CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK ----- Х TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES Of the COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION -----Х October 28, 2016 Start: 10:09 Recess: 11:09 HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall B E F O R E: COSTA CONSTANTINIDES COUNCIL MEMBERS: Stephen T. Levin Rory I. Lancman Donovan J. Richards Eric A. Ulrich World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road - Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

John Lee, Deputy Director Green Buildings and Energy Efficiency Mayor's Office of Sustainability, NYC Registered Architect

Margot Walker, Managing Director Green Infrastructure, Planning and Partnerships NYC Department of Environmental Protection

Jane Winkel, Roofmeadow

Marni Majorelle, Owner/Operator Alive Structures

Paul Miklowitz

| 1 | <pre><committee 3<="" environmental="" on="" pre="" protection=""></committee></pre> |
|----|--|
| 2 | [sound check, pause] |
| 3 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Good |
| 4 | morning. I am Costa Constantinides, Chair of the |
| 5 | Committee on Environmental Protection, and today the |
| 6 | committee will hear Intro 835, which will address |
| 7 | standards for green roofs in New York City. The |
| 8 | installation of a green roof system can offer |
| 9 | economic and environmental benefits. Green roofs can |
| 10 | benefit building owners financially by increasing |
| 11 | building installation thereby reducing heat-heating |
| 12 | and cooling costs, increasing the roof's systems' |
| 13 | protection against the elements, extending the roof's |
| 14 | life, reducing noise penetration into the building, |
| 15 | adding aesthetic value and marketability to the |
| 16 | building particularly in an urban setting and |
| 17 | increasing the building's value. Green roofs also |
| 18 | provide environmental benefits by reducing storm |
| 19 | water runoff, which mitigates combined sewer over- |
| 20 | sewage overflows to a limited degree, erosion and |
| 21 | flooding, reducing the urban heat island effect by |
| 22 | covering conventional dark roofing surfaces with |
| 23 | vegetation, which absorbs less heat, and reducing |
| 24 | greenhouse gas emissions by reducing cooling loads, |
| 25 | thereby requiring less combustion of fossil fuel |
| | I |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 4 |
|----|---|
| - | acception of Environment Mith for |
| 2 | associated with the HVAC equipment. With rew |
| 3 | exceptions, building products and materials must |
| 4 | comply with generally accepted industry-industry |
| 5 | standards. These standards establish thresholds for |
| 6 | safety and quality, demonstrate compliance with |
| 7 | specifications and create differentiation between |
| 8 | products. Over the past years, the ASTM |
| 9 | International convened a green roof task force, and |
| 10 | published standards relating to green roofs. |
| 11 | However, use of these standards depends on the type |
| 12 | of roof and the benefits sought. Use of these |
| 13 | standards for plan selection is not mandatory. We |
| 14 | want these green roofs that are installed in New York |
| 15 | City not only to survive, but to be a model for other |
| 16 | places that share our climate characteristics. Intro |
| 17 | 835 would establish standards for the selection, |
| 18 | installation and maintenance of plants for green roof |
| 19 | systems. Section 1 of Intro 835 would amend the |
| 20 | Building Code of the City of New York by adding a new |
| 21 | section, 1507-16-5 entitled Selection, Installation |
| 22 | and Maintenance of plants for green roof systems. |
| 23 | New Section 1507.16.5 would require that the |
| 24 | selection, installation and maintenance of the plants |
| 25 | for green roof system comply with the ASTM in 2400 |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 5 |
|----|---|
| 2 | Standard. Section 2 of it's-of Intro 835 would add a |
| 3 | new reference standard for the ATME 2400 to the list |
| 4 | of referenced standards in Chapter 35 of the Building |
| 5 | Code. Section 3 of the bill would-contains the |
| 6 | enactment clause and provides the bill takes effect |
| 7 | 180 days after an accident. This legislation will |
| 8 | provide environmental benefits to all New Yorkers. |
| 9 | I'm looking forward to hearing from all of you today, |
| 10 | and first I would like welcome the Administration |
| 11 | forward to be sworn. Thank you. [pause] |
| 12 | LEGAL COUNSEL: Can you please raise your |
| 13 | right hand? Do you swear or affirm to tell the |
| 14 | truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth |
| 15 | today? |
| 16 | JOHN LEE Yes. |
| 17 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: John, it's |
| 18 | good to see you. |
| 19 | JOHN LEE: Likewise. |
| 20 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And-and |
| 21 | thank you as always. We've had some great |
| 22 | partnerships and we're looking to partnering on this |
| 23 | bill as well so |
| 24 | JOHN LEE: We are for housing. Thank you |
| 25 | so much for the compliment. Good morning Chair |

| COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 0 |
|---|
| Constantinides, and members of the committee. I'm |
| John Lee, Deputy Director for Green Buildings and |
| Energy Efficiency in the Mayor's Office of |
| Sustainability, and I'm a registered architect in the |
| City of New York. I'm joined here this morning by |
| Margot Walker, Managing Director for Green |
| Infrastructure, Planning and Partnerships at the New |
| York City Department of Environmental Protection. |
| Thank you for the opportunity to testify today on |
| Introduction 835 in relation to establishing |
| requirements for the selection, installation and |
| maintenance of plants for green roof systems. |
| Introduction 835 would amend the Building Code to add |
| a new reference Standard ASTM E2400, a Standard Guide |
| for Selection, Installation and Maintenance of Plants |
| for Green Roof Systems to the New York City Building |
| Code. The Mayor and the Office of Sustainability |
| applauds Speaker Mark Viverito, Council Member |
| Constantinides and the City Council for a continue |
| effort to ensure quality installations of green roofs |
| and the improved sustainability of buildings in New |
| York City. The Mayor's Office of Sustainability, the |
| Department of Buildings, the Department of |
| Environmental Protection and the Department of Parks |
| |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 7 |
|----|---|
| 2 | and Recreation have long supported the installation |
| 3 | of green roofs. One NYC, for example, which outlines |
| 4 | the city's comprehensive climate change adaptation |
| 5 | and mitigation agenda recognizes the contributions |
| 6 | that green roofs can make to improving energy |
| 7 | efficiency and managing storm water runoff, reducing |
| 8 | greenhouse gas emissions and providing green spaces. |
| 9 | Green roofs provide insulation that helps keep |
| 10 | buildings warm in the winter and cool in the summer, |
| 11 | improving energy efficiency and reducing a building's |
| 12 | carbon footprint. As roughly 73% of New York City |
| 13 | greenhouse gas emissions come from buildings, |
| 14 | reducing energy consumption is a critical component |
| 15 | to achieving the city's goal of cutting greenhouse |
| 16 | gas emissions 80% by 2060. Green roofs also benefit |
| 17 | the environment by combining the urban heat island |
| 18 | effect, which is caused by the thermal and radiated |
| 19 | properties of our buildings and streets. The |
| 20 | concrete, asphalt and metals in our built environment |
| 21 | absorbs the sun's heat throughout the hottest |
| 22 | portions of the day, and re-radiate it back into the |
| 23 | atmosphere driving the localized temperatures even |
| 24 | higher, and increasing demands on cooling systems. |
| 25 | As we turn up our air conditioning on the hottest |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 8 |
|----|---|
| 2 | days, the equipment itself pushes extra heat into the |
| 3 | air. Thereby contributing to a feedback group that |
| 4 | increases localized ambient temperatures and impacts |
| 5 | the health of heat vulnerable New Yorkers. The US |
| 6 | Environmental Protection Agency has observed that in |
| 7 | the evening. In a city of one million or more can be |
| 8 | 22 degrees Fahrenheit warmer than in surrounding |
| 9 | rural areas. Green roofs replace the normally dark |
| 10 | roof surfaces with plants, which shade the roof's |
| 11 | surface and absorb rather than release solar |
| 12 | radiation into the surrounding air, and they help |
| 13 | keep the air cool evaporative transpiration by |
| 14 | releasing moisture into the atmosphere. Green roofs |
| 15 | also serve as a means of reducing storm water runoff. |
| 16 | Much of the storm water in New York City flows over |
| 17 | impervious surfaces into roof drains or catch basins |
| 18 | in the street, and from there into the sewers rather |
| 19 | than being absorbed into the ground. Impervious |
| 20 | surfaces including building rooftops cover |
| 21 | approximately 72% of New York City's 305 square miles |
| 22 | of land area, and generate a significant amount of |
| 23 | storm water runoff. The excessive water can pose |
| 24 | challenges to the city by triggering and combing |
| 25 | sewer-sewer overflows, washing improvement to our |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 9 |
|----|---|
| 2 | waters through the separate storm sewer system and |
| 3 | causing flooding. Green roofs can act as a sponge |
| 4 | storing a portion of rainfall in their membranes and |
| 5 | decreasing their demand on the city's storm water |
| 6 | management systems. This becomes particularly |
| 7 | important during large storms where the ability of |
| 8 | the store and diverse storm water can provide a clear |
| 9 | resilience of benefit. Finally, if implemented |
| 10 | widely, green roofs can improve the quality of life |
| 11 | or neighborhoods. Improving local air quality by |
| 12 | reducing greenhouse gas emissions and airborne |
| 13 | particulates as dust particles are trapped on foliage |
| 14 | and within the soil matrix, and by providing |
| 15 | additional green space for a building's tenants. In |
| 16 | the country's most dense urban environment, green |
| 17 | roofs can provide a respite for our New Yorkers' |
| 18 | urban daily life. The New York City Department of |
| 19 | Environmental Protection or DEP, the Department of |
| 20 | Parks and Recreation or NYC Parks and the Department |
| 21 | of Buildings or DOB all have significant experience |
| 22 | working with and supporting green roofs. Since 2011, |
| 23 | DEP has funded a number of green roof projects as a |
| 24 | storm water management practice through the Green |
| 25 | Infrastructure Grant Program. To date, the Grant |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 10 |
|----|--|
| 2 | Program has funded approximately \$14 million for 32 |
| 3 | projects. Of those funded, 16 have included green |
| 4 | roofs. DEP's goal for the Grant Program are to |
| 5 | manage one inter storm water runoff from impervious |
| 6 | surfaces on private property within the combined |
| 7 | sewer areas. DEP utilizes green infrastructure to |
| 8 | retain and manage storm water where it falls and |
| 9 | divert it from the city's wastewater system. Green |
| 10 | roofs are one of several tools used to achieve this |
| 11 | as a many properties are site constrained and the |
| 12 | only feasible place to manage one inch of rain is on |
| 13 | the roof. In addition to the storm water benefits, |
| 14 | green roofs offer other environmental benefits to |
| 15 | building owners and are an attractive building |
| 16 | amenity. Since 2007, NYC Parks has installed and |
| 17 | maintained its 46 green roof systems citywide |
| 18 | including the citywide services five borough complex |
| 19 | green roof on Randall's Island, Winakwa, the Bronx |
| 20 | Boroughs Parks Headquarters and a partnership with |
| 21 | Columbia University to install 12 green roofs plots |
| 22 | at 10 recreation center citywide. NYC Parks and |
| 23 | Columbia University are currently trialing 45 New |
| 24 | York City new species under controlled greenhouse |
| 25 | conditions to test their suitability for green roofs |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 11 |
|----|---|
| 2 | applications. Trials are in commercial green roof |
| 3 | soil medium under two watering regimens: Drought |
| 4 | tolerance, growth rate, and transpiration rate for |
| 5 | each species will be quantified. Transpiration rates |
| 6 | will indicate which species are best at taking up |
| 7 | water, an indication of their usefulness in |
| 8 | mitigation storm water runoff from city rooftops. |
| 9 | NYC Parks uses the information from its green roofs |
| 10 | to develop a model to project long-term impact and to |
| 11 | evaluate and design other green roofs. The 2014 New |
| 12 | York City Building Code provides standards for the |
| 13 | installation of green roof systems and requires |
| 14 | compliance with ANSI SPRI RP-14, which is a wind |
| 15 | design standard for vegetative roofing systems, and |
| 16 | ANSI SPRI VF-1, which is an external fire design |
| 17 | standard for vegetative roofs, or FM DS1-35, which is |
| 18 | the factual mutual data sheet for green roof systems. |
| 19 | These standards do include some guidelines for |
| 20 | vegetation and media selection, but they are in place |
| 21 | primarily to ensure that the green roof is safe in |
| 22 | terms of wind resistance, fire resistance and |
| 23 | structural considerations. While the Mayor's Office |
| 24 | and the City agencies are enthusiastic in supporting |
| 25 | green roofs, there are a number of concerns with |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 12 |
|----|---|
| 2 | Introduction 835. First, ASTM E2400 provides |
| 3 | information and general guidance only for plantings |
| 4 | installed and maintained as part of the green roof |
| 5 | system. ASTM E2400 does not include any specific |
| 6 | performance standards, prescriptive requirements or |
| 7 | benchmarks that would be enforceable by the |
| 8 | Department of Buildings. Nor are the general |
| 9 | performance characteristics and criteria outlined in |
| 10 | ASTM E2400 specific to New York City. For example, |
| 11 | Section 6.2.3.2 of ASTM E2400 states that the micro |
| 12 | climate of the specific location must be considered, |
| 13 | but does not identify which plants are appropriate |
| 14 | for different conditions or the criteria for a green |
| 15 | roof to be an acceptable code compliant insulation in |
| 16 | New York City. Second, ASTM E2400 includes |
| 17 | maintenance and seasonal consideration for plantings |
| 18 | that vague, and beyond the scope of the Department of |
| 19 | Buildings purview. For example, the Installation, |
| 20 | Methods, Maintenance and Irrigation Guidelines |
| 21 | outlined in Section 7.1, 8.1 and 8.1.1 respectively |
| 22 | speak in wide ranging terms propagating and |
| 23 | insulating plant material. The frequency of water |
| 24 | during the first year of planting, the monitoring of |
| 25 | rainfall as well as options available for a passive |
| | |

