

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

----- X

March 6, 2018

Start: 2:32 p.m.

Recess: 5:08 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: INEZ D. BARRON
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Laurie A. Cumbo
Robert F. Holden
Ben Kallos
Ydanis A. Rodriguez

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Matthew Sapienza, Senior Vice Chancellor & Chief
Financial Officer, City University of New York

Judy Bergtraum, Vice Chancellor, Facilities Planning
and Management, City University of New York

William Oberkehr, NY Solar Smart Unit, Sustainable
CUNY, City University of New York

Kisha Vaughan, Director of Child Care Services
City University of New York Central Office

Arlene Torres, University Dean Recruitment and
Diversity, City University of New York

Barbara Bowen, President
Professional Staff Congress CUNY

Sharon Persinger, Treasurer
Professional Staff Congress, CUNY
Faculty, Bronx Community College

Meg Feeley, Adjunct Lecturer, English Department
Union Adjunct Liaison, Kingsborough Community College

Levi Castle, Sophomore, Queens College & Board Rep
New York Public Interest Research Group

[sound check, pause][background comments,
pause] [gavel]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good afternoon. I'm
Inez Barron, Chair of the Committee on Higher
Education, and I would like to welcome you to our
hearing on the Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget, the
Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report,
and the Fiscal 2018-2022 Preliminary Capital
Commitment Plan for the City University of New York.
We will be joined by Matthew Sapienza, CUNY's Senior
Vice Chancellor and Chief Financial Officer, and Judy
Bergtraum, Vice Chancellor for Facilities Planning
and Management. Thank you for joining us today.
CUNY'S Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget of \$1.17
billion does not vary tremendously its Fiscal 2018
Adopted Budget. As always, there are items in the
state's 2018-2019 Executive Budget that remain in
question such as the state's share of support for
Early Child Care Services, ASAP programming
operations at the Murphy Institute soon to be a
school. The Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget also does
not include Council initiative support such as
funding for Mayor based scholarships or the
university's development of new remediation programs.

We will, of course, want to discuss all of these things today. But this year the Council is taking a new approach to its Preliminary Budget hearing to more effectively ensure that the city's budget is fair, transparent and accountable to all New Yorkers. While efficiency and performance have always been priorities of this body, today we plant to scrutinize the organization of the city's budget more closely than in past years. For CUNY this means that we will have a conversation about the limited number of units of appropriation used to describe vast areas of the university spending particularly around the community colleges. We will also be taking a closer look at how CUNY organizes its \$590 Million Fiscal 2018-2022 Capital Commitment Plan. Many city agencies, CUNY among them, developed plans that frontload the vast majority of their funding into a single fiscal year then commit only a fraction of that amount. Today, I would like to talk about why commitment rates are so low at CUNY and about how we can work together to come up with a more rational capital spending plan. I also look forward to learning more about how the university prioritizes its capital projects. This hearing presents us with

an opportunity to review other programs and activities at CUNY as well. The State's proposal to require all SUNY and CUNY campuses to house food pantries, raises important questions about costs and funding sources, but it also raises borough questions about CUNY students who are struggling to meet other basic needs. Turning to academics, CUNY has developed a number programs and services to better meet the needs of the 21st Century leaders over the past few years, and I would like for us to discuss fees as well. We know that by 2020, post-secondary education will be required by 65% of jobs. That is why I am calling for a restructuring of the State Educational Policy to provide an option to all students to continue in a free state sponsored education program for at least two years beyond secondary school level. Historically, by the end of the 19th Century it was apparent that compulsory education through elementary school was no longer adequate for the growing industrial age. Here now we similarly see that the information age and advanced technology require higher levels of education. If we make provisions for post-secondary education, we will expand opportunity and increase access for those who

have been marginalized and locked out. As always, I look forward to discussing hiring practices and the need for increased diversity both on CUNY's campuses and within its central administration particularly in light of the fact that Chancellor Milliken will be departing. With Connected CUNY as a strategic framework for CUNY, I am particularly interested in recent trends since in 2015 data showed that over the previous 20 years there had only been a 1% increase in black faculty, and there was a low percentage of blacks and Latinos in the PhD tenure track. Before we begin, I would like to take a moment to thank my staff particularly Joy Simmons, my Chief of Staff; Alma Wally Clay (sic) my CUNY Liaison; and N'Digo Washington my Director of Legislation; Paul Senegal, my Counsel to the Committee, Jessica Ackerman, Senior Finance Analyst to the Committee and Chloe-Chloe Rivera, Policy Analyst to the Committee. As members of the committee come, I will acknowledge them. At this time, I'm going to ask the counsel if he would administer the affirmation.

LEGAL COUNSEL: Please raise your right hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony

today before the Higher Education Committee, and to respond honestly to Council Members' questions?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: I do.

LEGAL COUNSEL: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. You may begin.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you.

Good afternoon, Chairperson Barron. I am Matthew Sapienza, CUNY's Senior Vice Chancellor and Chief Financial Officer. I am joined by Judy Bergtraum, Vice Chancellor for Facilities, Planning, Construction and Management. We are also joined by several of our colleagues from the university who will assist us in responding to questions and concerns that you may have after the testimony. We very much appreciate the opportunity to speak with you about the Mayor's Fiscal Year 2019 Preliminary Budget and its effect on the City University of New York. Chairperson Barron, we very much appreciate your strong and continuing advocacy for our students. This Higher Ed committee and the entire City Council and especially you, Chair Barron, have always understood and supported a strong and competitive university. There has never been a time when

education beyond high school was more critical for individual success and the city's economic competitiveness, nothing is more important for the economic strength of our state and city and the vitality of our society than a talented workforce to attract good jobs and to foster the innovation necessary to remain competitive. The knowledge economy of the 21st Century orders an array of exceptional career opportunities, but the most promising increasingly require a college degree, and that trend is only accelerating. The high growth industries that are shaping our future need not just in place with technological skills, they need a workforce that is intellectually nimble, able to collaborate effectively, and able to function well in different cultures and languages. In short, they need talent, skills and diversity. Those are the hallmarks of the college degrees that we offer at CUNY, and there is increasing evidence the businesses appreciate and are seeking employees with those characteristics. It's a win-win because the city and state prosper, and our students realize their ambitions. As many of you know, a landmark study by a group of respected economists released last year

demonstrated that CUNY is an unsurpassed engine of social mobility lifting almost six times as many lower income students to the middle-class and beyond as all of the Ivy plus colleges combined. CUNY colleagues hold six of the top ten slots in the rankings of the institutions that did the most to advance the economic position of their graduates. Importantly, most of the students who benefitted from a CUNY education are from unrepresented and immigrant groups bringing much energy and creativity to our city and state. A shining example of this is Thamara Jean, the daughter of Haitian immigrants and a Hunter student at Macaulay Honors College who attained a Rhodes Scholar, CUNY's eighth. As the Daily News said of Ms. Jean's Honor and I quote, "More quintessentially American, more quintessentially New York it does not get." Essential to our students' success at CUNY is recruiting and retaining an outstanding faculty. A critical goal in CUNY's strategic plan is to continue to increase the diversity of our faculty. I'm pleased to report that almost 44% of the new faculty hires last year from underrepresented group, a continuation of a significant upward trend. The result is that the

percentage of minority faculty members has reached an historic high of 36%. In addition, we have strengthened our faculty over the last few years by significantly improving the terms of the adjunct employees through negotiations with the Professional Staff Congress. Key gains include health insurance for eligible adjuncts and greater job security through three-year appointments for long-serving adjuncts. Now, let me speak to the city's Preliminary Budget. We are pleased that the city's Financial Plan provides stability for our community colleges. Funding from prior plans will enable us to continue the expansion of the ASAP program as well as programs targeted at college readiness such as Ours (sic) for All, CUNY Math Side (sic) and 12th grade proficiency. We are extremely grateful to the City Council particularly the Higher Education Committee for securing resources in this year's budget for the City Council Merit Scholarships. We will ask for your advocacy again as funding for this critical student support program was not included in the FY19 Preliminary Budget. This initiative provides financial aid to students who graduate with an 80 average for New York City high schools and who

maintained a B average at the university. These merit based awards are available to deserving students of both senior colleges and community colleges and are a significant contribution to our efforts to speed time to degree. They demonstrate to our students in a tangible way that their city makes it possible to pursue an excellent post-secondary education right here at home. We look forward to working with you and ensuring that these financial aid awards are protected. We also need your help in restoring \$2 million that was provided for remediation in the current fiscal year. CUNY has developed a plan to better tailor—better tailor remedial instruction to the needs of its students and to accelerate their degree progress. Advisors will strongly encourage students who have the greatest need, those who are placed into arithmetic and those who need remedial instructions in all three skill areas: Reading, writing and mathematic. To enroll in CUNY Start or Math Start, CUNY's effective programs are helping students achieve proficiency. Other students will be counseled to enroll in a targeted workshop offered by the University Skills Emerging Program. All of these interventions are low

or no cost for the student. Remedial students who cannot take advantage of these programs will have the opportunity to enroll in a co-requisite course combining credit costs work with supplementary instruction. Our plan is to eliminate traditional cost-based remedial instruction altogether within five years. Additional needs to support CUNY's ongoing efforts to complete completion rates—to increase completion rates—I'm sorry—are highlighted in our FY 2019 Budget Request. We are seeking city investment in several significant endeavors. The first is related to support for associate degree programs at our comprehensive colleges. The amount provided for these firms has remained constant at \$32.3 since 1995. Simply applying the Higher Education Price Index over that time period would have meant an additional \$29 million in annual recurring support. Investment priorities also include new full-time faculty, and discounted Metro Cards for our students. Let me turn now to the State Budget. CUNY's request to the state includes a three-year community college base aid funding increase of \$250 per student full-time equivalent each year. This increase would generate and

additional \$11 million in Fiscal Year 2019. This request is a multi-year effort to increase state funding to a level that will enable it to adequately support community college operations, and provide funding for strategic investments that will improve student outcomes. In addition, we are hopeful that the Senate and Assembly will restore funding for ASAP and child care centers. I would also like to take a moment to talk about the Federal Budget and particularly our deep concern with the legislation to reauthorize the Higher Education Act, which was approved by the House Committee on Education and Workforce in December 2017. This legislation known as promoting real opportunity, success and prosperity through education reform or PROSPER Act would make attaining a degree more expensive for tens of thousands of students at CUNY. The proposed total elimination of the Supplemental Educational Opportunity Grant Program, the SEOG Program, would make college less affordable for those with significant need. In this academic year, over 26,000 students at CUNY will benefit from over \$7.5 million in SEOG awards. The Federal Work Study Program, which helps needy students afford the cost of a—of a

higher education degree, as well as provide valuable work experience would also be significantly impacted. The initial analyses of the PROSPER Act show that once these provisions are fully phased in, CUNY would lose the most combined Federal Work Study and SEOG funding for any university system in the entire country. While the reauthorization of the Federal Higher Education Act is long overdue, we need to remain vigilant and ensure that the neediest New Yorkers have access to an affordable high quality higher education system. Chairperson Barron, please be assured that the University deeply appreciates your and the committee's continued commitment to high quality CUNY education, which is the vehicle that so many New Yorkers rely on for the path of upward mobility. I would now like to ask Judy Bergtraum, our Vice Chancellor for Facilities Planning, Construction and Management to talk about CUNY's Capital Budget.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [off mic]

Good afternoon. [on mic] Good afternoon Chairperson Barron and committee members. The City Council has been an outstanding partner to CUNY and especially to our community college by providing support for

critical maintenance work in major new buildings. In recent years your support has been instrumental in helping CUNY to complete North Hall's new quad at Bronx Community College, a major expansion of libraries at Medgar Evers and La Guardia Community College, a creation of a new dining facility at Queensborough Community College, the creation of the Feirstein Graduate School of Cinema at Brooklyn College and a renovation of the 500 Grand Concourse Building 4th floor at Hostos Community College. All of these projects added or upgrade space and have enriched those campuses with modern well designed facilities that inspires students. Also, with your support we've been able to start design on the new Allied Health and Science Building for Hostos. This major facility will provide classroom designs labs for the college's Allied Health Program which provides essential workforce development. In addition, it will house a dental clinic that will provide students with practical experience and furnish the community expanded service. In recent years, the Council has provided over \$300 million to CUNY and funded hundreds of projects in particular at the community college where the need is the greatest.

