

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

----- X

October 23, 2017
Start: 10:15 a.m.
Recess: 2:01 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: DANIEL DROMM
Chairperson

INEZ D. BARRON
Co-Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

DANIEL R. GARODNICK
DEBORAH L. ROSE
ANDY L. KING
STEPHEN TREMAINE T. LEVIN
CHAIM M. DEUTSCH
BEN KALLOS
MARK LEVINE
ALAN N. MAISEL
ANTONIO REYNOSO
MARK TREYGER
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
HELEN K. ROSENTHAL
RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

MARGARET CHIN
VINCENT J. GENTILE
JAMES VACCA
FERNANDO CABRERA

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Phil Weinberg
Deputy Chancellor for Teaching and Learning at
The New York City Department of Education

Reina Utsunomiya
Senior Director of Grades 9-14 Early College and
Career Schools

John Mogulescu
Senior University Dean for Academic Affairs and
Dean of the CUNY School of Professional Studies

Cass Conrad
University Dean for K-16 Initiatives at CUNY

Tracee Murren
Principal of the Kingsborough Early College
Secondary School, KECSS

Leara Marshall
Graduate and Teacher of Kingsborough Early
College Secondary School, KECSS

Stephen Tremaine
Vice President of Bard College Early Colleges

Michael Lerner
Principal at Bard High School Early College of
Manhattan

Hodja Diallo
Senior at Bard High School Early College
Manhattan Campus

Sterling Roberson
Vice President for Career and Technical Education
For the United Federation of Teachers

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Michael Wiltshire
Principal at Medgar Evers College Preparatory
School

Karenanne Carty
Vice President of Academic Affairs at Monroe
College

Mustafo Julel
Resident of New York City from Bangladesh,
Student at Renaissance Charter School

Abrar Kazi
Seventh Grade Student at Renaissance Charter
School

Ruben Contreras
Tenth Grade Student at Renaissance Charter
School

Jared Albinus
Eleventh Grade Student at The Renaissance Charter
School

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

5

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, good morning and welcome to today's Education Committee Oversight Hearing on earning an Associate's Degree in New York City's High Schools. I want to thank my Co-Chair, Council Member Barron for holding today's hearing. Having a college education is more important now than ever. Attending college gives individuals access to more job opportunities and the ability to earn higher wages. College, college graduates are in demand and many industries and careers now consider them mandatory yet according to census data in 2013 almost half of New York City's adults reported that they did not have at least an Associate's degree. Additionally, data shows that many students enrolling in city university of New York schools endure academic challenges. For example, at CUNY's seven community colleges only 17 percent of students graduated within three years. In addition, currently more than 6,000 students enrolled in CUNY each year need remedial courses in basic academic skills such as reading, math and writing. In an effort to make college more accessible to all students the Department of Education has partnered with post-

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

6

1
2 secondary institutions like CUNY and Bard College to
3 allow high school students to take up to two years of
4 college credit while in high school and earn their
5 Associates degree at no cost. This allows these
6 students to save both time and money and get a jump
7 start on furthering their education. through CUNY's
8 Early College Initiative Program over 7,000 students
9 at 17 DOE schools have the opportunity to earn an
10 Associate's degree at a partnering CUNY college.
11 Bard's High School Early College which has campuses
12 in both Manhattan and Queens serves approximately
13 1,213 students. I am particularly interested in
14 hearing more about the recent efforts of Bard to
15 increase the diversity of its early college student
16 population. At today's hearing the committees look
17 forward to hearing about the current programs offered
18 to students, the efforts made by the DOE to inform
19 prospective students about these programs and student
20 outcomes after enrolling in and graduating from such
21 programs. The committees are also interested in
22 learning whether the DOE has plans to expand the
23 model in the future. I'd like to remind everyone who
24 wishes to testify today that you must fill out a
25 witness slip which is located on the desk of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

7

1
2 Sergeant at Arms near the front of this room. To
3 allow as many people as possible to testify testimony
4 will be limited to three minutes per person and with
5 that I'd like to announce that we've been joined by
6 Council Member James Vacca, Council Member Margaret
7 Chin, Council Member Mark Treyger, Council Member
8 Alan Maisel and I will now turn it over to my Co-
9 Chair, Council Member Inez Barron.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Council
11 Member Dromm. Good morning, my name is Inez Barron
12 and I'm the Chair of the Committee on Higher
13 Education. We're joined... I'm joined by the... we are
14 joined together with the Education Committee Chaired
15 by my colleague Daniel Dromm who like me is a former
16 public-school teacher. As some of you may know I was
17 a public-school teacher and principal for 36 years
18 before I retired and became involved in the political
19 arena. During that time my experience as an educator
20 and an administrator left me with deep appreciation
21 for some of the challenges students experience in
22 pursuing their education. In today's global economy
23 we know that a college education has become even more
24 important, it is in fact projected that New York City
25 will gain 284,000 jobs that will require a Bachelor's

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

8

1
2 degree or more while an additional 201,000 jobs will
3 require an Associate's degree, or some college and
4 72,000 jobs will require a high school diploma.
5 Before the end of this decade employer demand for
6 employees with the Associates degree will increase by
7 21 percent. As a result, students who do not graduate
8 from high school or college will be forced to accept
9 the grim reality of living life on an economic
10 margin... in the economic margins that mean they will
11 find it extremely difficult to achieve economic self-
12 sufficiency, contribute to the economy or more
13 importantly support themselves and their family. Yet
14 the current state of our education system indicates a
15 lack of work... a, a lot of work remains to be done.
16 Too many students are graduating from high school
17 unprepared for college, we know this because a recent
18 study indicated that over 6,000 students who enter
19 CUNY have remedial needs in one of the basic academic
20 skill areas; math, reading and writing. As you all
21 know remediation often means that students will have
22 to spend more time and resources to graduate. For
23 many low-income students this can present an
24 additional buffer and hurdle to graduating on time
25 because many have to work to take care of their

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

9

1
2 families. While I applaud CUNY for its innovative
3 programs such as CUNY Start and the Accelerated Study
4 in Associate Programs, ASAP which are designed to
5 increase retention and graduation rates there's a
6 need to better understand why so many of our high
7 school graduates are not prepared for the rigors of
8 college. One program designed to do just that is
9 CUNY's Early College Initiative which was designed to
10 improve high school graduations rates as well as
11 prepare students for the rigors of college. ECI
12 offers students the opportunity to earn an
13 Associate's degree while in high school at no
14 additional cost. The program model is based on the
15 belief that by engaging students early in the college
16 experience through challenging coursework students
17 will not only be motivated to do well but the
18 experience in the program will encourage them to earn
19 college credit which will increase their chances for
20 college success and completion. The program target,
21 targets students who have historically been
22 underrepresented in higher education, this includes
23 low-income students, students who are the first in
24 their family to go to college and English language
25 learners. A recent study by CUNY of its ECI program

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

10

1
2 revealed four significant findings. One, ECI students
3 graduated on time at modestly higher rates than
4 students not in the ECI program. Two, ECI students
5 were more likely to be considered college ready.
6 Three, by earning more college credits while in high
7 school ECI students were better prepared for college
8 degree completion and four, ECI students had better
9 college retention rates than students in non ECI
10 schools. The study also found that black and low
11 performing students preformed much better than
12 students in non ECI schools. These findings are
13 promising and indicate the program is having a
14 positive impact on targeted students. However, it
15 remains unclear why, so many students graduate... how
16 so many students graduate with an Associate's degree,
17 we don't know the number. Additionally, I'm concerned
18 about how many ECI students actually graduate from
19 college. The study indicated that only four percent
20 of ECI students graduated from college, that number
21 is quite low, and one would expect a higher
22 graduation rate if 86 percent of ECI college students
23 graduated from high school on time with an average of
24 16 credits. The study further found that by the end
25 of the second year in college ECI students had an

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

11

1
2 average of 31 credits which places them a semester
3 ahead of students with non ECI schools who had only
4 accumulated 13 credits. That data suggests that more
5 students should be graduating given the number of
6 credits they have accumulated in college. I'm looking
7 forward to hearing more on this issue from CUNY.
8 Another early college high school is Bard Colleges
9 Bard High School Early College which offers high
10 school students the opportunity to earn an
11 Associate's degree while earning their high school
12 diploma in four years. With 93 percent of the 2016
13 class graduating with 93 percent of the 2016 class
14 graduating 93 percent graduating with an Associate's
15 degree conferred by Bard College it is clear that
16 students are doing well in Bard's Early College
17 Program. However, I was disappointed to learn that
18 only 28 percent of the 2015-16 student population on
19 its Queen campus and only 32 percent of its student
20 population on its Manhattan campus was comprised of
21 Hispanic and black students. Even more alarming was
22 that special need students accounted for only two
23 percent of the total population and no English
24 language learners were enrolled, that's a poor
25 reflection of the city's diverse population. During

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

12

1
2 today's hearing I'm interested in learning more about
3 the student curriculum at ECI schools as well as the
4 type of support students are offered to enable their
5 success as they pursue their high school diploma and
6 accumulate college credits. As I indicated earlier I
7 would like to know how many students graduated with
8 an Associate's degree and ECI student outcomes in
9 college. If ECI stated... if ECI's stated goal is to
10 increase high school graduation rates and prepare
11 them for college I want to know why more students are
12 not graduating from college. I would also like to
13 hear whether Bards High School has any plans to
14 increase student diversity and if so how it plans to
15 do so. I would like to thank my Chief of Staff Joy
16 Simmons, my CUNY liaison, Emma Walenciak; Miss Indigo
17 Washington, my Director of Legislation; Kiiru
18 Gichuru, my Legislative... my Committee Council; Chloe
19 Rivera, the Committee's Policy Analyst; and Jessica
20 Ackerman, Senior Finance Analyst to the Committee.
21 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much
23 Chair Barron. I'd also like to take this opportunity
24 to thank my staff; Sabastian McGuire, my Counsel;
25 Smita Deshmukh, my Senior Legislative Council; Jan

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

13

1
2 Atwell, Senior Policy Analyst; Joan Povolny, Senior
3 Policy Analyst; Kalima Johnson, who for the first
4 time has been really working very hard on a hearing,
5 thank you Kalima, Policy Analyst; Elizabeth Hoffman,
6 the Principle Finance Analyst and Kaitlyn O'Hagan,
7 the Finance Analyst for the Education Committee as
8 well. So, I want to also announce that we've been
9 joined by Council Member Helen Rosenthal and by
10 Council Member Ydanis... excuse me, Fernando Cabrera,
11 okay. Oh, Ydanis is here, okay, I thought I saw
12 Ydanis come in. Okay, so with that I'm going to
13 introduce our first panel which is the Deputy
14 Chancellor for the New York City Department of
15 Education, Phil Weinberg and Reina Utsunomiya from
16 the New York City Office of Postsecondary Education,
17 I apologize if I messed up your last name and with
18 that I'd also like to ask you to raise your right
19 hand, so I can swear you in. Do you solemnly swear or
20 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing
21 but the truth and to answer council member questions
22 honestly? Okay, thank you, Deputy Chancellor would
23 you like to start?

24 PHIL WEINBERG: Sure. Good morning Chairs
25 Dromm and Barron and members of the New York City

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

14

1 Council Committees on Education and Higher Education
2 here today. My name is Phil Weinberg, the New York
3 City Department of Education's Deputy Chancellor for
4 Teaching and Learning. I am joined by Reina
5 Utsunomiya, Senior Director of Grades 9-14 Early
6 College and Career Schools. We are pleased to be here
7 today to discuss our commitment to college and career
8 pathways particularly the progress we have made in
9 our early college programs. Through our Equity and
10 Excellence for All Agenda the city is working to
11 ensure that by 2026, 80 percent of students graduate
12 high school on time and two thirds graduate... two
13 thirds of our graduates are college ready. We want
14 our students to graduate with the option to pursue
15 and succeed in the college or career of their choice.
16 As we work to reach these goals early exposure to
17 college and work experiences can be a game changer
18 for many of our students particularly students from
19 low-income families, first generation college
20 students, students of color and students who have
21 struggled academically. We are making these
22 investments across the city through our AP for all
23 and college access for all initiatives. In just the
24 past two weeks we've been proud to announce a record
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

15

1
2 number of students taking and passing rigorous AP
3 exams and a record number of schools supporting their
4 students on the path to college during college
5 application week. As part of our broader efforts DOE
6 offers an array of programs for students to take
7 college classes while they are still in high school.
8 These range from individual courses such at CUNY
9 college now and dual credit courses to a whole school
10 early college high school model where students take
11 high school and college courses concurrently. Early
12 college high schools are unique in that they are
13 designed for students to earn up to 60 college
14 credits or the equivalent of two years' worth of
15 college towards an Associate's degree while the...
16 while they are in high school. Students in these
17 schools may begin taking college classes as early as
18 in the tenth grade. Each school partners with a
19 dedicated college partner to offer courses to its
20 students. There are three key characteristics for all
21 of our early college schools that make them
22 invaluable for students. First, our students take the
23 college courses tuition free because the costs are
24 covered by the DOE and the Higher Education
25 Institution. Second, students who successfully pass

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

16

1
2 their college courses in high school can transfer or
3 apply these college credits toward a four-year
4 Bachelor of Arts or Science degree. In some cases,
5 students are saving up to two years' worth of college
6 tuition by completing these courses while they are in
7 high school. And third these schools have
8 specifically designed their curriculum for students
9 to take high school and college classes concurrently.
10 We currently have 19 early college high schools
11 located in the Bronx, Brooklyn, Manhattan and Queens
12 serving over 8,000 high school students citywide.
13 CUNY oversees ten early college high schools that
14 partner with dedicated CUNY community and senior
15 colleges, each of these CUNY early college high
16 schools offer college courses towards an Associate's
17 degree in liberal arts from their partner college.
18 The first two of these CUNY early college schools
19 were opened in the 1990's with additional... with an
20 additional eight launched between 2000 and 2008. CUNY
21 and the DOE share the cost of these school's college
22 tuition. Bard College operates two early college
23 schools, the first opened in Manhattan on the Lower
24 East Side in 2001 and the second opened in Queens in
25 Long Island City in 2008. Students attending these

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

17

1
2 schools may earn college credits towards an
3 Associate's degree awarded by Bard... by Bard College.
4 The DOE and CUNY also collaborate on seven early
5 college and career high schools which are designed as
6 six-year schools for grades 9-14. Each of these
7 school's partner with a CUNY community college and
8 focus on a stem focused Associates degree and also
9 incorporate significant career and technical
10 education component working with their dedicated
11 industry partner. The first grades 9-14 school opened
12 in 2011 followed by two more in 2013 and three
13 additional in 2014. One of the CUNY early college
14 schools that opened in 2009 is now transitioning into
15 a grade nine through 14 school. I want to share a
16 little more information with you today about these
17 grades nine through 14 schools. We believe this model
18 is one example of our vision for equity and excellent
19 for all in action that's because our grades nine
20 through 14 schools represent a targeted effort to
21 bridge high school and college for underrepresented
22 students and break down the barriers that research
23 has shown to be one of the major obstacles of college
24 enrollment and persistence. You may have heard be... of
25 these schools referred to as P-TECH, Pathways of

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

18

1
2 Technology Early College High School schools named
3 after the original P-TECH school in Brooklyn which
4 opened in the fall of the 2011. This model was born
5 out of converging interest between the public and
6 private sectors in particular a collaboration with
7 IBM and CUNY to link high school and college with
8 industry based skills training for students who are
9 underrepresented in science, technology, engineering
10 and math fields and higher education. Our nine
11 through 14 schools do not require the students to
12 meet any academic criteria for admission and serve a
13 student population that is approximately 80 percent
14 black and Latino and 80 percent of the students are
15 eligible for free and reduced priced lunch. They are
16 one option for students to focus on growing
17 academically and pursuing college and career as real
18 options after high school. Every grade 9-14 school
19 works with a primary industry partner and a college
20 to focus on a specific career pathway. Each school's
21 six-year curriculum is designed in collaboration with
22 these partners so that the academic in career and
23 technical education courses will prepare students to
24 segway into college courses aligned with STEM related
25 Associates degrees. These seven schools career in

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

19

1
2 Associates degree pathways represent a wide breadth
3 of stem fields that include nursing and community
4 health, civil and electromechanical engineering, IT,
5 multimedia arts and technology, digital marketing,
6 construction management, architectural technology,
7 computer information systems, and energy technology.
8 All of these degrees and career pathways has been
9 selected with input from our school's industry
10 partners which include Con Edison, National Grid, New
11 York Presbyterian Hospital, Montefiore Medical
12 Center, IBM, SAP, New York City Transit, CH2M and the
13 American Association for Advertising Agencies. All of
14 these industry partners represent high growth job
15 sectors in need of a diverse and skilled workforce
16 right here in New York City. Because the student's
17 college and career... these college courses gear toward
18 more science and math than early college schools each
19 school work, works closely with its CUNY community
20 college partner to coordinate the sequence of high
21 school and progressively challenging college courses.
22 Students in grades nine through 14 schools must
23 demonstrate readiness to take college courses by
24 meeting CUNY proficiency levels and that is a primary
25 focus of each of these schools. The school also

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

20

1
2 aligns supports for students in the college classes
3 including advisory and seminars as well as direct
4 tutoring to support them while they're managing their
5 college course load. The industry partners also play
6 critical roles in supporting the students career
7 exploration. As part of each schools CTE programs
8 students are involved in various career awareness and
9 training activities with industry partners throughout
10 their six-year experience. These include group
11 mentoring, job site visits and mock interviews to
12 more hands-on learning such as jobs shadowing and
13 internships. These opportunities offer students
14 valuable social capital for their interacting with
15 industry professionals as well as practicing their
16 own networking and professional skills. Our school's
17 industry partners in turn see how they have direct
18 impact on student's perceptions about the working
19 world and the value of helping to develop their
20 future work force. Partners have shown their
21 commitment in a variety of ways such as hiring over
22 50 students for summer internships or funding a new
23 engineering lab at a school. Grades nine through 14
24 schools are still in their early stages of
25 development, P-TECH students from its 2011 opening

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

21

1
2 class just graduated this past June and two more
3 schools just had their first cohort of students
4 complete four years. We look forward to sharing the
5 outcomes of this work as these schools build a track
6 record. As these schools continue to grow we also
7 know there is continuing demand for grades nine
8 through 14 schools and programs to reach more
9 students. We are looking to expand the grades 9-14
10 model to three more sites with the aim to reach
11 geographic areas that are still underserved. Thank
12 you again for this opportunity to discuss our equity
13 in excellence for all investments in college access
14 and readiness specifically our grades 9-14 early
15 college and career schools.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much
17 Deputy Chancellor Weinberg for that testimony. Let me
18 start off just by asking you a little bit about how
19 ECI was created, what was the idea behind it and why
20 did the DOE invest in a program such as ECI?

21 PHIL WEINBERG: Well the, the first
22 early college started in the 90's and I'm not
23 prepared to speak about that but I think the ongoing
24 work throughout the 2000's has been about the belief
25 that both institutions have that making a smooth

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

22

1
2 handoff of students from the DOE to CUNY is important
3 and that the closer... the more closely that we work
4 together the more proactive and intentional we can be
5 about making sure our students know well what it
6 takes to be successful in their postsecondary degrees
7 and in their careers after that.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is there any
9 relationship between the students who stay in
10 college... the students who are in these programs are
11 more likely to stay in college and to go on to finish
12 their four-year degrees?

13 PHIL WEINBERG: I'll ask my colleague
14 Reina to respond.

15 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: And I... Good morning,
16 my name is Reina Utsunomiya. We definitely have seen
17 trajectory for the students especially for those who
18 have accumulated at least 30 credits that allow them
19 to then transfer on into the senior colleges in, in
20 the CUNY system so we know that this is definitely an
21 opportunity for the students not only to learn about
22 what it takes to persist in college but also to have
23 that leg up to really be able to then advance in
24 their education at the higher education level.

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

23

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How are students admitted into the program?

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Well for the nine to 14 specifically these students are basically they do not require any academic screening so for these students they basically have to attend an information session or an open house to learn about the program and that's basically it. Our schools are very active in participating in citywide and the borough high school fairs and they also host several open houses and so if they can get the information out about these schools and also working with their local middle schools that they can develop some relationships there as well.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you describe for me the, the faculty and staff that are involved in these programs, are they DOE licensed teachers and college professors or a combination of the above, how does that work?

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Sure, so at the high school they are all state and DOE certified instructors because these schools are a combination of academic and CTE we have both the core subject area teachers as well as career and technical

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

24

1
2 education teachers. The college courses are taught by
3 the faculty from the community colleges so those are
4 definitely, you know professors from the
5 participating colleges. In some rare cases we may
6 also have opportunities where the staff at the high
7 school may have adjunct status so that they are also
8 able to support the students both in, in teaching
9 both the high school and college course.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, can you give us
11 some examples of what the high school subjects that a
12 high school teacher would be teaching and the, the
13 subjects that a college professor might be teaching?

14 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Sure, so the core
15 subject area... the students are still required to meet
16 all their high school requirements, so they would
17 still be taking all their English language arts,
18 math, science, social studies, physical education.
19 all those core subjects are taught by the high school
20 staff along with any career and technical education
21 subjects which can really be something from as basic
22 as introduction to IT or whatever to progressively
23 more advanced coursework within their technical
24 subject areas. The courses that are taught with... by
25 the college are actually the school would work with

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

25

1
2 the college to design what would be the appropriate
3 sequence of courses for the students to take, it
4 wouldn't be fair for the students to all of the
5 sudden be thrown into an English composition class so
6 generally there's a gradual... there's an opportunity
7 for the students to begin taking an entry level
8 college course which might be, you know
9 communications, public speaking, critical thinking
10 and then as students are meeting CUNY proficiency
11 levels they would be taking many of the general
12 education or CUNY pathway courses that would be
13 required of any college student.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you describe to
15 me the difference between a nine to 12 and a nine to
16 14 school, I'm a little bit confused by that so are
17 the students who are in the 9 to 14 programs for
18 example are they physically in a DOE site when it's
19 the extra two years there?

