

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

----- X

September 15, 2016
Start: 10:24 a.m.
Recess: 12:40 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm,
14th Fl.

B E F O R E:
INEZ D. BARRON
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
James Vacca
Fernando Cabrera
Jumaane D. Williams
Laurie A. Cumbo
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Vanessa L. Gibson

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Vita Rabinowitz
Executive Vice Chancellor and
University Provost
City University of New York

David Gomez
President
Hostos Community College
City University of New York

Matt Sapienza
Vice Chancellor of Budget & Finance
City University of New York

Ginger Waters
Vice Chancellor
Human Resources & Management
City University of New York

Donna Linderman
University Dean for Student Success
Initiatives and
Executive Director
ASAP
City University of New York

James Murphy
University Dean
Enrollment Management
City University of New York

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Judith Bergtraum
Vice Chancellor
Facilities
City University of New York

Jay Hershenson
Senior Vice Chancellor
University Relations
City University of New York

Sharon Persinger
Treasurer
Professional Staff Congress

Harris Khan
Queensborough Community College Student
and Member of NYPIRG Board of Directors

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good morning.

[background comments] Good morning; glad that you're here. My name is Inez Barron and I am the chair of the Committee on Higher Education. Today we are holding an oversight hearing on the CUNY Master Plan 2012-2016.

Every four years, as per New York State Education Law, the Board of Trustees of CUNY, the City University of New York, submits a master plan of recommendations for the University's "organization, development and coordination" to the New York State Board of Regents. This long-range plan serves as a strategic framework of priorities and initiatives for advancing the University over the next four years. This includes a status report concerning the function and goals and needs of the University as well as recommendations in regard to curricula, facilities, policies with respect to student admissions and student enrollment projections.

Like the plans before it, the CUNY Master Plan 2012-2016 builds on the foundation of progress made to preceding plans titled "Investing in Our Future." The current plan sets forth and develops

the core academic values expressed in the University's legislatively mandated mission; that is, "The University must remain responsive to the needs of its urban setting as an independent and integrated system of higher education on the assumption the University will continue to maintain and expand its commitment to academic excellence."

As such, the CUNY Master Plan 2012-2016 is divided into four parts, each focusing on a specific part of the mission. Within each part I'm looking forward to hearing about progress made in those areas, which the Committee has held hearings this session.

Their mission part one, with regard to CUNY continuing to maintain and expand its commitment to academic excellence, the Plan defines ongoing efforts to improve student outcomes through cultivating full-time faculty diversity, fostering a research agenda and strengthening the CUNY experience.

Concerning faculty diversity, I am interested in learning more about the hiring of black faculty and whether there exists an initiative akin to the CUNY Latino Faculty Initiative, which performs

outreach and recruitment activities to attract exceptional Latino candidates to all disciplines.

Their mission part two is focused on the maintenance of the University as an integrated system in policy and practice and facilitating articulation between units. Expanding on the academic mission, this section concentrates on the specific needs that must be met in order to promote college completion, mainly the pathways to quality general education, smooth transfer and degree completion initiative. I'm looking forward to hearing data on the progress made in this initiative.

The mission part three is concerned with expanding access to quality education to all New Yorkers and New Yorkers from underrepresented groups in particular via financial aid, preparing for college success, The Percy E. Sutton SEEK Program and College Discovery and the CUNY Black Male Initiative.

Concerning CUNY's mandate to remain responsive to the needs of its urban setting, the mission part four expounds on ways in which the University serves the city and the state through workforce development, education teachers and early childhood educators for New York, nursing education

and CUNY TV. Following up on the Committee's oversight hearing on diversity at CUNY TV in April of 2015, I'm looking forward to hearing about the status with regard to the issues of diversity at the higher levels of CUNY TV and diversity in programming, particularly what the Plan is for an African American Legends in which the late Dr. Roscoe C. Brown profiled prominent black people in the arts, politics, social sciences, sports, community service, and business.

With regard to nursing education at CUNY, I am interested in hearing about the status of the development of the new Dedicated Educational Unit, DEU and partnership with local hospitals in order to provide nursing students with vital real life experience.

Further, I would like to know how it coordinates with the apparently dwindling preceptorship [sic], which is an internship that provides nursing students with the opportunity to shadow a working nurse and which I had learned about during the Committee's April 2016 oversight hearing on the status of nursing programs at the City University of New York.

Finally, I would like to add that the founding of City College as a free academy in 1847 until the City's financial crisis of the 1970s, CUNY was committed to providing eligible students with a free college education. Since arriving at the Council in 2014, I have spoken extensively about how CUNY's free tuition policy made it possible for me to attend Hunter College in the 1960s. I have also voiced my objections to the CUNY "rational" tuition plan, which increased student tuitions \$300 per academic year for five years, ending this spring, hopefully forever, and which the University Board of Trustees was in support of extending.