Because of your generous support of critical maintenance funding, CUNY has been able to address some of the most challenging critical maintenance issues at these campuses. In particular your allocation of loan sum funds that allow CUNY to add projects that are in press has helped CUNY move several important critical maintenance projects along. Last year the Council provided CUNY \$10 million, which CUNY has requested the state match that would then make it 20, and as you know from our previous discussion, achieving a state of good repair within the system is CUNY's priority. One of the largest ongoing critical maintenance projects is the replacement of the façade of La Guardia Community College Center 3 Building. This enormous building is 100 years old, and its façade must be replaced if the building is to be preserved. I am happy to report that we expect to complete the construction of this \$125 million project by the end of this year. I hope you will all take pride in the realization of what—what will be a community treasure. Other critical maintenance projects that have benefitted from Council funding are: The ongoing campus wide utility upgrade at Bronx Community College, a complete

replacement of the electrical system at Queensborough community college so that the college no longer suffers from power outage-outages and the phased renovation of Hostos Community College by Friends of the Grand Concourse Building, and roof replacements across the university, which are in need of repair at every campus. We are pleased to report all of this activity, but emphasize that critical maintenance continues to be a major capital priority at our community college campuses and we are still in need of your support for the long-term effort. We have over seven million square feet of community college facilities, three-quarters of which is over 40 years old. The most serious need remains to be the infrastructure system that supports Facilities' operations. Continued deterioration of these systems could lead to costly emergency repairs and in some cases major system failures. \$750 million is needed to keep the backlog deferred maintenance from growing. So, you will continue to see requests for critical maintenance funding from our colleges. This year approximately \$120 million is identified—in identified projects in the funding to cover critical maintenance items such as fire alarms, roofs,

boilers, heating ventilation, air conditioning, façade and windows. We are pleased to inform you that we're planning to expand our space in Inwood for the CUNY in the Heights Program associated with Hostos Community College and the Borough of Manhattan Community College. The expansion will allow us to continue to increase vital prior education services to the community providing many career ladders to educational attainment and careers. We estimate the expansion will cost \$5 to \$6 million. We continue to seek additional city and state funding for the Hostos Allied Health and Science Building that I mentioned, and we are very much in need for another important initiative which is \$50 million for a new permanent home for Guttman Community College. The work on our facility is continuing and it's integral to realizing those important goals. CUNY is a community treasure. Thank you for all your support, and for all you do for CUNY and New Yorkers.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I want to thank the panel for their presentation. I do want to acknowledge we've been joined by Council Member Holden, a member of the committee. We're glad to have you, and we are now going to jump right into the

questions. We've got lots and lots of questions, and we want to be considerate of the time. So, regarding the Capital Plan Organization for the Capital Commitment Plan, as I mentioned in my opening remarks, many agencies of the city have a history of frontloading the Capital Commitment Plan and CUNY is among those. So, in addition to creating gross disparities in the amount of funding that's allocated in any given year, and the amount that CUNY can realistically commit, the practice eliminates the ability of the Council to gain an adequate sense of how long individual projects will actually take to complete, and you did reference some in your remarks. But last year for Fiscal 2017 out of the \$298 million listed in the Executive Capital Commitment Plan, CUNY only committed \$33 million. So, what factors have traditionally gotten in the way of CUNY being able to commitment more to this plan and what made Fiscal 2017 a particularly difficult year?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Okay, fine.

The Capital Plan is really an accounting system. We look at it as the place where we go to—to record and to understand how much money is given by the—the Mayor the City Council and the borough presidents.

For--first and foremost, the issue that we have is what we call the state match and I think you'll--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] I didn't hear you. What is it called?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: The state match. For every dollar--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Okay.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: --you give us in this June, we have to wait 'til the following April for the city to match that. If you take that a little bit further, we get the money in April, we can access the--the money in June. So, it's really we're waiting nine months once you give us the funding. Now, CUNY, you know, everyone liked to be different, but CUNY is different. We are not a cookie cutter operation. What I mean by that if you go look at the SCA, they build buildings. Most schools have that basically the same a cafeteria, but at CUNY we are actually building buildings from the inside out, and what do I mean by that? Most of our community college--colleges we're not built as community colleges. If you take a look at Hostos, the building that I talk about that we're renovating used to be owned by an insurance company. La Guardia Community

College the other building that I talk about where we're--where we just completed the façade within the--the Nabisco Cookie Factory. So our facilities we have to renovate from the inside out. The other issue we have is--and I don't think there are many other entities that have that. We live in a two-budget world. We have the budget of the city, and we have the budget of the state, and we have to marry those two, and what I mean by marrying those two we have to receive approval from the--a CP from--from OMB and then we have to receive approval from the State. This process take time--takes time. The other issue is the city requires us to have all the funding for a project upfront. So, if the projects costs \$10 million, and the city allocates \$2 or \$3 million, we have to wait to accumulate those funds. Now, eventually we do accumulate those funds and I'll give you an example. You know, we talk--every time I come here I talk about the Bronx utility projects. We have spent almost or we will when we finish, \$170 million for the infrastructure. We started with 2003, we're up to Phase No. 5. We're up to Phase No. 5, and what we did was we accumulated funds in order to basically take care of the infrastructure at Bronx

Community College. So, that's another issue. You have to have all the upfront. So, let's look at last year. Last year we requested and you generously gave us the—with the Mayor and the Borough President \$80 million. So, we waited for a match for that \$80 million. That is sitting in this number that you quoted, the \$298. Now, let's talk about the \$80 million. Now, if that \$80 million went to one building, it would be committed within let's say four or five months, but that \$80 million consists of 20—20 to 25 projects. And some of the projects are a million and some of the projects are \$2 million, and I must say the amount of work that we need to do for a \$2 million project and the amount of work we need to do for a \$10 million project is basically the same. So, we have all these issues that are playing into that number.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, if I could just inter—interject for moment. If you have \$80 million, and if you have a \$10 million or a \$2 million project, why wouldn't that project have been done when you had the \$10 million? Why wouldn't you have just used the money then for the project that was \$10 million or \$2 million?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: If we got—if we got two--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Okay.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: --if we got \$2 million—if we got \$2 million on a project that costs \$10 million, we've got to wait to get the additional \$8 million, and meanwhile it's not just--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Okay, but you have \$80 million now?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I that \$80 million you could not have taken some of that money for that \$10 million project that you have?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Yes, we will, we will.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So then why did you have to wait because it seems that perhaps the time table would have allowed once you got the \$10 million rather than to let it accumulate to 80.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, because in order to—we have to get the match. In order to--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Right.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: --we have to get the match, and we can't go—we have it allocated

by campus basically so it's equal. So, every campus gives in a request. Every campus gives in a request, and that's what we match. For—for—for Fiscal 17 there was a registration of \$34.8 million for Phase 5 of what I just described and that—it was posted to 2018, and also we believe that our number for this year will be higher than the prior years. The other issue is projects that are delayed, and projects are delayed for one reason is that we don't get enough funding, and the other reason is that when we start looking at project, and I'll give you an example, if you look at a track, at a track at Bronx Community, we made a request. We started. We looked at design, and we thought it was just going to be repaving, but as we took a look we had to worry about the drainage. So, a part of that—

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You said you worry about...?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Drainage.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Drainage.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: So, a project that started out as \$500,000 ended up being \$3 million so that we don't have the—we don't have the funding for that. The other thing is we plan—we plan

ahead and the issue for us is that if you're going to do construction in a building, when school--when--when classes are--are--are happening, you need to have swing space or you need to have it arranged with the campus that they can still run classes, and sometimes that becomes a real--real big problem. So, you have what I just described before scope change. We're doing construction. We're doing construction while school is running. If we could close down our schools, we could do construction much faster, but we kind of don't have that--that luxury. And the last--the last thing that I have to say is can we do a better job and--and push more projects out? Yes, we are looking at that. We're meeting about that and we're talking to our colleges about that. So, that we tried getting--I kind of gave you a flavor of what we are up against.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, you may have answered this in your question, but if you could just clarify it for us. For city funds that have to be matched by the state, does that money have to be included in the city's Capital Budget or just in its Capital Commitment Plan?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: It has to be included in a published plan, and that is usually the September plan.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: The Capital Commitment Plan.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So, do city funds have to be included in the immediate fiscal year because you talked about a gap--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: and you have to wait.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So, they can't be included in the out years?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: No.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: If they're included in the out years we don't get the match.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. I want to acknowledge we've been joined by Council Member Rodriguez as well. Okay, now for the part-project prioritization, CUNY relies on a hundred buildings to support students across its seven community colleges,

and the average age of these buildings is more than 50 years, and you referenced some that are much older than that. So, while the buildings are--some of the are close to 100 years. So, how do you prioritize your capital spending?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Okay. [coughs] The number one priority is life safety concerns, and the projects that I've mentioned Bronx Community College, if you recall I think it was in 2000. It was when I first came. It was 2007 there was a--a large sink hole at Bronx Community College, and that was the beginning of our spending funding on the infrastructure there. So, the--the first thing is the life safety and the other one that I mentioned the Center 3, which I--I have to tell you it's a building, it's 800,000 square feet. We have campuses that aren't 800,000 square feet, and the reason that we're spending \$125 million on just the façade is because that was a danger condition. So, we start with where there are dangerous conditions, and Queensborough Community College. Actually, when I first got to CUNY they--they had more black--they had blackouts every single week. You know, we have spent--How much have we spent? [background comments] \$42 million in--

on that and that makes a really, really big difference. So, our number one—our number one issue is emergencies, and now that we've spend this money, the number of emergencies are decreasing. Now, you ask how we prioritize. We look at the critical maintenance, but we have done a critical maintenance study for the whole university, community colleges and senior colleges, and senior colleges, and we now are in the process—this is the—we did one in 2007 and we did one in 2012 and now we're doing another one, and that gives us the condition of every single—every single facility and we use that to prioritize what we're going to do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, the Critical Maintenance Studies that you've done over the years, I think you said 2007 and 2012.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Right.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What do you see? Do you see carry over or the same projects that were identified or the same conditions that were identified in the first study also still in the second study or how are you tracking that? How are you addressing those that are identified in each of these studies?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: The--the answer to that is in some cases. The--the--where we spent money, the problem has decreased. Where we have spent money the--the situation becomes worse.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So have some--have some capital projects gotten priority over what was in the Critical Maintenance Study or does--does CUNY say, Listen, all of these on our critical maintenance list have got to be done before we do other projects.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Everything is prioritized. Has anyone ever brought the book? [background comments] Okay, so we put out this book. We put out this book and I think you've gotten copies. It's--it is--it's--it's 200 pages long. It lists every single school, and it lists the priority. It lists the priority for the senior colleges and the priorities for the community colleges. We sit down with every college and we work this out because for instance let's say that there's a school that has a problem with three roofs, alright and let's say each one is at the same level, we can't shut down. Let's--we can't shut down one--one building. We can't shut down all three buildings to do the roofs. We have to make a decision and we do one roof this year and we

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

31

2 do another roof like two years from now, but this is
3 what the priority is.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, all of the lists
5 that the—all of the items that are in the book as
6 priorities, do they bump some of the items that were
7 on your critical maintenance? Do you have a master
8 critical maintenance list, and do projects that are
9 in this fit into your master or your comprehensive
10 critical maintenance?

11 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: This is the
12 master list.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: This is it?

14 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: This is it.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And so, in here we
16 can identify which of these priorities are on
17 Critical Maintenance List?

18 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: I would say if
19 you look in here 85% of them are critical
20 maintenance, ore almost 90% are critical maintenance.

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so can we get
22 the Critical Maintenance List from the studies that
23 you've done over the past years? Can we get that
24 list?

25 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, good. I'm going to—I have lots more questions, but I'm going to defer to my colleagues who are here. I'm sure they have questions as well.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, as I was in CUNY for 40 years, the New York City College of Technology as a professor, and I can attest to the fact that we had to make due in buildings that were not made—they weren't built for a college. We were in a Con Ed facility. We were in a factory, and our newest building was built in the early '60s. Right now I left obviously to be in the City Council and, of course, they're opening new buildings. It's a wonderful renaissance in Downtown Brooklyn, but we always wondered why we couldn't get on the list. I was there 40—like I said, 40 years, and it didn't seem like New York City College of Technology was a priority, and especially we were the only colleges of technology in the university, and so I'm glad to see that there's been an investment in certainly technology, and you—as you know, with technology comes special needs obviously in the building itself, the infrastructure, and the—the problem with adding on we—we rent buildings, obviously lease buildings.