20 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: I think the main
21 difference is for us thinking about who the students
22 are coming in for the majority of the nine to 14
23 schools the student's proficiency levels are really a
24 wide range, they... we have high, highly academic...
25 highly achieving students and then the majority of

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

26

1
2 the students being... you know struggling academically
3 or who have come in behind grade level. So, working
4 with them over the course of their high school
5 experience to make sure that they are not only
6 catching up but also being able to then be ready to
7 take the college courses is a huge leap that we are
8 pushing for within the 9 to 14. The additional two
9 years of high school is actually designed so that
10 they have that extra time to finish their college
11 coursework although the college portion does begin
12 while they are still, you know perhaps even tenth
13 grade but in 11th and 12th grade, we see that that
14 additional time provides the students to really learn
15 what it takes to persist at the college level but
16 also receive a lot of the supports that they may
17 otherwise not be able to find on their own. As
18 Council Member Barron had mentioned a lot of life
19 challenges that they face so that it might prevent
20 them from continuing their education so the
21 additional two years that we're able to provide under
22 this model really makes sure that the high school
23 provides them the space to at least receive the
24 support from a... from teachers and adults that they

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

27

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

know very well and... but still be able to continue on
and persist at the college level.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, how many 9 to 12
programs are there and how many nine to 14 programs
are there?

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Working with CUNY
there are ten of... well ten grades six, 12 and nine to
12 schools, some of them are secondary schools and
then there are seven of the nine to 14 schools.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Just go back to what
you were saying before, is P-TECH a nine to 14
program?

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Yes, it is.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It is also, okay. I
think that you have an ECI school in every borough
except for Staten Island if I'm... [cross-talk]

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: That's correct...

[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: not mistaken... [cross-
talk]

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: That's correct...

[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...are there... are there
any plans to expand the program?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: We definitely are looking at different locations that are still underserved; Staten Island definitely being one of them, we just want to make sure that in making this model available to the, the schools in the area that we have the right partnerships in place and the college... I'm sorry, the high school really has... you know they are ready to take on both the high school and the college course required because it is not only just the students but also the staff who really need to be able to support them in, in making that transition.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, which college... which CUNY colleges... which CUNY campuses do not have a ECI program?

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: At this time I don't think I... [cross-talk]

PHIL WEINBERG: Yeah, we... I think we'd have to go back and do process of elimination, we... if you... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

PHIL WEINBERG: ...I think between our partners we could figure that out in five minutes.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

29

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is it... okay, so is it
3 possible for an EC... for the... a DOE school to
4 transition into an ECI school?

5 PHIL WEINBERG: That has happened, right,
6 didn't we just... [cross-talk]

7 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Yes... [cross-talk]

8 PHIL WEINBERG: ...do that with... [cross-
9 talk]

10 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Yes, so one of the
11 early college schools that we're just working with
12 right now is... was originally a different type of an
13 early college high school, it was a bit of a more... of
14 an accelerated high school program so that they can
15 get the kids to take the college courses earlier.
16 Based on just experiences working with that... the, the
17 school and, and, and new partnerships that came into
18 play we've been able to convert the school into this
19 new nine to 14 model, it is still in development, but
20 it is something that we've been... we've tried out and
21 we're seeing success or slowly grow... seeing success.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: My understanding and
23 maybe I'm wrong on this but the schools like Townsend
24 Harris and Queens High School for sciences that are
25 on campuses are not ECI schools, am I right?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

30

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: That's correct.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That's because they're specialized high schools?

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Correct.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And a specialized admission programs into those... [cross-talk]

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Yes... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...schools... okay, how is ECI funded?

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: So, the nine to 14 schools are funded both through the DOE and CUNY as public high schools they still receive the fair student funding as CTE schools they receive additional funding to make sure they can develop robust CTE programs. We have a cautionary agreement in place also with CUNY so that we can help defray the cost of the tuition for the students and that includes anywhere from... you know the instructor's salary to the cost related to managing all these program across the city.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How much is spent per pupil at an ECI school for example versus what's spent for an average student in a regular high school?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

31

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: It's a little difficult to compare, I think every... there are just different programs in place like I mentioned some of our public high schools may offer various programs both CTE, maybe performing arts maybe specialized science programs so I don't think it... we can do a straight comparison. I, I would just say that the college costs aren't directly going into the school budgets, we know that that would just be an additional burden for them so we... that's something that we handle at the institutional level between DOE and CUNY.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is there a difference between the nine to 12 and the nine to 14 schools of cost per pupil?

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: I think the main cost differential would be tied to one's... the cost related to the career and technical education programs within our nine to 14 schools and then because the nine to 14 schools do span into the extra two years we do fund that portion from the DOE so that would just be the additional cost that goes into these schools compared to the nine to 12.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

32

1

2

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How are materials covered for the college courses, books and things like that?

5

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Those are part of our cautionary with the... with our CUNY partners so the students do not have to pay for textbooks or the supplies, those are usually covered directly for the... for the students.

10

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Does every school offer the opportunity to get the Associates degree or are college... or do, do some schools only offer college courses and then those credits could be transferred?

15

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: For all 17 CUNY schools that we work with those offer students... all students the opportunity to earn credits towards an Associate's degree.

19

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And I'm curious to know what type of an Associate's degree do they graduate with, is it an... [cross-talk]

22

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Sure... [cross-talk]

23

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...Associates... I don't even know like is it an Associate's degree in science, arts, or how, how is that worded?

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

33

1
2 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Sure, so with the.. and
3 I... my... I know my CUNY colleagues can speak more about
4 this later, with the nine to 12's or the six, 12
5 schools a lot of the schools are able to offer the
6 liberal arts Associates degrees or depending on the
7 student's interest they may have focused areas, for
8 the nine to 14 schools, we do focus on STEM related
9 Associate degrees so, it can be anything from
10 computer information systems, civil engineering,
11 electromechanical engineering so very specialized in,
12 in a technical area.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Those credits I'm
14 assuming are also transferable to a, a college system
15 outside of CUNY?

16 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: We definitely... we're
17 working with... well we're looking into how they might
18 be transferring those credits into CUNY systems and
19 we're beginning to look at how other private colleges
20 also might be willing to accept some of these
21 credits.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And Deputy Chancellor
23 in your remarks you mentioned that the first grades
24 nine to 14 schools opened in 2011, do you have any

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

34

1
2 statistics on that now how many students graduated
3 with the Associates degree?

4 PHIL WEINBERG: I think we'd have to
5 bring that back to you, I'm sorry to say, we haven't
6 released graduation data for the city for this year
7 and I don't see it here in our testimony. No, I do
8 see it... 71 out of 97 graduated by summer of 2017, 47
9 earned the Associates degree.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That's, that's with
11 an Associate's degree?

12 PHIL WEINBERG: Yeah 40... half of them got
13 Associates degrees and 71 out of 97 graduated by the
14 summer of 2017.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Alright, I'm
16 not going to... I'm going to turn it over to my Co-
17 Chair, Council Member Barron and let her ask some
18 questions as well.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Mr.
20 Chair, thank you to the panel for coming and I've got
21 lots of questions because I think this is an exciting
22 program. So, there are 17 high schools and the Bard
23 schools that make it 19, okay and of those 17 schools
24 is it six that have nine to 12 programs or programs
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

35

1
2 that allow students to graduate after the 12th grade
3 with credits... [cross-talk]

4 PHIL WEINBERG: So, there's... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...that go up...

6 [cross-talk]

7 PHIL WEINBERG: ...there's... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...to perhaps as
9 high as 60?

10 PHIL WEINBERG: So, there's ten that are...

11 [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Ten... [cross-talk]

13 PHIL WEINBERG: ...CUNY based, there's two
14 that are at Bard and then there's the seven, nine
15 through 14's for a total of 19.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, the ten CUNY
17 based schools are nine to 12 or six to 12, there's
18 some of them that I see start at 6th grade?

19 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: That's correct.

20 PHIL WEINBERG: Correct.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay. In terms of
22 the admission requirements I heard you say that the
23 nine to 14 there are no academic requirements?

24 PHIL WEINBERG: Correct.

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

36

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: What about the others, the other ten?

PHIL WEINBERG: The other ten... the other 12 are, are screened... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Twelve... [cross-talk]

PHIL WEINBERG: ...schools.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: They're what?

PHIL WEINBERG: Screened schools.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Screened schools.

So, that school itself sets the policy, how does the DOE get involved in setting that policy for screening?

PHIL WEINBERG: There's a long history of the DOE working with schools to create screens that are functioning for each of the schools. This administration has a great interest in seeing how those screens can become less exclusive and more inclusive.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Less... become less...

PHIL WEINBERG: More inclusive.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Become more inclusive. I'm particularly interested in Medgar

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

37

1
2 Evers early college high school because I received a
3 call of concern saying that the DOE was intending to
4 change its screening policy without having consulted
5 involved or had staff involved in that and that they
6 were I believe requiring them to take more homeless
7 students and more students with disability, that's
8 what was told to me and some document was also
9 presented in that regard?

10 PHIL WEINBERG: So, Medgar Evers isn't
11 one of the early college high schools in, in this
12 program, I'm not aware of that, I mean I'm happy to
13 get more information about what ask has been made of
14 Medgar Evers. I think there's a DOE wide interest in
15 making sure that all of our screened school served a
16 more... serve a more diverse population over time.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, you'll find
18 out and get back to me because I don't know that
19 there were other schools that are also going to be
20 involved in this now change or proposed change to
21 their screening and I would love to get more
22 information about... if there's anybody else on your
23 group who's here could answer that?

24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

38

1
2 PHIL WEINBERG: I think our staff will
3 have to go back to our enrollment office to get more
4 details for you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'd be very
6 pleased to know what that is because their success
7 rate is phenomenal as other schools in the program
8 have great rates and it was born out of a struggle as
9 you know... [cross-talk]

10 PHIL WEINBERG: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...and we're very
12 concerned and make sure that we maintain their
13 success and the great work that they're doing so, I'd
14 appreciate that... getting back from that. Now, do you
15 rank your ECI early college schools by RCI is that
16 how they're ranked by the RCI, the college readiness
17 index? I've seen charts that have that ranking of...
18 [cross-talk]

19 PHIL WEINBERG: So, we... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...high schools...

21 PHIL WEINBERG: We've made a great effort
22 not to rank our schools period, we're trying to
23 provide as much information as we possibly can about
24 all of our schools both to the school community and
25 to the general public so that we can inquire and ask

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

39

1
2 good questions about our performance and a... and about
3 ways in which we can get better, we don't have a
4 ranking system.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: You don't have
6 rankings, but do you have the CRI for each of the
7 schools that's in this program?

8 PHIL WEINBERG: We have the CRI for each
9 of the 486 high schools, yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, I would
11 love to get that listing of the CRI's for each of
12 those schools.

13 PHIL WEINBERG: Sure...

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And then in terms
15 of the courses that are offered in high schools in
16 these particular high schools we understand the
17 students have the opportunity to take college
18 courses, is there also an opportunity for students at
19 these particular schools to take AP classes and do
20 they take them and what is the advantage or is there
21 an advantage?

22 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: So, the early colleges
23 do offer... some of the early colleges do offer
24 opportunities for students to take advanced placement
25 courses, we... it's not necessarily something that we

1
2 feel is of course necessary because in many.. in many
3 cases the student... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Could you pull
5 the mic a little closer?

6 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Sure, in many cases
7 the students who are taking the college courses are
8 able to earn actual credits which is the goal for us,
9 there are cases where for example it may.. the course
10 that a student may be interested in taking for a
11 credit... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-
13 talk]

14 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: ...is not available
15 through their particular sequence at that school and
16 so that may be a time when the school might offer an
17 AP course.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And I heard you
19 talk about transferring.. working to have the credits
20 that students amass in this program to institutions
21 outside of CUNY, if a high schooler is associated
22 with a particular college can they just as readily
23 expect that all of the credits they received in their
24 associated college will be accepted, I mean as a part
25 of the pathway system, is that... do you know if that's

1
2 something that's happening or do you want me to save
3 that question?

4 PHIL WEINBERG: I mean I think... I think
5 John can speak to that more... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-
7 talk]

8 PHIL WEINBERG: ...quickly, I know that
9 CUNY's very interested in making sure that the
10 credits are credit worthy wherever they go.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay. And who
12 pays for the textbooks, I didn't quite get that
13 answer, the textbooks for classes... college courses
14 that the students are... [cross-talk]

15 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: That's... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...taking?

17 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: That's covered by the
18 DOE and CUNY.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: The DOE?

20 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: DOE and... [cross-talk]

21 PHIL WEINBERG: And... [cross-talk]

22 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: ...CUNY, yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And CUNY?

24 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Yes.
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

42

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And I really
3 would like to get a better understanding, it wasn't
4 clear to me how we can calculate the cost?

5 PHIL WEINBERG: Sure...

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: The additional
7 cost to run an ECI school as opposed to the regular
8 high school?

9 PHIL WEINBERG: That's something we'll be
10 happy to come back to you with.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay and what's
12 the difference between the... what is it... the ECI and
13 the Early College High School, so exam... for example
14 you have these 19 schools here but there are others
15 that are considered early college high schools I
16 believe they are the smart science at Medgar, the
17 city Politech so is that a separate program?

18 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: It's not... well those
19 are funded through... so, there is a grant through the
20 New York State Education Department... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-
22 talk]

23 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: ...called the Smart
24 Scholars Program, there are a couple of schools
25 within New York City that are funded through that

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

43

1
2 program, a couple of our current CUNY and DOE
3 schools... I'm sorry, nine to 14 also fall under that
4 category. We particularly have been focusing on the
5 19 schools where we know that they've definitely been
6 offering college courses that lead up to an
7 Associate's degree or the sequence has been designed
8 so that students are able to complete a... an
9 Associate's degree within the time at the high
10 school. So, yes, there are other programs offered and
11 it really ranges from offering, you know a small set
12 of courses or they may have a particular relationship
13 with universities that... we have not been directly
14 involved with in terms of the coordination of the
15 relationships, but we definitely are aware that there
16 are other early colleges with... well schools offering
17 other types of college..

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, Medgar Evers
19 college high school is not a part of these 19
20 schools?

21 PHIL WEINBERG: Correct.

22 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Correct.

23 PHIL WEINBERG: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: It is not?

25 PHIL WEINBERG: Yes, it is not.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

44

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, we have no
3 bananas. Okay. So, the other concern that I have is
4 that according to the data that I've seen yes,
5 students remain in college, remaining in college two
6 years after high school graduation is 42 percent for
7 ECI schools but only four percent receive an
8 Associate's degree, that's the data that I have which
9 is concerning and troubling. So, yes, we have 42
10 percent of ECI college students remaining in college
11 but the data that I have says only four percent
12 receive an Associate's degree and that's troubling to
13 me or puzzling to me because if they come in with so
14 many more credits and if I think 20 credits is an
15 indicator that a student can expect to go forward so..
16 in terms of how are we're going to evaluate the
17 success of the program.. [cross-talk]

18 PHIL WEINBERG: I think it's a fair
19 question around long term evaluation and I'd love to
20 sit with my partners from CUNY and talk about how
21 we're going to process that information and see
22 whether that's an accurate number.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay.

24 PHIL WEINBERG: And I believe that CUNY
25 will be talking about it in its testimony.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

45

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay. And...

[cross-talk]

PHIL WEINBERG: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...the other piece that I have is that moving on which is a related question, moving on to four-year colleges, four-year college programs its 71 percent at CUNY... 71 percent at CUNY so we're looking to see if we can get that graduation rate as well so... we can perhaps get that from my colleagues, the CUNY panel. And finally, what's the average number of credits, college credits that students have when they graduate from an ECI school that's one of the ten that are nine to 12?

PHIL WEINBERG: That's a great... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: What's the average... [cross-talk]

PHIL WEINBERG: ...question... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...number of college credits?

PHIL WEINBERG: It's a great question that we'd have to come back to you with, but we can... we can pull that, or you might even know it soon...

[off-mic dialogue]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

46

1
2 PHIL WEINBERG: Thirty, I believe it's
3 30, I was thinking hard on that so, so...

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Average number...
5 that's even more puzzling to me why then more
6 students don't get out. And... but I do... I do have some
7 great news in terms of the student on time graduation
8 rate is 86 percent for ECI schools and its even
9 higher for black students at 89 percent, that's a
10 switch and so this is great, a problem... a great
11 program that we're looking at in terms of closing
12 that gap for black and Latino students and we do see
13 that the region scores are higher and that the ELA
14 and math scores are improved. So, we think that it's
15 a good program, some accomplishments, we want to be
16 able to get some long-range analysis from this as
17 well and if you could forward those answers and
18 certainly would like to know, I think the Chair asked
19 the question how did it get started, I would
20 certainly like to know more about its beginnings.
21 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Great, thank you. And
23 just to follow up a little bit on, on, on what your
24 questions where, where you were heading with some of
25 this, for the students enrolled in grades nine to 14

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

47

1
2 what percentage of students leave school at grade 12,
3 would you know that?

4 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: That's definitely a
5 great question, we just had our first P-TECH
6 graduates this past June and then two additional
7 schools just met their four year... 4th year, we're
8 still working on getting that data which is being
9 finalized, we'd be happy to share that once its
10 publicly available.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright, thank you.
12 Council Member Vacca has questions.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Yes, hi... [cross-
14 talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Now followed by
16 Council Member Kallos.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you. I just
18 wanted to ask several questions, first of all where
19 are the nine to 14 schools in the Bronx?

20 PHIL WEINBERG: In the Bronx? Hero High
21 is in the South Bronx...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Where was that,
23 I'm sorry?

24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

48

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

PHIL WEINBERG: Hero High is in... Hero High is in the South Bronx, it's in... is it on the Evander Childs Campus?

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Samuel Gompers.

PHIL WEINBERG: It's on the Gompers Campus.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: That's the only program we have at the Bronx?

PHIL WEINBERG: The only nine through 14...

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Nine through 14, how many... and how many nine... [cross-talk]

PHIL WEINBERG: Of the seven... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: ...through 14's again we have?

PHIL WEINBERG: There's seven nine through 14's.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Seven, are there plans for a second one because I'd, I'd like one in my district to be very honest with you?

PHIL WEINBERG: Sure, there are plans that too try to expand the nine through 14's over the next couple of years and we're looking at underrepresented areas... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

49

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well I have an upper... an underrepresented area.

PHIL WEINBERG: That's great... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: And you can take care of it...

PHIL WEINBERG: Alright, thanks.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I'm prepared to meet with you, I can think of several principles that would be interested.

PHIL WEINBERG: Alright, we appreciate... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: So... [cross-talk]

PHIL WEINBERG: ...the input... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: ...lets partner soon because I'm leaving in three months, so we have to do this very quickly.

PHIL WEINBERG: Alright.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay. I wanted to ask you how many of the students in the nine to 14... what's the percentage of students in the nine to 14 schools that go onto a four-year college?

PHIL WEINBERG: So, the nine through 14's a new... a relatively new experiment, we have of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

50

1
2 seven schools one schools been in existence for six
3 years and two schools have been in existence for four
4 years, so we have limited data to talk to you about
5 their ongoing attainment, what... do we have any
6 details we can share right now?

7 [off-mic dialogue]

8 PHIL WEINBERG: Just for P-TECH we have
9 the graduation information I told you before and 62
10 percent of the kids who are graduating are, are
11 enrolling in four-year colleges at CUNY.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Sixty-four
13 percent?

14 PHIL WEINBERG: Sixty-two.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Sixty-two percent...
16 [cross-talk]

17 PHIL WEINBERG: Of the one class of
18 students we're talking about from P-TECH, the
19 original school.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay. What college
21 in the Bronx is the sponsoring college for your
22 existing facility of nine through 14?

23 PHIL WEINBERG: Bronx Community or is it...
24 its Hostos... so... that one's at Hostos, it's with... it's

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

51

1
2 at Hostos with Montefiore Hospital as the industry
3 partner.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay, what are
5 students really interested in in the nine to 14
6 school in the Bronx or anywhere else, are they more...
7 are they... what's the prevalence, is it generally
8 liberal arts subjects or is there a... [cross-talk]

9 PHIL WEINBERG: That's a... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: ...trade... [cross-
11 talk]

12 PHIL WEINBERG: That's a medical
13 profession school. They can get an Associate's degree
14 that leads them to the field of medical profession...
15 to medical profession skills.

16 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: The school that's...
17 yeah, so the school... nine to 14 school in the Bronx
18 is focusing on nursing and community health.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Now when you're in
20 the... when you're in the 9th... when you're in the 8th
21 grade you have to go through a high school selection
22 process that involves a lottery system, it involves
23 your name coming up somehow in being given a school,
24 do you have a wait list for the... for the nine to 14
25 school that you have in the Bronx when the students

1
2 do high school applications, is there a... what is the
3 demand because I'm sure students know about this, it
4 must be in the high school directory that this is a
5 nine to 14 school so have you looked at the wait list
6 to determine the demand that could exist beyond what
7 we have now?

8 PHIL WEINBERG: So, we have a high demand
9 for every single one of these programs, at Hero the
10 total number of applicants was 977 this past year and
11 the total number of seats we had available was 142,
12 119 enrolled.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay, my last
14 question is what is the... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Just before... [cross-
16 talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: ...degree of...
18 [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...you go on Council
20 Member as I interrupt you too, how do you go about
21 publicizing the program and we looked at the school
22 finder and it was a little difficult to figure out
23 exactly what was being offered etcetera, so forth and
24 so on so we're curious to know as a follow up to what
25 Council Member Vacca is asking?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

53

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Sure, so all our nine to 14 schools do participate in the borough and the citywide high school fairs, that's a huge opportunity for them to really meet students from across the city. In addition we host the career and technical education high school fair that has been a new initiative under this administration that's... and this year it's coming up this Saturday so the students really get a chance to speak about... and current students do participate in these fairs so that they can reach out to the eighth graders to talk about why it's unique to come to the nine to 14 schools, in addition all the schools host their own open houses, many of them also, you know provide information sessions for parents specifically in, in different languages so that they have an opportunity to learn about it if they are not English speakers.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Just, just to go back to one or two things I know it was mentioned but is space an issue, the students technically stay in the high school for the two years or do they take a combined type of presence... do they go both to high school and college, how does that work?

