CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

----- X

March 14, 2018 Start: 10:08 a.m. Recess: 12:14 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES

Chairperson

VANESSA L. GIBSON

Co-Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

RAFAEL L. ESPINAL, JR.

STEPHEN T. LEVIN CARLOS MENCHACA

DONOVAN J. RICHARDS

ERIC A. ULRICH KALMAN YEGER

BARRY S. GRODENCHIK

STEVEN MATTEO KEITH POWERS

HELEN K. ROSENTHAL

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Vincent Sapienza
Commissioner of the New York City Department of
Environmental Protection

Joseph Murren Chief Financial Officer of the New York City Department of Environmental Protection

Tasos Georgelis
Acting Deputy Commissioner for the Bureau of
Water and Sewer Operations in the New York City
Department of Environmental Protection

David Warren
Assistant Commissioner with the Bureau of Water
Supply at the New York City Department of
Environmental Protection

Phil Vos Director of Energy Vision

Angela Licata
Deputy Commissioner of Sustainability of the New
York City Department of Environmental Protection

Michael DeLoach
Deputy Commissioner Public Affairs and
Communication at the Department of Environmental
Protection

Cecil McMaster Chief Information Officer for the Department of Environmental Protection

Pam Elardo
Deputy Commissioner for the Bureau of Wastewater
Treatment at the New York City Department of
Environmental Protection

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jim Mueller
Deputy Commissioner of the Bureau of Engineering
Design and Construction of the New York City
Department of Environmental Protection

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET	
2	[gavel]	

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: alright,
good morning do I have to okay, I got to I got to
do it in on this thing first. Alright, good morning,
I am Costa Constantinides, Chair of the Committee on
Environmental Protection. Today this committee will
address the Mayor's fiscal 2019 preliminary budget
for the Department of Environmental Protection. The
department's proposed fiscal 2019 expense budget
totals 1.31 billion dollars which is 105.2 million
dollars less than fiscal 2018 adopted budget of 1.41
billion. DEP's proposed capital commitment plan for
fiscal 2018 through fiscal 2022 includes 13.8 billion
which is 65.7 million dollars more than the adopted
commitment plan. The committee looks forward to
hearing testimony on several important topics
including the agency's work to address combined sewer
overflows, measures to enhance water supply
redundancy, budgetary considerations put forth at the
proposed capital commitment plan, and agency
performance in light of the release of the
preliminary Mayor's management report. Commissioner
Sapienza of the Department of Environmental
Protection will be providing testimony today. Before

1
_

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET 5 we hear from the Commissioner I'd like to thank the committee staff for putting together today's hearing including Jonathan Seltzer our Finance Analyst right here to my left, our, our Counsel to the Committee Samara Swanston right here to my right, Nadia Johnson our Policy Analyst as well, and Nick Widzowski my Legislative Counsel. With that I will turn it over to the Chair of the Subcommittee on Capital for our Finance Committee, great advocate for the environment our, our Co-Chair of today's hearing Vanessa Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you so much Chair and good morning to each and everyone of you, welcome to City Hall. I am Council Member Vanessa Gibson of the 16th district in the borough of the Bronx and I'm so excited to be here as the Chair of the new Subcommittee on Capital Budget. I'd like to thank my fellow Co-Chair, our Chair of Environmental Protection, Costa Constantinides and certainly the members of the Environmental Protection Committee as well as the Subcommittee and thank them for being here this morning. I'd like to recognize Council Member Barry Grodenchik for being here, thank you colleague. This morning in it's second hearing as part of the FY 2019 preliminary budget hearings this

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET 6
2	Subcommittee on Capital Budget will be hearing from
3	the Department of Environmental Protection. I want to
4	thank Commissioner Sapienza for being here today and
5	I look forward to hearing your testimony from you and
6	your colleagues. DEP's preliminary capital budget
7	totals 13.7 billion dollars in fiscal 2018 through
8	2022 representing nearly one fifth of the city's
9	total capital plan. The preliminary capital plan has
10	grown slightly when compared to the Departments FY
11	2018 adopted commitment plan due to a variety of
12	projects from water pollution control to supply and
13	equipment purchases. Throughout this month in the
14	council this subcommittee will not only seek to
15	address those areas in which the city can improve the
16	capital process but certainly will also seek to learr
17	from those city agencies who generally implement such
18	projects effectively and I'm so proud to say that DEF
19	is one of those agencies who certainly we are looking
20	to for your leadership and certainly replicating a
21	lot of the great work that DEP has done. The
22	department's capital commitment rate for 2017, 78
23	percent, well above the citywide average of 56
24	percent, this agency this continues an agency trend
25	of beating our citywide average. These commitments

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	are particularly impressive given the nature of many
3	of our DEP projects which are often complex,
4	complicated and involve many moving pieces, so I wan
5	to commend DEP for this great success and I hope at
6	today's hearing this morning we're able to highlight
7	some of the best practices that might be replicated
8	across other city agencies. The subcommittee will
9	also continue to advocate throughout our hearings fo
10	design build authority for many of our capital
11	projects and I am just returning from Albany
12	yesterday meeting with many of my former colleagues
13	in the State Legislature including our Governor
14	talking about design build. So, I'm very interested
15	in hearing from DEP about agency projects where
16	design build might be applicable. Finally, as with
17	the other agencies that the subcommittee will hear
18	from later on this month, I hope to examine ways to
19	increase our transparency and communication in the
20	capital budgeting process and in other areas. In
21	terms of budgeting DEP's commitment plan similar to
22	many other agencies includes overly broad budget
23	lines that can make it difficult to track individual
24	projects to exert meaningful oversight. With respect

to a process like DOT, DEP performs numerous projects

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET 8
2	that effect work that is done by other entities such
3	as many of our utility companies as well as work in
4	locations outside of the city of New York. DOT
	-
5	Commissioner Polly Trottenberg mentioned to us last
6	week that DOT meets regularly with other parties and
7	stakeholders to get them on the same page about their
8	ongoing work, so I'm certainly interested in DEP's
9	participation in interagency as well as working with
10	our partners outside of the city of New York and
11	learning about the relationships that you have with
12	our local government outside of the city. So, I look
13	forward to hearing from our Commissioner today about
14	these and other issues and I'd like to also thank the
15	finance staff who worked very hard to prepare for
16	today's hearing; our Finance Director Latonia
17	McKinney, our Deputy Directors Nathan Toth and Regina
18	Poreda-Ryan, our Finance Unit Head Crilhien
19	Francisco, our Finance Analyst Jon Seltzer and our
20	Finance Counsels Eric Burnstein to my left and
21	Rebecca Chasan to my right and with that I want to
22	thank our Co-Chair for hosting today's hearing and
23	now I will turn it back to Chair Constantinides,
24	thank you.

-	$W \perp L H$	SUBCOMMITTEE	\cap N	СДРТТДТ.	RIIDGET

2 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Great, so

3 | Samara Swanston will swear in the witnesses.

2.2

COMMITTEE CLERK SWANSTON: Would you please raise your right hand, do you swear or affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth today?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: I do.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES:

Commissioner, good to see you again.

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Good to see you too.

Good morning Chair COnstantinides and Chair Gibson.

So, I am Vincent Sapienza the Commissioner of the New York City Department of Environmental Protection. At the table here today with me is Joseph Murren who's our Chief Financial Officer, Deputy Commissioner Michael DeLoach and behind me is DEP senior team who will help with questions and answers if we should need so before I start Chair Constantinides I just want to, you know say thank you again for all your support and great work on, on many of our shared priorities for sustainability and resiliency, a lot of environmental justice things we've been doing and just protecting the overall environment of the city so thank you on that and Chair Gibson

1
_

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET congratulations, we got to sit down the other day and go through some of the work that we're doing and you know we look to continue to work with you and the, the team on, on DEPs capital commitment for our critical infrastructure. We also want to give a special welcome to the, the new Council Members who, who are on these committees and we look forward to, to highlighting some of our great work and working with them in the future. So, as background DEP has the overall responsibility for the city's water supply and sewer system including providing drinking water to all New Yorkers, maintaining pressure to fire hydrants, managing storm water and collecting and treating waste water. In addition, DEP regulates air quality, hazardous waste and critical quality of life issues including noise. All of our water related expenses both operational and capital are paid for with money collected from the water and sewer rate charges billed to our 834,000 rate payers. The water rate is authorized annually by the New York City Water Board. As you know Mayor De Blasio completely eliminated the rental payment five years sooner than originally projected, the full elimination of the rental payment will result in a savings of seven

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	percent or 1.1 billion dollars for our customers
3	through FY 2020. In 2016 the city proposed and the
4	Water Board approved a 183 dollar credit to more than
5	664,000 homeowners and that was subsequently
6	challenged in court but we're happy to report that
7	the New York State Court of Appeals has ultimately
8	upheld the Board's authority to issue such a credit
9	and, and we began posting those credits on the water
10	bills last month and so over the next few months
11	those of you that are paying a bill will see that
12	credit reflected. Go, going forward now that this
13	issue is behind us we look forward again to doing a
14	standard rate setting for fiscal '19 and we, we will
15	be discussing with the Water Board in the next month
16	or so and then doing five borough hearings starting
17	in May. I'd also like, like to take a minute to
18	highlight that our harbor waters are cleaner and
19	healthier than they've been in more than a century.
20	Key indicators of water quality including in
21	concentrations of bacteria and nitrogen continue to
22	drop while dissolved oxygen is on the rise. We are
23	hearing more and more reports of whales, dolphins and
24	seals returning to our waterways and we are proud to

see that our hard work to date has, has been paying

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION COINTEL
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	off. And finally, I wanted to highlight an
3	accomplishment from last session that will have real
4	impact on New Yorkers, reducing construction noise.
5	Local Law 53, sponsored by Council Member Kallos and
6	passed by the Environmental Protection Committee last
7	fall and signed by the Mayor in January, will reduce
8	construction noise across the city which is the
9	number one complaint to 3-1-1. As you know, the law
10	authorizes DEP to now take street-level sound
11	measurements in the public right of way, 50 feet away
12	from construction related noise sources. Previously,
13	DEP inspectors were required to measure noise levels
14	from within the dwellings of residents who filed the
15	noise complaints. The new law establishes different
16	enforceable sound levels for residential and
17	commercial areas, as well as for street work. In the
18	event that a construction-related noise complaint
19	cannot be resolved, DEP can now issue limited stop-
20	work orders for equipment that exceeds the noise
21	levels, while allowing the rest of the construction
22	work to continue. It's a great piece of legislation
23	and we appreciate the collaboration between the
24	council and DEP. So, now I'll, I'll start discussing

the FY '19 Four-Year Capital Plan. So, our Four-Year

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	Capital Plan has approximately 11.2 billion dollars
3	for FY '19 through '22 as presented by Mayor De
4	Blasio on February 1 st , 2018, it's an increase of 748
5	million dollars or 7.2 percent over the FY '18
6	September capital improvement plan of 10.4 billion
7	dollars. The funding will allow our nearly 6,000
8	employees to continue to expand upon our history of
9	reliability and innovation. I will now provide some
10	highlights for the fiscal '19 through '22 plan
11	focusing on drinking water supply, the sewer network,
12	harbor water quality, and initiatives to promote the
13	overall health of the New York City environment. I
14	will also provide updates on performance metrics
15	pertaining to the mission of our complex agency. So,
16	first on drinking water, the New York City water
17	supply system provides approximately one billion
18	gallons of safe drinking water to about nine million
19	people. This includes residents of the city of New
20	York, the millions of tourists and commuters who
21	visit the City throughout the year, and approximately
22	one million people living in the counties of
23	Westchester, Putnam, Orange, and Ulster. In all, the
24	city of New the, the New York City water supply
25	system provides nearly half of the population of New

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	York State with drinking water. We work hard to
3	deliver an exceptionally high quality of water - one
4	that regularly wins national taste tests! DEP
5	scientists collect samples 365 days a year from our
6	expansive reservoir system, the aqueducts that
7	deliver the water to the city, and from roughly 1,000
8	sampling stations across the five boroughs. These
9	water samples are delivered to one of DEP's four
10	state-of-the-art laboratories where scientists
11	analyze them for more than, than 600,000 times
12	annually. In addition, we have robotic monitoring
13	buoys in our reservoirs that provide an additional
14	1.2 million measurements per year that help us to
15	send the best water to the city at all times. For FY
16	'19 to '22, the Administration is proposing to invest
17	significantly in protecting the quality of our
18	reservoirs and the integrity of our dams, providing
19	for treatment where necessary, and maintaining and
20	repairing the water main system conveying potable
21	water to all New Yorkers. We have budgeted a total of
22	1.2 billion dollars for water supply contracts,
23	including 30 million dollars for closeout at the
24	Croton Water Filtration Plant, 185 million dollars to

continue our watershed protection programs, and 376

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	million dollars to reconstruct dams in the
3	watersheds. There is also 1.2 billion dollars
4	allocated for the replacement of in-City water mains,
5	which includes 765 million dollars for specific
6	water-main work, 77 million dollars to accelerate the
7	replacement of underground water distribution
8	infrastructure, 67 million dollars for emergency
9	contracts for water distribution, and 85 million
10	dollars to keep our water distribution assets in a
11	state of good repair. As cities around the country
12	and world struggle to deliver safe drinking water due
13	to drought, climate change, budget shortages and
14	aging infrastructure; DEP is prioritizing the
15	following projects and programs to guarantee the
16	dependability and resiliency of the City's water
17	supply system. So, first I'll start with the
18	filtration avoidance determination. For decades, New
19	York City has recognized that it is environmentally
20	sound and cost effective to protect drinking water at
21	its source. This past December, the New York State
22	Department of Health awarded DEP a new 10-year waiver
23	to continue delivering unfiltered drinking water from
24	our Catskill/Delaware water supply, called the
25	Filtration Avoidance Determination or FAD This