We were just constantly moving and being there 40 years, we never had enough. Our buildings never operated properly. We never had enough power. So, I'm glad to see the investment. I see the kind—I'm seeing it first—I mean I witnessed first hand the daunting task you—you have, and I appreciate it and anything we can do in the City Council to make it a littler easier, but I do see an improvement in CUNY. I've seen an improvement over my 40 years, and I want to thank you for your testimony. They know the capital projects that's the toughest areas. There—there are so many things. We had leaks. We had—even when we had new construction there were problems in getting the building operational. Air quality, obviously we had a big problem with asbestos. We had a problem, and that's the critical issues we're seeing throughout the university. Obviously, you have to put these in priorities, but we also felt—I mean I felt that the college was really a stepchild for many years. I know it's changed, and we can't talk now because they have a new building, and by the way, did that open yet in Downtown Brooklyn at 30—at 300 Jay or across the street?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: It's-it'll open in the next month.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Great. Okay, just, but it will open mid-semester or--?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: It will open, but it-but the faculty will move in--

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing]

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: --and the classes will probably--

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] I have to go back there and see. It's-it's a wonderful looking building and they have many buildings, and the college does a great job, has a great president, but I just-again, I want to thank you and I understand the task, but anything we can do to make it easier on the capital end, we certainly would like to hear some more. Thank you.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: So let me-- we're going to open that building. It's 400,000 square feet. It's-it's magnificent, and it's going to have all of the technology classes in there. So, all of that is moving out. All of that is moving out from an old building to a new building. The new building is the building two of the floors we're

renovating now so that we can use that space, and the Voorhees Building we renovated that. So, I think if you went back to New York City Tech, the world that you saw, it looks totally different because New York City Tech looks totally different.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, my colleagues--my department was Communication Design, and I know they renovated what was called the Pearl Street Building--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]
That's right.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --and they're--and they're working their way up, which is--is great and the façade will eventually be done. That--that area, by the way, at Tillary and Jay where the Brook--where the Brooklyn Bridge comes in is probably the busiest corner, and it does deal with pollution problems. It was I think noted as the most polluted corner in the city of New York because of all of the--the congestion there. But I do appreciate the daunting task again, and I--and I want to thank you for your investment and your--your great work in--in--in the colleges. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Council Member Rodriguez, do you have questions?

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Chairman. One more time, one more budget, the same place. Now, the city rely on CUNY to prepare working class to turn—turn our working class into middle-class, and to provide opportunity for the middle-class to continue using CUNY. Many of us are here just because of CUNY. However, CUNY being defunded for so many decades, when it comes to the real need, and what we have seen is also a reduction of our black and Latino students in our—in our senior colleges over and over like you only got to walk through City College. When I was there and 80% of the students were black and Latino when I was there. I believe that today's population at City Colleges has to probably under 70, right? Is that accurate?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Council Member Rodriguez, don't have that information on the city. Oh, thank you. I do have that information.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Okay,

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: So, yes for undergraduate—undergraduate enrollment at City College, 17.9% are white, 34.4% Hispanic, 18.9%

black, 28.7% Asian and Pacific Islander, .2% American Indian Native Alaska.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, and that used to be again when I was there--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: --studying there in '87 the population was 80% black and Latino.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: --and I think that some of our youth blaming CUNY is about the pipeline. It's about preparing the students to go to be college material. So, I know that sometimes we expecting, we as CUNY, but this crisis is like the MTA. It didn't happen overnight, and I believe and I lived that experience. When I used to be a teacher in high school you had to go to Luperon High School.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: There was many students that they were 87 average and they would apply, and they did not get a seat into the senior colleges, and then I know that later on the Office of Administration at City College they did a pipeline, they did a pilot project and years after, two years after they took a few students who were in the same

average that they were refusing seats before. All of them provided the opportunity to get into senior college, graduated with a 3 and above point average. So, I think that we need to be more creative on how we also take our students who right now the only option is going through a community college, and we are able to provide them the opportunity to get into senior college even though probably they don't know that—they don't get the best SAT, but still if they are given the opportunity to get into a senior college, they will graduated. And I know that this is something. The reason why—why CUNY and City College being in that pilot project was because there was an interest to find out come out a solution, and just hope. Again, I don't know what have happened after that pilot project, but I just hope that more students who's average are 85 get the opportunity to get into a senior colleges especially if you are committed to maintain the diversity in our higher education. I have a concern—a question of concern, which is about when we look at the number from the 275,000, we look at 11 senior colleges, and then we look at 7 community colleges.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: In 7 community colleges we have how many? 98,000 students?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Correct, we have about--

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [interposing] 96,000?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --97,000 students at the Community College.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, in seven campus.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Are we, and again the answer for me is about so that we as a city and the state and everyone together deal with the reality with funding. Are we operating on capacity or are out seven campus right now working over capacity.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Council Member Rodriguez, on the community colleges it's a mixed bag, and what I mean by that is that we have a campus like Kingsborough out in Brooklyn whose enrollment has been down the last few years who could take more students. We have BMCC down the street here that as 27,000 this year and whose enrollment keeps growing

every year. Now to BMCC's credit and to President Price's credit, they find a way every year to make sure that they have courses early in the morning, late at night, Saturdays, Sundays. I mean they--they have a 234/6 campus just about. So, to go back to your earlier because you raise a very good point and-- and we very much appreciate at the university folks like you and Council Member Holden and Chair Barron who are products of CUNY and who know that the power of--of what we do at the University. Our feeling is we--we know that one of the main missions of CUNY is access, and we want to find a home for any student that wants to come. So, again, I agree with you it goes back to preparation, and are they prepared to do college work, and at what level, but--but anyone that wants to come we want to find a home and--

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]

Do we--but and seek, because this is about if you--if you don't share with us the reality, we cannot advocate at the city and state level and say guys, you know, the number of classrooms that we have in the seven campus, if we have a projection for the next five years and that--that population continues growing--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: --that seven campus will not sustain the number of students that were have applying. Can we say that today the seven campuses are enough, or can we say that there's a need to be more space for the students. In the case let's look at just community college.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm. I, yeah, I think the, you know, we-we definitely need more space at our community colleges. You know, we have seven community colleges. We opened up Guttman about five years ago, which was the first community college we opened up in 40 years in New York City, but space is always a concern. So, what we're doing-- one of the things we're doing is trying to be more creative and be more innovative in how we offer the program. And so, an example of that is more online programming, which is a big part of the university strategic framework. We want to have more online course offerings. But one of the things I just want to say about our enrollment and how we're serving more kids and keeping to a mission of access is that this past academic year we graduated 52,000 students at the university thanks to the great work of our

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

42

2 campuses, the great work of our faculty. That's the
3 highest amount that we've ever graduated in the
4 history of CUNY going back to 1847, 52,000 students
5 in one year. One of our concerns, though--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
7 What is the breakdown? Is that graduation for both
8 community--

9 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
10 Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: --and senior
12 colleges?

13 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes, yes,
14 total graduation.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
16 what--what is the breakdown of community college for
17 that number of 52,000 community college and senior
18 colleges?

19 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Michael is
20 pretty amazing, by the way, so thank you. [laughter]
21 37--about 37,000 at the senior colleges and about
22 15,000 at the community colleges.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: 15,00?

24 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: 15,000. So,
25 the point I wanted to make is--

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ:

[interposing]And I'm sorry—I'm sorry.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: No, no, that's
alright.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: --have an
understanding. With the 15,000, what was the cohort,
what was the expectation? Was that the number that
we're supposed to be graduating or we can say because
of more than 80% of the students, they need remedial
courses going to community college and that reality
that we know--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: --can we say
that that number compares to the cohort that was
supposed to be graduating, was supposed to be lower
or higher?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Well,
graduation rates overall at the community colleges
are now on the upswing, and a big part of that is
because of the ASAP Program, which I know you're very
familiar with. So, the graduation rates are
increasing at community colleges. There's now
question about that. So--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
3 And that number that--that number who graduated from
4 community college--

5 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: --and--and I
7 don't know if you will have the number, the data to
8 bring it right now. What percentage transferred to
9 senior colleges?

10 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: I don't think
11 we have that information, but we'll get that to you,
12 but let on that point--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
14 Because--because--

15 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: --as you will
17 look at it later on and share that information with
18 us, as you know, that's a concern that the Chair--
19 Chairman and--

20 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: --and
22 chairwomen and us we have, which is about how many of
23 those who graduated from community college--

24 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: --are getting into senior college?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: No, question. It's a great point. It's something that, you know, again goes back to the power of CUNY. We want students to articulate to the senior colleges, and one of the things that we did about two years ago, which we think was, you know, is really important is we did something called reverse transfer. So students--many of the students, as-as, you know, Council Member Rodriguez that do move from community College to senior colleges do so before they get the community college degree. So, before they get the community college degree. So, before they get 60 credits and before they get their associate degree, they've done enough course work where they're able to transfer into senior colleges and they move. But what happens is they're leaving without a degree, but that's from the student's perspective. The college perspective is they're getting no credit for that student as part of their graduation statistics. And so what we've done is something called reverse transfer where when students do accumulate 60 credits in total, they get that associate degree even though

they've already moved to a senior college, and we thing that's really important for a student because they need to have something for the good work that they've done to get the 60 credits, and so we implemented that about two years ago. If I can just for a minute I just want to go back to the point about the highest number of graduates we ever had. So, we had 52,000 graduates last year, which was tremendous, and that's why we're here is to graduate students. But, we were concerned on the back end that because we graduated so many more students that we normally have that that was going to mean a decline in our enrollment this year because we had to make up for so many students that--that left with a degree. However, our enrollment this year is actually up about 1%. So, our college is doing great work finding a home for the students that want to come. The students are, you know, were--they're-- people are voting with their feet. They're still coming to CUNY. We're doing, you know, tremendous work, but I agree with you, access is, you know, absolutely one of our critical missions and something that we're 1000% focused on.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: One program that happened at—in my al mater City College is to graduate a student form the Engineer Department. It's more expensive--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing] Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: --than any other field. How is CUNY supporting City College to be sure, and I would at City College, you could be sending me home to college and any other senior college in this field, but it's more expensive to graduate students than others.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: How is city—how is CUNY working with institutions at City College to be sure that they should support funding to maintain and increase? Especially we have the school of Engineer, but as far as I know, the one that graduate the largest number of students of color. So, are we—have projections to continue funding that school so that there's enough funding to keep adding—increasing the number of students in that field?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Right. No, it's—I'm glad you raised City College in general. So

City College has definitely had some fiscal challenges the last couple of years. We're very please that a new president was appointed there, President Boudreaux and he's--

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
That's a good one, by the way.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you.
Yes, we agree. He's been terrific and has tackled even when he's the interim president has tackled this fiscal problem head on, and it has been extremely transparent with the campus community as to what's happening. There and what the plans are. We're working very closely with him at the university level. President Boudreaux was in my office I think last week or the week before, and we're actually meeting tomorrow as well. So, we've been in constant contact with him trying to resole the fiscal issues they have. One of the best schools that we have in CUNY. I would argue it's one of the best engineering schools that's out there period, but you raised a very good point that engineering is very expensive, a very expensive program, and it's something that again we have to continue to manage in collaboration with the college leadership.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Okay, my last question is about something local which is CUNY in the Heights.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: You know our great-great John Kapasky (sp?) he been trying to help us on putting a meeting together, but one thing that I wan to bring to CUNY everything is local, and community college are funded by the city, and we just hope that as you put in place any programming for the CUNYs in the Heights that we have like discussion about what is the projection, what is the plan because I do believe that CUNY in the Height provide the opportunity for us to look at some point to have a plan to in the future to be trained as another community college.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm. Yes, we love the CUNY in the Heights program. We have a request in our Budget Request, which is on-on the CUNY website for additional space for CUNY in the Heights and I know Vice Chancellor Bergtraum is working very closely trying to secure additional space in the building that they're in now.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: We're [coughs] we're in the process of negotiate— negotiating the lease for an additional 15,000 square feet, and we're almost there.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I have some more. Just before I move onto—back to the budget questions, the data that I have in response to Council Member Rodriguez's question there is a disparity between the demographics of students at the community colleges as compared to the senior colleges. So, the data that I have says that there's about 25% black students at senior colleges and 28% at community colleges, and then for the Hispanic population, it's 26% at senior colleges and 40% at community college. So, when we talk about the professions that are higher end and that are more demanding, we see that the students who are black and Latino are not in the senior colleges in the same numbers as other ethnic groups. So, we need to, I think look at that, and in terms of the question, well, I'll—I'll come back to that. I want to get back to some more of the budget questions. So, once a project is funded on a particular campus, how does the process work for that campus to draw down the funding?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: On a capital project.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Once-once the project—we're talking about a community college or—its community college, right?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is—are the processes different? Let's do the community college.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Okay, the—if we—if a project is funded and we have enough funding—
—

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: --we go to the city and we get what's called a CP, which is a Certificate to Proceed, which what that basically tells us is that OMB has looked and we have enough money to move forward. Then—then I'm assuming if we've gotten the match already then we have to go to the state and get what they call--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, do you have to have the match before you go to OMB because I--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]
Yeah, you have to have all the money.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Alright.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: I'm just answering your question.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: I'm assuming we have it all.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: So, we go to the city.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-hm.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Then we go to the state and then we can move forward.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, and so then what role does the president play in this? You talked about you have to have swing space. So, what kind of-