| - | |
|----|---|
| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 13 |
| 2 | and active irrigation. Each of these terms are |
| 3 | fairly ambiguous making impossible to enforce and, |
| 4 | therefore, inappropriate to be written into the |
| 5 | Building Code. Finally, currently Chapter 15 of the |
| 6 | 2014 New York City Building Code requires-requires |
| 7 | compliance with the aforementioned engineering |
| 8 | standards that are in place to ensure that a green |
| 9 | roof is installed safety. Whereas, ASTM E2400 is |
| 10 | published as a guide for vegetation selection, and |
| 11 | does not purport to establish enforceable standards. |
| 12 | Notwithstanding how the DOB would enforce the |
| 13 | proposed guidance, the benefits of adding this |
| 14 | language I the code is not entirely justified. |
| 15 | Through DEP's experiences, the City has learned that |
| 16 | each green roof design is unique for the individual's |
| 17 | building circumstances and project objectives. The |
| 18 | Building Code should allow design considerations to |
| 19 | meet the goals for each project while foremost |
| 20 | ensuring public health and safety. Professional |
| 21 | architects, engineers and green roof professionals |
| 22 | are the best people that help guide these decisions |
| 23 | rather than imposing restrictions through the |
| 24 | Building Code. We wholly support simplifying the DOB |
| 25 | and the Fire Department approvals requirements for |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 14 |
|----|---|
| 2 | green roofs in order to enable more insulations on |
| 3 | roof tops through throughout New York City. With |
| 4 | respect to the existing reference standards in the |
| 5 | Building Code, the agencies have identified specific |
| 6 | provisions in the reference standards that hinder |
| 7 | practical implementation of green roof systems and |
| 8 | limit the use of certain construction materials. The |
| 9 | Mayor's Office and the agencies would welcome the |
| 10 | opportunity to work with the City Council to refine |
| 11 | the requirements in the existing standards to allow |
| 12 | for more installations while improving the quality of |
| 13 | green roof systems and preserving the safety and |
| 14 | welfare of building occupants. Based upon the |
| 15 | collective experience with the many types of building |
| 16 | owners and operators and green roof professionals, we |
| 17 | believe that regulation of green roofs must be |
| 18 | flexible and clear path to enforcement must be |
| 19 | identified in order to be successful. The Mayor's |
| 20 | Office and the agencies represented here today look |
| 21 | forward to working with the Council to find ways to |
| 22 | ensure quality in green roof insulation while |
| 23 | pursuing flexibility for architects and designers to |
| 24 | create solutions specific to each building owners' |
| 25 | needs. We also see opportunity in learning more from |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 15 |
|----|---|
| 2 | stakeholders and advocates. Ultimately, we hope that |
| 3 | by working with the Council and other partners we can |
| 4 | ensure that any regulation on green roofs is |
| 5 | efficient, clear and enforceable while providing the |
| 6 | flexibility necessary for innovation and design and |
| 7 | construction. Thank for the opportunity to testify |
| 8 | on this important legislation. We share your goal to |
| 9 | ensure that green roof systems installed in New York |
| 10 | City are high quality and deliver on our shared |
| 11 | resil-shared resiliency and sustainability goals. |
| 12 | I'm happy to answer any questions that you may have |
| 13 | at this time. |
| 14 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you |
| 15 | for your testimony. So how many buildings in New York |
| 16 | City have rooftops that might be suitable for a green |
| 17 | roof system? |
| 18 | JOHN LEE: That's difficult to quantify |
| 19 | because the viability of green roofs or any |
| 20 | sustainable or roof application is unique to the |
| 21 | circumstances of the buildings. We have-had supplied |
| 22 | before to the Council on a number of bills in the |
| 23 | past, and expressing the need for flexibility to both |
| 24 | on public and private circuit buildings the |
| 25 | flexibility to consider all of the options that are |
| | I |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 16 |
|----|---|
| 2 | on the table. A particular building may be suitable |
| 3 | for solar PV may end up excluding the viability of |
| 4 | doing a green roof for the decision point at-or an |
| 5 | individual building owner. We can attest that the- |
| 6 | the opportunities are vast, and we ideally like to |
| 7 | see more and more, but it is ultimately up to the |
| 8 | unique circumstances of each building. |
| 9 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And can you |
| 10 | talk about the building and rooftop conditions that |
| 11 | would be best for the solar, the solar PV system |
| 12 | versus a green roof and vice versa? What-what do we |
| 13 | look for? What are the optima conditions on either |
| 14 | side? |
| 15 | JOHN LEE: Well, in those circumstances |
| 16 | we would look for, you know, a healthy dose of sun |
| 17 | exposure either for the-the-the next generation for |
| 18 | Sola PV or for the-the healthy viability of any |
| 19 | plantings on the green roofs. After the physical or |
| 20 | technical viability of that site for either of those |
| 21 | alternatives, it becomes ultimately the objectives of |
| 22 | the building owner and—and the business objectives of |
| 23 | the building owner. Green roofs provide more |
| 24 | statements in the talk of this hearing, and also in |
| 25 | our testimony here. Benefits beyond just the |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 17 |
|----|---|
| 2 | insulation and the greenhouse gas emission for |
| 3 | control, and if it is a building amenity, that can be |
| 4 | saleable and marketable to a building owner. Solar |
| 5 | PV provides a potential revenue source or at least |
| 6 | the opportunity to offset operating costs, and these |
| 7 | are the business decisions that are subject to the |
| 8 | whim of the building owner. |
| 9 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I think we |
| 10 | share that goal of wanting to give that flexibility |
| 11 | and making sure that we're encouraging both, right? |
| 12 | Just kind of going back to green roofs for a second. |
| 13 | How many buildings—I mean how many buildings are |
| 14 | operated currently in-in the city where they have |
| 15 | green roof systems? |
| 16 | JOHN LEE: That is also difficult to |
| 17 | quantify because there is in many respects a gray |
| 18 | line for what we define as a green roof per se, and |
| 19 | many [coughs] roof gardens and it's-it's offered |
| 20 | colloquially called among the real estate community |
| 21 | that's provided purely for recreational purposes for |
| 22 | the-the occupants of the building. While it |
| 23 | functions as a green roof, it may not necessarily be |
| 24 | declared as a green roof. The-the number of |
| 25 | buildings that have currently come through the city, |

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 18 2 either through the Green Infrastructure Grant program 3 or through the Green Roof Tax Abatement Program is 4 quantifiable. I do not have the numbers on hand today, and I will have to get back to you with that 5 information. 6 7 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And what are the-what are the risks and hazards of having a green 8 9 roof installed that doesn't abide by the industry standards? 10 11 JOHN LEE: So that didn't abide by the--12 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: 13 [interposing] That doesn't abide by the industry standards? 14 15 JOHN LEE: Well, so our current industry 16 standards that we have in place in the Building Code 17 are addressing the wind resistance and the structural consideration and the fires resistance. And so those 18 19 all are, you know, in place to ensure the safety of 20 the occupants, and those-those standards must be 21 abided by in all-in all circumstances for lawfully permitted green roof insulations in New York City. 2.2 23 There is a-another I suppose you could characterize as operational risks that come with integrating the 24 system and that I'm surprised that they have to be 25

1COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION192maintained. These are living systems, and they have3to have adequate access to water and that healthy4soil needed.

5 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And-and we 6 know after installation have there been a number of 7 green roofs that have failed or if they have failed 8 for what reasons or, you know, where-where-how are we 9 doing as far as sustaining.

JOHN LEE: Those buildings that we have 10 11 observed on an anecdotal level have been kind of due 12 to lack of meetings. Again, the-the soil medium, you 13 know, watering has to be maintained, and then-and-and 14 I guess you could say an irresponsibly specified 15 planting within a shaded area that was not adopted for that kind of environment it made the plantings a 16 17 failure. That being said, the plantings can be 18 changed, and at a later date. However, within the 19 city run programs particularly around a green roof 20 top statement for them there is a requirement for 21 maintenance and inspection during the tax abatement 2.2 period.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And as-and as far as impediments what-what-what do you think is keeping us from seeing more green roofs installed in 1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 New York City and how do we get past that? How do we 3 overcome those-those barriers?

20

4 JOHN LEE: First is site viability. We are a very dense I'm going to say built up city. 5 The-the many of our rooftops are in shade, and are 6 7 not ideal candidates for either green roofs or solar 8 PV. Aside from the site viability, there's a matter 9 of cost, and there-there isn't necessarily a tangible return on investment always for the building owner 10 11 for providing a green roof as opposed to a solar PV where there's a-an identifiable revenue stream there. 12 13 The-the-while we do have places, programs in place to encourage the-the uptake of green roof 14 15 systems such as the Green Grant program and Tax Abatement Program. Again, these are always have to 16 17 be measured against the competing interests of the 18 building owner and the-the operating costs that they-19 they-they incur.

