

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

----- X

January 12, 2017  
Start: 10:15 a.m.  
Recess: 12:29 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm.  
14<sup>th</sup> Fl

B E F O R E: INEZ D. BARRON  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: JAMES VACCA  
FERNANDO CABRERA  
JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS  
LAURIE A. CUMBO  
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ  
VANESSA L. GIBSON

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Judy Bergtraum, Vice Chancellor  
Facilities, Planning, Construction and Management  
City University of New York  
Also Appearing for: James Milliken, Chancellor  
City University of New York

Matthew Sapienza, Chief Financial Officer  
City University of New York

Dr. Rudolph Crew, President  
Medgar Evers College

Robert Lemieux, Executive Director  
Design and Construction  
City University of New York

Barbara Bowen, Professor of English  
Queens College and Graduate Center, CUNY,  
President, Professional Staff Congress, PSC

Cindy Banks, Director of Counseling  
Director of Counseling Services  
New City College Technology, Brooklyn  
Delegate, Professional Staff Congress, PSC

James Davis, Professor of English & Chapter Chair  
Brooklyn College  
Delegate, Professional Staff Congress, PSC

Robert Farrell, Professor of Library Science  
Lehman College  
Delegate, Professional Staff Congress, PSC

Donovan Borington  
Student, John Jay College  
CUNY University Student Senate

Kristen Lee, Professor of Biology  
City College of New York, CCNY  
Chair, Faculty Council  
College of Liberal Arts & Sciences, CLAS

[sound check, pause] [gavel]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good morning.

COUNCIL MEMBERS: [in unison, off mic]

Good morning, Madam.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Welcome to today's oversight hearing on infrastructure disrepair under CUNY at the City University of New York. My name is Council Member Inez Barron, and I'm the Chair of the Committee on Higher Education. Witnesses invited to testify on today's topic include representatives from CUNY, the Professional Staff Congress, the University faculty, and staff, student groups and organizations and other interested parties. CUNY relies on three primary sources for funding: City funds, New York State Categorical grants, and tuition and fees for services. In 2008, the Recession led both the City and State to impose budget cuts at the University, and funding has failed to keep pace with inflation, and recent rapid enrollment growth of 5%. This chronic underfunding has not only resulted in tuition hikes, but has had a negative impact on students by underpaying faculty and neglecting basic infrastructure upkeep. The university owns 300 buildings comprised of 28 million square feet of

classrooms, computer centers, science and other instruction and research labs, theaters, political facilities and more. The average building is more than 50 years old. The majority of the inventory exceeds 30 years, and in some buildings are more than 100 years old. Many campuses are built specifically for college use, and such buildings are accordingly— are adapted accordingly, but many still require intensive mechanical upgrades and reprogramming for technology support. The infrastructure issues at CUNY are even greater than that. Last year, tired of dysfunctional toilets, leaking ceilings and infestation, Professional Staff Congress members at Brooklyn College took to social media and crafted a campaign to shed light on the state of disrepair and decay at the school. Using the hashtag #Brooklyn College, students, faculty and staff posted photos of broken and exposed wiring, gaping ceiling holes and toilets that have been out of order for nearly a year. Similarly, the Alliance of City Claim Our Schools started a hashtag #Reclaim our Schools campaign showcasing photos of broken windows, broke smoke detectors, fire alarm boxes and undrinkable water at other CUNY colleges. A recent New York

Times article devail-de-detailing the blight of CUNY's colleges reported leaking ceilings that cause concern over plug-in electronics when it's raining, overcrowded lectures, frequently out-of-order elevated, escalated copy machines, broken computers, relying on outdated operating systems and floppy disks, and malfunctioning Wi-Fis despite the fact that students were charged a \$125 technology fee each semester. Such conditions are neither safe not conducive to learning to say the least, and the university acknowledges the dismal state of many of its facilities. The City's Fiscal 2017-2020 Cap-Capital Commitment Plan that is funding dedicated to critical maintenance and repair includes \$488.3 million for CUNY, a \$43.8 million increase from the Fiscal 2016-2019 plan. This appropriate largely-this appropriate largely supports-this appropriation large supports projects at the University's seven community colleges for which matching funds for individuals projects are received from the State. Although, term represents a general increase, funding levels pale in comparison to the University's capital budget requests of \$6.8 million, \$6.8 billion, which includes \$5.1 billion for senior colleges and \$1.7

billion for community colleges for Fiscal 2017-18, for Fiscal 21-22. Per the request, the bonded funding portion of the request is \$6.5 billion for projects to address "critical maintenance, infrastructure and programmatic initiatives in support of the University's mission, and approximately \$3 million was request for minor repair projects. With regard to Governor Cuomo's recent announcement of a plan to offer free tuition at SUNY and CUNY Colleges, which is in stark contrast to his authorization of five straight years of annual tuition hikes by \$300, and which he quote said, "I said renew rational tuition, and allow them to increase your tuition." Which is what he said nine months ago. His proposed budget has sought to shift-- and his proposed budget then sought to shift \$485 million in funds to--for CUNY onto the City. I want to shed light on serious issues that are being overlooked. I've spoken extensively about CUNY's Tuition Free policy, which made it possible for me to earn my bachelor's degree in the 1960s and, in fact, this January this month marks the 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary of my graduation from Hunter College. [cheers/applause]

You know, we don't clap. So I have to ask you to

please no-no sounds. Fifty years ago this month I graduated from Hunter College. However, the last dollar funding structure of the Governor's proposed program, the Excelsior Scholarship, in which existing state and federal and loan grants are supplemented by the State, have been criticized for potentially providing less aid to low-income students. That is eligible students will still receive the State's Tuition Assistance Program, TAP awards, which are currently capped at \$5,165, and any applicable federal grants while maintaining tuition costs would be-while remaining tuition costs would be covered by the State. On the flip side, a "first dollar" approach would cover the entire tuition upfront and in addition, state and federal aid allowing low-income students, who also qualify for the Federal Pell Grant, for example, to receive more aid overall. Students whose families earn less than \$25,000 are eligible for the Pell Grant, and any funds that do not go towards tuition can be spent on food, lodging, textbooks, expenses that can be prohibited to many low-income New Yorkers. Indeed when accounting for various student fees that are charged every semester, books, supplies, transportation, food, personal



services, room and board, housing, CUNY estimates that the actual annual cost of attending school full-time may range from \$14,792 for a community college living-community college student living at home or with relatives to more than \$27,265 for a senior college student living away from home for the 2015-16 Academic Year. Although the proposed program may present more low-income students from enrolling at CUNY, it is also expected to greatly increase enrollment among middle-class New Yorkers. As such, the general wear and tear of increased class sizes in already outdated facilities in various states of disrepair and disrepair-of decay, would only do more harm to the University's infrastructure if critical maintenance needs are not adequately addressed. During today's hearing, I am interested in receiving an update on the status of CUNY infrastructure including critical maintenance needs and projects currently underway. In particular, I would like to learn about how issues covered in recent media reports have been addressed, and how the University prioritizes it. I would like to acknowledge my colleagues who are here with me, Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez and Council Member---

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [off mic] Good day. Come in. (sic) [laughter]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: James Vacca who's here, and I want to acknowledge Ndigo Washington, my Director of Legislation, Joy Simmons, my Chief of Staff. I don't think she's here yet, and my CUNY liaison Counsel--the committee Counsel Chloe Rivera, and my Counsel Kiridge Akiro (sp?) and the committee analyst Jessica Ackerman, the Finance Analyst of the committee, and now in accordance with the rules of the Council, I will administer the affirmation to the witnesses from the Mayoral Administration. If you would raise your hands, please. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this Council, and to respond honestly? Okay, thank you. If you can please introduce yourselves and offer your testimony.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Before I start with my testimony, I'd like to read remarks from James Milliken, the Chancellor of CUNY. Thank you Chairperson Barron, and members of the committee for the opportunity to discuss important issues regarding capital budgeting in facilities at the City University of New York. I would also want to thank

you for your support of—for the support that City Council has provided not only in capital funds, but in other areas such as the Merit Scholarship, which has been so important to many of our students. Like you, we are immensely proud of the mission at CUNY and the service this great institution provides to the City especially to immigrants underrepresented groups, and low-income families. CUNY's outstanding students have for generations contributed so much to the fabric of the city, and they are the focus of the important initiatives we will be rolling out in the coming weeks. This new vision will be provide much deserved educational and economic opportunity that will continue to change the trajectory of generations in New York. Our Capital Budget is critical for our students and communities supporting the very sizeable aging infrastructure we—we rely on to fulfill our mission. CUNY has benefitted enormously over the past decades from the support of both the state and city for expanding our facilities particularly in the sciences. We have 28 million square feet of space today across all five boroughs. About 12 million of those square feet are in buildings that are more than 50 years old, and you can appreciate the challenges

of maintaining suitable, effective facilities, which are used by more than 500,000 students. We are focused largely now on major critical maintenance projects and other building renovations where they are most needed. The University's new strategic framework will include carefully developed plans for broadening access to CUNY and providing more support to help far larger numbers of student graduates in a timely manner, like opening the door to a significant expansion in the number of internships and experience of learning programs we offer. That experience will sharply improve the ability of CUNY graduates get jobs and build successful careers in the city's most dynamic sectors. We are involved in a major initiative to redesign our administrative operations to significantly improve the service provided at every level of the Administration and importantly save tens of millions of dollars. We are pleased that with the assistance of the State and the City, CUNY is renewing its mission and substantially improving its services to our students and communities. Upgrading our infrastructure with your support is critical to accomplishing our investments. Thank you very much. Chancellor Milliken.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

13

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Good morning  
Chairperson Barron, Council Members Vacca, Cabrera,  
Williams, Cumbo, Rodriguez, and Gibson. I am Judy  
Bergtraum, Vice Chancellor for Facilities, Planning,  
Construction and Management at the City University of  
New York. Joining today—me today is Matthew  
Sapienza, Chief Financial Officer of CUNY, and Dr.  
Rudolph, Crew, President of Medgar Evers College. I  
am responsible for administering the University's  
Capital Program, which includes comprehensive  
construction and renovations for every campus in the  
CUNY system. Thank your prioritizing CUNY and giving  
me this opportunity to share with you the challenges  
association—associated with providing facilities that  
enable student success at the largest urban  
institution in the country. My remarks today will  
primarily cover the entire university. CUNY operates  
a remarkable large number and range of facilities  
across all five boroughs. Our portfolio includes  
nearly 300 buildings that total 28 million square  
feet, distributed over 650 acres. The most  
significant issues impacting our facilities are the  
age and extended use of our buildings. A majority of  
the inventory is more than 30 years old with an

average building age 50 and some of our buildings were built before 1900. The university serves 274,000 degree seeking students, another 269,000 continuing and professional students, and has more than 43,000 faculty administrators. Almost 600,000 people use our buildings, facilities, and services on a regular basis. Our campuses are open seven days a week with classes scheduled throughout the day and most evenings resulting in significant wear and tear on construction in common areas well as building systems and infrastructure. Increases in enrollment are a sign of strength, but they have had a significant impact on the buildings. There is more traffic in and out through those buildings taxing the elevators and escalators, bathrooms, environmental systems to their limit everyday. The age and heavy use of our facilities combined with a history of deferred maintenance due to funding issues present an enormous budget challenge to the university. In 2007, in partnership with CUNY, we continued the study to determine the amount of funding needed to bring the system to a state of good repair. All of the colleges participated in this effort, and each building was investigated. The analysis identified a

need in the billions of the dollars. We appreciate very much that since 2008, CUNY has received over \$1.7 billion in critical maintenance fund—funding primarily from the state, but recently with major support from the city. In 2012, we updated this analysis. The results indicated the system's deterioration had increased at a faster rate than the 2007 analysis—analysis had anticipated. But this is offset in part by a \$700 million reduction in the backlog.(sic) Through the funding provided in our efforts of addressing the Back Level Capital Project, the 2012 update identified a \$2.5 billion backlog of critical maintenance needs, which will grow to nearly \$6 billion if not addressed aggressively over the next ten years. It is vital that CUNY continue to receive critical maintenance funding from the State and City. The State provides critical maintenance funding for the senior colleges, and re-allocated based on a pro rata formula determined by each college's identified backlog. For community college addressing the state of good repair needs takes longer due to mandated city/state funding match requirement and different budget cycles. We need the city's funding in the first instance be it from the

