

1	COMMITTEE ON FINANCE	1
2	CITY COUNCIL	
3	CITY OF NEW YORK	
4	----- X	
5	TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES	
6	Of the	
7	COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH,	
8	COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION	
9	----- X	
10	May 16, 2017	
11	Start: 10:15 a.m.	
12	Recess: 2:58 p.m.	
13	HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall	
14	B E F O R E:	
15	Julissa Ferreras-Copeland	
16	Chairperson	
17	Daniel Dromm	
18	Chairperson	
19	COUNCIL MEMBERS:	
20	Steven Matteo	
21	Ben Kallos	
22	Ydanis Rodriguez	
23	Mark Treyger	
24	Margaret Chin	
25	Vanessa Gibson	
	Deborah Rose	
	Alan Maisel	
	Vincent Gentile	
	Daniel Garodnick	
	Inez Barron	
	Brad Lander	
	Rafael Salamanca	
	Chaim Deutsch	
	Corey Johnson	

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2

Jimmy Van Bramer
Helen Rosenthal
Robert Cornegy
Antonio Reynoso
Mark Levine
I. Daneek Miler

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Borough President Otto

Carmen Farina, Chancellor
Department of Education

Raymond Orlando, Chief Financial Officer
Department of Education

Lucas Taylor, Executive Director
[Inaudible]

Elizabeth Rose, Deputy Commissioner
Department of Education

Lorraine Grillo, President & CEO
School Construction Authority

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Good

morning and welcome to today's Committee Hearing, Finance Committee. My name is Julissa Ferreras-Copeland. I am the Chair of the Finance Committee. I want to acknowledge Borough President Otto who has joined us in the back. I want to begin by thanking my co-chair, Chair Danny Dromm, and the members of Education Committee for joining us today. I also want to acknowledge members of both committees who are here with us. We have Minority Leader Matteo, Council Member Kallos, Rodriguez and Treyger. This morning the Committee comminutes to look at the Mayor's Fiscal 2018 Executive Budget with the Department of Education and the School Construction Authority. We will hear first from the DOE's Chancellor Carmen Farina to discuss DOE's expense budget followed by DOE Deputy Commissioner Elizabeth Rose and SCA President and CEO Lorraine Grillo to discuss the capital plan. I will begin with a brief overview of the Department's budget, DOE's fiscal 2018 budget totals 24.3 billion in increases, approximately 1.1 billion over Fiscal 2017's adopted budget. DOE represents nearly 29 percent of the

city's budget. The department's new needs since a preliminary budget total 103.5 million in the coming fiscal year increasing to 217.7 million by fiscal 2021. Significant new investments, which we will discuss in more detail during the hearing, include the transfer the transfer of earn and earned from ACS to DOE as well as 3K for all to provide free full day preschool to three year olds in two districts. The DOE's budget supports a head count of just under 131 800 positions turning to the capital budget, the February 2017 proposed amendment to the DOE's five year capital plan total 15.5 million including 5.9 billion for capacity projects and approximately 6 billion for investments to improve and upgrade existing facilities. There are a number of areas that I hope to touch on in greater detail for today's hearing. To begin with on the expense side, I am concerned about the amount of state foundation aid received by DOE, 165.6 million less than the department had projected it would receive in the preliminary plan. This level of aid fails to meet the state's responsibility under the framework established by the 2006 Campaign For All equity decision. The impact of this adjustment will fall

directly on our schools, scraping a plan to increase in their budgets at maintaining the same base level of funding as the prior year. I would like to hear from DOE about how they intend to address this shortfall to provide the proper level of resources to our 1800 public schools. Furthermore, the Council was disappointed to see that the Administration failed to address our call for universal school lunch in this budget. All five borough presidents and 82 percent of the city's voter support the elimination of school lunch fees because all students would be eligible to participate if it removes the stigma receiving a free meal at school because no immigration restriction exists for this program children would be able to obtain meals regardless of their immigration status. Universal school lunch is not only the popular thing to do, it is the right thing to do. This Council will continue to push the Administration to include this essential priority in the adopted budget. Finally, as I mentioned, the expense budget includes 20 million to transfer the early learned child care system from ACS to DOE. The goal of this transfer is to better align the city's early childhood education programs and will fund

social workers and instructional coordinators in early learning programs as well as greater outreach. DOE will fully assume control of early learning in fiscal 2019. The Council applauds this initiative and we believe this provides a crucial opportunity to create pay parity for ACS and DOE educators. On the capital side, back in February, the Finance and Education Committees heard from DOE and SCA regarding the challenges of planning and siting for new capacity. Given the significant overcrowding in our districts, this is particularly prominent issue for Chair Dromm and myself but it is also something experienced by all of us. I want to thank the Speaker for addressing this concern in her State of the City speech and working with us to develop a working group that is exploring reforms to these processes. I would encourage those members of the public who want to provide us with their input on these issues to visit the council's website and submit their comments. This link is available in the report that has been distributed for this hearing. We will welcome the announcement -- while we welcome the announcement of 3K, the extent of the initiatives impact on DOE's capital budget is unclear. The

Department expects that half of the capacity will come from DOE's facilities which may require capital funding to convert existing space for classrooms appropriate for three year old students or to construct additional seats. This could very well worst an existing planning and siting challenges. Finally, I want to address something that is always a critical importance to me as we got through the budget process and that is transparency. In our budget response, we called on the Administration to make changes to the [inaudible 00:06:00] five year capital plan give the side at 15.5 billion and importance of the capital plan, we continue to urge the plans publication format to be more transparent, understandable and detailed for benefits of both the council and the public. I look forward to hearing from these issues and many more today. Before turning it over to my co-chair, I want to thank the Finance staff that helped prepare this hearing: Regina Parada (SP) Ryan, Nathan Tolk (SP), Elisha ??, Katlyn O'Hagan and Eric Bernstein. I will now turn the mic over the Chair Dromm for his opening statement.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much, Chair Ferreras-Copeland and good morning everyone. I am Council Member Danny Dromm and I am the Chair of the Education Committee. Welcome to the Fiscal 2018 Executive Budget Hearing on the Department of Education and the School Construction Authority. We will start today by hearing from the DOE's Chancellor Carmen Farina, who will discuss the expense and operating portion of the DOE's executive budget, and then we will hear about the DOE's capital plan from Deputy Chancellor Elizabeth Rose and SCA President and CEO Lorraine Grillo. The Department of Education's Fiscal 2018 Operating Budget totals \$30.8 billion including pension and debt service which represents 36 percent of New York City's budget. Education spending is also a significant portion of the capital budget. The DOE's ten year capital strategy is 20.5 billion or 23 percent of the city's capital strategy. DOE's executive budget on the expense side is \$1.1 billion more than the DOE's fiscal 2017 adopted budget and while I support many of the new needs added in their -- this plan there are still unanswered questions that I have about some of the Administration's priorities and spending choices.

There are two big changes in the DOE's executive budget that reflect this Administration's priorities.

The first is the Mayor's recent announcement about extending universal pre-kindergarten to three year olds through a new program called 3K For All. The DOE's fiscal 2018 executive budget commits \$16.5 million to begin this in two school districts,

District Seven in the South Bronx and District 23 in Brooklyn. The Administration plans to provide free full day pre-school for any three year old that wants it in those two districts by the fall of 2018 which will require an estimated 1,800 seats for three year olds. The budget lays out the Mayor's plan for expansions by adding two school districts every year so that by fiscal 2021. 3K For All will operate in eight school districts at a cost of \$157 million.

While I applaud the idea of providing free quality preschool to three year olds, I want to learn more today about the Administration's plans to make this a truly universal program. This is a very expensive endeavor which potentially could cost \$1 billion to provide every three year old and this cannot be supported by the city funding alone. We are the -- what are the city's plans to secure additional funds

from the state and federal governments to support his and is there any guarantee, especially in this political climate, that New York City will be able to secure funding for this. The Mayor's big announcement which is also reflected in this budget is moving the childcare system known as Early Learn from the Administration for Children Services to DOE. This move consolidates all early education programs under the management of one agency, the DOE, with the aim of creating a consistent system with better alignment between Early Learn and universal pre-kindergarten. This budget reflects this move by creating budget lines for early childhood programs in DOE and the Early Learn contract is recognized in the DOE's budget in fiscal 2019 when we anticipate a new RFP will be released. DOE is also baselined \$20 million to support the transfer and ensure alignment between Early Learn and universal pre-kindergarten. Today, I would like to hear from the DOE about how and why they decided to baseline \$20 million for this. I also would like to know or to hear about their vision for managing this new system which will now include providing programs to children ages zero through five incentive based childcare, home based

childcare through family child care networks and head start. DOE has always been a very large agency with a large budget serving over a million students but this transfer adds even more responsibility and money to the DOE. The DOE has been criticized in the past, including by me, about their contracting process and oversight in the contracting process. How can we be assured that the early learned contract can be reissued at DOE without any problem? How can you assure us that DOE has the capacity to properly manage this new system? I understand the desire to align Early Learn and universal pre-kindergarten and I especially hope this makes the day to day practice for providers easier to navigate but I want to ensure this is being done in the best interest of students, parents and teachers. I am disappointed that we did not see a commitment from the DOE to better support LGBT students. While the council funded an LGBT liaison in the fiscal 2016 adopted budget and the DOE baselined that position last year at adoption, the DOE has not made any other financial investments to support LGBT students or the LGBT liaison. I am interested in hearing today what the DOE's commitment and plan is to support the LGBT liaison and LGBT

students in the upcoming school year. I am happy to report that after the council called on the Administration to provide air-conditioning in classrooms has been included in the DOE's executive budget. The DOE has committed \$5 million in fiscal 2018 and additional funding in the out years to provide for the installation of air-conditioning in all classrooms by 2022. In the fiscal 2017 adopted budget, the council called on DOE to report on air-conditioning in classrooms in a term and condition which helped them strengthen the need for additional air-conditioners in schools. I am thrilled that this term and condition proved to be useful and hoped to see more areas we can work together to create better learning environments for students. The DOE and SCA are still investigating the costs of necessary electrical upgrades in buildings without air-conditioning and additional capital funding may be needed to cover this upgrade. However, in 2017, February 2017, SCA released a \$15.5 billion proposed amendment to the fiscal 2015-19 five year capital plan that included \$50 million to perform work that would facilitate the installation of air-conditioning in instructional classrooms. While the SCA has not

1 issued an update to the five year capital plan since
2 the preliminary budget, we look forward to discussing
3 the proposed amendment in further detail given new
4 funding in the DOE's expense budget for air-
5 conditioners and 3K. In addition, this hearing gives
6 us an opportunity to discuss the council's
7 preliminary budget response items related to
8 education capital, building essential school
9 components such as auditoriums, cafeterias and
10 gymnasiums, improving accessibility in public schools
11 and increasing the transparency of the capital plan.
12 Finally, as Chair Ferreras-Copeland mentioned,
13 accounts of working groups to address issues of
14 school planning, siting and overcrowding is taking
15 public feedback through the council's website. The
16 link can be found in the DOE's executive capital
17 budget report. I encourage members of the public to
18 submit comment. Before I conclude, I would like to
19 thank the staff of my committee: Elizabeth Hoffman
20 and Caitlin O'Hagan, our finance analyst, ?? our
21 counsel and Jan Atwell, Joan ??, Kalima Johnson our
22 policy analyst for the committee. I would also like
23 to thank Millie ??. I would also like to introduce
24 my colleagues. I think everybody so far has been
25

introduced, if I'm not mistaken, and who have joined us this morning. I'm sorry, Margaret Chin is here. Thank you, Margaret, for being with us as well and thank you again and we welcome to hear the Chancellor's testimony. I think we have to swear her in.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Good morning Chairs Ferreras-Copeland and Dromm.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chancellor, we have to swear you in.

[OATH ADMINISTERED]

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Good morning Chairs Ferreras-Copeland and Dromm and all members of the Finance and Education Committee here today. Thank you for the opportunity to testify on Mayor de Blasio's Fiscal 2018 Executive Budget as it related to New York City Department of Education. I am joined today by Raymond Orlando, the DOE's Chief Financial Officer. To begin, I would like to thank Speaker Mark-Viverito, Chairs Ferreras-Copeland and Dromm and all the members of the city council for your continued leadership and partnership on behalf of our 1.1 million students. This Administration is committed to ensuring that all students, regardless

of where they live and where they are from or where their parents are from, have access to an excellent, equitable education and I am proud of what we have accomplished so far on behalf of the city's students. Last year's graduation rate, 72.6 percent is the highest it has ever been while the dropout rate, 8.5 percent, is the lowest it has ever been. New York City students also outperformed the rest of the state in the state ELA exam for the first time and our overall improvement outpaced the rest of the state in both ELA and math. However, we still have a lot of work to do. That is why the equity and excellence agenda is crucial. Through equity and excellence we are addressing our students' academic, social and emotional needs starting with our youngest learners until they earn their high school diploma and receive a college acceptance letter. There are at least 800 schools with one equity and excellence initiative this year and this initiative will grow over the year. I would like to share some highlights. Our universal literacy initiative has over 100 reading coaches and by the beginning of September will have over 200 coaches and these are called teacher whispers. These are teachers who have been highly

vetted. We receive a tremendous amount of applications. We are in the process of interviewing now for September and they work exclusively with the K to 2 teachers in the schools they are assigned to and we are moving from four districts to 14 districts starting in September. Teachers are strengthening their math instruction in over 200 elementary middle and high schools through the Algebra for All. We are starting this work in fifth grade and will ensure that all eighth graders have access to algebra. This is particularly crucial if when they can get to high school they can have a sequential three year math program which we know is a determinate of success in high school and in college. This year we have received over 600 applications for training by teachers in the Algebra for All initiative and we expect this program to be one of our more successful ones in terms of increasing our math training. Our college access role initiative is making college and achievable expectation for all students. In particular we have eliminated the CUNY application fee for low income students. On April 5th, we held the first ever citywide SAT school day when all high school juniors in the city of New York were able to

1 take the exam in their own schools with their own
2 teachers during the school day. This is a remarkable
3 achievement and the fact that it was free egged it on
4 but was not the most important factor. They did not
5 have to travel to unfamiliar locations, sit with
6 unfamiliar teachers, and by doing it in their own
7 classroom the rate of success and their teachers
8 preparing them was much higher. An antidote I'd like
9 to share is last week I went to Ryker's Island, East
10 River Academy, and one of the teachers of the year
11 was in that situation and the students gave me a card
12 which I will actually save the rest of my life
13 because they told me that this is the first time
14 ever, ever in the history of Ryker's, where they were
15 allowed to take the SATs and the take on this is not
16 just the SATs but they have hope. If you believe in
17 kids and you let them take the unspoken messages, we
18 think you can go to college so it was very touching
19 to see them. They now have a library, they have
20 beanbags, they have other ways of expressing
21 themselves so I see this as a big success. Last year
22 we saw record number of students who took at least
23 one AP class, participation and performance gains
24 were the largest for black and Hispanic students with
25

an 18 percent increase in the number of black students passing at least one AP and a 10.8 percent in the number of Hispanic students. Our AP for All initiative which is bringing new AP course to 63 high schools will eventually ensure every high school has access to at least five AP courses. I saw our Councilman Ydanis Rodriguez here before, he's here, okay. One of the reasons I'm saying this is that one of the first schools we did this is one of his pet schools, George Washington High School, and in that campus alone there were very few AP courses and now that the kids can take AP courses in all the schools on that campus, the number of kids accessing this has really tripled, the number of kids who actually take the courses. So you can be in one of the small schools but take a course and it involved those people who know high schools, making the bells schedules equal in all buildings which is nothing short of a miracle so we are very happy with that. The AP for All expansion this year increased the number of AP courses again at Leeman as well and Leeman has been one of the cornerstone model campuses in terms of the things they are doing. Computer Science World initiative will ensure that by 2025,

all of the city's public school students will receive high quality computer science education at each school level: elementary, middle and high school. We will be training over 5000 teachers over the next ten years. I recently visited PF62 in Queens where computer science is taught in all grade levels through project based learning and Brooklyn's PS376 is integrating computer science esteem at each grade level. I went to visit that school on a day they were sharing what every grade is doing and I had a first grader doing coding and I went over to him to see if I could figure out what it was and I was glazed over by the time he went into his third sentence and he finally looked at me and said, Chancellor, I just think you are too old to learn this, and I take exception but, you know, he's probably right. But, these are schools that we have now made learning partner schools, model schools, and we are sending other people to visit them so we can more rapidly grow the stim program across the city and as I get visitors from across the country, they are amazed with is how much of the stim we have put into our elementary schools because that only raises the bar by the time they get to middle schools and

high schools. The single shepherd initiative in District Seven in the Bronx and District 23 in Brooklyn is showing promise. This program serves all 16,000 students in 50 schools and provides them with a dedicated counselor or social worker who will guide them on the path to success. Guidance counselors are able to spend more time and be proactive. These guidance counselors do not serve a specific grade. They serve a specific family for seven years so this becomes an extra member of your family and as Councilman Dromm heard on Saturday, we are working with someone from CASTLE, which is a national social and emotional learning organization, and what is really important is that every student in our schools have a personal relationship with an adult outside of their own family. It is important that all students feel that there is someone who really cares about them. An antidote on this program. I went to visit one of the programs in District Seven. The principal said he expects this year for the first time ever to have 100 percent teacher retention because of the single Shepard. In this school alone, there are eight people who do nothing but either be social workers or guidance counselors for the students in

the building. It's a six to 12 school and he said because teachers now can spend more time on teaching and where all the family, social and emotional issues are handled by somebody who is an expert they feel more comfortable. So that is a whole other point of success. Also with the District Charter Partnership Program, district and charter schools are coming together to share best practices on instruction particularly when it comes to English language learners and math instruction. We know schools throughout the city are making progress. Across renewal high schools, we have seen a seven percent graduation rate increase over the last two years. In addition, all renewal school attendance is up, chronic absenteeism is down and the teachers are developing strong instructional practices. These schools are receiving clear guidance on the progress that they need and one of the things that we see happening in all of the renewal schools stronger parent relationships and student lead conferences becoming the norm where the students actually come to talk to the teachers with their parents and going back, the message is the same to everyone. We are expanding the number of community schools. Last week

we announced 69 additional schools will become community schools in September. This will bring the total number to 215. We have received the national award which we will be accepting in June as a model city for community schools and one of the things in our community schools that is not often mentioned is the fact that they provide a tremendous amount of health support: mental health, physical health. This is where students get free eyeglasses but it is also where students who are deemed to be in need of extra support either due to depression or other issues, this is where the support comes out of and I believe that our community schools, particularly in neighborhoods where they may not have a lot of other services are crucial. Safety of our students is our highest priority. Every student in new York City has the right to attend a public school and we are committed to protect them and they receive a high quality education. In January and March, we issued guidance and resources to families regarding immigration and protocols and as you may have read this week, we actually went to a school to reinforce at the school that in terms of federal officers they may not enter our buildings, they may announce

1 themselves at the front desk but they then wait
2 outside while the principal or whoever is greeting
3 them receives further information and we have been
4 reassured by the agencies that we spoke to that this
5 will indeed be the pattern going forward. The DOE is
6 also partnering with Mayor's Office of Immigrant
7 Affairs and other community organizations to offer a
8 Know Your Rights workshops available during and after
9 school across the city. Generous funding from, city
10 council has enabled us to provide intensive
11 restorative justice programming in 25 schools, all of
12 which has seen a decrease in suspensions. Also with
13 city council funding for the first time, our schools,
14 communities will benefit from the programming and
15 support of a gender equity liaison and I heard you
16 loud and clear Danny and you should know we are
17 working on giving Jared a person to work also with
18 him out of the Family Engagement Office because what
19 we are seeing very clearly in this work is that it is
20 not just about working with teachers and
21 administrators but families are a crucial part of
22 moving forward so part of the training will be under
23 Jared, someone in Yolanda Torres' office to help them
24 with the work. We want to increase civic engagement,
25

voter registration and participation among high school students and I know for a lot of you that is an initiative and last year we were able to register a lot of high school students and we expect to do that again. We are pleased that our increased emphasis on parent engagement has resulted in significantly more parents attending conferences, parent groups and running for their CECs. We have held native language family engagement conferences in Spanish, Bengali, Arabic and Mandarin. We have also studied grand connections and engagement group for grandparents in December 2015. This is particularly close to my heart because as we go around the city we notice that many more grandparents are raising their children. These are not like me sometimes helping, these are grandparents who have a full responsibility to raise their children and they have asked for special support A, due to their age and health issues but most importantly reengaging with grandchildren after they haven't been in charge of children for many, many years and that is one of the initiatives under the Family Engagement Office. In addition, we are incubating two new initiatives, the Family English Initiates where parents not only learn

English with their L students in grades K to 2, but they pick up skills and information to support their learning at home. This year, 75 families from four schools are participating. Second is Space Lab, esteem education training program where parents learn to facilitate robotic activities with teachers in the classroom after school and this has recently received a grant to be able to teach parents more about stim that they can then help in their schools but also perhaps even increase their own job skills. Face Lab is currently in 18 schools with over 80 parents and just last week, we had over 500 parent coordinators attend a professional development at their New York Public Library to prepare themselves for engaging parents to attend Summer in the City work. To better reach the nearly 40 percent of our parents who speak a language other than English at home, we have significantly expanded and improved language access service for our families. Changes include designating and training a language access coordinator in each school, hiring nine new full-time field language coordinators to oversee services in schools and expanding services to CECs and providing schools with direct access to over the phone

interpretation in over 200 languages 24 hours a day, seven days a week. The change to over the phone services result in schools making over four times the number of calls as before. I remain committed to working to improve educational opportunities for all Ls and ensure they have access to rigorous instruction in full range of educational opportunities within the DOE. We currently have 434 bilingual programs across every borough and are adding 68 more this September including the first ever bilingual program in ERDUE ?? and expanding Bengali bilingual programs at elementary and high schools. As a former L myself, this work is very personal and I know how crucial these programs are and the difference they make in the lives of our students. As recently as last week, we hosted two national speakers on dual language and bilingual programs and they shared with us that we are looked at as the model in the country on how to expand more dual language programs. Our commitment to meeting the individual needs of our students with disability remains a focus for the DOE and is evidenced by the growth of our ASD programs and EST programs and ASD Horizon and bilingual special ed programs. This year

we opened 28 additional NEST and Horizon in district schools, seven new district schools opened NEST or Horizon programs. I would like to highlight our partnership with the Cerebral Palsy Foundation and NYU Medical Center around the Just ?? initiative celebrate the diversity of students with disability and strengthen school communities. This is a program where schools of color are located. District 75, [inaudible 00:29:52] agree to points of intersection on at least five issues: instruction, lunch time and play time and there's one -- parent engagement. These schools with share teachers with each other, they will share instruction facilities and they will work more towards making sure that services are provided equally to both. As an example of this, I went to visit Canarsie High School which is co-located with one district 75 school and one of the points of success is the principal said this year for the first time District 75 students are taking AP courses in one of the other schools. That wasn't available to them because there weren't enough kids in their program by themselves to take the course but by sharing they have access to this. Increasing the diversity of our schools and classrooms is also a top

