CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME USES

----- X

January 23, 2018 Start: 11:23 a.m. Recess: 11:49 a.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm, 16<sup>th</sup> Fl.

B E F O R E: ADRIENNE E. ADAMS

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

INEZ D. BARRON PETER A. KOO

I. DANEEK MILLER

MARK TREYGER

#### A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Kate Lemos McHale Director of Research at the New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission

Ali Rasoulinejad Director of Community and Intergovernmental Affairs at the New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission

Virginia Giovinco Owner and Taxpayer of Peter P. Huberty House

Paul Giovinco Cousin of Owner and Taxpayer of Peter P. Huberty House

# MARITIME USES

3

[gavel]

1

3	CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Good morning and
4	welcome to the first meeting of the Subcommittee on
5	Landmarks, Public Siting and Maritime Uses of this,
6	the $11^{ m th}$ session of the New York City Council. I'm
7	Council Member Adrienne Adams, the Chair of this
8	subcommittee. We're joined today by the former chair
9	of this subcommittee, Council Member Peter Koo and
10	Council Member Inez Barron. Today we will hold a
11	hearing on a single item, LU-7, the designation by
12	Landmarks Preservation Commission of the Peter P. and
13	Rosa M. Huberty House located at 1019 Bushwick Avenue
14	as a historic landmark. The Peter P. and Rosa M.
15	Huberty House is a freestanding colonial revival home
16	made of brick, terracotta and galvanized iron. The
17	house was designed in 1900 by Ulrich Huberty who also
18	designed several other Brooklyn landmarks. The house
19	is located in the $34^{\text{th}}$ council district and at a June
20	25 <sup>th</sup> , 2013 hearing held by LPC representatives of
21	former Council Member Diana Reyna spoke in support of
22	this designation. The current Council Member, Antonio
23	Reynoso has also expressed his support for this
24	designation. Our Speakers today are Ali Rasoulinejad
25	and Kate Lemos McHale. Please raise your right hands,

3

4

6

24

25

do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee and in response to all council member

KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Thank you Chair Adams

questions? Thank you very much.

7 and good morning subcommittee members. My name is

8 Kate Lemos McHale, Director of Research at the New

9 York City Landmarks Preservation Commission, I'm

10 | joined by Ali Rasoulinejad and Erica Rothman. Thank

11 you for the opportunity to present the designation of

12 | the Peter P. and Rosa M. Huberty House. The

13 commission voted to designate this property on

14 October 24<sup>th</sup>, 2017, the building had originally been

15 calendared and heard in 2013. The commission has

16 received both written and verbal public testimony

17 | including support for designation from former Council

18 | Member Diana Reyna, current Council Member Antonio

19 Reynoso, the Historic District's Council and the New

20 York Landmarks Conservancy. The property owner, a

21 | family member and a community member supporting them

22 popposed designation at the public hearing. LPC has

23 | reached out to the owner a number of times and late

last year representatives of LPC and Council Member

Reynoso met with the owner and explained how the

1
Τ

commission staff can be a resource to owners
including providing technical guidance and
recommending appropriate methods and materials for
maintenance and restoration work. The, the Huberty
House was designed in 1900 by the notable Brooklyn
architect, Ulrich Huberty for his parents and is a
significant and intact example of the colonial
revival style of the early $20^{ ext{th}}$ century. It
contributed to the late 19 <sup>th</sup> and early 20 <sup>th</sup> century
development of Bushwick Avenue as one of Brooklyn's
prestigious residential districts and remains one of
the most extinguished examples of this historical
development. The landmark site on Bushwick Avenue is
shown here and includes the entire tax lot. The
commission has designated residential and
institutional buildings in this area of Bushwick
including the Catherine Lipsius, Doctor Frederick A.
Cook House at 670 Bushwick Avenue; the DeKalb Branch
of the Brooklyn Public Library and the Reformed
Church of South Bushwick. Like these buildings, the
Huberty House speaks to the rich history of
development in Bushwick. The Huberty House is notable
for its association with Peter P. Huberty, a German
born lawyer who became a prominent figure in Brooklyn

politics in the local community and his son Ulrich, 2 3 an important Brooklyn architect who designed the 4 house for his parents. Ulrich J. Huberty designed many fine residential, ecclesiastic, civil... civic and commercial buildings including the Prospect Park Boat 6 7 House and the Williamsburg Trust Company Building both designated individual landmarks. Working in the 8 colonial revival style, Huberty adapted Georgian and Federal precedence for his parent's house including 10 11 the symmetrical arrangement of the façade, the hipped roof dormers, red brick facades laid in Flemish bond 12 13 with grey brick coins and windows topped with splayed terracotta lintels. The striking main façade features 14 15 a semi-circular portico, an open veranda, an arched entrance and bay windows. Among other notable 16 17 features are the substantial cornice, the variety of 18 dormers and its ornate iron work. The house's 19 architectural details and craftmanship stand out as 20 particularly fine. Between 1909 and 1928, subsequent owners added four additions each carefully designed 21 to harmonize with the original design including an 2.2 2.3 entrance vestibule on the Northwest corner, which you can see on the left and extensions at the rear of the 24 25 house. The Peter P. and Rosa M. Huberty House is a

	SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC STITING AND
1	MARITIME USES 7
2	particularly fine intact example of the colonial
3	revival style, a significant early work by a
4	prominent Brooklyn architect and represents
5	Brooklyn's immigrant history and the early 20 <sup>th</sup>
6	century character of Bushwick Avenue when it was
7	lined with large freestanding homes. We request that
8	the city council uphold the designation, thank you.
9	CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you, before we
10	continue I'd like to acknowledge we've been joined b
11	Council Member Daneek Miller and Council Member Mark
12	Treyger. Were, were you going speak also Ali?
13	ALI RASOULINEJAD: That's all.
14	CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, thank you. Does
15	anyone have any questions?
16	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes.
17	CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Council Member
18	Barron.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madame
20	Chair and congratulations on your for this hearing
21	here. The opposition that was presented, what was th
22	foundation and what issues were cited by those who

KATE LEMOS MCHALE: The property owners have actually... it's been in the same family since the

opposed to this landmarking?

23

24

#### MARITIME USES

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

8

1930's and they feel they've taken very good care of this house and they didn't want an extra level of sort of regulation placed on them.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, the property as it exists has maintained all of these features that you've highlighted here and there has not been any significant change to the façade, is that correct?

KATE LEMOS MCHALE: That's correct, it's very intact, it's a very fine example of its style.

> COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Members, anymore... any further questions? Are there any members of the public who wish to testify today?

[off-mic dialogue]

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, we will dismiss this panel. Okay. And we will call on Doctor (8:18). Okay, good morning, will you please identify yourselves?

VIRGINIA GIOVINCO: Oh, is this better? My name is Virginia Giovinco and I am the owner and taxpayer of the quest... house in question here and I strongly oppose this designation. This house has been the home of the family, the same family since 1937

1	
2	and I have
3	can imagi:
4	paint job
5	the colon
6	condition
7	previous
8	outside a
9	pureness
10	agency ei
11	always st
12	believing
13	tell you
14	nobody co
15	getting m
16	a great s
17	very comf
18	now sudde:
19	but telli:
20	designate

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

e lived in it since the first grade, so you ne through the decades all the repairs and s that have been done always in keeping with ial style and maintaining it in good as you can see and expressed by the speakers. The old timer did not need an, an gency to tell them they should preserve the of this house and I don't need an outside ther. Now I grew up in the house which ressed private ownership, I was brought up that owning a house meant that nobody could what to do, you do what you wanted and uld ask you to move because somebody was arried and needed the property and there was ense of security and as a tax owner I felt ortable now knowing that it was my home and nly I get a notice in the mail not asking me ng me that the house was going to be d and it meant curtailing my control over the house, I would now need permission to make repairs, I found that quite shocking. I spoke to my contractor, the one who's done all this work for me and he said forget about him, he's not signing any papers and, and he... I'm afraid that contractors also ...

1	MARITIME USES 10
2	other contractors will have the same idea. As a
3	matter of fact, years ago… I know you have a list, I
4	have such a list here of people, 15 years ago I
5	consulted somebody on one of your lists and it was a.
6	it was a total disaster, so I really lost faith in
7	these lists. I don't want to live with this feeling
8	that, who do I call when something happens, do I have
9	to go through all the yellow pages, who will come
10	and and sign papers, it's a total burden on my, I,
11	just cannot live with that idea so, I, I strongly
12	oppose this designation for that moment that I don't
13	have control over my house. Thank you.
14	CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Did you wish to speak
15	also?
16	PAUL GIOVINCO: Sure.
17	
	CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay.
18	PAUL GIOVINCO: My, my, my say here is,
19	is more to ask [cross-talk]
20	CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Can you please
21	identify yourself?
22	PAUL GIOVINCO: I'm Doctor Paul Giovinco,
23	Virginia's cousin. Again, this house is was
24	purchased by our grandfather, my parents lived there

her parent's lived there, our father lived there... my

father lived there. Since I was born I made trip,
trips, trips to the house, visited the house, I lived
there during the times when my mother gave birth to
my brother and sister. So, it's deep in my in my
soul also. The neighborhood, we've seen the change,
we've seen it gone through many changes, we're very
proud of the house, we've maintained the house as
much as we can but being many, many years of age
there are many things that are falling apart and yes,
you know you're, you're giving us a designation but
you're not saying well we're going to compensate you
for that or we're going to help or you know the way
the the way the as you can see the fence, the, the
wrought iron fence there it, it needs in repair,
there's not there's very hard people to find, it's
very costly when they see this stuff. I'm not seeing
that the preservation site is you know we're going
to give you 50 percent of the price to maintain this
preserved or this house as a landmark. The roof, all
tile, you know we're not going to go ahead and throw
down some tar paper and some shingles and we're
going to maintain it the same way, but I don't see no
compensation or help so what is the landmark giving
us, giving my cousin, she's the owner of the house.