Council from the Mayor or from the borough president followed by a state matching basis per year. Only then can we use the funds to address—identify capital needs. With the funding we receive, we are committed to providing healthy core learning and teaching environments, and to upgrade infrastructure and academic places across the university. Thus, preserving our facilities for year to come. We have about 300 active projects underway to address such items as roofs, reconstruction of bathrooms including ADA upgrades, reconstructing campus essential plans, individual heating and cooling systems and approving academic student and facilities space throughout the university. Here are some examples of what we are doing. We are construction a recent space for several—several colleges in support of the ASAP expansion. We are halfway into a three-year project to replace \$120 million façade at La Guardia's Community College Center 3. We are do—doing \$40 million in order to upgrade science labs at Brooklyn College into SoHo. I can go on for a long time telling you all that we are doing. You should know that critical maintenance funding is likely used to upgraded IT infrastructure and purchase capitally



eligible IT equipment university wide. In order to provide the most current computing environments for instruction—instructions and learning that's contributed—contributing to students' success. You have been a wonderful partner to CUNY. In recent years, the Council has provided nearly \$200 million for CUNY, and funded nearly 100 projects in particular at the community colleges where the need is greater. Because of this support, CUNY has been able to address some of the most challenging critical maintenance issues at these campuses. Our students in the city have benefitted enormously. (sic) CUNY's Capital Program is responsible for construction, renovation and infrastructure and the Capital Budget is now essential. (sic) Every year the university complete the Five-Year Capital Budget Request that outlines our facilities' five-year needs. In recent years, we have identified project totally more than \$6 billion in each five-year plan. Capital projects take time to plan, design, bid and construct. Maintenance on the other hand is a day-to-day process with expenses covered by operating budgets, which are managed by the individual colleges. Our group attempts to reduce operating costs by improving the

systems in our building, by constructing modern efficient central plans that reduce bars in staffing requirements, and by working closely with the college to select durable materials and finishes for capital construction projects, they--they will last many years. Every college and university system across the country faces these same challenges that CUNY is facing. At the same time this is happening, we are fortunate in that we will be completing the construction of two new buildings: A new performing arts and arts instruction center at Brooklyn College in the summer, and the new academic building at New York City College of Technology in January 2018. We at CUNY understand very well that we are fortunate to have the City Council as our partner, and we know how dedicated you are to our mission. Over time when we needed it most, you have provided funding to address many facilities issues across our campuses. Let me say thank you for all of this on behalf of the university, and I'd be happy to answer any of your questions.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Next panelist.

You're going to make presentations, Dr. Crew. Okay, so you're just here for the questions? Okay, good.

So I want to thank you for--for your--for your testimony and we have several questions and members have questions as well, and we've been joined by Council Members Williams who's a member of the committee. In terms of the buildings, we know many of them are quite old. Are all of the buildings in the CUNY system ADA-Compliant to, or to what degree are they compliant?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, this is what we do. For every new building--for every new building that we do--that we build, everything in there ADA-Compliant. Every classroom, anything that we touch in any building when we do any kind of repair or any kind of new construction is ADA-Compliant. It's a very, very path, and we have smaller projects and making the bathrooms at DN--DNCC ADA-Compliant. So that's a--that is a really big task, but we are working on it.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: If a student who is in a wheelchair wanted to attend any one of our 24, 25 campuses, would there be any obstacles to his getting or his or her getting classroom with the door, to the bathroom from one floor to another?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: We—we look at  
3 everything or we sit and discuss with—with all the  
4 campuses, and we basically look at that, and if there  
5 is an issue they bring it to us, and that's how we  
6 determine some of our priorities. Can I tell you that  
7 every single building and every single bathroom is?  
8 No, no I can't tell you that.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So then perhaps a  
10 student would be prohibited from taking a particular  
11 class based the location of where that course is  
12 being offered?

13 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, we try—  
14 we try to work that out with the school. They move  
15 the classes if there's a problem.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So no student would  
17 be prohibited? There wouldn't be any disruption in a  
18 student attending the class? You know, you get to  
19 the class, he or she gets a class for a day and can't  
20 get through the door.

21 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: I—I—I, you  
22 know what, I don't want to say 100%, but we work on  
23 that. We work on that for schools, and the schools—  
24 schools change the program to meet the needs of  
25 students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]

And--and by the way, I--I am not--I'm sitting in this position, I--no one has ever brought an issue like what you just described to me that a student can't come to class.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, I hope--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]

And I can't--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --some of my students are here from my group students who are disable.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]

And--if they ask me--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --so that they can confirm that.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Absolutely, if they are, if there is, I would them to come to me.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: And we'll fix it.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So if a student needs an accommodation, or if you're notified of a student needing an accommodation, if you're

notified of a student having a certain chronic condition, do you make provisions for that to-to be addressed?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Are you talking about specific—are you talking staff that's related—of things that are related to facilities?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Yes, I mean if—if the school notifies we will make an accommodation. Just remember, though construction, and—and implementing ADA takes time, but we will—and—and colleges they will handle that.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Colleges what? I didn't hear you.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Colleges handle—handle what's needed. If it's not, we handle it if capital construction.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So you only do the capital construction. Colleges do the—the—I heard your testimony, they do the critical and the maintenance or are you also a part of that?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: We—if there's an issue with a student, and they need our assistance, and they need any type of construction--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] All they had to do is pick up the phone and call you and, you're Johnny on the spot?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing] Well, you know, we have—we have people that—we have people that work in this campus. I have a project manager on every single campus. So, yes, that's correct.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, I'd think then perhaps maybe I would ask if you would inquire of your—of your presidents if there's a need so that you can address it. If it hasn't been brought to you, that's one thing, but perhaps we can be proactive--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: I absolutely will.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --and reach out to them and ask them. Okay. So, is there—as we talk about the money for the capital and for the critical maintenance, what are the sources of the money that come to you? Are they only state? Are they only state and city, or are there outside sources of funds that can come to also address these construction and capital needs?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, there may be donations from donors that--that--that come to us. For instance, the--the film school, which we opened last year.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: The donations to the film school for the PAC buildings, which is the Performing Arts and building access and colleges the donations. Now, for the--the donations for PAC, PAC is costing about \$100 million and the donation is much smaller than that, but we do get some donations.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And--and you talked about your current capital projects. What is the projected total costs, and when we met, you talked about doing these projects and favors because you have to the money to do the projects or you break it into phases, but it's not all the projects are in two phases or four phases. It depends on the amount of the project. So can you talk a little about how that's determined?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: So--so, you know, in your testimony and in the articles there are lots and lots of descriptions of issues and tools, which--which are there, and we recognize. However, we



have 300 projects in process, and those 300 process-projects are across all the campuses. Some of them are in the design phase. Some of them are in construction, the construction phase. What we basically try and do is we try and break it up into phases so we can start construction. Like the Shepard Hall at City College. That building is 100 years old. So what we've done is we've done it in phases, and we're up to about phase number a million or ten. (sic) And first, we start with the exterior, which is the facades and the windows, and we basically take care of that first. So what we try and do is we try and make phases so we can start a phase project if we don't have enough money. For instance, if we need, you know, \$39 million for a project, we try and break it up into phases so we can start the construction.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what's the total cost? What's the total projected cost for these 300 projects that are underway, that are on the--on the table?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: About \$2.5 billion.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So if you have \$2.5 billion in—in a one-lump sum, it would cover the projected cost for these 300 projects?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: It would—not all of them. Some of them, and we cover the design. Some of them we do the design first, and then we wait for the funding to come after that. That's for a State project. For a city project, you can't start a city project unless you have all the money.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So do we know the proportion of the 300 projects that are state and that are city? But if you don't have it, you can—you can get that to me. Okay. Now, you talked about maintenance being the responsibility of the individual campuses, and the budgets that they have. Do we have a basic list of the maintenance titles that the schools use to operate because we have information that at Brooklyn College there were only two plumbers for all of Brooklyn College.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Matt.

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Good morning.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Good morning.

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Give us your name for the record, please

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Sure. Matthew Sapienza. Chair Barron, yes, we do have a list of all the case titles that at the campuses. You know, they range from things like electricians and carpenters, roofers. We have painters and locksmiths, facility titles, a whole range of trade titles. We can certainly share that with you, and so all of those folks are--are employees of the individual campuses. They're hired by the campuses, and they would work on the day-to-day maintenance and operation of the facilities at our campuses.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So it's the purview of the President to decide how many of these personnel he would hire and--

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Correct.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --that--that would be case?

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: That's correct, uh-huh.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Excuse me. Maybe Dr. Crew could shed some light on that.

DR. RANDOLPH CREW: Well, about these--

[background comments]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Your name for the record, please? We know who you are.

DR. RANDOLPH CREW: My name—my name is Rudy Crew. I'm the President of Medgar Evers College. Council Member Barron and to the others respected Council Members, I would [coughs] indicate that the nature of the maintenance money used for any local campus covers everything from cleaning a hall to making sure the school is ready in the fall to identify problems that are frankly large enough that are outside their scope of work, and now should be brought to the attention either of the president and/or to CUNY for purposes of fitting into a longer term capital fix or repair. And, we are in control or presence of the number of custodians that we would need to do the former. We're also in charge of the plumbers and the various trades, titles that augment and support the infrastructure, the maintenance of the infrastructure of the campus, and to the extent that we need additional people, we do so within our own budgets. If, in fact, there is an emergency situation, as there was at Medgar with respect to the boiler and things like that, that would be something

that would rise to the level of now having to contact CUNY for the purpose of being able to get additional maybe consultation outside or additional technical support for the purpose of being able to—to remedy it.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So—so in your position as President, you know that, of course, you're the educational leader, but all these other things have to be addressed as well.

DR. RANDOLPH CREW: Right.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So do you have any idea of the—how much time it takes to do these general maintenance issues at Brooklyn, given a non-functional toilet? What's the turnaround time? Do you have any idea?

DR. RANDOLPH CREW: I—I—I—I mean if you did a time and motion study on—the kinds of things you're referencing, I would indicate that we probably are looking at something that should, in fact, take place within the scope of a week. If it's identified by Monday, in my judgment, it ought to be—be able to be repaired pending parts and/or other things that need to be obtained for the purpose of repairing it. But it should be repaired within that week.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, and so do you—  
but I guess my next question is do you feel that you  
have the budget that allows you to assign the  
adequate number of people that you need to maintain  
Medgar in a—in a capacity that's adequate, and  
appropriate?

DR. RANDOLPH CREW: I—I would—Council  
Member, I would—I would indicate that this—this is a—  
a perennial problem in the sense that depending upon  
the age of the facility, the answer to that would be  
for me no because there are needs that a place like  
Medgar that have existed for a long enough period of  
time that the current maintenance staff and so forth  
may not necessarily be completely adequate to be able  
to respond to those things. But, as I said, this is  
up to me to remedy that problem. I would not  
necessarily turn to CUNY and say, you know, you have  
to come and fix this unless it was something that was  
of the nature that I could not with my crew of people  
do it.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I have lots of other  
questions. I'm just going to ask one more before I  
turn it to my colleague. Medgar Evers College is  
very dear to me because I was a part of that struggle

for Medgar Evers College, and also a part of the struggle to get the capital funds for the additional building that finally went up, and-and was so pleased to know that, you know, I said-and you don't have to guess and you weren't there-that Medgar was not treated fairly in many regards in terms of the money that was given to it. And I had asked the question well, how are we prioritizing the school's request for their capital projects, and who decides what they writing will be, and there are opportunities for particular schools with dire needs to jump from this that might be set at any given time? And I was told yes that there are provisions for persons who are lower in the ranking to at some point jump. But if you could just talk briefly about the additions that were-what to Med-Medgar Evers College, and as well as the upgrade for the library.