1
2 priority. We will be releasing more information on
3 this work before the end of the school year and I
4 look forward to continuing this important
5 conversation. CTE, Korean technology, also a key
6 part of our strategy to put students on the path to
7 college and careers, to that end we are investing in
8 40 new high quality CTE programs opening this year
9 and across the next school year. We are also
10 strengthening the number of existing programs. In
11 addition, city council funding has allowed us to
12 significantly expand and strengthen work based
13 learning opportunities including paid internships
14 with students enrolled in CTE programs. We also
15 received news that last week the state has approved
16 more certifications for CTE teachers which is crucial
17 for us expanding this work and that also means that
18 many more of our students will be graduating with
19 state endorsed diplomas which will make it easier for
20 them to enter the work world. The 2018 executive
21 budget includes an allocation of approximately 30.8
22 billion including 24.3 billion in operating funds and
23 another 6.5 billion of education related pension and
24 debt service funds in 2018. Our funding is a
25 combination of city, state and federal dollars with

city tax levy dollars making up the largest share at 57 percent, state dollars at 37 percent and federal dollars at six percent. The Mayor's proposed 2018 budget for our school builds on this administration's progress and continues the historic investments made in previous years to ensure that students have access to rigorous instruction, nonacademic support to boost student achievement. It also makes additional target investments in all our schools. The recently announced 3K for All initiative builds on the success of Pre-K for All and provides New York City children continuum of early care and education from birth to five years old. 3K for all will begin in the South Bronx District Seven and Brownsville District 23. We're also helping families enroll in existing seats for three year olds across the city. I just want to make a point here that the reasons these, because it answers some of the questions you brought up prior, the reason these two districts are chosen to begin with is that they do have the available space without us having to search for more space in addition to which in many of these two districts they are also single Shepard districts, so we feel that the continuum of service for three year olds for right

1 through high school and into college is -- really
2 makes a lot of consistency possible and really forms
3 a strong foundation in those districts. As part of
4 our ongoing partnership with the Administration for
5 Children Services around supports for all students
6 and particularly their younger students, their Early
7 Learn New York City contracts will be integrated into
8 the division of early childhood to create
9 consistently high quality standards across all of the
10 publicly funded childhood continuum. This is
11 expected to support better transitions to elementary
12 school and we are pleased that the Mayor has
13 contributed 20.1 million in his executive budget to
14 improve the quality of early learned programs. I
15 also want to be very clear that this was not
16 something that we did recklessly or just at the top
17 of our heads, this took involved many years of
18 conversation and also very interesting conversations
19 with the new commissioner who really actually put us
20 to the test of finding our why we were going to do
21 this and we were able to actually satisfy him that
22 our commitment is just a start with kids,
23 particularly with literacy issues as quickly as
24 possible and also helping parents get parenting
25

skills even before age four so this is all part of our process and we expect to continue that relationship. This year we are implementing several new initiatives to support the academic and social and emotional needs living in temporary housing. We hired more tenderness teachers and social workers, are implementing literacy programs and shelters and providing school based health services. Additionally, the city launched a program to provide yellow bus service to students in grades K to six who reside in Department of Homeless Shelters. Next year's budget provides funding to continue these initiatives including providing social workers and schools with the highest concentration of students in shelter and after school tutoring in the shelters themselves. We are working to ensure that school can remain a constant stabilizing force in these children's lives. Last year for the first time, our summer program served high need second graders. The budget includes funding to expand this program to serve an additional 4400 second graders this year and due to the comments we got from last year, the program will actually run till 5:30 so the parents can see it as a full day program, academic till 2:30

and wraparound services from 2:30 to 5:30. This has been done in conjunction with Bill Chong and the Office of Youth Development. Often we have worked in cross purposes and we are combining our resources to make sure that it is one seamless program. We are investing over 16 million to provide better and faster internet service. Internet speeds will improve in all school buildings by the end of 2020 school year. Lastly, we are tackling an issue that I know is important to many of you by committing providing air-conditioning in every school that is without one by 2022. Beginning in 2018, I know Mark this is one of your pet projects, I know, I know, in each subsequent year we will see at least an additional 2200 classrooms receive an air-conditioner. Since 2009, the state has not met its court ordered obligations under the Campaign for Physical Equity and in this school year alone, New York City public school students have been shortchanged 1.6 billion in state education funds. Over two years, we raised a citywide average fair student funding from 88 percent to 91 percent. In addition, we are funding all renewal and community schools at 100 percent and no school in New York City

1 is below 87 percent. We are committed to reaching
2 100 percent for all schools but that accomplishment
3 can only be realized if the state keeps its
4 commitment to fund CFE settlement. While we are
5 confident that we are headed in the right direction,
6 we know that there is a lot more hard work ahead and
7 I look forward to partnering with you in building
8 upon this work alongside our educators and families.
9 I thank you for your time and look forward to
10 answering your questions.
11

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
13 very much for your testimony, Chancellor. It
14 included a lot of good updates that we have been
15 excited to share some of those victories with you. I
16 am going to ask a first round of questions and then
17 the Chair will ask his questions and then we will
18 have members ask theirs and we will come back for a
19 second round. I want to talk about Early Learn 3K
20 for All. So we understand there is there is
21 transition from ACS to DOE and if you can explain to
22 us why this makes sense, right, I, I just for the
23 record because we understand that it will create like
24 a systematic you come in at three and you're going to
25 have the same type programming so if you can walk us

1 through the thinking between moving from ACS -- the
2 Early Learn Program from ACS to DOE.

3
4 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think first and
5 foremost it was meant to strengthen both of us. ACS
6 has tremendous amount of responsibility on their
7 plate and one of the things that I think this is
8 going to help them focus on some of the issues
9 particularly in terms of childcare and abuse cases
10 and foster care, whatever those issues are they will
11 be able to devote a lot more to it. The other thing
12 that research shows us and that we have seen
13 certainly with the Pre-K for All is that the earlier
14 we get students in some form of academic setting the
15 earlier we can start working with their parents the
16 more likely they are going to be successful students
17 in our schools. So by being able to pilot in two
18 districts working with three year olds -- the other
19 thing with the three year olds and for any of you who
20 have children, you know, sometimes the most important
21 skill that they are going to develop at that age is
22 verbal ability so we feel that if they are in a
23 public school setting or even offsite that is still
24 directed by the people who are doing Pre-K, their
25 language development is going to be increased

substantially so we are even seeing that in schools where they already have a Pre-K but they have available seats we will actually mix the three year olds and four year olds. I know my daughters went to a three four year old program where their vocabulary is enhanced by having older children in the classroom. The other thing is also that we feel that for many of these children, the kind of support we can give that has literacy connected to it that is not strictly babysitting or daycare because this is not going to be daycare all day long is going to be able to also hold the teachers more accountable for the kind of work they do with the students so we expect to be retraining all the teachers that work with three year olds the same way we retrained all the teachers who work with four year olds and we also expect to have the same kind of supervision over the teachers and the programs that we are doing with the Pre-K. We will continue to work closely with ACS on other issues but the idea of having the parenting componing [sic], the student componing [sic] -- components and even the family engagement as a whole component, I think makes a tremendous amount of sense.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And we agree. Is there any agency issues, not agency, but I guess certification issues in the transition, class size? Does 3K require less students, you know, than universal than kindergarten so what are those challenges that --

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Those are the things that we are working on one at a time. Yes, class size will be different. The three year olds will be 15 students in a class and if they are combined with four years old, we will probably revert back to the 15 in those co-located sites. That is mainly because also three year olds need more help in terms of putting on their coats and hats and everything else in the wintertime so that is part of it. I think also in terms of how we -- the youngest children of both DOE and Board of Health in terms of the sites that they need, need more access to bathrooms and, you know, so forth. So that is all the stuff we are looking at which is another reason we started only with two districts so we can get it right and these can become the models for how we move this elsewhere but I think in terms of -- again, more nap time. I mean a three year old doesn't have the same stamina

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: My three
year old doesn't take any naps.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I wish he would.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Yeah. But I do think that it is a different -- every grade, every age has a different -- and we are working with it and I think that is one of the things that I really appreciate about Commissioner because he was very clear about what the things he wanted to make sure we were going to do and that again even with the kindergarten when we did four year old we insisted that any teacher who applied to work had to be retrained. They go over the summer because it is not the same thing to get down on your knees and play with the child as it is to stand in front of a classroom and do something else. So I think I can really assure you that on the

1 PD, we really have put certain things in place and
2 also working with existing sites that serve three
3 year olds. I mean many of the sites are the same
4 ones that are serving the four year olds so just a
5 matter of instead of working with these two
6 classrooms just walking down and working with these
7 four classrooms. So this will be a work in progress
8 but I am very confident that this is the right way to
9 go. Many years ago when I was a superintendent, one
10 of the programs that we started was meeting with
11 mothers who just gave birth in hospitals and we
12 worked with Literacy Inc., to ensure those mothers
13 went home with books to read aloud to their children
14 that they had a certain guidelines about what to talk
15 to your children about even though they are just
16 born. So I think that this is just our way to say
17 when it comes to learning that there -- it is never
18 too soon to start.

19
20 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And you
21 mentioned the Health Department. What is the Health
22 Department's role in this transition and I guess the
23 certification is it now the DOE is partnering with
24 the Health Department --
25

CHANCELLOR FARINA: We are going to follow the same rules that the ACS Services used but it is more the DOE -- the Board of Health role is more in terms of space, how big is the space, access to bathrooms, that is really -- and we did that with the four year olds and I don't anticipate a problem especially since we are starting small enough that we can grow it.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So some of the childcare providers and I never thought I'd be as Chair talking about potty-training but that's where we are, we are working with three year olds now, some of our very young babies are not -- they are babies, toddlers, aren't necessarily potty-trained at three. So does that pose a different challenge with the three year old siting will families have to be -- will children have to be potty-trained to participate in 3K?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Keep in mind that most of the students that will be accepted are already in a school in a setting so it is going to be using the same teachers and that is another reason why you have the 15 versus the 18 class size and also

when you work with three year olds you're expecting that --

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND:

Everything, yeah.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: -- including accidents in the classroom.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Yes.

Just wanted to make sure. And how many of the existing Early Learn providers already have contracts with DOE?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I can't answer that.

RAY ORLANDO: Hi, Ray Orlando. I'm the Chief Financial Officer. When we looked about 70 percent already have UPK contracts so we think that is going to be super helpful in moving the initiative forward.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Great.

Commissioner, do you -- Chancellor, I'm sorry, do you foresee how we can begin to resolve or look at, you know, we partnered both Council Member Dromm, myself and other of the very challenged districts that have overcrowding, we are still trying to site universal Pre-K so if we have that as a challenge and just K through 12, so we have challenges siting K through

12, challenges siting universal and now potentially and we are really excited to hopefully make 3K part of the citywide programming. What can we do starting now to be able to start thinking creatively with the space limitations that we currently have.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think the reason we picked the first ones is specifically because there was space available and keep in mind that even for the ones we project for the next three years in all of those districts there is not a lot of space like to put in a school but there is certainly enough space to put an additional classroom. I think it is also going to be important to start looking at how space is used, how it is utilized, you know, are the rooms all -- for this particular age group my feeling would be in a school they should be definitely on the first floor or the second floor at the top, you are not going to put these kids on the fifth floor of a building because they can't do that. I think it is really going to be a realignment of existing services and I think it is an opportunity in the districts where there is special need and central Brooklyn is certainly one of them. We have received nothing but overwhelming support from the superintendents, from

1 the principals who are eager to do this because they
2 feel it is going to make the kids really have an
3 advantage by the time they get into four years old so
4 any good idea has a lot of challenges and we are
5 certainly meeting this but by doing it in two smaller
6 districts we think we will develop a pattern going
7 forward that is going to resolve the issue that
8 you're talking about.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And also
11 I think it is an opportunity and we are going to be
12 discussing this in the task force that we are doing
13 with FCA and DOE to kind of reevaluate as you
14 mentioned the existing space, like what are we doing
15 with existing spaces, is this the most efficient way
16 and if we are going to need new wings and expansions
17 then we should start working on that now so that by
18 the time we wrap up and have the 700 million that we
19 need, because I know the state is just going to give
20 it to us, they are very eager.

21 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Right, fingers
22 crossed.

23 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So I
24 wanted to transition to immigration and talk about
25 state funding and then I will have the Chair continue

his questioning and I will come back with the rest of my questions in the second round. A federal immigration agent came to an elementary school last week to question a fourth grader. The agent was not allowed in the school building since DOE has a policy in place to turn away federal agents without warrants. We applaud both the Mayor and yourself for clearly making this decision and how timely and right it was. Unfortunately, it proved itself to work, right? That is probably the one thing you didn't want to see if it worked but it did. What is the school doing to continue to protect the students who ICE wants to questions and what are schools doing to ensure that all students in the school feel safe and how are parents feeling because that was the one thing that right after elections in districts like both the Chair and I it was total panic, parents didn't understand, didn't know and it is kind of a double edged sword, right? It's is great that the child was protected but it also kind of reinvigorated that fear of oh my God they are actually going to come to the school. So how do we communicate for calm and safety?

CHANCELOOR FARINA: I think first of all I want to make the record clear. It was not an ICE agent, wasn't even a Homeland Security agent. It happened to have been an agent who was trying to verify information for special benefits under green cards and still would not have been allowed to go in buildings. So I think that is one of the things that has been miscommunicated. I purposely went to the school yesterday to reassure parents and ask parents how they felt. It was very interesting that most parents do feel the school is a safe place and were comfortable bringing their kids. Where I think we still need to do some work, although I think we've done a lot of it on this, is how do parents feel themselves about leaving their homes and going to other events. One of the things we have been carefully monitoring is parent attendance at evening events. We have now put out Know Your Rights workshops across the city and we move them from mostly at night to some in the afternoon because that seems to be parents rather go to those workshops when they pick up their kids at three o'clock and move into one of those. So I think that is all true but we have really put out enough messages after the

1 event that took place last week, we have reinforced
2 by letters to all principals in the city. In the
3 past we are training mostly administrators and now we
4 are training everyone in the building including
5 custodians about what they need to do should this
6 happen again but I understand that we have been
7 reassured and I know Leesha from immigrant affairs
8 has been in touch with the federal government that
9 this was really something very out of the ordinary
10 and that it won't happen again. But I think letting
11 parents know going out in public, I have a town hall
12 meeting tonight in a district that has some of these
13 potential issues and we constantly reassure parents.
14 We take their questions. I think Pace, which is our
15 parent engagement office, has really done a fabulous
16 job on this but there are always going to be parents,
17 depending on their status, who are going to be
18 somewhat leery and on the other hand the single
19 shepherd that we talked about, one of our students
20 who is undocumented just received a four year
21 scholarship to college because of the single shepherd
22 in District 32. So we are seeing a lot of success
23 stories mixed in with some of the obvious, I don't
24
25

know if I would say fear, but unsettlement among some of our parents.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right.

We are still dealing with that and it's that. It's a very wide range of anxiety and just fear.

CHANCELOOR FARINA: Right.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Where parents aren't necessarily feeling the safest. So thank you for sharing about the earlier afternoon and it probably feels better to be walking in daylight than at night. It is probably another very important reason why parents are doing that. I wanted to talk about state funding. How can DOE raise the base level of funding in light of the lower than anticipated state funding and how much additional funding is needed to fund all schools at 100 percent of their funding level?

CHANCELOOR FARINA: I'm letting my budget person answer this.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

RAYMOND ORLANDO: Ray Orlando again, Chief Financial Officer. Good morning. SO in the absence of the sufficient additional state aid in the budget this year we are unable to raise the fair

1 student funding for this year so it will remain at 87
2 percent in the upcoming year. If those of you with
3 longer memories and financial bents will remember
4 that the first year the floor was at 81 percent and
5 the subsequent year we were able to raise it to 82
6 and then raised it to 87 in the current year where it
7 will unfortunately remain. It would cost, I want to
8 say, three-quarters of a billion dollars or more to
9 bring all schools to 100 percent of fair student
10 funding.
11

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Three-
13 quarters of a billion?

14 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I know
16 this is a smaller percentage but when we are talking
17 about new needs and faced with this challenge, what
18 was your thinking between presenting this list of
19 important we understand new needs as opposed to kind
20 of what was your thinking between doing that as
21 opposed to putting that towards making up for the
22 state funding short?

23 CHANCELOOR FARINA: I think one of the
24 most important things is that we are really finding
25 that the next place to invest our money is embedded

teacher preparation. If you have better teachers who can do the kind of work like our literacy coaches, if you have teachers who are working, coaches who are working with all teachers so that all children can read by the end of second grade we have made a major thing and that to me is worth the investment. The same thing with single shepherds. The longer I stay in this job, the more I realize that social, emotional learning is as crucial as academic learning. If we don't invest in that kind of support for students, that is what increases the dropout rate and so I do think having these equity issues and I also want to say this is by far not the answer but we have invested a lot more time and energy in going out for support from the foundations. For example, out science for all, half of it is being funded by private funders. We are looking at a lot more grants. My Brother's Keeper has brought in a lot of money into the city into individual districts to work on the lower achieving minority males in particular. We have looked for funding sources outside the regular parameters and will continue to do that. We have applied for a major grant which we will be finding out soon that is going to help us with a lot

of the other issues so I think we have to be a little bit more creative but I don't ever want to give up professional development for teachers over anything else because that is what impacts better student performance and ultimately allows us to increase our high school graduation rate and college readiness.

If the more students that we get into college finish in four years or even five, the better this New York City economy will be and the better we will have done our jobs so that is the reason why the focus is still on growing some of the programs.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And you know there is a very big budget implication when young people are not prepared for college so even if they are graduating, you know, we have the vice-chancellor testify from CUNY and say the level of remedial courses that young people have to -- young adults have to pay for as they are leaving the public school system is alarming so it costs families more because they are not able to immediately invest in college courses but it also creates this anxiety for the students because they don't want to be in college taking remedial courses so I think --

CHANCELOOR FARINA: You couldn't be more right and I -- Borough President Otto was in the room?

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: He just stepped out.

CHANCELOOR FARINA: Let me tell you what we are doing in this particular area because you are absolutely right. We need more of a consistency between the colleges and us. For example, the more AP courses you take the less college courses that you have to pay for so we are finding, let's use Leeman and George Washington Campus, many of the students who now graduate this year are going to need one less year of college which is going to save money but they are also going in to prove in successful in doing college level work which wasn't true years ago because we only had the AP courses in certain zip codes. The other thing that Staten Island has done which we are now using as a model for the rest of the city is asking universities to become more fully involved in the high schools themselves. So Staten Island, for example, they have three universities and each of them has taken on one of the high schools and has embedded their professors and their services in

the high school. In Port Richmond High School, there are guidance counselors from Wagner College living in that school so we need to stop making the separation between high school and college a wide gap but close that gap. We are meeting on almost on a monthly basis now with CUNY but also with private universities. What can you do to help our schools to make sure that as you offer scholarships to the kids or as you help the teachers get them better prepared but also what are you doing at the college level to prepare your teachers to be the kind of teachers that are more interactively working with our students. The days of being Electra at the college level and expecting 300 kids to take notes and respond to your work doesn't make sense. The other piece that we are growing a lot is our CT, Career on Technology, and let me give you an example and I know this is a big, for some of you, we are moving programs such as on the Harbor School on Governors Island so when students leave they have an option. They can go to Maritime Academy, they can also become divers, scuba divers, they can raise oysters. We are getting kids ready to go and join unions if that is what they want or they can go to college but they have an option

1 they can work their way through college. I am sure
2 many of you worked your way through college as did I.
3 So how do we make sure kids have options? I think
4 that is the word. Also, whatever option they choose
5 that they will be successful at it. This means that
6 we need to work a lot more strongly with our
7 universities. We actually now have partnerships
8 under Deputy Chancellor Weinberg where we're meeting
9 not only holistically with all CUNY but individually.
10 Queens College in particular, I have to praise, is
11 doing some phenomenal work in working with English
12 language learners and that particular college has
13 taken on leadership in working with My Brother's
14 Keeper and so I think there is lots of work to be
15 done here but my goal is to not start talking
16 graduation rates but college readiness rates and that
17 is the gap that I want to close this year and I think
18 we are on the way with the AP courses and the close
19 up coordination with universities.

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

22 Thank you very much, Chancellor. We have been joined
23 by Council Members Gibson, Rose, Maisel, Gentile,
24 Garodnick, Barron and Lander and now we will hear
25 from Chair Dromm.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much, Chair Ferreras-Copeland and you're going to laugh but thank you for talking about potty-training because I think it is so important that we realize that are students are human beings and that we have to meet their needs as they come into the school system and I think sometimes our discussions on education are too focused around budget, it's around test scores, it's around everything else but when you have a little three year old walk into the classroom and he's got to go to the bathroom, you have to deal with that first and foremost and I think that goes along with a lot of the work that the Chancellor has been doing. I was fortunate on Saturday to attend the conference on social and emotional learning and I was very inspired by the speaker there, Tim Shriver, who talked about meeting the needs of our students as well and if we don't meet them we pay for it later on actually in the classroom so we need to take that time to be able to deal with those emotional needs and the questioning on immigration as well and even the single shepherd are things that I think are really important to discussion about education so that kind of leads me as well to the issue of community schools

1 because I am also a believer in community schools and
2 so I have a few questions around that and, you know,
3 the Mayor has announced that, you know, one of his
4 signature initiatives is to transform how schooling
5 is done in New York City and the council of course is
6 very happy with that. How much is the DOE currently
7 spending on community schools and what is the
8 increased cost for the 69 new schools?

9
10 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Is this on? Can you
11 hear me?

12 CHANELLOR FARINA: Yes.

13 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Great. In the current
14 year the cost of the community school program is \$112
15 million.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: We understand that
17 there were several community schools that existed
18 before the Mayor's initiative was launched. Would
19 the additional of these 69 schools are there still
20 community schools operating outside of the
21 initiative?

22 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Yes. There are a few
23 schools outside of the portfolio that are exploring
24 the strategy and there were about two dozen maybe
25 that were doing community school type work and we're

sharing capacity and building resource with them and working with them as well.