I have made it clear that we should be working together to bring CUNY into better alignment with its historic mission by restoring it as the free university of New York; that is why, during the Committee's last hearing in June I introduced Int. No. 1138, legislation to create a taskforce of experts and interested stakeholders to analyze ways to eliminate tuition at the University as we develop proposals on the role the City can play and working towards that goal.

Now, as the term of the current CUNY Master Plan 2012-2016 concludes and a draft Master Plan for 2016-2020 is being reviewed by the Board of Trustees for submission, I am looking forward to an informative hearing on fulfillment of the 2012-2016 plan and the objective metrics used to determine the gains that have been made. Looking toward the future, I am also interested in learning about the goals of the CUNY Master Plan 2016-2020 as they build on the foundation of achievement in the current plan.

I would like to acknowledge the colleagues of the Committee who are present; we have colleague Mr. Vacca and we also have colleague Laurie Cumbo and I would like to thank my Legislative Director and CUNY Liaison, Ndigo Washington, the Committee's Finance Analyst, Jessica Ackerman, our Policy Analyst, Chloe Rivera, and our acting Committee Counsel, Amita Kilawana [sic]... What is it? [background comments] Aminta Kilawan; I believe in trying to get people's names correct. Thank you.

In accordance with the rules of the Council, we will now administer the affirmation to the witnesses from the mayoral [sic] administration, well in this case, from CUNY.

Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony before the Committee and to respond honestly to committee members' questions?

[background comments] Thank you; you may begin. We have as our first panel Vita Rabinowitz... [background comment]... Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost; David Gomez from Hostos Community College, and they'll be supported by others who will give their testimony and introduce themselves. Thank you; you may begin.

VITA RABINOWITZ: Good morning Chair Barron and members of the Higher Education Committee of the City Council. I do appreciate the opportunity to testify before you and to thank you, as always, for your steadfast support of the City University of New York, our students and our faculty and for the generosity of the Council to CUNY over many years, including your visionary support of the City Council Academic Achievement Scholarship.

I am here today to testify as to the status of CUNY's progress on the goals set forth in the 2012-2016 Master Plan; those goals, initiatives and outcomes, along with new contexts, opportunities

and challenges have informed our aspirations in the new 2016-2020 Master Plan, which will come to a vote before our Board of Trustees later this month, on September 26th. The new Master Plan will also be aligned with a new strategic framework, nearly completed, that will set forth bold goals in key areas, including access and completion.

Today I am honored to be accompanied at the table by Dr. David Gomez, the President of Hostos Community College. Dr. Gomez was named President only a year ago, but he has a long and distinguished record of senior leadership at Hostos and Kingsborough Community College of Brooklyn. Dr. Gomez will talk from his experience about how the 2012-2016 Master Plan inspired and guided some of the changes he has led at Hostos and elsewhere at CUNY. And I'm also please to have at the table, not to offer testimony, but to answer some of the Council's questions, Vice Chancellor Matt Sapienza of Budget and Finance and Vice Chancellor for Human Resource Management, Ginger Waters.

I would like to begin by quoting very briefly from the Master Plan 2012-2016 major goals.

"By the end of this Master Plan 2016, CUNY will fulfill its current trajectory and be widely recognized as the preeminent public urban university in the world; this recognition will be based on CUNY's continuing to adapt its historic mission to the complex needs of the 21st century, particularly the 21st century needs of New York City and New York State." And concluding in that paragraph: "By 2016, CUNY will bring to fruition initiatives that garner the many benefits of an integrated university while simultaneously respecting and encouraging the unique identity of the colleges."

Colleagues, I humbly submit that CUNY has made outstanding progress on even these lofty goals, even in challenging times for public higher education in the nation.

CUNY is indeed increasingly nationally recognized as a preeminent public university in several key areas. President Obama frequently refers to CUNY in major addresses as a national model in college readiness and college completion. For example, early college and career high schools, which support students in grades 9-12, ending our ASAP program (Accelerated Study in Associate Programs), an

initiative to which I will return in a minute. The State of Ohio has turned to CUNY to help launch ASAP-like programs in that state and other states and systems are calling. Four years ago CUNY announced the opening of a new community college called that, The New Community College, with the first New Community College in New York State in decades. Four years later that college has attracted one of CUNY's largest gifts in being renamed the Guttman Community College. Just last month, four years into its existence, Guttman was named the number one community college in New York State, #1 of 121 schools, by EDsmart.org, and was cited for its academic quality, student satisfaction and a 3-year graduation rate of over 50%.

We are deeply honored that Michelle Obama chose to give her final commencement address as First Lady at City College. Mrs. Obama was visibly moved by the outstanding student speeches that preceded hers by the valedictorian and the salutatorian, and beautifully; one was from the Macaulay Honors College and one from the SEEK Program. They spoke on the value of attending a college like City College that

was as inclusive and diverse as it was excellent and inspiring.

