

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

Jointly with

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

----- X

May 9, 2024  
Start: 9:41 a.m.  
Recess: 4:03 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Justin L. Brannan  
Chairperson

Yusef Salaam  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Diana I. Ayala  
Gale A. Brewer  
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers  
David M. Carr  
Amanda N. Farías  
Kamillah Hanks  
Crystal Hudson  
Farah N. Louis  
Francisco P. Moya  
Chi A. Ossé  
Keith Powers  
Pierina Ana Sanchez

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Althea V. Stevens  
Nantasha N. Williams  
Julie Won  
Joann Ariola  
Tiffany Cabán  
Carmen N. De La Rosa  
Robert F. Holden  
Rita C. Joseph  
Christopher Marte  
Carlina Rivera  
Kalman Yeger

Edward Caban  
NYPD Commissioner

Deidre Snyder  
NYPD Deputy Commissioner of Management and Budget

Tania Kinsella  
NYPD First Deputy Commissioner

Jeffrey Maddrey  
NYPD Chief of Department

Michael Gerber  
NYPD Deputy Commissioner of Legal Matters

Michael LiPetri  
NYPD Chief of Crime Control Strategies

Rebecca Weiner  
NYPD Deputy Commissioner of Intelligence and  
Counterterrorism

Bruce Ceparano  
NYPD Inspector at Patrol Services Bureau

Philip Rivera  
NYPD Chief of Transportation at Transit Bureau

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Wilson Aramboles  
NYPD Chief of Special Operations

Ruben Beltran  
NYPD Chief of Information Technology

Mark Stewart  
NYPD Deputy Commissioner of Community Affairs

Michael Kemper  
NYPD Chief of Transit

Chauncey Parker  
NYPD Deputy Commissioner for Community  
Partnerships

Wendy Garcia  
NYPD Deputy Commissioner of Equity and Inclusion

Joseph Kenny  
NYPD Chief of Detectives

Lisa White  
NYPD Deputy Commissioner of Employee Relations

Robert O'Hare  
NYPD Chief

John Benoit  
NYPD Chief of Personnel

Tracy Mulet  
NYPD Inspector at School Safety Division

Robert Barrows  
NYPD Deputy Commissioner of Strategic Initiatives

Paul Gamble  
NYPD Assistant Deputy Commissioner

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

John Cosgrove  
NYPD Chief of Personnel Standards Bureau

Miguel Iglesias  
NYPD Chief of Internal Affairs

Olufunmilola Obe  
NYPD Chief of Training

Carlos Nieves  
NYPD Assistant Commissioner

Terri Tobin  
NYPD Chief of Interagency Operations

Edward Delatorre  
NYPD Chief of Labor Relations

Donald Nesbit  
DC 37 Local 372

Olivia Duong  
Local 3778

Darren Mack  
Freedom Agenda

Kimberly Saltz  
Legal Defense Fund

William Juhn  
New York Lawyers for the Public Interest

Liz Roberts  
Safe Horizon

Robert Wallace

Abdul Nasser Rad  
Campaign Zero

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Sofia Whetstone  
Columbia Student

Bard Cash  
Columbia Student

Joshua J. Shaw  
ACLU

Elizabeth Brantl  
Center for Justice Innovation

Dr. Aztem Gurvich

Alex Brass  
CCIT

Victor Herrera  
Freedom Agenda



COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

7

1  
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning and  
3 welcome to today's New York City Council Executive  
4 Budget hearing Fiscal Year 2025 with the Committee on  
5 Public Safety and Finance. At this time, we ask that  
6 you silence all cellphones and electronic devices to  
7 minimize disruptions throughout the hearing. If you  
8 have testimony you wish to submit for the record, you  
9 may do so via email, [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov). Once  
10 again, that is [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov). At any  
11 time throughout the hearing, please do not approach  
12 the dais. We thank you for your kind cooperation.  
13 Chairs, we are ready to begin.

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you Sergeant.  
15 [gavel] Okay, good morning. Good morning and welcome  
16 to the fourth day of the FY25 Executive Budget  
17 hearings. I'm Council Member Justin Brannan. I am  
18 Chair of the Finance Committee. Today's hearing is  
19 on the New York City Police Department. I'm pleased  
20 to be joined by our Speaker Adrienne Adams and Chair  
21 of this Committee Council Member Yusef Salaam. We've  
22 been joined this morning by Council Members Cabán and  
23 Marte thus far, as well as Hanks. I want to welcome  
24 Commissioner Caban and your team. Thank you all for  
25 joining us today to answer our questions. As a

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

8

3 reminder, this is government proceeding and decorum  
4 shall be observed at all times. As such, members of  
5 the public shall remain silent unless they are  
6 testifying. We'll be taking public testimony at the  
7 end of the hearing today after the NYPD testifies,  
8 instead of holding one long day of public testimony  
9 at the end, we're doing everything day by day. If  
10 you're here today and you want to testify, you're a  
11 member of the public, make sure you fill out a  
12 witness form with the Sergeant at Arms. Before I go  
13 any further, I want to invite our Speaker Adrienne  
14 Adams to give her opening remarks and then we'll get  
15 started.

16 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much,  
17 Chair Brannan, and thank you so much Chair Salaam,  
18 for holding today's hearing where we will examine the  
19 Mayor's Fiscal Year 2025 Executive Budget for the New  
20 York City Police Department. The Mayor's Executive  
21 Budget includes a proposed Fiscal Year 2025 budget of  
22 \$5.83 billion dollars for the NYPD. This is an  
23 increase of \$72.2 million dollars from the FY25  
24 Preliminary Budget, and is \$21.9 million more than  
25 the FY24 Adopted Budget. The NYPD's budgeted  
headcount for the Fiscal Year 25 Executive Budget is



COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

9

1 659 fewer positions than in the Fiscal Year 24 budget  
2 at its adoption. The proposed budget includes a  
3 restoration of \$62.4 million dollars at FY25 after  
4 the Mayor restored the July 2024 and October 2024  
5 uniform academy classes that he had initially  
6 cancelled in the November 2023 Financial Plan. Each  
7 class is expected to include 600 new officers and two  
8 other academy classes planned for fiscal year 2025  
9 remain cancelled. As the Council has consistently  
10 indicated, it is critical for the City budget to be  
11 accurate, and for every agency to be accountable  
12 within its budget for our city to be fiscally  
13 responsible. In this hearing, we look forward to  
14 understanding the effectiveness of departmental  
15 spending in the current fiscal year and proposed for  
16 the forthcoming budget year, as well as the decisions  
17 that inform and impact these funding decisions. Over  
18 the years we've remained concerned about the NYPD's  
19 actual spending on overtime, exceeding its allotted  
20 budget each year. As of March of Fiscal Year 2024,  
21 the Department has spent approximately \$788 million  
22 on overtime which is nearly \$271 million more than  
23 the \$517.4 million budgeted for overtime in the  
24 Adopted FY24 Budget. Repeated overspending beyond  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

10

1 the allocated budget raises concerns about agency and  
2 fiscal management and accurate budgeting. The City's  
3 budget must be a reliable financial plan for our  
4 government, and it is important that the NYPD be  
5 treated the same as all agencies within an  
6 expectation to manage spending within its budget. Our  
7 city's fiscal health depends on responsible  
8 stewardship, and it is critical that we deliver an  
9 accurate comprehensive budget that reflects the needs  
10 of New Yorkers and makes our city's neighborhood  
11 safer. Achieving public safety for all New Yorkers  
12 requires an all-of-the-above approach that includes  
13 investments in communities that prevent crime and  
14 address root causes of violence. Our City's District  
15 Attorneys outline this imperative during their  
16 testimony at our Preliminary Budget hearing when they  
17 identify the need for greater city funding for  
18 programs that provide mental health interventions,  
19 housing, economic opportunity, and victim services  
20 and reduce recidivism. This council agrees and  
21 recognizes the importance of these investments as key  
22 to public safety. They help reduce the over-reliance  
23 and strain on our Police Department and its officers  
24 from shouldering responsibilities that should not be  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

11

1 there, helping to allow the Department to maintain a  
2 focus where it belongs. Public Safety is a shared  
3 responsibility, and it is important that our budget  
4 reflects that expectation. We remain focused on  
5 delivering the investments that will improve public  
6 safety for all New Yorkers. Commissioner Caban, we  
7 look forward to hearing from you and your team about  
8 the NYPD's budget and your plans to efficiently and  
9 responsibly manage the Department's budget.  
10 Effective partnership amongst all stakeholders is the  
11 safety of our city-- in the safety of our city is  
12 needed for the benefit of all New Yorkers. Thank you  
13 very much for your time. I now turn it over to Chair  
14 Brannan and Chair Salaam.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, speaker  
17 Adams. We've also been joined this morning by  
18 Council Members Holden, Ossé, De La Rosa, and Public  
19 Advocate. On April 24<sup>th</sup>, 2024, the Administration  
20 released the Executive Financial Plan for FY24 to 28  
21 with a proposed FY25 budget of \$111.6 billion.  
22 NYPD's proposed Fiscal 25 budget of \$5.83 billion  
23 represents five percent of the Administration's  
24 proposed FY25 budget in the Executive Plan. This is  
25 an increase of \$72.2 million or 1.26 percent from the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

12

1 \$5.75 billion originally allocated in the Preliminary  
2 Budget. This increase is largely driven by \$62.4  
3 million to restore the NYPD Academy classes that were  
4 cancelled in the FY24 November Plan. I'll take this  
5 time to note that the Administration's whiplash  
6 approach to cutting and restoring funding is  
7 destabilizing, and as we negotiate the final budget  
8 in good faith, it's important that we're all  
9 operating with the same set of facts. In the  
10 Council's Preliminary Budget response, we continue to  
11 push the progress we've made in prior years to  
12 increase transparency in the Department budget  
13 calling on the Administration to add additional units  
14 of appropriation to the NYPD budget to match its  
15 functional program areas. No such U of A's were  
16 included in the Executive Budget, and the Council  
17 continues and will continue to insist on expanding  
18 transparency and agency operations on taxpayer  
19 spending. My questions today will largely focus on  
20 subway safety, the police radio encryption, school  
21 safety agents, overtime budgeting, pension increases,  
22 and the FY24 general increase. I now want to turn it  
23 to my Co-chair for this hearing today, Chair of the  
24  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

13

3 Public Safety Committee, Council Member Salaam, for  
4 his opening statement.

5 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Good morning. May  
6 the peace, mercy, and blessing from the owner of  
7 peace, mercy and blessing be upon each and every one  
8 of you. Welcome to the Fiscal Year 2025 Executive  
9 Budget hearing for the Committee on Public Safety. I  
10 am Council Member Yusef Salaam, Chair of the  
11 Committee on Public Safety. Today, we will discuss  
12 the fiscal year 2025 Executive Budget for the Police  
13 Department to understand the Administration's budget  
14 proposals for an agency that plays an important role  
15 in public safety. I would like to welcome the  
16 Commissioner Caban and his executive staff. In the  
17 Fiscal Year 2025 Executive Plan, the Police  
18 Department's budget totals \$5.8 billion that supports  
19 48,844 budgeted uniform and civilian positions. This  
20 plan includes large changes to NYPD's budget,  
21 including PEG restorations for uniform Academy  
22 classes, increases to the overtime budget and various  
23 other adjustments, new needs, and the changes to the  
24 Capital Commitment Plan. There are many important  
25 budget actions in this plan and we hope to better  
understand them after this hearing. I look forward

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

14

3 to our fruitful conversation with ongoing oversight  
4 hearings. However, we have a lot of work ahead of us  
5 today. I want to thank our Public Safety Committee  
6 Staff for their hard work, our Financial Analyst,  
7 Owen Kotowski, Policy Analyst, Chad Benjamin,  
8 Counsel, Jeremy Whiteman, and Senior Counsel Josh  
9 Kingsley. I also want to thank my staff, Chief of  
10 Staff Jordan Wright, and Budget Director Mufazzal  
11 Hossain. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Chair.

13 Before we get started, quickly, I want to thank Jack  
14 Storey and Owen Kotowski from the Council Finance  
15 team for preparing for today's hearing. There's a  
16 lot of people that work very hard behind the scenes  
17 crunching the numbers this time of year and we want  
18 to recognize them. My Committee Counsel Mike Twomey,  
19 my Senior Advisor John Yedin, and now I'm going to  
20 turn it over to the Public Advocate for his opening  
21 statement, and then we're going to swear in the  
22 witnesses.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you, Mr.

24 Chair. Thank you to both Chairs and the Speaker for  
25 giving me the opportunity. My name is Jumaane  
Williams, Public Advocate of the City of New York.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

15

1 I'm happy to speak at this important hearing. The  
2 NYPD is by far the biggest and most expensive Police  
3 Department in the country and is often called for  
4 social service functions that are not appropriate.  
5 The NYPD is often called to address issues of  
6 homelessness and mental health crisis. We know that  
7 dispatching police to remove people perceived as  
8 being homeless or experiencing symptoms of mental  
9 health and acute mental illness hasn't worked long-  
10 term in the past, and that we must invest in non-  
11 police responses to people in mental health crisis to  
12 address those in crisis and to help address substance  
13 abuse. The fatal consequence of what happened when  
14 police responded to a person in mental health crisis  
15 was exemplified in March, again, when 19-year-old  
16 Rizario [sp?] called 911 while in emotional distress.  
17 As revealed in recent released body-cam footage, the  
18 responding officers tasered, and then Rizario-- and  
19 then shot Rizario five times within three minutes of  
20 their arrival, offering no help or attempting to de-  
21 escalate, killing him, and most recently the PD has  
22 been called quickly to forcefully respond to protests  
23 on campuses. In the past few weeks we have seen  
24 aggressive policing and quickly called on college  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

16

1  
2 campuses in the City in response to student  
3 encampments, calling attention to the ongoing  
4 violence against Palestinians in Gaza. Many  
5 students, faculty, members of the media, legal  
6 observers, and bystanders have described and witness  
7 unnecessary aggression by the NYPD against  
8 individuals who are not resisting arrest. It does  
9 seem that the scale and quickness of the police  
10 responses to the encampments are not proportional to  
11 what has been going on there. I am concerned that  
12 interactions between the pro-Palestinian protestors  
13 and the NYPD will continue to escalate. Further,  
14 yesterday CCRB announced that nearly 40 NYPD officers  
15 are facing allegations of misconduct connected to  
16 protests surrounding the war on Gaza. I'd be remiss  
17 if I didn't say I believe some of the aggression is  
18 because the Mayor and others do not like the voices  
19 of Pro-Palestinian being risen up, and I'm hoping  
20 that we'll take into consideration so that we can  
21 lower the temperature when these protests are  
22 happening. I'd also be remiss if I didn't say that  
23 the Mayor has yet to mention Palestine or Gaza or a  
24 cease fire since October, and I think it's troubling  
25 not to lift up the pain of everybody in this city.



COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

17

1  
2 The CCRB has been continuously underfunded by the  
3 City making it more difficult and in some cases  
4 impossible for the agency to provide oversight of the  
5 NYPD. Starting in January of this year, the CCRB has  
6 stopped investigating several categories of  
7 allegations due to budget cuts. An increasing number  
8 of complaints, 50 percent increase from 2022 to 2023  
9 has outpaced a number of CCRB staff resulting in  
10 backlogs and delayed investigations. At the  
11 Preliminary Budget hearing, the CCRB said they  
12 require 73 additional investigators and 376 total  
13 personnel to manage the current workload with a total  
14 of \$37.7 million budgeted. With the CCRB budget and  
15 its inability to impose its disciplinary  
16 recommendations and its lack of direct access to  
17 body-cam footage, the NYPD operates almost entirely  
18 without oversight. I do know that NYPD has an MOU to  
19 hopefully get the CCRB that footage a little bit  
20 quicker. This is not only unacceptable, but also  
21 could be dangerous. I also want to point out, it has  
22 a chilling effect that it seems the Mayor now wants  
23 to replace Chair Arva Rice for lifting up the issues  
24 and concern about the money needed for CCRB and for  
25 the pushback on the response of Kowaksi Traurig

1 [sp?]. The Mayor's subway safety plan has  
2 exacerbated the police overtime surge. There are  
3 millions of dollars on overtime for police officers  
4 to remove people many time perceived as homeless and  
5 mentally-ill from public spaces or standing around  
6 subway stations. According to the City Comptroller  
7 Fiscal Year 2024, the City has spent \$461 million  
8 through December on NYPD uniform overtime, \$109  
9 million more spent from the same period Fiscal Year  
10 2023, and is on target to spend \$925 million for the  
11 year. For 2022 to 2023 police overtime spending  
12 increased from \$4 million to \$155 million. There's  
13 an article that show that number of subway crimes  
14 stayed about the same and actually decreased in the  
15 areas outside of the subway. I do know there's a  
16 decrease that's happening now and some additional  
17 money has been put it. I would say it seems that the  
18 service of the Police Department are the only thing  
19 that we are able to continue to say the only thing we  
20 need to do is add more money and add more of to solve  
21 the problem. I always try to point out how it might  
22 look if we had the same approach to other agencies  
23 and other programs and relieve the NYPD of some of  
24 the social services that it's doing. Lastly, I want  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

19

1 to say it's also vital to adequately and robustly  
2 fund our Public Defender services. While free legal  
3 defender services for anyone who needs them are  
4 mandated by federal and local law, their  
5 organizations are consistently under-funded. It is  
6 low-income New Yorkers who ultimately face the  
7 consequences of a budget that favors District  
8 Attorney's offices too often, deprived of the robust  
9 legal representation they need or deserve. In June  
10 of last year, the City Council sent a letter to the  
11 Mayor asking for at least \$195 million for legal  
12 services providers to be added to Fiscal Year 24  
13 budget. At the Preliminary Budget hearings in March,  
14 legal defense providers asked for \$133.5 million in  
15 funding for Fiscal Year 25. However, the proposed  
16 budget for Fiscal Year 25 only increases funding for  
17 City-supported lawyers by \$46 million. City budget  
18 must ensure a high standard of quality legal  
19 representation for low-income New Yorkers. Thank you  
20 very much, and I hope that we all can agree we have  
21 to support our law enforcement to do the work that  
22 they are supposed to be doing, and most helpful thing  
23 to do that is stop asking them to do everything, and  
24

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

20

1 hopefully join together getting funds to agencies and  
2 programs that it can support. Thank you very much.

3  
4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Public  
5 Advocate. We've also been joined on Zoom by Council  
6 Members Moya, Ariola. Here in person, Louis,  
7 Restler, and Ayala. And I'm now going to turn it  
8 over to the Committee Counsel to swear in our  
9 witnesses.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Good morning. Do you  
11 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing  
12 but the truth before this committee and to respond  
13 honestly to Council Member questions? Commissioner  
14 Caban? First Deputy Commissioner Kinsella? Chief of  
15 Department Madrey? Deputy Commissioner Gerber?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: I do.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner  
18 Snyder?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: I do.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief LiPetri?  
21 Deputy Commissioner Weiner? Bruce Ceparano? Chief  
22 Rivera? Chief Aramboles? Chief Beltran? Deputy  
23 Commissioner Stewart? Chief Kemper?

24 CHIEF KEMPER: I do.  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE 21  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner  
4 Parker?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PARKER: I do.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Kenny? Chief  
7 LiPetri? Deputy Commissioner Garcia? Deputy  
8 Commissioner White? Chief O'Hare?

9 CHIEF O'HARE: I do.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Benoit?  
11 Inspector Mulet? Deputy Commissioner Barrows?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BARROWS: I do.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner  
14 Gamble? Assistant Chief Cosgrove?

15 ASSISTANT CHIEF COSGROVE: I do.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Iglesias?  
17 Chief Obe? Thank you. You may begin.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. You may  
19 begin.

20 COMMISSIONER CABAN: Okay, good morning  
21 Speaker Adams, Chair Salaam, Chair Brannan, members  
22 of the City Council. Thank you for the opportunity  
23 to discuss the Mayor's Executive Budget for the 2025  
24 fiscal year. As always, it's an honor to share with  
25 you the outstanding work that members of the New York  
City Police Department do every day and why this

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

22

1 funding is critical to our core functions. The  
2 NYPD's mission is simple to state, drive down crime,  
3 and keep people safe. That is our job. That is what  
4 every officer and civilian member of our department  
5 has sworn an oath to do, but fulfilling that mission  
6 and upholding that oath is some of the most complex  
7 and demanding work in our society. Fortunately, for  
8 New York City though, the professionals who do this  
9 work in our five boroughs are among the best in the  
10 world. These are truly remarkable men and women,  
11 people who have chosen to dedicate their lives to  
12 helping others, people like Detective First Grade  
13 Jonathan Diller. As you all know, since we last met  
14 in this chamber, our city lost a true hero.  
15 Detective Diller was a son, a brother, a husband, and  
16 a father. He was also a great cop. Jonathan  
17 represented everything that is good about public  
18 service. A young officer with just three years of  
19 service, he already set himself apart, willing to  
20 help, willing to go in harm's way, willing to do the  
21 job we asked him to do, but in an instance, in a  
22 sudden and senseless act of violence he was gone,  
23 murdered by a career criminal with no regard for  
24 human life who carried an illegal gun and thought  
25

1 nothing of pulling the trigger. Murdered while  
2 protecting the city of our city. This tragedy left  
3 us hurting, angry, and with many more questions than  
4 answers. Should have never have happened. It is our  
5 responsibility to Detective Diller and to the  
6 families of every single member of our department to  
7 make sure it never happens again. That is our solemn  
8 vow. And that means continue the work that Jonathan  
9 started, fighting crime, reducing violence, and  
10 ridding our streets of illegal guns. We are honored  
11 to carry on that work in Jonathan's name, and every  
12 day your NYPD officers are building on a tremendous  
13 legacy of those we have lost, and our efforts of  
14 making a difference and the data speaks for itself.  
15 So far this year, violent crime in New York City  
16 continues to fall. Compared to the same time last  
17 year, 2023, murders are down nearly 16 percent.  
18 Burglaries are down more than 12 percent, and total  
19 major felony crime has fallen around three percent.  
20 At the same time, major felony arrests are up another  
21 10 percent, extending a 26-year high, and major crime  
22 is down in all areas of the City from neighborhood  
23 precincts, to public housing, to our transit system.  
24 Our officers are addressing the community's public  
25

1 safety needs at every level. And as we have said  
2 from the beginning of this Administration, our focus  
3 remains on ending gun violence and protecting the  
4 lives of New Yorkers. To that end, both the number  
5 of shooting incidents and victims has continued to  
6 decline in 2024, prolonging the downward trend we  
7 have seen over the past two years. Shooting incidents  
8 have been reduced by about 17.5 percent, while  
9 victims have been declined around 17.6 percent, and  
10 these are much more than numbers; they are lives  
11 saved. Fewer victims of gun violence means fewer  
12 shattered families, and that is why the only  
13 acceptable number of shootings in our city will  
14 always be zero. We are not there yet, but your NYPD  
15 officers are out there in every neighborhood,  
16 changing our city for the better. So far this year,  
17 they have taken more than 2,300 illegal guns off our  
18 streets and out of the hands of violent criminals.  
19 Add this incredible work done since 2022 and this  
20 Administration has seized nearly 16,000 guns. Every  
21 gun we take makes our neighborhood safer, and we'll  
22 never again be used to harm another innocent person.  
23 So from our sector cops, Field Intelligence Officers,  
24 the Gun Violence Suppression, Detective Bureau, our  
25



COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

25

1  
2 Community Response Teams, and so many more, we are  
3 all united in this effort and relentless in this  
4 work. The people we serve demand it. They deserve  
5 it, and their cops are doing everything they can to  
6 deliver it. The same goes for our City subways. New  
7 York's transit system is the largest in the nation  
8 with a fleet of nearly 6,700 train cars running  
9 through more than 470 stations across 665 miles of  
10 mainland track. The system has about four million  
11 daily, which for context, is greater than the  
12 population of Los Angeles, and every single one of  
13 them deserves to be safe. So whenever there is an  
14 uptick in transit crime, our department will respond,  
15 and that is exactly what we did. We deployed  
16 thousands of additional cops into the system every  
17 day, on top of the amazing work done by our Transit  
18 Bureau personnel. These officers conduct train runs,  
19 platform sweeps, station inspections. They're posted  
20 at turnstiles and other points of entry, and their  
21 presence not only makes our system safer, it makes  
22 our riders feel safer, too. And now faced by double-  
23 digit reductions over the past few months, crime in  
24 our transit system is down more than four percent for  
25 this year. We are committed to turning this around

1 and there's no real mystery how. It is all about the  
2 cops. None of this happens by accessible. It is the  
3 direct result of the unmatched dedication of your  
4 NYPD officers. They truly are the very best, and the  
5 work they are doing in the face of today's many  
6 challenges is further proof of that. These days our  
7 world is more connected than ever before, and once  
8 again, we are seeing how events halfway around the  
9 globe have a direct impact on New Yorkers. we are  
10 dealing with international conflicts, weekly mass  
11 protests, the dual threats of domestic and  
12 international terrorism, and housing and services for  
13 new migrants, to name a few, and all this is on top  
14 of the day-to-day job of fighting traditional crime  
15 in the largest city in the nation. This directly  
16 impacts our personnel and patrol resources which then  
17 affects every other element of our work. Despite  
18 this, your cops are always out there wherever and  
19 whenever they are needed. It should be clear that  
20 the NYPD fully supports the constitutional right to  
21 peaceful protest, but we will never tolerate assaults  
22 on our officers, destruction of property public or  
23 private, or disruption of emergency services, and  
24 anyone who uses the cover of peaceful demonstration  
25

1 to mask criminal behavior will be held accountable.  
2  
3 Why? Because we have a sworn duty to ensure that all  
4 New Yorkers can exercise their constitutional right  
5 to free speech. Our job is to protect that right,  
6 but it is also our duty to protect the rights of  
7 residents trying to get around their neighborhood,  
8 the rights of small businesses to operate safely, and  
9 the rights of people to get to work, school, and  
10 anywhere else they need to be. The vast majority of  
11 protestors understand this and we work closely with  
12 them on a daily basis to ensure that their voices are  
13 heard, that they are protected while exercising those  
14 rights, and that the needs of their neighbors are  
15 respected. It is all a part of providing the highest  
16 levels of public safety for anyone and everyone in  
17 our city, and again, it does not happen by chance.  
18 It is the cops out there doing the work 24/7. They  
19 are the constant. They drive positive change, and  
20 they keep our city safe. More than 90 percent of our  
21 Department's budget is allocated to personnel and  
22 that is very purposeful. It may be a cliché, but it  
23 is no less true. You get what you pay for, and part  
24 of what you pay for is one of the most diverse Police  
25 Departments in the country. With every new class of

1  
2 police recruits, the NYPD is looking more and more  
3 like the people and the communities we serve from  
4 recruits to bureau chiefs. Our officers come from  
5 every corner of the world. They are the children of  
6 immigrant families, and often times, they're  
7 immigrants themselves. They speak hundreds of  
8 different languages, represent all races and  
9 ethnicities and span many religions, cultures, and  
10 creed. In every way our cops reflect the people they  
11 protect, and more and more our officers are New  
12 Yorkers themselves. Since I became Police  
13 Commissioner in 2023, 70 percent of our recruit hires  
14 are City residents, and this matters because no one  
15 knows the neighborhood better than the people who  
16 live, work, and visit here, and I promise you, as  
17 long as my team's in place, this commitment to  
18 diversity in our ranks will never change. Our  
19 ability to recruit and maintain this diversity stems  
20 directly from our community engagement efforts which  
21 has never been more valuable to the work we do. From  
22 our schools to our senior centers, the NYPD is  
23 heavily invested in programs designed to bring police  
24 and the people they serve closer together. Our  
25 relationship with the public must be strong, and it

1 must be open and honest. So at every level of our  
2 department we work to communicate and keep lines of  
3 dialogue open. After all, public safety is a shared  
4 responsibility. We are all in this together, and I  
5 know the members of this council understand that, and  
6 we truly appreciate the ways you support the men and  
7 women of the NYPD. Taking a closer look at the  
8 figures when it comes to the Mayor's Executive  
9 Budget, the NYPD's Fiscal Year 2025 Expense Budget is  
10 approximately \$5.8 billion where \$5.3 billion or 92  
11 percent allocated for personnel costs. The remaining  
12 \$446 million or eight percent is dedicated to non-  
13 personnel costs including technology that provides  
14 offices with immediate access to critical safety  
15 equipment, tools, and applications. Our agency  
16 authorized headcount is 48,844 positions of which  
17 35,001 are uniformed members of the service and  
18 13,843 are civilian. A key highlight of the  
19 Executive Financial Plan for the Department was the  
20 restoration of two additional recruit classes out of  
21 the five classes that were reduced in the November  
22 Financial Plan. The NYPD is still down approximately  
23 eight percent from our pre-COVID active uniform  
24 headcount, and the reinstatement of these July and  
25

1  
2 October 2024 classes will help us offset attrition  
3 and keep driving down crime in the City. Another key  
4 addition to the Department's budget for Fiscal Year  
5 2024 was the \$160 million overtime funding, primarily  
6 for migrant shelter security, enhanced transit  
7 safety, and deployment to protests. These are  
8 unprecedented events which no one could have planned  
9 for, and as a result, spending for these activities  
10 is outside of our adoption financial plan baseline.  
11 We are closely monitoring these figures internally  
12 with the Office of Management and Budget on a month-  
13 to-month basis. Other changes to the Financial Plan  
14 include approximately \$28 million for support and  
15 licensing cost for critical IT infrastructure, \$9  
16 million for auto costs to make critical repairs to  
17 our fleet, out-year funding for new leases for  
18 Detective Bureau functions, and collective bargaining  
19 and managerial wage increases. And at the start of  
20 my testimony I talked about how challenging our work  
21 can be and that is certainly true, but no matter the  
22 challenge, the NYPD will always work to find a  
23 solution. At the end of the day, there's a thread  
24 running through all of this. It's not policy  
25 innovation. It's not cutting-edge technology. It is

1 not updated procedure. It is the cops. It is the  
2 officer on patrol, on post working in our  
3 communities. It is the people who have made a very  
4 important choice to dedicate their lives to the  
5 service of others, and it is an undisputed fact that  
6 our city is safer because of them. This may sound  
7 simple in theory, incredibly complex in practice, but  
8 what is not difficult to undersee or understand,  
9 because it's right there in front of you every day,  
10 is the commitment our officers have to the people of  
11 this city. The NYPD has been out there for nearly  
12 180 years, and we will stay out there as long as the  
13 people of New York City need us. I know our  
14 conversation today will be wide-ranging, but you  
15 should never lose that thread. Our cops make all the  
16 difference, and the best most-effective way to keep  
17 New York City safe is a fully-staffed, well-funded  
18 New York City Police Department. Thank you again for  
19 the opportunity to speak with you on behalf of the  
20 dedicated men and women of the NYPD. At this time, we  
21 welcome your questions.

22  
23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you,  
24 Commissioner Caban. I'm going to turn it to Speaker  
25 Adams for her questions.

UNIDENTIFIED: [off mic disruption]

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, can we have her removed, please? Just a reminder about decorum in this hearing. We've got a long day here. The squeaky toys that were squeaking, if I keep hearing them, I'm going to ask to have you removed. We're trying to have a government hearing here. There's time later for public testimony. You can sign up to testify then, but until then if you're not testifying, you're not on the dais, I need everyone to be quiet. Now, we've also been joined by Council Members Joseph, Carr, Hudson, and Stevens, and Council Member Nurse. And now I'm going to turn it over to Speaker Adams for questions.

SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much, Chair Brannan. Welcome again to the hearing today. I'm going to jump into everybody's favorite topic. We should just kind of say it in unison, overtime. So let's get right to it. The Executive Plan includes an additional \$160 million for NYPD's overtime cost in the current fiscal year. This addition along with funding added in other plans and through other sources brings the NYPD overtime budget to \$961 million in Fiscal Year 2024, which is approximately



1 15 percent of the agency's total budget. As of  
2 March, the actual overtime spending is approximately  
3 \$788 million or 81 percent of the modified budget.  
4 This is another year in which the NYPD's spending has  
5 surpassed the adopted overtime budget by a  
6 significant margin. At the Preliminary Budget  
7 hearing, the Department explained how it was holding  
8 supervisors accountable for excessive reliance on  
9 overtime by holding biweekly meetings with bureau  
10 heads to identify areas of overspending and patterns.  
11 Yet, the Executive Budget continues the pattern of  
12 adding substantial funds for unbudgeted overtime. Do  
13 you believe your overtime control measures are  
14 undermined by the fact that overall overtime spending  
15 grows throughout the year and remains under budgeted  
16 in the financial plan?

18 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: Good  
19 evening, Speaker Adams, Commissioner Kinsella. So,  
20 you're right to a certain degree. This past December  
21 we were put at reductions over all our bureau heads.  
22 We really focused on three core areas--

23 UNIDENTIFIED: [audience disruption]

24 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, okay.

25 UNIDENTIFIED: [audience disruption]

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

34

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, Sergeant at  
3 Arms, I'm going to ask--

4 UNIDENTIFIED: [audience disruption]

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: If you're not  
6 signed up to testify, I want to clear the chamber.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: [audience disruption]

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. If there's  
9 one more outburst, we're going to completely clear  
10 the chambers today for those who are testifying.

11 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA:

12 Thank you. We really focused--

13 UNIDENTIFIED: [audience disruption]

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: That's it. If  
15 you're not testifying, you have to leave.

16 UNIDENTIFIED: [audience disruption]

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Sergeant at Arms,  
18 can you clear the chambers, please? If you're not  
19 testifying, you have to leave. Thank you.  
20 Commissioner, just give us a sec.

21 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: Yes,  
22 sir.

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you,  
24 Sergeants. Okay, go ahead. Sorry.

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

35

1  
2 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: So,  
3 we really focus on three core areas of our spending  
4 which was arrests, operational, and investigatory.  
5 We have, like you said Speaker Adams, we did put  
6 multiple layers of oversight in place like we spoke  
7 about earlier in the year. However, we're happy to--  
8 as a positive results we are seeing in just three  
9 short months. In all three combined categories,  
10 we've seen a reduction that equates to \$5.7 million.  
11 In arrest overtime we have seen a reduction by seven  
12 percent, and that is due to a more streamlining our  
13 arrest processing time. And then our investigatory  
14 overtime, we have seen a six percent reduction in  
15 overtime. However, their caseload did increase by  
16 18,000 cases. But by far, our biggest reduction is  
17 our operational overtime. In three short months, we  
18 have reduced our budget with the operational overtime  
19 by \$4.1 million. So, Speaker Adams, we are trying to  
20 trend in the proper direction downwards, and for any  
21 further analysis I have Deputy Commissioner Snyder to  
22 answer the questions.

23 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: So, good  
25 morning, Speaker Adams, Chair Salaam, Chair Brannan.

1  
2 I look forward to answering your budget questions  
3 today in my very new role. So I watched the Exec  
4 hearing. I'm listening to your testimony. I think  
5 some distinctions need to be made in our overtime  
6 budget framework so we can have some insight and real  
7 conversations. So, the first thing I want to clarify  
8 is that we're on the same page with spend. You  
9 mention \$788 million in your testimony. We show \$792  
10 million at the end of the March. For the adoption  
11 budget, uniform and civilian is \$554 million. Uniform  
12 only is \$513. So I just want to make those  
13 clarifications. So, financially, the Department looks  
14 at its overtime budget in three parts. The first is  
15 our core overtime. That's arrests, investigations,  
16 operational, our crime lab, all of those core  
17 operations of the Department. And our overtime  
18 budget supports that historically. It's for those  
19 things. It's City tax levy. And right now, our  
20 fiscal year to-date spend is 62 percent or \$493  
21 million dedicated to that part. The second part  
22 which the adoption budget does not include is all of  
23 our grant and reimbursable overtime. That budget for,  
24 you know, federal, state, other categorical intra-  
25 city, that gets loaded over the year, and it's not

1 City tax levy, so you don't see that at the beginning  
2 of the year. So, Fiscal Year 24, to-date, that  
3 represents 14 percent or \$113 million of overtime.  
4 That is not a city tax levy burden. The third part  
5 which I think is really important and where we're  
6 seeing the adjustments in the Financial Plan is the  
7 under-- excuse me-- the unfunded overtime projects,  
8 if you will for lack of a better work, asylum-seeker  
9 coverage, enhanced transit, protests, unplanned  
10 events. That's spend that was never baked into our  
11 historical adopt baseline. So what we're doing is  
12 we're on a month-to-month basis meeting with OMB and  
13 their incrementally looking at that spend and putting  
14 it in the budget, and those are some of the  
15 transactions that you see. That under-funded and  
16 unfunded overtime part represents almost a quarter of  
17 our spending this year, or \$186 million, and we can  
18 go into that in more detail. So the clarification we  
19 want to make is 40 percent of our overtime spending  
20 this year is not included in our Adopted Budget. So  
21 I don't think your questions was answered last  
22 hearing, and I'm hoping that clarified things for  
23 you. So, some other things we should mention. Our  
24 Adopted Budget this year is \$88 million lower than  
25

1  
2 our baseline in FY19, adjusted for collective  
3 bargaining. So that's a challenge. We're also down,  
4 like the Commissioner stated in his testimony, eight  
5 percent in uniformed active staff. That's six  
6 million straight time hours that we don't have this  
7 year that we had in FY19. And we're also down  
8 another 14 percent in civilian active staff for the  
9 same period. So, you know, generally, you know, when  
10 you have mandated shifts and things like that, you  
11 absorb some of that cost on the overtime side when  
12 there are straight time hours go down. So, to add to  
13 what Frist Deputy Kinsella state, we're definitely  
14 committed though in our core overtime budget to  
15 reducing hours. OMB's reduction target to the  
16 Department in the three areas she mentioned is really  
17 to try to push down our FY24 hours under FY23. We're  
18 seeing progress in the first three months. We're  
19 cautiously optimistic. We'd like to see longer data  
20 to see that downward trend. So that's encouraging.  
21 So, we want to make sure we really in more detail  
22 explain the landscape of our overtime so you know  
23 what we're dealing with. Now, to get a look a  
24 spending, a little bit more detail on the spend, we  
25 know it's not a small number. The \$160.1 adjustment

1 in the plan was for incremental changes for some of  
2 those unfunded things not in our adoption baseline.  
3 Areas that have also gone down besides arrests,  
4 investigations, and operational-- our other overtime  
5 has gone down 12 percent this year in hours. That  
6 includes court time for police officers, and also  
7 details have gone down 12 percent. Now, some of the  
8 areas that are up are planned events. That's up 18  
9 percent in hours. Some of that's attributable to  
10 increased coverage in October for High Holy Days, New  
11 Year's Eve, Brooklyn Bridge vendor enforcement.  
12 Unplanned events are also up significantly. That's  
13 for-- you know, we've had an increase the amount of  
14 dignitary visits, and we'll also have the Trump  
15 trials starting in April, right, April spend. And  
16 then lastly, protests are up 600 percent in our hours  
17 and spend year over year. So we're dealing with all  
18 of those challenges. We are working with OMB to find  
19 out what will be our new normal baseline. But also,  
20 you know, with reductions that they're looking for us  
21 to do. So, I'm hoping that really gave us a better  
22 starting point to discuss overtime in more detail,  
23 and if you have more questions on individual spend,  
24 I'll try to answer them.  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

40

3 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you. You have  
4 filled a very, very needed void.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: Thank you.  
6 That means a lot.

