

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS JOINTLY WITH THE  
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

----- X

November 27, 2017  
Start: 10:50 a.m.  
Recess: 1:34 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: I. DANEEK MILLER  
Chairperson

ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Mathieu Eugene  
Peter A. Koo  
Karen Koslowitz  
Carlos Menchaca  
Paul A. Vallone  
Bill Perkins  
Eric A. Ulrich  
Elizabeth S. Crowley  
Daniel Dromm  
Costa Constantinides

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Barbara Chang, Executive Director  
Mayor's Office of Office of Workforce Development

Jackie Mallon, Deputy Commissioner  
NYC Office of Small Business Services

Sterling Roberson, Vice President  
Career and Technical Education High Schools  
United Federation of Teachers, UFT

Christian Gonzalez Rivera, Senior Researcher  
Center for an Urban Future

Alex Gleason, Policy Associate  
NYC Central Labor Council, AFLCIO

Aaron Darsky, Government Affairs Director  
Consortium for Worker Education

Varun Sanyal, Vice President  
Economic Development  
Appearing for: Andrew Hoan, President & CEO  
Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce

Athena Hernandez, Director  
Workforce Development Program, Good Help  
Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce

Evelyn Ortiz, Chief External Affairs Officer  
Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow

Nelson Gonzalez, Director  
Adult Employment Programs  
Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow

Jesse Lehman, Director of Policy  
NYC Employment and Training Coalition

Annie Garneva, Director  
Communications and Member Services  
NYC Employment Training Coalition

Ariel Savansky, Advocacy and Policy Adviser  
UJA-Federation of New York

Keri Faulhaber, Vice President  
Partnership and Community Engagement  
Jobs First NYC

1 COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS JOINTLY WITH THE  
2 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

4

2 [sound check, pause] [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Good morning and  
4 thanks everyone for coming out, and I hope everyone  
5 had a happy Thanksgiving and remember that the thanks  
6 are in the giving, which is why we are all here today  
7 to make sure that we can continue to do that in a  
8 ways that is consistent with who we are here today.  
9 So, I'm Council Member I. Daneek Miller. I'm the  
10 Chair of the Committee on Civil Service and Labor,  
11 and I'd like to thank you all for being here, and we—  
12 I'd like to say that my Co-Chair of Small Business  
13 Council Member Robert had an emergency and will not  
14 be here this afternoon, this morning and so I want to  
15 keep him in—in mind as we go. Also, so we will—for  
16 the fourth time we will be holding this hearing  
17 jointly in attendance here today. Today, we'll be  
18 discussing the Career Pathway Program, revisiting a  
19 number of issues we discussed when the Council last  
20 held a hearing on this topic in January of 2016, and  
21 receiving an update from the Administration on its  
22 efforts is—it is seeking to fulfill the goals that we  
23 set our more than three years ago. The Committee on  
24 Civil Service and Labor has particular interest in  
25 learning more about potential opportunities for

1  
2 partnership in emerging industries such as  
3 hospitality, tourism, which is particular needs in  
4 Southeast Queens, the district, which I represent,  
5 and the status of the city's funded apprenticeships  
6 particularly involving building trades unions,  
7 quality control measures to ensure satisfaction in  
8 services with workforce development programs and the  
9 level of funding for career technical education  
10 programs as well. I'd like to acknowledge the  
11 members of the Civil Service and Labor Committee:  
12 Council Member Dromm and also the members of the  
13 Small Business Committee, Council Member Koslowitz  
14 and Council Member Perkins. I'd also like to thank  
15 the staff for its work, obviously counsel--Committee  
16 Counsel Matt Carlin, Kevin Kasowitz and Kendall  
17 Stevenson and Paul Stern for the work that they have  
18 done, and we are looking forward to hearing from the  
19 Admin and their latest report. So, without further  
20 ado [background comments] I'd like to call Jackie  
21 Mallon and Barbara Chang. [pause]

22 BARBARA CHANG: Good morning.

23 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Before we get  
24 started, I just need you to affirm that--yes, that you  
25

3 affirm that you will speak the truth this morning on  
4 behalf of the people. [door bangs]

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Do you want  
6 to affirm first?

7 BARBARA CHANG: I'm—I'm confirming my  
8 name? I'm sorry. I didn't hearing. I'm sorry.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: You're  
10 affirming that you're going to--

11 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Affirm that you will  
12 tell the truth.

13 BARBARA CHANG: Oh, yes, I affirm that I  
14 will tell the truth. [laughs]

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I do, as  
16 well affirm I will tell the truth.

17 BARBARA CHANG: Right, right, right.  
18 It's Monday morning. Kind of a hard time hearing  
19 [laughs] Okay, so thank you, Chair Miller for the  
20 opportunity to speak about the Office of Workforce  
21 Development and our systems coordination work. My  
22 name is Barbara Chang, and I serve as the Executive  
23 Director of the Office of Workforce Development, the  
24 Mayor's Office of Workforce Development. The Work  
25 Dev Office works primarily on policy, system  
coordination and strategy and we work in partnership

1 with more than a dozen city agencies as well as  
2 business leaders, education and training providers  
3 and community stakeholders to ensure the city's  
4 economic vitality today and in the future. We also  
5 oversee the Workforce Development Board, a body with  
6 a majority of business members required under the  
7 Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act of 2014, and  
8 we coordinate with the Center for Youth Employment an  
9 Initiative of the Mayor's Fund. In 2014, our office  
10 released a report Career Pathways: One City Working  
11 Together, a guiding strategy describing how elements  
12 of the city's workforce system should align and  
13 connect to one-to one another to support the city's  
14 growing businesses and economic development [door  
15 bangs] and to ensure that New Yorkers are prepared to  
16 enter career track jobs in key sectors. The Career  
17 Pathways approach connects progressive levels of  
18 education, training, support services and credentials  
19 while working with employers to grow a pipeline of  
20 skilled workers for in-demand occupations. In  
21 January of last year, our office testified regarding  
22 the Career Pathways Progress Update on the progress  
23 the city has made toward an efficient and effective  
24 workforce system that helps New Yorkers connect with  
25

3 careers that provide economic stability and mobility.

4 Since the last time we appeared—we appeared before  
5 you, we've made some progress in several of the key  
6 areas in the report.

7           The first is building skills employers  
8 seek. Working with our partners at New York City  
9 Small Business Services, we supported the launch and  
10 growth of five industry partnerships announced in  
11 Career Pathways. These include the New York Alliance  
12 for Careers in Healthcare, the New York City Tech  
13 Talent Pipeline, the NYC Food and Beverage  
14 Hospitality Council, and the construction and  
15 manufacturing partnerships. The goal of these  
16 partnerships is to work with industry to provide  
17 sustainable solutions to connect New Yorkers to  
18 opportunities in these sectors, and today I'm joined  
19 to my right by Jackie Mallon, the First Deputy  
20 Commissioner of the Department of Small Business  
21 Services, who will speak further on the work in SBS  
22 in promoting these industry partnerships.

23           The second is increasing participation in  
24 Bridge and training. As we shifted to Career  
25 Pathways as the framework for New York City's  
Workforce Development system, we've seen increased

1  
2 investments in training for growing sectors of the  
3 economy. When Career Pathways launched, we set a  
4 goal of providing occupational training to 30,000 New  
5 Yorkers a year by 2020. In Fiscal Year 17, we  
6 provided training to almost 24,000 New Yorkers, a 65%  
7 increase from the previous year. So, we're pretty  
8 much on track for reaching that goal. In addition to  
9 increases in training, we've made significant strides  
10 in promoting bridge programming across the system.  
11 Bridge programs combine industry specific instruction  
12 with foundational skill such as reading, math and  
13 English. These programs allow job seekers with  
14 limited educational attainment and low English  
15 proficiency to make progress toward occupational  
16 goals as they build their basic skills. Bridge  
17 programs offer participants a clear step to  
18 education, occupational training or employment.  
19 Following the Career Pathways approach, our goal is  
20 to invest in Bridge programs that support individuals  
21 with low educational attainment and limited English  
22 skills on a path to a quality job. To determine the  
23 best approach for both job seekers and businesses,  
24 we've piloted new programs such as Bridge for new-for  
25 young adults with limited educational attainment,

1 Bridge for English Language Learners, Bridge for  
2 foreign born workers with advanced degrees, and  
3 sector contextualization in healthcare, technology  
4 and the trades. We also launched the New York City  
5 Bridge Bank to share curricula that can be used by  
6 community-based organizations and other partners that  
7 want to offer bridge programs. Bridge programs are  
8 now included in a variety of city funded programs  
9 including HRA's Career-Youth Pathways; DYCD's in-  
10 school youth and out-of-school youth programs; the  
11 Young Adult Literacy Pilot, and several training  
12 programs developed by the industry partnerships and  
13 launched by our partners at SBS. We look forward to  
14 continuing to invest in occupational training and  
15 bridge programs across the city's workforce system.

17 The third is to improve job quality. The  
18 de Blasio Administration continues to lead the way in  
19 providing better protections for workers including  
20 paid sick leave and the Fair Scheduling Act. In  
21 2015, we also launched Best for NYC, a campaign that  
22 recognizes employers who are committed to offering  
23 high quality jobs and who value employee retention.  
24 Best for NYC has expanded to serve a network of 1,500  
25 employers beyond the 2015 goal of 500 employers.

1 Building on the success for Best for NYC, in 2017  
2 more than 100 employers began work to adopt a  
3 workforce innovation to improve the quality of jobs  
4 for their employees including hiring, training and  
5 promotion. Earlier this month, JP Morgan Chase  
6 Foundation announced a grant that will deepen the  
7 impact of Best for NYC in the Bronx by connecting  
8 businesses to one-on-one support and business  
9 opportunities.  
10

11           The force—the fourth is Connecting  
12 Economic Development in the Workforce. Working with  
13 our partners across the city, our office works to  
14 connect economic development activities in growth  
15 sectors to low-income job seekers. In 2015, we  
16 launched HireNYC one of the largest targeted hiring  
17 programs in the nation, which leverages our city  
18 purchasing power to create opportunities for more New  
19 Yorkers. Since the program launched, HireNYC  
20 connected—has connected over 5,000 New Yorkers to job  
21 opportunities, benefitting both businesses and job  
22 seekers. We've support efforts to connect New  
23 Yorkers to living wage work through the launch of  
24 ApprenticeNYC and the New York Works Initiative, both  
25 of which are coordinated through EDC.

1  
2           The fifth is Expand Resources for Youth  
3 Employment. A project of the Mayor's Fund to Advance  
4 New York City the Center for Youth Employment is  
5 working to increase work experiences for young people  
6 to put them on career pathways. This past fiscal  
7 year more than 92,000 young adults participated in  
8 summer jobs, internships, and mentorship experiences.  
9 This puts the Center for Youth Employment on pace to  
10 achieve the Mayor's goal of supporting at least  
11 100,000 youth in career development experiences. We  
12 applaud the work of our colleagues at CYE and the  
13 City Council to connect more young people to these  
14 opportunities, and we look forward to working with  
15 them both in the—in the coming years. The Center for  
16 Youth Employment also informed the final report of  
17 the Youth Employment Task Force that was released  
18 earlier this spring. The Task Force was co-~~led~~ed by  
19 Deputy Mayor Richard Buery and Council Finance  
20 Committee Chair Julissa Ferreras-Copeland, and  
21 included leaders from non-profits, industry,  
22 philanthropy and government. The report issued  
23 several recommendations on the Summer Youth  
24 Employment Program, which has nearly doubled under  
25 this Administration from 36,000 in 2013, the year

1 before the Mayor took office to nearly 70,000 this  
2 past summer. Additionally, funds have been baselined  
3 to ensure that the SYEP program remains at the  
4 highest level going forward. We're grateful for this  
5 productive partnership with the Council.  
6

7           And six is Coordinating Systems Change.

8 To address workforce and industry needs at the  
9 appropriate scale and in a long-term sustainable way,  
10 we've been working to shift the workforce development  
11 system. The goal of the Mayor's Office of Workforce  
12 Development is to foster a more coordinated and  
13 collaborative effort across city funded programs to  
14 connect New Yorkers to Career Pathways. This shift  
15 away from rapid attachment to work is evident in the  
16 types of programs this Administration has invested in  
17 such as courses that led New Yorkers to qualify with  
18 families to careers with family supporting wages.  
19 The Office of Workforce Development led the effort to  
20 establish common definitions and metrics across all  
21 city programs. By establishing these measurements,  
22 we're shifting toward a system that is better  
23 coordinated and defined success beyond just training  
24 or job placement but also the movement of an  
25 individual on a career path. To give a few examples

1 of our work with agency partners, in 2015 Human  
2 Resources Administration released—released a series  
3 of RF—RFPs that demonstrated a shift away from rapid  
4 attachment to work and an investment in training and  
5 bridge programming for low-income job seekers.  
6 Likewise with the support of the Council, DYCD  
7 included Career Pathways investments in both out-of-  
8 school and in-school youth programming. Our  
9 colleagues at SBS also continue to work with industry  
10 neighborhoods and small businesses to better connect  
11 the job seekers in need of this career, this city to  
12 pathways to opportunity. Fundamentally, these shift—  
13 these system shifting changes lay the groundwork to  
14 realizing the Career Pathways goals of providing  
15 access to secure jobs for low-income, low-skilled New  
16 Yorkers, and to help them maintain stable employment  
17 and earn a family support wage while ensuring that  
18 New York City businesses can find the talent they  
19 need. To share more about this Administration, what  
20 this Administration has accomplished with industry  
21 partnerships, small businesses and local talent, I'm  
22 now going to turn the mic over to Jackie Mallon of  
23 the New York City Office of Small Business Services.  
24 Thank you. [door bangs, pause]  
25

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Good

4 morning, Chair Miller and the members of the  
5 Committee on Small Business and Civil Service and  
6 Labor. My name is Jackie Mallon, and I am the First  
7 Deputy Commissioner of the New York City Department  
8 of Small Business Services. At SBS we aim to unlock  
9 economic potential and create economic security for  
10 all New Yorkers by connecting New Yorkers to quality  
11 jobs, building stronger businesses and fostering  
12 vibrant neighborhoods across the five boroughs.

13 Today, I am pleased to provide Council with an update  
14 on our work in support of Mayor de Blasio's Workforce  
15 Development strategy, Career Pathways: One City  
16 Working Together. In addition to assisting small  
17 businesses and commercial corridors, SBS is  
18 responsible for helping New Yorkers find jobs by  
19 connecting job seekers to employers and local  
20 residents to industry informed training. Through our  
21 network of 21 Workforce One Career Centers, SBS  
22 provides recruitment expertise, industry knowledge,  
23 and skill building workshops to match candidates to  
24 jobs. Annually, we successfully connect more than  
25 25,000 New Yorkers with quality employment, and  
nearly 4,000 New Yorkers with the training needed to

1 advance their careers. In support of the objective  
2 to help workers secure good paying jobs in fast  
3 growing sectors laid out by Career Pathways, SBS has  
4 instituted a job quality policy, which require  
5 businesses receiving free recruitment services  
6 through or Workforce One Career Centers to hire  
7 employers for full-time positions or pay at least the  
8 living wage rate, which is currently \$13.65 per hour.  
9 As a result, to date we have seen a significant  
10 increase in the percent of New Yorkers connected to  
11 full-time work from about 45% in 2014 to up around  
12 80% now in 2017. We've also seen a significant  
13 increase in the average wages at work from \$10.70 and  
14 hour in 2014 to \$13.25 in 2017. The City also  
15 utilizes our Workforce One Career Centers to connect  
16 New Yorkers to open positions created through the  
17 city's purchases and investments via HireNYC.  
18 Through the SBS operated HireNYC portal, venders who  
19 receive certain new city contract awards are now  
20 required to consider New Yorkers for employment  
21 opportunities. As projected in Career Pathways, SBS  
22 has significantly increased our investment in helping  
23 New Yorkers prepare, connect, and advance in the case  
24 that there's key sectors, rather, that drive New York  
25

1 City's economy. Our training investments share two  
2 characteristics: (1) The trainings are designed to  
3 help low-income New York-New Yorkers gain access to  
4 living wage jobs that they otherwise struggled to  
5 find and secure; and (2) the investments are informed  
6 by industry and design to meet employer needs. One  
7 of the primary ways we ensure alignment with industry  
8 is through our industry partnerships. As proposed in  
9 Career Pathways, we have expanded our industry  
10 partnerships in tech and healthcare, and have  
11 launched partnerships in food service, hospitality,  
12 construction and industrial manufacturing. The goal  
13 of these industry partnerships is not only to connect  
14 to New Yorkers through employment, but also to build  
15 the long-term sustainable connection between  
16 employers and the organizations that teach  
17 individuals the skills that are needed to enter and  
18 advance in the New York City job market. Through  
19 industry engagement, we are able to identify gaps in  
20 the labor market and develop new training models that  
21 could be replicated by providers throughout the city.  
22 We are aiming to address the systemic issues, which  
23 have prevented some New Yorkers from participating in  
24 the economy of tomorrow. With input from the  
25

1 employers and the industry partnerships, SBS has  
2 launched a number of new occupational training models  
3 to better meet the needs of employers and job seekers  
4 including models tailored for out of school, out of  
5 work young adults, immigrants, and other low-income  
6 New Yorkers. Healthcare has the largest private  
7 sector employment in New York City. With the  
8 implementation of the Affordable Care Act and recent  
9 New York State Medicare and Medicaid redesign, this  
10 sector has added a significant number of new  
11 occupations. Through the New York Alliance for  
12 Careers in Healthcare, which we call NYACH, our  
13 healthcare industry partnership, we have engaged  
14 healthcare employers to address the industry's  
15 rapidly changing labor force needs. To date, NYACH  
16 has developed a number of new training models  
17 including a model designed to train low-income  
18 immigrants with limited English proficiency for jobs  
19 as bilingual medical assistants. NYACH has also  
20 worked with the New York City Department of Education  
21 to redesign the core healthcare curriculum used by  
22 career and technical education schools to reflect the  
23 needs of today's healthcare employers. Launched in  
24 2014, out tech industry partnership, the Tech Talent  
25

