, increasing from 11 deaths to
13 34 deaths. Does the NYPD believe that there is a
14 connection between the decrease in DWI arrests and
15 the recent spike in DWI fatalities? And if not, what
16 explains both of these trends?

17 INSPECTOR O'SULLIVAN: Good morning,
18 Chair. So, for our DWI, driving while intoxicated,
19 arrests, we're up 2 percent, as you said, 3,568
20 versus 3,477. You know, we're dedicated to go out
21 there. We have our patrol officers, our highway
22 officers, our citywide traffic task force. It comes
23 up at TrafficStat. We're definitely focusing, and,
24 you know, there has been an increase with the DWI

2 arrests. We're going to be out there focusing on it,
3 and hopefully this year we'll have a better year.

4 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Does the Department
5 have a strategy for decreasing the occurrence of
6 driving under the influence?

7 CHIEF OBE: The strategies, that's the
8 messaging to our officers?

9 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Yes.

10 CHIEF OBE: If you could just clarify
11 that.

12 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Well, strategy to I
13 guess not necessarily just the officers, but with
14 regards to the people as well. I mean, I know we have
15 the palm card to assist in making sure that we have
16 safer streets in New York City. We're just wondering
17 what the strategy would be around decreasing, you
18 know, the occurrence of people driving under the
19 influence.

20 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So I think a lot of
21 different factors come into play in this. Like, one
22 of the good ones is the prevalence with ride share,
23 like Uber, etc. I think hopefully you see a decrease
24 as a result of that, but in regards to our specific
25 enforcement, again, we have the data, we follow the

2 data, we set up checkpoints. One reason why we can't
3 rely on cameras to do everything for us is because
4 you need a human in the loop for a lot of this stuff.
5 A camera is never going to know if a person is
6 driving drunk. But when we conduct an actual car stop
7 on the Belt Parkway or something, the officer can
8 then make a determination if this person is
9 intoxicated and possibly save that driver's life or
10 other people's lives. I don't think anything has
11 really changed in the avenue of DWI enforcement in
12 the last recent years. It's still basically I think
13 the same pattern. In regards to the specific stats
14 you asked about, I just feel there's a lot of factors
15 that come into play so I just wouldn't feel
16 comfortable commenting on why that decrease may have
17 happened for that one specific year.

18 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: According to the
19 Mayor's Management Report, the NYPD's Chief of
20 Transportation collaborates with precinct executive
21 officers to evaluate traffic patterns and enforce
22 strategies at weekly TrafficStat meetings. How does
23 the NYPD use TrafficStat meetings to assist and
24 respond to emerging collision patterns? And how often

2 does the NYPD revise its enforcement strategy based
3 on real-time or monthly traffic injury data?

4 CHIEF OBE: So, we do conduct extensive
5 quantitative analysis of traffic enforcement through
6 TrafficStat, like you mentioned. So, TrafficStat is a
7 weekly data-driven session modeled very closely after
8 ComStat that everyone's very familiar with. These
9 sessions bring together NYPD executives, precinct
10 leadership, and agencies such as TLC, the DOT in one
11 room, ensuring that all partners are working in
12 coordination to address, again, the three E's. At the
13 local precinct and patrol borough levels, we have our
14 borough executives and precinct EXOs expected to
15 conduct ongoing reviews of someone's activity,
16 collision trends, and fatalities to inform local
17 deployment strategies. These analyses support real-
18 time decision-making and long-term planning. So, for
19 instance, I talked about the 15 corridors, we're
20 ultra-focused on that. For commands that fall, again,
21 outside of that, they have to designate locations
22 where they have their worst or their highest KSIs. So
23 with TrafficStat, our reviews are typically done over
24 a 28-day or 56-day review and also year-to-date
25 review, as well as anything that's historic over that

2 time. And those reviews really identify shifts in
3 collision patterns. They help us, again, with
4 enforcement strategies and also support seasonal
5 adjustments in deployment. We know in the colder
6 weathers, for the most part, we have certain trends
7 as opposed to the warmer weather. So, borough-level
8 traffic teams also use these intervals to assess
9 precinct-level performance and drive followup so
10 that's what I would say about TrafficStat.

11 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. I'd like
12 to mention that we also, for the record, have been
13 joined by Council Member Ayala.

14 To what extent does the NYPD identify
15 areas in the city for targeted traffic enforcement
16 due to elevated traffic safety dangers in such an
17 area? And also, what data or analysis does the NYPD
18 use to inform resource allocation for targeted
19 enforcement and evaluate impact of enforcement?

20 CHIEF OBE: So, I think if I understand
21 your question, we touched on this with Ocean Parkway,
22 where we see a certain spike. We have a certain
23 initiative there. When we see trends in seniors, for
24 instance, senior pedestrians being killed or injured,
25 we'll focus our enforcement there so there's that

2 constant shift around the city and just drawing
3 resources towards a particular problem.

4 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I know you mentioned
5 this specific area, and I'm wondering, has this led
6 to safer street conditions?

7 CHIEF OBE: We do follow up. I would say
8 that it certainly has. Our goal, say for instance
9 with Ocean Parkway and some of the other areas that
10 we hit, is to change driver behavior. When I see a
11 motor vehicle out there, a police vehicle, for the
12 most part, people will slow down.

13 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I'd like to mention
14 that we've been joined also by Council Member Rivera.

15 How long does the benefit of increased
16 enforcement last?

17 CHIEF OBE: I don't know that I have an
18 answer to that, but we do weekly reviews during
19 TrafficStat and attack problems as we see it with the
20 different boroughs. I don't know that there is one
21 answer to that, one method to that, but it is a
22 multi-pronged approach.

23 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: As traffic cameras
24 and other means of automated traffic enforcement
25 become more viable with advanced technology, how does

2 the NYPD anticipate expanding its use of technology
3 to conduct traffic enforcement?

4 DIRECTOR LEVIN: When you talk about speed
5 cameras, that really lives with DOT, but what I will
6 say is this, I kind of touched on this earlier, happy
7 to leverage technology in a way that makes the
8 streets safer, 100 percent, but I still think you
9 need a human in the loop. You'll never be able to
10 take a human out of the loop on this stuff for three
11 reasons. Interdiction, identification, and education.
12 Identification because if you have an obscured plate,
13 the machine is never going to pick that up. You need
14 a human being to be able to do that, so that's
15 identification. Interdiction because you're not going
16 to know if that driver is unlicensed or is DWI. You
17 can have a little human being as a police officer
18 make that arrest. A camera is never going to be able
19 to do that. The third thing is education. Cops have
20 discretion. When they make a vehicle stop, if the
21 person is like, I'm so sorry, I'm just racing home to
22 get to my daughter's recital or whatever, you can
23 give a verbal warning because we're all human beings
24 and we understand this happens to people, but it's
25 also literally a chance to have a face-to-face

2 conversation with the driver, and you can explain to
3 the driver, on this corner last week, we had a
4 fatality, we had a DWI. We are out here looking for
5 them, so that's why I pulled you over, but I've got
6 to remind you to be safe, drive within the etc., etc.
7 You don't want to see that happen to your daughter,
8 etc., etc. Always happy to leverage technology, but
9 still think you need a human in the loop.

10 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: This may have been
11 answered, but are there certain types of dangerous
12 driving practices or other traffic violations that
13 would be well-suited for automated enforcement using
14 cameras or evolving technologies, and how could this
15 reduce the need for officer-initiated traffic stops?

16 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I think I'm going to
17 defer back to what I said earlier. I still think you
18 need a human being, especially if someone's
19 recklessly driving. What's a camera going to do if
20 they're weaving in between lanes at 4 o'clock p.m.
21 when everyone's getting out of school and stuff?
22 Again, always interested to leverage whatever we can,
23 but I think you need the human in the loop for those
24 reasons.

2 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I'm going to move to
3 traffic stops. Local law requires the NYPD to publish
4 detailed information on traffic stops occurring in
5 the city, including the demographics of people
6 stopped and outcomes of stops. The data shows
7 persistent racial disparities that exist across the
8 board in terms of police action related to vehicle
9 stops, most notably with Black and Hispanic drivers
10 disproportionately represented in all vehicle
11 searches, arrests, and use of force incidents.
12 Notably, White drivers account for 21 percent of all
13 vehicle stops, but are only subject to around 5
14 percent of all searches, arrests, and use of force,
15 whereas Black and Hispanic drivers account for around
16 50 percent of vehicle stops, but nearly 90 percent of
17 all arrests, searches, and use of force incidents.
18 How does the NYPD account for racial disparities in
19 traffic enforcement? Specifically, what explains the
20 relatively low rate at which White drivers have their
21 vehicles searched or are subject to arrests or use of
22 force following traffic stops?

23 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So, I think there's two
24 major responses to this. I think one is in the
25 aggregate and one is in the individual. In the

2 aggregate, like we mentioned earlier, we are going to
3 target specific corridors where we are seeing 3-1-1
4 and traffic issues. Those specific corridors run
5 through the city. So, I'll give you an example.
6 Atlantic Avenue. It touches the 84 precinct. It
7 touches the 75 precinct. Because the data is telling
8 us this is where certain crimes are happening, we are
9 going to have more officers in those specific areas.
10 So for example, the 75 has a different amount of
11 police officers than the 84 because it has to be
12 responsive to the crime that is happening there. And
13 this stuff is objective. It's like from 9-1-1 calls.
14 It's not us. It's the public telling us this. And so
15 as a result, any time that you have more police
16 officers in a certain area, as a result, you are
17 going to see more enforcement. You are going to see
18 more car stops. You are going to see more searches.
19 That's a fact. That's what I would say in the
20 aggregate.

21 In the individual, I just want to make it
22 very clear that there are mechanisms for if there is
23 any accusation of racial or bias-based policing,
24 there are mechanisms by which citizens can and should
25 address that. You can make a report to CCRB. Times

2 have changed. Drivers are filming police officers as
3 the officers are interacting with them. At the same
4 time, officers have their body-worn cameras on. This
5 stuff is being documented. There is paperwork.
6 Officers have body-worn camera on. Not only can a
7 complaint be made to CCRB, but also there are civil
8 issues if an officer makes an improper or illegal
9 stop to be sued. And whatever criminal case may come
10 from, you are going to have a judge at a hearing
11 reviewing all the evidence, all the body-worn, any
12 cameras, paperwork, the way the person was acting,
13 for there to be a determination of did this officer
14 really have that level of suspicion under the DeBour
15 factors. There are mechanisms in place to view and
16 review these things. I think it's a two-pronged
17 approach to that type of question.

18 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: What are the most
19 common offenses that lead to arrests following a
20 traffic stop? Are there racial-neutral explanations
21 for why the racial disparity in enforcement might
22 exist for those specific offenses?

23 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Let me take the second
24 part first. I think the answer I gave before explains
25 when you see more police officers, you're going to

2 see more enforcement. That's that. I looked at
3 quarter four for our vehicle stop report, and one of
4 the tabs is arrests that stemmed from a vehicle stop.
5 There are 8,215 individual arrests that stemmed from
6 vehicle stops in the fourth quarter of 2024. I went
7 through that. I isolated the top 17 most recurring
8 arrest charges that stemmed from those 8,200 stops.
9 These are ones that had 101 or more instances of
10 arrest. By the way, the number one one was vehicle
11 driving related, motorist related, vehicle safety
12 related, aggravated unlicensed operation of a motor
13 vehicle in the third degree. That was 1,700. The top
14 five are all vehicle traffic law, some are in the
15 penal law, but they're all about driving. You've got
16 unlicensed operation third degree, possession of a
17 forged instrument in the third degree. I'm
18 extrapolating a little bit. My guess is that's a
19 fraudulent plate or a fraudulent driver's license.
20 You've got unlicensed aggravated operation of a
21 vehicle in the first and the second degree, and then
22 rounding out the top five, possession of a forged
23 instrument in the second degree. Those are the top
24 five or so of the 17 most recurring ones. If you go
25 down the rest of the 17 of them, you'll see that the

2 vast majority of them are VTL misdemeanor or VTL
3 felony related, 40 percent or more. You're talking
4 3,200 of the 8,000 arrests were VTL stuff. Unlicensed
5 operation, license plate covered. Actually, that
6 3,200 doesn't even include DWIs. I just pulled the
7 top 17. That's what you're seeing in a breakdown.
8 It's a lot of VTL stuff, which is what we know leads
9 to fatalities and concerns.

10 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Apart from the
11 highway division and regular patrol officers, what
12 other command units or special teams engage in
13 traffic enforcement?

14 DIRECTOR LEVIN: There's patrol. There's
15 the Transportation Bureau. I think the big three are
16 the Quality-of-Life Teams, which I believe turn out
17 under Patrol Services Bureau. I could be wrong. I'll
18 double check that. I think those are the three major
19 entities that you were seeing doing this enforcement.