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

2.2

23

24

25

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET agreement commits the City, working with our upstate partners, to investing about a billion dollars over the next decade towards programs to protect our drinking water. If the FAD had not been renewed the City would be required to build a new filtration plant which would have cost upwards of 10 billion dollars to build and over 100 million dollars annually to operate. These costs would have to be passed on to our ratepayers. Maintaining the FAD is one our highest priorities, and the City's sciencebased approach to watershed protection has made our program a national and international model for protection. Under prior FADs DEP has preserved more than 150,000 acres of land, upgraded wastewater infrastructure throughout the watershed, worked with farmers to ensure their operations are both efficient and protective of water quality, and focused considerable attention on the natural infrastructure of our streams, wetlands, and forests. These programs are critical to our success and the capital plan includes 185 million dollars to continue FAD related programs over the next four years. On the Delaware Aqueduct Repair I am pleased to report that work progresses on schedule, and on budget, for the one-

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	billion-dollar repair of the Delaware Aqueduct, which
3	includes the construction of a 2.5-mile bypass tunned
4	that is now being drilled 600 feet below the Hudson
5	River from Newburgh to Wappinger. DEP began tunneling
6	last September and we expect to make the connection
7	to the existing aqueduct in 2022. City Water Tunnel
8	Number 3, the, the Brooklyn-Queens Leg to our, our,
9	our plan includes 600 million dollars to complete the
10	Brooklyn-Queens leg of Tunnel No. 3, which is
11	primarily for funding of two new shafts that will be
12	drilled from the surface down to where the tunnel is
13	In December 2017, DEP brought the Brooklyn-Queens led
14	of the tunnel itself to, to the below ground section
15	of the tunnel into a state of activation readiness,
16	meaning that in the unlikely event of a major failure
17	of City Tunnel Number 1 or 2, DEP could quickly
18	deliver water through City Water Tunnel Number 3 to
19	Brooklyn and Queens. On the Kensico Eastview Tunnel,
20	DEP has allocated an additional 35 million dollars
21	bringing the total allocation to 808 million dollars
22	for this project. When completed, the project will
23	provide additional redundancy for New York City's
24	water delivery system. An additional 33 million was

added to the plan for a total of $117\ \mathrm{million}\ \mathrm{dollars}$

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	for upgrades to the Ashokan Reservoir, the Olive
3	Bridge Dam and the Dividing Weir Bridge. Upgrades to
4	these nearly 100-year-old assets will ensure
5	continued compliance with New York State dam safety
6	regulations as well the continued safety of the
7	public traveling over the Dividing Weir Bridge. I'll
8	now turn to sewers. DEP is responsible for the
9	maintenance of more than 7,000 miles of sewers
10	throughout the City. Over the last several years, DE
11	has embraced a data-driven, proactive approach to
12	operating and maintaining the sewer system. By using
13	a range of digital tools and innovative practices,
14	DEP developed targeted programs to provide a high
15	level of service to our customers while focusing on
16	investments that prioritize resources. Over the past
17	decades, decade these programs have significantly
18	driven down confirmed sewer backups. Since 2013, we
19	have also been more proactively cleaning sewers,
20	rather than the previous practice of reactively
21	cleaning them after a backup occurred. In 2017, more
22	than 400 miles of sewers were proactively cleaned.
23	The leading cause of sewer backups continues to be
2.4	the buildup of fats, oils, and greases. In 2017, this

caused more than 70 percent of confirmed backups.

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	Since 2015, DEP has engaged thousands of households,
3	multi-family properties, religious organizations,
4	civic associations, and educational institutions in
5	communication on the proper disposal of used cooking
6	oil and the harmful effects on the sewer
7	infrastructure. Credit for another successful sewer
8	initiative goes to the City Council with passage of
9	Local Law 48 of 2015. The law required DEP to inspect
10	and clean as necessary all 148,000 street catch
11	basins on a yearly basis, rather than on the prior 3-
12	year cycle. The accelerated cycle proved beneficial
13	both to debris removal and to more quickly address
14	defects that required repair. The plan for FY '19
15	through, through '22 projects we project is 2.6
16	billion dollars of spending on sewers, which includes
17	the build-out of Southeast Queens for 796 million
18	dollars. In addition, the Plan allocates 916 million
19	dollars to replace sewers including the Mayor's
20	initiative for accelerated replacement, 1.6 billion
21	dollars to construct new sewers of all types of which
22	112 million is for high-level storm sewers, and 270
23	million dollars to expand, expand a blue belt
24	drainage system on Staten Island. Now I want to talk

about the initiative in Southeast Queens. Southeast

1
_

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

1112

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2122

23

24

25

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET Queens experienced rapid residential and commercial growth from the 1920s through the 1960s, and many of the natural watercourses that previously drained the area were paved over by developers, exacerbating flooding. The low-lying topography of the area and the enlargement of Kennedy Airport significantly complicated the installation of large storm sewers, making planned work extremely costly. Major projects had been deferred until Mayor De Blasio authorized 1.5 billion dollars over ten years for the Southeast Queens Flood Mitigation Plan. This has since been increased to even more than that, we've added money to that program. Together with our partners at the Department of Design and Construction and the Department of Transportation, DEP has developed a four-pronged approach to improve conditions in Southeast Queens. First is we're constructing quick fixes, such as storm sewer extensions, targeted fullsize sewers, and green infrastructure to bring nearterm flooding relief. Second, we're ... we ... we'll build neighborhood sewers where, where there's existing capacity in the existing sewer system. Third, we'll create future capacity for further neighborhood sewer projects by investing in large trunk sewers. And, and

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	finally we're evaluating opportunities to reduce
3	groundwater flooding. Together, these four approaches
4	are starting to deliver both immediate and long-
5	lasting relief for many residents in Southeast
6	Queens. As requested by the council, an easy-to-use
7	map of this work is now available on our website. Now
8	touching on wastewater treatment. DEP manages an
9	average of 1.3 billion gallons of wastewater each day
10	through our 14 waste water treatment facilities. The
11	alignment with wastewater utilities across the
12	country, DEP is embracing best practices to ensure a
13	sustainable future that minimizes waste, maximizes
14	resources, protects our ratepayers, improves the
15	community, and embraces innovation. Wastewater
16	resource recovery is an essential element in
17	delivering maximum environmental benefits at the
18	least cost to society. DEP is working to promote our
19	role in energy optimization, greenhouse gas
20	reduction, carbon sequestration, and operational
21	improvements to efficiently manage the expense budget
22	while expanding environmental opportunities. Our
23	capital plan projects a 2.6-billion-dollar capital
24	investment for the upgrade, reconstruction, or

replacement of components of the wastewater treatment

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	plants and pumping stations. While DEP is a world-
3	leader in water supply delivery and wastewater
4	treatment, we are constantly looking for innovative
5	ways to curb costs and enhance the environment of New
6	York City. These efforts include commitments to the
7	Zero Waste to Landfill initiative that the Mayor put
8	forth as well as his 80 by 50 initiative, so I'll
9	first talk about zero waste. Last year in 2017 our
10	wastewater treatment plants generated 490,000 tons of
11	biosolids, which are the nutrient-rich organic
12	materials that are generated during the wastewater
13	treatment process. Last year, approximately 74
14	percent of those biosolids went to landfill, 15
15	percent were used as alternative daily landfill
16	cover, and 11 percent were beneficially used through
17	mine reclamation and composting. Our goal of 'zero by
18	30' is to have non-landfill beneficial use of 100
19	percent of our biosolids by the year 2030, with year
20	over year progress starting in 2019. To this end, we
21	are in the process of awarding a 150-ton-per-day
22	contract for beneficial use only, as well as
23	developing short and long-term master plans for
24	beneficial end use. As you may recall, DEP, in
25	conjunction with the company Waste Management and

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	National Grid is launching a pilot demonstration
3	project at the Newtown Creek, Creek Wastewater
4	Treatment Plant in Brooklyn to accept food waste from
5	the City's organics program. DEP began accepting food
6	waste in 2016 and has ramped up to 80 tons per day o
7	food waste today. In addition to supporting the
8	city's Zero Waste initiative, this effort also
9	increases digester gas production at the plant which
10	is a clean renewable fuel. By the end of 2018, we
11	expect that National Grid will complete construction
12	of their biogas scrubbing system, which will allow
13	excess digester gas from the Newtown Creek Plant to
14	be delivered back into the nearby natural gas
15	pipeline. On 80 by 50, in support of the Mayor's
16	commitment to reduce greenhouse emissions, DEP has
17	launched a number of initiatives and I'll briefly
18	describe. So, first digester gas, on average, our
19	wastewater treatment facilities generate 3.6 billion
20	cubic feet of digester gas per year, of which
21	approximately only 35 percent is used at the plants
22	beneficially to power boilers and engines, while the
23	remaining is really worthlessly flared. Over the next
2.4	three decades, DEP will be phasing out flaring of gas

by developing on-site usage such as expanding our

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	ability to use it as a substitute for fuel or
3	electricity and delivering our digester gas into the
4	natural gas grid. Solar. By leveraging DCAS funding,
5	DEP is currently conducting a solar photovoltaic and
6	energy-storage feasibility study for the Wards Island
7	Treatment plant, at which there are prime
8	opportunities to install solar photovoltaic canopies
9	over wastewater-treatment processing tanks. In
10	addition, DEP is also evaluating ground-mount and
11	parking canopy solutions in the watershed. For energy
12	conservation, over the past several years, DEP has
13	identified more than 400 energy conservation
14	measures. At these as these facilities are upgraded,
15	DEP is seeking opportunities to integrate energy
16	conservation measures into its state-of-good-repair
17	capital planning process. On cogeneration, which uses
18	methane that's produced during a wastewater treatment
19	process to generate electricity and heat. Last year
20	we began construction on a 267-million-dollar project
21	at North River plant to replace the plant's existing
22	1980's vintage diesel-powered systems with five new
23	natural gas-fired and, and digester gas-fueled
24	cogeneration engines. This project will result in
25	improved energy efficiency, power supply reliability,

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	and air quality, while also maximizing the beneficial
3	use of methane produced on-site. In, in our plan we
4	also have 220 million dollars to upgrade the
5	digesters at the Hunts Point Wastewater Treatment
6	Plant, which will more effectively break down organic
7	matter, reducing the amount of residual solids that
8	need to be trucked from the site through the
9	neighborhood. More methane gas will also be produced,
10	which will be used to offset purchased fuel. And I
11	want to speak about harbor water quality.
12	Approximately 60 percent of New York City is served
13	by combined sewers, where storm water runoff and
14	sanitary waste are conveyed in a single pipe beneath
15	each street to a wastewater treatment plant. The
16	system was originally designed so that during
17	moderate to heavy rain events, excess water gets
18	released untreated into local waterways, which is
19	referred to as combined sewer overflow or CSOs. When
20	the city's long-term control process for CSOs kicked
21	off in 2012, DEP began engaging the public in the
22	development of each plan. Over the years, we have
23	listened to feedback on ways to improve our public
24	engagement strategies. In response, we have worked to

make our complicated presentations and informational

1 WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET	
2 materials more, more user friendly, coordinat	ted with
3 local organizations on meeting dates and loca	ations,
4 held dozens of public meetings, and responded	d to
5 public comments. Last November we announced t	that,
6 going forward, the public will have an opport	tunity t
7 review and comment on our proposed plans before	ore they
8 are submitted to New York State DEC for its r	review.
9 Under the Long Term CSO planning process, DEF	e will be
10 investing at least another 4.4 billion dollar	rs to
11 make further CSO reductions over the next 25	years.
12 The Plan includes 1.5 billion dollars for pla	anned
13 consent-order work related to the Long-Term C	Control
14 Plans for combined sewer overflow. In 2017, N	New York
15 State DEC approved seven of the City's plans,	with
16 two additional plans under review by the Stat	te. Two
of these plans call for enormous CSO storage	tunnels
18 beneath Brooklyn and Queens to reduce further	2
19 overflows into Flushing Bay and Newtown Creek	k. DEP i
20 currently developing two more plans, one for	Jamaica
21 Bay, and another for the East River and Open	Waters.
22 Once these plans are identified, they will be	
23 we will be able to estimate the cost associat	
them. The approved LTPT LTCPs for Alley Cree	