1 Pipeline, which we often refer to as TTP is designed  
2 to support the inclusive growth of the New York City  
3 Tech Sector—Sector and prepare New York City for 21<sup>st</sup>  
4 Century jobs. The Tech Talent Pipeline works with  
5 225 companies, 16 local colleges and additional  
6 public and private partners to define employer needs,  
7 develop training, education, and recruitment models  
8 to meet those needs and skill solutions throughout  
9 the city delivering quality talent for the city's  
10 businesses and quality jobs for New Yorkers. Since  
11 the launch, TTP has developed ten new trainings  
12 informed by industry resulting in more than 450  
13 people connected to employment. These efforts are  
14 just a part of the TTP's larger dimension of  
15 catalyzing continuous and lasting alignment with  
16 industry throughout the city's public systems. For  
17 instance, TTP has worked closely with the City  
18 University of New York to launch an initiative to  
19 double the number of graduates with tech bachelor  
20 degrees by 2022. Another growing industry that  
21 provides an opportunity for good paying jobs is  
22 construction. Our construction industry partnership,  
23 the Mayor's Committee on Construction consists of the  
24 city's building construction trade unions, pre-

1 apprenticeship programs, trade employers and  
2 associations, mayoral agencies and other city public  
3 authorities. This year the committee is focused on  
4 connecting more New Yorkers to apprentice programs  
5 through the Mayor's Green Job Corp program. Working  
6 with the Mayor's Office Sustainability and Climate  
7 policy, SBS is leading this three-year initiative,  
8 which will train roughly 3,000 individuals--  
9 individuals through a variety of trainings including  
10 pre-apprenticeships. Last year we launched our  
11 newest partnership the New York City Food and  
12 Beverage Hospitality Council, an alliance of more  
13 than 30 leaders of food service to promote the  
14 sustained growth of the local food and beverage  
15 industry. The Council's goals include addressing the  
16 industry's skills gap and labor shortages and helping  
17 small business navigate the regulatory environment.  
18 The Council has informed new initiatives including  
19 StageNYC a new training programing which provides out  
20 of school, out of work youth on-the-job training and  
21 leads to careers in the restaurant industry, and food  
22 business pathways an entrepreneurship initiative  
23 designed to empower NYCHA residents to start and grow  
24 food businesses. We've also launched our industrial  
25

3 manufacturing industry partnership. Through this  
4 partnership we are bringing together a wide range of  
5 manufacturing and industrial businesses across the  
6 city to address the industry's rapidly changing labor  
7 force needs, and the fast pace of innovation. In  
8 support of the Mayor and the City Council's  
9 Industrial Action Plan, we have launched a number of  
10 trainings to prepare New Yorkers for the industrial  
11 and manufacturing jobs of the future including a  
12 contextualized high school equivalency diploma  
13 program in partnership with DOE's District 79 in West  
14 Farms up in the Bronx. Currently this partnership is  
15 focused on launching the Mayor's first Apprenticeship  
16 NYC program for computer, numerically controlled  
17 machinists. We expect that program to launch in the  
18 second quarter of next year. Through our industry  
19 partnerships, SBS is working hand-in-hand with the  
20 leaders of the fastest growing industries to ensure  
21 New Yorkers are equipped with the necessary skills to  
22 succeed in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century economy. Thank you and  
23 I'll—I'll be happy to answer any questions you have  
24 now.

24 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay. Thank you.  
25 Before we dive in with the questions, I'd like to

1  
2 acknowledge that Council Member—we've been joined by  
3 Council Members Vallone, Dromm, and Eugene as well.  
4 So, howdy. [pause] So, according to the Center for  
5 an Urban Future, the city has certain investment  
6 targets for these programs for \$60 million per year,  
7 and thus far has repurposed \$6.4 million to provide  
8 Bridge programming opportunity for a thousand New  
9 Yorkers with a literacy level of fourth to eighth  
10 grade. Currently, how much money has been allocated  
11 in terms of meeting the \$60 million target?

12 BARBARA CHANG: So, I'll take that  
13 question. So, we have been able to—right now the  
14 number is closer to \$7.5 million. So, we've added  
15 about another million into the Bridget Programming  
16 investment that we've made. The way that we're  
17 approach this, and you should also know that HRA in  
18 their recent RFP included Bridge programming in their  
19 RFP responses and in—I'll just try to—I think there  
20 are about 2,000 New Yorkers that will be getting  
21 Bridge programming through their Career Advancement  
22 Program and another 1,500 through the Youth Pathways.  
23 So, we're making strides in the investments in Bridge  
24 Programming. I think that the approach that we're  
25 taking is that Bridge Programming, you know, the—the

3 success of Bridge programming has been shown and  
4 proven in cities like Seattle where it was really  
5 first introduced, and we love that model. It's the  
6 reason why I think a lot of agencies are starting to  
7 incorporate that in their RFPs, and in their  
8 investments. I think that what we're doing is we're  
9 beginning to pilot Bridge Programming in the setting  
10 of New York City where we have a much more diverse  
11 population, and we're looking to see what works in New  
12 York City as it relates to Bridge Programming, and so  
13 as those pilots come out with data, then I think  
14 we'll be making—we'll be in a better position to make  
15 strategic investments at scale. [pause]

16 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay, do we have a  
17 time table on that?

18 BARBARA CHANG: Well, we're waiting for  
19 some of the data to come out. I mean, Jackie, you've  
20 got some in the industry partnerships. Where are we  
21 at with that?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah, I can  
23 tell you a little bit about some of the Bridge  
24 Programs that we have developed that are tailored to  
25 meet the needs of both out of school, out of work  
youth so far and—you can hear me?

3 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Uh-hm, that is--

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Is that  
5 better?

6 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Yes.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I'm usually  
8 such a loud mouth. That's always surprising.

9 [laughter] So, we have been working on a number of  
10 different the Bridge Training program models, those  
11 that are aimed-aiming at helping out of school, out  
12 of work youth get into the-the healthcare industry  
13 those without a high school equivalency diploma. We  
14 do that in partnership with the Department of  
15 Education. We do that actually three different  
16 tracks, cable installation, medical assistance, and  
17 the third track is wood development. Sorry. In  
18 addition, we've-we've developed Bridge Programs to  
19 address the needs of-of foreign born New Yorkers or  
20 immigrants, also in healthcare. There's a very  
21 strong demand for-by medical-bilingual medical  
22 assistance, and so we've developed a Bridge Program  
23 to help those with lower levels of English  
24 proficiency, improve their English and get  
25 contextualized medical assistant terminology and get  
their certified medial assistant's licenses. Well,

3 in addition, commercial drivers. We have a Bridge  
4 Program that also helps those that are recent  
5 immigrants and/or have lower levels of English  
6 proficiency, and we are working on a similar program  
7 in-in the food service industry.

8 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: If-so, how did you  
9 pay for it? How did you fund these programs? Is it  
10 our--of these same dollars that were and were, and  
11 are we seeing an increase in the investment?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah, the-  
13 these programs are-are funded with the Career  
14 Pathways dollars in part. It's probably blended with  
15 some other streams as well, but for sure, these-these  
16 are-are Career Pathways funded in part.

17 BARBARA CHANG: Uh-hm. So, let's talk  
18 about the Workforce Development portion of it, and-  
19 and you said there's 21 partners, and-and those, they  
20 operate separately and independently of-of-of your  
21 agency or any government agency, correct? [door  
22 bangs]

23 BARBARA CHANG: The 21 city agencies?

24 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: No, not city  
25 agencies.

BARBARA CHANG: [interposing] I'm sorry.

3 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: It's the Workforce  
4 Developments.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Are you—you  
6 may be referring to the Career Centers.

7 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: I'm sorry?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: The 21  
9 Workforce Development One Career Centers?

10 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Yes.

11 BARBARA CHANG: Oh, Workforce One. I'm  
12 sorry.

13 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Are they—how do they  
14 operate? Are they—are they government entities—  
15 agencies or are they—are they contracted with  
16 government agencies? What are they specifically?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: So, so those  
18 are primarily federal EOF funded Workforce One  
19 Centers. There are 21 of them, and they're  
20 throughout the five boroughs. Some of them are—are—  
21 we are collocated with other agencies like the  
22 Department of Education and/or—and/or HRA. We are  
23 all working together to—to ensure that there's good  
24 coordination among the—the various services at the  
25 agencies but--

3 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So, there are 21. I  
4 wasn't that far off. Who runs them?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Well, we  
6 had—we run them, but they are contracted vendor  
7 partners that—that operate them, if that's what you  
8 mean.

9 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: That's exactly what  
10 I was asking.

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Okay.

12 [laughs]

13 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So, what kind of  
14 oversight do we have on these Workforce Development  
15 Centers that are operating here? Do we—so, I'm going  
16 to—in—in the interest of—of because I'm going to ask  
17 some questions on behalf of—of my colleagues from  
18 Small Business and I'm sure others have some  
19 questions, but in the interest, I will tell you that  
20 my office has had concerns from some of the centers  
21 citywide and these come from clients as well as some  
22 of—some of the employers, whether or not it will get  
23 any qualified folks, whether or not clients were  
24 being trained in the proper way, and whether or not  
25 they were most importantly being property compensated  
as well. And so, we—who oversees that to—to ensure

1 that our investments are creating real career  
2 opportunities?  
3

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: So, the-I  
5 certainly would love to hear more about the specific  
6 concerns that maybe I'll find because I would want to  
7 address any issues that you have heard about, but so  
8 there-the centers, the Workforce One Career Centers  
9 are operated through contracts that SBS manages, but  
10 the-the further oversight is really provided by the  
11 Workforce Development Board, which is the-a board  
12 that is-that is 51% private employers, and then a  
13 number of other individuals that-that make up the  
14 board and that's by federal statute. We're required  
15 to-for the Board to have oversight over those funds.

16 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Uh-hm.

17 BARBARA CHANG: And-and the Board is-is  
18 at my office. It meets quarterly and we get reports  
19 from both SBS receive and DYCD, which are the two  
20 agencies that receive WE (sic) ELLA monies. So,  
21 every quarter we have a dashboard, and we're looking  
22 at the performance of the centers as well as the  
23 programs that are funded through WE (sic) ELLA  
24 monies. So, that's-that's the oversight from the  
25 Workforce Development Board.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: We've been joined by  
3 my esteemed colleague Elizabeth Crowley, and I'm sure  
4 she'll have some questions as well. When we first--  
5 when we first had--when we had our first hearing back  
6 in 2014, we talked about emergency--emerging  
7 industries . We talked about the development that  
8 was at construction and development that were taking  
9 place throughout the city. We're talking about  
10 hotels and hospitalities, and what have done to--to  
11 take advantage of those opportunities. [background  
12 comments]

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: So, from a--  
14 from and SBS perspective a couple of things I think  
15 we can--we can report back to you on. As I said, this  
16 year we launched--well, I'll say yeah, the New York  
17 City Food and Hospitality Industry Partnership, and  
18 we have beginning with a--a program that is modeled  
19 after a apprenticeship program for prep cooks and  
20 line cooks, which here is a great shortage of here in  
21 New York City. It's a three-month program that takes  
22 out of school, out of work youth

23 out of school, out of work youth, gives  
24 them some classroom--initial classroom prep and then  
25 puts them at a restaurant to--that is with a tailored

1 on-the-job training program that that models an  
2 apprenticeship program. In terms of-of-of  
3 development, maybe you're also getting at like  
4 HireNYC, which is a policy that was-that was  
5 developed by the Mayor where city contracts over a  
6 certain amount the vendors are required to register  
7 on our portal, give us a set-a list of all the open  
8 positions that they're going to need to hire for as a  
9 result of winning those contracts, and then work with  
10 us to-to review our candidates, and-and hire anybody  
11 that's a-that's a good fit. Is that-is that what you  
12 were referring to?

14 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: That's-that's-that's  
15 it. So, for those who are actually administering  
16 the-the training services, how do we stay ahead of  
17 the curve in that in understanding in advance that  
18 this is-I mean should we-we should know enough about  
19 the industry to know that these are the positions  
20 that need to be filled within hospitality,  
21 construction trades and so forth. How are we then  
22 training and so that we can provide the workforce  
23 immediately upon completion? So, one of the  
24 experiences that I've had and that we've-we've, you  
25 know with all the development we had these community

1 based agreements that we come up with, with local  
2 hires and MWBEs and local contractors and so forth,  
3 and it appears at least according to some of-of the  
4 vendors or developers that they are not getting  
5 trained folks from the Workforce Developments, and-  
6 and a minimal training or not trained necessarily in  
7 the skills that they're looking for. There's also a  
8 plethora of, in fact, hotels coming up all over the  
9 place, right? We're considering that with zoning and  
10 the rest of that, but be that as it may, besides the  
11 full services are-are we-we're looking at career  
12 paths and-and sustainable wages, and as apart of the  
13 oversight. And I know we talked about living wages,  
14 but quite frankly, when you're working in the  
15 construction trades, what I have seen that all of our  
16 folks have been severely undercompensated for-for  
17 even the entry level positions that they have been  
18 trained for without long-term opportunities. And so,  
19 I would submit that probably require-would require  
20 greater insight and partners-partnership, hands-on  
21 partnership with these folks as opposed to an outline  
22 of what a program is going to look like. And we-we  
23 got a 12-week draft and-and they go to the site  
24 something more sustainable than that, a real  
25

1 sustainable apprenticeship. I would hope that when  
2 you have billions of dollars literally of investment  
3 in—in one local community that we could leverage that  
4 in a way that we're not spinning our wheels, and I  
5 think what we came out of here is that what—that we  
6 want to create real living wage jobs, and that we can  
7 keep people here in New York City. And—and—and what  
8 I'm trying to get to is—is are we doing that? And  
9 so, and I'm telling you from my experience that  
10 there's been a lot of questions around whether or not  
11 we were training folks for the appropriate positions.  
12 And I get that it could be an excuse that people want  
13 to use who they want to use, but I also know that  
14 there's a reason why people engage in programs that  
15 employers engage in such programs because they get  
16 people on the cheap. And that's a price to be paid  
17 for the cheap, and I want to make sure that we are  
18 not complicit in doing so, that people are getting  
19 properly compensated, and again, I would ask what the  
20 oversight on these programs, on these Workforce  
21 Development programs were. Whether or not we are—I  
22 know in 2014 and subsequently we were talking about  
23 whether or not—we—we were talking about job retention  
24 and whether or not these were the same 100, 200 low  
25

1 paying jobs that were being recycled, and have we  
2 gone beyond that, and do we have numbers that would  
3 sustain that?  
4

5 BARBARA CHANG: I'll—I'll take the sort  
6 of system level, and talk at a broad—from—from  
7 citywide system level. There are a couple of things  
8 that I want to respond to. One is that in order to  
9 make sure that we are consistently attuned to  
10 employer demand, we are through the industry  
11 partnerships primarily in—in constant conversation,  
12 and dialogue with them. And that is—that is exactly  
13 what the Career Pathways Report was about, which is  
14 that we—we focus on jobs that are really there that  
15 are growing, that are in—in sectors that are growing,  
16 and we're not sort of just like using the same  
17 industries that have always existed in New York City,  
18 and in some—in some instances actually on the  
19 downswing. So, we're looking at growing industries.  
20 I think through SBS's industry partnerships, we got a  
21 robust dialogue going on with them, and we're  
22 creating curriculum that is attuned to what the  
23 employers' are saying they need. On hospitality I—I  
24 have a particular—there—we've gotten requests from  
25 the hospitality industry to help work with the State

3 of New York on their Registered Apprenticeship  
4 process because for hospitality, you know, most of  
5 the registered apprenticeship rules and regulations  
6 have been built around the trades historically. But,  
7 because now more industries like tech and hospitality  
8 and manufacturing are moving into more of an  
9 apprenticeship model, they need those regulations to  
10 be sort of re-realigned to industries that are not  
11 the trades. So, we're working with them. We've  
12 brokered conversations with the State of New York to  
13 help and--and grow--and quite frankly very receptive  
14 to doing this because they understand the importance  
15 of apprenticeships. And particularly because the  
16 hospitality industry is so big and growing in New  
17 York City it's a focus of ours to make sure that we--  
18 we are able to meet the talent needs of the  
19 hospitality industry as they grow in--in the city.

19 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So, I--I--I do want to  
20 stay while we're talking about apprenticeships, and  
21 kind of are we taking advantage of local-- Even with  
22 our municipal workforce there is collective  
23 bargaining agreements that--that have apprenticeships.  
24 Are we taking advantage of that? Has there been any  
25 conversation between labor relations, local labor

1 unions about that? I know that I'm a—I'm a former  
2 President and Business Agent, and—and we had such an  
3 apprentice, and we took mechanics, and we—right out  
4 of high school, assistant mechanics, trained them,  
5 and ultimately they became—and the diesel mechanics  
6 working on trains and buses throughout the MTA. I  
7 don't see why we can't do that, take advantage of  
8 that, but also I know that there are—you—you have the  
9 obvious—the NYCHA apprenticeship in the construction  
10 trades, and before we let go, I want to know where  
11 that is. I know it expires at the end of the year,  
12 this year, and—and—and, in fact, we could just start  
13 with that, and whether or not it's going to be  
14 funded, and what needs to be done between the Admin  
15 and the Council so that people don't get three-  
16 quarters of a way through an apprentice program and  
17 then the program no longer exists. Do—do you know  
18 where we are with that?

19  
20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I just want  
21 to make sure I can—I—if you can clarify. Are talking  
22 about the—the Memorandum of Understanding between the  
23 city--

24 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] I'm  
25 talking about—

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: -- and the  
4 building trades? Are you--?

5 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Yeah, so,  
6 specifically--

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:  
8 [interposing] Yeah.

