CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON VETERANS

----- X

September 30, 2016 Start: 1:14 p.m. Recess: 2:37 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: ERIC A. ULRICH

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Fernando Cabrera

Alan M. Maisel Paul A. Vallone Joseph C. Borelli

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jeff Roth, First Deputy Commissioner NYC Department of Veteran Services

Assistant Commission Jamal Othman NYC Department of Veteran Services

Kristen Rouse, Veteran
New York City Veteran's Alliance

Peter Kempner, Director Veteran's Justice Project

Elana Duffy, Veteran and CEO Pathfinder Labs

Joe Bello

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

[sound check, pause]

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Good afternoon. am Council Member Eric Ulrich, Chair of the City Council Committee on Veterans. Last year with the landmark passage of Local Law 113, the City Council took a crucial step in serving our city's more than 200,000 veterans and their families by establishing the New York City Department of Veteran Services. Ιn doing so, we tasked the department with being the place where veterans throughout the five boroughs could go to access information about services and benefits available to them based-based on their service to our country. Information about how to qualify and apply for these resources is often difficult to understand, and veterans must access numerous websites, flyers, pamphlets, et cetera to get the information that they need. Many veterans are also unaware of the rights and privileges given to them under federal, state and local laws. other resource guide offered by the City currently through Small Business Services, Workforce 1, and our program hasn't been updated in more than three years. Today, the Committee will hear proposed Intro 828-A, which will require the Department of Veteran Services

2.2

2.3

to create a centralized comprehensive resource guide that will be available both electronically on the Internet and in the printed form. The guide would contain information all in one place about the eligibility and processes of applying for federal, state and city Veterans benefit, special rights accorded to veterans under the law, health programs and services, legal and housing counseling and other available resources, employment opportunities, et cetera. The Guide would be updated periodically so that veterans and their families are given up to date information, and we must ensure that no one who has served our country falls through the cracks when it comes to entitlements or benefits that could save their lives or help them on this.

I want to acknowledge the members of the Veterans Committee who have joined us Council Member Borelli of Staten Island is here and Council Members Vallone, Maisel and Cabrera are on the way. There are two other hearings going on simultaneously. I'd also like to thank the Committee state Art Bernstein, Committee Counsel, Michael Kertz (sp?), our Policy Analyst and Jayden Subudhi our Financial Analyst, and I'd like to thank and welcome Commissioner—Deputy

2.2

2.3

Commission Roth for his work on behalf of our City's veterans, and I would invite him to testify after the oath is administered by the committee counsel.

LEGAL COUNSEL: Can you raise your right hand, please. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony before the committee today, and to respond honestly to council member questions?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: If you could just hit the button on the microphone if it's not on. It should be on. Okay, and please begin when you're ready.

afternoon, Chair Ulrich, and members of the Committee on Veterans. My name is Jeff Roth, and I am honored to serve as the First Deputy Commissioner of the New York City Department of Veteran Services. I'm joined today by our Assistant Commission Jamal Othman.

Thank you for the opportunity to meet, and hear our testimony on Introduction 828-A, which would require the department to create and periodically update a Veteran Resource Guide made available on our website and in pint. I want to start by updating you on how

2 far this agency has come. Not even one year ago 3 historic legislation was passed by the City Council, 4 and signed by Mayor de Blasio in a bold statement to 5 New York City veterans and their families of this city's tireless commitment to their wellbeing. As an 6 7 agency in transition, we are currently focused on 8 growing our team with top talent to establish the strongest foundation possible for supporting this agency's mission. Since the signing of Local Law 10 11 113, the Department of Veteran Services has 12 diligently worked to onboard a talented and diverse 13 group of professionals to staff this new agency. 14 Since April, we have grown this agency to over 20 15 people, and we'll reach maximum staffing capacity in 16 our three lines of action by the end of the calendar 17 year when we will have 34 DBS staff members. We have 18 on-boarded the leadership of the remaining two lines 19 of action, education, employment and entrepreneurship 20 or E-3 with Jamal Othman, integrative health and community resilience with Darlene Brown-Williams. 21 2.2 They have joined Nicole Bracco, who heads our 2.3 existing line of action, Housing and Support Services. We have hired or Chief Information Officer 24 Vincat Macapalli (sp?), Senior Advisor of 25

Communications and Press Secretary, Alexis Wichowski,
and Senior Advisor of Public and Private Partnership
Jason Mangione. We're also pending hire of our
Director of Intergovernmental Affairs and Director of
Administration. We've also identified candidates for
key positions within each of our lines of action, and
look forward to reaching full operating capacity by
the end of calendar year 2016. Also, since April,
the Veteran Advisory Board has met twice, once in
Staten Island in June and in the Bronx in September,
and we continue to raise awareness of the Veteran
Designator on the IDNYC, which has seen 5,650 IDs
issued about trends to date. Already we have come a
long way towards realizing our mission to honor and
serve veterans and their families, and to fulfill our
mission, which is the Department of Veteran Services
is dedicated to improving the lives of all New York
City veterans and their families. Martialing the
collective resources of the City of New York, the
department will achieve the following the objectives:

Ensure that all veterans have permanent affordable housing and access to the support services needed to find and maintain their home.

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Implement the Vets Thrive NYC integrative health program to foster the physical, mental and spiritual wellbeing of veterans and their families.

Expand education and career opportunities for veterans through a rapidly growing network of city, public, private and non-profit partners.

Provide the human and technological infrastructure for veterans and their families to gain citywide access to benefits, resources and care through a leading coordinated service network. As we build our capacity to establish a strong and diverse foundation of professionals to best enable our programs and initiatives, let me provide a brief summary of the key elements that we are continuing to address. Effectively ending veteran homelessness in New York City and sustaining the gains through developing systems and apply resources to ensure that all veterans who become homeless are rapid rehoused in permanent affordable housing with the services they have earned and deserve. Specifically, DVS will continue to work with its city, state, federal and community partners focusing on meeting functional zero, ending homelessness for veterans currently in shelter and developing a rapid rehousing system for

- 2 housing new veterans with 90 days of entry.
- 3 Mitigating recidivism by bolstering after care
- 4 services through a dedicated coordinator who will
- 5 driver assessment priorities and fully leverage the
- 6 | vital veteran peer coordinator role. This
- 7 | coordinator Angela Guyton Seral (sp?) is now on staff
- 8 | with DVS. Leading efforts to systematize the
- 9 assessment and housing placement of homeless veterans
- 10 across systems and resources and scale the system to
- 11 benefit all homeless New Yorkers.
- 12 Working with the First Lady's Thrive NYC
- 13 | Mental Health Road Map through implementing the Core
- 14 | Four Integrative Health Model to address the full
- 15 | impact of war, mind, body and spirit for our veterans
- 16 and their families by applying a peer based community
- 17 approach that increases engagement and lowers stigma
- 18 | and cost. This work includes working with service
- 19 providers to participate in implement the Core Four
- 20 | Integrative Health Model, which leads with trained
- 21 peer intervention and integrates education, culture
- 22 and the arts with holistic services and clinical care
- 23 for veterans and their families. Conducting citywide
- 24 outreach and family engagement to better connect
- 25 | veterans and family members with a comprehensive

2.2

2.3

range of resources specifically tailored to their needs and strengths. Accessing holistic services in non-clinical settings, and engaging in the Thrive NYC Education Campaign to erode stigma and foster engagement.

Executing DVS' strategy for recruiting and connecting veterans and their families to city career services and resources through a phase action plan aimed at upgrading the DVS website for direct access to city job opportunities; collaborating with DCAS citywide recruitment Workforce 1 and the public-private sectors to identify HR best practices for citywide agency dissemination and application; standardizing citywide intake forms to foster self-identification of veterans and families; and establishing New York City Veteran Business Leadership Consortium designed to enhance business and procurement opportunities for veteran business owners.

Launching Vet Connect NYC, a digital platform and portal and coordinated service network connecting veterans and their families with comprehensive referrals, counseling, benefit support across a growing constellation of services providers.

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Currently, we're drafting a scope of work and look

forward to presenting a draft contract for negotiated

acquisition in the coming months.