Flushing Creek, and the Hutchinson River include

1
_

2

3

4

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

1213

14

15

16

17

18

1920

21

2.2

23

24

25

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET projects to disinfect CSOs using bleach, with the intent of significantly reducing pathogens during the recreational season. I recently met with several environmental groups and I acknowledge their concerns about residual chlorine entering water bodies where it could potentially have an effect on marine biota. It should be noted that these three projects will also include de-chlorination systems to eliminate any residual chlorine compounds prior to release, and we will conduct extensive environmental reviews during the design phase before proceeding with construction. The ultimate goal of eliminating CSOs is daunting, given the challenges of siting extremely-large infrastructure in a very dense city and the massive capital cost, which could exceed 30 billion dollars for New York City. The LTCPs represent a significant next step, and one that won't break the backs of middle and working-class homeowners who pay a water bill. DEP looks forward to a continuing dialogue with the stakeholders, with the City Council and with New York State DEC on this complex issue. On green infrastructure, in 2010, DEP launched, launched a green infrastructure program in the combined sewered areas of the City to help reduce CSOs. DEP has worked

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	diligently to advance construction of green
3	infrastructure in priority areas, which reduces the
4	amount of storm water runoff entering the wastewater
5	system and adds multiple co-benefits for New Yorkers
6	such as decreased ponding, increased shade, and
7	community greening. To date, DEP has constructed
8	approximately 4,000 green infrastructure assets, the
9	majority of which are located in the right of way.
LO	From its out, outset, DEP committed 1.5 billion
L1	dollars for the Green Infrastructure Program, of
L2	which over 468 million dollars has been encumbered to
L3	date and another 990 million dollars has been
L 4	budgeted through fiscal year 2027. The funding will
L5	be used to continue to build right-of-way rain
L 6	gardens, as well as green infrastructure retrofits of
L7	City-owned property through partnerships with the Ne
L8	York City Housing Authority and the Departments of
L 9	Education and Parks & Recreation. These partnerships
20	allow us leverage funding and support from other
21	City-initiatives such as Park's Community Parks
22	initiative and we have added 50 million dollars to
23	that program to ensure that these parks are managing
24	storm water runoff and contributing to healthier

waterways. To date, DEP has completed 48 public

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	retrofit projects with our partners, and 200 are
3	currently in design. Briefly I want to talk about the
4	Gowanus Canal now. The Gowanus is a major priority
5	for the city and for DEP. EPA has required the, the
6	City to limit CSOs into the canal by constructing two
7	underground tanks and associated infrastructure to
8	intercept and store CSOs during wet weather events.
9	We are in the final step of our ULURP application
10	with the Council hearing just this past Monday. We
11	have been pleased that stakeholders seem to approve
12	our approach with the Community Board, Borough
13	President, and City Planning Commission all
14	supporting our application with conditions. We are
15	hopeful to acquire these properties without eminent
16	domain, but we will still meet our milestones even if
17	that is not the case. It is important to meet that
18	schedule and milestones on this project, as if we do
19	not stay on schedule, the EPA could have us move to
20	a to do the project under an adjacent park and, and
21	community swimming pool and we share the community's
22	opposition to that alternative. So, now I'll speak
23	about the FY '19 expense budget. The projected
24	Expense Budget for the current fiscal year, FY '18 is

1.3 billion dollars that includes approximately 80.2

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	million dollars in Community Development Block Grants
3	funds for the "Build it Back" program, for which DEP
4	serves as a contracting entity for the City.
5	Therefore, backing out that Build It Back Funding
6	DEP's FY '19 Preliminary Expense Budget is 1.2
7	billion dollars. The Preliminary FY '19 Expense
8	Budget breaks into the following large categories:
9	543.8 million dollars or about 41.6 percent of the
10	budget is for personal services to pay the salaries
11	of our nearly 6,000 funded positions, 763.8 million
12	dollars or 58.4 percent is for other than personal
13	services, OTPS which includes taxes on upstate
14	watershed lands, which account for 167.2 million
15	dollars or nearly 12.8 percent of our expense budget.
16	As you may know our growing ownership of watershed
17	lands represents a critical investment in maintaining
18	the high quality of the City's drinking water by
19	protecting it at the source and ensuring that it does
20	not require more expensive treatment, such as
21	filtration. I am pleased to report that we have
22	successfully negotiated agreements with upstate
23	jurisdictions to make our tax obligations more stable
24	and predictable. DEP's energy costs, including heat,
25	light, and power, account for 92.8 million dollars or

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	7.1 percent of the FY '19 Expense Budget. DEP is the
3	third-largest municipal consumer of electric power in
4	City after the Department of Education and Health and
5	Hospitals, and our consumption will grow as we bring
6	new online treatment processes for wastewater. To
7	control energy costs and to meet Mayor De Blasio's
8	major commitment to reduce greenhouse gas emissions,
9	DEP is investing in projects to reduce energy needs,
10	including the cogeneration plant at the North River
11	Treatment Plant that I mentioned earlier. The
12	chemicals that are necessary for both our drinking
13	water supply and wastewater treatment are estimated
14	to cost 49.0 million dollars in FY '19 or about 3.7
15	percent of the Expense Budget. For drinking water,
16	DEP continues to add chlorine and fluoride to Cat/De
17	water in order to meet federal, state and city
18	treatment requirements. Also, for drinking water, the
19	treatment processes at the new Croton Water
20	Filtration Plant requires additional chemicals. Our
21	wastewater plants rely on the addition of polymers,
22	sodium hydroxide, glycerol, and ferric chloride and
23	other chemicals to improve removal rates and continue
24	to disinfect their effluent with chlorine compounds

as we have done since the 1930s. On sludge management

ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY

	I
	COMMITTEE ON
1	WITH SUB
2	we produced betw
3	that's projected
4	'19 which is abo
5	Expense Budget.
6	continue to iden
7	finding a more b
8	Savings Initiati
9	processes to ide
10	without sacrific
11	example of this
12	uses to meet str
13	nitrogen from wa
14	eight million do
15	reduce costs, DE

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
we produced between 1,200 and 1,300 tons per day and
that's projected to cost 56.4 million dollars for FY
'19 which is about three which is 4.3 percent of our
Expense Budget. As mentioned earlier, we will
continue to identify ways to reduce these costs by
finding a more beneficial use. Just briefly on cost
Savings Initiatives. DEP has taken a hard look at our
processes to identify where we can reduce costs
without sacrificing quality or reliability. One
example of this is the chemical Glycerol, which DEP
uses to meet strict regulatory requirements to remove
nitrogen from wastewater. In 2017, DEP spent almost
eight million dollars for glycerol. In an effort to
reduce costs, DEP rebid the glycerol contracts with
improved contract terms and we achieved a price
reduction of approximately 55 percent per pound of
glycerol, about 4 million dollars in overall savings.
We are anticipating several million in savings in
2018. In addition, through the ingenuity of our
workforce, DEP attained 3.4 million dollars in
savings last year through operational changes to
process air systems, overhauling tanks in-house, and
other creative initiatives. We look to expand these
best practices and increase these savings in, in the

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	future. So, finally on behalf of the 6,000 employees
3	at DEP across the city and upstate I you know I wan
4	to again express our appreciation to Chairman
5	Constantinides for your steadfast environmental
6	leadership and to Chair Gibson and you have our
7	continued commitment to collaborating with you and
8	your committee on delivering our infrastructure
9	program. I want to thank you all for the opportunity
10	to present testimony today and we look forward to
11	answering questions. Thank you.
12	CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you
13	Commissioner, we're joined by Council Member

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you

Commissioner, we're joined by Council Member

Grodenchik, Council Member Richards, Council Member

Matteo, I know Helen Rosenthal, Council Member

Rosenthal was here as well. So, I'll ask a couple of

questions and then I'll kick it back to the Chair and

then we'll open it up to the, the other Council

Members. So, looking at biosolids, you talked about

coming up with a, sort of long term plan about... you

said about 150 per day.

VINCENT SAPIENZA: 150 tons per day.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And how much do we, we, we create about 1,300, right?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Yes.

2.2

1 WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

2 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: So, how do

3 we scale that up over the next... and you put 30 years,

4 how do we do that?

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, so it's, it's a challenging program but we, we... just a little bit of a history so, in 1988 congress unanimously passed the ocean dumping ban act, municipalities used to take their biosolids and dump it out at sea and, and since that time municipalities have had to either incinerate it or land apply it and DEP has been land applying it probably going back ten years when the recession hit, the cost of beneficially land applying it on cropland, on grazing land went up in value a lot and that was costing DEP over 40 million dollars a year at one point and we hit 50 at... back ten years ago and landfill costs were very low due to the recession and we, we had been landfilling our sludge ever since. We would like to now more beneficially use that sludge, get it out of landfills and it does have a nutrient value to use it so as a first step we're issuing this 150 million dollar... this 150 ton per day, sorry, contract to, to take our biosolids and use it for a beneficial purpose rather than just essentially putting it in, in landfill as waste. Over

L	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	time we'll we will see how that first contract
3	progresses and then try to move forward but our goal
1	is by 20130 to eliminate that 1,300 tons per day from
-	going to landfill

2.2

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Okay.

Alright, so looking next at Flushing Bay, I know that there's a dredging project going on there, the timeline is to complete it during this fiscal year?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: That's correct.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And if it doesn't... we are not able to finish... how are we doing, how... what's the progress so far?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, so we have this project to, to remove dredge material from Flushing Bay, this is just basically sewer sediments that have accumulated over the, the, the decades. The, the dredge work itself removing that material is essentially complete and what we're continuing to do now Council Member is, is, is capping that, that site and then doing some shoreline restoration and, and some greenery of the site so we fully expect to have that done... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: So, it's not going to bleed into FY '19?

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET VINCENT SAPIENZA: No.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And how long will that keep Flushing Bay in good condition because I... you know it, it's kind of the, the chicken and the egg problem, right, we're, we're still having the, the CSOs in Flushing Bay so what... how long is it going to be until we have to dredge again?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: That's right, so, so we've done a couple of things, one is several years ago we completed the 400 million dollar project to build a 40 million gallon storage tank to reduce overflows into Flushing Creek which eventually make its way into Flushing Bay but there are still a couple of large CSO outfalls into Flushing Bay which as, as you said Mr. Chair continue to contribute sewer sediments. One of the projects that we mentioned in the long-term control plan for Flushing Bay is to build a massive storage tunnel that will be a couple hundred feet below ground and that will store combined sewage that would otherwise have overflowed, we'll store it in the tunnel until the storm ends and then that could be dumped... pumped to a wastewater treatment plant.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And that
3	would be with the Bowery Bay Wastewater Treatment
4	Plant so that, that'd be coming through from Flushing
5	Bay through Jackson Heights and to Astoria, correct?
6	VINCENT SAPIENZA: Correct.
7	CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And what's
8	the timeline on that tunnel, what's, what's the sort
9	of long term plan there?
LO	VINCENT SAPIENZA: Yeah, so we, we are
L1	really in the early stages, we, we hope to begin
L2	design, the full design in the next year or two but
L3	we I don't know if we have those the timeline Joe,
L 4	for the CSO, yeah, it's, it's late 2020's is
L5	completion.
L 6	CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Its
L7	completed of the design?
L8	VINCENT SAPIENZA: No, of the of the
L 9	entire project… [cross-talk]
20	CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Oh, the
21	entire project so late 2020's oh, so late 20 not in
22	late 2020 but late 2020's so yeah, I, I, I hear you
23	on that, I mean as, as, as a representative of, of

Western Queens that abuts Flushing Bay but also that,

that represents the Bowery Bay Treatment Plant, I'm,

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

1213

14

15

16

17

1819

20

21

22

23

24

25

I'm very interested in that project and, and seeing how we progress and seeing how we can best capture as much of the CSO waste there as possible. And then looking at... again going back to the CSO issue, I know that my colleague Barry Grodenchik is probably going to go into more detail on this but looking at the chlorination, it'll... is there a record of this working?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, in, in working with New York State DEC on looking at alternatives for, for CSO so we, we have been doing grey infrastructure these large storage tanks, we've been doing green infrastructure but in some cases even with building these massive storage tanks they're periodically, you know maybe once a month or so there will be an overflow that, that can't be captured it's just a heavy rainstorm and the, the proposal now is to when there is an overflow is to add sodium hydroxide, it's essentially strong Clorox bleach to kill whatever bacteria may, may be in those overflows. We, we also ... part of that ... those projects will include a de-chlorination system using sodium bisulfite to remove any chlorine compounds before they, they may go into water bodies and, and the

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

it can impact marine biota and we want... we want to

concern about chlorine getting into waterways is that

avoid that. So, it... we, we know it's going to be a challenge, we've looked at other municipalities that have done it, we will always want... if we... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: But how does it... how does it work in those other municipalities?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: It's, it's been challenging in, in other places and, and what, what other municipalities have done and what we will do is default to having no, no residual chlorine going into waterways, we may not get as much bacteria kill as, as we hope to achieve but we will always default to having no chlorine residual being... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Because I...

Alley Pond I know has how many students, 75,000

students that sort of go through APAC on a yearly

basis so making sure we get that right for that

particular ecosystem is, is abundantly important and,

and, and we... you have your work... you'll, you'll be

sort of keeping us updated on... because... you know some

of that... the, the old parabola, the, the old lady who

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

1112

13

14

15

16

17

1819

20

21

22

23

24

25

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET swallowed the fly, you know at the end of, of... end of the story it doesn't go well for her...