9 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: --specifically in  
10 the latter instance, I'm talking about the NYCHA  
11 Apprentice Program where they--where they are doing  
12 construction and particular--in particular the--the--  
13 the--the agreement that the they have with DC9 where  
14 they do the painting, and they do other such work--

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Uh-hm.

16 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: --mold removal and--  
17 and sheetrock and so forth within NYCHA program--

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:  
19 [interposing] Okay.

20 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: --development.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Okay, so  
22 I'll--let me--let me--let me give you like a broader  
23 answer first, and--and then maybe talk about that  
24 specifically. So, the--as I'm sure you are aware, the--  
25 the city has a Memorandum of Understanding with the--  
with the building trades unions, and in it--it

1 requires that new apprentices make up- Sorry.  
2  
3 Graduates of pre-apprenticeship training programs,  
4 women, residents of NYCHA, people at public-people  
5 that graduate at the public high school system are  
6 all priority. Fifty-five percent of the new  
7 apprenticeships each year need to-need to be people  
8 that come from those groups, and we to complement  
9 that, we through our construction industry  
10 partnership, fund those union recognized pre-  
11 apprenticeship training programs like the non-  
12 traditional funding for women, Helmets or Hard Hats,  
13 et cetera, et cetera, and it's a core part of our  
14 Green Jobs, the Mayor's Green Jobs Program as well.  
15 So, in the past three years, I want to say that we've  
16 funded like 150ish folks to-to get in and through  
17 those programs, and we-we will continue to do that  
18 in-in the coming years as well, and-and NYCHA  
19 residents in particular are priority for us.

20 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] So, so  
21 part of that, what-what I would like an answer to  
22 where are we on the-on the DC 9 Apprentice Program?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:  
24 [interposing] Retainers.  
25

3 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: That is a program  
4 that I've written a letter to the Admin and most of  
5 the Labor Committee had signed onto that. They were  
6 three-quarters through their apprenticeship, and the  
7 program has been--has not been picked up beyond  
8 December 31<sup>st</sup>, which would be an absolute travesty.  
9 Furthermore, I think what we were trying to get to  
10 whether or not we were leveraging the opportunity for  
11 all the development and construction that goes on in  
12 the city, and what those-- Whether or not they have  
13 project labor agreements attached to them so that  
14 there is real living wage opportunities there because  
15 quite frankly, as I said, you know, you're working on  
16 a construction site, and--and you--you have these local  
17 hires simply because they're--they're hired on the  
18 cheap. They're not trained properly, first of all,  
19 around safety. They're not compensated accordingly,  
20 and without those, are we leveraging those  
21 opportunities? I'll give you an example, there's  
22 also \$1.8 billion in infrastructure being done in the  
23 city in Southeast Queens in my district, and there's  
24 no one from the community working on those projects.  
25 We have created \$2 billion in wealth for someone  
outside of the community. I've had this conversation

1 with the Admin. I've had this conversation with SBS  
2 and the Deputy Mayor and other folks. We've had  
3 meetings. We've brought in contractors, and-and  
4 otherwise. I think that we're really missing an  
5 opportunity. There's going to be infrastructure work  
6 going on throughout the city forever, and-and yet,  
7 we're not leveraging it, and-and I get this is a  
8 highly skilled profession and trade, but there is  
9 real opportunity for apprenticeships in those areas  
10 there and we really, really have-to have that  
11 conversation about how do we do that. As well as-as  
12 we-we are subsidizing all of this housing that is  
13 going on, and it is-and there is not a single  
14 affordable developer that pays more than \$15 an hour,  
15 and that is ridiculous for that work that is being  
16 done. And-and where the oversight is I'm-I'm missing  
17 it, and I think there's some real long-term career  
18 paths, which I'd love to discuss further as we move  
19 further talking about who these community partners  
20 are or who these potential corporate partners are  
21 whether it-whether it's-it's technology, it's trades,  
22 it's hospitalities, whomever, how far along we are  
23 with those conversations, and quite frankly, what-  
24 what-where the bar is on that. It is-it's great that  
25

1 you come in, and—and you do this training, but the  
2 fact of the matter is, is something in it for them?  
3 It's subsidies, it's opportunities that, you know,  
4 I'm—I'm hoping it's just not the cheap labor, right,  
5 and how do we prevent that from happening because  
6 everyone in business doesn't have the morals and  
7 scruples that we hope they would have. [door bangs]  
8 They attend to these agreements because it benefits  
9 them, and so again, you know, I kind of just wanted  
10 to drill down before we talk about all the great  
11 things that are happening. Are we taking advantage?  
12 Are we leveraging, and are—is there oversight on  
13 what's happened now because there are city subsidies  
14 all over the place, and as I said and—and I'm not  
15 seeing the community benefit from it, and that is not  
16 simply Southeast Queens. Development is happening at  
17 record pace throughout the city, and we want to make  
18 sure that we're—we're taking full advantage of it.  
19 [background comments] With that, I'm going to pass  
20 it over to Council Member Dromm. So, we've been  
21 joined by Council Members Menchaca and  
22 Constantinides.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very  
25 much, Chair, and I just have a couple of questions

1 more really regarding education. I'm the Chair of  
2 the Education Committee here in the Council, and I'm  
3 noticed in Deputy Commissioner Mallon's testimony you  
4 mentioned that you launched a number of trainings to  
5 prepare New Yorkers for the industrial and  
6 manufacturing jobs of the future including a  
7 contextualized high school equivalency diploma. What  
8 does contextualized mean?  
9

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: For the  
11 specific occupations.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Alright.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: So, while  
14 you learn your high school--while you're getting the  
15 high school equivalency prep, we've worked with DOE  
16 to concept--contextualize that prep so that you're--  
17 you're beginning your [door bangs] your--your cable  
18 installation training while you're doing your high  
19 school equivalency.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So, now those--in  
21 District 79 those are students who are under the age  
22 of 21 and they're in like basically transfer schools  
23 or a situation like that, an they're working toward  
24 their high school equivalency--

25 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Correct.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: --in most cases.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Correct.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, and do you  
6 know the number of students that would be involved in  
7 that program?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I-I-I could  
9 get back to you. You mean specific in the industrial  
10 and manufacturing. I can totally get back to you.  
11 Bear in mind it's a--we just started it. We're just,  
12 you know, figuring out how to make it work so-- But  
13 I'd be happy to get back to you with specifics.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: But that was my  
15 question also because in your testimony the last  
16 sentence you said we expect the program to launch in  
17 the second quarter of next year.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: This is a  
19 different program. You're referring to the  
20 ApprenticeNYC. It's different that the--the--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: With the  
22 numerically control machinists.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, so that's  
25 different.

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah, two  
4 different things.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Is that as, um, a,  
6 um, a GED—a high school equivalency diploma also  
7 there?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Not to begin  
9 with no.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Oh, okay and the  
11 reason I'm asking also is because the DOE, I—I  
12 listened to the hearing on adult hearing--

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: --and with the high  
15 school equivalency diplomas they're not doing such a  
16 good job. They only had 150 students get a high  
17 school equivalency diploma out of 28,000 students.  
18 So, that's why I'm particularly interested in looking  
19 at those numbers to be able to compare what you're  
20 doing there with what the DOE is doing. That's--  
21 that's an actual education given its different  
22 circumstances, but I'm interested in--in looking at  
23 those two numbers, two sets of numbers.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Okay, I'd be  
25 happy to follow up with you--

3 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: [interposing]

4 Okay, thank you.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: --and even  
6 sit down and talk a little to learn from you as well.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, great. Thank  
8 you.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Thank you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: And also in your  
11 testimony you mentioned the--the healthcare curriculum  
12 was revised or redesigned. Can you give us some more  
13 details on that? How was it redesigned or what was  
14 the--the idea behind that if you don't know the exact  
15 details.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Sure. Sure,  
17 sure. So, in general, the shift in healthcare I  
18 always feel this is--it sounds so ironic every time I  
19 say this, is to a patient centered--centric model,  
20 which you would think it was always like that, but--  
21 which means that there are a lot more frontline  
22 positions, and a lot more coordination--coordination  
23 among various healthcare specialists for your care,  
24 and so the--the principals of--of like dealing with  
25 people and issues and--and--and all kinds of elements  
related to care and, of course, the--the more

1 traditional things like, you know, math and science  
2 and whatnot, we—we worked together with an industry  
3 to develop a core competence. All the core  
4 competencies one would need in order to succeed in—in  
5 healthcare, and work with DOE—DOE to get it  
6 integrated into the CTE curriculum. So, now they're  
7 in their healthcare focused CTE schools. They're—  
8 they're—some of them are beginning to teach that.  
9 Does that make sense the way I said it?  
10

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: You said—yeah, as  
12 follow-up, so what type of job title would those  
13 include that they're preparing for?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Medical  
15 Assistant, Certified Nursing Assistant.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: CNAs?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah, but  
18 nurses and techs, peer counselors, a whole range of—  
19 of physicians where that would be—the part of the  
20 fundamental skills.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: You worked with  
22 the Highs School for Health and Sciences in Newtown  
23 High School?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I believe  
25 so, but I—I would have to double check--

3 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: --the  
5 specifics on that.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, that's in my  
7 district.

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Again, I'd  
9 be happy to follow up with you, and--and give you all  
10 the details on--on--on these things and--and learn from  
11 you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, thank you  
13 very much.

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Sure. It's  
15 a pleasure.

16 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Thank you, Council  
17 Member, and if I may just follow up on that before I--  
18 I--I know Council Members Menchaca and--and Crowley  
19 also have questions, but to follow up on--on Council  
20 Member Dromm's and particularly the CTEs and what's--  
21 --what--what level of education and curriculum is going  
22 on there, and I know we talked about medical  
23 assistants and so forth. When I was in high school,  
24 we kind of had then to a medical assistant. I'd like  
25 to think that we've evolved and if we have our young  
people in this building for four years that we have

3 the resources and technology to at the very least  
4 create respiratory technician and--and things like  
5 that to be able to certify and credential in areas  
6 beyond what we were doing 25 years ago. You know and  
7 that's being gentle, 25 years ago, right, that--that  
8 we can do better. And--and I know that I've been in  
9 conversation with--with UFT and CSA and others about  
10 CTE programs as well as the trades and--and coming in  
11 and that there's been these walls that we have to  
12 knock down where there is really the will to come in  
13 and really train our young people in--in--in real  
14 career path opportunities, and we can't get there  
15 because we can't navigate the initial government and  
16 that's--and that's there. And--and speaking of which  
17 is there. So, is Health and Hospital a partner in  
18 anyway, and do they do apprenticeships? Are they  
19 partners in any of the CTEs?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Well, two  
21 different--two different things, and I just want to  
22 for the record 25 years ago is probably generous for  
23 me to have been in high school as well, but [laughs]  
24 just medical assistant is one of the highest  
25 demanding and growing occupations. It's changed a  
lot. The actual job has changed a lot since--

3 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Uh-hm.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: --the-so,  
5 just to be fair on that point. [beep]...partnership  
6 with-with Health and Hospitals and-and recently  
7 worked with them to develop a-a certified peer  
8 specialist, somebody who works with-with people in  
9 recovery, but that's not-not the same as our  
10 partnership with-with DOE and-and the work we've been  
11 doing in CTE. So, for-I don't you have a-a broader  
12 sense of-of whether Health and Hospitals has a  
13 partnership with CTE, because I don't know that.

14 BARBARA CHANG: I do not know.

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Okay.

16 BARBARA CHANG: Just don't know. Most-and  
17 CTE-

18 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] So, I-  
19 I would hope that-that we'd go back and we-we would  
20 kind of-we'd investigate and that we really  
21 encouraged them [door bangs] to-to invest in our  
22 young people and-and the future of their workforce  
23 considering where the city workforce is, is in-in  
24 that-in the next five years. Probably two-thirds it  
25 will be able to walk out the door, and we want to  
make sure that we're cultivating developing that next

1 generation of worker, and-and all these different  
2 professions. Council Member Crowley.

3  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you,  
5 Chair. Thanks for having this important hearing. I  
6 have two questions. First, I just want to follow up  
7 on your question earlier. I don't think we got an  
8 answer from your offices as to where the city is with  
9 the NYCHA Apprentice Program that does painting in  
10 the, you know, it puts residents to work on much  
11 needed projects that, you know, all these buildings  
12 are in disrepair. We need to be doing all we can to  
13 bring them up to code, and certainly making sure that  
14 the units and the buildings painting from this  
15 program that the city was in partnership with both  
16 the Mayor's Office and the Council. It doesn't have  
17 the funding as far as I know after January 1<sup>st</sup>. Do  
18 you know if the City plans to continue funding these  
19 needed jobs?

20 BARBARA CHANG: So, I'll [door bangs]  
21 I'll say that our colleagues at NYCHA are really the  
22 ones who are best positioned to answer that question,  
23 and we will get back to you on that. We-I definitely  
24 know about the closing of this program. We were-we  
25 were very, very concerned, and I think it really is a

1 question that we need to engage NYCHA with. So, we  
2 will get back to you on that.  
3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: The second  
5 question I have is about the film industry. (coughs)  
6 Excuse me. It seems more and more films or more and  
7 more TV production, film production is happening in  
8 our communities throughout the city, which is great.  
9 It looks, you know, it's helping to strengthen our  
10 local economy, but what is your offices doing to work  
11 with this industry to make sure that New Yorkers have  
12 an opportunity in these various different trades? It  
13 seems like it's complicated to understand how you can  
14 gain access if you want to be a production assistant,  
15 or if you want to work on your sets, and I know most  
16 of these jobs are union jobs. But, you know, I don't  
17 know how to help city residents gain access, and so  
18 I'd like to know more about what you're doing to—to  
19 bridge that opportunity.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Okay, I can  
21 tell you about some of the work that we're doing with  
22 the Mayor's Office of Media and Entertainment, and  
23 specifically we have several programs that we've  
24 recently developed. There is the—the production  
25 assistant program that's been around for awhile, and

1 they've sort of built a succession to that, which is  
2 a production assistant program with our local  
3 community partner where we're taking people who have  
4 been successful as a production assistant, and-and  
5 put them through a series of trainings including like  
6 the [door bangs]-I can't remember the specific name  
7 of the software, but you need to be good at a certain  
8 software, and-and some on-the-job training with  
9 another production person. So, that's one. We're  
10 also have-did another program. All of these in  
11 partnership with the Mayor's Office of Media and  
12 Entertainment, which was a screenwriter's  
13 apprenticeship essentially internship type of program  
14 where hundreds of people applied and got some support  
15 from experienced and-and successful screenwriters,  
16 and a few more got actually-- I don't know if  
17 internships is like the word that's coming to mind  
18 where they worked one-on-one with a screenwriter for  
19 six months or so in order to-to-in hopes of launching  
20 a production in New York City and diversifying the-  
21 the screenwriters.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: You know there's  
24 a few unions that are within the areas you mentioned.

25 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Right, and there  
4 I believe outside of the High School of Film and the  
5 industry that's in Long Island City. I'm not saying--  
6 sure if I'm saying it correctly. There needs to be  
7 more opportunities for pre-apprenticeship to--to feed  
8 into the union jobs--

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Uh-hm.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: --that ate the  
11 stage hand type of jobs that pay very well, and are  
12 not the traditional, you know, production assistant--

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

14 [interposing] Yeah.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: --or  
16 screenwriting. Those are the real jobs that there  
17 are so many of them that we need to build some type  
18 of pre-apprentice program for it. So, I urge both of  
19 your offices to--to look into this more, and help to  
20 create more access [door bangs] for New Yorkers.

21 BARBARA CHANG: One--one thing that I can  
22 say is that we-- In fact, tomorrow I'm going to be  
23 heading over to the Brooklyn Navy Yard. We've got a  
24 great partnership with the Brooklyn Navy Yard and the  
25 expansion of Steiner Studios is underway. We are  
going to be convening--you know, what we're interested

1  
2 in is how do we engage the NYCHA community around the  
3 yard to—in jobs that are being created by the yard at  
4 pretty—a pretty fast clip, and so one of the things  
5 that we're discussing is convening employers  
6 including Steiner to understand better what positions  
7 are opening up as they begin to populate and—and  
8 offer more opportunities for New Yorkers, and how  
9 those match the current skills of NYCHA residents,  
10 and how can we make strategic investments in training  
11 NYCHA residents to become eligible for those jobs.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Good. So there's  
13 another NYCHA program to work with NYCHA to do this  
14 type or pre-apprentice and—and you'll fund it, too?  
15 I mean—

16 BARBARA CHANG: [laughs] Well, I think--

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing] It  
18 seems interesting to me, but it's an idea--

19 BARBARA CHANG: [interposing] Yeah, I  
20 mean I—I--NYCHA--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: --but you really  
22 need to put funding behind the idea, and make it a  
23 real plan that you could then be able to get people  
24 jobs.

25 BARBARA CHANG: Yeah, I mean I do--

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing]

4 And the only way to do that is really through either  
5 working with the various different employers to do a  
6 wage subsidy type of program where they could learn  
7 on the job, or put in—put students who want to learn  
8 the trades because there are many different trades  
9 into a program where they're going to be in class and  
10 employers are involved as well, and they're going to  
11 guarantee some access to jobs.

12 BARBARA CHANG: Yeah, I mean I—I think  
13 what we are right now in the middle of doing, we're—  
14 we're, it's early sort of due diligence to understand  
15 what these jobs are, and then putting together the  
16 right program where we can then move to seek funding  
17 for those programs, but at this point I think it's  
18 premature to probably get funding for a program that  
19 we aren't really sure what we're talking about yet.  
20 So, we're getting there, though. That's why we're  
21 talking about it.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Well, it's a  
23 good idea. Hopefully, you could put a solid plan  
24 together.

