

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

----- X

June 14, 2016
Start: 11:57 a.m.
Recess: 12:23 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: JULISSA FERRERAS-COPELAND
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Ydanis A. Rodriguez
James G. Van Bramer
Vanessa L. Gibson
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Laurie A. Cumbo
Corey D. Johnson
Mark Levine
I. Daneek Miller
Helen K. Rosenthal
Steven Matteo

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 [sound check, pause] [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Good
4 afternoon and welcome to today's Finance Committee
5 hearing we--where we will be adopting Fiscal 2017's
6 budget. I am Council Member Julissa Ferreras-
7 Copeland and I am the Chair of the committee.

8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet
9 please.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: We've
11 been joined by Council Majority Leader Van Bramer,
12 Council Members Cornegy, Rosenthal, Cumbo, Levine and
13 Miller. Today the Finance Committee will take the
14 necessary actions to allow the City Council to adopt
15 the Fiscal 2017 Budget, which totals approximately
16 \$82.1 billion. In total, this committee will vote on
17 12 budget related items. In addition, we will also
18 be voting on eight land use item, but before we get
19 started, there is a long list of people that need to
20 be thanked for getting us here today. First and
21 foremost, I need to thank the Speaker Melissa Mark-
22 Viverito for her stewardship of this body throughout
23 the budget negotiating process. The Speaker is a
24 true leader. She listened to the voices of the
25 council members and the public, and then with that

2 information in hand, she approached the negotiations
3 with tenacity, vision and purpose. As this year--and
4 this year it's certainly paid off. With the Speaker
5 at the helm, the Council achieved some amazing
6 victories, and that is why today we can pass a budget
7 that can--that we can all be proud of. Of course, I
8 also want to thank the Speaker's Chief of Staff,
9 Ramon Martinez for all that he does for the Council
10 and each one of us and probably keeps us in check
11 more often than we need. Thank you to my fellow
12 Finance Committee members for once again being active
13 and engaged in the budget process. Together at the
14 Executive Budget hearings we spent nearly 80 hours
15 listening to testimony from dozens of agencies about
16 how the budget proposed by the Mayor affected their
17 ability to perform their core services. On the last
18 day of Executive Budget hearings we also heard from
19 over 70 members of the public about how the Executive
20 Budget affected them. We shared that we learned
21 through the--we shared that we learned through the--
22 through the budget hearings with our colleagues and
23 B&T and delegations and with other, and worked
24 together to have our voices heard. So thank you
25 Finance Committee members for being partners with me

2 during this budget cycle. I also want to thank our
3 talented and dedicated Finance staff. Under the
4 leadership of the Finance Director Latonia McKinney
5 with a third budget under her belt as the leader of
6 the Finance Division, Latonia is a seasoned,
7 effective and skilled negotiator, and we could not
8 have done this without her. Thank you, Latonia, for
9 your excellent work.

10 LATONIA MCKINNEY: [off mic] Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Let's
12 give Latonia a round of applause. [cheers/applause]
13 I also want to thank the staff of the Finance
14 Division individually. Everyone plays an important
15 role and I thank you for all the hours you worked
16 around the clock on weekends and the evening and the
17 crack of dawn. Some of you probably never even made
18 it home. Being--for being responsive to council
19 members' questions and requests for information and
20 guiding us through delegations and BMT, I'd like to
21 thank Deputy Director and Chief Economist Dr. Ray
22 Majewski; Deputy Director Regina Poreda Ryan; Deputy
23 Director Nathan Toth; Deputy Director Paul Scimone;
24 Assistant Director Emre Edev; Committee Counsel
25 Rebecca Chasan; unit heads Ayisha Wright, Chima