CHANCELLOR: FARINA: Let me just add that one of the things about community schools that we have made universal, the ones that were, the ones that are and the ones that will be, is that they need to be embedded during the school day. This is not an after school program. It is not about the kids who can't do x, y and z. This is about how do you support and that is why the RFPs with community based organizations ask, do you have an academic component to this, do you have a social, emotional component, do you have an art's program? We really want to see that community based organizations bring something else to the table and particularly family counseling has been an important part of this. So I would say that we've done a much better job in making sure that all community schools serves certain things equally no matter whether they were the past of the present. I think the other thing that is important is that depending on the site there are always going to be some unique features to the site. For example, at 188, which is right here in downtown, because a large number of homeless and shelter kids one of the things

1 the principal requested and God, she wanted washing
2 machines and dryers in her community school because a
3 lot of the kids do not have access to clean clothes
4 and this was an important part. She has also done
5 something which I can't praise her enough and she is
6 also getting an award in Washington for what she's
7 done as a model community school that her children
8 are involved in community projects to help people in
9 other places so we need to get away from this victim
10 philosophy in our schools or these poor people
11 because I really resent that. I think a lot of our
12 kids in particular are there through no fault of
13 their own so it is about how do we help them become
14 more productive and in this particular school the
15 kids were experimenting with mealworms and they were
16 going to develop recipes to send to other countries
17 to hopefully help them with some of their issues. So
18 I think community schools are resources to the
19 neighborhoods. The other thing is that now
20 principals now get to pick the community service
21 provider they want to work with and our expectation
22 is that the community service provider and the
23 principal together will develop a plan, how do what I
24 do benefit what you do, and we have a whole range of
25

-- all community schools have an outside support person whether it be Children Aid Society, UFT, there is a whole range. I went to see one called WDECO (SP) in the Bronx, phenomenal work but they also have the ability to go and knock on people's doors. One of the major reasons that we put some of these in our renewal schools is that attendance was an issue and they spent all summer long going to the schools where kids register to go knocking on doors and say we expect to see you there in September. This is not the capacity that a school is ever going to have so I do think by picking them very carefully, making sure it is a right match between the school and the provider and making sure the criteria of services is the same for everyone we will be in a very good place in September.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Very good. My next question is really around the New York State Community School Grant Initiatives Schools. I think last year we lost about -- 12 schools lost their state funding last year and the DOE assumed the cost for them. The remaining 13 have contracts expiring this year. Are we going to be able to in this budget pick up those 25 schools?

RAYMOND ORLANDO: I believe that is going to be part of the discussion that we and you and OMB have as we move towards the adopted budget.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Are you separating them out from the pas? Are you dealing with them on two separate issues like because we did provide the additional funding for the 12 last year?

RAYMOND ORLANDO: I believe those schools are part of our ongoing discussion.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Has the first cohort of 12 schools permanently been folded into the city's community school initiative?

RAYMOND ORLANDO: Yes, they are receiving the same supports as the other schools in the program, yes.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But they are not going to be part of the 12 --

RAYMOND ORLANDO: The first group, the group we picked up this year yes, have been integrated into the community schools work. The second groups remains to be seen.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And I guess we are going to continue to discuss the cohort two schools?

RAYMOND ORLANDO: For sure.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Moving forward, okay.
How many of the 25 schools are also renewal schools?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: All renewal schools
get community school support and will continue to do
so.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So regardless of
whether or not it was the state funded community --

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Yes. The renewal
schools all have that, yes. The answer is yes.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. So if we
continue to provide contracts or extend contracts for
these schools, can the DOE ensure that the CBO in
place with remain if both the school and the CBO
would like to continue working together?

RAYMOND ORLANDO: As the Chancellor
mentioned, the programs will be integrated into the
community schools model so if the principal and CBO
they are currently working with assuming that between
now and when the budget gets adopted that the --
those groups of schools are funded in the upcoming
school year, I think we would expect that those
relationships would presumably continue assuming both
parties are happy.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you also answer the same thing with the beacon schools?

RAYMOND ORLANDO: I'm sorry I don't --

CHANCELLOR FARINA: The beacon.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So I have School 149, 149 in Jackson Heights, which was a beacon school, Good Will was the sponsor, they dropped out because they don't believe it's their mission any longer and the principal is now in the process of making a choice about what group to work with and that decision is solely up to the principal?

RAYMOND ORLANDO: I'm sorry, I will have to look into it.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Danny, I think, if we -- my feeling is I will look up this particular case, if the principal is not on board with the provider, chances of the program working are reduced substantially so to me having a principal who invites -- one of the things we've asked is that the CBO in all our schools be part of the principal's cabinet that discussions take place simultaneously so I would say I will look into this one but the reality is I expect the principal to play a role in choosing a provider so they can work more closely together.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Good. So last year the DOE received 28 million in community school foundation aid set aside funding. For Fiscal '18, the DOE stands to receive 60 million in state community aid, an increase of nearly 30 million for the community schools. What did the DOE do with the funding they received last year?

RAYMOND ORLANDO: The community schools, the \$28 million, the legislation required us to show the state that we were spending \$28 million on community schools as part of the current year's budget which we were able to show. We expect to be able to again show in the upcoming school year that we are spending that level of resources on the community schools.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What does the DOE purpose to do with the purposed funding for Fiscal '18? There was an increase on the state level and community school funding of I believe about 50 million statewide but we don't know -- do we know how much the city is getting yet?

RAYMOND ORLANDO: No, I believe it is competitive so it remains to be seen. I don't think there is any guidance but stay tuned.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Will be applying for that funding?

RAYMOND ORLANDO: If eligible, yes.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you provide us with some information about the programs that are the mental health programs, the eyeglass foundations, the things that are available in community schools? Do you know who those folks are who are providing some of those services?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Well Warby Parker is the eyeglass provider. They also do the eye exams in the schools and that has been particularly successful. I think also when you think about some of the things that kids lack for becoming better academic students, not being able to see is major especially if you have an eye strain and then you don't like reading because it is too strainful so I do think that has been very productive. I think one of the other things we are seeing some good results on is the Thrive New York initiative in the lower grades in terms of mental health. For parents, this is not -- any of the clinics, particularly the high school clinics, kids can self-recommend themselves if they are feeling depressed or anxious or stressed or

any one of those. I was just in one of the clinics where the students just have to sign in their name, they say what time they are available and someone sits and talks to them. We are increasing those. We just saw a health clinic, I believe it was at George Washington, is that one of the places we saw the new health clinic there? So I do think having the services at the local level makes a really big difference. I think also having difficult conversations with adults in the buildings, like the teachers, how do you change your teaching strategies. That is one of the things that Tim Shriver said very clearly, you can't teach a lesson without knowing how the students in your class are reacting to the lesson. They are coming with all kinds of things in their backgrounds or whatever so how do you make the classroom a good place for them to be able to be receptive but also for parents, we are getting a lot more parents coming into the school saying I need such and such. Many of our districts are forming closer relationships with their local hospitals. I know District Seven for example has started working with Lincoln Hospital and having a lot of the doctors from Lincoln Hospital come in on a regular basis to

1
2 give lectures and whatever to parents so I do think
3 we are working on all levels and I think it is
4 important particularly in places where there is a lot
5 of trauma to reassure people that school is still the
6 best place to be and the school will provide whatever
7 services they need.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Let's talk a little
9 bit about federal funding. The federal budget
10 reduced Title 2A grants for teaching development.
11 How will this cut affect federal funding the DOE
12 receives through that program and what will be the
13 effect on services and programs supported by this
14 funding?

15 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I want to say
16 personally this is the one place where I really would
17 be upset if the funding became too low. We have been
18 assured that the percentage of -- this funding will
19 not be taken out in its entirety. This is also
20 something that is a national issue so I am hoping
21 that a lot more places other than New York will
22 protest this. As of right now I think we were told
23 12 percent reduction which is not low but is not as
24 bad as it could be and the New York State
25 Commissioner has assured me on Saturday that she is

1 asking for a certain percentage of money in the state
2 budget just for professional development because this
3 is the money that gives us the ability to train
4 teachers and administrators on one of the best
5 pedagogical practices so this would be money that I
6 would fight tooth and nail to retain but I know the
7 Commissioner also feels the same way so I think if we
8 can at least fill in some of the blanks at the state
9 level it would help us.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. So in December
12 of 2015, President Obama signed the Every Student
13 Succeed Act, ESSA. Can you describe to us the
14 elements that ESSA and New York State plan and the
15 New York -- they just came out with a plan at the
16 state level, how, what does that plan look like and
17 what will it mean for us here in New York City?

18 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Well we are still
19 reading the fine print and getting a sense of what it
20 is. To me, the most important thing is that at no
21 point are they stressing that they will be making any
22 curriculum decisions. The curriculum decisions will
23 still be local and we have spent an awful lot of
24 time, energy and monies in developing curriculum over
25 the two years and now we have a stated New York City

1 Social Studies curriculum, which everybody is asking
2 for, we have a very heavily professional development
3 around all aspects of literacy. We are coming out
4 with a new program in September, Middle School
5 Literacy, sixth, seventh and eighth grade with all
6 instructions for teachers so I think that the fear I
7 had is we would go back to a more prescribed approach
8 and that doesn't seem to be the case. I think we are
9 looking to see where we have a little bit more
10 ability to make certain decisions would be in terms
11 of our compliance issues, in terms particularly about
12 testing for English language learners. Does it make
13 the most sense to test students the first year that
14 they are in this country or would it make more sense
15 to test them after their second years? So these are
16 the things that we are still looking at, what does it
17 say and where do we have some wiggle room or
18 negotiation room and everything else. I have a
19 committee trying to be much more specific but right
20 now it is so vague that it leaves a lot up to the
21 interpretation.
22

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How much funding does
24 New York City anticipate receiving from the ESSA
25 grant?

RAYMOND ORLANDO: Sorry, I have it in a few pieces but the Title One, Title Two and Title Three are the major pieces of the federal funding and the total of Title One is 650. There is another 85 in Title Two and another 36 in Title Three. Sorry, I didn't do the math.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: A lot of the Title Three money is going specifically to English language learners which are a major population in New York City and that is also what is helping us with our dual language programs, our new bilingual programs and in particular with some of our summer programs that we are putting in the summer for Richmond for English language learners. I think sometimes we forget because you don't speak English doesn't mean that you're not a gifted student or whatever so I think that is an important part of our initiative.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Before I turn it over to my colleagues for questions, one of my request and one of the things I was a little bit disappointed about not seeing in the budget was some money to support the tremendous work that Jared is doing and I would really like to see a budget line there for the LGBT liaison so that he can continue to

do the outreach that he has done so I hope moving forward that will be part of our discussions.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Certainly.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Chair Ferreras?

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you, Chair. We will not hear from Council Member Rodriguez followed by Council Member Kallos followed by Council Member Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Chairs and Chancellor, thank you for everything and the whole thing like I can say in Lower Manhattan we have witnesses the difference when we have a Chancellor who is an educator and as we know, it is difficult to move our city and move our system. Sometimes we [inaudible 01:15:37] being in classroom teaching high school, I told my students I believe that the percent of Latino with a college degree was like 13 percent and I told my student that in 30 year from now we move that number to 20 and 25. We should celebrate because, you know, to put together the pipeline and be able to say we can make our city a middle class city is not an easy thing to do when three years ago the prior director he say we live in

a city where close to average close to 50 percent of New York live on poverty line. No, I remember working together with a colleagues, she used to be a teacher, established in high school and she say when I got to parent's meeting I have to be ready to explain to parents there why their son average is 97 and what is my plan to bring that 97 to a hundred but also those parents they ask about what role can you play to accomplish this goal together. So we know that is the difference that is the city where we are, you know, it not only what happen in the classroom, Danny and I both been teachers, it what happen after three p.m. It is the quality of after school program. Any middle class or upper middle class, we live paycheck by paycheck because we invest in whatever is there [inaudible 01:17:14] and robotic in swimming in soccer in anything that make a difference in the child so, you know, it is like when you are the teacher in a school since they are kindergarten they know how to read, of course you will look good because you took like student group population that is not same one you taken ins school that they are in first grade and they have trouble recognizing their names so and that is what we have built as a city for

decades and that reality cannot change and I have seen, I used to Chair the Committee of Higher Education and I always say don't ask me about why we are getting 89 percent of student going to community college taking remedial courses in reading, writing and math, those graduating from New York City public schools. So my approach is about we cannot look at high school unless we have a strong pipeline and everyone recognize. This is not about we advocate for the poor New Yorkers, these are private sectors they should recognize that they need to continue investing more because if we build a stronger middle class it will be good for everyone and I think that is, for me, no doubt that computer for all, UPK for three years old. I remember being in Albany and we were talking about some former assembly member saying we need to get funding for kindergarten for all and they would say you crazy, do you think we can get the funding? So here we are saying, poor child in the South Bronx, in Washington Heights, in some places in Brooklyn, you have the right to be enrolling in UPK and, you know, we should the definition. That's not daycares. Sometimes we look and we talk about what

1
2 is your child going, what he or she be daycare? It's
3 not daycare.

4 CHANCELLOR FARINA: No, it's not.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: That's where
6 real education is happening so again for me, big
7 changes, great investment, high expectation because
8 poverty cannot be the reason or the excuses of why we
9 believe that our children are failing. You know, why
10 those children getting boring, why they cutting
11 classes, why they don't want to go to classroom at
12 8:30 in morning, so those for me are the questions.
13 One thing I would say was once I hope Chancellor that
14 under your legacy we make after school mandated for
15 all elementary children. You know, cannot be we have
16 this program and they are expanding this because we
17 know it again. For me I fight for whatever I know
18 that my children will be fighting for working for and
19 I know that, you know, I used to be in the DOE when
20 it was like in October the principal gonna say we
21 \$20,000 put together after school program so how can
22 we keep improving the quality of the school program
23 and how can we also guarantee that after school
24 program is mandated for all elementary students?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Honestly, it comes down to money, very simply so I think in terms how we look at priority we certainly encourage principals and it's interesting because one of the courses that we now put out for principals is how to manage your budget more effectively because there is some money in schools, particularly Title One schools to rethink where you are investing your money and if after school programs make sense and they are a specific programs that are more likely to be part of your schools then that is really something schools can make those decisions. The other thing is also to look at programming. Those of you who are former teachers understand but sometimes you can get money just by the way you program your school. Teachers have to work a certain amount of hours per day but they don't all have to work the same hours so we have been encouraging principals to think about if it makes sense, for example, to have some after school programs at four o'clock because there are some of your teachers that could be programed particularly in middle school and high school to start later in the day without breaking any rules but I think it is about being more creative but I think -- I want to

pick up on one thing you said. It is all about expectations which is why I sometimes get worried when we use the work poverty. We have to say all students in the City of New York should have the expectation that they could be anything they want to be and if we start with that as a premise and then work backwards, let me just give you an example of more creative thinking. One of the things I've asked, I think Elizabeth will share it later, we have increased the number of PSAL programs in all of our schools particularly in co-located schools. One of the things I asked Eric Holstein, who is fabulous at this, is to start looking at which of the scholarships for college that are not being utilized the way they would be, one of the sports, for example, did you know that one of the sports that many of our colleges offer scholarships for is lacrosse so if we can put in courses that will also bring kids to school because they have something else they can look at, ultimately it is another pathway to college that is part of it so expectations to me is really important and I think also what we need to know is that we now have in every zip code in New York and you know this wasn't true before, master

1 teachers and highly effective teachers. This tended
2 to be sometimes more in some parts of the city than
3 others but we have been able to get teachers to apply
4 to work in certain districts that no one was applying
5 to before. We have a special new teacher center
6 initiative center in the Bronx, across the whole
7 Bronx, to bring in more teachers and also higher
8 teacher retention in areas where in the past they
9 were revolving doors. So expectations are crucial
10 but expectations by everyone: the principal, the
11 teacher, the parents themselves which is why I
12 believe in more parent education so parents know what
13 is appropriate behavior at certain ages and what do
14 they need to be able to support their children. SO
15 we will continue to work on this.

17 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: We have
18 now been joined by Council Members Salamanca,
19 Deutsch, and Johnson. We will now hear from Council
20 Member Kallos followed by Council Member Treyger
21 followed by Council Member Gibson.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you Finance
23 Chair Ferreras-Copeland and Education Chair Dromm for
24 your leadership. Chancellor Farina, I will ask you
25 as always about school seats and lunch. I look

forward to no longer asking your those questions as we achieve those victories. A quarter million out of 780,000 public school students who are eligible for fare reduced price meals do not participate, school lunch participation rates drop from 81 percent in elementary to 61 percent in middle school to 41 -- 38 percent in high school with requests from the Speaker, City Council Budget Response, support from CSA, UFT, ??37 include counts on fully funding universal school lunch with \$20 million to get \$59 million from the federal government this year.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: This is a conversation that is ongoing and we will continue to have but I want to reassure as I have in other meetings, no child in New York City is deprived of lunch ever. 76 percent are entitled to free lunch and those who may on a given day or week or whatever not have the required money will get food. I will put out a memo [inaudible 01:24:34], which is what I do, to make sure that all principals understand that the cafeteria workers are and should be giving out lunch to any student who needs it. I think and I said this before and I have worked with some of you, you know, in committees, to me the school lunch

cafeteria environment is as important as some of the other things that we are doing and I know that we have picked seven schools to years ago to be models and we started by redoing the cafeterias and I was just sharing with you that one of the schools in Coney Island have redone the cafeteria, has increased the kind of -- the salad bar and other things and she said she went from 800 students middle school getting lunch to almost 1100, Ashley Marie Bender School, so I am happy to take you to visit this but I will certainly put in writing to all principals that no child at any time should be deprived of lunch as long as they are on the lunch line.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: SO I think just along those lines just making sure that it is an official memo that has contractual binding rights so that local 372 lunch workers are able to provide this and they will not be penalized in any way and I think along the same lines that no member of the school may engage in billing or collection practices for families or children who receive food for free in the cafeteria without paying.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I am going to -- the first one I can do. The second one, I will let you know.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay. I think it is just important.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: The first one has been in practice -- I was a principal for ten years and this was common practice and was common practice across the whole entire district and when I was superintendent and had 184 schools, common practice. So I will make sure but I will get back to you with whatever we put out on writing by the end of the day.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you. I also want to thank you for agreeing that the Upper East Side needs school seats at the preliminary budget [inaudible 01:26:26] hearing we learned from DOE that there were 900 four year olds that applied for less than 600 seats on the Upper East Side. We had a rally for school seats with Controller Stringer and Public Advocate James, Borough President Brewer, Senator Kruger, Assembly Member Steve Wright and Court, Council Member Garodnick, parents and children. Has Department of Education made any

progress in opening new school seats on the Upper East Side for this coming school year?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Well I was just told there was 700 applicants awarded 500 seats and my feeling is again if you give me another three weeks. Generally what happens is parents on the Upper East Side have safety seats. They think of Pre-K as sort of like college and may apply to more than one place so I think a month from now we can review this and see if those numbers are still there. We can review this and see if those numbers are still there. We will make sure that we do this. We've added 90 seats to the Upper East Side and --

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So how many total seats are we up to?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: 497.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So that is less than last year? Last year we --

CHANCELLOR FARINA: No, we added -- it went from --

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: We lost seats. We lost seats so when you took away the seats and then added 90 we actually lost 22 seats.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Again, I noticed PF6 has two additional and they had none when I was principal there so anyway. Go sit over there.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So I think one of the --

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I'm going to have to --

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: We are actually losing seats on the East Side this coming year versus gaining them so just whatever we can do to open previously offered seats and then working with community based providers who are willing to provide full day seats and I think we could get another 160 seats tomorrow if DOE is willing to say yes to the community based providers and forcing the schools to offer certain seats that were offered previously.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I am going to let my Pre-K expert answer.

[OATH ADMINISTERED]

LUCAS TAYLOR: I'm Lucas Taylor, I'm the Executive Director for [inaudible 01:25:28].

LUCAS TAYLOR: So the 90 seats we've added are since this last April. As you know we have lost the seats at Wagner Middle School which was a

one year arrangement. This is not yet incorporate the seats that we will eventually gain as we convert class size from 18 to 20 by adding the additional pair professional in each room. We are continuing to work with DSDA to identify any possible space that can be used for additional Pre-K capacity and we will be putting out the RFP in the summer and we would certainly hope to work with any community based providers that are able to provide additional full day seat in the Upper East Side.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So I guess I am just disappointed that there aren't additional seats from where we were before and just I am relying and counting on you Chancellor, please, take care of these four year olds so they don't have to commute down here. It's a 45 minute commute o a very crowded subway and it is just not the right place for four year olds.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: We will definitely look into it.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you. We will now hear from Council Member Treyger followed by Council Member Gibson followed by Council

Member Chin and we have been joined by Majority Leader Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you both Chairs and welcome Chancellor and again I want to begin by commending you and your staff for the commitment for air-conditioners for all classrooms. This has major ramifications for public health for learning even for -- I know it presents testing issues, summer school ramifications and that's a big deal and I appreciate that. Just have some questions, Chancellor. The first topic is I continue to hear feedback from school communities with regard to over the counter students that come on after the October register and they are not particularly English language learner students with IEPs that they are not receiving funding for and this is a practice I remember back in my days of teaching that still existing. Sometimes there is friction between principals and high school admission about this issue but I think the real issue really is that schools welcome the kids but they need to welcome the funding to meet their needs so if you could speak to this to where we're at to make sure that we are providing

these schools with the resources they need to meet the needs of these students.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think there are several things that, and maybe the general public doesn't know this, school funding is given on student enrollment by the end of October 31st. So any student that comes into school after October 31st to some degree is non-funded. That doesn't mean that we don't fix it because the other thing is also a lot of students leave as well as students come in but in terms of over the counter students, we are monitoring this much more heavily. We started last year so that every school, particularly high school, gets a fair share of what is happening in that neighborhood and we have been monitoring so closely that I have been very clear with our high school principals that this is not in their hands, more essentially done now than it used to be in the past and we want to make sure that all of our schools have their fair share of English language learners as well as special needs kids. Si think we are monitoring it a lot more carefully. Anyone -- by the way, [inaudible 01:31:50] to email me on any of these issues. The schools that were complained the most three years ago

1 I think you will find have said okay, things are much
2 better. I will give you an example also that our
3 welcome centers are summer. Welcome centers I have
4 now encouraged principals to actually attend those
5 centers over the summer to recruit students so that
6 it doesn't happen at the end but it is actually part
7 of September so, for example, if Franklin K. Lane
8 reopens a one room enrollment for the summer so as
9 parents come to enroll their kids, the principals in
10 that building, there are five of them, can rotate
11 welcoming them, encouraging them to come. We are
12 looking at other issues of funding, what is the right
13 number, let's say by the end of December, that may
14 generate something else but certainly if you have
15 IEPs or other needs there will be teachers that serve
16 those needs. You want to --

18 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Sure. I just want
19 to add that for students of IEPs we take that
20 snapshot at 12/31 not at 10/31 so for the general ed
21 kids we take the snapshot at 10/31 so --

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: What happens if
23 there --

24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: If there are kids
25 who show up after January, unless it is a situation

that Carmen and I are aware of and talking about and pay attention to, we are sensitive to the fact that children with IEPs may show up or their IEP may show up post 12/31.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I have hear for example that some schools have received over 40 students since January 1st all English language learners and some of them have --

[cross talk]

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Mark, in cases like that, really principals should email me directly because we get [inaudible 01:33:25] and there was one school this year there was a big immigration pattern in this particular neighborhood and the challenge for us was that these were kids coming as an uprising in their country and the students were coming with no prior written language at all so these are challenges that we try to face on a case by case basis but when this happens by all means let us know and we try to fix --

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I will be more than happy to follow-up with you and I appreciate that Chancellor. I am going, in the interest of time, am going to get my two last questions in. I

1 have more but and then you feel free to respond
2 afterwards. With regards to lunch forms, I know that
3 again while I was teaching many schools relied on and
4 forgive me if the practice has shifted since but
5 schools rely on lunch forms to qualify for Title One
6 funding with this new Administration where people are
7 -- even before this Administration people were
8 concerned about returning those forms in but now it
9 is even worse with the fears and concerns, what is
10 being done to make sure the schools are not being
11 unfairly really hurt because parents and families are
12 afraid to return those forms and the last question I
13 had before the bell rings is teacher recruitment and
14 retention at UPK sites and the future 3K sites.
15 There were some reports about many pf the providers
16 having serious concerns about recruiting teachers
17 with regard to pay issues and salaries and issues
18 which I am sure is still to this day so those are the
19 two questions I have.