20 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: What percentage of
21 all stops, searches, and arrests are conducted by
22 specialty units, such as the CRT or Neighborhood
23 Safety Teams?

24 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I'm not sure. I don't
25 know.

2 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: What percentage of
3 vehicle stops result in retrieval of illegal
4 firearms?

5 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I looked at quarter four
6 2024 again when I was doing this data review. Of the
7 8,200, I mentioned there were 8,200 individual
8 arrests. Of the 8,200 arrests, 585 of them were CPF,
9 criminal possession of a weapon, related. The biggest
10 one was criminal possession of a weapon in the second
11 degree with the subsection being loaded firearm. That
12 was 215 of the 585. Okay? So just aggregate number
13 585 out of 8,215 is 7.1 percent. Approximately 7.1
14 percent.

15 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Is there a percentage
16 of those that are misdemeanor?

17 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So, I didn't write down
18 whether each one was misdemeanor or felony. I believe
19 criminal possession of a weapon in the fourth degree
20 like piercing ammunition could be a misdemeanor. I
21 can follow up.

22 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Like knives or stuff
23 like that.

24 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Oh. There are some CPW-
25 4s, but it's not broken down by... the subsection says

2 firearm, throwing star. There's a bunch lumped in
3 there, so we don't have it broken down by that.
4 Firearm is included as one of those ones in CPW.

5 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: What guidance or
6 policies exist regarding when an individual subject
7 to arrest following a traffic stop should receive a
8 desk appearance ticket as compared to being detained
9 and arraigned in criminal court?

10 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I didn't bring it with
11 me. I can follow up with you. There are very specific
12 criteria by when a DAT can and should be issued. It's
13 not dictated by whatever form is being used. It's
14 being dictated by Department policy. There are
15 certain factors that disqualify you from getting a
16 DAT. I used to have them all. I can definitely follow
17 up with you.

18 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I definitely would
19 like to see that. And also if you can follow up, can
20 you add the racial breakdown of the individuals who
21 receive these DATs versus those who are detained and
22 arraigned?

23 I'm going to pass it to Council Members
24 for questions, starting with Council Member Cabán.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. I just
3 also want to acknowledge Families for Safe Streets. I
4 know that there are family members here that have
5 experienced a lot of pain and loss. It's not easy to
6 come here and advocate so thank you for being here.

7 I want to start a little bit by talking
8 about data, although I might as well already sign up
9 for a second round. I'm going to be referring to the
10 newly released data report by NYCLU, the NYPD Vehicle
11 Stops Data. I just want to start with this. I'm going
12 to ask you to keep your answers as succinct as
13 possible. I might interrupt you. I have a lot of
14 questions. Why are Black and Latina drivers stopped
15 so much more often than their share of drivers?

16 DIRECTOR LEVIN: What do you mean by their
17 share of drivers?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: For example, Black
19 and Latina drivers represent approximately 22 percent
20 and 23 percent of the driving population
21 respectively, but they account for 32 percent and 30
22 percent of the traffic stops. Why are Black and
23 Latina drivers stopped so much more often than white
24 drivers?

2 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Where's that percentage
3 coming from?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: From the report.

5 DIRECTOR LEVIN: The NYCLU report?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yes.

7 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Do you know where it
8 comes from from NYCLU, though? It comes from a survey
9 of commuters coming into the city. Between you and
10 me, I'm not sure that's the best benchmark.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: So you're saying
12 that it's not true that Black and Brown drivers are
13 stopped more often than White drivers?

14 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Not what I said. What I
15 said is I'm just hesitant to say there is a number
16 who should be stopped based off a survey of who is
17 commuting.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay, so my
19 question for you is why are Black and Latina drivers,
20 putting the numbers aside, why are Black and Latina
21 drivers stopped more often than White drivers?

22 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I think it comes down to
23 where we see the deployment of resources, like I
24 explained earlier. When you have more police officers
25 in a certain area because you're responding to

2 specific crimes, you're going to see more
3 enforcement.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: So, racial bias?

5 DIRECTOR LEVIN: No. The Department is not
6 racist, Council Member.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I think that the
8 data says otherwise, Counsel.

9 I'm going to ask my next question. The
10 same report found that NYPD searched 83 percent more
11 vehicles in 2024 than 2023. Can you explain the
12 really large increase in vehicle searches?

13 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So, I think it all
14 depends on the conditions that the officers are
15 seeing, and it depends on what the prevalent crimes
16 that are being committed. We see surges of certain
17 crimes. So, no. I think it depends on a lot of
18 different factors that are even micro-community
19 related.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: So, you can't
21 explain an 83 percent increase over a year span in
22 searches. You can't say with any particularity any
23 things that contribute to that massive increase.

24 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I mean, our mission is
25 constantly to respond to the crime trends that we are

2 seeing so we can maintain lawfulness in the city, and
3 so, as those things push and pull, we respond to
4 them.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And obviously, as
6 you said before, when it comes to stops, cops have
7 discretion, right? You testified. Cops have
8 discretion.

9 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I'm not fighting you. I'm
10 just trying to..

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: No. That's a yes or
12 no question.

13 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Do police officers have
14 discretion?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: You testified that
16 when a stop is made, cops have discretion.

17 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Like in writing a summons
18 or giving someone a verbal warning?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: What should be done
20 after a stop? Cops have discretion, correct? That's
21 what you testified. You testified cops have
22 discretion. It's really easy. I mean, we can roll
23 back. We're going to move on because we can just play
24 the tape later.

2 So, with that discretion, we've seen
3 also, again, an 83 percent increase in searches. Why
4 are Black and Latina drivers treated so much
5 differently after they're stopped? And I'm asking
6 specifically about searches. Why are Black and Latina
7 drivers treated differently when it comes to a
8 vehicle search?

9 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I think it goes back to
10 the individual. It all depends on what that actual
11 specific officer is seeing in those specific
12 circumstances and the specific crime trends that
13 they're responding to.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: So, are you saying
15 that Black drivers much more often than White drivers
16 after being stopped are exhibiting the necessary
17 information, evidence to allow for a legal search of
18 the vehicle?

19 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I think there are so many
20 factors that go into whether a search is done. I'm
21 not comfortable saying writ large something like
22 that. What I am saying is that officers have to find
23 a particularized suspicion in order to search a
24 vehicle or even ask for consent to search a vehicle.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And do you think
3 that Black folks are committing crimes at higher
4 rates than white folks?

5 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Of course not. But what
6 we are seeing is specific data... (CROSS-TALK)

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay. So, then why
8 are Black drivers searched at a rate roughly 10 times
9 greater than the rate that White drivers are? And
10 Latina drivers are being searched at a rate roughly
11 six times greater. Why is there that disparity?

12 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I think it goes back to
13 what I said before, but I think another important
14 thing to keep in mind is that plus 50 percent, 56 to
15 61 percent of these searches are consent searches.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yeah. Because Black
17 and Brown drivers are afraid they're going to get
18 killed by the police. (TIMER CHIME) May I have just a
19 few more moments? I was a public defender in the
20 court system for nearly a decade. I'm also a Brown
21 person who has a brother, an uncle, a father. You
22 better believe that when you have a uniformed officer
23 with... however, they're approaching the vehicle and a
24 gun on their waistband, that you do not think

2 sometimes that that search is voluntary. So that's a
3 bunch of BS.

4 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Well, this stuff is all
5 recorded on... just for the record, Council Member,
6 this stuff is all recorded on body-worn camera.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And we don't always
8 get those. They're not always on. We take weeks and
9 weeks. Oftentimes, we only get that body camera
10 footage if somebody gets seriously hurt.

11 DIRECTOR LEVIN: There's paperwork that is
12 filled out in connection with a consent search.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And you have not
14 answered the fundamental question of why Black and
15 Brown drivers are getting stopped more, getting
16 searched more, getting arrested more than White
17 drivers when they represent a smaller amount of the
18 population of drivers at large. Yet you want to say
19 that there is no racial bias involved and the data
20 says otherwise.

21 DIRECTOR LEVIN: And I'm sure you're also
22 aware of the Right to Know Act. So, officers have to
23 voluntarily explain what the purpose of the search and
24 the consent search is and get affirmative consent
25 from the person.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And I'm a criminal
3 defense lawyer, and I know that that doesn't always
4 happen.

5 DIRECTOR LEVIN: And so for all of those
6 reasons, I feel like it's important perspective when
7 you're talking about searches in this context.

8 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: We'll come back for a
9 second round.

10 We're going to move to Council Member
11 Holden.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair.
13 And thank you all for your testimony. And I want to
14 congratulate Inspector O'Sullivan. Again, a bang-up
15 job you did in Queens and in surrounding areas, and
16 you were our go-to guy and I congratulate you on your
17 promotion hopefully to Chief, but that's another
18 story.

19 Let me just bring up a couple of things.
20 On the e-bikes, the Chair mentioned the fact that e-
21 bikes, and we all know if you walk around New York
22 City or drive around or do anything in New York City,
23 there's a ridiculous amount of percentage of e-bikes
24 and e-mobility vehicles that are running red lights.
25 Especially dangerous in the crosswalks. That's why

2 most pedestrians are struck by vehicles of all kinds
3 in the crosswalks. You agree with that? Tell me, how
4 could we better, other than the education that you
5 mentioned, how do we enforce red light running on an
6 e-bike if you can't identify them and if the person
7 has no identification on them, if you do stop them?
8 How does that work?

9 CHIEF OBE: So just very quickly, I just
10 want to prioritize, just mention some of the worst
11 VTL violations that we prioritize. Six of them, which
12 is reckless driving, operating under influence of
13 alcohol or drugs, wrong way driving, disobeying red
14 light, and failure to stop at stop sign. I just also
15 want to mention that we currently have a plan that's
16 been rolled out as it pertains to e-bikes. The focus
17 is on a certain number of corridors which we've
18 identified, working closely with our counterparts.
19 And to your point, the identification process you're
20 concerned about when most of these riders don't have
21 identification on them.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Right. What do we
23 do?

24 INSPECTOR O'SULLIVAN: So with this e-bike
25 plan, we've identified these corridors citywide which

2 have high complaints of e-bike and micromobility
3 areas. So, as you spoke earlier, a lot of these
4 people riding e-bikes, they don't have a driver's
5 license. We did a big campaign since October, and we
6 handed out over 80,000 flyers for the education part.
7 But there's more to education. So right now, during
8 this rollout of this new enforcement, we have
9 concurrent jurisdiction from the VTLB summonses to
10 the criminal court summons. And with these six
11 violations we identified, we're going to utilize the
12 criminal court summons instead of the B summons. And
13 so it doesn't matter if you have a license or not so
14 if you're out there and you're operating this
15 recklessly, you'll be issued the criminal court
16 summons.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: If they have no
18 ID?

19 INSPECTOR O'SULLIVAN: So then we'll run
20 their name, make sure that they don't have a warrant,
21 and they'll be issued a summons. If they have a
22 warrant, then...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah. But how do
24 you know that they're John Smith, let's say my name
25 is John Smith, how do we know if they don't have ID?

2 You're just taking their word that his name is John
3 Smith who was stopped.

4 INSPECTOR O'SULLIVAN: Well, we utilize
5 technology. You know, we could run the name, call
6 someone that they know to bring over their identity.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah. I know, but
8 wouldn't it be better if the e-bike was registered to
9 a person? There's an ID on it. There's a license
10 plate. They can be also caught by cameras if there
11 was a license plate. Would that be better?

12 CHIEF OBE: The registration portion of it
13 is difficult because e-bikes are not considered to be
14 vehicles so I think that's a logical...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: No. But my
16 question is if they were registered, some
17 municipalities do register them, because then there's
18 accountability. If somebody runs a red light, they
19 could be caught by a red light camera, or if they are
20 stopped by a police officer, they could be issued a
21 summons based on their registration of the vehicle,
22 so would that work? Would that work better for the
23 Police Department?

24 CHIEF OBE: It's something we'll consider.
25 We'll go back and take a look at it.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: All right. I have
3 about 33 more seconds left, but on the corridors that
4 you mentioned, could we get the location of the
5 corridors that you're... you don't have to give it to
6 us now, but after the hearing, could we identify
7 those corridors? And then my backup question on this,
8 many pedestrians are being struck by trucks that are
9 essentially illegal in New York City, 53-footers.
10 They seem to be... we're looking the other way because
11 now I see most tractor trailers are in that variety
12 that are illegal to operate on the streets of the
13 City of New York. They need a special permit even to
14 go through. Yet, in speaking to the leadership in the
15 NYPD, it's something like we're just kind of we don't
16 have the staffing level to enforce this. Could you
17 tell us how many 53-foot illegal operations were
18 issued in Fiscal Year '24 for 53-foot trucks?

