

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

----- X

July 17, 2018
Start: 12:16 p.m.
Recess: 12:26 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: ANTONIO REYNOSO
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Fernando Cabrera
Chaim M. Deutsch
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Paul A. Vallone

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

3

2 [sound check] [pause]

3 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Give me a couple
4 seconds. The members are sitting. [pause] Let's
5 go. [background comments, pause] Alright. [gavel]
6 Welcome everybody—everyone to the Committee on
7 Sanitation and Solid Waste Management. My name is
8 Council Member Antonio Reynoso. I am the chair. I
9 want to thank my colleagues for being here, Council
10 Member Vallone, Deutsch and Cabrera. I want to thank
11 the members of the Committee for attending today's
12 vote. As you all are aware, Intro 157 is a
13 critically important piece of legislation that will
14 bring equity to our city's waste processing system,
15 and deliver environmental justice to low-income
16 communities of color in North Brooklyn, the South
17 Bronx and Southeast Queens. This bill has faced
18 significant political obstacles during my time in the
19 City Council having been introduced under three
20 different Speakers. However, I know my colleagues
21 understand the deep inequities present in our current
22 system, and I trust they will join me in delivering a
23 measure of justice that has eluded residents of these
24 communities for so long. I have worked tirelessly
25 for over—for over—almost a decade to pass this bill

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

4

2 holding countless meeting with the industry,
3 advocates, community residents and Council
4 colleagues. This bill has been—seen countless
5 versions introduced and amended. We have done this
6 analysis. We have heard from all sides. It is now
7 time to act. Our communities can no longer wait, and
8 I would like to now ask my colleagues to join in
9 voting in favor of Intro 157. Before I call the
10 vote, I just want to ask if any Council Members have
11 anything to say. Any comments? Some comments.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic] Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright, I-[pause]
14 Alright, So, I'll ask for the Clerk to call the vote,
15 and we've also been joined by Council Member Espinal.

16 CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk,
17 roll call vote Committee on Sanitation and Solid
18 Waste Management, Introduction 157-C, Chair Reynoso.

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I vote aye.

20 CLERK: Cabrera.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Permission to
22 explain my vote.

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
25 much. [coughing] Well, I'm going to be voting no

2 today for a couple of reasons. The first reason is
3 being to jobs. Jobs, jobs, real jobs. I'm talking
4 about union jobs, Teamster's jobs. We're talking
5 about people that today they're going to be hearing—
6 they start hearing about the fact that we're starting
7 to set in motion here a position where hundreds of
8 people are going to lose their jobs. We talked about
9 that this bill's intention is—is to help those in the
10 community where are people of color. Well, the
11 reality is that a lot of other people who are going
12 to lose their job are people of color. That's the
13 irony of—of this bill, and—and you'll have struggle
14 with this bill from the beginning because I don't see
15 a win situation for people in our community that are
16 going to be affected in every borough. The same
17 recent struggle with this bill is that we're going to
18 be talking about this truck, buses, trucks that are
19 going to be now traveling farther. I just don't see
20 the logic of having trucks travel farther and then we
21 have a carbon footprint that is going to be longer.
22 I just don't see the logic on that, and very recent I
23 have visited some of the stations, and this is hard
24 work. I mean this is work that probably half of us in
25 this room couldn't do this type of work, and I find

2 it ironic that we at the Council give funding to non-
3 profit organizations who those very non-profit
4 organizations, which do fantastic work—fantastic work
5 refer people to these very stations who are now are
6 not going to be able to do that because you're going
7 to have people actually losing their job and not
8 getting a job. So, for that reason, Mr. Chairman,
9 I'm going to be voting no on this. Thank you so
10 much.

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.

12 CLERK: Deutsch.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Can I please
14 explain my vote?

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [off mic]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, is that yes?