21 CHANCELLOR FARINA: We haven't seen a
22 drop in forms. I think parent coordinators in the
23 schools have taken this on as one of their jobs and
24 we have pretty much retained Title One status. The
25 only thing that happens with Title One as you well

1 know, it is a federal form -- percentages so we have
2 to watch that very carefully. In terms of teacher
3 retention, it actually has been quite the opposite.
4 We have received a lot of applicants for teaching
5 positions even outside the city so I think we are in
6 a very, very good place. We anticipate this year's
7 teacher retention citywide to be among the highest it
8 has ever been. We received a national award recently
9 for our dropout of teachers is seven percent. It is
10 one of the lowest in the country so I think we are
11 becoming to be more attractive to many people.

12
13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: But this is for
14 the UPK sites?

15 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay.

17 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Across the board.

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Council
19 Member Gibson?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very
21 much. Good afternoon, Chairs. Thank you, Chancellor
22 to you and your staff for all the work you do. I
23 certainly want to thank you for your commitment. I
24 stood with you and the Mayor a few months ago with
25 school safety to make sure that we affirmed our

1 commitment to protecting all students regardless of
2 status and I think in light of the environment it is
3 even more important that everyone is on the same page
4 in terms of teachers and our professionals and other
5 support staff to make sure that we are protecting all
6 students while they are under our supervision so I
7 thank you for that. I just had a few questions and I
8 wanted to ask quickly about the language access and I
9 see that we are expanding Bengali bilingual programs
10 which are incredible because of the diversity across
11 out city. I wanted to specifically ask about
12 District Nine in the Bronx. We have a high
13 population of students that are from West Africa and
14 I have talked to you about that to identify ways in
15 which we can really incorporate more bilingual
16 programs. I think a lot of the bilingual services we
17 get are for many of our Latino students which is
18 great but I also wanted to see what are we doing
19 about students of West African descent?

21 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think this was the
22 group I was alluding to before that a lot of the West
23 Africans students that are coming in do not have a
24 specific written language and we are looking at how
25 do we do more language acquisitions through visuals.

1 I mean, the superintendent there and I have been
2 discussing. One of the programs we have been
3 discussing more oral approaches to teaching of a dual
4 language so I think this is definitely on our radar
5 and now we are seeing another part of the city with
6 some of the same issue but the other thing is we
7 talked about how do we get information to parents,
8 the parents of those students and we actually have
9 someone who is developing a visual message, you know,
10 in terms of using pictures and so I think this is a
11 challenge but we are up for challenges and I am happy
12 to discuss this with you further.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay. Great.

15 CHANCELLOR FARINA: But we do know that
16 challenge exists.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay. Single
18 shepherd, I spoke to the superintendent at District
19 Seven, very proud of the work there. How long do we
20 access the success and measurement of the program
21 before we expand to other school districts? So we
22 are now in D7 and D23 in Brooklyn.

23 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think this is
24 something that obviously cost factor always comes
25 into it. I think we have a tremendous amount of

1
2 positive antidotal. We are looking to see and also
3 to measure it by does it stop dropout rate, does it
4 improve students who are applying to colleges, not
5 necessarily get but applying and so those are things
6 we should be able to figure out by end of this year,
7 beginning of September and once we get a better idea
8 of what the successes are then I will be able to give
9 you a better --

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, great. I
11 appreciate your commitment to working with so many
12 students in temporary housing. District Nine has a
13 high concentration. I know we have hired literacy
14 coaches, attendance monitors to reduce absenteeism
15 and to make sure that families are, you know, working
16 with many of the shelter providers and social workers
17 but I also wanted to ask within the shelter
18 population many families are victims of domestic
19 violence so keeping them in their home community may
20 be a concern so how do you identify those particular
21 cases to ensure that students are not traveling an
22 hour to school but making sure their safety is never
23 compromised. How do you work with the shelter
24 providers in that regard?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think to some degree it is parent's choice where they want to send their students to school. I will tell you that one of the highest level of students in temporary housing that we know with domestic violence is in a specific school and we have increased the amount of services in that school particularly to work with the adults but it is also interesting when we offer it as a -- sometimes the move out of those shelters, we have offered them other -- those parents all chose to stay within that school because of the welcoming nature of that principal and the teachers. So this is almost like a school by school decision based on that but we have put on more guidance support and we work very closely with domestic violence commission and we work with all the commissioners so as an issue if you have a specific situation I will be happy to look it up.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, great. And I wanted to ask two questions that focus on suicide prevention as well as the active recruitment to hire make teacher, particularly men of color and where we are with that and then my final question is the renewal school program and as you know in District Nine we are losing junior high school 145 on Teller

1 Avenue and we are working with the superintendent and
2 those parents of sixth and seventh grade but I wanted
3 to make sure the campus itself and the two remaining
4 schools we need support and when I say support I mean
5 money and we need resources and teachers to sure that
6 we uplift those two existing schools within our
7 District Nine.

9 CHANCELLOR FARINA: You gave me a lot of
10 things, let me see if I remember.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Suicide
12 prevention.

13 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Suicide -- a lot of
14 things come by my desk that I could get very upset
15 about but nothing gets me more upset than when a
16 child commits suicide because it is [inaudible
17 01:41:022] and the question we always ask ourselves
18 is what could we have done to prevent it.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Right.

20 CHANCELLOR FARINA: SO we have a
21 curriculum that we now have sent out, it's been a
22 while, but we really have asked teachers to have more
23 discussions on this. We also gave done more training
24 for parents on how to have these kinds of discussions
25 with their children at home so there have been

workshops for parents on this issue as well and the other and it is a bigger challenge for us when teachers recommend students who they believe are depressed or any number of signs because we do have symptoms to look for that sometimes families are reluctant to take the next step so we have been looking at that as well. But, this is something that is definitely on my radar. It is on the Deputy Chancellor Rose's jurisdiction but it is something she and I talk about a lot based on what is it that causes a child to do this and also to some degree the numbers have stayed steady over the years but one is one too many in my opinion. The male recruitment is under I Teach and Men Mentor. We have 100 males that we anticipate putting in our schools in September that are coming out of this particular training. All minority teachers -- some of them who are coming from other parts of the state of country to work here in New York City they -- we have also out in place which I think the align themselves culturally responsive curriculum to all new teachers particularly in the Bronx across the board as part of the new teacher training so that it is not just what your gender or race is but how do you deal with students when they

1 are in front of you and may not be like yourself,
2 whatever the like yourself means. So I think we are
3 trying to do this in multiple ways. We have also
4 started working with the university to see if they
5 can embed some of this work into their teacher
6 training program. We can't all be on our -- some
7 teachers should come to us prepared to deal with some
8 of these issues already so this has been a
9 conversation. We have a working group at CUNY and we
10 are also working with several private universities.
11 I want to say something about the site of 145.
12 Almost every student in that building was on a
13 regular basis with talking to the superintendent has
14 been assigned another place. The other school in the
15 building Bastian Millennium --

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: And Urban
18 Science.

19 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Yeah. Is doing some
20 fabulous work so I assume he will be taking more and
21 we have a plan that we are working on right now for
22 some of the space in that building to deal
23 specifically with District Nine issues which I will
24 be happy to discuss with you later because we are not
25 fully ready yet to make it public but I think it will

be something that will fit the needs of District Nine in a very special way and that I think you will be very happy with.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay. Thank you very much and thank you Madam Chair. I just want to go on record and add my voice to supporting universal free school lunch in our efforts. So thank you once again, Chancellor, and thank you Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, Council Member Gibson. We have been joined by Council Member Rosenthal and Council Member Cornegy. And now we will hear questions from Council Member Chin followed by Barron and Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair. Good afternoon, Chancellor. First of all, I just wanted to comment again that it really makes a difference to have an educator as Chancellor. The way you have been answering our question and knowing the program, it has just been great and we really appreciate you being there.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I understand it is a new trend in this country to hire educators as superintendents. Flabbergasts me.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: We should follow that trend. I was very excited to hear in your testimony about programs that you are focusing on English language learners especially the new initiative so you started off with 75 family, the Family English Initiative, so my question on that is focused on K to two. What about starting early for Pre-K, right, and when the K3 starts as early as we can I think that is where we should really bring the parents in so if their plan to really start it earlier and also what the plan of really expanding it as quickly as possible?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I mean again I will certainly take it back to, you know, again everything has a money cost. This one not as much but certainly important. Keep in mind, think about yourself as a teenager or even a fourth grader, do you really want your parents sitting in the classroom with you and I am just saying that is one of the things. So we start it young because we think the young kids will love having the parents in the room with them and if a teacher is teaching literacy to an early childhood the parents can be learning right along. This is something I had wanted to do years ago when I was a

teacher but I am certainly willing to take back the Pre-K idea. I don't know why we didn't start there but I'm happy to get back to you on that.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. I agree with you start as early as possible. Maybe by second grade might be -- the kids might not want their parents to be there. The other question I have is really like the core nation. I know that you increased the language at this program but you have other programs the universal literacy program for second graders. How are English language learner students also get incorporated into those other programs so that they don't -- they can also take advantage of it especially also when you talked about the stim program and the space lab program and all these wonderful initiatives that you're starting, we just want to make sure that all students will also be able to take advantage of these new initiatives.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: There is absolutely no differentiation for literacy coaches in schools across all these programs so all our literacy coaches get some training because they have to go for a two week summer intensive training. They get some training on how to work with L's and they get some

1 training on how to work with special ed so if you
2 have five classes on a second grade, all five classes
3 will receive literacy coaches regardless of whether
4 they ESL classes, L classes or special ed classes. I
5 think that is an important part of the program. I
6 have all the numbers on that because I actually had
7 my office break it down that way and that is one of
8 the reasons we started with the four districts to
9 ensure that we would be able to serve the needs of
10 all kids. As we go to 14 districts it has even been
11 more important but there is no differentiation among
12 the students in terms of getting the literacy
13 coaches. They just have to be trained on how to work
14 with the different student population.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: That's great. The
17 other program that I know you mentioned was the Grand
18 Connection and I think that program itself also has a
19 big connection to English language learners
20 especially in the Asian community a lot of
21 grandparents at the one taking care of the kid and
22 they should be somehow incorporated into the English
23 language learning part too even though they might be
24 grandparents they can still learn English and get
25 involved in that way.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Actually the Asian community both in your district and also in Flushing and other parts of Queens have been particularly receptive to the work that we are doing. We asked them what they wanted more help in and they specifically wanted more help on how to do parenting when they themselves might not have done it in the last 20 years. And if you read, there was an article in the New York Times recently about all the things that have changed like do you put your child on their stomach, do you put them on their back, but also what books do you read aloud to children which may not have been what they read to their children so the grandparent connection, the first time we met with them there was about 25 of them and we met with them in a bookstore and we met with them to really hear what some of the issues were and what we are finding is that more of their issues now tend to be around health issues for themselves and how to deal with their children's health issues. So we have been kind of working a lot more with some of our health providers because it was a very sad experience for me, I had grandparents who --

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I just want to add in my last question. I didn't hear anything about dual language programs so I --

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Oh no --

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: -- hope there are still plans on continue to expand because especially kids can learn -- learning a second language at a young age has got to be a priority in our city. You can finish the grandparent part.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: We are taking from the grandparents what they want more of and we now have an advisory team of grandparents that [inaudible 01:49:39] more of but I want to go back to the dual language. Now that there is some research that it keeps you from having Alzheimer's I think we are getting a lot more traction on this. Our biggest challenge with dual language and it doesn't mean we are backing away from it, is getting certified teachers. You know that. We have discussed it. We want to talk to the China Institute and how they can help us but the reality is that we are asking universities we have also asked the state if they would start considering reciprocal -- if you come from China and you have been a teacher in China, can

1 we get reciprocal licensing here in New York. So
2 these are all conversations that we are having but
3 the biggest challenge to increase more dual language
4 continues to be the ability to get teachers who are
5 fluent in two languages so otherwise I would love to
6 grow it. I would love to make New York City a dual
7 language city in its whole.

8
9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
10 you, Council Member Chin. We will now hear from
11 Council Member Barron followed by Council Member
12 Rosenthal followed by Council Member Cornegy.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
14 Chair and thank you to your co-chair and thank you to
15 the Chancellor for coming to present the [inaudible
16 01:50:49] of that. Ten questions, I guess that is
17 about 30 seconds per question, in terms of you cited
18 an increase in college readiness among graduate, CUNY
19 has said that there has not been a reduction in
20 students needing developmental courses and that
21 increases the time and cost to those students so
22 there seems to be a disconnect. I have heard you
23 talk about the programs that are -- you are working
24 with in conjunction with CUNY but how are we going to
25 ensure that we get students into colleges

1 particularly interested in black students because we
2 know that the DOE has had a major reduction in black
3 students, I think it is ten black teaching staff, I
4 think it is 10 percent over the last 12 years, the
5 reduction of the number of black teachers that there
6 are and also of course the significant reduction in
7 the number black students who attend the so called
8 elite schools so how are we going to address that?

10 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I don't know about
11 the specific numbers. I am happy to review it but I
12 would say that with the addition of the AP courses
13 that we are going to see students that are much
14 better prepared and we are actually have increased AP
15 courses more in minority -- in schools with a large
16 minority population because many of these schools had
17 absolutely no AP courses whatsoever if you look at
18 neighborhoods that in the past may not have these
19 opportunities. I also think that one of the things
20 that we are doing is increasing course work. For
21 example, increasing Algebra for all. By putting
22 Algebra in fifth grade, it is a game changer because
23 we know that Algebra is one of those courses that is
24 more likely to be a predictor of really good ability
25 to get into college and stay there. We are looking

1
2 at other programs that looking backwards say if you
3 take this course, like more writing courses, this
4 year we have increased the amount of writing in our
5 high schools because if you go to college and can't
6 write then that is a problem.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. We
8 know that there is a problem with lead in the water
9 in our schools. I was very alarmed when the deputy
10 chancellor referenced the fact that well it would
11 only impact the student who was at that first sip of
12 water, that first fountain. I thought that was very
13 insensitive and talked to a fact of a part of not
14 understanding we don't want any student to have
15 contaminated water so I think we need to look at
16 that. I was very disappointed that I wasn't able to
17 get from the DOE a printout of schools in my district
18 and what the report was for the lead. I was told it
19 was online, you can go on there and get it. I don't
20 think I should have to scroll through 50 schools to
21 find out which of my 50 schools have lead in the
22 water so I would like to get that as a printout for
23 my district and moving on to the 3K program that is
24 coming forward, do you think that a ratio of one
25 adult to 15 three year olds is appropriate?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Do I think what?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: A ratio of one teacher to 15 students, 15 three year olds is an appropriate ratio?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: They have a para.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: They do have a para?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I will say by the end of the day you will have a list of all your 50 schools.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. The renewal schools as we know were told they would have three years to bring their scores up yet only after about a year and a half of services one of the schools in my district that is a renewal school being closed, two others are losing grades six, seven and eight which like -- which carriers that title of truncation. What are we going to do with those buildings, that particular building, the [inaudible 01:54:36] school that is being closed and parents are told that they can select another school to send their child to and I would say to you since the

average reading score in District 19 is 19 percent on grade level in reading and 15 percent on grade level in math that we are sending students who are not performing well to another low performing school?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Many questions in one, let me see if I can answer them. First and foremost, you now have a relatively new superintendent who has made his focus instructional leadership. I have gone through this at several of the schools in District 19 and I think they are on the right path. In terms of closing renewal schools we looked at A, what is the potential that they will increase also what is the number of kids in that building, [inaudible 01:55:32] in particular had I think 100 and some odd children left. You can get a good education when you can have the money for a guidance counselor, reading teacher, whatever it is you need so I think the opportunity and by the way all schools that go through closure have an option of three other schools so they have gotten other choices and I am pretty sure that by now they must now where they are going but the last question that you're asking I think is really important. Truncation means that we looked at in K to eight schools, parents who

1 have students by the end of fifth grade who are
2 relatively successful will apply to go to a
3 standalone middle school or a middle school that has
4 at least 200 or more kids. What gets left behind in
5 six, seven and eight and we looked at these numbers,
6 you have less than 60 kids across three grades who
7 are probably the kids who are special needs or
8 English language or whatever that nobody wanted so I
9 am just saying the truncation to us is the way to
10 increase the K to five seats or Pre-K, gives us room
11 there, and the other students will be in place where
12 I think they will be better served but we do this on
13 a school by school basis. There is no universal rule
14 on how we merge, consolidate, close, the truncate.
15 This comes out of the superintendent, it comes out of
16 many factors but generally it is how will the
17 children be well served and that is really what I
18 look at.

19
20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. What
21 are the plans for the building?

22 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I can tell you but I
23 will have to go back and look at my sheet.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I can expect what
25 the answer will be. I can expect --

1
2 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Don't assume that.
3 We will get back to you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: If it's not what
5 I assume that it is, I will be shocked.

6 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Okay.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And Madam Chair,
8 your indulgence, in terms of the fair student funding
9 you said that no school is below 87 percent and I
10 read in your report for the renewal schools and
11 community schools it's a hundred percent but there
12 are some schools that are at 91 percent and I wanted
13 to know how we decided which schools would be at 91
14 percent as opposed to 87 percent and if you don't
15 have that that could be forwarded to us, I would
16 appreciate it.

17 CHANCELLOR FARINA: We will get back to
18 you on that.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: thank you. Thank
20 you, Madam Chair. I have other questions but my time
21 is up.

22 [off mic talking]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: Good morning, Madam
24 Chancellor, how are you? I want to start by actually
25 commending you and thanking you for the quick

response to the request for the implementation of
gifted and talented programs in communities of color.

I am blessed to have had a gifted and talented third
grade last year which appears to be doing well and
junior high school starting in the fall. I agree
with the third grade implementation as opposed to the
kindergarten because it gives us a greater

opportunity to assess a child's acumen so I am very
happy about that. I did want to talk to you about
the specialized high schools and the below average
participation of minority students. The Ivy Leagues
have a program now where they are doing a cumulative
entrance into Ivy programs which is inclusive of the
entrance exam but also the past history of the
student. So statistically I have been able to gather

that if we were to allow every valedictorian and
salutatorian into specialized high schools we would
double the amount of minority participation in
specialized high schools almost overnight. I wanted
to know what your thoughts were on that so I know
there has been tremendous negative push back as it
relates to doing away with the test. I'm not asking
that. I'm asking if we could look at the holistic
student and if we just took the top ten percentile of

1
2 junior high schools around the city and allowed
3 admittance of minority students it would increase
4 minority participation almost double overnight. I
5 wonder what your thoughts were about that.

6 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I am certainly
7 willing to talk about it and, you know, we can have a
8 one on one the way we have looked at other things.
9 It is certainly one of those things we have discussed
10 in the past. I don't have the specific answer to you
11 right now but we are coming out with something by the
12 end of the school year, June. I do want to say in
13 terms of the -- we started four programs this year in
14 third grade for gifted and talented and I want to
15 reiterate that the reason for doing this is so we
16 could use multiple measures so we had prior teachers'
17 recommendations, we have their homework assignments,
18 we had report cards. We were able to access these
19 kids which would also mean that they are more likely
20 to be successful. The other things that we told
21 every district but you superintendent got a head
22 start on this, that every district that we have
23 opened a gifted and talented in third grade should
24 have a middle school that is going to take those kids
25 by the time they get to sixth grade so we have a whole

1 chain that moves it and the same thing that we would
2 have high schools that would then for these kids
3 would have a special ability to get in so we are
4 looking at all that but the other issue I'm happy to
5 contemplate more of and I'm happy to talk to you
6 about it.
7

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: So I appreciate that
9 and we worked together again on other things and I
10 would like to work on that but I would also like to
11 look on making sure that for these newly implemented
12 gifted and talented programs, third grade and junior
13 high school that the resources match because some of
14 the parents who are considering gifted and talented
15 in my district are noticing a lack of resources to
16 meet the needs of the gifted and talented program so
17 that is something I would like to talk to you off-
18 line about.

19 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Okay. I think what
20 we need to know is that all the teachers who are now
21 teaching these programs, they are going to more
22 rigorous training. We have also put together an
23 advisory group of all the principals who have taken
24 on these programs, not just the new ones but other
25 ones. Anna Kamtanta (SP) in my office is responsible

1
2 for some of this work and we are looking to see also,
3 we have a partnership now with the New York
4 Historical Society and Hunter College to train the
5 teachers who are going to be the teachers in these
6 programs. In New York City, we have had I think in
7 the last three of four years, the need that teachers
8 who teach in gifted programs must be gifted and
9 talented certified. So our challenge is to make sure
10 we find the teachers who either have that
11 certification or are willing to be trained in that
12 certification so we are working on this. In terms of
13 individual resources, I am happy to discuss further
14 what is missing.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: Lastly, in my last 40
16 seconds, in my district we understand that the gifted
17 and talented programs are pipe line programs for a
18 lack of a better term to greater success and what I
19 have done is spent some discretionary funding to
20 partner with the National Society of Black Engineers
21 to get students ready for the exam. My colleagues
22 may not be able to do the same. I would like to see
23 the DOE make that same investment across the board so
24 that we can continue to have a pipeline and that
25 maybe members don't have to do that individually.

Another thing I would like to talk to you about off-line. There are groups who are willing to help --

CHANCELLOR FARINA: We have increased our mentoring programs. We have also working with historically black colleges in more extensive ways, particularly Staten Island. So we are looking at a lot of different ways to do this but the pipe line is there and the other thing that is happening which I think is what we really expected to see also is that for principals who don't want to lose their gifted and talented kids, that they have started putting enrichment programs in their own schools to keep the parents local so I think it really raises the ante for everybody.