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, before, you know, before this book is put together we sit down and we talk with the presidents before they're going to request something, and we say if we're going to take, you know, six or seven classrooms offline, what are you going to do? If this is what you want, you request to be what are we--and we basically work it out. So, we do this right with presidents.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. CUNY's Fiscal 2018-2022 Capital Commitment Plan includes 34 budget lines, 591 project identification codes, and this makes it nearly impossible for the Council, which adopts the city's Capital Commitment Plan each year by budget code to hold CUNY or the city to any level of accountability for the progress of these individual projects. So, 91% of CUNY's Capital Commitment Plans falls into just one of ten categories labeled miscellaneous reconstruction. So does CUNY use more specific categories to analyze its capital projects?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [coughs] So, first, let me explain how this works. The three categories there are ten categories. We can only use three. One is miscellaneous construction. Another one is gymnasiums and the third one is--is equipment. Those are the only three that's technology. The other seven are not related to us, but let me explain the 500 number. We look at the budget as an accounting system, and what that number represents--remember, we represent 24 colleges and the projects on each campus. So, let's pick a project at Medgar Evers, and let's say that project has money from this--from

the Mayor, the City Council and the borough presidents. So, that's three numbers for that one project. So, let's just say we don't have enough money, and we sit with those--those--we sit with that amount of money and we wait for the next year. So, the next year. So, the next year that project gets three more numbers. So, if you take my example and you multiply it by the number of campuses, that's how you get the number 500. Now, as far as it's--it's a tool, as far as using that as a tool to basically see the status of our projects, I understand that's not--that's not really very helpful to you, but for us a budget mechanism and a budget document, it's very helpful. So, I know your issue is transparency--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Yes.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: --to the thing. So, what we've done for our board and we started this in June, if you go online and you look in the CUNY website, you will find a list by college a list of all the projects that are in pre-design--design and construction, and it will give you information on when we project that project to be completed. Now, this is a--this is a project in the works. Based on what you're telling and the--the

questions that you're asking, we're going to go back, and we're going to look at what we've posted, and we're going to see if there's any more information that--that we can add. So, we started this in June. I'm just about to post this, and we're going to do this every six months. After our board meeting I will post the next six months, [background comments] and if you take a look at this, and if there is other information that you want added, we'd be happy to add it. So, if you want to see where projects are, that's the place to go. You will see it every community college, and you will see it for every senior college. So, you will see where we are and what's happening with your funding.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: But the question that I asked, though, said that the Capital Commitment Plan falls into just one of the ten categories. So, you named three. You said gymnasium, you said equipment, technology and I forgot.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Those are the three that--that we use.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: But-but think about this. How many times do we do gymnasiums? That's why everything else--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] So, what happens to the other seven? Why do you only use three?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: The other seven are not related to capital construction.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: I think it's-- it's the way the system is created, but I understand if-if you issue is you want transparency, and you want to see where we are--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Can you send the doc? Can you send that information--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --so that we don't--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: If-if you wait 'til the end of the month, I'll send you the most up-to-date one after the board--after the CUNY board.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Can you send me what you already have so that--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --it's just about the beginning of this month.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, if you send me what currently exists. Okay, good. So, new projects in the preliminary, and I want to acknowledge we've been joined by Council Member Cumbo, a member of the committee. New projects in the Preliminary Capital Commitment Plan, the Fiscal 2018-22 Preliminary Capital Commitment Plan includes three new projects with \$6.6 million in new money added for Fiscal 2018. So, can you describe each of those projects, tell us what they will do, and the total projected budgets and the estimated timelines of completion?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Sure.

[coughs] The first one is the Data Center at 395 Hudson Street. The construction of the data center is almost complete, maybe in the next two weeks, and we will be using these funds to buy equipment. We will be buying equipment this year, and we will be buying equipment next year.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, it's a data center to be utilized by--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: All of CUNY.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: All of CUNY.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Right.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: The—the second project is really I find very exciting. It's Baruch College. If you go to 25th Street between Lex and Third, you will see that the street is closed. This is a project for the construction of the street, which we will basically turn into a campus for Baruch. The city has been unbelievably cooperative and DOT. DDC is going to do the construction. The construction will cost approximately \$6 million and you know, your—your first question it's very interesting. We started this project almost—I don't know, five or six years ago, and the City Council funded a part of it. But what did we have to wait for? We had to wait DEP to take care of the construction, the underground construction. So, this money—this is going to create a campus for Baruch College. So, it's pretty amazing. The last project is one of the things I talked about an emergency. It's a bridge at Bronx Community College. It connects to the gym. The bridge was deteriorating,

and it's going to cost us about \$700,000 to renovate the bridge, and those are the three projects.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Well, I'm going to move onto the Expense Budget organization. CUNY has a total proposed budget of \$1.2 billion for Fiscal 2019 all of which is organized into three broad categories or paired units of appropriation. But more than 95% of all of that money falls into these pairs supporting community colleges. So, CUNY has conversation—has CUNY had a conversation with OMB about restructuring funding for the community colleges into more units of appropriation?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Chair Barron, we have not had those discussions with OMB, but again, going back to what Vice Chancellor Bergtraum said, anything that the Council or OMB the Mayor's Office feels can bring more transparency we're happy to have those conversations with both OMB and with the Council Finance Division.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so according to the distribution of funds by object code in OMB's records, \$542 million out of the community college's \$1.1 billion budget falls under a single budget code 2-4-3-0.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Labeled Community College Central Administration. So, that's more than a third of the budget, and obviously a third of the money cannot just support CUNY Central, and a significant portion of that money must be distributed across campuses over the course of the year. So, in order to run the University system effectively, CUNY presumably must have its own internal system of tracking funding outside of the system the OMB currently uses, but this in no way provides a level of transparency required for monitoring agencies including how the Council wants to track how funds are spent. So, how does CUNY track its budget internally in comparison with how OMB tracks CUNY's budget?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm. Yeah, and you're right Chair Barron. The--the overwhelming majority of those funds that are in that--that budget code extension 2-4-3-0, do end up through budget modifications throughout the fiscal year being allocated to the community colleges, and so it reverts back to that code at the beginning of the fiscal year, and then we allocate it to the community

colleges. Again, going back to what Vice Chancellor Bergtraum on the—on the capital side, on the operating side we've also working with our Board of Trustees have a new process in place where the board adopts a budget in June and as part of that process, we've been updating our budget quarterly throughout the year. This is our latest—this is actually our Fiscal 19 Preliminary allocation, which we just presented to our Board Fiscal Committee last week. Again, as to capital, all of this is on our website. This is 189-page report. It's very line item detailed. So, again we—we are definitely focused on transparency. We want to report these budget allocations publicly at our board meetings. These reports again are on our website, and do provide a level of detail to the allocations in terms of what we're monitoring as the college budget.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So, can you explain to me how you track internally as--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
Right. Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: So, we—at the beginning of every fiscal year we—we allocate funds

to our colleges based on how much is available. From state, city tuition. We make a determination about the allocations to the colleges. We issue those allocations. Colleges then are required to submit financial plans that have developed in consultation with elected student and faculty leaders and submit them to the Office of Management and Budget and Finance for review and approval. Then throughout the year what we do is we are monitoring. When I say we I mean the Central Office of Budget and Finance. We're working every single day with the campus fiscal personnel to review their expenditure patterns, how much revenue they're collecting in terms of tuition revenue, their staffing, their headcount, how many people they're hiring. So that we're monitoring how they're doing from a fiscal perspective, and then we do quarterly reports that again now that we are publicly reporting those quarterly reports to our Board Fiscal Committee on a quarterly basis, and those are again posted to our website. So, they—they are public, and that's our way that we track how the colleges are doing from a fiscal perspective, but certainly if we are concerned about any one college's fiscal condition, we'll call them in, have a meeting,

ask them to resubmit a financial plan, work with the presidents and their fiscal staff to make sure that they're on—they're on good footing.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, a college gets an allocation based on what criteria? [coughing]

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: We—we look at how--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Is it numbers? Does everybody get the same allocation per student? Is it programs? How do you determine the funding that an individual college will receive?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: So, for the senior colleges, it's—it's an incremental based budget funding in a similar way to the way the city allocates to their agencies. So, each senior college has a base budget that rolls over from year to year, and then we make incremental changes to that. Hopefully, we're adding to those incremental based budgets every fiscal year. Sometimes, unfortunately, we have to reduce, but the senior colleges' incremental base budget. The community colleges are—we do differently in that we have an allocation model that has a few different factors, but the—the overwhelmingly dependent factor in the community

college allocation model is enrollment. So, the more enrollment a college has, the—the more of the funding they'll get. So, community college is a little bit more towards the zero based funding in that every year we start over and we run the allocation model. So, two different ways of allocating between the seniors and the communities, and we at the beginning of every year will present back to the community—to the colleges, and again, we'll always give the colleges some advanced warning based on for instance where we are now. We know that the Governor's Executive Budget Proposal was. We know what the Mayor's Preliminary Budget proposal was. So, we have the sense of what the budget picture is looking like for next year, and communicating that to our colleges.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, good. Could you send us copies of that as well so that we could have that?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Absolutely. Yes.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: How are funds assigned to the Central Administration spent or distributed over the course of the year?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: A similar process as to how we do the senior colleges. There's a base budget that we, you know, roll from year to year. On the central administrative budgets and what we call our shared services centers, which is—which is part of central that provide services to the college—on behalf of the colleges. We've actually done some significant reductions over the last three years. We've reduced—we've done reductions to the Central Office and shared services budgets of 13% over the last three years. So, we're trying to redirect more resources from administrative areas, both at Central and at the colleges to instruction in student support areas, but again, the Central Office in terms of the process is done very similar to the senior colleges.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Are there every circumstances in which money is assigned to the Central Administration is routed to a CUNY foundation?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: No. Not from Central Administration. Not that I'm aware of. You know, foundation monies are privately raised. They're—they're separate 501(c)(3)'s and so tax levy

money does not get rerouted or allocated or transferred over to foundations.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what type of monitoring or recording do you do of foundation money that is given to CUNY? How—how is that recorded and where is that recorded?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: The foundations are required at the end of every fiscal year to provide audited financial statements to the university, which is part of the university's comprehensive annual financial statements that we issue every—by October 31st of every year. So, we monitor them that way. We also have a new policy where each college president has to report on their discretionary non-tax levy money of which foundation money could be—is a subset of, and so those are the ways that we—we monitor it.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, just a few more questions and I thank you for your patience and for your thoroughness in answering questions. For the new needs, the Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget includes very few new needs for CUNY. Regarding the New York Solar Smart, the Preliminary Budget adds a ne ombudsman for New York Solar Smart, an initiative

to lower the cost of installing solar panels across the state. The ombudsman will be based out of CUNY. So, what has been CUNY's role in the New York Solar Smart so far--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
Uh-hm.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --and what will be the responsibilities of the Ombudsman?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: So, Chair Barron, I'm going to--we're going to make our first call to the bullpen if--if with your approval.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Sure.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Because we have folks here from our Solar Smart Program. They're doing great work so--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I'll just ask if you would have--respond to the affirmation from the Counsel.

LEGAL COUNSEL: Okay. Would you raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony today before the Higher Education Committee, and to respond honestly to Council Members' questions?

I do.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: And this is William Oberkehr from our Solar Smart Unit.

WILLIAM OBERKEHR: Alright. So, Sustainable CUNY has led the NY Solar Smart Program since its inception over a decade ago. Working with the New York City agencies and the utility to be able to streamline permitting processes around getting solar energy into New York City into our infrastructure. Eleven years ago when the program started there was one megawatt or solar capacity in New York City and no one really knew where that was. With the advent of Sustainable CUNY's NY Solar Smart Program and the attention (sic) span we're now nearing 200 megawatts of solar capacity over the last ten years, and we've developed a pretty sophisticated processes for--for tracking pretty sophisticated metrics. [background comments] One of the central key roles of the ombudsman team, which was initially funded by the U.S. Department of Energy was to work with city agencies and the utility to ensure that utmost safety for the citizens in New York City while allowing this relatively new technology or this burgeoning technology to really incorporate itself

into the infrastructure of the city. So, there have been large successes through the NY Solar Smart Program in the solar energy arena, and emergent technology now is battery technology, energy storage systems and essentially energy storage systems are now where solar was, you know, maybe 10, 11 years ago. All of these same processes are being figured out and streamlined. Sustainable CUNY is working with the Fire Department, with the Department of Buildings on a regular basis with Con Edison as well to be able to see the path forward for these energy systems to really be safely incorporated into the city's infrastructure in support of the city's goal of 100 megawatt hours of solar energy storage, and a gigawatt of solar, and the state's goals of 1.5 gigawatts of energy storage.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. What are the opportunities—what opportunities with CUNY's involvement with New York Solar Smart offer students in terms of interns—internships or work/study jobs or hands-on experiential learning?