VINCENT SAPIENZA: No, we, we understand and, and, and as we progress the designs on these we will be doing continual environmental review to, to just make sure that these plans work going forward.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Okay and that, that... you know I think we share a deep concern here that we want to make sure we get this right for the environment and for our... you know for the entire community in, in Eastern Queens. So, with that I'm going to come back, I have more questions, but I know that I have our Chair... or one... Vanessa one more before I, I go and I'm going to come back for a second round. Also representing Bowery Bay I know that there's a directive that's part of climate change and you know looking at extreme weather, you know I know that Bowery Bay is in, in a... in a flood zone, I represent a community that's got the power plants, the Bowery Bay Sewage Treatment Plant there's sort of infrastructure in Northwestern Queens that needs hardening, can you provide the committee an update with where the agency is in respect to design, construction and resiliency measures at select

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

1213

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET pumping stations and other facilities across the city?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, Bowery Bay is one of our 14 wastewater treatment plants, all 14 of those plants were put right at the waters edge and there was a reason that they were put there, we want sewage to flow downhill by gravity to get to those plants so they're all again right along the waters edge, all susceptible to, to flooding from, from, from storms and particularly sea level rise due to climate change so we have been undertaking resiliency measures at all the plants. We had to do work at several plants particularly along the South shore after Sandy to, to restore some of the equipment that was damaged but going forward we have over 300 million dollars in the plan to do things like hardening some of the infrastructure, raising electrical equipment, just making sure that things are more resilient... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: About 300 million you said?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Yeah, do we have the... 300,000 million is correct.

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

1	
П	
_	

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And that's

going to... and, and that's already in the budget,
already being worked upon and, and what's, what's the
sort of target completion date for all this work?

JOSEPH MURREN: Mr. Chair those are in the budget for fiscal year '18 and '19 so they're in the process of being, I believe contracts are prepared being put out to date so it should be over the next couple of years.

wastewater treatment plants I saw that you had talked about, you know us being the third largest municipal consumer of electricity are we looking at also renewable energy opportunities at these plants as we're looking to retrofit all city owned building by, what is it 2025 as part of the OneNYC plan what's our plan when it comes to these wastewater treatment plants to, to reduce our energy consumption?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Yeah, definitely. It takes a lot of power to, to pump and treat 1.3 billion gallons a day of wastewater and we've been looking at a number of initiatives and one most particularly is using the, the methane gas that's produced in the wastewater treatment process as a

1 WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2 fuel to power on site generation and we began a
3 project last year at our North River plant on the
4 upper West side of Manhattan to put in cogeneration
5 engines that'll use that renewable digester gas
6 that's produced every day as a fuel to make

electricity there.

2.2

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Alright, well I mean as, as... I was looking yesterday at the solar readiness report put out by DCAS pursuant to the local law that we passed, and I saw that nothing at Bowery Bay was solar ready, so I would love to see us figure out a way to sort of incorporate Bowery Bay into renewable energy opportunities in the city.

 $\label{eq:VINCENT SAPIENZA: We'll take a look at that.$

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Especially when we have all the emissions from the power plants in Western Queens, but 55 percent of the city's power is sitting not too far away from there it'd be great if, you know the city could lead the way on emissions reductions in Western Queens, we're giving the power plants... holding them more accountable. Alright, with that I'm going to pass it over to my Co-Chair Vanessa Gibson for questions.

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you Chair

and thank you Commissioner to you and your team for being here and I guess just a few of my guestions will obviously focus on just the capital work and the infrastructure of DEP and obviously the ongoing relationships that you maintain with other agencies as well as utility companies and localities outside of the city of New York. So, I first wanted to ask DDC plays a major role in a lot of your capital projects and right now DDC is managing 482 of your capital projects going through divisions like equipment, sewers, water mains, treatment, water pollution control and water supply and so I wanted to ask what actions does DEP take when you're working with DDC in terms of not only making sure that there is a productive working relationship but more importantly that projects are finished on time so can you just give us an understanding of how that works?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Sure, so Chair Gibson

DDC has, has the responsibility of doing a lot of

street work for us so water mains and sewers

primarily that are below ground and, and the reason

that DDC manages those projects because there's often

overlap with things that DOT needs to do or moving of

well.

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

utilities and they really, DDC has the expertise to

do that work. We've done a lot of what we call

upfront planning with them over the last couple of

years just to make sure that everyone is on the same

page with what needs to be done ahead of issuing

capital contracts to move forward and I, I, I think,

you know that's, that's bourn some fruit over the

last year or so and there's been probably less, you

know delays in some of the work that they've been

doing for us but on, on, on installation of new water

mains and, and sewers I think, you know the last

couple of years, '17 and '18 we've progressed fairly

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: And at what point does DEP decide to bring DDC on board like is it during the design phase or are there certain protocols that you have when you determine DDC should be involved, how does that work?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Yeah, I, I think we, we typically default to them on any large water main or sewer work again given if a street has to be ripped up to, to do that we know that DOT needs to be involved and you know with their gas lines in the

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

street, electric lines, cable it, it, it's something

that DEC... DDC just does very well.

2.2

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay. And do you think that its useful to incorporate DDC during the design phase on all of these projects or is that something that DEP would normally take up?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, DEP normally does the design, but part of the upfront planning process is we, we will work with DDC and just explain to them what needs to be done... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay... [cross-talk]

VINCENT SAPIENZA: ...how it will connect to other assets and I think that that's worked out really well over the last couple of years.

OUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, so in my opening I talked about the commitment rate and this subcommittee has obviously been looking at a number of agencies and the commitment rate and I think DEP has done a fairly remarkable job of not only exceeding the city average but looking at a lot of DEP projects and really making accurate projections, right, I think that's a challenge for a lot of agencies because there are a lot of unintended things

that happen that we don't always foresee so I wanted to specifically ask in 2017 DEP was able to commit 78 percent of its projects but the previous year there was a, a little bit of a dip to 68 percent so I just wanted to understand like with that type of fluctuation although its not a major one, I've seen far worse, is, is there anything that explains that and how do you maintain year to year some sort of an average of your commitment rate on some of your large projects?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, we, we do have a large capital plan essentially every year and it, it's really... it's planning in the years before we get to that particular fiscal year what projects do we need to do and what do we reasonably expect we can get contracts out the door in, in any particular year and you know I, I think we're very realistic about what we can deliver so, so that goes up front and then second is just holding the staff accountable to make sure that that happens. At DEP we have senior level bi-weekly procurement meetings that I sit in on and we just go through schedules for procuring all contracts whether they be construction contracts, professional services, other purchases and we just

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

Τ 0

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

lot of the vendors you work with I can imagine that your flexibility sometimes can be limited because

 $\label{eq:with_subcommittee} \mbox{WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET}$ $\mbox{make sure that we are on timelines to deliver those}$

things.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: So, within that

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Yeah, there, there can

structure what do you think are some of the

challenges that the agency may encounter in your

ability to fulfil that commitment rate?

be a, a variety of, of things Chair Gibson, it... there

10 are... there periodically are problems with, with

vendors when they, you know have to get, get there,

their... now it's called passport, it used to be called

VENDEX approved, there are often questions that get

raised with DOI or, or at MOX and then that can

periodically delay, you know the vendor approval for,

for months, there, there are, you know internal

problems with us just, just getting contracts, you

know approved through the legal process that, that

can delay things but again we try even before a

particular fiscal year to just make sure that, you

know we have the capability of, of getting as close

to 100 percent of our commitment as possible.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay and within a

1
1

there are a few number of companies that can actually do this major capital work are you looking at all at increasing the opportunities for additional vendors that may not necessarily have the long standing relationship with the department, with the city to try to achieve more of a balance, you know so obviously many agencies are, are looking at MWBE firms and other firms within the city that don't necessarily have the contracts with agencies but could potentially do the work, is that something that is on your radar in terms of ongoing conversation?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: It, it is and in, in some cases there are just big contracts that can't be unwound into smaller ones... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Right... [cross-talk]

VINCENT SAPIENZA: ...but we have been trying more and more to do that and I, I personally, you know being at DEP for a long time always liked having smaller contracts rather than one large disruptive contract at a wastewater treatment plant that, that effects, you know operations potentially just doing it in, in smaller pieces and we've tried to do that over the last couple of years so if you'll

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	look at our, our capital plan I don't think you'll
3	see any of those or many of those big, you know multi
4	hundred million dollar projects we've tried to, to
5	break them into smaller pieces. One of the other
6	things we've been looking at too when we when we
7	hire professional services to do things in the past
8	it had been a quality based selection, it's almost
9	exclusively so when we need work we'll have through
10	the RFP process have people submit proposals,
11	companies submit proposals we'll look at them and,
12	and just based upon the quality of the, the
13	particular firm what has been their experience in,
14	in, in similar projects, how do they intend to do
15	that work and, and that often leaves out smaller
16	firms who may not have that prior experience or
17	expertise but we're looking to do more now instead of
18	just purely quality based is a, a value based so we
19	also want to look at what the price proposals are,
20	you know some, some smaller firms they're, they're
21	hungry to do work and we may see lower cost so going
22	forward we want to do more of those, those value
23	based rather than just quality based selections

25

24

[cross-talk]

1 WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay... [cross-

3 talk]

2.2

VINCENT SAPIENZA: ...for professional services.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, so this year's current commitment plan is about 2.6 billion dollars so do you expect to achieve even more of a commitment rate than last year, are you guys aiming higher? How much do you expect to commit?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Well we... yeah, we...

again we, we meet bi-weekly, we just met last... wait a

minute was it last Monday... on Monday, we, we think

we're going to be over 80 percent, we're still

pushing to be over 80 percent... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Alright... [cross-talk]

VINCENT SAPIENZA: ...so...

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay. I like when we aim high, that's great, okay. So, throughout a lot of the hearings and you know as I mentioned I was in Albany with colleagues yesterday including the Speaker so we've been talking a lot about design build and I wanted to find out number one your thoughts on design build, is it beneficial to you,

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	have you used it on any other projects and do you
3	think that design build could be applicable to some
4	of your ongoing work?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: We do. There, there are certain types of work that we, we, we don't think design build is a good fit, they're just complex designs or, or things that, you know we still need to, to... you know put... develop scope on as, as the designs move along but there are some straightforward projects we think like tunneling work, you know tunnels are built all over the country, all over the world, there are firms with, with the expertise to do that and so we think that type of work is, is certainly amenable to design build and, and then there are other projects as well so we, we support it and we hope we get legislation to, to get approval to do it.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: And what about the Kensico would that project... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL DELOACH: Can I just add to that really quickly... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay... [cross-

24 talk]

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY 1 WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET 2 MICHAEL DELOACH: ...so likely... [cross-3 talk 4 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Sure... [cross-5 talk] MICHAEL DELOACH: ...because of your help 6 7 and advocation up in Albany for the first time ever our two projects are two of I think ten or 12 that 8 both the senate and the assembly have included in 9 their One house bill as of last night so that's a 10 huge accomplishment and something that we haven't 11 seen before... [cross-talk] 12 13 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Which projects? 14 MICHAEL DELOACH: For us it's the Kensico 15 Eastview tunnel connection and some work that we're 16 doing at Hillview so two priority projects of the 17 Mayor that again are both included now in, in the 18 legislative One house bill so we're... [cross-talk] COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Great... [cross-19 20 talk]] MICHAEL DELOACH: ...very pleased. 21 2.2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: And the assembly 23 is voting on their One house today, wonderful. Okay, that's great, great start. I wanted to ask about the 24

agencies and you know many times we've noticed that

25

2.2

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
in terms of the budget lines there really isn't an
itemized list of some of the projects so for example
DEP has one budget line that includes the purchase of
equipment for use by the DEP and mandated payments
for a private gas utility relocation but it doesn't
give any specifics so its like one sentence and a
large amount and then it doesn't give details, so I
wanted to ask the department if that's something that
you would be willing to consider in terms of giving
us a little bit more details so we can understand
some of the more individualized projects that fall
under these budget items?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: And, and Joe I'll turn it over to you because we talked a little bit about this.

think there's a lot of merit to what you're proposing, I think the problem that we run into... some then particularly the example that you used of the utility line that is one of the ones that would probably be very difficult to break up because that's our agreement that we have with primarily with Con Ed and National Grid. When they're doing street work and we're doing street work as well we have a reciprocal

1
_

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

1718

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET agreement that we... you know when they're doing work at our behest that we, we reimburse them and when they're doing... when we're doing work at their behest they reimburse us so we go through and we true those up and you know it's a very, you know large process that we go through every year and it's, you know tens of millions of dollars but there are I think a lot of other projects that we probably could start looking at and look at in terms of seeing how can we break them down further and in particular I think one of the things that we'd want to do is in probably working with, you know you, your... the council and the staff is seeing how we perhaps could look at what's in the existing system of using the budget lines and the budget codes to be able to, you know create more transparency in terms of what some of those projects are particularly for us it becomes, you know again I'll... you know I'll say where we have a lot of funds that we will allocate, you know as lump sums because we don't know yet, like for emergency work when we have to do emergency sewer or emergency water main construction those we know happen for a certain amount every year like 100 million dollars but we don't know where they're going to be happening until

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

1213

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
they do... you know a break does occur so, those are
other ones that may not lend themselves that but
there is a lot of other ones that we can be working
with the council I think in terms of creating more
transparency into how we can, you know make it more
visible to, to, you know the council and other
oversights in the public in terms of where our money
is going to.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, no I appreciate that, I think it's important for my colleagues and I because the average resident, the average New Yorker sees the work going on, the disruption, the impact on their everyday life and they don't know whether it's utility, DEP, you know they just don't know so it's helpful for us especially during the budget process to further understand so if it's not that particular budget item, if there are other suggestions the agency has certainly we're amenable to further discussing that. I think the broader goal of, of all of the work is just to make sure that there is a system of an open process where we can understand with the millions of dollars we're talking about especially for projects that are more long term that you can project as

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET compared to emergencies and things that happen where you have to go underground, I mean we understand that so where we can find areas of agreement on improvement I think that we should be willing to do that.