25 BARBARA CHANG: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you.

4 Thank you, Chair. No further question.

5 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Thank--thank you,  
6 Council Member, that was insightful, and I know you  
7 kicked this up on the--on regular issues. So,  
8 appreciate it. Council Member Menchaca.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,  
10 Chair. Thank you for having this joint hearing, and  
11 welcome back. It's always great to talk to you in  
12 the office about the good work that you're doing. I  
13 have a few questions just a better--a better--better  
14 ground meaning some either data or point us into some  
15 directions for the next session that we're about to  
16 start the next calendar year, and one I--I want to get  
17 a better sense about in your testimony, you--you point  
18 the jobs of future, and I want to get a sense about  
19 how you define the jobs of the future.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I think that  
21 was your--your question for Mia. Well, we start with--  
22 with industry. We have the five industry  
23 partnerships and we are in close connection with them  
24 and working and we tried to understand as best we  
25 can what the--their needs, as far as I can tell, what  
their needs are going to be moving forward and--and,

3 you now, work from there, and also look at economic  
4 trends and all that kind of stuff.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So, industry  
6 and—and I kind of got a sense from the industry that  
7 there's a lot of different industry, but you have a—  
8 you have a task force or a group of people that you  
9 go to right now.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Each—for each  
11 industry that we're focused on.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So, can you  
13 tell me a little bit about—about from that analysis  
14 how you're defining the jobs of the future. It  
15 sounds like—so, here's—here's the I guess--

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:  
17 [interposing] Sure.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --what I'm--what  
19 I'm kind of seeing is a blind spot. We're going to  
20 companies that are growing right now that are in a  
21 peak moment where there are a lot of jobs. You  
22 mentioned hospitality and food services are two  
23 different areas where—where jobs are growing, but I'm  
24 just kind of thinking about the last four years and  
25 kind of multiple hearings that we're having about—  
about stuff that we're not—we're—we're just beginning

3 to thank about in the world of technology, driverless  
4 cars--

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --or things  
7 that are on their way that won't have an industry  
8 partner relationship because that industry isn't here  
9 yet, and we're not necessarily preparing for that.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So that's--  
12 that's what I'm trying to understand is are we really  
13 talking about jobs of feature or are we talking about  
14 the peak jobs today, which are not the future that  
15 will be past very soon, and--and we're going to have a  
16 wave of--of industry that--that has yet to--yet to even  
17 blossom yet, but we know are on their way. That--  
18 that's what I'm trying to understand, and discern  
19 here from--from your group of people that you go  
20 search, understand, respond, invest and then connect  
21 job seekers to training.

22 BARBARA CHANG: So, a great question and  
23 things that keep us up at night is thinking about the  
24 jobs future that on jobs that aren't even here yet.  
25 There is a lot of conversation going on not only in  
New York City but also on a global level of what is

1 the impact of automation on jobs generally in  
2 different countries in New York city. I meant it's  
3 a-it's a-it's definitely a conversation that's  
4 getting a lot of play. We have engaged a number of  
5 employers who are engaged at the World Economic Forum  
6 to talk about what is the impact of what they're  
7 seeing globally in New York City, and so what we're  
8 looking at is what kinds of jobs are more prone to  
9 being sort of automated, and what jobs are more  
10 likely to be growing. We're-we're engaging with  
11 those employers to-and also connecting them with the  
12 Department of Ed and CUNY as they're looking at their  
13 curriculum in terms of foundational skills that are  
14 going to be needed in order to compete for the jobs  
15 that are coming on that we really don't even know  
16 what we're talking about yet. So, I mean a lot-what  
17 we do know is that it's a lot of STEM conversation  
18 that's going on. We also know that a lot of  
19 administrative kinds of jobs and retail and sort of  
20 like, you know, grocery checkout jobs are probably on  
21 their way out, and so what are we doing in order to  
22 skill up not only the current adults that are in the  
23 system, but also the future of our workforce, which  
24 is right now they're in the K through 12 and in the  
25

3 CUNY system, but we're definitely in that  
4 conversation.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So, it sounds  
6 like it's—the conversation that's happening, how is  
7 that impacting the work at the city level and the  
8 Administration level to start preparing for that.

9 BARBARA CHANG: Yeah.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Because I  
11 think—I think a lot of people are having those  
12 conversations, but they're not necessarily having an  
13 impact on the day-to-day in the way that I think  
14 another question that I wanted to ask was out of the  
15 chart, the pie chart of investment and I think our  
16 numbers are showing that there are well an increase  
17 of 500--\$500 million in '14 to \$606 in '16. We'd  
18 like to know what—that that number is today as far as  
19 the work services—workforce services are, and that's  
20 a whole bunch of categories of tax—city tax, the  
21 Council dollars. Well, not city tax, Private  
22 resources and others. What are at now, and how much  
23 of that is—is being geared towards instruction in  
24 these jobs for the future that we just—that you just  
25 mentioned?

1  
2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I just want  
3 to—I just wanted to add one point that I think  
4 addresses your—a point of clarification, in fact.  
5 The industry partnerships that we have established  
6 sure they—they are some of the—the output of the work  
7 that they're currently doing on new training models  
8 to get developed and replicated, but actually the—the  
9 longer term goal and what we're really striving to do  
10 is to establish them so that they are directly  
11 connected with the people that do—maybe it's not the  
12 people, the organizations that do training and skills  
13 building directly so that whenever things evolve the  
14 connection exists and industry is informing  
15 educational training providers like real time. It  
16 will take some, you know, time before we get there,  
17 but that's the ultimate goal. It's not a—you know  
18 what I mean so that we can be prepared and be ready.  
19 We will never be ready obviously for a brand new  
20 industry that we can't foresee, but changes to  
21 industries like you mentioned as self-driving cars.  
22 That's a transportation—we have a transportation  
23 industry partnership where the dialogue is going to  
24 be about that, and if the connection is there we  
25

3 should be able to—to, you know, respond to it more  
4 faster.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So, you're just  
6 talking relationships that are being built right now  
7 so that there's conversation, but how is that and I  
8 just—help me understand are we also talking about  
9 educational—

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: [interposing]  
11 Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --facilities  
13 or—or infrastructure that you're saying is—is out  
14 there right now that can help transition so that  
15 you're—you're—help me understand that part.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: So, if—if  
17 we're—I'll give you—

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing]  
19 Because that's for me the most important. That's how  
20 I understand it. That's how I think about it as a  
21 Council Member in a district where there are  
22 organizations that are currently trying to do that  
23 right now, but if they're not connected to a larger  
24 brain like yours that's trying to think about these  
25 things that we're talking about today, and having

1 funding and having relationships, then we're going  
2 to--there's going to be a big gap.

3  
4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yep. No,  
5 understood. So, may I give you a concrete example  
6 that would--would bring it to light? So, in  
7 healthcare a lot of the--the work that we're doing now  
8 through NYACH, the New York Alliance for Careers in  
9 Healthcare, which is our industry partnership, is  
10 getting all of the--the emerging needs and occupations  
11 that healthcare providers--sorry, employers are citing  
12 as--as new, and--and different, and so we're working  
13 with--with the CUNY system so that we can inform them,  
14 but also working to establish a longer term  
15 connection so that moving forward sometime in the  
16 future and it will take you a while because these  
17 things do, we will have moved the system so that as  
18 an example, you know, CUNY will be directly connected  
19 to these employers and will be responsive. So, they  
20 won't need, you know, necessarily another entity or  
21 us to make the--to broker the relationship. We'll  
22 have succeeded in this ongoing continuous feedback,  
23 but it's just an example, but and we would aim to do  
24 that, you know, systematically, you know for all of  
25

1 the-the entities that provide training and education  
2 and do skills building. Does that make sense? Uh-hm?

3  
4 BARBARA CHANG: Yeah, and I-I can just  
5 add that it's-it's, you know, training for jobs that  
6 currently don't exist is probably not something I  
7 mean from a-from a hardcore occupational training  
8 perspective we want to stay current, right? We want  
9 to make sure that their jobs are out there when-when  
10 these folks graduate. What we're hearing from the  
11 folks that are again having more sort of global  
12 conversations is that it's not so much about the  
13 actual occupational skill, which we're going to  
14 obviously be focused on, but the foundational  
15 baselined understanding of what kinds of skill are  
16 going to be needed regardless of what kinds of job  
17 you're going to get. So, critical thinking skills  
18 add, you know, continuing to learn. Those kinds of-  
19 of foundational sort of values that you bring into  
20 your job is going to be what works in the next jobs  
21 in-in the future because these things are changing so  
22 rapidly that by the time you enter CUNY today, but-  
23 and you exit, you-you might actually be obsoleting  
24 there in the actual occupational skill that you're  
25 learning. So, you've got to learn how to continue to

3 learn, and to sort of really sharpen those skills  
4 when you're in the workplace and continue to sort of,  
5 you know, be as agile as the—as the jobs are going to  
6 come through. So, that's what we're hearing.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Got it. Well,  
8 I-I have a lot more questions, and we should sit down  
9 and—and just kind of think a little bit more about—  
10 about that, and-and then everything. Every time I  
11 think we've ever spoken and that's—so I don't want to  
12 not mention it in a public hearing like this, but  
13 thinking about communities that—that you're focused  
14 on, low-income communities. But also thinking about  
15 communities that have other barriers to jobs like  
16 language and making sure that we—we invest and we  
17 continue to invest in adult education courses that  
18 are about moving people through English language  
19 learning curriculum that can also be jobs and intents  
20 and skilled trained-training, and that's where I feel  
21 like Sunset Park is going to be a place where—where  
22 if we get it right there, we're going to get it right  
23 in the whole city, and there's—there's a lot of  
24 opportunity there that we can—that we can focus on.  
25 And other things like the laws that we've just  
passed, 1447-A—or C where we can look at an

3 instruction that's on its way that we're going to  
4 have to retrain an entire industry soon, and that's  
5 an educational opportunity where—where we can build  
6 the relationship there, too, in case things change in  
7 the future even within construction. So, this is a  
8 big task no doubt, but I think it's up to us as a  
9 city to think about this, to invest in it, and not  
10 get caught off guard when whole industries will just—  
11 the whole bottom will fall out and we're going to  
12 have—we're going to have thousands of people out of  
13 work and—and figuring out how we—how we—how we  
14 respond to that, how we think about it, and  
15 anticipate it so that it's a good and just response  
16 for all our communities that we represent in New York  
17 City. So, thank you.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Thank you very much,  
20 Council Member. So, on behalf of—again of my  
21 colleague Council Member Cornegy, I'd like to ask a  
22 few more questions, but specifically about in—in  
23 terms of the Workforce Development is there any MWBE  
24 investment that has been done there, and what does  
25 that look like? [background comments]

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I'm sorry,  
4 could-do you know what, could you just clarify that  
5 for me.

6 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: In terms of  
7 workforce development has there been any investment  
8 in MWBE in MWBE development and-and training to do  
9 training as well as--- So, we've identified, and I'm  
10 going to see if we can break this down a little bit.  
11 We've identified a number of industries that may or  
12 may not have them. We-we-we have not explored it as  
13 of yet. I know sitting here a few years ago I-I  
14 mentioned that we've had conversations with the JFK  
15 BID around logistics and-and-and the fact that they-  
16 there was a lot of employment opportunity there and  
17 that they could not necessarily because of  
18 transportation options or a lack thereof recruit in a  
19 way that they wanted to, and that the local people  
20 did not have-the local residents did not have the  
21 skillsets that were necessarily, which-which kind of  
22 creates the natural synergy for-for community and-and  
23 bridges and things that. We put that out, but that  
24 that has yet to manifest itself in so many different  
25 ways, and-and I think one of the things is that when-  
when there's a lack of understanding of these

3 communities and what the communities--what natural  
4 resources exist within those communities like  
5 demographically being between the airports and/or  
6 their local development that is going on on the  
7 waterfronts in Red Hook. How do we capture that, and  
8 whether or not folks from outside of the community  
9 are recognizing the indigenous opportunities that  
10 exist? And so, that gets us back to our MWBE  
11 investment. If any--if there's none then you don't --

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

13 [interposing] So, I'm just trying to figure are you--  
14 I'm sorry. I just want to clarify. Are you asking  
15 are we in terms of workforce development, are we--do  
16 we have any specific offerings that are tailored to  
17 meet the needs of MWBE employers? Is that what  
18 you're--?

19 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] And--  
20 and no. Employers and training opportunities so--  
21 because MWBEs--

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: [interposing]  
23 Yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: --also are engaged  
25 in workforce development as well. So, have we

3 reached out or are there any within the industry? Of  
4 the 21 are any MWBEs--

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

6 [interposing] I see. You're asking are--are any of  
7 our providers MWBE firms.

8 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Uh-hm.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I would have  
10 to come back to you on that. You're talking about  
11 training providers and the--and the operator of our--  
12 our--

13 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] Is  
14 there any investment in MWBE employers or vendors?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Sorry, say  
16 again.

17 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Employers as well,  
18 are any of those MWBEs? What kind of investment are  
19 we doing locally? Because MWBEs are more apt to hire  
20 locally than--than others, right. So, that would be a  
21 question there. So--

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

23 [interposing] At least one of our Workforce 1 Career  
24 Center providers is a--is a certified MWBE. They have  
25 two contracts I think, but I can get--I can get back  
to you with more specifics on--on the rest of them and

1  
2 our training providers because that I don't know off  
3 the top of my head.

4 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: How many and--and how  
5 many of them is local vendors?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Um, that one  
7 is and--and again, I'm specifically responding to the  
8 question about the career center context--

9 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] Yes.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: --because  
11 that's what I have--

12 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] Uh-hm.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: --in my  
14 head. I think it's one of three, right? Three,  
15 yeah.

16 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: The local was in New  
17 York City.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: It is in New  
19 York City. Yeah. One--one of them--

20 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So, the other 18  
21 come from outside of New York City?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: No, no the  
23 vendors operate at more than one location.

24 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Hm.  
25

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah, there  
3 are--there are currently three--

4 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] How  
5 many in--?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Three  
7 organizations operate the 21 centers between them.

8 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Oh, and of the  
9 three?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: One for  
11 sure, one of three is near--both MWBE and New York  
12 City based.

13 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: And the other two--

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:  
15 [interposing] That's a-- I'm, not sure. I can't--I'm  
16 not--

17 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: --operates?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I know--

19 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] Do you  
20 know how many? For instance, well how did the-the-  
21 the New York City based MWBE, how many do they  
22 operate?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Like a third  
24 of the system. It's--it's pretty much--

25 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] Okay.

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: --a third, a  
4 third, a third.

5 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Alright. So,  
6 [pause] okay, and I—I did want—I have a follow-up to  
7 the Council Member, but I think we've kept you here  
8 long enough, and that we—I think we have a meeting  
9 coming up with—with the Commissioner and your group  
10 in the very near future. So, we will have that, and  
11 certainly there are more questions that the committee  
12 has that we'll forward to you--

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:  
14 [interposing] Perfect.

15 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: --and we will have  
16 an answer before our next meeting, and then we can  
17 address that, but I really look forward to continuing  
18 working with you on this very, very important issue,  
19 and opportunity making sure that we're really  
20 leveraging these opportunities, and I think that  
21 there's a lot of ideas here and, you know, up on the  
22 stage here, and—and hopefully we can work  
23 collaboratively to make sure that we make those ideas  
24 reality that we can really take advantage of the  
25 opportunities that are out there. So, thank you.

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Terrific.  
4 Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: And we'll call--call  
6 the next panel. [background comments, pause] Okay,  
7 then next panel Sterling Robinson, VP of CTE UFT,  
8 Alex Gleason from New York City Central Labor  
9 Council; Christian Gonzalez, Center for--Center for  
10 Urban Future; and Stephanie Coles, Project Renewal.  
11 [background comments, pause] Based on whose testimony  
12 that I have in here. [door bangs]

13 FEMALE SPEAKER: Sure.

14 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay, thank you so  
15 much, and I think I now have them all. So, do you  
16 want to start at this end and then--? Okay. [door  
17 bangs] Now that I have Mr. Sterling's testimony in my  
18 hand, maybe we'll start there, alright?

19 STERLING ROBERSON: Well, good morning,  
20 Council Member. Is it on? It's not close enough.  
21 How's that? I think so. Well, good morning and  
22 thank you for the opportunity for me to testify on  
23 behalf of the United Federation of Teachers. My name  
24 is Sterling Roberson, Vice President for Career and  
25 Technical Education High Schools for the UFT. On  
26 behalf of President Michael Mulgrew and all of the

1 200,000 members we represent and officers. It's  
2 great to be here to speak on—to the Committee on  
3 Civil Service and Labor and talk about regarding  
4 Career Pathways and Workforce. Now my testimony I'm  
5 going to read it verbatim. You have it in front of  
6 you. I'm going to highlight it, and really thinking  
7 about the importance of career and technical  
8 education as part of the One New York Plan. When the  
9 plan was released, part of that plan was the  
10 expansion and strengthening of career and technical  
11 education in New York City. One of the things that  
12 we have been doing and advocate for and working with  
13 the Department of Education on is strengthening CTE  
14 across the city. Currently, when we look at the—the  
15 scope of CTE we have approximately 47 designated CTE  
16 schools. We have close to 300 programs and about 130  
17 academic high schools. The reason why that's  
18 significant is because the focus areas in that  
19 expansion is in many of the fields that the City  
20 Administration talked about: Healthcare, technology,  
21 industrial manufacturing, construction, retail, food  
22 services, but the goal of Career and Technical  
23 Education is to ensure that our young people have a  
24 Career Pathways to mid-skill jobs that they are able  
25

1 to gain skills needed to be successful in today's  
2 knowledge-knowledge economy. So, it's important that  
3 we work collaboratively to provide an infrastructure  
4 so that individuals can benefit and have access and  
5 opportunity to those programs. So, in terms of CTE  
6 in New York City, in terms of those growth  
7 industries, obviously we created more Career and  
8 Technical Education schools. We highlighted running  
9 that on Long Island City where we talked about that's  
10 connected to television and film. If we look at some  
11 of the Workforce Development that has been done like  
12 in the Borough of the Bronx which has healthcare  
13 services. We have a school called HERO, Health,  
14 Education and Research Opportunity schools. Each one  
15 of these schools are themed to focus on areas that we  
16 know are booming sectors in New York. Obviously,  
17 we've also put together in New York City an Advisory  
18 Council that is made up of volunteer industry folks  
19 as well as higher education partners. So that we are  
20 not just creating programs, but we are creating an  
21 authentic pathway for young people. So, in a school  
22 when you have a Career and Technical Education  
23 program, the program is not only supported by  
24 industry that signs off on the program. It's also  
25

1 [bell] approved by the City as well as the State.  
2  
3 So, with that being said, what I can say is that we  
4 need to continue in our effort to be able to provide  
5 opportunities for many of our young people and create  
6 the kinds of pathways that we know that leads to jobs  
7 where many of our folks can provide for their  
8 families. But moving forward, one key thing I want  
9 to make sure that I leave with is—leave members with  
10 is that we also have to do a major focus on how do we  
11 deal with many of our populations that are like  
12 students with disabilities, English Language  
13 Learners. We have to do as much as we've made many  
14 gains, we still have some work to do in those  
15 particular areas so that we can provide opportunities  
16 for all New Yorkers especially many of our  
17 populations that need our support. So, thank you  
18 very much for allowing me to testify.