DR. RANDOLPH CREW: Thank you. Thank you very much. Madam Chair, members of the committee and to the audience. This is a-a good news story for the most part to your issue that I think you raised adequately where there's-to the past, I think Medgar's journey from its inception to now has been, if you will, dotted with both successes and frankly

some frustrations. Those frustrations, I think are rightly pointed out as issues of adequacy of being able to have gotten enough money in its earlier time to—to have it at least built out its infrastructure in ways that other campuses are currently able to enjoy. In many respects what I have seen of this administration is that there's a willingness and an open ear to hear me say here's how we can begin to catch up with respect to the infrastructural needs of—of Medgar. And certainly by the Chancellor as well as the members of his staff at central office, there's been a complete willingness to be responsive to that. With respect to the process by which that happened, the—the good news to that is the process of old is not the process now. There was a point in time when the squeaky wheel period was in play.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh.

DR. RANDOLPH CREW: You put onto it. I'm not saying that that's going to get me fired, or—or people yelling at me. I'm just going to say the truth as I know it, but the truth of the matter was there was a squeaky wheel period, and colleges that knew how to play that, played it. Medgar didn't play



it, or didn't play it very well, and if it did, it played it almost in a very certain narrow bandwidth.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh.

DR. RANDOLPH CREW: What I believe now happens is that there is a more objective process by which priorities are made, critical ideas are brought to the table, and examined for the purpose of being able to fit within the capital budget. It is, as was talked about here, a capital plan that anticipates growth and needs of campuses and so forth. It would in that context that I would say that the library, which was a multi-million dollar project that literally just got finished here within the last 48-two years basically. It came into existence. It has been an incredible asset to the college. It remains as one of the really more vibrant elements of the college and to boot, it's also been, if you will, annexed to the—for us as a student lounge area, a coffee shop area and so forth.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Yes.

DR. RANDOLPH CREW: Some of the things that we didn't have before, and all of this happened because of the ability to get these things literally woven into the master plan, and into the capital

budget and, therefore, funded and these projects were done and done well and on time and in budget, and certainly based on a lot of growth. I would close in simply saying that there are a number of other projects that as we look forward to the next round of funding even though I understand that there's an austerity clause in the world right now, but that doesn't stop people from dreaming what-what their campuses could and should be like and being-being to respond to the needs of the campuses and students on the those campuses. And so we have looked at at Medgar what it would look like if we had maybe even five more million, six more million dollars just a marginal amount of money, capital money to be able to kind of take the next phase of a college. I dare say every college president who has done that same thing it's not so much what do you have now, and what might already be in-in the projects that are current in the capital plan. But what would additional money from the state, or what would additional money from the city buy in the way of new services, new infrastructure, new opportunities for the campus? And in our case at Medgar, it would be among other things tremendous numbers of AC units, HVAC repair.

Things that again the infrastructure has been, you know, very weak on being able to respond to so far. We obviously need more classroom space as our enrollment is—is continuing to decline, and generators for purposes of being able to maintain the equipment, technical—technology equipment and so forth. When things go down, we still need to be able to keep air condition—air conditioning on in computer rooms and so on and so forth. Student Services and student activities and rooms for student events, and—and—and so forth. The continuing of those activities and having a wider growth of campus activities for our students, all of that would be the kinds of things that we would try to build out if we had additional capital.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And as we talk about utilization by students, we know that Medgar has a great connection to the community as well, and has a wide range of community activities, many of them free of charge where people are invited to come, and conferences that are held particularly as relate to black culture, and our history. So thank you for that.

DR. RANDOLPH CREW: Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: At this time, I'm  
3 going to ask Council Member Vacca if he has questions  
4 that he would like to pose.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Yes, thank you,  
6 Madam Chair, and thank you all. It's a pleasure to  
7 see Ms. Bergtraum and Mr. Sapienza again because you  
8 always come here, and Chancellor Crew, I go back with  
9 you many years. I was much younger at the time, but  
10 I was a president of a school board in the '80s and  
11 '90s. [bell] So I thank you for your service to us.

12 DR. RANDOLPH CREW: Thank you, sir.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: And then you're  
14 back in our city serving us again. I thank you very  
15 much as well. I wanted to raise several issues.  
16 This comes down to money periodically. This is a  
17 money issue pure and simple. We have to decide how  
18 can we go about being of greater assistance. We did  
19 have a leadership meeting in the Council this  
20 morning. I'm sorry I was late, but that's where I-I  
21 came from, and we were discussing what should be our  
22 response-what should be our ask of Albany. Every  
23 year we go to Albany. We lobby for the city's needs,  
24 and we have a policy position-position paper where we  
25 articulate the needs, and I-I do think, and I think

many of us—I hope many of us will be lobbying for the Council to prioritize CUNY. Of course, based on what we now know, but also based on the reality that I do think free tuition is going to be a reality in one shape or form—one form or another. I do think free tuition will be a reality, and I do think that with free tuition, we're going to have increased enrollment. So, even if we say everything now is wonderful, which it's not, we have to prepare for the future. But, a couple of questions arise. First of all, as I said, I would advocate for the City Council doing that when it comes to our Albany package. I was concerned about something Ms. Bergtraum spoke about in her testimony, namely that when the City of New York allocates money to the community colleges, you then have to wait for the state, and that takes at least one year if not more I would think for you to wait for the State to give you the matching money or the other appropriations because the City's allocation is not sufficient or for whatever the reason. I just need an explanation of that because part of us wants more money, but another part of us has to make sure that the money we allocate is spent efficiently and expeditiously, and our—our money is

not caught up in a bureaucracy. And it just seemed to me that that reality of having to wait means that projects are on the books for some times—for some time before we get a shovel in the ground. And I also have to tell you from experience where we have that situation, the cost of the project starts here, and at the end of the day, the cost of the project may end up here. And—and if that's the case, it's more money out of the taxpayers' pocket, but it's also going to mean that we have often go through that whole process again. So what can we do about that?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Look, the—the—the-let me just go back a little bit. The—the priorities of how we're going to spend the money that we get starts some time in April, and we sit down with the—with all the colleges, and we talk about what projects they have, and what—what projects they need based on our Critical Maintenance Study, and we go back and forth, and that takes four months. We then produce this book, which you should be getting copies of pretty soon. We just released this book, and in this—this is almost like a catalogue. You know, if we want to figure out what money—what—what money can buy in this is the priority for every

single CUNY school in order of basically what they need. It's addressed to the State and it's Reso 8. (sic) The reality of it is if the City Council order their appropriate money in June, we have to wait for to the following—we have to wait to the following April to get a match—to get matching funds. That takes a few months, and then we can basically access the money let's say sometime in the following September. That's basically what the process is. Now, we know that's what the process is. So that's how we plan projects that way. We plan ahead, and your—your issue about the increase in the—in the funding is true sometimes, and we plan for that, too. But that's kind of what the—the process is. A few—a few—I think six or seven years ago it was the other way, but the state appropriated it, and then the City appropriated it, but this—this—this has changed. But we—we plan for that, but the reality is we're waiting. We're waiting to get the funds, but the number of projects that we have, we have 300 projects. If you just pick any school, that—there's ten projects going at the same time, and one of the issues we have is that unlike other institutions. We cannot close down anything to do construction. You

have to have—you have to have swing space. Our schools don't have swing space. So it gets very, very complicated. So we particularly know what the process is. We plan—we plan ahead for that.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: And I—and I do think that with free tuition coming, we're going to have to look at swing space even more so. We're going to have look at programming, and timing of classes, and use of buildings to maximize the space. I will—I'm chair of the—I'm chair of the Committee on Technology. So I have to ask one question also about capital expenditures. We in—in the Council now give resolution any money to our local public schools through our technology enhancements, and the principals in those public schools come to me and say Councilman Vacca, thank you so much and then three years later they're back, and they're telling me, you know, we're moving on with technology. The next step is this.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: So technology is an evolving field. So how do we keep track of the technology needs of CUNY of all places? How do we



keep track? How-how do you do it, and how can we be of help?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, the capital is basically the infrastructure for--we basically spend money on the infrastructure--

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [interposing] You don't use capital money for technology for--?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: The infrastructure for technology--

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA[interposing] The infrastructure, oh, right.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: --and at some point we can buy some equipment as part of a big package, but we have a Vice Chancellor whose job it is just to do just what you're describing. And we sit down, and we discuss it. It's kind of the same thing as what we do with each college. We sit down and discuss what the needs are, and what we should ask for in the area of technology.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: So it's not as much of an issue here? You-you-you need capital money for the big systems--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing] Well, it is--

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: --for the  
infrastructure?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: --it is an  
issues, because what you're describing we're just  
like the public schools. You know, they ask us for  
money in one year, and a year and a half later the  
technology is--the technology changes. So, we have  
the exact same issues that the public schools have,  
and--and what we are doing is when we basically  
renovate classes, we're making smart class. So the  
technology is like marrying to the capital  
construction. When we touch any facility, we look at  
the technology.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: The City of New  
York can allocate capital money to a community  
college, but they cannot allocate capital money to a  
four-year college. Am I correct?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: They can.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: They can allocated  
to a four-year college--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]  
Yes

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: --the capital  
expenditure?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: You-aren't there  
4 instances where the City of New York can allocate the  
5 money, and you do not have to wait for a state match  
6 where the city totally--

7 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]  
8 The state match is only for--the state match is only  
9 for community colleges.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: So even if Bronx  
11 Community College comes to the Bronx Delegation, they  
12 may say that we need \$1 million in upgrades to our  
13 library, and we allocate all the \$1 million and we  
14 get it into the City budget. That fulfills what  
15 Bronx Community asked for. Why are we waiting for a  
16 state match?

17 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Because for  
18 that project--let's just take your project. Maybe I  
19 need \$2 million, and you've allocated one. I went to  
20 the State to get--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [interposing] But  
22 with that I understand, but if we--if we total--if we  
23 do the total cost to the city there's no need. We  
24 skip that step, don't we if we allocate the total--if  
25 we make the allocation?

2 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: We get--the  
3 state matches whatever you give us.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Even--even if--if  
5 it's not needed? Is it an--it's an automatic match  
6 from the State?

7 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Not, it's--

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [interposing] Also  
9 doing this. Okay, I got it now. So there's never a  
10 need for the city to--

11 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]  
12 So far.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Right, it's an  
14 automatic match, but if there isn't a requirement  
15 that you wait a time period to get it?

16 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: The time that  
17 you--your timing is through the budget because the--the  
18 budget is a back--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [interposing] Or  
20 that your budget is on a different--different cycle?

21 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Right.  
22 That's the issue, the cycle.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay, fine. Thank  
24 you. Thank you, all.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Council Member Rodriguez, do you have a question?

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I do. So thank you, CUNY for the great job. You know, we are all CUNY grads, and that's, you know, that's a reality I can say at the Council most of all of the 51 Council Members we are CUNY grad and, you know, that's what the middle-class New York City is like. Most of us got our first opportunity getting or being amassing (sic) of the colleagues continue that in the PSD for CUNY. So we have a debt to pay because CUNY New York City have a larger middle-class community, and that's the hope that we have, you know that those children that they—that we have in the New York City public system, they're new coming that they can continue dreaming that CUNY will have broad opening up for them to get their degree and to come out—out of poverty ,and be able to say even though the middle-class we live paycheck by paycheck, that we know that the tools are like to here to education. It's most important even that the money that we make in our jobs. So I just hope that, you know, the whole plan right now that we have for CUNY take into consideration all the contributions that CUNY have

made, and the respect for CUNY. Because an institution, you know, it's so important. I have no doubt that, you know, money will continue being an issue. I agree with what the chair says, and her concerns on it. We will see probably an increase of the students, especially if we are able to provide open to a free tuition, something that we support, but we also get—we need to look at the details and be sure that the working class of students they are not hurt with this plan A. But, one of the questions is first of all, to—what is today CUNY—what is the population of CUNY students? I know in the past there used to be 260 students. It's the same? It's in the same number or is—have—have that number increased or—dropped?