Building upon the Task Force on Behavior Health and the Criminal Justice system and its progress to date, we're applying the system's lens to fully assess veteran needs in the criminal justice system including coordinate access to housing, employment, legal and health services. Improving access to veteran benefits by training a team of outreach workers and establishing a satellite office in each of the boroughs to provide assistance direct to the veterans in the community. Collaborating with the Mayor's Fund to advance New York to establish and maintain strategic partnerships with private entities, non-profit organizations, and foundations to generate support, and foster bold investment designed to plug gaps in service, test, pilot and scale innovative new programs, and leverage the flexibility of the private sector to support our public initiatives, all aimed at empowering New York City veterans and families of all generations. Developing and implementing a digital transmedia plan including launching a new website platform to

2.2

2.3

facilitate interaction and access to resources; engage in strategic media outlets to amplify DVS key messages and activities; expanding the interactive universe of veterans connecting with DVS by setting and meeting social media targets for maximum awareness engagement and activity. Continuing DVS collaboration with the Mayor's Office of Special Projects and Community Events, the Mayor's Office of Citywide Event Coordination and Management in veteran service organization partners to assist and organize major veterans commemorative ceremonies and special events that honor service. Working as a team we have achieved so much, and yet I know you will agree that our most important work is still in front of us.

In regard to Introduction 828-A, which would add a new section to the Administrative Code to require the Department of Veteran Services to maintain and periodically update a resource guide for veterans, we concur that finding ways of connecting New York City veterans to the resources and benefits they have earned is a chief aim of DVS. Indeed, it's the main reason for the creation of this very agency. However, DVS is opposed to this bill for the simple reason that a guide is not more effective for

supporting our veterans, and helping them navigate
the many resources and benefits available to them,
are the methods we currently employ. In fact, a
resource guide would be a less innovative approach
than those we have already implemented and planned to
implement as we transition to an agency to reach
veterans. To this end, in addition to the projects I
have mentioned, we intend to leverage many other
methods for sharing resources with veterans and their
families beyond a simple list of resources.
Currently, we are upgrading our new DDS website, the
first phase, which we expect to go live any day now.
It will be structure by which we make multiple more
significant content upgrades occurring between now
and the end of the calendar year. These upgrades to
our website will include a comprehensive list of
local, state, and federal resources that are
available to veterans and their families. It is
something that we will maintain, and upgrade on a
regular and recurring basis, and as we learn as new
resources and benefits, we will use this form to
share those updates as well.

We will also leverage social media to include Facebook, Twitter, Linked In and other

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

digital media platforms to highlight new and changing resources to ensure that as many veterans and their families are made aware as quickly as possible. will continue to leverage the networks of our partner veteran service organizations, not-for-profits and other organizations to further push the information to as many veterans as possible. Additionally, we head New York City Serves NYC, which is currently available by phone and which connects veterans and their families to services through a coordination center of trained staff. This staff is familiar with the various service providers and the network of public, private, and not-for-profit partners who provide service to veterans, and can readily assist veterans in accessing the many benefits they have earned. As I mentioned previously, this service, which will be rebranded as Vet Connect NYC, is currently available and has served nearly 2,000 veterans during its pilot phase, a number that we will actively work to increase in the coming calendar year. For the veterans who did not have ready access to a computer or social media for accessing this information, they can also call 311 24 hours a day, seven days a week, 365 days a year, and receive

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

information on access and benefits. And even better, we are placing community outreach specialists to serve as a direct link between the community in each borough and DVS by providing the human element of one-on-one support. Community outreach specialists are trained to connect veterans and their families to trusted resources available to them from the city, state, and federal governments including employment resources through the Federal and State Department of Labor, city Workforce 1 centers, and employment opportunities with the city in partnership with the Department of Citywide Administrative Services. These employment resources include communication of available positions, job placement, resume building and developing interview skills to name just a few. Additionally, our outreach specialists are trained to identify and guide veterans and their families with education and vocational services through the U.S. Department of Veterans Affairs or VA, and New York State, including the Post 9/11 GI Bill Vocational Rehabilitation and New York State Tuition Assistance Program. Likewise, our specialists work closely with our Veteran Peer Coordinators who work for DVS and assist with access to housing and homelessness

2 programs. Deployed to the five boroughs, our 3 specialists are creating a citywide presence and 4 taking information on programs and services to 5 veterans in their communities through collaborative partnerships with host sites. These host sites, or 6 7 satellite offices, are particularly critical for veterans who have difficulty traveling outside the 8 borough or are reluctant to visit the offices of a larger institution such as the VA, or our own offices 10 11 here in Lower Manhattan. To date, we have active offices and collaborations with the Queens Borough 12 President's office, and CUNY's College of Staten 13 14 Island. We're actively discussing with host sites in 15 the Bronx, Northern Manhattan and Brooklyn to follow 16 as we bring on board the staff to work in those communities. Additionally, our specialists receive 17 18 professional training in specific areas and are 19 working on developing cross-trainings with Human Resources Administration staff on SNAP benefits, and 20 Department of Finance on their benefits for veterans 21 as examples. Lastly, our specialists have undergone 2.2 2.3 classroom and practical trainings with the New York State Department of Veterans Affairs under whose 24 sponsorship our staff are pursuing their BA 25

2.2

2.3

accreditation as service officers, which will allow them to assist veterans and their families with apply for disability and compensation benefits through the VA.

Finally, with our upgraded website we will be releasing our resource guide that our outreach coordinates have used internally for supporting veterans. We are currently updating this guide, and we will release it on our website for veterans. We will also send this to veterans and support organizations, and are happy to provide them a hard copy any time requested.

Regarding the proposed amendment to

Section 1, Title 31, we know that connecting New York

City veterans and their families to timely resources

and services is central to the purpose for which the

New York City Department of Veteran Services was

established. Ensuring such is one of our top

priorities. To this end, DVS requires maximum

flexibility for determining the best methods for

achieving our mission because, as we say, we will

stop at nothing to do as much as we can for the

veterans we serve. At this time, I'm pleased to

2.2

2.3

2 address your comments and questions. Thank you very
3 much.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Thank you,

Commissioner for your testimony. We have also been
joined by my very good friends and colleagues on the
committee, Dr. Fernando Cabrera of the Bronx, Alan

Maisel, Council Member Maisel of Brooklyn, and Paul

Vallone also from Queens. Before I ask my questions,
I know there are other committees that are meeting so
I'll defer to my colleagues if they have any
questions. I know Council Member Borelli has a few.

Okay, and then we'll hear from Council Member

Vallone. So I'll turn it over and then we'll come
back to me. [off mic] So, take it. (sic)

[background comments]

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: [coughs] Thank
you very much, Deputy Commissioner. I have a group
in my district called the Veterans of the Battle of
the Bulge. A rough estimate do you have any idea how
old the guys are in that club?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: If they were fighting in World War II between the years of '40 to '45 at 20 years of age so add 60 so they're in their-

2.2

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: [interposing] 90
3 years old.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: --close to the 90s, right?

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OTHMAN: January

1, 1945 was the Battle of the Bulge. So these guys
at youngest are 89, and this group maintains a
monument in my district. It's, you know, called the
Monument to the Battle of the Bulge, and it's a
beautiful thing. It's in a park. It's about 15
years old, and it's in disrepair, and they need some
money to fix it, and I'm helping them with that, and
it's wonderful. Unfortunately, I have to get them to
use a computer to get the grant. Have you ever seen
a guy who drove a Sherman tank in his lifetime use a
Safari Internet browser?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: Not yet.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: It is not—it's not pretty. It's not pretty and I—and I say it as a joke and, you know, the guys in this group are—are great friends. I'm sure they don't mind me poking a little fun at their age. Frankly, we're lucky to have them still. But the point I'm trying to make is

2.2

2.3

2 not everyone is able to use a computer. Is there a 3 reason why we—we can't just print things in a guide?

can print things in guide. I think our preferred method is to do things more one-on-one. So rather than just giving a list of here are places where you can turn to, we want to help walk them through that. Number one, that allows us to do some quality assurance to make sure they're getting the benefits and resources they need. But also, no matter who they call on that resource guide, at some point they are going to have to fill out a form, complete some paperwork, access a computer in some way. By using our outreach coordinators, they can walk them through that, help them fill and file the paperwork that's required, and make sure that there's feedback loops so that we know who has submitted it.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: [interposing]

But in—in your testimony, you said that you've

already on the website, already have amassed some—

some form of data and some form of—of resources

available for veterans on the website. Do those

resources do they not have like a link? Like in

other words, if you're a veteran who is in need of

COMMITTEE ON VETERANS

2.2

2.3

sort of medical care, maybe there's a link for a doctor in that area? So—so already that's one example where the person just needs the information. They may not need the one-on-one service. I mean is that not true?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: That's true and so we do have those listed on the website for those that prefer to do the self-care that way, those resources are available.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: [interposing]

But one is a Catch 22 where—where we see the need for the information that doesn't require one-on-one service, but yet we don't want to do the—the guide.