19 INSPECTOR O'SULLIVAN: Good afternoon. For
20 the last few years, there's been a huge uptick in the
21 commercial truck industry, especially the larger
22 trucks that you mentioned. The Department has focused
23 a lot on, once again, education and enforcement. In
24 Queens alone, in southeast Queens, we've done
25 numerous large-scale towing operations that tow these

2 trucks. There's other hot spots in Brooklyn South and
3 in the Bronx. We did have a task force over the last
4 year or two where we worked with EDC, DOT, and they
5 just rolled out a new pilot program where there's new
6 locations for these larger vehicles to park and it
7 won't inhibit the residential parking area. Going
8 forward, it's going to be about education. It's going
9 to be about towing more. Once again, these vehicles
10 are very big, so tow space is very critical. We also
11 have some new technology with the barnacle we've been
12 using in these areas and our Code 6 and Code 78 for
13 the overnight truck parking violations, extra
14 enforcement, especially overnight.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you. Thank
16 you, Chair.

17 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. We'll now
18 move to Council Member Joseph.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you, Chair.

20 Just as my Colleague mentioned, is it
21 possible you can share the corridors that you
22 mentioned, the 15 corridors and the precincts with
23 this Committee so we can see where they are? On Ocean
24 Parkway, how far are you going in that visibility?
25 Because I also share Ocean Parkway in my District.

2 Just want to know how far that part is going in terms
3 of enforcement because that whole corridor, that
4 whole Ocean Parkway right by the circle is also very
5 dangerous. I think it also contributes because of
6 street design. I don't know if you ever look at the
7 way the street is designed, it also creates a safety
8 issue as well.

9 How do you work with DOT post-accident
10 because I also lost a couple of constituents in my
11 district to cyclists as well so, after an accident,
12 how do you work with DOT to improve that corridor? Is
13 there anything, and I've been constantly calling on
14 Dorchester to be looked at and that's why I'm a very
15 big proponent of supporting daylighting because I
16 have a senior center right by Dorchester and
17 Marlborough and the cars are speeding all the time. I
18 have an elementary school right down the block,
19 PS139, and students are interacting in that space,
20 but DOT said they were going to do the study, they
21 said there was nothing, but the time they decided to
22 do the study was when the kids were out. That doesn't
23 help.

24

25

2 CHIEF OBE: Council Member, just to your
3 first question about the Ocean Parkway corridor. So,
4 we have it touching the 60, 61, and the 66 precincts.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: And the 72?
6 Because it overlaps with 72 and 66. That's my
7 corridor.

8 CHIEF OBE: Yeah. We have specifically 60,
9 61, and 66.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Because I'm doing
11 a walkthrough there I think this week because of
12 safety issues with the bike lane and the traffic so
13 I'm doing a walkthrough there with all of the
14 agencies involved and I think you guys are coming
15 along as well. But it's not just where the accident
16 happened, it's that whole strip of Ocean Parkway.

17 CHIEF OBE: So, this is one of the things
18 that we do well. If is some consideration about
19 extending into the 72, you said? We can certainly do
20 so. But again, we work very closely with the DOT and
21 considerations are put into the reason for extension.
22 So, we'll meet with you and with DOT and consider
23 extending it to the 72.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: So how do you
25 address increase in bicycle fatalities? Are there any

2 targeted enforcements or outreach strategies being
3 utilized to address these incidents? And how many
4 bike-related incidents you've had this year?

5 CHIEF OBE: Okay. So, just very quickly,
6 with bikes, we don't see it. I talked about overall
7 fatalities, the 52 versus 79. Pedestrians is where we
8 see our biggest problem right now.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Especially with
10 our older adults and what are we doing to protect our
11 older adults?

12 CHIEF OBE: Okay. So, one of the things
13 that we do when we see a spike, I spoke very quickly
14 about the 109 precinct. Again, I know it's very
15 short, that's some of the criticism that we get.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Did you show up
17 after the problem?

18 CHIEF OBE: Yeah. We showed up.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: It's reactive,
20 yeah.

21 CHIEF OBE: Ocean Parkway (INAUDIBLE) but
22 I don't think it's reactive. There's a mix of both.
23 It is proactive because our officers are there along
24 the corridors and we see the work that they do. And
25 again, we focus not just on all summonses but we know

2 summonses that actually are the worst contributors to
3 these types of incidents, failure to yield, speeders,
4 that type of thing. So again, total fatalities, 52
5 versus 79. What we see that's troubling are the
6 pedestrians, specifically senior pedestrians.
7 Traditional bike fatalities, we have one versus two.
8 Motorized two-wheeled scooter, that's kind of a
9 universe of e-bikes, stand-up scooter.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: But the e-bikes
11 are all over the sidewalk and still no enforcement.
12 We need to do that. Are you reaching out to older
13 adult centers also?

14 CHIEF OBE: Yes, we are.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: As you said,
16 you're doing your education and your outreach. I
17 think it should also start in your older adult
18 centers to make sure that the provider is also
19 educating the staffers. But older adults, like I have
20 a mom who's older adult. She had me late. She should
21 be able to feel safe to go outside and cross the
22 street without having to get out the way on the
23 sidewalk. I see bikes on the sidewalk. I see them
24 violating all traffic rules. Our older adults need to
25 be protected because that's the call I get the most

2 from older adults who are like, I weigh 130 pounds.
3 If I get hit by one of these e-bikes, it's over for
4 me, Council Member. How can I make my older adults
5 feel safe? I think the outreach and the education is
6 great, but are you reaching the people on the ground
7 that really needs to hear that message?

8 CHIEF OBE: Yeah. We actually do. Again,
9 going back to the 109 precinct, a lot of good work
10 again. But the criticism, like I said, is always that
11 it's reactive, but we do have the sessions in our
12 senior centers. And of course, the pamphlets we also
13 give out are also in different languages, too.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: So, I hope to see
15 you at one of my many senior older adult centers that
16 I have in my District, making sure that we keep our
17 (TIMER CHIME) older adults safe.

18 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Just one thing. I just
19 wanted to talk about how do we do it. It's not just
20 the education. There has to be an enforcement
21 component. There must be an enforcement component.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Absolutely.

23 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So, the number of
24 summonses we have written up for e-bikes has gone up
25 208 percent. So, we hear it. It's never enough. We

2 know. And we're trying to do the things that need to
3 be done to keep people safe. I can't imagine my
4 mother walking, she's 75, and getting hit by..

5 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Mine is 90.

6 DIRECTOR LEVIN: (INAUDIBLE) so I can't
7 imagine.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: So what happens to
9 repeat offenders? Let's say you give somebody a
10 ticket before, and then you're ticketing that same
11 person. What happens to repeat offenders?

12 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I don't know what the
13 escalation of the fee schedule and or the punishments
14 are. I'd have to get back to you.

15 CHIEF OBE: So, I just also wanted to
16 throw in there that we actually do seize. So,
17 seizures I think are also very important, too. So,
18 mopeds and scooters, again, year to date we've seized
19 3,830 mopeds and scooters. Motorcycle seizures have
20 been 1,329 for this year so far.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you, Chair.

22 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: You're welcome. But
23 along the same line of questioning, I'm wondering has
24 there been, so to speak, hot spots identified where
25 we could probably provide more enforcement

2 specifically for the people? Because we do see all
3 throughout our city bikes flying down the sidewalk.
4 And of course, this is prior to the scaffolding law
5 that we just passed, but navigating in the
6 scaffolding and things of that nature is very, very
7 dangerous and difficult as well.

8 CHIEF OBE: So, the hot spots, we did some
9 analysis and that also ties into the corridors that
10 we have citywide. We'll provide you with the
11 corridors as soon as the plan rolls out.

12 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you.

13 DIRECTOR LEVIN: The Quality-of-Life
14 Teams, too, are data-driven and they are targeting
15 specific areas where we're seeing these things
16 happen.

17 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. I'm going
18 to move to Council Member Restler.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you very
20 much, Chair Salaam. I'm really grateful for you
21 holding this hearing today on such an important
22 topic.

23 Firstly, congratulations to Chief Obe on
24 her appointment. I guess it's a month now. Is that
25 right? Okay. So, you're getting up to speed.

2 And I just want to also thank Chief
3 O'Sullivan. You know, when I've reached out, you've
4 personally come to the District, come to hot spots
5 and dangerous locations in my community with me,
6 deployed Traffic Enforcement Agents, been
7 impressively responsive, and I would say, in general,
8 I think we get the best responsiveness out of the
9 Transportation Division than any unit within the NYPD
10 so I just want to thank you, and I could list a
11 number of people on your leadership team who are
12 similarly responsive to me and my community when we
13 highlight issues and concerns so I really do
14 appreciate it.

15 I continue, though, to be really
16 concerned about rampant illegal parking in my
17 community. If you were to walk around downtown
18 Brooklyn today, you would find many hundreds of
19 illegally parked cars on just about every single
20 street. And when Chief Schell was here the last time
21 we had a hearing on this topic a couple years ago, he
22 testified that he'd done more in four months than
23 anyone had in a very long time on this topic. He has
24 multiple inspections going out every week, vacation
25 days. He's holding officers accountable for illegal

2 parking, etc. We've seen no improvement while Chief
3 Schell has been in his leadership positions. No
4 additional attention to the illegal parking issues.
5 And it's dangerous, right? We have cars that are
6 parked on sidewalks, parked in intersections, parked
7 in bike lanes, parked in bus lanes. And there's no
8 accountability because the worst offenders in
9 downtown Brooklyn are the men and women of the NYPD.
10 And it's really, really frustrating. The illegal
11 parking that we see around every single precinct in
12 the City of New York, or 95 percent of precincts in
13 the City of New York, is chronic. It's endemic.
14 There's never any improvement, and it's incredibly
15 disappointing. Just firstly, is this a priority of
16 yours, Chief Obe, to actually finally rein in rampant
17 illegal parking in downtown Brooklyn and other
18 communities across the city and around NYPD police
19 precincts?

20 CHIEF OBE: We're just going to address
21 that piece by piece. Yes, I am committed to ensuring
22 that we address these issues in your District. So,
23 I'm going to go as far as O'Sullivan has done with
24 you. I come out for a visit. I'm actually visiting a
25 number of Council Members so I'll come out and take a

2 look. But I also want to assure you that our traffic
3 agents work really, really hard.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I know they do.

5 CHIEF OBE: I spoke earlier about the type
6 of work that they do. The summonses have not reduced
7 in any way. Their numbers have reduced. But the
8 commitment is absolutely there.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And I really do
10 appreciate the work of TAs. I think we should have
11 more TAs on the street. And it's a hard job. Not
12 enough pay. And folks put themselves in dangerous
13 positions in this work, and I'm grateful. But when
14 there's a placard in the vehicle, when there's a vest
15 in the vehicle, when there's anything at all in the
16 dashboard of the vehicle, no summons gets issued. And
17 that's, to me, the corruption that's deeply, deeply
18 troubling that I see no improvement on. And I really
19 hope in your new post, because you've only been there
20 30 days. We can't criticize you on this one yet. We
21 can criticize the Department's actions over decades
22 on this, but you have a fresh slate that you and
23 Chief O'Sullivan and the team will finally take this
24 issue seriously.

2 CHIEF OBE: I just want to assure you that
3 we take it very seriously. There's a lot of work that
4 we do. I don't know that you necessarily see this. So
5 again, written just by our own TEAs, there's a lot of
6 enforcement out there, and Josh will speak to a
7 different unit that actually does some really great
8 work. So, with our TEAs in terms of placard abuse, in
9 year-to-date 2025, so again, that's 1/1 through 4/20,
10 they've written 14,878 summonses. I don't think that
11 we sing enough praises when it comes to the TEAs, but
12 this is just phenomenal work that's done towards the
13 placards themselves.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I'd love to dig
15 in on that data with you because I see zero progress
16 in downtown Brooklyn. Zero. And I'm not saying, I
17 mean like, I would love to celebrate you all taking
18 this issue seriously, I'd love to celebrate that
19 there's, because when we say placard abuse, most of
20 the people who use "placards", they're not using
21 placards at all. They're putting a vest in the
22 dashboard, right? And they still just park wherever
23 the heck they want so I will take you up on the offer
24 to come out and take a look at this issue together.
25 We would love it. I will recognize that Captain

2 Maffei (phonetic) in the 84 is severely understaffed,
3 and we've received commitment from the PC's office
4 that new recruits will be heading to the 84 and the
5 graduating class in May to help address this and
6 other issues, and I'm grateful to that.