CUNY's distinction is evident at all levels, from the pre-college and associate degree programs to graduate and professional programs. To name just a few achievements, our fully online bachelor's programs offered through the School of Professional Studies, are now ranked #1 in the State of New York and #11 in the nation by *US News and World Report*, where we are tied with such national leaders as Arizona State and Penn State. Just this week, new rankings by ValueColleges.com place SPS' online programs as #5 in the nation; in this way, we are fulfilling one of the tenets of the existing Master Plan. Baruch College has just received the highest rankings in its history, from the newly released *US News and World Report*, ranking #5 among top public institutions in the north region. Yesterday we also learned that CUNY's Williams E. Macaulay Honors College received the highest rating among public universities, honors colleges and programs nationally, earning five "mortarboards" out of a possible high score of five. Macaulay is one of just three honors colleges in the northeast to

receive this accolade. CUNY Law has risen markedly in state rankings and its clinical program is now rated third in the nation. As noted this week in *The Chronicle of Higher Education*, John Jay College of Criminal Justice skyrocketed to 7th place nationwide among 600 institutions in the rate of increase in garnering federal research dollars between 2005 and 2014, an astonishing increase in research productivity, all in the public interest for the public good.

According to the National Science Foundation, the CUNY Graduate Center is among the nation's top 10 producers of doctoral degrees annually. In the past year CUNY has created the New CUNY Graduate School of Public Health and Health Policy in Harlem and opened the CUNY School of Medicine, also in Harlem on the City College campus. The CUNY School of Medicine will be from its inception one of the most diverse and inclusive medical schools in the nation.

Our senior colleges are opening exciting new schools, for example, Brooklyn College's Feirstein Graduate School of Cinema at Steiner Studios, with multiple new MFA programs. And the

senior colleges are offering more of their own stand-alone doctorates -- in instructional leadership and nursing practice at Hunter College, in nursing practice at the College of Staten Island and Lehman College, and the executive business doctorate at Baruch, to name a few. In 2014, in the crowning achievement of the decade of science, which I will discuss more in a moment, CUNY opened the Advanced Science Research Center, the ASRC, a state-of-the-art university-wide science facility that is equal of any in the world. Specializing in the interdisciplinary areas of nanoscience, neuroscience, structural biology, environmental sciences and photonics, ASRC scientists are collaborating with each other, with CUNY faculty from across the colleges, with students at all levels and scientists across the city and the world, creating opportunities that never existed before at CUNY.

The Master Plan of 2012-2016 devoted a great deal of attention to the decade of science. Of course, we are in fact in an era of science that extends far beyond a decade, but it is worth reviewing quickly what that designation meant for the University. Beginning in earnest in 2005 and

continuing to this day, CUNY has made a significant commitment to improve science research and teaching, making a multibillion dollar investment in faculty, facilities, degree programs, and student educational opportunity. This initiative has elevated science across the CUNY landscape and improved the quality, breadth and depth of scientific offerings at all levels. We hired and supported over 300 new science faculty members, a 20% increase in STEM faculty since 2005, and we increased the number of students and undergraduate STEM degree programs by 70%. Beyond the ASRC, CUNY built new science facilities at City, Lehman, John Jay, Hunter, and Queens Colleges and is in the process of completing a new science facility at New York City Tech and CUNY renovated over 45 teaching research labs in existing facilities.

These select highlights -- and there are too many to mention -- are very exciting, they raise CUNY's profile and extend our reach within and beyond the City, but they must not overshadow the enormous progress CUNY has made in the past four years on the most fundamental aspects of our mission: access, excellence and student success. I turn to these now.

Increased Access

CUNY continued to expand access to higher education for New Yorkers. Between fall 2012 and fall 2016, the number of new students entering CUNY as freshmen and transfer students rose by 4,517; CUNY's total headcount increased by 4,096 in that period. Indeed, last year represented CUNY's highest enrollment in its history.

But access means little without the opportunities and tools to succeed. 57% of all CUNY students and over 80% of community college students enter CUNY with remedial needs. In 2009-2010, CUNY piloted a program called CUNY Start, designed to serve students with significant developmental needs in reading, writing and math. CUNY Start students defer matriculation for one semester to receive intensive instruction and support for a modest fee of \$75. The results, in terms of completion, were so encouraging that in the period of 2012-2016, CUNY moved quickly to scale up CUNY Start from 150 students in the pilot to 3,600 students enrolled last year. Encouraged by that success, CUNY also created and piloted in 2014 an intensive 8-week math intervention called Math Start modeled on the semester-long CUNY Start math course. Over 90% of

the students became math-proficient in 8 weeks. The City of New York has recently funded a major expansion of Math Start to serve 1,000 students in this academic year and 4,000 students in 2018-2019. The 2012-2016 Master Plan notes an intention to permit the piloting of alternatives to elementary algebra for developmental math students who intend to major in non-algebra-intensive majors. Quantway and Statway were indeed successfully piloted at two community colleges, BMCC and LaGuardia, respectively. Students taking these courses passed them at significantly higher rates than similar students taking elementary algebra. These and other innovations at the community college level have reduced achievement gaps and changed the career prospects of thousands of students. And importantly, they are informing our plans for the future of developmental education at CUNY, which I hope I can discuss with you at a later date.