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

6

2 Obichere, John Russell, Paul Sturm, Dohini Sompura
3 and Crilhien Francisco. The Finance Analysts in
4 alphabet--alphabetical order are Jessica Ackerman,
5 Alia Ali, Ruby Anache (sp?), Ellen Eng, Sarah
6 Gastelum, Kenny Grace, Elizabeth Hoffman, Sheila
7 Johnson, Crilhien Francisco, William Karamentin
8 (sp?), Prince Menza, Janette Merrill, Brittany
9 Morrissey, Namira Nuzat (sp?), Jimmy Regas, Steve
10 Riester, John Seltzer, Kendall Stephenson, James
11 Subudhi, Brand West and Davis Winslow. I'd like to
12 also thank the wonder Finance support staff, Nicole
13 Anderson, Roberta Caturano (sp?) and Maria Pagan, and
14 last but not least, I want to thank my staff Daniel
15 Coty, Vanna Costelin Sabeda (sp?), Cheyenna Gweiser
16 (sp?) and everyone in the district office who kept
17 everything going while we were here. Thank you to
18 all. Can we please get the entire Finance Division a
19 big round of applause. [cheers/applause] Now, with
20 all that said, let's adopt the budget that is early
21 and timewise early in June. Some of us I don't know
22 what you're going to do with these two extra weeks in
23 June. This Fiscal--this Fiscal Adopted Budget
24 includes many significant wins for the Council.
25 These wins will benefit both the New Yorkers who will

2 the services we fought to have included as well as
3 the city as a whole due to the long-term budget
4 stability measures we have put into place. When the
5 Executive Budget was released, and so few of the
6 Council priorities were included, there were many who
7 were uncertain about how influential the Council
8 would have been this year during this Adopted Budget.
9 However, after very--after a very successful
10 negotiating with more than half of the Council's
11 Budget Response now included, it is absolutely clear
12 that the Adopted Budget reflects the Council's great
13 impact and our emphasis on addressing inequality
14 through responsible budgeting. This year we building
15 off last year's efforts to enhance transparency and
16 foster equitable growth. We negotiated a budget that
17 includes the Council's signature priorities much
18 needed capital funding, significant investments in
19 the City's reserved, and the revamped Council
20 initiative process that eliminated consolidated and
21 re-prioritized the Council's spending. First and
22 foremost, I must highlight that \$100 million--let me
23 repeat--\$100 million investment that we're making at
24 our city's youth. This includes 3 point--\$38.5
25 million to support 60,000 jobs in Summer Youth

2 Employment Program; \$17.5 million for SONYC Summer
3 School for 26,000 children; \$16.8 million for COMPASS
4 and \$16 million for the Council's year-round job
5 programs Work, Learn and Grow. In addition, this
6 budget includes investments in our city's immigrants
7 with \$12 million for adult literacy programming,
8 \$12.--\$2.7 million for the Immigrant Opportunities
9 Initiative to take on more complete legal cases, and
10 \$2.5 million for legal services for unaccompanied
11 minors; \$21.9 million for five district attorney's
12 offices including funding for groundbreaking efforts
13 by the Bronx District Attorney to investigate and
14 prosecute crimes on Rikers Island, and by Staten
15 Island District Attorney to address the opioid drug
16 crisis. \$43 million for three library systems to
17 continue to offer six-day service in a baseline, an
18 additional \$40--\$40--I'm sorry. An additional \$4.9
19 million for Emergency Food Assistance Program to
20 support the increased demand on over \$450 food
21 pantries across the city. They're incredible
22 victories, but throughout the negotiations we were
23 not only focused on where spending could most
24 significantly have a positive impact for New Yorkers
25 lives and address inequalities for a program's

2 opportunities and access. An important part of the
3 Council's position was that the City must be better
4 prepared for any economic downturn that may come in
5 the future. Therefore, we also focused on ensuring
6 that the Administrations increase its savings plan,
7 and further shored up our reserves. The initial
8 citywide savings program presented \$1.3 billion--
9 billion dollars in savings for Fiscal 2016, and \$997
10 million in savings for Fiscal 2017. Given the
11 Administration's addition of nearly two--addition of
12 nearly \$2 billion in new needs in Fiscal 17 alone,
13 the Council insisted that additional savings be found
14 to further offset the new spending. As a result, the
15 Citywide savings program will now include \$311
16 million more in savings from Fiscal 2016 and \$135--
17 \$134 million more in savings for Fiscal 2017 for a
18 combined total across the two years of \$2.7 billion
19 saved.