7 SPEAKER ADAMS: I appreciate the clarity  
8 very, very much. Along those same lines we're  
9 looking at, as was stated, a rise in events,  
10 different types of events, realizing that does  
11 contribute to overtime. What is-- and I'll guess  
12 I'll shift back to this side of the table for this  
13 response. What is the decision-making process in  
14 determining how many officers are dispatched and at  
15 what level? And when is-- when and how is this  
16 considered overtime versus regular deployments?

17 COMMISSIONER CABAN: I'll switch it over  
18 to my Chief of Department Jeff Maddrey. Before I do--

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing]  
20 Congratulations Chief.

21 COMMISSIONER CABAN: Before I do, just  
22 let me reiterate that since October 7<sup>th</sup>, the NYPD has  
23 responded to over 2,400 protests, and each protest is  
24 unique in its own nature given certain circumstances,  
25



1 certain threat levels. So I'll turn it over to Chief  
2 Maddrey to fulfill the second part of that question.  
3

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you.

5 CHIEF MADDREY: Yes, thank you,  
6 Commissioner. Good morning, Speaker Adams. Just in  
7 terms of how we prepare for planned events and how we  
8 deploy. When we are-- when we become aware of a  
9 planned event, the precinct or the borough concerned  
10 will usually put a plan together. They will make a  
11 request for a certain amount of officers to be  
12 deployed at the planned protest. It comes to down to  
13 my Operations Unit. My Chief Matt Galvin, who's in  
14 charge of Operations, he takes a look at it, and then  
15 he'll bring it to me and we'll go over it and we'll  
16 make a final decision. Since I've been in this role,  
17 we've been cutting down on a lot of our planned  
18 events. We've been saving money at a lot of our  
19 planned events. I think our biggest challenge is the  
20 unplanned events where we're spending a lot more  
21 money. As the Commissioner just said, you know,  
22 we're closing in on 3,000 protests since October 7<sup>th</sup>.  
23 Some of them we're aware of and we treat them as a  
24 planned event. Some we're not aware of and we have  
25 to sometimes hold over members of the service from

1 the day shift, midnight shift, and this is what  
2 causes our overtime to increase. So it's been a  
3 challenge, especially since October 7<sup>th</sup>. It's been a  
4 challenge averaging 12 protests a day. Some are  
5 small. We use very little resources at. Some are  
6 massive and it requires a lot of police personnel to  
7 control.  
8

9 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you. How do you  
10 measure your progress in reducing overtime in some  
11 areas when there are increases that set back your own  
12 control policies?

13 CHIEF MADDREY: I think we look at each  
14 individual category. Like I said, we have arrest  
15 overtime. We have operational overtime. Operational  
16 overtime is just the functions of a precinct, when  
17 officers get held on a late job, when something comes  
18 up and they need to hold additional officers just  
19 operationally. We have our investigative overtime,  
20 you know, a bad scene, our detectives. Our arrest--  
21 those are our main overtime, and we look at those and  
22 we compare them one to themselves. How did we do  
23 last year? How did we do last month? Again, planned  
24 overtime, we look at how we, you know, did the year  
25 before. We have a parade, St. Patrick's Day Parade.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

43

1  
2 How did we do in 2023 versus how we did in 2024? We  
3 look at that, and like I said our biggest problem is  
4 our unplanned overtime which is really skewing our  
5 overtime right now. It's difficult to even compare  
6 that to last year or the year before, because these  
7 are vents. These are not our every-year events. We  
8 know every year events. We know them in advance.  
9 These are different events and they cause a strain to  
10 our department, a strain to our budget. A lot of  
11 them are unforeseen events. So that's how-- that's  
12 what we look at.

13 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: But  
14 we also hold our supervisors accountable as well.  
15 Our ICOs, our precinct commanders, our borough  
16 commanders, the administrators in the boroughs that  
17 are responsible for the oversight of overtime, and  
18 our bureau heads. So every-- biweekly when we have  
19 these meetings, these variant meetings, overtime and  
20 overspending is a huge-- is the topic of our  
21 meetings. So, we've been holding our bureau heads  
22 and all the supervisors involved accountable for  
23 spending.

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

44

3 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you. Do you  
4 anticipate another addition of overtime funding at  
5 adoption for Fiscal Year 2024?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: I think  
7 that's something we're monitoring on a month-to-month  
8 basis with OMB. Protest overtime really is  
9 escalating. Just to give you a sense of scale, and  
10 this is just an estimate. From 04-21 to 05-07 alone  
11 we spent almost \$6 million in protest overtime. So,  
12 I think that we just have to watch that closely.  
13 There's a lot of unknown factors with how much we're  
14 going to spend there. And I think, you know, also to  
15 give some more context, last year we spent about \$7  
16 million in protests, and we're already up to \$53  
17 million.

18 SPEAKER ADAMS: That was going to be my  
19 next question. Thank you for seeing that coming.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: Okay, thank  
21 you.

22 SPEAKER ADAMS: the Fiscal 2025 overtime  
23 budget, we gave the figure. Yours might have  
24 changed, but we \$564 million. This is approximately  
25 \$400 million less than the current Fiscal 2024  
budget. What is the plan to address the fiscal risk

1 of the potential under budgeting and are there plans  
2 to find future reductions and efficiencies?  
3

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: I think I  
5 can explain that simply. A lot of that amount is the  
6 one-year overtime increases you're seeing in just  
7 FY24. That funding was not baselined, so it helps  
8 cause that disparity. We also had some one-time  
9 adjustments for auto parts, IT infrastructure. So  
10 they make it look like the budget drops off the  
11 following year. So it's simply that.

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay. Do we know how  
13 much overtime has spent on planned versus unplanned  
14 events?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: Yes. So,  
16 fiscal year to-date for planned events, we show we've  
17 spent \$87.9 million for 1.1 million hours. For  
18 unplanned we've spent almost \$128 million and--  
19 excuse me. We've spent almost \$13 million and 173,000  
20 hours.

21 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay. Thank you very  
22 much. We're going to turn the page and talk about  
23 public relations and your DCPI budget. NYPD has  
24 recently undertaken several new public relations  
25 campaigns that have raised significant questions,

1 including its use of social media and video  
2 production. This includes the use of official social  
3 media accounts to target public officials and  
4 civilians alike. These posts can often convey  
5 inaccurate or misleading information, and could  
6 potentially incite threats of violence. I use the  
7 word potentially with caution, because they have in  
8 some cases incited threats of violence to  
9 individuals. This conduct is dangerous, unethical,  
10 unprofessional, because included in the Department's  
11 mission is to preserve peace, protect the people and  
12 reduce fear. At the Preliminary Budget hearing you  
13 testified that there are over 250 social media which  
14 are executives and precinct commanders are given  
15 access to so they can inform the public in their  
16 area. In addition, several higher level executives  
17 are entrusted with social media accounts to  
18 communicate with the public on behalf of the  
19 Department. City law prohibits the use of city  
20 resources for political purposes. Using that resource  
21 to issue a statement that an elected official's  
22 stance on how an agency conducts itself is "a  
23 horrifying affront to democracy" and that people  
24 should "seek the change you want by getting involved,  
25

1 then you know what to do..." That seems to be  
2 conveying a political message and potentially even  
3 worse, a message that could be misinterpreted and  
4 lead to threats. In addition, my concern is that  
5 while you may be speaking to one group of New  
6 Yorkers, you are indeed alienating other New Yorkers  
7 whose trust the Department's officers need to help  
8 keep our city safe. As the bearers of public safety,  
9 what exactly is the Department's message in this  
10 post, and how does this post help deliver it or  
11 advance the safety of New Yorkers?  
12

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Good morning,  
14 speaker Adams.

15 SPEAKER ADAMS: Good morning.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Alright, so  
17 a few points in response to your question. First, as  
18 you're aware, there is now a DOI investigation into  
19 these matters.

20 SPEAKER ADAMS: I prompted it.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: I'm aware,  
22 yes. They have contacted us already. We are fully  
23 cooperative with that investigation, and I think it's  
24 critical that investigation be allowed to play out.  
25 On the issue you raised about political activity on--

1  
2 our view on that issue is that the tweet in question  
3 does not violate the law, does not violate the Patrol  
4 Guide. Political activity, I think, is not how we  
5 view that. We view that in a different way. We view  
6 that as part of-- in the context of a debate, a very  
7 significant debate, a very intense debate about the  
8 nature of public safety in the City, the role of the  
9 Police Department, the role of policing in New York  
10 City. I do think that context is important, and I  
11 think that context informs the meaning of that tweet,  
12 and I think it also goes to the questions of whether  
13 or not it constitutes political activity as that term  
14 is defined under the COIB rules and under the Patrol  
15 Guide. That said-- that said, there is a DOI  
16 investigation. I think it's important that it be  
17 allowed to play out. We don't want to do anything  
18 that's going to compromise that investigation. We  
19 want to respect that investigation, respect of the  
20 rights of the people involved in that investigation,  
21 and when that investigation's over, if history's any  
22 guide, DOI will issue a report to the public. I  
23 imagine whatever that report says, the City Council  
24 will want to hear from us, but I do think it's  
25 important and necessary that we allow that



1  
2 investigation, that inquiry, to play out as an  
3 independent investigation as requested by you.

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: No one is more excited  
5 than I am over that inquiry, and no one will be more  
6 excited than I will be to hear the results. Do you  
7 feel that post was appropriate?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Again, we're  
9 going to allow the DOI investigation to play out. I  
10 think that is critical. I don't--

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] Do you feel?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: I'm here  
13 speaking on behalf of the Department.

14 SPEAKER ADAMS: Commissioner, do you feel  
15 that post was appropriate.

16 COMMISSIONER CABAN: As you know, it's an  
17 active investigation. That very-- I might be the  
18 [inaudible] discipline, so at this time, I cannot  
19 comment [inaudible] that speech.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Speaker  
21 Adams, if I may. It is important that that  
22 investigation be allowed to play out in fairness for  
23 everyone involved, whatever one's view on the post.

24 SPEAKER ADAMS: Do you feel the post  
25 should have been deleted?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

50

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Speaker

4 Adams, I--

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] Do you feel  
6 it was deleted improperly?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: I am not--

8 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] Do you feel  
9 it should have come back?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Speaker

11 Adams--

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing]  
13 Commissioner, do you feel that the post was  
14 appropriate and should have-- or should have been  
15 deleted?

16 COMMISSIONER CABAN: It's inappropriate  
17 for me to comment while the process is ongoing.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Speaker  
19 Adams, there is an investigation--

20 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] Did you  
21 instruct the Chief to delete the post?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Speaker  
23 Adams, this is exactly what DOI is looking at.

24 SPEAKER ADAMS: Commissioner, did you  
25 instruct the Chief to delete the post?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

51

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Speaker

4 Adams, respectfully--

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] I asked the  
6 Chief a question.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: I  
8 understand. Very respectfully-- Speaker, very  
9 respectfully, I understand your questions, I do.  
10 This is precisely what DOI is looking at, these  
11 issues, and in fairness to everybody involved,  
12 separate and apart from the substance, it's a matter  
13 of process--

14 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] I think that  
15 that was a very fair question for this hearing, sir.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Speaker  
17 Adams, given the DOI investigation--

18 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] The  
19 Commissioner leads this department, sir.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Yes.

21 SPEAKER ADAMS: I feel that was a very  
22 appropriate question for the leader of the NYPD to  
23 respond to this body.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: It is also  
25 important to respect that investigation. There's a  
process here. As you say, there are accusations

1  
2 being made against individual members of the  
3 Department. There's a process for this. To sort of  
4 short circuit that process at this hearing I don't  
5 think is appropriate.

6 SPEAKER ADAMS: I beg to differ with your  
7 consideration there, and I will continue on my line  
8 of questioning when it comes to the appropriateness  
9 of such posts. Will such posts-- are such posts  
10 today being permitted as we speak?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Speaker, the  
12 DOI report-- the DOI's going to look at this--

13 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] Is that a  
14 yes?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: No. Speaker  
16 Adams, we cannot speak to the issues that are at  
17 play--

18 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] So, as we  
19 are speaking today--

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: [interposing]  
21 the investigation you requested.

22 SPEAKER ADAMS: if this post-- like this  
23 post were to be targeted towards any one of my  
24 members or any member of the press, any civilian,  
25

1  
2 that's perfectly fine as we speak right now going on  
3 your social media site.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Speaker  
5 Adams, we do have some disagreements here about some  
6 of the nature of these posts, we do, and I understand  
7 what you're saying. We have a difference of opinion  
8 on some of these issues.

9 SPEAKER ADAMS: That's not what I asked.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Speaker  
11 Adams, it's very important that we allow DOI to do  
12 its work to look into the very--

13 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] I agree with  
14 you. DOI is doing its work, will be allowed to do  
15 its work. My question was very simple and required a  
16 very simple yes or no response. I am going to-- I am  
17 going to consider that a yes since you did not say  
18 no, that such posts will be ceased or have ceased  
19 since this hearing, before this hearing since the  
20 last one seemed to very, very highly-charged, very  
21 proudly stated. I am going to consider that as we  
22 speak the poster or posters will continue to do such  
23 until they are told not to. What is the current  
24 policy and procedure for reviewing social media posts  
25 made on NYPD accounts?

1  
2 COMMISSIONER CABAN: So, right now, as  
3 you stated, Speaker, the NYPD has over 250 social  
4 media accounts.

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: Yes.

6 COMMISSIONER CABAN: I can tell you over  
7 the last four months there have been over 23,000  
8 social media posts throughout our social media  
9 platform. I give my executives autonomy to speak  
10 directly to the public, and they do that through  
11 social media. I could also tell you that my  
12 executives are very passionate about what they do in  
13 their bureaus, very passionate about the work that  
14 men and women do in this city every day to keep New  
15 Yorkers safe. My Assistant Commissioner--

16 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] Are the post  
17 reviewed before they're posted?

18 COMMISSIONER CABAN: I have my Assistant  
19 Commissioner Carlos Nieves here who oversees--

20 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] Who reviews  
21 the posts before they go up? Who reviewed the post  
22 regarding my colleague before it went up?

23 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NIEVES: Okay,  
24 the-- over the past 10 years, the Department has  
25 embraced the use of social media. Beginning in 2014,

1 prior to that there was basically one voice in the  
2 Department. At 2014, under the direction of  
3 Commissioner Bratton, he wanted all his executives to  
4 be able to address the community and be able to speak  
5 to the community to address their concerns. So, when  
6 a precinct commander has a social media account, he  
7 is the one that decides what is going to go out and  
8 how they're going to inform the community.

9  
10 SPEAKER ADAMS: That's a problem.

11 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NIEVES: Now,  
12 these social media posts are reviewed by members of  
13 DCPI. If there is something that is inappropriate,  
14 we would address it, and on certain cases they've  
15 been taken down.

16 SPEAKER ADAMS: Who reviewed the post in  
17 question from Chief Chell and said that was okay?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Again,  
19 Speaker Adams, these are precisely the issue that DOI  
20 is investigating. We are cooperative in that  
21 investigation. That is exactly the point of inquiry  
22 that you asked for, for them to look at this to  
23 investigate the facts--

24 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] Nobody. No  
25 one reviewed the post that Chief Chell put up.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

56

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Speaker

4 Adams--

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] Nobody.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: these are  
7 precisely the factual issues you have asked DOI to  
8 look into, and we're going to respect that process.

9 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay. Are there currently  
10 any considerations being made to change the current  
11 policy? No, okay.

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: We are going  
13 to look very carefully at what DOI comes back to us  
14 with. There's going to be a report, as we all know.

15 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay. I'm going to take  
16 that as a no as well. How many NYPD agency staff are  
17 there whose primary task is public relations?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: I think I  
19 can help out with that.

20 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: I have the  
22 public relations budget here.

23 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: So right now  
25 we have 86 headcount budgeted for the public  
relations, so in that ballpark.



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

57

3 SPEAKER ADAMS: Do we know what their  
4 responsibilities are?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: I do not  
6 have that detail.

7 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay. Does anybody know  
8 what their res-- okay.

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NIEVES: Yes, the  
10 Office of Public Relations, DCPI, is open 24 hours a  
11 day. So it's staffed 24 hours a day. We have a  
12 Deputy Commissioner, an Assistant Commissioner. We  
13 have several front line supervisors, detectives and  
14 police officers. Specifically, for social media, we  
15 have six individuals that are assigned to handle the  
16 social media. We have a sergeant, a detective, three  
17 police officers, and a civilian member of the  
18 service. They review what the-- all the agency  
19 precinct commanders put out.

20 SPEAKER ADAMS: They do.

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NIEVES: Yes. We  
22 also handle requests from the media. We average  
23 about 36,000 email requests per year, and we deal  
24 with members of the media answering their questions  
25 in regard to breaking news. We offer cover parades  
and protest activity.

1  
2           SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay. Does the NYPD rely  
3 on personnel or services outside of the Department of  
4 public relations, and if so, can you tell us the  
5 amount of each of those contract's payments?

6           DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: We'll have  
7 to get back to you with that detailed information.

8           SPEAKER ADAMS: Do we know whether or not  
9 there are outside contracts at all, payments aside?

10          ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NIEVES: There is  
11 one outside agency. We have a service that documents  
12 all social media posts and they are recorded, so in  
13 case they are deleted, they're always preserved, and  
14 that is not funded by the Department. That is  
15 covered by DORIS, and under OIT.

16          SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay. Thank you.  
17 Outside of body-camera video and surveillance video  
18 monitoring, how many staff are assigned to video  
19 production for your public relation videos, and how  
20 much is the Department spending on PS and OTPS for  
21 public relations video production?

22          ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NIEVES: Okay, we  
23 also have-- under DCPI we had a Creative Services  
24 Unit where we have an executive director and I  
25

1  
2 believe six or seven civilian members that produce  
3 videos for the Department.

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay. How do these  
5 numbers relate-- or how did the numbers-- we don't  
6 have the number?

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NIEVES: I do not.

8 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay, alright, we don't  
9 have those numbers. Let's move onto Columbia and  
10 City College response. On April 30<sup>th</sup> the NYPD was  
11 asked by Columbia University to respond to protests,  
12 and it was also called into City College. Videos and  
13 social media posts of the protests and the NYPD's  
14 responses have raised some concerns with the Council  
15 about the scale and tactics used that night and the  
16 following days, and we'd like to review that. The  
17 Department deployed significant resources to Columbia  
18 and City College. Can you explain the decision-  
19 making process behind deploying the amount and types  
20 of resources that were deployed?

21 CHIEF MADDREY: Yes, I'll explain that.  
22 So, on that particular evening we received the call  
23 earlier in the day for Columbia that day, they want  
24 us to come clear their campus. We sat down-- I sat  
25 down with my leadership team. We put a plan

1 together. We used approximately 6-700 cops to  
2 respond there to deal with the protests that were  
3 going on on the sidewalks and the street to address  
4 the encampments and to address Hamilton Hall that was  
5 taken over by protestors.  
6

7 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay. Did the Department  
8 follow established guidelines for mobilizing the  
9 Department's resources, or were the tactics and  
10 operational decisions unique to this situation?

11 CHIEF MADDREY: They were a little bit of  
12 both. We definitely followed established procedures.  
13 We mobilized our cops in advance. We did roll calls.  
14 We gave everybody specific instructions. I called  
15 chiefs from all over the City to help out to make  
16 sure that we did this accurately and as safe as  
17 possible. You know, I mean, the plan itself was  
18 particular to Columbia. You know, we never moved on  
19 Columbia before, so it was particular to Columbia,  
20 working with their public safety team as well, and it  
21 was done at their request. I believe we did a very  
22 safe procedure in terms of going on there. People in  
23 the streets, we ask them and gave them numerous  
24 warnings. People in the encampments, there were only  
25 a few people in the encampments, and the people who

1  
2 broke into the building, we arrested the people in  
3 the building.

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Chief Maddrey, at our  
5 Preliminary Budget hearing, you testified that when  
6 responding to protests, NYPD starts with the lightest  
7 touch. Would you classify this response that night  
8 as a light touch? Because based on media coverage  
9 and the video that your department made and released,  
10 this response appeared to start with more than just  
11 the lightest touch?

12 CHIEF MADDREY: It may appear to you that  
13 it was more than the lightest touch. We're the ones  
14 that walking into danger, to unforeseen dangers. We  
15 don't know what's waiting for us. We have to go in  
16 there with enough resources and bringing enough  
17 resources also helps de-escalate it. When people see  
18 we have enough resources, they usually will back down  
19 instead of challenging us. We took enough resources  
20 in there. We had to make sure we had ample amount of  
21 police officers to make arrests, to clear buildings,  
22 to perform any life-saving measures if need be, to  
23 talk to people, and I think we did all of that. We  
24 did it precisely, and I think we did it safe as  
25 possible.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

62

3 SPEAKER ADAMS: On Tuesday night, the  
4 NYPD was called to respond to an encampment on FIT's  
5 campus. How did this deployment scale differ from  
6 the response we saw at Columbia's campus, and what  
7 was the decision-making process behind the scale of  
8 that deployment?

9 CHIEF MADDREY: The FIT deployment, it  
10 wasn't something that we were prepared for. We were  
11 actually out there to address another protest, and  
12 then FIT somehow became the focal point. So the  
13 resources that we had there already were used to  
14 address FIT.

15 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay. There have been a  
16 number of protests at colleges which we've seen,  
17 colleges and universities around the City that the  
18 NYPD has responded to. What has been the full cost  
19 of the NYPD's response to these protests, and how  
20 much of this is overtime spending?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: so, I think  
22 for protests in general we have those figures, as I  
23 stated before. Since October, which we really saw  
24 protests over time taking off and started  
25 individually tracking it, we've had \$53 million in  
spend, and 677,000 hours spent. This is \$46 million

1 more than last year. So anything more detailed than  
2 that, we can circle back with counsel.  
3

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you. How does the  
5 site, the size and scale of equipment and support  
6 vehicles used, as well as specialized units deployed  
7 impact the cost of these operations, and are they  
8 supported within the Department's current budget?  
9 For example, the resources deployed at Columbia  
10 differed significantly for the resources deployed at  
11 the New School.

12 CHIEF MADDREY: Yes, so I mean, it was a  
13 different challenge at Columbia. I mean, there was a  
14 building that was taken over that was broken into  
15 that was barricaded. We needed to bring different  
16 resources. All the resources that were brought are  
17 resources we already own. Our Bear Cat, our  
18 Emergency Service Personnel, we-- they're already in  
19 our possession. In comparison to the New School, the  
20 New School we didn't need those special resources.  
21 School personnel was able to let us into the  
22 building. We walked in there and told anyone if they  
23 want to leave, leave, and whoever didn't want to  
24 leave we arrested them and we brought them back to  
25 our processing center. So we didn't-- we weren't

1  
2 faced with the same challenges at the New School that  
3 we were faced at Columbia.

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: At Columbia, just for my  
5 own edification, what were the circumstances around  
6 the lock-down situation, particularly for faculty,  
7 for others that were told to shelter in place?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: If I may?  
9 So that was directed-- as I understand it was given  
10 by Columbia University. I believe there was-- I'm  
11 not sure if it was email or text message that was  
12 sent out by the University to students, faculty who  
13 were on campus to shelter in place. We were aware  
14 that was happening, but that was a message from  
15 Columbia not--

16 SPEAKER ADAMS: [interposing] From the  
17 university itself.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: It was.

19 SPEAKER ADAMS: Not from the NYPD?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: That's  
21 correct.

22 SPEAKER ADAMS: How much has been spent  
23 on deployments to college campuses, and with the  
24 college-- will the colleges reimburse the City for  
25 the cost of increased police presence going forward?



3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: So, for the  
4 campus-specific overtime spending, we would need to  
5 do an analysis and get back to you on that. As for  
6 the reimbursement, I'll defer to Commissioner Gerber.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: That is  
8 something we are exploring. We don't have answer for  
9 you on that yet. Totally understand the ask, and  
10 that is something that we are internally actively  
11 looking into.

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: Has any other institution  
13 besides Columbia asked for sustained presence?

14 CHIEF MADDREY: At this time no. Columbia  
15 was the only one that did ask for it, and we only--

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: [interposing]  
17 I think there-- I may be correct, but there may have  
18 been-- I'm just not sure. There may have been a  
19 request from NYU as well. I don't want to give  
20 inaccurate information, so we have to get back to you  
21 on that, because if memory serves, there may have  
22 been a request from NYU as well.

23 CHIEF MADDREY: But Columbia was the only  
24 place we actually put sustained police officers-- a  
25 request may have been made, but Columbia received the

1 resources, and NYU we didn't put resources on the  
2 campus.

3  
4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay, thank you. Just a  
5 couple of more. I know my colleagues-- I've taken a  
6 lot of your time, colleagues. It's okay? Thank you.  
7 Let's talk about NYPD settlement costs just for a  
8 minute. During the hearings on the Preliminary  
9 Budget, the Comptroller stated his belief that the  
10 City's payouts and settlements from claims be  
11 shouldered by the agency or department responsible  
12 for the claim. He stated that agencies responsible  
13 for the actions that brought about the claim have no  
14 incentive to improve their performance since the cost  
15 of the payouts-- the cost of the payouts do not count  
16 against their budgets. Does the Department believe  
17 that dollars spent on internal discipline, training,  
18 and robust supervision can save the City in the long-  
19 run by limiting the dollar spent on settlements and  
20 claims for misconduct?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: I can start  
22 with that. I think we spend a tremendous amount of  
23 time and resources on I think everything you're  
24 talking about. For example, we have an entire  
25 bureau-- our Professional Standards Bureau, that's

1 what they do in trying to enhance supervision,  
2 enhance-- sort of mitigate problems, prevent problems  
3 from arising, trying to attract these sorts of  
4 issues. So they're doing that. Obviously, there's  
5 an entire bureau that does training, tremendous  
6 resources put into training, an entire Internal  
7 Affairs Bureau. So, I couldn't speak to the dollar  
8 value, but I think those bureaus must be a tremendous  
9 amount of money going into these resources.  
10 Obviously, it's not just about mitigating litigation  
11 payouts, but I would like to hope that those bureaus  
12 doing their job effectively will decrease litigation  
13 payouts over time.

14  
15 SPEAKER ADAMS: What's your budgeted  
16 headcount, your budget and headcount for your  
17 Internal Affairs Bureau, and do you think that it's  
18 sufficient to review all allegations and instances of  
19 misconduct?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: That I'll  
21 have to get back to you on that specific budgeted  
22 headcount for that bureau. [inaudible] I apologize.

23 COMMISSIONER CABAN: Chief of Internal  
24 Affairs who can talk about his headcount.

25

1  
2 CHIEF IGLESIAS: Good morning. The  
3 headcount of Internal Affairs grew by over 300 people  
4 in July of last year. On July 3<sup>rd</sup>, Internal Affairs  
5 took over the investigative units. So our current  
6 headcount is at 653 members.

7 SPEAKER ADAMS: What are some baseline  
8 controls and operational protocols that officers and  
9 executives alike should follow to avoid misconduct  
10 like the type of misconduct that we've mentioned  
11 previously? What are the disciplinary measures taken  
12 for breaking that protocol, and how do CCRB  
13 recommendations play a role in that disciplinary  
14 process?

15 CHIEF IGLESIAS: As far as CCRB's  
16 concerned, they handle FATO [sic], which is force--  
17 Internal Affairs handles serious misconduct and  
18 corruption, right? When you have forced discourtesy  
19 and abuse, that goes to CCRB. If CCRB gets an  
20 allegation that falls into Internal Affairs realm,  
21 they refer it to us. We have an allegation that  
22 falls into their realm, we refer it to them. As far  
23 as controls that we have, and in order to address  
24 misconduct, we get the allegation, the allegation is  
25 processed and assessed. At which point it either

1 goes to one of our groups which is serious  
2 allegations and then that's the reason that we also  
3 took over the investigative units. In order to have  
4 a proper investigation or a seamless investigation,  
5 or the same type of investigation within the groups  
6 and the investigative units-- so, what we found-- and  
7 I'm just going to let you know the reason that it was  
8 done. What we found is that the investigations at  
9 the IU or Investigative Unit process, they were  
10 assigned to each borough and bureau. So across the  
11 City we're seeing different type investigations done  
12 in a different way, discipline laid out in a  
13 different way, so that's why everything came under  
14 the Internal Affairs Bureau. That way we could have  
15 the same type of investigation and assess the same  
16 type of discipline.

18 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you. This is my  
19 final couple of questions. At the Preliminary Budget  
20 hearing we asked what efforts the Department  
21 implements to reduce the impact of settlements and  
22 claims on the City's budget. Your office responded  
23 that NYPD "continually reviews policies, procedures,  
24 and training to mitigate the likelihood of claims and  
25 payouts." What are some specific policies,

1  
2 procedures, and training you've implemented recently  
3 to ensure good office conduct, and do you feel the  
4 current policies and training are sufficient and are  
5 working to deter officer misconduct?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: So, I can  
7 speak to that. Just to go through a few things that  
8 were either-- we've already implemented or are  
9 working on-- think this speaks to your question. So  
10 for one thing, for example, is Compliance Stat [sic]  
11 started this year, and it builds off of Four Stat,  
12 which you know, existed previously, but now it's  
13 looking at a much more holistic view, not just on  
14 force play at issues, but also more broadly on  
15 compliance issues. It functions sort of like  
16 CompStat, but for compliance issues, and it's really  
17 I think a very effective mechanism and I think has a  
18 lot of promise to ensure, really emphasize supervisor  
19 accountability. In the same way that CompStat, we  
20 have supervisors up at the podium being held  
21 accountable in terms of enforcement, here we have  
22 supervisors at the podium being held accountable on  
23 compliance issues. That's really important. Another  
24 thing that we're rolling out soon, we have a Truleo  
25 pilot that we're going to be doing, and that involves

1 essentially AI looking at body-worn camera feeds to  
2 identify problems. It's a pilot. It hasn't started  
3 yet. We're going to have an impact and use policy  
4 that will be going out, a draft one under the Post  
5 Act. So it'll be a lot more information put out to  
6 the public about that. I think that actually has a  
7 lot of potential to help with compliance. We've been  
8 looking at issues in terms of our car chase policy  
9 and ways to improve that and to enhance supervisory  
10 oversight when it comes to pursuits. And also  
11 something else we're working on, we have an Early  
12 Intervention program. We want to do more in terms of  
13 incorporating lawsuit data, or lawsuits or red flags  
14 into that process. We already have as part of that  
15 process flagging situations which the Law Department  
16 declines to represent an officer or there's a lack of  
17 identification. That's actually required under the  
18 court order with the Monitor, but we're looking to  
19 sort of expand that, to try to identify sort of what  
20 would be appropriate red flags to say okay, given a  
21 lawsuit pattern or whatever it may be, this officer  
22 should be incorporated into Early Intervention. We  
23 haven't fully landed on how we're going to do that  
24  
25

1  
2 yet, but that's something that's being actively  
3 pursued now.

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay, thank you. I'm  
5 going to turn it over back to the Chair. Before I  
6 do, just a quick remark. I really appreciate all of  
7 you being here today to offer your testimony. You've  
8 come here in large number, which the council  
9 sincerely appreciates because we need to hear from  
10 you. I will also express my disappointment in the  
11 lack of response to simple yes or no questions that I  
12 asked regarding the situation with the social media  
13 posts. I think that the questions were pretty  
14 simple. Yes or no is pretty simple to respond.  
15 Understanding the investigation that is going on, yes  
16 or no's to my simple questions should have been  
17 answered. My biggest concern, though, is the answer  
18 to this particular question that I asked you, is that  
19 as we sit here today in this hearing, what is  
20 prohibiting the same post from going up to damage  
21 elected officials, media, and civilians at the moment  
22 that we are sitting in this hearing right now? What  
23 is being done to prohibit that or stop it from  
24 happening to cause any more harm to those that are  
25 being targeted and/or spoken about as we sit here



1  
2 today. I am disappointed in your responses. I turn  
3 it back over to the Chairs.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Speaker.  
5 We've also been joined by Council Member Sanchez,  
6 Paladino, Banks, Powers, Rivera on Zoom, and Council  
7 Member Brewer. I'll try to be as quick as I can,  
8 because we've got a lot to do. Just staying on  
9 something that the Speaker just mentioned, and I  
10 think DCPI mentioned that the social media post  
11 really started under Commissioner Bratton. Was there  
12 a change in that policy since then, or is the policy  
13 that existed under Bratton is the same policy that  
14 exists now?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: You'll have  
16 to forgive me. Actually, I don't know what that  
17 policy looked like at the time, so I'm not in the  
18 position to speak to what extent there were changes  
19 in the social media policies since this was years  
20 ago. I'm not sure anyone here was involved in that  
21 policy at that time.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. I mean,  
23 because there's definitely been a change in the  
24 aggressiveness of the approach, right, since Bratton.

1  
2 So, I-- was there a conscious decision to get more  
3 aggressive?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: I think  
5 again, what I would say is to the extent what I think  
6 you're asking about is the recent post, and I would  
7 go back to what I said to the Speaker before, which  
8 is this is precisely, exactly what DOI is looking at,  
9 and they'll have the report. I want to emphasize  
10 again we are fully cooperative with that work, and I  
11 think when that report is done-- that investigation  
12 is done, that inquiry is done, that report is done,  
13 you know, I have every expectation that we'll be  
14 talking about this again. But at this point, I don't  
15 think I'm in the position to answer that question in  
16 light of an important DOI investigation.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Staying on  
18 the overtime budgeting as well as the units of  
19 appropriations. The Council continue to push for  
20 transparency into agency spending and operations by  
21 negotiating every year at adoption. The creation of  
22 new units of appropriation just allows us to take a  
23 closer look at how this money is spent. However, the  
24 overtime spending is centrally budgeted, even though  
25 we received precinct-level overtime spending from a

1 term and condition. So, could you talk a bit about  
2 if the NYPD has precinct-level data on overtime  
3 spending, couldn't we then create a projected  
4 overtime budget for each precinct?  
5

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: I don't see  
7 why that's not possible.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Alright, and  
9 broadly, the FY24 General Budget increased. So, the  
10 FY24 Adopted Budget was \$5.8 billion. Since then,  
11 the FY24 budget has increased by \$732 million to \$6.5  
12 billion of which approximately \$500 million comes  
13 from city funding. I know you mentioned that 92  
14 percent of your overall budget is personnel costs.  
15 So, other than increases to related overtime costs,  
16 could you talk about what are some of the drivers  
17 behind that increase?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: Right. So,  
19 some of the changes since Adopted, which I'm still  
20 getting familiar with-- I know there was the police  
21 officer restoration in the January Plan. That was  
22 for this January and April class. We also have the  
23 restoration in the Executive Plan for July and  
24 October. We have an auto parts increase of \$9  
25 million. We have a substantial amount in overtime

1 which I mentioned earlier, probably \$4-500 million.

2 We have the \$28 million IT adjustments. We also have  
3 an increase of almost \$42 million in the Jan Plan for  
4 the Domain Awareness System. That system is  
5 supported both on City Tax Levy and also federal  
6 grant funding. We've had some lease adjustments as  
7 well. I know there's a lot of transactions in the  
8 November Plan that were savings, so that offset some  
9 of the increases.  
10

11 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: so, the current  
12 FY25 budget is \$5.8 billion which is actually \$700  
13 million less than the current FY24 budget, so then  
14 would you assume that the FY25 budget would need to  
15 be increased as well?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: Well, some  
17 of that is overtime, right? The incremental overtime  
18 for those unfunded projects that I mentioned. We're  
19 doing that incrementally with OMB in just the current  
20 year. So that's our \$400 or \$500 million of that  
21 variance. Then we also, again, have those \$9 million  
22 for auto parts, \$28 million for IT infrastructure. A  
23 lot of that's driven by just one-time funding  
24 adjustments in this fiscal year that was not  
25 baselined to next year.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

77

3 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: What is the  
4 anticipated civilian and uniform attrition for the  
5 current fiscal year?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: So for  
7 attrition figures, I'm going to defer to the Chief of  
8 Personnel.