Rising Success Rates

This past year, CUNY reached an all-time high in the number of degrees it conferred -- 50,022. This figure is up more than 10% from 2011-2012, the year before the master plan was released.

Graduation rates have been rising steadily in both associate and bachelor's programs. The 3-year graduation rate for freshmen entering our associate programs rose from 12.6% for the 2009 entering cohort to 17.5% for the 2012 entering cohort, a 5% increase.

The 6-year graduation rate for freshmen entering our bachelor's programs rose from 51% for the 2006 entering cohort to 53.9% for the 2009 entering cohort, an increase of almost 3%.

ASAP (Accelerated Studies and Associate Program) -- CUNY's nationally acclaimed ASAP program is our most successful single initiative to raise degree completion rates. As you know, the program was founded in 2007 with support from the New York City Center for Economic Opportunity precisely to improve graduate rates among community college students. As of fall 2015, ASAP has served 12,780 students. Last year alone, more than 8,000 students were enrolled in ASAP at nine colleges; its results have been nothing short of remarkable. To date, the average 3-year graduation rate among ASAP students is 53% compared with 23% for similar students. I also want to note outstanding 2-year graduation rate of

34% for ASAP students vs. 12.5% for a similar comparison group; these are the highest 2-year community college graduation rates we have seen at CUNY. Given the program's proven value and with the City's generous support, CUNY plans to greatly expand the program, growing it to 25,000 in FY 2019. Besides expanding ASAP, CUNY will also embark on the ultimate proof of the ASAP concept at a single college, and that is, the campus-wide expansion of ASAP at Bronx Community College.

Guttman College boasts 3-year graduation rates comparable to ASAP, at about 50%.

I also want you to know that CUNY is piloting a variant of ASAP at the baccalaureate level; that is a program called ACE (Accelerate, Complete and Engage), at John Jay College. Early returns on the program, which was inaugurated just last year with support from Robin Hood, already shows improved retention rates and credit accumulation rates, and bachelor's programs at other senior and comprehensive colleges have expressed interest in such a program at the bachelor's level.

Improving Transfer Processes

The 2012-2016 Master Plan cites the Pathways Degree Completion Initiative as its most ambitious effort to make CUNY a more coherent, integrated public university, a core part of its mission, for the benefit of our students.

Since the inauguration of the Pathways Initiative to streamline and harmonize a general education, transfer enrollment has increased at CUNY from 21,205 in fall 2012, the year before Pathways was inaugurate, to 25,068 in fall 2015.

Many more CUNY students are transferring within CUNY since the inauguration of Pathways; there is, for example, a 31% increase from fall 2012 to fall 2015 in the number of students transferring from a CUNY associate degree program with an associate degree to a CUNY baccalaureate program, and we are very pleased with that, to see associate degree students graduating with degrees and continuing their education.

Further, the percentage of students who are denied credit for a transferred course dropped from 33% to 12.8% in the 2012-2015 period.

In recent years it is the case that about two-thirds of the new students who enter CUNY during

a typical year who enter bachelor's programs are indeed transfer students, the majority of whom are from the CUNY system.

Now colleagues, these are preliminary data; we cannot attribute all of these strong numbers to the Pathways Initiative, but they are encouraging. We will continue to monitor the implementation of Pathways and assess the effects of Pathways on student outcomes and student success as we move forward.

I wanna say a word about improving career opportunities and new academic programs.

Since the submission of the last Master Plan in 2012, CUNY has registered well over 100 new degree and certificate programs across the system in a wide variety of academic disciplines, many of them with a professional focus on sectors that count in New York City and New York State: tech, healthcare, transportation, government, media, finance, security, education, hospitality, the performing and creative arts, and tourism. In accordance with the directives in the Master Plan, many of these new programs are dual or joint degree programs or have been designed to articulate with other CUNY programs to create

career ladders for students; more and more of them are online. With curriculum and courses developed by CUNY faculty, these new offerings serve the full spectrum of New Yorkers, from high school graduates seeking technical training in certificate programs through bachelor's master's and Ph.D. programs. Within the last year alone, Baruch College created three new majors in data analytics: in computer information systems, marketing and marketing analytics and information risk management and cyber security.

A number of other innovative programs have been created at CUNY, many of which are unique not only to CUNY but to higher education in New York City. These include a Master of Science in Translational Medicine at City College, a Bachelor of Science in Pharmaceutical Science at York, a Bachelor of Technology in Applied Chemistry at New York City Tech, a Master of Science in Disability Services in Higher Education at the School of Professional Studies, and a Master of Arts in Arts Administration. Medgar Evers College is launching an innovative interdisciplinary new BFA program to connect students to careers in the arts in New York. CUNY has also

continued to introduce new masters and doctoral degrees in healthcare fields like nursing and physical therapy.

I wanna say a word about improving career opportunities through expanded experiential learning.