1
2 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Sure, at the years
3 five and six point they more likely spend their time
4 on the college campus so while they may come back to
5 the high school for various seminars, for check ins
6 with their advisors, the students are expected to
7 spend more time on the college campus. I would say
8 that when we were initially developing these schools
9 we had accounted for the fact that there might be
10 some needs for the additional space during those
11 periods so that was accounted for but as always space
12 is a premium in the city. So, we do want to make sure
13 that the students do have an opportunity to come back
14 and, and see their high school advisors on a regular
15 basis so we, we make sure that space is available to
16 them.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: And my last
18 question is I would think that in an... in an endeavor
19 like this you'd have to have a large degree of
20 parental involvement, is there a component that deals
21 with keeping parents involved and in touch with their
22 student's progress starting maybe in grade nine,
23 there has to be a buy in from parents because this is
24 such a unique program?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

55

1
2 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Absolutely, so there
3 are various ways we've been doing this, one at the
4 institutional level CUNY and the DOE has been
5 collaborating on creating an FAQ for parents so that
6 they have an understanding of what is involved in
7 attending a school, a... an... in a nine to 14 school and
8 that document has been translated in all nine
9 languages and also distributed at the high school
10 fairs. The schools individually host different
11 programs so that they can really meet the needs of
12 their particular parent population, some may host
13 annual student conference events or dinners where
14 they have the opportunity to bring the parents
15 together with their students and meet with faculty so
16 that they can talk about where there students are
17 currently, what they need to be doing academically or
18 getting additional support so that they can advance
19 in their college courses in their high school
20 academics. There are schools that host monthly... or
21 what they call coffee sessions with the principal so
22 it's an opportunity for them to check in to learn
23 about different supports and initiatives that are
24 offered directly to the parents, so every school is
25 approaching this in a different way based on who the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

56

1
2 parents are, where their student's, you know families
3 are located but yes, we definitely see parental
4 engagement as a huge and necessary component for the
5 success of the nine to 14s.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Is there adequate
7 representation from students who have special needs
8 or is there an outreach that's done in that regard to
9 make sure that there's an equitable representation?

10 PHIL WEINBERG: The nine through 14's
11 there is.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Sorry?

13 PHIL WEINBERG: In the... in the seven nine
14 through 14 schools we see a diversity pattern that
15 reflects the city, yes, in the... in the seven.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay. Thank you,
17 Mr. Chair, Madame Chair.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much
19 and just to follow up again because we did a little
20 experiment on the school finder and when we put in
21 words like Associate degree versus Associate's with
22 an apostrophe S versus early college it came up with
23 all different results of what's available so when you
24 do the training how... what do you tell students to
25 search under or parents to search under?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

57

1
2 PHIL WEINBERG: We will certainly speak
3 to our colleagues in enrollment and try to get you an
4 answer for how we train students to use the... and
5 families to use the school finder.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay because that can
7 be quite confusing in terms of what's offered when
8 that search is done. Alright, let's go to Council
9 Member Kallos followed by Cabrera.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you to our
11 Chairs to calling attention to this issue and just
12 following along on the Chair's question. So, this
13 reflects specific schools that are participating in
14 your program, I went to a high school in the Bronx
15 across the street from Lehman, across Harris Field
16 from Lehman and a lot of our students took classes
17 there and we happened to be friends with kids just
18 down the block from City Hall who are across the
19 street from BMCC, is any of that... and, and took a lot
20 of classes and I think in both cases we had some over
21 achievers that may have graduated back in the 90's
22 with an Associates in high school if you could just
23 share what the reporting is there and how those
24 programs happen whether officially or unofficially?

25

1
2 PHIL WEINBERG: So, the reporting on the
3 non-early schools where students still take courses
4 at CUNY, I think that our colleagues from CUNY are
5 prepared to speak about that more deeply than we are
6 right now.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So, I should save
8 that... if, if, if you can just email me with the
9 response, I, I, I won't be here at the same time as..
10 sadly, I think the other quick question along that is
11 so this looks like a tremendous opportunity however
12 even at the high school in the Bronx that I went to
13 where a lot of the kids were gifted and talented, you
14 turn 16 what's the point of school some might
15 question and a lot of kids just are done with it and
16 a lot of the folks that I knew particularly folks who
17 didn't come from wealthy neighborhoods or didn't come
18 from nuclear families or in multigenerational
19 households really felt the pressure to go get a
20 trades degree and go out there and earn income from
21 the family and in fact a number of us including
22 myself were working part time, sometimes full time
23 just to be able to afford to go to high school which
24 is a reality in this city... [cross-talk]

25 PHIL WEINBERG: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...what is the opportunity for targeting kids who are at risk of dropping out or stop showing up to school and coming to them and saying you know what we will help you with your GED, we will pay for you to go to CUNY for the next two years if, if you come back to DOE, you don't have to set foot in the high school again but we want you to get your Associates between now and when you're 18 and while we technically have some responsibility for you so that when a child wants to exit and... at 16 though they can exit, I still think they're children?

PHIL WEINBERG: I mean dropout prevention is a key component of the work that we're doing, the dropout rate is... has been dropping year after year since 2014, I love your idea if you're offering us the funding to do it that's fantastic, the... we want to make sure we have as many options available to as many students to find their way to complete their education because we like you know that the completion of the high school credential and some kind of post-secondary experience is essential to the health and well-being of the whole city not just that one young person.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

60

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So, that, that...
I'm, I'm glad we have a meeting of the minds, how
much would it cost?

PHIL WEINBERG: We'd have to get back to
you to... talk about paying... bringing kids back and
offering them... kids who are at risk and offering them
opportunity to co-enroll in CUNY while at the same
time as completing their high school GED?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Right, I think
it's parallel to this program, the only difference is
in one case the kid has chosen to be at one of your
schools that has this program versus thousands of
other high schools where this program doesn't exist
to I guess what is the current cost for your program
and how many at risk... what's the current cost for
your program, how many participants, how many at risk
kids, yeah and then we can extrapolate?

PHIL WEINBERG: So, we're... we've promised
to bring current cost as, as quickly as we can, and I
think cutting it by at risk students which is a
definition that changes depending on who's asking the
question, we will happily look at that as well and,
and try to tie it to cost, absolutely.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

61

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And do you know
3 how many kids dropped out last year?

4 PHIL WEINBERG: Of the city it's below
5 eight percent now, is that, about right? I think
6 we're... we've did... it's, it's gone down steadily in
7 the last three or four years and it's around... the
8 dropout rate I believe was eight percent last year,
9 but we've have to check just to make certain.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So, eight percent
11 of around 60,000 so around 48... sorry, 480?

12 PHIL WEINBERG: Four... it would be... eight
13 percent would be 4,800.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay, so, so
15 4,800...

16 PHIL WEINBERG: It's 8.5 so... 5,100 sorry.
17 And sorry, I missed... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So, so, so we're
19 talking about 5,000 or so kids and so... and then how
20 much do the Associates programs cost?

21 PHIL WEINBERG: I mean just... in general
22 we can... we can do a years' worth of CUNY tuition to
23 start to know the baseline cost plus you're talking
24 about intelligently the... there needs to be some
25 baseline support for students who have had non-

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

62

1
2 success in high school to make sure that they cannot
3 just take advantage of this opportunity but meet the
4 needs of that opportunity if its presented. So, it,
5 it would be a very different kind of early college
6 program then has been designed before, it's a really
7 interesting idea but it requires... it would require
8 funding CUNY tuition and funding a school.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS And, and I think
10 similarly are there any budget lines DOE wide in
11 terms of paying kids to go to school because when
12 you're choosing between supporting your family,
13 keeping you in your home or waking up the next day in
14 a homeless shelter versus going to school... [cross-
15 talk]

16 PHIL WEINBERG: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...and providing
18 for your family there, there really may not be a
19 choice there.

20 PHIL WEINBERG: Oh I struggled with that
21 when I was leaving school, I, I hear what you're
22 saying, there is... the only money I know that goes
23 directly from the DOE to the students is money for
24 internships while there especially in some of our CTE
25 programs, I don't know of a program we have right now

1
2 where students are financially taken care of to keep
3 them in school.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you.

5 PHIL WEINBERG: Sure.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, Council Member
7 Cabrera.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
9 much. Just a few questions, on just need point of
10 clarification here, what's the difference between DOE
11 versus CUNY running the programs, is there a
12 difference?

13 PHIL WEINBERG: So... I mean we are co-
14 running this experience for, for young... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: In every school?

16 PHIL WEINBERG: In each of these places
17 where students are enrolled in CUNY and, and in the
18 Bards School, the... we have... we have... we share
19 responsibility for the student's experiences across
20 institutions.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay and then
22 you mentioned something that got me a little
23 confused, do they... do they... they do 9th and 10th grade
24 in high school and then what happens in 11th grade?
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

64

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: So, they will still continue, you know finishing all their high school course and requirements in 9, 10, 11, 12; the expectation is though that the courses that they... the college courses will pick up more once they hit 11th and 12th grade so they may... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: And how many is that normally?

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Again it ranges but we try to balance between a full course load that the students have to manage at the high school and the college, students may be taking anywhere from two to three or four courses in their 11th grade and even more at 12th grade... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, do the college courses count towards the graduation... high school graduation, how do they meet the full requirement for the high... [cross-talk]

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: There may be courses and the school's definitely look into this where they may be able to offer dual credits so the college course that they take in say English may also apply towards their high school requirements.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

65

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: How is this
3 different from AP courses?

4 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: I would say with AP
5 courses one of the challenges that a lot of the
6 students' performance really relies on this one final
7 test that they take at the end whereas with the
8 college courses they are really getting a full
9 semester or years' worth of experience as a college
10 student, there are different points within which they
11 are able to demonstrate their performance and you
12 know the credits that they're able to accumulate at
13 the end they can definitely transfer into, you know
14 CUNY or SUNY or whatever college that they may
15 advance to, with AP credits it... I think it's at the
16 discretion of the college that they go to so it... we
17 feel it's much more advantageous for them to be able
18 to earn a college credit.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: And what's the
20 plan for expansion, is it... do we have a clear
21 pathway, trajectory of where we're going here?

22 PHIL WEINBERG: So, the plan right now is
23 to expand to three... at least three more nine through
24 14's and right now the DOE is in discussions that
25 will include CUNY around what... where those nine

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

66

1
2 through 14's should be located, what the industry
3 partner should be, and which CUNY campus would like
4 to be involved.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I, I want to
6 join the, the chorus here regarding... look, I, I think
7 part of the big problem that we have in just about
8 any system that you come into is transition, I think
9 that this program does a fantastic job in creating a
10 real bridge, it's working, I'm just wondering why not
11 look at it at a system wide a possibility because
12 it's costing us more money for students not to
13 succeed not just in the short term but in the long
14 term that the possible millions of dollars we will
15 have to spend to expand that into every school, do
16 you... do you... do you see the possibility... let's say
17 if, if funding was not an issue, this working in
18 every school?

19 PHIL WEINBERG: I think if, if we're
20 talking about a world in which funding is not an
21 issue we would love to have our students in DOE
22 schools have more and more opportunity to live in the
23 world of post-secondary education and make sure they
24 know what they're transitioning to and what they need
25 to do in order to transition to something. One of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

67

1
2 things about young people that's true... that's a
3 terrible sentence... the... when there is something that
4 people work toward they do better work, when they
5 know what the end of their work is. The exciting
6 thing about these programs is that we're revealing to
7 students what the future could look like to them and
8 it allows them to be inside this conversation around
9 why education is necessary, why career experience is
10 necessary for them to, to make smart choices about
11 their own lives and so if this was more widely
12 available to young people this would be a boom for
13 our city, yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I, I agree with
15 you, I think that they would see a greater value for
16 their investment in sticking to school and to have
17 consistency in school, this is why I think that we
18 should start considering in the future and when I
19 mean the future I don't mean four years from now, I
20 mean starting now to see... because to be honest with
21 you three is not going to have a huge impact, three
22 schools. I, I... how much does it cost to do each
23 school?

24

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

68

1
2 PHIL WEINBERG: So, we, we have to come
3 back to you with specific information; there are a
4 myriad of costs involved.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: But I mean
6 what's the ballpark, you got a... it, it can... when
7 you're running this program I'm surprised you don't
8 know how much it cost... [cross-talk]

9 PHIL WEINBERG: Yeah, me too... [cross-
10 talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...to run each of
12 the programs, what's like the ballpark?

13 PHIL WEINBERG: We have... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: A million
15 dollars...

16 PHIL WEINBERG: We have a million dollar...
17 million and a half communicated to CUNY, I'm not...
18 [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: To run all 17
20 schools or per school?

21 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: So, for the college...
22 just for the college portion I would say it's
23 approximately 1.3 to 1.5 million just for the 17
24 schools of... [cross-talk]

25 PHIL WEINBERG: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

69

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: ...CUNY... [cross-talk]

PHIL WEINBERG: ...I think it's, it's, it's
a deeper cost than that because of the number of, of
students, we are going to have to sit with CUNY and
give you better information and there's a separate
fiscal arrangement with Bard... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Does TAP and
Pell pick up anything here?

PHIL WEINBERG: No, they do not with...
[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: They don't...
[cross-talk]

PHIL WEINBERG: ...kids don't, don't use
their TAP and Pell money here, it is one of the
lovely things about the program in that the TAP and
Pell money is still available to students, it's
really a generous... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: And how many
high schools do we have in the city right now?

PHIL WEINBERG: There are 10 CUNY early
college high schools, there's seven nine through 14's
and there's two high schools run by Bard University...
[cross-talk]

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: No, I'm talking
3 about a DOE all together, how many high schools?

4 PHIL WEINBERG: 486 or so.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: 486, are we
6 talking about 400,000 plus... even if we were to do
7 half of that to start with, what... can you imagine the
8 impact that we would have in the students creating a
9 real bridge, creating that hope, that vision where
10 the students can see I'm going to get a college
11 degree when I finish here is something that we should
12 seriously talk about and to be honest a choice not a
13 lot of money in the scheme of things when we have...
14 what's the budget now Chair Dromm right now for the
15 DOE, is it 26 billion dollars? So, so like... something
16 like that, I mean this would greatly increase high
17 school graduation and end up with a college degree, I
18 would have loved to have had that I was in... finishing
19 high school and have a college degree that would have
20 been amazing. Thank you so much, look I, I appreciate
21 all the work that you do and I'm... the reason I'm
22 talking this way because I do believe in what you're
23 doing and, and we should definitely expand it, thank
24 you so much.

25 PHIL WEINBERG: Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

71

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: These are good questions and we will follow up with the, the DOE on that and I know in particular in my discussions with Bard also the, the, the amount of money that Bard is getting to offer these programs has been a concern to them and to this... to this committee as well so... thank you. Council Member Barron, Chair Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Mr. Chair. A few more questions, you talked about students being able to realize that there's more that they can do and it's a bigger world a lot of that also has to do with students connecting to the teacher, the ethnicity of the teacher and we know that predominately black and Latino students are... make up the majority of student population in DOE, what do we know to be or do we have data about the ethnicity of both the teachers in these ECI schools and I'll ask CUNY about the CUNY staff?

PHIL WEINBERG: I certainly don't have that information available today about the 19 schools.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, if you could get that to us we'd appreciate that. And a few

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

72

1
2 other questions, I see that there are two schools
3 that are nine to 13, I believe International High
4 School at LaGuardia is nine to 13... [cross-talk]

5 PHIL WEINBERG: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...and the middle
7 college high school at LaGuardia is nine to 13, so is
8 it the same concept as nine to 14 but its condensed
9 or consolidated into a year or is...

10 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Those two schools are
11 still part of the... what we've been counting as part
12 of the nine to 12's for CUNY but they do offer an
13 extra year for the students to be able to finish
14 their Associates degree, they are different from the
15 nine to 14's in that they are not necessarily
16 focusing on a career in technical education.
17 International High School is focused... and of course
18 my CUNY colleagues will speak... can speak more about
19 this but International High School does serve a
20 predominately ELS or population of students who have
21 recently come to the United States so they're working
22 with students who may also be academically behind.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And in terms of
24 schools that are nine to 14 can a student accelerate,

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

73

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

can they finish a year ahead, can they consolidate
classes or on the other hand... [cross-talk]

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: There's definitely
examples where... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Say again?

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: There are definitely
examples where students who are much more... [cross-
talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-
talk]

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: ...high achieving has
been accelerating and taking on college... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And when a...
[cross-talk]

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: ...courses... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...student is in
the nine to 14 that last year or year and a half do
they have to go to school full time?

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Since they are still
enrolled as high school DOE students, yes, we do want
them to be attending school full time, are you
talking about the years five and six?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Say again?

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Are you... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

74

1
2 PHIL WEINBERG: Yeah, she asked about the
3 last two years...

4 REINA UTSUNOMIYA: Oh okay, so for the
5 years five and six if they are taking the college
6 courses that's going to predominately be where
7 they're going to be focusing their instructional
8 time.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay and how long
10 the process for a high school that's interested in
11 being a part of the ECI, how long does that process
12 take for a high school to contact you and say we want
13 to be a part of that program and what do they have to
14 do to be a part of that program?

15 PHIL WEINBERG: Its... there isn't a
16 straight answer to that questions, there's a lot of
17 fiscal considerations and enrollment... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That's
19 interesting, a lot of fiscal considerations but yet
20 you're not able to give us, you know the data that
21 we're asking you for... [cross-talk]

22 PHIL WEINBERG: Yeah... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So... [cross-talk]

24 PHIL WEINBERG: ...I apologize... [cross-
25 talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

75

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...it seems like...

[cross-talk]

PHIL WEINBERG: We'll... we will get you
that data, I am... I do apologize for that.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay and then we...
your, your population is to help... your... part of your
goal, your purpose is to reduce remediation and we
know that many of these students are in need of
support not just the academic but social as well so
what do you offer to students to help give them what
they need?

PHIL WEINBERG: Uh-huh...

REINA UTSUNOMIYA: So, at the nine to 14
schools that's definitely a huge focus both in
supporting them academically and in their social,
emotional development. As an example, one... the Hero
High School in the Bronx they have actually assigned
or hired social workers for every single grade so
that they can provide that type of wrap around
support because they know that that's a huge factor
in making sure that the students are able to engage
and stay in school. In other schools they may be
offering... one of our schools has been working with
Include NYC which is an organization in Unite... in New

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

76

1
2 York City focusing on helping students to transition
3 as their students with disabilities or students with
4 IEP's so that they have ways where if the school
5 itself may not be able to support that, that they are
6 able to provide the... their full service or community
7 based support for the students. So, the schools are
8 all working on different strategies that meet the
9 needs of their particular population.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay and I think
11 this is my final question, I looked at the data that
12 you gave us in terms of the 19 ECI schools and when
13 looking at those that are part of the nine to 12
14 model which allows a student to graduate from high
15 school with up to 60 but on an average of 30 credits
16 which is great, I noticed that the trend of the black
17 enrollment at these schools has gone down. So, for
18 example the Brooklyn College Academy which has been
19 in, in existence from 2012 to 2017 has dropped from
20 75 percent black to 68 percent and also at City
21 College Academy there's a very small population of
22 black students, only five percent on an average which
23 has dropped down now to four percent of black
24 students, at Hostos another one of the schools where
25 it's nine to 12 it's dropped from 22 to 20 percent

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

77

1
2 black enrollment and at... my lines are crossing here..
3 oh the Manhattan Hunter Science School it's dropped
4 from 60... I'm sorry, from 20 percent black to 16
5 percent and most alarmingly at York Early College
6 Academy it's dropped from 63 percent to 47 percent.
7 So, those are disturbing trends that I'm looking at
8 in terms of enrollment of black students who have the
9 ability to graduate from high school with a
10 significant number of college credits. So, I would
11 like to get some explanation for that and if you
12 could get back to me I would appreciate that.

13 PHIL WEINBERG: Sure...

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Chair
16 Barron. Just as my final question, I think Stuyvesant
17 students go to the borough of Manhattan Community
18 College and students from Bronx Science go to Lehman,
19 is that part of the ECI program?

20 PHIL WEINBERG: It is not.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It's separate, is it..
22 is it... DOE involved in that?

23 PHIL WEINBERG: I... say again? There... I
24 mean one easy way that it happens is through the
25 College Now Program which you might be fam... you...

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

78

1
2 which you might familiar with, there are other
3 institutions that make agreements institution to
4 institution to allow kids to articulate in the
5 limited way.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, that's between
7 the high school itself and the... and the... and the CUNY
8 College?

9 PHIL WEINBERG: Exact... we have more
10 formal arrangements like through our College Now
11 Program that really capture a, a much wider swath of
12 the city's students than any one of these particular
13 programs.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Uh-huh. Okay, thank
15 you very much. We're going to stop here with this
16 panel and then bring up our next panel. I'm sorry,
17 we've been joined by Council Members Salamanca,
18 Deutsch, Garodnick... Grodenchik... Garodnick, excuse me.
19 Yes, and I want to thank this panel for coming in and
20 we look forward to our next panel which is John
21 Mogulescu from the Senior University Dean of Academic
22 Affairs at CUNY; Cass Conrad, University Dean K to 16
23 Initiatives at CUNY; Tracee Murren, the Principal at
24 Kingsborough Early College Secondary School and Leara
25 Marshall, Former Student and a current Teacher at

1 Kingsborough Early College and Secondary... Early
2 College Secondary School to come up and while they're
3 coming up I did want to read a statement from Council
4 Member Debi Rose who unfortunately can't make this
5 hearing but is on the Committee because she's in
6 Staten Island this morning and there was a conflict
7 in her schedule so from Council Member Debi Rose it
8 says, with more than 60 percent of jobs nationwide
9 requiring post-secondary education is paramount to
10 our students... it is paramount our students obtain
11 higher education so that they can remain competitive
12 in today's market. However, soaring post-secondary
13 tuition costs have forced our youth to question the
14 value of obtaining such a degree but providing our
15 students with a free opportunity to earn Associates
16 degree while still in high school we are ensuring
17 that every child can pursue a higher education
18 regardless of the socioeconomic status. This is one
19 of the reasons why my vision for the North Shore of
20 Staten Island includes an education complex that
21 begins at Pre-K and continues through to an
22 Associate's degree. Having spent much of my career
23 working to keep at risk youth in school I understand
24 the importance of higher education and the obligation
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

80

1
2 we have to put our students on the best path to
3 success by investing in programming to enable them to
4 graduate with not only a high school diploma but
5 their Associates degree as well. And that's from
6 Council Member Debi Rose. So, thank you for coming in
7 today and I'm going to ask you to raise your right
8 hand, so I can swear you all in. Do you solemnly
9 swear or affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth
10 and to answer Council Member questions honestly? Okay
11 and so who would like to start? Yes, and just you
12 have to hit that mic with... and put... make sure that
13 red lights on.