9 CHIEF BENOIT: Good morning.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Good morning,  
11 Chief.

12 CHIEF BENOIT: So, in terms in reviewing  
13 our attrition, I'm happy to report that we're  
14 actually starting to stabilize in terms of attrition.  
15 As of this morning, we currently have 33,402  
16 uniformed personnel currently working. We-- we are  
17 649 officers below our authorized headcount of  
18 35,051. On a positive front, if we compare 2024 with  
19 2023, we noticed a 45 percent decrease in attrition,  
20 specifically with members of the service that have  
21 less than five years of service. So, just to give  
22 you an example, we lost 936 officers due to  
23 resignation. Almost 50 percent of those  
24 resignations, those officers, pursue a career in  
25 another law enforcement agency. It's noteworthy to  
us, because we've also seen a slight uptick in our

1 request for reinstatements, and probably what's most  
2 noteworthy is that in the first quarter of 2023,  
3 calendar year 2023, we experienced a 78 percent  
4 increase in request for reinstatements. Now,  
5 typically, we generally average between two and three  
6 reinstatements per month. So these are noteworthy  
7 increases, and what makes the 2023 78 percent  
8 increase noteworthy to me, is because that occurred  
9 prior to the announcement of the PBA contract which  
10 was announced in April. So, we're doing well. I  
11 mean, we're below our three year average of  
12 attrition, but you know, with hiring on a quarterly  
13 basis we're basically meeting-- we're treading water  
14 basically. We're fighting our attrition. We have an  
15 upcoming class, you know, thanks to you. We have a  
16 class that we'll be hiring in the upcoming months,  
17 and again, we'll-- it's like a constant struggle  
18 where we have people leave, and then we hire the  
19 class, and we're right back. So we're hovering around  
20 like 649 officers on any given academy class.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So while I have  
23 you, the recently adopted state budget included bills  
24 that many on this council supported granting pension  
25 increases for officers who remain on the job past 20

1 years. So, do you have a number for how many  
2 officers have or are close to 20 years on the job?  
3

4 CHIEF BENOIT: So, I could tell you that  
5 legislation would entitle a police officers with 25  
6 years of-- between 25 years and 29 years of service  
7 would be entitled to the same rights in terms of a  
8 pension for a third grade detective who served for  
9 two years of service at the higher salary rate. Just  
10 to give you a perspective, we currently have 76  
11 police officers that are in that category right now.  
12 We also have as part of that legislation people who  
13 served 30 years or more of service would be entitled  
14 to the same rights, pension rights, as a sergeant who  
15 served for two years at the higher salary rate. Just  
16 to give you a perspective on that, we currently have  
17 53 police officers that fall into that category.  
18 Right now, we have 402 police officers that have been  
19 20 and 24 years of service, but we have 3,114 police  
20 officers that actually beyond-- that are eligible for  
21 service retirement. Now, I know these numbers seem  
22 low, but I think this is just the starting point,  
23 because these numbers will increase over time.

24 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: What is the NYPD's  
25 current hiring status for civilian positions?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

80

3 CHIEF BENOIT: In terms of?

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Is there currently  
5 a hiring freeze for civilian positions?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: So, for  
7 civilians, we are still subject to the two for one  
8 hiring policy with OMB. So generally every two  
9 separations we're allowed to hire one back.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Are there certain  
11 civilian positions where there's a higher vacancy or  
12 a higher priority to fill?

13 CHIEF BENOIT: You know,, the positions  
14 that we like to fill, you know, like for example the  
15 psychologist position, that's a position that is  
16 challenging to us, because there's a need for-- you  
17 know, with our wellness programs and then just trauma  
18 debriefings, the incidents that the psychologist  
19 respond to. To be a psychologist in the NYPD is a  
20 little bit unique because many of them serve on-call.  
21 They're on-- they serve on an on-call capacity for  
22 trauma debriefing. If there's a catastrophic  
23 incident they're out there to provide support to not  
24 just our members of the service, but the families  
25 that may be affected by an incident. So, we noticed  
that it's challenging and you know, to be competitive



COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

81

1 with the private sector, we tend to pay a little bit  
2 less than the private sector, so that's a constant. I  
3 would say that that is a position that we have  
4 difficulties in, you know, trying to attract people  
5 to do this type of work. I think because of the on-  
6 call schedule, remote work options. Like, these are  
7 the issues that I get based on the feedback of me-- I  
8 read all the resignations, and I like to see what  
9 people report when they leave, and I-- these are the  
10 things that I see regularly. It's salary,  
11 competitive salary, and resignations-- excuse me,  
12 work-- remote work options. Another thing I want to  
13 point out is the information technology positions are  
14 positions that are challenging, because the private  
15 sector is very competitive in terms of salary. They  
16 offer, you know, remote work options. They're just  
17 a-- with cyber security and the need to have like a  
18 robust cyber security program, it's difficult to find  
19 highly talented and credentialed people because of  
20 the competitive nature of the salaries. And again, I  
21 look at all of the resignations, and we've had about  
22 928 civilians who resigned. Believe it or not,  
23 several of them resigned to become police officers,  
24 but the ones that I focus on very closely are the  
25

1  
2 ones that have agency ramifications, specifically the  
3 IT positions and the psychologist positions.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: What about 911  
5 dispatchers?

6 CHIEF BENOIT: So, 911 dispatchers--

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Are they included in  
8 your civilian count?

9 CHIEF BENOIT: Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Is there still a  
11 two-for-one hiring freeze on dispatchers?

12 CHIEF BENOIT: Well, I can't speak for  
13 the hiring freeze, but what I can tell you about our  
14 police communications technicians, so right now we  
15 currently have 1,356 police communications  
16 technicians that serve the City of New York; 118 of  
17 them are on extended leaves, and that could be from a  
18 military leave to a family leave. We have a-- we're  
19 actively processing 138 viable candidates, and we  
20 expect to have another hire on June 7<sup>th</sup>. But in  
21 terms of attrition with the police communications  
22 technicians, we lost so far this year 87, but I want  
23 to report that 14 of the 87 elected to serve as--  
24 became police officers with this last class.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

83

3 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Thank you,  
4 Chief. Quickly, School Safety Agents, what is the  
5 FY25 School Safety Division?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: So, for  
7 School Safety specifically the PS budget is  
8 approximately \$204 million.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Say it again.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: \$204 million  
11 and the OTPS budget is approximately \$4.9 million.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: so, in December, I  
13 believe, NYPD announced the new position, Assistant  
14 School Safety Agent, would be created to fill some of  
15 the need for School Safety Agent positions in  
16 schools. How will those positions be funded?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: That I'm not  
18 sure yet. We will get back to you.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, because I'd  
20 also like to know what the estimated increase in the  
21 budget would be for those positions. I want to talk  
22 about ghost plates. The Administration recently  
23 announced a multiagency city taskforce dedicated to  
24 removing ghost cars, ghost plates from the streets.  
25 I understand that PD, and I've seen it myself, has  
been performing stings to address the issue. I'd

1  
2 like to know how much is budgeted for those stings,  
3 and what resources have you dedicated to removing and  
4 getting these cars off the street.

5 INSPECTOR CEPARANO: Good morning. I  
6 don't have the exact budget for these resources, but  
7 I could tell you that our citywide response teams  
8 have been focused mostly solely on these ghost  
9 plates, ATV initiatives, and removal of these cars.  
10 Should be noted that in just the fourth months of  
11 this year alone in 2024, we removed 209 ghost  
12 vehicles off our streets. In the entire year of 2022  
13 we removed 10,000. So we're definitely on pace to  
14 surpass that. It should be noted that our  
15 [inaudible] 911 calls in 2023-- I'm sorry, year to  
16 date, we have 323 911 calls, and last year at this  
17 time we had 812 911 calls for roving [sic] bans  
18 [sic]. so the removal of these ATV and ghost cars is  
19 definitely giving what the public wants, because our  
20 911 calls and 311 calls in regards to these roving  
21 bands have sufficiently been decreased.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Do you have a sense  
23 of how much revenue we're losing every year to ghost  
24 plates?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

85

3 CHIEF RIVERA: I have that answer. Chief  
4 Rivera, Chief of the Transportation Bureau. So we've  
5 been doing operations on some of the major  
6 thoroughfares into New York City. We've done  
7 operations-- we've done 10 operations since March  
8 5<sup>th</sup>, and just at these locations we've made 131  
9 arrests, and we're talking about \$3.5 million in  
10 judgements from 514 vehicles that were seized. So is  
11 this just probably the tip of the iceberg. We're  
12 doing these operations now twice a week, and we've  
13 had success wherever we've gone. The good thing  
14 about this is that this is not just the NYPD. This  
15 is a multiagency operation which consists of the New  
16 York State Police, MTA, TBTA, the Sheriff's Office,  
17 and we just recently got on board with the Taxi and  
18 Limousine Commission.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: And how often--  
20 I've seen recently, you know, the big operations at  
21 the bridges or the tunnels. How often are we doing  
22 those now?

23 CHIEF RIVERA: We're doing those twice a  
24 week.

25 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Twice a week.

CHIEF RIVERA: Right.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

86

3 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: And the Sleep Act,  
4 so the Council supported the passage of the State  
5 Sleep Act which allows the police to cite vehicles  
6 with incredibly loud and illegal mufflers and exhaust  
7 systems and increased the fines from I think \$150 to  
8 now it's \$1,000 per ticket. Could you tell us how  
9 many summonses have been issued citywide for the  
10 Sleep Act?

11 INSPECTOR CEPARANO: Excuse me, I could  
12 tell you just the number of exhaust summonses that  
13 we've issued year-to-date, 947 exhaust summonses for  
14 2024, year-to-date. 2023, we issued 2,058 of these.  
15 It should be noted that we have 88 sound meters  
16 deployed in all of patrol service bureau's precincts.  
17 That also actually helps with this enforcement.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So, 947 year-to-  
19 date, exhaust summonses, correct?

20 INSPECTOR CEPARANO: Yeah.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I'm assuming those  
22 are all in Bay Ridge? Okay, last thing for me, and I  
23 think then we're going to take a break and we'll come  
24 back. Mental health removal-- so recently it was  
25 announced that PD's role in conducting involuntary  
mental health removals would be increasing. This

1 included the creation of clinical telehealth within  
2 the Department to support police officers in  
3 evaluating individuals for hospital transport. So  
4 could you give us an idea of has this system been  
5 fully implemented and what other supports are in  
6 place for officers that are now tasked with  
7 evaluating the need for mental health removals?  
8

9 CHIEF TOBIN: Good morning.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Good morning.

11 CHIEF TOBIN: So, under the directive  
12 that we received last year, we began doing  
13 involuntary removals for people who we knew could not  
14 care for themselves. We send them to area hospitals  
15 with the expectation that they will be evaluated in  
16 the CPEPS [sic] at the various hospitals that we take  
17 them to. We have done training for people who do the  
18 removals, and but I want to state overwhelmingly we  
19 take people voluntarily to the hospital. When we see  
20 someone who is in mental health crisis, our objective  
21 is to treat them as an aided case rather than to  
22 criminalize the behavior.

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: How many have you  
24 done of those involuntary removals year-to-date?  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

88

3 CHIEF TOBIN: So, this number is as of  
4 March 31<sup>st</sup>, 2024. We have done a total of 1,719  
5 removals.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Do you have a  
7 dedicated headcount for these programs or programs  
8 like this and B-HEARD? Is there a dedicated--

9 CHIEF TOBIN: [interposing] No, B-HEARD  
10 is not an NYPD program. That is program run by the  
11 FDNY and Health + Hospitals.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: But PD doesn't go  
13 on those runs?

14 CHIEF TOBIN: We do not go on the runs,  
15 but we totally support the program in terms of is the  
16 appropriate agency responding to people in mental  
17 health crisis.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. We're going  
19 to take a break as requested, and then we're going to  
20 resume with questions from Chair Salaam. 10-minute  
21 break. Thank you.

22 [break]

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: If I could have  
24 everyone's attention. Please, we'd like to ask  
25 everyone to please start finding seats again. We are  
going to reconvene in just a moment. Also, a



COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

89

1  
2 friendly reminder to please silence all electronic  
3 devices. All electronic devices turned to silent  
4 please. And again, for those of you who have just  
5 arrived, if you are here to testify, we need you to  
6 fill out a witness slip at the Sergeant at Arms desk  
7 at the front of the room. Once again, if you are  
8 here to testify, regardless if you registered online,  
9 please fill out a witness slip at the Sergeant at  
10 Arms table. Once again, we ask everyone to please  
11 kindly find their seats. Thank you. Once again, if  
12 everyone could please find their seat. We have quiet  
13 in the chambers, please? We are going to reconvene.  
14 Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, welcome back  
16 everybody. We've also been joined by Council Member  
17 Avilés. We've got I think three more folks to swear  
18 in, and then we're going to hand it over to Chair  
19 Salaam.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell  
21 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth  
22 before this committee and to respond honestly to  
23 Council Member questions? Chief Tobin?

24 CHIEF TOBIN: I do.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE 90  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner  
4 Delatorre?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DELATORRE: I do.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Assistant Commissioner  
7 Nieves?

8 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NIEVES: I do.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Turn it over  
11 to Chair Salaam. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Good morning. We  
13 are still in the morning. So I'd like to start  
14 questions in relation to the non-enforcement based  
15 public safety. The police pulled back initiative  
16 with the Brownsville Safety Alliance, a pilot program  
17 from 2021 where police withdrew their regular post  
18 while community-based violence interrupters and  
19 crisis management groups watched over a two-block  
20 zone saw very positive results. My questions are has  
21 the Department considered replicating or expanding  
22 this type of programming to other neighborhoods, and  
23 if not, why?

24 CHIEF MADDREY: Good morning, Chair.  
25 Just really quick, and I'll ask Chief LiPetri to join  
in and Commissioner Kinsella. Yesterday we had a

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

91

1 meeting with citywide CMS groups. We had a very  
2 positive and productive meeting, and we all  
3 committed-- every precinct commander in the City,  
4 most of our crisis management systems were there, and  
5 we committed that we're going to build up our  
6 partnership. We have a great partnership already.  
7 People are trying to say we don't. That's far from  
8 the truth. We have a great partnership. I know most  
9 of our CMS providers, most of the leaders,  
10 personally. We had a great meeting, a productive  
11 meeting. Our commanding officers-- we have new  
12 commanding officers in place. A lot of them were  
13 able to meet with their CMS provider and exchange  
14 numbers, and even our commands that don't have CMS  
15 providers, we've said found out who your nearest  
16 provider is, make sure you have a contact with them.  
17 Let's do some unconventional crime fighting, getting  
18 to young people, working with them. We saw a  
19 terrible event that happened in SoHo, in the first  
20 precinct that doesn't have a CMS site that goes back  
21 to East Flatbush, and the commander for that precinct  
22 connected with the service provider from East  
23 Flatbush to help. So we're definitely going in the  
24  
25

1  
2 right direction with that. I can see the First  
3 Deputy wants to say something--

4 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA:

5 We'll add that we've been working with Councilwoman  
6 Rivera to add a CMS in Bellevue, because what we--  
7 unfortunate circumstances of earlier this week with  
8 our young male. We think that that-- adding CMS work  
9 into Bellevue is going to be a real good job for our  
10 communities. But like Chief Maddrey said that  
11 yesterday-- we had meeting before. It's not just  
12 yesterday. We had meetings a month or two ago with  
13 our CMS workers, and believe it or not, our  
14 commanders and CMS workers work very well in the  
15 communities together. Yesterday was just to talk  
16 about the summer and how we want to continue to work  
17 together to help our youth, because we're seeing a  
18 real crisis. So we're brainstorming together.

19 CHIEF LIPETRI: And if I could just add  
20 as far as the CMS, it's data-driven also. You know,  
21 my office, Crime Patrol Strategies, we share data  
22 with CMS, you know, areas that we think maybe they  
23 could expand to. Maybe they're-- just the catchment  
24 area might be two housing developments, let's just  
25 say, in East New York where we see an uptick in shots

1 fired maybe in the rear of that housing development.

2 So we will share that data with them. And like Chief

3 Maddrey said and Commissioner Kinsella, it is a

4 working relationship, and it's really never been

5 better. There is intel that we share with them also.

6 You know, we do share intel on things that we see on

7 social media, things that we might have connectivity

8 with as far as young gang or crew violence. And you

9 know, again, it's a real good working relationship.

10  
11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PARKER: And if I

12 could just add, Chair. Chauncey Parker. For over

13 two years, we've been working daily with the Mayor's

14 Office, with the Gun Violence Prevention Taskforce

15 which is the Mayor's blueprint to end gun violence,

16 which there's a cornerstone of it-- it is based on

17 the Brownsville community Public Safety Alliance

18 where 73, 75, 76 precinct, 73, 75, 40, 42, 44, and

19 47, it is a partnership of all government agencies to

20 work together to prevent gun violence. In fact, we

21 host the quarterly meeting that they have of that

22 that's hosted in the NYPD's Intelligence Center, and

23 we've been a partner with them for-- working every--

24 really literally every day with it. It's Co-Chaired

25 by AT [sic] Mitchell and the First Deputy Mayor.

CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Turning to Traffic

Enforcement Agents. Fiscal Year 25 Executive Budget includes \$191 million that supports 3,260 positions within the Traffic Enforcement Division. Does the Department believe that automated enforcement of traffic violations such as speed cameras and other technology-- or other technology can be leveraged to reduce the manpower needed in Traffic Enforcement?

And also, could such shifts to automated enforcement serve as a mechanism to overcome historical patterns of racially disproportionate or biased policing of traffic violations?

CHIEF RIVERA: Chief Rivera, Chief of Transportation. So, the one thing with the traffic cameras are that they're fixed. So, we like to be data-- we are always data-driven. We like to focus on the spots where we're seeing most of our issues arise, and then the logistics of affixing those cameras, taking them down to redeploy them somewhere else is not always expedient. They do have their value, you know, certainly in certainly highly-trafficked areas. You know, it's a deterrent, but then once everybody knows that they're there they tend to slow down. There's all kinds of social media

1  
2 apps that alert people to where these objects are  
3 affixed. So we do have a shortage currently of  
4 Traffic Enforcement Agents. We're down 358, but we  
5 do have a class in right now of 114 that's expected  
6 to graduate on July 26<sup>th</sup>. We do believe in our  
7 people. They're very effective when given the right  
8 locations. They're out there not just doing  
9 intersection control, but also addressing the parking  
10 congestion, and I do believe that the Traffic  
11 Enforcement Agents are the best remedy for the  
12 current situation.

13 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: This is not a  
14 question that I've been given to consider, but I was  
15 on the highway this morning headed down to work, and  
16 I noticed that there were at least two-- I don't know  
17 if we call them-- but they were food workers. They  
18 were on the mopeds, and you know, you can clearly see  
19 it said Uber Eats or something on the back of their  
20 thing. And I was just wondering what's being-- how  
21 do we address that where those workers are now on the  
22 highways delivering food?

23 CHIEF RIVERA: So, again, there are  
24 certain-- you know, there's a lot of bike paths  
25 throughout the City. I think-- you know, that are

1 just increasing day by day, and we certainly would  
2 like the delivery workers to be in the bike paths.  
3 We also acknowledge that, you know-- we don't want  
4 those vehicles on the highway. They're not equipped  
5 to be on the highway. There's not-- you know,  
6 they're wearing a helmet that might be bike approved,  
7 but it's not necessarily DOT approved. So when we do  
8 see them, we absolutely do enforcement on it. We've  
9 seized, you know, countless bikes. I think we're up  
10 to 8,000 this year, versus 2,000 earlier. We're  
11 significantly up in mopeds and the e-bikes that we've  
12 seized. But again, I know that the Mayor's Office is  
13 working on a new agency that's going to take a lot of  
14 these situations that we're dealing with with the e-  
15 bikes under consideration, and it's in the planning  
16 stages as of right now. But, you know, there's a lot  
17 of different components that go to the delivery  
18 drivers as well as, you know, people who are  
19 recreational users. And of course, safety is  
20 paramount when we look at the causation of some of  
21 these incidents, a lot of it unfortunately is user  
22 error. They're not a-- there's no license  
23 requirement to have an e-bike. That's something that  
24 this multiagency taskforce is looking to address, but  
25



COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

97

1  
2 in the meantime, you know, we're doing our part with  
3 enforcement and education.

4 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. Moving  
5 to discuss civilianization. As part of the  
6 Administration's Blueprint to End Gun Violence  
7 released when the Mayor entered office two years ago,  
8 NYPD announced plans to identify inefficiencies  
9 within the Department to enable uniformed officers to  
10 be shifted from administrative roles to patrol. What  
11 efforts at civilianization has the Department  
12 undertaken to achieve more efficient deployment?

13 CHIEF BENOIT: So, on the face of  
14 civilianization, we're making every effort. So,  
15 civilianization is something that we do on a regular  
16 basis and again, because I have access to all the  
17 personnel tables, I have access to look at all of the  
18 commands in terms of their rosters and how they staff  
19 their personnel once we transfer for them. So, the  
20 Police Department at the conclusion of 2023, I'm  
21 happy to report that we civilianized 500 positions.  
22 Now, that's itemized as follows. So, 133 police  
23 officers were redeployed to operational commands,  
24 meaning they worked, for example, like in police  
25 headquarters, or they worked outside one of our 98

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

98

1 enforcement commands, and they were transferred to an  
2 operational command, one of our 98 enforcement  
3 commands. We also redeploy-- we reassigned 367  
4 police officers that actually served in one of our  
5 enforcement commands, but they were performing tasks  
6 that could otherwise be, you know, earmarked for a  
7 civilian employee. So they've been redeployed to  
8 perform patrol functions. So, when we last had the  
9 pre-council briefing, we constantly audit the  
10 rosters. It's a constant process. Just to give you  
11 an example, we had 292 positions that we had  
12 identified that could be civilianized with  
13 redeployments and new hires. So we're down now since  
14 that last-- the pre-budget briefing, we're down to  
15 180, and this is something that I do personally.  
16 Under the supervision of First Deputy Commissioner  
17 Kinsella, one of the things that we did was we  
18 changed-- and again it's an institutional change. We  
19 never actually-- me, my position, never actually sat  
20 down and looked at the exact positions that we were  
21 going to hire for any specific week. Now, generally,  
22 we hire every Monday. We have hires every Monday,  
23 but nobody at my level prior to this management team,  
24 you know, directed us to actually look that closely  
25

1  
2 at it. So what we do is we-- when we were  
3 civilianizing, we changed the manner which we deploy  
4 our hiring freeze. So if we saw a position that  
5 could be more appropriately staffed by let's say a  
6 staff analyst, we would gear our hiring pools to  
7 staff analyst, like the people that we can call as a  
8 staff analyst to deploy them to that position. And  
9 that's how we were able to achieve these numbers.  
10 And again, it's something that we do every single  
11 day. I look at the hires every week, and when we can  
12 plug them in, we plug them in. So it's not something  
13 that I could say is going to end. It's like an  
14 ongoing-- civilianization is an ongoing process for  
15 me. But it's a-- it makes up about 25 percent of my  
16 time at work every week.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BARROWS: So, just to  
18 supplement the Chief's testimony-- Bob Barrows, I'm  
19 the Deputy Commissioner of Strategic Initiatives. I  
20 just want to talk about a little bit of the audit  
21 that we did at the beginning of the Administration,  
22 and this came from the urging of City Hall as well.  
23 We took-- throughout 2022 and most of 2023, the  
24 Department conducted literally a bureau by bureau  
25 review as part of its civilianization strategy to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 facilitate the return of additional officers to  
4 patrol. So that analysis included things like data  
5 review, site visits, interviews with bureau  
6 personnel, review of process improvements, tech  
7 solutions, and review of legal mandates and other  
8 requirements to really determine what the appropriate  
9 staffing level when it comes to uniforms in our  
10 bureau. So, in that process in doing those audits,  
11 we returned, you know, significant numbers, nearly  
12 two academy classes as the Chief noted during that  
13 time. And we built, as Chief mentioned, really long-  
14 term solutions. Civilianization is something that  
15 goes on every day, as the Chief said, but we also  
16 reorganize a number of our bureaus to improve  
17 efficiency. We created within personnel a new unit  
18 to continuously review positions for civilianization.

19 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. Are  
20 there established benchmarks for returning a specific  
21 number of officers to patrol and over what timeframe  
22 will the shift occur?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BARROWS: I think a  
24 lot of that work happened during the audit that we've  
25 done in 2022 and 2023, but as the Chief said,  
civilianization is something that's ongoing, but just

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 going back to some of the criteria that we looked at  
4 when we did this analysis is again, we were looking  
5 at, you know, caseloads, work load of the bureau,  
6 data-- full data review. We visited each and every  
7 one of these bureaus. We sat down with key bureau  
8 personnel, went through line by line their staffing  
9 and also looked at how can we supplement some of that  
10 work through either just a process improvement or  
11 through tech-- or some sort of technology solution  
12 and where we could find those efficiencies and those  
13 savings, that's when we made a decision either to  
14 redeploy as the Chief said, because you know, another  
15 civilian can take this line that a uniform is doing  
16 or we designated the spot for civilianization. We  
17 were going to bring a civilian in to take-- to do  
18 that spot and return that uniformed member back to  
19 patrol.

20 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: What are the main  
21 reasons for uniformed officers serving in  
22 administrative roles, and how many officers are  
23 serving in administrative roles due to injury or  
24 misconduct?

25 CHIEF BENOIT: So, just to circle back on  
your last question, I need to provide some context.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Less than one percent of our uniformed force in our  
4 98 patrol commands are doing civilian's work. So  
5 that's pretty noteworthy. In terms of restricted  
6 duty personnel-- let me give you the right number.  
7 So we have just over 2,000 people that are on  
8 restricted duty that serve in one of our-- several  
9 restrict-- what we call restricted duty pools. Now  
10 these officers served in support capacities. There  
11 are vital functions that need to occur that can  
12 really only be performed by a uniformed person. For  
13 example, we have officers that serve in some of our  
14 detective units while they were on restricted duty.  
15 They can't perform the full duty-- the functions of a  
16 full duty police officers. So their-- what we do is  
17 to maximize the full duty personnel that can go out  
18 and do fully duty police work, we deploy them to  
19 functions that are necessary to run the agency, but  
20 not use a full duty person to do that. Now I'm the  
21 face of that as well. So I oversee the restricted  
22 duty program. I oversee all of the-- my primary role  
23 in the agency is to document, track, and account for  
24 all uniform and civilian transactions, all the  
25 employee transactions. I manage the restricted duty  
pool, and again, that's like civilianization. This

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 is something that occurs every day because people who  
4 go on restricted duty, you know, that changes. Like,  
5 we have people that are on, for example, position  
6 limitation. We have officers that are expecting to  
7 have children. They're going through a pregnancy,  
8 they can't be out on patrol. So then we have vital  
9 functions that we could deploy them the duration of  
10 their pregnancy to perform vital functions while  
11 keeping somebody on full duty that we could have out  
12 to do enforcement work. Again, I manage that every  
13 day. Those numbers change every day. They probably  
14 changed since this report was printed. So this is an  
15 ongoing thing and we work in constant contact with  
16 our medical division. I supervise the physician  
17 staff across the agency in terms of how we manage  
18 when officers go out sick. I'm the one that oversees  
19 all of the-- the officers, the sick systems, our  
20 unlimited sick system. We've had mechanisms where we  
21 look at people who we believe that are malingering,  
22 where people that are trying to not go out and do  
23 enforcement work and maybe report sick. I'm the  
24 person that sends out people to make sure that these  
25 people are actually out sick, and I'm also the person  
that oversees the physician staff that gets these

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 police officers back to work so that we can deploy  
4 them out on patrol.

5 CHIEF MADDREY: I just want you to be  
6 assured that even our officers who are assigned to  
7 administrative functions, they are mandated to go out  
8 on patrol. We do administrative all-outs [sic],  
9 especially in the summer time. Every week they have  
10 to go out. When we're in emergency situations, we'll  
11 mobilize, you know, our people who are working in  
12 administrative capacities included that one PP, my  
13 office as well. We will use all of our resources  
14 wherever we need them. So anyone who's full-duty,  
15 they may be currently assigned to administrative  
16 position. They are mandated to go out. They're  
17 mandated to respond to mobilizations when we need it,  
18 and during our CompStat process, when we see problems  
19 we need additional resources. That's one of the  
20 first resources I ask commanders about, how we're  
21 using our administrative people-- cover school posts,  
22 cover posts where we have trouble. It's all part of  
23 the plan.

24 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Will officers be  
25 returning to patrol if on modified or administrative  
duty due to substantiated allegations of misconduct?



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA:

4 Well, eventually, yes, but it depends on a case-to-  
5 case basis, right? So, we can't say that all-- we'll  
6 respond-- return to fully duty. It depends what the  
7 penalty is. sometimes the penalty is to fire,  
8 separate from the Department, but ultimately, our  
9 goal is to make sure that justice is served for the  
10 person the discipline-- the complaint, and for the  
11 officers to receive due process, and to return them  
12 back to full duty in a expeditiously way.

13 CHIEF IGELSIAS: Under the leadership of  
14 the First Deputy Commissioner, we put a working group  
15 together to go over these cases on a monthly basis.  
16 So every month we're going over what we call our  
17 modified suspension list to see who we can go back--  
18 put back to full duty.

19 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: And  
20 this process, it doesn't linger on for two to three  
21 years. Now every bureau-- that's DAO, every bureau  
22 that's involved have a timeframe which they have to  
23 hear the cases, even trials and so forth. So, with  
24 this working group, we are working with the community  
25 who have made the complaint to make sure that justice  
and-- they receive swift answers and results to their

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 complaints, and that the officer is returned back to  
4 full duty or cleared for promotions or so forth.

5 CHIEF BENOIT: So, we have a process  
6 that-- under the leadership of the First Deputy  
7 Commissioner, the Suspended Modified Review Board,  
8 and in conjunction with that Chief Iglesias is  
9 saying-- I'm on that committee as well, and we made  
10 some institutional changes in terms of the  
11 administrative flow of paperwork. That cut down on  
12 the turnaround time for how long these cases going to  
13 turn-- are going to be active in terms of keeping  
14 somebody that might be facing a penalty. And as an  
15 institution, there was a mindset that when-- if we  
16 came close to knowing what that penalty was actually  
17 going to be, it was at that time that the person was  
18 returned to full duty. The mindset and the cultural  
19 change that was shifted under this leadership team--  
20 and it's a big cultural shift-- is we don't wait for  
21 that. Some-- often times an officer is in trouble  
22 and their duty status has changed, but we know what  
23 the outcome's going to be. Now, in the past, that  
24 person would go through the disciplinary process, and  
25 that resulted in them being out for a protracted  
period of time. One of the biggest shift was that

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 when we know what that penalty is going to ultimately  
4 be, and there's no need to keep them out, for the  
5 period of time that we traditionally kept them out.  
6 And this-- the Suspended Modified Review Board, Chief  
7 Iglesias accompanies my staff and I on that  
8 committee, and we return them back as quickly as  
9 possible. So we do that once a month, and we've  
10 turned several hundred officers back to patrol so  
11 that they can perform full-duty police work. It's  
12 something that we monitor on a regular basis.

13 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: And  
14 another aspect of it, we instituted a-- we had a  
15 command, ACD-- command discipline and a Command B.  
16 Now we have a Command C discipline which is you  
17 receive up to 20 penalty days for internal  
18 misconduct. So now, these officers that have usually  
19 been held up or modified, now they're receiving this  
20 penalty, the CCD penalty in lieu of being modified  
21 and so forth. So I think that was a huge difference  
22 as well to make sure we keep our officers fair, but  
23 we also make sure that the appropriate penalty is  
24 addressed.

25 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GAMBLE: Paul Gamble,  
Deputy Commissioner and Department Advocate. While

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 we're anxious to return officers to full duty to  
4 perform the law enforcement function, we want to make  
5 sure that officers who are returning to duty have  
6 been appropriately sanctioned where appropriate for  
7 the misconduct. Sometimes that misconduct is so  
8 serious that they can no longer remain on the force.  
9 Last year, 78 members of the force were terminated.  
10 The total suspension days and vacation days imposed  
11 totaled 14,500 which would be the equivalent \$5.3  
12 million in fines. So, while we want the disciplinary  
13 process to move expeditiously, when police officers  
14 are brought back we want them brought back with a  
15 sanction that will be a disincentive to any further  
16 misconduct. You should know 91 percent of the force  
17 has never had an allegation of misconduct, and for  
18 those who do, 83 percent of them never have a second  
19 allegation. So, we believe that our efforts are  
20 effective, and where someone should no longer be part  
21 of the force, they are removed.

22 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Moving to PEG

23 restorations. The PEG restorations as of July and  
24 October 20-- PEG restoration of July and October  
25 2024, uniformed academy classes, the Executive Plan  
includes the restoration of \$62 million in Fiscal

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Year 25, \$7 million-- I'm sorry-- \$76 million in  
4 Fiscal Year 26, increasing slightly to \$79 million in  
5 Fiscal Year 29. For the July and October uniform  
6 classes, each class is expected to include  
7 approximately 600 officers. With this restoration,  
8 three of the five classes which were eliminated in  
9 November in the November Plan PEG have now been  
10 restored. Do you expect the additional two classes  
11 that were-- that are still cancelled to be restored  
12 in the future plan?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: So, I think  
14 that's a discussion that needs to be had with OMB.  
15 Our first focus truly-- and we're grateful for these  
16 classes, because as Chief Benoit stated, it's going  
17 to enable us to keep up with our attrition and  
18 maintain the current staffing levels. I think we  
19 don't want to get ahead of our elves, and we want to  
20 see that we fill these two class restorations first.

21 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: How will you deploy  
22 the officers once they graduate from the Academy?  
23 Are there certain precincts with low headcount and  
24 resources that need to be backfilled?

25 CHIEF MADDREY: Deployment usually goes  
through my office. I sit down with of course the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Chief of Crime Control Strategies, the Chief of  
4 Personnel. We look at first, where we're having  
5 trouble. We look at crime, if we need to put more  
6 officers there. Then we look at commands that are  
7 down and police officers that we put them there. So  
8 we usually-- it's based on crimes, conditions where  
9 we need additional resources. Then we look then to  
10 the command center suffering from personnel losses.

11 COMMISSIONER CABAN: Yeah, and like I  
12 said, Chair, we mentioned over and over again how  
13 important our officers are to our Department. In our  
14 opening statement I mentioned the great work they're  
15 doing. Over 16,000 guns taken off our streets. Month  
16 after month we're seeing crime reductions in our  
17 city, and those are because of the cops that are out  
18 there doing the work every single day, and I sit here  
19 and I thank them for that.

20 CHIEF LIPETRI: If I could just, you  
21 know, the present Academy class that just graduated  
22 and the upcoming graduating class, you know,  
23 historically 25 precincts make up 75 percent of the  
24 shooting incidents. We've identified 3.5 percent of  
25 the area of New York City which accounts as 35  
percent of all shootings in New York City. Those are

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 where the officers are going. We're putting an  
4 additional 1,200 officers to those areas this summer,  
5 part of summer deployment. We did that last year.  
6 We saw a 35 percent reduction in those areas in  
7 shooting incidents. We saw a 42 percent reduction in  
8 confirmed shots fired, and we saw an increase in  
9 every enforcement category in those areas, and we're  
10 doing the same thing we did-- we actually enhanced it  
11 this year, and hopefully build on the successes that  
12 we had last year. Like I said, the majority of those  
13 officers are going to be on-foot patrol in those  
14 areas.

15 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I want to move to  
16 the IT adjustments. The Executive Plan includes an  
17 additional \$28 million for Information Technology for  
18 the current year. What systems in technology does  
19 this funding support, and what's the total costs of  
20 these systems, and do these systems support reporting  
21 and documenting information on stops?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: So, I don't  
23 have specifically in detail what the systems do, but  
24 I can let you know what the funding was for. So,  
25 when it come to the Department's OTPS budget, over 40  
percent is IT related. So that really is the core of

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 our OTPS budget that supports our critical  
4 infrastructure, communication for our officers,  
5 etcetera. So when the Department did a detailed  
6 analysis of its IT budget, we had quite a few  
7 contracts in licensing programs that went up. I  
8 think with inflation, with escalations in contracts,  
9 licensing, that's something we're seeing consistently  
10 in our OTPS budget. so half of the \$28 million just  
11 was for five things, our Microsoft Premier Support  
12 Services, IBM licensing increases for our real-time  
13 crime center or our crime data warehouse, all of our  
14 Microsoft ELA licenses, our Azure cloud storage, you  
15 know, all of those things. We had IBI licenses for  
16 Enterprise case and records management, and also  
17 additional license costs even for our body-worn  
18 camera subscription. So, that was half of it at  
19 \$14.3 million. I think even in my prior role at  
20 Finance, we were seeing a lot of pressure on IT costs  
21 going up in industry, so this particular increase was  
22 for cash flow for the rest of the year. and of  
23 course, you know, we're looking at FY25 budget  
24 development with a fresh eye, so we're going to take  
25 a critical look at that and see if some of these  
costs might be able to come down for next year.