The 2012-2016 Plan recognizes the importance of experiential learning to our students' success. We are pleased that more and more CUNY students leave CUNY with degrees, but we want them also to leave with real-world experience, a resume that they can be proud of and a network of peers and partners that they can turn to. Last year Chancellor Milliken convened a task force on experiential learning and charged it to develop a plan that was right for CUNY and would expose every interested student to an authentic experiential learning opportunity. Our plan was completed in June 2016 and it calls for greatly expanded active learning experiences, more engagement with our city, its institutions, agencies and workplaces, more opportunities for internships for undergraduate research and for study abroad. CUNY has expanded its highly successful CUNY Service Corps, in which students have quality, supervised paid internships in

agencies and organizations, along with academic mentoring and peer support. One of the ways that CUNY is creating meaningful experiential learning is to partner with other great institutions. Just last week, *The New York Times* announced an innovative partnership among CUNY, the New York City Department of Cultural Affairs and The Rockefeller Foundation. Funded by the City and Rockefeller, this \$1 million initiative will create the CUNY Cultural Corps, based on the Service Corps model that will place dozens of students in paid internships at cultural institutions across the city; this will create opportunities for our students to get experience in some of New York's most vibrant sectors and may one day lead to a more diverse arts workforce. Another innovative partnership among CUNY, Cornell Tech and Verizon called, Women in Technology and Entrepreneurship in New York (WiTNY), seeks to grow and diversity the tech workforce by expanding the participation of women in the computer science pipeline. Medgar Evers College is taking the lead in developing smart new entrepreneurial programs that are inspiring their students to compete and win in entrepreneurial competitions, and Medgar Evers is a vibrant site for

CUNY's Start Up NY ventures with new companies, again, bringing internship opportunities for our students.

Colleagues, there is entirely too much to say about the past four years at CUNY. In my focus on academic quality and student success, there are obviously many areas I did not touch upon at all, including some of the ones that you mentioned, Chair Barron, in your introduction. And while all of our major initiatives bore fruit, some were frankly more successful than others and much work remains to be done. CUNY serves the great evolving city of New York surpassingly well, but access could be even wider. At CUNY and throughout the nation, there are still too many students who arrive not fully prepared for the rigors of college work. Our traditional developmental education programs must be improved; indeed, they must be transformed. Degree completion, as you heard, is increasing at all levels at CUNY, but it is not nearly where it needs to be.

As our master plan rightly notes, CUNY can and must be a leader in preparing the workforce for the 21st century; this will require improving STEM education across the curricula, deepening our

relationship with the Department of Education and developing a much stronger level of engagement between CUNY and the employers across the sectors of our city and state. Again, there is much work to do, but we are building on a solid record of success, our direction is clear and our resolve is palpable, and I thank you for your time.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you; next.

DAVID GOMEZ: Good morning Madam Chair; members of the Council. Thank you for the opportunity to address you today and thank you for your support of the University in general and community colleges in particular. It has been my privilege to have served the City University of New York for the last 42 years including 28 years at Kingsborough Community College in Brooklyn. This, I believe, has given me a deep appreciation for both the importance and the impact of our colleges in our city.

For the past 48 years, Eugenio Maria de Hostos Community College has proudly served the South Bronx and surrounding communities as a gateway to academic and socioeconomic achievement. We have worked diligently to fulfill the goals of CUNY's

2012-2016 Master Plan and fully intend to continue this work in our next plan.

Hostos has had a productive year in terms of student success, grant and contract revenue, and productivity initiatives. The 2015-2016 academic year yielded 1,196 graduates (the largest graduating class in the college's history), an increase of 37% from last year's total. The 3-year graduation rate for our fall 2012 cohort was 20.6%, an increase of 8% from fall 2011 and 12% from fall 2008, the largest increase among all CUNY community colleges.

Now while we are proud of our successes, we remain mindful of the work yet to be done. Successful completion of developmental education continues to be one of the most significant barriers to degree completion. 90% of our students require support in at least one basic skills area. The more remedial work students need, the less likely they are to remain in school. We are committed, therefore, to increasing the number of students who successfully complete remediation in their first year of college. Beginning in the fall of 2013 we increased the number of workshops offered during summer and winter for students needing support, with targeted sections for

high fails and multiple repeaters. We aligned funding to meet this goal and, where data showed evidence of success, activities were scaled up. We have explored a number of ways to increase retention: creating and implementing a number of student supports; re-engineering and revising our remedial and developmental programs in mathematics, English and language and cognition, and redoubling our efforts of creating new and strengthening existing readiness programs. We are also looking at ways to promote greater student-faculty interaction, which has shown to improve retention.

Our Division of Continuing Education and Workforce Development has had great success with its Math Start Pilot program. CEWD has played a crucial role in realizing the College's PMP goal of increasing the number of non-degree to degree pathways. We are nearing a launch of two such programs -- an Interdisciplinary Food Studies program and a new Construction Technology and Management program.