WILLIAM OBERKEHR: Directly we do have an internship program with Sustainable CUNY and the City University of New York, and obviously we—we pull

exclusively from CUNY students for interns. For instance, right now our—our primary web developer started out with us as an intern from Queens College, and he was able to—to stay on in a part-time capacity after graduating with a Master's degree. And then more broadly right now the solar industry not included—including energy storage employees 2,300 New Yorkers within New York City alone, and in order for those jobs to be able to be available in the first place, and be sustained the processes by which these technologies are permitted and incorporated into our city need to be streamlined to make sure that those opportunities continue to grow in availability as—as opposed to construction.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you very much for your answer, and before I call on Council Member Cumbo, I just want to go back to the units of appropriation.

WILLIAM OBERKEHR: So, would CUNY be supportive of going to or having the Council go to OMB and talk about a separate unit of appropriation for each of the community colleges? Would you be supportive of that appeal?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: I—I think that it's something we're willing to talk about. I—I, you know, I don't want to say that Chair Barron would be supportive of it because I think we have to see how that would affect the community college operations. I know that there's, you know, certain restrictions on moving monies between units of appropriation and we don't want to limit our colleges in terms if they have to move money from—let's say from PS to this, but certainly willing to have the discussion. You know, in—in a prior life when I was at the Department of Ed we increased the units of appropriation there by 50% from one year to another. So, we're absolutely open to that discussion in partnership with the Council Finance Division and—and OMB.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Great. Thank you. We'll now have questions from Council Member Cumbo, and I do have to step off. So, I'm going to ask Council Member Rodriguez if he would chair until such time as I return, which should only be a couple minutes but okay. Council Member Cumbo.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Chair Barron. Thank you for your presence here today. I wanted to begin with child care on college campuses.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Chair Barron held a very eye-opening hearing on that last year, and I wanted to follow up with it because I strongly believe that every CUNY campus should have the ability for families to be able to have child care in order to complete their education and to do so at the highest level.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Do you know what the total budget for child care programs across CUNY campuses are right now, and what percentage of CUNY campuses are child care ready?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Well, and—and thank you Council Member Cumbo for bringing up that—that issue because we agree with you. It's one of those critical functions that we have on our campuses, and I believe currently we have 17 child care centers at the university. Some of our campuses obviously are smaller graduate programs like the Graduate School of Journalism, the Graduate School of Public Health and Policy, which, you know, a child care center wouldn't necessarily be appropriate or effective, but—but most of our campuses do have child

care centers. So, we have 17 of them. The total budget is \$6.75 million, the sources of which are about \$3.1 from the state, \$500,000 from the city about \$2.2 from the federal—from federal funding, and a little less than a million that's redirected within CUNY's budget. So, it's about \$6.7 million. One of the things we're really concerned about which I—I mentioned in my testimony very briefly is the proposed state budget would reduce the funding to the child care centers about \$900,000. So, it's something that we're working with the legislature and our folks in the Assembly and the Senate to get that restored. It was restored this past year, and we're—we're optimistic that it will get restored for this year. So, a very critical function for our student parents, a very critical operation to have that and, you know, one of the things I always like to say when we talk about child care centers is one of the great services that they provide not only for our student parents, but to the children of the students is our child care centers are not, you know, babysitting. There's instruction--

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing]

Right.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --that goes on at our child care centers. So, it's--it's a great learning experience for the--for the children of our students as well to be in--be in an environment like that.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Do you know the calculation of that in terms of the campuses that are child care ready versus those that are not? Do you know the percentage?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: I don't know if we have that, but I mean 17 of our campuses have--

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] Like how many total campuses?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: We have 24, but again, some of our graduate programs wouldn't have a need for child care center necessarily because they are smaller. They only have a few hundred students. The students fit most of the programming for some of our graduate schools like in the evening, but we will look at our schools that have undergraduate programs that don't have a child care center, and get back to you about which ones would be ready to operate one or not.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Because we would like to see all of the CUNY campuses child care ready, and as a new mom myself, and I'm 43 years old, some might say well some of the older more established members don't need child care, but believe me, I need it. So, I'm sure that some of the more advanced degree programs and programs that you brought up I'm sure families and parents could benefit from that as well. I wanted to--there was a--a specific issue of a child care programming space at City College--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: --and we spent a great deal of time at length on that. What is the status of those renovations and where have parents at City College been sending their children in the meantime?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, I can tell you that the renovations will be completed by the summer and the child care center can open for the fall term. So, the renovations will be complete.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So, this in 2018 that space will be ready and open to the CUNY campuses at that time?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: The other issue
4 that was brought up at the hearing was so the fact of
5 the timing as far as when the child care services are
6 made available to students in terms of some students--
7 some parents have early morning classes. Some have
8 late evening classes, and it didn't seem that the--the
9 child care centers were available necessarily at the
10 times that parents needed them based off of their
11 school schedule and work.

12 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Council Member
13 Cumbo, with your and the Chair's approval, I'd like
14 to call up Kisha Fuentes. She's our Director of
15 Child care Services at the Central Office--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing]
17 Chair Barron.

18 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --to address
19 that.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-hm. [background
21 comments, pause]

22 LEGAL COUNSEL: Would you raise your
23 right hand, please. Do you affirm to tell the truth,
24 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your
25 testimony today before the Higher Education

Committee, and to respond honestly to Council Members' questions?

KISHA VAUGHAN: [off mic] I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: If you would state your name.

KISHA VAUGHAN: Kisha Vaughan.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

KISHA VAUGHAN: Hello.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

KISHA VAUGHAN: Can you please ask me the question one more clear?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: It was in regards to a hearing that we held in regards to child care on CUNY campuses, and through that particular hearing individuals that did testify and even after the hearing spoke about how difficult sometimes child care is in alignment with their school and work schedule, and that parents may have early morning days. They may have late evening times, and the hours and the time frequency in which the centers are made available do not always correspond to the child care centers. So, it would be an ideal situation and wanting to understand through the 17 or so campuses that already have, do they have like maybe 8:00 a.m.

to 8:00 to 9:00 p.m. hours so that way it's—it's non-traditional in terms of how people would see child care, but most people that are working as well as going to school have non-traditional hours.

KISHA VAUGHAN: Yes, based on the different campuses and the different structures and the different needs of the—so the parents some of the funding kind of prevents the child care centers to provide services throughout the day for the student parents. We have some centers that do provide services from 8:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. and then sometimes on the weekends, and on Sunday—Saturday and Sunday, and they're able to accommodate their student parent needs. Some of the centers need more funding to get more staff in order to accommodate the student parents' needs.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I think in the moment that we're in and just moving forward sometimes we know that there's a greater need, but we never vocalize exactly what that need is, and so if you could begin to understand on different tiers, you know, in terms of the existing campuses this is what it would cost to operate this many centers. If we had full day what we just described as full day.

2 KISHA VAUGHAN: Uh-hm.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: If we had child
4 care throughout the entire CUNY system, what would
5 that cost capital as well as expense. So that we
6 could begin to understand and actually ask for it
7 versus saying stuck in that space of we know we need
8 it, but we just don't have the resources--

9 KISHA VAUGHAN: [interposing] Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: --to this is what
11 it would cost for us to be where we need to be
12 because this Council is very concerned about child
13 care.

14 KISHA VAUGHAN: Yes. I would take that
15 into consideration. Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay, thank you.
17 I have just a few more questions that I wanted to go
18 through. When we first came into office Chair Barron
19 was very instrumental in leading our committee as far
20 as the merit based scholarships--

21 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: --and if trends
23 from the 2017-2018 academic year continue, how many
24 students do you anticipate being eligible for merit-
25 based scholarships next year, and in order to

accommodate that number of eligible students this year, the Council had to reduce the size of each semester's per-student award from \$400 to \$350. For the Council to both restore merit-based scholarships to the previous size, and accommodate all eligible students, how much money will CUNY need?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: We're very appreciative of the--this entire Committee of Higher Education for allocating that funding several years of the City Council Merit-Based Scholarships. A very successful program, and it makes a huge difference to the 23,000 students that are receiving it this year. So, in terms of your question--question, Council Member Cumbo, we--this year we had a first time freshman enrollment increase of about 3%, and we're anticipating that again next year. So, the 23,000 if it grows by 3%, there would be about another 700 students that would be--that would be eligible. So, a little less than 24,000, and we agree. We--we would like to have the award go back to \$400 per semester. As you said, we had to reduce it to \$350 to fit into the allocation. So, \$400 per semester for 23,700 students would be about \$19 million, and that's what we're seeking in Fiscal Year '19's Budget.

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

81

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Repeat that number
3 once more.

4 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: \$19 million.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: \$19 million to get
6 us to where?

7 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: To get us to
8 \$400 per semester for 23,700 students.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Understood. I
10 think we've got our work cut out for us.

11 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Wanted to ask as
13 well about dormitories. So, how-how does CUNY make
14 the decision about which campuses will have
15 dormitories and which ones don't, and I'm very
16 interested in Medgar Evers College having dormitories
17 more specifically?

18 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

19 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: So, so we-I
20 want to go back, and just tell you what CUNY has.
21 CUNY has four dorms that were actually constructed on
22 our campuses, and the-and then for-there's about
23 4,000 students in dorms, which is a very, very small
24 percentage of our total population. Half of them are
25 in dorms on-on college campuses. The other half are

in dorms that we lease. So, the—you have to have space. If you want to build a dorm, you have to have space and do a study to just basically see what the need is. So, that's how we build them. If, as far as leasing them, it's kind of the same thing. We do a study to basically see what the—what the need is. We are now looking at a new model where we'll—where we'd be able to have dorms all—basically all over the city, but the first thing is you have to show that there's a need because the city and the state are basically guaranteeing what the cost is, and—and the other thing about a dorm is for New York City is it has to be self-sufficient. You can't use tax levy money. You can't use state money to run the dorms. So, it has to be self-sufficient, and that's just for New York City. So--

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And what do you—how do you determine if there is a need because from what I've understood from other hearings is that for let's say our foster care community, when many children are aging out of foster care for those CUNY campuses that do have dormitories, I've seen where those students are able to then transition into CUNY housing to complete their education, and for many of

our students that potentially might be living in shelter, dormitories are also another option for them in order to be able to have housing while they get their education. And I know that the population at Medgar certainly does have both as well as many other students that are commuting that could benefit from a dormitory style campus.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [coughs]

Well, the--the issue with the foster care, when we started that program, the program was small, and it's really open to any foster care--and foster care student that basically wants to enter that--enter that system. Last year--so far we have 100 students. We're adding 20 students to that, and honestly what we do is we--we--the hundred spaces we reserve for foster care, but the--the

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] What is the need, though? Let's say you reserve 100, but there's a waiting list or a demand of how many that would benefit from that?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well--well, the number of students that would benefit comes from ACS. We work very, very carefully with--with ACS, and so every year we're going to increase the population. I

guess your issue at the beginning is in order for us to increase the population, we're going to have to have more and more dorms. So, we're looking at model where we will be able to--where will--we're going to try and get dorms in other locations in the city just like what you're saying.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I think Medgar Evers would be a perfect opportunity for you to expand that program, and I know that this committee would be very interested in working further on that with, and I just have one other question. So, for the recruitment, you say that 36% of your faculty now come from CUNY or is it that in terms of diversity numbers?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: No, no, 36% are--that's the diversity numbers. Yes, that's correct. Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Does CUNY--on your campus do you have some kind of like marketing program that from the time you come in the front door, it's CUNY wants you, and if you want to become a faculty or a professor or a teacher or a part of the administration, CUNY wants you, and if you're interested after you get your degree in coming here

to teach, we're going to get you on a track from freshman year so that after senior year maybe even after your graduate degree and other programs that you have an opportunity to teach here. We want you. That's our goal. We want to recruit you, and CUNY wants you. It's-it's-it's slam bam in your face as soon as you get there because I was an adjunct professor at Pratt for ten years, but it's not anybody necessarily recruited me in a way. It was more someone outside saw me, and I never even thought I could be a professor because I was 24 years old, and to be an adjunct professor on the graduate level was quite intimidating at the time, but someone saw that I could do that. So, I think it's important to be able to let students know that you can be a professor, and you can be a professor here because I-I have-to be honest with you, if someone had not tapped me and said I think you can do this, I would have never dreamed because I have this lofty goal of what professors look like, and maybe necessarily didn't look like me.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm. Well, our doctoral students at our Graduate Center, part of their program they do provide teaching to our

campuses, and so that that's—that's a really important part of their doctoral program, and—and helps our colleges in terms of having additional teaching power. But with the Chair's approval, I'd like to ask if our university Dean for Diversity, Arlene—Dr. Arlene Torres is here, and can come and talk a little bit about what we're doing in terms of recruitment and diversity—our diversity program in general. [pause]

DEAN TORRES: Good afternoon.

LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony today before the Higher Education Committee, and to respond honestly to Council Members' questions?

DEAN TORRES: Yes. I do. So, let me talk a little bit about the—

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Would you just give us your name for the record?