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: During the recent  
4 protest at Columbia University, there was  
5 notification of a firearm that was discharged. So my  
6 question is when was the Manhattan District Attorney  
7 and the New York State Attorney General notified of  
8 the accidental firearm discharged that occurred in  
9 Hamilton Hall? Did the timeframe and processes for  
10 notifying such offices comply with existing protocols  
11 for making those offices aware of NYPD firearm  
12 discharges?

13 COMMISSIONER CABAN: I'll start with part  
14 of the question. Obviously, it's a very rare  
15 occurrence, but it does happen, and every time it  
16 does happen and there are no injuries it's referred  
17 to the District Attorney's Office in the borough that  
18 it occurred. That's exactly what happened in this  
19 case. We referred it right away and it's pretty much  
20 common practice what we do in, obviously, accidental  
21 discharges. We can talk about--

22 CHIEF ARAMBOLES: [interposing] Thank you,  
23 Commissioner.

24 COMMISSIONER CABAN: timeframe involved.

25 CHIEF ARAMBOLES: Wilson Arambales,  
Special Operation Chief. On that day, after the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 accidental discharge, I personally investigated the  
4 matter. I saw that no one was injured. It did not go  
5 through the window, and right immediately after that  
6 incident I notified Force Investigation Division to  
7 conduct a thorough search of this investigation.

8 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Moving to NYPD  
9 surveillance. What are the policies for deploying  
10 drones in protests and demonstrations, and how is the  
11 footage that is captured used in NYPD investigations?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: so, I can  
13 speak to that. so what we do is-- we definitely use  
14 drones sort of to track the movement of large crowds,  
15 and I think-- I'm not coming at this from the  
16 enforcement side, but I do think it is a very helpful  
17 resource, particularly if we're trying to figure out  
18 where a large group is going and making sure the  
19 appropriate resources. As someone mentioned earlier,  
20 we sometimes don't know where a group is headed and  
21 it could be very helpful to see at the drone level,  
22 at a high level, okay, they're heading in this  
23 direction or that direction. There are very strict  
24 rules in place, and it goes to-- it's embodied in our  
25 polices, and it goes in relation to Handschu  
Guidelines. When we're talking about peaceful

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 protest, right, which is the vast majority, the  
4 [inaudible] of protests in the City, we're not  
5 allowed to zoom in on individual protestors. Can't  
6 do that. In the same way that if it's a peaceful  
7 protest, officers can't activate their body-worn  
8 camera. We can't otherwise have folks videotape--  
9 video recording faces, unless and until we're in a  
10 situation where either there's, you know, criminal  
11 conduct occurring or imminent criminal conduct. If  
12 we're about to take enforcement action, in that  
13 scenario then officers are actually required to turn  
14 on their body-worn cameras and we definitely will  
15 record if we're talking about taking enforcement  
16 action. And in that instance-- in that instance, we  
17 are permitted to zoom in. again, because then we're  
18 talking about criminal conducts occurring, and you  
19 know, drone surveillance is no different than in that  
20 scenario, you know, a body-worn camera or other  
21 recording. But just to go back to the key point, I  
22 think, peaceful protest, not taking enforcement  
23 action, the drone will survey at a high level, but  
24 not zooming in on any faces.

25 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Kind of was reading  
my mind. My next question was do these drones

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 capture facial recognition data, and if so, does this  
4 data help in NYPD surveillance of operations, and has  
5 the use of the drones led to savings for the PD to  
6 date?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: So, I'll--  
8 on the first piece. There is no real-time facial  
9 recognition technology in our drones, and in fact,  
10 our policy forbids real-time facial recognition  
11 technology in our drones. That said, as with any  
12 other recording we may have-- for example, if there's  
13 some crime being committed and the drone then zooms,  
14 we could take a still from that recording and run  
15 that through facial recognition. In that sense, it's  
16 really no different than a still off of any other--  
17 you know, off an Argus camera or off a body-worn  
18 camera. Again, it's not facial recognition in the  
19 system. It's not real-time, but we can get a still  
20 off of that, and then you know, if and as appropriate  
21 run that through our facial recognition system.

22 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Does the NYPD work  
23 with or receive support from other national or  
24 international agencies or entities to support its  
25 surveillance operations?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER WEINER: good

4 afternoon. I'm Rebecca Weiner. I'm the Deputy  
5 Commissioner for Intelligence and Counter-Terrorism.  
6 We have extensive partnerships at the Department and  
7 as a bureau with federal agencies, as well as  
8 international law enforcement to support ongoing  
9 criminal investigations.

10 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. I want to  
11 touch on something that was more recent with regards  
12 Win Rozario. Can you share with the Council, the  
13 number of NYPD uniformed officers who are currently  
14 on NYPD mental health co-response teams? What budget  
15 is there for these teams in Fiscal Year 2024 and  
16 2025?

17 CHIEF TOBIN: Good afternoon. Terri  
18 Tobin, Chief of Interagency Operations. When you're  
19 referring to co-response you are speaking of teams  
20 that are comprised of social workers or social  
21 workers and officers.

22 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I think the  
23 appropriate would be probably both, because I know  
24 sometimes it-- probably most times these are very,  
25 very dangerous situations, but I'm more concerned  
about the presence of a trained person that is

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 available to de-escalate and therefore save lives in  
4 that particular regard, so definitely both.

5 CHIEF TOBIN: Understood. So, we do have  
6 co-response within the Police Department; however,  
7 they do not respond to 911 calls. They are pre- and  
8 post-crisis. So, currently there is no team of  
9 officers with clinicians that respond to 911 calls  
10 for people that are having a mental health emergency.

11 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Can you clarify the  
12 kinds of trainings if any that officers receive  
13 before being allowed to participate in mental health  
14 crisis responses?

15 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: So,  
16 to start, in 2023 our department responded to 175,000  
17 calls for an emotional, disturbed persons in need of  
18 help. We as a department take great care in handling  
19 these crisis. So, under the Police Commissioner's  
20 direction we formed a working group to identify the  
21 areas that we need to improve in. So, the first item  
22 that we saw that we needed to improve in was  
23 increased training, right? So, currently,  
24 approximately 50 percent of our members on patrol are  
25 trained in crisis intervention training. This  
training is a four-day training, collaborating with

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Department of Health and Hygiene, right? So, 50  
4 percent of our members are trained in that. We are  
5 now in the emphasis stages of adding additional  
6 training called Integrating Communications  
7 Assessments and Tactics, ICAT. This will train our  
8 officers to respond tactically which we believe would  
9 be a great complement in addition to the CIT  
10 training, which this training will be a refresher  
11 annually, not just a four-day training which you have  
12 it four times-- in the four days and then you don't  
13 have it again for the rest of your career. So, now  
14 we're making it an annual refresher. Every officer--  
15 in addition to that, every officer has on their  
16 Department phones instructions how to deal with the  
17 different types of radio runs dealing with  
18 emotionally-disturbed persons, whether it be violent,  
19 non-violent, involuntary. So we put that on their  
20 phones. In addition to that, we transitioned our  
21 equipment, our taser-- we have a new taser, taser  
22 seven, that is a lot more accurate. This taser has  
23 two cartridges, two laser dots that show where the  
24 dots will automatically land and turn on body-worn  
25 cameras that are 30 feet within the taser. So it  
makes it more accurate. We also took a tally of our

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 gear that officers have in their patrol vehicles  
4 responding to emotionally disturbed persons. So,  
5 we're in the process of purchasing more department  
6 gear to help in our different steps of response to  
7 these radio runs. In addition to that, we change our  
8 administrative reporting recommendations. Like, our  
9 radio codes are more accurately captured on how the  
10 job will be resolved, so forth, and paperwork.

11 CHIEF OBE: Good afternoon, Lola [sic]  
12 Obe, Chief of Training. I just wanted to mention  
13 that at the last hearing I brought up CIT and to the  
14 First Dep's point, we're looking to enhance our  
15 training. So what are we doing? What's the next  
16 steps for us like the Commissioner mentioned-- I  
17 mean, like the Commissioner mentioned. We are  
18 looking at putting together a virtual training  
19 through a system called NYPDU. So we'll do that  
20 just-- and it's titled with some sensitivity. We're  
21 working with Chief Tobin's office and a licensed  
22 clinician we have working within the NYPD. So it's  
23 titled "Engaging Individuals in a Mental Health  
24 Crisis." We're currently in the final phases,  
25 seeking approval. As soon as that's done we'll  
incorporate that into NYPDU. We're also working on a



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 series of videos, again, from Chief Tobin's office.

4 Some of the things that she recommended and also from

5 the First Dep's working group is that is we focus on

6 things that really matter. My team calls it

7 reminders just for our officers out there when they

8 find themselves in a-- responding to incidents of

9 people in the throes of mental illness. So, one of

10 the things is just a reminder. Required

11 notifications, call that sergeant, call that

12 lieutenant-- and certain things that we have within

13 our Patrol Guide within our policies and procedures

14 within the Patrol Guide just, you know, depicting

15 also the use of equipment that the First Dep

16 mentioned such as the shield rope [sic]. What does

17 that actually look like? So we're looking to put a

18 series of videos that actually show that. We're also

19 looking to-- you mentioned de-escalation. We're

20 going to be relying on body-worn cameras. I think

21 that's so people can see good and bad videos that

22 depict what it is to de-escalate. Again, no two

23 incidents are the same. We're all going to respond

24 differently to those incidents, so it's important to

25 depict what de-escalation looks like and what the

Department is looking for when you get out to those

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 incidents and you want to bring down the heat with  
4 the situation. So, and also we're working closely  
5 with Chief Tobin also in responding to clinical  
6 removals when we have-- when applicable. We're  
7 working also with the First Dep's office down the  
8 road sometime this year to just have a mandatory one-  
9 day refresher for everyone in the NYPD at our  
10 facility or we have joint-- we call it J-Tac [sic]  
11 Centers, eight of them citywide. We have it there at  
12 the Police Academy, but just have that one-day annual  
13 refreshers. To the First Dep's point, if you take  
14 CIT-- say you took-- you were trained in 2019. It's  
15 a one-day-- it's a four-day course, but one time a  
16 training. Are you going to remember all of that? So  
17 the idea is-- under her leadership is bring it back.  
18 Let's have the one-day refresher, and we'll just keep  
19 pushing that forward. Again, just so our officers  
20 remind-- have those reminders and keep themselves  
21 safe, and also the people that respond to it are also  
22 kept safe, too.

23 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I'm thinking about  
24 all of this as I'm wondering why was he killed. I'm  
25 thinking bout this because, you know, with the  
release of the body-worn camera footage, the death of

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Win Rozario, the 19-year-old boy who was shot  
4 multiple times by the NYPD during a response to a  
5 mental health call, it was evident that both officers  
6 responding exhibited inexperience in responding to  
7 mental health crisis. From the language they used to  
8 the lack of the de-escalation methods used-- to be  
9 quite frank, the disregard for the safety of those in  
10 that home that day. It seems to me that the NYPD  
11 officers may not be the best equipped to respond to  
12 these events by themselves. Have the NYPD in earnest  
13 considered moving both the fiscal and operational  
14 responsibilities of responding to mental health calls  
15 to other agencies or other organizations with mental  
16 health expertise and experience with crisis  
17 responses? If so, which groups have you met with?

18 CHIEF TOBIN: Sir, we work with the  
19 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, Department  
20 of Homeless Services, Health + Hospitals, and we were  
21 very instrumental in moving the funds that we had so  
22 that we could have a 911 response with a social  
23 worker and a police officer. That funding was moved  
24 over to start the B-HEARD program.  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I want to come back  
4 perhaps with a second round of questioning and open  
5 it up.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Chair.  
7 We're now going to hand it-- we've also been joined  
8 by Council Members Yeger, Williams, Fariás. We're  
9 going to start-- as well-- I said Avilés. And we're  
10 going to hand it over now for questions to Council  
11 Member Ayala followed by Cabán.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you. Is  
13 this still Thursday? Happy Thursday, everybody. I  
14 want to piggyback on some of the question the Chair  
15 was just asking, because I really would love to  
16 learn-- and I'm happy that we have two of my favorite  
17 handling this, but in regards to the mental health  
18 calls, like I'm-- that's an area that really concerns  
19 me. several years ago we tried to pass a bill that  
20 would ensure that every city agency that may touch on  
21 such call be specifically trained on how to respond,  
22 and we received a lot of pushback, because you know,  
23 some people felt like we were codifying the use of  
24 the NYPD, and what we were trying to do was  
25 acknowledge from a place of, you know, reality that  
there may be situation where an NYPD officer will

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 show up anyway, right, because a neighbor called,  
4 because it wasn't classified as a EDP call, and I  
5 need to make sure that that officer is trained when  
6 they get there. Now, because this was not the first  
7 incident, then my concern is what did we learn from  
8 pa-- like, I'm happy to hear that we're going to have  
9 new training and that we're going to do this and that  
10 we're going to do that. I would love to know how  
11 much of the budget is allocated toward that, but what  
12 did we learn from the last, you know, several police-  
13 involved shootings of people with mental health  
14 issues? I-- you know, Chief Tobin and I, like, we  
15 worked on this very vigorously when I was Chair of  
16 Mental Health. I have a brother that has serious  
17 mental health issues, and the first time that I had  
18 to make that call to the NYPD-- well, when I called  
19 911, I was really afraid of what would happen,  
20 because his behavior was erratic. I didn't consider  
21 him dangerous, but I don't know, right? He didn't  
22 have a weapon, but I was really afraid of what that  
23 would result in, and when the officers came, I never  
24 identified myself. I tend not to do that. But they  
25 were more than-- they were great. Like, they handled  
him, you know, really well. They were calm, you

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 know, with him, and they escorted him, but I could  
4 feel the tension. Like, you can cut tension in the  
5 room because you could see it, and it was my first  
6 time standing there looking from the outside in and  
7 seeing the situation where both parties were scared,  
8 you know, of what the other would do. And I realized  
9 then, like, that we-- and it's hard. Life is  
10 unpredictable. These cases are unpredictable.  
11 People and behaviors are unpredictable, but we need  
12 to make sure that whenever anyone that is carrying a  
13 weapon is responding to a call like this, that they  
14 are equipped to de-escalate as quickly as possible.  
15 And in the case of Win, when I was looking at the  
16 video from what I saw, and again, this is just what  
17 was shown. I'm sure that there's more to it. There  
18 was no evidence of any attempt to de-escalate. That  
19 to me is troublesome, again, because this is not  
20 first rodeo. Like, this has happened to too many  
21 families, and I, you know, want to reiterate I don't  
22 think the officers are waking up in the morning and  
23 going, you know, let me look and see who I'm going to  
24 shoot today. But I do wonder, like, you know,  
25 there's a consequence to both, right? Having to deal  
with that, to wake up every day and knowing that you

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 took a life in a situation that could have been  
4 prevented. It's horrible on both parts. So what did  
5 we learn? Why-- what have we applied, you know, to  
6 ensure that these things are not happening, and why  
7 now? Why are we here now?

8 COMMISSIONER CABAN: I'll start off.

9 Just, you know, first and foremost, like you said in  
10 your scenario, your mental health is a priority for  
11 everyone. It impact everyone's life different ways,  
12 and as a department we're always looking for  
13 different ways to improve the job that we do. First  
14 and foremost, it revolves around training. I'll turn  
15 it over to our Chief of Training who can answer the  
16 other questions.

17 CHIEF OBE: Council Member, just to add  
18 to what the Commissioner said, I just want to assure  
19 the Council that at the core of what we teach at the  
20 Police Academy is to train our officers to-- you  
21 know, within constitutional guidelines. We're also  
22 driven by state mandates, too. We want to keep our  
23 officers safe. We also want to keep our communities  
24 safe. We also want to provide the right tools for  
25 our officers when they respond to all types of jobs.  
Naturally, something like this is troubling to us

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 all. I cannot speak to that specific case. I can tell  
4 you what training looks like. It's two-fold. For  
5 our recruit class that's in the Police Academy, and  
6 we also have an in-service component. That's the  
7 people who are out in the field. They're  
8 grandfathered out of the Police Academy. So at the  
9 recruit level, I talked about CIT the last time I was  
10 here. The First Dep touched on ICAT. So that kind  
11 of incorporates, you know, some tactics. At the  
12 recruit level, they get the same CIT training that  
13 all the in-service members get throughout the six  
14 months that they're there. So it's a one-time thing.  
15 They get the four-day course. I want to add that  
16 with the recruit class that has just graduated,  
17 that's the October 2023 class, they got the CIT  
18 training, and moving forward, every Academy class in  
19 the Police Academy will get whether it be CIT or  
20 ICAT, they will get that training before they get out  
21 into the field. You talked about de-escalation. In  
22 their curriculum, de-escalation is sprinkled  
23 throughout the six-month process in their classes and  
24 they talk about policing professionally, the use of  
25 discretion, [inaudible] partially. So all of that  
is, you know, sprinkled throughout their training



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 throughout the six-month process. What's important  
4 also that we do, and we touch base with all of my own  
5 partners here, the bureau chiefs and all, is when we  
6 see incidents like this, we want to depict that same  
7 incident. It's tough. The setting is of course a  
8 lot different, but we have something called Scenario-  
9 based training. So we take a look at it. We depict  
10 an incident that we see, and our officers learn from  
11 it. We group. We critique. We reassess whatever we  
12 need to do, but a lot of this scenario-based  
13 incidents are based on real-life scenarios. As a  
14 matter of fact, at the end of every six-month  
15 training academy our recruits have a post-exit  
16 survey, and they want more scenarios. So these are  
17 the things that we see, that we do when we see things  
18 out there, not necessarily all troubling, but we want  
19 to make sure that, you know, this is what the  
20 response to mentally-ill person looks like. You  
21 know, so we incorporate a lot--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: [interposing] I'm  
23 sorry to interrupt, Chief, but who's providing the  
24 training?

25 CHIEF OBE: We are. We are.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: The NYPD.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHIEF OBE: The NYPD within-- we have--  
4 we use actors, you know, within the Police Academy--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: [interposing] Do  
6 you have any mental health professionals that are--

7 CHIEF OBE: [interposing] That is part of  
8 CIT. We work with professional-- we work-- as part  
9 of the MOU with DOHMH. We have clinicians that work  
10 with us with CIT. The officers also get that, but  
11 also just to enhance CIT with the recruits, we also  
12 add scenario-based training which we use our own  
13 actors within our Police Academy to depict real life  
14 scenarios.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: And these are--  
16 I'm assuming the CIT are trained to work with the  
17 most seriously mentally-ill--

18 CHIEF OBE: [interposing] Well, the MOU  
19 goes back to 2015. So, DOHMH selects that provider.  
20 The person that-- the company-- I mean, the  
21 organization we use is called Center for Urban  
22 Community Services. We call them CUCS. They've been  
23 with us a long time and that's-- they have clinicians  
24 and they work hand-in-hand with us for CIT. But to  
25 enhance the CIT and just enhance the training  
process, we also have scenario-based training which

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 is based on anything that's out there in field. It's  
4 all about real life scenarios that we depict within  
5 the Police Academy. The recruits like it. They want  
6 more of it.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: It would be nice  
8 to have some families or people that have-- that are  
9 going through similar situations at home that can  
10 kind of describe, right, what does that behavior look  
11 like.

12 CHIEF OBE: I can invite you to the  
13 Police Academy, and Council Member Ayala, we would  
14 love to have you. CIT's a four-day training. That's  
15 part of it. It's really intense.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah, I would love  
17 that. I would love that.

18 CHIEF OBE: We will extend the  
19 invitation.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Do you know what  
21 component of the budget is set aside for the  
22 training?

23 CHIEF OBE: I believe about \$2 million,  
24 but I could have--

25 CHIEF TOBIN: [interposing] It's  
approximately \$2 million annually. I would just like

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 to add to Chief Obe's comment that we do have a peer  
4 panel where people with lived mental health  
5 experience come in and they sit on a panel. They  
6 describe their experience with a police response,  
7 both positive and negative, and then there's a  
8 wonderful interaction with the members of the class  
9 and the panel each week.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay, I would--  
11 yeah, I would love to be--

12 CHIEF OBE: [interposing] We will extend  
13 with the invitation.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah, I don't  
15 think \$2 million is enough for that, but you know--

16 CHIEF OBE: [interposing] I'm sorry, say  
17 it again.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I don't think \$2  
19 million is a lot of money for this type of training,  
20 but I will leave it at that. I have a question  
21 regarding the-- so in an incident like this where  
22 there's a police-involved shooting and the-- what  
23 happens immediately after? Is the officer-- with the  
24 officers? Are the officers take-- you know, taken to  
25 the precinct to kind of go over the events of what

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 transpired? Do they go to the hospital immediately  
4 after? Like, what is the protocol for that?

5 CHIEF MADDREY: When we have member of  
6 the service involved shootings, usually after the  
7 shooting they were moved to the hospital to be  
8 evaluated, you know, just trauma, tinnitus, other  
9 things, blood pressure. They get treated. They're  
10 usually brought back to the precinct and then based  
11 on the situation, Force Investigation Division in  
12 consultation with the District Attorney's Office,  
13 they may question them or they may not question them.  
14 So, that's usually the immediate--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: [interposing] So,  
16 I'm concerned then, why-- and I think that all those  
17 things should happen, right? I can't imagine how  
18 horrifying a situation like that, you know, would be.  
19 By why is that level of efficiency not afforded to  
20 the families, that level of sensitivity? According  
21 to media reports, Mr. Win's family stated that  
22 directly after their incident they were taken  
23 directly to the precinct. I can only imagine as a  
24 mother, as a person with blood running through my  
25 veins, if someone that I love is killed in front of  
me, the trauma that that would induce, and then to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 have to go directly to a precinct and be held there  
4 is even further traumatizing and insulting, and I  
5 don't understand that, I really don't. I think that  
6 is an area where we need to also look at, because  
7 it's equally-- as important as it is to the  
8 Department to ensure that your officers are safe,  
9 it's also important to ensure that the community  
10 feels that same, you know, level of attention,  
11 especially when, you know, they were trying to get  
12 help, right? This is an unfortunate, you know,  
13 incident and until the investigation's concluded, you  
14 know, it is what it is, we'll work through that, but  
15 this mother's son was shot in her face. She was  
16 literally, like, millimeters away from her son as he  
17 died, and nobody thought to take her to the hospital?

18 CHIEF MADDREY: Council Member,  
19 absolutely it was a situation nobody here wanted to  
20 see. But one of the difficult parts about the  
21 situation was the home was the crime scene, so we  
22 would have to move them out the crime scene. But as  
23 always, every police involved shooting, any shooting,  
24 we always go back and we critique and we learn from  
25 it. This is something we will definitely incorporate  
to understand that hey, we have a situation like

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 this, maybe go to a family member, a hospital. The  
4 mother, the other son that was there were in the  
5 crime scene. They were witnesses to it as well, so  
6 they definitely had to be questions. But we'll  
7 definitely go back and discuss that, because of  
8 course they were dealing with unimaginable trauma at  
9 that time, and we go to make sure we show that same  
10 concern.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I mean, the fact  
12 that she showed restraint, because I think if you  
13 tried to drag me into a precinct after my kid has  
14 been shot and killed in front of me, I'm going to--  
15 I'm going to get arrested right after. Like, that's  
16 not--

17 CHIEF MADDREY: [interposing] And I  
18 understand. No,--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: [interposing]  
20 You're not going to take-- yeah, I'm not going in  
21 there that lightly.

22 CHIEF MADDREY: Seriously, I do  
23 understand that. I understand how you feel.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: It's horrible.  
25 It's horrible.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHIEF MADDREY: but again, we don't even  
4 want to see situations like that.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah.

6 CHIEF MADDREY: Listen, our core mandate  
7 is to protect life.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: That's right,  
9 everybody.

10 CHIEF MADDREY: And when people call for  
11 help, our job is to get them-- you know, to get them  
12 out of whatever situation they're in safely.

13 Overwhelmingly, we respond to these type of calls and  
14 we do a great job. Tragically, this incident didn't  
15 happen that way, and we're going to look at it every  
16 way. We're working with the DA's office. We're  
17 going to look at it. We're going to improve where we  
18 can improve as an agency.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah. Okay, I  
20 appreciate that. I just have two really quick  
21 questions. One is, have we received any additional  
22 resource from the state to cover the cost of the  
23 illegal cannabis shop enforcement efforts? And two,  
24 regarding the NYPD budget, how much of it is set  
25 aside for precinct vehicle replacement cost? Not the  
repair part of it. I'm actually looking at the



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 replacement. Some of my precincts are reporting that  
4 they're working with, you know, a very limited fleet  
5 of vehicles making it difficult. So we were giving  
6 out turkeys in November, and we had to like figure  
7 out how to get those presents to the precinct because  
8 they only had one van, and I-- you know, so I'm  
9 trying to get a better understanding of how much of  
10 the budget is geared towards that as well.

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: Okay, so  
12 I'll start with cannabis.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yes.

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: We know that  
15 recently the state passed a budget and it had some  
16 provisions in there. I'm not-- we've been speaking to  
17 OMB about what the Department needs financially in  
18 order to assist with the closing of the shops. We  
19 know that on a personnel services side, that's like  
20 we're going to be an unfunded overtime project. We  
21 will-- we're not sure what that's going to look like  
22 yet.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Is the state  
24 helping with that?

25 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: I think  
we're liaisioning [sic] through OMB to have that

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 discussion. We don't-- we're not sure what those  
4 costs will look like yet. I think we just started a  
5 pilot inspection program last week. So we're going  
6 to monitor that spend. We already have an overtime  
7 code set up for that. When it comes to the OTPS  
8 side, it's a lot smaller. Our property clerk is  
9 evaluating our space, because we know there's going  
10 to be a lot of vouchered evidence, and so they're  
11 making accommodations to make sure they have the  
12 right supplies and space to do that. That we're also  
13 talking to OMB about. So the costs aren't totally  
14 ironed out yet, but we're operationalizing to be able  
15 to track them with that and to see what that path  
16 forward would be.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay, and the  
18 fleet?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: So, in the  
20 November Plan I'm aware that part of our PEG to meet  
21 the five percent target was to for two years reduce  
22 funding to replace vehicles. and I think as a  
23 practical matter what that tells us is that that  
24 funding reduction was to extend the useful life of  
25 our fleet by two years, right, before we can make  
replacements again. We've been discussing that with

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 OMB. We do have some vehicles that-- you know, are  
4 out of service rate has gone up. So our plan is to  
5 do-- really analyze that, do a targeted, you know,  
6 ask in adoption plan of coming in this month for  
7 those that are most critical to be replaced.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay. I really  
9 would appreciate that. and I'm sorry, I have one  
10 really important question regarding an incident that  
11 happened in my district where Mr.-- former NYPD  
12 officers Tim Pearson [sp?] went to Randall's Island  
13 to-- I guess it was an attempt to identify four  
14 individuals who had supposedly assaulted an officer.  
15 Not sure if it was a security officer, an NYPD  
16 officer, but you know, either way he ended up at  
17 Randall's Island at the HERRC with 100 police  
18 officers, two drones, wearing an NYPD jacket and no  
19 warrant, and I would love to know what that cost and  
20 who authorized that. And is it normal practice to  
21 allow non-members of the NYPD to use police gear?

22 COMMISSIONER CABAN: So I can tell you  
23 that Tim Pearson's not a member of the NYPD, and I  
24 believe this is an active investigation by DOI to  
25 this incident.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay. So, you're  
4 not going to comment on--

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: [interposing]  
6 Council Member, I want to make sure we're getting you  
7 accurate information. If it's okay with you, we're  
8 going to-- we will get information about that and we  
9 will get back to you. I don't think we have sort of  
10 the information here to provide to you, but we will  
11 come back to you with that.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I would appreciate  
13 that, because I find that to be an abuse of, you  
14 know, power, and 100 officers for four people with no  
15 warrant is ridiculous. So,--

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: [interposing]  
17 Council Member, I'm not sure that's exactly what that  
18 operation was about, but I don't have the answer for  
19 you here. We will come back to you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay. I  
21 appreciate that. Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I have questions  
23 from Council Member Cabán followed by Hanks and  
24 Restler.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. Before  
I go into my questions, I just-- I want to-- like

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Deputy Commissioner Gerber, for like lawyer to  
4 lawyer, say that you were asked questions by Chair  
5 Brannan about the general department-wide policy  
6 regarding social media as it exists today and going  
7 forward. It was not about a specific tweet. A  
8 specific tweet was used as-- there's not a question  
9 here, so you can hold your-- you can hold off on your  
10 mic-- was used as a reference point, but it wasn't  
11 about the tweet. You could and you should have  
12 answered. You chose not to and so my request is that  
13 that policy be sent to this council. Now I'm going  
14 to begin my questioning, and I'm just going to put it  
15 out there. If the question's not being answered or  
16 if there's filibustering, I'm going to interject.  
17 I'm going to start with going back to some of the  
18 protests around the universities. For what purpose  
19 did the NYPD originally obtain the Bearcat vehicle  
20 that was then eventually used at Hamilton Hall? What  
21 was the original purpose for that vehicle? And how  
22 much did it cost?

23 CHIEF ARAMBOLES: Good afternoon. So,  
24 the plan was to use the Bear as called. It's a  
25 ballistic-- I'm sorry. It's a ballistic engineer

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 armor response vehicle. So the reason we use that  
4 vehicle, it was to easily and--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing]  
6 Original purpose of the vehicle, why you obtained it?

7 CHIEF ARAMBOLES: The vehicle could be  
8 used for many, many reasons, for safety reasons, to  
9 help the public in scenes where there's shots fired  
10 somewhere.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay.

12 CHIEF ARAMBOLES: We could put an  
13 innocent bystander inside the vehicle to protect  
14 them.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay. So I'm  
16 going to ask you how much did the vehicle cost?

17 CHIEF ARAMBOLES: The vehicle is  
18 approximately close-- I'm not 100 percent sure, but  
19 it's about like \$700,000.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay. I'm going to  
21 move on. I'm not aware of any reports that any of  
22 these students had guns that required a militarized  
23 vehicle that's bullet-proof.

24 CHIEF ARAMBOLES: Ma'am--

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing] My  
next question--

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHIEF ARAMBOLES: it's not a militarized-

4 -

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing] My  
6 next question is going to be--

7 CHIEF ARAMBOLES: [interposing] But I  
8 need to answer that question correctly.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Sir, my next  
10 question is going to be on the accidental discharges.

11 CHIEF ARAMBOLES: It's non-military.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Sir--

13 CHIEF ARAMBOLES: I'm sorry.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: So, this was asked  
15 about before, but NYPD spokesperson stated that there  
16 are about eighth accidental discharges by NYPD per  
17 year. How many times have weapons been accidentally  
18 discharged in 2024 so far?

19 CHIEF MADDREY: We'll get back to you  
20 with that.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay. And in any  
22 of those instances, did you find that the  
23 unintentional discharge was in violation of NYPD  
24 policy as described in section 202104 of the Patrol  
25 Guide?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHIEF MADDREY: Yes, we do a force review  
4 board. We have had accidental discharges where we  
5 found they were in violation.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: and for this  
7 particular officer that discharged his weapon, is he  
8 still permitted to carry a weapon while on duty  
9 today?

10 CHIEF ARAMBOLES: [inaudible]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: That's a yes or no  
12 question.

13 CHIEF ARAMBOLES: As right now, he's  
14 administrative and he's not carrying. He's retrained  
15 until we find further-- until the investigation by  
16 force investigation division is resolved.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Chair Brannan, may  
18 I ask two more quick questions?

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yes, go ahead.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: So, of the 282  
21 students arrested, how many students did the NYPD  
22 decide to issue desk appearance tickets? What was  
23 the reason that at least 46 of those protestors  
24 arrested weren't given DAT's for their low-level  
25 charges, which is mandated by statute at this point?  
And what was going on with people being held in



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 custody longer than the 24 hours constitutionally  
4 required in Roundtree V. Brown, especially given that  
5 this was a planned action by the NYPD and so many  
6 units were deployed. Why wasn't the law complied  
7 with?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: so I'll take  
9 part of that. On the last piece with regard to  
10 Roundtree. As you know, Roundtree is a presumption.  
11 It's actually not an absolute rule. There are--  
12 there can be exceptional circumstances, so I think  
13 that's important here.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: But you created  
15 those circumstances by not issuing more DATs and  
16 processing these [inaudible].

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Council  
18 Member, what I'm also going to say is that I agree  
19 with you that some of these processing, it took too  
20 long and we need to do better and we have to work on  
21 that. So, on that we agree. I don't agree that there  
22 was a violation of Roundtree, because I do think  
23 there was unusual circumstances here, but I agree  
24 that some of the processing took too long and we need  
25 to improve on that and we're going to work to improve  
on it.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: But do you agree  
4 that you were-- the Department was in fact supposed  
5 to issue way more desk appearance tickets than ended  
6 up. And we didn't get the number, by the way.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: No, we don't give that  
8 desk appearance tickets for burglary.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Council  
10 Member, I think what you're getting at-- I could be  
11 wrong. I think you're getting at the issue that's  
12 being litigated now in the Douglas case, if I'm not  
13 mistaken. That was about desk appearance tickets in  
14 the field versus desk appearance tickets back at a  
15 precinct or at a MAPC [sic]. And as you know, that's  
16 a matter of dispute between Legal Aid-- I believe  
17 it's Legal Aid, and the NYPD and it's currently being  
18 litigated.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I caught the  
20 cheeky response about burglary, and for folks who  
21 don't know, the legal definition of legal burglary  
22 is--

23 UNIDENTIFIED: [interposing] I know what  
24 it is.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: trespass with the  
intent to commit a crime therein, which could be

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 anything as simple as a violation or a small piece of  
4 property that was damaged or whatever it is. So it  
5 could be something that little that you are then over  
6 charging and over arresting with a non-violent felony  
7 that carries mandatory minimum upstate time that you  
8 then leverage in a criminal legal process.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Council  
10 Member, they took over a building, barricaded it.  
11 there was an article this morning, actually, maybe  
12 you saw it, about how the guards, you know, people  
13 who were working in that building were absolutely  
14 terrified, and it sounds like at first at least one  
15 of them was not able to leave because they had tied  
16 the doors.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I mean, I heard  
18 lots of folks were absolutely terrified by the  
19 militarized vehicles, by the accidental discharge  
20 that went off, by the use of force by the Department.  
21 I am over my time, and so chair, I apologize. I'm  
22 going to wrap. But I find your answers to be wholly  
23 unsatisfactory and entirely unconvincing [sic]. Thank  
24 you.

25 CHIEF MADDREY: The Department responded  
out there at the request of Columbia. We were very

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 restrained out there. We spoke to the young people.  
4 We did our job properly out there, alright. We  
5 responded to a call for help from the university.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Questions from  
7 Council Member Hanks followed by Restler.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Thank you, Chair  
9 Brannan, Chair Salaam. So, my questioning revolves  
10 around the Neighborhood Safety Teams and the  
11 Community Response Teams. So, the Neighborhood  
12 Safety Teams have been launched a little over two  
13 years, and you testified that there are currently 147  
14 members in NST uniform deployed to 24 precincts and  
15 four police service areas. I believe when it was  
16 first launched it was nine precincts. What was the  
17 reasoning of the bump in the additional precincts  
18 that it was deployed, and are there any metrics to  
19 support that bump?

20 CHIEF LIPETRI: I can talk a little bit  
21 about that, because I was part of the working group  
22 prior to forming the Neighborhood Safety Teams. So  
23 no, that's not accurate. It was not nine precincts.  
24 So we looked at violent crime. The metrics we used  
25 were the most violent crime in the Bronx, the  
shootings. So we looked at approximately, like I

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 described before, the top 25 commands which make up  
4 75 percent of the shootings historically citywide.  
5 So that's kind of where we built it out from, but it  
6 was not nine. It was more than that.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Thank you for the  
8 clarification. So what is the current budget of the  
9 Neighborhood safety Teams? Maybe I should complete  
10 my sentence. Yes, what is the current budget of the  
11 Neighborhood Safety Teams?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: I'll have to  
13 get back to you on that. I apologize.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Okay, thank you.  
15 So may I ask an additional question, Chair?

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Thank you. So,  
18 during the hearing we discussed the vacancies in 911.  
19 So recently in Staten Island we've received several,  
20 several calls from our constituents saying that when  
21 they call 911 they're issuing-- they're saying high  
22 call volumes, and officers were on the scene for--  
23 you know, they didn't get there in time. This  
24 Samaritan had been calling 911 since 7:30. And so we  
25 just wanted to understand-- you know, we just  
recently all of the-- excuse me. All of the elected

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 officials in Staten Island put a letter out really  
4 asking about what is the status of the 911 system  
5 where it's not being answered, and we're getting  
6 tremendous amounts in volumes of calls in. So I just  
7 wondered if you could speak to that, and should New  
8 Yorkers be concerned about the 911 system?

9 ASSISTANT DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GAMBLE:

10 So, Council Member, we also received that inquiry  
11 through DCPI. I believe the inquiry that 911 was  
12 down for 30 minutes in Staten Island. We reviewed,  
13 and I think that call did come in. There were delays  
14 and there was heavy call volume during that period of  
15 that specific case in question. But there was a 50-  
16 minute-- within 50-minutes after the time they  
17 reported that they had started calling, we had a 911  
18 call on record, and within nine minutes we had a  
19 response from EMS. Now, there have been increased  
20 delays that have been created. We have a new  
21 contract with PCTs in terms of the scheduling of  
22 days, 10-hour days for four days a week versus the  
23 five days a week eight hours, and also the change was  
24 implemented during the same time there was a break  
25 from school. So I think that-- we had some growing  
pains and adjusting and making sure operationalizing

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 that change, but we've normalized it already and  
4 we're working with the unions to make some more  
5 changes to make sure that during high-volume periods  
6 we don't experience those [inaudible].