The College plays an important role in providing educational and workforce development opportunities to strengthen the economy of the South

Bronx. I note with pride the rebound of the College's NCLEX pass rates, which highlights Hostos' reputation as a key source of new and highly-skilled healthcare workers. Our annual alumni survey indicates that 88% or more of our Radiologic Technology students find high-demand and well-paying jobs. Nearly 100% of our Dental Hygiene graduates find employment within a year. RNs and LPNs also quickly find employment. Hostos is developing additional Allied Health programs to meet regional market demands and is in the process of creating a non-credit to credit pathway for an Occupational Therapy Assistant program in order to meet the projected 21% growth in our labor market.

Hostos remains committed to the definitions of excellence as articulated in our 2011-2016 Strategic Plan. Every decision we make is guided by our response to these critical questions: What best serves our students? What are our outcomes? What have we done right and what do we need to improve? Answering these questions honestly requires that we look critically at what we do and, more importantly, address what needs improving.

Based on what the data shows, we build on what work and revise what doesn't.

In my experience, this approach is not unique simply to Hostos. I believe that the Chancellor and the leadership of this University are equally committed to evidence-based decision-making and to the continuous improvement of our academic offerings and support services to our students.

Thank you for your time and attention.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I wanna thank you for your presentation and I also want to thank you for the specifics, which is really what I'm interested in examining as we talk about a plan that we've laid out and get some kind of evaluation of how successful that plan has been. So I appreciate all of the references to important people in the field of education and organizations that have given such high-ranking to the programs that are operating at CUNY, that's wonderful, and I've got lots of questions, as do my colleagues that are here.

I wanna start with the ASAP program and you talked about a variation of that ASAP that you're going to use at the senior colleges; could you talk about that a little more?

VITA RABINOWITZ: I would be pleased to, and Chair Barron, after my introduction, there is an expert on ASAP, our ASAP leader, Donna Linderman, here, who may have a... yes.

Most exciting proof of concept, and a major program to promote degree completion in four years, not in six years, as CUNY so often reaches in four years, would be an ASAP-like program. John Jay College of Criminal Justice was interested in such a program in several of their most popular major; not just one course of study, but several. They were able to attract a grant from the Robin Hood Foundation to support the program, because like ASAP, it comes with many tangible supports -- MetroCards, free tuition, books paid for... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Wait, wait. What did you just say after MetroCards, **(inaudible)**...

[laughter]

VITA RABINOWITZ: MetroCards... Yes...
[interpose]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes and then after MetroCards you said... [crosstalk]

VITA RABINOWITZ: Yes. Okay, uhm free text books and free tuition... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's not what... Oh, okay.

VITA RABINOWITZ: Ah, that... see, that's exactly what you want...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's the part I wanted to hear. Thank you.

VITA RABINOWITZ: That's right. That's right. So, yes. So I mean it's... it is frankly, a very expensive program, but Chair... and we only have one year of data; it's called ACE and Donna maybe able to fill in the details. But we're already seeing early signs that this can work on the baccalaureate level, and some were skeptical that a program like this could -- Chair Barron, what's exciting is; not only is John Jay interested in pursuing, but other colleges, other CUNY senior colleges have been excited about anything that might be right for them.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What is the cost to the partner that... What is... Robin Hood Foundation; what is the cost and then how many students are participating in this program right now, for this pilot?

VITA RABINOWITZ: Excuse me. Donna; can I ask you to answer those questions? These are great questions.

DONNA LINDERMAN: Do I need to be sworn in?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes you do.

DONNA LINDERMAN: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee and to answer questions honestly?

DONNA LINDERMAN: I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Please give us your name and your title and... [interpose]

DONNA LINDERMAN: Donna Linderman, University Dean for Student Success Initiatives and ASAP Executive Director.

So thank you so much for your interest in John Jay ACE. The model is fully... it is the ASAP model and its entirety is focused on doubling four-year graduation rates. We began with 262 students, funded by the Robin Hood Foundation, and in terms of the student experience, it is exactly like ASAP in the sense that students have a menu of financial

resources to remove barriers to full-time study; any gap need above their financial aid is fully waived, including fees; students receive unlimited monthly MetroCards to make it possible for them to travel freely between work, school and home and they receive textbook support, because as we all know, textbooks are one of the most prohibitive costs for students.

Students are assigned to one dedicated advisor who works with them from the minute they're admitted until the day they graduate; all students attend full-time. John Jay opted for six of their criminal justice majors, both BA and BF majors, and the students are expected to graduate in four years; because of that, students must go to tutoring; they are very closely monitored, both from a personal growth perspective, transitioning to college and their advisors really make sure they are working on their reading and writing and math needs. The program has done spectacularly well; our first to second semester retention rate was 95% and students take 15 credits a semester, earned a mean of 13.3 and about 86% of students were retained to the third semester, with the same number of students earning about 30 credits. So the students have done

spectacularly well in the program, demonstrating that the vast majority of them are going to be able, if they stay on track, as they have in their first year, to graduate in four years. Our goal is to see at least a 50% four-year graduation rate; that would be more than double the current rate at John Jay.