14 JOHN MOGULESCU: Thank you. Good morning,
15 I'm John Mogulescu, the Senior University Dean for
16 Academic Affairs and Dean of the CUNY School of
17 Professional Studies. Let me start by thanking both
18 Chair Dromm and Barron for hosting today's hearing. I
19 think we will do our best to testify and also fill in
20 some of the gaps and answer some of the questions
21 perhaps that DOE colleagues were, were not able to,
22 to answer. I appreciate the opportunity to, to speak
23 here today. Let me just mention I also appreciate the
24 Council's strong support of CUNY over the years
25 particularly this year's support of our efforts to

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

81

1
2 reform remediation at the colleges and the funding
3 and support you've provided has helped us to develop
4 new policies and curricula that we believe will make
5 a significant difference in our student's success
6 rate. The City University of New York and the New
7 York City Department of Education are deeply
8 connected by the students they serve, you, you know
9 that roughly 60 percent of DOE graduates who go to
10 college attend a CUNY College, approximately 78
11 percent of first time freshman at CUNY are graduates
12 of DOE schools. As part of our Chancellors recently
13 announced strategic framework CUNY clearly recognizes
14 the Department of Ed is its most important partner
15 and pledges to work closely with it to help ensure
16 that a larger number of entering students are
17 prepared for success starting with early childhood
18 education and assisting them up to and through high
19 school. CUNY's Office of K-16 Initiatives is home to
20 the early college initiative as we've talked about
21 and all of our programs that serve DOE students. In
22 2016-17 these programs together served over 50,000
23 students for more than 500 schools throughout the
24 city, nationally recognized programs aimed to improve
25 success rates and ease the transition from K-12

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

82

1
2 public school to college and beyond. I'd like to take
3 a moment to remind you of some of the important work
4 we're doing in this area even beyond the early
5 college high schools. College Now which came up
6 briefly at the end of the... DOE's testimony as CUNY's
7 largest dual enrollment program enlisting 17 colleges
8 and 420 or so New York City High Schools in its
9 mission to prepare students for high school
10 graduation and college success. The program offers
11 college credit courses, preparatory courses,
12 workshops, summer programs and access to campuses and
13 cultural offerings free of charge to over 21,000
14 students each year. CUNY Prep is an innovative
15 college preparatory school that offers out of school
16 youth an alternative pathway to college. CUNY Prep
17 offers a full-time program for students age 16 to 18
18 in which students take core classes in math, science,
19 writing and social studies and work to earn their
20 high school equivalency diploma once successful
21 students move into college transition academy and
22 finally the third phase of the program the College
23 Success Network supports students while in college.
24 CUNY Explore has enabled all New York City middle
25 school students to visit a CUNY College Campus at

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

83

1
2 least once during their middle school years, the
3 program helps students understand that college is for
4 everyone, college is affordable, and that middle
5 school students with the support of their families
6 and school staff can take steps now to become college
7 ready. In '16-'17 the Explorers Program on ten CUNY
8 campuses will serve 22,000 7th graders, at full
9 capacity the program will serve approximately 80,000
10 students annually. Finally, CUNY Link Program serves
11 high school seniors who are on track to graduate but
12 have not met traditional benchmarks for college
13 readiness. The program trains high school teachers to
14 teach specifically designed senior year math and
15 English courses that prepare students for CUNY's
16 placement exams. Students also receive support to
17 complete the FASFA and the CUNY online applications.
18 Together all these programs demonstrate the
19 university's commitment to the young people of our
20 city and to provide... providing access to a high-
21 quality college education. CUNY founded on the basis
22 of equity and social justice remains a national
23 exemplar of the ideals of public higher education.
24 I'd be happy to provide additional details about the
25 programs and your questions and... afterwards as well

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

84

1
2 but now I'd like to introduce Cass Conrad, University
3 Dean for K-16 Initiatives at CUNY will provide more
4 detail on our work to support the early college
5 initiative schools.

6 CASS CONRAD: Thank you John for that
7 introduction and I would like to say thank you to the
8 Chairs and the Committee Members for this opportunity
9 to speak with you today. I'm Cass Conrad, the
10 University Dean for K-16 Initiatives at CUNY. I've
11 had the privileged to work with our early college
12 schools since I started at CUNY in 2004. CUNY's Early
13 College Initiative was founded on the belief that all
14 students deserved the opportunity to attend engaging
15 schools that help them successfully transition from
16 high school to college to challenging 21st century
17 careers. Working with CUNY Colleges and our partners
18 in the Department of Education the Early College
19 Initiative or ECI develops innovative schools with
20 integrated support systems that help ensure success
21 for all students. New York City has one of the
22 highest concentrations of early college schools in
23 the country, nearly 9,000 students are enrolled in
24 CUNY's network of 17 early college schools, each of
25 which is partnered with a CUNY college. The ECI

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

85

1
2 schools help students from a broad range of
3 backgrounds earn both a high school diploma and an
4 Associate degree or up to two years of college at no
5 cost to themselves and their families. The schools
6 are specifically designed to support low-income
7 youth, first generation college goers, English
8 language learners, and other groups that have
9 historically been underrepresented in higher
10 education. in large measure the population of the
11 early college schools matches the neighborhoods in
12 which they are located. Approximately 35 percent of
13 the students are black, and 40 percent are Hispanic.
14 Just over half, 52 percent are male, about 15 percent
15 of the early college students have an IEP and seven
16 percent are English language learners. Early college
17 students take carefully selected college credit
18 courses as part of their regular curriculums. These
19 courses are offered during the school day and many of
20 them count for both high school and college credit.
21 By making campus life and college level work a part
22 of every student's high school experience early
23 college schools eliminate the financial, academic,
24 and psychological hurdles that prevent too many
25 students from entering and succeeding in college.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

86

1
2 [coughs] excuse me... although all 17 early college
3 schools share this common design principle there are
4 a few differences among the schools. Six schools... and
5 as I'm going to clarify a little bit from the
6 testimony earlier this morning, six schools begin the
7 6th grade and continue through the 12th grade, four
8 schools begin in the 9th grade and continue through
9 the 12th or 13th year and seven schools begin in the
10 9th grade and allow students to stay for up to six
11 years or until the 14th year. This last group, the
12 nine to 14 schools include P-TECH and others that
13 have both a college and career focus. Regardless of
14 the grade configuration all early college schools
15 feature a program that seamlessly integrates high
16 school and college courses. For example, at the York
17 Early College Academy or YECA in Jamaica, Queens
18 students often begin taking college courses in the
19 10th grade, typically they would start with an
20 introduction to poetry course and then in the 11th
21 and 12th grade they would build on that foundation by
22 adding English, math, arts and social science
23 courses. This scaffolded approach is one element that
24 contributes to the student's success, instead of
25 abruptly from a high school environment to a college

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

87

1
2 campus as is the case for graduates of most high
3 schools ECI students begin with one college course so
4 that they can learn the different expectations placed
5 on college students in a much more supported manner.
6 Additionally, unlike some traditional schools in
7 which only high achieving students are selected for
8 accelerated or honors courses, ECI schools expect
9 that all students will have the opportunity to earn
10 college credits while in high school. This
11 expectation creates a culture that supports and
12 encourages students who might struggle in other
13 environments. Thinking again about YECA this culture
14 of success for all is evident in their outcomes. On
15 average students earn 47 college credits, credits by
16 the time they graduate, that's more than the typical
17 CUNY student earns in the first... their first two
18 years of college. Across all the early college
19 schools the on time high school graduation rate is 92
20 percent and the average graduate has earned 30
21 college credits, that's an important milestone that
22 helps them on their way to a college degree and helps
23 them now meet the expectations of the excelsior
24 scholarship. Because ECI schools work with both
25 community colleges and senior colleges students from

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

88

1
2 about half the schools have the opportunity to earn
3 an Associate degree by the time they graduate. In
4 2016 roughly, 16 percent of the graduates from those
5 schools did just that and graduated with both high
6 school diploma and Associate degree. As some of the
7 newer nine to 14 schools reach maturity we expect
8 that number to increase. Any ECI graduate who has
9 earned more than 16 credits which is about two thirds
10 of our most recent cohort has the ability to apply to
11 CUNY as a transfer student. This status helps ensure
12 that most if not all of their credits transfer and
13 acknowledges the fact that students have a
14 significant amount of college experience under their
15 belts. Given that level of experience roughly two
16 thirds of the graduates from the ECI schools enroll
17 in four-year colleges immediately. Our research shows
18 that the benefit of early college credits continues
19 to help students well beyond their high school
20 experience. Alumni of early college schools enter
21 with more credits, earn credits in a college.. in
22 college at a faster rate and are more likely to stay
23 enrolled. This boost to their momentum helps them
24 reach college graduation at higher rates than their
25 peers. Nearly 1,000 students from these schools have

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

89

1
2 earned college degrees at CUNY in the last ten years.
3 We are so very proud of all that they have
4 accomplished. And just to give you... I know the
5 question has been asked several times this morning
6 about their graduation rate, it's approximately 30
7 percent of the early college graduates have earned a
8 college degree or more than one degree by the time...
9 by four years after their high school graduation and
10 another 30... 35 percent of the students remain
11 enrolled in college at that point in time. In 2013
12 President Barack Obama highlighted the early college
13 model in his State of the Union Address and described
14 the remarkable goals of P-TECH and other similar
15 schools, in that speech he stated we need to give
16 every American student opportunities like this, we
17 couldn't agree more, and we would love to have the
18 opportunity to expand this model to more schools and
19 more students throughout New York City. Now it's my
20 great pleasure to introduce Miss Tracee Murren, the
21 Principal of the Kingsborough Early College Secondary
22 School. I've known Tracee since 2005 when she became
23 one of the founding teachers at that school, over the
24 years she has developed into an exceptional educator

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

90

1
2 and leader and we are proud of all the work that she
3 has done for the students of KECSS.

4 TRACEE MURREN: Thank you. Good morning
5 everyone. My name is Tracee Murren and I'm the
6 Principal of the Kingsborough Early College Secondary
7 School or as we fondly call it KECSS. KECSS was
8 founded in 2006 in partnership with the DOE and the
9 CUNY Early College Initiative. We are an unscreened
10 school that serves grades six to 12 and provide
11 students with the opportunity to earn a tuition free
12 Associates degree from Kingsborough Community
13 College. Our goal has been to provide college access
14 to students who traditionally have been
15 underrepresented in college. Seventy-three percent of
16 our students come from families who fall below the
17 poverty line and as a result qualify for free or
18 reduced lunch, 50 percent of our student's body is
19 black or Hispanic and 20 percent of our students have
20 special needs. At KECSS we have worked closely with
21 our staff and CUNY liaison to develop traditions and
22 systems to infuse college and career readiness into
23 all that we do. All of our students are part of an
24 advisory group beginning the summer of 6th grade. In
25 advisory students receive personalized attention from

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

91

1
2 their advisor with the curriculum focusing on
3 character development, team building and developing
4 the academic skills they need to be successful in
5 their college courses. Advisory is also a place where
6 students begin to explore their career interests and
7 participate in events such as our annual student run
8 college fair and student led conferences. By taking
9 part in these activities students develop the skills
10 our staff believes they need to be successful in the
11 ECI model. For the last 11 years we have worked very
12 closely with the faculty at Kingsborough to plan a
13 scoping sequence that maximizes the potential of our
14 students and ensures that they have the tools to be
15 successful high school and college students. We
16 ensure that our high school curriculum aligns with
17 our college curriculum so that our students are
18 better able to meet the behavioral expectations and
19 academic rigors of college coursework. This is no
20 easy task, but these conversations are woven into the
21 cultural fabric of our school, our teachers
22 understand that they are a crucial part of the
23 journey to that Associates degree and they take that
24 responsibility very seriously. In order to ensure
25 that our students have the foundational literacy and

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

92

1
2 numeracy skills required for success in college
3 courses we offer math and literacy interventions all
4 throughout our middle school. The goal of these
5 intervention programs are to ensure that our students
6 do not require remediation for their college courses.
7 Through programs such as guided reading, IXL and Just
8 Words we are able to address instructional gaps and
9 make sure that students reach college readiness
10 standards before they begin the college portion of
11 their journey at KECSS. We have experienced
12 substantial success with our mission as our 2016-2017
13 graduation rate reached 96 percent with 70 percent of
14 our students earning a full Associates degree from
15 Kingsborough Community College. Because the Early
16 College Initiative makes transfer of college credits
17 so seamless for our graduates over 90 percent of our
18 graduates move on to four-year CUNY institutions to
19 earn Bachelor's degrees and pursue career paths of
20 their choice. As a legacy teacher and now the
21 principal I feel blessed and fortunate to work with
22 students who are excited to learn, are grateful for
23 the opportunity they have been given and are
24 dedicated to their goals. This program provides
25 students not only with college credits but with the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

93

1
2 self-confidence, determination, and self-advocacy,
3 advocacy skills to become independent, successful
4 members of the larger community. It is now my
5 pleasure to introduce Leara Marshall, one of my
6 former KECSS students who I'm very proud to say is
7 now a colleague.

8 LEARA MARSHALL: Good morning, welcome
9 all city officials, organizers of today's testimony
10 and to everyone who is in attendance here today. I am
11 Leara Marshall and I'm a graduate of KECSS legacy
12 class, the first cohort of students to graduate from
13 the school. When I was 11 years old and leaving
14 elementary school, I was picked in a lottery to
15 attend Kingsborough Early College Secondary School.
16 At that time, I had no desire to attend this school,
17 I wanted to remain with my fellow school mates from
18 primary school, my dance club and I wanted to attend
19 the designated area secondary school. Thank god for
20 the wisdom and assistance of my grandmother as she
21 made sure that I held my chin up and forged.. and
22 forged ahead. At 11 years of age I just didn't
23 realize the impact that this great opportunity would
24 have upon my life. As soon as I entered school on the
25 first day I knew what a great decision it was to

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

94

1
2 attend KECSS. Throughout my years there I could
3 always rely on the fact that my school was providing
4 me with the skills and support system I would need to
5 be successful in the program. I began taking my first
6 college class which was a health class between the
7 summer of eighth grade... eighth and ninth grade. The
8 feeling of taking my first college class was surreal,
9 I couldn't believe I was being taught by a college
10 professor at the age of 13. My freshman and sophomore
11 year of high school I was young and still learning
12 how to function as a college student, so professors
13 came to our school to teach us. When they left each
14 day, I could rely on the support of my high school
15 teachers to ensure I was successful in those early
16 classes. In 11th grade I traveled to the campus for
17 class and by the 12th grade I was fully immersed in
18 the college experience. As time went on and as I got
19 older I began taking more college classes and the
20 excitement of being in a college classroom was soon
21 accompanied by a growing confidence as I felt... as I
22 felt more mature and proud of myself, proud that I
23 was taking and succeeding in college classes, proud
24 that I was only a teenage but accomplishing the goals
25 that are typically set for young adults. There were

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

95

1
2 times along the way that I struggled and became
3 discouraged so much so that I wanted to give up, it
4 was sometimes overwhelming to carry the workload of
5 my high school classes and college classes along with
6 juggling a part time job as a junior in high school,
7 however I was always able to rely on the strong
8 support network around me. By the time I reached
9 senior year I knew that I could turn to any of my
10 classmates who at that point had become more like
11 family. I also always had the support and devotion of
12 my teachers and advisor who were not only mentors but
13 were like family to me as well as were... as were
14 always there encouraging me and pushing me to keep
15 striving for my goals, they always gave up their free
16 time to assist me with anything I might have been
17 struggling with or needed. Around testing times
18 Saturday school was offered to anyone who needed
19 extra help. Unlike other schools where the student
20 teacher relationships can be impersonal KECSS staff
21 made it their personal obligation to see that... to see
22 that students succeed and felt supported. Their faith
23 in me fueled my self-esteem to not be a quitter,
24 children like me, those exposed to low income
25 communities with fewer opportunities than other

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

96

1
2 children often find giving in and giving up a
3 standard way of life but with the help of my KECSS
4 family that just wasn't an option for me. After
5 spending seven years at Kingsborough Early College
6 Secondary School I graduated and was the first person
7 in my family to obtain an Associate's degree. I then
8 went on to Brooklyn College and obtained a Bachelor's
9 degree in childhood education which felt seamless to
10 me because I was already used to being in a college
11 environment. Now I'm extremely proud to say that I
12 currently work as a sixth-grade math teacher at
13 KECSS. It was because of KECSS, the program and the
14 staff that I was able to achieve this great success
15 this far in my life, I will forever be indebted to
16 KECSS and I am thrilled that I can now help continue
17 a legacy of offering opportunities and college access
18 to other students who face some of the same
19 challenges as I did as a young student. Thank you for
20 listening.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you so much
22 to the panel, we're so pleased that all of you were
23 able to come and share your information. I was
24 talking with my colleague and we said that your
25 colleague, your staff looks like she could still be a

1
2 student at the school, so we appreciate her coming
3 and sharing her experiences. I have a few questions,
4 Miss Conrad in your testimony you talked about after...
5 on your second page of your testimony you inserted
6 some data which is not incorporated in the print, you
7 talked about the graduation rate I think it was, you...
8 something about 30 percent so if you could give that
9 to me again so I can make accurate notation of what
10 it was you said?

11 CASS CONRAD: Absolutely and we can also
12 send some information to you after the... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Please... [cross-
14 talk]

15 CASS CONRAD: ...hearing. So, the on time
16 high school graduation rate across all 17 schools is
17 92 percent... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-
19 talk]

20 CASS CONRAD: ...on average the students
21 earn 30 credits by the time they graduate although
22 the... there's quite a difference... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Say again, could
24 you slow down... [cross-talk]

25 CASS CONRAD: ...on average... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

98

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes... [cross-talk]

CASS CONRAD: ...the graduates earn 30
college credits... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-
talk]

CASS CONRAD: ...by the time they graduate
from high school, although there's quite a... array of
performance there roughly two thirds of the graduates
go on to enroll in four-year colleges and one third
in Associate degree programs...

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-
talk]

CASS CONRAD: ...and our... I know you've
asked about college degree completion roughly 30
percent of students who enroll at CUNY have earned a
college degree within four years of graduating from
high school and another 35 percent remain enrolled at
CUNY at that point in time.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, 30 percent of
the ECI graduates enroll and graduate?

CASS CONRAD: The enrollment number is
much higher, it's roughly 85 percent of ECI graduates
enroll in college after... within a semester after

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

99

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

graduating from their high school program... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

CASS CONRAD: ...two thirds of those high... of those college entrance goes to CUNY and of the students at CUNY two thirds are in a four-year program.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Do any of those students ever need any remediation?

CASS CONRAD: Some need remediation although the vast majority of students are graduating without the need of remediation.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: What percentage would you say needs remediation?

CASS CONRAD: Just give me a moment and I'll find the number for you...

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay...

CASS CONRAD: For... let's see, student... 82 percent of the students are meeting proficiency in English and 74 percent are meeting proficiency in mathematics.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, is that
3 considered the CRI, the College Readiness Index would
4 that be what that is?

5 CASS CONRAD: I think our colleagues from
6 the Department of Education would have to explain the
7 CRI, that's a measure that they've used, I know it is
8 based on the benchmarks that CUNY sets for college
9 proficiency... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-
11 talk]

12 CASS CONRAD: ...but I can't comment on how
13 it's actually calculated.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, do we know if
15 any of these remedial courses that students have to
16 take are in classes that they have been granted
17 credit for?

18 CASS CONRAD: I... can I just ask a
19 clarifying question, are you speaking specifically of
20 the courses that the early college students have
21 taken or CUNY in general?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Both.

23 CASS CONRAD: So, the early college
24 students by in large do not take remedial courses, as
25 you've heard... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

101

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Do you have a percentage?

CASS CONRAD: Well as you heard our colleagues from the Kingsborough School talk about the high school actually prepares the students for their college credit courses so the work that might be... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I, I, I would think that if a student were in the ECI program and got college credit for whatever the courses are they would not be any of those students taking remedial classes and that's not what I think I'm hearing.

CASS CONRAD: You're hearing that roughly 80 percent don't need any remediation in English... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-talk]

CASS CONRAD: ...and roughly 75 percent don't need any, any remediation in math so... and that's for the time they finish high school...

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right...

CASS CONRAD: During their high school program the high school courses are actually preparing them so you are correct, in the early

1
2 college program they are not taking remedial
3 coursework.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Zero?

5 CASS CONRAD: Correct.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, that's what
7 I wanted to find out.

8 CASS CONRAD: Okay.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, in terms of
10 the testimony that I have there was a statement that
11 these are dual enrollment programs that the students
12 are in so does that mean... does that mean that if
13 during the course of a day a student has an... well
14 when I went to school eons ago there were... I think we
15 had eight periods, I don't know what it is today, so
16 after a student has been at the DOE curriculum taking
17 eight periods do they then go for additional time to
18 take classes and does the class that they take at
19 college substitute for some of the credits that they
20 would need to satisfy with DOE?

21 TRACEE MURREN: So, you're correct in
22 assuming that, some courses do substitute for each
23 other so for example a student can take freshmen
24 English one in 11th grade after they have met the
25 CUNY requirements to sit in that class which is

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

103

1
2 actually a 75 on the regents exam so our students
3 would earn that on the regents exam and then be
4 allowed to take freshmen English one at the Campus,
5 that class would dual as credit for... towards their
6 Associates degree but also towards their high school
7 diploma so 11th grade English would be served by
8 freshman English one.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Great and then do
10 students... you said most of your... you said that... oh
11 boy... you had a high percentage of students who
12 graduated with an Associate's degree?