20 Looking forward to Fiscal 2018, the
21 Council will continue to press the Administration to
22 find savings that are true agency efficiencies rather
23 than just an array of accruals, re-estimates and
24 other non-recurring savings. At the Council's
25 urging, the Administration will also be putting aside

2 an additional \$250 million into the Retiree Health
3 Benefits Trust Fund bringing the total investment in
4 the fund for Fiscal 2017 to \$500 million. With these
5 victories in hand, the Council engaged in deep
6 focused internal process to determine which public
7 services and populations needed additional support,
8 and to develop new initiatives and strategies to meet
9 those needs. This year we tightened the focus of our
10 initiatives to align them more closely with the
11 vision and priorities of the Council. From a list of
12 190 initiatives in 24 program areas, the Council
13 created a package of \$140 initiatives in 25 program
14 areas. Programs and services with complementary and
15 overlapping scopes were combined, and initiatives
16 that did not align with current priorities were
17 eliminated. This year after engaging in that
18 process, the Council's discretionary spending will
19 fund incredibly worthwhile initiatives such as \$5
20 million to launch the Young Women's Initiative, which
21 will offer leadership development and violence
22 prevention and response; reproductive health support
23 and other services to young women and girls.
24 Enhancements to cultural initiatives like CASA, which
25 will grow from eight to eleven sites in each Council

2 district for a total of 561 after-school cultural
3 programs citywide. A 46% increase in funding to
4 combat domestic violence through DOVE, the DOVE
5 Initiative, and \$1.3 million for the Veterans
6 Initiative to address issues such a veterans mental
7 health, unemployment and homelessness. \$2.5 million
8 to support community programs in smaller neighborhood
9 parks and the work of existing park and garden
10 volunteer groups citywide. \$9.6 million to our Parks
11 Department to retain 150 park and maintenance
12 workers, and \$2 million for stabilizing NYPD to
13 support legal and organizing resources into a
14 citywide fund against predatory equity. This
15 meaningful balanced package of spending and budget
16 stability measures is attributed to the dedication of
17 this Council and to the people of New York, and we
18 should all be proud of what we've accomplished for
19 Fiscal 2017.

20 Before we move on, I'd like to
21 acknowledge that none of this would have been
22 possible without the Administration's willingness to
23 come to the table to hear us out, and the ultimately-
24 -and ultimately agree to provide the vital services
25 and budget stability measures demanded by the

2 Council. Through the partnership and collaboration,
3 we are today able to pass this city's earliest budget
4 in 15 years. Now, with all that good news laid out,
5 let's discuss the items that the Finance Committee
6 will vote on today, which actually make these great
7 things a reality. And everybody will see it in their
8 envelopes, and you will be tested on everything I
9 just said. [laughter] Finance Committee members
10 should have a budget packet that contains all budget
11 related legislation that must be voted on by the
12 committee and again by the full council at the State
13 Meeting. The packet also includes supporting
14 schedules that are not voted on, but filed with the
15 committee as well as other non-budget related items
16 that are being voted on today. I wanted to strongly
17 emphasize that the Finance Committee members will be
18 getting only one budget packet. So after you vote on
19 the packet items, you must bring the packet and all
20 of its contents to the Stated Meeting vote again.
21 Council members who are not in the Finance Committee
22 will be given their budget packets at the Stated
23 meeting a description of all the items written to you
24 by my Counsel Rebecca Chasan. So I will simply list

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

13

2 the items that are in your agenda today that require
3 vote. The first item is Reso A Capital.

4 The second item is Reso B Capital Budget,
5 which is the Capital Budget as amended by Reso A.

6 The third item is the resolution adopting
7 the Contract Budget.

8 The fourth item is a resolution adopting
9 the expense and revenue budgets.

10 The fifth item is the resolution to
11 approve the amendment to the Five-Year Education
12 Capital Plan.

13 The sixth item is the resolution
14 approving the 43rd year of the Community Development
15 Program and the 42nd year of reallocations.

16 The seventh, eight and ninth items are
17 three property tax resolutions.

18 The tenth item is a resolution approving
19 an expense budget modification.

20 The eleventh item is the resolution
21 approving a revenue budget modification

22 And the twelfth item is a partridge in a
23 pear tree. Nobody is listening. [laughter] I see.
24 The twelfth item is a transparency resolution.