7 I'm going to just shift gears because I
8 could talk about my concerns around traffic violence
9 and traffic enforcement for the rest of time, but I
10 do want to raise this NYCLU report that I found to be
11 enlightening and profoundly disturbing. And I will
12 say that I'm disappointed, Mr. Levin, by your
13 testimony today and your response to the questions,
14 because when 90 percent of people (TIMER CHIME)
15 getting stopped are Black and Latino, 90 percent of
16 people who are getting arrested for traffic stops are
17 Black and Latino, that's a problem. When 5 percent of
18 people that are Black who are getting stopped are
19 getting arrested, 4 percent of Latino people who are
20 getting stopped are arrested, but under 1 percent of
21 White people are arrested, that is an extreme
22 disparity. You didn't like the data, you didn't
23 accept the data that NYCLU used for driver
24 demographics, but let's take a look at the Health
25 Department, which I don't think you're going to

2 dispute the methodology of the Health Department.
3 They did a study in the last Administration that
4 found White people are far more likely to be driving
5 in New York City relative to their percent of the
6 city's demographic as a whole. Black and Latino
7 people are less likely to be driving than the percent
8 of New York City as a whole. They're more likely to
9 be speeding. They're more likely to be driving and
10 texting and doing illegal activities. And yet, they
11 are far less likely to be stopped by the NYPD. So,
12 rather than you coming to this hearing and saying the
13 NYCLU report is disturbing, there are concerning
14 trends here, your response is basically that there's
15 more officers in the 75 and therefore more Black
16 people are getting stopped, and that explains it. But
17 the data doesn't back that up at all, right? I mean,
18 if you want to go through precinct by precinct of
19 where people are getting stopped, they're
20 overwhelmingly in Black and Latino precincts, but at
21 factors that are far larger than the differentiation
22 in the police force in those precincts. So, why is
23 the NYPD not taking an introspective look at this
24 very concerning and troubling data that is clearly
25 disproportionately stopping and arresting Black and

2 Latino drivers? Why is there no effort to say, hey,
3 we should make sure that we're doing this the right
4 way and doing this better? Why are you so certain
5 that everything is right when the data is so deeply
6 disturbing?

7 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So, I just don't think
8 it's fair to say we're not doing anything or have any
9 concerns, that our only concern is just, like we have
10 robust procedures in place, right? Not only do we
11 have the trainings, implicit bias training, etc. Not
12 only do we deploy specifically to where we see the
13 crime happening, but as I explained earlier, there's
14 mechanisms by which officers can be held accountable
15 if this is true. I just think we have a difference of
16 opinion on it. And let me just say one other thing.
17 Let me just say one other thing. I'm not trying to
18 indict NYCLU. I had one specific concern with that
19 one...

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I know, I did,
21 and I gave you a different data point to show that
22 that's a ridiculous argument. I mean, it's a
23 ridiculous argument. The Health Department found that
24 54 percent of White people in New York City were
25 likely to have driven in the last 30 days, 40 percent

2 of Black people, and 32 percent of Latino people.

3 Black and Latino people are much less likely to be in
4 cars. They in aggregate represent 49 percent of the
5 population, but are far less likely to be drivers on
6 the road than that percent. Yet are 62 percent of the
7 stops and 90 percent of the people arrested. The data
8 is deeply, deeply disturbing.

9 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Can I comment on that?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Please.

11 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I guess this is what I
12 would say, and be more than happy to have ongoing
13 conversations your place, my place, wherever you want
14 to do it, okay? But for the sake of this, if White
15 people in the DOH study are committing more traffic-
16 right, just quoting them, if you have less police
17 officers there, it's not going to be interdicted the
18 same way when you have more police officers in
19 different areas.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: But come on. I
21 don't think that's a cop-out. But let's go through
22 this then. You're saying East New York, you gave an
23 example where there were 55,000 people stopped last
24 year in the 94, which is a smaller precinct, it's not
25 all apples to oranges. Not every precinct has the

2 same number of people. There were 13,000 people
3 stopped last year. The 94 is Greenpoint and
4 Williamsburg. I represent 88 percent of it. I mean,
5 roughly. Are you trying to tell me that there are
6 five times, four and a half times as many officers in
7 the 75 as in the 94?

8 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I actually don't know
9 what the exact...

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: But that's—my
11 point is that's ridiculous. There aren't five times
12 as many officers in the 75 as the 94. And the
13 argument that every officer just means the same
14 amount of stops doesn't make sense. What we're seeing
15 is racially disparate enforcement and racially
16 disparate arrests. And I don't see why the Department
17 wouldn't come to this hearing in good faith and say,
18 there are trends in this NYCLU data that are
19 concerning and that require us to shift our
20 enforcement approaches. It shouldn't be that we have
21 to go to court and sue the Police Department to
22 recognize illegal disparities and racial disparities
23 in enforcement, like has happened on Stop and Frisk.
24 It shouldn't be that. We should be working
25 collaboratively together to say, hey, there are

2 troubling signs here. We shouldn't be enforcing these
3 issues only in Black and Latino communities. That's
4 not right. That's not fair. That's not the way the
5 Police Department is supposed to work. But that's
6 what the data shows. And I don't hear any recognition
7 of a deeply, deeply troubling report that came out
8 last week.

9 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So, I hear what you are
10 saying. All I'm going to say in response to that is,
11 I feel like there are so many different data points
12 and so many factors that need to be taken into
13 consideration. I'm just not sure the six-page NYCLU
14 report, which cites the Census Bureau information
15 about surveys of drivers, is enough for us to have a
16 substantive conversation about it.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: But take the
18 surveys of drivers aside. The enforcement data, the
19 disparate enforcement data, is serious. And you could
20 offer some context that makes it less of an extreme
21 disparity, as perhaps it appears, but the disparity
22 persists. And I don't think that Commissioner Tisch's
23 Department wants to be operating a Department where
24 90 percent of the people getting arrested for traffic
25 stops are Black and Latino, when they represent such

2 a modest minority of the drivers on the road. That's
3 not right. That's not fair. That's not the NYPD that
4 she aspires to or that I aspire to or this Council
5 aspires to. And it's not what's happening every day.
6 And so I'm disappointed that you've come to this
7 hearing basically saying, this data point I disagree
8 with, I'm not going to engage seriously in this
9 report, despite there being really, really, really
10 troubling trends that we are seeing that we know
11 about in our communities that those of us, you know,
12 we see this. We talk to our constituents. The data
13 here is a compelling citywide analysis that I just am
14 disappointed. I'm not hearing the recognition, the
15 awareness, or the plan for how we're going to do
16 better moving forward, and I hope the Department
17 takes this hearing to say that we do need to do
18 better and we do need to shift our policies and
19 approaches and tactics to make sure that we have less
20 racially disparate enforcement than we do today.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I have another set
22 of data for you, Lincoln.

23 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: We're going to go
24 into second round. But what's good about this
25 conversation? I didn't want to stop it, but the

2 reason why I allowed it to continue was because the
3 best thing about the NYPD, best thing, period, is the
4 slogan that we are the best Police Department in the
5 world, and I think to that particular end getting
6 there and making sure that the people feel it, the PD
7 is showing it on all levels is really, really
8 important. So, I'm going to pass for a second round
9 to Council Member Cabán.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. I'm
11 going to build on what Council Member Restler was
12 saying in terms of the Department's responses, which
13 were, needless to say, a bit lackluster. But talking
14 about that disparity specifically, right? White
15 people account for 21 percent of stops but only, and
16 this completely throws out your argument about what
17 happens and where the officers are being sent and
18 that determining what happens, the data that we have
19 for enforcement is from the NYPD's own data. And we
20 know that White people account for 21 percent of
21 stops but only 5 percent of all searches, arrests,
22 and use of force. We know that Black and Latino folks
23 account for almost 90 percent of all searches,
24 arrests, and uses of force, while being around 50
25 percent of the stops. So, we're talking about what

2 happens after the stop is made and then now we're
3 getting into the realm of propensity, which we
4 shouldn't be doing, that can be the only explainer
5 for this huge disparity. Because again, post-stop, I
6 quote, cops have discretion, and so I just want to
7 take a second to outline that in another answer, you
8 threw out terms like, well, the cops, they're there,
9 there's DeBour, the people up here, besides me, don't
10 know what DeBour means, so you throw that there, they
11 continue with their questioning and like, that's
12 fine. Then I question you and I say, after you make
13 the stop, what is it that the officer's seeing in the
14 car of a Black or Brown man that is so wildly
15 different to result in the search, the seizure, the
16 arrest, the use of force, and you cannot articulate
17 what you're being seen when that's the plain language
18 of DeBour. That's DeBour. So, you give it as an
19 answer to somebody else, as a term of art that nobody
20 challenges you on, I ask you it in plain language,
21 what are you seeing, and you can't articulate it, and
22 that's a problem so I want to know why. Why White
23 people account for 21 percent of stops but only 5
24 percent of all searches, arrests, and use of force,
25 and why Black and Latino folks account for 90 percent

2 of searches, arrests, and use of force, and White
3 people while they're being 50 percent of the stops.
4 This debunks your argument around demographics of
5 drivers and resource allocation. I also want to know,
6 because I should ask a couple questions, I guess. I
7 also want to know why there has been an increase in
8 use of force. So that same report showed that NYPD
9 reported use of force in 53 percent more instances
10 stemming from traffic stops than in 2023. I want to
11 know how you explain that. And I also want to know,
12 then, beyond that, why are Black and Latinx drivers
13 treated so differently in relationship to use of
14 force, knowing that approximately 87 percent of
15 drivers subject to use of force cases were Black or
16 Latina. 87 percent. How do you explain that?

17 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So just to back up, what
18 was the thing you said I was trying to evade
19 answering?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I asked you, very
21 specifically, I said, the disparities around
22 searches, right? So we know that Black drivers were
23 searched at a rate roughly 10 times greater than the
24 rate that white drivers were, and Latino drivers were
25 searched at a rate roughly 6 times greater, and your

2 answer to that was, well, it has to do where we're
3 getting the reports and the crime is happening and
4 we've got more officers there. And I said, well, what
5 are you seeing in these stops post-stop, what is the
6 officer observing that is rising to the level of
7 these searches at such a disparity, and you could not
8 articulate what that was after testifying around
9 DeBour. You couldn't answer that question.

10 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So let me address it for
11 you now, because that's clearly not what I heard
12 earlier, so we can make sure we're on the same page.
13 As you know, in DeBour, you have to be able to
14 articulate certain factors that get you to a higher
15 level of suspicion. It all depends on what the crime
16 is. So, for example, if it's a DWI, you're looking
17 for messed up clothing, slurred speech, blurry
18 unfocused eyes, flushed face.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And how many of
20 those, I'm aware of all, bloodshot red eyes. I am
21 aware.

22 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So this is my way of
23 explaining to you that that is what officers are
24 looking for... (CROSS-TALK)

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Putting aside the
3 small percentage that are stops related to DWI, I'm
4 talking about moving violations, things other than
5 that, that are when a Black person gets stopped
6 versus a White person, they are being searched ten
7 times more. What is it about their behavior (TIMER
8 CHIME) that is different, that is rising to the level
9 of a search consistently ten times more than a White
10 driver?

11 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Well, since there's no
12 way to review, at least right now in this moment,
13 every single stop that is contemplated in this
14 vehicle arrest report, I cannot answer that.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: But we do know that
16 cops have discretion.

17 DIRECTOR LEVIN: You keep using this like
18 it's some weapon. Let me make sure to clarify for
19 you. Yes, of course.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: It is a weapon for
21 the police force to continue to disparately
22 criminalize Black and Brown drivers. It is. It is a
23 weapon. That's exactly what I'm saying.

24 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So let me explain, right,
25 that of course they have discretion. If you're

2 talking to a human being and they're like, I'm trying
3 to get to my daughter's recital, I didn't mean to go
4 eight miles an hour over the speed limit. I want an
5 officer to be able to have a conversation with that
6 person and choose... (CROSS-TALK)

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: That's a really
8 beautiful example, but it does not explain why Black
9 drivers are being searched ten times more than white
10 drivers. What is it? Are Black drivers behind the
11 seat acting more dangerously? Do all of those Black
12 drivers have weapons that are visible to the naked
13 eye when the officer approaches? Or is it the
14 officer's discretion in what they're describing or
15 seeing as, quote unquote, furtive or erratic
16 movement? Right? Like, you want to dig into DeBour?
17 We can dig into DeBour.

18 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Let's do it. Have you
19 watched body worn? I know you have as a public
20 defender.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yes, I have. But
22 explain to me why the disparity.

23 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Have you ever watched a
24 body worn camera where you're like, ooh, I think I

2 understand what the police officer's talking about in
3 their paperwork.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Sometimes, sure.

5 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So... (CROSS-TALK)

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Does it account for
7 ten times? Are you saying that officers feel that way
8 around Black people more often than not? You're
9 making my point for me.

10 DIRECTOR LEVIN: What I'm saying is that...

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: You should probably
12 stick to answering the question of why is there a
13 disparity between the use of force and the search and
14 seizure of Black and Brown drivers versus white
15 drivers. That's what I want the answer to.