And I—I—I brought some—I mean the—the city literally prints guides by the tons. We have guides—the—the police roster. If you want to know who the district attorney's office squad leader it's Captain Deluca and here's his fax number. We have property taxes.

Each Council Member gets a guide for what DDC is doing in their district. Just one city agency makes 51 different guides to tell you what's going on. So if you wanted to know, you know, what's going on in the Tote Hill sewer project, you can look it up.

This is all stuff that's available through the City's

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

website?

Open Data Portal and other things, but we're making it in a format that's easier for people to use. NYP-I mean I can go through the list. I won't. Why are these things more important to put in a guide form than the resources that are available on your

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: We have heard overwhelmingly from the veterans that we service that navigation is the primary, and chief challenge that they have in accessing benefits, and that's the reason that we're using this outreach coordinator method. So that we can work one-on-one with them. Where they don't want to receive assistance one-onone, we'll certainly provide them with a list of places that they can turn, but rather than creating a static booklet that's outdate the minute we print it, we would rather access and provide a list of the things that are eligible for by understanding theirtheir particular need. By giving them a list of all those things, it's a complicated rule in terms of veteran resources. There's multi areas of government.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: [interposing]

But I know if we outdated the problem because this is

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

a 2015 and if I call the Property Clerk Division Oil Pound System, maybe I won't speak to Captain Luzette Scarfuto, but I'm sure that in the phone number is still the same for—for that [coughs] and if I have a car impounded I'm sure I could still get somebody at that number. So I mean is the fear that we can't get things so up to date the reason why we're not printing it as a guide?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: No, and as I mentioned like we're more than happy to print it. think our fear about putting out a guide is that because it's complicated and because there's difficulty in navigating these things, by putting out a guide, it's just one more place where people turn and don't necessarily get the-the help that they Additionally, if we printed a guide with all of the resources available, it's hard for us to do feedback on that, and know if they're receiving the quality of care that they're supposed to. It can be seen as an endorsement of particular organizations or service providers if the city is listing this in a guide. And again, we want to have data on what the needs and demands are of our veterans. We went to be able to walk them through these things so that we can

COMMITTEE ON VETERANS

2.2

2.3

help them navigate because we have heard over and over again. But again, we will print and provide them a list of resources any time they ask for it.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: So—so how do we get feedback or how do we get feedback from the web list, and how does the web list not an endorsement of the proofs that you're listing.

went to the website themselves and found a link and contacted that particular agency that we linked to or called them if we provided a number, we wouldn't have a way of knowing if they interacted with that agency or not. By working with our outreach coordinators then we can capture what the feedback is. We know who they contacted. We can help them complete their forms. We can see where there's particular difficult issues with navigating the system, and we can collect those data and know what demands and needs our veterans have. So, we think that's a better and a preferred method for interacting, and working with our veterans to navigate those systems.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Well, the last question then. You guys are opening up and I think-I think you're doing a great job. I-I really don't

in the waiting room?

2.2

2.3

want my comments and—and questions to indicate that

I think you're doing a bad job, but— So when you're

opening these offices in different boroughs and a

veteran goes in there and he's got his American

Legion hat on or she does, and—and the jacket, and

they're sitting waiting to meet with that

coordinator. What's on the table next to the chair

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: There'sthere's pamphlets to a number of programs, and—and
benefits that are available to them.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Right. I'm sure. So I mean I—I guess you could you could see my point that I'm—I'm just bewildered why as—as you said, you're happy to print something. I'm just bewildered why the—the de Blasio Administration would—would even have any inclination that this is not something we could just add to the things that are printed. I mean on the back of this, you could see it's—it's used with—in conjunction with You Tube, Instagram, Twitter, Facebook. I mean, I—I just don't know why the multi-media approach that works for nearly every other agency is—is not done here. I—I think, you know, rubber stamps in government are—are not

2.2

2.3

something we should often use, but when it's a simple a question like should we—should we just print out the list on our website and put it in the fancy thing so that veterans who are in the—their 90s, could access. I think it's just a—a simple thing to accomplish, and I hope you guys reconsider. Thanks.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Thank you, Council
Member Borelli. We have a few questions from Council
Member Vallone and then Maisel and then I will wrap
up the questions for the Administration.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you, Chair and welcome, Deputy Commissioner.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: Thank you.

excited to see the staffing and the growth of the department, Chair Ulrich and the members of this committee for—valiantly for your creation. So we're—we're happy to see you and your staff here continuing the charge for our veterans, the best veterans in the world right here in the city so—

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: I'm honored to be here. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Well, I—I have to agree with Council Member Borelli, though. I—I

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

mean most of the veterans we're working with are seniors, advanced seniors. Very hard to even get to our office, and when I'm usually with them, it's at one of their annual events or addressing or at their chapter or, of course, that the parades, which our district has many because we have probably some of the most veterans in the city. I would hope the answer would be yes. Simply just—it shouldn't really be a-not an argument, but a dialogue whether it's necessary. It's completely necessary because of the generational concerns and gaps that we have between our new veterans and our older veterans. And our older veterans even from the Vietnam past now are—are just-even me at 49 with my kids sometimes it seems like I'm 100 years old compared to what they can handle versus what I can handle. I think the answer is yes we'll get a guide We're not going to presentprint 8-1/2 million for every citizen in—in New York, but they're ready, they're available. We'll get them to our veterans. We'll have them at their office, but our preferred way would be online with everything else. I mean I'm hoping that's where you're going with this at the end of this hearing.

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: Yeah, I-I think we completely agree with the spirit of providing as much information to veterans as possible. What we see in this legislation is it's a floor. It's a minimum. We should do at least this, and it's pretty prescribed in terms of what the chapter should be, and how it should be outlaid. What we're looking for is maximum flexibility to provide the information, in as innovative means and methods as possible in-in as many ways as possible. That includes a printed guide. That's something certainly we will do if that's things that our veterans request. So we're not opposed to providing information. We just want flexibility in determining the methods for doing that. COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Well, I don't

think anyone here especially our chair is going to limit your abilities to provide information. I think we're just trying to start it at the basics, and always say for more information please see--DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: [interposing] Sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: --your veteran If you-you have a website then the office.

2.2

2.3

department, but I-I think there's some critical information that we could have, and we can update on an annual basis as—even as your department grows. I mean we're going to have more resources available as we fight for budgetary increases as Chair Ulrich and I will—will do every year to make sure that you guys get increased funding, staffing and services for our veterans.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: Uh-huh.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Just—but my last question will be as you see the department growing, what would you see in—as—that we can assist you with this year's budget that you would like to see the increase within your own department?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: Well, no assessment yet on the budget as we're staffing up. We've got 20 of our 34, which will be our full operational capacity. We should all 34 on staff by the end of the calendar year. I think one way that the City Council and this committee can support us is by working closely with our community outreach specialists in each of the boroughs. Pull them into events that you might have, have them come out and meet with any of your constituents who happen to be

2.2

2.3

2	veterans,	and use	them as	resources	to	help	get	them
3	into the	communiti	es to-to	support	our	veter	ans.	

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Well, we'd like to-we'd like to see more of that. You know, the Council Members especially in Queens have a difficult time getting folks out past-beyond Borough Hall. We want to see them out where the veterans are where we can get them assistance. So, and--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: [interposing]
Absolutely.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: --and getting that up to speed as quickly as possible, we appreciate it.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: Great. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you chair.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Thank you, Council Member Vallone, and just as a commercial we will have—it's required by law a finance hearing during the budget process next year to discuss the finer details of the department and be able to ask questions about the budget, and the staffing there. Council Member Maisel is next. [pause]

2.2

2.3

Thank you for being here. A quick question. Have you thought of using the libraries as a resource center? There are libraries all over the place, and the libraries would be a great place to have the kind of information that people can access without having to go on the computer, although there are computers there? So have you?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: Yeah,
absolutely, and I'll let Jamal Othman, our AC for
Educational Entrepreneurship and Employment discuss a
little bit about what we're doing to set up our
satellite offices in each of the boroughs.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OTHMAN: Yes.

Thank you for that question, Council Member.