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: And you'll be  
8 giving us a formal response to the letter that's  
9 freaked everyone out.

10 ASSISTANT DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GAMBLE: Of  
11 course.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Okay, I appreciate  
13 that. That concludes my questioning. I just wanted  
14 to thank you all for your testimony and thanking the  
15 men and women who put on a uniform. We want to thank  
16 you very much.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: We have questions  
18 from Restler followed by Holden.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you very  
20 much to the Chairs and the Speaker, PC and team.  
21 Thank you for coming today, and congratulations Chief  
22 Maddrey, again, on passing the bar. I am-- I just to  
23 want to say I'm disappointed by the lack of  
24 responsiveness to questions from the Speaker and  
25 other Council Members today. I think hiding behind a  
DOI investigation to fail to provide direct answers

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 to Council Member questions is inappropriate, and I  
4 do hope that information will be provided in writing  
5 and follow-up, because there's no reason not to  
6 provide direct answers to the questions that have  
7 been put forward today. And I'm disappointed-- it's  
8 the first time I can recall the Chief of Patrol not  
9 showing up for an Executive Budget hearing and  
10 answering questions. That is a serious  
11 disappointment as well. I am very concerned about  
12 the return of Broken Windows policing since Mayor  
13 Adams came into office. We've seen a-- I think we're  
14 on pace for a four-fold increase in the number of  
15 summons that are going to be issued this year. Stop  
16 and frisk, pedestrian stops are up 90 percent,  
17 basically doubled. Misdemeanor arrests are up 51  
18 percent. Adult incarceration is up 30 percent. Youth  
19 incarceration, kids in jail have doubled. So across  
20 the board we are just sweeping more and more and more  
21 of young people, especially young Black and Brown  
22 people into our criminal justice system. And the  
23 effect that it's having on crime-- on solving and  
24 preventing crimes in our communities is significant.  
25 We've seen response go up dramatically year over  
year, and imagine you've all had a chance to review



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 the data since the last time you came before us, is  
4 that right?

5 CHIEF LIPETRI: Yes, yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: So you do have--  
7 and you now verified the Mayor's Management Report is  
8 a city report that has accurate information?

9 CHIEF LIPETRI: I saw the report. I have  
10 the response times in front of me.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Okay, so--

12 CHIEF LIPETRI: [interposing] As we sit  
13 here-- do you want me to answer the question?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Okay. Please,  
15 let's-- for critical crimes in progress, can you give  
16 us the response times?

17 CHIEF LIPETRI: Sure. So, look, you can  
18 look at response time a lot of different ways. I'm  
19 going to look at it the following way. You have the  
20 event create. So, the event creating [sic] means the  
21 job comes up on the screen. The dispatcher has the  
22 job in front of them. Then you have the dispatch  
23 time, and then you have the arrival by the officer.  
24 So the officer has to put him or there 84, or a sharp  
25 dispatcher will put them 84, even if they don't put

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 themselves 84, but they start coming over the radio  
4 to inform--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing] So,  
6 this is end to end, is that what you're giving me?

7 CHIEF LIPETRI: No, I'm not giving you  
8 end to end.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Okay.

10 CHIEF LIPETRI: That would be close-out  
11 job. I gave you event time to dispatch time to when  
12 the officers arrive.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Okay.

14 CHIEF LIPETRI: So, right now we're about  
15 flat from last year. We're at about a 14-minute--  
16 now, this is not critical. Critical--

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing] No,  
18 I'm asking for critical.

19 CHIEF LIPETRI: Critical, we're about  
20 seven minutes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: You're about  
22 seven minutes. So historically it'd always been about  
23 five minutes. Where were we at last year on  
24 critical?

25 CHIEF LIPETRI: Last year we're about  
six, six and half.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Six, and back in  
4 FY19 we were at five. So for critical crimes in  
5 progress, the most serious crimes happening in the  
6 City of New York, when guns are shot, when robberies  
7 are happening, when people's lives are at risk, it's  
8 taking 40 percent longer from pre-pandemic times for  
9 NYPD to respond, is that right?

10 CHIEF LIPETRI: Look, if we want to--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing]  
12 Just yes or no.

13 CHIEF LIPETRI: No, I can't answer that  
14 question.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: You can't answer  
16 that question?

17 CHIEF MADDREY: Council Member, so one  
18 thing you have to understand about response times is  
19 that, you know, it's an average. One bad job can  
20 skew all the numbers. So we could have 20--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing] But  
22 how many jobs have you responded to--

23 CHIEF MADDREY: [interposing] I'm just  
24 giving an example. We can have 20 critical jobs and  
25 we can respond with lightning quick. We have one bad  
job where officers can't get to because they're on

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 another job, they're on a shooting, they're dealing  
4 with something--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing] I  
6 hear you, but Chief--

7 CHIEF MADDREY: [interposing] It does skew  
8 the numbers.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: you're  
10 responding to thousands and thousands of critical--

11 CHIEF MADDREY: [interposing] So, we  
12 really have to--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing]  
14 response.

15 CHIEF MADDREY: When we deal with  
16 response times, alright, and this is-- you know, when  
17 you asked this question last time, even before you  
18 asked that question I looked at response times, and I  
19 realize it's certain precincts that they have a  
20 higher volume of calls, they're dealing with more  
21 difficult situations and they skew citywide numbers.  
22 So we really have to drill down and look, and say,  
23 we're having an issue with these precincts because of  
24 lack of manpower, increased volume, whatever the  
25 situation may be, but it doesn't speak to the bigger  
picture. A lot of our critical response jobs, our

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 officers get there fast, they're able to make  
4 arrests. They do a good job.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Chief, I  
6 appreciate the responses, but I would just say  
7 there's many, many, many, many thousands of critical  
8 response times. So if one or two things are skewing  
9 it, it's not skewing it because there's so many  
10 thousands of calls that are coming in.

11 CHIEF MADDREY: And I disagree--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing]  
13 Secondly, there's a few precincts that have issues.  
14 Let's drill down and figure out how we can help. Are  
15 there things that we can do to be supportive in our  
16 communities if response times in those areas are  
17 skewing the data, but when you look at the citywide  
18 data, we went from five minutes to seven minutes for  
19 the worst types of crimes that are happening? That  
20 is a major difference.

21 CHIEF MADDREY: Absolutely.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And I'm really  
23 concerned about what that means for collective  
24 safety, and how we can work together to address the  
25 issue.

CHIEF MADDREY: Well, of course--

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHIEF LIPETRI: [interposing] If I could  
4 just add--

5 CHIEF MADDREY: [interposing] Just,  
6 [inaudible] and absolutely we worry about that, too,  
7 collective safety. We want to make sure-- I want my  
8 officers to get to these jobs as fast as possible.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: 100 percent.

10 CHIEF MADDREY: I want to protect people  
11 and I want to make sure they're safe. So we are  
12 looking at this. We are trying to address the  
13 commands. It's a lot of factors.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Is there  
15 anything you can say Chief that is happening now to  
16 try and address this issues so that it doesn't get  
17 worse?

18 CHIEF MADDREY: I mean, we're taking a  
19 closer look at it. My office started looking at it  
20 after the last hearing, alright. The Chief of  
21 Patrol's Office, the Chief of Crime Control Strategy,  
22 all my chiefs were looking at it. Sometimes it's  
23 leadership issues in the command. It's so many  
24 different factors.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: IT-- I've gone  
over time. I--

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHIEF RIVERA: [interposing] If I may,  
4 Chief Rivera, Chief of Transportation.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Can I just-- go  
6 ahead.

7 CHIEF RIVERA: I'm sorry. Just, we are  
8 in the midst of a pilot project that we just started  
9 on May 6<sup>th</sup>. We don't have the data. It's obviously  
10 pretty new. We looked at the 10 commands that  
11 generated the longest response times for 911 calls  
12 and 311 calls, and as a result we chose these 10  
13 commands, Brooklyn, Bronx, Manhattan, Queens, and  
14 what we're trying to do is route those calls directly  
15 to Traffic Enforcement Agents to address traffic-  
16 related issues which generally take a longer time to  
17 respond to and not always a priority. So that frees  
18 up the officers to get to the crimes in progress.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I'm happy--

20 INSPECTOR CEPARANO: Can I also just add--  
21 - sorry, you talked about 911's, but 311 calls are  
22 year to date up nine percent as well. That obviously  
23 takes a strain on our manpower and our response times  
24 for 311's were down 18 minutes year to date. So that  
25 also takes into account the strain on patrol.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And I want to be  
4 clear, since the PMMR came out, the Mayor's  
5 Preliminary Management Report that comes out, you  
6 know, once a year in-- earlier this year. We have  
7 seen some progress in the dynamic Mayor's Management  
8 Report on some of the information on response times  
9 from NYPD for non-critical crimes in progress in the  
10 ensuing few months. So there has been some areas of  
11 progress. I'm appreciative of the focus that-- and  
12 the pilot to try and address these issues in areas  
13 where there are problems. The broader trend is  
14 deeply concerning. We have not seen increase  
15 response times for FDNY or for ambulances. We are  
16 really seeing it critically for the Police  
17 Department, and so we are happy to hear that there's  
18 some progress. Would love to learn more about the  
19 pilot that's happening, and what if there's anything  
20 that we can do together to be partners to try and  
21 address and reverse the trend.

22 CHIEF MADDREY: Council Member, I assure  
23 you that we're looking at. We're taking on a lot  
24 more responsibility in the last few months, but it's  
25 something that's a priority to us. We want to make  
sure we do our jobs as quick as possible.



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I appreciate you  
4 acknowledging this is an issue and that you're  
5 working to fix it. That was not the conversation we  
6 had last time, so thank you for that and look forward  
7 to working together to try and help make progress.  
8 Thank you, Chairs.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, we have  
10 questions from Holden followed by the Public  
11 Advocate.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you,  
13 Chairs, and thank you all for your testimonies.  
14 Again, it's stellar. And I just want to mention  
15 about what was just said about response times,  
16 because I did complain at the last hearing that I  
17 don't have enough uniformed officers in my precinct,  
18 and I hear the scanner and I hear the holding five  
19 jobs per unit. Those are 911 calls. So the argument  
20 for more cops in the precincts was just made, and I  
21 need more cops. And I just want to thank you, Chief,  
22 and certainly Chief Maddrey. At the last hearing I  
23 mentioned about our squad, our detective squad down  
24 to nine detectives when they used to have 20, and  
25 they have probably one-third or more jobs to handle.  
So I want to thank you, Chief Kenny, you responded,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 both Maddrey and Chief Bastedenbeck of Queens North  
4 responded. I got four after that hearing-- after the  
5 hearing, I think yesterday I got four new detectives,  
6 and that went a long way in validating and giving--  
7 you know, obviously, detectives were demoralized  
8 because they have so many more jobs, but we need more  
9 uniformed cops, too, period, in the entire City of  
10 New York. We're down, and that-- and of course, we  
11 have more jobs now. Just one thing about Broken  
12 Windows, it worked. We have proof that it worked.  
13 Handling the smaller issues will stop the bigger  
14 issues later on. So we have to start, you know,  
15 going back to what worked in the past. But I just  
16 want to again thank Commissioner Caban for what you  
17 did at Jonathan Diller's funeral and your words.  
18 There was not a dry eye in that church, and what you  
19 did was amazing, the speech you gave, the eulogy was  
20 amazing. And the toll it takes just being there, by  
21 the way. I could see the officers. I don't know how  
22 the Police Department really keeps going, you know,  
23 keeping up the morale, how difficult that is in these  
24 times. You know, criticizing the Columbia operation  
25 which there were no serious injuries that I know of.  
You can't win apparently many times in these

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 hearings. You can't win. If you do a great job, you  
4 get criticized. If there's a mistake, you're not  
5 human. You're not supposed to make mistakes. So I  
6 think we got to get to a point where-- we don't want  
7 any more Jonathan Dillers. We don't-- you know, he  
8 was an amazing, amazing cop for three years only, and  
9 that's why I was talking to Chief Kenny. I said, we  
10 have to recognize these stars that we have working  
11 for us in New York City, and they're not recognized  
12 often enough here, and I think we need to look at.  
13 They risk their lives every time they leave the  
14 house. So, I could only thank you guys. I mean, you  
15 keep us safe. It's so important. Anybody that's not  
16 recognizing that-- anybody that's not recognizing  
17 that is really not being honest. Because I listen to  
18 the scanner, I do, and I hear what's going on. I  
19 hear that the cops are stressed and every-- they're  
20 seeing the worst of society. They're going to job  
21 after job and there's problems, and they have to  
22 solve it. And when they make a mistake, when they  
23 are human, it's blown up. They're human beings,  
24 alright. They're just like the rest of us, and they  
25 have feelings, and they have problems, and they have  
a home life, and they risk their lives every day when

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 they go out and we should thank you all for that.

4 Thank you. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. We have  
6 questions from the Public Advocate followed by  
7 Council Member Stevens.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you, Mr.  
9 Chair, and thank you Commissioner, Chief Maddrey  
10 Esquire, congratulations, and Deputy Commissioner  
11 Kinsella and all the folks who are here today. Thank  
12 you for giving us the opportunity. I did want to  
13 flag that question about response times increasing  
14 have happened before the How Many Stops Act have gone  
15 into effect. So I just want to make sure we put that  
16 on the record. Commissioner, when I go to many  
17 places, left-leaning and right-leaning, I ask a  
18 couple questions. I ask how many people think that  
19 crime's an issue we have to address, they raise their  
20 hands. How many people think that police are our  
21 partners is getting that done, they raise their hand.  
22 How many people think police alone can solve it?  
23 Most people don't raise their hands. I think most of  
24 the folks here have that same thought process.  
25 Throughout the testimony it sounded like we were  
heavily focused on just policing. [inaudible] the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Commissioner has the focal point of what's causing  
4 crime to go down I know is an important role for him  
5 to play. I also know it's going down across the  
6 nation. So something is happening as well. Don't  
7 want to take away the risks that the men and women  
8 take to respond to acute situations that are going  
9 on. But my question is, and you said you get what  
10 you pay for in your testimony which I think that you  
11 do. Just in your opinion-- and I just have an  
12 opinion. Why is there so much stress and tension  
13 around the conversation of the thing we should agree  
14 on which is you are correct you get what you pay for,  
15 but many agencies don't have access to the same  
16 overtime. In the same time we're talking about  
17 things that are going on, why you need overtime, I  
18 have never had the DOHMH here discussing why their  
19 overtime is through the roof because they're  
20 addressing mental health crisis. Same thing with HPD  
21 addressing housing and homelessness crisis. So as we  
22 try to push the conversation to where we know it  
23 needs to go, which is other places getting the  
24 funding that they need so that we can relieve the  
25 Police Department from responding to things they  
shouldn't be. Why is that conversation always so

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 contentious when we all say we agree on the things  
4 that I said?

5 COMMISSIONER CABAN: As far as the agency  
6 concern, obviously the Police Department our main  
7 goal's right there, reduce crime and keep everyone  
8 safe. And I'll say it over and over again. That's  
9 the way I said it my opening remarks. Public safety  
10 is a shared responsibility, and that's why we're all  
11 here to take part of talks like this, dialogues like  
12 this, because we know there are other agencies that  
13 could help in public safety. That's exactly why  
14 we're here.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Agencies and I  
16 think organizations. I guess I'm trying to figure  
17 out why is it-- the comments get so contentious when  
18 we're trying to find a way to do the thing that we're  
19 saying we should be doing?

20 CHIEF MADDREY: Thank you, Mr. Public  
21 Advocate. I don't disagree with you. I've been  
22 saying for years and years, when the police are  
23 called it's too late, alright? That means the family  
24 broke down, the school broke down, the church broke  
25 down, the community broke down, social services broke  
down, and now we're called in. The reason why we're-

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 - you know, our overtime budget is as high as it is,  
4 because we're the ones answering the millions of 911  
5 calls a year. We're the ones that's always  
6 responding. I can't tell you how many jobs I've  
7 responded to in my 33 years. Like I just said, this  
8 is really not a police job, but people call because  
9 they're looking help. They're looking for immediate  
10 answers, and we come in, we're the ones that are  
11 giving it to them. I'm not disagreeing with you and  
12 I don't believe we're trying to make it a contentious  
13 thing. We're the Police Department. We're here to  
14 speak about what we're doing, how we're trying to  
15 address crime, how we're willing to work with the  
16 communities and do different things. Spoke about our  
17 meeting with the CMS providers, how we want to do  
18 different things. There's just other conversations  
19 that need to be had, but no one is disagreeing.  
20 There should be other things that help out before we  
21 have to deal with it.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: IT just seems  
23 every time we try to do the thing whether it is try  
24 to get some funding that maybe shouldn't just go to  
25 all this overtime, but to other places, there's anti-  
cop rhetoric that was told. We try to switch to make

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 sure that officer not responding to mental health  
4 calls, there's pushback of anti-cops. So, it's just  
5 hard to have a conversation we agree on when every  
6 time we try to do the thing that you're saying, we  
7 get tremendous pushback to even move the needle a  
8 little bit. So I just-- we should just think about  
9 that. We're trying to do what it is we're saying  
10 we're agreeing on. So the less that we can get the  
11 "oh, you're just anti-cop, pro-criminal rhetoric,"  
12 the more we can move this thing forward. And Mr.  
13 Chair, if I can I had an additional question, just  
14 switching it, because I-- this is about the social  
15 media post. I know there's some things that can't be  
16 spoken about. The question I have about that was,  
17 does the police leadership and I guess the Mayor  
18 believe that all the posts have-- forget about the  
19 ones you can't speak about that are under  
20 investigation-- that all the posts have shown the  
21 courtesy, professionalism, and respect that the  
22 Police Department says it should.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: So, Council  
24 Member, again, the inquiry as I understand it from  
25 DOI and I can't speak for DOI, of course. But my  
understanding is they're looking at the broader



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 question that I think you're posing, right? They're  
4 looking-- it's not just-- not just particular post.  
5 It's the larger social media policy, strategy, so  
6 again, it is critical to let that play out--

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: [interposing]

8 Okay, so--

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: and have--

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: [interposing]

11 To be clear, you can't speak about any posts that  
12 have happened and you can't speak about any posts  
13 going forward?

14 CHIEF MADDREY: Public Advocate,

15 overwhelmingly we put out posts every day, and we put  
16 out great posts, community stuff, good police work  
17 and stuff. The Speaker took us through a line of  
18 questions this morning. Our Counsel spoke. We want  
19 to move on from social media. We want to talk about  
20 other issues. We want to talk about crime. We want  
21 to talk about the things we're doing and how we  
22 could--

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: [interposing]

24 The reason it's important to me is because the Police  
25 Department wants to make sure the community trusts  
that in very stressful situations they will get

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 people who are trained to not respond in kind as much  
4 possible and to respond with courtesy and  
5 professional respect. It's hard to see how that  
6 happens if publicly on social media that's not  
7 happening. So, the only thing is if you can't  
8 respond to the past social media and the future  
9 social media, that's a different conversation to  
10 have, but you're still going to tweet. So, like, you  
11 can't talk about it, but I'm assuming that's still  
12 going to happen.

13 CHIEF MADDREY: I can tell you  
14 personally, and I'm pretty sure many of my colleagues  
15 as well, how many people have reached out to me  
16 personally through social media and the things that  
17 we've done-- we did in the past and things that we  
18 constantly do to help people out. Our social media  
19 accounts have done-- have been a tremendous help to  
20 many people, alright? But we've addressed the social  
21 media issue. You know, our Counsel spoke. We want  
22 to just move on and talk about crime and other issues  
23 that are going on right now.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,  
25 Chair. I don't-- it's hard to move on because the  
post may still happen, but I hear what you're saying,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 and I've used my time. If we could get a response to  
4 the Chairs-- I did want to ask how PD makes decisions  
5 of when it's going to use-- what I sense is there's  
6 going to be like private security for institutions  
7 like Columbia and others that may ask for it. I  
8 don't know if that line of questioning is-- I can  
9 still ask that, which I did.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Public  
11 Advocate, if you could just repeat the question. I'm  
12 not sure I--

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: [interposing]  
14 So, I know that Columbia and I think you said earlier  
15 NYU may have asked as well for I guess additional  
16 police presence after the students were removed. I  
17 think that kind of amounts to some kind of private--  
18 we're securing space for a private institutions. And  
19 so I think-- I'd like to know how much it costs if  
20 you know. But two, when do we-- how do we make those  
21 decisions?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: First, one  
23 thing just to clarify on sort of the record. During  
24 the break, it was also-- I think Fordham may have  
25 also asked about putting officers on campus. So I  
think-- given the requests I think it was Columbia, a

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 request from NYU, a request from Fordham. Again, in  
4 terms of the deployment I'm only aware of right now  
5 being deployed at Columbia.

6 CHIEF MADDREY: Just to answer the  
7 question, we have raised the issue that if our  
8 officers are going to be on these private  
9 institutions, that it shouldn't come from the City.  
10 That it shouldn't come from the City, that it should  
11 be compensated from the schools.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yeah--

13 CHIEF MADDREY: [interposing] Something  
14 that OMB will deal with at our--

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: And just also  
16 when do we do it, and what private citizens can  
17 request that is another just compensation--

18 CHIEF MADDREY: [interposing] Well, you  
19 know, we do have an off-duty employment thing.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Yes.

21 CHIEF MADDREY: Where our officers are  
22 paid by private companies, Target, movie sets, movie  
23 productions. So you know, along the lines of this,  
24 this is something that's being presented and  
25 [inaudible]. I don't have the details. It's out of

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 my purview, but OMB has been in touch with our budget  
4 commissioner and they're working through that.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Let me make  
7 one more point. I understand what you're getting at,  
8 and it is important to acknowledge, these are  
9 extraordinary circumstances that we're talking about,  
10 and you know, I think -- this is not a situation  
11 where we-- as you know, we don't generally deploy  
12 officers on private property outside paid detail  
13 program, but I think what we've had recently in  
14 situations at universities and particularly at  
15 Columbia, it has been extraordinary circumstance, and  
16 we've tried to address it.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: thank you.

18 And I want to-- my previous colleague. I want  
19 Jonathan Diller's name to be remembered. That was a  
20 horrific incident. I can understand how it can  
21 reverberate around the Police Department doing the  
22 job that we ask. I want everyone to be safe. I  
23 wanted John Diller to be safe. I want Kowaski Trauig  
24 [sp?] to be safe. I want Win Rozario to be safe.  
25 I've been to funerals of officers who have died,  
people who have been killed by officers, people who

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 have been killed by other civilians. Their pain  
4 looks very similar of the people who are mourning.  
5 So my hope is that we can mourn together and prevent  
6 it from happening by having the conversations about  
7 what we need to do, how we use the Police Department  
8 and what other agencies and communities need to be a  
9 real part of that conversation. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Questions from  
11 Council Member Stevens followed by Carr.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Good afternoon.  
13 We're now in the afternoon [inaudible]. I'll be  
14 really brief, and just a couple of things even before  
15 I ask my line of questioning. You know, I think  
16 contrary to some people's belief it's always like,  
17 oh, you know, you guys are asking tough questions or  
18 you're always beating up on NYPD, and I think that  
19 that's not the case, because I feel like if you see  
20 me at any hearing, my job is oversight and so I'm  
21 going to ask the questions that need to be asked.  
22 And also, just thinking about the relationship. I  
23 have a great relationship with officers, and so I  
24 think sometimes we come here and it always seem like  
25 we're against you. That's not the case. And you  
guys mentioned like getting a new class. My hope is

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 that the 44 is getting additional officers, because  
4 we know I have a tough district. We know we have a  
5 lot of shootings and a lot of crime in our area, and  
6 so our job is to think about how do we work together  
7 as a community. And so it sometimes just kind of  
8 gets me frustrated because it's always like, oh, you  
9 guys don't like the cops. It's not the case. Our  
10 job is oversight and the same way your job is to  
11 prevent-- not prevent crime, but to fight crime,  
12 right? And so those are our jobs and so it just  
13 looks differently. And again, it doesn't matter  
14 who's sitting at the table, I'm going to ask the  
15 tough question because that's what the people of the  
16 16<sup>th</sup> district brought me here to do. And just-- I  
17 know Deputy Speaker Ayala spoke a little bit about  
18 the Win family and their experience. I was at the  
19 rally yesterday, and as a mother and as a person I  
20 was like heartbroken to hear how the family was  
21 treated after the fact. The fact that they couldn't--  
22 - that they were taken immediately to the precinct as  
23 if they committed a crime, the fact that the brother  
24 spoke about how he only had on a pair of shorts and a  
25 shirt, and he was really cold, and he asked if he can  
get clothes. He was told no. And they didn't do

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 anything wrong. And so even thinking about moving  
4 forward and procedure-wise, we need to really be  
5 thinking about how do we make sure everyone is safe,  
6 and how do we make sure that everyone is taken care  
7 of, and the same way we do your officers. And so  
8 that is a problem, and there's a clearly a blind spot  
9 that together we have to fix, and thinking about how  
10 do we do this moving forward. First of all, we  
11 shouldn't be thinking about how we do this moving  
12 forward. Because first of all, we need stop killing  
13 people, especially on mental health responses. So,  
14 that's what we need to focus on and not that, because  
15 this incident, we shouldn't-- I don't-- it's  
16 heartbreaking and on both sides, right. It's just a  
17 terrible situation. But one of my questions in my  
18 first question-- and I'm going to ask a bunch of  
19 questions, because I don't want y'all to filibuster  
20 me, because every time I ask questions y'all take 20  
21 minutes. I'm going to ask my all questions. Get  
22 your pens ready. One, my first question is going to  
23 be how do you guys plan to repair the relationships  
24 with communities moving forward? Because every-  
25 like, it's not going to be fixed through a basketball  
game. It's not going to be fixed through tweeting out



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 pictures of y'all talking to the community. What is  
4 the real plan that you guys are working on to repair  
5 the relationship? Because every time there's an  
6 incident like this there's a tear in the community,  
7 and what happens is it makes your job harder. It  
8 makes our job harder to trust, and that's a problem,  
9 because we are community. We have to work together.  
10 So I really want to think about what is the  
11 comprehensive plan that you guys are working on. And  
12 here are a number of other questions. Earlier today,  
13 you stated that there was a number of staffing at  
14 NYPD's Public Relations budget with 86 individuals.  
15 Can you clarify what the total budget for the  
16 Department is and how much of that goes to personnel?  
17 What is the total number of uniformed cops who are  
18 currently on NYPD mental health co-response teams,  
19 and what is the current budget for that? And when  
20 will NYPD release the next round of data on how many  
21 people who are connected to services through those  
22 teams, and how does NYPD monitor the effectiveness of  
23 those teams? And also, does the NYPD determine which  
24 subway station mental health co-response teams are  
25 deployed in, and is the public-- is there a way for  
the public to track that data?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER STEWART: Deputy  
4 Commissioner--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: [interposing] I  
6 told y'all to get y'all pen ready. That's why I know  
7 you know how to take notes, so don't say you couldn't  
8 take all them notes.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER STEWART: Deputy  
10 Commissioner Mark Stewart, Community Affairs.

11 Listen, I could sit here and read off all the  
12 programs that we have in our communities, which I'm  
13 not going to do, because--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: [interposing]  
15 Please don't.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER STEWART: We started--  
17 - I'm trying to run off-- what we're trying to do-- I  
18 started a clergy community conversation unit. We  
19 have to have these conversations in our communities.  
20 What I'm looking at in New York City is that-- it's  
21 like a relationship. I've been married for 34 years.  
22 We're going to go up and down in our relationships,  
23 but we're not going to duck away from the  
24 conversations. We had 20 Black females from 14 to 16,  
25 and we asked them all if they like the police. They  
all said no. After an hour, hour and a half, of

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 talking to them and engaging with them, we had 10  
4 that had an open mind. So that tells me that we're  
5 missing in our communities our conversations. Black  
6 and Brown, our communities, that's the problem. So  
7 when we go out there and have these conversations  
8 with our kids and with our communities, we're going  
9 through a generation of dislike of Police  
10 Departments--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: [interposing]

12 Absolutely, and there's a huge generational--

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER STEWART:

14 [interposing] in the Black and Brown--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: disconnect

16 between older adults and young people.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER STEWART: That's

18 right.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: But I'm asking

20 what is the plan, right? Because I get that. I am a  
21 person who believes we should be having these  
22 conversations [inaudible] but I think that we need to  
23 have-- and this is something I've been saying for the  
24 last two years. We need to be thinking about a  
25 comprehensive plan to rebuild the trust. The  
community does not trust you. People that you're

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 supposed to keep safe do not trust you, and that's a  
4 problem for you to do your job. And so-- and it's  
5 not just NYPD. Young people don't like adults,  
6 period, because I had a conversation with them. They  
7 said they don't feel safe by any of us, so we're all  
8 failing. So, I think, even with the programs I think  
9 we have to get to a place where we're thinking about  
10 what does it really look like, what does community  
11 policing really look like because there is no plan,  
12 because we got to have conversations, but what else?  
13 What else are we doing other than sending out  
14 pictures and having basketball games and having, you  
15 know, our-- what is it, nights, Saturday nights, and  
16 all that stuff.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER STEWART: No, no, no,  
18 no. I'm not even talking about that. Listen,  
19 basketball games and sports, when we have sports it  
20 has to be educational, too. Basketball and sports  
21 that's the engagement. What's the retention plan?  
22 The retention plan is that we get these kids and have  
23 a conversation and get these programs to keep them in  
24 like our Explorers, our youth, our Blue Chips from  
25 our program. What we're missing is that mentorship  
to keep our kids and them coming back, and that's

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 what we're doing. I'm in the communities all day,  
4 every day. I get to talk to these kids, and these  
5 programs are very important, because we don't have  
6 any stats to say--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: [interposing] But  
8 it's not just the kids.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER STEWART: No, no, no,  
10 no. I do Community Affairs. I do the--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: [interposing] I  
12 know.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER STEWART: I do the  
14 parents, the--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: [interposing] I  
16 hear you, but--

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER STEWART:  
18 grandparents and the adults.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: We running out  
20 of time, because I know-- but again, I think again--  
21 and I'm happy to sit down with you, not here because  
22 we're on the clock, to have a real conversation  
23 because I think we have to develop a real plan, and I  
24 think you're at the start of making a plan, but I  
25 think that we need to continue to think about what  
that looks like and rolling it out as soon as

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 possible because every time incidents like this  
4 happens, it tears the fabric of the relationship.

5 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: And  
6 we want--

7 CHIEF MADDREY: [interposing] And  
8 Council-- go ahead.

9 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: And  
10 we want that. We want that uncomfortable  
11 conversation. We welcome it, because the only way to  
12 get better is to do better and have those  
13 uncomfortable conversations. But I will you tell  
14 that, Ms. Stevens, that part of us trying to do  
15 better is employing people that look like the people  
16 that we serve in the communities. We put a major  
17 emphasis on that, alright? So, we welcome that. We  
18 want to sit down. We want to-- we want to know how  
19 can we get better with our community. But we don't--  
20 I want to stress this to you, please, everyone here  
21 today. We don't go out-- we don't wake up in the  
22 morning and say that we want to hurt adults--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: [interposing] We  
24 know that. Agreed.

25 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: Let  
me finish. Let me finish. Right? Any life loss is

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 terrible, is terrible. Jonathan Diller-- when any  
4 life lost is-- it's hurtful for all parties involved.  
5 So, as an agency, as people-- for the people in the  
6 community, we welcome to work together to bridge that  
7 gap so that we don't continue to have thee  
8 unfortunate circumstances.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: No, I agree, and  
10 we're all on the same page with that, but again, a  
11 comprehensive plan is to be-- and I think we have  
12 pieces of it. even the things you're talking about,  
13 the programming, even talking about the tough  
14 conversations, those are pieces, but we need a real  
15 plan, a real comprehensive plan to be rolled out to  
16 really be thinking about how we're going to do this,  
17 because again, every time these incidents happen, it  
18 destroys your relationship with the community, right?  
19 And so-- and that's a problem, because then people  
20 like me don't feel like I can call you guys when I'm  
21 in trouble, and that's what it's supposed to be. And  
22 so we have to stop dancing around it and making it  
23 seem like, oh, if you say anything against us, you  
24 know, they don't like us. It's not true. My  
25 community needs police officers, because we have a  
lot of crime. There's a lot of things that's going

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 on, and we have to work in partnership. I asked a  
4 number of questions, and y'all know y'all not going  
5 to get to it. So I will make-- I would like for you  
6 guys to respond to the Chair with those answers, so  
7 that we could get it, because I asked about five  
8 questions and we didn't get to them. So, I know  
9 there's a lot of colleagues still waiting to ask  
10 their questions.

11 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Council  
12 Member. Now we have questions from Council Member  
13 Carr followed by Brewer.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you, Chair.  
15 Commissioner, First Deputy Commissioner, Chief, it's  
16 great to see you, and on behalf of all the people I  
17 represent, I want to thank you and everyone in your  
18 department for the outstanding work that you do each  
19 and every day to serve and protect and keep our city  
20 safe, whether it's our patrol area chiefs, Chief  
21 Ackavoy [sp?], Chief Golatta [sp?], our wonderful COs  
22 that serve Staten Island and Southwest Brooklyn to  
23 everyone across the NYPD working in the subways to  
24 keep us safe on our commutes, addressing issues at  
25 Columbia where a university can't even guarantee the  
safety of students, faculty, and employees of Jewish



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 heritage. The work you do is heroic, and I thank you  
4 so much for it each and every day. My biggest  
5 problem with the NYPD is there's not enough of you.  
6 And actually, when I was running for office, I was  
7 calling for us to return to a budgeted headcount of  
8 40,000 uniformed officers, and as much as I would  
9 love to push for that today, I'd love to hear about  
10 the agency's efforts to actually reach the existing  
11 budgeted headcount, because I know that it's  
12 difficult with attrition, folks retiring earlier than  
13 ever before, and I'd love for you to talk about why  
14 you think that is, what you're doing to address it,  
15 and try to get us to our current budgeted headcount  
16 so maybe we can talk about even getting beyond that  
17 at some point.

18 COMMISSIONER CABAN: So, I'll call our  
19 Chief of Personnel John Benoit.

20 CHIEF BENOIT: So, again, we made-- this  
21 leadership team made a bunch of substantial changes.  
22 One of the changes that we made in terms of how we  
23 recruit. We never had-- you know, we always had a  
24 recruitment section, but we never had a unit that  
25 could supplement or augment the operations of the  
recruitment teams. Meaning, to pinpoint areas of

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 vulnerabilities in terms of people that we need to  
4 recruit. So a major shift that we did in my tenure  
5 when I was appointed to serve as Chief of Personnel--  
6 this is one of the mandates that was placed on me to  
7 establish a community outreach team. So in addition  
8 to our recruitment section, I established-- under the  
9 direction of the Commissioner and the First Deputy  
10 Commissioner and Chief of Department, we established  
11 a community outreach team. Now, we have a  
12 recruitment section. We have limited amount of  
13 staff, but another strategy that we just implemented  
14 was working with our 41 fraternal organizations.  
15 That has been very, very effective, by the way. So I  
16 don't have specific metrics in terms of our success,  
17 but I have some. I want to point out that we've  
18 effectively utilized our 41 fraternal organizations  
19 to have those officers take us to those places where  
20 we're going to get the greatest bang for our buck,  
21 and we've never done that before. That's a major  
22 culture shift. Another thing that we're doing is  
23 something that we've never done as an organization,  
24 we don't wait for the candidates to complete their  
25 online application before we engage them. We  
actually engage them when the Department of Citywide

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Administrative Services gives us a list of  
4 preliminary passers. We've never done that. This is  
5 something that we just started doing over the last  
6 several months. It's keeping us in the game in terms  
7 of our fight to maintain attrition and to, you know,  
8 tread water if you will. So, we're actively doing  
9 it. I'm seeing right now for-- just to give you a  
10 quick example without hardcore numbers. I can  
11 certainly get back to you. But a hard to recruit  
12 demographic point is African-American males. Now, I  
13 can tell you that since I've been in this role and  
14 using the concepts that I just laid out, we're up in  
15 that demographic category by 0.06. I'd like it to go  
16 a little bit higher. I actually think when I go back  
17 and check I'm going to be slightly higher. One of  
18 our most recent classes, we've hired the highest  
19 number of African-American candidates than we've had  
20 since-- in about four years. So these tactics that  
21 we started utilizing are helping. They're working.  
22 I have other goals, but they're working. Just to  
23 give you another example, another major win for us is  
24 our Pakistani population. We've increased the  
25 Pakistani officer population by 184 in my short  
tenure in my role, and that's a direct result of us

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 working with our fraternal organizations to have them  
4 tell us where we need to go, what locations do we  
5 need to go to. And now I can have the biggest  
6 recruitment unit in the City. I can take somebody  
7 from any one of the 41 groups to have them take me to  
8 these locations and now the people that are in these  
9 locations could see them, meaning they could see  
10 themselves in that role, because we're bringing these  
11 members with us. Like, oh, I never-- maybe I can be  
12 a cop. It actually-- it's effective. It's working.  
13 It's relatively new, but I suspect that in future  
14 sit-downs I'll have some positive news to report to  
15 you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: That's good to  
17 hear, and I think targeted demographic pushes in  
18 certain communities is the way to go. But I think we  
19 also have to acknowledge the weight of words, right?  
20 And we're talking about that a lot in this hearing,  
21 and I think public discourse has not been helpful to  
22 your recruiting drive, because it is so disrespectful  
23 to the police and the work that they do, and so I  
24 think we have to do a lot to turn that around. And  
25 my last question, if I can have the Chair indulge me,  
is regarding retail theft. Retail theft is a huge

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 problem across the City, and I've seen some numbers  
4 recently to-date where there seems to be an uptick in  
5 Staten Island, and so I'd love to know what the  
6 Department's doing to address that, because small  
7 business is the cornerstone of the jobs economy in  
8 our city and it's crucial to our quality of life.