16 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So, Council Member, what
17 I'm saying is that any comment that explains a
18 massive type of analysis in a quick 45 second
19 explanation is not only inaccurate, I would have no
20 faith in it, but also it's a disservice to you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Do you think that
22 it's a problem? Do you think the disparity is a
23 problem?

24 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I can't comment because I
25 don't know the individual factors that are going into

2 account in all of these individual stops. But as you
3 yourself have said, you have seen body worn camera.
4 You understand what some of these things look like.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Let me ask you this
6 hypothetical. Let's say you're walking into a public
7 park and you see trash piled 20 feet high and I asked
8 you hey, do you think that trash is a problem, and
9 you go, I don't know because I can't tell you about
10 all the circumstances about how every single little
11 piece of trash ended up getting piled there and then
12 got piled and piled and piled so I can't answer that.
13 That's what you're saying right now when I tell you
14 that Black and Brown people are being beat up,
15 searched, arrested 10 times more than White people
16 and you're sitting here and telling me you can't even
17 acknowledge that that's a problem. I'm done. Thank
18 you, Chair.

19 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: This brings me to
20 parking enforcement. Data from recent years on NYPD
21 enforcement shows similar decreases in the issuance
22 of parking summonses while neighborhoods citywide
23 have seen the increasing prevalence of illegally
24 parked vehicles including dangerous practices such as
25 blocking access to fire hydrants, sidewalks, and

2 crosswalks. In Fiscal Year '24, the NYPD issued over
3 8.2 million parking summonses and towed more than
4 41,000 vehicles, a significant decrease from Fiscal
5 Year '21 when the Department issued over 9.4 parking
6 summonses and towed more than 89,000 vehicles. How
7 does the NYPD account for decreasing rates of parking
8 enforcement by the Department and have there been any
9 changes in the staffing of traffic enforcement
10 agencies or other Department policies that has
11 contributed to fewer parking summonses being issued?

12 CHIEF OBE: Chair Salaam, I just wanted to
13 I touched very briefly on doing more with less. I
14 gave the stats earlier. Right now in 2025, 1,337
15 agents and the average about 26.9 per tour versus say
16 2020, just going through 2020 to 2025, 1,835 agents
17 with 18.4 summonses issued per tour so the work is
18 there. They're certainly doing a great job. You
19 talked about towing. Did you touch on towing very
20 quickly because you had a number of questions here?
21 Okay. So year end 2019, you're right, the high of
22 105,800 tows. We do see that dip in 2021 again
23 because of the closure of the Manhattan Pound. In
24 2024, we had 44,443 tows. Again, the top five
25 violations, no standing 12,000 plus, no parking,

2 noncommercial 7,000 plus, fire hydrant, the numbers
3 are definitely there. But I want to assure the
4 Council that despite the closure of the Manhattan
5 tow, we still tow vehicles from Manhattan north of 59
6 to the Bronx, south of 59th Street to Brooklyn so the
7 work is there.

8 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: So, the NYPD has
9 previously cited to the loss of tow pound capacity in
10 Manhattan as the reason for decreasing rates of
11 vehicle towing in recent years. Can the Department
12 speak to the need for more space to tow illegally
13 parked vehicles? And what steps has the NYPD taken to
14 obtain a new pound location?

15 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Many, many, many, many
16 steps. We will be the first to agree that it is
17 important for us to have this pound capacity straight
18 up. So just by way of a little bit of a background,
19 the State budget passed in 2021, the 2020-2021
20 budget, the Hudson River Park Act, which was amended,
21 which required us to cease our occupancy of the tow
22 lot that we had there. That was over 200,000 square
23 feet. It's a lot of space. And so since then, our
24 capital project scope development was undertaken
25 between January of '19 and March of 2020 in

2 anticipation of having to vacate the pier so we
3 proactively started looking for locations. But as I
4 explained earlier, it's an island. There's only so
5 much real estate. It's one of the densest urban
6 environments in the world. Any Council Member in
7 Manhattan, you want to identify a space in your
8 District, right, for us to put a tow, we'd be more
9 than happy to do a site evaluation. But we've
10 explored automated. We've explored surface options to
11 replace all of that. Some of the costs didn't work
12 out, had a cost between 334 million, 500 million. But
13 I think the important thing is we are continually and
14 actively engaged with DCAS to explore locations in
15 Manhattan which could meet our operational need,
16 including evaluation of other City sites that
17 hopefully we could maybe repurpose or use. We're also
18 repurposing other Department facilities. So. although
19 they can't really be used for a tow, because I think
20 90 percent of all vehicles are picked up from the tow
21 lot, about 90 percent, so it's a lot of back and
22 forth and the trucks are wide. We're even looking at
23 other Department facilities where we could put long-
24 term storage cars, cars that are connected to an
25 ongoing criminal case that don't have to be moved in

2 and out constantly. So, we're 100 percent aware of
3 this. Nobody wants more tow space than we do. It's a
4 very tough circumstance that we're in though. So,
5 that's all the work that we've done and we continue
6 to do work to try to isolate and locate a new tow
7 facility.

8 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: How does the
9 Department determine when a vehicle should be towed
10 versus given a summons or immobilized?

11 CHIEF OBE: Well, vehicles that are
12 clearly in violation, parking violations, bus stops,
13 double parkers, that type of thing. So, when there's
14 a parking violation, those are the things that we
15 consider.

16 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: How often does
17 limited tow pound space prevent officers from towing
18 illegally parked vehicles or vehicles without proper
19 licenses or registration?

20 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I think it's tough to
21 answer a negative like that. I don't know. There
22 could be many factors why a car doesn't get towed.
23 There's human error, theoretically. A traffic
24 enforcement agent mis-entered in a license plate or
25 typed in something wrong. I don't know. What I can

2 say is we're talking about 1,200 approximate capacity
3 with our tow lots and 90 percent are picked up. So,
4 there's a large amount of cars that are coming in and
5 coming out nonstop. I don't know. I'm not quite sure
6 we can answer that.

7 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I'm going to pass it
8 to Council Member Holden for a second round.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair,
10 for the second round.

11 Inspector O'Sullivan, I think we spoke
12 about this before, but I've had a lot of, through
13 your help, a lot of vehicles towed with improper
14 registration. Many of them are trucks. They have
15 regular plates, no commercial plates, but they're
16 improperly registered. We got them ticketed. We got
17 them towed. Next day, the truck is back on the
18 street. When they pick it up at the tow pound, when
19 the person who owns the vehicle picks it up, he can't
20 drive it off with the improper registration, can he?

21 INSPECTOR O'SULLIVAN: No. Technically, if
22 the car is not registered, doesn't have insurance, he
23 has to hire a legitimate tow truck.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: A tow truck. But
25 you give it back to him, that person, with a tow

2 truck, and then the next day it's back on the street.
3 Is it possible to require them to show the proper
4 registration before they pick it up, or they just
5 have to show that they own the vehicle?

6 INSPECTOR O'SULLIVAN: Due to our
7 constraints, if they come there with a licensed tow
8 truck to tow it out, we have to release it.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: You have to give
10 it to them. So, we have this vicious cycle, because
11 I've been, you know, it's like this truck that, it's
12 a big truck, and it has suburban plates, regular
13 plates, and it's back on the street. Now it's been
14 several years so it's like this vicious cycle. We
15 should have some kind of way to do it.

16 By the way, another problem that I have
17 on 3-1-1, when I use the 3-1-1 app, is that you can
18 see, by driving around the neighborhood, where many
19 vehicles on every block, there's three or four of
20 them, have a film over the license plate and it blurs
21 out the numbers, especially at night when a light is
22 shined on it, and yet I can't get those summonsed.
23 The officers don't know that there's a film. But you
24 can see it when you shine your vehicle, especially at
25 night, you can actually see it. You can see it in the

2 daytime too. How many vehicles with that film are we
3 just letting go by because there's no tickets. I just
4 have like an answer on my 3-1-1 that the officers
5 took action to correct it, but it doesn't tell me
6 what they did.

7 INSPECTOR O'SULLIVAN: Okay. So, the new
8 technology, this film, it just came out, you know,
9 law enforcement, security industries, they're in the
10 process of trying to figure out how to get that
11 ticket violation. But when it comes to covered
12 plates, mismatched plates, stuff like that, so far
13 this year we've already issued 65,000 summonses for
14 these types of offenses. Also, we have our traffic
15 agents out there. We have our new 3-1-1 pilot program
16 where our agents are responding to these traffic
17 complaints, and it's freeing up the officers to
18 respond to 9-1-1 calls and quality of life. And we
19 have our Traffic Agent Enforcement addressing these
20 conditions. So hopefully this year, this will be the
21 year you see a big issue with enforcement against
22 these covered plates and this, you know, microfilm.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you. Thank
24 you, Chair.

2 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Can I just add one thing?
3 I also think the ability to write to the VIN number,
4 the Resolution, would be extremely, extremely
5 helpful. Because a plate, you know, you can take off
6 and move around. You can put a deck plate on when
7 you're trying to come across the bridge. You can
8 change a VIN, but you have to be a mechanic,
9 whatever. Right? It's much harder to change the VIN.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Exactly. Right.
11 Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I'm going to move to
13 vehicle chases.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I'll be nice. I
15 just want to ask about data.

16 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I'll pass it to you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Oh, thank you. All
18 right. I just want to ask some data questions. In the
19 fourth quarter of 2024, the NYPD issued 21,501
20 criminal court summons. Of these criminal court
21 summonses, how many were for traffic infractions?
22 Quarter four.

23 CHIEF OBE: Sorry, Council Member, we
24 don't have that. I don't have that on me.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: So what I would be
3 asking for, and I'm assuming that you may not have
4 the others then, from the fourth quarter, if you
5 could report back to this Committee, how many traffic
6 infractions there were, a breakdown of race; how many
7 were for VTL misdemeanors, a breakdown of those by
8 race; how many were for VTL felonies, a breakdown of
9 those for race. Can you get back to the Council with
10 that?

11 CHIEF OBE: Absolutely. Will do.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. Do you
13 have any data on the... I'm assuming you don't have the
14 same data as it refers to desk appearance tickets. Is
15 that correct? Okay. So we'd be asking for, in the
16 fourth quarter, how many arrests were made for those
17 traffic infractions, but how many received a desk
18 appearance ticket and a breakdown of those by race;
19 how many were detained and arraigned in a criminal
20 court, those broken down by race; and the same for
21 VTL misdemeanors, VTL felonies.

22 And then I also want to ask, apart from
23 the Highway Division and regular patrol officers,
24 which other commands, units, or teams engage in
25 traffic enforcement? So specifically, are

2 Neighborhood Safety Teams doing any traffic
3 enforcement? Are Community Response Teams? Are the
4 Public Safety Teams? Are they all expected to engage
5 in traffic enforcement activity?

6 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Yes. As a police officer,
7 if you see a violation being committed, you see
8 something being committed.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: So how does their
10 use of VTL enforcement relate to the broader purpose
11 and mandates of those specialized teams? They have
12 very specific purposes. The NSTs, the CRTs, the PSTs,
13 they're focusing on very specific initiatives,
14 correct?

15 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I'm not 100 percent sure
16 what each individual purview is, but I do know that
17 quality of life is involved.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: But you do
19 acknowledge that these are specialty teams meant to
20 target certain things, and maybe your colleagues can
21 answer that.

22 CHIEF OBE: I wouldn't go as far as saying
23 that, you said target certain things.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: So, for example,
25 the Neighborhood Safety Team, right, that is meant,

2 the Department says, to really hone in and tackle
3 guns, correct?

4 CHIEF OBE: Correct.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And Community
6 Response Team, that's a specialized team. Public
7 Safety Team, that's a specialized team. They aren't
8 part of traffic enforcement. They aren't part of the
9 broader Department. They're specialized, curated
10 teams. So, my question was, are they engaging in
11 traffic enforcement? And if they are, how does their
12 use of VTL enforcement relate to their broader
13 purposes and mandates of those specialized teams?

14 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So they're still on the
15 radio, so if they're in a neighborhood and something
16 comes over about a robbery in progress and they're
17 given a description of a car and they're given a
18 description of the occupants who may be inside the
19 car and they see that car zipping past them, they're
20 going to investigate that to see if it's related at
21 all.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And so as it
23 relates to that, do you have statistics on 2024
24 vehicle stops disaggregated by the special teams? So
25 for example, for each team, how many vehicle stops

2 resulted in the search of the vehicle? For each team,
3 how many vehicle stops resulted in a misdemeanor
4 arrest? For each team, how many vehicle stops
5 resulted in a felony arrest? For each team, how many
6 vehicle stops resulted in the retrieval of an illegal
7 firearm? For each team, how many vehicle stops
8 resulted in the retrieval of illegal substances or
9 drugs?