2	When I was little I remember going out on that
3	portico and watching parades down Bushwick Avenue, it
4	was a beautiful place, it was a beautiful place. Is
5	the preservation company is the preservation
6	commission land historic commission going to redo
7	the neighborhood so that we can be proud of it again?
8	How many can anybody lift their hands up
9	and say that they've walked down Bushwick Avenue or
10	drove… driven down Bushwick Avenue from Eastern
11	Parkway to Myrtle Avenue, anybody here? Okay, where
12	what are you seeing, we're seeing derelict cars on
13	front of grass where there used to be grass, where
14	there used to be beautiful statues in front of the
15	homes, we see derelict cars, we see broken down cars,
16	we see commercial vehicles, that's not that's not
17	showing preservation of the neighborhood, you know we
18	want to talk about one house but what about the
19	neighborhood, okay? And, and in conclusion, you know
20	we, we have one famous word that is this month come
21	up to everything, okay and, and the rest of the
22	neighborhood, yeah, we're looking beautiful but the
23	rest of the neighborhood is looking like that S-hole
24	and I'd like to see that change. That's all.

2

3

4

5

6

7

talk]

8

9

11

12

13

14

15

16

1718

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you both for being here today, thank you for your passionate testimony to this committee and to this audience, I thank you very much for being here.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Council... [cross-

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Yes sir, go right ahead, Council Member Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Please if you don't mind, I, I do have a question and I do actually have... I have driven down there, I lived a few blocks away during a, a, a period in my life and, and on the contrary if, if you drive Bushwick Avenue in the community you know that it is on the come up and that things are different certainly from what they were decades that past and that they are changing, continue to change but I think what... as stated here is whether or not and, and your cousin said that, how do you maintain the integrity of the home, obviously your family has been committed for generations to doing just that, it is absolutely beautiful, I, I know the house, go past there two or three times a week but there are other historical or potentially historical homes that are now co-ops and condos and I

think when you have something such a and
magnificent that you have there that you want to be
able to maintain that and, and the historical
background of that community and, and that's what
we're trying to do here in the midst of whatever
happens and things are happening in Bushwick for
sure, I don't think anyone would, would deny that
just pick up any real estate magazine but there is
certainly a, a point that, that you have there but I,
I don't think representing a historical community in
which a, a, a great portion of the homes have been
designated that I would say that it does not create
an unfair burden in terms of maintaining the property
in that experience. So, it, it may be a little
premature in, in saying so but definitely we want to
be supportive in, in whatever way in being able to
maintain this property as is and, and surely I would
hope that it is not that it is protected from
becoming one of the condos that we see in the
Bushwick area so, thank you and I had to be here so
forgive the attire and everything else but we are
here and congratulations and [cross-talk]
CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you [cross-

1	MARITIME USES 15
2	COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER:thank you very
3	much, have a great day.
4	CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much
5	[cross-talk]
6	COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you
7	[cross-talk]
8	CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Council Member
9	Miller. Committee members are there any other
10	questions? Are there… yes, Council Member Treyger.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you Chair
12	Adams and congratulations for, for, for and excellent
13	first, first hearing and the form the, the
14	former history teacher in me enjoys hearing about
15	these historic homes. I'm just… I have a question for
16	the… for the homeowner with regards to when did you
17	first learn about the interests of, of the city to
18	designate this as a landmark?
19	VIRGINIA GIOVINCO: I'd say about 20
20	years ago, 15 at least 15 to 20 years ago.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So, this has
22	been in the works for close to two decades, is that
23	correct?
24	VIRGINIA GIOVINCO: Yes, but I, I

resented it at that time too.

of both the, the interest to, to preserve a sense of

our city's history and at the same time being

24

the city's end to make sure that your rights are as crystal clear to you as possible and that if there are folks who are trained and skilled in this particular field of maintenance at reasonable costs that they come to your attention and I think that that's... this process should be a two-way street and again I, I thank the Chair for her time.

VIRGINIA GIOVINCO: Can I respond to that? May I respond to that?

VIRGINIA GIOVINCO:

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Yes, of course.

I... yes, the landmarks

does have a list of repairmen but, you know some of them are located in Mount Vernon, I mean faraway places, they're not going to come into Bushwick and it's a... it's a terrible sense of insecurity you have no idea, I've been through this very recently, who do I call and who will come and they... and they see me alone and I don't know, you know they'll charge anything they want, it's very insecure this... if somebody's going to dictate who I call, I have somebody very nice now who I can rely on, he's not going to want to sign papers, he has no time for that. Thank you.