19 CHRISTIAN GONZALEZ RIVERA: Good morning,  
20 Chair Miller and Council Member Perkins. So my name  
21 is Christian Gonzalez Rivera, and I'm a Senior  
22 Researcher at the Center for an Urban Future. We're  
23 an independent non-partisan research organization  
24 based here in Manhattan that generates sustainable  
25 public policies to reduce inequality and increasing

3 economic opportunity. For more than 20 years the  
4 Center has focused on skill building, and—and jobs,  
5 you know, publishing reports on subjects ranging from  
6 the importance of ESOL to adult basic education, and  
7 Workforce Development. As you know, we published  
8 the—the first independent assessment of Career  
9 Pathways a year after it was established, since then  
10 we also publish reports on how the workforce system  
11 could better serve New York's immigrant-immigrant  
12 workers and also on the challenges that small  
13 businesses face in connecting to the Workforce  
14 Development system. So, thank you for the  
15 opportunity to testify. As you know, Career Pathways  
16 is—is a strategy for boosting economic opportunity  
17 that really works for New York. In the past, you  
18 know, Workforce Development has relied on placing as  
19 many people into jobs as possible with little regard  
20 for quality or fit, but to its credit the de Blasio  
21 Administration has acknowledged that human capital  
22 development is one of the most important factors in  
23 ensuring economic opportunity for New Yorkers, and  
24 also set about creating a blueprint for how New York  
25 might achieve—might really create a human capital  
development system that works. But our research has

1 shown that there—there are some serious barriers to  
2 implementation that could really derail the momentum  
3 that has been built, and I'll mention five of those  
4 recommendations very briefly. You have for the  
5 descriptions in the written description—in the  
6 written testimony in front of you. But the first is  
7 really that we need to fully fund Career Pathways  
8 with local city funds at least at the levels that are  
9 indicated in the report. So, as you know, you know,  
10 New York City really can't count on federal support  
11 right now, and the state has been way too slow to  
12 act. And while philan—private philanthropic funds  
13 have driven a lot of the innovation in the field  
14 scaling up models that work in Workforce Development  
15 will take a concerted effort from the city to provide  
16 funding that is flexible, and this is very crucial.  
17 You know, funding that is flexible and attuned  
18 crucially to the demands of New York's  
19 entrepreneurial Workforce Development providers, and  
20 that's something that's currently not happening with—  
21 with public—with publicly available funds. The  
22 second—the second recommendation is that some of that  
23 funding needs to be set aside for rigorous evaluation  
24 of programs, and setting up a research  
25

1 infrastructure, and this is no small thing. I mean  
2 just last week the Center for an Urban Future held a  
3 forum where we asked five respected leaders in the  
4 workforce community what would it take to really  
5 scale up what works in Workforce Development? And  
6 it's like you really serve more people with effective  
7 programs. And one of the main things that came out  
8 is that there's not enough rigorous research that  
9 really shows what works, and then how to scale up  
10 what works. I mean it's like there's just not the  
11 information there. As a result, public contracts too  
12 often end up going to organizations that produce the  
13 best RPFs, not necessarily the ones that are actually  
14 producing the best models. And because federal  
15 funding and, you know, a lot of local funding is not  
16 well suited [bell] to the need of the most effective  
17 programs. There are many providers that are choosing  
18 just not to play with the city at all, to just not  
19 accept public programs and this, of course, is a  
20 crisis when we're talking about how to scale up the  
21 programs that work. Very quickly, the next thing  
22 that needs to happen is—is—is to ensure that  
23 providers have incentives to work with small  
24 businesses. Right now, it's a business that's based  
25

1 on value, how many people you can place into jobs,  
2 but the fact is that small businesses don't -can't  
3 always hire 30 or 40 people at a time. I mean you  
4 can't always hire in large volumes so they're really  
5 being left out of the workforce system, and this is a  
6 very big-big issue. Because, of course, small  
7 businesses is where the growth is in New York City's  
8 economy. Industry partnerships need to be made  
9 accountable. That's something that, you know, of  
10 course I mean there was—the whole conversation we  
11 just had now. You know, one of the toughest jobs for  
12 Workforce Development providers, you know, whether  
13 they're non-profits or for-profits is to connect with  
14 employers. And industry partnerships were created by  
15 Career Pathways exactly to do that. Yet, they're  
16 largely being operated in the dark by-by SBS. I mean  
17 some of what we learned today is—is information that  
18 is coming out to the public for the first time. So,  
19 accountability is a huge issue when it comes to—to  
20 industry partnerships because they're really the  
21 lynchpin of Career Pathways. Without that employer  
22 connection, the—the Workforce Development system is  
23 really left afloat. And, you know, when we did our  
24 independent evaluation two years ago, this is what we  
25

3 found, and it's still the case today two years later.  
4 So, there's a big issue.

5 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [off mic]

6 CHRISTIAN GONZALEZ RIVERA: Yeah.

7 ALEX GLEASON: Good morning. My name is  
8 Alex Gleason and I'm the Policy Associate at the New  
9 York City Central Labor Council of the AFLCIO. This  
10 is my colleague Aaron Darsky, who's the Government  
11 Affair Director at the Consortium for Worker  
12 Education. We represent 1.3 million workers across  
13 300 affiliated unions, and advocate for lifting the  
14 floor on standards and wages for all workers in New  
15 York City. The Central Labor Council's Workforce  
16 Development arm, the Consortium for Worker Education  
17 or CWE, operates programs positively impacting every  
18 neighborhood and tens of thousands of workers  
19 annually, and this is only one example of the many  
20 that the labor movement has to show how the floor can  
21 be lifted. The Consortium for Worker Education  
22 provides a range of Workforce Development programs  
23 through their more than 30 community-based  
24 organizations and its 29 union partnerships. One  
25 program in particular, Jobs to Build On, is funded in  
part by the City Council, and has trained more than

1  
2 14,400 individuals while placing 19,000 in jobs with  
3 an average wage of \$14 per hour. Last year alone,  
4 Jobs to Build On created and tracked over 2,000  
5 placements connecting workers with classes, skills  
6 and certifications, Jobs to Build On places workers  
7 on track for in-demand positions with opportunities  
8 for training and career ladders. CWE trains tens of  
9 thousands of other workers through a multitude of  
10 programs across industries. One industry the labor  
11 movement is particularly equipped to train and  
12 prepare workers for is in construction. A unionized  
13 apprenticeship program is only successful when there  
14 is a pipeline of work to grow and expand market  
15 share. This is made possible through vigorous safety  
16 and licensing standards as well as successful labor  
17 management partnerships. Fundamentally, this is  
18 controlled by standards government places on  
19 projects. Development is a vehicle for economic  
20 opportunity that can have long run benefits. As  
21 local hire and Pipelines to Apprenticeship have been  
22 established and implemented, the city's communities  
23 and tax base benefit. According to the Economic  
24 Policy Institute, minorities accounted for 61.8% of  
25 all city residents union apprenticeships and black

1  
2 construction workers earned 36.1% more than black  
3 non-union construction workers. This goes directly  
4 back into communities most in need of investment and  
5 development. Union training and standards are not  
6 only anti-poverty tools, but positive contributors to  
7 the neighborhood multiplier effect. The labor  
8 movement has already built the infrastructure to  
9 train and connect workers with careers. It is  
10 specifically our job. The New York City Labor-  
11 Central Labor Council and Consortium for Worker  
12 Education are prepared to collaborate in any ways  
13 that connect workers with education and training  
14 necessary to succeed in the workplace, and we are  
15 happy to answer any questions you may have. [pause]

16 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Thank you, Mr.  
17 Gleason. So, we talked to that—we did say we'd get  
18 back to data and accountability [bell] and one of the  
19 questions that we did not get to ask was—was the  
20 tracking and placement statistics of the industries,  
21 whether it was done by industry, whether it was done  
22 by borough and demographics, how do you grab data on-  
23 on job placement around the city? Yeah.

24 STERLING ROBERSON: [off mic]

25 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: That's correct.

3 STERLING ROBERSON: [off mic] We have  
4 that and I believe it is--

5 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So you have your mic  
6 on?

7 STERLING ROBERSON: [on mic] So, yes. I  
8 mean we—we ourselves I mean we do not gather this  
9 data on—on placement. This is something that the  
10 city does.

11 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So, does—do—do—do  
12 the vendors provide any services? Do—where do we  
13 access that information?

14 STERLING ROBERSON: So, you would have to  
15 ask SBS for—for all of the—the placement that's done  
16 through—through Workforce 1, and then there's also  
17 placement that's done by individual non-profits, and  
18 that's work that you'd have to ask specifically the—  
19 those non-profits for that information.

20 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay, is that  
21 information readily available? Has it been difficult  
22 to obtain that? I think you said—you started your  
23 testimony by saying that the first issue was lack of  
24 access to—to this data.

25 STERLING ROBERSON: Yes, I mean one of  
the—one of the biggest issues here is that when we

1 think about the Workforce Development system, it's  
2 not just one agency. It's six different agencies and  
3 it's not just one, you know, a few organizations.  
4 It's dozens and dozens of organizations. All of them  
5 collect different information. Those that are  
6 publicly funded deliver that information to—to public  
7 agencies. Those that are not may deliver it to their  
8 own funders. All this data is collected in different  
9 ways, and it's not always possible to connect. I  
10 mean it's, you know, one piece of data with another  
11 piece of data depending on—on who it's delivered to.  
12 So one of the biggest challenges here is really  
13 having some kind of common metrics that show what  
14 exactly is the workforce system throughout—producing?  
15 Who is being helped? How are they being helped, and  
16 what are really the metrics that make sense, and  
17 right now we don't really have those common metrics,  
18 although part of the work around Career Pathways was  
19 exactly to do that, develop common metrics that we'll  
20 be able to show them.

22 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Based on the  
23 testimony of the Administration, do you feel that—  
24 that—do you feel any better about the data that you  
25 received this morning?

1  
2                   STERLING ROBERSON: Well, it's good that  
3 we received some information. So, you know,  
4 definitely thank you for holding this hearing but, of  
5 course, I mean we need ongoing accountability. I  
6 mean it's not something should happen once every few  
7 years because basically the Workforce system-the big  
8 picture here is that when we're thinking about human  
9 capital development system, right, I mean it's like  
10 those of us here who have the benefit of, you know,  
11 like I did I mean going to four years of college, my  
12 human capital development system was high school to  
13 college to grad school. But the fact is, I mean it's  
14 like if you don't go to a four-year college, there's  
15 not really a system for you. There isn't a human  
16 capital development system for you. So, here we've  
17 been talking about different programs, different  
18 initiatives, et cetera, et cetera, and these are all  
19 big-these are all small pieces of what really is a  
20 large human capital development system that is not-it  
21 doesn't yet exist. You know, basically if you don't  
22 have four years of college there is not really a  
23 cohesive system for you, and what we really need is  
24 to know all these different program, how are they  
25 working together to really move the needle on skills

1 building for those people that, you know, don't have  
2 that--that--

3  
4 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] So I  
5 would disagree. I would say that civil service was  
6 that--that had it driven in the past considering that  
7 there's over 305 employees--city employees there  
8 that's simply take an exam, and--and have a career,  
9 but even that has not been developed over the last  
10 year and an occurrence over the last few years that  
11 we have actually gotten away from that, and--and  
12 certainly there's great benefits to that as well.  
13 Mr. Roberson, on the CTEs I know we--we have Benjamin  
14 Franklin and--and the High Schools of Sciences, right,  
15 in the district, and--and I want you--I know you and I  
16 have had conversations about potential CTEs in the  
17 district and there's value in bringing them in, but  
18 have been able to jump through those hoops to--to make  
19 I a reality. And for those programs that have come  
20 in, and this kind of speaks to what you were saying  
21 about data and--and vendors and those who are  
22 providing services, and--and whether or not they are  
23 up to snuff. So, we have one program, the  
24 Technologies Program. We--and--and they are on a  
25 campus that has four schools in it, and--and--and

3 participate in this particular campus of technologies  
4 program between SOA (sic) and Council funding and DOE  
5 funding. So, we have them up and running, but we  
6 have one classroom that lacks computers. The other  
7 classrooms has the computers, but is not wired. The  
8 other one—and the other one is wired, has computers,  
9 and has air conditioning that is necessary as well,  
10 right. So, even when we make the investment, we  
11 don't have the type of coordination. What kind of  
12 real commitment is that when we can—when—when Council  
13 can come up with dollars, DOE can do certain things,  
14 and—and but we can't put three classrooms together to  
15 make this a reality considering the amount of  
16 investments that have already been made. Is this  
17 typical?

18           STERLING ROBERSON: I think it's typical  
19 in a sense that any time you are coordinating from  
20 various entities it sometimes becomes a challenge to  
21 execute things fully through. I think one of the  
22 things and one of the lessons that we've learned is  
23 that we've—we've done a lot of investment in terms of  
24 the hardware, in terms of technology, but we may not  
25 have anticipated how rapidly broadband connectivity  
was going to move us, right? Just like we spread the

3 lot over the years in buying—buying computers and  
4 disc and—and DVDs and now everything is moving toward  
5 Cloud based, right. So the challenge any educational  
6 institution is how do you keep up? So, even though  
7 you make those investments, it's really about how do  
8 we try to anticipate where the industry is going. I  
9 mean we—we do that in terms of labor market  
10 industries, but it's one thing about the technology,  
11 and then there's the next thing about what we need to  
12 do to sort of put the infrastructure together so that  
13 it is successful and you don't have these impediments  
14 to progress.

14 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So—so and I will say  
15 one, this year will be their first graduating class.  
16 So, I—I wouldn't anticipate that they'd be antiquated  
17 in—in four years in--

18 STERLING ROBERSON: Correct.

19 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: --in that manner but  
20 in terms of—of—of partnerships, what does a CTE  
21 partnership look like whether it's with the trades or  
22 other corporate sponsorships and partnerships that  
23 exist as well. I know that on the—on—the Advisory  
24 Board of—of—of—of—for Workforce Development we have  
25 groups like Linked-In and Facebook and—and—and other

3 folks like that, but I have not—have not seen whether  
4 or not they actually have apprenticeships or other  
5 programs that actually facilitate employment locally.  
6 I—what I've seen, and perhaps there's more data out  
7 there, is that the—the—they—they kind of have more of  
8 a national and an international workforce, and that  
9 they're not investing in—in local communities that  
10 they're in, and I think that we've seen that with a  
11 number of companies in the city here. How do we get  
12 around that, and then how is—is there, in fact, any  
13 such partnerships that existing with the DOE?

14           STERLING ROBERSON: So, in New York City  
15 there is what is known as a Career and Technical  
16 Education Advisory Council. That Council is a—is a  
17 separate entity from the department. It makes  
18 recommendations. It's made up of volunteer business  
19 folks from a variety of industry. Part of the Chair  
20 Leader is a partnership in New York, Kathy Well's  
21 group as well as small businesses. There's education  
22 folks that—that sit on that committee, and one of the  
23 things that they do is they connect directly to the  
24 schools based on their industry. The Commission is  
25 broke up with the advisories. It has commissions. So  
there's an Advisory Council, and then there's

1 specific commissions that deal with today's industry.  
2 So, there's a Healthcare Commission. There's an IT  
3 Commission. There's a Hospitality and Tourism.  
4 There's a commission for each one of those areas. So  
5 they guide and help schools as well as educators and  
6 administrators what exactly—what's happening in the  
7 industry, how do they review curricula? How do they  
8 look at how we assess where students are? What are  
9 the employability skills that they're looking at?  
10 So, we work with the industries to actually develop a  
11 cohesive ecosystem that allows for that Career  
12 Pathway for that child to be successful. So, that—  
13 then that devising for it is key in our area because  
14 without their expertise and knowledge as well as  
15 providing work based learning opportunities that  
16 correct—connected to the curricula. So, if you're in  
17 automotive and you're working with the Greater New  
18 York Automobile Dealers Association knowing where the  
19 jobs are located, working with the—the dealers so  
20 that you know that there's some outcome at the end of  
21 that education for the young person.