DEAN TORRES: Arlene Torres, University Dean for Recruitment and Diversity.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you

DEAN TORRES: So, CUNY does have a vision for trying to enhance the diversity and the inclusion

of faculty across the system, and one of the challenges that we face nationally, and also locally is how do we create a really critical pipeline eventually, right? But we need to start now, and so the kinds of things that CUNY has been involved in has been a CUNY Pipeline Program at the Graduate Center we have students come from the CUNY campuses and they spend a year and in some cases the summer and they participate in what is leadership development and research opportunities so that they being to think about careers in the professoriate. So, that's one Pipeline Program. Other kinds of Pipeline Programs that exist on some of the campuses you may be familiar with the McNair Program and that program is geared towards students again participating in programs over the course of their academic year, and in other cases over the course of the summer to advance research opportunities and they work with a faculty member who serves as their mentor so that that that student begins to think about opportunities that may be available to them to pursue a career in the professoriate. We also are one of— one of the historic system wide campuses that is supported by the Mellon Foundation, and four of our

senior colleges have received funding for over the course of 20 years from the Mellon Foundation to support Pipeline Programs to enhance diversity in the professoriate, and I can proudly say that I have been a mentor to a number of those students at Hunter College including that young lady who is now a Rhodes Scholar. She participated in one of our Pipeline Programs, and my hope for her as well as many of the other students who have participated in the program across CUNY is that they become future members of the professoriate at CUNY and also nationally.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I think that sounds great. I would just like to add that I think it's so important to start at the freshman orientation because I—I graduated with a degree in art history, and I never really—I just thought I was going to be a museum director or a curator or something like that. It never occurred to me that I could teach. So, I think that it's important from freshman year that the student body understands that if this CUNY education is successful, you will be a professor here at this school, and then allowing them the opportunity to have classes, and opportunities along the way in order to fulfill that goal. Because

I—I feel that—I'm a strong component, and when I see some of the decisions that are made in terms of how people are selected to lead throughout the city I always feel that it should come internally because the greatest compliment to the work that you do is that your own graduates become trained and educated enough so that they can then lead the very program that educated them.

DEAN TORRES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So, I—I would definitely think that freshman year is the year to begin, and to start that pipeline and discussion there, and just hammering it away that we want to—that—that CUNY wants you.

DEAN TORRES: I agree.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

DEAN TORRES: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you Council Member. I have just a couple of follow-up questions and the hour is late. We have more people. So what we may do is summarize the questions and put them in written form and send them to you, and you could respond to us. So, you had said that there's a 36% diversity in CUNY.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-hm.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Well, I'm looking at your 2014 through 2016 three-year compilation of CUNY Workforce Demographics, and I don't see any real increase. You have some charts. You've got some graphs that show the demographics, and I think where I saw an increase was in the Higher Education Officer Series, the HEO Series, and I think in another. So, my question is I haven't seen a--You're familiar with this I'm sure.

DEAN TORRES: Yes, I am.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I haven't seen--oh, I haven't seen it. So, what does 36 represent? 36%, what does that represent in terms of blacks? What does it represent in terms of Latino, and what has been the trend because in 2015 there was a report from CUNY which said the previous 20 years had only seen a 1% increase in black faculty. So, what do blacks represent in that 36%, and what has been the trend and are they particular titles in the citywide--in the system wide of CUNY that we can see where there are those increases?

DEAN TORRES: Okay, if we look at full-time faculty and we compare 2015, 2016, and 2017

figures, and I can give you that update because I—I noted that you mentioned and I think that you only have the figures up through 2016, and we just produced the 2017 figures. For our total minority in 2015 full-time faculty, there are 2,568, and that represented 34%. In 2016, it was 2,594, and that represented 34.5% and then in 2017, it was 2,746, and that was 35.9 or 36%.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is that black?

DEAN TORRES: Among African-Americans --

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

DEAN TORRES: --let me go to specifics now. In 2015, the numbers were 929. That was 12.3%. In 2016, 918. So, in real numbers there was a drop, and that represented 12.2% and in 2017, there was an increase in the numbers to 944, but a percentage pretty much stayed the same at 12.3%.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, CUNY's not doing well. It's been—it's the same pattern of what we've had in the past. So, it was a question that I asked the first year I came here: What are we doing to increase the number of blacks, and we'll add Latinos as well and Asians, but what are doing? I'm not

happy. Here we are five years later, and it's the same.

DEAN TORRES: So, let me talk a little bit about what--what kinds of strategies we are employing now to address these issues. We are producing very detailed quarterly reports that we provide to the Board of Trustees where we analyze what the changes are from year to year in then number of faculty by race and ethnic group and by gender. We use the affirmative action plans that are developed on the campuses where they track the number of faculty that are hired, and those that leave the institution, and we deal with understanding the underutilization, and what we mean by that is what is the market availability of let's say Latino faculty in the field of anthropology. And then we look at what the numbers are at CUNY, and if those numbers fall short of the market availability for anthropologists among Latino, Hispanic or African-American anthropologists then that unit is said to be underutilized. What we are doing now is that we are asking the department at the department level on each campus when they are conducting a search they must assess whether or not they are underutilized, and if

they are underutilized in a particular field, then they have to submit a plan of action when they conduct a search as to what plan of action they will take to address that underutilization. How they're going to engage in recruitment practices, how they might change their search process, and what are the specific areas in which they are going to engage in recruitment, and even educating the search committee itself to improve outcomes. And so, we are now tracking that information. We receive those plans in the fall from all of those departments that are experiencing underutilization for any race and ethnic group, and for gender, and we are at—and we received that data, and now on March 15th, we are poised to receive a new data set so that we get some understanding of the search process and whether the things that they said they were going to do that were in their plans they carried out. So, that by the time May and June rolls around, if a hire was made, we're in a better position to understand the hiring process and the outcome.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's sounds great. Okay, but those are just words, and there has not been any demonstrated results over five years. It

was in your Master Plan. It as the Master Plan, the first time that I was here. Now, it's called Connected CUNY, but the results are not matching what you say is your intent. What kind of incentives then? Sometimes people need some incentives. What kind of incentives can we give these departments which I'm beginning to think is just a continuation of the old boy network and, you know, the--the white man club that exists. So, what kind of incentives can we give or what kinds of consequences can there be when they go: Oh, we tried, but we just didn't do it. No, you know, the city's got goals for MWBEs and we have incentives and make sure that those goals are met. What can CUNY do? Because in five years, it hasn't changed.

DEAN TORRES: As it stands right now we are working very hard to understand the metrics, and over the past year some of what we're doing did occur.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] But when we have all these plans and metrics and we don't get the results, what difference does it make?

DEAN TORRES: So--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] It's fine that it's on paper.

DEAN TORRES: So, some improvement did occur. Over this past year we had—we have a small number of hires. So, we had 311 hires over the past year, and out of those hires over 40% of those hires were of people of color. So, we have—we are making that kind of concerted effort, and I agree with you it's not enough, but coupled with this expectation of reporting and of understanding the search process, it will also allow us to develop some leverage when it comes to performance management tools to one—to speak to the President and to the Provost and even all the way at the level of the department about what the challenges they're experiencing, and what the outcomes are, and how they might improve those outcomes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I thank you for your testimony, and I would love to have those reports so we can look at them, and perhaps we can't sit down—perhaps we can sit down and see what some of our committee members can do to—to get results rather than just have it on paper that this is what we want to do, and we're not seeing that. And I would also

2 like to know—I'd also like to know in what areas
3 those hires were—were made. Okay.

4 DEAN TORRES: I will be please to provide
5 you--

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Okay.

7 DEAN TORRES: --with those reports.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Council Member Cumbo
9 has a question.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I really want to
11 echo the sentiments of Chair Barron because we have
12 been a part of this committee now for five years, and
13 for us we understand the metrics and we understand
14 that the numbers have not moved. It would be in
15 terms of something that you are doing. I don't feel
16 that everything has been exhausted. So, for example,
17 we're the Black, Latino and Asian Caucus of the City
18 Council. So, at the very least I would even start
19 there. We have positions open in these particular
20 fields of interest. Can you all make recommendations
21 or can we come to your districts and to do
22 recruitment there? Can we advertise in culturally
23 specific advertisements in newspapers and—and those
24 sorts of things in order to get the word out? I've
25 actually been—although the numbers haven't moved

significantly, but with the FDNY you hear, you know, the advertisements everywhere in terms of the fact that there is this particular campaign. So, for us, we're just hearing the numbers every year, but I think that it would be more empowering if you would engage everyone and to cast your net far and wide to say this is something that's really important to us. We're asking for help and support and assistance. We want to work with the BLAC on the city level, on the state level, the Black Congressional Caucus, all of these different bodies. There are so many different, you know, sororities and fraternities. There are so many different programs that you could really tap into, and I-I feel that that talent pool exists, but it just simply has not been. Are you also recruiting even from some of our HBCUs as far as student population? Of course, we want everyone to come from CUNY, but there are also opportunities for that type of recruitment from our historically black colleges and universities, which might mean that travel budgets are allocated or professional departments where they do hiring, and that sort of thing, and - and students can come to find out what jobs are available to them upon graduation. That should-it-

it—I just can't believe that—I just can't believe that the talent doesn't exist, but what I can believe is that the recruitment efforts have not been sufficient.

DEAN TORRES: So, we—we would appreciate that opportunity to partner with you. The recruitment process at CUNY is quite extensive. We do work with direct employers in order to provide information statewide and also nationally to the jobs that are available. And we also do have resources within the central office to support faculty and Chairs of search committees to go to conferences, and also to develop partnerships and relationships with predominantly Hispanic serving institutions as well as HBCUs. And in some of the recruitment plans that have been submitted by the department to the central office they are taking advantage of those opportunities and working with the HSIs and HBCUs to enhance their recruitment effort.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: And I just want to add also I know Chair Barron, you—you've had—held hearings on this—on this topic over the years, and we know that—that—that you and the rest of this committee is going to hold us accountable on this

issue. I just want to add from the university and the administration's perspective, and just give you the assurance that our board is holding us accountable on this issues, too, and our board is—we've had several board committee meetings where they've been asking for more data on this, asking to see progress, as you pointed out. So, again, I just want to give that assurance that our board—this is a very, very important issue for our board and they're holding us accountable, and we're going to continue to work on it.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Well, I'd like to add something. As somebody who's—who has served on the Appointments Committee of my department for 30 years, there was always a frustration and it—it spanned over several administrations. Many times I felt, and this is—this is my perception that the administration was more interested in going outside of the—of the college to recruit, and not within, and we had very, very competent black adjunct faculty that were put forward, and were not selected. The adjunct—there's a tremendous resource in adjuncts, and—and in our department we had over a 100–150 adjuncts and maybe 30, not even 30 full-time faculty.

You had a tremendous resource. We knew the faculty, the adjunct faculty. We knew their track record, and yet I think the--the administration needs to look at that as a possible resource and--and to level the playing here to--and--and it was very frustrating being on the Appointments Committee putting competent candidates forward and as it--as--and we knew over maybe a ten-year period that they were great in the classroom and their phenomenal expertise, and yet, they weren't selected. And they'd rather go outside to Montana and--and recruit somebody, and many times that didn't work out because they couldn't make it in New York City. They couldn't afford the rent, and we would lose them. Sometimes we'd lose the candidate. So, I think look within sometimes and the adjunct, tremendous adjunct faculty in many departments throughout the university. So, I would suggest that as--as--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]

Yeah, it's--

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --and in addressing Chair Barron's remarks.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you Council Member Holden. It's a very fair point. The

University has done—over the years we have done a few rounds of adjunct to lecture conversions. I the last agreement with the Professional Staff Congress there was also part of that agreement was to convert adjuncts to lecturers as well, and so we're very open to having that discussion. So, it's—it's a good point and I—I'm grateful to you for raising it.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: We want to thank you for coming, for your testimony. We've got many, many, many, many more questions, but we'll submit in writing.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Okay.

COMMISSIONER GARCIA: You've been here for several hours, and we do want to thank you for your testimony.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, and at this time we'll move to the next panel, and we appreciate your patience, but I think, as you can see, it's very important for us to get these questions out so that we can look to see how we can make improvements because this is unacceptable. CUNY is doing great work in other areas, and I appreciate

that and, you know, I'm a proud alum from Hunter, and we want to make sure that continue to do great work. So, at this time I'm going to call the next panel. That will be Barbara from PSC; Sharon Persinger from PSC; Meg Findley—it might not be Findley from-- [background comments] Peely, Feeley-F-E-E-L-E-Y, Feeley from PSC, and we're also going to ask Levi Castle from NYPIRG to join this panel because this is the last panel. [background comments, pause] And we are so appreciative that you stayed for hours and hours to be able to bring your testimony, and we'll ask you if we could start. Yes you may begin. Just give us your name, and you may give us your testimony.