1	MARITIME USES 19
2	CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: We will be happy to
3	facilitate a meeting with landmarks to help you with
4	that after this session, we would be more than happy
5	to… [cross-talk]
6	VIRGINIA GIOVINCO: One other point I'd
7	like… I don't… [cross-talk]
8	CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Yes.
9	VIRGINIA GIOVINCO:feel I have control
10	over my house, it no matter how small the
11	infringement is on my privacy or my control, I feel
12	it's, it's not mine anymore, it's, it's a terrible
13	feeling.
14	CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Council Member Koo?
15	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you Chair
16	Adams, Adams yeah. Virginia Giovinco you are the… you
17	are the only owner of the house or you have a your
18	whole family's the owner the owner?
19	VIRGINIA GIOVINCO: No, I am the owner of
20	the house.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Oh
22	VIRGINIA GIOVINCO: I'm the sole owner.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah, so how many
24	people live in the house now?

1	MARITIME USES 20
2	VIRGINIA GIOVINCO: Just me at the
3	moment.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Oh, so [cross-talk]
5	VIRGINIA GIOVINCO: Well we had the
6	family has dwindled down to just me.
7	PAUL GIOVINCO: And me
8	VIRGINIA GIOVINCO: And, and well he, he
9	spends a great deal of time and his children live in
LO	my house all the time.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So, why now can you
12	meet all the burdens on maintaining the house
L3	economically I mean like do you make enough money to
L4	pay all the bills
15	PAUL GIOVINCO: Within reason, yes.
L6	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah.
L7	VIRGINIA GIOVINCO: I've lived in it my
L8	whole life so that its nothing new to me.
L9	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah, because like,
20	like you said before I sympathize with your
21	situation, right, you're, you're the only owner of
22	the house and you're a senior citizen so you may not
23	like be able to afford extra burden to maintain the
24	house because once its landmarked, you know there are

all these different criteria to meet so, so you, you

1	
╛	L

suffer economically, we don't want to do it so, the...
maybe the... our committee has to hold on to these to...
we have to further study on this case, yeah. Miss
Chair Adams just thank you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah... [cross-talk]

PAUL GIOVINCO: Just, just, just to answer... [cross-talk]

PAUL GIOVINCO: ...that, we had a meeting with, with the gentleman who just spoke before with the landmarks about a month, a month and a half ago and they said, you know they have this list people who would want... but for them to start any project they're going to have to sign on and, and, and show the insurances and, and go through a whole bunch of paperwork before they will allow it to go, half of these people don't want to do that and that's the problem that we have. I live... I live out on Long Island in, in a... in a very Italian area of Glen Cove, I can get guys into to do the brickwork and the cement work and everything but they're not going to want to do the paperwork and they are master

mechanics, okay at their work, it would look better

than when it was built but again these are the

problems that we sit with, okay and she had some

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

cement work done and the job is off color, when... I'm not happy about it, it's shameful that it happened that way but again you, you, you're dealing with who, what, when and where so if you see the columns, all those flutings that are at the top you can't ... you, you can't find those, they're not ... you can't go to Home Depot and, and buy those, you don't go to Home Depot décor, you, you don't go anywhere, they have to be handmade, it's, it's a... it's a... it's a major project not that we're going to change it, we want to keep it that way, we're happy, we are proud of this piece of property and we're glad to see that other people want to make something even more proud but again the neighborhood and, and... let us, you know let us have the freedom to do it the way we're doing it and the way we're keeping going with it and, and as you say we haven't change, don't plan on changing for the next bunch of years.

VIRGINIA GIOVINCO: I, I'd like to add something to that, in talking about the columns the capitals on one of them was completely destroyed about two years ago and this man that I was telling you about, the contractor he searched the computer and he found a place in Oregon to, to replace those

MARTTIME USES	
MARTTIME USES	3

capitals, I didn't buy one, I bought enough for all
four or whatever so in case the others go I still
have some held in reserve because I know I'll never
get them again anywhere. So, I mean it takes a lot of
thought to own that and keep maintaining it and I
love it, I mean I have no problem doing it but let me
be free, let me it's my home, I'm not doing it for
somebody else.

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much for your testimony today.

PAUL GIOVINCO: You're welcome.

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: I will now... [cross-

talk]

PAUL GIOVINCO: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you. I will now close the public hearing on LU-7 and we will lay that matter over. I'd like to thank the members of the public, my colleagues, council and land use staff for attending today's hearing. This meeting is hereby adjourned.

[gavel]

## $C \ E \ R \ T \ I \ F \ I \ C \ A \ T \ E$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

January 24, 2018