9 CHIEF LIPETRI: Good afternoon. So,  
10 you're correct. There is a slight uptick in retail  
11 theft this year driven by petty larcenies, and when  
12 I'm out and about and speaking to the businesses, you  
13 know,-- extremely data-driven. We know that 25  
14 percent of the businesses-- 25 percent of the  
15 businesses account for 60 percent of the retail  
16 theft. We absolutely know who the recidivists are in  
17 New York City. You know, 542 people, you know, have  
18 31,000 total arrests in their life. You know, half  
19 of those, 17,000, are retail theft. We so we do see  
20 an uptick in petty larceny, but the reason for that--  
21 and you know, part of the reason for that is better  
22 reporting. You know, we are encouraging businesses  
23 to report retail theft. You know, at community  
24 meetings, Commanders, myself, everybody on this dais,  
25 we're constantly saying if we don't know about it, we  
can't help. So, we've established our business

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 district in and around retail theft locations that we  
4 have, you know, the highest crime. But you know,  
5 arrests are up. We-- 25,000 retail arrests last  
6 year, and retail theft did come down. You are  
7 correct, there is a slight increase in petty  
8 larcenies.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you. I  
10 appreciate the answers, and I love to be involved in  
11 working maybe with some sort of mini hiring hauls in  
12 the future to help the Department.

13 CHIEF BENOIT: If I can provide a little  
14 bit of comfort. We have-- we have a paid detail  
15 program that 6,058 uniformed personnel participate  
16 in. So, the paid detail program is when we have--  
17 our members are working off-duty. They wear our  
18 uniform. They serve 225 vendors and cover 499  
19 locations. The largest vendor that we have is Target  
20 and Burlington Coat Factory where many of these petty  
21 larcenies are occurring, and I just want to report to  
22 you that that's increased. So, the interest in  
23 officers looking to participate in the program  
24 actually increased. So, just-- we're out there. I  
25 mean, in addition to the people that we have that are  
working-- when they're working we have a contingent

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 of officers that do the paid detail program when  
4 they're not working.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you. Good to  
6 know. Thank you, Chair.

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, we have  
8 questions from Council Member Brewer followed by  
9 Joseph. We got to stick to the clock, because we're  
10 running out of time.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: thank you very  
12 much. First of all, thank you to all of you, but  
13 also to the 20, the 24, and Central Park. So quite a  
14 few questions. I'll go through them and then you can  
15 answer them. I-- Council Member Ayala asked about  
16 the smoke shops. Obviously, I've tried to work to  
17 close them. and my question is not the budget,  
18 because I know you said you're working with OMB to  
19 come out with a budget hopefully, but I wanted to  
20 know what role you'll play in pursuing not only the  
21 cases of the smoke shops, but some of the people who  
22 own them who have a very long history of challenges  
23 in terms of their illegal activity in the past, and  
24 how you're going to coordinate with the District  
25 Attorney? Those are my questions. Number one is  
smoke shops. Number two, apparently there's a big

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 drop in parking violations issued since pre-COVID. I  
4 guess that would be 2019. So I want to know why, and  
5 if that's true. And obviously, if people are parking  
6 illegally like the-- I would say the ice cream truck  
7 right now outside in the bike lane, example. So I  
8 want to know why that's happened. Now, in terms of  
9 the issue of no tow pound in the borough of  
10 Manhattan. I know you've been looking for one. We've  
11 all been looking for about, I don't know, eight years  
12 now. So my question is, is it costing more to take  
13 cars elsewhere? Most of the cars that park illegally  
14 and get towed are in Manhattan. So I want to know  
15 more about the cost of that and what we're doing to  
16 address that. I also want to ask-- I know Chief  
17 Maddrey, we talked about Planned Parenthood. There  
18 are more challenges than ever, an awful lot of cops  
19 there every Saturday first of the month, and it is--  
20 I mean, I know you need support and so does Planned  
21 Parenthood, but it's about 80 police officers.  
22 That's a lot, it seems to me, for a fairly small  
23 demonstration. I'd like to understand that. And  
24 also what is your parade overtime or street festival?  
25 I don't know if that's combined. I also want to know  
what your Public Relations budget is. If you can't



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 give it all to me now-- and then I was-- I heard  
4 today that I didn't realize that 911, you do not get  
5 necessarily social work case worker support. It's  
6 just for those that are coming in regularly or  
7 through the precincts. I want to understand how we  
8 can get more support for the mental health issues.  
9 We've been talking around it, it seems like, all day  
10 today. but what I also never understand about PD, as  
11 great as you are, you are the eyes and ears, and  
12 sometimes you're a little siloed [sic], you know? In  
13 other words, you should be able to tell other  
14 agencies this is a big problem. And I know it kind  
15 of maybe goes to the Mayor's Office, but it never  
16 seems to get beyond the work that you do, and you  
17 need help. So I want to understand more about what  
18 else do you need to address the mental health issues,  
19 not only response, but on the street? People are not  
20 happy about public safety. It's not that you're not  
21 doing a great job, you are, but the mental health is  
22 taking over. It's completely taken over. So, those  
23 are my questions for now.

24 INSPECTOR CEPARANO: Good afternoon.

25 Obviously, there was a lot of questions there, but--

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] Yes.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 INSPECTOR CEPARANO: I'll get into the  
4 first question which was surrounding smoke shops.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Yes.

6 So recently, as everybody knows, the NYPD  
7 was given some of the authority from the Sheriff's  
8 Office--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] Yep.

10 INSPECTOR CEPARANO: to civically close  
11 these illegal smoke shops down. We are hitting the  
12 ground running, and our Community Response Team which  
13 consists of three captains, seven lieutenants, 22  
14 sergeants, and approximately 144 police officers  
15 around the city alongside the Sheriff's Office. All  
16 of them are trained and deputized by the Sheriff's  
17 Office.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay.

19 INSPECTOR CEPARANO: Since May 4<sup>th</sup>, we've  
20 hit-- we've inspected 26 of these smoke shops  
21 alongside of our Sheriff's Department, and 21 of  
22 those locations are currently padlocked. I can say  
23 that 78 summonses have been issued regarding OATH  
24 summonses. That's by the NYPD, New York Sheriffs,  
25 and DCWP. Total of 206 bags of marijuana products  
and vape pens, gummies, and things of that nature

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 have been seized, and a total weight of 3,037 pounds  
4 of this marijuana.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Great.

6 INSPECTOR CEPARANO: Moving forward into  
7 the future, May 15<sup>th</sup>, we're going to be aggressively  
8 inspecting. Our targeted inspection is 60 smoke shops  
9 a day which is going to entail obviously a lot of  
10 manpower from our Community Response Team, the  
11 Sheriff's Department, around all eight patrol  
12 boroughs. And we have a whole system set up  
13 collecting all this data, entering it into an Excel  
14 program that is going to be transparent through the  
15 NYPD, obviously the Mayor's Office, and everyone  
16 throughout the Sheriff's Office. So, we look forward  
17 to, you know, conducting these inspections citywide,  
18 and close these illegal smoke shops down.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. And  
20 you'll work with the DA, I assume, and try to find  
21 some of these owners of--

22 INSPECTOR CEPARANO: [interposing] So,  
23 this is civil proceeding, so this is going to be with  
24 OATH.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 INSPECTOR CEPARANO: Our legal  
4 Department--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing]  
6 Terrific.

7 INSPECTOR CEPARANO: They're going to be  
8 doing those hearings.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you.  
10 That's very helpful.

11 CHIEF RIVERA: So, with reference-- Chief  
12 Rivera, Chief of Transportation.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Yes.

14 CHIEF RIVERA: With reference to the  
15 traffic enforcement summonses written by our Traffic  
16 Enforcement Officers, we are down about eight  
17 percent.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: 19 percent?

19 CHIEF RIVERA: No, I'm showing 2,833,000  
20 versus 3,000,098 for a difference of 265,000, 8.6  
21 percent. I'll be happy to share the data with you  
22 offline. So, the issues with our short [inaudible]  
23 are two-fold. First, as I mentioned before, we are  
24 down 358 agents. We do have 114 that are currently  
25 in a class, and they're expected to graduate in July-  
- July 26<sup>th</sup> of this year. The other issue that we do

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 have is the same operational demands that are placed  
4 on patrol are often placed on agents. Any time that  
5 there's an unplanned event, especially when it's in--  
6 it's traffic related, we have to reroute traffic. We  
7 have to account for pulling officers off of  
8 enforcement duty and assign them to operational  
9 intersection control. So, that has placed a  
10 significant strain on our ability to enforce traffic?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: But has that  
12 always been true, or are there just more events?

13 CHIEF RIVERA: Well, it's ramped up  
14 significant since October 7<sup>th</sup>, you know,  
15 operationally--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing]  
17 Okay. So, it's more demonstrations, not so much  
18 events.

19 CHIEF RIVERA: Well, even with the events  
20 as well, because as we're trying to save money with  
21 assigning officers. In the past we assigned officers  
22 to traffic intersections. Now we're replacing that  
23 with agents in an effort to save, you know, money  
24 operationally on officers. A lot more demand is on  
25 our division than in the past, but again, we are-- we  
do have 114 in the pipeline. Hopefully we can get

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 those out-- those agents out to the street, you know,  
4 soon. So, with regard to the tows, I'm sure you're  
5 well aware, 2017 we had the 207 Street pound, and  
6 then we lost-- in 2021 we lost Pier 36.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Yep.

8 CHIEF RIVERA: So, now we're limited to,  
9 you know, Bronx, Brooklyn, and Queens.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Yeah, so what are  
11 we doing about this?

12 CHIEF RIVERA: So, we are in talks with  
13 DCAS as well as our facilities division. There's a  
14 conversation that needs to-- that will happen on  
15 Monday where we're looking at-- it's a location in  
16 the Hunt's Point area of the Bronx.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: That's not  
18 Manhattan.

19 CHIEF RIVERA: I understand that, but the  
20 price of real estate in Manhattan has gone up  
21 significantly as we're all well aware. As far as the  
22 ability to have a lot that can handle the capacity of  
23 the vehicles that we need to tow as well.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. Can I just  
25 say, if the casino doesn't go through in the area  
around Hudson Yards, Community Board Four is happy to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 have it there. I don't think the casino is going to  
4 happen. That's another story. But that's a location  
5 that you should look at. Hudson Yards, they are  
6 interested in having the tow pound there.

7 CHIEF RIVERA: We'll certainly consider  
8 it amongst the other locations currently--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing]  
10 Hunt's Point, now that's some place in the Bronx.  
11 That's too far.

12 CHIEF RIVERA: It's close enough to  
13 Manhattan. You know, it's right around mid-Manhattan,  
14 you know, once you get over some of those bridges.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Alright. I know  
16 our time is of the essence. So, tow-- look at the  
17 location, though, please.

18 CHIEF RIVERA: We certainly will.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. I had more  
20 questions.

21 CHIEF MADDREY: I'll address Planned  
22 Parenthood. The message with them, it must have got  
23 lost in translation. I'll assure that we cut that in  
24 half.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. Thank you  
very much.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Now we have  
4 questions from Council Member Joseph followed by  
5 Ariola.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you. Good  
7 afternoon all. I have a couple of questions that's  
8 not even on record. One, I've seen a slew of  
9 motorbike shops that are opening up. I have three in  
10 my district. Who would be the division to handle  
11 that? Another question, the parking around my  
12 schools. I do walk. As the Education Chair I visit  
13 schools all the time, and I'm realizing that parking  
14 is happening on the sidewalk, so it creates a safety  
15 issue for our students getting to and from school  
16 because it blocks the bus stop. It blocks them  
17 getting into the school. I have a particular school  
18 I can talk offline about that, and I would love that  
19 to be addressed. So, and Commissioner Stewart, we  
20 talked about young people, right? When we talk about  
21 young people, do we talk to them? Right? We usually  
22 talk about young people, but we don't talk to them.  
23 So moving forward, if we want to engage young people  
24 in conversations and making decisions, we must truly  
25 put them at the table to talk to them and listen to  
26 them, not talk at them, but listen to them and take



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 their suggestions. And we talk about this all time.  
4 You want young people to come to your program. Before  
5 you created the program, did you talk to that young  
6 person? Maybe that's not what they need, right? So  
7 maybe moving forward in terms of engaging young  
8 people, talk to them. Find out what they want and  
9 what they need and how can that partnership-- but  
10 that relationship we talk about building, right, it's  
11 about building trust. And I talk about this-- I've  
12 been talking about this for two years since I got  
13 here, right? I'm a mother of four Black boys, I told  
14 you that. It has to be with trust. If we constantly  
15 pull them over, they're not going to trust you. My  
16 son drives a car, and that happens still today,  
17 right, that you pull him over. So, he's not going to  
18 trust you. So, trust is something that's built and  
19 it's two ways. It's not ever to bash you guys, and  
20 that's exactly what we talk about. It's about  
21 building relationship and trust, right? So, for  
22 those programming, I think you should create an  
23 advisory board with young people at them to help you  
24 make decisions with them, not for them. And answer  
25 to my questions around--

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHIEF RIVERA: So I can address the first  
4 part of your question with regard to the bike shops.  
5 We do have a taskforce that goes into the bike shops.  
6 If you're talking about moped or bicycle shops--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: [interposing] All  
8 of them.

9 CHIEF RIVERA: So, we go into the shops  
10 and we inspect for illegal micro-mobility devices.  
11 We'd be happy to get the three locations that you  
12 just mentioned. But when we do go in, it's a stiff  
13 penalty if it's an illegal moped. You're talking  
14 about a gas-operated device that doesn't have a VIN,  
15 it can't be registered, can't be insured. That's a  
16 thousand dollar OATH summons per bike that the owner  
17 will get. For a bike shop, if they're selling an  
18 illegal bike, and usually the indicator of the illegal  
19 bike is the battery size, as well as whether the  
20 pedals are fixed. If the pedals are operable, that's  
21 a legal bike, but depending on the ultimate speed  
22 which is no more than 25 miles per hour. But when we  
23 go in and that's illegal, we don't seize the actual  
24 bicycles, but they do get a summons for not having  
25 their bikes-- I'm sorry, we do seize them if they're  
illegal, but we give them a summons if they don't

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 have the actual sticker that shows what the battery  
4 capacity is. In reference to the schools, the  
5 parking issues, I'll be happy to get those locations  
6 for you after this session.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: That would be  
8 helpful. Thank you. Chairs, thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Questions from  
10 Council Member Ariola on Zoom followed by Brooks-  
11 Powers.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you,  
13 Chairs. I would like to thank all the members of the  
14 NYPD for coming out today. I would like to say that  
15 I agree with the Public Advocate and my colleagues  
16 for talking about mental health, but that's not on  
17 you. That's on the DOHMH. That's on the CBOs that  
18 are getting funded on various levels of government  
19 that are not doing the proper outreach that's needed  
20 to prevent you from having to be called to go into a  
21 home or office and something tragic could possibly  
22 happen both to one of your officers or the people in  
23 that room. Why aren't we holding them accountable?  
24 You were called to go to Columbia, and I watched that  
25 whole operation, and I saw you walk into something  
that anything could have happened, and little to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 nothing that was illegal took place except against  
4 you. You treated everyone with respect and with  
5 professionalism, even though at all the protests and  
6 at the schools and at Columbia you were not treated  
7 the same way, and I applaud you for maintaining your  
8 level of respect for yourselves, the badge that you  
9 wear, and the professionalism that you exude. That  
10 being said, I'd like to talk about the 911 system. So  
11 I'm going lump my questions as well. Where do the  
12 911 operators work out of? Are they allowed to work  
13 from home?

14 CHIEF BELTRAN: Hi, Council Member Chief  
15 Beltran.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: How are you,  
17 chief?

18 CHIEF BELTRAN: Yeah, that-- we do have  
19 civilian members within the Police Department in our  
20 bureau that are allowed to work from home. The PCTs,  
21 SPCTs, and Principal PCTs who are the employees at  
22 the 911 centers PSAC1 and PSAC2 have to report on-  
23 site. I think the negotiation with them was they gave  
24 them the reduced days since they have to appear. So  
25 they have to make all their appearances at work at  
the facility.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Okay. And so is  
4 that because it was initiated during COVID, and is  
5 there a plan to bring them back?

6 CHIEF BELTRAN: Yeah, they've never been-  
7 - the PCTs have always worked in the office. I think  
8 there was some administrative people that maybe were  
9 permitted to do so before. That was before I came  
10 back, but all the PCTs, all the 911 civilian workers  
11 have to appear at work on site every day. We've  
12 reduced the number of days by increasing the number  
13 of hours per day, but they're-- they show up to work  
14 every day.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Okay, great. And  
16 are you at your budgeted headcount for operators or  
17 you need more?

18 CHIEF BELTRAN: I think we need more. I  
19 think the issue here is just being able to hire to  
20 meet our headcount. This is issue for us like it was  
21 discussed earlier today, that it's a challenging  
22 position to recruit and to hire, but we could  
23 definitely use more.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Okay. And because  
25 of the reduction in the headcount that you're  
experiencing, what happens when calls are at a high

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 volume in periods where there are not enough  
4 operators on staff? What is the protocol?

5 CHIEF BELTRAN: The protocol is when we  
6 do have high volume periods that are more than can be  
7 handled by the call-takers that are plugged in is  
8 that they're given a recording. If it's not an  
9 emergency to call 311. What we're trying to  
10 institute now is to encourage them to stay on the  
11 line, because a lot of callers when they get the  
12 message are hanging up, and when they hang up,  
13 they're more or less increasing to the call volumes.  
14 It's kind of self-reinforcing issue. But like I said  
15 before, with the new scheduling that we have working  
16 with the unions to improve the scheduling for some of  
17 those heavy volume periods, we expect to address that  
18 in short order.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Great. And  
20 Chief, I'm going to call you offline to talk about a  
21 couple of issues. I don't want to take up the time of  
22 this body right now. So, but thank you for the job  
23 that you do.

24 CHIEF BELTRAN: Thank you, Council  
25 Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Appreciate it.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Questions from  
4 Council Member Brooks-Powers followed by Yeger.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,  
6 Chair. Thank you for your testimony today and the  
7 work that you've been doing in my district following  
8 the tragic loss of Detective Diller. A couple of  
9 questions starting with policing in the MTA, wanting  
10 to understand that a bit better. The NYPD has  
11 reported that it issued nearly 120,000 summonses for  
12 fare beating in 2023. How many of those have  
13 resulted in frisks? How many have resulted in  
14 search?

15 CHIEF KEMPER: So, it's a complex answer.  
16 What I can say is just about 97-- 96 point whatever  
17 percent of the people we stop for fare evasion in  
18 2023 were not searched. They were treated as a civil  
19 violation, if you will, and released on a TAB  
20 summons. So that would leave two point whatever  
21 percent that either received a Criminal Court summons  
22 or arrested. Certainly, if you're arrested your  
23 frisked and searched. And to be arrested on a fare  
24 evasion charge, it's usually-- what we see is you  
25 have an active warrant for your arrest, and/or you're  
found in possession of a weapon. So, 97 percent of

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 people are not frisked. They're stopped. They  
4 present ID, and they're released within a few minutes  
5 with a civil TAB summons.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: And then  
7 within that two percent that you're saying the frisk  
8 is happening is due to all of them being arrested?

9 CHIEF KEMPER: Well, it's-- each  
10 situation is different, but the overwhelming super  
11 majority of people that are frisked, if you will, or  
12 searched are subsequent to arrest on a fare evasion.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Does NYPD  
14 have like a more-definitive statistic on that in  
15 terms of out of that grouping of those who are  
16 frisked, what proportion of those are then arrested  
17 versus those who are not? And for those that are  
18 arrested, what are the types of offense and for those  
19 who are--

20 CHIEF KEMPER: [interposing] So,--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS:  
22 [interposing] I'm just sorry. And for those that are  
23 not arrested, what led to the frisk?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Can I jump  
25 in? If I may just jump in for a second, because this  
might help. So, usually when we talk about-- you



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 know, we have obviously lots of data regarding frisks  
4 and searches. In a level three situation where we  
5 have a reasonable suspicion to stop, right, you're  
6 not making an arrest. You may or may not make an  
7 arrest. You're making a level three stop, and then  
8 there are all sorts of rules about when you can frisk  
9 and when you can't, when you can search and when you  
10 can't, and we obviously-- we have reports we're  
11 required to do every time we have a level three stop  
12 and we have to track frisks and searches alike. But  
13 I think what Chief Kemper is getting at is that in  
14 the fare evasion context, if you're talking about an  
15 actual arrest, you're almost always going to be  
16 talking about a situation where you have a probable  
17 cause arrest to begin with, that is someone was  
18 caught evading a fare. Most of those times we're not  
19 effectuating an arrest as Chief Kemper said, but in  
20 that universe, almost always you're going to be a  
21 level four situation, probable cause arrest for some  
22 reason, one of these narrows reason we've chosen to  
23 actually effectuate and arrest, and then every time  
24 someone's arrested, right, there's going to be a  
25 frisk and search pursuant to arrest-- pursuant to  
arrest. So I don't think we would necessarily track

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 that, because every arrest has sort of a search ends  
4 into arrest that comes with that. But I think what  
5 we can do is, we can certainly, you know, pull the  
6 data, look at it, and to the extent we have data  
7 that's responsive to your question, we will provide  
8 it to you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Chairs,  
10 can I just ask two and a half more questions, please.

11 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I'll give you two  
12 minutes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: thank you.  
14 In terms of the overtime, in the Prelim hearings I  
15 had inquired about wanting to know if there was a way  
16 that PD could project what the hours are that they  
17 needed, so instead of it being overtime hours, that  
18 the hours are fully accounted for in the budget, is  
19 that something that PD is able to do? And then also,  
20 with the coordination with the Governor's efforts to  
21 address the subway spike in crimes that was taking  
22 place, what is the coordination with NYPD, MTA, and  
23 the state patrol in terms of the searches that were  
24 taking place at the train station? And then finally,  
25 the 116<sup>th</sup> precinct which is in my district, I wanted  
to just get a status update on when that precinct

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 will actually be open. There's also the satellite  
4 that's still there, and my understanding is the  
5 satellite for the 105 precinct was still-- be owned  
6 by NYPD and there will still be operations out of  
7 there. But now that we have a brand new state-of-  
8 the-art precinct in the 116<sup>th</sup> precinct, I just want  
9 to understand better what that means in terms of the  
10 law enforcement presence there, in terms of is it  
11 going to be still having units out of the satellites?  
12 And is there a way that we can develop that into  
13 maybe a community space instead now that we once  
14 again have a brand new precinct?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: So, I'll  
16 take the first question. Council Member, nice to  
17 meet you. I don't know if you had the benefit of my  
18 overtime explanation a few hours ago.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Sorry, I  
20 had to step away.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: That's okay.  
22 So our overtime is really quickly broken down into  
23 three pieces. There's the Adopted Budget which  
24 you're probably looking at that covers our core  
25 overtime. And there's a significant amount of grants  
and reimbursement funds that are loaded in over the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 year. So it's increased over the year incrementally.  
4 That's federal, state, other categorical and inter-  
5 city funding that's significant. And thirdly, some  
6 of the unfunded overtime projects we have like  
7 asylum-seeker coverage, the enhanced transit,  
8 protests, things of that nature, we manage that  
9 incrementally in financial plans with OMB. So that's  
10 why like in the January plan you saw that incremental  
11 increase for those types of one-year unfunded costs.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

13 CHIEF KEMPER: As far as the additional  
14 assets, you know, the NYPD increased our presence by  
15 a thousand additional cops, really the first week of  
16 February. So I want to make that clear, and the  
17 results were immediate. Crime was down the month of  
18 February over 15 percent. Subsequent to a few high-  
19 profile, you know, very, very tragic unfortunate  
20 incidents. I'm going to bring you to March, mid-  
21 March, probably March 15<sup>th</sup>-ish. That's when the  
22 governor announced that she was directing the  
23 deployment of the National Guard, if you will, into  
24 the subway system which started then and is still  
25 currently in place. So, our relationship since March  
15<sup>th</sup> is great. We literally work side-by-side. I

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 want to be very clear, the National Guard is not  
4 patrolling the New York City subway system by  
5 themselves. At every assignment they are with a New  
6 York City cop. They're assigned to, you know, either  
7 presence at the turnstile area with a New York City  
8 cop and/or they're assisting us at back checks.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: And with  
10 the communication, I understand you say it's great,  
11 but what makes it great? Like, how is, I guess, the  
12 chain of command when you're there? We had the MTA a  
13 few months ago come in and give their perspective,  
14 but I'm curious to hear from NYPD's perspective  
15 what's working, what's not working, how the  
16 communication is to address being preventative in  
17 terms of the crime in the subway?

18 CHIEF KEMPER: So, I'll be clear, the  
19 NYPD is in charge of public safety in the New York  
20 City subway system. Everyone else that's assigned  
21 there including the National Guard is to support our  
22 efforts. And I'll say this again, the relationship  
23 is strong, we get along, and it's well-received by  
24 the public. I want to say also that our efforts, the  
25 cops' efforts, New York City cops' efforts, since the  
beginning of February have reduced crime

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 dramatically, 15 percent reduction in February, 23  
4 percent reduction in March, 23 percent reduction in  
5 April. And I don't want to jinx it as we're sitting  
6 here right now into May, but we could always do  
7 better. We're not waving a flag of victory. We  
8 recognize that. I say that all the time. We always  
9 strive to have zero crime. We are nowhere near where  
10 we were in January. We understood the concern.  
11 We've recognized the concern and tremendous  
12 investments have been made, and those investments,  
13 you know-- and I'm proud to sit here and tell you,  
14 these investments are paying dividends.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you  
16 for that.

17 CHIEF MADDREY: In terms of the 116, late  
18 September, early October. We'll probably name a  
19 commanding officer next month, early--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS:  
21 [interposing] September, October?

22 CHIEF MADDREY: excuse me?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: You said  
24 September, October?

25 CHIEF MADDREY: Yeah, September, October.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: What's  
4 causing the delay because I was told it was going to  
5 be late spring by DDP?

6 CHIEF MADDREY: No, I don't think that  
7 was ever-- I never heard that. I've always heard  
8 mid-September, late September. So we're looking at  
9 mid-September, late September, early October. But we  
10 are in the process of finding a commanding officer.  
11 We'd like to have the commanding officer named by  
12 early to mid-June, that way the commanding officer,  
13 her or she, can start getting to the community,  
14 start developing a little bit of a leadership team,  
15 help build the Community Council, start doing certain  
16 things. So that way when it does open it'll have a  
17 community. He or she will have a community council  
18 in place. We'll have certain things in place as they  
19 start bringing in new police officers and start  
20 addressing the conditions over there in the 116.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: And it'll  
22 still have that community process in terms of the  
23 community being able to be a part of the  
24 interviewing, correct?

25 CHIEF MADDREY: Yes, absolutely. We're  
going to definitely open it up for the community to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 meet with whichever commanders submit and selected.

4 116 is going to be great. You know we have the  
5 community room there that people will be able to use.

6 In terms of the other building, you know, it's still  
7 our property. We have to sit down and strategically  
8 figure what we're going to do with it, if we're going  
9 to put different units in there, if it's more  
10 adventitious for us to put different units there to  
11 send extra support to the Rockaways, things like  
12 that, our detective units or other units. So it's  
13 something that'll be worked out and discussed.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: I think it  
15 will be wonderful to consider like maybe a community  
16 space there instead, because adding other units  
17 there-- I'm already concerned about the parking  
18 dynamics for the police cars so that they're not on  
19 the sidewalks. They're not taking up the community  
20 space in that, because parking over there already is  
21 just not great. And so it would be great to maybe  
22 repurpose that facility considering we have a brand  
23 new facility there. But thank you for the responses.

24 CHIEF MADDREY: Yes, ma'am.

25 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BARROWS: And Council  
Member, just to-- Bob Barrows, Deputy Commissioner of



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Strategic Initiatives. Just to add on what Chief  
4 Maddrey said, the late September, early October open  
5 date, that's a date that we're getting from DDC. But  
6 as Chief Maddrey mentioned, we are under way in terms  
7 of our own employment. So it's not like we're  
8 waiting until we get to that date to start staffing  
9 and moving this along. We now how much the community  
10 is anticipating this new precinct, as well as  
11 yourself.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,  
13 because that October deadline, I'm sure I'm going to  
14 get some emails and calls today about that, but that  
15 you.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, we have  
17 questions from Council Member Yeger, followed by  
18 Paladino.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Good afternoon.  
20 There we go. Good afternoon. A lot's been said  
21 today. I think you've been here for a couple hours.  
22 I think the one thing that probably hasn't been said  
23 often enough, although it has been said a little bit  
24 here, is thank you very much from the people of New  
25 York who appreciate you and notwithstanding the talk  
that you're not trusted seem to be calling you

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 notwithstanding-- call you anyway. As Chief Maddrey  
4 said, people don't call the police when things are  
5 good. People call the police when things are bad,  
6 when something got broken. Whether it's a crime,  
7 whether it's somebody not healthy, whether it's  
8 something wrong, things are not right, and that's  
9 what triggers a call to the police. Otherwise, nobody  
10 would ever call the police. So, the idea that  
11 there's a lack of trust, I'll ask the following  
12 question-- do you know of any city agency that  
13 doesn't have a social media account talking about the  
14 work that they do?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Council  
16 Member, I appreciate the question, but I just-- for  
17 the same reasons that we didn't answer earlier--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: [interposing] I'll  
19 answer it.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: we're not  
21 going to do that.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: No problem.  
23 Lawyers. So I have a view of it. As you can imagine  
24 I have a view of some things, and my view is that  
25 when the Police Department tweets about the work that  
it does, it's to create trust. It's to tell New

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Yorkers this is why you pay us and this is what we're  
4 doing, and we're doing this to protect you. So for  
5 example, a group of people took over a private  
6 building, went into that building, barring the owner  
7 there from, keeping some of the people who were in  
8 that building who didn't want to be there against  
9 their will, and the owner of the building reached out  
10 to the Police Department that said, "Hey, can you  
11 help us out?" Things were broken so they called the  
12 police. That's what happens. If things were good,  
13 they wouldn't have called the police. And then the  
14 police went and successfully. Nobody was injured.  
15 The biggest complaint that we've heard today is an  
16 accident. Discharge of a weapon when there were no  
17 longer any civilians there. That wasn't said before,  
18 that the civilians were no longer there at the time  
19 when the officer's weapon was accidentally discharged  
20 as it was being moved from hand to hand. It's not  
21 optimal. Nobody wants their weapon to be discharged,  
22 but it was accidental and nobody got hurt, and that's  
23 the biggest complaint you've gotten today about that  
24 operation. And also your use of a particular  
25 vehicle, which sounds to me that you ought to have  
one of those, maybe more if something's happening.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 You don't know who has weapons and you need the  
4 ability to actually usher the victims or potential  
5 victims into something where they can be protected,  
6 particularly if they're out on the street. So, when  
7 you're-- it's spoken about the fact that there are  
8 complaints about it, and you don't have to answer  
9 this. I know you're off that topic, but I'm on it.  
10 I want you to keep talking about it. I think there  
11 are a lot of New Yorkers that appreciate that you  
12 keep talking about it. We always talk about how  
13 Twitter isn't the real world, and it isn't, but the  
14 complaints that-- the loudest voices against the  
15 Police Department are on Twitter. It's not in the  
16 real world. It's not in the communities that we  
17 represent for the most part. The idea-- that wasn't  
18 a question because you're not going to answer. The--  
19 what's been going on in New York City for the last  
20 couple of weeks, last couple months, it's clearly  
21 escalated, and it's not because of law enforcement's  
22 fail, right? I mean, it's been escalation and there  
23 are a lot of people responsible for it escalating, a  
24 lot of people who have deliberately caused that kind  
25 of chaos because they want chaos, and the Police  
Department's response is to respond. That's their

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 job. It's not there to stop it before it happens,  
4 because you can't. Anybody can say anything they  
5 want, they have free speech. When the free speech  
6 gets to the point where it's taking over private  
7 property and threatening people's ability to live  
8 free, it's no longer free speech. It's not free  
9 anymore. There's a cost. And free speech, that cost  
10 is not free, and that's not constitutionally  
11 protected. It's not. You can't just march into  
12 somebody's house and take it over and say I'm here  
13 now and I have free speech. We appreciate you very  
14 much, and I know that there are a lot of members of  
15 this council who do. There are a lot of New Yorkers  
16 who do. We have over eight million people live in  
17 the City, and a lot of us call you, and we ask you to  
18 do things for us and for the neighborhoods that we  
19 live in. You show up. And the complaint about the  
20 response time, just want to remind for the public  
21 that we lost cops to attrition, and we lost classes  
22 of cops to replace the attritted [sic] cops. So,  
23 since this is a finance hearing, let me get to the  
24 finance part. I recognize from the testimony,  
25 Commissioner, that you have a schedule-- reinstated  
two classes July and October. So, as I understand

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 it, the fiscal implication of cops on straight time  
4 versus overtime, if you have-- if you have five cops  
5 who are on over time or 10 cops on straight time, you  
6 have double the cops, but it's actually less money.  
7 Is that a fair assessment of the finances of how it  
8 works?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: So, yes, but  
10 I think it's more nuanced than that. It's not just  
11 overtime. There's salary involved.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I'm not talking  
13 about pension cost, and--

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: [interposing]  
15 Yeah.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I'm talking about  
17 on the straight operational budget of the City of New  
18 York when we talk about the-- because the biggest  
19 complaint about your expenditures for deployment is  
20 overtime. Oh my God, there's overtime. By the way,  
21 I've been in two hearing for the last six years and  
22 four months and nine days. Never once did I hear  
23 anybody criticize or question the Department of  
24 Sanitation's overtime cost or the Department of  
25 Transportation's cost or any other agency. I know  
the Mayor said the same thing and it's true. Never

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 seen any other agencies overtime cost questioned.

4 The police are called because something happened. So

5 I'm just asking personnel-wise, if we have more ops

6 and they're only doing their shift and not a minute

7 of overtime.

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: Yes, the

9 rate is time and half for overtime versus straight

10 time.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Cheaper?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Fiscally

14 responsible? Fair to say. So we want more cops to

15 reduce the overtime?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: Well, I

17 think in concept, right, our overtime is up. Our

18 active officer headcount is down eight percent like I

19 testified before. That's six million in straight

20 hours we don't have. That's six million in straight

21 hours that may alleviate the overtime burden in

22 concept.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: If there was no

24 crime in this city, there probably wouldn't be

25 overtime, right?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SNYDER: No.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: It's not a trick  
4 question. Okay. Look, I went over my time and I  
5 know the Chairs are looking at me, and I like to go  
6 last, because it's really-- I'm not last?

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: You're not last.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I'm not last.  
9 Because my time is running out here, and this is--  
10 this may be last opportunity to keep Councilman  
11 Brannan sitting and working. We came in together and  
12 we get to leave at around the same time. But I  
13 really do appreciate you very much, and it has to be  
14 said very often and very loudly, you're doing what we  
15 have asked you to do. you all took the same oath to  
16 serve and protect our communities in every single way  
17 we can, to uphold the constitution of this state and  
18 this-- and the country and the charter of the City of  
19 New York, and our obligations are the same, whether  
20 we wear uniform and put ourselves between danger and  
21 the citizens, or whether we wear a semi-fancy suit  
22 and sit behind a microphone and pontificate at you.  
23 Our obligation is the same, but you're the one with a  
24 hard job, because your guys wake up every single  
25 morning and they don't know what they're going to  
face. And as we saw very recently in the most tragic



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 way, a baby without a father because of that. So,  
4 thank you very much and keep it up.

5 COMMISSIONER CABAN: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, we have  
7 Council Member Paladino.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Good afternoon,  
9 everybody. At the risk of sounding redundant,  
10 terribly redundant, yet the thank you's just cannot  
11 stop coming. I want to refer-- we're here of course  
12 for budgetary reasons, but it's super important that  
13 we go over a few things here. The NYPD brass have  
14 every right to explain your policies on social media.  
15 When you're not covered properly in the news and the  
16 press, I think it's about time that you started to  
17 toot your own horn, and that's exactly what you did.  
18 I really don't think you should be coming under any  
19 kind of investigation or reading in this voodoo sort  
20 of line that seems to be going around that you had  
21 criminal mischief in mind or whatever when you were  
22 simply doing your jobs. People don't understand, you  
23 were up against criminals in these universities.  
24 They weren't just simple protestors protesting  
25 peacefully. We know what peaceful protesting looks  
like. I certainly do. We've lived through it a lot,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 but we saw what could happen in 2020 and it happened  
4 in 2020, and we don't want to see it happen again.  
5 So, what you guys did was you nipped it in the bud,  
6 but you did it with the way you should do it, with  
7 respect. And you should be in return respected for  
8 the way in which you handled it. I'm terribly upset  
9 about Chief Chell. I'm terribly upset about the  
10 narrative that was put out yesterday when he was  
11 asked to speak at a town hall that everybody knows  
12 Council Member Paladino hosts a great deal of town  
13 halls, whether it's about DOT, DEP, DDC-- public  
14 safety is constant. And the fact that he was brought  
15 under scrutiny by the Daily News, New York One, and  
16 other such media is absolutely disgraceful, and I'm  
17 terribly sorry. And for Kaz as well, I'm terribly  
18 sorry. Everybody did their job. It was a tough job,  
19 but they don't understand the people, and you had to  
20 go to the people and tell them that you were faced  
21 with anarchists. You were faced with things that you  
22 guys probably maybe never saw in your-- and some did.  
23 The young guys probably never saw it. and you had  
24 every right to go to the media and defend yourselves,  
25 and the fact that this body here in this City Council  
wants to call you to task, and yet now tell you

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 nicely how much they all need more of your help, and  
4 yet when you respond to their help you get criticized  
5 and you get called out on the mat in the worst  
6 possible way. I am angered and I'm very sad, because  
7 our NYPD deserves the respect and you should be  
8 getting the respect, and please extend to Chief Chell  
9 and Daughtry that I'm broken-hearted for them, and  
10 they-- and you will continue to get the respect you  
11 need from the people that you heard from here today.  
12 So, thank you very much everybody. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Commissioner, you  
14 and your team, I appreciate you giving us your time  
15 today, and we look forward to working with you in the  
16 future. Thank you all very much.