What's most exciting is that we're seeing that the model works. I can give you some information about the students who we're serving. In ACE, they're very representative of the overall John Jay population -- 80% are financial aid recipients, 46% of students are Hispanic, 22% white, 17% black, 15% Asian; slightly more females to male. So this is not a group of students that, you know, is being creamed, they are representative of who the typical students are that come to John Jay, and we're very excited that the students at John Jay will be partaking extensively in a range of career development activities, delivered both by the CEF, Career and Employment Specialist, embedded in the ACE program, as well as encouraged to participate in the internships and externships to help them graduate with an eye on professions they aim to enter, which are almost entirely in criminal justice. So it's a very positive model; as Vita

mentioned, there's already other CUNY senior colleges who have expressed interest in coming onboard and we would be delighted to see this model, this ASAP-like model expanded. And I'm happy to answer any specific questions that you might have about the program.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh great; thank you for that overview.

I thought I heard you say that you remove barriers to students being full-time students; what are those barriers and how do you give them that assistance? Suppose someone, you know, is... I heard you say 80% of them are financially... [interpose]

DONNA LINDERMAN: Yes, correct.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yeah. And then I have other questions that may all be able to come together.

DONNA LINDERMAN: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What's the average GPA of the students that are in the program? What's the cost? How are students selected and how can we encourage other partners to support and get involved in this program?

DONNA LINDERMAN: We'll start with the barriers. As with the ASAP program, some of the

1 barriers our students face are transportation and
2 textbook costs [background comment] and if they have
3 a gap need after their financial aid, those become
4 barriers to students going full-time; they make
5 decisions about dropping a class or two, so we remove
6 those three barriers right off the bat, as we do in
7 ASAP, so that's very critical. The intrusive
8 advisement is also very critical, the transition into
9 and through college; the road is fraught with many
10 challenges -- how do you balance school, work and
11 home life; how do you communicate with a faculty
12 member if you're struggling in class; having one
13 caring adult to help the student think through those
14 issues... [interpose]

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Suppose someone
17 needs childcare; is that one of the areas where you
18 would give them assistance?

19 DONNA LINDERMAN: So that has not come up
20 at John Jay yet, but in ASAP, absolutely; if there is
21 on-site childcare and that is a barrier, we would
22 find space for a student to utilize childcare
23 services. So that so far has not come up at John
24 Jay, but if it did, we would certainly help them
25 address that.

The cost per ACE student; it's slightly more than our ASAP cost per student right now, it's \$4,000 per student per year; with ASAP our costs have dropped because we have realized economies of scale, but we certainly think that the same drop in costs would happen in the ACE program or other similar models across CUNY as the program expanded, because you spread your fixed costs across larger groups of students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

DONNA LINDERMAN: Next question was about GPA...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: GPA and how are students selected?

DONNA LINDERMAN: I don't know the GPA off the top of my head, but I can tell you that 86% of students ended the first year in good academic standing; I can certainly get back to you with the exact GPA, but I know it was quite high.

Students are selected in the same way they are for ASAP; ACE is a post-admission option, so after the students were admitted to John Jay they were invited to come in and learn about the program if they were intending on entering the six criminal

1 justice majors that were being supported, and even if
2 they weren't, if they heard about the benefits of the
3 program and they wanted to change majors, that was
4 completely an option too. So basically anyone that
5 was planning on coming full-time was invited to come
6 in and learn about the program and then when we hit
7 -- we actually went above our target -- so the
8 program was aiming to serve 250 students, but we made
9 room for 262 because there was interest, but there's
10 no kind of measurement... there was no minimum GPA; if
11 you were admitted to John Jay, you were willing to go
12 full-time and participate in the program activities
13 -- meeting with and advisor, going full-time, going
14 to tutoring if you needed to -- you were welcomed
15 into the program.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Great. Okay, I have
18 lots of other questions; I'm gonna try to curtail
19 them so that my colleagues will be able to -- and I
20 wanna acknowledge we've been joined by Council Member
21 Cabrera; welcome him.

22 I'm always very interested in faculty
23 diversity and I know the University has a University
24 Diversity Action Plan, but I didn't hear any
25 presentation on that. So as a part of mission one,

Academic Excellence, it says that it wants to cultivate faculty diversity and then in your 2012-2014 Master Plan you indicate, "A diverse faculty promotes intellectual vibrancy and enhances the teaching/learning experience. A representative workforce also fosters a climate of inclusion that has a positive impact on student retention." So I'd like to hear what has been addressed, what's been completed and what have been the results in terms of attracting, retaining -- black faculty particularly -- what is the correlation between that and the Latino faculty initiative, and what tenure track programs exist and how successful have they been?

VITA RABINOWITZ: Thank you Chair Barron.

(inaudible)... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is your mic on?