10 DIRECTOR LEVIN: We can certainly look
11 into that and follow up.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay. So my request
13 is that that data be given to the Chair of the
14 Committee. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. So
16 regarding vehicle chases, the NYPD faced significant
17 criticism for the Department due to increasing
18 occurrence of vehicle chases that often result in
19 pursuits that put the pedestrian and other drivers at
20 risk. In response to public concern, the NYPD
21 policies on vehicle chases have recently changed. Can
22 you explain those changes?

23 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Yes. So, I'm so sorry.
24 Just to confirm, you're talking about the vehicle
25 pursuit policy? Is that what you said?

2 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Yes.

3 DIRECTOR LEVIN: So the vehicle pursuit
4 policy, in short, was changed in, for example, a few
5 ways. The first is that violation and nonviolent
6 misdemeanor cannot be the basis for a pursuit. Okay.
7 Number two, officers have the discretion to call off
8 a pursuit if they don't think it is safe or the roads
9 are too slick or there's too much traffic or there's
10 kids out. They are allowed to call that off without
11 any concerns or consequences to them. And also, there
12 is a Safety Board Review Meeting after any type of
13 incident that looks into and reviews what brought
14 that to that moment so reviews the propriety of the
15 encounter.

16 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: What follow-up
17 investigations or enforcement occurs in circumstances
18 when the NYPD decides to discontinue a vehicle
19 pursuit? And how does the Department assess risks
20 versus reward when initiating or continuing a
21 pursuit?

22 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Yeah. I think the idea is
23 to provide clear, unambiguous parameters for when to
24 initiate, continue, and terminate the pursuit. It
25 also requires the documentation of all that. I think

2 it comes down to a multitude of factors. So I
3 mentioned some of them earlier. The speeds, how dense
4 the environment is, if it's like near a public
5 school, that's going to be different than the Belt
6 Parkway at 3 a.m. The weather, the lighting, reports
7 they may have about the car, etc. These things, you
8 can't plug this information into a computer and have
9 it spit out, time to pursue. Human beings are making
10 these individualized determinations in the heat of
11 the moment given a totality of the circumstances with
12 the best judgment of what their training is versus
13 what their experience is.

14 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I'm going to go down
15 to ghost cars and ghost car enforcement. How are
16 officers trained to distinguish between a legitimate,
17 temporary plate and a fraudulent one during a traffic
18 stop or while conducting parking enforcement?

19 CHIEF OBE: Our officers are well trained
20 in making the distinction between the plates that you
21 mentioned, and this goes as far back as when we first
22 started to see the proliferation of ghost vehicles. I
23 will say that the work continues, and I just want to
24 highlight the multi-agency ghost car operations that
25 we have citywide. In 2024, there were 61 initiatives

2 conducted on various bridges and tunnels citywide,
3 resulting in 740 arrests, 34,000 plus summonses
4 issued, 3,450 vehicles, and upwards of 48 million
5 dollars in tolls and tax warrants. This year, year to
6 date 2025, we've had 17 initiatives so far, resulting
7 in 267 arrests, 9,144 summonses, 940 vehicles seized,
8 and 5 plus million dollars in tolls and tax warrants,
9 including administrative fees.

10 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: What obstacles exist
11 for NYPD in its efforts to enforce laws requiring
12 vehicles to have proper license plates and
13 registrations?

14 CHIEF OBE: The obstacles.

15 DIRECTOR LEVIN: I'm sorry. Could you give
16 both of us the question one more time?

17 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Sure. What obstacles
18 exist for NYPD in its efforts to enforce laws
19 requiring vehicles to have proper license plates and
20 registrations?

21 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Well, I think there's a
22 bunch of different factors, even some of the stuff
23 like films, somebody obscuring a plate, somebody
24 defacing a plate. And I think if we were able to
25 write to the VIN number, that's going to remove a lot

2 of these concerns. You know, 170.60 of the penal law
3 is knowingly covering, altering, or defacing a VIN
4 number. And so, I mean, yes, that means if you take
5 your mail and you throw it in the top of the vehicle,
6 right, and it covers up the VIN, technically, you
7 have not committed that. You knowingly did it, but
8 you didn't mean to cover the VIN, right? But people
9 are exploiting that sometimes, and they know that you
10 have to be able to prove intent so they'll just throw
11 the mail up there, and now we can't read the VIN
12 number at all. So, there's a lot of different things
13 that we see that go into account for this. But as you
14 know, we're leveraging technology. We're working with
15 all of our partners, with the MTA and the Port
16 Authority, to interdict these vehicles. We've
17 recovered over, I think, 48 million dollars in unpaid
18 tolls or fines last year alone from ghost plates and
19 people driving into the city. It's a large process.
20 It takes a lot of different organizations to get it
21 to where it needs to be, but we're doing that.

22 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. Thank you
23 for your testimony.

24 DIRECTOR LEVIN: Thank you all. Have a
25 good day.

2 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I'll now open a
3 hearing for public testimony, and I want to remind
4 the members of the public that this is a government
5 proceeding and that decorum shall be observed at all
6 times. As such, members of the public shall remain
7 silent at all times.

8 The witness table is reserved for people
9 who wish to testify. No video recording or
10 photography is allowed from the witness table.
11 Further, members of the public may not present audio
12 or video recordings as testimony, but they may submit
13 transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant-at-
14 Arms for inclusion in the hearing record.

15 If you wish to speak at today's hearing,
16 please fill out an appearance card with the Sergeant-
17 at-Arms and wait to be recognized. When recognized,
18 you will have two minutes to speak on today's hearing
19 topic, NYPD Parking and Traffic Enforcement and
20 related legislation.

21 If you have a written statement or
22 additional written testimony you wish to submit for
23 the record, please provide a copy of that testimony
24 to the Sergeant-at-Arms. You may also email written
25 testimony to testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72

2 hours of the close of this hearing. Audio and video
3 recordings will not be accepted.

4 For in-person panelists, please come up
5 to the table once your name has been called.

6 I'd now like to call our first in-person
7 panel.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL KINGSLEY: We're going
9 to start with the two individuals on Zoom and try to
10 move past that, and then we will kind of turn to the
11 folks here.

12 The first person on Zoom is Eric McClure,
13 followed by Andre Carroll. If you're available, that
14 would be great. Then after those two individuals
15 speak, we will take the rest of the folks here.

16 Eric McClure.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL KINGSLEY: We could come
19 back to you as well. Let's just start off with the
20 panel in person.

21 We'll hear from Amber Adler, Darnell
22 Sealy-McCorey, and Dahlia Goldenberg.

23 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: And you may begin in
24 whichever order you'd like.

2 AMBER ADLER: Hi. I'm Amber Adler. I'm a
3 car crash survivor. I'm also a member of Families for
4 Safe Streets. I'm also a resident of southern
5 Brooklyn, and I live just a few blocks away from
6 where the Ocean Parkway crash happened just a few
7 weeks ago and killed Natasha Sada and her two
8 daughters and left her son fighting for his life. I
9 know, I knew people on both sides of that. The
10 driver, Ellie, should not have been driving. Many
11 times she's called Miriam, but it's Ellie to most
12 people that know her, but she was. She was driving.
13 And like many super speeders, she didn't have a valid
14 license. She didn't care that she didn't have a valid
15 license, and she still got behind the wheel of her
16 car. Now, had the stop super speeders bill, which is
17 proposed right now, Bill A in the Assembly, A2299 in
18 the State Senate, S4045, had it been passed last
19 session, it wouldn't have made her not get in her
20 car. But she would have got in a car and there would
21 have been a device that would have stopped her from
22 going more than five miles per hour over the speed
23 limit. Now, this is a huge deal. This is a huge deal.
24 Sorry, it hurts for obvious reasons. It hurts for
25 obvious reasons. That car couldn't have hit that high

2 speed, and the lives that day could have possibly
3 been saved. They might not have been deaths. They
4 might have been recoveries. And really, they might
5 have been neither, because if she wasn't going that
6 fast, her car wouldn't have been able to flip in that
7 capacity. It did slide down the street and crush a
8 mother just crossing her kids across Ocean Parkway.
9 Some vehicles, as you know, are getting hundreds of
10 tickets every year (TIMER CHIME) and it's just a
11 matter of time before another super speeder kills.
12 There's vehicles with so many violations. I think,
13 factually, speeding violations are twice as likely to
14 be involved in a car crash that leads to death.
15 Similar bills to what I was mentioning before were
16 enacted in the District of Columbia and also Virginia
17 and passed in the State Legislature in Georgia and in
18 Washington. And on an even more personal note, last
19 year on Ocean Parkway, my eldest son, who is about to
20 be bar mitzvah, was almost hit by a car as we crossed
21 Ocean Parkway to go to his yeshiva. That was a Sunday
22 morning when people say it's not as busy. Nobody
23 cared, apparently. The driver did not care. There
24 were no traffic agents because yeshivas are schools,
25 but they don't have traffic agents on Sundays, even

2 though they're all active. And I was with him, so he
3 went just a little bit in front of me and it didn't
4 matter because in that location, like many other
5 locations, there's not much more you can do to the
6 streets. That is an evacuation route, actually.
7 There's really not a lot you can do to the streets
8 there. And once again, making it even more important,
9 these speed limiter devices in cases like this. Thank
10 you very much. I just want to thank the Council for
11 even hearing this, and I really urge you to support
12 anything whatsoever, not just this, but all things
13 that can help prevent.

14 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Absolutely. And thank
15 you for your testimony. If you have the testimony
16 that you were reading, I would love to have that
17 submitted as well.

18 AMBER ADLER: I have it. I might have
19 sweat off of it a few times because I sort of get
20 choked up in the moment with things.

21 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Absolutely.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Also, I want to
23 thank you. I wish that the NYPD officials that
24 testified had stuck around. And I know you probably

2 know this, but here in the Council, we do have a
3 resolution supporting that State bill.

4 AMBER ADLER: Yes, 100 percent. And it's
5 so important. And if I had to beg everyone
6 individually and tell them all the things that I've
7 seen, not just even with my son, but other things on
8 Ocean Parkway. Just last week, I was walking past the
9 memorial that's been set up for Natasha and just an
10 avenue down, there were like shards of cars from a
11 fresh crash that happened on the corner.

12 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Clearly, we have to
13 do something.

14 AMBER ADLER: And actually, one more thing
15 I will note, very important. I know a report came out
16 a week or two now and showed all the top speeders in
17 the whole city, and the top is from that area, the
18 top super speeder is from that area. And the
19 intersection, there's an intersection on Ocean
20 Parkway and Ocean Court, which is also a few avenues
21 down, which on that one intersection, they have 70,
22 70 tickets at that one spot. And it's right outside
23 of Yeshiva.

24 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you for your
25 testimony.

2 DAHLIA GOLDENBERG: Good afternoon. My
3 name is Dahlia Goldenberg. I'm the Associate Director
4 of Families for Safe Streets. And thank you to the
5 Chair for holding this important hearing and for
6 introducing Resolution 854, calling on New York State
7 to pass A2299/S4045, the Stop Super Speeders Bill, as
8 we like to call it. Families for Safe Streets is an
9 organization that brings together over 700 members,
10 all of whom have either lost a loved one in a traffic
11 crash or themselves been injured in a traffic crash.
12 At Families for Safe Streets, we work to advance
13 proven safety measures like speed limiters, and we're
14 proud to testify for the Chair's Resolution in
15 support of our Stop Super Speeders Bill. The data
16 shows that a majority of drivers after they receive
17 one or two speeding tickets, they don't ever receive
18 another one. They change their behavior. But a small
19 minority of speeders, what we call super speeders,
20 tickets don't deter them. Just 1.5 percent of drivers
21 across New York State. Fines don't deter them. Even
22 suspended licenses don't deter them. As you heard in
23 the case that Amber spoke of in South Brooklyn, a
24 driver with a suspended license and who was a super
25 speeder with multiple speeding violations. These

2 super speeders need speed limiters. Transportation
3 Alternatives recently released a report that Amber
4 also mentioned on the top 10 super speeders in New
5 York City and found that some vehicles are getting
6 hundreds of tickets a year without being forced to
7 change their behavior. In fact, the number one worst
8 super speeder in New York City got a shocking 563
9 school zone speeding tickets in 2024 alone and owes
10 thousands of dollars in unpaid tickets. That's in
11 South Brooklyn. Our number two worst super speeder is
12 along the west side of Manhattan. We can't continue
13 to wait. Just 1.5 percent of drivers, a small
14 percentage that would be considered super speeders in
15 New York State, they cause over 21 percent of (TIMER
16 CHIME) pedestrian deaths and we have an opportunity
17 to slow these cars down. If I can just put in one
18 more line, speed limiters are a proven solution.
19 They're already considered a best practice by the
20 City's own DCAS and it's time to bring them to New
21 York City. This same legislation has been passed in
22 Georgia and Virginia and Washington D.C. and it's
23 time for New York State to lead. So, we thank again
24 the Council for taking on this issue and we urge you

2 to pass the Resolution immediately before the State
3 session ends in June. Thank you so much.