17 [break]

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,  
19 please come to order, we're getting ready to resume  
20 with the hearing. Once again, please come to order.  
21 We're getting to resume.

22 [gavel]

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, good  
24 afternoon, everybody. We're now going to open the  
25 hearing for public testimony. Just to remind members  
of the public that this is a government proceeding.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Decorum shall be observed at all times. As such,  
4 members of the public who are not testifying should  
5 be silent, unless they are testifying at the dais.  
6 The witness table is reserved only for those who wish  
7 to testify. No video recording or photography is  
8 allowed from the witness table. Furthermore, members  
9 of the public may not present audio or video  
10 recordings at testimony, but they may submit  
11 transcripts to the Sergeant at Arms for inclusion in  
12 the hearing record. If you wish to speak at today's  
13 hearing and you have not done so already, please fill  
14 out an appearance card available at the back table  
15 with the Sergeant at Arms and then wait to be  
16 recognized at the dais. Once recognized, you'll have  
17 two minutes to speak on today's topic, the NYPD FY25  
18 Executive Budget. If you have a written statement or  
19 additional written testimony that you wish to submit  
20 for the record, just provide a copy of that testimony  
21 to the Sergeant at Arms. Also, for people that might  
22 be watching on Zoom or here today, if you want to  
23 submit testimony, you have 72 hours after the hearing  
24 is over to submit testimony. Audio and video  
25 recordings will not be accepted, only written  
testimony and it can be emailed to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov). I'm now going to call the  
4 first panel. We have Donald Nesbit from DC37 Local  
5 372 and Olivia Duong from Local 3778.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Hi, good afternoon.  
7 You can begin when you're ready.

8 DONALD NESBIT: Good afternoon, Chair.  
9 I'm Donald Nesbit, Executive Vice President of Local  
10 372, New York City Board of Ed Employees from  
11 District Council 37, AFSCME. It's an honor to be  
12 before the Committee to testify on behalf of the  
13 2,200 School Crossing Guards who we represent under  
14 the leadership of President Shaun D. Francios, the  
15 first. School Crossing Guards are often the first  
16 line of defense to improve the safety for students  
17 who walk, bicycle, take public transportation in  
18 school. Student pedestrians often face major safety  
19 traffic hazards every day crossing by double and  
20 triple-parked cars and at bus stops in front or near  
21 school buildings. These workers have risked their  
22 own safety, their health and lives to perform their  
23 vital services to the community. This role often  
24 places the school crossing guards at vulnerable  
25 positions with no immediate assistance on-hand. Just  
last year, two of our members in Queens were struck

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 by moving vehicles and unfortunately one of those two  
4 tragically lost her life. Cases like this are sadly  
5 becoming a common occurrence and this is essential  
6 that the City increase funding for additional hiring  
7 of School Crossing Guards. When such incidents  
8 happen, on duty School Crossing Guard would have to  
9 leave their post and cover the recent vacant station  
10 or post, thus leaving a school crosswalk vacant and  
11 vulnerable to accidents-- student safety. The City  
12 cannot continue shuffling our members around when the  
13 number of School Crossing Guards are not enough to  
14 begin--as the number of the School Crossing Guards  
15 continue to decline, a number of unprotected school  
16 crosswalks continue to rise. This leaves our  
17 children's safety in jeopardy. Local 372  
18 respectfully request that the City restore the School  
19 Crossing Guard positions that were cut from the  
20 previous budget to fill the priority school  
21 crosswalks. We have heard a lot of on the news  
22 recently about violence against transit workers.  
23 What we have not heard is that a similar risk exists  
24 for School Crossing Guards, and they face this on a  
25 daily basis as drivers are threatening safety every  
day as they try to keep all of us safe. This is why

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Local 372 also respectfully requests city funding to  
4 support the promotion of a citywide public awareness  
5 campaign to stop the violence against School Crossing  
6 Guards. While increasing the number of School  
7 Crossing Guard positions solve the staffing need and  
8 safety issue, it does not solve the inequalities, the  
9 equity problem that our members are currently faced.  
10 Whenever there is a snow day or certain holidays, new  
11 holidays that exist in the City of New York, School  
12 Crossing Guards are off like every other City worker,  
13 but not paid for those days. Despite working under  
14 the Police Department, School Crossing Guards are  
15 functioning similar to school support staff in the  
16 City Department of Education, yet they are not paid  
17 and we request that permanent reforms to conform  
18 School Crossing Guard pay practices is another thing  
19 to support these 2,200 members who sacrifice of  
20 themselves. Again, I thank you for the opportunity  
21 to provide this testimony, and for your continued  
22 support on behalf of Local 372 School Crossing  
23 Guards. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

25 OLIVIA DUONG: Hello, good afternoon,  
everyone. Chair Salaam, Chair Brannan and fellow

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Council Members. My name is Olivia Duong and I'm the  
4 President of Local 3778 of DC37 AFSCME, representing  
5 300 civilian NYPD professional titles such as  
6 Criminalist, City Research Scientist, Architect and  
7 Engineers. I'm here today to highlight a group that  
8 has been providing essential public safety services  
9 in the background, the Forensic Scientist or  
10 Criminalist working at the NYPD Police Laboratory of  
11 whereas mentioned today by our Commissioners is the  
12 core operation of the Police Department. Some  
13 background of what we do. We are part of the NYPD  
14 Detective Bureau and are Forensic Scientists who  
15 analyze different types of evidence involved in  
16 alleged crime such as drugs, latent fingerprints,  
17 gunshot residue, firearms, etcetera, using accredited  
18 scientific methods. We provide investigative  
19 information to detectives and our scientific findings  
20 to the District Attorneys across all five boroughs,  
21 as well as to the Federal Government. Criminalists  
22 also testify in court as expert witnesses to the  
23 result of our analysis. Our testimony educates  
24 juries to make informed and fair verdicts. Throughout  
25 the pandemic, Criminalists were deemed essential  
workers for our role in public safety, and we



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 answered them all. Council Members, there is an  
4 urgent need for a new laboratory building.

5 Currently, there are just under 400 employees who  
6 work in forensic chemistry, firearms analysis and  
7 crime scene departments out of a five-story building  
8 in Queens built in 1930. Originally a department  
9 store refitted as a college university, and most  
10 recently a chemical laboratory, the current facility  
11 is outdated and in a state of constant repair and  
12 disrepair. I believe testimony from our former Chief  
13 of Forensic Investigations Division, given a few  
14 years ago, mentioned how urgently we need a new home.  
15 Millions of dollars have been put in and continue to  
16 be put in just to assure the roof does not leak. New  
17 York City is a gateway of drugs in the United States.  
18 In the past 10 years, landscape of drugs has become  
19 increasingly variable and deadly. Fentanyl, modified  
20 Fentanyl and synthetic cannabinoids are flooding the  
21 streets, and our laboratory members are tasked with  
22 handling them day to day, hour by hour. Most  
23 alarmingly, Carfentanil has been detected more  
24 frequently in the last few months. Carfentanil is  
25 used as a tranquilizing agent for elephants and other  
large mammals. It's approximately 100 times more

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 potent than fentanyl which can be lethal at the two-  
4 milligram range. To visualize that, two milligrams  
5 is about the size and mass of one singular grain of  
6 rice. In addition to overdose among opioid tolerant  
7 users-- and even amongst opioid tolerant users, the  
8 presence of Carfentanil poses a significant threat to  
9 first responders and law enforcement personnel who  
10 desperately need the right PPE and facilities to  
11 handle those ever-potent materials.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Please conclude.

13 OLIVIA DUONG: Just to wrap up. Our  
14 operations have long out-grown the space provided for  
15 testing needs. Despite all these challenges, we  
16 continue to provide the highest quality of testing  
17 for the City of New York, and I thank the Public  
18 Safety and Finance Committee today for the  
19 opportunity to speak.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Have you identified  
21 a new location for a new laboratory building?

22 OLIVIA DUONG: That information at this  
23 point I'm not too sure about.

24 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay.

25 OLIVIA DUONG: I believe the answer is  
no. Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, thank you.

4 Thank you both very much. Okay, our next panel,  
5 Pernell Brice, William Juhn [sp?], Yuris Romero  
6 [sp?]- I'm sorry, I couldn't read the handwriting--  
7 Kimberly Saltz, and Darren Mack. Darren Mack,  
8 Kimberly Saltz, Yurin Romero, Pernell Brice, William  
9 Gun or William Juhn [sp?]. Okay, want to go left  
10 from right, right from left, whatever you want.

11 DARREN MACK: Thank you, Chair, for the  
12 opportunity to testify today. My name is Darren  
13 Mack, Co-Director of Freedom Agenda. New York City  
14 has committed to closing Rikers Island because mass  
15 incarceration undermines public safety by  
16 destabilizing communities and draining resources we  
17 need for housing, healthcare and more. Rikers is  
18 legally required to close by 2027, and our City  
19 budget must pull all the necessary resources in place  
20 to give people the support they need, close the  
21 pipelines that feed incarceration and shift to a  
22 smaller borough jail system. Unfortunately, Mayor  
23 Adams is planning to do the opposite, doing an  
24 Executive Budget proposal that will cut social  
25 services while continuing to funnel billions to the  
Department of Corrections and NYPD. The Mayor's

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 proposal to slash millions from alternatives to  
4 incarceration and re-entry services should be a big  
5 concern for all New Yorkers committed to public  
6 safety, and we thank the City Council for pushing  
7 back. New York City has an incredible network of  
8 alternatives to incarceration providers who are far  
9 more successful in preventing re-arrest and Rikers.  
10 Some providers has success rates of over 90 percent  
11 in preventing felony re-arrests for their clients  
12 within two years. ATIs cost between \$8,000 and  
13 \$22,000 per person per year, while exposing someone  
14 to the brutality of Rikers costs \$556,539 per year.  
15 Rather than cutting their funding, the Mayor should  
16 be directing the Office of Criminal Justice to  
17 actively encourage judges and prosecutors to utilize  
18 supervised release and alternatives to incarceration  
19 instead of bail remand and city sentences. Expanding  
20 the use of these alternatives is even more urgent  
21 when we consider that 90 percent of people at Rikers  
22 have not been convicted, and over 50 percent have a  
23 mental health concern. It is unconscionable that the  
24 Mayor proposes cutting funding for evidence-based  
25 programs while maintaining a \$5 million public  
relations budget for the NYPD, an agency that uses

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 those resources to attack civil right reforms and  
4 undermine the presumption of innocence. The NYPD's  
5 public relations budget should be cut by at least  
6 half, and they should not be allowed to add 1,200  
7 recruits to uniformed headcount. Lastly, this city  
8 council knows that the safest communities are the  
9 ones with the most resources. In the written  
10 testimony that we submit, you'll see a full budget  
11 analysis from the campaign to close Rikers that  
12 outlines necessary amendments to the FY25 budget.

13 Thank you so much.

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. You can  
15 begin. Just make sure your mic's on.

16 KIMBERLY SALTZ: Hello. Gooda afternoon  
17 and thank you for this opportunity to testify. My  
18 name is Kimberly Saltz and I'm a Law Fellow speaking  
19 on behalf of the Legal Defense Fund. We urge the  
20 City Council to divest from the harmful policing  
21 entity that disproportionately target Black  
22 communities and instead invest increased funding  
23 towards social services and mental healthcare for  
24 communities that are most negatively impacted by  
25 police practices in New York. The City should end  
its investment in mental health co-responder models.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 The City's approach to train police to respond to  
4 emotional distress calls or pair of officers with  
5 mental health workers is a backwards and failed  
6 approach. Nothing else strikes this point more than  
7 the recent tragic and preventable death of Win  
8 Rozario. Win was a 19-year-old who called emergency  
9 services for help during a crisis, and his calls  
10 should have been met by unarmed, trained mental  
11 health emergency responders. Instead, he was met by  
12 police who tased and shot him in front of his family  
13 in their home. While the NYPD budget is largely  
14 untouched, the Mayor's budget calls for a 24 percent  
15 decrease in funding to the Department of Health and  
16 Mental Hygiene. Meanwhile, one in five New Yorkers  
17 experiences a mental health episode each year. Our  
18 city has deep racial and economic disparities in  
19 regards to the quality and access of mental health  
20 care. In the last few years, the City has  
21 increasingly relied on the criminalization and  
22 emergency hospitalization for those in need of crisis  
23 intervention. Rather than connecting them to long-  
24 term support of holistic community-based services.  
25 For example, in 2022, the Mayor rolled out the widely  
criticized initiative that authorized first

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 responders to forcibly detain New Yorkers for  
4 psychiatric evaluation if they were deemed to lack  
5 the ability to care for themselves. According to the  
6 NYPD's own figures, 47 percent of people who are  
7 subject to involuntary mental health removals are  
8 Black. The NYPD is not equipped to conduct mental  
9 health outreach services. They are law enforcement.  
10 They are not mental health workers. People  
11 experiencing a mental health crisis require  
12 healthcare-centered response with the mental health  
13 system taking the lead. The City should direct  
14 funding towards respite centers which offers safe  
15 space for crisis recovery. They have a documented  
16 success rate in helping individuals recover from  
17 psychiatric episodes and get connected to ongoing  
18 care and support. We also need increased funding for  
19 community-based programs, such as short-term stay  
20 apartments, walk-in urgent care centers, and drop-off  
21 centers scattered throughout communities. They are  
22 readily accessible to people in all neighborhoods.  
23 The Mayor's plan to slash funding for social services  
24 threatens the vital services that most vulnerable New  
25 Yorkers rely on the most. LDF urges City Council to  
take a different, more effective path by investing in

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 communities and developing effective strategies for  
4 public safety. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

6 WILLIAM JUHN: Good afternoon. Thank you  
7 for this opportunity, Chairs. My name is William  
8 Juhn. I am a Senior Staff Attorney at New York  
9 Lawyers for the Public Interest. On March 27<sup>th</sup>, the  
10 NYPD fatally shot Win Rozario who was 19 years old  
11 while he was experiencing a mental health crisis for  
12 which he had called 911 for help. How many more  
13 individuals must die by the hands of police before  
14 you finally adopt a more-humane peer-led and person-  
15 centric approach to mental health crisis. I'd like  
16 to talk about three things today. First, the City's  
17 B-HEARD program still authorizes extensive police  
18 involvement and is likely to continue the violent  
19 responses by the NYPD. For example, in fiscal year  
20 2023, close to 80 percent of all mental health calls  
21 in the B-HEARD pilot areas were still directed at the  
22 NYPD. The City must join other cities to remove  
23 police entirely from the equation. For example, CCIT  
24 NYC is a coalition of over 80 New York City  
25 organizations and it has already developed such  
proposal in which teams of trained peers and EMTs who



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 are independent of the city government would respond  
4 to mental health crises. We therefore urge the  
5 Council to demand changes to the B-HEARD program to  
6 align it with the truly non-police peer-led model.  
7 Second, the Mayor's involuntary removal program  
8 allows untrained police officer who have no expertise  
9 with individuals with mental disabilities to detain  
10 them by force and move them to a psychiatric hospital  
11 against their will, solely because the officer  
12 believes the individuals has a mental disability. No  
13 New Yorkers should be treated this way. Lastly, the  
14 Governor recently announced that she's directing \$20  
15 million to the subway core response outreach team,  
16 the scout team which permits the use of force against  
17 people with mental health challenges. What people  
18 with mental health challenges need are supports and  
19 services such as a successful non-police SOS health  
20 teams in the subways who are trained to bring in the  
21 police if needed. We ask that you urge the Governor  
22 to instead use the \$20 million to provide for  
23 voluntary mental health treatment, respite care,  
24 food, clothing and shelter. Thank you very much.

25 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Thank  
you all very much. Okay, next panel-- again,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 apologies if I pronounce wrong or I can't read the  
4 handwriting. Raluca Anachio [sp?], Melissa Chua  
5 [sp?], Tanya Mattos [sp?], Liz Roberts from Safe  
6 Horizon, and Robert Anthony Wallace [sp?]. So, I  
7 have Robert Anthony Wallace, Liz Roberts, Tanya  
8 Mattos, Melissa Chua, and Raluca Anachio. Okay, say  
9 your name and begin. You want to-- you guys decide.

10 LIZ ROBERTS: Can you hear me?

11 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah.

12 LIZ ROBERTS: Good afternoon, Chairperson  
13 Salaam, Chairperson Brannan, other members of the  
14 committees. My name is Liz Roberts, and I am the CEO  
15 of Safe Horizon, the nation's largest nonprofit  
16 victim service organization. Safe Horizon offers a  
17 victim-centered, trauma-informed response to 250,000  
18 New Yorkers every year after an experience with  
19 violence or abuse. We use the lens of racial equity  
20 and justice to guide our work with clients, with each  
21 other, and in developing the policy positions we  
22 advocate. My testimony today will be brief and to  
23 the point. We need the help of these committees and  
24 the full City Council in urging the Mayor to reverse  
25 a \$3 million PEG to our crime victim assistance  
program. If this cut goes through, it will

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 dramatically curtail Safe Horizon's ability to  
4 respond to victims of crime and abuse across all five  
5 boroughs. At a time when New Yorkers are deeply  
6 concerned about shootings, transit crime, sexual  
7 assault, hate crimes and other forms of violence, we  
8 need a deeper investment in victim services. The  
9 last thing we need is unnecessary budget cuts to  
10 essential programs that help individuals and families  
11 to heal. Who does this program serve? In fiscal  
12 year 23, the crime victim assistance program provided  
13 services to over 26,000 domestic violence victims,  
14 over 27,000 victims of other crimes, and 811 sexual  
15 assault survivors, reaching a total of nearly 54,000  
16 victims. Because our advocates are in all 77 police  
17 precincts, nine police service areas, and all five  
18 Special Victims Division precincts, we proactively  
19 respond immediately after an incident, reaching crime  
20 victims in every neighborhood, every community across  
21 all five boroughs. The loss of \$3 million in funding  
22 will mean 11,000 crime victims who could have had our  
23 help will not receive it next year, 20 precincts that  
24 currently have on-site advocates would no longer have  
25 that support for their community, and 50 fulltime  
staff position would be impacted. Mayor Adams has

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 emphasized the importance of public safety, but we  
4 know that true public safety requires a holistic  
5 approach, addressing the root causes of violence and  
6 supporting those who have been impacted by it. The  
7 work that we do helps to break the cycle of violence  
8 and create a safer, more resilient city.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Just  
10 hit the button on your mic.

11 ROBERT WALLACE: Oh, yeah, there's an on  
12 switch. My name is Robert Wallace, known as Bob.  
13 I'm-- I live at 236 East 82<sup>nd</sup> Street, Apartment 5A.  
14 I'm a lawyer at Paul Weiss [sp?], but I'm not here  
15 representing anybody. I'm certainly not here on their  
16 behalf, but I'm here because I'm a person who's  
17 concerned about the escalation in let's call it  
18 collective violence of demonstrations and people who  
19 take advantage of those. There's been a lot of  
20 testimony for the time I was here this morning that  
21 just gets me absolutely convinced that the Police  
22 Department's doing everything they can across the  
23 board in all kinds of dangerous situations, dangerous  
24 challenges that New Yorkers and particularly the  
25 police face. And I was going to make a few  
recommendations of where the public safety budget

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 should go, except now all I can say is don't cut it  
4 and let the professionals do their jobs, because it  
5 seems to me like they're doing exactly that. My  
6 specific concerns and those of the people that I  
7 associate with are that the City has had more  
8 frequent and more highly-charged public events around  
9 the Mid-East crisis or the Mid-East events, before  
10 and since October 7<sup>th</sup>. It's around the same time  
11 private lawlessness that takes advantage of these  
12 events has also gone up, and it's affected persons  
13 and properties, the feeling of safety that people  
14 have, the feeling of safety that property owners  
15 have. I only came here today to plead that public  
16 funds that I think you have a role in recommending  
17 should, in this climate, have a larger share of any  
18 recommendation you make and that you may have ever  
19 made. So, thank you very much for listening to that.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you very  
21 much. Okay, next panel, Dominique Hood, Abdul Nasser,  
22 Bard Cash [sp?], Sofia Whetstone, David Jenkins.  
23 Okay, you can begin when you're ready. Go ahead.

24 ABDUL NASSER RAD: Good afternoon,  
25 Chairperson Salaam, members of the Council. My name  
is Abdul Nassir Rad. I'm a proud graduate of CUNY,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 former New York City public servant, and proud son of  
4 a New York City cab driver. Currently, I'm the  
5 Managing Director of Research and Data at Campaign  
6 Zero. Previously, I was a staffer in the New York  
7 City Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice, and I've  
8 also advised law enforcement agencies across the US  
9 on comprehensive strategies to improve public safety  
10 while at the Vera Institute, and we are here in  
11 community-- in partnership with Communities United  
12 for Policing Reform. We are profoundly disturbed by  
13 the recent actions of the NYPD against student  
14 protests on New York City campuses. The NYPD has  
15 displayed a violent, militarized response to peaceful  
16 student protest. This has not only exacerbated  
17 tensions, but also contradicts the First Amendment  
18 principles of free speech and peaceful assembly.  
19 Borrowing from a U Chicago law professor, you can  
20 characterize the health of a democracy by the type of  
21 policing it employs and deploys. What does it say  
22 for the health of New York City democracy that our  
23 first line of response to student protests was a  
24 militaristic deployment with a callous disregard for  
25 the health and wellbeing of college students. We  
want to ensure that peaceful protests can remain

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 peaceful and believe hate has no place anywhere,  
4 period. But the police response did not improve the  
5 situation. Instead, it escalated tensions and  
6 reduced safety. To this end, we have five focus  
7 demands. First, there needs to be an immediate ban  
8 on the deployment of the NYPD SRG units until there  
9 has been an independent investigation into the NYPD  
10 response to student protests. Second, it's crucial  
11 to take tangible measures to protect faculty  
12 attempting to engage in peaceful negotiations with  
13 students. Third, New York City Council should urge  
14 all five New York City District Attorney Offices to  
15 drop all criminal charges levied on non-violent  
16 protestors. Fourth, New York City Council needs to  
17 support students who have been wronged by demanding  
18 university administrators across all New York City  
19 campuses immediately reverse any punitive  
20 disciplinary actions. Finally, New York City Council  
21 needs to fund and develop an alternative response  
22 model. This is going to happen over and over again  
23 where there's going to be large crowds we need to  
24 police. New York City needs to lead the way on  
25 alternative responses. Will we continue to  
criminalize dissent and respond in this manner

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 whenever there are large groups of individuals  
4 exercising democratic practices? How we move forward  
5 as a city will dictate the health of New York City's  
6 democracy, and we're inspired by those university  
7 campuses across the US that have responded in a  
8 healthy way and that is consistent with democratic  
9 values, treated students with dignity, and allowed  
10 peaceful dissent. We have complete faith that New  
11 York City can do this as well. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

13 SOFIA WHETSTONE: Hello. My name is  
14 Sofia and I am a New York City resident and a senior  
15 at Columbia University. I'm here to urge you, City  
16 Council Members, to hold the NYPD Strategic Response  
17 Group, SRG, financially accountable for its abuse and  
18 disband the unit. On April 30<sup>th</sup>, I was working with  
19 a medic outside of the Amsterdam Columbia University  
20 gates after being locked out of campus to provide aid  
21 to students. We were cattled [sic] and threatened  
22 with arrest just to make way for the SRG to enter  
23 Hamilton Hall with guns drawn. Medics inside campus  
24 gates were locked inside a building while they  
25 watched their classmates get brutalized. It was  
terrifying and dehumanizing. I've spoken personally



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 with police officers stationed around campus to this  
4 day who have apologized for their disruption and  
5 admitted that they think their deployment before, on,  
6 and after April 30<sup>th</sup> is wrong. Criminalizing free  
7 speech and normalizing brutal police crackdowns is  
8 unconstitutional. It dehumanizes peaceful protestors  
9 and officers alike, including those officers given  
10 carte blanche to lock medics in buildings, throw  
11 demonstrators downstairs, break our bones, pepper  
12 spray us, toss flash grenades, and even discharge  
13 their weapon in a school building. This city paid  
14 for, promoted and then lauded this inhumane assault  
15 on its citizens. Chief Maddrey stated that the NYPD  
16 were very restrained at Columbia University on April  
17 30<sup>th</sup>. He also swore not to lie under oath. So if he  
18 honestly considers throwing-- so, if he honestly  
19 considers discharging a gun in a school building,  
20 throwing students downstairs, breaking their bones,  
21 and locking medics in a building restrained, I am  
22 terrified to imagine what he would define as  
23 unrestrained police behavior. In short the SRG's  
24 mission and behavior is not rational, rather it is  
25 antithetical to the foundational values of the United  
States: life, liberty and the pursuit of happiness,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 freedom of speech. So you guys have a clear choice.  
4 You can hold the SRG accountable for its continued  
5 abuses and vote to defund the unit or at the very  
6 least, ban it from ever entering college campuses for  
7 protests again, or you can continue to sponsor the  
8 SRG so it can continue to trample NYC residents and  
9 our constitutional and human rights. Any of your  
10 children could be up here asking the same exact thing  
11 as I am right now. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

13 BARD CASH: Hello. My name is Bard Cash.  
14 I am a graduate student at Columbia University and a  
15 New Yorker. I'm here today to testify about the SRG.  
16 I agree with much of what Sofia said. The  
17 particulars of the brutality experienced by student  
18 protestors, peaceful student protestors, and I'll  
19 even-- the caveat of outside the building is  
20 unacceptable. I think further speaking directly to  
21 testimony heard earlier this morning from  
22 Commissioner Caban, directly leads to what I take to  
23 be the core issue with the SRG which is that it  
24 elides an incredibly important distinction between  
25 protected speech and in the case of what Caban was  
saying, terrorism. It is a problem that there is a

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 section of the NYPD whose tasks are both to counter  
4 terrorism and then deal with First Amendment  
5 protected protests. Responding to First Amendment  
6 protected protests with a highly militarized unit is  
7 an excellent way to escalate those protests. We've  
8 seen historically, both reported on by Human Rights  
9 Watch by the NYCLU, etcetera, that this is what  
10 happens every time. When there are mass protests in  
11 the city and the SRG is deployed, there are hundreds  
12 of people arrested, sometimes unconstitutionally, and  
13 hundreds of people injured. It has to stop. It must  
14 be disbanded. That's all I have to say.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you all very  
16 much. Okay, next panel, Joshua J. Shaw, Nash Dixon,  
17 Devin or Devon Krishnani-- I'm sorry, I can't read  
18 it-- Ileana Mendez-Penate [sp?], and Elizabeth Branti  
19 [sp?].

20 JOSHUA J. SHAW: Goo afternoon. My name  
21 is Joshua J. Shaw. I'm a protest monitor with the  
22 ACLU. I'm a veteran and I'm also a public servant.  
23 During my time with the ACLU, it's become obvious to  
24 me that there's a clear and pervasive bias within the  
25 NYPD. It's a bias that is routinely demonstrated by  
their wildly different treatments towards protestors

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 championing certain causes. More specifically, the  
4 NYPD employs their evident bias against leftist and  
5 progressive causes by using it as justification to  
6 violently beat, intimidate, and silent those they  
7 disagree with. We've seen this historically with the  
8 NYPD. They've proudly escorted Nazi's and Klansmen  
9 alike through our city streets while simultaneously  
10 beating and dehumanizing civil rights activists.  
11 Unfortunately, this stark dichotomy still exists  
12 today and it cannot be better exemplified than by the  
13 NYPD's treatment of the peaceful protests in  
14 opposition to the ongoing genocide in Gaza. Zionists  
15 and pro-Israel advocates have seemingly been granted  
16 unregulated authority to issue death threats, dox,  
17 and unleash violence on these protestors. All the  
18 while, the NYPD turns a blind eye to their crimes,  
19 and sadly, for those who call for a free Palestine,  
20 they are not awarded these same luxuries, and they  
21 must fear for their lives every time that they're  
22 brave enough to stand against fascists and their  
23 sympathizers. In the NYPD's campaign to silent  
24 dissent, the SRG has been the primary weapon in this  
25 arsenal, and that is exactly why it must be disbanded  
immediately. Additionally, the SRG must be disbanded

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 because quite frankly, it's ineffective. They don't  
4 scare us. Despite all their resources, all of their  
5 posturing, despite all of their might they have  
6 failed to silence us, and they will continue to fail  
7 to silence us, because as long as there are  
8 oppressors, there will be those who are brave enough  
9 to stand in their way. I ask you to stop funding the  
10 SRG and reallocate our tax dollars towards  
11 initiatives that will actually help our city  
12 flourish, instead wasting our money on something as  
13 useless, as ineffective, and as incompetent as the  
14 SRG and the NYPD. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Whoever wants to go  
16 next.

17 DEVON KRISHNASWAMY: Of course, thank  
18 you. Hello, my name is Devon Krishnaswamy. I am a  
19 New Yorker and I am a CUNY student as well who has  
20 witnessed some of the most dehumanizing events caused  
21 by the SRG and the NYPD as a whole. I have seen  
22 students, protesters being pushed to the ground.  
23 I've seen students being put in chokeholds. I've  
24 seen unbelievably horrifying things that are being  
25 put on those who are trying to peacefully protest and  
who are trying to echo what is a genocide going

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 across. The SRG has been doing this along with many  
4 other protestors, and it is most important that we  
5 not only defund and disband this group, but we also  
6 reallocate those funds to what the City actually  
7 needs. It is incredibly important, because right now  
8 we are giving this group, we are giving the NYPD  
9 money, funds to brutalize and attack peaceful  
10 protestors, including myself, and I applaud-- I  
11 especially applaud those who have been able to stand  
12 and continue to protest, including those in Columbia  
13 and in the City-- in colleges in the City and in the  
14 State alone. And I hope for an end to the violence  
15 that is going on, and I hope that-- what-- I hope the  
16 SRG is disbanded and that is all I have to say. Free  
17 Palestine.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Go ahead.

21 ELIZABETH BRANTL: Good afternoon, Chairs  
22 Brannan and Salaam, and Council Member Holden. Thank  
23 you for the opportunity to testify today on behalf of  
24 the Center for Justice Innovation. As the City  
25 further invests in traditional public safety methods,  
it is imperative to make parallel investments in

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 preventative services, upstream responses, and  
4 justice system off-ramps like alternatives to  
5 incarceration. Funding for programs like ours can  
6 help keep individuals out of the justice system in  
7 the first place, and when necessary, connect involved  
8 individuals with meaningful supports so they can live  
9 productive lives safely in community. Our sites  
10 including the Midtown Community Justice Center, Bronx  
11 Community Solutions, Neighbors in Action, and more  
12 play an instrumental role in reducing recidivism.  
13 Beyond just processing cases, our staff works to  
14 resolve the underlying issues that can result in  
15 justice system involvement, connecting participants  
16 with a range of services, including counseling, drug  
17 treatment, employment, and housing help. Offering  
18 support early builds safety, restores lives, and  
19 saves money. For example, at Brooklyn Mental Health  
20 Court, teams of mental health practitioners and  
21 judges work together to craft effective responses to  
22 crimes committed by those with severe mental illness.  
23 Addressing both program participant needs and  
24 community safety concerns, the court links defendants  
25 who'd ordinarily be incarcerated to long-term  
community-based treatment. To date, over 1,300

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 participants have received treatment, satisfied  
4 program requirements, and graduated all outside of  
5 the carceral setting. These participants saw a 46  
6 percent reduction in the likelihood of rearrest and a  
7 29 percent reduction in the likelihood of  
8 reconviction. The center's programs generate lasting  
9 benefits to public safety. With further city  
10 investments we can continue to transform the justice  
11 system into an institution that is truly meaningful  
12 and transforms the lives and communities it touches  
13 for the better. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

15 ILEANA MENDEZ-PENATE: Thank you so much  
16 Chair Brannan, and thank you Chair Salaam. My name  
17 is Ileana Mendez-Penate, and I'm here on behalf of  
18 Communities United for Police Reform and our New York  
19 City Budget Justice Campaign. We're here to talk  
20 about the fiscal year 25 Executive Budget that  
21 proposes \$5.8 billion for the NYPD's expense budget,  
22 but it also proposes another \$6.1 billion in fringe  
23 and pension costs for NYPD that are centrally funded.  
24 So this brings the total spending for the NYPD that's  
25 proposed for next year to \$11.9 billion. While \$72  
million has been restored to the NYPD from the PEGs,



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 there's still significant cuts to crucial public  
4 programs and services. This is-- for example, cuts  
5 to schools, cuts to mental health programs, cuts to  
6 police oversight like the CCRB, cuts to housing  
7 programs, programs for older adults, programs for  
8 young people, childcare, adult literacy, and services  
9 for people leaving Rikers. Over the past several  
10 weeks, we have also seen hundreds of NYPD officers  
11 respond in hyper-militarized fashion to peaceful  
12 protests on university campuses. We've seen the NYPD  
13 attack Council Members and journalists on social  
14 media, and we've also seen alarming footage of Win  
15 Rozario being killed by officers in his home. The  
16 Mayor's Executive Budget continues to reward the NYPD  
17 in the budget process rather than address these  
18 harmful actions. The NYPD Public Relations  
19 Department, for example, has grown from a staff of 36  
20 a few years ago to now a staff of 86. That's a more  
21 than double in the NYPD Public Relations Department.  
22 The Mayor's also proposing a \$10 million increase to  
23 the Strategic Response Group, and he's sustaining  
24 funding for police in schools and police response to  
25 mental health crisis, even while he's cutting the  
education budget and cutting services to mental

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 health. So, we are calling for the Council to cut  
4 the NYPD's Public Relations Budget by at least 50  
5 percent. We're calling for the Council to freeze  
6 hiring on school police, to disband the notoriously  
7 abusive SRG Unit, and to remove police from mental  
8 health response. Thank you so much.

9 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you all.

11 Okay, next panel, Doctor Aztem Gurvich, Alex Brass  
12 [sp?], Dorine Tai or Dorine Tal, Olivia Tai or Olivia  
13 Tal, Victor Herrera.

14 AZTEM GURVICH: Okay. Good afternoon,  
15 Chairman Salaam, esteemed members. I testify before  
16 you today with a heavy heart. I'm troubled by the  
17 alarming situation which is unfolding now in the  
18 streets of our beloved New York City. As a Jew, as a  
19 co-founder of a Jewish community organization, I  
20 cannot stand silent in the face of the escalating  
21 wave of violence, hatred targeting not only my fellow  
22 Jews and supporters, but also targeting the very  
23 essence of our democratic values. Jewish student and  
24 Israeli supporters are facing appalling acts of  
25 harassment, aggression, intimidation by individuals  
openly advocating for terrorism. Our war memorials

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 are being disgraced. American flags are being  
4 burned. It is a direct insult, not to Jewish or  
5 Israeli supporters, but also to all who cherish  
6 democratic values and symbols. It took far too long  
7 for the authorities to let NYPD do their job during  
8 the disturbing encampment at Columbia, and it  
9 happened only after property was damaged while the  
10 Jewish hatred incidents were simply ignored. Today,  
11 we demand action. These issues cannot be addressed  
12 without empowering those who are tasked with keeping  
13 our streets safe. Therefore, I urge this committee  
14 to allocate more power, more budget and more support  
15 to NYPD, and I would like to thank NYPD for their  
16 courage and the professionalism during keeping our  
17 streets safe. Further, we demand a meeting and a  
18 listening-- hearing, sorry-- to address this alarming  
19 incidents of antisemitism during those anti-Israeli  
20 protests and to address these-- disgracing the  
21 symbols of our democracy. Let us come together to  
22 confront these issues, these ways of hatred and  
23 ensure that our streets remain safe for all. Thank  
24 you very much.

25 ALEX BRASS: Hi, thank you for being  
here. My name is Alex Brass. I'm here representing

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 the Steering Committee of Correct Crisis Intervention

4 Today, otherwise known as CCIT. I identify as a

5 peer. Back in January of 2022 I had a health crisis

6 and a police response which resulted in an

7 exacerbation of my mental health and substance issues

8 and has been a long road to recovery. Unfortunately,

9 I have many friends who are unable to be here today

10 and share their story because they're still dealing

11 with the aftermath of their police interactions and

12 their crisis response. Thankfully, we do have

13 solutions to this. CCIT has been advocating for

14 changes within the B-HEARD program and a move away

15 from police response. This year, we have two simple

16 asks. We'd like to swap out social workers and

17 replace them with peers with lived experience who are

18 best equipped to manage these situations.