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yeah, thank you Council Member Rodriguez. Currently, CUNY is at 270,000 degree seeking students, and I just want to talk about the issue that Chair Barron and—the other members of the committee have so far raised because it's—it's a really critical position, a really critical issue that [coughing] that everyone needs to understand especially when it comes to maintenance and operation funding, and repair at our

campuses. So we currently have about 270,000 degree seeking students. Ten or eleven years ago, we had 220,000. We've added 50,000 students in the last 10 to 11 years. So just to give a little context for everyone and for the committee about what that means. If you take the entire population of Columbia University and the entire population of Fordham University and add them together, that's less than 50,000 students. We've added in the last 10 to 11 years more than the entire student population at Columbia plus Fordham. So we've added a lot of students. There's over a 20% increase that we've added, and our campuses have made additional investments in maintenance and operations over the over the last five years. They're spending more money in maintenance and operations, but unfortunately, it hasn't been able to keep pace with the large student enrollment increases that we had. I mean that's a—that's an issue that comes up when it comes to new faculty hiring. We—we've added almost a thousand new faculty lines over the last five years, but again, not keeping pace with the enrollment increases. And so, you know, I'm very grateful that the Council has raised the issue about student

enrollment increases, and it has a direction tie in to the—to the issue we're talking about today with—in terms of providing enough funding for—for maintenance costs.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: And I've seen that in the list of—in your testimony that page 4 you also include as one of the areas where CUNY has been spending more money it had to be also in support on—on leasing a space for several colleges in support of ASAP expansion. And we know that the ASAP is working based on what CUNY has shared with us and that the ASAP is making a difference for some students being able to graduate or not from community college. Do you anticipate a need of more resources, more money to continue expanding spaces for tutoring, labs, that current that is part of the ASAP program in order to, you know, graduate. Because it means like I'm happy with the free tuition, but at the same time, how there if we know that the ASAP is making the difference or students graduated from community college or not, we are also including in the whole plan that the institution will get enough funding from the state. And, therefore, we need to get that from the City to be sure that every single student



who get into community college who need remedial courses are also getting enrolled in the ASAP program?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: The—as far as the facilities, the city has been very, very generous. We are looking for space for ASAP at Hostos and Bronx Community College. At the moment, we surveyed every campus, and we're trying to meet their needs. If CUNY expands any further, of course, we're going to need additional space. But right now, the City has been unbelievably generous.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: But, you know, I—my problem is like—and there was some committee that I—I decided not to, you know, I leave with the face of frustration because sometimes we do business as usual. When it comes, we hear that everything is perfect. And then we go to those campuses, and we just think that the, you know, informal conversation with the students, professors, presidents, and we know that there's a another reality when it comes to CUNY needs more space. And if we are not able to get all this information, what is like, you know, we have everything we need, then we cannot be entitled to go and say we need to fight from our end.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]

Well--

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: You know, my question is, is CUNY in need of more resources to get more space for the ASAP program?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Okay, the-- the--the two colleges that we're leasing space, we are going to lease more space than we estimate at this moment today than we will need for the ASAP program.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: So we don't have to fight for more dormitory--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing] Right now, right--right now, we are--we have--have more than what need at those two schools. Yes, as we speak today. Today's date, yes. I mean if the plan-- we have planned for growth for two schools.

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: So, Council Member Rodriguez, I--I'm very grateful you brought the--the ASAP program, and incredibly successful program. Has tripled the graduation rates of community college students that are in the ASAP program compared to--to the national rates, more than tripled the--the graduation rates. The--the current plan is that we are expanding ASAP to 25,000 students by 2019, and as

Vice Chancellor Bergtraum said, was very grateful that the city has helped support the space needs to grow to 25,000. But, you know, again I'm a finance person, and I like to grow that return on investment. I don't think there's a better return on investment that the State or the City can get than investing in ASAP. It's proven that it works, and it works spectacularly well. So, once we reach that goal of 25,000 the--the trick is how do we replicate that to--to more community college students? So, future goals yeah, I think we--we will need more space to--to accommodate the ASAP program. But, for the current plan, the--the city has provided funding for it, to help us with--with the space needs. And one more thing I just want to add very quickly about ASAP that we're really excited about that's part of this expansion is Bronx Community College will become--will becoming a full ASAP campus, and that all of the full-time students at Bronx the goal is that they will be in the ASAP program.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: And I'm proud of the funding that we as a city provide to the community college. I don't know about right now, but I know in a few years we were putting 30% of the pay--

of the spending at community college. So my, you know, and—and we will continue doing our part from the city. My last question is about on capacity. I know in the past we were dealing with a situation that CUNY was in need of having more capacity even with—CUNY was even dealing with the challenges of programs and some classes because, you know, they increase as you say 15,000 new students, 50,000 new students being enrolled, which is good because it show that a lot of people are interested in CUNY, but also agreeing the challenge of its space. I don't—today in 2017, do you anticipate it growing of the city population? Is CUNY today working over capacity and come to a student having—CUNY having another space for those teachers to teach the classes or is CUNY also looking at the need to say, we need to build other community or senior colleges in our city?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: In this request that we have here that I keep holding up, in this request is a request for five new buildings, and that's basically to meet a capacity now, and to plan for the future. So we—yes, we do need, we do need new buildings. We have requests in there for five or six campuses, and that's the planning for the future.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. We've been joined by Council Members Cumbo and Cabrera. Now, we talk about—before—they have questions as well, but before I go to them, so CNY has a number of buildings. Does CUNY also lease space in other buildings, and what's the cost of that?

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Yes, Chair Barron, we do—we do lease space as well especially for our Manhattan campuses because, you know, our Manhattan campuses are sort of landlocked in terms of where you can build even if you have capital funding. So we do have to lease additional space and especially to accommodate this growing student enrollment that I talked about earlier. So I believe our total lease budget for everything in terms of senior colleges and community colleges is around \$16 million a year, but—but we'll get you the actual number. But—but yeah, the—the lease budget, which is part of the operating budget is a big component, and a way that over the last, you know, 10 to 12 years that we've been able to help accommodate this growing student enrollment by—by finding leased facilities.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what's the value of the buildings that CUNY does own?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: I get—I—we—we-we can get you that answer, or we can answer.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I'm sorry? The answer. Okay, good, and as we talk about increased student and the need for additional space, what provisions has CUNY made on the provisions for staffing, faculty? We can't have all these students and expect them to still receive courses from the limited number of full-time faculty, and certainly the part-time faculty. So what plans does CUNY have going forward if we see the significant increase in students to reach out and get those faculty members because you know that's always an issue that I raise particularly when it comes to a lack of Black and Latino faculty. The information that I have says that there's only been a one percent increase in CUNY and black faculty over the last ten years? So what are going to do? How are we going to use this time and the opportunity to reach out and get faculty?

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Well, this is—this a challenge in terms of the issue we're talking about today about space and that, you know, I mentioned earlier that we've created over a thousand new faculty lines over the last five years, and what

we've hear from a lot of our campuses is they're very grateful to have additional faculty because that's something that's—that's critical to its success, but we need to find space for those faculty as well in terms of office space, space where they can meet with the students, and have office hours and mentor them. So it is absolutely a challenge. The more faculty that we hire, the more space constraints that we have because we need to find office space for the staff. So, you know, our Four-Year Financial Plan that we submitted to our Board of Trustees and was approved in October, called for the hiring of additional full-time faculty. So it's something that has definitely continued to be a priority for us, and something that we'll continue to work with—with our campuses on.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: The thousand new faculty lines were those for full-time faculty?

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Full-time faculty, yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I do have more questions, but I believe Council Member Williams is next.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you, Chair. Thank you all for testifying. Always proud

to say I'm a CUNY grad. Dr. Crew, thank you for your politically correct response to some of the questions that were asked. But I just want to say on the record I believe that Medgar Evers was ignored because of the fellow that created it, and the people it served. So I just want to make sure I put that on--on the record and--and thankfully things are--are beginning to change, and I think the attention that it deserves is happening. So I wanted to say that. Also, in--in a few days on the 20<sup>th</sup> we begin to make America great again, and I think that will have some major impacts on the city, and possibly CUNY. And so, we talked about a lot of good plans for the construction. Is there some contingency plans that you've thought about in the case of what's happening?

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: I think the biggest thing for--the biggest concern that we have on the federal level for our students is the protection of the Pell Grants. The majority of our students are eligible for Pell Grants. It's an absolute life line for them in terms of being able to attend college, and I think that is the biggest concern we have on the federal level is to make sure that Pell Grant funding is protected, and that it continues to--to



grown. It has the--the maximum award for PELL has gone up over the last several years, which we're really thankful for, but that's something that is really critical for our students, and--and needs to be protected.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So none of the projects that you've talked about are connected at all to--to federal funding, on the PELL, and that seems to be the biggest concern, which is a huge concern I would believe.

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Right, there's no--there's no federal funding for capital projects.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Keeping in mind that if New York State and New York City gets cut the funding you get, you probably could address. So you should probably think about--

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: [interposing]  
Absolutely.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --that as well. The last question is for--for quite some time, we've had--there's been resistance. We talk about, you know, losing tuition, and there's always a plan to increase it irrespective. With that additional money, we've had a number of conversations. I just

want to get a reaction to work that Governor Cuomo presented, which—and I believe that Council Member Vacca that we're eventually going to get to a place where we are getting free education and we know we have to get people. So I would like to hear what your reaction is?

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: Uh-huh. Well, I think that, you know, any proposal, and I know that the Council has been, you know, a leader in—in—in vocalizing this in terms of—of providing additional assets for—for students. So, you know, any proposal that—that puts forth the chance for—to provide better access to our students, you know, we are supportive of, and I think as it was mentioned earlier by—by Councilman Rodriguez, we absolutely need to—to study these new details, and see how it's going to affect our individual students. But—but, you know, we're supportive of—of any program that's going to help—help secure one of CUNY's main missions, which is access for—for students.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very much. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Before I continue my questions, I'll will allow Council Member Cabrera to pose his questions.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much, Madam Chair. First, I wanted to thank you for the epic construction work at the library at Bronx Community College. It's really an amazing job that was done. Also the Quad. The--the groundwork that was done and we recently dedicated that, and also I want to thank especially John Takowski (sp?) for helping us getting the World War II Dominican Memorial in progress, and to design. My question is a question that, you know, I ask every year. That's regarding Bronx Community College. In terms of construction, can you let us know what's the next step that we're going to take? As I understand it, we--we probably have about half a billion dollars worth of work that we still need to do on the campus, and the campus with the greatest need of capital improvement. What's the next step?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: You know what I'd like to do because you asked this question in every [coughs] handbook. (sic) I have here my Executive Director for Capital Construction, and I'd

like him to come up here and let him describe so we can get a picture of all of the phases for this project, and go through and basically create for you the picture of what's happening.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Fantastic.