JOSEPH MURREN: Definitely.

two final questions before I turn it back over to the Chair. The change order process, so I have a little bit of experience working for a general contractor and we worked on million dollar contracts and there were times when we had a change order and at times that could, you know significantly impact the entire process itself so I wanted to understand your change order process and where you find challenges within that and how we can find areas of improvement?

NINCENT SAPIENZA: So, change orders have historically been a challenge for, for New York City in general so just what is a change order. When we issue a construction contract there are certain specifications, certain requirements in a contract the contractor's expected to do but periodically when a contractor is on site actually doing the work there is some field condition that may be slightly

1
_

2

3

4

5

6

7

8 9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET different that is not required in the contract and so the contractor will say if you would like me to do this there will be a change order. So, just one specific example, I was at our 26th Ward Wastewater Treatment Plant last month and we have a contractor installing a new primary tank, he has to do excavation in, in, in a large patch came across an old 48 inch sewage pipe that may have been there for a 100 years, wasn't expected to be there so it wasn't in his contract to remove and he said to us if you'd like me to remove this pipe I will need money and a change order. The, the change order process in itself can take months to get approved and that often slows up projects because a contractor can say I'm not going to remove that pipe until I'm assured that you're going to pay me and it, it ... and again it can take weeks if not months to get change orders approved and that's been a significant challenge. It, it has to go through several levels of, of approvals, it, it's just the onsite engineer can't say yes that, that pipe is there please remove it for 10,000 dollars it's, it's got to go all the way, in many cases to even get a Comptroller registration.

ı	
	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: And the change
3	order process is approved by M OMB?
4	VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, if we have a
5	change if we identify, I need to remove this, this
6	buried pipe that was there, we didn't know it was
7	there and the contractor says its going to cost X and
8	we say well it's going to cost Y, we negotiate a
9	price… [cross-talk]
LO	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Uh-huh [cross-
L1	talk]
L2	VINCENT SAPIENZA:it's got to go
L3	through several levels of approvals and I know Joe
L 4	you can talk about… [cross-talk]
L 5	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay [cross-

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay... [cross-talk]

VINCENT SAPIENZA: ...those, yeah.

JOSEPH MURREN: There will be some and you know again Council Member and you're probably familiar somewhat it depends on what the scope of the contract was and you know in most of the construction contracts there is some degree of contingency built in so you will be able to go and get those component pieces that are under the contingency amount through the process somewhat quicker but if you've had more

1
_

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

1112

13

14

15

16

17

1819

20

21

22

23

24

25

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET than one or numerous change orders that may occur on a construction contract which is often can happen you would then at that point have to be able to go back to OMB and you know the Comptrollers Office to get the registration, you know process from there. So, it depends on the magnitude and the, the, the... of both the change order as well as the project itself, you know on smaller ones it's... you know could be a small amount that could trigger the change order, on the larger ones in over many years you may not have it triggered early on but it could happen over the course of time and then as you're getting towards the end that's when they start compounding and that becomes I think when some of the pressure happens because you don't ... you know you're, you're getting it towards the final stages of it. One of the things that we're looking at to improve this is one area that... where you could have scope changes that were not anticipated either planned or on planned we're trying to be much more diligent in the engineering process of looking at those projects as they go forward and also while its developing and say when do those occur and when does it require a change order in that we could as much as possible try to

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	anticipate it before the contract is even bid and
3	then during the course of the contract it may say
4	this is work that is outside the scope and we may
5	have to do a whole new contract from there and
6	making that decision we think may also improve the
7	process as well because it'll tighten up our control
8	over, you know what's happening on that contract
9	[cross-talk]
10	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Right. So, do you
11	typically have funding that is projected for these
12	change orders as best… [cross-talk]
13	JOSEPH MURREN: No, we, we if we
14	have it in that specific contract, you know we will
15	it's, it's on the CP level but it's not… [cross-talk]
16	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay [cross-
17	talk]
18	JOSEPH MURREN:at the budget level so
19	we will go through during the course of the, the year
20	and that's one… [cross-talk]
21	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Got it [cross-
22	talk]
23	JOSEPH MURREN:of the areas where as
24	you look at the commitment rate and you see, you know

that we commit 80 percent those... that other 20

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

percent not commitment is where we would draw funds

from, you know during the course of the year to say

oh, we need to fund this change order so that's where

we'll use where there is some flexibility within the,

the budget to be able to use available resources to

cover some of those change order costs.

question as, as it relates to all of the upstate work that the department does maintaining relationships with local governments, I was a former assembly member so many of those county legislators I know, they all came from the assembly, how do you work with the local governments with landowners and property owners where you're going under their property, what, what does that relationship look like and in terms of the workforce do you have a unit at DEP that's focused on working with like upstate county legislators, how does that work?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: We, we do and that's been a historical challenge because when New York City built some of its reservoirs, you know more than 100 years ago we, we bought out a lot of property owners, we picked up some towns and moved them elsewhere and there's still a lot of hard feelings in

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	some of these communities but I think we've worked
3	hard specifically through the filtration avoidance
4	process is to make sure that the needs of those
5	communities and, and, and the, the, the water supply
6	for New York City is met and our you know folks
7	that, that work upstate and live upstate I think have
8	done a great job over the last, you know 15, 20 years
9	in reestablishing some of those relationships and
LO	working closely with those municipalities you, you
L1	know you mentioned some of the work that, that we're
L2	doing for Kensico Eastview connection it's [cross-
L3	talk]
L 4	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Right [cross-
L5	talk]
L 6	VINCENT SAPIENZA:possible design build
L7	that we want to do and also the, the Delaware
L8	Aqueduct repair… [cross-talk]
L9	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Right [cross-
20	talk]
21	VINCENT SAPIENZA:where we are again

we've needed easements from, from several property owners to, to do work under their properties and you know I think explaining to them what the work is we,

23

24

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

we, we've come a long way from where we were I'm

going to say 20 years ago.

2.2

okay. Well thank you Commissioner, I really appreciate it and like I mentioned I think the department is doing a great job and in my capacity Chairing this subcommittee certainly want to work with you on best practices, on improvements in budget items and, and certainly the ongoing relationships, the interagency partnerships that you have with DDC as well as utility companies, certainly want to thank you for your work and keep that commitment rate up, thank you very much.

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Chair.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you Chair Gibson, before I pass it to Council Member Grodenchik I do want to ask one question that my, my colleague sent me via text. Relating to the, the announcement of the feasibility study in January... of July of 2017 relating to the groundwater drainage project in Southeast Queens, I know that the groundwater there has been rising consistently causing basement flooding, I know that Donovan

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

1112

13

14

15

16

17

1819

20

21

22

23

24

25

Richards I know will talk a little bit further probably about that but wanted to get a sense of, it says that it'll be completed this... the radial collection study will be completed by spring of 2018, spring is about to start in seven days though it doesn't feel like it outside what part of the spring do you anticipate it being done?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, so I'll give a bit of a preview so it, it just... as, as background water was provided in, in many parts of Queens from the Jamaica water supply through the 1990's so groundwater was, was drawn and, and, and distributed but, but over the last, you know I guess ten years or so we've, we've stopped using all ground water from Southeast Queens from Queens in general and provided water to those residents from, from upstate water supplies from, from the reservoir surface waters and so what has happened is the ground water has started to, to creep up over time and some homeowners are actually seeing ground water getting into their, their basements, you know we, we, we've seen some businesses complaining that they have to periodically pump and homeowners so we've looked at a bunch of alternatives. One is to continue to pump ground water

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

∩ 1

24

25

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET and not provide it as drinking water but just to waste and our neighbors in Nassau County have a concern with that because they use the ground water supply as their primary source of drinking water and they would like to keep as much of it in the aquifers as possible, DEC has some concerns about pumping so we started looking at and we call this, this, this radial groundwater study as not, not actually using pumps but just using gravity to peel off a certain amount of ground water and bring it to places like Alley Pond so we've done some modeling, some, some assessment and it looks like we... there, there, there may be some areas where we can reduce levels of, of ground water in certain specific areas and again we're putting the report together now, I've seen some drafts and, and we'll, we'll have that done within a couple of months.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Do we... do we think we'll be able to get that done for FY '19 or at least there will be some of that happening in this fiscal year and what would that cost?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, so the, the, the report and I don't remember off hand, the, the report did have some costs in it for various levels of

2.2

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

these, these essentially radial arms, I... off the top

of my head I don't remember but we'll, we'll have

that report done like I said... I, I, I saw an

intermediate draft I guess I'll call... in the last

couple of weeks.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And I think there's an opportunity for us to rehabilitate some of that water for drinking use during the, the, the possible shut down of, of the roundabout west tunnels?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Yeah so the, the, themone of the things that we had looked at is during the, the period of time in late 2022, early 2023 when we have to shut down the, the Rondout West branch leg of the Delaware Aqueduct to, to make the, the connection from the parallel tunnel we said will this city have enough water supply just coming from the, the Catskill Aqueduct and from Croton would we need other sources of water like the old Queens groundwater wells, the wells are still there we, we think that without putting those wells back into service we will... we will have enough water supply from those other sources while the tunnel is shut down.

1 WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

2.2

2 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: We will be 3 able to, to mitigate the flooding in Southeast Queens

4 that's coming from this groundwater based on this
5 radial collection?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: To, to, to a small degree, yes, it, it won't... not everyone is going to be happy but there are areas where groundwater by gravity can be reduced and, and carried away.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I, I look forward to hearing more because there's going to be money well spent for those homeowners and, and the, the, the residents in Southeast Queens with that I'll turn it over to Council Member not Garodnick but Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you Mr.

Chair, Madame Chair, good... it's still morning, good

morning Commissioner. Chair Gibson I just want to let

you know that the ACOMMITTEE CLERK SWANSTONO at DEP

is a former colleague of mine, Elisa Velazquez who I

had the pleasure of working with when she was the

General Counsel to borough president Melinda Katz,

she's outstanding, she's a former General Counsel at

MOXs and she's also my constituent so... and a good

friend so we're in good hands there and she doesn't

1
_

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

1213

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET take... she is tough as nails, she doesn't take guff from anybody except from the Commissioner of course. Commissioner a couple of quick things, we are... I was going to talk about chlorination and I might still, we... you're dismantling on Springfield Boulevard just South side of the Grand Central Parkway that... on a large storage tank that's been there since... as long as I can remember which is 58 years, do you have any other plans to do that, I know that my district Councilman Richards and others, Councilman Miller, Councilwoman Adams, Councilman Ulrich we cover the former Jamaica water supply so one, do you have plans to get rid of other facilities like that and two, and maybe more importantly if you get rid of those storage tanks and other amenities that come with the water system will you be disposing of any of that land back to other agencies or the public so that's my first question?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, these are... for the old Jamaica water supply that drew ground water that... the, the water was primarily pumped into those storage towers, we've taken some down, the one in Springfield we're taking down. I'm going to look...

Tasos Georgelis who's our Deputy Commissioner for

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
water and sewer operations if he's got some
additional information.

2.2

TASOS GEORGELIS: Morning.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Good morning.

TASOS GEORGELIS: So, we do have plans for two or three I think that we're looking at now and we're obviously going to evaluate the rest of them to see if they're unsafe and if we should be taking them down.

are very large ones in Holliswood I don't have a problem with you taking them down I haven't gotten a single complaint, a couple of people have called and asked what's going on and I've seen the removal of the paint which is being done in an environmentally sensitive way I just want to make sure that we're informed so... because you know we always... the constituents always know before the elected officials because they live right there so I would appreciate any of that and I'm sure my colleague Mr. Richards will have other questions about, about ground water in Southeast Queens. I would ask you this question though, if you're planning on peeling off some of that water to Alley Pond which does have any number

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	of vernal ponds and waterways in it that mostly sits
3	on top of the Terminal Marine and would you have to
4	pump the water up?

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

TASOS GEORGELIS: I don't know if I

mentioned Alley Pond, it's a... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: You did say

Alley Pond maybe you meant Baisley Pond.