19 Additionally, we're looking to restore PEG cuts

20 within the budget so that the B-HEARD program can be

21 in a better position to operate and do what they're

22 to do. It's also important to note that the

23 implementation of the 988 number is lagging which is

24 critical to ensure an appropriate response. Only 18

25 percent of mental health crisis calls are even routed

to B-HEARD, 82 percent still have a police response.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Additionally, B-HEARD response times lag behind  
4 traditional emergency calls which pose an additional  
5 issue. I want to reiterate the importance of peers  
6 which is in line with programs used by other cities  
7 and other states. We've heard from countless people  
8 about the tragedy of Win Rozario, and unfortunately,  
9 I wish it didn't take another death. We've had 19  
10 other individuals who have died at the hands of NYPD  
11 over the last nine years with a mental health crisis  
12 response. Let's not let his death be in vain, and  
13 let's please prioritize this and avoid these  
14 unnecessary deaths and long-term trauma for  
15 individuals and their families, and treat our most  
16 vulnerable New Yorkers better. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Just speak-- just  
18 got to speak into a mic.

19 VICTOR HERRERA: Good afternoon,  
20 Committee and Speaker on Public Safety. My name is  
21 Victor M. Herrera, a member and leader of Freedom  
22 Agenda and Treatment Not Jails. My testimony before  
23 you today is a critical one for myself as a person  
24 with mental health trauma. 911 and mental distress  
25 first response is critically costing lives on the  
account of the misconception and belief that any call

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 direct from the community to 911 is to be called a  
4 NYPD response when Public Safety should demand that  
5 911 emergency response should focus on financing the  
6 call centers needed for B-HEARD and psychiatric  
7 intervention 988 to prevent the NYPD as first  
8 responders of any given call of an emotionally  
9 distressed incident. NYPD is again attempting to  
10 continue criminalizing the mentally distressed  
11 community by attempting to convince the committee  
12 that CCIT along with Center for Urban Community  
13 Services training which even in all the years of  
14 training received from CUCS has not prevented or led  
15 to any changes or the practice of wrongful and  
16 criminally-negligent homicides in such responses.  
17 NYPD does not need any financing beyond their own  
18 budget, and no training will change the present  
19 preemptive criminalization as was the case in Win  
20 Rozario's death, a child whose life was taken  
21 prematurely after continued financing of NYPD ideas.  
22 NYPD should never gain entry and the community should  
23 be informed of the right to keep them from entering  
24 in such responses until mental health professionals  
25 and peers takes on a more active and responsive  
effort in public health related mental health crisis,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 along with peer specialists working not from the  
4 confines of the Police Department, rather FDNY, EMS  
5 stations located throughout many of the city and  
6 private hospitals. 911 is an emergency response call  
7 center, not an NYPD call-taking center. Such an idea  
8 declaring that all calls at 911 are more criminal  
9 than trauma-based. Yesterday was my 58<sup>th</sup> birthday,  
10 and just seeing the body cam footage of the deadly  
11 shooting caused me so much distress. No matter how  
12 much information the NYPD received, personal  
13 experience even on August 1<sup>st</sup> of 2023 during a  
14 pretext op, the sergeant and police officers were  
15 made aware of my own condition, disabled, and solely  
16 on account of a license suspension applied an arrest  
17 process that is common with extreme force, which is  
18 followed by the abuse practice of being processed,  
19 reported as an EDP, and again, forcibly medicated by  
20 hospital staff, ignoring the obvious implication of  
21 no examination or evaluation-- solely to accommodate  
22 the NYPD's practices. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you all very much.

24 Okay the next panel Esther Bak, Beth Schwartz, Rachel  
25 Herlands, Jeanne Sprenger and Clea Hogigog (SP?)

[05:43:03]- [05:43:27]

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 JEANNE SPRENGER: Alright thank you Chair Salaam,  
4 Chairman Brannan and the rest of the Council. My  
5 name is Jeanne Sprenger and I'm here to speak about  
6 the budget for NYPD that I believe needs to be  
7 increased for three reasons. First of all, we need  
8 more - first of all we're not safe. As others have  
9 mentioned from these anti-Israel protests, which  
10 really aren't protests, they're terrorist takeovers  
11 of our city. They are anarchy and they're anti-  
12 American as well as anti-Israel.

13 There is not enough NYPD coverage. As we see  
14 Monday night, the NYPD was focused on keeping them  
15 out of the Met Gala but then in Central Park there  
16 were Jews that were being beat up. There were flags  
17 that were burned. There were World War I memorials  
18 being defaced and there wasn't NYPD presence there to  
19 protect us. So, there needs to be more budget for  
20 more NYPD because of the increase in terrorism, the  
21 increase in destruction and violence and harassment  
22 that's taking place on our streets.

23 The second reason is the NYPD mentioned that  
24 since October, there have been \$53 million has been  
25 spent just in overtime. And this is money that  
taxpayers, we should not be paying for lawlessness,



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 for terrorism and I believe that there should be  
4 money allocated for the NYPD or for the Public Safety  
5 Committee for an investigation and who is funding  
6 these takeovers? Who is funding these so-called  
7 protests? Because they need to be held accountable  
8 for the Lawlessness and destruction that they're  
9 leading in the city and that we should not as  
10 taxpayers be paying the \$53 million in overtime.

11 And thirdly, the fact that there is \$53 million  
12 in overtime tells us that these are not peaceful  
13 protests. If they were peaceful first amendment  
14 protests there would not be \$53 million being spent  
15 in overtime by the NYPD. And by focusing on and  
16 asking the NYPD, how much do you think you're going  
17 to spend in overtime this year? They can't answer  
18 that question because these protests, takeovers are  
19 continuing to intensify because we're not getting to  
20 the root cause of the lawlessness that's taking  
21 place. The NYPD are not the criminals. The  
22 criminals are these protestors and we need to get  
23 that straight and we need to focus on increasing the  
24 penalties for these crimes, so that lawlessness is  
25 curtailed. And we need to also, is the City Council

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 to uhm, legislate new legislation regarding hate  
4 crimes and antisemitism.

5 And lastly, as I've mentioned other times that  
6 I've been here Chair Salaam, we need to have a  
7 specific hearing. Obviously there's so many issues  
8 that are contained in these anti-Israel protests.  
9 There needs to be a separate hearing on this issue  
10 that we can discuss this and also with the NYPD  
11 because obviously their budget is being overrun by  
12 this takeover of our city. And I thank you for your  
13 time.

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

15 RACHEL HERLANDS: Hi, my name is Rachel Herlands.  
16 Thank you so much for allowing me to speak. This is  
17 the first time I've actually been in City Hall, even  
18 though I've been a New Yorker all my life. I have  
19 attended many rallies, counter protesting, not  
20 initiating any violence over the last seven months,  
21 since October 7<sup>th</sup> and I have to say that I have not  
22 felt safe. I attended the Wall Street Rally, Pro  
23 Hamas Rally and as I walked down the street to an  
24 area that the police sectioned for the pro-Israel  
25 group, I was surrounded by pro-Hamas protestors and  
felt very, very unsafe. I feel the police presence

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 there was very restrained. I have never seen at any  
4 rally any abuse and I felt protected and I feel the  
5 city needs to increase their budget and to protect me  
6 as a citizen.

7 My grandfather came here with his father in  
8 Russia in 1915 his father went back on the Lusitania.  
9 My family has been here and we've always felt  
10 protected until this year. We feel very unsafe in  
11 this city. I feel unsafe in the subways when pro-  
12 Gaza, pro-Hamas, and pro-Palestinian, and anti-  
13 American posters are put up there, and I feel we need  
14 more protection.

15 So, I am encouraging the Council to increase the  
16 budget for the police and also, I thank them for all  
17 their work that they've done for us.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

19 BETH SCHWARTZ: Good afternoon Chairman and  
20 Committee Members. My name is Beth Schwartz and I am  
21 an actual lifelong New Yorker who has been registered  
22 to vote in New York City for the past 40 years. I  
23 live on the upper West side just south of Columbia  
24 with my visibly Jewish family and I am shocked that  
25 the city has not done more to protect its Jewish  
citizens and start these illegal pro-terrorist anti-

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Jewish protests that actively call for the murder of  
4 Jews and the elimination of the world's only Jewish  
5 state.

6 It is shocking to me that there are City Council  
7 members who do not seem to understand that phrases  
8 such as "globalized the intifada and from the river  
9 to the sea, Palestine will be free," are calls to  
10 murder Jews and I am actually dumbfounded that  
11 members of the City Council actively support and have  
12 participated in the protests.

13 The intifada was not a benign event. It was a  
14 campaign to murder and terrorize Israelis. Over  
15 1,000 Israelis were viciously murdered, including  
16 Muslims and Christian Arabs and over 8,000 Israelis  
17 were injured. In addition the physical toll, there  
18 was a horrible emotional toll. Everyday Israelis  
19 worried. Would this be the day I will be killed or  
20 severely injured by a suicide bomber while I am  
21 grocery shopping or getting gas for my car? Is this  
22 the day that one of my children will be murdered on  
23 the way to school? Did you know that families would  
24 stagger their kids who went to the same school on  
25 different public buses, so if God forbid there was a

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 suicide bomber, they wouldn't lose all of their  
4 children.

5 The chant, "Palestine will be free from the river  
6 to the sea" and the Arabic version, which is  
7 translated as, "from the river to the sea Palestine  
8 will be Arab" is a call to eliminate the only Jewish  
9 state, and I think it is clear that Hamas has  
10 demonstrated how they intended to achieve this on  
11 October 7<sup>th</sup>.

12 Are you actually okay with protestors chanting  
13 these phrases? You know that these are not all  
14 peaceful protests because as was mentioned earlier  
15 today, the city has spent \$53 million on police  
16 overtime on seven months of these protests and it's  
17 not summer yet. The things that the city can do to  
18 lower the financial costs and keep these protests -  
19 uh, of these protests and keep New York City  
20 residents safe. First, people who are arrested  
21 during these protests and especially those who are  
22 repeatedly arrested should be getting more than a  
23 desk ticket. There needs to be real consequences for  
24 those involved in the call to murder Jews and destroy  
25 Israel.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 I'm also shocked that these protestors are  
4 allowed to protest with keffiyeh's wrapped around  
5 their heads like a KKK hood. Would there be any  
6 kinds of protests besides for these anti-Jewish  
7 protest that would allow the City Council, that would  
8 allow for this? The right thing to do is pass a law  
9 that forbids one to protest with their faces covered.  
10 And I also ask for a hearing specifically on these  
11 protests.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

13 ESTHER BAK: Hi.

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Just turn your mic on.  
15 Just hit that little button. Thank you.

16 ESTHER BAK: Hi, my name is Esther Bak and I want  
17 to speak from two sides of myself. One side is as a  
18 single woman living in the Upper West Side. I  
19 frequently have to walk around at night by myself and  
20 there is nothing that gives me more confidence than  
21 occasionally seeing an officer on the beat. It's  
22 very frightening to walk past people that are  
23 obviously threatening.

24 I'm a member of a synagogue and if you want to  
25 wonder about peaceful protests, you should look at  
the security that is in place at every single

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 synagogue in New York City now. That's coming out of  
4 our budgets and it's not for nothing. There's a  
5 reason why we need that security.

6 The second side of me is as a grandmother whose  
7 many of my friends are sending grandchildren to  
8 colleges and the first thing that they ask is for  
9 example, my grandchild wanted to go to NYU but I  
10 don't think it's safe for him to go to that school as  
11 a Jewish person. So, I'm asking for your  
12 consideration of this culture of fear that has now  
13 covered the entire Jewish community in New York City  
14 and to help us feel more safe. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you all very much.  
16 Okay, next panel Sheryl Betesh, Susan Friedman, and  
17 Rebecca Citron. [05:52:56]- [05:53:12] Ready.

18 SHERYL BETESH: Hello, good afternoon gentlemen.  
19 I thank you for allowing me the moment to speak. I'm  
20 a New Yorker. I was born in Brooklyn and I have four  
21 children and a couple live here in the city. My  
22 daughter is a Jewish Heritage Educator. My son  
23 teaches Judaism to kindergarteners and we are  
24 teaching the next generation of Jewish children, our  
25 historical background.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 I'm a lover of all kinds of people but I'll be  
4 honest with you in my attempt to explain the feelings  
5 of the people in our Jewish communities, what we're  
6 seeing at these demonstrations, I wish that it was  
7 really calm and I wish the police didn't have to  
8 interfere but we all see and know that that's not  
9 true. It's really just not true. The children that  
10 are there, and I'll call them children because  
11 college age students are children still. Young  
12 adults forming their morales and their respect for  
13 the future.

14 This building that we're sitting in it's  
15 dignified. I think that if we stop for a moment and  
16 look at what's going on in our centers of  
17 congregation for these young adults forming their  
18 future for the way they're going to bring up their  
19 families and their communities that they're involved  
20 in. It's not respectful. It's not fair to even  
21 people on this Committee and this Council to make  
22 believe to themselves that it's safe to put ourselves  
23 in the way of people who are demonstrating in an  
24 illegal and a mannerism of antagonistic, unhealthy  
25 behaviors. We're seeing it increase quickly to  
physical contact. I'm watching videos of girls at



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 these rallies taking out knives to other people and  
4 joking around and deflecting their responsibility as  
5 young adults to behave themselves and throwing it.  
6 They call it gaslighting. Throwing it onto the  
7 people who have authority to come and help contain  
8 this behavior. The behavior is not being contained  
9 and I know we're at a budget meeting for the police.  
10 I only see police that in general try to help the  
11 citizens of the United States and this City of New  
12 York that I dearly love and I wish that you can think  
13 to the future just a little bit in understanding that  
14 if we continue to allow the behavior to escalate,  
15 there's really no telling exactly how far it's going  
16 to go.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

18 SHERYL BETESH: I appreciate you, thank you.

19 DR. SUSAN FRIEDMAN: Hi, my name is Dr. Susan  
20 Friedman. I've been practicing dentistry in this  
21 state, in this city, for 50 years and I have never  
22 felt better. I have had experiences in antisemitism  
23 when I interviewed at Columbia 50 years ago. Where  
24 they asked me am I Jewish. So, antisemitism has been  
25 around a long time and the ugly head appears in every  
generation as it says, and so, we must combat that.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 We cannot be peaceful if people are coming with  
4 knives and guns and all kinds of things to rallies.  
5 Peaceful, uhm, I've lived a long time so we've had a  
6 lot of protests over many, many years. We've walked  
7 for many times in this city but the idea is to have  
8 peace while we do it. It's not to make people  
9 scared, frightened and unsafe in the city. Many  
10 people move out of this city. They're moving to  
11 Florida, they're moving everywhere. Well, I happen  
12 to love this city and I will defend this city and I  
13 will defend the Police Department because they are  
14 really here to support and to make sure everyone is  
15 safe.

16 So, I believe in funding the New York City Police  
17 Department. I don't believe in rallies. They cause  
18 hatred for anyone, especially Jews. We've been here  
19 a long time. We've been very established and we've  
20 been a major part of the city, and we need to know  
21 that the police are there to help support us and to  
22 secure us. So, I believe that the Police Department  
23 really does need to be funded and rallies cannot be  
24 terroristic. You know, we don't want to bring that  
25 to our city. We don't want to bring it our country.  
Where the countries have, we don't want. We want to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 secure our city. We love it, that's why we live  
4 here. We support it and so we need all the  
5 protection we can get.

6 REBECCA CITRON: Hi, my name is Rebecca Citron  
7 and I'm also a Native New Yorker. I've spent my  
8 whole life in the city. I am a graduate of NYU. I'm  
9 a graduate of Columbia. Uhm, I have degrees from  
10 both institutions and seeing what has happened in  
11 recent months is just horrifying, surreal. I grew up  
12 in Queens. I knew there was antisemitism. I have to  
13 say it never hurt me. I knew there were people that  
14 had stereotypes and you know they were just ignorant  
15 and you just kind of wrote it off. In my life I  
16 never was afraid of being Jewish. I was always proud  
17 of being Jewish and to see what is going on now in  
18 this city is absolutely surreal.

19 Uhm, it's so reminiscent we begin to wonder are  
20 we back in 1938? Should we be worrying about leaving  
21 this country? This is my country. I grew up here.  
22 This is my home. I have a home in Israel. I have an  
23 apartment in Israel but to me that's always been a  
24 place to visit as a vacation. Some place that I feel  
25 identified and comfortable in but never did I think  
about fleeing this country, fleeing this city. It

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 never dawned on me until the last few months. The  
4 experience of what I see going on and my allomothers  
5 is absolutely surreal. I never experienced any kind  
6 of antisemitism when I was there. It was harder to  
7 be a woman in some cases than to be Jew. I had more  
8 problems with that.

9 The words hurt and words have meaning. People  
10 cannot just throw out things and words are loaded and  
11 have meaning and influence others. As we can see,  
12 the demonstrations at Columbia have sparked  
13 demonstrations all over the country, all over the  
14 world. Just words, it's not just words, it's a lot  
15 more than that.

16 I thank the New York Police Department for  
17 keeping this as quiet, keeping things as calm as  
18 possible. We need your protection. We need the  
19 protection of the city. We need to feel safe here.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

21 REBECCA CITRON: I just want to end by saying uhm  
22 I happened to visit Roosevelt Island yesterday and  
23 the For Freedoms Park and the four freedoms that are  
24 listed there is the first freedom is freedom of  
25 expression. The second is freedom of religion,  
freedom from want but the fourth fear is freedom from

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 fear and the freedom from fear should be taken as  
4 strong as freedom of expression. People have given  
5 up their rights to freedom of expression. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

7 PANEL: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, now we're moving to  
9 Zoom. We'll start with Daria, Daria M.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

11 DARIA M: Hello, can everyone hear me?

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Hi, yes, go ahead.

13 DARIA M: Great okay, good afternoon. My name is  
14 Daria. I'm an undergraduate student who was born and  
15 raised in Brooklyn. I'd like to thank you guys for  
16 the opportunity to testify today.

17 So, I'm here today to not only urge you to hold  
18 the NYPD Strategic Response Group accountable for its  
19 abuse but also push to disband the unit. The SRG was  
20 founded as a counter terrorism unit, yet they  
21 continue to be deployed at peaceful protests despite  
22 consistently being known for their violent strategies  
23 and evermore militarized tactics.

24 As if that isn't bad enough, the SRG is central  
25 to countless lawsuits which has only led to massive

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 financial costs to all parties to settle these cases  
4 and that's awfully redundant, if I do say so myself.

5 For as long as I can remember, I've been a local  
6 organizer and activist with fellow students across  
7 New York City. Throughout my journey I've often  
8 asked myself, why is it that people are neglected in  
9 the first place? Why does the system fail to provide  
10 adequate social programs, housing or even basic  
11 health care?

12 As I continued my education, it became  
13 increasingly evident to me that it's because we give  
14 the vast majority of our funding to the police  
15 instead of giving New Yorkers what we need to  
16 survive, our government officials utilize cops to  
17 criminalize our differences and then punish our  
18 outreach. We're all citizens. I feel that all  
19 suffering should concern public safety.

20 When I graduated from Stuyvesant High School last  
21 year, I received an award from the City Council  
22 commending me for my outstanding civic engagement and  
23 dedication to bettering the circumstances of all New  
24 York City residents. Yet, when I came home over  
25 spring break to continue doing exactly that, I was  
met with a brutal arrest at the hands of the SRG.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 Don't you find it dreadfully ironic? On March 8<sup>th</sup> of  
4 all days, I watched as more than 60 of my fellow New  
5 Yorkers were kettled, beaten and violently arrested  
6 but of course it was National Women's Day. Let's  
7 celebrate by throwing them to the ground and beating  
8 them unconscious so that their limp bodies can be  
9 handcuffed more easily. Is this how you say thank  
10 you for our civic engagement?

11 It's unacceptable to be toasting to the tenacity  
12 and resilience of young students like me just to turn  
13 around and throw them up against a hood of a car -

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired. Thank  
15 you.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, now we have Debbie  
17 Becher.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

19 DEBBIE BECHER: Sorry, thank you. It's not  
20 letting me turn on my video, is that right?

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: It's okay, go ahead.

22 DEBBIE BECHER: Okay, sorry. Thank you to Chairs  
23 Brannan and Salaam, Speaker Adams and Council  
24 Members. My name is Debbie Becher, I'm a member of  
25 Jews for Racial and Economic Justice and Professor at  
Barnard College in Columbia University. I'm here to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 ask you to withdraw police from Columbia's  
4 neighborhood.

5 As a Jewish person, I am passionate about  
6 combating antisemitism and all forms of hate, and I  
7 feel for the people who spoke earlier and for  
8 students who feel unsafe. But we must treat  
9 antisemitism with speech with education and existing  
10 anti-discrimination procedures, not arrests. More  
11 police are not making Jewish students or faculty any  
12 safer. In fact, they are making us less safe. This  
13 is especially true for Black and Brown community  
14 members.

15 We have been dismayed for over six months by the  
16 increased police presence on and around our campus.  
17 As you know, recently, things got much worse when  
18 police came to end a brief student occupation of a  
19 campus building. It is hard to describe the horrors  
20 of that night. Hundreds, possibly a thousand, police  
21 suddenly descended and took over our streets. Many  
22 marched in riot gear into the campus gates while the  
23 SRG's massive ladder truck fed others into Hamilton  
24 Hall.

25 The police and university ensured that few  
witnesses were inside by locking almost everyone



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 either out of campus or in buildings, including the  
4 press, legal observers and medics. We have since  
5 learned that police pushed students down the steps.  
6 At least one was knocked unconscious by the fall and  
7 lay there with no first aid. Students were  
8 handcuffed, thrown to the ground, and then kicked in  
9 the face. They heard an officer discharge a gun in  
10 the building.

11 Since then, NYPD has dramatically increased its  
12 presence. New clusters of officers are stationed on  
13 and off campus on a 24-hour basis. Police have kept  
14 some public streets blockaded and stay at every  
15 corner keeping even pedestrians out.

16 The Mayor has fueled this fervor with his public  
17 lies about outside agitators. He portrays civil  
18 disobedience as violent terrorist acts to justify all  
19 of this.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired. Thank  
21 you.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, now we have Hadeel  
23 Mishal.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

25 HADEEL MISHAL: Hello, can you all see me? Okay  
perfect.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yes, go ahead.

4 HADEEL MISHAL: Alright, good afternoon my name  
5 is Hadeel Mishal and I'm a Lead Organizer at the New  
6 York City Anti-Violence Project. Our mission is to  
7 empower LGBTQ folks and HIV impacted communities and  
8 all forms of violence through organizing, education,  
9 advocacy and counseling. AVP was founded in 1980 as  
10 a resource for community when other agencies did not  
11 and would not show up for us. So, we keep us safe  
12 and started our 24/7 hotline as an alternative for  
13 our community.

14 A huge part of our organizing capacity right now  
15 goes into police accountability and transparency.  
16 The NYPD essentially functions as a military force  
17 within our city. It has a budget that is larger than  
18 most militaries in the world and they still fail to  
19 keep us safe. The police fail to serve as a main  
20 component of public safety and it's time for us to  
21 reimagine what true public and community safety can  
22 look like.

23 With the ongoing college encampments, the NYPD  
24 has displayed violence towards these protestors.  
25 Whenever NYPD has showed up, instead of supporting  
the young people, we have seen them escalate in harm.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 The City of New York has invested \$10.8 billion into  
4 the NYPD for this past fiscal year and that's about  
5 ten percent of the budget. When education, housing  
6 and our health systems are not properly funded it is  
7 ludicrous to know that the NYPD has billions  
8 allocated to them. That there are still officers on  
9 the force who have unjustly murdered people that are  
10 still on that force, such as Kawaski Trawick's  
11 killers, Herbert Davis and Brennan Thompson.

12 At Columbia University a student was thrown down  
13 the steps of Hamilton Hall, which students occupied  
14 as Hents Hall and when a fellow student and medic  
15 attempted to provide assistance, they were blocked by  
16 an NYPD officer.

17 On another day NYPD injured three protestors and  
18 arrested 109 more. Does the NYPD have nothing better  
19 to do than to terrorize college students? With the  
20 billions that the NYPD gets from the city, the  
21 standard should be hire. If the NYPD were to disband  
22 SRG it would save our city \$133 million.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired. Thank  
24 you.

25 HADEEL MISHAL: No problem.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Now we have Joo  
4 Han.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

6 JOO HAN: Good afternoon Chairs Salaam and  
7 Brannan for this opportunity to testify. I think  
8 hearing from a lot of organizations today, uhm I  
9 think the Committee wants and calls for alternate  
10 forms of community safety.

11 I'm the Deputy Director at the Asian American  
12 Federation, a research and advocacy organization that  
13 represents 70 groups serving 1.5 million Asian New  
14 Yorkers. Public safety is an urgent need for our  
15 community. Anti-Asian hate has been on the rise  
16 since COVID and our community members continue to  
17 feel unsafe in the midst of this recovery and  
18 especially after October 7<sup>th</sup>, the middle east crisis  
19 has fueled refresh attacks on our Arab, South Asian,  
20 Muslim community members.

21 Despite NYPD reporting that anti-Asian hate is no  
22 longer a problem, people are not actually reporting  
23 to the NYPD and they continue to come to the  
24 federation and our hope against hate partners that  
25 works to adjust anti-Asian violence for a needs on an

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 everyday basis because they've been victims of anti-  
4 Asian hate.

5 Based on a report that we did last fall, two-  
6 thirds of Asian New Yorkers and were surveyed that  
7 they feared being a victim of anti-Asian violence and  
8 we know that in the first two years of the pandemic  
9 of 2000 to 2022, 3,500 incidents of anti-Asian  
10 assaults impacted Asian New Yorkers. We really urge  
11 the City Council to do their - play their role in  
12 being able to address anti-Asian violence. Public  
13 safety is not just for one community but for all  
14 communities. We believe that being able to invest in  
15 community center safety solutions ensure safety for  
16 all New Yorkers and there is a really dire and urgent  
17 need to expand the capacity of community center  
18 solutions to be able to address anti-Asian violence.

19 We urge the funding of initiatives like  
20 federation Hoping as Hate Campaign, which is 30 Asian  
21 nonprofits using community center safety solutions to  
22 provide anti-Asian violence, safety training, victim  
23 support services, protective presence, youth  
24 programming and other services needed to help people  
25 feel safer in New York.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 In the past two years, we've fronted millions of  
4 dollars to groups doing this work but that funding  
5 has now dried up. We are training several thousand —

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired. Thank  
7 you.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Now we have Leo  
9 Ferguson.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

11 LEO FERGUSON: Thank you. Thanks so much. Uhm,  
12 hello Chairs Brannan and Salaam, Speaker Adams,  
13 Council Members. My name is Leo Ferguson. I am the  
14 Director of Strategic Projects at Jews For Racial and  
15 Economic Justice, and a member of Communities United  
16 for Police Reform.

17 Before I even get into my testimony, I feel like  
18 I just have to address at least one or two of the  
19 things that have been said by prior folks testifying.  
20 As someone who is Black and Jewish, I am just  
21 particularly insulted by the comment comparing  
22 keffiyehs to clan hoods, which is a comment that  
23 somehow manages to be racist, Islamophobic,  
24 McCarthyite and anstakle(SP?) all at once. That  
25 might be kind of a record. About people inventing  
knives and guns and what not out of thin air talking

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 about what have been overwhelming nonviolent  
4 protests. We don't all have to agree with protestors  
5 demands but we should, I think frankly be very proud  
6 of young people when they participate passionately in  
7 civic life.

8 So, I'm here to talk about a dangerous and out of  
9 control NYPD that continues to pour precious – that  
10 the city continues to pour precious resources into  
11 even as we contemplate cutting education, libraries  
12 and we chronically under-fund social services. Just  
13 look at the past few months, we've seen the body cam  
14 video of Win Rozario's murder, a sickening, tragic  
15 scene. We watched police ignore the desperate pleas  
16 of Win's family and then shoot and kill him in front  
17 of his family. Anyone who looked at that video would  
18 conclude that Win would be alive today if the NYPD  
19 had not responded. The NYPD did not make him safer.  
20 They made him less safe.

21 Earlier today, Council Member I think Joseph,  
22 asked what have we learned about situations like this  
23 one? Well, the NYPD hasn't learned anything because  
24 they obstructed the CCRB investigation of the murder  
25 of Kawaski Trawick and has refused to impose even the  
most basic discipline on the officers who killed him.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 At Columbia and other campuses throughout the  
4 city, we watched SRG go on a local college tour of  
5 chaos imposing their violence on nonviolent  
6 protestors. Who is this for? As Jews, the notion  
7 this is to protect us is ludicrous when so many of  
8 the students endangered were Jewish. And this  
9 Administration by the way cannot claim to care about  
10 -

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired. Thank  
12 you.

13 LEO FURGUSON: The direct office for Hate Crime  
14 Prevention.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Now we have  
16 Marie Adele Grasso.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Alright, I'm actually speaking on  
19 her behalf as she isn't present at the moment but I'm  
20 just going to deliver her testimony if that's  
21 alright. So, here is the testimony.

22 On April, oh yeah sorry, Marie Adele Grasso is 19  
23 years old and is a student at Barnard College of  
24 Columbia University. This is her testimony.

25 On April 30<sup>th</sup>, I was in a peaceful protest when my  
University called in the SRG. We were calm,



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 standing, linking arms and singing a song about  
4 peace. We did this because we care about protecting  
5 our peers and neighbors and also humans across the  
6 world. The NYPD and SRG stormed campus aggressively  
7 without assessing the situation. They forced Press  
8 and EMS away to avoid witnesses. Next, they threw me  
9 against a gate and forced others downstairs using  
10 metal tables and chairs. An individual was  
11 unconscious so I ran to check vital signs. As I was  
12 checking, SRG pushed me to the ground. I asked them  
13 to call EMS for the individual, they ignored me. The  
14 police grabbed my phone, smashing it and pulled me  
15 dislocating my shoulder, hurting my back and legs and  
16 twisting my wrist. I requested to be cuffed in front  
17 and to use my mobility aid.

18 The officer responded, "if you have a disability,  
19 you shouldn't get arrested. Not my problem."

20 Because Marie Adele Grasso is a woman, she requested  
21 a female officer to pat her down. However, the  
22 arresting officer zip tied me in the front. He was  
23 angry and aggressively tightened the zip ties,  
24 cutting off my circulation. All of this was  
25 abhorrent treatment but what horrified me the most  
were the police's words on the bus. The officers were

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 casually stating they were disappointed they didn't  
4 get – this is a direct quote. "To use various  
5 weapons on us including guns." Harming us excited  
6 them. They claim their goal is safety but they  
7 continually abuse citizens. One of the most  
8 appalling parts of this was that the NYPD and my  
9 university were proud of their actions. Any  
10 institution behaving like this must be immediately  
11 disbanded.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired. Thank  
13 you.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Alright, take care. Sorry about  
15 that.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Now we have  
17 Nicholi Mishler.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

19 NICHOLI MISHLER: Hello, thank you Chairs Brannan  
20 and Salaam and Speaker Adams for this opportunity to  
21 testify. My name is Nicholi Mishler, I am a Jewish  
22 New Yorker and a member of Jews for Racial and  
23 Economic Justice and Communities United for Police  
24 Reform.

25 My recent encounter with the Strategic Response  
Group reaffirmed to me that our taxpayer dollars

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 should not be funding this unit and that for the  
4 safety of all New Yorkers, it must be disbanded.

5 Last week I went to the city college campus to  
6 support the encampment of student protestors. In  
7 exercising their first amendment rights, I was blown  
8 away by the students, including many Jewish  
9 remarkable commitment to creating a space filled with  
10 emotional care, support, cultural understanding and  
11 their deep-rooted commitment to peace and justice for  
12 all.

13 I returned to the campus the evening the NYPD  
14 swept a peaceful encampment as if it was a war zone.  
15 Earlier today, the NYPD testified that they swept  
16 Columbia's encampment precisely and as safely as  
17 possible. What I witnessed at City College was that  
18 the NYPD were the ones making students and their  
19 community at large unsafe. When I got there, the  
20 energetic but peaceful and stationary crowd had  
21 already been barricaded by the NYPD.

22 After randomly grabbing a few people and  
23 arresting them out of nowhere, SRG started to kettle  
24 the group on my side of the sidewalk, which quickly  
25 escalated into a full-on charge. Some were able to  
escape the NYPD's attack but about 50 SRG officers

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 wearing helmets and batons entrapped and started to  
4 violently push the crowd backwards. The police were  
5 yelling, "you have to move back" and the people in  
6 the crowd responded, "we're trying, let us move  
7 back." They proceeded to push and rough us making it  
8 impossible to move. I saw them grab a fail old  
9 woman. Someone said, "she's 76 years old" and they  
10 essentially trampled her.

11 We helped her out of the way. The SRG officers  
12 did not help her. Her shoe fell off. She was  
13 stumbling without a shoe and I looked at one of the  
14 officers in the face to say she is missing a shoe and  
15 he completely ignored me. I asked the old woman if  
16 she was okay. She said no. It was terrifyingly  
17 apparent that the NYPD SRG officers were not there  
18 for our safety.

19 There was a young person in front of me stopping,  
20 saying you're supposed to be protecting us. Why are  
21 you here?

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired. Thank  
23 you.

24 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Now we have  
25 Tanya Krupat.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 TANYA KRUPAT: Hi, can you hear me?

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yes, go ahead.

5 TANYA KRUPAT: Okay, great. Thank you for the  
6 opportunity to speak with you today. My name is  
7 Tanya Krupat, I am the Vice President of Policy and  
8 Advocacy at the Osborne Association.

9 In March, a colleague testified about our work  
10 with the NYPD and community-based organizations  
11 throughout the city to safeguard children when their  
12 parent is arrested. The City Council is currently  
13 the sole funder of this work and we are very  
14 grateful. We have submitted a discretionary funding  
15 request to be able to continue this work, including  
16 training and providing tools to NYPD's more than  
17 30,000 members of service.

18 In 2019, thankfully City Council passed a law,  
19 which led to changes and mandated NYPD to adopt  
20 guidelines to safeguarding children present during an  
21 arrest, and to provide training for officers. To  
22 date, we have made significant inroads, but we have  
23 so much more to do. Children are deeply affected by  
24 a parent's arrest, yet prior to this law, NYPD  
25 training did not include information about child  
development, trauma response, and tools for

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 interacting with children of different ages. The  
4 importance of the work now underway cannot be  
5 overstated. Each year in New York City, tens of  
6 thousands of children experience their parents'  
7 arrest, and many of them witness this arrest. Not  
8 only do they carry this experience with them, often  
9 without ever speaking about it, but it shapes their  
10 view of law enforcement, immediately and into the  
11 future.

12 We've been working with young people who share  
13 their experiences. One said, every time I see a  
14 police officer, I remember the day my mom was  
15 arrested. Another said, it definitely shaped my view  
16 of police, I was definitely like, don't trust the  
17 cops, don't call the cops and many of them have  
18 recommendations for what we should do next.

19 One said, I now understand that the police were  
20 just doing their jobs but it was the way they went  
21 about it. To date, we've trained more than 2,900  
22 police officers, including recruit sergeants and  
23 youth coordinating officers. The NYPD Commissioner  
24 has provided a letter of support for our funding  
25 request and we hope City Council can continue this  
unique and important work. Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you very much.

4 Christopher Leon Johnson.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

6 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Hey, good afternoon  
7 Justin Brannan and Mr. Salaam. This is Christopher  
8 Leon Johnson here. So, I want to make this quick old  
9 Zoom call to announce that Mr. Salaam, you going to  
10 resign as Chair. You're not a great Chair. You're a  
11 joke of a Chairperson for the Committee. You need to  
12 resign. You need to give it to Bob Holden. Shout  
13 out to Bob Holden. Bob Holden is a real one to City  
14 Council. This is a wolk session. This is a wolk  
15 Committee. All this, we know that you don't care  
16 about public safety. We know that you don't care  
17 about human lives. All you all care about is taking  
18 away from NYPD and driving these corrupt  
19 organizations that do not do nothing for the City of  
20 New York.

21 Now, I'm not saying to defund SRG but the SRG  
22 needs reform. You can't defund SRG because what's  
23 going on right now with these Palestinian people  
24 running around the city beating up cops and saying  
25 all the antisemitism stuff in NYC. Now the big issue  
is, is you Justin Brannan, the Chair? People call

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 you fester for a reason. Is that you're defending  
4 these people. You have no problem defending these  
5 people because you have a big Islamic population down  
6 there and you know you need their votes for  
7 Christopher Cray. Christopher Cray is working for  
8 State Assembly and you need their votes and at the  
9 expense of antisemitism.

10 It's ridiculous Justin. Why are you not saying  
11 anything about the Palestinian people like [06:21:45]  
12 and with their lights on, that is backed by  
13 socialists of New York beating up Jews all over New  
14 York City, destroying property. It's ridiculous. We  
15 know you ain't going to listen Justin. We know you  
16 ain't going to listen Yusef Salaam. You all don't  
17 care about the Jews in New York City; you all just  
18 care about the Muslim votes and it's ridiculous. You  
19 all need to care about everybody in this city. It's  
20 getting out of control.

21 And that's all I got to say. And one more thing  
22 Yusef, you should not park in a bus lane. Jeff  
23 Colton exposed you this morning on Twitter of you  
24 parking in a bus lane. You need to stop parking in  
25 bus lanes.



1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

3 I didn't take that picture, Jeff Colton did. Are  
4 you going to block Jeff Colton?

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired. Thank  
6 you.

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you so much.

8 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, and with that, Day  
10 four of Executive Hearings is adjourned and we'll see  
11 you tomorrow. Thank you. [GAVEL]

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 15, 2024