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Do you think anything to do with the standards or-or the selection or how do we make it easier for them to sort of cut through some of the-is there any red tape that we can make easier?

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 JOHN LEE: No, we can certainly always 3 make permitting in general in New York City easier 4 and yet the-the-one of the-the issues that come up 5 with being in a very dense city is that we also have a very high degree of seniors in place for our 6 7 safety, and the-the sort of residual impacts of any 8 universal system. I have not observed any 9 impediments that have been imposed by the code in terms of plant selection per se. Again, these-the 10 11 standards that we do have in place are primarily for 12 fire and structural concerns, and as a result they 13 are subject to the fire department and the Department 14 of Buildings approvals. I stated in my testimony I 15 think there-I believe there are opportunities for 16 improvement to the system and this a-a-a continuously 17 evolving and ongoing effort between the agencies and 18 the Mayor's Office. 19 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And-and I

15 guess the last think I'll ask is, I mean it's germane 20 to this bill, but as-as far as applications and so 22 on, they're able to be done electronically or how-how 23 does one-one apply today a green roof? 24 JOHN LEE: The current permanent regime

25 that is in place is and it-it still remains on a

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 22 |
|----|---|
| 2 | Legacy system. The Department of Buildings is in the |
| 3 | process of implementing an electronic filing system |
| 4 | that will ultimately be deployed for all permanent |
| 5 | activity in the department. Currently, they're- |
| 6 | they're deploying it in stages beginning with the so- |
| 7 | called—the more easily amenable permit pipes except |
| 8 | that they're on plumbing, but we expect to see the |
| 9 | rollout, you know, within the next 18 months or 24 |
| 10 | months for that work. It was actually Captor |
| 11 | cleaning their systems. |
| 12 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I appreciate |
| 13 | that and definitely I think we-we-I share that goal |
| 14 | with you of making it as easy as possible to be-to be |
| 15 | more green and be more sustainable. If-if we can |
| 16 | make it as easy to be green as it is to be |
| 17 | traditional I think we can level the playing field. |
| 18 | It's not only costs, it's time. So I-I-I applaud the |
| 19 | efforts of DOB for making these changes, and I'm |
| 20 | looking forward to partnering with you not on those |
| 21 | but on-on green roofs as well. So thank you for your |
| 22 | testimony today, and I appreciate your good efforts. |
| 23 | JOHN LEE: Thank you, Council Member. |
| 24 | Thank you. |
| 25 | |
| | |

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 23 2 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I'd like to 3 invite up Jane Winkel from Roofmeadow in 4 Philadelphia. [pause] Okay, I'll have our-have the 5 attorney swear you in. LEGAL COUNSEL: Would you please raise 6 7 your right hand? Do you swear or affirm to tell the 8 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth 9 today? JANE WINKLE: [off mic] I do. 10 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Just turn on 11 12 the mic when you. Okay. There you go. 13 JANE WINKEL: Thank you. I'd like to 14 thank the Committee on Environmental Protection for 15 inviting Roofmeadow to testify at this hearing today. 16 Roofmeadow is a landscape architecture and civil 17 engineering firm specializing in the design of green 18 roofs, and has been designing roofs for almost two 19 decades making Roofmeadow one of the first, if not 20 the first North American design firm to bring German 21 style green roofs to the United States. Charlie Miller, Roofmeadow President was a contributor to 2.2 23 sections of the Guidelines for the design and construction of storm water management systems that 24 25 pertain to green roofs. And I am Roofmeadows

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 24 |
|----|---|
| 2 | Director of Stewardship and I've been with the |
| 3 | company since 2002. Our comments today are as |
| 4 | follows: Introduction No. 835 refers to a bill ASTM |
| 5 | E2600 and that guide is titled Standard Guide Vapor |
| 6 | Encroachment Screening on the Property Involved in |
| 7 | Real Estate Transitions, which is not relevant to the |
| 8 | design, construction and maintenance of green roofs. |
| 9 | The ASTM Standards are intended as guidance only. |
| 10 | Section 511 of E2400 states: This guide provides |
| 11 | general guidance only. It is important to consult |
| 12 | with a professional horticulturalist, green roof |
| 13 | consultant or work with similar professionals that |
| 14 | are knowledgeable, experience and acquaintance- |
| 15 | acquainted with green roof technology and plants. |
| 16 | Standards and guides are subject to continue review |
| 17 | and updating. And the ASTM E2400 standard is no |
| 18 | exception. We find E2400 to be deficient in some of |
| 19 | its recommendations based on more recent information |
| 20 | and experience with green roof horticulture. In |
| 21 | particular Section 612 states extensive green roofs |
| 22 | generally require less maintenance than intensive |
| 23 | green roofs. It's my experience that extensive green |
| 24 | roofs perform best when they are cultivated and |
| 25 | subject to a regular maintenance program. Section |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 25 |
|----|---|
| 2 | 622 contains guidance on perennials and ornamental |
| 3 | grasses under the heading Aesthetic. Many |
| 4 | horticulturalist would disagree with some of the |
| 5 | guidance in that head-under that heading including |
| 6 | the appearance of summer perennials and the timing of |
| 7 | grass pruning. Section 822 advises against the use |
| 8 | of fertilizers stating these chemicals could |
| 9 | potentially hasten degradation of the root membrane. |
| 10 | In almost two decades of green roof work we have |
| 11 | never seen a waterproofing membrane suffer damage |
| 12 | because of amendments added to promote the |
| 13 | horticultural performance of greenery. Furthermore, |
| 14 | waterproofing systems selected for using green roots |
| 15 | should be resistant to common horticultural |
| 16 | preparations, and also damage to microbial action and |
| 17 | root action. This section also includes a passage |
| 18 | suggestion weeds can be controlled by utilizing |
| 19 | shadow—shallow medium layers and foregoing (sic) |
| 20 | irrigation. Many reefs cannot survive in shallow |
| 21 | medium depth, but anyone who has seen weed growing |
| 22 | through the cracks in their concrete sidewalk can |
| 23 | understand that this section of the guide is not |
| 24 | supported by general observation. Building owners |
| 25 | with green roofs relying on the thickness of the |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 26 |
|----|--|
| 2 | profile to limit weed pressure may be disappointed |
| 3 | with the botanical invaders that take their green |
| 4 | roof. The success of a green roof depends on a wide |
| 5 | variety of factors including the vitality of plant |
| 6 | cover. If the committee wishes to include ASTM |
| 7 | standard in the Building Code, then AST Standard |
| 8 | Guide E2777 Standard Guide for Green Roofs offers a |
| 9 | much broader set of guidelines and best-best |
| 10 | practices and also incorporates ASTM Standard Guide |
| 11 | E2400 by reference. It provides greater detail and |
| 12 | tech-technical depth, which can be used by |
| 13 | architects, landscape architects and green roof |
| 14 | professionals to develop significant green roof |
| 15 | projects. ASTM E2777 offers general information to |
| 16 | practitioners in the field of green roof design and |
| 17 | construction. The guide encourages innovative but |
| 18 | responsible green roof design with the focus on |
| 19 | performance and quality assurance. E2777 will not |
| 20 | restrict adventurous designers, but will provide |
| 21 | parameters for design standards that will lead to |
| 22 | safe and long lasting rooftop environments. Please |
| 23 | keep in mind that guides are not standards and they |
| 24 | are subject to interpretation by developers, |
| 25 | designers, and reviewers. Therefore, we recommend |
| | l de la constante de |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 27 |
|----|---|
| 2 | including a statement of how the information in the |
| 3 | guide is to be used in the context of the code. |
| 4 | While ASTM E2777 is an acceptable guide, I'd like to |
| 5 | recommend that the kit-the committee consider |
| 6 | amending the Building Code to include guidelines for |
| 7 | the design and construction of storm water management |
| 8 | systems developed by the New York City Department of |
| 9 | Environmental Protection in consultation with the New |
| 10 | York City Building Department. The Guide was |
| 11 | developed specifically for New York City to encourage |
| 12 | public and private implementation of green |
| 13 | infrastructure citywide. The guide contains much of |
| 14 | the same information contained in ASTM Standard |
| 15 | Guides E2400 and E2777. Like these other guides, it |
| 16 | should also undergo regular review and should be |
| 17 | updated to reflect our understanding factors |
| 18 | influencing green roofs perform—performance. |
| 19 | Roofmeadow worked on the development of the guide, |
| 20 | and would be please to work with the city to update |
| 21 | the document to reflect current thinking and best |
| 22 | practices in the field of green roof design, |
| 23 | construction and maintenance. The committee may also |
| 24 | want to consider amending the code to include |
| 25 | performance requirements for green roofs that are |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 28 |
|----|---|
| 2 | important to the New York City Department of |
| 3 | Environment Protection. For example, the Code might |
| 4 | establish seasonally adjusted minimum plant cover |
| 5 | requirements. |
| 6 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you. |
| 7 | JANE WINKEL: Thank you. |
| 8 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I have a few |
| 9 | questions. |
| 10 | JANE WINKEL: Okay. |
| 11 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Just sort |
| 12 | of speaking to what do-what do you feelI asked the |
| 13 | Administration the same question What do you feel |
| 14 | main impediments to-that are preventing building |
| 15 | owners from implementing green roofs in New York |
| 16 | City? |
| 17 | JANE WINKEL: I guess probably it depends |
| 18 | on the building owner's goals for the building, but I |
| 19 | think many of the-the things that would prevent them |
| 20 | from doing it would be financial. There has to be |
| 21 | some sort of benefit for them if they are installing |
| 22 | a green roof for storm water management purposes to |
| 23 | become part of the green infrastructure system of the |
| 24 | city. |
| 25 | |
| | |