TASOS GEORGELIS: I meant Baisley.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Okay. And lastly on the chlorine, I am very concerned certainly I, I've been following this issue since I first got into government because I was working for Assemblywoman Mayersohn in the late 80's when we started to talk about this and I attended some of the very first meetings with DEP regarding the outflow into the, the CSO which is currently next to College Point Boulevard and we have... they were going to be baseball fields now its soccer fields that's how long it took. My question with the chlorination, I am concerned that we get it all or at least as much as all as is feasible and I, I would rather delay that to see that whatever technology you need to find to be able to do that we worked very, very hard as you know to restore Little, Little Neck Bay, the Alley

1

2

3

4

5

6

/

8

9

11

12

1314

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

_ -

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
its thriving now, it's a big fishery, it's, it's... a
lot of people crab there, I don't want them to be
eating the chlorine as well. I know that it's a
balance that you have to take but is it... what is...
what is currently the level of chlorine that you'll
be able to take out of the bleach as you call it?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, yeah, it's, it's... the, the chlorine that we'll be adding will be sufficient to kill many of the pathogens that would otherwise be in those CSO releases but the, the process to add sodium bisulfite which is a dechlorinator we think can get the chlorine residual down very low. At, at the testing at some of our wastewater treatment plants we're able to get the residual chlorine down to tenths of part per, per million, you know we often say... you know our drinking water often contains, you know more than is acceptable to go into, to waterways because the marine biota are more sensitive but, but again when, when we eventually build these systems if that's the, the, the path forward we would always default to having less of a bacteria kill to avoid having any residual chlorine leak into those waterways.

l I				
_	₩ T T T	I SIIBCOMMITTEE	ON CAPTUAL	BIIDCET

2.2

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Is it a solid

3 that you use or is it a liquid or is it a gas?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: It's, it's a liquid bleach, it's, it's just Clorox in a... in a slightly stronger form.

thank you Commissioner and its, it's been a pleasure to work with you and I want to thank your staff for being fairly responsive, we are still waiting for the study on the 188th Street so if you could get to that I... before this spring runs out, it's been a little while now so I appreciate that so thank you Madame Chair and Mr. Chairman.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you

Council Member Grodenchik... Grodenchik I, I, I love

you brother, I... I see Keith Powers and it... and it, it

messed me up I'm, I'm so sorry Council Member

Grodenchik. With that said we've been joined by

Council Member Powers of Manhattan and with that

I'll, I'll turn it over for Donovan Richards for

questions and I'll find a hole to crawl into.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you

Council Member Constacon... how do you say your last

name, I'm messing with you Constantinides it took me

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	like a year to get that right. Thank you and I want
3	to thank the Chairs for this hearing. I wanted to ask
4	some quick questions so let's go into catch basins so
5	obviously we passed Local Law 48 in which you were
6	supposed to clean out all 148,000 street catch
7	basins; did we achieve that goal?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: We did, so last year Council Member... [cross-talk]

2.2

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Fell a little short last year, right?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Fiscal '18 we, we, we got to about 99 percent, I mean there were... there were some catch basins that we just physically couldn't get to for a variety of reasons sometimes cars were parked over them but we got very close to the, the 100 percent and I, I just want to say, you know we, we said in the testimony its really been a terrific program, I mean its been more work for us but we've been able to remove material more quickly before the basins get filled, we've been able to, you know address repairs when they are small before they get large...

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: How many defective basins did you find?

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	VINCENT SAPIENZA: Do we have that
3	number do we have that Tasos or defective basins
4	do you want to come up?
5	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Come on up
6	come on down. I think you have to state your name for
7	the record.
8	TASOS GEORGELIS: So, when we when we
9	say… [cross-talk]
10	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: You have to
11	state your name for the record I think to… [cross-
12	talk]
13	TASOS GEORGELIS: Tasos Georgelis. So,
14	when, when we say defective we have two categories,
15	one are the ones that are non-functioning and then
16	the ones that need a repair, but it still functions.
17	So, in, in the last report I think it was somewhere
18	about between two and three thousand were non-
19	functioning [cross-talk]
20	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh [cross-
21	talk]
22	TASOS GEORGELIS:but for repairs its
23	going to be a, a few thousand more so I think it's
24	around three percent… [cross-talk]

1 WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And we've made

3 repairs to all of those... [cross-talk]

TASOS GEORGELIS: ...needed, needed

5 repairs.

4

8

9

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

24

25

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: You made

7 | repairs to all of those?

TASOS GEORGELIS: So, we work on the ones that are non-functioning first... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-

11 talk]

TASOS GEORGELIS: ...the priority one's

underneath safety, the ones with smaller repairs just

because the number and volume of work that we're

seeing I think is taking us a little longer to get to

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh, alright, good and we would love to see numbers it just gives us a little bit more...

but we're working on it as fast as we can.

VINCENT SAPIENZA: And, and what I'd like to add Council Member as well is we've started to now see complaints for catch basin issues come down...

23 [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yeah, yeah that's what the purpose of the Local Law was for,

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET thank you Samara. I wanted to go into ... so just speak a little bit about coordination amongst the agencies so obviously we're seeing a lot of work done and I want to thank you Commissioner, I know its been a long time to get here... taking a long time to get here, can you speak to the coordination amongst the agencies, DDC and then one of the holdups that historically has really kept projects from moving forward was DOT, right, because they needed to have money in their budget so can you speak to what that coordination looks like? I know I recently met with DDC to acknowledge I think they have a whole unit now dedicated to Southeast Queens, are you part of those conversations or and can you speak to just coordination on the... [cross-talk]

We, we essentially now have daily conversations with, with DDC but you're right a lot of it just initially up front coordinating work that, that needs to be done, we wanted to make sure that where we were intending to put sewers in DOT didn't just put in a new street or repave and, and we would rip that up so we've done a lot better up front planning with, with DDC just to make sure that, that everything has been

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
coordinated and you know as, as you've noted work
over the last year or two has really started to ramp
up and, and move forward.

questions. I'll, I'll go into air quality... well let, let me go to ground water quick, so when do you anticipate the study, I know you went into a little bit on the ground water what has the study found so far, I mean could you go into some specifics... and in what areas are... do you think we will look at to address these areas, I, I know you can't get into the whole thing but can you identify specifically...

[cross-talk]

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Yeah, so, so just quickly... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...any areas... [cross-talk]

VINCENT SAPIENZA: ...the, the, the intent of this study to... was to look at are there areas of Southeast Queens where ground water levels are above even though you say its still be... it's below the ground but are higher... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-

25 | talk]

2.2

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY 1 WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET VINCENT SAPIENZA: ...than some local 2 waterways like Baisley Pond... [cross-talk] 3 4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [crosstalk] 5 VINCENT SAPIENZA: ...so if, if that's the 6 7 case there may be the ability to put in just a pipe that by gravity would collect that ground water below 8 a homeowner's basement or, or equivalent to a 9 homeowner's basement level and just by gravity have 10 that water drain into again Baisley Pond or another 11 12 natural... [cross-talk] 13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: There would... 14 [cross-talk] 15 VINCENT SAPIENZA: ...water source... [cross-16 talk] 17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ... no cost to the 18 homeowner? VINCENT SAPIENZA: And there would be no 19 cost to the homeowner... [cross-talk]] 20 21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-22 talkl 23 VINCENT SAPIENZA: ...again we're looking at... in, in the report, you know we, we, we're looking 24

at a bunch of different areas, in some areas it looks

	CONTINUE ON ENVIRONMENTED TROPEGIES COUNTED
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	like this radial system will work and others we're
3	we were hopeful it, it, it wouldn't and we're now
4	starting to develop, you know what, what the cost may
5	look like but again we should have the I, I saw a
6	draft of the report about, don't know two weeks ago
7	and it should be out soon.
8	MICHAEL DELOACH: Yeah, I think the plan
9	is to meet with local stakeholders, elected
10	officials, community board folks, people that we've
11	been talking about this over the past few years and
12	[cross-talk]
13	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay [cross-
14	talk]
15	MICHAEL DELOACH:present the results
16	and then have it public.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, awesome.
18	Last question just on air quality complaints so I
19	think there's been an increase we've seen over the
20	last four months, can you speak to why we're closing
21	our air, air quality complaints less frequently than
22	we used to, what are the challenges?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Yeah and I'll ask

Deputy Commissioner Licata to, to come up and... she

manages our air noise and asbestos unit.

23

24

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY 1 WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET 2 ANGELA LICATA: Good morning, good afternoon, I'm not sure what time it is right now. 3 So, with respect to noise complaints we have seen a 4 slight uptake. 5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Oh, I didn't 6 7 ask about noise but that's good to hear... [cross-talk] ANGELA LICATA: Yeah, I understand... 8 [cross-talk] 9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...too, how are... 10 [cross-talk] 11 ANGELA LICATA: ...I under... [cross-talk] 12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...we addressing 13 14 both of them now? 15 ANGELA LICATA: I haven't seen the uptake 16 in the air complaints as, as significantly as we've 17 seen an uptake in noise complaints but the... what we 18 do with inspectors... [cross-talk] COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-19 20 talk] ANGELA LICATA: ...for the air and the 21 22 noise unit is we have been increasing our use of

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-

technology... [cross-talk]

25 talk]

1

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

2

ANGELA LICATA: ...and just you know

speaking of the uptick it's a little difficult to see

3

that as a trend necessarily although we have seen in

4

the past several years a clear increase in complaints

5

associated with after hour construction so there is

7

no doubt that we believe that there is a construction

8

boom and that's relating to the increase in the

9

number of complaints.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh and, and

ANGELA LICATA: We have now... and, and so

11

we're... and we're still at that number roughly around

12

40 or 50 inspectors for the city, are there any...

13

[cross-talk]

14

15 the Commissioner is showing me that in fact the four-

16

month year over year for air quality complaints has

17

actually come down that's why I got... I got a little

significant trend in terms of the increase or the

18

confused but I wouldn't look at that as too much of a

19

decreases I would say that we have a lot of

20

complaints with respect to air, engine noise,

22

quality, I think the improvement that we made with

23

respect to the Local Law 53 I think it is increasing

24

our authority under the noise code to enforce against

25

noise... [cross-talk]

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh [cross-
3	talk]
4	ANGELA LICATA:will be extremely
5	helpful so that piece of legislation I'm really
6	excited about, the possibilities associated with
7	implementing that I think that's both sensible
8	legislation that allows for our inspectors to have
9	certainty because they'll have an absolute noise
LO	level standard at the street level but also will
L1	allow the regulated community to have a better
L2	understanding of what they really need to do to
L3	mitigate their noise to have acceptable noise levels
L 4	on the ground… [cross-talk]
L5	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And your
L 6	average days to close out has increased?
L7	ANGELA LICATA: Yes.
L 8	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So [cross-
L 9	talk]
20	ANGELA LICATA: There was an uptick in
21	the average days to close out however not really
22	looking at that is a large alarm, we did go back and

look at those numbers and we actually found that there was an open ticket, this is our jargon but there was an open ticket in Manhattan which was

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
really a paperwork issue so we were able to close
that down. Once you closed out that particular job
the average day... [cross-talk]

2.2

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Just one ticket caused this?

ANGELA LICATA: Yes, yeah, yeah it was open for a year. So, once we took that out we actually normalized the data and there's not too much of an uptick at this point but what I was saying earlier is that we were... we're looking now at the possibilities of technology... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

ANGELA LICATA: ...and so one improvement that we've made is to give our inspectors in the field these 62 inspectors plus supervisors have access to handheld tablets, so they'll have more immediate information at their fingertips. The other thing we're experimenting with now is a heat map so as we get those 3-1-1 complaints we're able to look at those if they look like they're geographically clustered we can send somebody out right away to say okay what's going on and that becomes a more real time response.

1

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

2

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, well

3

4 truly for the work that we're doing in our community

5

and you know we can see the results, we have ... still

thank you and I want to thank the Commissioner really

6

have a long way to go but we cannot... I can't sit here

7

and say there's been no progress, so we look forward

8

to our continued partnership with you over the next

9

four years or so to, to get this done.

for your support and pressure.

10

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Alright and thank you

11

12

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you.

13

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you

14

Council Member Richards. I just want to quickly piggy

15

back on something that both Chair Gibson and, and

16

catch basins, when there's work done by DDC on behalf

Council Member Richards talked about which was the

1718

of DEP like replacing water mains do we go back and

19

inspect the catch basins post work to make sure that

20

they're up to par because right now there's a huge

21

project going on in Astoria where we're replacing

22

water main and the, the catch basins along those

23

streets are in horrid, horrid condition and I hope

24

that we're not going to wait a year to then go back

25

out and inspect them after this works been done?