COUNCIL MEMBER ??: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you, Council Member. We will now hear from Council Member Rosenthal. We have been joined by Council Member Reynoso and [inaudible 02:03:23].

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so much, Chair. I really appreciate this hearing and Chancellor it is great to see you as always. I do want to start by thanking you, you know, first for the school rezone plans in the southern portion of

1
2 District Three. I've been talking to your staff who
3 are looking at the numbers and it looks like the
4 integration that we are hoping for is going to be --
5 is going to happen which is --

6 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Yes. To have a wait
7 list at 191, not a bad thing to be.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Pretty great,
9 pretty great. So thank you for that. Similarly I
10 want to thank you, we've worked with your office over
11 the last year getting a memorandum of understanding
12 for review of the contracts and we now have a signed
13 letter and I really appreciate that and am looking
14 forward to that playing out with the additional
15 transparency. I think from last year's hearing to
16 this year's, we -- on our side we've seen some real
17 progress and have very much appreciated working with
18 your staff. I am seeing some of them and smiling at
19 them as we speak. Thank you. So that has worked out
20 great and I want to thank you for that. Following up
21 on Council Member Cornegy's point about the gifted
22 and talented programs being so helpful, that was
23 another addition that you came up with for PS191 and
24 that looks like we are having enrollment and that is
25 going to change the whole tenor of the school so I

1
2 guess that turned into a thank you as well. I want
3 to ask you about construction next to schools. I was
4 thinking should I bring this up at the SCA hearing
5 but it is really an expense thing and the reason is
6 because it is not about using the expertise that SCA
7 brings and how to build a school or how to renovate a
8 school, the issue really is when a building is going
9 up next to a school that already exists how do we
10 make sure that the principals know how to -- that the
11 principals can assure the parents that their kids are
12 safe and I am wondering if you invested at all in
13 coming up with a plan to do that. I spoke to the
14 building's commissioner who gave one suggestion that
15 we could require the builder to have a flag person at
16 each and every one of those building site locations
17 to make sure that when the trucks are going in and
18 out kids would be -- someone would pointedly be
19 looking out for the kids from the builders at the
20 builder's expense. He had a couple other ideas as
21 well and I'm wondering in this budget you've invested
22 anything in, you know, putting together information
23 for principals kind of like that.

24 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Well, it's an
25 interesting idea. I know right now -- you're talking

about 163, I was just there the other day. There are certain key times of the day when construction and school need to be matched: arrival time, any lunch time activity that takes place in the schoolyard and dismissal time. We have asked construction crews in other parts of the city to be aware of these three times. In addition, testing weeks are crucial. I think by having some specific guidelines Deputy Chancellor Rose has also assigned some people in her facilities team to be the liaison to the principal. The principal shouldn't have to drop everything to discuss anything with a developer but having a liaison we know have that already in our budget plan in terms of the person who will work with that and I know as a principal who had construction around the building just having someone, in my case it was the person in charge of custodian, just to take that load off when they were doing the pointing in the building and putting in air-conditioning and all that so I think we can be clear that New York City is a city on the move but that there are key times in a schools life that are more crucial than other so I think having said what they are and letting the -- whoever

is developing keep an eye on that I think that is important.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great. I appreciate your support of that and, you know, the parents at 163 have been spectacular about bringing this to all of our attention but I have two other schools that are facing this, PS75 could face it if the developer comes back with a new plan and that would be right across the small street, and now right on the corner of 70th and Amsterdam, a developer has put in plans for basically a 66 story building that would be built about a half block away from PS199 so that is going to be another location where we are going to need help and I really do think that as I talked to my colleagues in other boroughs, you know, we are lucky to have had the parent leaders at 163. I am not sure there are those type parent leaders at other schools that might be undergoing this. Thank you for your consideration.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. We have now been joined by Council Member Mark Levine who has questions as well.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Chair Dromm. Thank you Chair Ferreras-Copeland. Wonderful

1 to see you Chancellor. I know you have already
2 spoken some on topic that you and I are both
3 passionate about which is dual language education. I
4 am so appreciative of the strong support you have
5 given to this model which both offers something great
6 for children who are learning English but the
7 opportunity for emersion for children who can learn a
8 new language is also so impactful. You know this.
9 You've been very strong on that. Forgive me if you
10 have already discussed this one angle I want to ask
11 you about but there are additional costs for dual
12 language programs perhaps because you need to acquire
13 materials that are more expensive, may even have to
14 be shipped from abroad for example to get subject
15 matter in a foreign language and sometimes even as
16 translation service is done even of American
17 curriculum into the second language and at least some
18 schools talk about additional staffing needs because
19 to work it out with having an English speaker and
20 someone who can teach the content in a second
21 language depending on the size of the program can
22 require extra staffing and I am wondering if you all
23 have evaluated the cost of dual language programs and
24 whether you generally allocate additional money for
25

1 schools who are starting them and whether there is
2 even a top line system-wide number for what we are
3 spending on this.
4

5 CHANCELLOR FARINA: First of all, we --
6 when we put out RFPs for schools that want to do dual
7 language, we give them a year planning time. This
8 doesn't get started without any preparation and part
9 of the planning time is more training for the
10 teachers and the principals about what kind of
11 language allocation policy you're going to put in
12 place. Starting in September, I'm asking for a color
13 coded approach to language allocation. When I go
14 into a school, I shouldn't ask whether you have
15 English in the morning, Mandarin Chinese in the
16 afternoon. I should know by the color that is the
17 process you're using. Are you doing two teachers in
18 a classroom parallel teaching, are you doing Mondays
19 in one language, Tuesdays in another. So we need to
20 be very explicit on what we mean by dual language,
21 otherwise a lot of the money could be not used for
22 the process that we plan on so there is a lot of
23 training and most schools go through an entire year
24 of training of their teachers and their principals to
25 understand that programming does matter so that is

1 certainly number one. The other thing that we have
2 been very fortunate in is that a lot of our foreign
3 consulates and embassies are very energized around
4 this program so for example for our new program in
5 Williamsburg of Japanese, actually the Japanese
6 government and the first lady came in person to give
7 us a grant to buy materials in the native language.
8 Translating American books into another language is
9 not, in my opinion, the best dual language process.
10 The best dual language process is having the books
11 that are already written in the native language
12 because native language is also about understanding
13 culture. So I don't want to do Dick and Jane
14 American style for kids who are learning Mandarin, I
15 want to do whatever it is that culture thinks is
16 important so that becomes the kind of connection. We
17 have had the French government who actually honors
18 our principals of French every year in Paris and they
19 pay all the expenses and send the materials. They get
20 the French legion of honor. We now have the Italian
21 consulate willing to do things. A lot of our Arabic
22 materials are given to us by the Qatar Foundation
23 because they want to see their culture also so I
24 think in terms of materials we are always struggling

1 for more appropriate materials on the right reading
2 level because we are focused on that in our own
3 English literacy but I do think getting the
4 appropriate materials is difficult. I know Margaret
5 Chin invited me to something the Asian Society was
6 doing and I said if they could get more materials
7 written in mandarin that would be child friendly
8 based on some of the things we are using that would
9 be very helpful. So I think we are moving in the
10 right direction and by the way because New York City
11 is doing so much of this, I get letters all the time
12 from publishers, you know, we're willing to come on
13 board, what do we need to do so I just think this is
14 moving in the right direction but I would like to
15 move away because we have lots of translate. I mean,
16 corduroy comes in Spanish. Corduroy is corduroy in
17 English. So I want to see programs, books written in
18 the native language to make sure that the culture is
19 also so.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Well Chair Dromm
22 and I would like to be considered for the delegation
23 to Paris. We are available. In the last few seconds
24 left, is there any budget allocation, is there a line
25

in your budget for dual language or how do you look at this from a fiscal perspective?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: A lot of it comes under Title Three and Title One and someone asked before about the stim. We now actually have stim that is particularly ear marked for out English language learners. We have a special summer program in stim in District 32 that is primarily for English language learners because we find that English language learners learn English more rapidly when they are doing it with hands-on programs rather than -- so stim is a very natural way to do that but there are allocated lines. We can always use more money for the parent component for this but I am pretty happy with the funding sources right now if they don't dry up.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Chancellor. Thank you, Mr. Chair and Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you, Council Member. We are now going to begin our second round. This round is a little bit shorter. There is going to be questions between both Chairs that we are not going to be able to ask today so we

ask that you respond to it expeditiously so that we can use them for budget negotiation purposes.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: And I will tell you that is what we do at town hall meetings. I get to as many questions as I can. Anything you send to me will get back to you within 48 hours.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Sounds wonderful. ?? has projected savings by incentivizing schools to permanently hire teachers from the absent teacher reserve. You projected 10.9 million in savings for fiscal 2018 growing to 21.9 million in 2020. Taking those costs to schools to eventually shift this cost to schools I think after for years. For example, if the teacher was hired from the ATR pool, DOE will pay the salary cost for the first year. In the second year, DOE will cover 50 percent and so on and so forth. This is not the first time the DOE has incentivized schools to hire teachers from the ATR pool. What is different about this plan from the previous plan and how will DOE ensure the projected savings it's generating?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Okay. First of all, let me be very clear, that these are not all ATR teachers. These are select ATR teachers. What is

different from the past is these are teachers who are filling a vacancy. A principal says I have two vacancies and we have an ATR teacher who has the credentials for that vacancy. A principal key teacher for a year and says wow, this really worked out and we have examples of that throughout the city so by the second year that teacher is filling a vacancy but it is already money that is allocated to that school budget rather than our budget which is what is paying ATR separately. We have been very successful this year and expect to do more of this next year where these teachers are now going back into schools where the principal may have had a vacancy for a year or two so this is also based on principal decision. These teachers have to be rated effective or highly effective in order to be part of this pool so it is not all ATR teachers. It is a select group of ATR teachers who are going to be moving into this and it is also based on principal recommendations and also we hired now the former principal of Brooklyn Tech, Randy Asher, to led this work so he has actually personally interviewed all the teachers that would be in this pool and matched them with schools who have the need for them. It is

not an add-on person so it is not adding onto the budget it is filling a vacancy that already exists.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I guess I need to better understand the savings component of it from your perspective.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Right now, we are paying for many of these teachers and they are not necessarily on any school budget. They are on our budget. The intention is to ultimately put them on the school budget because they are actually doing the job of a teacher in that school.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And then the percentage bringing it down is why you see the savings -- okay.

[off mic talk]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So is there an overall reduction in ATR teachers?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: There is.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you know the number?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: It is a floating number but it is moving rather rapidly, yeah. I can give you the exact number though. I want to get the

latest by Randy Asher and Randy is working on this and this is his only responsibility.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So is the savings somewhat in the fact of attrition then as well that you are losing some of those --

CHANCELLOR FARINA: There are three different tracks for the ATRs. Partially what I said filling vacancies, there is also retirement and buyout and a whole bunch of different extras.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, okay. Thank you

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you. I wanted to talk about school lunch. As you know we've been asking for this for several years now and in several budget responses now we have all five I believe borough presidents committed, yes, all five of the borough presidents committed to this call, 82 percent of voters, New Yorkers, want this. Are you thinking about including this in the plan in the future, what are your thoughts on -- why wasn't this included in the executive --

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think everything can be discussed at some point. I just wanted to again be clear that students are not deprived of

1 eating lunch because of money. I promise Ben Kallos
2 and I'm going to do it as soon as I go back to the
3 office that we will reiterate to the teachers and
4 principals city-wide. To me the most important thing
5 is making sure -- where we saw a real need is in
6 middle school. The reason we did middle school free
7 lunch is that adolescents, because they are
8 adolescents, make certain decisions, you know, so we
9 thought having the free lunch in the middle school is
10 very successful. What we found in terms of increase
11 are the use of lunch was more or about as equal as
12 the environment as it was about the free lunch and in
13 schools where they don't have cap -- captive lunch is
14 where you're not allowed to go out for lunch and in
15 schools where they have the ability to go out for
16 lunch, that the students were not actually eating
17 lunch in school although it might be part of the
18 school program. I think this is a lot more
19 complicated but I am happy to continue this
20 discussion with your committee or anyone you want.

22 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So we are
23 going to continue to push, we believe in it.

24 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I'm sure.
25

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: But also it is interesting that you talk about students being able to go out to lunch. I think if you ask any young person I think they probably prefer to eat out because of the option so --

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I was a principal when I first brought the idea of having my, at that time, fifth graders go out to lunch starting in April, not all year long. They weren't mature enough in September. I got a lot of push back from parents but the beauty of having a going out to lunch under very strict rules, I had the police department engaged, I had parent workshops on this is it moves them toward independence and as they go on to the next level of schooling, be it middle school or high school, they are ready to manage their own time and their own behavior but there are a lot of rules and a lot of things put in place and a lot of it the kids split their own lunch. They would sit on the steps of the Metropolitan Museum eating lunch. They weren't necessarily going into the pizza shop, some were and some weren't. It is a matter of how you say may two days a week versus three days a week and it has to be managed but the end goal has to be moving

1 the kids to be more responsible for themselves. They
2 go to the next level of schooling that they have that
3 engrained in them. And many of them, honestly,
4 didn't eat when they went out, they just needed that
5 burst of being on their kind of, independence. Like
6 I said, I am happy to continue this discussion and we
7 have to look at also what is the cultural need about
8 eating. It is not just about the eating. One of the
9 things I was discussing with Ben, how do we look at
10 schools that start lunch at 10:30 in the morning. I
11 was in the school recently where they, in my opinion,
12 were starting lunch too early and half of the
13 lunchroom was empty because they had several schools
14 in the building and I said why can't you have lunch,
15 all ninth graders at the same time no matter what
16 school they are from. So I think lunch has a lot of
17 other issues that we can be talking about to -- are
18 cafeterias attractive places? That was in a school
19 recently where I gave the principal an idea and she
20 talk to my custodian, I talked to the custodian and
21 so we'll have it done by next week. So this is a lot
22 of issues but I am happy to further this discussion.

24 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Yeah, am
25 I agree. I think creating a more comfortable space

1
2 for young people to want to eat. Some buildings will
3 have that luxury. Buildings like PS19 may be in the
4 future with a new wing but right now it is already a
5 challenge of running programs in the cafeteria so
6 there is a lot -- our cafeterias are becoming more
7 about swing space in many cases.

8 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Right. What we call
9 [cross talk]

10 CHANCELLOR FARINA: -- lunch where you
11 have half eating and the other half class. Lunch as
12 a principal was always one of my how do we do this
13 better so I do think sitting down and having this
14 discussion is worth it.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And I
16 think there is something to be said and this is way
17 down the road but there is probably also cultural
18 sensitivity and giving people options of different
19 foods. We work really hard at making sure that our
20 seniors have the proper lunch when they go to the
21 senior center, clearly a much smaller population but
22 as we think about diverse ways of being able to
23 support our young people I think if we give them more
24 options we can see more engagement with --
25

1
2 CHANCELLOR FARINA: This is actually
3 something that is already on our radar so I am happy
4 to discuss that with you.

5 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND:
6 Excellent. Thank you very much. I just wanted to
7 follow-up on Council Member Barron's point with the
8 water testing. Obviously, this is something very
9 important to all of us for many reasons. Can you --
10 given the uncertainty, how did you reach the
11 conclusion that the fixtures were solely to blame in
12 some of these instances where you were testing where
13 the lead was high in water and that is kind of the
14 response we got that it was the fixtures as opposed
15 to piping or, you know, kind of what -- how did you
16 come to that conclusions?

17 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think that the
18 experts told us that's the reason for it. I can't
19 reiterate enough though that our water is really
20 safe. Every school has on their website what the
21 latest results were and I am actually going to be
22 given specifics and any of you who want it
23 specifically by your district I am happy to pull it
24 out that way and give it to you.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And do
you believe that just mitigating the fixtures will be
--

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I truly believe that,
yes.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And by
when will you be done with all the fixtures?

[off mic talk]

CHANCELLOR FARINA: We completed all the
testing so as of right now whatever the number is
that you have that is the number that it is. Again,
Deputy Chancellor Rose will have all the specific
numbers when she comes after me.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right.
Okay. Very good. Chair Dromm?

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, Chair
Ferrerias. I'd just like to go back for a minute
again to the Title Two A grant, teacher development.
I understood that Title Two A grant according to a
memo that Mr. Orlando sent out last year was
basically for class size reduction. Can you explain
to me why it is being used the way in which you
described it?

RAYMOND ORLANDO: Sure. Class size reduction is one of the major goals of Title Two A hence the allocation memo. The funds are available to be spent on hiring teachers, training teachers. There are some broad rules around Title Two A. The memo, class size reduction means this is a big basket of things that schools can spend this money on.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Plus the majority goes to that.

RAYMOND ORLANDO: Yeah, 97 percent of the money I think when we looked went to class size reduction activities which includes both the hiring of teachers and the PD.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So how many teachers would be needed then in order to reduce class size to level specified in the contracts for excellence?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: We'd have to give you that number but the reality also that these kids still involve is the space there and in many cases it is about having two teachers in a classroom or having an additional para. It is more complicated than that but we can certainly discuss that at the next committee meeting.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: SO if we were to hire the teachers that we feel might be needed, do you have type of estimate of what the cost would be for that?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Not at this time.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Let me go to another area of questioning then at this point. So one of the programs that the council has funded is the positive learning collaborative and we've done that with the United Federation of Teachers. Have you had an opportunity to visit any of those schools with the positive learning collaborative model in them? It is a restorative practices model.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I was in one the other day. We have many restorative practice programs. We have overcoming obstacles, we have TBIS (?) so they are all working in terms of lessening suspensions, getting teachers more engaged in working with their students but in terms of one program over the other having better success, we really haven't seen it. It is more about teacher training and having teachers, as Tim Shriver says, look at every child in the classroom as individual so I know that Carmen mentioned to me on Saturday as well but I

1 think there is a lot of different programs. We are
2 working with Morningside Heights on some of these
3 issues also so.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: SO one of the things
5 I think is true about the PLC model is that mostly
6 they are in elementary schools whereas the other
7 restorative money that we put in was for the upper
8 grades. Would I be correct in stating that?

9 CHANCELLOR FARINA: No. I think the
10 restorative justice is actually being used equally
11 across the board. I think --

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: In elementary as
13 well?

14 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Yes, because I think
15 the major goal particularly with -- is getting the
16 students to talk about their own opinions and really
17 feel voiced. I think with more of an older group is
18 the Overcoming Obstacle Program that is particularly
19 geared to middle school and high schools but I think
20 also we tend to have a different kind of teacher
21 training in the elementary schools to begin with so
22 it is a combination but I would say all the schools
23 that are in part of this are also requires that
24 principals be heavily invested and that they are
25

1 willing to change some of the culture in their
2 individual schools.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: One of the reasons I
5 brought it up is because I feel that it is
6 particularly important in the elementary schools that
7 we instill those processes by which we can work out
8 the problems before we, you know, go to the classroom
9 and I think that we can do that at a younger age. It
10 is neither more effective if we wait till later on.
11 Enough on that. I want to go to another question on
12 the Early Learn 3K for all. So will there be any
13 additional capacity in the new Early Learn RFP when
14 that comes out for additional students?

15 RAYMOND ORLANDO: That remains to be
16 seen. That is why the money is in '19 for the Early
17 Learn piece. There is a lot of work to be done
18 between now and then,

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do we know when that
20 RFP will come out?

21 RAYMOND ORLANDO: We do not at this time.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But obviously within
23 enough time to --

24 RAYMOND ORLANDO: There will certainly be
25 enough time. We are very focused on how best to

1
2 accomplish this. Again meeting all of our sort of
3 new contract policies and procedures we agreed to
4 recently with you all.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Also on that same
6 issue, will it cost any more when we shifted from ACS
7 to DOE will there be additional charges?

8 CHANCELLOR FARINA: No.

9 RAYMOND ORLANDO: I, I --

10 CHANCELLOR FARINA: At this moment we
11 don't anticipate that but we will let you know. I
12 mean the most important thing is that we, we stay
13 focused on the educational component of this and that
14 is something that we are very committed to.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: One of the concerns
16 that has been brought to my attention is the pat
17 equity issue and I would just anticipate that was
18 going to be a higher cost and we are working with the
19 provider community as well as the Office of Labor
20 Relations with the city and ACS around those issues.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And I believe and in
22 most cases where you have Early Learn, there are
23 certified teachers who work with an assistant teacher
24 and perhaps an aid in the classroom as well. A
25

1
2 little bit different model than the DOE's model with
3 UPK but nevertheless they are certified teachers?

4 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Yeah. The expectation
5 is that the funding moves along from ACS to us to
6 support the program as envisioned.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much.
8 Thank you, Chair.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
10 you, Chair. We will now hear from Council Member
11 Treyger followed by Council Member Barron and we have
12 been joined Council Member Miller.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you again
14 and Chancellor I wanted to appreciate your pointing
15 out with regards to in the first round of questioning
16 the over the counter student that includes new
17 Americans, immigrant students that come in and
18 certainly areas I represent we welcome and see a
19 great influx of families from other countries and
20 also -- it also includes a practice that I have been
21 very critical of in the past and I hear stories how
22 they continue where certain schools, particular, some
23 not all charter schools, will wait until the October
24 attendance register month is over and then somehow
25 the students get off their register and end up in a

1
2 district public school and the funding does not
3 follow the student and Chancellor, I keep hearing
4 this again and again and again and I just wonder has
5 there been any discussions with school leaders in
6 these particular schools where you see an -- or an
7 examination of this practice and to speak to them
8 directly and say why is it that miraculously or
9 magically students disappear off the register
10 November 1st.