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 29 2 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Okay, and as 3 far as does it-it require any credentialing to 4 install a green roofs in-in the city? JANE WINKEL: I'm sorry. 5 6 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Even get to-7 the installation of a green roof system does it 8 require any credentialing? [pause] Do you need to 9 have some sort of credentials on it to be able to do it or--? 10 11 JANE WINKEL: I-I mean to design a--CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh. [12 13 JANE WINKEL: -green roof--14 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh. 15 JANE WINKEL: --you should-I'm not 16 familiar with the New York City requirements. I-my 17 firm is a landscape architectural firm, a civil 18 engineering firm. So if you're submitting documents 19 to city, you do need to have credentials to-to submit 20 permit documents. 21 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Oh, okay. 2.2 I-I understand what you're saying Okay, as far as 23 how do you feel our regulatory environment is here in New York City to help foster-to help foster green 24 roofs? 25

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 30 2 JANE WINKEL: I can't say for sure. I 3 mean I know that in Philadelphia there have been many regulations that have been established to incentivize 4 green roofs, but I'm not familiar--5 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: 6 7 [interposing] Okay. 8 JANE WINKEL: --as familiar with New 9 York's regulations. 10 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Okay, well 11 I-I def-I definitely appreciate all of your technical 12 expertise on-on the-on the code and-and I definitely would love to continue our conversation how we move 13 14 forward and-and figure out a best way to-to move 15 forward on these big results. So thank you for your 16 time. 17 JANE WINKEL: Thank you. 18 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And thank 19 you for your trip today. [laughs] [background 20 comments, pause] Alright, so we have Marni 21 Majorelle. I apologize if I pronounced your name 2.2 wrong and-and Maria Wynn-Wynn. 23 MARNI MAJORELLE: We go together. CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Yes, yes, 24 25 just please come up. You have a yes. Yes.

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 31 2 MARNI MAJORELLE: Good. [background 3 comments, pause] Hi. 4 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Marion. 5 MARNI MAJORELLE: Okay. LEGAL COUNSEL: Would you please raise 6 7 your right hands. Do you swear or affirm to tell the 8 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth 9 today? MARNI MAJORELLE: I do. 10 11 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you. 12 MARNI MAJORELLE: Okay, so thank, Marian. 13 Thank you everybody for your interest in this really 14 important topic. So my name is Marni Majorelle. I'm 15 the owner of the Alive Structures, a landscape design 16 and installation company that I founded in 2007. I 17 have a background in biology, conservation and 18 landscape design, and my partner's expertise is in 19 construction and on districts. And so together with these two fields we are able to effectively and 20 21 practically install-file diverse areas on rooftops, 2.2 terraces and in gardens. But we have a specialty in 23 green roof installation. I am a native New Yorker, and I love the city, and I love nature, and I believe 24 that we do not have to choose between these two 25