BARBARA BOWEN: We are also very appreciative of your being here and staying. I'm Barbara Bowen. I'm President of the Professional Staff Congress, CUNY.

SHARON PERSINGER: And I'm Sharon Persinger. I'm the Treasurer of the Professional staff at CUNY, and I'm on the faculty at Bronx Community College

MEG FEELEY: My name is Meg Feeley, and I'm an Adjunct Lecturer in the Department of English

at Kingsborough Community College, and I'm the Adjunct Liaison for the Union at Kingsborough.

LEVI CASTLE: Hi, my name is Levi Castle. I'm a sophomore at Queens College and also a board representative for the New York Public Interest Research Group.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Barbara, would you like to begin?

BARBARA BOWEN: Yes, thank you very much. Oh, did we do our swearing in?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You don't have to.

BARBARA BOWEN: Oh, okay.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

BARBARA BOWEN: Oh, alright. I'm very grateful for the opportunity to be here, very grateful as always, Council member Barron for your seriousness and conscientiousness about this committee, very pleased to meet one of our former professors at CUNY from City Tech. It's good to have you here. Before I start my formal remarks, I just want to say one thing about the discussion you had in the last panel. What—what wasn't mentioned was that CUNY is not hiring full-time faculty at the rate at which they should, and yes it's great that 44% of the

most recent group of hires are people of color, but there should have been 2,000 people hired last year, not 300. If we had 44% of that group, then you would see a big demographic change in the faculty overall, and why isn't CUNY hiring? Because CUNY is underfunded, and the other piece of that that goes to funding is that a major issue with every single faculty member of color we've tried to recruit and my department has been extremely successful is the heavy teaching load and the relatively low salaries. So, when we talk about money, I'm not saying that that there—that is the only issues, because there are also other issues that have a terrible and long history, but we've got to look at the dearth of hiring, and the high teaching loads and low salaries. It's very difficult sometimes because other places can offer much more to—to prospective faculty. So, I do want to say in—in starting that we are pleased that the city has maintained by a pretty—a pretty continuing budget for CUNY. They've continued their commitment and that the Mayor has continued a commitment to adding to CUNY's budget. That's important as you know after years when there was subtraction. To have adding is important. The Mayor has increased funding

for STEM programs. He has committed to expanding ASAP with \$18.6 million committed last year. Those are very good things to talk about. They are specific programs, and what we are going to talk to you about are things that reach overall throughout CUNY. You've heard earlier from the CUNY management folks the administration about CUNY's really unmatched record in the entire country in helping students to move from the lowest quintile of income to the highest or to the middle-class. CUNY is unmatched in the country. Among the community colleges that were ranked by a national study coming out of Harvard and Stanford of the effective college on income compared to the parents' IRS returns of the two-year public colleges, the top ten, five of them are CUNY Community Colleges. We have only seven and one is very small, Guttman. So, the--the rankings of CUNY are extraordinary, but and--and we see that with that there are literally tens of thousands of people whose lives are changed, and in a city that continues to talk in this administration [bell] and certainly your leadership has been so focused on opportunity, CUNY provides and unrivaled opportunity. What's mission, however, is the funding to allow all the students of

CUNY to have that opportunity, and we have seen the consistent underfunding especially at the state level, but also at the city and that means that here's this engine that could and does do fabulous things for students, and yet there are tens and tens of thousands of students who are not graduating, who are not reaching their own goals. You know, our graduation rates are 6% after two years from the community colleges, 18% after three years. The—the national average is not great either. It's 22%. The largest factor in that is poverty. The students coming out of poverty. That is the biggest stressor of all, but a second factor is the lack of resources when they get to CUNY. We should be doing everything to make up for that so our graduation rate can be 95%. Imagine the difference CUNY would be making in this city, and we have—what's—what's difficult for us is that to—to wrap our heads around is that in a city where people are constantly talking about needing to find solutions to the problems of the city, let's find solutions. Let's study. CUNY already has that solution worked out. It's already demonstrated that CUNY can transform lives one at a time, and families at a time because you know better than I do that it's

not just the individual, it's the whole family, and the whole community that that's with you in the classroom. So, we had something that is already proven to work, and yet there's not the investment to make sure it does work. So, we really want to call on the Council, and you have been a total champion on this to work with us in the time when the city does have some money to increase the funding for CUNY. CUNY itself the CUNY Colleges need \$87.7 million more in total funding. That includes almost \$50 million [bell] whoops—in mandatory costs, which includes costs for inflation and also collective bargaining. We heard Matt Sapienza earlier talk about our collective bargaining agreement. You know about it, Council Member Holden, and it was approved by the city, but it's not fully funded. We've got to have—that's a basic cost of doing business. It should be in the budget. There is—also we do support CUNY in their request that the amount that the city puts in for the Associate Degree Programs that are located in the four-year schools that that be increased by the level of inflation. It hasn't changed for 20 years, and we believe that that should be increased just to keep up with inflation. We also call for closing the

tap gap, and we can talk about that further if you'd like. I just want to talk about a couple of other things because I know you've been here a long time, and my colleagues want to speak. CUNY is also calling for \$34 million to invest in student success. There are proven things that help students to succeed. It's not a mystery. It's really not a mystery. It's just a question of whether it's done or not. This past fall or winter actually, we reached a very important agreement with CUNY management to restructure the teaching load for the full-time faculty so that there would be more time to spend with individual students and less time just churning from class to class. Our-but that-and that changes the number of courses, and you listen to us when we-you did a wonderful hearing, and our members testified. You've heard us on that. I remember, and the city said to us, the Mayor's Office, get an agreement on paper, and then we'll talk about funding it. We got the agreement much sooner than we thought, and in order to implement it properly, it needs to be funded, and what we are calling for every course that is not going to be taught by a current full-time faculty member. Those courses should

amalgamated, put together, and they should be reason to hire new full-time faculty not just to increase the exploitation adjuncts because the whole point was to create more time the individual faculty, and we see funding this new initiative as an opportunity to increase diversity of faculty. It's not huge numbers, but it could be big CUNY overall. It could be a thousand CUNY wide to increase diversity and move adjuncts into full-time positions. And then the last thing I'll mention before my colleagues speak is about adjunct faculty, and--and Meg is an adjunct. We heard--heard you speak about it, and Council Member Holden, you mentioned that. What has happened over the last couple of--Well, since, let's say since 2000, CUNY's total student population has grown by 45%. That's the equivalent of adding Baruch and Hunter, but the funding for CUNY especially from the state side did not increase, did not keep up with the increase in student population or inflation. So, what did CUNY do? More and more students coming in, less and less money per student. What they did is cut their costs of instruction, the basic cost by filling the classrooms with underpaid adjuncts. So, now we have about 7,500 full-time faculty, and nearly

15,000 underpaid adjuncts. That is a crazy way to run a university. To pay adjuncts as low as they do means that adjuncts have to run from job to the next to the next because they—they can't be there. They have—I talked to an adjunct this morning, who is working five jobs. How much time can she give to her students? And she's a brilliant teacher. How much time can she give? So, one of the chief things we are looking for is the Council's support and help as we seek in collective bargaining to increase adjunct pay so it's at a fair level, and so that it's a dignified wage. There is something very wrong about an institutions that famous for moving its students into the middle-class and meanwhile it's moving its faculty into lower—into poverty, and I just said into poverty. There is something weird there, and I think the Council can play an important role in calling attention to that, and helping us to fix it. So, we asked you to work—this is an opportunity year because there is some city funding that's there. The city is not in a deficit mode—to take this opportunity this year to make sure that the city, that it's a priority for new Speaker. I mean that's really what it comes down to, a priority for the new Speaker to make those

basic investments in mandatory costs and in things we know allow student so succeed so CUNY can reach the potential that it has and--and be the--be the force and the resource for this city that it should be. So, we know we have counted on you in the past, and you have come through for us. So, we thank you for that, and look forward to your comments and questions. Thank you.

SHARON PERSINGER: Well, thank you again for giving us the opportunity to speak here, Chairperson Barron and Council Member Holden. I appreciate that you're--that you're listening to us carefully and thanks to the people in the audience for not leaving. I've spent the last week and a half, you know, talking to the legis--to legislators in the state about this. So, and I've been rattling off numbers to folks because that's kind of the way I operate, but I sort of really want to--to talk about some of the things that CUNY students need. I know that the CUNY management made a request for an additional \$34 million and it was labeled as to invest in students' success and on time graduation. So, that led me to start thinking about what CUNY students--what I think CUNY students need to succeed,

and I've taught at the Community College so I really know community college students better. Just some statistics about CUNY students. Sixty percent of them have family incomes less than \$30,000; 45% of them are the first generation in their--in their family to go to college; 77% of them are people of color; 57% receive TAP; 36% are immigrants. If you ask anybody who teaches CUNY students, they'll say well, some of my students are part time, some of my students are full time. Maybe they, some of them even take 18 hours--18 credits of classes in a semester, but almost all of them work in addition to going to school. Some of them work full time in addition to going to school full time. They care for children. They care for their siblings sometimes. They--sometimes they have parents who are ill or grandparents that they're responsible for. Some of them have emigrated to New York City alone without anybody else in their family coming. Some of them are homeless. So, I think what is--what do they need to succeed? Well, I'm a teaching faculty and so I would say--I'd like to say yes we--they should taught--be taught entirely by full-time faculty, but I think actually the--the thing that with that population it

seems to me the thing that would make the most impact is that they really need student support services in a thorough way that the university is just not currently providing. They need full-time advisors and counselors. We know that that—how effective that would be because that's the thing that the ASAP program, which triples the community college graduation rate, that's the thing one of the things the ASAP program provides. There are counselors assigned to a student and they're supposed to meet with that—so to meet with that counselor regularly [bell] monthly. Sometimes more frequent. That counselor is—they officially call this model intrusive advising, which means that that person is there to assist the student in navigating college to get on their case, you know, if they're not doing well. To see that they take advantage of tubing (sic) facilities, writing lab, math lab if they need that to see that they are connected to psychological services or social services if that's what they need. I think that all community colleges just about need—all community college students need support like that. I know I would have benefitted from support like that. Here's the issue. In ASAP, the ratio,

the number of students per counselor runs around—it's supposed to be around 60 students to 80 maybe to 100 students. Outside of ASAP the ratio is 600 students to one counselor. Maybe even as much as 1,500 students to one counselor. So, that means that CUNY needs ten times as many counselors. You know, that's one of the things that this additional money to invest in student success and on-time graduation could be used for. I know that there are a lot of other things that we could say it could be used for because it's—it's all the—the legacy of the underfunding of the institution. But this kind of money is what's really needed I think to get CUNY students to succeed.

MEG FEELEY: [off mic] Thank you very much. [on mic] I'm turning it on, yes. Hi, thank you so much and I'm so honored to be here in a house of the people and speak. I just taught my second day of the semester and I'm kind of—I wish I could tell you what it's like to be in a classroom with students who are bursting to tell you that they've been thinking about the assignment from day one. It's just—it's an exciting job I have and I love my job as do most adjuncts that I know. But the problem with

the adjunctification is that it's a race to the bottom, and what we're seeing and to piggyback on what Sharon said what we're seeing at Kingsborough as the Adjunct Liaison I've become aware that we have 200 people working at Kingsborough now who are part-time and they're non-teaching adjuncts. They're using a line that we have to pay for meeting attendance and they're using it, the administration is using it to pay advisors, people who are advising veterans and disabled people, and people of all kinds, freshmen, you know, transfer students and what have you. And they're working on the non-teaching adjunct line, and they're—they have a maximum of 225 hours per semester. They work two or three days a week. Last fall they were laid off because there wasn't enough work. This is adjunctification, and what we're seeing now is a replication of what happened with my predecessors and with me as first teaching adjuncts are concerned. So, because of our activism, and because of our union, we've gained benefits, but many of those benefits are not in the contract for non-teaching adjuncts, and it just becomes a race to the bottom. Same thing with continuing ed teachers. If you tell a family of four

that they can have \$200 a month to eat on, they'll do it okay for a month, but after that two months how long will they be able to live like that? That's what is happening in CUNY. That is what is happening at Kingsborough. It's happening every day. I haven't really gotten and effective raise in years, and I know that the price of--of things is going up. I don't want to talk about how I make or anything like that, but I do want to say that I know that for some people this is a question of ethics, and I asked Bill Thompson--I sever on the University Faculty Senate as an Adjunct Representative for my college--and I asked Bill Thompson, the Chair of the Board of Trustees if it kept him up at night that he was basically balancing the budget of CUNY on the backs of 15,000 adjuncts, and he said yes it bothered him. It was ethically problematic he said. But I don't know how to solve the problem, he said. And I want to say that I am very grateful that I think our union has some answers really. I mean we get together. We are the university. [bell] We're just talking shop all the time, and we do have some answers, and, you know, it's--from Albany I have a button here it says #Bring the Money. Okay, it's really that pedestrian

and boring, but our students deserve Harvard. Out students deserve the best money can buy, and if that's possible in this great city that's what we have to give them, and I want to bring to them. I don't want to make a fortune. I'd be happy if I could make \$45,000 a year. That would make me very happy. That's what we're really asking for to do the same work. I don't want to teach more than two classes a semester. I like being able to give my students the time I can, but I can't really live on that either. So, that's what we're asking for, but our union always asks first for CUNY and second for ourselves, and that's what we do, and I'm—that's what we're here for today is asking for our students. Thank you.