11 CHANCELLOR FARINA: First and foremost,
12 we now have a head of charter schools, Melissa
13 Harris, who now has an actual team that is actually
14 monitoring all this but I have said over and over
15 again to principals, you have to keep a list and then
16 when this has become either rumor or hearsay doesn't
17 help me when if -- I hear a lot about this. I had a
18 principal said to me recently, I said how many kids
19 in your school, oh not in my school I heard it's
20 someone else's school so I have been telling
21 principals when you get students who you know have
22 come from any of these schools keep a list and let us
23 know immediately. There was someone at Melissa
24 Harris' office who actually is keeping these lists so
25 I am happy to follow-up on any of these cases. We

1 have also heard rumors that there is more of this
2 just before testing like in January so again letting
3 us know we follow-up immediately but I will say that
4 our relationship with most of the charter schools is
5 actually improving in many different ways. One of
6 the things that we have asked co-located sites is to
7 do more sharing in a building. I will give you
8 another example uncommon charter schools is moving
9 into two of our high school spaces and we have asked
10 them, South Shore being one and ?? King Lane being
11 another, we have asked them to put some money into
12 the pot for the campus as a whole and whatever the
13 other schools want to do they are going to do
14 together. Many of the schools have asked us for more
15 help in working with English language learners so
16 they can take more of their share. We are trying to
17 really work together in as many places as possible.
18 I went to a charter school last week actually where
19 the principal is opening a second school, the
20 Hellenic charter in Brooklyn and to me there are,
21 like public schools, there are people who play to
22 work together and then there are those we have to
23 work with a little bit more seriously in other ways
24
25

so I do think this is -- call me, let me know and I think that is the way to go.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I will and just the last question in the matter of time is has there ever been an examination by the DOE with regards to equity across schools with regards to student clubs and activities where certain schools in wealthier neighborhoods have the capacity to raise funds from outside the school budget to provide students for more opportunities like debate teams, chess clubs, other type clubs and activities which really do make a difference in school versus schools in areas that are not very wealthy where they lack that capacity because even air-conditioning issue, we saw PTAs in certain school communities raise private money and get air-conditioners for those schools and schools in my neck of the woods we didn't have that capacity so there has never been an examination of how do we level the playing fields for all schools to provide kids with maximum activity opportunity.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think in terms of clubs and electives, we have not put together a group of schools that are doing this particularly well. I think if you are a Title One school sometimes it

balances what parents are raising but particularly in most of our renewal middle schools they have something called MS2I which actually you guys have helped fund has been remarkable, has been I think one of the features of success in most of our middle schools and they as part of their program do debating and we now have in many more of our middle schools debate clubs that we never had before and they tend to be mostly Title One schools. I think in terms of chess and other clubs we just put on our showcase schools 217 in Brooklyn who does one of the best electives I have ever seen in the Title One with over a thousand kids but it is again about programming. How do you -- we are doing training for teachers, how do you take Friday afternoons for example and program your whole school into clubs. It doesn't mean you have to bring in an expert and pay them a lot of money but how do you look at programming as an ability to do this. So I do think there is a lot more work we can do in this. We have actually started putting more schools in our showcase and learning partners and are doing a good job so other principals can go and see how they can do it as well.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you Council Member. Council Member Barron followed by Council Member Rosenthal followed by Council Member Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madam Chair and Mr. Co-Chair. A few quick questions. In terms of the contract portion of the budget, what amount of money is designated for consultants?

RAYMONF ORLANDO: The vast majority of the contract budget is for things like pupil transportation and --

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes.

RAYMOND ORLANDO: -- payments that go to [inaudible 02:37:04] and others. I don't believe I brought with me --

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Let me just explain what may or may not be a consultant. Many of our schools are working with outside agencies that provide professional staff development that provide in-house training to teachers. They can be listed as consultants but they are not a one person that comes and gives us -- so for example, we have Pam Allen who is working with Lit-something in some of our districts. She is listed as a consultant but it is

her whole program that she brings into a school to work with teachers.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: But if you have specific consultants that you have heard of I am happy to review that but the majority --

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But we don't have a dollar amount in the budget for consultants?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: We can get --

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I would like that.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think defining the word consultants is important.

COUNCIL MEMEBR BARRON: Yes, I am aware of that. Thank you. Secondly, for students who are living in temporary shelters I believe it is 10.3 million in the budget and I think it is just for one year so are there plans to continue that amount of money and is there any consideration of waiting the formula, the fair student formula, to account for those schools that have a high population of students living in shelter. I have a friend who was a principal at a school in District 23, a large number of her students came from the housing that was

1 temporary shelter. Two of them in temporary shelter
2 but she got no consideration other than I think it is
3 the \$100 in the McKinney Vento allocation from the
4 feds and she only got that \$100 which was already in
5 her allocation, not an additional money, to be
6 designated for use with those students.
7

8 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Hi. We have been
9 working on collecting data on students in temporary
10 housing and although we are not planning in the
11 upcoming school year to add a wait for students in
12 temporary housing we are hoping to get better and
13 more data over the next year and we will consider it
14 again when we in the fall when we start developing
15 the waits for the next school that begins next year
16 but we have had trouble collecting the data frankly.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And the DOE is
18 going to be a part of the RFP that is going to be
19 released for the 3K program? My concerns are that we
20 need to make sure that those organizations that have
21 long-standing credibility of being effective in the
22 community are not displaced for those other
23 organizations that can hire grant writers and make an
24 impressive presentation so that is a concern because
25 that has been a policy or a result of the RFP policy

1
2 for the city and lastly I am looking forward to the
3 relocation of the East New York Family Academy as a
4 whole for the next year and for the construction of
5 the brand new East New York Family High School in its
6 entirety, not in sections so I am looking forward to
7 that and I appreciate the work that was done to find
8 the location that could keep them as a whole during
9 this interim time.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Just before we go to
11 the next council member if I may do a follow-up with
12 the 10.3 million. How is that allocated, the costs?
13 My understanding is that not every school that has
14 had an influx of homeless students is receiving those
15 dollars and I am concerned about that and I will tell
16 you selfish, I have School 102 which is next to the
17 Pan-Am Shelter that I don't believe got any funding
18 and it has over 100 students that just came into his
19 school and he's not getting that additional support.

20 RAYMOND ORLANDO: As the initiative
21 develops, it changes as we learn more. Attendance
22 improvement is one of the major goals of the work as
23 well. The population itself as you know is -- moves
24 itself but we try and keep up but I can get you more
25

information. I didn't bring a whole lot of information about that but the problem persists.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So we have Pan-Am Shelter, 800 new residents mostly all -- it's all families that moved in. One hundred or more students at 102 so I really urge you to look at PS102. Thank you.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: You should also know that we started literacy centers off-site and we particularly successful during vacation times where these students come all day and I was just in one Sheltering Arms in Bushwick, and we have more of those throughout the city so not all the work with these students is school specific but it is being done in centers themselves with their families in attendance.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so much, Chairs. Chancellor, I want to follow-up on Council Member Levine's questions about dual language. How much is in the budget -- how much was in the budget for dual language at adoption last year? How much is in the budget now for dual language?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: We can get you specifics but our hope was to increase dual language to at least a hundred schools over the next two years so that has been our goal. The problem here continues to be finding the teachers because our goal is to continue the dual language through high school. I can get that --

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I hear you. I hear you. I heard that. I get it. When a publisher sends you a letter saying how can we help, do you ask them to provide the books?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: We ask them to produce the right kind of books because I think that is an issue. We also --

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I head you say that too and I heard you say that the embassies with all good intentions wouldn't necessarily be doing what you'd like to see in terms of curricula so when -- what I am trying to get at is it is my understanding that there are books out there that are -- would be appropriate, maybe not in every language but certainly for French dual language for example or Mandarin for example. I mean these are all languages that are taught in other school settings where they

1 have great books on this. Why not ask the publishes,
2 if you are tight for money, ask them to supply the
3 books or why not add whatever it takes to the budget
4 for the books? There is a school in my district, the
5 middle school dual language French school that has
6 been having to raise, you know, public school -- the
7 parents have been having to raise, you know, private
8 -- the parents have been having to give the money for
9 the books. I don't understand why the principal
10 would have to -- if it is a dual language school
11 would have to come up with funds to pay for the books
12 that they are not getting and therefore have to cut
13 something else.

14
15 CHANCELLOR FARINA: All schools receive a
16 book budget that it depends on how the principals
17 chose to spend it and you get your book budget
18 according to the number of students.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Sure but this
20 would be a doubling because now you need the book
21 budget to cover two languages.

22 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I hear that but I do
23 think that one of the things we have put in place we
24 have two annual conferences now that we ask foreign
25 book publishers to help sponsor and present their

books at those conferences. I may need to do a better job of making that more public and I will look into the resource money but I do know that one time we actually gave libraries to schools. It us about how they use it and maybe as they go up a grade they are not as available. I will check into that.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I appreciate your checking into it. Sounds like there are two hiccups. One hiccup is making sure the principals know that this conference exists but the bigger hiccup is you can't say, you can't say, you know, that they get a book budget when they need a book budget that is twice as big if it is a dual language program. I think that is, you know, I think that is misleading. Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPLEAND: Thank you Council Member. We will hear from Council Member Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Madam Chair. Mr. Chair over there. Good afternoon Chancellor. I have a few questions and I am sure you have heard most of them already but I want to talk about the CTE's and how do you determine the locations of these schools and let me be forthright

1 that I have been having conversations with people
2 within the DOE for a number of years now and they
3 have not yet come to fruition and we would love to
4 see one in the district if we could -- if there could
5 be any assistance in that, we have spoken with some
6 of the experts in the areas and my background and
7 labor and those folks who are willing to give up
8 their talent as well as some of the UFT and CSA folks
9 but we have yet to really have substantive
10 conversation that can make this thing come to
11 fruition.
12

13 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I will first of all,
14 we have someone who is in charge of our CT programs,
15 John Woodland, and that is the first person to speak
16 to but the other thing is we are increasing our CT
17 programs by 40. The new approach to CTE is also to
18 try to think five, ten years down the line. What are
19 the jobs that are actually going to be paying living
20 wages because a lot of our CT programs from the past
21 are no longer producing professions that are really
22 going to be part of the future so I think that was
23 one of our first challenges. The other thing is CTE
24 programs have to be in places where there are going
25 to be enough kids who want it so we are putting CT

1 programs first and foremost in our co-located campus,
2 Springfield Gardens is one. We are looking at Beach
3 Channel for another where the kids across the campus
4 can chose to have a program instead of opening more
5 CTE schools, having programs within existing schools
6 makes sense. What has been clear to us is that the
7 two growing fields is anything in the health careers,
8 geriatric care and also anything that has to do with
9 computer technology, fixing them as well as
10 developing their own programs. So we have embraced
11 the community as a whole for more mentors but if
12 there is a specific school that you think -- we have
13 asked principals that want to do more CT to let us
14 know, our handicap was but now I think has been
15 solved was that we didn't have the certified
16 teachers. If you are going to do a pharmacy program,
17 you need a registered pharmacist to have and that has
18 been a problem. I understand because this is also
19 one of the Chancellor and Betty Rose the Chancellor
20 and Commissioner Elliot initiative so we think as of
21 last week some of these Albany -- you know Albany had
22 to make some of these changes happen but is there a
23 specific school that you are interested in?
24

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Campus Magnet.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Okay. I will look at that.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Not far from Springfield Campus but they are two separate districts and serve a different constituency.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I actually think I spoke to your counterpart in Albany about this. Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So we have that. So then school choice broadly defined as school choice but we have -- I have written some letters some years past about specifically not specialized high schools but specialized without the exam, Townsend Harris High School. Three years running I have had several of our top graduating middle school students apply for the school and some of these young people had extraordinary PTAs and were not accepted into the school and had written a letter to the principal and got a very vague response about what their criteria was considering the, the disproportionate amount of African American in that school specifically and it certainly was something of concern and also considering we are sending them the cream of the crop and they weren't really being

1 considered. Do you have a respond to that? How do
2 we get that number considering the borough of Queens
3 in the city, how do we stay at six percent, why as
4 educators?

5
6 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think our
7 enrollment office is going to be more closely
8 monitoring those enrollment processes for high
9 schools to be continued.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So was that a
11 decision that was made in the school by the school
12 specifically?

13 CHANCELLOR FARINA: in the past, the
14 answer is yes. In the future we are reconsidering
15 how some enrollment is done on the high school
16 levels.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I don't know
18 exactly how to take it but I will roll with it over
19 if we have any problems --

20 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think it is very
21 good that you brought it up.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I know there was
23 some conversations about the make teachers, about the
24 black male teacher initiatives that were going on and
25 I know that we have also sent about four or five of

1
2 our local mentees to the program and they were not
3 accepted into the program but we will keep sending
4 them. Again, what is -- yes, we have and sat down
5 with the director as well and made sure that the
6 young men were meeting the criteria considering the
7 importance of having these young men in the schools.
8 Is there anything we can do to assist, is there
9 something that we are doing that we are missing to
10 ensure that we are sending you qualified folks and
11 that they are part -- have an opportunity to really
12 be a part of the DOE?

13 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I will be happy to
14 send you the criteria as it is now written and then
15 discuss whatever the gap is between what the student
16 said and us.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay. Thank you
18 so much.

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND:
20 Chancellor, we wanted to do some follow-up on the
21 community schools sustainability and I know that you
22 kind of gave us -- we just need a little bit more
23 detail, the information before we start negotiations
24 on exactly what the budget is, the spending, where
25 are we with these 25 community schools?

1
2 CHANCELLOR FARINA: We can get that for
3 you but the most important thing with the community
4 schools once again is that embedded during the school
5 day, extra support for parents and also a variety of
6 after school programs that are not daycare kind of
7 programs so that they all have to have an academic
8 component, they have to have a counseling component
9 wherever possible some form of the arts. It depends
10 on the school and also the selections process is done
11 by the principal in conjunction in many cases with
12 the SLT to meet the needs of the school but
13 specifically in terms of the different components we
14 are happy to get more information.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And I am
16 sorry, I just wanted to kind of -- it was really
17 about the ones that have potential of losing funding
18 because we know that 12 of them --

19 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Ray will send you
20 that information.

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

22 CHANCELLOR FARINA: By the way, I invite
23 any of you who want to join me on a visit to
24 community schools to see how it is different now than
25

what it used to be because they really are in a very different place.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Great.

As I said earlier, both committees are going to be -- have additional questions but we want to get started with SCA also which is the other part of this. Thank you. I started here at ten and we are getting you at one so it wasn't too bad.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: it's always a pleasure.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you so much. That concludes the first part of today's budget hearings. I want to thank Chancellor Farina for testifying. As a reminder the public will be invited to testify here on Thursday, May 25th, the last day of budget hearings at approximately one p.m. in this room. We will now take a ten minute break so we can get some lunch. We will be right back with the School Construction Authority.

[pause]

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: This will now conclude the eighth day of budget hearings with School Construction Authority President and CEO Loraine Grillo and DOE Deputy Chancellor Elizabeth

Rose. The Finance Committee is then joined by Chair Dromm and the Education Committee. In the interest of time, I will forgo an opening statement and turn it over to my co-chair, Chair Dromm for his opening remarks.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: In the interest of time, I will turn it back over to you and forgo my opening statement as well and ask the council to swear in the witness.

[OATH ADMINISTERED]

ELIZABETH ROSE: Good afternoon, Chairs Ferreras-Copeland and Dromm and members of the Finance and education Committees here today. My name is Elizabeth Rose, Deputy Chancellor for the Division of Operations at the New York City Department of Education. I am joined by Loraine Grillo, President and CEO of the New York City School Construction Authority. We are pleased to be here today to discuss the proposed February 2017 amendment to the Fiscal 2015-2019 five year capital plan. Since the last time we appeared before you, we have opened 29 sites creating almost 5700 new seats for our students and we are on track to open 25 locations next September for an increase of over 8300 seats in the

2017-2018 school year including new Pre-K sites. We are grateful to the City Council for strong support and generous funding to our schools. The proposed amendment will allow us to site and create new capacity in districts with persistent or projected overcrowding and also continues to fund key administration priorities to create additional high quality full day pre-kindergarten seats, remove all transportable classroom units from the system, and reduce class sizes. Additionally, the plan targets much need improvements for our aging infrastructure. The proposed 15.5 billion capital plan contains over 600 million in new funding from the spring 2016 adopted amendment. Main program increases include funding for additional pre-k for all seats, Hurricane Sandy reimbursements, city council borough president funding, replacement accessibility and school based health center funding. As you are aware, we testified before the education committee regarding the capital plan in March. While there are no changes from the proposed plan we presented, I welcome the opportunity to revisit that testimony particularly since members of the Finance Committee did not participate in that hearing. The proposed fiscal 2015-2019 capital plan

amendment is funded by state and city tax levy and 783 million in proceeds from the New York State Smart School Bond Act. The DOE's proposed allocation of Smart School Bond Act proceeds known as the Smart School Investment Plan, allocates funds to technology, pre-k for all capacity and removal of TCUs and is available on the DOE's website. The SSIT was submitted to the state for approval. We look forward to hearing back from the Smart School Bond Act review board. As you are aware, we developed an annual amendment process beginning with fiscal 2005-2009 plan. Regularly reviewing out capital plan allows us to identify emerging needs quickly and gives us the opportunity to make changes as necessary. To Track changing needs we conduct an annual building condition assessment survey in which we send architects and engineers to evaluate our approximately 1400 buildings. This survey generates our needs for capital investment projects and maintain our buildings in good repair. We also annually update enrollment projections. These projections incorporate data on birthrates and immigration rates and migration rates from various city agencies. Additional agencies provide

1 statistics on housing starts and rezoning efforts
2 using a broad range of sources provides a complete
3 view of potential student demand and annual updates
4 allow us to make timely adjustments when there is a
5 sustained increase in student population in one part
6 of the city or a decline in student population in
7 another. These enrollment projections which are
8 performed on a district and sub district level help
9 inform our needs for new capacity projects. In
10 addition to evaluating our school buildings and
11 student population public feedback plays a crucial
12 role in our capital planning process. Each year we
13 undertake a public review process with community
14 education council, the city council and other elected
15 officials and community groups. We offer ever CEC in
16 the city the opportunity to conduct a public hearing
17 on the plan and we partner with individual council
18 members and CECs to identify local needs. Your
19 insight in this process are essential and we look
20 forward to our continued partnership. The proposed
21 2017 amendment includes \$5.9 billion for capacity, 6
22 billion for capital investment and 3.6 billion for
23 mandated programs. The proposed fiscal 2015-2019 plan
24 amendment creates over 44,000 seats that will address
25

overcrowding as well as two administration priorities: pre-K for all expansion and a class size reduction initiative. Of the 5.9 billion allocated to capacity, 4.5 billion is dedicated to creating more than 44,000 new seats through an estimated 84 projects within school districts experiencing the most critical existing and projected overcrowding. Seventeen projects have been identified since the last adopted amendment including a middle school at 48th Street in District 30, the Francis Lewis High School Annex and an elementary school at Targee Street in District 31. The proposed 2017 amendment continues to identify a seat need of approximately 83,000 seats which is partially attributable to the recommendations of our community partners on the blue book working group who voice long-standing concerns regarding the way school space is used and how capacity is measured and reflected. The amendment also includes \$800 million for pre-k for all seats, an increase of approximately 130 million from the 2016 adopted budget which will create more than 8300 new seats across the city. In addition, 142 million have been allocated to replace facilities where leases expired during the plan. Finally, 490 million

is allocated in our class size reduction program to build additions or new buildings that would significantly benefit from additional capacity. This program recognizes the need for targeted investments in areas of the city that may be geographically isolated and have unfunded seat need. Schools in these areas may also have a high rate of utilization and TCUs. Under this program, three projects are currently under design, one each in District 11 in the Bronx, District 19 in Brooklyn and District 29 in Queens. Capital investment. Over 60 percent of the 6 billion capital investment allocation which includes Resolution A projects will address the buildings identified in our annual building survey as most in need of repair such as roof and structural repair, safeguarding our buildings against water infiltration and other facility projects. The capital investment category also includes funding for upgrades to fire alarms, public address systems and remove of TCUs. More specifically, 405 million has been allocated to remove TCUs and redevelop the yard space where the TCUs had been located. To date, we have removed a 110 TCUs and have developed plans to remove 108 more leaving a remaining balance of 137

TCUs not yet slated for removal. It is important to note that the removal schedule is contingent upon capacity constraints within the area and the input of local school communities. The remaining nearly 40 percent or 1.5 billion will go towards school enhancement projects. The two main programs in this category are facility enhancements and technology. The proposed 2017 amendment includes approximately 875 million for facility enhancements. Some of the highlights of the program include electrical upgrades to facilitate installation of air-conditioners, bathroom upgrades, accessibility projects, upgrades to instructional spaces in existing buildings such as the restructuring of classrooms, creation of health centers in our renewal schools, safety and security upgrades and a program to renovate existing school cafeterias to better align our existing facilities with school food's mission of promoting healthy and attractive food choices to our students. As a part of a broader commitment to support students in temporary housing, nearly 20 million in capital is committed to build health centers at the schools with the highest concentration of homelessness. In order for our students to become college and career ready

in a digital and information age, we will make certain that technology upgrades remain a priority in the proposed amended plan. We are committed to bridging any existing gap in technology in our schools in order to implement the administration's instructional priorities of computer science for all as well as other programs including the software engineering pilot program and advanced placement computer science courses. Specifically, over 75 percent of the 654 million of the technology spending under this plan will build on our school buildings for technology infrastructure. This funding allows us to continue to transform our school environments from industrial age to information age schools where learning can be customized to each child's unique needs. Over the course of the plan, essential upgrades and incorporation of next generation broadband, wireless and learning technologies are plans for all school buildings. As part of the technology program, approximately 145 million will be invested in upgrading legacy systems such as student information systems, improving enterprise level learning platforms, developing new data systems and upgrading business operation systems in support of

1 school needs. Lastly, we are committing
2 approximately 29 million in expense funding over the
3 next five years to provide air-conditioning in every
4 classroom that is currently without one. Beginning
5 in fiscal year 2018 with 2000 classrooms, each
6 subsequent year will see at least an additional 2,200
7 classrooms receive an air-conditioner. We know this
8 is an initiative that is very important to many of
9 you. The proposed plan supports the initiative by
10 allocating 50 million for electrical upgrades in some
11 buildings that require additional electrical capacity
12 to facilitate the installation of air-conditioners.
13 Work is already underway to access some of our
14 buildings for electrical upgrades. Mandated
15 programs. The total cost to support the city's
16 effort to remove and replace all polychlorinated
17 biphenyls or PCB containing lighting fixtures
18 throughout the entire school system was \$1 billion,
19 about half of which was covered by the previous five
20 year capital plan. The proposed 2017 allocated
21 amendment allocates 480 million to replace all
22 remaining lighting fixtures in our schools and I am
23 particularly pleased to say that this long term
24 project was completed in December 2016, five eyars

ahead of the original schedule. We are grateful to the council for its support in this effort. The mandated program category also includes approximately \$750 million for boiler conversions in approximately 110 buildings currently using Number 4 oil. The remaining funds are assigned to cover other required cost, including insurance and completion of projects from the prior plan. We understand that the public school system as a whole continues to experience pockets of overcrowding and we are working to address these concerns through new school construction. We remain focused on remedying these issues and will continue to rely on your feedback and support as we do so. Our annual capital planning process has already benefited significantly from your input and our students have benefited from your generous support of capital projects. With continued collaboration and tens of thousands of seats slated to come on-line over the next five to seven years, we remain confident that the expansion and enhancement of school buildings across the five boroughs will improve the educational experiences for the city's 1.1 million school children as well as the teachers and staff who serve them. Thank you again for

allowing us to testify today and we would be happy to answer any questions you may have.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you very much. So we are going to jump right into some questions. Actually, I wanted to follow-up, we had asked Chancellor Farina about the lead in schools and the numbers that were reported and she expressed confidence that it is more so in the actual faucet as opposed to the pipes. Is that something that you remain confident in one and also have all the faucets been replaced or what is the timeline for the replacement of this equipment?