Absolutely, we have. With regard to the question about libraries, we actually collaborate with—with many libraries out in the communities to—to try to really connect the best with the constituents, the veterans associations to those neighborhoods, and those communities whether it's collaborating on benefit fairs or resource fairs to really get information out. With work in the satellite offices, you know, as—as—as we mentioned in our testimony, we

2.2

2.3

have two of our offices active and running, and—and we get them all established in all the five boroughs, we really see these as, you know, forward operating bases of—of DVS, and extensions of the—the host sites that will be hosting our resources as well to really connect best with the unique needs of those particular communities. One of the—one of the critical aspects to the satellite offices that our resources, our outreach specialists are going to be deployed out into the community working with the local stakeholders who in turn can have a synergetic relationship to really identify what the needs are, where are the places that we need to have our—our resources best situated. And how we can best assist our veteran constituents.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: I mean what I was thinking was that there should be—we should have like a veterans corner, you know, with the appropriate materials and a guide or whatever, pamphlets, places to call, a poster, a sign, something so that the veterans know. And I'm sure that most veterans don't know that we have a department, that we don't have a commissioner and a first deputy that you're staffing up. Most veterans particularly the older ones

estimated any costs on the resource guide.

25

2.2

2.3

Currently, there—we do have the information on the website. That's something that we're upgrading. If we were to look into that I could provide an estimation on printing the guide in mass quantity.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Is—is—has that come into as available in your decision making whether, you know, it's going to be a cost?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: No, I-I don't know that the cost could be particularly prohibitive. Again, I-I think when you read this introduction it was really we saw this as a bare minimum that the agency should be doing, and stuff we're doing anyway already. So the need to legislate. We thought minimize our flexibility to look at innovative and new approaches.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: When the community outreach people do outreach, what do they use as a—as a tool to give out to veterans.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: They—they use a variety of things. If there's a particular program or an initiative that they're eligible for we'll provide them with pamphlets or information particularly to that. But what we're trying to train our staff to do, and we're not completely staffed up

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

yet, so we're building this team out. But what we're trying to do is enable and equip them to be able to do much more than that. So, help them navigate the system, help them complete the form, help them file the forms, help them overcome hurdles and road blocks any time they encounter those when they are applying to particular benefits. And as we bring that staff on board and train them in those areas, and get the state accreditation, those are the things that we're trying to do.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: You know why I ask? Because in just about in any arena where you're trying to do marketing, and you're trying to reach out to people whether it's people in the streets trying to sell you something, or the religious community, they always have something to give out. I-I would think that it would be a good pretext to start a conversation with veterans. It's something that it doesn't seem as intimidating as it is- As Council Member Vallone was mentioning earlier, what we found out and, in fact, I had a staff meeting about this earlier today, you know, the older population they tend to stay away from the Internet or they may have, you know, other challenges.

2.2

2	would be a good pretext to say hey, we-we have
3	something new here then they begin to go oh what is
4	it? You know, you just sparked conversation. So
5	that would be something to look at. And—and my last
6	question real quick here. I don't know if I heard
7	you—if I heard correctly. So, you're open now to the
8	idea of-I-I thought I heard you say that with Council
9	Vallone to doing the resource guide.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: What we do—so we do a number of things to reach out. We've printed information. We've got information on the website. I think where we get nervous is if we did a static guide that's really large, these programs change all the time. Again, we've heard from veterans that navigation is the critical piece. So we want to make sure our outreach coordinators are specifically trained to help—

council Member Vallone: That's when you said then. [laughs] Then you gave us--five minutes ago you said you'd be completely open toward creating the possibility of a guide for our veterans.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: That's what I thought I heard.

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: That's what we heard. So he's not saying that now?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: That's what I wanted to double confirm that I heard, or did you mean something else?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: We printed things for veterans and it's particular to them. think our nervousness is if it's a really large guard-guide that's explicitly addressed in the introduction. It's very particular on the chapters that are in there, and the information that it has to contain. A lot of this information changes all the time. What we would rather do is simple pamphlets, particular to a program or an issue that we're trying to focus on or that we've heard is complex. We want them to connect with our outreach coordinators. want to give them information that's specific to the benefits and thigs that they're eligible for because veterans come from different eras, and there's different benefits that they're eligible for. If we printed one large guide for all veterans, that would be very complex, and-

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: [interposing]
Well, how much do you think this will be? I mean I

2.2

2.3

- wouldn't-- I know you wouldn't like this. I don't-I
 don't think it would be this large. I mean what-what
 are we talking about?
- DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: Well, based on the information in the there, I think it could be rather—

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OTHMAN:

[interposing] Surprisingly, yes, Council Member. It
would be--

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: [interposing]
This is thick?

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OTHMAN: --if-if you think of an exhaustive—there's been a prolif—proliferation of organizations that have really established itself, many of them great organizations over the last 10 or 15 years. Many here in New York State and New York City, and have an exhaustive list especially when you're posting veteran benefits, which could be really complex and sort of identify with the criteria that's in many cases always changing, is—is a—perhaps not the best value I think for the—for the veterans themselves.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: What about an abridged version? [laughs]

2.2

2.3

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: Which would be on our website. We do list various references, resources--

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: [interposing]
Well, we—we know about the website.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: --and—and what else do we have? If someone requests it, we will absolutely print that out, and we've also made pamphlets on things particular to our—our single resource or program in city government. It's something that we're aware of. We are going to more and more events. Part of that is we will be out and more visible in the communities as we build this team.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay, I will close with this, and I'll turn it back to the Chair.

Mr. Chairman, thank you so much for bringing—

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: [interposing] Thank
you.

what—what I wanted to close with that this is an easy ask. It's not—to me it's not like a big ask, and it could only help. I don't see how we could be detrimental in any way. I think it—it would only

2.2

2.3

help, and anything that will only help is a good
thing at least from where I'm sitting. Thank you so
much, and thank you for all you do.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: Thank you.

Member Cabrera, and the other members of the committee. I know that there are several other hearings going on simultaneously. So if you have to excuse yourself, you don't need my permission. You just leave whenever you feel like it, but, okay. So getting back to the central question, the position of the Administration at this point is that they're open to printing various materials, but they don't want to compile one single guide. They don't want to be compelled by law to be required to print an annual or bi-annual veterans resource guides because of the number of groups that might be included, the amount of information, the cost. What is at the heart of like we don't want to do this? What is the--?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: I—I think
because we've heard from our veterans over and over
again that navigating these things is the real
challenge. By putting out one more resource guide
that is particularly challenging in navigating

2.2

2.3

doesn't really address the problem that veterans have with connecting to the resources they are eligible for.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: So, getting back to the connecting part, what services are probably the most frequently requested by veterans that call or email the department? What-what makes up the bulk of your constituent calls?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: Sure we—we receive a number of calls, and in our pilot program with the coordinate—with NYC Serves New York City.

We've found that surprisingly most of them are about housing. That tends to be the largest of the 2,000 veterans that we have served through that pilot program. Each has been on—served on average 1.4 times. So that is what we're seeing, and we're also surprised to see that 32% of those callers are actively serving either on active duty or in the National Guard or Reserves.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Do you have any statistics today on—on the average age or the demographics? Where they're calling from, what boroughs, what era did they serve in?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: We can

3 absolutely--

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: [interposing] And any other breakdown.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: --provide that. Absolutely, get the breakdown.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Yeah, or you can follow up with that. We don't necessarily need all of that today, but we were just trying to get a sense of it. My-the point of the question I'm asking is that perhaps if you know that the bulk of your phone calls are about employment, housing and mental health, you know, information to mental health services for veterans and their family members. perhaps you could tailor at least for this guide that, you know, lists of two or three of the top providers or the-or the ones that the City currently I mean it's just an idea. I don't-I don't think the-the goal of the legislation is to take away your flexibility in drafting and crafting and making this up, but the Committee Counsel just showed me a-a resource guide that DFTA puts out for senior citizens in senior centers, and I think it would be helpful to have one place, even just with your phone number and

your information, and your email and your website.
Actually print that on a piece of paper that can be
made available at senior centers, libraries and other
non-for-not-for-profits, homeless shelters, other
places where veterans are going to be because not all
of them are online, and not all of them even know
that we have a new department. So, I think that is
the intent of the law, and if there's specific
changes, I'd like to hear what they might be, not
necessarily today, but in the next few weeks perhaps
you can send over some suggestions. But this seems
like something that other agencies are already doing,
and even though you're a new agency. I think the
Council or the position of the—the sponsors of the
bill and myself is that at some point we would like
to see something printed with a welcome message from
Commissioner Sutton, and some helpful information,
phone numbers and links to a website that people can
access. So
DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ROTH: [interposing]

Absolutely, we would welcome an opportunity to look at the language.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: We're going to continue the dialogue. Thank you for your testimony.