4 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you for your
5 testimony.

6 DARNELL SEALY-MCCROREY: Hello. My name is
7 Darnell McCrorey, and I am a member of Families for
8 Safe Streets. I'm here to speak in support of Chair
9 Solon's Resolution to stop super speeders. Families
10 for Safe Streets is an organization made up of people
11 like me, and all of us have either lost a loved one
12 or ourselves been injured in a traffic crash. We know
13 that when our streets and our intersections are
14 deadly, we are the ones who are paying the price.
15 Bear with me. Last year, my 13-year-old daughter,
16 Nayel McCrorey, was hit and killed by a SUV driver at
17 the intersection of West 110th Street and Manhattan
18 Avenue on October 24th. My beautiful, intelligent
19 daughter, Nayel, had a passion for dancing, learning,
20 and inspired many other friends and teenagers via
21 TikTok with her self-taught choreographed dance
22 routines. She had aspiring dreams of becoming a
23 doctor or a lawyer. I never thought her mother and I
24 would be burying our daughter so soon. We prayed that
25 she would recover and her intracranial pressure would

2 decrease, but sadly she was pronounced deceased
3 November 1, 2024. The day we lost Nayel was the most
4 difficult of our lives.

5 Today, we can protect our families from
6 suffering like this. There's a bill up in Albany that
7 will require speed limiters in the cars of the worst
8 of the worst repeat offenders. Some vehicles are
9 racking up hundreds of speeding tickets a year and,
10 if we don't do something, one of these drivers is
11 going to kill, just like a super speeder killed a
12 mother and her (TIMER CHIME) two children in Brooklyn
13 last month, speed limiters are the answer. They'll
14 physically slow down super speeders to prevent
15 crashes and save lives. We are not saying punish the
16 driver. We are saying here's a way to help you stop
17 your reckless behavior because you can take lives. We
18 can send a message today to our legislators up in
19 Albany that New York City supports this bill and
20 thank you for your opportunity to share testimony
21 here today. Thank you for the time. I'm just a little
22 bit under mental and emotional distress. I just want
23 to also add that I was previously incarcerated, and I
24 just came home February 8th of 2024. I never thought
25 in a million years that I would be burying my

2 daughter the same year that I came home from spending
3 four years behind bars talking to my daughter every
4 day on the phone so I'm just asking to please
5 consider this bill. It is serious. Her mom cannot be
6 a part of any of this. She does not have the strength
7 to do nothing that I'm doing so I'm doing this for my
8 family and I'm doing this for others. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. Thank you
10 for your testimony. You know what is super impactful
11 for me along with the fact that you just came home is
12 that your daughter died right in the most western
13 part of my District.

14 DARNELL SEALY-MCCROREY: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Remembering that day,
16 remembering your daughter, I wonder if, I don't think
17 anything has been done to that area, that
18 intersection...

19 DARNELL SEALY-MCCROREY: No.

20 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: And I'm wondering if
21 you also, in terms of what we're trying to push
22 forward in terms of the super speeder law, what else
23 can be done because we have a lot of intersections
24 like that. We have a lot of places where these are
25 considered, I would say, sensitive spaces where

2 children are frequently moving around and drivers may
3 not be as cognizant of the dangerous situation. And
4 just from your perspective, is there anything more
5 that we can do?

6 DARNELL SEALY-MCCROREY: I would like to
7 see TAs in that area, but listening to what's going
8 on earlier, I just hope that it's effective if it is
9 applied to that area. There's just no limiters. It's
10 a very busy traffic area. There's traffic coming from
11 all ways. There's no limiters. There's nothing to
12 help desensitize the speed of these drivers. This
13 speed limiter, this device, I really hope that it's
14 passed and I wish it was passed before. Maybe my
15 daughter would still be alive. It would, I hope, slow
16 down that vehicle that day. This is my reason for
17 publicly advocating for others, not just my daughter.
18 I don't want people moving on in the future to
19 witness to my... it's a lot of pain, it's a lot of pain
20 I have to live with. It's an accident. This is an
21 accident. It's just something that I'm never going to
22 be over. My heart is forever broken, but it's still...
23 Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you again for
25 your testimony. Thank you.

2 DAHLIA GOLDENBERG: If you'd like, I could
3 also respond to that question.

4 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Yes, please do.

5 DAHLIA GOLDENBERG: Just that we also
6 advocate for improvements to the street design, to
7 the intersections. We have the Universal Daylighting
8 Bill right now, which improves safety at
9 intersections. We'd also be happy to meet with your
10 office to discuss safety improvements to that
11 particular street. We're also working to with
12 community boards to pass resolutions calling on
13 Sammy's Law to be implemented in more districts on
14 more streets. The City now has permission from
15 Albany, because of our work last year, to reduce the
16 speed limit to 20 miles per hour on most city
17 streets, and that's something that can also be
18 implemented further.

19 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I actually have a
20 question, and correct me if I'm wrong, but I think
21 some of the testimony that was received here today, I
22 think it might have been Council Member Joseph who
23 was saying, it may not have been her, but
24 specifically about the street design. Now, years ago
25 prior to me being known in an infamous way, I used to

2 ride my skateboard from Schaumburg Plaza up to the
3 hill, Cathedral Parkway. I had friends that lived up
4 there, and I do know that part of the way that the
5 streets now are being designed, the fact that it's
6 becoming more constrictive as opposed to widened, I'm
7 not sure if there ever has been a study, and if it
8 hasn't, I think it might be a great exercise to look
9 at before and after, because the biggest problem that
10 we're trying to fix, especially when it comes to
11 people speeding, there's a whole host of other
12 dynamics. It might be as was described by the PD, you
13 know, somebody trying to rush to a recital or go
14 here. There's so many different things, but when you
15 restrict the streets to, you know, there's confusion
16 coming from Columbus Avenue down to Manhattan Avenue,
17 especially because the buses now are on the same side
18 as cars, and then there's that single lane that goes
19 left, but it doesn't really look like that's a lane
20 that goes left, but I'm not sure if that's something
21 that has been looked at as it relates to, especially
22 with Sammy's Law, with regards to the super speeders,
23 all of the things that we are trying to shore up.

24 DARNELL SEALY-MCCROREY: That
25 intersection, I just wanted to (INAUDIBLE) it

2 definitely needs infrastructure. I don't know how to
3 say it, but it's wide. It's wide, but still so
4 narrow. It's really easy for you to get hit there.
5 It's very easy for you to, if you're not paying
6 attention, and you know people like to wear their
7 AirPods, and it wasn't just my daughter that week,
8 there were two others same week, so something has to
9 be done, and like she said, we're running out of
10 time, and we're really trying to push this bill.

11 DAHLIA GOLDENBERG: The U.S. DOT uses
12 something called the Safe System Approach that we
13 also support. It's highly backed by data. It has been
14 researched across the country, and also in places
15 like London, and across the EU. It includes safer
16 vehicles, which is things like speed limiters to make
17 the vehicle itself safer, safer speeds, so reducing
18 the speed limit. That has been the number one thing
19 that has reduced fatalities on streets in London,
20 when they reduced their speed limits to 20, and then
21 safer roads, and so there are a number of things,
22 such as narrowing the lanes, making changes at the
23 intersections that cause vehicles to slow down, when
24 all of those other factors are a part of it, and all
25 of these approaches work together as a safe system

2 approach, reducing the traffic violence. That's why
3 we work across all of these different areas, the
4 roads, the vehicles themselves, and the speed limits.

5 AMBER ADLER: I want to add one thing here
6 that I find really important to note, especially as
7 you're saying it's a wide road, and Ocean Parkway, by
8 me, is very wide. The thing with the speed limiters,
9 it's driver by driver, car by car, and that's
10 effective in a lot of areas where you can't change
11 street design. Ocean Parkway is an evacuation route,
12 and I was working for Safe Streets, even when Chaim
13 Deutsch was in office, and I went out there with Tish
14 James and him and all these other people, and Vision
15 Zero came out at one point, and they had service
16 roads next to it, and they changed the arrows, like
17 where you could turn. You can only turn here, you can
18 only turn there, you can only do this, you can only
19 do that, and that helped to an extent, but there were
20 still then people speeding in the service lanes,
21 people not stopping in the service lanes. That's why
22 I'm just going to underline places where you can only
23 change so much because of it being an evacuation
24 route, those devices in the car become even more
25 vital.

2 DARNELL SEALY-MCCRORY: Right. Yeah.

3 Because after my daughter was struck, the vehicle did
4 not stop. The vehicle kept going. No, it did stop. It
5 didn't stop automatically, like right then and there.
6 It stopped. So, it happened at 110th, between 110th
7 and 109th. It stopped a little past 109th. Why?
8 Speeding.

9 DAHLIA GOLDENBERG: So, thank you again,
10 and thank you for this Resolution, and we urge you to
11 keep working with us on all of these approaches, and
12 right now on our priority, which is getting the Stop
13 Super Speeders Bill passed in Albany.

14 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you all for
15 your testimony. It definitely was appreciated. Thank
16 you.

17 DAHLIA GOLDENBERG: Thank you so much.

18 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: And if you also have
19 any of the testimony hasn't been fully read by you,
20 definitely submit it to be included today.

21 DAHLIA GOLDENBERG: We will.

22 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL KINGSLEY: Thank you,
24 everyone. Next, we'll turn to Zoom. Eric McClure,

2 followed by Andre D. Carroll. I will unmute you just
3 now. One second.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

5 ERIC MCCLURE: Thank you, Chair Salaam,
6 Council Member Cabán, if you're still there, I can't
7 see the full dais, but I apologize for not being
8 ready. I was juggling two meetings and was not able
9 to unmute quickly enough, but my name is Eric
10 McClure. I'm the Executive Director of StreetsPAC. We
11 strongly support Resolution 854 and the corresponding
12 State legislation it supports, which would require
13 the installation of intelligent speed assistance
14 devices in the vehicles of super speeders,
15 individuals who repeatedly receive speed and red
16 light camera violations and/or accumulate 11 license
17 points over an 18-month period. Super speeders are
18 responsible for an inordinate number of crashes that
19 cause death or serious injury. The New York City
20 Department of Transportation study covering five
21 years of data through 2022 found that drivers who had
22 racked up 20 or more speed camera violations in one
23 year were five times more likely to be involved in a
24 crash resulting in death or serious injuries. Recent
25 horrific crashes underscore this data. The vehicle

2 whose driver hit and killed Amanda Servetio in
3 Astoria last October had accumulated 80 speeding
4 tickets in just the previous two years. And Miriam
5 Urimi, who was driving at more than twice the speed
6 limit and failed to stop for a red light when she
7 struck and killed Natasha Sada and her two young
8 daughters on Ocean Parkway last month, had received
9 more than two dozen camera violations over the
10 previous 18 months. It's also important to keep in
11 mind that speed cameras are only triggered when
12 someone exceeds the posted speed limit by more than
13 10 miles per hour and that many more tickets would be
14 issued if not for defaced or illegally covered
15 license plates. The beauty of intelligent speed
16 assistance technology is that it doesn't restrict a
17 person's ability to drive. While we have little
18 sympathy for individuals who claim they need to be
19 able to drive for work or other reasons but have such
20 little regard for others that they repeatedly break
21 traffic laws, ISA allows operators to continue
22 driving while restricting their ability to cause
23 mayhem by controlling their speed. The use of such
24 devices in the U.K. reduced fatal crashes by more
25 than a third, and New York City's pilot effort in

2 fleet vehicles resulted in near universal compliance
3 with speed limits, along with a 36 percent drop in
4 hard braking events considered strong evidence of
5 unsafe (TIMER CHIME) and aggressive driving. The
6 District of Columbia and the State of New York...

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time has expired.

8 ERIC MCCLURE: Have enacted laws that
9 require, I'm almost done, ISA devices in the cars of
10 super speeders, and similar bills have passed the
11 legislatures in both Washington and Georgia. With the
12 support of the City Council, there's a good chance we
13 can pass this legislation in Albany this session. We
14 strongly urge a yes vote on Resolution 854. And I
15 will submit written testimony that addresses the
16 other Resolution and legislation considered today.
17 Thank you very much.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL KINGSLEY: Thank you so
19 much for your testimony. Next, we'll hear from Andre
20 D. Carroll.

21 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL KINGSLEY: Andre, you
23 are muted. Unmute yourself.

24 ANDRE D. CARROLL: Here we go. It was not
25 allowing me to unmute. Thank you. First, I want to

2 give my condolences to the gentleman who spoke last
3 in person to him and his family for the loss of his
4 daughter. Then I would like to also thank New York
5 City Council. I want to thank Chairman Salaam for
6 holding this hearing, and I also want to thank
7 Council Member Cabán for her remarks today.