ELIZABETH ROSE: So yes. We are confident that the actions we are taking to remediate the fixtures are effective and we know this from evidence. We know that when we replace fixtures that had tested above guidance and retest those same fixtures using the exact same protocol, we are able to get test results that are below guidance showing that we have addressed the issues. We also know that when you test water, we are testing water that has been stagnant in those, in those, in those fixtures and those pipes for at least eight hours and in many cases longer than eight hours. We are taking that

1 first draw sample. We know that after you take that
2 first draw sample, if you let the water run even
3 briefly and take another sample that that second
4 sample tests below the levels of the first draw. So
5 again, that water would have been in the pipes
6 further down the line so we know that it really is
7 from being stagnant for long periods of time that is
8 contributing to the levels we were seeing. We are in
9 the remediation process now. Remediation will
10 continue, will likely continue into the next school
11 year but we know that systemically we have water that
12 is safe to drink and that even if there are some
13 outlets that are out of service until we remediate
14 that there are plenty of outlets in each school that
15 can provide drinking water for our students and
16 staff.

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So I
19 guess can you walk me through the priority? You said
20 you were going through this remediation plan. What
21 schools get it first? Is this the ones that had
22 higher lead or, you know, what is the process?

23 ELIZABETH ROSE: So there are a couple
24 different considerations. We do this -- we have
25 teams that are working this on a borough by borough

1 basis so within their borough. We are looking at
2 elementary schools and schools that had a higher
3 proportion of their fixtures with high elevations are
4 the buildings that we are addressing first.
5

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And you
7 said this -- you will be -- this remediation will
8 probably last until next fiscal --next year?

9 ELIZABETH ROSE: It will be ongoing over
10 the summer and probably into the new school year.

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay. As
12 you can imagine this is something that is a bit
13 alarming to us. It is hard to explain to parents,
14 you know, the first draw that the kids run the water
15 is all very confusing. People hear lead, especially
16 after what happened in Flint, and I think it is an
17 opportunity to also be clear this is not the same
18 thing.

19 ELIZABETH ROSE: It is not the same thing
20 and thank you for saying so and

21 [cross talk]

22 ELIZABETH ROSE: So there are two key
23 differences. The first is the quality of our water
24 source. The New York City water source is among the
25 cleanest best water in the world. Our Department of

Environmental Protection runs over 500,000 tests of water quality against our water source every year.

So we know our water source is good. That is not the case in Flint where their water was very corrosive.

The second is that we treat our water, and here I say we, the city, Department of Environmental Protection, treats our water with a food grade additive called orthophosphate and orthophosphate coats the interiors of pipes to help prevent any metals from leeching from pipes or solder into that water. And again, in Flint, there was no treatment of the water so you had corrosive water running through older pipes which in fact accelerated the leeching of metals into the water rather than preventing the leeching of metals in the water. So two very important differences.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So and I guess this goes directly to President Grillo, we have praised you on several occasions on actually expediting building, the actual construction. Members have been incredibly frustrated with other agencies, we are not going to point fingers, we are you're not, I know, but it is incredibly frustrating that many of our projects often times even costing less than what it would cost to build the school

1 don't necessarily get done in an expeditious manner
2 and in a recent briefing with the Mayor, we kind of
3 brought this up and you were once again highlighted
4 as one of the best practices. Why do you think it is
5 -- what are the challenges that maybe you don't have
6 to face as compared to other agencies because we are
7 trying to find the best practices as we move forward
8 to actually getting our capital projects done in a
9 timely manner?

11 LORAIN GRILLO: Absolutely and I do
12 appreciate that because the other agencies do face
13 some restrictions that we do not as an authority.
14 For example, we are exempt from the Wick's Law so
15 that when we design a project we don't have to put it
16 into separate bidding packages for each trade. So we
17 have that exemption, other agencies do not. In terms
18 of as we proceed through a project, as change orders
19 occur, we don't have to stop the project and go back
20 to the Office of Management and Budget for additional
21 funding and so they have a review process which they
22 should. We have the ability in those cases to move
23 forward and to do, you know, minimal funding for the
24 contractors so they can continue the project and then
25 come back at the end of the project and negotiate the

1 actual cost of the change order and that sort of
2 thing. So there are a lot of different things that
3 we have the ability to do that other agencies do not.
4 I will say this and I, I -- we often and we continue
5 to work with all of the other agencies that handle
6 capital work and, you know, really share best
7 practices so we actually started that initiative over
8 several months.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Good. So
11 you think the largest component of the -- or the
12 largest or the biggest obstacle is within the
13 procurement process kind of right? It's the back and
14 forth, the change orders which end up for example and
15 I can give an example. We had a \$3 million library
16 that was built -- Helen Marshall put in 3 million.
17 It was built -- well hasn't been built yet. We went
18 -- we finally broke ground 13 years later at a cost
19 of 17 million. Same extension. It's not like I
20 built this amazingly different or an idea, you know,
21 something that was different, multi floors, just an
22 extension and it cost \$14 million more all these
23 years later. Do you think that -- I want to be clear
24 that the procurement process is probably --

LORAIN GRILLO: I think procurement process is part of it. I think the design process as well. I think --

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: You have in-house designing?

LORAIN GRILLO: We have both actually. We do at least 40 percent of our designs in-house and then the other is consultant design.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And on average how long does it take for --

LORAIN GRILLO: For a school for a -- if we were to design a school, it would take approximately 12 to 14 months.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay. On average, how many different firms bid for education capital projects? Is there a limit to overall capacity for education construction?

LORAIN GRILLO: I wouldn't say that that was the case. There are particular trades. For example, over the last several years, one of the trades that we have a very difficult time finding enough contractors are boiler contractors. Why, because A, Hurricane Sandy happened and B, we are not the only agency bidding on these projects right now.

1
2 NYCHA incurred a great deal of damage during
3 Hurricane Sandy and their boilers were damaged and so
4 we've got a lot of people, you know, needing boilers
5 with a very limited amount of boiler contractors.
6 But generally speaking, from the general contractors,
7 we have literally hundreds of contractors that bid on
8 work.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
10 you. I am sure we are going to be following up with
11 you. We are creating a task force to help really
12 kind of, I don't want to say abends, but abends the
13 process and figuring out how we stay within because
14 we want things to be transparent but we also
15 understand the procurement process is necessary. We
16 are not saying to avoid it but it just seems a
17 certain agencies they are certifying to certify the
18 certification of the certification and we are back at
19 square one.

20 LORAIN GRILLO: The other, as you
21 mentioned that, the other advantage that we have, we
22 pre-qualify our contractors which is a very difficult
23 process but once they are pre-qualified they have the
24 ability to bid on projects and we are very confident
25 that the contractors that we hire have gone through

all of the vetting that they need to go through before they bid on projects.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you very much. I have two additional questions and then I will have the Chair ask his question. Three-K For All. I am very excited. I have a three year old at home, you know, full disclosure he won't be taking advantage of this but the reality is that while I am excited both Chair Dromm and I as you know we work very closely on this have incredibly overcrowded school districts and how do you now prioritize? Let's say move fast-forward three years from now we have \$700 million to do the full ramp-up of 3-K. We have issues in citing UPK and we issues in citing K through 12. So what is the priority now when we have this additional, I don't want to say burden, but this additional challenge, I don't know what to call it, strain on the system?

ELIZABETH ROSE: So we hear you and we have some of the same concerns and questions. We are working closely with Deputy Chancellor Wallick (SP) who is leading this initiative but the issue that you just raised is exactly why the two districts that we are focusing on initially for expansion of 3K for all

1 are districts that have a available capacity and so I
2 think we will continue that pattern where we will
3 look at districts that have both high needs
4 populations and also have existing capacity and yes
5 there are districts that exist in New York City where
6 we have many underutilized seats and in contrast to
7 some of our districts where we have -- where we are
8 searching as hard as we can for additional seats.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And
11 logically and because we need to prove that this
12 program is going to be a success and that is what I
13 want it for this program to be a success. I almost
14 wish though that we had a cite that was challenged or
15 a district that had these challenges because what you
16 are going to learn from that experience is very
17 different from the one that has 3Ks that are ready to
18 go so it is almost like you are doing the academic
19 test and I get that but you are still going to have
20 this space challenge that is very real and I am not
21 confident that our districts change that much in the
22 next three years where all of a sudden we have this
23 like land mass of discovered unless -- and these are
24 even more challenging because President Grillo you
25 have walked my district, you have walked Danny's

1
2 district and you know that it is not just the space
3 it's, you know, first floor and, you know, these are
4 little, little toddlers so they are going to have
5 even more challenges and the school size, class size
6 are even smaller so it just seems that it is an
7 incredible challenge that you need to be faced with
8 and I don't know how we are going to get there.

9 LORAIN GRILLO: Yes, we hear you. We
10 certainly agree. I also do want to say this, we've
11 had a lot of success, maybe not as much as we'd like,
12 but certainly some success in citing schools and one
13 of the challenges in your particular district is that
14 we are building additions onto 19, PS19 as well as
15 PS143, and the children that were in those
16 transportable classrooms had to be relocated
17 temporarily, taking up space in other schools and
18 it's been shifting over time until we get those
19 additions done. In the meantime, we are opening
20 PS298 this year. We have opened PS315 and so on and
21 so on and so on. I think once those additions are
22 built we will have some relief and then we will go
23 onto the challenges 3K for all. But, in the
24 meantime, it is going to be tight for the next couple
25 years.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Yeah, and for both districts for 24 and 30, we are still -- even with building the expansions and building these new schools we are still short seats. So while the relief is -- it is almost like it is not a real relief because you still have to answer the questions to I think it is 1400 seats if I -- somewhere around that even after we build -- it's almost like we need to build two additional schools, not even responding to the need of 3K versus universal. I just feel like we are going to have a real moment where we are going to have to question priorities and when you have three very important but competing interest with very limited space, I would like to understand how you process this, how does the DOE handle this?

ELIZABETH ROSE: Well and I also recognize that what we have been able to achieve and what SCA has been able to achieve in siting UPK reflects that the priorities are not exactly competing because the size and scale of a site needed to build a full elementary school is a very different kind of property than the size and scale of a site that will help address UPK or 3K needs. The continued work with the Early Learn sites which are

CBOs just like many of our early childhood centers.

They are noncompetitive, not the same real estate and so yes, funding for both is going to be important but in terms of the specifics of what property we are looking for, they are less competitive than they might appear.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And is that where you find as we transition to Early Learn programs, right, because they are already in --

ELIZABETH ROSE: SO the Early Learn programs will continue. They will continue under the leadership of the Department of Education and Deputy Chancellor Wallack but the programs that already exist for three year olds will continue to exist and we may be able to expand those programs within the organizations that are already serving them.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I think it is an appropriate time since we are going to be continuing our task force, our task force conversations to be able to put this into 3K so hopefully we can present some remedies to some of the challenges that we have. Chair Dromm?

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you and just to follow-up a little bit on what Chair Copeland was

1 saying, are any of the 3K sites going to be in the
2 sites of where Early Learn are now, the same
3 buildings?
4

5 ELIZABETH ROSE: So --

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Like daycare centers?

7 ELIZABETH ROSE: Early Learn sites do
8 have a three year old program and so in the same way
9 that we have worked with CBOs to offer UPK and
10 upgraded the content and the training or those
11 programs. I anticipate we will be doing that for 3K
12 as well. We will also be offering 3K programs in DOE
13 sites where we have space available.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I used to be a
15 director of a daycare center, Grant Houses Daycare
16 Center, and they were in a NYCHA building and I
17 wonder are we going to open any three year old
18 classrooms in NYCHA buildings?

19 ELIZABETH ROSE: So I -- we don't have any
20 specifics today but this is something that I think we
21 will have more information coming, forthcoming as
22 Deputy Chancellor Wallack and his team digs into what
23 currently is there and what we can do.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: In my experiences
25 working with NYCHA, Chair Grillo, were very difficult

1
2 to get capital improvements done there and so I would
3 encourage that we do that outreach in terms of who is
4 going to be able to do what and what is going to be
5 able to be put forward before we take on that
6 responsibility as well.

7 LORAIN GRILLO: Absolutely.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: it is a very
9 complicated relationship with NYCHA and how you get
10 repairs done in those buildings. Let me go talk a
11 little bit about the SESIS and of course that is the
12 Student Information System for Special Education, and
13 the preliminary budget includes an expense of funding
14 for upgrades to SESIS, I think it was about \$4.4
15 million if I am not mistaken on capital funding,
16 excuse me, and how is that funding for SESIS going to
17 be spent in the capital funding?

18 ELIZABETH ROSE: So it is broken out into
19 three main components about 2.3 million of the
20 capital is for building out a data warehouse so that
21 we will have a central depository for all of the
22 information for students and their IEPs. It is a
23 combination of hardware, professional services, data
24 modeling and that is 2.3 million and then there is
25 another million that is for software licenses for a

number of users and another 850,000 for effectively performance monitoring to the applications so that we can ensure that the application is functioning well. One of the things that the team has done on an intermediate basis, immediate basis is they have been able to identify where we have seen system failure in SESIS and quickly address those functions that have returned empty pages or have hung-up the systems and significantly reduced errors in the user experience by, you know, tracking and then addressing the highest sources of system failure.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Thank you and let's talk a little bit about accessibility in the public schools. Have you undertaken a comprehensive assessment of capital repair work needed in schools to provide accessibility?

ELIZABETH ROSE: So we have a committee that focuses on accessibility and meets, I believe, biweekly and that is a cross functional team that includes representatives from the school construction authority, from our Office of Space Management, our Office of Student Enrollment, our Division of Specialized Instruction and our legal team and a number of others to access the current state of

accessibility and what is needed. We have hired five new staff members across SCA, Division of School Facilities and Space Management to do in-depth work with their respective teams in SCA's case and to go into schools to do assessments of our buildings and identify what we need to upgrade. We are working fairly systematically on a district by district, grade level by grade level to identify where do we need to bring up from the bottom so that we can identify accessibility projects in a very equitable way across our district.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you have advocates on that team?

ELIZABETH ROSE: We work very closely with a number of parent advocates in developing our new rating survey and school profile so we basically worked with several advocates from CECs on exactly what a questionnaire or survey of buildings would look like and they how we could convert that information to a very parent friendly document so that parents could see and on-line get details of individual school buildings and say okay, this building has accessibility for this variety of classrooms or functions but does not have

1
2 accessibility to the stage, does this work for my
3 child or not. We have surveyed all of our high
4 schools in Manhattan and Staten Island as a first
5 round and a parent friendly visual both accessibility
6 rating and detail will be included in the on-line
7 high school directory this fall for those boroughs so
8 that families will have the information they need
9 without having to go visit a school to determine
10 whether that school is a possibility for their child
11 that would support their child's disabilities.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: you know that --

13 ELIZABETH ROSE: We expect next year to
14 complete that for all of the boroughs.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I just got this by
16 the way so I am going to look at that later on, the
17 accessibility study that you're talking about I
18 think. At the March hearing that we held on School
19 Construction Authority, I think we had advocates that
20 came in and gave very moving testimony about having
21 their child accepted into a school of their choice
22 but then having to choose another school because it
23 was not accessible. So how is the DOE dealing with
24 those issues now?

ELIZABETH ROSE: So a couple of ways.

The first is that we do have a contact, a central contact point for any questions from parents on accessibility and we do go out to schools to see if there are accommodations that we can make to enable a child to attend the school of their choice. So to hear from any parent this concern, please ask them to go to our Office of Space Management page on the DOE website, the bottom right-hand corner there will be an email address for any parent questions around accessibility and we encourage families to do that. The second thing we are doing is try to be more transparent with information about accessibility up front so that parents are able to make very informed choices on their applications about where they would like to apply for schools so we try to avoid a disappointment like that. We want to help parents get to the school that will work for their child.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is there any funding set aside for making to school building more accessible?

ELIZABETH ROSE: SO we have \$100 million in this capital plan that we are devoting to accessibility upgrades. We have used that. I think

we have identified 17 projects significant projects to help bring the level of accessibility in our less accessible districts up and again we will continue bootstrapping as much as we can to get all districts up to the same level.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So I think that is 100 million in this year's plan but do we have any money moving forward in the five year plan?

ELIZABETH ROSE: So we haven't yet started the developments yet of the 2020-2024 plan and this is certainly a topic that I think we will be looking to continue.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And when we talk -- I'm sorry. And when we talk about accessibility we are talking about more than first floor accessibility?

ELIZABETH ROSE: So again, we funded about 17 major projects which is more than first floor accessibility. We still have some money left and with a little money that we have left, we are looking at how can we increase first floor accessibility to our school. We have been working very closely with the Mayor's Office of People with Disabilities to understand their priorities. They

1
2 are big proponents of increasing first floor
3 accessibility particularly in buildings where the
4 first floor is the access point for a number of
5 services so auditoriums, cafeterias, gymnasiums, you
6 know, if there are those things plus some classrooms
7 that becomes highly valuable to make that first floor
8 accessible.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And for things like
10 parent teacher conferences as well for parents who
11 might have accessibility issues, provisions are made
12 for those parents also?

13 ELIZABETH ROSE: Yes. So we do try to
14 make accommodations where they are needed and I
15 certainly heard about some specific schools where
16 there have been requests for can we get a ramp or
17 arrange to meet with the parents in a location that
18 is accessible.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Good. Let me go to
20 air-conditioned schools. So some of the schools
21 identified for capital upgrades related to air-
22 conditioning have working air-conditioning in the
23 majority of classrooms. Why do these buildings need
24 electrical upgrades and is the current electrical
25 load in these schools from the use of the ACs unsafe?

LORAIN GRILLO: Okay. To answer your questions, in those schools that already have air-conditioners in classrooms, we will examine to see if there is enough additional electrical power to support more air-conditioners but it --

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: In different rooms?

LORAIN GRILLO: But it is much more likely that would be the case and there is -- if they have enough power within the building it is absolutely no danger whatsoever.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So which schools can support air-conditioners without capital upgrades? Are there a number of those?

ELIZABETH ROSE: There are and there are sort of three components of this program. One is there are buildings that have everything they need, they just need the air-conditioners and so we will be purchasing and installing the air-conditioners for those locations. Then there's a group of schools that need distribution wiring in order to get the power from the panels to the classrooms in order to support the air-conditioners and they will get that wiring plus the unit and then there are schools that need a full electrical upgrade so division school

1 facilities is working very closely with the school
2 construction authority to develop those three
3 buckets, if you will, of schools and so then we
4 create a scheduled to address those needs.
5

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: No idea how long that
7 will take?

8 ELIZABETH ROSE: I expect we will have a
9 preliminary sense of which buildings fall into which
10 category within -- by the end of this school year and
11 we will be moving forward this summer to address some
12 schools that can be addressed quickly.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So the funding that
14 we put in that we are talking about putting in is for
15 the -- none of it is for the repair or replacement of
16 ACs that break? Most of them have a shelf life of
17 about seven years maybe. Is there any plan moving
18 forward to replace those.

19 ELIZABETH ROSE: So there are a few lucky
20 schools that as we surveyed our buildings earlier
21 this year in our work with the administration and OMB
22 on this program, we identified a couple hundred
23 classrooms that have air-conditioners that don't
24 function, those lucky few will get a new air-
25 conditioner as part of this program but going forward

1
2 we are currently funded just for the classrooms that
3 don't have anything and at the moment will still be
4 responsible for replacing their air-conditioners in
5 the future.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you ever take out
7 any service contracts or warranties past the seven
8 years?

9 ELIZABETH ROSE: I will have to get back
10 to you on that. We do have our custodial staff
11 perform maintenance on air-conditioning in our school
12 buildings, they check filters, they check for
13 cleanliness to keep our air-conditioners operating in
14 good repair and help them as long as possible.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And staff in school
16 kitchens report that the temperature often reaches
17 about 110 degrees. Are there any temperature
18 controls in school kitchens to ensure decent work
19 conditions?

20 ELIZABETH ROSE: So some of our kitchens
21 probably do, other of our kitchens as you know well,
22 many of our buildings are very old and were developed
23 in a time long before air-conditioning. At the
24 moment, this program is focused on classrooms. We
25 certainly heard inquires and interest in expanding

that to public assembly spaces and kitchens, et cetera, but for right now we are very excited to do the work on classrooms.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is there any way they can be provided with fans?

ELIZABETH ROSE: I think many of our locations probably do have that but we can follow up on that.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. That was also an issue in the classrooms, we were not allowed to bring fans into the classroom. It is a regulation I believe you're not allowed to have a fan in the classroom. So just on that note, because there was a time when I think we did put some air-conditioners into schools. Not every classroom got it. I don't know how it was designated but I would just caution you because this is a very technical thing, I think the BTUs on those air-conditioners was about 2300 BTUs and some of those were not sufficient enough to adequately cool the rooms so I would urge you to make sure the BTUs on these air-conditioners are appropriate for the classroom because many of them have very high ceilings and it's difficult with just a 23,000 BTU unit to cool those classrooms down.

ELIZABETH ROSE: So we will be with our custodians accessing what is the appropriate level for each of these classrooms as we purchase the air-conditioners and --

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you know the BTUs now?

ELIZABETH ROSE: Over the past several years, CSS has been very involved with any school that has purchased air-conditioners to ensure that they are both appropriate size, appropriate quality and installed safety so all of those things are things we have been managing centrally for some time.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is there any regulation to a classroom getting more than one air-conditioner?

ELIZABETH ROSE: I think that if we can address a classroom with one in an adequate way that's what we will do.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It was helpful but if you have 90 degree day and it only brought it down to 85 or whatever, it was still very hot in the classroom so I would urge you to however you are going to go about installing these that the BTUs are correct. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I have a quick follow-up. When we did our briefing, we discussed that with the Mayor that is that many of our schools, again because of limited space, are actually giving instruction in non-traditional. They are out of the classroom so in some cases they have classes in auditoriums or they have classes in the cafeteria so in that case I would believe where there are classes being taught that should be looked at an opportunity to put air-conditioning into that space.

ELIZABETH ROSE: I certainly --

[cross talk]

ELIZABETH ROSE: A lot of the work that we are doing on new capacity will hopefully help alleviate those needs as well. The current program is funded for classroom spaces and so we will have to access where we are as we get through air-conditioning all of our classrooms.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So we are going to be pushing that in negotiations and that is something that is important to this council and speaking to the Mayor he understood that is a challenge and committed to getting us there so I just wanted to kind of put that on your radar that there

1
2 are going to be schools where I am sure you are going
3 to here form principals that my school is one of the
4 spaces where we are using the cafeteria or even the
5 gymnasium in some cases, especially in the older
6 schools, that you actually have the sites separate as
7 opposed to the newer facilities that have air-
8 conditioners one or that have swing space so I wanted
9 to kind of put that on your radar.