13 TRACEE MURREN: I did, I... last year I had
14 70 percent of my students... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Congratulations...
16 [cross-talk]

17 TRACEE MURREN: ...graduated with a degree...
18 thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Congratulations
20 and do those students who are in those classes do
21 they... what grade do they start taking advanced
22 classes or college level classes so that they can get
23 60 credits because the other testimony that I had
24 early seemed to say that students start, started
25 taking classes after the 10th grade... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

104

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

TRACEE MURREN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...so, I'm just
trying to figure out how... [cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: So, the beauty of the six
to 12 model is that we have the opportunity to do
most of our remediation with our students during the
middle school years...

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-
talk]

TRACEE MURREN: So, students... because we
are an unscreened program we can take students who
come in reading on a second-grade level or reading on
a high school level, it is our duty in the middle
school to get them ready to start taking college
classes as soon as possible. We have sat down with
the Planning Committee at Kingsborough, the Provost
and all of the curriculum people and they sat up a
scoping sequence that works really well for our
students, they begin taking classes that are not
particularly challenging for them... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-
talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

105

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

TRACEE MURREN: ...and they... it spirals upward so during the summer going from eighth grade to ninth grade they... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: ...take their first college class on campus, it's a health course which is offered through the college but it's only one credit, so the students sit in that class after they've been remediated by us so they're ready to take college level coursework and that starts at eighth grade, ninth grade they take one more class which we've stretched across the entire year because they're still young... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: ...and so something that would have taken a typical college student one semester to do we've done across the entire year... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: ...that's a Spanish class which our students are prepared for because they take

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

106

1 Spanish in our eighth-grade year. Moving on then in
2 tenth grade they take four classes and then 11th
3 grade they take... it, it goes higher and higher and
4 so... by the time they go to, to 12th grade they have
5 earned 60 of the credits.

6
7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: In terms of
8 admission how are students admitted?

9 TRACEE MURREN: Into my school?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes.

11 TRACEE MURREN: It's unscreened, it's
12 strictly by lottery but our school gives preference
13 to districts 20, 21, and 31 so roughly like Manhattan
14 Beach, Coney Island and Staten Island.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: What is the
16 ethnic composition of districts 20, 21, and 31?

17 TRACEE MURREN: It varies because like 21
18 is Coney Island and then 20 is like... is Manhattan
19 Beach and 31 is Staten Island.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: How much
21 preference is given to those districts?

22 TRACEE MURREN: No, those are the only
23 districts that our school accepts students from.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh you only take
25 students... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

107

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

TRACEE MURREN: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh, oh... [cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: Yeah, we only take...
[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...so it's limited...
[cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: ...students from those
three districts.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh, interesting.
Okay, so it's not citywide it's just those... [cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: No, it's just those...
[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, you have to
live there... [cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: ...those three... exactly.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And these...
[cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: ...and this is because...
this is because we take students in the middle school
so it's... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right, so do you
take students into your high school?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

108

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

TRACEE MURREN: We open a few seats in ninth grade only because we don't have rolling admission throughout our middle school years so when we begin in ninth grade... in sixth grade with 100 kids if we lose students due to attrition then we will fill the seats in the ninth-grade year but typically that's about 15 seats.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So... [cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: And then it's citywide...

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right, so I, I... the reason that I asked is because I noted in the data that DOE sent us that your school had the highest percentage of white students, you had 24 percent black, 28 percent Hispanic and 40 percent white so I was wondering... [cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...how that came to be, so you're limited...

CASS CONRAD: Yes...

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...so, so it's really not preference but it's... [cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: It's the district...
[cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

109

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...limitations,
3 restrictions.

4 TRACEE MURREN: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay. I'm going
6 pass... [cross-talk]

7 CASS CONRAD: May, may I add one, one
8 just note there, Tracee said that but in large
9 measure the schools that admit students in the sixth
10 grade admit the way middle schools do around the city
11 and those tend to draw primarily from the geography
12 or the neighborhoods where they're located so that's
13 a piece of what drives the ratio makeup is what
14 communities the schools are located in and you know...
15 [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, it's a
17 reflection of the systemic system that we live in
18 that creates districts that have particular ethnic
19 groups concentrated in those areas. Okay, I'm going
20 to... I have more questions but I'm going to turn it to
21 my Co-Chair.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much
23 Chair Barron. Let me just say we, we really like what
24 we're hearing in terms of the programs, it's really
25 seems something that we probably should be doing a

1 lot more of, but I do have some questions as well and
2 I also appreciate you bringing in someone who has
3 been an example of the successful programs and that
4 of course is Miss Marshall. So, Miss Marshall do you...
5 did you get... did you go on... you went on for your
6 Bachelor's degree did you say at Brooklyn College?
7

8 LEARA MARSHALL: Yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Did you... are you
10 going for a Master's degree now?

11 LEARA MARSHALL: Yes, well not currently,
12 the program that I would like to enroll in doesn't
13 take spring admissions, so I'll be enrolling for fall
14 2018 at Brooklyn.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, you will have to
16 eventually go for the Master's degree... [cross-talk]

17 LEARA MARSHALL: Yes... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...as well... so, that's
19 also a notable accomplishment that you're going for
20 the post-secondary...

21 LEARA MARSHALL: Thank you... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...the post graduate
23 degree as well. Thank you and thank you for coming in
24 and sharing that, I was a teacher for 25 years and
25 Council Member Barron may even have more time on me

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

111

1
2 than I have in the public-school system so may you
3 have as long of a, a career in your... in your school
4 as well.

5 LEARA MARSHALL: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Sure. And then for
7 Miss Murren I noticed that you said that in your
8 graduation rate you had 96 percent graduation rate
9 and 70 percent of your graduates earning a full
10 Associates degree, that's within the four years...
11 within the six-year period that you have them, they
12 don't... they don't go and... they don't stay with you
13 till 14, right?

14 TRACEE MURREN: They do not, so this is
15 within the time that they are with us including the
16 summer after they graduate, some students take
17 classes that summer but after that... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, they're leaving
19 all of them, 70 percent of them are leaving with the
20 Associates degree?

21 TRACEE MURREN: That is correct.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you and
23 then for Miss Conrad a question as well, in your
24 testimony you said that roughly 16 percent of the
25 graduates... it's on the second page, it's a little

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

112

1
2 unclear to me, so let me just read the paragraph,
3 because the ECI schools work with both community
4 colleges and senior colleges students from about half
5 of the schools have the opportunity to earn an
6 Associate's degree, degree by the time they graduate,
7 so that's half of the 17 schools?

8 CASS CONRAD: Yes, that's right, the
9 other half of the schools are partnered with a CUNY
10 four-year college and the four-year colleges don't
11 have the opportunity to grant Associate degrees so in
12 those cases students are earning up to 60 credits
13 which would be a... the equivalent of the first two
14 years of a Bachelor's degree.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, of those students
16 who are in the four year who are so affiliated with
17 the four-year colleges do you know how many... what
18 percentage would go on to continue to get the four-
19 year degree?

20 CASS CONRAD: We have over 80 percent of
21 our students who are enrolling in college immediately
22 thereafter and I think that's relatively consistent
23 across the two years and the... both groups.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What was that
25 percentage again?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

113

1
2 CASS CONRAD: Its over 80... I'll give you
3 the exact number, just a minute please... it's roughly
4 84 percent of the students go on to college
5 immediately after they've graduated from an early
6 college school.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, so in your
8 testimony also you said in 2016 roughly 16 percent of
9 the graduates from those schools did just that,
10 that's what I was unclear... they did... what did they
11 do, did they, they, they got the Associates degree?

12 CASS CONRAD: That's correct.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, that was in the
14 half of the schools that participate?

15 CASS CONRAD: That's correct.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, so that seems a
17 little low to me compared to Kingsborough, can you
18 describe what's happening and what's the difference
19 between the colleges?

20 CASS CONRAD: Absolutely, that... there,
21 there's... within the group of schools that have the
22 potential to grant an Associate degree by the end of
23 12th grade there's a couple of different models, we
24 talked earlier or the... in the DOE panel earlier we
25 mentioned middle college high school at LaGuardia and

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

114

1
2 International High School at LaGuardia which were
3 long standing schools and be, became early college
4 schools those students are earning college credits
5 but they're less focused on the Associate degree so
6 the 16 percent takes into account those two schools
7 even though there's less of an immediate focus on, on
8 students earning the Associate degree.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It still seems to me
10 though that that is a number we'd like to see
11 improve.

12 CASS CONRAD: I completely agree.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So what are we doing
14 to make that happen?

15 CASS CONRAD: So, we continue to work
16 with schools like Kingsborough and they have an
17 exemplary Associate degree rate we believe at this
18 point in time, Hostos Lincoln Academy has actually
19 increased its Associate degree granting rate as well
20 over the last several years, so we are taking best
21 practices, we actually have the schools come together
22 and talk with each other about the best practices
23 that they use in order to get to degree completion
24 rates.

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

115

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, how many student's system wide earns an AA degree while still in high school?

CASS CONRAD: We can get you that number, I don't think I have it right here at the moment.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay and then you mentioned in your testimony also you said in 2016 roughly 16 percent of the graduates, do you have figures for '14 and '15?

CASS CONRAD: Sure, we'll get those to you after today.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, do... but off the top of the head... off your head would you know if they're higher or lower than the 16 percent?

CASS CONRAD: My sense is it's roughly comparable, but I'll have to get you the data.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay...

JOHN MOGULESCU: Councilman Dromm could I just add one... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes... [cross-talk]

JOHN MOGULESCU: ...point on that which is the question of, of increasing the, the number of students who ultimately graduate whether it's while they're at the high school or beyond, as we expand

1
2 ASAP to 25,000 students and particularly the students
3 who have the lowest number of credits accumulated
4 while in high school we are pretty convinced by the
5 evidence that the number of students will
6 dramatically increase because of what is going on in,
7 in... at ASAP and with the dramatic expansion so I'm
8 relatively optimistic that that figure will, will
9 change a whole lot in the next couple of years, it
10 may not mirror what Kingsborough is doing, clearly
11 they are a star school but I'm, I'm pretty confident
12 that, that, that progress will continue to be made.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And so the other
14 programs that you mentioned in your testimony as well
15 they're contributing to that... you, you hope to see
16 just... [cross-talk]

17 JOHN MOGULESCU: I believe that is true
18 as well, I, I... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: The Explorers for
20 example?

21 JOHN MOGULESCU: Yeah, too early to have
22 any real significant results on what Explorers is
23 going to mean other than exposing lots of, of
24 students to, to what college is, is about, the Link
25 Program as well which is expanding and clearly

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

117

1
2 College Now which enables students to, to have
3 credits and this is again all of these are far beyond
4 the early college high schools, you know we're, we're
5 involved in I think over 400 high schools as we said.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm just interested
7 in that and, and questioning that because the council
8 spends a lot of money on high school dropout
9 prevention which I think is very important but often
10 times part of that is also visits to college campuses
11 which I think is very beneficial to do and, and so
12 that's why I was interested in that as well. Now do
13 the students who are enrolled at ECI schools have
14 access to the partnered college campuses, can they
15 just go, can they share in programs, student
16 benefits, etcetera?

17 CASS CONRAD: Yes, the students
18 participate in a variety of activities on the college
19 campus, each college partnership is slightly
20 different, but students can participate in clubs,
21 students at KECSS become part of the honor society at
22 Kingsborough if they meet those criteria. The
23 students really do become integrated fully into the
24 life of the college as they mature in their program.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you offer any type of SAT prep?

CASS CONRAD: Some of the schools do create SAT prep opportunities for their students, yes.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: With the cross enrollment do they need the SAT prep?

CASS CONRAD: Given that the majority of the students who are graduating from the early college schools are entering CUNY as transfer students in large measure the SAT is not necessary, sometimes it's beneficial to them.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And how are children... how are students tracked after graduation, do you have any system for that?

CASS CONRAD: Yes, the students who are alumni from the early college high schools have a code in the CUNY system that notes that they're an alumni of an early college school, so they are... they're identifiable across the CUNY data system.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you have any, any information on what that looks like?

CASS CONRAD: We do... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What are they doing?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

119

1
2 CASS CONRAD: We do, the students... I mean
3 as we talked earlier they're earning college credits
4 at a faster rate than their peers, they're staying
5 enrolled longer and persisting to degrees faster than
6 similarly prepared students from other schools.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And job wise?

8 CASS CONRAD: We don't have data on how
9 they do once they graduate from college.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What percentage are
11 still in... of students go onto enroll at community
12 colleges, at CUNY or community college?

13 CASS CONRAD: Sure, so roughly... let me
14 give you this... so, of the students who graduate
15 roughly 60 percent of them come to CUNY and of that
16 60 percent roughly two thirds are in four-year
17 colleges and one third are in community colleges.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, I think that's
19 it for me, Council Member?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Mr.
21 Chair. A few more questions, so Miss Conrad you said
22 that students amass credits, but they don't
23 necessarily have an Associate's degree, they don't
24 have enough credits for an Associates, how many of
25

1
2 those students who have amassed some credits go onto
3 either a two or four-year institution?

4 CASS CONRAD: The vast majority of
5 students who've graduated from an early college
6 school have credits... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-
8 talk]

9 CASS CONRAD: I believe it's over 90
10 percent graduate with at least six credits...

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay...

12 CASS CONRAD: So, then I gave you the
13 statistics earlier about 84 percent of them are going
14 to college, 60 percent of that group are at CUNY, two
15 thirds are in a four-year college, one third are in a
16 community college.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay. In terms of
18 pay, finance, fiscal issues what does it cost CUNY
19 for this partnership, we seem to be able to... we don't
20 seem to be able to get that dollar amount and I'm
21 sure that... [cross-talk]

22 JOHN MOGULESCU: I think we're going to
23 give you some estimate figures right now if you
24 would... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

121

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

CASS CONRAD: Yes... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Do you have any idea of what it cost in terms of providing for the text books for these students?

CASS CONRAD: So, as our colleagues from the DOE mentioned in their panel we do share the costs of this program with them... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Is it 50/50?

CASS CONRAD: It is 50/50 include... after taking into account some contributions from the state. At full capacity for a school that has roughly 110 students per grade level once the school is in its full capacity that school requires between 300 and 400,000 dollars a year to cover the college expenses for the school.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Finally... [cross-talk]

CASS CONRAD: Yes... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...a number we can start with, good. Okay, I did have another question. Oh yes, to our panelists... your name again?

LEARA MARSHALL: Leara Marshall.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, why did you decide to go to Brooklyn when the school that you were partnering with was not Brooklyn, why did you decide to go to Brooklyn College and did you have any problems with your credits being accepted at Brooklyn?

LEARA MARSHALL: No, I didn't go... well I graduated with my Associates degree, so I was already done with Kingsborough, so I went onto Brooklyn rather than... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Alright, Kingsborough, two years now, okay...

LEARA MARSHALL: No, I didn't have any problems transferring my credits, I started as a junior.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: You started as a junior... [cross-talk]

LEARA MARSHALL: Yes... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, right because you were graduated already with... you had your Associates degree, no problems so it just was seamless with that?

LEARA MARSHALL: Yep.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

123

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay. So, where do most of your students go, is... are there particular four-year schools, do you find a concentration of particular schools where your graduates go?

TRACEE MURREN: Yes... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Those that have their... [cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: So... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...Associates?

TRACEE MURREN: Yes, most of my students who stay in the CUNY system... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: ...tend to go to Brooklyn because of proximity to... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: ...their homes, they're all South... either South Brooklyn or Staten Island students...

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Do you have any percentage of students who go to other schools outside of CUNY, do you have a, a statistic for how many students don't go to CUNY but go elsewhere?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

124

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

TRACEE MURREN: So, last year we graduated 80 students about 60 percent of them went onto... I'm sorry, about 60 of the 80 students went onto CUNY schools.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And do you know where the others went, did we keep that data?

TRACEE MURREN: They went to SUNY schools and about eight of them didn't enroll in college right away, I have three kids who went into the military and some students who went into trade programs but...

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, well I, I commend you for the work that you're doing and...
[cross-talk]

TRACEE MURREN: Thank you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...first of all being a principal is challenging and to get those kinds of results is fantastic, so I do commend you and the results, you know the proof is in the students that come back and are able to even come back and be an instructor where they were at high school so that's really great, I commend you.

TRACEE MURREN: Thank you.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, we want to
3 thank you so much for coming... [cross-talk]

4 CASS CONRAD: Thank you very much...
5 [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...and
7 participating, we do ask that you get back to us with
8 the questions that we asked, thank you.

9 JOHN MOGULESCU: Thank you.

10 CASS CONRAD: Thank you.

11 TRACEE MURREN: Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you and
13 now we'd like to call up the representatives from
14 Bard High School; Michael Lerner, the Principal;
15 Hodja Diallo, a student; and Stephen Tremaine, from
16 Bard Early College High School as well. So, I'd like
17 to swear you in if you'd just raise your right hand,
18 do you solemnly swear or affirm to tell the truth,
19 the whole truth and nothing but the truth and to
20 answer Council Member questions honestly?

21 STEPHEN TREMAINE: Yes.

22 MICHAEL LERNER: Yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you. Who
24 would like to start?

25 STEPHEN TREMAINE: I'll begin.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

126

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Go right ahead..

[cross-talk]

STEPHEN TREMAINE: Thank you Council..

[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yep.. [cross-talk]

STEPHEN TREMAINE: ...for the opportunity to submit testimony and thank you for your interest in Early College in New York City. My name is Stephen Tremaine, I'm Bard College's Vice President for Early Colleges. Bard is a non-profit independent college of the liberal arts and sciences in Annendale, New York about two hours up state. Bard is distinguished by a set of initiatives that extend opportunities in the liberal arts and sciences without compromise to the corners of American life in which those opportunities are often least accessible. In this spirit Bard runs three signature programs, the nation's largest college and prisons program, the national network of tuition free Bard courses for the working poor and a national network of tuition free early colleges run in partnership with public school systems. The Bard Early Colleges Network started in New York City in 2001 at the invitation of then Chancellor Harold Levy. It wasn't an accident that Chancellor Levy

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

127

1
2 invited Bard, since 1979 Bard has led the nation's
3 first early college, Simons Rock, a residential
4 college for high school aged students located in
5 Western Massachusetts. Bard brings over 35 years of
6 experience and expertise in early college to its
7 partnership with the DOE. The Bard High School Early
8 College model enables students to earn 60
9 transferable college credits and a Bard Associates
10 degree at no cost to students alongside a state high
11 school diploma. It's a simple idea, to make the
12 transition to college as seamless as possible we
13 provide the first two years of college during the
14 four years of high school under the same roof and
15 with the same community. Students graduate two years
16 ahead of the game and they stay ahead of the game.
17 BGSEC, Bard High School Early College graduates are
18 better prepared for four-year degrees, more likely to
19 finish and vastly better positioned to afford a high-
20 quality BA with little or no debt. The results are
21 powerful. In the most recent graduating class 92
22 percent of students earn the Associate in arts degree
23 at BHSEC and among those who did not complete the
24 degree the average number of transferrable credits
25 earned was 50. Over 95 percent go on to enroll in

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

128

1
2 four-year colleges and over 70 percent do so here in
3 New York at popular schools primarily including the
4 SUNY's. From the classes of '06 and '09 94 percent of
5 students have completed a BA in four years or less
6 compared to a national average of 59 percent in six
7 years or less. A matched pair analysis recently
8 completed by Metis Associates shows that alongside
9 matched comparable groups from traditional and
10 selective New York high schools there was a
11 significant increase in BA attainment through BHSEC,
12 it was most marked we found for boys who were 40
13 percent more likely to finish a BA coming through the
14 Bard Program than a traditional high school model.
15 Last year over 6,000 students applied for the roughly
16 300 open seats at our two New York schools, in the
17 face of this extraordinary demand from families
18 across New York we are working strategically to make
19 BHSEC accessible to ambitious young people of all
20 backgrounds. Of our 1,200 students in the city 12
21 percent are African American, 18 percent Hispanic, 31
22 percent Asian and Pacific Highlander and 37 percent
23 white. While we don't yet have all free and reduced-
24 price lunch forms for this year, the student body was
25 36 percent free and reduced lunch last year, 42

1
2 percent of last year's incoming class were recruited
3 from high needs middle schools. We're implementing a
4 special education program which began last school
5 year through which the ninth grade is nearly eight
6 percent and the student body will be nearly doubling
7 in special education in the coming year.