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 32 |
|----|---|
| 2 | things. If more areas in our city were converted to |
| 3 | open green spaces, natural habitat and used green |
| 4 | infrastructure the city would be a healthier, more |
| 5 | beautiful and less polluted city. Rooftops are an |
| 6 | underutilized space, and with real estate on the |
| 7 | ground being so valuable it is space that property |
| 8 | owners can consider greening without losing the |
| 9 | economic value of the land. Since 2007, my company |
| 10 | has installed somewhere between 20 and 30 green roofs |
| 11 | using a range three roof systems, plants, |
| 12 | installation techniques and working with a divers |
| 13 | clientele. I have witnessed interest in green roofs |
| 14 | and green infrastructure grow in New York City |
| 15 | through various studies conducted by Columbia |
| 16 | University, BET, CET and many other universities and |
| 17 | city industry all over this country. Knowledge and |
| 18 | understanding of green roofs has also grown. We know |
| 19 | that green roofs produce air and water pollution, |
| 20 | reduce island effect and reduce energy consumption. |
| 21 | A green roof can create habitats that is essential |
| 22 | for bird and migrating birds, butterflies as well as |
| 23 | other species who live in this city. Green roofs can |
| 24 | also provide badly needed open green space for |
| 25 | building tenants, office workers, school kids, and |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 33 |
|--------|---|
| 2 | community residents. Psychologically and physically |
| ۱ ۱ | city dwellers face a great deal of stress on a daily |
| 5 | basis Manu wang people in New York City suffer |
| 4 | basis. Many young people in New York City suffer |
| 5 | from Asthma and other pollution related illnesses. |
| 6 | Attention Deficit Disorder, low self-esteem, and |
| 7 | aggressive behavior in children and adult living in |
| 8 | cities have been attributed to decreasing amounts of |
| 9 | time in time in several studies. Access to natural |
| 10 | areas has proven to be therapy making us healthier, |
| 11 | less violent and smarter. With all of this knowledge |
| 12 | and excitement about green roofs, it is surprising |
| 13 | that New York City has not taken greater initiative |
| 14 | to make green roofs more abundant in New York City |
| 15 | and easier to install. In several countries in |
| 16 | Europe and in states in this country, New York City- |
| 17 | sorry—green roofs have been made mandatory for new |
| 18 | construction. So, as we can see there are plenty of |
| 19 | examples all over the world where green roofs have |
| 20 | become part of mainstream construction, and have been |
| 21 | made affordable. Some of the larger impediments to |
| 22 | installing green roofs I think most of us who have |
| 23 | experience doing constructionthere are several of |
| 24 | us here-know that the biggest impediment is |
| 25 | financial. The second biggest impediment would be |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 34 |
|----|---|
| 2 | the structural support of the building. There are |
| 3 | several property owners in New York City who would |
| 4 | like to install a green roof, but their brownstone in |
| 5 | Park Slope, for example, can't support the weight. |
| 6 | Where the large industrial building that's one story |
| 7 | in Long Island City would be a perfect candidate. |
| 8 | However, that property owner might not be interested |
| 9 | in new environments or spending what could be |
| 10 | considered a large amount of money just to help the |
| 11 | environment. But his impact would be greater than |
| 12 | the Park Slope brownstone retrofit. Currently, so I |
| 13 | said these are the major challenges to installing |
| 14 | green roofs. The generalby our estimatesexpense |
| 15 | for a green roof run between \$25.00 to \$35.00 per |
| 16 | square foot. This is just for an expensive green |
| 17 | roof like a basic green roof, your average green roof |
| 18 | planted with seedling (sic) species, low growing and |
| 19 | about three to four inches of soil dust. For |
| 20 | intensive green roof, that has deeper soil median and |
| 21 | it's planted with larger flowering perennials and |
| 22 | grasses, the cost can be upwards of \$40 per square |
| 23 | foot. The logistics of installing a green roof many |
| 24 | components in New York City can be difficult often |
| 25 | requiring expensive trans limits and/or many laborers |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 35 |
|----|---|
| 2 | to bring soil, live plants and rolls of geo textile |
| 3 | and bring this manually to a roof. It is not an easy |
| 4 | job to coordinate all these different trades and |
| 5 | materials. So even though \$35 per square foot sounds |
| 6 | like a lot, when you think about all the different |
| 7 | materials, the soil, the layers and actual live |
| 8 | plants being planted, the labor and the materials |
| 9 | together, it's really that not that expensive, and |
| 10 | this come at a cost to the contractor who is usually |
| 11 | not making a lot of money on these jobs. And this is |
| 12 | unfortunate because we could be a source of growing |
| 13 | economic, you know, a burgeoning field where we could |
| 14 | be hiring more and more people. My company has just |
| 15 | hired two people that we've worked with through the |
| 16 | Fortune Society where formerly incarcerated people |
| 17 | find help in new green professions, and this is a way |
| 18 | that we are helping people find work that they can- |
| 19 | they can learn, and we are teaching them actively |
| 20 | every season in bringing home more people. But the |
| 21 | more jobs we have, the more people we can bring. If |
| 22 | we don't have the jobs, we can't train people. We |
| 23 | can't help people. We can't provide stable jobs. We |
| 24 | just can only provide seasonal and temporary work if |
| 25 | we don't have enough consistent green roofs. |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 36 |
|----|---|
| 2 | Currently the-the two programs that are on offer in |
| 3 | New York City through the Department of Buildings, |
| 4 | there is a property, a tax rebate and then through |
| 5 | the DEP there's the Green Infrastructure Grant |
| 6 | Program. I applaud both of these program, and both of |
| 7 | them my company has worked with in the past. But |
| 8 | those have been-have serious challenges that fell |
| 9 | short of their goal of creating more green roofs and |
| 10 | making it easier to get more green roofs. So, the |
| 11 | largest problem with the tax rebate is that it does |
| 12 | not offer enough money in a rebate, and it's only for |
| 13 | one year. It also requires a fair amount of paper |
| 14 | work that must go through the Department of |
| 15 | Buildings. You have to get an expeditor. This would |
| 16 | not be necessarily-necessary to do if you were just |
| 17 | getting a green roof and you didn't want to get the |
| 18 | tax rebate. You wouldn't have to go through all that |
| 19 | paperwork. So this type of property rebate only |
| 20 | proves effective when it's a very large project or |
| 21 | it's a project that incorporates many different |
| 22 | aspects of construction and it's a gut renovation. So |
| 23 | this has been for the most part an ineffective way to |
| 24 | promote green roofs. It's-I have not had any clients |
| 25 | who want to this today since 2007. So, it hasn't |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 37 |
|----|---|
| 2 | been very popular. The other program is the Green |
| 3 | Infrastructure Grant Program offered by the PEP, |
| 4 | which is I think it's a great program because it |
| 5 | offers a 100% rebate for the cost of the design and |
| 6 | the installation of the green roof. There are still, |
| 7 | however, impediments to this program really being an |
| 8 | effective way of installing green infrastructure in |
| 9 | New York City, the main problem being that: |
| 10 | (1) Property owners don't know about the |
| 11 | program because there has been so much commotion of |
| 12 | it. |
| 13 | (2) The application is complex, and often |
| 14 | requires professional help. |
| 15 | (3) The Funding Agreement requires the |
| 16 | property owner to pay all of the upfront costs; and |
| 17 | (4) The Restrictive Covenant requires |
| 18 | property owners to maintain and warranty the green |
| 19 | roofs for the next 20 years. |
| 20 | My suggestions are as follows: If there |
| 21 | is a larger repaid and expedited paperwork offered by |
| 22 | the Department of Buildings, then this would be an |
| 23 | effective way to promote green roofs. If the |
| 24 | Department of Environmental Protection offered more |
| 25 | assistance with the Green Infrastructure Grant |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 38 |
|----|---|
| 2 | Application and producing the structural analysis |
| 3 | report, assisted in obtaining interest free loans for |
| 4 | successful applicants, expedited the reimbursement |
| 5 | process, and promoted the program through largescale |
| 6 | info advertisement, and the relaxed the restrictive |
| 7 | covenant, then this green infrastructure program |
| 8 | would be more effective. And I want to say that the |
| 9 | restrictive covenants wouldn't be an issue if green |
| 10 | roofs were mandatory or had a significant financial |
| 11 | incentive. Then the restrictive covenant would not |
| 12 | be seen as an obstacle for property owners. In fact, |
| 13 | it would be looked at as an asset. And if more |
| 14 | property owners were to-were made to pay to taxes on |
| 15 | the impermeable surface area of their property, this |
| 16 | would motivate people to install rain gardens, |
| 17 | bioswales, permeable concrete and green roofs. As it |
| 18 | currently stands, there's not enough financial |
| 19 | incentive for either of these programs to be |
| 20 | effective on a larger scale. Thank you. |
| 21 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you. |
| 22 | Next. |
| 23 | MARIA WYNN: Good morning everybody. Mr. |
| 24 | Chairman, I want to thank you for introducing this |
| 25 | bill and its overall progressive direction. We've |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 39 |
|----|---|
| 2 | heard quite a bit this morning already on the various |
| 3 | guidelines out there, and I want to share a few |
| 4 | thoughts about how these guidelines would impact |
| 5 | reality. First, how can we adopt greater use of |
| 6 | living architecture, which includes—includes green |
| 7 | roofs and green walls to address climate change, and |
| 8 | how can we ensure that the living architecture |
| 9 | projects actually contribute as much positive |
| 10 | environment or impact as possible. Now, City |
| 11 | government can take the lead on this with a portfolio |
| 12 | of city-owned properties. However, the Department of |
| 13 | Design and Construction does not procure services for |
| 14 | green or in-vegetative roofs directly. I was told |
| 15 | this by the Commissioner's office in August. In the |
| 16 | construction of a public building in Brooklyn, the |
| 17 | awarded contracts left it up to the discretion of the |
| 18 | construction manager to find a green roof supplier. |
| 19 | So unless I'm going to think something, how can the |
| 20 | DBC track the performance of installed green roofs |
| 21 | and green walls? But my second point is without |
| 22 | directly working with a talented and experienced |
| 23 | professional in New York's living architecture |
| 24 | industry, how can the city influence the elevation of |
| 25 | performance norms? Climate change is on everyone's |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 40 |
|----|---|
| 2 | mind. Living architecture projects, green roofs, |
| 3 | green walls, are important adaptation tools as the |
| 4 | climate changes faster and faster. My first point is |
| 5 | the opportunity really exists for New York City to |
| 6 | become-to become a leading center of living |
| 7 | architecture not unlike the city's successes we're |
| 8 | seeing in the film and TV production industry and |
| 9 | Sil-Silicon Alley. As the world plays catch-up in our |
| 10 | response to climate change, this city can pace at |
| 11 | (sic) Toronto, Paris, Chicago, Philadelphia, |
| 12 | Washington, San Francisco and now Cordova, Argentina. |
| 13 | The green roof and green wall professionals in the |
| 14 | city stand ready to work with you—you all in this |
| 15 | committee to craft legislation that works for the |
| 16 | particular conditions of our city. Thank you. |
| 17 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you. |
| 18 | I want to recognize Council Member Eric Ulrich from |
| 19 | Queens that's here today, and Council Member Steve |
| 20 | Levin from Brooklyn. Now I'll turn it over to |
| 21 | Council Member Levin for some questions before I come |
| 22 | back. |
| 23 | COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I just want to |
| 24 | thank this panel very much for your advocacy and for |
| 25 | the work that you do to advance the living-the living |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 41 |
|----|---|
| 2 | infrastructure and living architecture and green |
| 3 | roof-the green roof movement in New York City. I |
| 4 | want to say for the record, I think that the job that |
| 5 | the City of New York does when it comes to green |
| 6 | roofs is woefully inadequate, frustratingly in |
| 7 | adequate, and every month that goes by that we don't |
| 8 | have a mandate of new buildings or a mandate or city- |
| 9 | owned buildings to have green roofs, is missed |
| 10 | opportunities, and we're not going to pay for it. |
| 11 | It's our children's children that are going to pay |
| 12 | for it because we have an opportunity in New York |
| 13 | City to have a real impact on our carbon footprint of |
| 14 | the entire country, and the main offender when it |
| 15 | comes to heat island effect and carbon emissions in |
| 16 | New York City are our buildings. And this is the |
| 17 | technology that is needed to have a long-term impact |
| 18 | on that, and-but you look out-out the window right |
| 19 | now, you look at Downton Brooklyn, and you see |
| 20 | hundreds of thousands of-of square feet of new space |
| 21 | that has just been built in the last five years, and |
| 22 | that jut-all that is a missed opportunity. It's just |
| 23 | one big missed opportunity because we did not create |
| 24 | mandates like they do in Toronto or programs like |
| 25 | they have in Washington, D.C. or in Philadelphia. |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 42 |
|----|---|
| 2 | There are best practices out there. This isn't |
| 3 | rocket science, but we have-we have every-every |
| 4 | building cycle that we don't have a large percentage |
| 5 | of green roofs, it's a missed opportunity in my book. |
| 6 | So I want to thank you very much for doing what |
| 7 | you're doing. We're going to keep up the pressure, |
| 8 | but it's really, it's frustrating and I think that we |
| 9 | have done-we have not done a good job, and we should |
| 10 | be looking to what other cities a doing and finding |
| 11 | out how they made it happen and doing it ourselves. |
| 12 | But I want to thank you because you are the ones are |
| 13 | the cutting edge of this and leading the charge here |
| 14 | in New York City. Thank you. |
| 15 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you, |
| 16 | Council Member Levin, and I want to thank both of you |
| 17 | for your efforts and definitely I appreciate your |
| 18 | testimony and answering my questions before I can |
| 19 | answer them-or ask them. [laughter] So thank you for |
| 20 | that. We definitely want to make sure that we're- |
| 21 | we're-we're-we're continuing this conversation and |
| 22 | finding, as Steve said, a way to move forward that we |
| 23 | can get more green roofs installed in New York City. |
| 24 | MARNI MAJORELLE: I'm sorry, but I did |
| 25 | just want to say there was something that came up |
| | |