10 ELIZABETH ROSE: Thank you, Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Let me talk a little
12 bit about class size reduction and then I will turn
13 it over to other council members that have questions.
14 So the proposed amendment has 490 million for the
15 creation of 4,900 seats through class size reduction
16 projects but only three projects representing 1354
17 have been identified. It has been over a year since
18 class size reduction projects have been identified.
19 Can you describe the exact process for identifying
20 class size reduction process?

21 LORAIN GRILLO: Again, if I may, there
22 is a committee that meets along with space planning
23 and the DOE space planning as well as SCA and
24 enrollment and we review several criteria including
25 the location, the geographical location whether there

1
2 are TCUs in the building and that sort of thing and
3 as a group we decide what schools should move forward
4 with that. The other thing that is necessary too is
5 of course space and in some cases where you have all
6 of those criteria, you may not have space to build so
7 this is an ongoing committee and all of these three
8 projects are in process right now so we are kind of
9 getting ready to review again to see what could
10 possibly be.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is there a timeline
12 for that?

13 LORAIN GRILLO: there is really no
14 specific timeline.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It's ongoing?

16 LORAIN GRILLO: We would like to do it
17 within this plan. At least identify those.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So we will be
19 notified as you move forward on that about additional
20 projects? Do you expect any additional projects
21 before the November '17, you know, midterm mid-
22 budget?

23 LORAIN GRILLO: Hopefully. Certainly
24 again, several people, great minds tend to think
25

alike on selecting these kinds of projects to move forward.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you, Chair. We have been joined by Council Members Miller, Chin, Garodnick, Barron and Rosenthal. We will hear from Council Member Rosenthal followed by Council Member Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so much and thank you, Chair. We have been here all day. Impressive. I am glad you are stepping out to get food occasionally. Good to see you. Thanks for your answers to our questions. I want to start just by confirming the PS191 renovations. I don't know what number that school building is or if you have figured that out but the school at Riverside Center. When do you expect construction to finish? Parents are anxious to do walkthroughs.

LORAIN GRILLO: Well that, if I may, that construction is moving along nicely. Certainly we are keeping the contractor and the developers feet to the fire to make sure this project is completed on

time for school. I will venture to guess that it would be late summer.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Late summer, okay. I mean if there are portions that parents could start to do walkthroughs where it is safe we could continue to work together on that. Then I do want to follow-up on the Chair's questions about air-conditioning in the school cafeterias. I have a couple schools that are desperate for that and I have heard from the workers as well, just sounds, you know, miserable work conditions. Do you have a -- do you know which cafeterias don't have air-conditioning?

ELIZABETH ROSE: SO we have as part of our principal annual school survey, they survey, we have a reasonable by classroom by area is it air-conditioned yes or no. We do typically go in as we began this project and we did have our custodians go in and do a little bit more in-depth confirming look. So we certainly have a baseline level of indicators. It is directional probably not a hundred percent.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: SO I would love to see draft directional. If you could send over the report sort of telling us how many, you

1 know, I know there are a couple in my district but I
2 would be curious to know in everyone's district where
3 we are with air-conditioning in kitchens and where
4 there is not air-conditioning, you know, are these
5 ginormous fans available to the school. I also want
6 to talk about the ADA compliance. Do you know if any
7 of the school assembly areas are better -- I'm asking
8 about hearing loops which is a technology that wipes
9 out the white noise for people who are hard of
10 hearing. What tools do you use for kids who are hard
11 of hearing?
12

13 ELIZABETH ROSE: So the new survey that we
14 have been doing for these high schools in fact
15 include specific information about hearing loops,
16 whether it is a hearing loop or induction coil and so
17 that --

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well done.

19 ELIZABETH ROSE: -- that information is in
20 the survey report.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So we will be
22 getting that information back. The survey to ask
23 principals if they have it or do they need it?

24 ELIZABETH ROSE: No, this is a special
25 survey that we are having staff do focused on

accessibility so that the report that parents can do will give them that level of detail so we will have that for all of the high school --

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I'm not seeing -- are you -- I'm sorry to interrupt. I have a minute left. I'm asking are you finding out which schools have hearing loops or induction loops or are you finding out about the need?

ELIZABETH ROSE: We are finding out whether they have hearing loops, induction coils or nothing so that -- we will get that information as part of the surveys that will be published in the high school directory.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Do you know what the demand is?

ELIZABETH ROSE: Off the top of my head, I don't have that with me today. We can follow-up and see what we know.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I would really appreciate that information. I had a town hall the other day where we did lay down an induction loop and when I announced that about five people who look younger than me adjusted the t-coil in their hearing aid so I think it is much more prevalent than people

1
2 know and it is certainly not just problem with those
3 of us who are aging and getting increasingly hard of
4 hearing. Do you think there are any schools with
5 induction or hearing loops?

6 ELIZABETH ROSE: I believe there are and
7 certainly some of our newer buildings would
8 absolutely have this.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Would
10 absolutely have it.

11 ELIZABETH ROSE: Yes.

12 [cross talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: -- new PS191
14 have it?

15 ELIZABETH ROSE: Should be.

16 LORAIN GRILLO: I don't know off the top
17 my head but I will follow through on that.

18 ELIZABETH ROSE: And of course we also do
19 have schools where we have specific programs for
20 students with hearing loss of different varieties and
21 they choose what kind of programs they want. We have
22 programs for students who want sign language. We
23 have programs for kids who don't want sign language
24 and prefer to operate within a hearing environment.
25

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yep. Sounds like you -- yep. Those are the issues. I'd enjoy -- I'd appreciate hearing more. Thanks so much.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you so much. Before I turn it over to Council Member Miller, I just wanted to ask about I think you were doing surveys on single stall unisex all gender bathrooms. Can you give me an update on that?

ELIZABETH ROSE: Sure. The program that we are rolling out is asking every principal to identify a bathroom in their building and this is an existing bathroom that is effectively a single occupant bathroom. Our student bathroom tend to have multiple toilet stalls and/or urinals and what we are looking for is a single occupant bathroom that would enable any child who wants to have additional privacy in the bathroom to go into a bathroom essentially by themselves and receive that level of privacy. Most of our buildings have these bathrooms. They are typically assigned for staff and many of the buildings have multiple of these so that reassigning for student use instead of staff use is easily accommodated within the building. We have just begun rolling this out. We will be doing several

hundred schools before the end of the school year and then in phases over the course of the summer and into the next school year so that we expect all buildings to have a bathroom identified for all gender student use by the end of the calendar year, January 2018, there will be a small number of schools for whom we have to work closely and come up with a creative solutions but most of our schools will be able to accommodate ??

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Council Member Miller followed by Council Member Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Chair Dromm. Good afternoon. So I want to ask about the TCUs. I know that, that school construction has been absolutely committed to their removal although that has been kind of a snail's pace and I know everybody is doing their due diligence. What is the hold up on that? Is it space or -- I notice that also that you identified one location in 29. Do you know which one that is because we still have several remaining in 29 and so we want to speak to that and how we can expedite the removal as well as does it matter indicating that the educational experience for these

children in the TCUs are equal equitable to those in a traditional building?

ELIZABETH ROSE: I want to first start with how do we develop a plan because I think in some of the locations that is a challenge. Once we have identified the plan it is a question of ??. In some locations that are currently using those TCUs, the challenge is we have to plan for where will those students be educated to enable us to get those children out of the TCU and demolish that TCU.

Sometimes that is we are going to build an addition to that building and so we need to find swing space nearby. As for example in Council Member Barron's district we are doing that in one case. Sometimes it is that the school has simple -- it's enrollment needs to be brought into a range that can be accommodated in the main building so that we can remove those TCUs and that can take from the time you identify the plan to reduce enrollment to perhaps by one section a year, it can take several years before the total enrollment in the building allows for the removal of the TCUs. So we work -- our division space management works very closely with principals, superintendents, and consults with CECs to develop

the plan for how are we going to no longer need the space in the TCU in an area and once we are able to do that it then goes to the SCA.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, so, so there is plans for all of the schools that currently house TCUs in my district and throughout the city is what you're saying?

ELIZABETH ROSE: SO we have successfully removed a little over a hundred TCUs. The SCA has been able to execute on those. We have plans for removal of I believe about a 109 more and we still have about a 135, 136 where we are developing the plan. We don't yet have it and we need to continue working to develop a plan.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And is there data that supports that there is equitable education going on experienced holistically for the students in those -- that have been educated in those TCUs as opposed to the traditional buildings?

ELIZABETH ROSE: SO I know that our educators are all incredibly committed to ensuring that the education is equitable. Frequently what we see is a single grade level will be in the TCUs so all of the children in that same grade level have the

1 same experience and then they all move up and
2 articulate up to the next grade level in the main
3 building.
4

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: But is that any
6 different from children who are being educated in a
7 traditional building maybe in a school across the
8 street in another district? Are they being deprived
9 by being in those TCUs?

10 ELIZABETH ROSE: We don't think they are
11 being deprived but we also know that we think that
12 all students should be in permanent buildings so we
13 are working very hard to achieve that.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: On the bathrooms,
15 I know you have a ?? plan to replace bathrooms and
16 what does that look like? Obviously we have a list
17 of bathrooms in the district that haven't been
18 remodeled as of yet. Also throughout our
19 participatory budgeting, there has been some money
20 allocated towards remodeling bathrooms as well. How
21 do you prioritize that and what does that look like?

22 ELIZABETH ROSE: So we have been doing
23 bathrooms in groups or phases over the past several
24 years. Over time we have evolved in how we are
25 selecting those bathrooms a little bit so that in

1 addition to the personal observations of our school
2 facility staff and requests from schools and requests
3 from council members, we are also looking at our
4 biannual school ??. We are literally -- we send
5 assessors into our buildings to rate our buildings
6 for the cleanliness and the fixtures quality and
7 state of repair like bathrooms. It's how we access
8 our custodial staff

9 [cross talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: -- any way of
11 knowing what --

12 ELIZABETH ROSE: -- projected --

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: -- projected
14 timeframe is on those and whether or not -- whether
15 or not it is a wise -- prudent investment to
16 participatory budgeting or Reso A but particularly
17 participatory budgeting for parents to, you know, to
18 invest in those --

19 ELIZABETH ROSE: Invest. So what I would
20 say is we will not, we currently are in the process
21 of doing our fifth phase and our first four phases we
22 were able to -- we completed 532 bathrooms which is
23 almost all of that phase. I think we have three more
24 to go. We are currently in phase five where we are
25

1
2 working towards 149 additional bathrooms. Our phase
3 six, which we are about to launch which will be
4 completed in this coming fiscal year, as another 272
5 so we are making progress across the system but we
6 will not be able to get to every bathroom in every
7 school that would like an upgrade so yes,
8 participatory budgeting I think this is a positive
9 contribution because we won't be able to get to
10 everything by ourselves. It is I suppose a way to
11 jump to the front of the queue if you will. We are
12 working very hard to address the neediest bathrooms
13 to the extent possible.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you and I
15 am sure someone else will question ?? NWBE
16 participation in these programs as well and we are
17 happy to know that we recently registered a bunch of
18 contractors from the district and I got all the phone
19 calls and they are excited about -- I have spoken
20 with SCA and we are looking forward to that as well.
21 Hopefully, it will ?? --

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Council
23 Member Barron?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Mr.
25 Chair. Thank you to the panel for coming. First

ELIZABETH ROSE: The first draw of water that has been stagnant overnight is not representative of what our children normally experience during the day and as soon as that first sample of water, the first water of the morning flows through, we know that the water immediately behind it is clear and clean and is safe for students to drink so while I know that this is not perfect, it is -- if someone is concerned that they are the first user of a fountain the in morning they can flow the water for a little bit and that will reduce any concerns they might have but we do know that our water in our buildings is safe to drink and that it would require

1
2 that first sample every day for a very long time to
3 have any impact.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: My point was that
5 that should not have even been a consideration for an
6 example to have been presented because we don't want
7 any of our children to be exposed to any kind of
8 contamination and that is what I had said at that
9 time. So we heard earlier that it is the faucet and
10 not the pipes and you indicated earlier in your
11 testimony that it is based on other kinds of
12 experiences and collections that are done in other
13 areas. Do you still hold that? Is that what you
14 say? You don't think there are any other problems?

15 ELIZABETH ROSE: So the work that we are
16 doing and the approach we are taking to remediating
17 those fixtures that tested above guidance is
18 effective that when we re-test when we replace those
19 fixtures we do get negative test results, test below
20 guidance and we don't return that fixture to use
21 until we are able to get a test below guidance.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: In terms of the
23 five year capital plan, is it the current five year
24 capital plan? What are the years that are in the
25 current five year capital plan the --

ELIZABETH ROSE: 2015 to 2019 so we have two more years remaining.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Is the East New York Family Academy in that cycle, 2015-2019?

LORAIN GRILLO: Yes, it is. Actually the project is in design as we speak and when the students are moved into their temporary location then we will start construction and that is going to happen September 2018.

ELIZABETH ROSE: 2018 and in fact the proposal to relocate those students to be accommodated at Maxwell High School will go before the panel for Education Policy in their June meeting.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So when will we expect that the new facility will be completed in its entirety and not in phases as at one point discussed initially and we said that didn't sound good because things don't always get completed when they are not done in its entirety.

LORAIN GRILLO: Correct and we were very, very fortunate to find space planning was terrific at finding space for the entire school for

[cross talk]

LORAIN GRILLO: -- swoop and we are looking at a completion in 2021.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And as we are designing this school, will it have a dedicated auditorium, dedicated cafeteria, dedicated gymnasium?

LORAIN GRILLO: I know it will have a dedicated gymnasium. I know it will have a dedicated cafeteria and I'm sorry and a swimming pool. In terms of an auditorium, I don't it will have an auditorium dedicated. It will have likely a gymnasium within the building which it can be converted very easily to auditorium space.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Having been principal I know the disadvantages of having a gymnasium as you are calling it before us. That was the construction of the school where I was so it limited what could be done although it did have an advantage because we could fold the wall back and have the whole school there for exceptional programs designed for the whole school. In terms of the class size projects that are in the budget, I think there were only three locations or three projects that were identified. Is that still limited to three?

LORAIN GRILLO: Yes. As I mentioned to the Chair earlier, we are a committee that works together to decide on the next steps as far as the next schools that would be -- take advantage of this. There are a lot of variables as I said earlier in the case of East New York Family Academy, relocating that school was a challenge and that took quite some time. In other cases it is geography or it is space within itself so there are a lot of things and we have a committee made up of folks from DOE's enrollment office as well as DOE space management group and so on and we continue to get together to find out -- move forward with additional sites.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Madam Chair if I could ask one more question. In terms of NWBE, I know you have a mentor program so could you talk about that program briefly and what are the -- how many NWMEs are involved with School Construction Authority and what is the average size of the award from the contractor involved in?

LORAIN GRILLO: I am not sure I have every detail. I will tell you that we are extremely proud of our NWBE program. As a matter of fact I think it last year's -- last fiscal year, SCA was

1 responsible for about \$700 million in NWBE contracts
2 so which is probably the largest in the city. In
3 terms of our program, our mentor program really, is a
4 program that takes small emerging contractors and
5 puts them through a training course with the
6 construction manager to teach them the ins and outs
7 of dealing with city agencies and so on. They know
8 their trade certainly but it is working with us.
9 Plus, then they go through that process for a maximum
10 of four years and if they reach a certain skill
11 level, they graduate to the next level which is our
12 graduate mentor program. During that -- at the
13 mentor level, they are able to bid on small projects
14 and when I say small projects, I mean projects valued
15 at up to \$750,000 and that is with the help of a
16 construction management firm supervising them. Then
17 they move on to our graduate mentor program which is
18 projects up to \$1 million. As they begin to grow and
19 reach a level of bidding up to \$4 million for a year
20 they graduate out of it and then they are able to bid
21 on our regular capital improvement programs so they
22 are mentored throughout those first early years until
23 they grow to a certain level. In addition to that we
24 have what we call an opportunity academy where we
25

1 have young people from the local community colleges
2 and we provide an internship program training them on
3 how to do back office work or how to mentor
4 contractors and these young people go through intense
5 training plus we intern them into the mentor
6 contractors to help them with their paperwork and
7 this year we had 30 students and 30 of them have full
8 time jobs and they are very, very skilled right now
9 and people are fighting over them so we are getting
10 ready to do our next class.
11

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: How many NWME
13 participants do you have?

14 LORAIN GRILLO: We have hundreds of them
15 in the mentor program right now I believe somewhere
16 in the neighborhood of about 100 and -- I have it
17 right here. There are currently 823 MWLBE firms that
18 do business with us and 111 are participating in our
19 mentor and graduate mentor program.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Thank
21 you Madam Chair and Mr. Chair.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: Thank you Chair
23 Ferreras-Copeland and Chair Dromm for leading this
24 and your support on so many of the things you've been
25 working for from school seats to lead to

accessibility. I want to start by saying you've got a great team at SCA and I probably know more than most because they are on the phone with my office ?? so I would like to touch on school seats, lead and accessibility. At the preliminary budget hearing, Chancellor Farina agreed that the Upper East Side needs more school seats. Following the hearing we learned that we had 900 four year olds apply for less than 600 seats on the Upper East Side. We had a rally for school seats with Controller Stringer, Public Advocate James and Borough President Brewer, Senator Kruger, Assembly Member Seawright and Court, Council Member Garodnick, parents and children following the hearing and the rally the Mayor announced 3K for all which means we have doubled the need for seats on the Upper East Side and at the executive budget briefing the Mayor agreed to my request to begin negotiating with all new large construction projects on the Upper East Side to include new school seats and that all having happened, what progress has SCA made toward building or opening new school seats on the Upper East Side?

LORAIN GRILLO: Thank you for the question, Councilman because I have been anxious to

1 let you know that over the last couple days we have
2 come to terms with on two projects in the Upper East
3 Side. One of them in Council Member Garodnick's area
4 as well as one large on in your area for Pre-K and we
5 are very excited about it and we are happy to meet
6 with you to give you the particulars on it. It is
7 quite a large project.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: That is great news.
9 I guess the overall concern is thank you for the good
10 news. I'm ecstatic. You can hear it in my voice.
11 Sorry I'm not more emotional but very excited about
12 it and I think it is just great work and if we can
13 keep on going is there a commitment to keep finding
14 more space?

15 LORAIN GRILLO: Yep. We actually have
16 two other sites in consideration.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: That is fantastic
18 news and I will continue to be your cheerleader on
19 that. I guess I want to turn to lead. I have asked
20 questions about this before. It seems like some of
21 the situations are under control but on April 28the
22 the New York Times reported on "Most New York City
23 Schools have high lead levels, re-test fine." It
24 goes on to say that in the first measuring only one
25

percent measured it but then they found that somebody had apparently contacted the Time to indicate that there had been a flushing for two hours which is a concern to me especially since some of my schools were indicated in prior reports and now as of at least what the Times is saying that eight percent of outlets have levels exceeding 15 parts per billion and the vast majority of schools 83 percent at least one outlet with the lead level above the threshold so folks are starting to get a little bit concerned particularly with the Times article I am also concerned about the -- why you chose to the two hours and how we can be sure of future tests [cross talk] and Roosevelt Island and all the schools in my district are and throughout the city are on track and not have this problem.

ELIZABETH ROSE: So lots of different things to address there. First and foremost, 92 percent of our fixtures tested below guidance so we know that this is not a systemic issue, this is not about our water, this is not about our schools are not safe. Eight percent tested above guidance. That by the way compares very favorably with the rest of the state. We are all required to report to the

1 state. Statewide the average is 14 percent of
2 fixtures tested above guidance. Any time we know
3 that in those eight percent that families get
4 concerns let's remember that the average school has
5 over 100 fixtures. So again, let's if you make the
6 math easy, let's say it's 100, 92 of the fixtures are
7 completely safe and eight of them have elevated
8 levels, if it was a drinking fountain or a sink used
9 for cooking water we will have shut them off so that
10 no student can drink from them until it is
11 remediated. Again, there are still 92 fixtures in
12 that school building that are --[cross talk] --

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: How often will we be
15 testing and retesting since we obviously had a change
16 between tests?

17 ELIZABETH ROSE: The state requirement is
18 that we test every five years and we are remediating
19 the fixtures from this last round of testing over the
20 course of the summer and into the fall.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: Would you be open to
22 doing it more frequently than every five years and
23 perhaps twice -- each semester?

24 ELIZABETH ROSE: So I -- we can have a
25 conversations outside of this testing. What we learn

1 from the testing is several ?? one is that it is
2 individual fixtures. It is not a system wide issue
3 and that our remediation is effective and that we do
4 test every fixture that we remediate so that we know
5 that that fixture is below guidance before it comes
6 back on-line so in effect any fixture that has been
7 tested above guidance has been remediated and tested
8 to be below guidance so that should address some of
9 your concerns around frequency. The other thing we
10 know is that flowing water through system and always
11 having fresh water is one of the ways that we can be
12 very effective and ensure that our student have safe
13 clean water to drink. So while we did change the
14 protocol in accordance with the updated state
15 guidance, one of the things that we have evidence
16 that fresh water that we know in our system is clean
17 and you missed Council Member Ferreras-Copeland did
18 ask for what is different between our situation and
19 municipalities that have bene in the news as having
20 real issues and there are very clear differences in
21 the underlying water system and how that water is
22 treated that we know keeps New York City water safe.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: I would be interested
24 in learning how much more it would cost to do another
25

1 test. I have one last question regarding
2 accessibility. The Board of Elections has \$4 million
3 in their budget for storing installing and removing
4 accessible hardware from public schools throughout
5 the city. The Board of Elections is open to
6 installing the equipment permanently at the schools.
7 Will you accept and maintain this equipment for year
8 round accessibility at schools?
9

10 ELIZABETH ROSE: So we work very closely
11 with the Board of Elections. We are happy to work
12 with them and discuss any proposals that they have.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
15 you, Council Member. With that being said, that
16 concludes today's hearing. Don't looks so surprised.
17 Thank you again to Chancellor Farina, Deputy
18 Chancellor Rose and President Grillo. We are going to
19 have additional questions that we are going to send
20 you ?? specifically on accessibility because it is a
21 big issue and some other items so hopefully we can
22 get those answers back to us as soon as possible
23 because we will need them for adoption. I would also
24 like to once again thank my Co-Chair, Chair Dromm,
25 and the members of the Education Committee and again

remind you that the public will be invited to testify on Thursday, May 25th, the last day of budget hearings at approximately one p.m. in this room. For any member of the public who wishes to testify but cannot make it to the hearing you can submit your testimony to the finance division on the council's website, council.nyc.gov/budget/testimony and the staff will make it a part of the official record. The Finance Committee will resume budget hearings tomorrow in this room at 10 a.m. with the Transportation Committee to hear from the ??, New York City transit followed by Taxi and Limousine Commission and Department of Transportation. With that, this hearing is now adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 19, 2017