1

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

VINCENT SAPIENZA: That's, that's a great point Mr. Chair and that's been a challenge for us when there's any kind of street work whether its installing you know subsurface infrastructures or even you know mill... re-milling and paving of, of roadways is... I think we have to do a better job of going and inspecting our, you know catch basin infrastructure once the work is done.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Alright, so I quess I'll, I'll be sending you some information relating to those particular ... I wanted to make sure what our coordination is with DDC to make sure when that work is done that we go out and inspect like how does... they, they're supposed to bring things back to code when they finish the work, how do we... how do we spot check to make sure that they're... you know that the catch basins are part of that?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Yeah, so, so under the contract... the contracts require the, the... that the person doing the work is to actually protect those catch basins and they're supposed to put silt, silt fabrics or other devices over the catch basins to prevent material from, from getting in but you know during busy construction things can happen and it,

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET it, its... you know DEP should ultimately be looking at those basins after work is done.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Alright, great, thank you, I'm going to continue to, to follow up with you about that because its right now the, the entirety of the streets in bad shape but the catch basins do not look in good condition and even after the work is done if they do not look in good condition. With that I'll turn it over to my colleague Council Member Helen Rosenthal from Manhattan.

much Chairs, welcome Commissioner, I actually going to be asking questions with my member of the Subcommittee on Capital Budget hat on. Although I want to start by asking where can members of the public get the water bottles that you guys are displaying and is it BPA free?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Yeah, so we periodically, periodically have events where we hand them out and I don't know where's the, the best place to marry up the… [cross-talk]

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I'm just
3	saying maybe when you're testifying in front of the
4	[cross-talk]
5	VINCENT SAPIENZA: Yeah, well, we'll,
6	we'll [cross-talk]
7	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay [cross-
8	talk]
9	VINCENT SAPIENZA:you know we'll bring
10	you some… [cross-talk]
11	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, I noted
12	I, I really want to compliment you on page nine in
13	your testimony, you were talking about your cost
14	savings initiative and I mean the one about glycerol
15	is just great, a 50 percent reduction that's
16	astounding and then the operational systems that,
17	that seems meaningful but, but let's transfer that
18	thinking to the capital to capital contracting, have
19	you identified ways to capture savings on the capital
20	side through procurement changes?
21	VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, when we're
22	developing a, a capital contract we, we generally
23	will work with, you know design professionals to
24	determine what, what equipment is the most efficient

meaning that has, you know lowest energy use or, or

T	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	emissions and, and we look at life cycle costs as
3	well so we're looking at, you know a piece of
4	equipment maybe slightly more expensive but it uses
5	much less energy so while, while doing that work,
6	while identifying the equipment that's going to be
7	installed under the capital contracts we're, we're
8	generally always looking at those types of things
9	[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So... right,
what I'm talking about... that's great... [cross-talk]

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...I appreciate you. What I'm talking about is literally in the process of procurement where you can find savings so for example, passport and I am the former Chair of the Committee on Contracts was supposed to result in savings, reductions in costs because the capital contracting process or any contracting process would be faster and easier and I heard... what I heard you say about where the... where things get stopped not changing or not being fixed with passport another words it still gets stuck in DOI or law department or MOX.

2.2

1 WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

2 VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, I think some of

3 the changes that have been made in procurement have

4 helped and, and passport I think in... overall has

5 | helped the process it's just that when information

6 and passport raises a red flag, you know a company

7 has whatever some prior history of something... [cross-

8 talk]

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I'm very proud of those red flags, I think they named them red flags because I kept calling them red flag not that I'm the only person who does that but its critical for your agency in my mind's eye because my guess is they're aren't that many bidders.

VINCENT SAPIENZA: And, and, and that's a great point so some of the larger work we're doing if we're... for the 20 million dollar, 50 million dollar, 100 million dollar project we see few bidders and particularly with the economy good and a lot of companies busy with other projects we, we, we often in some cases we get... we've had a couple where we've had two bidders... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: What's the most number of bids you've ever... what type of project gets the most number of bids?

1						
_	1	WTTH	SUBCOMMITTEE	ON	CAPTTAL	BUDGET

2.2

VINCENT SAPIENZA: The, the, the smaller stuff we do so if its... some, some of the, the water and sewer work if we're doing a small above ground structure we'll get a lot of bids, some of the maintenance work we do at our wastewater treatment plants where we're replacing simple equipment, pumps or piping we... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: How many is a lot?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: We, we, we... on some we get eight to ten bids in some cases. In some more complex work we do, we only get two bids and like I said and, and a lot of bigger companies are very busy with other work throughout the city, throughout the world and... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Do you compete with the MTA for tunneling for example?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: We all do this, there's a very small number of companies that do that specific type of work and when we, we, we looked at the, the Delaware Aqueduct bypass tunnel that we bid this is two years ago now, its contract BT2, a 707 million dollar project there are very few companies that can do 707 million dollar tunnel jobs and that's

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	what we, we face periodically but again we've been
3	trying over time Council Member is to, to break down
4	contracts into, into smaller bites and, and the other
5	thing too I think as, as everybody knows of the, the
6	bids have been coming in higher in the last couple of
7	years and we've seen some stability I guess in, in
8	fiscal '18 but fiscal '16 [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I mean... [cross-talk]

2.2

VINCENT SAPIENZA: ...and '17 is... [crosstalk]

that part of the reason they're coming in higher is because there's something about the procurement system that actually keeps multiple firms from getting engaged. I've heard from companies as it has to do with the MTA who do subway work for Philadelphia, Boston, New Jersey but won't bid on MTA contracts because of the procurement rules that have, you know come up over time that are basically biased toward some firms so that... and certainly this was the situation and Mr. DeLoach is very familiar with this because he was incredibly helpful but with the DOE contract that was 600 million where there was 600

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	million of fluff it was there because of how the
3	procurement was written, once we wrote it differently
4	so that there was not a single provider, you know
5	because there was really only one provider who could
6	do what the city was asking for. In truth the city
7	didn't need that provider at all and once that was
8	cleaned up the contract went from 1.2 billion down to
9	450 something million dollars so what I'm that's
10	what I trying to get at.

VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, so a couple of things, one is you know when we, we put together our contract specs we try to make sure that, that the, the process is competitive where there will be multiple firms, we don't just, you know look at one particular firm on that it... but, but just to... in, in general, you know some of the, the city's rules for insurance and bonding that make it tough for, for, for companies... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well... [cross-talk]

VINCENT SAPIENZA: ...it... the payment processes it often takes a long time to issue payments to companies and... that boxes out some...

25 [cross-talk]

2.2

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, passport... (cross-talk)

2.2

VINCENT SAPIENZA: ...of the smaller firms...
[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...if you get them in the finance portal is going to end that so are your contracts in the finance portal yet or are they only in for RFP, RFP?

JOSEPH MURREN: I would have... I believe they are... you know we're in just this... I don't think we're in the pass... the payment portal but I'll have to... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, I would urge you to get in there because it's a tired excuse for contractors to say that they have to bid higher because we don't pay that's no longer true and so to the extent that your ACOMMITTEE CLERK SWANSTONOS can become facile on this you will save the city money or we need you to be pushing harder when you're putting out bids to make sure that you're wiping out the fluff that's in there for late payments.

JOSEPH MURREN: Yeah and... [cross-talk]

VINCENT SAPIENZA: And, and I didn't mean to say that, that they were bidding higher

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	because of, of the time it takes to get paid but it,
3	it does box out some smaller firms who can't front
4	that money to pay those… [cross-talk]
5	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, what I'm
6	saying is that shouldn't be happening anymore that to
7	the extent that you can get them the contract they
8	should be invoicing and getting paid within three
9	months and the city is also willing, they've done
LO	this with the human service contracts to, you know
L1	prepay for contracts we know we're going to sign and
L2	that's simply a matter of timing.
L3	VINCENT SAPIENZA: Did you want to add
L4	anything
L5	JOSEPH MURREN: And I I'll and thank
L6	you for that Council Member, yes and I think that
L7	model is something we have not used on the
L8	construction side, I think its an interesting concep
L 9	that we'd probably like to explore, and I think
20	[cross-talk]
21	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I mean if
22	that's what… [cross-talk]
2	JOSEPH MURREN: it would do a lot for

24

us… [cross-talk]

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSESNTHAL:would bring
3	in smaller companies and start to drive down costs
4	that would strike me as something that could be a top
5	priority for DEP.
6	JOSEPH MURREN: I would add though that

JOSEPH MURREN: I would add though that there is a degree of complexity that we also had to be cognizant of which is... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Of course... [cross-talk]

JOSEPH MURREN: Yeah, when you have a human service... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: It took me four years to understand contracts, I get complexity... [cross-talk]

JOSEPH MURREN: Oh, no, no, no I... what, what I'm saying... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...and I get the fact that there is Manisha in every field that makes it different, we have to get over that, its' time to interrupt that thinking, that is true in every area of business so that cannot be a hurdle you can't get over.

2.2

1					
_	$W \perp L \perp$	I SIIRCOMMIT	TEE ON C	`APTTAT.	RUDGET

JOSEPH MURREN: And I agree, and I think we have to bring our game up and as I will speak to Councilman Grodenchik who has left but... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Grodenchik...

6 [cross-talk]

JOSEPH MURREN: ...where we had...

8 Grodenchik, I apologize... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: But I get that, Grodenchik... [cross-talk]

ACOMMITTEE CLERK SWANSTONO is bringing that to bear and we're working closely with all of our bureaus especially on the contracting side, I think one of the big things that the Commissioner alluded to is up front where we're doing better planning I think now and also doing better scope development. It's...

[cross-talk]

what I need you to do on the capital budget side is translate that into savings even if its savings that... here's my concern that all of that good critical and of course that's your job so all of that work is translating into savings and what I am concerned about is the bidders who are used to getting 500

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	million dollar contracts still think they should be
3	getting 500 million dollar contracts when you through
4	your good scoping and no longer having to have as
5	many change orders etcetera have really brought the
6	cost of that contract down to 450 million dollars.
7	JOSEPH MURREN: Right [cross-talk]
8	JOSEPH MORREN: RIGHE [CIOSS-CAIK]
9	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And I need you
10	to demonstrate to the taxpayers that you're capturing
11	that savings, we need [cross-talk]
12	JOSEPH MURREN: Yes[cross-talk]
13	
14	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL:you to do
15	that and I don't I, I it would be extraordinary if
16	DE DEP could lead the way on literally tracking tha
17	and you could do that now through passport.
18	JOSEPH MURREN: Yeah and we're [cross-
19	talk]
20	
21	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: It's the tool
22	[cross-talk]
23	JOSEPH MURREN:working and we will
24	work with the system and we will work with, you know

our oversights which includes both, you know MOX, OMB

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	and ultimately the Comptroller as well to, you know
3	get those savings there and I think we're, we're
4	working towards that and we will get there and we
5	work for look forward to working with the council or
6	that as well.
7	
8	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah, it would
9	be great to see that as a for our capital
	subcommittee to see that as an indicator at next
10	years budget hearing. So, I'm just putting that out
11	there. Two last quick questions, does DEP have a role
12	in fixing ponding?
13	
14	VINCENT SAPIENZA: Street ponding from,
15	from storm runoff, yes. So, there are [cross-talk]
16	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Can I bring
17	you out to ten sites in my district?
18	you out to ten sites in my district:
19	VINCENT SAPIENZA: Sure. Yeah, so there
20	[crows-talk]
21	
	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That's all I
22	want to know.
23	VINCENT SAPIENZA: We, we will go out and
24	vincont billionii. We, we will go out and

take a look... [crows-talk]

1 WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you...

3 [cross-talk]

4

VINCENT SAPIENZA: ...at, at... [cross-talk]

5

7

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Because DEP

another agency that could help me with ponding. And

isn't ... I mean DOT isn't helping so I'd love to find

g lastly I'm wondering and this is just totally I'm

10 back to... sorry Chairs, a different issue so stay with

me for one second, now I'm just putting on my mere

12 Council Member hat, do you have the capacity, the,

13 the software networking capacity to know by address

14 whether or not the complaints that you have

15 | inspectors going to and, and resolving can be

16 connected with the Department of Buildings so another

17 words the Buildings Department and also HPD you could

18 look up an address, see the complaints but I'm

19 | thinking about tenants that have complaints that fall

| into all the agencies, is there any way from your

side to connect by address with DOB or HPD or DOF for

we do I'm going to look to my folks... alright, I'm

22 that matter?

23

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Yeah, I'm not sure if

24

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	going to ask Cecil McMaster who's our Chief
3	Information Officer to come up.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great and we
5	
6	can follow up on this after I realize it's a little
7	off topic so my apologies.
8	CECIL MCMASTER: Yeah, so I'm Cecil
9	McMaster CIO for DEP, yes, we could connect to the
10	other agencies by address.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Oh, you are my
12	new favorite friend, can I have your card, and could
13	we meet and discuss that?
14	we meet and arbeass that.
15	CECIL MCMASTER: Yes.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Oh, that
17	really ended on a high note, thank you so much
18	Commissioner and thank… [cross-talk]
19	
20	CECIL MCMASTER: Thank you Council
21	Member.
22	CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you
23	Council Member Rosenthal, we're joined by Council
24	Member Yeger from Brooklyn and now for questions

25

Council Member Powers.

1	
П	
_	

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you, I'm

going to be quick because I apologize I have to leave, I think he just got raise by the way and thank you Commissioner for being here and the team from DEP, I, I... you guys have a, a sometimes unnoticed mandate in the city and I know you do an important job for, for all of us and I share Council Member Rosenthal's and others, you know questions about cost savings but also the work you're doing so I appreciate it. I just... on the cost savings side I, I note that you have some stuff around the reduction of chemical costs and on, on the operating side and some, some time ago in a former life of mine I actually worked with the very good you have at DEP at one of the wastewater plants around looking at magnesia actually as a replacement chemical as you actually I think were at the initial meeting of pre, pre being Commissioner I, I, I wanted to note two things first of all the... I think it was Jerry Fergias [sp?], Art Spangle that team was, was fantastic and I, I hope they're... I hope they're all still there and they're great and one of them is a constituent of the Chair by the way but so I wanted to do that plug, I sort of think sometimes the staff goes unnoticed but

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
is that factored into... is that program still
happening, is that pilot still going on or its
probably not a pilot anymore and is that factored
into your... I, I note that because I know... also
remembered that some of the folks who worked there
appreciated having something that was safer than the
existing product that would not cause safety concerns
for the staff?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Well I'll give a little background then I'm going to ask Pam Elardo our Deputy Commissioner for Wastewater Treatment to come up but to do PH adjustment on our plants we've long used sodium hydroxide, its... it works very well but, but it can be corrosive and so we've looked at magnesium hydroxide, I know we've done a pilot and Pam do you know...