LEVI CASTLE: So good afternoon and on behalf of NYPIRG and myself, I'd like to say thank you for allowing us to give you our testimony. In and increasingly economically divided and high cost city degree completion is vital. The key to improving degree completion is improving access to programs that have a steady track record of success and the increasing graduation rates among—among the students most at risk of dropping out. Students who

are enrolled in ASAP graduate—oh, I'm sorry.

Students enrolled in ASAP graduate at more than

double the rate of on-ASAP students. ASAP, SEEK and

College Discovery offer many benefits that are

necessary to the students, and to our city and they

should not only be protected but expanded. Malinda

(sic) from the community, oh, sorry from Queens

Community College ASAP wants to share a bit of her

story. I love the program. We have much better

tutors than the rest of the school, which is so

important for my math studies. So, increasing

support to opportunity programs will help the city

meet job growth needs across all income levels.

NYPIRG urges the City Council to protect and increase

funding. We have noticed that too many students are

unaware of the programs like ASAP until it is too

late to enroll. Tyrell, a former student at Bronx

Community College, who had dropped out, shared: I

found out about ASAP too late, but if I had known

about it, I would have applied to it for the tutoring

to bring my grades up. And then, he also pointed

out: Textbooks were the biggest cost. I couldn't

keep up with my studies because I couldn't afford the

materials, and this is when I was receiving TAP and

PAL. PAL helped for some, but I also had to pay for all of my living expenses. It's way too much.

NYPIRG urges the City Council to work with CUNY and NYC Chancellor and the Board of Regents to ensure more eligible students have knowledge of—knowledge and access to opportunity programs like ASAP and to create a citywide strategy for raising awareness of true college costs while supporting opportunity programs, which address such expenses. Alexis at the Borough of Manhattan Community College, student and mother, shared: Between textbooks, Metro Cards and paying for diapers and food for my son, I often can't afford to buy food for myself. I would like to make a special note on this issue. It's call food insecurity among CUNY college students and myself and a victim of this growing trend among college students. I, honestly, I'll raise my right hand on this. I haven't eaten since Monday morning, that's not because I've been too busy or because I didn't have time to have a meal, it's because due to high costs to—from Metro Cards to textbooks to the high cost of rent here in the city to my bills, I just simply have to ration out how often I can eat because I simply cannot afford it. Because the money that

would go to food has to go to my Metro Card in order to get to the classes that I need to take in hopes for a better income in the future where I won't have to feel [bell] food insecurity or anyone else. So, we urge the City Council to provide resources that reduce and eliminate college student food and housing insecurity as well as expansion of single stop offices at all CUNY campuses. Without support from the city or state, CUNY Community Colleges will be raising tuition \$100 this year. This will be an unfair burden placed on New Yorkers who often don't receive aid due to their immigration status, or inability to commit to full-time courses loads. Currently, one-third of CUNY's Community College students attend part-time. We urge the City Council to ensure that students and families are protected from the burden of a tuition increase a Community-Community-sorry, CUNY Community Colleges and senior colleges. NYPIRG urges the City Council to expand city programs to support undocumented students particularly programs that undocumented students benefit from such as ASAP and Citizenship Now. In conclusion, programs and initiatives that have proven to work must be expanded. Any investment in higher

education will have a net positive impact on the city. We appreciate your continued support and thank you, and I'd also like to note that the adjunct issue is not only an issue for these workers, but also the students. Me personally, this semester my adjunct professor for my astronomy class every second class of the week he has to leave from 10 to 20 minutes early just because he has to make another job at another university, and that is not the professor's fault. That is CUNY Central's issue, and that is also the issue of the state for underfunding CUNY for so long. So, thank you for your time.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I want to thank the panel for your testimony. It's very practical, very direct, very hands-on, and I appreciate it. I do have a couple of questions. [pause] Eli-Levi, what school do you attend?

LEVI CASTLE: I go to Queens College. I'm a sophomore there.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You go to Queens College. What kind of assistance does Queens College have for students such as yourself in terms of food—a food pantry or--?

LEVI CASTLE: So, actually in the past year starting last spring, NYPIRG the organization that I'm a board representative for along with several other clubs on campuses have organized a food pantry. So, right now we are collecting food, and it is available to students, but it's not nearly enough for the high demand because--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] So, it's something that students initiated? Is that something--?

LEVI CASTLE: [interposing] Yes, something that the students initiated. Although, I am aware that on other campuses it's a different situation. The administration has also initiated it. For a lot of campuses students are the ones who bring this up, and organize to help other students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thank you, and I'll talk to you afterwards. We'll talk for--and to-- to the question of non-teaching adjuncts, what would be the title or what would be the position that you would have if you were an adjunct? What would be the series of titles that you would fulfill?

MEG FEELEY: So, my observation is that most non-teaching adjuncts are working under the

direct supervision of people in the HEO line, or the Higher Education Officer line. So, they--and I have heard that there's been a freeze on hiring in--HEOs at Kingsborough, but there has been instead this rise of non-teaching adjuncts to fill those positions.

BARBARA BOWEN: If I could just add.

CUNY has a considerable number of people who are adjunct meaning, you know, in a sense part-time--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Yes.

BARBARA BOWEN: --and some of them are really full-time, part-time, but--and as Meg said, in the non-teaching category since most are teaching, the other is non-teaching. Some work in libraries. Some might be fully qualified as a librarian, but be a fill-in for somebody who is on parental leave or some other kind of leave. There are quite a few in libraries. Those are the steadier and better paid ones, but they're what Meg was talking about I think that's very important is using non-teaching adjuncts as advisors. I mean Sharon talked about the crisis--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Uh-hm right.

BARBARA BOWEN: --in the number of advisors. The solution is not to replicate the whole

2 system of underpaid part-timers to do the job. The
3 solution is to get the funding in so that people who
4 are fully trained and fully and a lot of the part-
5 timers are fully trained for the job. They just
6 can't get the full-time job.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-hm.

8 BARBARA BOWEN: So, the concern that we
9 have is that we're seeing the trend of replacing
10 teaching faculty with part-time teaching faculty at a
11 third or less of the pay, now being replicated with
12 other kinds of staff same problem with the pay.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Council Member
14 Holden, do you have any questions.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Oh, yeah.
16 [laughs] I want to thank Barbara Bowen for your
17 leadership in PSC CUNY. It's been amazing for what
18 you've done. In the--in the years that you've been
19 president of the union, you've advanced CUNY, you've
20 advanced the union, you've advanced the faculty
21 certainly. A tremendous job. I want to thank you
22 for all you've done, and--but there's a lot more work
23 to be done, and--and you've said it today. There's--I
24 have a lot of, you know, big--I have a lot of comments
25 because the question is CUNY hasn't invested in the

1 faculty. Like I mentioned before, the full-time
2 faculty continues to drop. Actually, in-in my
3 department over the years we would see people retire.
4 We would see actually faculty recruited from the
5 department to work in the administration, and give
6 them release time, which was a big problem within
7 the-in the departments. So, they would take-the dean
8 would take some faculty and give them full release
9 and they would still have a lot on the faculty, but
10 they weren't in the classrooms, and I just couldn't
11 understand that. Why not just recruit from outside,
12 get your-your HEOs or get-get other deans and so
13 forth, assistance to work, get them from the outside.
14 Leave-let the faculty mentor the students. So, my
15 department had gone from 18, like I mentioned before,
16 18 full-time, and way over a hundred. I forget the
17 number of adjuncts. That didn't make any sense. You
18 have many adjuncts stressed out. They're running
19 from the school to school. They-they were going and
20 teaching a Queensborough. They were going out to
21 Long Island teaching at-and Nassau, and they were
22 working let's say in Manhattan at another CUNY
23 campus. It was an impossible schedule. They're
24 exhausted. They-and they're terrific faculty. We
25

just couldn't hire them. There were not enough lines that particular year. They would never invest in the full-time faculty. I just don't get it. They—we invest so much in capital. So much in the expense budgets. The biggest investment has to be made in the faculty in full-time faculty and, you know, there was a time that they target faculty—full-time faculty student ratio. I don't know what it is now. It was never where it should be. Now, just to give you an example. We have students, and I had DACA students, undocumented students who came to me and I—a few of them I would talk to, and I said, you know, you're a very good designer. I told a communications designer, you're a very good designer. How come you can't—how come you're not really doing your work like you should? She goes, well, when I go home I can only sleep because there's another family coming in. So, once we sleep we have to get out, and we don't—I don't have a place where I can work. So, I—I gave my office some students who I said that you can stay in. I might get in trouble for this, but I said you can stay in until the security guard finds you at 3:00 in the morning or whatever it is, but just be quiet and work on the computers, and you can do it, and I—many

of the faculty we would also buy students books because they couldn't afford it and, you know, you feel wait a minute. This is a very good designer, a very good student. I can go and--and buy on Amazon or ebay for a fraction of the cost let me just and I sent the books right to their homes, and it works. But you need full-time faculty to mentor the students because they have the deck stacked against them. Like I said before, they have a very difficult situation not only in the college, but in life, and we owe it to the students to give them. I mean it's just a--it's not really a large investment. It's full-time faculty versus adjunct I think in the long run, and I don't know why the university continues with this adjunct trend, which many of the private colleges are doing, which is wrong and--but they're getting huge obviously they--they have a lot of money coming in. Their tuitions are way out--out of whack, the private institutions. So, we owe it to CUNY to really fight for it, and I want to thank you for fighting for the full-time faculty, and we don't have enough. We never did, by the way. But I--I want to thank you again for all the work you're doing.

BARBARA BOWEN: Well, thank you. It's really a privilege to be able to do it. I feel that every single day. I do feel that, and I agree with you and it's very, very good to have your voice on the Council. I mean I think that will be a very good thing. In terms of the ratio, I think you're absolutely right putting your finger on the ratio. The last time I looked at it, it was about 1 to 35 at CUNY. It was 1 to 8 at my college when I went to college, 1 to 8. It tells the whole story, right. How much time? They have four times more time to spend with each student and a smaller teaching load, and I mean the--what you just described is extraordinary to send books to students' homes and, you know, you're right. They do have the deck stacked against them. As Meg said, we should then be giving them Harvard not meet--not meeting them with more poverty conditions when they get to college. They've already succeeded when they get to colleges. Then to throw at them hardship conditions and not support them to me is a real act of oppression against the students, and there are things we can do. I agree with you, and it's very important to raise them and to--to try to make sure that the Council can

continue to be a voice to say we just have to do that basic investment and then students will do better. I mean we've heard it from everybody especially Levi here today. So, thank you very much. I'm—I'm really glad you're speaking up about it.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I want to thank the panel for coming and for sharing your testimony. We appreciate it, and yes, the problem is that there's a been a lack of funding from the State and also from the city, but mainly from the state to be sure that we can provide the education and provide all of the amenities that go with that, and CUNY's revenues now depend—I think it's 54% on tuition, and that's why they keep raising tuition each year they call it. They started out calling it rational, and they had to—we go so much pushback, they had to jump and change it to predictable. But it's an obligation of a society to educate its population, and CUNY is subjected to that lack of funding from the state. So, we've got to mobilize the forces, the partners that we have certainly in Albany, but we know that the governor talks at education, but does not put the funding in to support what it is that he says he understands to be important, and yes, he did do the

Excelsior Scholarship, which is, in fact, in my opinion a factor that contributes to the gap that exists between blacks and whites in terms of students being on campus because we didn't have the question posed to CUNY, but we do want to find out how many students in CUNY were able to get any type of support from the Excelsior scholarship, which we know is the last dollar in, and we know that the money in the main that's coming in through the Excelsior Scholarship is supporting those families at \$100,000, and we know that in the main those are not black or Latino families. So, the people who are benefitting from the Excelsior Scholarship are, in fact, generally not black, not Latino. So, that influx of the population that's coming is, in fact, increasing that gap that exists, but we do want to thank you so much, and we're going to continue to battle and struggle and work collectively and collaboratively to improve what it is that we know CUNY is capable of doing. Thank you.

BARBARA BOWEN: Thank you all very much.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, and with that, seeing no further testimony, we are adjourned. Thank you so much. [gavel]

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

131

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 26, 2018