- 2 | We're going to hear from the first panel now. Thank
- 3 you. Kristen Rouse, New York City Veteran's
- 4 Alliance; Peter Kempner, Legal Services NYC; Elana
- 5 Duffy, Pathfinder Labs, the New York City Veterans
- 6 Alliance; and Joe Bello representing himself. [door
- 7 | slams, pause] Are we missing one? I just-oh, she's
- 8 coming. Okay. [pause] Why don't we start with
- 9 Kristin and-and work our way down, if we can. Thank
- 10 you. [pause]
- 11 KRISTEN ROUSE: Good afternoon. It's
- 12 good to see all of you again. My name is Kristen
- 13 Rouse. I'm a veteran of the United States Army and I
- 14 served three tours of duty in Afghanistan. I am
- 15 | testifying on behalf of the Board and more than 200
- 16 dues paying members of the New York City Veterans
- 17 | Alliance. We agree that key role of DVS is
- 18 | maintaining an up-to-date listing of resources in New
- 19 York City and beyond that can assist veterans,
- 20 | military members and their families. This was, in
- 21 fact, one of the recommendations that our team of
- veteran service providers and experts made in the
- 23 policy paper we released last year. We further agree
- 24 that it is the role of government to ensure that
- 25 | veterans, military members and their families are

2

3

4

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

able to access the services, benefits, resources and opportunities afforded to them through city, state, federal and non-profit programs. We also agree that access must be made available to members of-to all members of the veterans community regardless of their age or ability to use the Internet or electronic devices. For these reasons, we do support amending the city's Administrative Code to spell out what resources veterans should be able to learn about and access through DVS. However, we also strongly advise this committee to revise this bill to ensure that it is a long-term benefit to our community rather than a costly duplication of what community based organizations have already created, or worse, [banging door] a dead—a source of dead-end referrals to overburden social service organizations that cannot always help. Resource guides for veterans are not-not at all hard to come by. The VA gives out printed guides and maintains an online and localized national resource directory. The New York State Division of Veterans Affairs has an app anyone with a Smart Phone can download. It isn't hard to find phone numbers or facilities or any number of job and resource fairs handing out pamphlets and flyers

2 promoting resources to veterans. Yet, far too many 3 veterans and families in our community still need 4 help. Last year, a veteran told me she went in person to the then Office-Mayor's Office of Veterans 5 Affairs for help, and all anyone there could give her 6 7 was a printed resource guide that gave her a list of 8 agencies names and phone numbers to call for help. MOVA was even included in the listing. It was like a bad joke she said, and she never went back. 10 We hear 11 frequently from veterans who call and email 12 government-government and non-profit agencies, but 13 they get inaccurate or confusing information, or they 14 can't get appointments for weeks or months. Or, they 15 get what feels to them like a runaround. We don't-we 16 don't hear veterans saying I couldn't find a resource 17 quide or I couldn't get a referral. What we do hear 18 is I can't get a lawyer, or I can't get a decent job, 19 or I can't get help with paying rent. New York City 20 veterans don't really need more phone numbers to call well-web addresses to email or offices to visit. 21 2.2 What we do need is accurate accessible information, 2.3 high quality coordinated and available resources, and meaningful follow up from people who care. DVS has 24 made tremendous progress in building a trained and 25

2

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

resourced team of veteran outreach coordinators, and this we believe is more important and beneficial than any online or printed resource guide. The more experienced and skilled this team becomes with providing clear and accurate information connecting veterans with available resources, and following up to ensure success, the more our community will grow to trust DVS as a worthwhile resource. Meanwhile, community based organizations and innovators have already moved beyond resource guides. NY Serves has developed as a digital hub connecting veterans online and by phone with resources and based on eligibility and needs. The VA operates a help line where licensed social workers connect veterans of all eras with benefits and-and resources. Numerous VSOs and direct service organizations likewise provide individualized referrals. Because of the web of resources-because the web of resources for veterans is often too complex and confusing without the help of an experienced professional who knows the ropes. Moving on even from referrals, Pathfinder, who will speak in a moment, has created an extensive online listing of resources that uses reviews to show where veterans are actually getting help. A resource guide

2	can be a good thing, but it will only be a wasted
3	effort and expense if it fails to keep abreast of
4	what community-based organizations are already doing
5	or even harmful if it only leads to confusion,
6	runarounds and dead-end referrals to resources that
7	can't actually help veterans and their families. We
8	strongly recommend that this committee revise this
9	bill to ensure that a resource listing maintained by
10	DVS works in conjunction with what's already been
11	built by the-by community-based organizations, and
12	that no New York City veteran military member or
13	family member finds more dead ends without
14	information as a result. This concludes my
15	testimony. Thank you for the opportunity. [pause]
16	PETER KEMPNER: [coughs] Good afternoon,
17	Mr. Chair, Mr. Vallone. My name is Peter Kempner.
18	I'm the Director of the Veteran's Justice Project at
19	Brooklyn Legal Services, a part of Legal Services
20	NYC. Legal Services NYC is the largest provider of
21	free civil legal services in the nation. We serve
22	over 70,000 New Yorkers annually. The Veterans
23	Justice Project represents low-income veterans,
24	active duty service members and their families who
25	are in mood of civil local services in the areas of

25

2 housing law, family law, public benefits eligibility, 3 and other essential needs. We're delighted that New 4 York City Council's Veteran Committee is holding this hearing and invited us to testify in support of this bill that would mandate the creation and maintenance 6 7 of a resource guide for New York City's veterans. 8 With the creation of the New York City Division of Veteran Services, our city is in the midst of transforming how services are delivered to our 10 There are dozens, if not hundreds of 11 veterans. 12 organizations responding to the needs of New York 13 City's veteran population, and we must ensure that 14 the City effectively provides veterans with 15 information on where and how they could receive services. Now that DVS is an independent agency and 16 17 has greatly expanded in scale and scope, it-it's the 18 proper agency for hosting a centralized clearing 19 house of information on the various veteran service 20 providers throughout the city, and providing 21 referrals to those providers as well. While it's 2.2 true that other resource guides for veterans exist in 2.3 one form or the other, the mandates of this bill would result in the creation of a comprehensive 24

living document that is maintained and updated

2 regularly by DVS, and as part of its mission, DVS 3 should be the main resource for veterans' related 4 information in New York City. Centralization of veteran related information will streamline the 5 services that we all provide to veterans, and make it 6 easier for veterans to navigate where they need to go 8 to find help. If this bill is enacted, I urge the city and DVS to be as specific as possible in the drafting of the resources guide. For example, New 10 11 York City has many free legal service providers for 12 veterans. However, each of these legal service 13 providers have different criteria for accepting 14 It may handle on criminal cases or civil 15 cases, sometimes both. It's important, therefore, that veterans are not forced to call multiple 16 17 providers to find appropriate legal services, 18 providers in the-in the proper place to assist them. 19 Our office-our office often receives calls from 20 veterans seeking legal assistance in areas of the law 21 that we don't handle. Fortunately, we're able to 2.2 provide referrals to other agencies, where they could 2.3 be helped, but it's often disconcerting to make a veteran call elsewhere, which leads to further delays 24 in them providing legal services. It's not enough to 25

just have a list of legal services providers. 2 3 to say what they do, what their eligibility criteria 4 is and so on. So we ask the city to work closely with the providers in drafting the descriptions of 5 resources, have regular contact with providers to 6 make sure the information in the resource guide is 8 current and comprehensive. Beyond the list of the services available to New York City veterans, the bill also ambitiously calls for creating a guide to 10 11 veterans benefits and preferences available on the 12 federal, state and local levels. The proposed 13 Section 31-106(b)1 through 2 is a monumental 14 undertaking, which could greatly benefit our city's 15 veterans, but the benefits for veterans are 16 complicated. They hinge on numerous factors 17 including, but not limited to discharge status, 18 periods of service, length of service, active duty 19 service versus reservist service, disability type, 20 the cause of the disability, and many other factors. 21 We recommend a guide that provides the basic eligibility criteria for various benefits and 2.2 2.3 information on where and how to apply for the benefits. This would greatly serve the community 24 since state and local benefits and preferences are-25

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

are often obscure, and less well known than the benefits under federal law. I've been providing legal services to veterans for years, and I'm still grappling with which state and local law benefits veterans. Again, I would urge the drafters of the guide to work closely with the agencies who administer the veteran's benefits, and preferences and with advocates who assist veterans in obtaining these benefits preferences on drafting the resource quide. Just to add to the chorus of the concerns about an online only resource, it's not just elderly veterans who would be prejudiced by something that would be limited to an online draft form. Very lowincome veterans, the veterans that we work with often don't have access to technology. They don't have either computers at home, they don't have Internet access at home, and—and they would be limited also in-in something that was web-based only. And there are also veterans with disabilities that prevent them from using technology, and so I think we want to be as expansive as possible to be able to accommodate everybody, all veterans of all ages and stripes, andand disabilities in-in making sure that everybody gets access to benefits and services in the city.