[pause]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good morning. If you would just raise your right hand and then give us your name. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee, and answer questions honestly? Thank you so much. You can give us your name and your testimony. [background comments]

ROBERT LEMIEUX: My name is Robert Lemieux. I'm Executive Director of Design and Construction at CUNY. I work with Judy, and we manage centrally four of the capital projects undertaken by CUNY. Many times we work very closely with Dormitory Authority. Sometimes we do it ourselves. With respect to Bronx Community College, we're currently finishing the third phase of what's at least a prime phase in maybe a six-phase infrastructure project. We basically bring hot and chilled water to all of--and the electrical service to

all of the campuses—to the campus. At this point, we've done most of the trenching, most of the very difficult things for people to deal with in terms of on the campus. The trenching has all been done. That was done in the third phase. The fourth phase is we will bringing—bringing a new Con-Ed service in on the south side of the campus, which will enable us to basically get rid of one of the Con-Ed substations in—in the building. Once that phase is done, we will start bringing in chilled water to the buildings. Now, we don't get air conditioning, but if the building—bringing chilled water to the buildings. We need to have air handling units, which take cold water run it through fans and then distribute it to the buildings like we see the events here to bring chilled water. It does not exist in most of the buildings at Bronx Community College. That will be fifth and probably the sixth phase of this project of upgrading infrastructure. Bronx Community College like City College was built at the turn of the century, 1900 or just about. This building is 100 years old. There have been no investment in Bronx Community College for probably 60 or 70 years after they moved in. We have recently added a couple of

buildings. We have recently started that reinvestment that is necessary, and I think there's a lot of work going on up there that is probably worth noting that this is work in progress, but it's a-a needed investment that's been made.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: My last question is when does the next--the next phase begin?

ROBERT LEMIEUX: Next year. I mean we--we are doing this project phase after phase. The City was very--we work very closely with our Budget Officer and very closely with the city-owned BIDs. (sic) We've gotten the money to advance this phase. We don't have quite the money for the last phase or phase and a half, but we have the money to advance--advance it to the next round.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much. I'm very happy to hear this. Madam Chair, thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Before you leave, I have a question for you. Thank you. So, I believe the Council Member was talking about the HVAC system. Does that include the--that was a \$12 million project? It's about \$12 million at that time?

2 ROBERT LEMIEUX: No, the HVAC project  
3 that Bronx Community College is really bringing  
4 chilled water to all the campus buildings.

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

6 ROBERT LIMIEUX: Now, some of them have  
7 HVAC central and air. Many of those buildings have  
8 window air conditioning units. So, the ultimate plan  
9 is to bring the chilled water to the building.  
10 Basically put a distribution system to hold chilled  
11 water, but—and chilled water from the air handler,  
12 and basically bring—bring chilled air through duct  
13 systems. That is the HVAC system that we're talking  
14 about, but that's probably phase 5 in terms of the  
15 Bronx Community College.

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So I understand also  
17 that Bronx Community College also requested an \$11  
18 million electrical upgrade. So is that connected to  
19 this? Is it part of it? It's kind of the same?

20 ROBERT LEMIEUX: [interposing] It's—it's  
21 part of—it's part of the same project. When we did  
22 the trench—when we did the trenching, we put in pipes  
23 for chilled water, pipes for hot water for heating,  
24 and pipes for electrical upgrades to the building.  
25 So that we can basically I think through Con Ed

Service we can energize those--those wires if you want additional electrical service in the campus building. That's your fundamental infrastructure project on the--on the campus.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, and since you're here--

ROBERT LEMIEUX: [interposing] Okay.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --Council Member Vacca has a question for you as well.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: That'll teach you to go up on that platform. You're kill yourself. (sic) A couple of things, but I wanted to question you on one thing about Bronx Community. I--I know the Chair mentioned about faculty and the--the very slight increase in Black and Hispanic faculty, one percent each, she had indicated. I want you to know that Italian-Americans are a protected class in CUNY and the numbers of Italian-Americans faculty have gone down. So I state that for the record. I'm not happy about that. Now, I wanted to talk quickly about Bronx Community because I--the--the committee staff was nice enough to let me peruse the--the book that we'll soon be receiving, soon be receiving, as Ms. Bergtraum indicated. Some of these capital needs



are—involve life. We're putting our life and limb very honestly. I'm really alarmed because I saw with Bronx Community in my borough that there's a campus wide fire alarm replacement request.

ROBERT LEMIEUX: That's correct and we are—we have basically—I think we have—we have four buildings. We are currently doing a fire alarm upgrade program, and one of the central initiatives that we're undertaking is to upgrade the fire alarm systems throughout all of our campuses over the next three or four years. In the same way that previously we started to redo science laboratories during the age of this, you know, the decade of the science. City Codes in terms of fire alarm codes have radically changed over the last 20 years. Our building are much older than that in many instances, and they don't always meet current codes. They all have fire alarm systems or they have fire watches if the fire alarm system isn't interacting, it's not working half the time. So the buildings are protected, but upgrading our fire alarm system is a basic—another basic infrastructure project—projects that we have to do throughout all of our campuses. I mean we're building new buildings. It's really

starting rebuilding it the way it's supposed to be built. We've got a large inheritance of buildings that aren't there, and we have to bring them there, and that is a very difficult thing. You know, building an occupied building or rebuilding an occupied building nobody likes to live through a construction project in their house. And we don't the swing space to--so we do build with people in our spaces, which makes it pretty difficult. Our fire alarms are something that is very much on our radar and all of the Boards' radar and something that we are basically addressing.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: My concern with fire alarms is that we are not at the point that Bronx Community where fire alarms will just--just cease to operate?

ROBERT LEMIEUX: No, no.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: No.

ROBERT LEMIEUX: We're not--we're not there--

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [interposing] I want to make sure.

ROBERT LEMIEUX: --and--and--and as I was saying if a fire alarm is--is not operating, they do a

fire watch to basically alert the individuals on campus, but the problem with the fire alarm systems at Bronx Community College is that they're all outdated, and it's very, very difficult to get parts. I mean you actually--sometimes they have to be specially fabricated so--and it's very tricky.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: And just briefly for Ms. Bergtraum I noticed that that Lehman College for example was--and this is very prevalent throughout the Capital Plan Book that we received. The access-- we have a text--an Access and Technology Center at Lehman College. Now, this is going to be a technology center that will provide full access for disabled students. In this case, you received \$432,000 from the Borough President, but you still need \$125,000. So, in a case like this where you don't have all the money, do you proceed to design? Do you--you start design? Do you anticipate the money? How do you--how do you do that?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: For--for Lehman we sent--for Lehman, we can begin the design because it's State money, but if it was a community college, we could.

2 ROBERT LEMIEUX: We use the State money  
3 to advance design, and we basically--the additional  
4 city money is to complete the construction.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: So you still need  
6 more construction money, but if it's a four-year  
7 college, you can--you can proceed--

8 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]  
9 Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: --not having all  
11 that money at hand? For the community college you  
12 need the total allocation before you can proceed with  
13 design?

14 VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Yes.

15 ROBERT LEMIEUX: That's correct.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay. Thank you.

17 ROBERT LEMIEUX: And that--and that does  
18 delay how quickly in advance projects on community  
19 colleges.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Just a  
21 few more questions. I know you've been here quite  
22 while. I appreciate your--your participation. We  
23 know that in 2007, the capital backlog was \$1.7  
24 billion, and then by 2012 it had grown to \$6 billion.  
25 Were there any attempts after 2007 to address that

issue? Was there any—any funds that were allocated to address that and if not, why? Because you know that saving a stitch in time saves nine. So some of those maintenance issues perhaps regress to the critical stage.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, the history of this was that in 2007, because we partnered with SUNY, the State Legislature started giving us pretty significant amounts of money for critical maintenance, which we hadn't gotten before. So that kind—that's what the money was for, and that started in 2007. Because of this study that we did, and because we did the study, the two systems together. So that money was allocated for that.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, and to address—to follow up on the issues of—of my colleague talking about how critical and--life threatening some of these situations might be, has CUNY been subjected to suits by students or faculty because of injuries that they've sustained for issues that—situations that were not maintained?

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: I'm—I'm not, but I'm not—I'm not aware of any specifically, but—but with a—with a, you know, university of our size in terms

of the--our students and faculty, you know, I'm sure that there are some cases like that. But what we could do is we'll--we'll check with our Office of General Counsel, and--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]  
And we'll get back to you.

MATTHEW SAPIENZA: --and we'll get you an answer.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And--and then one other question. I--I don't if you don't need to come back. What exactly is the relationship between CUNY and the Dormitory Authority? Because that's the first that I heard that reference. So what's that relationship?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: The--the relationship, let me--Prior to 2007, DASNY, okay DASNY does two things. DASNY sells some bonds to CUNY and DASNY did the construction for everything on CUNY. After 2008 or 9, we had an agreement with CUNY with the DASNY that we would do some of the construction and they would--they would do some of the construction. So we created our own construction unit. So right now, DASNY does some, and we do some.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So what determines which is done by which body? How do you determine that?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing] Actually, we determine that.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You decide. So you determine--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing] We decide that.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --if you will Batham (sic) to do it?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Yes, and--and now that we've--we've--we're experienced with this working with DASNY and deciding this, now we make decisions on--based upon who has the--who has the, um, the expertise to. If we have a project manager on a campus from DASNY that's excellent, we let DASNY do it. So it's kind of a balancing act, and it's more advantageous to us because honestly, there is competition now for that.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, okay. Thank you so much for your testimony, and we look forward to the answers to the questions that we posed that you did not have. We want to know what CUNY's value

is, all the building that they do, and we look forward to that. Thank you so much.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: We—we actually have to report that. So we have it.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thanks and we'll get ready now to call our next panel. Thank you. [background comments] And the next panel will be presenters from PSC. We have James Basis from PSC at Brooklyn College. We have Robert Fallow from PSC at Lehman College. We have have—I think this is Cindy Bake from PSC at New York City Technical College, and Barbara Bowen from PSC. [pause] Good morning. If you would raise your hand, please? Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this Council, and to answer all committee questions honestly? Okay, thank you. Please give us your name and your testimony.

BARBARA BOWEN: Good morning. Thank you so much, Chairperson Barron. Thank you to other members of the Council who were here earlier and for the very good questions they asked. I'm sure you'll pass it onto them, and also thank you for those who are here testifying with me, and who are here to—to



listen, and to participate in this very important topic. I'm Barbara Bowen. I'm a Professor of English at Queens College and Graduate Center, CUNY, and I'm President of the Professional Staff Congress, which is the union that represents nearly 30,000 faculty and staff at the City University of New York. I'm here with wonderful colleagues from the campuses and they're going to give most of the testimony about the situations on various campuses. Cindy Banks from City Tech, who is the Director of Counseling at City Tech. James Davis who's the professor of English at Brooklyn College, and Robert Farrell who is a professor in the Library, Library Science at Lehman College. We're all going to speak, and although we're all from four-year colleges, we'll say a little bit, too, about the two-year colleges. I-I wanted to say how important I think it is to hold this hearing, and I'm very glad you connected it to the proposal from the Governor for the Excelsior Scholarships that I know how close to your heart and work it is to enable not just scholarships but free tuition at CUNY. And we all hope that that will mean an influx of students. We also know that not only would there be a problem if there's an influx of students, and a

need for more capacity, but there's already a--there's already an existing need. When you hear it's going to take a staggering number of years just to upgrade the fire alarm system, and when we see and we hear about the kinds of conditions that you'll hear about today from my colleagues, I think we make it very dramatic that there is an existing--a pre-existing need to invest in the physical plant just as much as there is a need to invest in the other topic you raised, which is instruction in the faculty and staff. There is as much as a \$2 billion hole in CUNY's budget due to years and years of underfunding, and that shows up in the--in the most dramatic way. I think even more dramatic than the long lines at the registrar's or the crowding to get into classes. I think it shows up most dramatically in the physical plant. And as somebody who occasionally goes to other colleges and universities and speaks there or visits colleagues there, even public universities that are much better funded than CUNY. I have to say I am shocked when I come back to CUNY or when I go there and I--even some SUNY campuses are so much better equipped than CUNY campuses. And it just brings home to me the message the buildings telegraph