22  
23 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Interesting about  
24 that we have a—kind of one of those auto tech schools  
25 in—in the district, and after about \$18,000 in

1 tuition and—and they were not providing the  
2 prescribed man hour—prescribed technical hours in  
3 order for them to move onto an apprenticeship. Do—  
4 do—obviously we're taking a look at that in advance  
5 that in order for you to qualify, you have to have X  
6 amount or two hours or whatever for whatever  
7 industry--

9 STERLING ROBERSON: [interposing] Right.

10 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: --there is that—that  
11 there is oversight on this. Obviously, they're a  
12 private organization so—

13 ALEX GLEASON: Council Member, if I may  
14 add, what you're describing is—is not unique just to  
15 that industry. It's something that—and Aaron might  
16 speak, will speak more to this, but it seems to me  
17 that intermediaries are constantly being created to  
18 do Workforce Development where they're already  
19 successful programs in place, and that the small  
20 amount of dollars that are actually at the discretion  
21 of the city through various programs could be used  
22 putting people through the already existing  
23 intermediaries rather than creating their own  
24 especially when the intermediaries being created are  
25 connecting folks to jobs that frankly don't have the

1 same sort of career ladders that existing programs  
2 already have, or relationships or instructors et  
3 cetera, et cetera, et cetera. And—and that's like  
4 you're talking about the most egregious symptom of it  
5 right, which are these sort of predatory for-profit  
6 schools that are teaching people many of which the  
7 same skills that a union apprenticeship would for  
8 free, but there are other examples of that as well in  
9 practically every industry. [pause]

11 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay. I want to,  
12 yeah, it's true, of course. Council Member Perkins.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: So, this [pause]  
14 Can you hear me? [laughs] How—how are we being  
15 accountable for this—these—these trainings that are  
16 going nowhere?

17 CHRISTIAN GONZALEZ RIVERA: So, I can  
18 speak to the one that happened last year is—and I can  
19 recognize Councilman Dromm on the Education Committee  
20 where they held hearings in New York City around  
21 career and technical education for oversight where  
22 they're now required to report the—the status of the  
23 number of kids in programs, where the programs are  
24 located. It gives the full entire landscape of what  
25 we're doing within the city of those programs. This

1 way there's transparency as it relates to who's being  
2 impacted, what communities are deficient, where do-  
3 should we put resources to expand some of those  
4 programs so on the education side of what we're doing  
5 in career and technical education. The Council has  
6 been instrumental in being able to create an  
7 oversight through an ability to be able to do that.  
8 So, I think that has become important, and it moves  
9 our-our school system in a-in a way where it's-it's  
10 more cohesive.  
11

12 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: So, how do we-  
13 how do we get better informed about what's working  
14 and what's not working? What's being accountable and  
15 what's not being accountable?

16 CHRISTIAN GONZALEZ RIVERA: I mean part-  
17 part of what's really needed is to make sure that in  
18 every contract that-- Sorry, for Workforce  
19 Development services, part of the money is actually  
20 going to evaluation and-and-and data collection, and  
21 that's-that's part of the issue that's not happening  
22 now. I mean it's very often public contracts are  
23 actually underfunded. I mean there was actually not  
24 enough money to even-for-for providers to actually  
25 the work that they need to do let alone collect data,

3 let alone then contract with an evaluator to find out  
4 whether what they're doing is working. So, on the  
5 private foundation side, I mean it's like  
6 organizations that are lucky enough to get funding  
7 from foundations, actually do have that. I mean it's  
8 like where foundations do want to know detailed  
9 information about how the program is working, for  
10 whom it's working, demographics of the people that  
11 are going through program and all of this, but on the  
12 public side, that's not as much present. And so,  
13 that's one of the issues that really needs to be  
14 really-really needs to be looked at.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Yeah. So, what  
16 is your suspicion of the-of the shortcoming?

17 CHRISTIAN GONZALEZ RIVERA: Why are there  
18 issues?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Well, there's  
20 shortcoming you're-you're analyzing, and I'm just  
21 wondering what-what do you-why is that the case?

22 CHRISTIAN GONZALEZ RIVERA: Where-where  
23 the shortcomings are?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Yes.

25 CHRISTIAN GONZALEZ RIVERA: Well, I mean  
the-the fact-the fact is that when you have a program

1 that's not funded at a level where you could—you are  
2 able to have instructors that of the very highest  
3 quality, where you're able to have wraparound  
4 services for people because it's not just the skills  
5 building part but, of course, you know, people face a  
6 lot of life issues that also impinge on their ability  
7 to be able to get the skills they need to be  
8 competitive in the labor force. When you don't have  
9 the ability to—to provide those supports, that's a  
10 problem. Once you place somebody into a job, if you  
11 don't have the ability to be able to follow up with  
12 that person and also with their supervisors to be  
13 able to say if there are any issues please call us,  
14 you know, to be able to—to basically smooth out that  
15 transition between the skills part and the actually  
16 placing someone into job. If you don't have the—the  
17 funding to do that then that's another place where—  
18 where the—the process of connecting people to jobs  
19 can actually fall short. So, basically every step of  
20 the process I mean there are potential leaks in that  
21 pipeline between taking people, you know, building up  
22 their skills, and putting them into jobs. But there  
23 often isn't enough funding really to do all of those  
24 pieces. And so, because when you think about, I mean,  
25

3 it's like, you know, people—if you take somebody and  
4 basically his job title out of the education system.  
5 So they're basically going from a system that invests  
6 \$19,000 a person, you know, ahead per year on them to  
7 a system that--that sometimes invests less than  
8 \$1,000 a person. You know, so I mean that's an  
9 enormous transition there, and the—if they're lucky,  
10 they'll have programs that can invest several  
11 thousand dollars on them if they're in a privately  
12 funded program. But at the scale that we need, I  
13 mean given the huge needs in New York City, we just  
14 don't have enough public funding that's dedicated to  
15 the programs that really, really work, and we're not  
16 looking at how what we're doing is actually working.  
17 So, at every level I mean there—there are shortcoming  
18 really.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: So I guess,  
19 there are some programs we know that are working?

20 STERLING ROBERSON: Yes, we do. So, for  
21 instance, I mean to—to give an example from the—the  
22 panel that we held last week on or actually the week  
23 before I guess on scaling up programs that work, we  
24 had the head of Per Scholas as one of the—the people  
25 in one of the—we had the head of First Scholars (sic)

1 as one of our panelists, and this is a program, of  
2 course, that's been evaluated that, you know, there's  
3 that it's been shown to work. Yet, they, and they  
4 have been able to expand in New York City to a  
5 certain extent, but a lot of their expansion has  
6 actually been national, and that's because a program  
7 like theirs, they have not been able to find always,  
8 I mean it's like the public funding to allow them to  
9 serve more people in New York. So, luckily for them,  
10 because they're working in the tech space, and  
11 there's a lot of, you know, money, in the tech space,  
12 and because they're training people for, you know,  
13 directly for companies that are based in New York,  
14 those companies have been able to support, their work  
15 with-with private funds again. But again, the  
16 problem is that expansion didn't happen through  
17 public funds. It didn't, you know, through taxpayer  
18 dollars. It happened through private work. And so  
19 Barbara Chang actually was talking about something  
20 extremely important here about the-the-importance of  
21 foundational skills. So, you know, getting to  
22 Council Member Menchaca's point about what are the  
23 jobs for the future and how can we prepare for them,  
24 and how do we deal with automation? It's almost  
25

3 impossible to find out to say there's going to be 600  
4 jobs that are growing in this field that is not going  
5 to be automated in 20 years. It's almost impossible  
6 to be able to say that, but what you can do  
7 proactively is right now is say we know that what  
8 people need to succeed in the future are these 21<sup>st</sup>  
9 Century skills, you know, the critical thinking, team  
10 building, et cetera, et cetera. Often those are  
11 called soft skill, but I mean so there's nothing--  
12 there's nothing soft about them. They're really 21<sup>st</sup>  
13 Century skills, the skills of the future, and that  
14 kind of programming doesn't plug directly into a  
15 particular company. So, there are very few private  
16 companies that are going to say hey, I'll fund this  
17 kind of work. So, this is where the public sector  
18 really needs--

19 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] Those  
20 are really supportive skills on top of whatever  
21 training--

22 STERLING ROBERSON: [interposing]  
23 Exactly, and that's what the public really needs.

24 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: --on this and that--  
25 that--that obviously is something that is--is not--may  
or may not be added into the cost whether or not a

1 person can get to a location and—and operate  
2 independently, and be able to train because they lack  
3 other skills or have other like situations. But I'm  
4 sorry Council Member.  
5

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Oh, thank you,  
7 sir.

8 FEMALE SPEAKER: I just wanted to  
9 interject briefly the Consortium actually trains  
10 workers citywide. We like to say that there is no  
11 wrong door. You have a constituent that might live  
12 in your district, but work in Helen Rosenthal's  
13 district, and we make sure that we have brick and  
14 mortar services available to that worker no matter  
15 where they live or work.

16 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [off mic]

17 FEMALE SPEAKER: I'm sorry. We have  
18 citywide services, your soft skills, your workforce  
19 training available to workers citywide. Also, to  
20 your earlier point, Council Member, I wanted to  
21 interject that we also do—the Consortium is very data  
22 driven, and we have a—a wealth data not only on the  
23 recipients, on the programs. Of course, it's self-  
24 identifying. So, it is—it is limited in that  
25 respect, but we also do retention up to a year after

1 the person is placed in a program. So, in addition  
2 the career counseling, we really track them where  
3 they go after they leave us, and I think that we're  
4 unique in that respect.

5  
6 ALEX GLEASON: I just wanted to point out  
7 to—to your question Council Member Perkins about what  
8 works and what doesn't, and one of the big problems  
9 we've encountered at the Central Labor Council in our  
10 work on large building retrofits, which if we can  
11 complete it, we'll create thousands and thousands of  
12 jobs every year on Union Pathways if we insert labor  
13 standards into the sub cities of those, but one of  
14 the things we've found was that if you look at the  
15 federal level where most of the Workforce Development  
16 dollars are coming from, and the Administration  
17 alluded to this, the problem is it's so disjointed  
18 that nobody actually knows where the money goes or  
19 what it goes to it would seem. There's a really  
20 great report that when Bill Thompson was Comptroller,  
21 he did on this, he did two reports on this actually,  
22 and I can find out the names and get them to your  
23 office of the reports. But he goes into just how  
24 difficult it is to actually figure out where the  
25 money is. So, the city ends up being unable to touch

1 a vast majority of it, which is tied up in some-in  
2 strings, and so the money doesn't actually get to  
3 where it needs to go, which is why we end up relying  
4 on these public-private partnerships to fill skill  
5 gaps, and I think also sometimes, and—and granted I'm  
6 speaking as the labor guy. So, this is sort of my  
7 role, but sometimes I think when we're talking about  
8 Workforce Development, we get tied up in the skill  
9 gap discussion that everything can be solved by  
10 filling a skill gap with another certification or  
11 another class. So, today, it might be in vogue to  
12 tell everyone to go and learn to code, and last week  
13 it might have been vogue to tell—in vogue to tell  
14 everyone to go our and learn how to be a pharmacist,  
15 but the reality is at the end of the day if we can  
16 use government in a smart way. And we're leveraging  
17 of our dollars in a smart way on capital funding to  
18 create long-term Workforce Development programs like  
19 with large building mandatory retrofits, you could—  
20 you could start to game out and plan a generation's  
21 worth of work, and work in consort with the unions,  
22 with the training funds, et cetera to create many,  
23 many positions, many, many apprenticeships and  
24 provide local hire opportunities.  
25

3 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: How long is Long  
4 term?

5 ALEX GLEASON: I'm sorry.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: You mentioned  
7 long-term Workforce Development.

8 ALEX GLEASON: Sure. I mean well if  
9 we're—if we're thinking about to the point about the  
10 jobs that haven't been created yet, we should be  
11 thinking 20, 30, 40, 50 years. I use our example of  
12 large building mandatory retrofits as a great example  
13 because think about it. The government has the  
14 ability to mandate something. Through that mandate  
15 there will workforce opportunities generated. You  
16 know that there is some amount of quantity that will  
17 have to meet that mandate, and so you can start to  
18 actually game out and figure out how many people in  
19 each decade afterwards it will take and that's only  
20 one example. You could—you could look at all sort of  
21 projects, but fundamentally, my point is the  
22 government has the ability, the city has the ability  
23 using their dollars and investment to create jobs,  
24 and if—if it's done in a way where you're thinking  
25 holistically about long-run opportunities, there are  
more long-run investments in creating Career Pathways

3 through say a union apprenticeship than there is in  
4 the short-term gain of a low-wage job that isn't  
5 going to generate much revenue. It's very true that  
6 we got all the jobs back we lost in the Recession.  
7 The question is what's the wage differential of pre  
8 and post, and what were those jobs created in?  
9 Mostly low-wage, low skill jobs, and that's the  
10 problem.

11                   STERLING ROBERSON: So support what he  
12 just said, I mean—and also to—to get to your point  
13 about how long—how long term is long term? Well, our  
14 public education system is long term. Universities  
15 are in it for, you know, for the long term as well,  
16 but when it comes to human capital development, when  
17 it comes to Workforce Development programs, we don't  
18 know how long it's going to last. I mean we were  
19 just talking about a program that might just end at—  
20 end at the end of this year. Imagine if our public  
21 education systems and our universities might just cut  
22 out after your junior year. We don't really have a  
23 system, a human capital development system for people  
24 who don't go to four years of college, and that's the  
25 central problem that we're really talking about.

3 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Thank you. Thank  
4 you. Thank you to the panel, and I—and I—you know, I  
5 would just say, too, in—in listening to that, I think  
6 by not having that we kind of lend ourselves to those  
7 predatory folks that come in and exploit the  
8 industry. And in the time when the economy is really  
9 bad, every commercial is a training school for  
10 something that's going to give you the skill to earn  
11 big dollars and—and folks go out and then ultimately  
12 they are not even providing the skill level that  
13 allow you to walk into those jobs or even the next  
14 level of training. So, it's certainly something that  
15 it's always about enforcement that we create  
16 opportunities for a target audience, but if you don't  
17 have enforcement, and you're not understanding and  
18 preparing that target audience, then it kind of goes  
19 by the wayside. So, data is important, and what all  
20 you do is important as well. Thank you.

21 STERLING ROBERSON: Thank you.

22 CHRISTIAN GONZALEZ RIVERA: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: And we've been joined  
24 by Council Member Eric Ulrich. [pause] The Brooklyn  
25 Chamber and Opportunity for a Better Tomorrow, Evelyn

3 Ortiz, Albert and Nelson Gonzalez. [background  
4 comments, pause]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Did you get a  
6 chance to introduce yourselves? Okay, by all means.  
7 [laughter] [background comments]

8 Hi. Good afternoon, Committee, Council  
9 Member Perkins. I'm Varun Sanyal, Vice President of  
10 Economic Development at the Brooklyn Chamber of  
11 Commerce here delivering testimony on behalf of our  
12 President and CEO Andrew Hoan, and joining me here is  
13 my colleague Athena Hernandez whose the Director of  
14 Workforce Development Program. Good Help. Job  
15 creating and Workforce Development is a key priority  
16 for the Brooklyn Chamber because an effective  
17 workforce is vital to meeting the needs of a robust  
18 economic development occurring in Brooklyn. In the  
19 Brooklyn Chamber's 2016 State Member Issued Survey,  
20 52% of participants indicated that they planned to  
21 hire 1 to 5 new employees. However, many firms said  
22 that finding and hiring qualified workers was a  
23 challenge. We believe that one way to reduce the  
24 occurrence of short-term placements is to increase  
25 the focus to employer led workforce development.  
While job placement satisfies recruitment goals, gaps

1 will appear in a system that individuals are not  
2 comprehensively supported by violating their current  
3 skills. Inquiring about their desire to go to work and  
4 mapping out a tangible pathway to a sustainable  
5 career through training and skill development.

6 Judging from the placements that we facilitate and  
7 sectors such as hospitality, accommodations, food  
8 services, construction and manufacturing these  
9 sectors largely lack accessibility to training and  
10 entry level careers especially for those that come  
11 from economic disadvantaged populations.

12 Apprenticeship and training opportunities that create  
13 a pipeline to these sectors will particularly benefit  
14 individuals who do not have a post-secondary  
15 education and provides prospects of financial  
16 security. We recommend subtle enhancements to the  
17 current city system of Workforce Development focused  
18 on empowering employees to be the centerpiece of the  
19 network.

20  
21 1. Increase accessibility and funding  
22 for on-the-job training and customized training  
23 programs, along with a focus on streamlining the  
24 process for accessing the funding available through  
25 these programs.

2                   2.     Creation of satellite workforce  
3 officers as opposed to one primary center that may  
4 not be accessible for residents living in  
5 neighborhoods across the borough and city.

6                   3.     Enhance funding for training  
7 vouchers for Workforce 1 participant to seek employer  
8 mandated certificate and training programs that may  
9 otherwise not be available through the centers.

10                   New York and Brooklyn continues to lead  
11 in private sector job creation, and it is critical  
12 that a Workforce program as innovative and adaptable  
13 as the innovation economy of the borough. On behalf  
14 of the members of the Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce,  
15 thank your for the opportunity to testify. I look  
16 forward to working with you and your colleagues to  
17 strengthen Workforce Development across our city.

18 [pause] [coughing]

19                   EVELYN ORTIZ: Good morning. My name is  
20 Evelyn Ortiz and I am the Chief External Affairs  
21 Officer at Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow. Thank  
22 to the members of the Council. I'm pleased here-to  
23 be here today to provide testimony regarding the  
24 city's Career Pathways program and-- Is it on? Can  
25 you hear me? Sorry. [laughs] I apologize. Sorry.