25

2 And the thirteenth through the twentieth
3 item are LU items for today.

4 The other documents in your package,
5 which do not require a separate vote are listed terms
6 and conditions adopted in Fiscal 2017, Schedule C and
7 the borough president's proposed changes. As a
8 reminder to member's, Schedule C is a schedule of the
9 expense revenue and contract budget, and the
10 appropriations for the organizations listed in
11 Schedule C and the Expense Revenue and Contract
12 Budget. We do not vote on Schedule C separately.
13 Council members will have to sign a disclosure form
14 indicating whether or not conflicts exist with any of
15 the groups in Schedule C or Reso A. If any council
16 member has a potential conflict of interest of any
17 organization included, he or she has the opportunity
18 to disclose the conflict at the time of their vote.
19 If you have not yet signed those disclosure forms,
20 staff from the General Counsel's Office will be here
21 to guide you through the process so please see one of
22 them before we vote. As a further reminder, please
23 disclose any conflict you may have with proposed
24 subcontractors that are used by any of the
25 organizations sponsored. These disclosures must be

2 made before the subcontractor can be approved. As I
3 mentioned the staff from the General Counsel's Office
4 are here to assist you with any questions or
5 concerns.

6 I will now speak briefly about the eight
7 Land Use items and the Transparency Resolution. All
8 eight Land Use items are received--will receive
9 property tax exemptions to preserve or construct
10 affordable housing units to the city HDFC program.
11 They are as follows:

12 81 Madison Street in Council Member
13 Chin's District, which will receive a fully 40-year
14 exemption to preserve 20 units.

15 257 West 29th Street and 424 West 55th
16 Street both in Council Member Johnson's district,
17 which will receive a full 40-year exemption to
18 construction 37 and 17 units respectively.

19 100 Madison Avenue in Council Member
20 Garodnick's district, which will receive a full 40-
21 year exemption to construction 18 units.

22 305 East 171st Street within Council
23 Member's Gibson's district, which will receive a full
24 30-year exemption to preserve 9 units.

2 Minford Gardens in Council Member
3 Salamanca's district, which will receive a partial
4 40-year exemption to preserve 77 units.

5 Marine Terrace Apartments in Council
6 Member Constantinides' district, which will receive a
7 partial 32-year exemption to preserve 444 units.

8 Clarkson and Winthrop Gardens in Council
9 Member Mealy's district, which will receive a partial
10 40-year exemption to preserve 101 units.

11 Representatives from HPD are here to
12 answer any questions you may have on the Land Use
13 items. Next, we will have the Transparency
14 Resolution. This resolution sets for new changes in
15 the designation of certain organizations receiving
16 local, aging and youth discretionary funding as well
17 as new changes in the designation of certain
18 organizations receiving funding pursuant to certain
19 initiatives in the budget. Organizations appearing
20 in the resolutions that have not yet completed the
21 prequalification process conducted by the Mayor's
22 Office of Contract--our Contract Services, the
23 Council and other entity are identified in the
24 attached chart with an asterisk. As with all
25 transparency resolutions, council members will have

2 to sign a disclosure form and stated previously,
3 staff from the General Counsel is here to assist you
4 with any questions. Those are all our items for
5 today. We will--we will take now some time. Is
6 there any additional questions from members on the
7 Land use? We've been joined by Council Members
8 Johnson, Minority Leader Matteo, and Council Member
9 Rodriguez. If you have anything to disclose they
10 should be disclosed on the record at the time of your
11 vote. I think we all should have our forms for
12 disclosure. Are there any questions on the Land Use
13 items for today? Any statements on the Land Use
14 items for today? Seeing none, we will ask Billy
15 Martin to roll--call the roll.

16 CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk,
17 roll call vote Committee on Finance. All items are
18 coupled. Chair Ferreras-Copeland.

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I am
20 disclosing on the records of the Council proceedings
21 that Asphalt Green, Inc. is funded in the budget and
22 we are adopting and my son attends classes there, and
23 proudly vote aye.

24 CLERK: Rodriguez.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 18

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] I'm
3 disclosing--

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Your
5 microphone.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I'm disclosing
7 on the record that the Association of Dominican
8 Classical Artists, Inc., Catholic Charities,
9 Community Service--Dominican Cultural--and I don't
10 know if we put funding to the Asphalt, but also
11 Asphalt Green does have three entities that my child
12 attends, and with that, I vote aye.