to our students every day. A dilapidated building sends the message to students every day: You don't matter. You're education doesn't matter. All you deserve is a broken down building. That's the message it sends no matter—no matter how many how many posters are up in subway saying you can be a star, if you walk into a building and seeing a broom handle holding up the ceiling with a bucket underneath with water dripping down, you are getting the message that you don't matter. When you walk into a campus at Ogram (sic) College where I went or, you know, some place else, Rutgers even. You walk there and you get the message all around the campus you matter, and you—and the richer the college is the, the stronger that message is. You matter, your education matters, and I'm afraid that too often CUNY sends the opposite message, and that message has deep roots in historical racism, in the class structure, and as an institution, as a university, CUNY should be in the business of challenging not reinforcing those structures. So even though there are beautiful buildings, and we love them, and I think we love them even more because of the other buildings, and the other conditions. We celebrate those buildings, and

we see what difference they make in the way students congregate and learn in those buildings. All of our students should those buildings. It should not be a poverty atmosphere. So having said that, I'll just say a couple things about funding and then turn it over to my colleagues. We do appreciate that the City has increased the capital funding. We know the increase of any allocation has occurred under Mayor de Blasio, and with you in this Council leadership position, and we're very grateful for that. We see the difference it makes, and we look forward to your advocacy for more, and we special look—especially look forward to your advocacy with the State Legislature when the budget is considered. Last year, CUNY's Capital Request was for \$284 million, and the allocation was \$143. So just about 50%. This year the request is for \$300 million. We urge you to make sure that in this year they get 100% of the funding because as you've heard from the CUNY Administration, that funding is essential not just for design but for completion. So we need that capital funding, and it's—buildings do make a difference. The grounds do make a difference for safety, for health, and also for learning, and that's

why we think they are critically important for the students we are very proud to serve. So I'll turn it over to my colleagues, and ask who would like to speak first. Cindy. Okay, great.

CINDY BANKS: Thank you for allowing me to speak today on the topic of infrastructure disrepair and decay at CUNY. My name is Cindy Banks and I'm the Director of Counseling Services at New York City College of Technology in Brooklyn. While my job is to counsel students, I also serve as a delegate to the PSC representing higher education officers, and we serve in areas such as tutoring, Financial Aid, Admissions, Registrar, Bursar, and student affairs. Our college administration reports that they do not have funds to repair and maintain buildings, which is amazing what I just heard because that's what we are hearing. Several years ago, CUNY's central office stopped providing funding for repairs and maintenance I'm told in the yearly amount of between \$300 and \$400,000. That's just for repairs and maintenance. The college administration also reported that they don't have funds to hire more staff to clean and repair, and this is a concern at City Tech because we have a new building that's about

to open, and the current conditions of our buildings are so deplorable. Some of the ongoing problems we observe including the following area: Heat and AC system malfunctioning regularly. Some offices report temperatures above 90 degrees. Just this week I had to-to-the Director of Admissions called me and said I'm wearing summer clothes because it's so hot. In another office in another building, the-the offices are so cold employees are wearing coats and hats, and employees are becoming sick and others have resigned as a result.

Plumbing problems: Sporadic and ongoing pipe bursting and water damage are a major concern. Some employees place garbage bags over their desk at night because flooding has often damaged student documents. Employees worry about breathing in mold spores because their offices have been flooded so much. A foul stench on the lower level floors reoccurs every time it rains. In one office the plastic ceiling tile was designed to collect groundwater from a permanent leak that could not be repaired. Water pours into the office when the cafeteria located on the upper floor above is washed. The brown liquid is funneled into a repurposed water

bottle on the floor. This is the same office where for years a sticky black oozing liquid came up from the floor under and employee's desk. In a dean's conference room a leak had occurred for years causing a stalactite to grow. Some of these issues have been repaired, but other appear daily.

Rats: Over the past years, rats will appear during counseling sessions--I'm the Director of Counseling--causing a major disruption to our services, and a terrible challenge for any student attempting to obtain mental health services. Rats have chewed through phone lines and jumped out from counselor desk draws. A recent repair may or may not have helped this. Minor construction: Lack of funds is delaying the construction of a small wall for our veterans' Mental Health Service Corps office, which is part of the Mayor's Mental Health Initiative, and as result, veterans may lose additional mental health services at a time when it's most needed.

While I am only a counselor and do not know the financial intricacies of a university, I see everyday what is happening at City Tech. We want to work, and help students, but these conditions distract us from our task. We ask you to explore and

review the needs of our college and support CUNY's efforts to secure additional state and city funding. Let us know how we can better advocate to resolve these problems, and I have a few photos. Some of the photos that I have this was the Counseling Center that we basically had to—I think—I don't know if you ever had them, but at the Counseling Center we walked students through the dark for two weeks because the water poured in from a—a hole in the ceiling that basically could not be repaired, and the lights had to be turned off because we were afraid that there would be an electrocution. So for two weeks we walked students through the dark. This is in the Financial Aid Office that it just erupts. We never know where it's going to hit. This is a—this is a picture of a—in front of the news Student Center where that day within hours before this picture was taken there were about 30 students standing, and if they had been in that area when the ceiling collapsed, they would have been hurt. And—and then this is a picture of the great PSC thermometers we have, and then you can see the—the funnel of the—the plastic bottle that collects the—the water if they



wash the cafeteria floor in the second floor in the Admissions Office. Thank you.

ROBERT FERRELL: I'm sorry. Okay. Thank you, Chairwoman Barron and the members of the Council Higher Education Committee for calling this oversight hearing on the state of disrepair at CUNY Colleges. Again, I'm Robert Farrell from Lehman College. In 2009, Lehman College submitted its 2010-2011 Capital Plan. It included \$8 million for façade restorations to four original campus buildings. The buildings were seriously leaking. September 2012 was the completion date. Some façade work was subsequently done to the old gym, which houses many of our student services. This summer, 2016, emergency fencing was put up around two of the smaller buildings. The work started there. How much additional damage to these buildings occurred since 2009? How much more will it cost to fix them than it otherwise would have? How much more damage is occurring in our music building, which hasn't been touched. I can show you pictures of our music building. Walls, which were patched prior to President Obama's visits to Lehman last year, and are bubbling again with water damage. No assurances have been made that the underlying

problems have been addressed. The ceiling of our recital hall is snowing down—snowing down in a fine dust onto its floor. Leaks are common. Just last week a busted water pipe caused the power main to explode resulting a multi-building blackout for several days. Fortunately, no one was hurt. Emergency funding had to be secured to address the problem. Across the campus, there are classrooms, with cracked chalkboards, lecture halls with missing benches, and windows with falling and missing screens. The sidewalks are in terrible disrepair beyond what a single mason can accommodate. Lehman's Library has skylights in the roof that leak so much during heavy or persistent rains that they are not enough buckets in the building to catch all of the water that comes in. It's been this way for 15 years and more. We've been told that the repairs have been costed and that there was a plan to fix the situation. But why even after the New York Times showed pictures of these leaks on its front page last spring, are we still waiting for the work to be done? The University's inability to secure adequate funds from the state along with the absence of a dedicated line of repair fund for CUNY has resulted in a sort

of delayed and deferred maintenance. Consequently, CUNY colleges allow things to get worse to the point where a capital request can be made. The state capital for CUNY has gone down every year since 2011. As a result, the list of work to be done now years long as costs increase. We greatly appreciate support from the City Council Higher Education and Labor Committees in October 2015 calling on Governor Cuomo to sign the State Maintenance of Effort Bill. Unfortunately, he vetoed the bill, which would have been a first step to address the situation. This investment in the university haven't just led to embarrassing and in many cases dangerous situations. Investments in CUNY's future have also had to be deferred as limited capital is direct to emergency situations, and I can address those in further remarks if you have any questions. Thank you.

JAMES DAVIS: Hi, thank you for the opportunity to address the committee. I'm James Davis, and Professor and I teach English at Brooklyn College and I'm the Chapter Chair of Brooklyn College, and I want to echo my colleagues' remarks, and express the appreciation for—for Chair Barron's support of CUNY and for the Committee's support over

the years. My remarks are illustrated by a series of photographs, which if they could just be passed through the committee, I would appreciate that.

[pause] The—the issue that—that my colleagues have already raised is—is—falls generally under this idea of always feeling like we need to do more with less, and being told that we need to do more with less, and one can accommodate a great degree of resignation to that, and—and accommodate oneself to it. I want to briefly talk about the way that that looks on the ground to back a few members teaching in the classrooms, and to students. And I want to presume student experience. Maybe there'll be students who will speak to you as well, but I know based on students that I work with, with their—with their experience at Brooklyn College is right. Chair Barron, you mentioned the social media campaign at Brooklyn College in their opening remarks, and that social media campaign did have some effect on—on our campus, but we also got significant blow-back from the college administration on that in the sense that it made them first of all deeply uncomfortable that we were publicizing a lot of infrastructure issues, and health and safety issues on the campus, but also

they told us that it was a blow to the morale of the maintenance staff, [laughter] which—which struck me as on one hand very sad, but also, you know, precisely missing the point of any social media campaign and especially one that was attempting out of solidarity with the greatly depleted staff on the maintenance crew to try to drive resources and funding, and attention to the deplorable conditions that all of us who are working it. But unfortunately, when it comes to doing more with less, it tends to be the people who were working in the officers and the students in the classrooms and the faculty members who are absorbing the brunt of the responsibility, and not so much the people who are working in management and the people being hired to new deanships and—and places like that. There are two kinds of issues, and my colleagues have already sketched some of them out. There are real health and safety issues, and Brooklyn College's buildings are between, you know, 50, 80 sometimes older than that, and our administration knows full well. It's not like they don't understand what the problems with that are, but there are real issues of danger on the campus. And then there are also those issues of the

shabbiness of the place that Professor Bowen alluded to in her opening remarks. And I want to just mention in both of those categories issues of health and safety that have been brought to my attention just within the past calendar year as the chair of the Chapter of Brooklyn College. The chemistry office last summer the ceiling tiles caved in through leaks. A math professor came to me to tell me that a lot of the stuff that had been in storage in his office was damaged beyond possible repair because he had been out of the country for a couple of weeks when a leak occurred in his office. So there was terrible water damage to all of his stuff. The Television Center is depicted in one of the photographs that you have. We have extraordinary equipment in the Television Center, which is fantastic except that students and faculty couldn't use it because it had to be closed down for an extended period time. It still may be closed. I'm not sure where that's at, because of leaks and there are 20,000 amps of electricity running near where this water leak has been. Now, to her credit, our new president immediately went to the University Administration, and--and said we really need to get

this fixed. So, this isn't a criticism of the President and Administration of Brooklyn College, but there are quite a few of these real health and safety matters. I'll just close by echoing what President-- what Professor Bowen said before, I do feel very strongly from my students that they--they get the message. They're not happy with it, but they feel the message that's being sent, whether it be sent from the State or their Administration. You know, they don't know. They don't parse out what comes from the tax levy side of the budget, and the non-tax levy side, right? They don't know that Murray Cooperman (sic) endowed the School of Business at Brooklyn College, and that's why it looks fancy, and their classroom doesn't or the film school or the other facilities. They just know Brooklyn College, and they know that the chalkboards are pitted, but they still have an ancient professor like me who uses the chalkboard. They know that the technology is inadequate and they know that when they want to do something simple like use the restroom, two-thirds of the toilets are wrapped in cellophane, you know, and it's just not--it's just not acceptable. So, I appreciate what you said at the outset of your--of

your opening, which was that—that the basic infrastructure upkeep has been neglected, and I think the best efforts of the administration is certainly the maintenance staff are being put into that. So we need to look not only at increasing the funding, but also as Dr. Crew alluded to before, how are top level administrators making prioritizing decisions about where their resources are being dedicated on the local campuses. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I want to thank the panel for their testimony, and I do have some questions. Thank you for the photos. They're quite telling, and the photos that you have submitted from Brooklyn College, today reflects still the current state. I see there's one that has a before and after. So I guess my question is are there other after situations that are not reflected in these photos?