8 Additionally, we're excited to be working with the
9 New York DOE Diversity in Admissions Pilot which
10 we've applied to be a part of which would allow for
11 an admissions process that would ensure that at least
12 63 percent of seats at our Queens campus went to
13 students from low income families. To sustain the
14 excellent early colleges already in place and to work
15 to meet the demand from families across New York, we
16 are hoping to work with the city to address key
17 structural challenges, the most significant of these
18 is financial. Bards Early Colleges in New York face a
19 structural funding gap equivalent to 3,000 dollars
20 per student per year. These funds over and above the
21 purview of funding provided by the DOE are needed for
22 three areas that are essential to the early college
23 model; student supports to help young people through
24 a uniquely rigorous program, outreach and admission
25 staff to recruit student body that are eager for

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

130

1
2 early college and representative of the diversity of
3 New York, and collegiate textbooks and academic
4 resources. Currently the schools are dependent on
5 philanthropy to close this gap, Bard has taken
6 responsibility for raising these funds and has
7 invested them fully back in the BHSEC's. Since 2001
8 in New York City alone that investment has totaled
9 more than 40 million dollars. This funding gap leaves
10 a vibrant and highly successful path to college with
11 an uncertain future if this gap is addressed early
12 college can and will grow ambitiously across New York
13 City enabling thousands more families to earn a free
14 high quality two-year degree through the DOE and
15 partners like Bard. This is an investment that we
16 know is well placed, early college graduates finish
17 college in far higher rates and at far lower total
18 cost to government and to themselves and their
19 families. New York City took the lead in launching
20 the Public Early College Movement and we ask that the
21 city's leadership continue in finding a lasting
22 funding solution for this work. Thank you for your
23 consideration and I'm happy to introduce my
24 colleague, Michael Lerner, Principal of the Bard High
25 School Early College in Manhattan.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

131

1
2 MICHAEL LERNER: Good afternoon. Thank
3 you to the Chairs for the opportunity to submit
4 testimony today. My name is Michael Lerner and I am
5 the Principal of Bard High School Early College of
6 Manhattan. I began teaching history at this school in
7 2002 and took over as Principal in 2010. In addition
8 to serving as Principal I continued to teach classes
9 in history and serve as a student advisor in our
10 advisory program. I feel very fortunate to be leading
11 this partnership between the Department of Education
12 and Bard College. There are 590 students currently
13 enrolled at the BHSEC Manhattan campus which is
14 located on the Lower East Side, another 600 are
15 enrolled at our sister campus in Queens. The simplest
16 way to explain our program is that students do two
17 years of high school coursework in ninth and tenth
18 grade followed by two years of college coursework in
19 what would normally be the last two years of high
20 school. BHSEC students complete five New York State
21 regent's exams by the end of tenth grade and spend
22 the last two years enrolled exclusively in college
23 level classes. At the end of four years BHSEC
24 students earn both a regent's diploma and an
25 Associate's degree from Bard College. BHSEC students

1 typically earn 60 or more college credits all tuition
2 free which are transferrable to public and private
3 colleges. The ability of BHSEC students to earn and
4 transfer college credits makes college more
5 affordable and more accessible to hundreds of New
6 York City families every year. The student experience
7 at BHSEC is anchored in a traditional liberal arts
8 curriculum, the ninth grade and tenth grade program
9 emphasize giving students the foundations and
10 teaching them the academic skills to succeed in
11 college. Classes emphasize argumentative and
12 analytical writing, hands on work in science labs,
13 problem solving, discussion, critical thinking and
14 collaborative work. In addition to all the core
15 disciplines students study mandarin, Latin or
16 Spanish, participate in the arts, and take part in a
17 wide range of extracurricular activities including
18 clubs, athletics, internships, and volunteer work in
19 the community. The BHSEC College Program resembles
20 what any student might encounter in the first two
21 years of the small liberal arts college except that
22 it is in a high school setting. At the core of the
23 curriculum is an interdisciplinary humanities seminar
24 modeled on what is offered at Bard College. Over the
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

133

1
2 course of two years all students read and discuss
3 classic texts in history, philosophy and literature
4 from the ancient to modern era. Students write
5 extensively and complete the course with an
6 individual research project of their own design. In
7 addition to the seminar sequence all students in the
8 college program take college biology, a seminar in
9 mathematical fot and choose an array of electives to
10 complete the requirements for the Associates degree.
11 Both the high school classes and college classes at
12 BHSEC are offered in the same building by the same
13 faculty, students do not travel off site to take
14 college classes and they work with the same teachers
15 over four years. This adds an additional measure of
16 support as students take on the challenge of college
17 work. Classes are small, generally 20 to 24 students
18 and a range of academic supports are available to all
19 students. BHSEC faculty tend to come from college
20 teaching backgrounds, our program requires teachers
21 have their credentials and experience to teach
22 college classes, they must also know how to teach and
23 support younger students in the ninth and tenth
24 grade. Since opening in 2001 BHSEC has attracted a
25 diverse student body from all five boroughs of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

134

1
2 city, some students may commute three hours a day to
3 take advantage of the opportunity to earn college
4 credits. The different... demographic breakdown of the
5 school is 70 percent Hispanic, 26 percent Asian, 14
6 percent African American and 40 percent white, one
7 percent multi-racial. Last year 45 percent of the
8 student body was eligible for free or reduced lunch,
9 about six percent of students received special
10 education services and that number is growing as we
11 expand our special education program. As a screened
12 school we receive approximately 3,000 applications a
13 year at each campus for admission into ninth grade,
14 we typically have 100 to 107... 150 to 170 seats
15 available. We rank students for admission by a
16 combination of a writing assessment, a math
17 assessment, and an interview; we do not strictly rank
18 students by performance but review each applicant
19 holistically. The diversity of BHSEC is fostered by
20 an extensive outreach program facilitated by a...
21 facilitated by a New York State Smart Scholars Grant.
22 The funds from the grant have allowed us to reach out
23 to underserved middle schools throughout the city to
24 recruit students who may be interested in early
25 college. In recent years nearly a third of our

1
2 incoming class has come through Smart, Smart Scholars
3 outreach. In the past four years BHSEC has
4 consistently graduated 97 to 100 percent of each
5 cohort and all but a handful of students earn the
6 Associates degree. Those who fall short of AA
7 requirements still graduate with upwards of 55
8 college credits. Just as important DOE metrics show
9 that 94 to 99 percent of Bard students have met the
10 city's college readiness criteria and 99 percent of
11 students persist in college beyond 18 months. By any
12 measure the partnership between DOE and Bard College
13 has been very successful, 16 years after the founding
14 of BHSEC Manhattan over 2,500 students have received
15 free college degrees as a result of this opportunity
16 giving these students the preparation necessary and a
17 clear path to a Bachelor's degree. Thank you for the
18 opportunity to present this overview of the Bard
19 Early College Program in New York City. I'd like to
20 introduce one of my students, Hodja Diallo

21 HODJA DIALLO: Hello, my name is Hodja
22 Diallo and I am a senior at Bard High School Early
23 College Manhattan campus. The first time I had heard
24 of Bard High School was in seventh grade when there
25 was word going around the school about Bard

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

136

1
2 administrating that admissions test at our school.
3 Soon the high school fair took place where I met a
4 Bard Representative who spoke to me about Bard's
5 unique curriculum. The same day I went home and told
6 my mother about Bard and her interest in what I was
7 saying did not spike until she heard me utter the
8 word college, to my mother the word.. the word college
9 holds a promise and a future that she did not have
10 but has worked hard for her kids to one-day
11 experience. With that one word my mother and I
12 visited Bards information session where we met with
13 upper classmen and spoke with them about their
14 experience at Bard and how Bard has shaped them.
15 Despite my mother not wanting me to leave the Bronx
16 for high school she highly encouraged me to endure
17 the 75 minutes of travel to Bard every day for the
18 next four years. What seemed to be the worst day of
19 my life at the time dawned on me the day that I was
20 not accepted to Bard High School. My freshman year of
21 high school was spent at another high school in the
22 Bronx, in the beginning of the year my Principal and
23 guidance counselor encouraged me to reapply to Bard
24 because they believed that they could not offer me
25 the most rigorous coursework or assistance that I

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

137

1
2 could receive elsewhere. At the time I was taking
3 geometry with sophomores and chemistry with seniors
4 and juniors. After reapplying to Bard I transferred
5 in tenth grade, the transition was rough as I had to
6 readjust to a new setting, a new style of learning
7 and rigorous coursework. It was easy for me to make
8 friends because the students at Bard are genuinely
9 open to talking to and meeting new people. At Bard
10 learning from one's peers and engaging in seminar
11 styled discussions where students are prompted to
12 think are both valued. I was nervous at first to
13 speak up in class until I realized that I learned
14 best when engaging and putting forth my ideas. The
15 hardest part was adjusting to the coursework, I was
16 not used to receiving multiple essays, readings and
17 daily homework, at first it was hard, but I worked
18 closely with my guidance counselor to learn how to
19 balance this new workload. She encouraged me to go to
20 office hours which all teachers at Bard have. My two
21 biggest resources my first year at Bard which remain
22 the same today are office hours and the writing
23 center, for every paper I have I meet with my
24 professor to talk about my thesis and then I go to
25 the writing center to polish my essay. My transition

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

138

1
2 into the college program was at first daunting but
3 also rewarding, the workload became heavier and
4 expectations grew but the guidance was still there
5 for those who needed it. the most rewarding aspect
6 comes from the ability to choose my own classes,
7 while there's vigor there's also engagement as I'm
8 able to craft what I want to learn more about. For
9 instance, after taking introductions to college
10 biology I'm currently doing an independent study with
11 my professor on the effectiveness of DNA barcoding as
12 opposed to taxonomy classification for classifying
13 soil and vertebrates. I would like to reemphasize the
14 unique guidance at Bard, there are multiple
15 counselors at Bard who are there and willing to help.
16 I often find myself going back and forth between
17 three different counselors for different expertise.
18 As of now the most rewarding help that I and my peers
19 receive are guidance from the college office. The
20 graduating class is broken up into different cores of
21 20 students who work one on one with a college
22 admission, with a college counselor and applying to
23 college, this helps... this help begins as early as our
24 first year in the college program. For example, I
25 began writing drafts of my college essay several

1
2 months ago with the help of my college counselor. In
3 college advisory we were encouraged to find programs
4 unique to our interest to explore over the summer.
5 With the help of my outside program and Bard I took a
6 course at Northwestern University over the summer and
7 with the help of Dr. Lerner attended ACLU's summer
8 institute as well. My experience at, at Bard has
9 served as a beacon of light that will help me further
10 discover my interest in college.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you to the
12 panel for coming and for sharing, I did have an
13 opportunity as did the Co-Chair here for this hearing
14 to visit Bard and I was very impressed, it is in fact
15 that seminar format that's used and engages students
16 and gets them to contribute and to share their ideas
17 so I commend you on what you're doing and to Miss
18 Diallo just a quick question, so if you spent... from
19 what I understand at Bard four, four years of high
20 school is consolidated into two and then the last two
21 years of high school are in fact college courses so
22 if you came in as a transfer student how did you work
23 to get all of those three years consolidated into
24 one?

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

140

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

HODJA DIALLO: So, for a lot of the transfers we typically come in having taken similar courses that the freshmen at Bard would have taken the only difference would be if we didn't take the five regents that are necessary so coming into Bard my schedule was completely the, the same as everyone else, I took my global history course with the regents, I also took a world literature class to take my English regents and I took physics instead of chemistry so... in ninth grade at Bard students take physics and tenth grade they take chemistry but because I had taken chemistry freshman year I just took the freshman course to fulfil that requirement so I don't think you, your, your course... your course load wouldn't be packed to fulfil other requirements because the school makes sure that the students coming in have certain prerequisites already.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And did you find that the course work that you did at your first year in high school was on par with what you got at Bard if you were to make a comparison, I won't ask you to name them, but did you find that it was as academically sound?

1
2 HODJA DIALLO: Yeah, I think the work at
3 Bard the only difference is the rigor of the work and
4 the amount of work that you're given but I think that
5 at first it was overwhelming but at Bard there is
6 good guidance for transfer students so we meet with
7 our counselors and they give us advice on how to deal
8 with that and a lot of the times you should just meet
9 with your teachers during office hours but I think
10 the academic rigor definitely increased and the
11 amount of work that you're expected increases I think
12 to help you transition into the college program more
13 effectively.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I'm,
15 I'm very, you know pleased to know that Bard has a
16 vision for understanding that it has some social
17 responsibility and that you offer college courses in
18 prison which is commendable because we know that if
19 we have people who are incarcerated who don't expand
20 what their world is and what their opportunity is
21 there's a higher rate of recidivism and of course the
22 tuition free courses that you offer to the poor, so I
23 commend you on that. In your testimony on the second
24 page, second paragraph... oh Mr. Tremaine, you talk
25 about the funding need, Bard's Early Colleges face

1
2 the structural funding gap the equivalent of 3,000
3 dollars per student, these funds over and above the
4 proverbial funding provided by the DOE are needed for
5 three areas of the college model; student supports to
6 help young people through a uniquely rigorous program
7 which is a question that I had asked earlier outreach
8 and admissions staff to recruit student bodies that
9 are eager for college, early college and
10 representative of the diversity of the city and
11 collegiate textbooks and academic resources which is
12 another question I asked. So, previous testimony said
13 that DOE pays half and CUNY pays half so can you
14 explain why there's this need for collegiate
15 textbooks above and beyond what CUNY and DOE say they
16 provide and can you explain how you're working to
17 increase the numbers of students who are black and
18 Latino because I think it's only 12 percent that you
19 have that are black in... and 18 percent Hispanic so
20 those two points and just expound on the financial
21 needs?

22 STEPHEN TREMAINE: Thank you Council
23 Member and I'll address the financials and ask my
24 colleague to speak to the second part of your
25 question. The Bard campuses in New York City receive

1
2 the per student funding comparable to other New York
3 City high schools as well as an additional weight for
4 specialized academic programs, it's beyond that that
5 we raise... under a business model that's probably
6 different than the CUNY ECI programs, 3,000 dollars
7 per student per year. We're pleased that the DOE has
8 worked with us on some ideas about addressing that
9 gap and we're excited to do it but that 3,000 dollars
10 as a composite figure encompasses not only textbooks
11 but also a number of the supports that Miss Diallo
12 mentioned like a writing center, like guidance
13 resources those supports that you have the
14 responsibility to provide a young person in their
15 first years on a four year campus we provide under
16 the roof of the early college campus currently that's
17 at a cost to Bard College.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, I just want
19 to be clear, the 3,000 dollars is for additional
20 textbooks that students need that DOE and CUNY don't
21 provide for?

22 MICHAEL LERNER: So, let me give a, a
23 more concrete example... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you...
25 [cross-talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MICHAEL LERNER: ...our DOE allocation for textbooks every year is... for this year is just over 30,000 dollars, we typically spend upwards of 100,000 dollars a year on textbooks so Bard and additional help from our PTA make up the difference. College textbooks tend to cost more, they're not always available through the DOE purchasing pipeline so we really do rely on Bard College to supplement the DOE funding in that regard.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay and the other parts of the question about the outreach and the student supports, well you did talk about student supports but about outreach?

MICHAEL LERNER: The outreach has been a major focus of ours for the last ten years or so, the Smart Scholars Grant that we get from New York State is critical for that, what we found and if you compare our numbers now to what they were say ten years ago you will see a, a great shift, it is very difficult in, in New York City to get a diverse student body in any school, I mean a lot of the way the system works makes it harder to do that, we're not able to consider things like lunch status or ethnicity in, in admissions obviously so we do have

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

145

1
2 to do a great deal of outreach to make sure that
3 families are aware of the opportunity of Bard, we do
4 send students and outreach staff out to schools all
5 over the city, they often go and actually give the
6 test at the school that we're visiting, all of that
7 we hope from year to year yields a more diverse
8 student body, some years are better than others, it,
9 it is always an uphill battle. If we left things
10 alone and did not do that additional outreach, then
11 ours would be... would be far less diverse than they
12 are.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, you go to the
14 schools and administer the test at the schools, is
15 there... [cross-talk]

16 MICHAEL LERNER: We do... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...a pool of
18 schools that you've targeted or how does a school get
19 to be included or considered?

20 MICHAEL LERNER: Yeah, through... the Smart
21 Scholars Grant defines a certain pool of schools as
22 underserved middle schools and we do go to those
23 schools to administer the test there.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Are those schools
25 located in all of the boroughs?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MICHAEL LERNER: All five boroughs, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: All five boroughs, if, if you could get us that list I'd like to see... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL LERNER: Sure... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...what that list is.

STEPHEN TREMAINE: I would just add Council Member that we refine the list largely through a study conducted by the Annenberg Institute for School Reform called Is Demography Still Destiny that identifies the 17 zip codes within New York City in which students face the largest systemic obstacles to higher education degree complement and we reach out strategically to the middle schools in those neighborhoods.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, so it's 17 particular zip codes that you pull your students from?

STEPHEN TREMAINE: Not exclusively but with the greatest emphasis.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That's good, okay if you could get that list I'd love to see it, I want to see if my district... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

147

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STEPHEN TREMAINE: Absolutely.. [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...zip codes are in there.

STEPHEN TREMAINE: Absolutely.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, thank you.
Mr. Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Chair
Barron as well, I visited Bard at Queens and was very impressed with the level and quality of teaching and I do agree that the students were tremendously engaged in their work. I observed a lesson that was being taught by a teacher on The New Jim Crow and on Mass Incarceration which was very engaging for the students and it, it's in line I guess with the work for the incarcerated as well which I think probably happens mostly upstate in the Poughkeepsie, Rhinebeck area near the, the main campus and I can.. I congratulate you and applaud you on that. One question that comes to mind, you know next week we're having a hearing on bullying and the effectiveness of the DOE's programs on bullying, I would imagine that that might be an issue in Bard or any of the high schools that we've been talking about today as well

1
2 and so I'm just wondering if you would know do any of
3 your... do either of the schools, either of the
4 campuses have a gay, straight alliance, a GSA, how
5 have you addressed that issue on your campuses?

6 MICHAEL LERNER: Both schools have, have
7 GSA's and other clubs, I mean a number of student
8 organizations, I think... I mean Hodja if you want to
9 speak to the, the climate of the school but I'll say
10 that while bullying is a concern in any school I
11 would think that the, the expectations of students in
12 the early college programs tend to set the tone in a
13 little different way and so often these problems are
14 not as severe in early colleges as they are in
15 traditional high schools.

16 HODJA DIALLO: Yeah, I think that at Bard
17 there is not a huge or even a culture of bullying at
18 our school, I think that students there genuinely get
19 along and I, I don't see any cases of that and I
20 think in terms of clubs there are many clubs that are
21 inclusive so... especially through the diversity
22 initiatives so a lot of times you have BSA and this
23 year we just opened up a new club called ASO, African
24 Student Organization, we have LASO and we... this year
25 we also have a new club the Jewish, Jewish Student

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

149

1
2 Alliance and I think that each club makes it a point
3 to have as many students in their club as possible
4 especially through the incoming freshman class to
5 help them find their place at Bard.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, I guess with that
7 level of respect amongst students you don't need
8 metal detectors?

9 HODJA DIALLO: No, my old school had
10 metal detectors but... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Your old school did?

12 HODJA DIALLO: Yeah, Bard doesn't have
13 them... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Interesting, what was
15 that like?

16 HODJA DIALLO: I had to get to school
17 about 40 minutes early because there were about I
18 think 8,000 kids in the building so...

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How did that affect
20 the environment of the school? Did that have any
21 impact on why you wanted to go to Bard?

22 HODJA DIALLO: No, I had my mind set on
23 Bard since seventh grade and I think my main focus
24 point was on the academics. I think that all schools...
25 you can go to a school and make the best out of it,

1
2 it just depends on the rigor of the courses and, so I
3 think that's what my main focus was.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That must have been a
5 very liberating experience to go from a school that
6 has metal detectors allegedly because of incidents of
7 violence or bullying in the school to a school as
8 esteemed as Bard.

9 HODJA DIALLO: Yeah.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Right?

11 HODJA DIALLO: Yeah.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And I think that
13 probably had a tremendous impact on many of the
14 choices that you've made since then...

15 HODJA DIALLO: Yeah... [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...and will make in the
17 future as well. Let me just go back a little bit to
18 the LGBT issue because Council Member Barron covered
19 a lot of what I was going to ask before, but do you
20 do any data collection on LGBT students?

21 MICHAEL LERNER: I mean we, we, we do
22 data collection on everything but yes, we do, I mean
23 it's, it's something... we've, we've really prided
24 ourselves at Bard as being a safe and inclusive
25 community for all students so issues around

1
2 transgender students, gay students, making sure that
3 they have supports, I mean the faculty are very
4 involved, it's something that's a, a big part of the
5 discussions at the school.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, does... you said
7 you do, do... you do, do data collection?

8 MICHAEL LERNER: Again we're collecting
9 data on everything, it... do you have any specific data
10 in mind that you're, you're... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well no, I... [cross-
12 talk]

13 MICHAEL LERNER: ...looking for... [cross-
14 talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...I... we recently
16 passed legislation here in the council that's going
17 to require the Department of Education to do data
18 collection for LGBT, I and A students and other
19 descriptions as however they want to use it and I
20 really believe a lot in that data collection is
21 voluntary but it would be for every student who's
22 above the age of 14 years old to complete because
23 there's very little data on LGBT students and I think
24 one of the things that I did learn on my trip to Bard
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

152

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

was the, the pro... the positive treatment of LGBT
students in your schools...

MICHAEL LERNER: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And so that's why I
kind of wanted to ask these questions so... but if
you're not already collecting specific data in those
categories I would love to have a discussion with you
further on about how we could do that.

MICHAEL LERNER: Certainly.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yep, okay and then
just to go back to the money because I know that
that's been an issue that has been brought to my
attention, how many students do you have, New York
City public school students in the two campuses?

MICHAEL LERNER: It's just over 1,200,
about... roughly 600 at each school.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: 680?

MICHAEL LERNER: 600 at each school.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: 600 in each school,
1,200 student's times 3,000 dollars to... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL LERNER: That's right... [cross-
talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...make up the
difference?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

153

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MICHAEL LERNER: Yeah...

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Who's good at math?
What would be the total cost of that?

STEPHEN TREMAINE: The total gap that we
face in New York City all combined is 3.9 million
dollars per year.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: 3.9 million... [cross-
talk]

STEPHEN TREMAINE: Towards that amount
the New York City DOE makes a contribution that's
noted in your briefing of 895,000 dollars every year
and the remaining three million dollars every year is
through the college's fundraising efforts.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, I think when
Queens... when Kingsborough was talking about resources
there was a figure of about 300,000 dollars used if
I'm not mistaken, how does that differ with Bard, is,
is part of the reason for the cost because you're a
private institution?

STEPHEN TREMAINE: Yeah, that is part of
the reason frankly, there's a structural distinction
whereby the college as a private institution in New
York State is not eligible to receive base aid which
is a per student funding source through Albany that

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

154

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

we do not see that I believe the ECI schools do and you could look at that as roughly equivalent to our fundraising need.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, it's an interesting relationship then you're working with New York City school students so we're technically eligible for public school aid but not necessarily because you're a private institution.

STEPHEN TREMAINE: Precisely, yeah.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, great so I, I look forward to continuing to have that discussion with you on the 3.9 million and what we can do to fill that gap as well...

STEPHEN TREMAINE: Terrific.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you... [cross-talk]

STEPHEN TREMAINE: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, I have just one or two other questions. What are the qualifications of your staff, your faculty?

MICHAEL LERNER: We generally are looking for people who have the credentials to teach college classes so often has a PhD in their field or a

1 terminal degree in their field, some college teaching
2 experience and... I mean that's generally what we're
3 looking for and that is a very different profile than
4 the typical New York City DOE teacher.
5

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And what is the
7 number of faculty that you have for the 600 students
8 in each of those campuses?