3 Okay. So, founded in 1983, OBT is currently one of  
4 New York City's largest provider of Workforce  
5 Development and Educational Services [bell] for  
6 opportunity youth ages 17 to 24 and adults who are  
7 disconnected from education and/or employment. OBT  
8 serves over 4,000 youth and adults annually across  
9 six sites in Brooklyn and Queens within the  
10 neighborhoods of Sunset Park, Bushwick Bedford-  
11 Stuyvesant and Jamaica, Queens. OBT's programming is  
12 based on a model that combines the most comprehensive  
13 academic and vocational support needed to move  
14 individuals to self-sufficiency. First, we want to  
15 thank the City for the recognition that a Pathways  
16 approach means that Workforce training is not  
17 necessarily linear, nor one-size-fits all. Community  
18 based organizations like OBT have an opportunity to  
19 better support programs participants with a more  
20 holistic group of services that have multiple entry  
21 and exit points offering ongoing educational and  
22 career advancement opportunities at every step of  
23 their career and critical interventions such as  
24 childcare assistance, housing referrals, food stamps  
25 and other benefits. The Career Pathways model  
aspires to create this multiple entry, multiple exit

1 approach that not only aligns with our mission as an  
2 organization, but reflects the reality of what our  
3 communities need to fully participate in the economy—  
4 in the economy of the city. While the Career  
5 Pathways model aims to create a more differentiated  
6 system, at OBT we continue to experience several  
7 factors that put pressure on the system, and require  
8 both additional resources and an increased  
9 coordination of services. For instance, we've  
10 noticed that there's an increased need for basic  
11 skill support. Over the past five years, OBT has  
12 seen some important shifts in who our High School  
13 Equivalency program is serving. For our most recent  
14 cohort in Fiscal Year 17 in Literacy 51% of youth  
15 participants are at a 9<sup>th</sup> Grade level or below with  
16 20% at a 7<sup>th</sup> Grade level or below. In numeracy, 63%  
17 are at 7<sup>th</sup> Grade level or below, 37% are at 5<sup>th</sup> Grade  
18 level and below. Students are taking longer to pass  
19 a TASC compared to the GED. At OBT we have seen that  
20 the amount of time that it takes someone to prepare  
21 for TASC exam increased from five months to a full  
22 year. While we collaborate with the New York City  
23 Department of Education's District 70 Pathways to  
24 Graduation Program, we've had to make our own  
25

1  
2 investments in strengthening basic skills preparation  
3 for those individuals with the lowest levels of  
4 readiness. The increased amount of time towards  
5 completion requires additional resources and creates  
6 a significant hurdle in the job placement timeline.  
7 There's an increase—an increase in barriers faced by  
8 youth and adults. While OBT has always served youth  
9 with significant barriers to employment, we have seen  
10 increases in the number and level of need. Barriers  
11 include court involved youth, young parents needing  
12 childcare, youth in transitioning—that are  
13 transitioning out of foster care, youth living with  
14 unstable housing conditions or are homeless, food  
15 insecurity, lack of access to transportation and an  
16 increased number of applicants with an IEP. The most  
17 recent data shows approximately 40% of young people  
18 at both OBT's Out-of-School Youth Programs in  
19 Bushwick and in Sunset Park, have received IEP  
20 services in the past.

21 OBT's Successful Bridge Programs: As we  
22 look at our most effective initiatives targeting  
23 youth with significant barriers to employment  
24 requiring strategic city funded Bridge programs, we  
25 have found that individualized services [bell] create

3 high impact support. So, some of these programs  
4 include the Young Adult Literacy Program. These are  
5 all DYCD funded programs, and what we're encouraging  
6 you is to continue to make investments in such Bridge  
7 Programs such as the Young Adult Literacy program. We  
8 have a young adult here today who will testify on  
9 behalf of that program and its success. 72% of  
10 participants were able to make a reading or math game  
11 of which 30% were placed above a 9<sup>th</sup> Grade literacy  
12 level and were placed then in OBT's Full High School  
13 Equivalency Program. The Young Adult Internship  
14 Program Plus, which is the program that focuses on  
15 foster care youth, or who are transitioning out of  
16 foster care, and then the P3 Initiative, which is a  
17 federally funded program, which is alongside with-  
18 with DYCD. The initiative aims to assist young  
19 parents with securing childcare and facilitate  
20 parenting workshops. It increases the timeline for  
21 those young adults because it's taking them longer to  
22 actually obtain their High School Equivalency due to  
23 childcare challenges, and then college persistence.  
24 We understand that young adults who are aiming to go  
25 to college need more supportive services specifically  
once they enroll in college. So, we provide them

1 services while on site while they're in school, and  
2 we've noticed that 68% of our alumni who enrolled in  
3 college in Fiscal Year 16 successfully completed  
4 their first year with a two-year or four-year  
5 institution. We have various programs that address  
6 both youth and adult needs. We spoke about it—it was  
7 spoken about earlier in terms of the adults.  
8 Specifically those who are in need of adult literacy  
9 services, we want to make sure that you understand  
10 that there's a need for—for more investment within  
11 the Adult Literacy programming specifically  
12 contextualized learning. We want to make sure that  
13 adults have access to the employment opportunities  
14 that are available within the communities, and that  
15 they're being skilled up for those opportunities.  
16 Council Member Menchaca specifically stated that  
17 Sunset Park is one of those communities that is  
18 rapidly, you know, it has incredible access to—to  
19 different types of manufacturing jobs and so forth.  
20 We want to make sure that we can upscale our  
21 residents for those opportunities. So, overall what  
22 we're trying to show and say is that there needs to  
23 be more resources that are implemented within  
24 programs that already have—that have demonstrated  
25

1 success. You know, these are city funded programs,  
2 and we understand that, you know, we heard SBS state  
3 that, you know, they--there's a seven--that there was  
4 already a \$7 million investment in Bridge  
5 Programming. We encourage that there's more  
6 investment that is made within the next year, you  
7 know, by 20/20 that they can spend down the \$60  
8 million that they committed to spend down, and that,  
9 you know, if you are encouraging collaborations and  
10 partnerships that there's an investment that is made  
11 and not that the non-profit or like the community-  
12 based organizations are required to make their own  
13 individual investments and require--or are required to  
14 obtain their own private funding in order to make  
15 this happen. Thank you for this. [laughs]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you.

18 Anyone else?

19 NELSON GONZALEZ: Good afternoon. My  
20 name is Nelson Gonzalez. I am the Director of Adult  
21 Employment Programs for Opportunities for a Better  
22 Tomorrow, and I'm here representing my participants.  
23 I would like to share a story of an adult participant  
24 that limited by challenges affecting many New York  
25 City residents, but yet still seeking sustainable

1 employment in order to achieve economic mobility.

2 Let's call her Ms. WB. She is a single mother of  
3 three who has to juggle her time between securing her  
4 children's health, the tuition and shelter needs,  
5 while having to make sure she prepares herself for  
6 her future and that of her children. While searching  
7 for a certification that will support her career  
8 goals, she walked into OBT's Bushwick's Workforce  
9 Resource Center to earn a chance at acquiring  
10 certifications as a Microsoft Office Specialist and  
11 through the National Retail Federation and Customer  
12 Service skills through our adult employment program  
13 for SNAP recipients this past summer. Like her,  
14 there are many that without funding for Bridge  
15 Employment programs, which create pathways into  
16 careers, would find it hard to access such trainings  
17 due to their financial limitations, lack of education  
18 and employment experience. This program is providing  
19 tons of job readiness, case management services, one-  
20 on-one support from job developers that understand  
21 the employer needs, and provides access to job  
22 opportunities that are not readily accessible. We  
23 need to continue to evolve to fit the needs of our  
24 communities as changes is undeniable. Through the  
25

1 implementation of the Career Pathways Initiatives, to  
2 move away from mass recruitment and hiring towards  
3 one focused on education and job training providing  
4 families with sustaining wages, we're stepping in the  
5 right direction. While, we keep in mind individuals  
6 like Ms. WB, we cannot forget to engage the local  
7 and small business sector of our communities.

9 According to our own New York City Department of  
10 Small Business Services, 81% of businesses in New  
11 York City and 84% of those in Brooklyn and Queens are  
12 small businesses. So, these owners of the services  
13 they wear many hats including that of recruiters, and  
14 it is hard for understaffed companies due to  
15 financial restrictions to meet their own recruitment  
16 needs as they remain underserved by most workforce  
17 programs. We must strengthen industry partnerships  
18 with employers to meet their staffing demands, keep  
19 fostering local business growth, and provide  
20 individuals like Ms. WB with access to local  
21 employment opportunities. It is with much delight  
22 that I would inform you that Ms. WB contacted us last  
23 week to thank us of our services and support that she  
24 received while in the program. The approach of  
25 teaching subskills s part of the Certifications

3 Program combined with the one-on-one meetings opened  
4 her eyes to the potentials she did not realize she  
5 had. After completing [bell] the trainings, she  
6 applied for a team member position with a local non-  
7 profit. Not only was she hired, but she hired as a  
8 team leader providing her with a better wage and  
9 opportunity. Please continue to invest in Bridge  
10 Employment Programs, which help high impact support  
11 services and industry credentials for the most under  
12 served populations seeking advancement in order to  
13 sustain themselves and their families, and on their  
14 behalf, I thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Anyone else.

15 ALBERT JOHNSON: Hello. Alright.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: [off mic] Turn  
17 your light on.

18 ALBERT JOHNSON: Yeah, the lights on.  
19 Hello. Okay, good. I am currently a participant  
20 from OB--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Say your name,  
22 please.

23 ALBERT JOHNSON: My name is Albert  
24 Johnson. I-I'm a part-I'm current-I was a  
25 participant in the Young Adult Literacy Program for-

1 and that was formerly, but good morning everyone—good  
2 afternoon everyone. My name is Albert Johnson. I  
3 was born and raised in a Hispanic family in Staten  
4 Island, and for the past 12 years I have been living  
5 in Williamsburg, Brooklyn. I am filled with—I am  
6 filled with joy to share with you that as of last  
7 week I passed a TASC exam. I am overwhelmed know  
8 that in a few weeks I will receive my High School  
9 Equivalency diploma. It may not seem like much to  
10 some people, but it means a large dream all made  
11 possible with the tremendous help I received in the  
12 Young Adult Literacy Program and the Out of School  
13 Youth program and the Opportunities for a Better  
14 Tomorrow. I am here today to tell—to talk you about  
15 the importance of education and Bridge programs like  
16 the Young Adult Literacy Program that are available  
17 for youth who are between the ages of 16 and 24 like  
18 me, seeking to succeed in college or at work, but  
19 need extra support. I joined OBT in 2016 after  
20 dropping out of high school during my sophomore year  
21 when I was only 16 years old. I dropped out not by  
22 choice but life happens. One day while waiting for  
23 the bus to go to school a car hit me and left me  
24 without the ability to walk. You could only imagine  
25

1 the excruciating physical pain and emotion struggle I  
2 was going through. With all that, I still attended  
3 my regular high school walking with crutches, and  
4 when this became too much, I transitioned to home  
5 schooling up until one day this alternative was no-no  
6 longer available. I could not longer go to school  
7 and I felt like I was lost. I fell into depression  
8 for a few years. All I did was sleep, wake up, watch  
9 TV and research about my condition. I couldn't I was  
10 out of school for seven years, and that was—and that  
11 I was 23 years old. I was at a point in my life  
12 where I didn't have many expectations. One day a  
13 friend of mine, Hector Gonzalez, talked to me about  
14 Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow, and how they  
15 helped him get his GED. Hector suggested I give it a  
16 shot, and so I did. OBT welcomed me and it was a  
17 breath of fresh air to be there. After taking the  
18 reading and writing math assessment, I was placed in  
19 the Youth-Adult Literacy Program at the Bushwick  
20 location. It is a Bridge program that would help  
21 bring my readiness—my reading and math scores up so  
22 that I could successfully transition in to OBT's Out  
23 of School Youth Program, where I would get my tasks  
24 and attend job readiness skills and obtain the  
25

1 assistance in enrolling in college or finding  
2 employment. At OBT I felt a true sense of belonging  
3 in the community that cared about me, and that cared  
4 about all the participants. It was hard work since I  
5 had not been in school for a while. I had to  
6 readjust my sleeping schedule and had to cut off on  
7 watching cartoons or whatever. So, I could get to  
8 classes on time. While I was in the program, I had  
9 100% attendance except when my wheelchair broke down.  
10 All my teachers, counselors and staff at OBT helped  
11 me build my confidence, self-esteem and motivation  
12 [bell] being—being sure that I completed my homework  
13 and I—that I participated in all activities. At OBT  
14 I learned academics, financial literacy, how to do my  
15 resume and interview properly. I learned how to  
16 present myself to others, and to network with  
17 professionals. They told me how to dress  
18 professionally and—and received clothing when needed  
19 from their Opportunity Boutique. I also explored  
20 career and college options, also career and college  
21 options. For all those great things I wasn't to  
22 thank OBT. As from someone that came from the Young  
23 Adult Literacy Program, I—I do encourage that you  
24 will continue to invest in programs such as this.  
25

3 Such because coming from me and taking quite a while  
4 to get-to transition from the Young Adult Literacy  
5 Program the Out of School Youth Program and then, you  
6 know, at least they graduated. So, I do have-I do  
7 encourage you as to encourage-to be-to encourage  
8 people like me to become motivated to-to continue,  
9 you know, with furthering my education and career  
10 goals so on and so forth.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you very  
12 much. Mr. Chair.

13 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Thank you. So, I  
14 guess we-we-we've heard from organizations that-that-  
15 that was able to articulate the work that they're  
16 doing in the communities throughout the city  
17 particularly I know of in-in Brooklyn and Queens, and  
18 for-for a full disclosure I've had young folks from  
19 this organization that have interned in my office  
20 and-and done extremely well, and we look forward to  
21 continuing to be able to be support, and I think that  
22 we've been able to answer some of the questions about  
23 what is actually happening with those demographics  
24 and-and individuals who are being served look like.  
25 What communities they are coming from, and that is  
really important for us to go and get that, and I

3 appreciate that, the work that we're doing together.

4 So, thank you. We'll call the next panel.

5 [background comments] The final panel Jessie Layman,

6 Eric Antical (sp?) Arielle Severn, Arielle and Keri

7 Faulhaber [background comments, pause] We did sign

8 and I have testimony from Mr. Lehman in my hand as

9 well as--

10 JESSE LEHMAN: I'd be happy to lead off.

11 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Yeah.

12 JESSE LEHMAN: Alright. Thank you

13 Chairman Miller and Council Member Perkins as well as

14 to all the other Council Members and Council staff

15 who helped make today's hearing possible. I know I

16 won't have time to read through all of my testimony,

17 and so I'll just over some of the key points and some

18 of the recommendations that we have. My name is

19 Jessie Lehman. I'm the Director of Policy at the New

20 York City Employment and Training Coalition. The

21 Coalition is the umbrella organization that

22 represents 180 organizations in New York City that

23 provides some sort of Workforce Development services

24 including some of the folks you've heard from before

25 such as Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow who are

just sitting here. Also the Consortium for Worker

3 Education run through the Central Labor Councils and  
4 member and some of the folks that I'm joined with  
5 here at the table are members of the Coalition and,  
6 you know, we want to present some—some broad  
7 sentiments around Career Pathways and the Path  
8 Forward. I think the first thing to understand is  
9 that the community of Workforce Development providers  
10 is strongly behind the vision of Career Pathways. We  
11 believe that the report that put—was put out three  
12 years ago is the right way forward, and we're glad to  
13 hear representatives from the Administration from SBS  
14 and from the Office of Workforce Development talking  
15 about that vision still being central to this  
16 Administration's plans in the future. However, it  
17 has been three years now since that report was  
18 published and embraced by the Administration. And  
19 there have been unfortunately sort of minimal and  
20 halting progress on some of the key recommendations  
21 within the Career Pathways report as yourselves and  
22 some of the other Council Members that were here  
23 before pointed out in your questions to them. And to  
24 the real focus of our testimony today is on those  
25 areas where there has not been enough progress, and  
we think there needs to be a real urgency of action

1  
2 in the next year to get on track to meeting some of  
3 the goals of the Career Pathways plan, and so our  
4 Recommendation No. 1 and this touches on a topic that  
5 Chairman Miller you brought up. The Administration  
6 must get on track to meeting the budgetary benchmark  
7 of \$60 million in funding for Bridge programming by  
8 2020. It is understandable that they would want to  
9 start out by piloting programs and by testing  
10 programs that work. But there are already many  
11 privately funded and independently operated Bridge  
12 programs out there that are working well, but not at  
13 a sufficient scale. There are the publicly supported  
14 Bridge programs that have been mentioned, and I think  
15 Ms. Mallon mentioned a few really good example: The  
16 La Guardia Community College Bridge to Health Program  
17 for bilingual home health aids. These are all great  
18 programs. There are great models out there. They  
19 need to be scaled up, and scale from funding. The  
20 fact that we are three years in, and we're taking  
21 about \$6.5 million or \$7.5 is not nearly enough. That  
22 is Recommendation Number 1 and Number 2 and Christian  
23 Gonzalez from the Center for Urban Future touched on  
24 some of this as well, is that the industry  
25 partnerships particularly the new ones that have

3 launched simply don't have enough to show for them  
4 for their work so far, and there needs to be an  
5 urgency to getting those really operating and  
6 actually training people, [bell] and I can talk about  
7 some of the numbers in a minute. If we come back  
8 from some of the testimony before that were  
9 concerning to us and that we'd like to see expanded in  
10 the future. And just briefly, my final  
11 recommendation that I will noted I that with regard  
12 to SBS, and the Workforce 1 system, we need to know  
13 who SBS is serving now in order to know who isn't  
14 being served. Jackie Mallon talked about 25,000  
15 people placed in jobs, and just 4,000 people sent to  
16 training through the Workforce 1 system last year.  
17 The real concern for members of our coalition is that  
18 the people who need the most services, whether  
19 they're English Language Learners, people with court  
20 involvement, people who have had long periods of  
21 unemployment and don't have marketable skills, they  
22 aren't getting the services that they need through  
23 Workforce 1. There is a piece of legislation  
24 introduced by Councilman Mathieu Eugene recently,  
25 Intro 1736, which would require SBS to report on the  
key demographic data of who is going through the

3 Workforce 1 system. That would be an important first  
4 step to understanding where we need to go from here.  
5 I'd be happy to answer more questions and to provide  
6 some more numbers, but I want to create the  
7 opportunity for my colleagues to testify as well.

8 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [off mic] Thank you.