JAMES DAVIS: There are and there are several.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

JAMES DAVIS: They are—they are successive (sic) and again, I want to give a lot of credit to our new President who's come in with a very



different attitude about addressing the infrastructure in Lehman, but again, every year, you know, they—they say we don't—we can't pay more than two painters, or like Professor Farrell said, we only have one mason on the campus. There is only so much that can be done, and also unfortunately, too, I think that when faculty and staff are raising issues of infrastructure decay, what tends to happen in a tight budget situation, and every year it keeps getting tighter, is that the decision making becomes more consolidated, and a little more shrouded and—and more opaque at the top. So it's not always clear how, as you asked the CUNY panel, how are things prioritized, and there were more transparency, right, about how those priorities were set within individual campuses, I think that would help people feel like okay, even if it's not done yet, we know they're working on it. We know where it is in the—in the—in the series of—of projects, but there are, of course. You know, as you saw, the Chairs that were brought into that lecture hall because it was frankly a dangerous situation. Of course, they recognize that.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So as we talk about transparency and talking about really not having a

clear picture as to how—which agency or which date or which—which locality has the responsibility for making the repairs. Oh, it's a repair. Oh, it's maintenance and it's critical. People not having that information. Is there a structure for a system whereby staff at the colleges can have ongoing interaction with the president to lay out for the president what your concerns are? Because we know the presidents aren't going into every building and see all of the conditions that you see in—in your travels throughout the campus. So is there a structure, an opportunity for faculty and we'll ask students when they come up to be engaged in that kind of interaction?

CINDY BANKS: Well, we participate on the Labor Management Committee with our college president, and I have attended for the last I would say four years, and have reported these issues at practically every meeting. The problems that we have with plumbing, people leaving. I actually submitted an employee's letter of resignation that basically said they can no longer work in this environment because of the breathing conditions in the Registrar were so bad. There are no windows that open. The

same thing for Financial Aid and Admissions. So we report—I've been reporting this on a regular basis to the President, to the Administration on a regular basis. So, yeah, but the—the-what-at the last meeting we were told we don't have the money. We just don't have the money, and we've been told that for a long time.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So you said yes there is the Labor Management Committee, and you do have an interaction, and that you report it. Is there a structured form for reporting it, or is it just bringing it up at the meeting? Is there a mechanism that it gets report? You know, we talk about NYCHA having lots of problems with the infrastructure, but we know there's a system set up. Okay, you get your ticket, you get your number, dah-dah-dah, and you can track it. So is there a mechanism in CUNY for that to happen?

CINDY BANKS: Well, at City Tech there is. I don't think all faculty have access to putting that in. It's usually department directors that can put it in from time to time.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] So not everyone can do this?

CINDY BANKS: No, but-but there is a-  
there is a system a City Tech, and you can put a  
ticket in, and tickets have been put in, and I have  
said to employees that come-come to me concerned that  
they don't have heat. Everyday for the last month we  
didn't have heat. So are we supposed to put a ticket  
in everyday, and I say yes, put a ticket in everyday.  
And sometimes they just burn out on putting tickets  
in because they don't see any change. So, the  
tickets process is there. People know it. People  
talk about it, but there's still the-the answer that  
comes back is we don't have enough money.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So do we know if  
that ticket system or reporting system is CUNY wide  
or is it campus by campus? Do we know?

CINDY BANKS: I think there's a similar  
process at the different campuses. At Lehman College  
we have the same ticketing process, but you can't-if  
you're a faculty member or staff member you can't  
just submit a ticket. It has to go through either a  
department secretary or somebody who organizes that-  
that for that site. And the because the tickets often  
aren't resolve or acted on, there's a sense of  
futility that occurs over time. And there's not an

incentive for people to really be proactive. Not even the maintenance staff submits tickets around work issues that they see just on their regular rounds. Nor is there is there a really kind of closure system in place that we've identified so far at Lehman where they are actually tracking it. I think you heard that from the CUNY Administration. Actually, I think it's the President of Medgar Evers. He gave you a ball-ballpark estimate of how long it takes to resolve a-a problem. But I know at Lehman there's not really a tracking. It's not really tracked to see exactly how long it takes to resolve one of these problems, and that's something we're trying to work on the faculty and staff side to try to push the Administration to be more accountable of our plight.

BARBARA BOWEN: I'd like to add that for several rounds of collective bargaining we had a demand from the Union to the University that a labor management committee specifically on health and safety be contractually mandated at every campus, and that it be mandated to meet regularly. That's not a cost item just to have the committee meet. There are a few campuses, and I think City Tech is one of them

where there's been more of a tradition of cooperation and at least addressing some problems. Queens College, my college, because of the incredibly active work of some of our members, there has been more response. But, in terms of CUNY Central's position where we have repeatedly sought to bargain just for that structure, they have refused. And I think that's important because what you pointed to the—the possibility of having a system where you just clicked on and you looked and saw where's your project. If it's a fixing the roof tiles or the heating or whatever, and you could okay the ticket is in. They're deciding or they're fixing it, or it's going to be fixed next month or whatever it is. I think that would provide people with a sense that there was at least something being done, and that's exactly the kind of system that a unified set of labor management committees on health and safety could create. I will say that we do meet regularly. We have a central Labor Management Committee on Safety and Health. Our Executive Director meets with a counterpart at CUNY, and they do resolve some problems, but there has been a continual refusal to make a contractual commitment to health and safety committees on every campus, and

that's where people see the--the trouble. You can't see it from far away.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And the--the tradition of not being willing to consider that is based on finance, time and--

BARBARA BOWEN: It's not based on finance. So and I can't speak for the university's position. I'll just say they have consistently refused. It's not--I mean perhaps they see that's leading to financial issues, or I won't speak for them, but it's--it is never represented as a cost item simply as an administrative. It would be a commitment. It would be a serious commitment, and we feel it could lead to better communication at least. It doesn't produce the money. I mean as Cindy and others said, the basic problem--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Right, it's a basic problem.

BARBARA BOWEN: --is refusal to invest. It's not failure to invest.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh.

BARBARA BOWEN: Refusal to invest, but at least you could see where things are in the process.

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, those of you  
3 who—who are talking about your particular campuses,  
4 has it—I believe the first panelist is Cindy Bank, is  
5 that it?

6 MALE SPEAKER: [off mic] Yes, it's  
7 Cindy.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Talked about the—  
9 apparently saying well this is not within our  
10 purview. We have to move it to critical maintenance  
11 or whatever. Has the president been responsive to  
12 those general maintenance issues because some of  
13 these photos are things that just need painting and  
14 fixing and replacing. So has the president been  
15 responsive to the maintenance issues that you  
16 brought?

17 CINDY BANKS: You know, I am a union  
18 person. So I go to the Labor Management Committee,  
19 and I'm known to speak up. So my area when I  
20 complained about rats, the next day I had ten people  
21 in my office knocking down walls and things like  
22 that. Not everybody is willing to do—to say that and  
23 to—to say to president this is not right, and I think  
24 that's, you know, part of the issue. I think the  
25 president—when I first started working at City Tech



there was an office in the Counseling Center that basically was—the outer wall was plywood, and the counselor could see their air breathing. Those things have changed at City Tech. There's a lot that's been done at City Tech, but there still needs to be more. There's problems with the AC. There's problems with plumbing. There's—there's and the CUNY Central Office has stopped giving us money. Over the course of the last few years, there's been a consistent drop I've been told in funding for maintenance and repair. So I think the president is—he wants to help. I think his hands are tied because there isn't the money. I think he listens to us. We're in the Labor Management Committee every other month, and so anyway I hear you on this particular issue.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] So I understand. Well, as has been presented, there are these distinctions, and some of these are capital items, HVAC appears are capital items, and presidents have got to use whatever techniques they've got to get themselves up on the list, and to get those things. But, in terms of the maintenance, those are issues as have been presented by the previous panel

to be decided by the president at each campus. So I just want to make that distinction. Yes.

ROBERT FARRELL: If I could speak to that a little bit. The campus operating budgets have been shrunk over the past decade--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Right.

ROBERT FARRELL: --or more, and that's where these maintenance come from. So, it's really an impossible choice if you're a president or a head of facilities. I have to say our head of facilities is a wonderful person. She does great, but she's doing more and more with less and less, or she's doing the same amount or less with less because she has less, and that's really what it comes down to. We have a brand new president. I've been very impressed with what he's doing so far. I have great confidence in where he's going to take the college, but there's only so much that he can do. The strategy in the past has been to let things crumble before a capital request could be made. So we have a sidewalk kind of walkway, pedestrian bridge at Lehman that at one point was absolutely dangerous. And they actually got this kind of passport material that's really a kind of rubberized surface to put over these

pits and cracks, and which actually made it worse to walk across especially if were wearing heels or something of that nature. But their goal was to make a capital request. They made the capital request to eliminate the pedestrian bridge, and to excavate a certain part of the campus and put the dirt under it and kind of build a real sidewalk. The money never came through. So they ended up having to do more patchwork and patchwork, and there's still dangerous for-for disabled students or our faculty members. You could easily trip and hurt yourself. And the other issue is with the phasing of the money. When it does become a capital issue, you know, faculty and staff don't necessarily recognize that things are being done very slowly. So there's an ADA situation in the Lovinger Theater in the college. Money has been requested at-in multiple, multiple countless requests over the past at least decade. A little bit comes in here, and this here is out there and, you know, the problem doesn't get fully resolved. You know they do what they can as they can, but then it becomes more expensive. It gets worse, and people get frustrated.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Can you speak specifically to the ADA situation that you just referenced?

ROBERT FARRELL: Alright, in the Lovinger Theater, I don't know the exact nature of all of the -

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Okay.

ROBERT FARRELL: --areas that are not in compliance. I think some senior discontinued the class requirement. (sic)

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

CINDY BANKS: I would like to say something about the ADA. If you want to know, there are Offices of Accessibility Services on every campus, and the Directors could tell you specifically if there is a concern about the infrastructure, and the ability for disabled students to have access to classes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, good. Thank you. Okay, thank you so much for your testimony. Thank you for the pictures. It really brings it to light, and, um, we know that we are engaged in a process that does not have a quick immediate end, and being an activist myself prior to all these other

positions that I may have held, we know we've got to be in it for the long haul. We've got to pace ourselves, and encourage others to get involved and-- and to not give up the battle. Thank you.

[background comments, applause] Thank you. And we now have our final panel, and we're pleased to have Donovan Borington come and he's from CUNY University Student Senate. [pause] Thank you. Will you raise your hand, please? Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this Council, and to answer all questions honestly?

DONOVAN BORINGTON: Yes, I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Please give us your name and your testimony.