9 MICHAEL LERNER: We have 48 faculty in
10 Manhattan and the number in Queens is similar.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And what's the
12 average class size?

13 MICHAEL LERNER: 20 TO 24 students.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: What's the
15 average class size?

16 MICHAEL LERNER: 20 to 24 students. 20 to
17 24 students which is by... I mean you know part of the
18 thinking behind this is... I mean if you visit either
19 of the Bard campuses you'll see... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-
21 talk]

22 MICHAEL LERNER: ...we run a pretty tight
23 ship in terms of money, there's not a lot of money to
24 go around because we're putting it all into faculty
25 and part of our belief is that if you're going to ask

1
2 students to do college work at the age of 15 or 16
3 you have to give them smaller classes and you have to
4 give them support so that's why we really do
5 prioritize the class sizes that we have.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, that...
7 because you got to have the instructors reading and
8 grading and interacting with the students on their
9 writing, it's not just to give them a grade and you
10 give it back to them then you've got to council with
11 them and, so it really is that intense and... [cross-
12 talk]

13 MICHAEL LERNER: Yeah, it's, it's a
14 different kind of, of teaching, it's a different...
15 [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Exactly... [cross-
17 talk]

18 MICHAEL LERNER: ...different demand on the
19 instructor.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Exactly, okay.
21 And... did I have another question... oh yes, what about
22 your ELL learners, do you have a percentage of that,
23 you... I saw black, Latino, Asian...

24 MICHAEL LERNER: As you pointed out
25 earlier the number of ELL students is very low and I

1
2 will tell you right now we have only one student at
3 the Manhattan school who is a... an active ELL student
4 receiving services however 36 percent of the students
5 are former ELL students so they still need and
6 receive additional support, I mean that one ELL
7 student who we have based on her she'll probably test
8 out this year and so we don't typically get a lot of
9 students who are ELL's, I mean that's part of the
10 nature of a screened program for better or worse but
11 we do see students who are coming with many ELL
12 issues and that is part of the support services we
13 address.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Great, thank you,
15 thank you. Oh yes, I... in terms of the faculty that
16 you have, you, you have high standards which is
17 commendable, and you indicate that they... the salary
18 that they are paid reflects the fact that they're...
19 what is their salary range?

20 MICHAEL LERNER: Well if you're familiar
21 with the DOE budgeting process there's an average
22 salary for the building so the average salary for DOE
23 faculty in the building this year is roughly 84,000
24 dollars, they tend to be on the higher end of the UFT
25 scale because they have the advanced degrees and we

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

158

1
2 also have a pretty good track record in terms of
3 retaining faculty, so they tend to be people who've
4 been at this school for say ten years or longer.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And what's the
6 ethnic breakdown, breakdown of your faculty?

7 MICHAEL LERNER: I just did some quick
8 numbers while, while we were hearing from the other
9 panels, of the 48 faculty members of my account is 14
10 are faculty of color.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay and do you
12 have a breakdown of black, Latino... [cross-talk]

13 MICHAEL LERNER: Five African American,
14 four Hispanic, five Asian.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay. Okay, thank
16 you.

17 MICHAEL LERNER: You're welcome.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you so much
19 for coming and providing testimony.

20 STEPHEN TREMAINE: Thank you for the
21 opportunity.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very
24 much to that panel. Our next panel is... will be
25 Sterling Roberson from the UFT Vice President;

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

159

1
2 Michael Wiltshire from Medgar Edgars... Medgar Evers
3 College Prep; Karenanne Carty from Monroe College.
4 Okay, I'd like to swear you in if you would just
5 raise your right hand please, do you solemnly swear
6 or affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and
7 nothing but the truth and to answer Council Member
8 questions honestly? Okay, Mr. Roberson would you like
9 to start?

10 STERLING ROBERSON: Sure. Well let me
11 just say thank you for being here, my name is
12 Sterling Roberson, Vice President for Career and
13 Technical Education for the United Federation of
14 Teachers and just to say to the Chairs and Miss
15 Barron and Dan Dromm on behalf of the 200,000 members
16 we represent in terms of our, our members. It's great
17 to be here in dealing with this important matter with
18 regards to the impact of what we're talking about,
19 about high schoolers earning an Associate's degree.
20 So, we heard a lot of testimony today, I'm not going
21 to read my testimony, its shared with distribution.
22 I'll just deal with the, the various aspects of my
23 testimony but we've heard a lot of data in terms of
24 the importance and the statistical data as it relates
25 to the number of students, the various programs, the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

160

1
2 number of programs so I'm going to be a little bit
3 more practical in terms of... and right to the point
4 about what is this all about, we're going to break it
5 up in categories what's at stake, what does it mean
6 in... as it relates to the Associate degree and what...
7 how does it provide dividends for many of our
8 students which was discussed. The strength of the P-
9 TECH model, we're very familiar with that model and
10 support it, how do we build on College Now the
11 readiness programs and the UFT overall support of
12 higher education and career preparedness and
13 obviously at the end of the day how do we ensure that
14 we have lifelong learners. Well first of all when we
15 think about what's at stake its real simple we know
16 that the changes educationally and around the world
17 we are living in a global knowledge economy which
18 means that we have to prepare our young people for
19 that change and when we think about it we talked
20 about the reduce... the reduction of remediation, many
21 of those things but at the end of the day what does
22 that really mean when we overarchingly talk about an
23 education whether it's post-secondary or in a K-12
24 space how do you ensure that students have the 21st
25 century skills they need to be successful in college

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

161

1
2 or career, what does that mean, how do they
3 collaborate, how do they communicate, how do they
4 have the critical thinking that they need as well as
5 the creativity and innovation. What does that really
6 mean with respect to what we need to do to provide
7 students in... all young people with the competencies
8 that they need. In our area of career and technical
9 education it's the combination of the skill set as
10 well as the academics, ultimately dealing with
11 literacy and how do we quantify that through
12 credentialing, in this case we're talking about the
13 Associates degree and earning that at, at the high
14 school level. With that being said what do we need to
15 do to sort of change what we do educationally to meet
16 that challenge and the demands today. So, when we
17 think about what the nine through 14 model... well
18 first let's talk about also why it's important in
19 terms of the conversation that we're having today.
20 Number one, how do we ensure that students in
21 economically disadvantaged at the equity and access
22 that they need to a variety of programs. Number two,
23 how do we also with the understanding that the cost
24 when it comes to the rising cost of higher education,
25 how do we make sure that these students actually are

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

162

1
2 able to afford to go to college. There's one thing
3 about access and you can have access but then if you
4 can't afford it then you're, you're back to square
5 one but the reason why the nine through 14 model is
6 appealing to us and why we, we like this model is
7 because students are gaining a number of things.
8 Number one, it's a cost savings when it comes to the
9 time in high school as well as... we talked about the
10 cost sharing but at the end of the day students have
11 a proven track record of mastery. Number one, they
12 get the academics, they get their regents diploma.
13 Number two, from the Career and Technical Education
14 side the, the authenticity as it relates to gaining a
15 credential meaning an industry credential as well as
16 an Associate degree, it is very important and when we
17 think about the models although it was not really
18 talked about today it's not just the idea that the
19 nine through 14 model that the students are getting
20 an Associate's degree, many of those schools are
21 career pathways, it's not by happen stance there's a
22 business, there's a B-TECH, the Business of
23 Technology Early College, there's an engineering and
24 architecture, there's an energy tech, these are all
25 of the industries that are important as it relates to

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

163

1
2 New York City infrastructure. So, it... the
3 practicality of that it becomes important. Obviously,
4 I don't have to tell this body about the importance
5 of higher education in learning a post-secondary and
6 what that means in terms of earnings over the course
7 of a lifetime as compared to individuals that have a
8 degree, does not have a degree as well as individuals
9 who dropped out we touched on various points in that
10 but one of the things that we... that was talked about
11 here as it relates to the ECI graduation rates. We
12 connect those graduation rates to the CTE graduation
13 rates which is 82 percent so when you think about the
14 schools with 86 percent it only makes sense that CTE
15 schools if you have a pathway approach and students
16 are engaged within their education they understand
17 what they're going to get as it relates to their
18 academics, their industry credential and a... and a
19 pathway for them it's only going to make sense that
20 they're going to also graduate at a higher rate which
21 means that in the CTE schools that higher rate is 82
22 percent. So, we think about that but the four aspects
23 of the model that we like extended to... excuse me...
24 extended time where students get a six year and... six
25 years stay in, in high schools for that extended

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

164

1
2 time. I talked about the industry credential that's
3 related to their field, it's an enhancement and it
4 shows that the students have masteries so if they're
5 in IT and they get a Sysco certification its
6 important, if they're in, in automotive and they get
7 a, a... an ASE certification, six of eight that means
8 that they have mastery, these are the things that are
9 quantifying. The academic credentials besides the
10 diploma, the Associates degree as well as an enhanced
11 diploma which brings to that. And last but not least
12 which was not talked about which is important hand in
13 hand to education is the work based learning
14 experiences and the experiences that they receive
15 going through a school especially with a CTE pathway
16 as part of a component it's important that the
17 students not only have a relative field, gain
18 credentials but also are working in the field related
19 to their interest. So, we believe that that's a very
20 important thing that we need and with the, the model...
21 the P-TECH model does for all of our schools is that
22 it connects... it creates the whole ecosystem,
23 industry, higher education, it has the Department of
24 Education, it engages us and the unions, it engages
25 others as well as government. We look at label market

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

165

1 trends, we look at the infrastructure in New York and
2 what those trends look like, and we match that to
3 what it is that we know that these models are
4 designed to do. So, obviously let me speed it up by
5 talking about... we talked about the College Now and a
6 number of students that's impacted by the College
7 Now, we need to support those programs, we need to
8 support those programs that's going to allow with the
9 20,000 plus students that are involved in that in a
10 number of schools, it should be all high schools
11 although they use the number 200... about 390 high
12 schools, there's 480 some odd high schools so there's
13 a lot of high schools that's not in that portfolio or
14 using College Now, we need to be able to support
15 programs that do that where students can actually do
16 that. The UFT by and large we've been working with
17 CUNY for many years in terms of that as well as with
18 the Department of Education specifically in the CTE
19 space we've worked with CUNY with the office of
20 Collaborative Programs. I know through my office
21 we've done something with the Carpe Diem Program, the
22 teacher leaders quality because although we talk
23 about the student preparation it's also about the
24 teacher preparation that goes hand in hand. We talked
25

1
2 about Bard where we talked about the credentials of
3 the teachers, but we also want to make sure that when
4 we talk about pathways and opportunities for students
5 that that diversity and that opportunity holds true
6 for many of our students as well as the teachers
7 getting the various types of professional learnings
8 that they need to enhance their skills. So, we
9 support that obviously we support education not just
10 because we're a union, we also put our money where
11 our mouth is with our, our Albert, Albert Shanker
12 scholarship fund where we give millions of dollars
13 away for students that are going to four-year
14 institutions that are going to continue their
15 learning and we do that as part of a, a graduate
16 program as well. So, the ideas in, in terms of this
17 conversation about students earning the credential, I
18 know we talked about a lot of the, the important
19 topics about the statistical data and those things
20 but from a practical standpoint I submit my testimony
21 obviously in terms of why this is important and why
22 we support it and why we have to collaboratively work
23 together to provide students with the opportunities
24 that they need to be successful in their career path.
25 Thank you very much.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

167

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much,
3 next please.

4 MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: Good morning. Okay,
5 so good morning everyone and thank you for the
6 opportunity to be here this morning, it is really a
7 great pleasure and an honor for me to be here today.
8 Today I speak to you on behalf of the stakeholders of
9 Medgar Evers College Preparatory School, our
10 students, parents, faculty staff and community of
11 Medgar Evers College Preparatory School. Medgar Evers
12 College Preparatory School is a sixth through 12
13 school located on the campus of Medgar Evers College.
14 Despite the fact that over 65 percent of the students
15 at Medgar Evers College Preparatory School are
16 economically disadvantaged and qualify for the
17 federal free lunch we have high attendance,
18 retention, and graduation rate. Our students are
19 diverse, enthusiastic and engaged, many are from
20 immigrant families. MECPS as a population of
21 approximately 1,260 students, we only have 56
22 teachers compare that to some schools that have 48
23 teachers to 600 students. Over 70 percent of Medgar
24 Evers College Preparatory School students belong to
25 communities of low socioeconomic status who have

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

168

1
2 historically not have access or success in higher
3 education. Approximately 90 percent of, of our
4 students are African American descent and grew
5 historically underrepresented in signs, technology,
6 engineering and mathematics. I want to add to that
7 that this year for example we had 196 of our students
8 pass one or more AP exams and college board
9 acknowledged six to one students are the designated
10 six to one students as AP scholars... AP scholars with
11 honors and AP scholars with distinction. Over the
12 past 16 years through the leadership team and the
13 commitment of the school's dedicated staff of
14 educators MECPS has produced graduation and
15 attendance rates that exceed 95 percent over the past
16 12 years. Our students matriculate into most of the
17 top colleges and universities in the country and
18 excel in their chosen major. Our mission is to
19 provide all of our students with a superior college
20 preparatory education. This specialized academic
21 program at MECTS is based on the philosophy that all
22 students are entitled to and can succeed in college
23 preparatory programs when the curriculum is rigorous
24 and engaging, when the school emphasizes good
25 character, community responsibility, realization of

1 potential and when a community network supports
2 students' academic, social and physical well-being in
3 a holistic approach. The following are noteworthy; at
4 the MCAA centennial convention in July 2009 the then
5 president, President Obama cited Medgar Evers College
6 Preparatory School as having an innovative approach
7 that challenges the students to complete high school
8 while simultaneously earning an Associate degree or
9 college credit. In 2010 the school received the
10 coveted inspiration award annually by a college board
11 to only three schools nationally that have
12 demonstrated exemplary college preparation and also
13 advanced placement courses. As I stated before we
14 have over 200... close to 200 students who passed one
15 or more AP exams last year, we also... Medgar Evers
16 College Preparatory School has now become an AP
17 capstone school where students have the opportunity
18 of earning in addition to the various high school
19 diploma offered by New York State they can also earn
20 a AP capstone diploma. Medgar Evers College
21 Preparatory School has been able to realize it's
22 mission despite the fact that the school is in dire
23 need of basic resources, we have no gym, we have no
24 auditorium, we have inadequate classrooms, we have a
25

1 situation for example this year with our AP physics
2 one class has 39 students, our AP... several of our AP
3 classes has over 34 classes... 34 students, all of our
4 regents chemistry and physics class they all have
5 over 34 students, that is the sort of condition that
6 we operate in but despite that the, the school
7 continues to do well because we have a philosophy
8 that when there is no way we find a way to succeed.
9 The structure of Medgar Evers College Preparatory
10 School is very important, our school consists of
11 three basic strands; grade six, seven and eight that
12 is our early high school, grades nine and ten that is
13 our high school and grades 11 and 12 are our early
14 college. What is so unique about these strands, in
15 six, seven and eighth grade our early high school,
16 note I did not say middle school because we do not
17 have a middle school, we have an early high school.
18 In this early high school model students begin with
19 six weeks of rigorous summer school and also a
20 Saturday academy then in the seventh grade they take
21 four regents examinations; the algebra one, the
22 geometry, the living environment and the global
23 history. In the eighth grade they take the physics,
24 some take the chemistry, the English, the US history
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

171

1
2 and some of our students take the Mandarin and
3 Chinese regent. Let me just share with you our
4 results this year; of the 58 students who took the
5 physics regents, 54 of those students passed and I'm
6 not talking about passing with 65, they all scores in
7 the 80's and the 90's, 17 out of 20 students passed
8 the chemistry regents and 64 students passed the
9 algebra two trig regents which most high school
10 students do not take. By the time these students get
11 to the ninth grade they begin to take advanced
12 placement courses in the ninth grade or high school
13 and those students who join us for the first time
14 from other schools in the ninth grade they also are
15 put on an accelerated track so by the end of the
16 tenth grade they will complete all of their regents
17 exams and are ready for our early high... early college
18 program in the tenth... in the 11th and the 12th grade.
19 By the end of the, the, the tenth grade most students
20 in our school have completed all of their regent
21 exams and in addition to that they have taken several
22 AP courses thus they are ready for our early college
23 program in the 11th and 12th grade. A little bit of
24 history about our early college program; in 2002 we
25 started the, the dual enrollment program through

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

172

1
2 Medgar Evers College School with just about
3 absolutely no support from the DOE, this partnership
4 continued until about 2009 and in 2009 the, the
5 program was kind of... went in a lull because of the
6 lack of financing and then we applied for the state
7 early college grant in 2010, the grant was awarded in
8 2011 and we established the early college program.
9 The early college program, the award, the grant was
10 of 450,000 dollars over three years, we had to admit
11 only 75 students in the first year so can you imagine
12 75 students for... with 150,000 dollars where we have
13 to provide books and all of those kinds of things but
14 our first group... this first cohort in 2013 we had 35
15 of these students receive their Associate degree and
16 the other students completed at least one year of,
17 of, of college. Over the next two years when the
18 grant was renewed the amount of the grant with the
19 increase in college expenses and so forth, we had to
20 reduce the number of students in the program from 75
21 to 50 thus we saw a drop in the number of students
22 who graduated from the program but despite that we
23 still tried to work our way as best as possible to
24 ensure as many students gain access to this program.
25 Now the question that we face is that the limited

1 funding we have to reduce our only... made only 75 now
2 less than 50 students have access to this program in
3 the 11th and the 12th grade and so for the graduating
4 class the number of students in the 11th and 12th
5 grade are over 500 students so in each grade we have
6 to select 40... between 40 and 50 students for this
7 program, I mean I can tell you that this is a very,
8 very difficult thing to do because most of our
9 students are qualified for this program and they're
10 enthusiastic, they want to work hard but because of
11 the limited funding that we have we have to restrict
12 the number of students who are in this program. So,
13 so over the years the program started out being
14 successful now we're seeing that the only way that we
15 will be able to continue to have the level of success
16 that we have had in this program in the past is
17 through sustainable funding unlike the early college
18 initiative with the, the DOE our students do not
19 enjoy... our school do not enjoy that kind of status so
20 the, the survival of the program depends on whether
21 or not the state renews this grant and we become
22 qualified... or we're selected for this grant each
23 year. The... this program has been instrumental in a
24 number of ways to our school, we know for a fact that
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

174

1
2 our students when they go on to a college they end up
3 spending three years in, in fact some students who
4 have continued in CUNY have graduated in two years,
5 in this year at our partner school we're having 11
6 students who are graduating in three years. Many of
7 these students are also graduating with double
8 degrees. So, this program is instrumental in terms of
9 increasing the number of high school graduates,
10 college graduates in reducing costs and just.. and
11 most of the students who are in this program they are
12 the first-time graduates and in.. even in some cases
13 they are the first one in their family graduating
14 from high school. So, while the program works and
15 works very, very well unlike most of the school we
16 are in this unique situation and perhaps there may be
17 other schools such as us, I don't know where we.. the,
18 the survival of our program depends solely on whether
19 or not the state will renew this grant at the end of
20 the... at the end of the year. Just a, a few other
21 points, the, the, the model that we have put in
22 place, the early high school model it lays that
23 foundation from the sixth, seventh and eighth grade
24 that pairs these student to be highly successful not
25 just in college but.. not just in high school but

1
2 college and beyond and this is the perfect model
3 where students complete all high school courses, all
4 high school regents, take AP examinations by the end
5 of the tenth grade, ready for this program but again
6 because of funding we're not able to do so. So, I
7 would appeal to the council, to the DOE to do
8 whatever is possible to ensure the survival of this
9 program because we're serving a community that really
10 lacks these opportunities and I may also point out
11 and this is really critical, the Associate degree
12 that our students receive this degree is in science,
13 biology science or computer science so... because our
14 focus is really in the STEM area where our student
15 is... where students of color, our representation are
16 somewhat lacking. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, next
18 please.