PAM ELARDO: Good morning, its... I'm Pam
Elardo, I'm Deputy Commissioner for the Bureau of
Wastewater Treatment, great to meet you all. Yes,
we're constantly looking at different ways to use the
best chemicals, the most cost-effective chemicals and
the safest so magnesium hydroxide is a perfect
example of that. We did do a pilot in one of the
treatment plants, I'm pushing that as a reportable

metric to meet on a quarterly basis as how we're going to roll that out to the other plants fortunately it doesn't take a lot of additional infrastructure or additional cost, it might be some new piping systems relatively straightforward not new tankage but overall its going to be cheaper, its more effective and safer for, for our employees. And, and on top of that we, we, we researched advantages throughout... for our industry all the time and we also take employee input and a lot of times an employee will come up with why are we using this chemical and concerns about safety will really drive us towards the most cost effective and safe, safest solutions.

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Great, thank you. Thanks a lot, I'm sorry I have to leave early but thanks, thanks so much.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you

Council Member Powers. Just quickly talking about

facility security checks, according to the Mayor's

MMR the number of facility checks has decreased from

98,528 in the first four months of fiscal of '17 to

89,606 during the same period in fiscal '18, what's,

what's the rational for those... the decreasing in

1		
L	L	

2.1

2.2

Z 4

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

York City DEP is the only municipal water supplier in the country that has its own police force, so we have 200 officers who patrol our, our, our water shed territories and do those security checks. Over, over the past year we've had some attrition there in the police force some, some members have, have left to go to other municipalities, they move upstate and they've, they've joined police forces there but fortunately we have 38 new officers who are going through our academy right now and this spring they will be out at the sites and having that new class of 38 will get our numbers back up to where they need to be.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: So, once we... so those... that's all we'll need is those 38 or we need to add more of a head count?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Once we're at 38 we will be at full head count.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Then we'll be back to our full 200 and then we'll have the ability. So, what is our... and I, I don't want to know the details of it, right so I'm just asking if it... if

2.5

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
it exists, we can talk offline of what it actually is
but does the department currently have a terrorism
action plan so if something does go wrong at the
water supply we do have some sort of plan in place to
deal with that, correct?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: We, we do both terrorism and counterterrorism as well to, to... you know we, we get a lot of attempts into our computer systems as well and Cecil McMaster who, who was just up here, our Chief Information Officer works closely with NYPD and the FBI on that.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: So, there's coordination amongst the agencies to keep the water supply safe and...

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Absolutely... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: ...again I'm not looking to broadcast it here today I just want to make sure that it exists. Alright and then so the other questions I have around the elimination of the Owls Head wastewater treatment, the watering contract, I'm looking at an... I know that the docks were in very poor condition, what are our plans to

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET ensure that other agency docks do not ever reach that sort of level of disrepair, we can sort of get in front of these sort of challenges?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, so to remove sludge from most of our treatment plants we have large vessels that come in and sludge is loaded onto those vessels and then they, they... it goes over for further processing off site, the dock at Owl Head it, it... that actually been inspected not long before we, we noticed some squishiness in the roadway leading to the dock, the bulkhead itself was, was in good shape but we, we were concerned about vehicles driving onto that roadway to help load the, the, the sludge vessel so what we've been doing for, for the last year and a half or so is de-watering that sludge on site rather than having liquid sludge go onto the boat while those repairs continue but Mr. Chair we, we, we have and we continue to look at the, the docks at all of our wastewater treatment plants to make sure that the... they're, they're stable at this point.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: How often do we inspect them or make sure that they're in good working condition... [cross-talk]

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

Commissioner of... [cross-talk]

_

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Pam and... Pam or Jim, the dock inspections. This is Jim Mueller our Deputy

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: If he... if he can just state his name for the record before he begins speaking... [cross-talk]

JIM MUELLER: Sure, Jim, Jim Mueller. So, we'll do... right... we've been working with EDC to program dock inspections throughout the city, its been a very valuable program, I know Pam and... Pam's staff has also, also been intricately involved so you know we can provide more information on, on the status of that but its' been a very good collaboration with EDC and ourselves to do that kind of inspection.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And, and you said how, how often are they being inspected or...

JIM MUELLER: I don't know if, if there's a recurring frequency to it, I think they haven't been inspected in quite some time, so a lot of these inspections are happening now, and we can provide more information on that.

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Can you

provide that information to this committee, you know
before the next hearing?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: I, I know that some... I just want to say I know that some had, had been inspected, I know Owls Head because I had seen that report previously, Rockaway I know had been inspected previously so...

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And, and then... okay, and the last question I have relates to again the, the FAD which is... you know you outlined and, and talked about it in great detail but the, the preliminary Mayor's MMR notes a decrease in the number of acres of land solicited in the water shed from 13,000 to about 7,800 in fiscal '18 why are we purchasing fewer acres of land upstate?

VINCENT SAPIENZA: So, one very important programmatic feature is purchasing land around our water shed territory so that we are the owners and can set aside that land for, for any future development that may take place that, that could potentially affect our water supply. We've, we've had this land acquisition program now for, four decades

and its always been willing buyer, willing seller so we'll solicit property owners, hey would you like to sell your lands here's what we think the, the value of your property is and that, that's... we've done a great job I think over the last 20 years or so but I think as the program matures there's been less and less owners of property who, who want to sell, they want to stay in their land and Dave Warren who's an Assistant Commissioner on our water supply if you got anything to add, Dave.

DAVID WARREN: Good afternoon, yes, my name is David Warren I'm Assistant Commissioner with the Bureau of Water Supply. As the Commissioner mentioned in his testimony we just passed a great milestone with the land act program, we purchased 150,000 acres since 1997, our new FAD continues to set solicitation requirements for DEP at roughly the same rate they have been historically. The FAD that just completed we had a six year, 300,000 acre solicitation goal, the new FAD has a seven year, 350,000 acre solicitation goal so again continuing to solicit at roughly the same pace that we have been in recent years and I would just point out that 2017 was our highest year of acquisitions that is signing

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET contracts since 2012 so we continue to acquire land through the ongoing solicitation process.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: But... so and it looks in... is that because we were solicitating doing more in 2017 and it looks like our, our numbers are down as far as solicitation so...

DAVID WARREN: Our, our solicitation... in the recent FADs our solicitation goals have been set as multi year goals rather than, than annual goals that allows us some flexibility within the program to, to pace our solicitations. We also do solicitations in batches throughout the year so that partial year number may not fully reflect where we will be by the end of the fiscal year because we, we... you know we sort of batch process, we'll send out a bunch of letters, do solicitation on those properties and then we'll do more later as the year goes on.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And how do we hold ourselves accountable on the purchasing... if we're only required by law to solicit but not to purchase a certain amount of land?

DAVID WARREN: Right, so when the land acquisition program began the communities in the

2.2

water shed expressed a lot of concern that if the goals were expressed as acquisition goals that the city could potentially resort to condemnation so though the negotiation of the water shed agreement in the mid 90's it was agreed that the, the target would be a solicitation with the city required to follow through if we solicit a property owner and the property owner expresses interest in selling to us we are obligated to follow that through to, to purchase.

we're, we're, we're staying on top of this, see more in the exec and, and to talk further to make sure that we stick to our goals and we're able to keep the FAD because ten billion dollars... I know that the taxpayers don't... you know the, the water and sewer rate payers ten billion dollars would be a hit to water rates that would be irrecoverable, correct?

DAVID WARREN: Yeah...

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: So,
everyone's nodding yes so, so you need to verbalize
it then. So, with that I, I will thank you

Commissioner and for everyone at DEP for all of your
work, I look forward to getting some of the

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET 2 information from you and hearing more as the year progresses, thank you Commissioner for your testimony.

VINCENT SAPIENZA: Thank you all.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: So, we have one member of the public to testify today, we have Phil Vos From Energy Vision. Alright, Mr., Mr. Vos let's make sure your microphone is on and you can give your testimony.

PHIL VOS: Okay, got it, alright. My name is Phil Vos and I thank the Chair and the committee for this opportunity to testify on behalf of Energy Vision in New York Bays 50... 501C3 environmental group and a leading expert on alternative fuels for heavy duty vehicles. This testimony relates to another aspect of the committee's work which is your work with the Mayor's Office of sustainability in developing sustainability policy. We encourage the committee and the Mayor's Office of Sustainability to work to align city vehicle and fuel procurement policies with the city's climate and clear air goals by phasing out the use of diesel fuel among city fleets. Calling climate change an exponential threat

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	the city's 2015 New York City clean fleet document
3	set a goal to cut greenhouse gas emissions or GHGs
4	from city vehicle fleets 80 percent by 2035.
5	Biodiesel blends and electric vehicles have enabled
6	some progress but achieving the ambitious 80 percent
7	target will require a major shift away from using
8	diesel fuel. City diesel vehicles consume 60 percent
9	of all fleet fuel and emit 63 percent of all GHGs.
10	Fortunately, appropriate technology alternative
11	technologies exist proven, commercial and cost
12	effective compressed natural gas or CNG has been
13	successfully deployed in New York buses and
14	sanitation trucks and its expanded use opens the door
15	for two even cleaner options; biomethane fuel and
16	near zero emission engines. Any CNG vehicle can use
17	biomethane which is made by refining biogases from
18	decomposing organic wastes, it has greenhouse gas
19	emissions 70 percent or more lower than diesel and 40
20	percent or more lower than fossil natural gas.
21	Biomethane made from food waste can actually be net
22	carbon negative which means that capturing the biogas
23	to make it prevents more GHG emissions than it
24	releases when combusted. Biomethane also called

renewable natural gas is being used now in hundreds

	COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION JOINTLY
1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	of UPS trucks and tractor trailers and in the refuse
3	fleets of haulers like our public services and waste
4	management. Santa Monica's entire bus fleet runs on
5	it, LA is piloting it in 300 buses and in England,
6	Bristol, Nottingham and Redding have all introduced
7	biomethane buses. With, with abundant organic waste
8	streams New York could produce its own fuel,
9	biomethane now produced at fresh kills landfill is
10	being sent to California via pipeline. As noted in
11	DOPs in DEP's testimony food waste is now being
12	added to sewage at the Newtown Creek Wastewater
13	Treatment Plant to boost biogas production for
14	biomethane. This could be replicated at other
15	wastewater treatment plants. Gas from commercial food
16	waste alone could displace 12 million gallons of
17	diesel fuel, the addition of residential organics
18	could displace all fleet diesel and drive the city's
19	goal of zero waste to landfill. Heavy CNG vehicles
20	that can use biomethane can also be fitted with EPA
21	certified near zero engines, these engines cut health
22	damaging nitrogen oxides and particulate matter 90
23	percent below EPA requirements. This would
24	particularly benefit the often-poor neighborhoods

that house many of the city's truck and bus depots.

WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET

Combining the proven available technologies of

biomethane and near zero engines would drive city

environmental goals using the hundreds of millions of

dollars now spent on diesel vehicles and fuel to buy

cost effective clean alternatives leverages the

city's huge buying power to combat the existential

threat of climate change. We encourage the committee

and the Mayor's Office of Sustainability to ensure

vehicle and fuel purchasing align with the city's

environmental goals by tackling our outdated diesel

dependence in favor of zero and near zero emission

technologies that are available today. Thank you.

Mr. Vos I appreciate your testimony and, and as you know this committee is committed to reaching our goal of reducing city emissions to 80 percent by 2050 and, and renewable energy and renewable opportunities are going to play a huge role in that. So, as we... you know have over a million cars and transportation vehicles on the streets of New York today... every day opportunities to reduce emissions from them will be looked at and in our city fleet so we, we should be setting the tone as a city when it comes to emissions and, and, and vehicle emission reduction so we will

1 WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET 2 be in close contact with you and all stakeholders to

make sure we get it right.

PHIL VOS: That's excellent and New York City has been an environmental leader in the past, I hope it will continue to be so and please view Energy Vision as a resource in addressing fleet emissions.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: We, we look forward to working with everyone as a partner as we get this done, we have to get ... we get it done and get it done right.

PHIL VOS: Okay, thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you, any questions anyone? Alright, thank you Mr. Vos.

PHIL VOS: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: With that I ... alright, so with that I just want to thank again our financial... Finance Analyst Jonathan Seltzer, our counsel Samara Swanston, our Policy Analyst Nadia Johnson and, and my staff as well Nick Widzowski and my counsel and Eric Burnstein from the Finance Division and of course it was great to Chair this

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

hearing with my colleague and Co-Chair Vanessa

1	WITH SUBCOMMITTEE ON CAPITAL BUDGET
2	Gibson, it was great to partner together, I look
3	forward to doing it more in the Exec Budget. So, with
4	that I will gavel this Committee hearing of the
5	Environmental Protection Committee closed.
_	r 11

[gavel]

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

April 4, 2018