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 43 2 earlier about solar panels that I feel that we didn't 3 discuss how green roofs assist PV panels in optimal 4 performance earlier. I hope that maybe somebody else 5 can address that in further detail later. CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Well, look, 6 7 we're going to have, you know, someone else testi-8 testify after that. [laughs] Thank you. [banging 9 door, pause] [background comments] COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Okay. 10 I am 11 Council Member Ulrich, and probably DEP's worse 12 nightmare that I would be chairing this committee, 13 but [laughter] notwithstanding, now we have one more person who came to testify and that is Paul [banging 14 15 door]--PAUL MIKLOWITZ: [interposing] Miklowitz. 16 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Miklowitz. I 17 18 apologize. Miklowitz. Thank you, sir, please take a 19 seat. From the Bronx. 20 LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you swear or affirm to 21 tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the 2.2 truth today? 23 PAUL MIKLOWITZ: I do. COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Please proceed. 24 25

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 PAUL MIKLOWITZ: [off mic] And apologies. I got it at small room and got trapped up on there. 3 4 The-this is a great thinking forward. I'm going to 5 hand-I have to say that New York City has got a Building Code built for Rolls Royces, and I think we 6 7 need something like a Tesla here. Let me say this 8 another way, basically this is a great move forward, 9 but it's small. Another way to put it is that we have resources here that are enormous. By that I 10 11 mean when you look at the roof spaces, it's 34 square 12 miles. When you look at something like the gray 13 water in New York City, one-half of the wastewater of 1.2 billion gallons, the gray water is six times the 14 15 peak load in New York City. I have built buildings in New York where they pay 40% less of their air 16 17 conditioning and 24% less of their heating. That's 18 real money for every building in the city, and it 19 will drop the bottom temperature of the city, and you 20 can do it with water, the 600 million gallons that 21 the city produces as gray water goes into the sewer 2.2 system. We pay \$2.4 million a day to treat that. 23 That-that same water is worth about \$320 million a day in cooling capacity. It will drop the body 24 25 temperature of the city. As I say, it is six times