2.2

2.3

thank the committee and the Council for holding this important hearing introducing this important piece of legislation, and we work—look forward to working with you, and the administration to ensure that New York City is able to provide the best services to our

veterans as possible. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Before we continue,
I normally save the questions to the end. Can you
elaborate a little bit on your point with regard to
centralization? You mentioned that in—in the
beginning of your testimony. I thought that was an
important point.

PETER KEMPNER: Yes. You, know, I look at legal services, and—and often times, you know, we will find some providers who are listed in one guide, other providers are listed in another guide, but they're all always comprehensive. If there is a—a single agency that is responsible for this to be comprehensive, and that is their job, then they'll do a better job at it.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: And I also realize and I hope you'll agree there are wonderful lay providers of services for veterans in New York City. They are all—there are also some really bad providers

wasting their time--

1

8

11

12

13

14

15

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

- or non-providers I should say that raise money,

 parade around as these wonderful organizations, but

 in reality they don't very much to help veterans.

 And that could be the department would be required to endorse one group over another. But certainly they

 could weed out the bad actors so that people aren't
- 9 PETER KEMPNER: [interposing] Absolutely,
 10 and--
 - CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: --calling back-calling the fax numbers I think.
 - PETER KEMPNER: --Kristen and I just had a-an encounter a week or two ago about-about one of these bad actors--
- 16 CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: [interposing] Yes.
 - PETER KEMPNER: --and it was great that we were in communication because, you know, not everybody knew, and—and I say this— So I think that's a—a very valid point as well.
 - CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: And—and in your work at Legal Services, how difficult is it for you even to navigate several different not-for-profits or providers or agencies to get, you know, access to mental health, or—or housing, court answer or

very comprehensive detailed resource guides, one for

veteran employment and one for veteran education and

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

one for veteran entrepreneurship. So, at the very least I think they could do a very good job of-of doing that, but a lot of people don't even know thatthat they exist, or what they do, and they do a very good everyday. They have some really talented staff some of whom were just hired, some of them have been with them for a while. All of them very caring and dedicated people, but a lot of folks in the city they don't know that they can go to Borough Hall to talk to a benefits counselor about their particular issue or that might need help applying for a property tax exemption, or they might have questions about something they saw in the news that relates to benefits for veterans, but they're not sure if they themselves are eligible. We have nothing to hand them with anybody's name or phone number on it, and I think that that is-that's a problem. So I'm sure what it would look like or how big it would be or how many there might even be, but the fact that we have nothing now and we just rely on the VA and a couple of not-for-profits to print a few pamphlets this is not sufficient and it's not-it's not particularly helpful. So, but I have a few questions.

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

continue in the-and I-I don't want to be rude to the

other folks who are here to testify.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: You're stuck with us anyway. So you have to. [laughs]

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: That's right.

ELANA DUFFY: We're already at the table. Good afternoon. As an Army combat veteran, please allow me to first say thank you for your continued service. My name is Elana Duffy. I served in the U.S. Army from 2003 to 2012 and was medically retired after a roadside bomb in Iraq. I am one of only approximately 300 female Purple Heart recipients. I use many veteran resources. I know what it is like to search for services, have them-that fits with those resources, and refer others based on my experience. I have since created the www.pathfinder.vet an online platform of verified and reviewed veteran and family support resources. use customer impact data to better understand interactions between the better-the greater veteran community and those surrounding populations, as well as provide a tool for veterans to find and connect with local resources. We have already built the data base proposed in Introduction 828-A using input from

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

the Veteran community on what would be most useful to them, and a-and a dynamic tool instead of a static (sic) database. We, therefore, recommend revisions to the proposed mission. There are approximately 22 million living veterans with 216,000 living in New York City; 250,000 service members exit the service each year. With this continuous population, new resources are created often. Nationwide there are over one million organizations and programs offering assistance applicable to veterans. A static city database simply cannot stay current. Our system allows veterans to tell others about even the smallest effective service. The veteran community has additional challenges. For years we could not quit, nor choose assignments. So many select where o transition based upon a single factor such as family or school, not combined resources as it feels too complex. For our time on active duty, we are taken care of. We received three hots and a cot, plus we're monitored on healthcare, finances and dentaldentist appointments. We do not have to make many choices not even what to wear each day. We have a built-in support network that we lose upon transition. These are critical when considering

tools offered, and where other tools already fail. 2 3 Department of Defense Transition Assistance Programs 4 provide resource information similar to this pamphlet, but it is incomplete and local to the base 5 whereas-while a significant number of veterans 6 7 relocate. Veterans in need of support do not know where to look in a new location. A locality based 8 resource platform deployed nationally can assist in planning a smooth transition. Our research also 10 11 suggests that with the ability to choose between so 12 many resources overwhelmed veterans and families may 13 rush selection leading to a poor fit. Many veterans 14 who have a poor experience with a resource are 15 reluctant to try another option. This is in 16 particular with a lot of the older veterans. For 17 instance, a poor experience with one mental health 18 professional may result in discontinuing care. 19 tool simply cannot simply give veterans options it 20 must empower better choices. The database proposed 21 is jut not enough. Long-term a dynamic platform 2.2 inclusive of reviews and working in tandem with other 2.3 resources as we are, including the VA and others who are nationally and locally deployed can also move our 24 community forward. For example, services veterans 25

need are similar to those used for presumably with
recidivism and reintegrating those recovering after a
long-term illness. City resources and provide
verified referrals. Donors and investors can gain
perspective on the impact of their dollar when used
for social good. New York City can lead in the Smart
Cities Movement, increasing the connectivity between
city resources and those at state and national
levels. The proposed data base in its format cannot
do such things, not without reinventing what our
community has already created. And naturally, any
database that is created online can be printed
comprehensively. As the CEO of Pathfinder Labs and a
member of the New York City Veteran Alliance, we do
support the concepts of Introduction 828-A, but
recommend a revision that the city partner with
existing platforms to create a more dynamic and
relevant tool. Using the platforms already in the
community would support veterans and small business
initiatives, be more cost-effective for the city and
be far more versatile option than the database
proposed. And as side note, we also filter through
between discharge status and other concerns that

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 would be very difficult to provide in a static
3 resource guide. Thank you very much and—

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Thank you for your service and your testimony. We'll get back to you in a minute. Just get the last person here today who is Joe Bono. (sic)

JOE BELLO: Okay, alright, Chairman Ulrich, Council Member Vallone, members of the Veterans Committee, thank you for giving the opportunity to speak today. I'm here to voice my support for Intro 828, which is the creation and maintaining of the Veterans Resource Guide by DVS. As stated, the bill would require the new York City Department of Veteran Services to maintain and to periodically update a resource guide for veterans. This guide would be available on the DVS website in a written format if requested. There are several reason for this guide, many of which the three-[laughs] right next to me have been kind of been talking about. But one of the challenges, and this one stated as well, is we have a predominantly older veterans population. As such, while many have Facebook or know how to check on it now, many others do not and don't even know how to use the computer,

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

and, therefore, finding online resources often comes through word of mouth. As a result of this, the Bronx Borough President in conjunction with his-his advisory board this year created a Bronx Veterans Resource Guide, which is both online and in print to help find-veterans find the resources in the Bronx with some in the city. This is a direct services resource guide only, and so I would recommend that any resource guide created by DVS only touches upon direct service to veterans. We've seen that many veterans even local—even returning veterans usually reach out to the local elected official or their local community board first before they even hear word of mouth. Thus, they are usually the first line of defense in pointing the veteran or family member in the right direction. And this leads to my next point. As we've seen over the years, multiple amounts of information correct or incorrect is out there and this has been stated. Having DVS create or build upon what they currently have, and could vet, would allow for this information to be streamlined and collated at one site and one place where veterans having hearing from the grapevine or Internet savvy or having to research multiple websites.

2.2

2.3

would be for the ability for DVS as a city agency to track and keep pace with what organizations are here, are new to the space, or has left the space. As we've been seeing in the community, the philanthropy money is beginning to leave the space. Several notfor-profits no longer have dedicated veteran services. Therefor, it's important to keep track of who's here today and gone tomorrow. And the last thing I would say is that if we do—if a database or a resource guide is created that it should start with the local elected officials and the community board. Therefore, I once again voice my support to Intro 828 and look forward to seeing the intro move forward.

your testimony and for your service for those of you who have served and continue to serve. Your service never ends, and we are the beneficiaries of that.

