

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

----- X

FEBRUARY 2, 2023
Start: 10:51 A.M.
Recess: 11:04 A.M.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: CARMEN DE LA ROSA, CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS: ERIK D. BOTTCHER
TIFFANY CABAN
ERIC DINOWITZ
OSWALD FELIZ
KAMILLAH HANKS
RITA C. JOSEPH
JULIE MENIN
FRANCISCO P. MOYA
SANDY NURSE

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: This is a microphone
3 check for the Committee on Civil Service and Labor.
4 Today's date is February 2nd, 2023. Located in the
5 Committee Room. Recording done by Pedro Lugo.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning. And
7 welcome to the New York City Council vote of the
8 Committee on Civil Service and Labor. At this time
9 can everyone please silence your cellphones? Thank
10 you for your cooperation. Chair, we are ready to
11 begin.

12 CHAIRPERSON CARMEN DE LA ROSA: (gavel
13 pounding) Good morning and welcome to today's vote
14 of the Civil Service and Labor Committee. I am
15 Council Member Carmen De La Rosa, Chair of the
16 Committee. It is the City Council's responsibility
17 to conduct rigorous oversight of public sector wages
18 and recruitment to ensure these jobs remain
19 competitive. Public sector employment has long been
20 a source of economic security for women and people of
21 color. City jobs are coveted because they are --
22 they are more likely to be unionized, well-paid and
23 provide benefits and protections for workers. We
24 must safeguard these jobs to ensure that they supply
25 family sustaining wages to New Yorkers. That's why I

2 am proud to support these bills that will increase
3 pay transparency and expand diverse recruitment
4 across Government Intro 541-A sponsored by Council
5 Member Louis and myself would amend Local Law 18 by
6 requiring the Department of Citywide Administrative
7 Services to provide new categories of improvement
8 data for each City employee. This Bill would also
9 expand the definition of agency to capture more of
10 the City's workforce including Department of
11 Education. Finally this Bill would provide the
12 Council pay and employment data year round so the
13 Council can analyze the data at its discretion and
14 provide more robust oversight over the
15 administration. Intro 527-A sponsored by me would
16 require each City Agency that requires applicants to
17 take a Civil Service Exam to report on the metrics
18 related to those examinations. To evaluate and
19 expand diverse recruitment and retention with any
20 City Government. I would like to thank the Committee
21 staff for their hard work in preparing for this
22 vote, Assistant Deputy Nick Connell, Sr., Counsel
23 Malcolm Butehorn, Policy Analyst Elizabeth Artz
24 as well as my staff, Chief of Staff James Burke,
25 Legislative Director Kiana Diaz (phonetic) and COMS

2 Director Fraynette Familia. I will now turn it
3 over to Council Member Louis to give remarks on her
4 Bill.

5 FARAH LOUIS: Good morning and thank you
6 Chair De La Rosa for your leadership and support
7 through this process. I'm excited to join Speaker
8 Adams, Chair De La Rosa and Members of the Civil
9 Service and Labor Committee to advance a piece of
10 Legislation today which will bring New York City one
11 step closer to its goal of being a place where people
12 can live, work and thrive equitably. Today the
13 Council will be voting on Intro 541-A which will
14 amend local law 18 and build on its ability to dig
15 into disparities we still see in New York City
16 Government pay. This amendment is the next step in
17 how we achieve pay equity for the City's essential
18 and diverse workforce. New York City has been on a
19 pay equity journey for some time now. In 2019, City
20 Council passed Local Law 18 which began the process
21 of collecting data to understand pay disparities
22 within the City's workforce. What we found is that
23 New York City has some work to do. Women of color
24 that are City employees still make 73 cents to the \$1
25 that their male colleagues make. New York City's men

2 of color employed by the City of New York make 79
3 cents for every \$1 made by their white counterpart.

4 And you better believe that female employees of color
5 are still getting the short end of the intersectional
6 stick which black women making an appalling 69 cents
7 on the dollar when compared with their white male
8 counterparts. We still have work to do. These

9 numbers represent the non-adjusted pay data. The
10 adjustment tells us that the occupational segregation
11 is the driving force for pay and equity across New
12 York City municipal workforce. I don't need to tell
13 you that this is unacceptable because we know it is.

14 We have been having the conversation about pay equity
15 for many, many years. Talking about it is not
16 solving the problem. These disparities exist across
17 sectors, employs in red states and in blue states.

18 We need data. We need action on what the data tells
19 us. Anything less than that is lip service and we
20 are tired of lip service. So here is how the Bill
21 works. Introduction 541-A will require the

22 administration to provide additional reporting
23 metrics to the Council to enable us to dive deeper
24 into the quadrant of pay disparities that were
25 exposed in Local Law 18. Since 2019, the Council has

2 only had access to this pay data for 90 days. That
3 has limited the type of analysis we have been able to
4 do crucial work with for the data that was presented
5 to us. My Bill removed the 90 day window and gives
6 the Council Data Team access to the information it
7 needs year round. Removing this limitation will
8 permit the Council to study pay equity issues within
9 the City of New York's Municipal Workforce ongoing.
10 It sends a message that we prioritize this and it
11 gives us the tools to act and to act fast. Pay
12 equity is the cornerstone of a just society. With it
13 employees face unequal opportunities that harms them,
14 their families and their communities. I want to
15 thank Speaker Adams, Chair De La Rosa for their
16 leadership on this pay equity package and all bill
17 sponsors or joining us on these bills. I
18 specifically want to thank Malcolm Butehorn
19 for his tireless effort to get this bill
20 to the finish line. Thank you so much, Chair.

21 CHAIRPERSON CARMEN DE LA ROSA: Thank you
22 so much Council Member Louis. I will now turn it to
23 the Parliamentarian to call the roll.

24 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Good
25 morning. William Martin, Committee Clerk. Roll call

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

8

2 vote Committee on Civil Service and Labor on proposed
3 Introductions 527-A and 541-A. The items are
4 coupled. Chair De La Rosa?

5 CHAIRPERSON CARMEN DE LA ROSA: Aye on
6 all.

7 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Moya?

8 FRANCISCO MOYA: I vote aye.

9 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank
10 you. Dinowitz?

11 ERIC DINOWITZ: Aye.

12 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Feliz?

13 OSWALD FELIZ: Aye. Congratulations
14 Chair De La Rosa and Council Member Louis and all
15 others.

16 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Caban?

17 TIFFANY CABAN: Aye.

18 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Hanks?

19 KAMILLAH HANKS: I vote aye.

20 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Joseph?

21 RITA JOSEPH: I vote aye.

22 Congratulations to you both.

23 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Menin?

24 JULIE MENIN: I and congratulations to
25 the sponsors.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR 9

2 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Nurse?

3 SANDY NURSE: I vote aye.

4 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: By a

5 vote of nine in the affirmative, zero in the

6 negative and no abstentions, the items have been

7 adopted by the Committee. Madam, Chair, there is

8 one outstanding Member.

9 CHAIRPERSON CARMEN DE LA ROSA: Yeah. We
10 could keep it open.

11 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

12 Continuation roll call, Committee on Civil Service

13 and Labor. Proposed Introductions 527-A and 541-A,

14 Council Member Bottcher?

15 ERIK BOTTCHEER: Aye.

16 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Final

17 vote now on these items is 10 in the affirmative,

18 zero in the negative and no abstentions. Madam Chair

19 that is a full committee.

20 CHAIRPERSON CARMEN DE LA ROSA: The

21 meeting is adjourned (gavel pounding).

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date FEBRUARY 9, 2023