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 45 |
|----|---|
| 2 | the peak load of the city. So we can go for very |
| 3 | small scale incremental steps forward to mitigate the |
| 4 | damage or given the technology that we basically have |
| 5 | bottle (sic) the rest. Or, you can take something |
| 6 | that is a magnificent resource. We have one of the |
| 7 | gest water infrastructure systems on the planet |
| 8 | because John Bloomfield Jarvis recognized that if he |
| 9 | put nature around our watersheds it would protect the |
| 10 | water quality forever. And DEP is actually still |
| 11 | working on that find. Olmstead (sp?) realized if you |
| 12 | put a park in the center of the city it would protect |
| 13 | nature. It would actually create environmental |
| 14 | quality that was good for each and every citizen of |
| 15 | the city. We know now and we have in-we have |
| 16 | basically investment plans by which we can put |
| 17 | photovoltaics on rooftops. Photovoltaics have a |
| 18 | thermal optima around 80 degrees just as plants do. |
| 19 | If you put wetland plants or shade tolerant plants |
| 20 | below them, you would basically optimize the |
| 21 | performance of the photovoltaics as well as treat |
| 22 | again up to 600 million gallons a day, and up to one- |
| 23 | half of the waste water of the City of New York, warm |
| 24 | season. During the cold season it goes down to a |
| 25 | tenth of that, but I'm saying is that the same |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 46 |
|----|---|
| 2 | investment opportunities that you get in the mail as |
| 3 | I do to basically put solar panels on your buildings |
| 4 | and get a pay back from the photo-photovoltaic |
| 5 | companies, we could do the same thing with our water |
| 6 | that's now going down the sewer that the city treats |
| 7 | quite well really. But that water is of immense |
| 8 | value because literally we are in the richest |
| 9 | biodiversity zone on earth in terms of vegetation. |
| 10 | The Southern Appalachian Province. You can grown |
| 11 | plants. I can show you them, and you can see them |
| 12 | yourselves on the five borough maintenance facility, |
| 13 | the Parks Department and many things of that the city |
| 14 | has built in terms of swales systems in all different |
| 15 | borough. So the choice is we can either flush it |
| 16 | down the sewer or we can literally change the climate |
| 17 | of New York City. Increase the biodiversity and |
| 18 | increase the habitat for the 200 or so migrating |
| 19 | pass-through birds that pass through here-this season |
| 20 | every year, and the choice is ours. [pause] |
| 21 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I want to |
| 22 | thank you for your testimony. Now, I want to thank |
| 23 | you for your testimony. Now, this will be a little |
| 24 | effort. You know, I was just discussing this now. |
| 25 | You're really just pointing out that it's a false |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 47 |
|----|---|
| 2 | choice that we have to make between solar PV and-and |
| 3 | green roofs, and that we really need to just kind of |
| 4 | take a deeper dive into how they can be complementary |
| 5 | of one another. So I appreciate that good testimony, |
| 6 | and looking for ways in how we can better work with |
| 7 | you to make that a reality. |
| 8 | PAUL MIKLOWITZ: Well, let me know. I |
| 9 | wasn't trying that much as 2014 and 2015, but I know |
| 10 | you'll laugh at this, but I think it's simpler to do |
| 11 | things here. It's just that that definitely creates |
| 12 | rates, but we are, too, and we have great deal of |
| 13 | space and we have a great of interest and we have |
| 14 | great deal of expertise. We have one of the oldest |
| 15 | and best water utilities on earth, and we need to |
| 16 | basically incorporate that into our Building Code, |
| 17 | into our infrastructure, into our green |
| 18 | infrastructure, into our building walls. There's 34 |
| 19 | square miles of good space in New York City. I can |
| 20 | ask you exactly how much wall space here. I don't |
| 21 | know. It's 3,000. It's a huge amount of wall space, |
| 22 | but those walls could be habitat, and basically what- |
| 23 | If you had going up 50 or 30 feet on a block, it |
| 24 | would drop the temperature of that street degrees |
| 25 | below it is-what it is now, and be probably below |
| | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 48 |
|----|---|
| 2 | ambient. So a 95-degree day is may 89% relative |
| 3 | humidity. The temperature below the plants will |
| 4 | always be because of physics, 92 degrees, not 95. We |
| 5 | see them as nice. The swale plants that you see on |
| 6 | green roofs are okay, but those can't behave like a |
| 7 | plant that's about two feet tall that will drop the |
| 8 | body temperature always guaranteed to be below |
| 9 | ambient. Think of those brutal days this summer. |
| 10 | Think of the 37 people who died in New York City |
| 11 | because of-basically, the temperature was up too |
| 12 | high. That just-it's so high and you can't live like |
| 13 | that if you're a 98 degree mammal as we are. So it's |
| 14 | just this is an opportunity, but it's way, way larger |
| 15 | than what's in front of you right here. It's a great |
| 16 | thing to move these incremental steps forward, but |
| 17 | the other side of it is that water is a resource. |
| 18 | Every water that evaporates takes with it 580 |
| 19 | calories. Okay, just to put that in context. A gram |
| 20 | of oil has got nine calories, 9,000 calories. It's |
| 21 | 28 times more energy but, of course, it could—if you |
| 22 | ever get oil here and the water is flowing through |
| 23 | here at huge quantities, again 20- it's just-it's |
| 24 | just 20 times more powerful, but just one gram of |
| 25 | water when it evaporates, it drops the body |
| | |

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 49 temperature of a pound of stuff by more than a degree 2 3 Celsius. So it's a magnificent building matrix. 4 We're just not yet using it and we could. CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: 5 T-T appreciate-I appreciate your testimony. 6 I 7 definitely-based on the-all the testimony I've heard 8 today it sounds like cost seems to be our biggest 9 impediment, and I think we have a-a-a Green Infrastructure Grant Program from DEP that's working 10 11 very well, and definitely look-- I think we just need to see how we can build on that success and-and 12 13 provide additional incentives and ways that we can 14 get green roofs built New York City and, you know, it 15 can't provide more carrots and find more ways to-to 16 incentivize it. I think we can definitely have that 17 shared goal. 18 PAUL MIKLOWITZ: Absolutely critical. I've learned something on this and actually with DEP. 19 20 It's a very fine program, that Green Infrastructure Program. I built a 22,000 square foot green roof on 21 Einstein Medical College for about \$25 per square 2.2 23 foot. Once you start getting much below 20 then the investment will come back something like 10 years or 24

less, and as I'm saying it will-basically for a

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 50 |
|----|---|
| 2 | building owner it comes back quite quickly, and you |
| 3 | can visit any time you want. Red Hook Green Material |
| 4 | Corporation. He saves 40% of air conditioning and |
| 5 | 24% of his heating, and there's-the-the five borough |
| 6 | does the same kind of thing, but the cost is it. If |
| 7 | you can basically make it attractive, people will- |
| 8 | people will buy this. |
| 9 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I |
| 10 | wholeheartedly—I represent a district with a lot of |
| 11 | one, two, three-family homes and larger homes as |
| 12 | well, apartment buildings, and I think that finding, |
| 13 | as I said before, of making it cost-effective and |
| 14 | time effective for-for residents to be just as green |
| 15 | as it is to traditional. They'll make those green |
| 16 | choices. I think that they-people just don't know or |
| 17 | they—they want—they need to—to—to understand how we— |
| 18 | how to utilize their-their roofs in a better way, |
| 19 | and |
| 20 | PAUL MIKLOWITZ: [interposing] Yes. |
| 21 | CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES:most-most |
| 22 | residents just don't know how to do that, or it's |
| 23 | just too cost-too cost intensive or too time |
| 24 | intensive as was brought up before that it's just you |
| 25 | end up just saying I-I'm-I'm-they throw their hands |
| 1 | |

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 51 2 up and say I'm-I'm done. I'm just going to do it the 3 old fashioned way, and that's not the way we need 4 them to go.

PAUL MIKLOWITZ: No, you're right, but I 5 think people don't know, and I think all you would 6 7 need to do-I don't know if you've ever lived in a top 8 floor apartment. I have. It's just brutal on those 9 hot days. It never will go to those high temperatures again with the green roofs. So if you 10 11 build a few and people can actually tell their 12 neighbors, I think they'll start to invest, but the cost is-right now it's-- The other thing to do is if 13 14 we could possibly get multiple homeowners to do it at 15 the same time, staging costs then go way down and it drops enormously. So that would be another way to 16 17 look at opportunities moving forward.

18 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I appreciate 19 that. I appreciate that. Thank you so much. Thank 20 you. It sounds like we have a lot to-to work 21 together on, and rely-I will definitely thank the 2.2 administration. I thank all the industry and-and all 23 of-everyone who sort of testified today, and with that I will gavel this hearing. I want to thank 24 25 first our-our staff attorney who is great as always,

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION 52 |
|----|---|
| 2 | Samara Swanston, our Policy Analyst Bill Murray, |
| 3 | Jonathan Seltzer, our Financial Analyst, my own staff |
| 4 | Nick Wazowski and John Benjamin, and with that I will |
| 5 | gave this hearing of the-the Committee on |
| 6 | Environmental Protection closed. [gavel] |
| 7 | |
| 8 | |
| 9 | |
| 10 | |
| 11 | |
| 12 | |
| 13 | |
| 14 | |
| 15 | |
| 16 | |
| 17 | |
| 18 | |
| 19 | |
| 20 | |
| 21 | |
| 22 | |
| 23 | |
| 24 | |
| 25 | |
| | |

CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 22, 2016