What I would really like to do at some point is find out how much this is actually going to cost. That's a good idea because not only are we going to have to print a lot of comprehensive information, we're probably going to have to put it in many languages because not all veterans prefer to speak English as

their primary language, and they have every right to 2 3 speak whatever language they choose. So the cost 4 fact I think is significant. What it looks like is also-is the most important thing, but how much is 5 this going to cost and—and who it's going to be 6 7 provided to. I do think that there's something to be said about integration of dissemination of 8 information, which currently doesn't exist. A lot of folks don't know that the Department of Veteran 10 11 Services is on Twitter, and they everyday post very helpful information, great articles, you know, 12 13 stories about New York City veterans that are doing extraordinary things. They don't have a lot of 14 15 Twitter followers. A lot of people don't know 16 they're on Twitter, or they're on Facebook. I'm sure they're posting a lot of the same photos, and 17 18 information and important dates and events and things 19 that they're hosting. Every time the Council Member 20 or your local borough president or-or Council Member 21 sends out a mailing, you'll always see, you know, the 2.2 Twitter bird, the Facebook, the Lined In, the social 2.3 media links and information and how to access them because we're constantly providing updates and 24 information and—and things that are very pertinent to 25

2 our constituents. I think that a resource guide 3 would be able to boost their presence on social media 4 in a way that a mailing or a pamphlet that would, that an elected official sends out also does for us. The fact that all of these things are sort of going 6 7 on independently in these sort of silos and that—that 8 they're not coordinated or all in one place to literally hand somebody I think is significant. hopefully as the discussion moves forward we can have 10 11 a conversation with them on what the resource guide could look like, how much it would cost, how often it 12 13 could be printed, and what information they think is absolutely necessary. The last thing we want to do 14 15 is print something that is unnecessary but it's just 16 a-a director of phone numbers and emails of every not-for-profit that, you know, is under the sun. 17 18 Your point about the direct services is well taken, 19 and I think that they are-they are-they have not 20 announced yet, but I heard through the grapevine that 21 there is an announcement coming in the near future 2.2 regarding an online platform, which is really going 2.3 to take it to next level. We're excited about that, but there are a lot of veterans who are not online 24 25 who ae in shelters, who are low-income, who need

2.2

2.3

access to information. And they don't know where to get it. They can't go to the library and get it.

It's not there. They can't come to my office. I have nothing to hand them. They are not even aware that DVS has employees in each borough. So I think that a piece of paper, although it might cost a lot of money—I don't even know how much it might cost—would actually do a lot of good, and a lot of people know that they're there. So, Council Member Vallone had a few questions, and then we'll wrap up the hearing.

Ulrich. Thank you to all of your groups. You're always teaching us to be better Council Members and we appreciate that. On a personal note, Elana, to you and every veteran that has served and sacrificed you always see me stand for the Pledge of Allegiance. That's the least we can do for what you sacrificed. I'm always touched when I come to these hearing and hear and see the passion in what everyone does whether it's volunteer for the veterans and as the city is trying to ramp up and get where they should have always been. We're getting there, and I think as a peer—as a lawyer, I can't tell you how many

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

phone calls I get that have nothing to do with my law firm or my father's firm, and we spend 50% of the time directing them to where they're supposed to be at the Queens County Bar Association, but I still wouldn't want them to call. So I think we're all kind of saying the same thing, and it's probably a good idea if it's done correctly. And I think this is a great opportunity since we just created DVS. know about it, but the really-even the average citizen doesn't know about it let alone the veterans. So, even though it may be hard and it may be costly, I still believe like you said, having that book on my desk. Having something that I can refer that that I know is going to be outdate the minute it's created. Well, we know that. So it's our job to be on top of it, and update it, and put amendments to it, and-and exhibits in the back of it, and continue to grow it. I still firmly believe in in the idea there's-this bill the Chairman put forward, and I think we should try to tackle it. I think we should coordinate and make sure we don't duplicate. I think there's some great points Kristen and everyone made today that the-the last thing you want to do is undo the work that the groups have done in giving out wrong

this type of coordination. Joe

2.2

2.3

information. I know sometimes what Peter and I have to do we actually have to reach out to the organizations to say how would you like to be listed and what information would you like us to put? And I think that's what the department's goal—you're still here thank you—is to do. If—if we create this, what information? I think there's going to have to be

JOE BELLO: Just-just to tell him I think that's why it's so important what Peter was saying about vetting the bad apples in the groups because we do see a lot of them, you know, even in the Bronx and the outer boroughs. So it is important to see who's really actually doing those services, who's using the money to do good, and who's actually—who's not? Because really, this is just a not-for-profit for some other entity. But again, this goes to the point. That's why it should be about direct services like legal, housing, things of that nature where most veterans—and this was just testify what most veterans are looking for right now.

ELANA DUFFY: And additionally that is one of our—our next steps for implementation on Pathfinders is to work directly one—on—one with every

COMMITTEE ON VETERANS

1

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

19

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2	organization	that	is	recommended	to	us	bу	а	veteran.
---	--------------	------	----	-------------	----	----	----	---	----------

3 We don't list anything that has not been already used

4 at some point by a veteran for good or for bad.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: So that's your

6 litmus test is—is all veteran referrals and—and--

ELANA DUFFY: [interposing] It—it is veteran. It is services that veterans have something to say about. It is like yes this was good, no this was not good, and then we come—and then we comprise them what's similar to a Yelp format of saying these were worthwhile. These were not and here's why.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Did you say Yelp?

ELANA DUFFY: It's similar to Yelp.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Yelp like the

restaurant, where you--?

ELANA DUFFY: [interposing] It's like

18 Yelp for-it's like Yelp for veterans services--

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: [interposing] Right.

20 | That's very interesting. I didn't know that.

ELANA DUFFY: --to comprise all of the different-to comprise all of the different elements, but we're also working with the organizations to say what is your actual mission statement towards veteran integration? Listing veteran business-veteran-owned

businesses. We're starting to partner our work. I
have a call next week with the Chamber of Commerce in
Brooklyn actually to start getting Chamber of
Commerce so that we can integrate the entire city,
and make sure that everyone is aware of what's going,
and actually I've had a few conversations with both
Kristen and Joe and Commissioner Sutton about being
able to integrate all of this because we don't want
to duplicate efforts any more. There's already so
many people doing the same things. That's what we're
trying to avoid. We-we're trying to take out the
noise and the confusion from the services community
overall, and veterans is—is a great way to start
because it's such a diverse and sort of complex
network that—that it seems like it's one of the best
ways to be able to filter our community services and
not duplicate.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: There may be a future hearing that the Chair—we are looking to on—on vetting out the groups creating some type of system whether it's like every other agency that has any VC system or something that we can put a five star with a voucher. Something that we can create to put people to know that this group has been verified and

COMMITTEE ON VETERANS

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

thoughts?

trusted by fellow veterans. This group may be new.

We don't know about it. This group has a track

record of violations on non-service or something.

But going forward any—anything else? I still think

Kristen I mean you seem the most skeptical of the

four I think of the creation of this. After hearing

everybody and what we have to say, it—any final

ELANA DUFFY: Printed guides are great to be able to hand out, and I-I-I give out, and I-I-I give out all of the time as a number one referral DVS's phone number to get in touch with-with the-the Veteran's Benefit coordinators. That's-that's the first step, and NY Serves and IVA, but I have people come up to me and say oh well, I-I called all of those, and nobody could help me. And then so I do-I do a warm hand-off to, you know, to service providers who I know in the community, and I-I think the community-based organizations are getting it, and-and my organization doesn't even do direct service. but people-yeah, people are-are coming to us to all of our different email addresses. You know, the-the volunteers answers, that I answer with all kind of requests for help. And it's-it-it seems

overwhelming. People call our-our Google voice
number, and—and say I'm having this problem. I have
this complaint. I can't get it addressed through
government or through any other, you know, any of
other organization. Can you help direct me to the
right resource? And it's-it's been-it's been-it's
been really overwhelming just to me because that's
also not-not the primary purpose of the Alliance.
But so what-so community based organizations, have
aotten verv-

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: [interposing] But why—but Kristen why are they turning to you, and not the department? Why do people call you and not DVS?

KRISTEN ROUSE: [interposing] Um-

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: And what is the top complaint that you receive?