19 KARENANN: Hi, good... I think I'm the
20 first one to say good afternoon so good afternoon
21 everyone. As I was preparing my testimony I was
22 wondering how I would make the case or how Monroe
23 College fits into this whole concept of dual
24 enrollment and now that I've been able to sit through
25 a variety of presentations I think I have just the

1
2 answer about how we fit in. So, my name is Karenann
3 Carty, I'm the Vice President of Academic Affairs at
4 Monroe College, I've had a 35-year career in
5 education, my husband is a proud UFT member working...
6 teaching in the Bronx and for 16 of my years I've
7 been working at Monroe College and Monroe for those
8 of you who don't know has been an anchor for 80... over
9 80 years in the Bronx offering career oriented
10 education and for 50 years now in New Rochelle..
11 actually for 35 of those years in New Rochelle, feels
12 like 50 to me and we have been having a tremendous
13 impact on our communities on both of our campuses.
14 For today though I, I will focus on the Bronx because
15 that's where, you know we're focused in this area
16 today. There is something very important about Monroe
17 that I think people should know and so we are a
18 private college that has been family led for all of
19 our 80 plus year history and so we've had three
20 generations leading the college keeping us focused on
21 our mission and keeping us focused on our community
22 and in the Bronx we've had a tremendous impact and
23 we've been branching out from mostly adult education
24 in the Bronx, adult commuting education to having a
25 greater and greater impact in our high schools. So,

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

177

1
2 recently Mark Gerome became the President of Monroe
3 College and he has made it his signature event...
4 signature issue to actually expand into the high
5 schools, speak with the principals and find out how
6 we can be of service. So, just a few points about
7 Monroe, we offer in the same institution Associate,
8 Bachelors and Master's degree programs, we have some
9 of the best outcomes in the country for low income
10 and minority students. In fact, the latest data that
11 came out from IPEDS show that we graduated the
12 highest number of African American and Latino
13 students in New York State in 2015. We have one of
14 the highest graduation rates in low student default...
15 student loan default rates in the country for
16 students we serve and now that we have a, a new
17 president who is focused on access and affordability
18 we have been penetrating high schools and finding out
19 from principals what they need, he personally has
20 visited over 100 high schools and I have been
21 following up with him going into the high schools
22 speaking with the principals and the guidance
23 counselors about what we can do. For over 15 years
24 Monroe has been providing early college access and
25 our purpose in doing this we've reached about 10,000

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

178

1
2 students over the course of that time is first as
3 many of us have said to introduce students to the
4 college search process and the college selection
5 process to provide them with an enriched academic and
6 career focused experience and to make college more
7 affordable because all of our early access programs
8 like the others who have said... mentioned... given
9 testimony today we actually provide our programs free
10 of charge, we do not charge students for books, we do
11 not charge students fees, we provide everything to
12 them and they can walk away with a transcript that
13 they can take to the college of their choice. Our
14 programs have evolved over the past 15 years starting
15 with our largest program which is called JumpStart at
16 Monroe and that's where we offer college courses to
17 high school students on our campuses on Saturday
18 mornings and we have reached hundreds of students
19 each year through our JumpStart Program. After we had
20 a history of that program many principals and
21 guidance counselors would ask us if we could come to
22 their school and offer the courses at their schools
23 because of the transportation and other logistics
24 related to it and so we've had selected high schools
25 over the past several years where we have gone into

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

179

1
2 the high schools with a college professor to offer
3 college courses on the high school's... and generally
4 these are courses in one of our career related degree
5 programs business, accounting, information
6 technology, medical, you know Allied Health
7 Professions, etcetera. And then most recently and
8 this is why I have to tell you that I was delighted
9 to be here today to really hear what everyone had to
10 say because most recently we launched a true dual
11 enrollment program with several high schools, three
12 high schools to be exact where they have asked us to
13 actually provide more of a... of a pathway, an
14 expansion of these free college courses on their high
15 school campuses and we've worked very closely with
16 these principals to try to craft the pathway. So,
17 hearing all of these models that people have been
18 discussing today is actually very eye opening for me
19 and very helpful. What, what we did with... when the
20 principals had asked us to expand this dual
21 enrollment we were happy to do it but we also knew
22 that we were going to have to expand the ranks of our
23 faculty be... you know to be deployed out to the high
24 schools and so we did also develop what we call the
25 high school faculty development program where we have

1 taken on high school faculty who are qualified to
2 teach at the college level who essentially become
3 adjunct faculty at Monroe, they have access to all of
4 the training and faculty development that we do, they
5 are partnered with a mentor and they're actually
6 teaching the Monroe courses on the high school
7 campuses. We've done that just with three high
8 schools this year and its brand new, so I can't
9 really give you data on it, we're actually in the
10 process now of visiting the high schools and the... and
11 seeing how things are going with the principals. What
12 I, I, I gave a lot of thought to this issue of the
13 earning of the Associate degree in the high school
14 and now that I've learned so much more about what's
15 happening at CUNY and at Bard and at Medgar Evers,
16 you know I see the value but what I learned as a
17 novice and I just want to share this with you because
18 I think it will be relevant is that there are
19 certainly, certainly financial benefits to the
20 earning of a... an Associate degree credential in high
21 school but if we want to expand the model out to
22 places like Monroe where we would have individual
23 institutions actually partnering with individual high
24 schools and forming that kind of partnership, I think
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

181

1
2 that the, the... there are a number of logistical
3 issues that are really prevalent and also we have to
4 think about the value that we're actually adding for
5 the students. So, what I've learned in working with
6 the individual high schools in trying to craft this
7 pathway because we don't have a full system or a
8 full, you know integrated right into the high school
9 is the logistics are really... are, are really... can
10 really be an impediment, we have to mesh the high
11 school, a curriculum and schedule and flow with what
12 we do at the college, we have to ensure that the
13 faculty we deploy, you know understand the Monroe
14 culture and can also be integrated into the high
15 school culture, we have to plan the scheduling and
16 the traveling and all of that. So, there are those
17 logistical issues, but they are really surmountable
18 as long as we know that in the end we're doing
19 something that's tremendously worthwhile. The
20 downside I think to a full Associate degree in a
21 model like we would have at Monroe is Monroe offers...
22 we run all year round so we offer three full academic
23 semesters every year and students who come to us can
24 actually earn a Bachelorette degree in less than
25 three years if they go straight through. So, if we

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

182

1
2 have the model where we have a student essentially
3 finishing their Associate degree at the age of 17 or
4 18 and they come to Monroe they will be completed
5 with a Bachelorette degree at perhaps the age of 19
6 and because we are career focused we not only want to
7 make sure the student has the appropriate academic
8 credential but that they actually have the
9 professional maturity and that they would actually be
10 employable to the types of employers that we serve
11 through our educational programs. So, that was a
12 thought that I gave that, that made me give pause and
13 say you know what we really have to investigate this
14 and make sure we feel really good about it before we
15 dive in. there is... you know one principal who did ask
16 us to map out a pathway for a cohort of students who
17 similarly to what others have mentioned by tenth
18 grade they had completed the regents, they many of
19 their high school credentials under their belt and
20 that was a, a discreet cohort of students and we
21 actually have crafted out a thirty credit program for
22 them that we're just implementing now and so the
23 results of that remain to be seen. She was the most
24 ambitious principal that we had, and it is though...
25 the... it is rigorous, and it is year-round, and the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

183

1
2 students have to be completely committed as well as
3 the parents and the college and the high school. I
4 think that to, to bring my, my comments to a close
5 the value that we've had as an institution in
6 engaging in this kind of dog... dialogue with our
7 principals has been invaluable, we've been working
8 together to try to improve our outcomes at the high
9 school and our outcomes at the college and I think
10 that the kinds of conversations we're having really,
11 you know will, will point us in the right direction
12 going forward as to how far to go, how much exposure
13 is... works perfectly well and how much might be too
14 much down the line. So, those are the questions that
15 we're exploring at Monroe and you know I'd be happy
16 to answer any questions that you have.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I want to thank
18 the panel for their presentation and just a few
19 questions for Miss Carty...

20 KARENANNE CARTY: Yes...

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Dr. Carty...

22 KARENANNE CARTY: Uh-huh...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: In part of your
24 addendum you have faculty development programs for
25 high school partners and you talk about the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

184

1
2 candidates have to submit a resume, you have to be
3 interviewed, provide a demonstration lesson and
4 complete faculty development programs and then for
5 your professional development components you say
6 training in Monroe's course management system,
7 blackboard and an opportunity to earn blackboard
8 certification, what is blackboard, is that a... [cross-
9 talk]

10 KARENANNE CARTY: Okay, so at our college
11 we use the course management system called blackboard
12 and that is a system which houses all of our courses
13 and we create within that system what we call master
14 shells so that each faculty member will have housed
15 electronically all of the resources they need, it
16 allows us to do assessments electronically through
17 blackboard, it allows us to do collaborative sessions
18 even remotely and it's just... it... an... a community
19 engagement tool as well as a course management
20 system. So, the beauty of that for the high schools
21 is that because all of our resources are housed there
22 when the faculty come, and they get certified in
23 using that software... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh-huh, okay...
25 [cross-talk]

1
2 KARENANNE CARTY: ...they then can deliver
3 the coursework at the high school.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, good. Dr.
5 Wiltshire can you just share a little bit of your
6 history with the DOE?

7 MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: Well I, I, I started...
8 well I became principal at Medgar Evers College
9 Preparatory School in 2001 and I have been there
10 since then. I, I, I think that in terms of our
11 history with the DOE I would say that we had to
12 somewhat charter our own course and we had to... you
13 know when we... for example when we started out our
14 early college... our early high school, when we
15 developed the early high school model it was
16 something that was approved, supported by the DOE but
17 then in subsequent years they decided to revisit that
18 model and in 2013 I think that they decided that they
19 were going to review that model to see if there
20 should be some changes in our approach but that was
21 not... but they were not successful and so they
22 approved us to continue with that model and so we are
23 now in another situation where there are some
24 concerns about our admissions policy and whether or
25 not that should become... well and, and that should

1
2 become a part of the essential admission process so
3 that they want to bring all of the middle school
4 under. The, the, the thing is that when, when we
5 created... when we... well when we transformed middle
6 college high school to Medgar Evers College
7 Preparatory School it was supposed to be a unique
8 model that did not focus on the traditional high
9 school... the traditional middle school model and so...
10 and that is the reason why and we focus mainly on the
11 high school level courses and so on and so forth.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, earlier on
13 I asked the DOE about a document which they had
14 released which was a draft talking about proposed
15 changes to your admission policy and no one seemed to
16 know what in the world I was talking about, is there
17 any representatives still here from the DOE? Okay, so
18 it's interesting that there was this great
19 deniability when I asked about it or no one knew the
20 ignorance so have they pulled back?

21 MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: What... that is
22 possible because I, I've never seen that draft really
23 so I, I don't know what draft you're speaking to
24 because... well you know I got... I saw a draft but not
25 from the DOE so what I'm saying I've not seen any

1
2 official draft from the DOE as to what the new policy
3 is going to be.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, have they
5 involved you at all, have they reached... [cross-talk]

6 MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: Yes, we did... [cross-
7 talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...out to you...
9 [cross-talk]

10 MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: ...meet with the Senior
11 Deputy Chancellor and she visited our school, she met
12 with a group of parents, FLT, PTA, included myself
13 and she did outline the Chancellors vision as to
14 what... as to what the new approach to their admission
15 policy will be for middle schools, for all middle
16 schools including our school. The thing with Medgar
17 we're a citywide school and the admission has always
18 been local so that admission process... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And how many
20 students are enrolled at Medgar Evers College High
21 Schools... [cross-talk]

22 MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: 1,260 students.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: 1,200 and...
24 [cross-talk]

25 MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: ...60.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

188

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: 60 and how many staff members do you have?

MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: We have 56 staff members.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And what's the average class size?

MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: It varies, I would say the average class size contractually for grades... it's... I would say that the average class size is over 30... is about 34, close to... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: About 34... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: ...34 students, I mean you know you're going to find that there are some classes with much less students... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: ...but yeah...

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And, and so you said that your funding is from the state?

MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: Yes...

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Through the early college high school... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: Grant... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

189

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...the Scholars Program?

MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And so if the state were to not give you funding how would that impact your program?

MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: The program would end.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, what does the DOE do for you to maintain this program?

MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: Nothing. No, we do not get any support from the DOE, the only support that we get from this program is for our partner school Medgar Evers College who over the years have come up with all sort of creative ways to give our students an opportunity to take college classes through our... the dual enrollment program but that is with... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: No, no other... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: No... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...funding comes through that?

MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: No.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

190

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay. So, my
3 final question, were you ever an ECI school, do you
4 want to become an ECI school would.. [cross-talk]

5 MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: Well... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...it be
7 advantageous to you to do that?

8 MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: So, when the RFB came
9 out for the establishment of the first ECI school we
10 did apply but our application was not successful.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, would you be
12 interested in being an ECI school or do you not see
13 an advantage to that?

14 MICHAEL WILTSHIRE: Well that is
15 something that I definitely would like to explore if
16 it's a situation where we can do some of the things
17 that I've heard here today, certainly.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, good thank
19 you.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Chair
21 Barron and Mr. Roberson, in terms of the ECI schools
22 within the Department of Education are any of those
23 school's pro schools?

24 STERLING ROBERSON: That's actually a
25 good question, I am not 100 percent sure, they may..

1
2 they may be but I'm not 100 percent sure, so I don't
3 want to give you an answer... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: The reason I'm asking
5 I'm just wondering if there are any special
6 provisions that need to be made or are made in regard
7 to the ECI schools, any contractual concerns in those
8 schools beyond the obvious?

9 STERLING ROBERSON: I mean the construct
10 of the school gives it what it is, they still are
11 following the collective bargaining agreements in
12 those areas, the flexibility of pros and less
13 progressive redesign opportunity schools of
14 excellence that we have within our contract that
15 allows more flexibility in terms of loosening up some
16 of the rules that may... schools may find cumbersome
17 but that's something that the... that the school
18 community has to agree upon in terms of making those
19 kinds of changes.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, I think I heard
21 in your testimony that the most positive impact on
22 students whether they be in ECI schools or if they're
23 in CTE programs is the, the end goal is established
24 for them, that they know what it is that they're
25

1
2 aiming for, can you elaborate a little bit further on
3 that for me?

4 STERLING ROBERSON: Absolutely, so when
5 you think about students that may have an interest in
6 health careers and we have a Hero High Health
7 Education research opportunity schools that's
8 connected to, to, to Hostos Community College in the
9 Bronx but at the same time, you know you have... in the
10 Bronx you have Montefiore Hospital which is big, you
11 have St. Barnabas, you have Lincoln, you have a
12 variety of folks... and you... in, in terms of that
13 ecosystem of higher education as well as what are the
14 trends that's happening in that community around
15 health care so that school is geographically located
16 in an area that you know that's going to be important
17 as it relates to the viability of the community, the
18 same thing holds true if you look at the historic way
19 back when days of vocational education when you have
20 a school like aviation, it's not by happen stance
21 that it's in Queens, it's not by happen stance that
22 they're connected to Vaughn College, it's not by
23 happen stance that they are connected to JFK and
24 LaGuardia airport geographically. So, the, the
25 original concept of these schools and pathways is

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

193

1
2 almost like going back to the future, right but what
3 we're doing is looking at the current models and the
4 current demands of industry as well as looking at the
5 infrastructure of New York and where the trends are
6 obviously the Bronx in terms of medical, hospitality,
7 tourism and we can go on and on for the variety of
8 boroughs for all of the boroughs and then we can
9 think about those models so when a student is going
10 to that particular school they know what it is that
11 they want to do. Now it does not necessarily mean
12 although they may have that interest they are young
13 people and they tend to change their mind but the
14 idea of them getting their foundational skills
15 academically, getting a credential that's offered to
16 them as an enhancement that shows mastery, having a
17 post-secondary partner, it gives them the, the, the
18 grit and the determination and all of the things
19 necessary for them to be successful as lifelong
20 learners and... as well as being able to fit in our
21 global knowledge economy and be successful.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Uh-huh, I would agree
23 with that assessment and I think at this point I'm
24 going to leave it at that on a good positive note and

25

1
2 thank you all for coming in and we will call our next
3 panel up, thank you.

4 STERLING ROBERSON: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, our panel of
6 students who have waited all this time to come and
7 give some testimony is made up of Ruben Contreras
8 from the Renaissance Charter School in Jackson
9 Heights; Mustafa Jalel [sp?] also from the
10 Renaissance Charter School; Jared Albinus,
11 Renaissance Charter School and Abrar Kazi from the
12 Renaissance Charter School as well, come up have a
13 seat and welcome to the Renaissance Charter School to
14 the New York City Council's Committee on Education
15 hearing. Often times I say gentlemen that we wish we
16 could hear your testimony first because it's very,
17 very important to us unfortunately part of our job or
18 fortunately depending on how you're looking at it is
19 to grill the administration and the agencies that are
20 involved about what they're offering our students, so
21 we don't get to you students as, as quickly as we
22 would like but we certainly definitely value your
23 contributions. So, I need to swear you in so would
24 you raise your right hand, and do you solemnly swear
25 to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

195

1 the truth and to answer Council Member questions
2 honestly? Okay, who would like to start? Alright,
3 very good make sure that red light is on and speak
4 loud and clear.

6 MUSTAFA JULEL: Good afternoon, my name
7 is Mustafa Julel, I came from Bangladesh and I'm 13
8 and I've resided in New York City for 12 years and I
9 went to a New York City school for nine years. I
10 believe high schoolers should have the capability of
11 earning college credits. Since college prices are
12 increasing every day, month and year, they're in the
13 thousands many families and students are going into
14 enormous debts. With the capability of high schoolers
15 able to earn college credits would really lower a
16 family... a family or student's financial burden. there
17 are many students who take the... their studies very
18 seriously and some of the time they're not in a
19 financial position to afford further education for
20 the successful future that they deserve. And
21 actually, I know a family friend who graduated from
22 Bard High School Early College and the family told us
23 that the two-year early college the... provided by Bard
24 really financially helped them since the student
25 already started into study on her subject.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

196

1
2 Conclusively I think that the college credits will
3 really benefit many families not only positively and
4 financially. Thank you for your time.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much,
6 next please, yes.

7 ABRAR KAZI: Hi, my name is Abrar Kazi...
8 [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Pull the mic down a
10 little bit like this. There you go and a little
11 closer. No, pull the whole bottom, the base, there
12 you go.

13 ABRAR KAZI: And I was born in New York
14 and I was going to school for eight years and I'm,
15 I'm in... I'm 12 years old and I'm currently in seventh
16 grade in the school of the Renaissance Charter School
17 and I agree that the high school students should get
18 college credits because it's a better opportunity for
19 them and it'll help them get, get a scholarship and a
20 degree and it's going to help them financially
21 because they necessarily wouldn't have to pay a lot
22 of money and they wouldn't like lose a lot of money
23 and this will help them in a way financially in a
24 positive way. Thank you, have a good time.

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

197

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay and thank you,
3 next please.

4 RUBEN CONTRERAS: Alright, good
5 afternoon. My name is Ruben Contreras and I'm
6 currently in the tenth grade at Renaissance Charter
7 School. I'm taking two AP classes and handle my
8 studies very seriously as I want to get as many
9 credits from high school as possible. You see I come
10 from a blue-collar family, right so I don't have the
11 same financial capabilities as others for my advanced
12 education and therefor I want and need to take full
13 advantage of all of the opportunities that high
14 school offers me. I believe that students should be
15 allowed to receive as many college credits as
16 possible because I know there's a lot more like me
17 that they, they don't have the same opportunities to
18 receive like your scholarships per se because like me
19 I have to watch my younger siblings every day after
20 school because my mother always works like around 15
21 hours and same as my parents so yeah...

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you and
23 the next please.

24 JARED ALBINUS: Okay, hi good afternoon.
25 My name is Jared Albinus and as everyone else I go to

1
2 the Renaissance Charter School and I'm an 11th grader
3 and from my view I believe that it would be agreeable
4 for a high school student to have an Associate... to be
5 able to have an Associates before going to college
6 because as an 11th grader like I'm getting ready to
7 prepare for college and, and if I had that
8 opportunity... if... yeah, if I had that opportunity to,
9 to take... to take AP courses to me I see that as an
10 opportunity for me to not prove others wrong but to
11 prove me wrong that I can do like things that college
12 kids do at a younger age and it just gives me the
13 opportunity to go to college and do what I need to do
14 for the next couple of years. Yeah, thank you, sorry.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I want to thank
16 the panel very much for coming and for sharing your
17 testimony with us. At the school that you attend do
18 you have the opportunity to take any AP classes, you
19 do which areas are they in?

20 RUBEN CONTRERAS: So, in... beginning in
21 the eighth grade I believe well you, you already
22 start with an advanced class in science because
23 unlike other schools at the Renaissance Charter
24 School you be... you take earth science in eighth grade
25 and that just gives you more opportunities in that

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

199

1
2 you're guaranteed by the time you're in 11th grade
3 already taking one of the senior courses or you can
4 already get a... into a biology AP after that it would
5 have to be... in ninth grade you can take Spanish in...
6 no, tenth grade, my bad and from there on there... you
7 can take Spanish advance placement classes until your
8 senior year and there's an English course in, in 11th
9 grade...

10 JARED ALBINUS: Uh-huh...

11 RUBEN CONTRERAS: Yeah, 11th grade and
12 there's an advanced placement in English and also in
13 the 11th grade there is calculus I believe and there
14 is world history in tenth grade and government I
15 believe in the 11th or... no...

16 JARED ALBINUS: AP US history...

17 RUBEN CONTRERAS: Oh AP US history in the
18 11th.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, that's great
20 your school does have quite an offering of AP classes
21 so we're glad that you know about it and that you're
22 taking those classes and availing yourself, very
23 good.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'd just like to say
25 the Renaissance Charter School is one of the best

1 schools in my district, they really do prepare
2 students well, I think the secret to their success
3 and I think that you'll understand what I mean Chair
4 Barron when I tell you is collaboration...

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh-huh...

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...they all work
7 together from the principal in the school, Stacey to
8 the teachers and the students and the parents, very
9 important because the parents are very much involved
10 in the education at this school. I just wanted to ask
11 because Renaissance has its own high school do you
12 have an early college program, can you get credits at
13 Renaissance?
14

15 JARED ALBINUS: Yes but they also... they
16 offer College Now where you go to colleges and take
17 college classes with like other college students and,
18 and the PSAT... here you talk... tell them...

19 RUBEN CONTRERAS: In order to get into
20 the College Now Program you need to have a certain
21 score on your PSAT and that's how you get qualified
22 into each of the classes.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I think you mentioned
24 in your testimony about this being an encouragement
25

1
2 for you to want to achieve a goal, can you explain
3 that a little bit further?

4 RUBEN CONTRERAS: Well my family doesn't
5 have a... like, like I said the... it doesn't have the
6 financial stability to guarantee me a... at... not even
7 two years maybe three and... in college and therefor I
8 have to take full advantage of, of what I can get
9 right now because my future in advanced education is
10 unsure so make the best out of what you have.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And do you have
12 college counselors at Renaissance?

13 RUBEN CONTRERAS: I wouldn't be aware
14 because I just joined last year.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm pretty sure that
16 they do have it but... yes.

17 JARED ALBINUS: Yeah, I'm not really sure
18 if they have college counselors or not, yeah.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Uh-huh, you know a
20 lot of questions were, were, were raised today about
21 the differences between high school and colleges and
22 I have to tell you the one big difference that I
23 found was that you have a lot more freedom when you
24 go to college, you're not there all day long, you
25 might go one day for one period and then the next day

1
2 you go for three periods and it's really learning to
3 have that discipline to be sure that you show up for
4 classes and do the right thing in order to be able to
5 get the degree but even down to that, you know level
6 those are the things that students need to know I
7 think to prepare them for college so we hope that
8 that is what happening at the Renaissance, I'm pretty
9 sure that that probably is and we thank you. I'm
10 going to have a little session with you after this
11 hearing is over so stay don't move and I think some
12 of your other students are up here as well they're
13 going to join us in a moment and I want to thank you
14 all for coming in today and for giving testimony and
15 for waiting so long to be able to give that
16 testimony.

17 RUBEN CONTRERAS: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much.

19 Good? Yeah.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, seeing
21 no further witnesses to give testimony we are
22 adjourned.

23 [gavel]

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

November 7, 2017