8 I am State Representative in Pennsylvania
9 Andre D. Carroll. I just want to mention that public
10 safety is a priority for all of us, but community and
11 police relations must also be a priority.

12 Philadelphia City Council Member a few years ago
13 introduced driving equality, which was introduced by
14 Isaiah Thomas, which City Council passed. This law
15 was introduced to help reduce the targeting of
16 drivers of color. I do want to share a personal story
17 that while I was a Lyft driver during my college
18 years, I had been pulled over numerous times. A few
19 times included air freshener hanging from my rearview
20 mirror and a single headlight being out as a reason.
21 I also have been pulled over for sitting too long at
22 a gas station on the phone. While none of these
23 instances impeded on public safety, my interactions
24 with police was not always positive. Oftentimes, I
25 felt targeted and because of those reasons for

2 pulling me over gave me room to be subject to a car
3 search with every single time no contraband being
4 found. A research on when the law in Philadelphia was
5 conducted, it showed that out of 300,000 traffic
6 stops that only 0.03 percent of the searches led to
7 any kind of contraband. While I now may be a State
8 Representative, I understand that everyone doesn't
9 have that privilege and that everyone deserves to be
10 treated with dignity and not be subjected to targeted
11 traffic stops. I want to thank City Council for
12 allowing me this space today, and I also want to ask
13 that you consider these considerations as you
14 continue to promote traffic safety.

15 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: May I ask a
17 question? Great, thank you.

18 Hi, Senator. First, I want to thank you
19 for being here From afar, I'm an admirer of the work
20 that you're doing out there in Pennsylvania and
21 obviously I'm a huge fan of Council Member Isaiah
22 Thomas who really championed the Driving Equality
23 Plan.

24 You talked about your personal
25 experiences which obviously bear out the data you

2 then see in your city, and there are similarities
3 here in terms of the disproportionate number of
4 stops, searches, seizures, arrests. Can you talk a
5 little bit about when the law went into effect and
6 some of the effects you've seen from removing police
7 from certain parts of traffic enforcement?

8 ANDRE D. CARROLL: Absolutely. The law was
9 passed in September 2022, and it became law in March
10 of 2023. It's been a few years now. The thing that
11 I'll share is that my personal interactions with the
12 police is that I've had a taillight or I've had a
13 headlight that's been out since this law has been in
14 effect and it has taken down the anxiety that you
15 will get pulled over because that exists. Also, I
16 just do want to mention some of the things that it
17 does change as violations that can be enforced on a
18 traffic stop. Late registration. Before this law, if
19 your registration was expired a day, they could just
20 pull you over for that but the car has been
21 registered to somebody's name but maybe the person
22 hasn't had a chance to get the car registered. That's
23 another one of the things that I thought was helpful
24 to give working class folks an opportunity to correct
25 some things. Another thing that I'll mention is if

2 the inspection or emission sticker on the front of
3 the car is expired, it gives them some time to be
4 able to get that course corrected as well. Those are
5 just a few of the things that has removed police from
6 being able to use that as a reason to pull folks over
7 which also to have, in my opinion, saved the city
8 money because now we don't have police officers
9 conducting traffic stops for things that don't yield
10 in return, things that make our communities safer.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Right. And my
12 understanding is that before the legislation was
13 introduced and then obviously subsequently passed,
14 there were long-term studies on which traffic
15 infractions to include in the bill and not include
16 and those were rooted in safety statistics so which
17 infractions led to more dangerous traffic outcomes,
18 for example, so took the ones that didn't have an
19 impact on safety and then just removed the ability of
20 the police to be able to make the stop for that thing
21 understanding that what we're seeing is that after
22 the stop, there's this real disparity between how
23 Black and Brown drivers are being treated.

24 ANDRE D. CARROLL: Absolutely,
25 Councilwoman. There was a lengthy amount of time that

2 there was a conversation. To my understanding, there
3 was at least a year that included the Philadelphia
4 Public Defenders Association, Philadelphia Police
5 Department, and also Councilman Isaiah Thomas' team
6 to talk through this bill. Yes, there was a lot of
7 things that was taken out of the bill and not
8 considered in the final passage, and one of the
9 biggest misconceptions in Philadelphia is that tinted
10 windows was included in this bill, and that is
11 something that one could argue would impede on public
12 safety because it may impair the driver from being
13 able to see through the window so that is not
14 included in this bill, but the eight violations that
15 are included in the bill were things that were agreed
16 upon for all three folks sitting at the table that
17 would not impede on public safety.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Awesome. Thank you
19 so much. Super thoughtful. I love having folks from
20 other cities' jurisdictions come in and tell us how
21 they're doing their thing so thank you.

22 ANDRE D. CARROLL: Thank you so much. This
23 is my first time sitting through a New York City
24 Council hearing and... (CROSS-TALK)

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: It gets spicy
3 sometimes.

4 ANDRE D. CARROLL: Yes. I understand. We
5 have the same kind of tensions in the Statehouse so I
6 do want to thank you for your time and thank you for
7 including me.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL KINGSLEY: Thank you so
10 much for your testimony.

11 Next, we'll be hearing from people in the
12 audience here.

13 We'll be hearing from Christopher Leon
14 Johnson, Y. Jennings, and Andrew. You may come up and
15 speak, all three of you at the same time.

16 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Ready? Hello.
17 My name is Christopher Leon Johnson. I'm here to
18 support your bill, Resolution 854, and I'm going to
19 explain why but first off we have to say rest in
20 peace to Rebecca, Deanna, and Dana Sada who passed
21 away in Inna Vernikov's District. I want to know
22 where was Inna Vernikov? Where is she at? Why is she
23 not here? Why is she not saying anything about this?
24 Is she a speeder herself? Is there a reason why she's
25 not for this bill? She's not supporting it because

2 she's a speeder herself? That minicar? Let's keep it
3 100 percent. Where are you? Why are you not
4 supporting these people with this stuff? Why are you
5 not supporting Families for Safe Streets? I
6 understand they're playing with Democrats but safety
7 in the streets is not Democrat or Republican. This is
8 human rights. It's all about human rights. Let's keep
9 that 100 percent.

10 Now I want to show my support for this
11 bill, this resolution because today I just came from
12 50th Street with a political candidate. I can't be
13 political. I can't say that person's name, but
14 running for public advocate, and we was there showing
15 our respects to the people that passed away and
16 construction accidents. And at the same time that I
17 feel that construction workers and deliveristas,
18 they're not safe in the streets because there's a lot
19 of people that speed in the City of New York,
20 especially in Manhattan and nothing ever happens.
21 This resolution, I hope this gets passed in the State
22 Senate with Andrew Gounardes that it will protect
23 these deliveristas, Worker Justice Project. It will
24 protect the construction workers under the CLC labor
25 unions. It will protect these people. It will protect

2 them. I believe that these bills, resolutions will
3 protect these deliveristas and construction workers.
4 They matter mostly to more than just, not to say more
5 but the same as regular people that just get hit by
6 cars and stuff like that. But it will protect the
7 labor. It will protect labor. But before I get off
8 here, I'm going to ask, I'm going to say, Inna
9 Vernikov, where are you? Why are you not here? Why
10 are you not supporting this bill? What's wrong? I
11 mean, that's my honest opinion. Inna, if you don't
12 care about people, you need to be voted out. That's
13 why you're getting chomped by Ari Kagan and the other
14 girl on the other side. But if you don't care about
15 (TIMER CHIME) street safety, Ari Kagan need to get
16 you out the door. So that's all I got to say. Ari
17 Kagan, hope you do the right thing. Appreciate it.

18 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL KINGSLEY: You may go
20 ahead. Ms. Jennings? You may go ahead.

21 Y. JENNINGS: Can you hear me?

22 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Yes.

23 Y. JENNINGS: I spoke in February about
24 the stalking issue. The car is driving by. I'm on the
25 sidewalk. Bicycle's coming at me. I leave here.

2 People march into me. Start date of me being stalked
3 is May 11, 2006. 2007, I speak to a private eye. The
4 private eye said he couldn't help me, but the phone
5 would blow up. Do you know that all your phones have
6 something to do with mine? You need to speak to Matt
7 Frazier. What's his name, Matt Frazier? And Jessica
8 Tisch. Those letters that I tried to show you, that I
9 never got to see you last November. Five months after
10 my heart attack and now I'm having a pain and I'm not
11 doing well. Any health issues that I have now will be
12 fought, I'm going to put it towards encouraged by the
13 wonderful people that I reached out to. Because I
14 reached out to all the wonderful elected officials
15 like I should in 2006. It is now 19 years of people I
16 don't know assaulting me on the property, harassing
17 me. I had a heart attack, yeah. What did they do from
18 11 p.m. to 3 a.m.? The wonderful staff marched around
19 as I cried them all in pain. I think I showed my
20 diary to many of you here. And I have to sit still as
21 people creep around and harass me. I'm out of
22 patience. So I asked you wonderful, Yusuf, if we
23 could meet and have a little talk about something
24 very urgent. Because the 5,000 plus letters to the
25 White House now have major names in it and go on

2 every camera I pass. Because I fear for my life and
3 safety. I don't know these people. And you saw me sit
4 back there very calmly and then I had not well. I
5 write everything down. You see my diary. And the
6 diary doesn't cover anything. The underline of this
7 was drugs. An El Chapo thing. Oh, has a lot to do
8 with City Council. The man who came in with 3 billion
9 who's worth 100-something billion, I had a client
10 help him get it (TIMER CHIME) so I asked if we could
11 meet. Very urgent. Okay? Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you.

13 Y. JENNINGS: I don't have (INAUDIBLE).
14 One day someone's going to come at me and I'm going
15 to get a little agitated. I don't understand it.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL KINGSLEY: Thank you for
17 your testimony.

18 You may begin.

19 ANDREW: Testing. Okay. Hello there. Thank
20 you for your time. I'm not here to threaten people
21 getting in office, out of office. That's not me. I
22 came to ask for assistance. I've been asking for
23 assistance for years. I've had flyers, police, FBI,
24 terrorist organization blocking me from getting a
25 job. This is a court case in New York City where law

2 enforcement running around making people homeless,
3 getting fired from their job. For years, I've been
4 asking for an investigation. I was assaulted in
5 Chicago. I was assaulted in New York. They were
6 refusing police reports. So, there's something that
7 they're hiding. And every time someone breaks into my
8 car, they refuse to show up or, when they do show up,
9 they refuse to issue a police report, which again it
10 shows that they're hiding something so I keep asking
11 for an investigation. I keep asking for help. They're
12 blocking me from getting a job. They're blocking me
13 from getting a place to live. Blocking me from
14 (INAUDIBLE) of my family and interfering with my
15 religion. These people are criminals. So, I'm asking
16 for assistance so I can get some help. If you have
17 any suggestions how to get these criminals to stop
18 attacking me, I'd be more than happy to write it down
19 so I can apply it so I can get a job, get a place to
20 live, start my new family, have no interference in my
21 religion.

22 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I have a question.
23 Have you reached out to the Neighborhood Defender
24 Services to seek counsel?

25 ANDREW: No.

2 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: That may be a good
3 first step to assist because when you talk about
4 needing support in what you're going through,
5 oftentimes it's legal recourses that you have to go
6 through first in order to find ways forward.

7 ANDREW: National...

8 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Neighborhood Defender
9 Service.

10 ANDREW: I think I've been to them
11 already. I've been to Legal Aid. I've been to a
12 couple. So far nobody's assisted me. I've been to
13 Legal Aid and something in Manhattan with the
14 lawyers. Lawyers Guild or whatever it was. So far
15 nobody has assisted me in getting law enforcement to
16 stop attacking me, which obviously it has to be them
17 because they are refusing to investigate my claims.

18 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Gotcha. Hopefully
19 they'll be able to assist you from now.

20 ANDREW: Okay. So, Neighborhood...

21 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Defender Service.

22 ANDREW: Defender Service. Okay. Thank you
23 very much.

24 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you for your
25 testimony.

2 We have now heard from everyone who has
3 signed up to testify.

4 If we have inadvertently missed anyone
5 who would like to testify in person, please visit the
6 Sergeant-at-Arms table and complete a witness slip
7 now.

8 If we inadvertently missed anyone who
9 would like to testify virtually, please use the raise
10 hand function in Zoom and a Member of our Staff will
11 call you in the order of hands raised.

12 Seeing none, I would like to note again
13 that written testimony which will be reviewed in full
14 by Committee Staff may be submitted to the record up
15 to 72 hours after the close of this hearing by
16 emailing testimony@council.nyc.gov.

17 Thank you. That concludes today's
18 business. [GAVEL]

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 29, 2025