KRISTEN ROUSE: I well--

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: [interposing] Is it housing or--?

top request/complaints are—are related to employment and affordable housing, and a lot of times those go—those go hand—in—hand because if you don't have a—a job that pays decently then you—then you're going to

have a hard time paying your rent. And so, you know,
the requirements for HUD-VASH Vouchers or-or SSVF,
assistance-housing assistance or whatever the-you
know, the-there's very specific requirements that
somebody who works in that has to sit there-sit down
and advise a veteran on exactly what they're eligible
for because even if I say, you know, here is a perk-
here is a thing that you could be eligible for and
then they go to the, you know, the different
providers, and they have—they go through these long
application processes and long conversations only to
find out oh, I didn't actually serve on Title 10
during my time in the—in the Reserves or National
Guard. And so I'm not actually eligible for, you
know, SSVS Housing Assistance, you know, for example
like that's one of the recent situations that I ran
into, and it's a-

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [interposing]
That's why you got the phone call.

KRISTEN ROUSE: Right and so-

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Because you know

23 all of them.

KRISTEN ROUSE: You know, so it's—it's like all of these like sort of long and complex cases

2	that-that like I keep-I keep referring to people, and
3	then-and then it will-and then they will keep coming
4	back to me. And so, you know, and—and DVS I think
5	is—is probably tired of hearing from me on, you know,
6	like can't you, can't-isn't there something to help?
7	But so, so community based organizations are very
8	familiar with what each other provides and, you know,
9	a lot of this it's-it's like a small town. We all
10	know each other where we're able to refer one to-one
11	to another, and—and, you know, the DVS team is—is—is
12	increasingly part of that network that, you know, of
13	hand-offs. But, what is more opaque to—at least to
14	me-I don't know-you know, I don't want to speak for
15	Pete or-or anybody else who's referring veterans to
16	resources. What's more opaque is all of the
17	different programs that the city itself offers. You
18	know, there-there's all these guides produced by city
19	agencies that say what the city does for its
20	citizens, and—and that, you know, and perhaps instead
21	of thinking of well how can a city government—a city
22	agency tell the story of everything that's happening
23	in the community, why doesn't—why doesn't DVS perhaps
24	focus first on what the City itself is offering. I
25	also-I've also had the city's Department of Finance

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

come to me for help with promoting, you know, DRIE and SCRIE Applications for veterans. I-I happen to have a-a large, you know, email and social media, you know, communications outreach right now. Hopefully, DVS will soon exceed that reach, but-but the problem is disseminating information into the community and so like the-you know, the-the-the DRIE and SCRIE eligibility requirements and where to go to apply that could be something that would be in a city guide for veterans specifically. That or, you know, or programs for-for veteran entrepreneurs, veteran street vendors. We-we've, you know, we've talked about this, you know, in-in recent months about-it-it can be very confusing for veteran street vendors to even know what the city-what the city rules and programs are, and where-who to call and where to go to for help. And so, so even if the city could consolidate its own guide for what veterans needs to know, or what veterans, you know, could benefit from, that would help the community based organizations better understand what's going on. So-so you, you know, maybe-maybe that could be a starting point instead of trying to, you know, put all of-all of the incredible wealth of all of the community based

2.2

2.3

organizations in New York City, and to figure out
what they're doing even if it's only direct services.

Like instead of trying to tell that story, why not

tell the story of what the city can do for veterans?

6 Because that's not getting out.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I think that will be my last question, Chair. Is—is what do you see as the ultimate as the department goes, do you see its role as a better road map to the community based organizations in providing and supporting financial help and assistance to those groups, or do you see the veterans organization agency growing to actually supplement and eventually provide those various sort of services?

Working in tandem with because there's—there's veterans who are never going to seek help from government. You know, there's been veterans who—who have felt betrayed by the—the old MOVA. You know, going—going back, and—and they don't want to go to anything that, any iteration of MOVA or a city office. A lot of veterans feel betrayed by the VA. There's, you know, there's—there's veterans who just don't have a lot of confidence in government to

2	improve their situation and so their-so community			
3	based organizations are where they're going to go.			
4	You know, conversely there's also, you know, veterans			
5	who-whose first, you know, first step is to call-call			
6	government. You know, so it's-it's really-it's			
7	really a mixed bag just like, you know And I think			
8	you probably get that in the younger-younger			
9	generations as well as the older generations. It's-			
10	but, you know, the whole point is to make sure that			
11	we have a—an overall network and that everybody			
12	connected in that network so that any veteran			
13	reaching out for help eventually finds it, you know,			
14	with-without the dead ends, without the			
15	misunderstandings, without the, you know, needing to			
16	go to five different places only to find out they're			
17	not actually eligible for something.			

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Thank you, Council Member.

PETER KEMPNER: [interposing] And—and can

I just answer that. I think that for the—for the

community based organizations could serve as watch

dog. I—I would, you know, there—I don't think

there's any malicious intent on any government

agency's behalf, but when you have independent non—

2.2

2.3

profits working in the field, you know, we can hold the government's feet to the fire. And make sure that veterans who are entitled to Mitchell-Lama preferences are getting those. Veterans who—who have disabilities and are—are entitled to a vetting license are getting those, and sometimes the agencies are—are improperly denying veterans the conferences (sic) and benefits to which they are entitled, and—and that's why I think you need independent non—profits working in—in that space as well.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Well, no question.

Mr. Bello, do you want the last word today?

JOE BELLO: Yes, I'm—I'm just going to follow up on what Kristen was saying. I absolutely agree with her. Maybe DVS should start with what the City has because we—we, you know, we were talking about how things are changing and in the veteran space with philanthropy money and not—for—profits—now veteran not—for—profits, but not—for—profits deciding either to stay or go. But we don't know what's in the city like for example with DCAS and they offer waivers for the Civil Service exams. Now, they don't do it no more. So, you know—

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: [interposing] What was that last point. I'm sorry.

JOE BELLO: DCAS was offering waivers for Civil Service exams for I guess to take the City's Civil Service exams. Well, now, you know, I've been told by several people they no longer do that.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Wow

JOE BELLO: So, you know, I mean there's changes within the city as well, and maybe, you know, DVS should take a look and see what does the city do, all its agencies offer for veterans and collate that into something and maybe that's a start. You know, or to move onto something so—

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: [interposing] We-we don't expect them to put absolutely everything under the sun what everybody is doing, who they are, where to go.

JOE BELLO: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: But they—we have to tell a story, and we're not doing a very good job telling our story. People don't know what the story is. They don't know how they got here, what they do, how to reach them, and they have these little, you know, mechanisms that they currently use, which is

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

great, but there's nothing sort of tying it all together. I just take a resource guide to be able to do that, but they're building capacity, but they're also building more contacts and—and expanding their own network of outreach. I mean it—every day they probably get email, addresses of veterans in New York city that they're adding so they can include them on the—the blast that they send out.

JOE BELLO: [interposing] And I-I can just add in like as part of the Veteran's Advisory Board, we have asked the Commissioner to take a look and see what does the population of veterans actually look like here in the city. Because the reason we put all the numbers like 259,000, 295,000. Okay, now how many is Vietnam? How many are OEF/OIF? growing? Are we shrinking? We really have no idea, and so we've asked the Commissioner as part of the Board to take a look into that. Just let us know like what-what does the population-what does the community look like now? You know because we suspect the numbers have grown on the OEF/OIF side with the Vietnam veterans, which they're--they're getting I mean so we-we-we need to know that as older. well.

2.2

2.3

know why we fought to put the veterans ID card out there so we could start to get the data, and now that they refused and didn't want to do that, and then they had to put an amendment later on because we wouldn't go away, but that was part of it. We should try to get that data.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Well, what if the census captures that data and if it's updated with the community survey every several years. I imagine it has to. I know when we break it down by--

JOE BELLO: [interposing] Well, I-I know
John Rowan has had some—some thoughts about that and
everything but he—but again we figured since it's the
city, and since the Commissioner has access to
starting things we don't, that perhaps it would be,
you know, a good way for them to come back and at
least share at—at the public meeting like what
things—what that looks like.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Good idea.

ELANA DUFFY: The—the census captures, the census can capture whether or not someone in a household has served. So if an OEF/OIF veteran moves back home, and then they would say yes a veteran

1	COMMITTEE	ON	VETERANS
---	-----------	----	----------

lives here, but it may or may not be the—the head of the household. Like—so if the father had or had not served in Vietnam. So it's a little bit more complex, but you can pull the data from—from the census, and the subject data in there.

CHAIRPERSON ULRICH: Well, lots of-lots of wonderful topics today. A very informative hearing. I want to thank all of you and, of course, the Administration for their testimony today, and hopefully we can keep the conversation going.

There's a lot of wonderful programs, a lot of great services that are available to veterans. We have to find better ways of disseminating that, and getting it out there, and maybe this is the first step. If there's a better way, I wan to hear that, too. So thank you all for coming today. Thank you.

JOE BELLOW: Thank you.

[gavel]

2.2

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 17, 2016