DONOVAN BORINGTON: Good afternoon, everyone and Chairman Barron. My--my name is Donovan Borington and I'm a student at John Jay College, and pursuing my masters in public administration and management operations. I'm here today to represent the students at the City University of New York on behalf of the CUNY University Student Senate, which is the governance organization representing all the students that attend the university. I'm here today

to express support of the Capital Plan Request that the University has put forth and to kind of highlight some of the things that—that was mentioned from the other panelists. To kind of share the student experiences, the Capital Request is—is needed to be supported in full. I know CUNY has put together this requests, and had mentioned that in years they haven't received the full amount, and I think that's what's really hurt our students. Just to talk about a student like myself who has gone throughout the CUNY system. I started out at community college, La Guardia and Queens, and then I transferred to Baruch College to pursue my bachelors and now I'm in John Jay so I've—I've had the experience to—to enjoy several CUNY campuses, and just to see that some campuses give support and others don't, and it takes time to provide the—the necessary campus that our students need because they're struggling, and—and sometimes I see, and it looks like it's our administration. What I've come to learn over the last few years in my studies is that it's—it's due to the—the failure to—to support CUNY as—as needed. Just think about our students who are graduating within five to six years, and they may not have the

campus they needed five or six years ago, or to prepare for a career 10 or 20 years from now. And one of the examples I used was seven years ago I started out at La Guardia Community College, and the campus didn't have the library that we needed. They're in the middle of requesting a new library, and now that I go back, they're working on that library, and it's almost finished. Just think about if I would have had that library ready for me seven years ago. Right? Now, I've—I've transferred to Baruch. They were in need of a new library, escalators, elevators fixed. They didn't have it. I've gone out. They're working on fixing one of their buildings at 17 Lex. I didn't that when I was a student there, but one fortunate thing I can say is now that I'm at John Jay in this Masters Program, they actually have a building that fits some of the needs for me to—to have a good study. But all of our buildings at CUNY don't have that opportunity. I'd probably be more prepared as a graduate student probably if I had those up to par buildings and facilities at La Guardia and Baruch at the time that I was studying. One of the stories I would like to share with you today is a friend of mine who I was

studying at La Guardia with she's now at Brooklyn College pursuing her degrees in communications and wants to get scholarships. During the courser of her studies she—she had a child and she—she called me up and she was considering dropping out because she didn't a place to take her child. I said well CUNY offers childcare services. Is Brooklyn accessible to you? Are you able to do that? Because she lives in Queens, and now to have to go from work in the city to Brooklyn is just—it's challenging. She was fortunately enough able to get child care services at Brooklyn, but when I think about that, if she didn't know me and I didn't inform her of that service, what would have happened? And then I think well, there's 270,000 other students, and some of them are probably in need of that service, and it's not available to them at every campus. How can you provide that service? This is where, you know, we're going in today's society. Our students need this type of support. As it was mentioned earlier, I—I think it was Council Member Vacca who said are—are we thinking ahead of the curve, not just what we need today, but what we need 10 or 20 years from now to prepare that



next generation because we—we don't have it at every campus. Some campuses do--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

DONOVAN BORINGTON: --some campuses don't. At La Guardia, you know, they're 100% Smart Classrooms. Every classroom has a projector. There may be one campus that doesn't, and those students are like me, and I—I think we—we really need to look at that, and it's been great having the Council as, you know, champions of CUNY and higher education providing the Merit Scholarship, supporting our programs like ASAP, but you cant have these programs and make them successful if you don't have the infrastructure or foundation in place. It just doesn't make any sense. So I would love to see ASAP expand to 25,000, but we're going to need chairs and classrooms for 25,000. We're going to need lights on, projectors. We're going to need all those things that our students need to be successful in a modern society moving forward. Not now 2020, but now 2030, 2040 and 2050 as technology continues to evolve, and—and I'll take any questions you have to kind of share of the student experience.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, good. Now, before I pose questions to you, I want to ask that Kristen Lee join this panel. Kristen Lee from CUNY, and she's a professor at CCNY. So that we don't have to have it set for a panel. [pause] Thank you. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before the Council, and to answer questions honestly?

KRISTEN LEE: Yes, I do.

DONOVAN BORINGTON: Thank you. Give us your name and your testimony.

KRISTEN LEE: My name is Kristen Lee. I'm a Professor of Biology at City College of New York. So thank you for—Chairperson Barron for the opportunity to highlight some of the infrastructure issues that we face at CUNY and in particular at CCNY or City College where I've been teaching and where my research laboratory has been located for 12 years. I want to first start by emphasizing that I'm not placing blame on the administration of CCNY. Like the rest of the failing US infrastructure our administration has been woefully—has been given a woefully inadequate budget for which they must prioritize academic excellence and infrastructure

needs. What I would like to emphasize is that the budget allocations to CCNY and the rest of CUNY have been severely underfunded for the entire time I have been at CCNY. This continued underfunding and these constant budget cuts through CCNY over the past three years are beginning to compromise our academic excellence. In 2013, I became Chair of the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences, CLAS Faculty Council. This body represents 19 departments out of 31 departments at CCNY, and 54 to 65% of the undergraduate students. There were so many complaints and worries about what was happening to academic programs the Faculty Council decided to survey all CLAS departments or chairs about the impact of the budget cuts on infrastructure, and our ability to maintain academic excellence, and 17 Chairs responded. The report is included as a supplement. The analysis of the data as well as the raw data are included so that you can read about these problems in more detail. The major problem raised by 15 of the 17 chairs was the abysmal state of our facilities. Department Chairs reported as other campuses apparently that water leaking in hallways and classroom and having to scurry around

waste buckets set to catch the falling water, and you can see that in figure 1 of my testimony. There were vermin problems. One professor mentioned that he couldn't understand why students were doing the wave and jumping up in his classroom until he realized that they were avoiding mice running across their feet. Paint was peeling. Unhealthy black mold was growing in classrooms, and hallways, and classroom chairs were broken. You can see in figure 2 in the testimony and less in the back of classrooms.

Classrooms were too hot or too cold. One summer the temperature rose to over 90 degrees in some classrooms, particularly including the health of our Muslim students, who were fasting during Ramadan, at risk. Waiting seven minutes for—at least seven minutes for an elevator in the North Academic Center, the NAC Building, became the normal rather than the exception making it difficult for students and in particular disabled students to make it to classes on time. Furthermore, at any given time, some set of escalators in Math was nonfunctional. The conditions of our facilities were depressing and disrespectful to the students, staff and faculty and non-conducive for learning or a scholarship. A second major

concern cited by 13 of the 17 department chairs was the dismal fate of our information technology, our IT. To be competitive and remain on the cutting edge students and faculty must access—must have access to information 24/7, which is one of the critical requirements for all of our universities. In fall, 2014, CLAS' Faculty Council conducting a second survey that focused on IT problems. Within a few week we received over 128 negative responses--there were no positive responses—from users on campus and again the analysis of the survey is included in your supplement document. While New York City has managed to provide Wi-Fi-Wi-Fi access to all subway stations, our classrooms and offices have limited Wi-Fi capability. The cost of upgrading systems to bring main feeds into buildings to expand bandwidth is over \$10 million, a much needed investment for learning and research. In some buildings data closets current service three floors rather than a single floor so that systems quickly become overloaded when many students access Wi-Fi simultaneously. City College did receive about \$6 million to upgrade our systems, but this amount only covers small check assignments (sic) to STEM buildings. Other buildings such as

Marshak and Shepard await further plumbing allocations. This wait is particularly vexing for non-STEM disciplines depending on ready access to the Internet, such as accessing music scores during class or illustrating advertising schemes in Branding and Integrated Communications Program. CCNY has such limited bandwidth that we ran out of static IP addresses and instead have to rely on dynamic IP addresses, which limits our ability to download applications for research and during classes.

Although there is an initiative to actually expand online learning, it's very difficult to do that when we do not have sufficient IT capabilities. An issue that directly impacts our science labs is the lack of natural gas pipe into our Science Teaching and Research Lab. Over five years ago, Con-Ed shut off all natural gas into the Marshak Building because of a gas leak, which will cost over \$1 million to locate and repair. This shut-off means that now our students have to sterilize items not with a Bunsen burner, but with propane tanks, which are easy to tip over and pose a potential safety issue to our students. We need the gas line fixed, and natural gas piped into the Marshak Building once again.

Limited resources have limited the ability of our administration to address such immense problems. In a 2015 follow-up survey--and again the analysis is in your supplement documents. Major problems still exist. We're also doing a follow-up survey currently for this academic year. As one chair so eloquently said, when you start from far, far below acceptable, and improve slowly, it's possible both to see significant change and to be discouraged and empowered by the state of things at once. Lastly, our campus is part of a larger Harlem community. We have a planetarium that needs to be retrofitted with technology for our science based students. This planetarium is also an important community asset for field trips for nearby K through 12 students. The swimming pool at Marshak has been out of service for several years. Not only is it a much needed physical fitness resource for our students missing, but in the past the swimming pool was also open to the community. Harlem residents, young and old, were able to use this facility and in some small part address the racial divide in swimming. To deprive the community of such a treasure is a travesty. My faculty colleagues are outstanding scholars who

believe strongly in the mission of City College to provide access, opportunity and upward mobility to the rich and poor alike. However, we are severely hampered by our delay—our detained facilities and decreasing budgets to maintain academic excellence. We need to start investing in our infrastructure, our students and the future of CCNY and CUNY. So I want to thank you for your consideration and your continued support of CUNY.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you to the panel for your testimony to Mr. Borington I want to encourage you to continue and we thank you for the leadership that you have provided in USS, and we encourage you to do that, and it does—your point about it was only a personal interaction that allowed you to refer the student to inquire as to whether Brooklyn College would be appropriate for her. It brings to mind the question of is there any kind of standardization that CUNY has that you're aware of that would highlight what the amenities are or what the support services are that students can expect at the various colleges? Do you know such a format or a schematic?



DONOVAN BORINGTON: [on mic] It-it's on some campuses. [on mic] On some campuses it--there is and for most students it's just difficult to find because there is a litany of information. And one of the things that we've, you know, kind of talked about is triaging the students to kind of see what services they may need, and some campuses do a very good job at that. Some campuses need to do a better job. So, and in particular for--for that student, just wasn't sure if--if--if they see repair. Like this is the questions that the student is asking. Was--does this facility meet my--my child's need. It's there but I'm concerned about that because you're telling me about all the things like there's lack of funding. And I said, you know, it--it--some campuses it's there. You have to look up a report to see if it meets the needs of your child in terms of safety by also education.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, if--do you know, if there's a comprehensive document or project site location what--whatever that says here or a list of the childcare centers that are at the colleges within the CUNY system. Do you know if there's one comprehensive document?

DONOVAN BORINGTON: [interposing] No.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, we need to-- well, I'll check and we'll find out from CUNY if there is such a document.

DONOVAN BORINGTON: I'll search as well.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, but it doesn't depend on an individual person knowing that there's a childcare program to get that benefit. Thank you and in terms of your testimony, Miss Lee, there's a document, which has just been published. It's titled the CUNY University of New York Five-Year Capital Plan 2017-18 through 21-22, and for the entry for City College it has the five-plan, and the problem again is that these projects exist in phases over many, many years, and when the funding is not adequate to get the whole project done, they break it up and funding into phases. That's how it has been explained to me. So this document does, in fact, look at that. So, for this year there are some projects at City College, which are identified actually to Fiscal Year 17-18. Fiscal Year 17 and Fiscal Year 18 and the-- What's indicated here is some campus ADA upgrades, the Marshak Building Rehabilitation for \$20 million, Shephard Hall Rehabilitation, Steinhart, HVAC system, campus wide

roof repairs and Davis Hall Library upgrades and security upgrades. So those are some of the projects that are identified. Hopefully, you can be able—you can have access to this document, and see how they are addressing the needs at City College, but certainly the problem is the bureaucracy and the problem is the state not giving adequate money for the operation of all of these campuses that are going forward. And someone had mentioned earlier about getting state support. We know that there are people in the State Assembly as well as the State Senate that understand the problems of CUNY many of those persons. Well, several of those persons themselves are alum from CUNY and—and SUNY as well, and understand the importance of making sure that we provide facilities that are welcoming that are safe that are encouraging and pleasant so that students will feel that they are valued and, you know, they have the opportunity as well to enjoy that kind of security and those safes surroundings. So we certainly know that people in Albany are going to be fighting, and perhaps they're even more encouraged now to address some of the issues that need to be addressed and increased, and we're going to be

working with our Assembly and Senate partners to make sure that we can push for that kind of funding, and agreement with the—the Memorandum of Understanding, which the Governor did not sign, did not adhere to was legislated as well. So we're going to be working with those partners there to push for those issues as well, but we do thank you for your testimony. Again, I will read all of the amendments to your documents. Thank you. Seeing no others who have submitted testimony, we are going to adjourn this hearing.

Thank you. [gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 15, 2017