13 CLERK: Van Bramer.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I vote aye.

15 CLERK: Gibson.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
17 quickly explain my vote.

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: [off mic]
19 Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Than you so much
21 Madam Chair to you and the entire Finance Division
22 for countless hours of so much work in all the
23 hearings. As a member of this committee it's been an
24 honor working with you on yet another fiscally
25 responsive budget, responsible, and I really

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

19

2 especially want to go on record in commending you and
3 your staff for the work for the district attorneys.
4 We rallied, we yelled, and people heard us, and they
5 recognized that we can invest in the NYPD, but we
6 certainly have to invest in our district attorneys as
7 well. So I want to thank you for that, and all of
8 the investments around summer youth and all year
9 round, our culturals, our libraries, ATRs. The list
10 goes on and on, and I know on behalf of my district n
11 the Bronx I am very proud to cast my vote in the
12 affirmative, and I really want to thank all of you
13 guys. And certainly on behalf of Lloyd's carrot
14 cake, which we enjoyed a lot, and that will be coming
15 more. I definitely thank the Finance team. You
16 deserve it, and I hope you get a vacation and thank
17 you all for all the work you've done. I proudly vote
18 aye on all.

19 CLERK: Cornegy.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: [off mic] Aye on
21 all.

22 CLERK: Cumbo.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [off mic] Hold
24 on. (sic)

25 CLERK: Johnson.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

20

2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I'm not legally
3 required to make this disclosure, but I feel like
4 it's important to do it anyway. My boyfriend works
5 at the Crime Victims Treatment Center, which receives
6 money in the initiative to combat sexual assaults. I
7 wanted to just disclose that for transparency
8 reasons, and I vote aye on the Budget.
9 Congratulations.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Oh,
11 Laurie.

12 CLERK: Council Member Cumbo.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [pause] I--

14 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: [off mic]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Sorry Mark.

16 [background comments] [laughs] I am disclosing on
17 the record of the Council proceedings that the New
18 York City Department of Education is funded in the
19 budget we are adopting, and my sisters are employed
20 as teachers with DOE.

21 [background comments] [laughter]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBER: I'm glad I
23 disclosed it. Thank you.

24 CLERK: Levine.

25 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Levine.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

21

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you. I am
3 disclosing on the record of the Council proceedings
4 that Columbia Secondary School is funded in the
5 budget we are adopting, and my child is a student at
6 this school. Do you have a comment on the school,
7 council member.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: They can use
9 it.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Okay, wonderful.
11 [laughter]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: They--they
13 didn't want our people.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: [laughs] And
15 that Friends of New York County Courts is funded in
16 the budget we are adopting, and I am a voluntary
17 Council representative with this organization. With
18 that, many congratulations and I vote aye.

19 CLERK: Miller.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye.

21 CLERK: Rosenthal.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [off mic] I
23 don't think I will thank you for everything.

24 CLERK: Matteo.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you, Helen.

3 I am once again thanking the Finance staff. I've
4 been here a long time, and I see how hard you've
5 worked from when I was a staffer and now as an
6 elected official. So I do want to thank you, and I--
7 it's so just so great I think we need to give them
8 another round of applause. [applause] I also have a
9 lot of kids. So I have a lot of disclosures. So I
10 have--my son is in I.S. 51. We're funding that.
11 Susan Wagner High School my daughter attends, which
12 also has Alumni (sic) which we are funding. My
13 daughter works in the Summer Youth Employment Program
14 and my son goes to UAU camp. My youngest goes to
15 P.S. 29 and we'll be going to P.S. 30 in September,
16 and lastly, my brother works as an E.R. at Rumsey.
17 With that, however, I am voting no on Preconsidered
18 419, no on Reso 1126, no on Preconsidered 1115 and
19 1116 and aye on the rest.

20 CLERK: All item on today's Finance
21 Agenda have been adopted by a vote of 11 in the
22 affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions
23 with the exceptions of 419, 1126, 1115 and 1116,
24 which have been adopted by a vote 10 in the

2 affirmative, 1 in the negative and no abstentions.

3 Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And we
5 would also like to thank the--our legal team, Chuck
6 Davis, who runs around to make sure we have all of
7 our disclosure forms signed. [cheers/applause]
8 Thank you very much. Members, again is this is your
9 packet, the only packet you're going to get. So
10 please keep this close. I'm sure there will be
11 people who want to peak in your packet. I don't know
12 if that sounded well. It didn't sound very good.
13 [laughter] Let's scratch that one from the record,
14 and we are going to be going to Stated in-- [off mic]
15 Do you know when the Stated is? [background
16 comments] So our Stated Meeting is scheduled for
17 1:30 and we've been--we're moving on time. So thank
18 you very much, and congratulations to all those who
19 are benefitting from our Land Use vote today.

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 25, 2016