9 ANNIE GARNEVA: Hello. So, my name is  
10 Annie Garneva. I'm actually the Director of  
11 Communications and Member Services also with the New  
12 York City Employment Training Coalition, and I'll be  
13 submitting testimony on behalf of Eric Entecal (sp?)  
14 from one of our member organizations, Non-Traditional  
15 Employment for Women. You do not have his paper. He  
16 left and did not give it to me. So, that's why I'm  
17 submitting it orally, and will be passing testimony  
18 on to you after the fact. So, through, as you all  
19 might know, Non-Traditional Employment for Women is a  
20 highly successful pre-apprenticeship program that  
21 specifically focuses on helping women enter the  
22 construction trades, which have predominantly been  
23 and white and male throughout history, and they have  
24 significantly moved the needle. I think the number  
25 is up to approximately 10% of women from [door bangs]  
prior to the program starting. About a decade ago,

1 it was about 3%. So, that is the a highly successful  
2 model that answers the questions that we try as a  
3 coalition to focus on that Jesse just alluded, which  
4 is not just job development, but job development for  
5 whom and how. We represent about 800,000  
6 collectively job seekers that are predominantly low  
7 income and minority who are significantly stuck in a  
8 cycle of poverty due to the fact that a lot of these  
9 investments that we make are not geared towards their  
10 specific needs. So, NEW is an example of a program  
11 that tackles those needs and that we think should be-  
12 programs like this should be invested in. NEW wanted  
13 to emphasize three different points through their  
14 testimony that this committee should look into. One  
15 is the need for more pre-apprenticeship programs that  
16 specifically focus on the wraparound services. So,  
17 things like-that were previously alluded to by OBT.  
18 So things like social outcomes, literacy  
19 requirements, basic math. Those aren't-currently not  
20 taken into account, and so people that start off that  
21 do not have those fundamental skills find themselves  
22 consistently shut out of programs like NEW and other  
23 programs that we represent like Per Scholas. So,  
24 that kind of requirement would be served-better  
25

1 served by what you've heard over and over again our  
2 investments in Bridge programming that help people  
3 learn the basic math and literacy skills and often  
4 times a wraparound by languages in order to then be  
5 able to access the highly successful construction  
6 programs that exist or tech programs. STEM is a  
7 sexy—is having a really sexy moment. However, the  
8 800,000 people that we represent will never be able  
9 to enter those jobs without a multi-year support.  
10 This will take—if they were underserved by the public  
11 school system, they'll continue to be underserved by  
12 the Workforce Development system unless they actually  
13 tackle those ones from the mental skills problems.  
14 And third of all is the social service—the wraparound  
15 services problem, which was previously alluded to by  
16 the T, which is requirements like follow up once they  
17 enter a job, learning how to deal with cultural  
18 differences [bell] within a job where currently the  
19 culture is unlike the people that are entering the  
20 system. Learning how to ask for an increase in pay.  
21 Those are all currently not part of the system, and  
22 people that have not learned how to deal with those  
23 kinds of problems won't learn them on their own.  
24 Thank you.  
25

3 ARIEL SAVANSKY: Good afternoon. My name  
4 is Ariel Savansky and I'm an Advocacy and Policy  
5 Adviser at UJA-Federation of New York. On behalf of  
6 UJA, our network of non-profit partners in those we  
7 serve, thank you for the opportunity to submit  
8 testimony New York City's Career Pathways and  
9 Workforce Development System. I want to start by  
10 thank the Council and the Administration for your  
11 committee to investing in adult literacy programs,  
12 which we view as an integral component of an  
13 effective Workforce Development system. We would  
14 also like to thank the Administration for the recent  
15 investment in Workforce Development programs serving  
16 Haredi Jews throughout the city. However, New York  
17 still has a long way to go towards achieving the  
18 goals laid out in the Career Pathways Blue-Blueprint,  
19 and we would offer the following recommendations some  
20 of which echo what my colleagues here have discussed  
21 already.

22 First, we urge the Council and the  
23 Administration to use the Career Pathways Blueprint  
24 as a guide to create a stronger workforce. Fiscal  
25 Year 2018 marks the third year of a five-year plan to  
transform the city's Workforce Development system.

1 The goals of this transformation are to expand access  
2 to career track jobs in fast growing industry  
3 sectors, improve job quality, and foster a more  
4 cohesive workforce. If substantial new city resources  
5 are not made available, many low-income and  
6 unemployed New Yorkers will be left out of the  
7 growing economy. We also urge and increased  
8 investment in Bridge programs for low-skilled job  
9 seekers, and the low-skill job training. Bridge  
10 programs are essential in helping New Yorkers with  
11 gaps in their skills, education or credentials, get  
12 the training they need to either find a quality job  
13 or enroll in a more advanced course of study. The  
14 Blueprint, as my college have discussed calls for an  
15 investment of \$16 million annually by FY 2020, but  
16 for FY18 included only \$6.4 million in funding for  
17 these programs. Our agencies work with many  
18 immigrant families and communities providing services  
19 to put these individuals on a career trajectory and  
20 setting them up to be able to support themselves and  
21 their families who will not have access to these  
22 services should funding not be increased. Lastly, we  
23 urge the Council and the Administration to work  
24 together to restore and baseline \$12 million for  
25

3 adult literacy programs and work to develop a  
4 taskforce on adult literacy. As a member of the New  
5 York City Coalition for Adult Literacy thousands of  
6 students will lose the classes without the  
7 restoration of this funding. Furthermore, single  
8 year funding makes it difficult to operate programs,  
9 retain talented teachers and threatens to interrupt  
10 student gain. It also does not allow NYC to update  
11 reimbursement rates and program design.

12 Additionally, we urge the Council to work with the  
13 Administrative to launch an adult literacy taskforce  
14 to examine the city's adult literacy system and make  
15 recommendations to improve coordination, referral and  
16 outcome. We look forward to working with the City  
17 Council and the Administration to create an effective  
18 Workforce Development system [bell] that has the  
19 capacity to serve the individuals who need these  
20 services. Thank you again for the opportunity to  
21 testify.

22 KERI FAULHABER: Hi. Good afternoon and  
23 thank you. I'm Keri Faulhaber, and I currently serve  
24 as the Vice President for Partnership and Community  
25 Engagement at Jobs First NYC. For ten years, Jobs  
First has been working with local communities across

1 the five boroughs developing and supporting  
2 collaborative and innovative strategies to find  
3 effective solutions to support out of school, out of  
4 work young adults in New York City. We welcome the  
5 opportunity to provide high level feedback on the  
6 progress of the Career Pathways strategy and look  
7 forward to working with each of you to ensure that  
8 every young adult can access the economy and reach  
9 their full potential. My testimony today will focus  
10 on two critical areas. First is how the Career  
11 Pathways framework and by extension the City of New  
12 York does not adequately address the specific needs  
13 of the out of school, out of work young adult  
14 population in New York City, and second to echo my  
15 colleagues here, the city's slow approach to funding  
16 and scaling effective Bridge programs. Over the past  
17 five years, New York City has seen a notable decrease  
18 in the number of share of young people ages 18  
19 through 24 who are out of school and out of work.  
20 From 22% to in 2010 to 17% in 2015. However, the  
21 barriers faced by the remaining 136,483 young adults  
22 age 18 to 24, increases the challenges to serving  
23 them. Recent research by Jobs First, which will be  
24 published in the coming weeks, has also surfaced a  
25

1 new set of structural challenges that New York City's  
2 out of school, out of work population is faced with.  
3 Among them include how most job growth over the last  
4 five years has been in part-time work as full-time  
5 jobs have decreased, and even with a tighter labor  
6 market and increased demands for labor, wages for  
7 young people have decreased. Additionally, despite  
8 higher high school graduation rates and increasing  
9 college enrollment rates, a growing number of young  
10 people are leaving college without credentials to  
11 enter the labor market with many falling into low-  
12 wage work or becoming part of the out of school, out  
13 of work population. Despite these new structural  
14 challenges, as well as some persistent barriers for  
15 out of school, out of work young adults to  
16 participate in the economic life of New York City,  
17 the city has not adequately responded with its own  
18 strategy. In fact, much of the youth Workforce  
19 Development discourse has been focused on programs  
20 that mostly serve in-school youth. For example, the  
21 Summer Youth Employment Program. We recommend New  
22 York City create a comprehensive strategy that  
23 addresses the specific needs of out of school, out of  
24 work young adults. We are encouraged by the creation  
25

3 of the New York City Disconnected Youth Taskforce,  
4 and will look to this initiative as a vehicle to  
5 developing, executing and marshaling the citywide  
6 strategy to fully address the specific needs of New  
7 York City's out of school, out of work young adults,  
8 similar to the one the city of Los Angeles has  
9 implemented. The Los Angeles Performance Partnership  
10 Pilot [bell] is a leading effort of the City of Los  
11 Angeles, the County of Los Angeles, Los Angeles  
12 Unified School District, Los Angeles Community  
13 College District, Local Cal State Universities, Los  
14 Angeles Chamber of Commerce, Los Angeles Housing  
15 Service Agency, and over 50 public philanthropic and  
16 community-based organizations to improve the service  
17 delivery system for the disconnected young adult  
18 population, and connect them to the economy. This  
19 initiative outlines in Los Angeles Performance  
20 Partnership Pilot 2017 to 2020 Strategic Plan is an  
21 unprecedented effort in Los Angeles and across the  
22 country to coordinate and integrate the delivery of  
23 education, workforce and social services to  
24 disconnected youth. I won't review the core  
25 functions. They're in the testimony there. What?

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Please wrap it up.

1  
2           KERI FAULHABER: Okay, sure. I'm going  
3 to jump to the concern about the Bridge Programming.  
4 We recommend that the city invest \$20 million to fund  
5 and scale Bridge programs in the next budget year,  
6 and the remaining \$33.6 million a year after, which  
7 would bring annual funding to \$60 million by 2020 as  
8 the city committed in the Career Pathways Plan.  
9 There's examples there of working Bridge programs and  
10 two partnerships that Jobs First NYC has worked with.  
11 One is Tech Bridge, an initiative of Per Scolas and  
12 the Door, and as others here have noted, Per Scolas  
13 has outcomes to back their—their programming, and  
14 this is a Bridge program that has upskilled young  
15 people that were unable to enter Per Scolas' training  
16 without the Bridge program, and another example is  
17 the partnership with Comprehensive Development, Inc.  
18 the career, CDI Career Academy in partnership with  
19 the MCC, a Bridge program.

20           CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] I'm  
21 sorry. So, so—your clients come from where?

22           KERI FAULHABER: Well, Jobs First is a  
23 non-profit intermediary, and we work with and--

24           CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] Yeah.  
25

3 KERI FAULHABER: --direct service  
4 providers all across New York City.

5 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: So, so, so this is  
6 a--a collaboration of workforce providers that you're  
7 speaking specifically about?

8 KERI FAULHABER: Yes. Jobs--

9 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: [interposing] You're  
10 talking about one or two programs out of how many?  
11 [door bangs]

12 KERI FAULHABER: These are just examples.  
13 Jobs First launched an initiative in 2012 called the  
14 Young Adult Sectoral Employment Project, and through  
15 that project these are two of the programs, two of  
16 ten.

17 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: How many are en-en-  
18 enrolled in the program?

19 KERI FAULHABER: How many are enrolled in  
20 Per Scolas' training?

21 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: No, in-in-in the-in  
22 the initiative that was just launched in 2012? How  
23 many--

24 KERI FAULHABER: [interposing] Well, the  
25 Jobs First Initiative has to date served over 1,600  
young adults and placed more than 50% of them in

3 employment and over 700 of them have received  
4 industry recognized credentials.

5 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: And how many vendors  
6 are involved?

7 KERI FAULHABER: There's 11  
8 collaboratives. Each of those collaboratives has at  
9 least three non-profit partners in them. So, over  
10 33.

11 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay. Do you find  
12 that--that [pause] that it is difficult to work with  
13 that many different groups or is it--obviously, that's  
14 your goal to--to bring people together and to kind of  
15 be able to facilitate this, but is--is it something  
16 because we've been kind of grappling with this all  
17 morning, and on what we thought was the best method  
18 to provide these services, and--

19 KERI FAULHABER: [interposing] Uh-hm.

20 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: --whether or not  
21 and--and we all agree that--we agree with the  
22 importance of and--and the mission of Workforce  
23 Development. We just don't know if it's doing what  
24 we set out to do, and how do we capture that? How do  
25 we ensure that the data and transparency, but I love  
to hear these stories, these success stories, but we

3 would be in with those who would then be able to pull  
4 them down so that when young folks come into my  
5 office and they come to visit Council Member Perkins,  
6 that we can guide them in a certain direction. And  
7 that we can put our stamp behind these organizations  
8 and the training and the skills that they're going to  
9 be able to provide for these young folks. Often not  
10 very easy to do, right, and—and so, I think that's  
11 really a part of what the hearing is. I mean the  
12 city wants to talk about what they're doing, but we—  
13 You're service providers just as you are in that end,  
14 that is exclusive to what we do. We serve the  
15 communities that—that we've—in fact, we serve the  
16 city as elected here and we want to make sure that we  
17 have products out there that meet the needs of—of our  
18 constituency. And—and that's what we're trying to  
19 really drill around on today. Is it happening? Are  
20 we doing what we set out do three years ago? How far  
21 are out in that plan, and—and we rely on the experts  
22 to tell us that it is working, that it isn't working  
23 that we are lacking resources, that we need to relog  
24 the resources or whatever is going on. And so,  
25 that's kind of what we're trying to do, too, and  
while we have all the experts in the room today.

3 JESSE LEHMAN: Thank you.

4 KERI FAULHABER: Sure.

5 JESSE LEHMAN: I mean, Keri, to pick up  
6 on that and to answer the Councilman's question, I  
7 mean I think the short answer is that yes, there are  
8 programs out there that really are working. The--the  
9 trouble is that they're not big enough scale because  
10 of a lack of public funding--

11 KERI FAULHABER: Uh-hm.

12 JESSE LEHMAN: --and that there is not a  
13 smooth enough connection between the public workforce  
14 system such as the Workforce 1s, and the industry  
15 partnerships that were recently launched, and these  
16 many community-based organizations that are running  
17 these effective but relatively small scale programs  
18 across the city, and Keri referred to a couple of  
19 these Bridge programs. Young Adult Employment  
20 Project, and I think the thing to just--to note for  
21 example about the Tech Bridge partnership between Per  
22 Scolas and the Door is that that this funded with  
23 philanthropic dollars not City dollars. And so,  
24 people are getting onto a career path towards a  
25 really good career in technology, people that often  
times did not finish high school are going through

1 this Bridge programming and then through Per Scolas'  
2 programming, and that's the sort of thing that if the  
3 city stepped in and scaled up Bridge programs like  
4 that, we could get more people those sorts of  
5 opportunities. The other example, just I wanted to--  
6 to call out something First Deputy Commissioner  
7 Jackie Mallon talked about, as an example here where  
8 the public system is not working as well as it needs  
9 to with the existing independent operators. She  
10 talked about the launch of the training program for  
11 line cooks, if you recall, and it's called Stage NYC  
12 to run through the--the new industry partnership for  
13 food service. It's--it's a small scale program that  
14 just launched, and she didn't actually provide any  
15 numbers on whether any people have graduated and  
16 gotten placed yet. But we know that just within the  
17 Employment and Training Coalition we have providers  
18 such a Project Renewal and the DOE Fund that are  
19 providing culinary training already for people that  
20 have experienced homelessness. We have providers  
21 like the Osborne Association that has a culinary  
22 program for people that are formerly incarcerated.  
23 We have Seed (sic) Code that provides culinary  
24 training for people that are unemployed, and Fedcap  
25

1 that provides culinary training for people that are  
2 on public assistance, and all of those culinary  
3 training programs are larger than the new Stage  
4 Program that the City of New York just launched. Why  
5 isn't the City of New York working with those  
6 providers and funding those providers to scale up and  
7 train more people from these high needs communities  
8 to get good jobs as opposed to trying to reinvent the  
9 wheel and create a new entity. Those are the sorts  
10 of disconnects that we find troubling that we think  
11 really could be resolved through better oversight,  
12 better management, more empowerment of the Office of  
13 Workforce Development, and things of that nature.

14  
15 KERI FAULHABER: Yeah, and—and I'll add I  
16 think all of us in this room know that partnerships  
17 are difficult and partnerships are costly, the  
18 capacity to maintain them and ensure that there's a  
19 framework in place that will uphold a partnership  
20 that is being developed. All of the work that I've  
21 mentioned and—and the work that Jesse has mentioned  
22 is these pathways are done in partnership. No one  
23 organization can get somebody from—speaking of young  
24 adults from a place of being out of school and out of  
25 work into a credential programming. There's partners

1 along the way just as the Door are partnered with Per  
2 Scolas, each leveraging their own expertise, and the-  
3 the funding-the level of funding that they are  
4 receiving from private funders just-you're right, can  
5 only train so many people, and the-the capacity to  
6 scale up the-the-would require support from the city  
7 funding.  
8

9 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay, and then I  
10 want to thank everyone for coming out. This  
11 information and your input is vital to the Workforce  
12 Development of our city, and we want to make sure  
13 that-that we also have the-the hearing is about  
14 checks and balances here that-that we are working and  
15 we are achieving what we set out to achieve. I'd  
16 like to-to thank everyone for coming out. I would  
17 especially like to thank Council Member Perkins for  
18 their due diligence. I know that this has been a  
19 long day and for sitting there, and we had another  
20 hearing going on right across the hall as well.  
21 We've been joined by a number of members, and-and the  
22 staff. I want to thank them so much. It has not  
23 been easy coordinating these joint hearings. As  
24 well, Counsel, thank you for the work that you've  
25 done in that as well, and to my staff Brandon and Joe

3 as well. [background comments] Yes and Corey and  
4 we've been joined by Council Member Corey Johnson as  
5 well, and so I did hear again from Council Member  
6 Cornegy. He sends his apologies, and he is in the  
7 midst of a family emergency, and we keep him in  
8 prayers. So, with that, I call this hearing is now  
9 adjourned. Thank you. [gavel]

10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 8, 2017