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yes, oh, yes, yes.
18 I apologize.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you,
20 Chair. So, any time we vote on a piece of legislation
21 it's—it's not for the short—short-term. It's for the
22 long-term and it makes an impact on New York City
23 residents, and it's not always an easy decision, and
24 specific—specifically, this bill 157 I have met with
25 advocates on both sides—on both sides, and people

2 from the carting industry, and those who—who
3 represent the environmental issues that affect New
4 York City residents, and I had to come up with a
5 decision, and I really wanted to understand the pros
6 and cons of what this bill will have on—on our city
7 as a whole and in addition to that, I did receive
8 yesterday a number of phone calls on the 12th Hour
9 and also people approaching me over the last three or
10 four hours telling me why it's good or why it's not
11 good, but, you know, I'm always accessible, and I
12 always like to learn, and I always like to hear from—
13 from people whether they support a bill or not, and
14 understand how I should vote. So, that being said,
15 after reviewing this bill, and speaking to many
16 people and some individuals as many--meeting them as
17 many as three or four times, I just want to
18 congratulate Antonio Reynoso and Steve Levin, and I
19 will vote yes on 157.

20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.

21 CLERK: Espinal.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote aye.

23 CLERK: Vallone.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: A moment to
25 explain my vote?

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: So, with all the
4 hard work on this this bill, I just wanted to put
5 onto the record that as a Council Member, I am aware
6 of my father's consulting firm has clients
7 potentially affected by this bill, but at no time
8 have I been lobbied by any member of the firm. The
9 aimed goal or potential of this bill is to regulate
10 and reduce the amount of waste particular communities
11 can handle in this legislation, and hope before it
12 passes with some additional amendments will help
13 bring relief to the neighborhoods such as College
14 Point. So, I'm voting yes on this bill. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you and I
16 would like to call on Council Member Daneek Miller
17 from Queens for a statement.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Chair.
19 Let me just say—let me begin by saying that from its
20 inception I think from the time that I became a
21 member of this Council I was introduced to then 495
22 and by Council Member Reynoso and its met and on
23 it's—on it's merits I absolutely unequivocally was
24 100% behind it, the—the fact that there were
25 communities that were being disproportionately

2 impacted. Over the past year we have worked—I think
3 that the goal of this bill is for us to be better,
4 for us mitigate and alleviate these conditions that
5 communities of color and other communities throughout
6 the city find themselves in. I think that what this
7 bill has ended up being is punitive and it is a
8 legislation that dissuades any investment in
9 communities that would make it better that there is
10 an opportunity particularly in Community Board 12 to
11 provide state-of-the art waste transfer and recycle
12 facilities, something that we can be proud of,
13 something that I think is everybody's objective here
14 in this Council, and I think that the bill certainly
15 by not including myself Council Member Adams and
16 others being impacted we missed an opportunity to
17 really drill down and be better and be a model for
18 what waste transfer and recycle throughout not just
19 the city, but the country can be, and I'm hoping that
20 we're—that there's opportunity upon implementation
21 that we quantify what exactly a 10% threshold is, who
22 is fixing that threshold and when—when, where and how
23 these cuts come into place. Certainly, I remain
24 willing to work with the Chairman and this committee
25 and others to—in order to facilitate that, but the

2 goals are admirable goals, but the outcome at this
3 moment is certainly something that I-I don't agree
4 with, but I look forward to working with the Chair.
5 Thank you. Thank you for allowing me to speak.

6 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I just want to say
7 to Council Member Miller so long as I'm the Chair of
8 here I'm going to do everything in my power to be as
9 helpful as possible to Southeast Queens. This is not
10 the beginning nor the end. We've got a lot of work
11 to do when it comes to Sanitation. I just want you
12 to know that I'm going to continue to be a partner to
13 try to do right by Southeast Queens on your behalf.
14 So, I really appreciate your time here. Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you.

16 CLERK: By a vote of 4 in the
17 affirmative, 1 in the negative and no abstentions,
18 the item has been adopted by the committee.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you and
20 the vote is now--the hearing is now closed. Thank
21 you. [gavel]

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date July 30, 2018