VITA RABINOWITZ: ...did not... I did not address the matter of faculty diversity at all; I will note; in general terms, CUNY's faculty is quite diverse by national standards, but is not as diverse as we want it to be. And in fact, we do have programs -- we do not have a program directly similar to the Latino initiative for black faculty; I will state that outright. We have received an exciting

new grant from the Mellon Foundation precisely to diversify the CUNY professoriate, but I would like to, with your permission, to bring in Vice Chancellor Ginger Waters to discuss faculty diversity initiatives and the state of faculty diversity at CUNY.

GINGER WATERS: Good morning.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good morning.

GINGER WATERS: So let me begin by saying something somewhat sad; Arlene Torres, who is our relatively new dean for recruitment in diversity, was scheduled to be here today; unfortunately, she had a death in the family and is not here. She has many more specifics on the diversity, because she works so directly with them. But I will give you an overview of some of the successes we've had; some of the challenges we still face and tell you a little bit about the program that is in the Office of Recruitment and Diversity.

As you noted, we firmly believe that it is CUNY's obligation to provide our students with an excellent faculty and to experience not only faculty who look like them, which we believe is very important, but also to experience faculty who have

depth of knowledge, research, scholarship in order to be able to give our students the best education possible.

As Provost Rabinowitz mentioned, our representation of underrepresented groups in the faculty compares quite well with national data and I can give you a few statistics on that. Nationally, "minority" -- and I put that in quotes -- faculty are 19.9% at CUNY for the same period which we're talking about, around 2013 our percentage was 32.9% and fall of 2015 33.9%. We have been able to hire about 488 full-time faculty between 2011 and 2015 and 818 part-time faculty. Faculty from federally protected groups increased by 265 between 2011 and 2015; the greatest increase was among Asian Americans and followed by Hispanics. Asian American full-time faculty increased from 784 to 955; Hispanic faculty increased by 53; black faculty, 39, and Italian Americans, who as you know are a protected group in the University, observed a slight decline from 5.9% to 5.1%. On the part-time faculty side, blacks are 1,975 or 16% of our part-time faculty; Hispanics 9%; Asians 11%; Italian Americans 3.3%.

One of the things that I think is very interesting in CUNY's workforce at this point is that we are expecting, as are many organizations, a lot of retirements going forward and we took a look at the age cohorts of our faculty and it's interesting to see that in the age grouping 50-79 they are a total of about 56% in full-time faculty. So expect that as we go forward we will be seeing a lot of turnover and I think that it's our perception that this will represent an opportunity to further diversify the faculty.

As you mentioned, we do have a Faculty Diversity Strategic Plan in place; we are currently looking at the campus plan, so there's a university plan and then each campus also develop their own diversity plan; we are now going over those diversity plans, they give us yearly updates and we're looking at some interesting trends that we're seeing; one is that while we are reaching out and hiring more underrepresented faculty, we're also looking at the movement of those faculty, from assistant professors to associate professors to full professors, so this Mellon grant that Provost Rabinowitz mentioned is going to give us an opportunity to provide support to

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thank you for that and I would hope that as we have more specific questions we can give them to you and get them **(inaudible)**... [interpose]

GINGER WATERS: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I just want to say, as you talk about comparing yourself to the nation, the nation doesn't look like New York... [interpose]

GINGER WATERS: That is true.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: so we need to compare ourselves to other urban areas with a similar ethnic composition so that we can get a more accurate comparison. Okay? And in terms of -- I have a couple questions -- and then I'm gonna move to my colleagues, 'cause they've got questions as well. In terms of the statement in your plan, the Master Plan for 2012-2016, the Plan is designed to promote innovative recruitment and inclusion initiatives and programs to foster a climate that supports faculty members and encourages them to thrive and then it says, "These recommendations include but are not limited to making diversity goals and strategies to reach them, specific targets of the annual performance management process (PMP), assessing the

VITA RABINOWITZ: There is indeed an item or category in the performance management process that requires us to track and strongly encourages us to increase the diversity of our faculty and our staff, including leadership and again, we showed a very modest, very modest increase of one percentage point... [interpose]

VITA RABINOWITZ: Chair Barron, as we finalize our strategic framework, I will get back to you on what new initiatives with goals and targets that we intend to implement. One idea that we have discussed seriously is an in-house East Leadership Program for underrepresented groups in academic and

administrative leadership in CUNY, for example, following on the heels of a very successful American Council on Education Leadership Program I have served as a mentor; I'm sure others in this room have as well; we would like to offer that opportunity to CUNY leaders who seek even more influential senior positions. Also, another facet of the Mellon grant to which we referred involved identifying -- and we'll be held accountable to the Mellon Foundation for these results -- accepting minority post-doctoral students into our program; I believe our target is 15 new minority scholars who want academic careers, who are interested in teaching at one of our schools (and our schools have accepted a willingness to accept these successful candidates), supporting them, grooming them, committing to hire them and over the life of the Mellon grant I believe we have -- and I will get back to you on this if I'm wrong -- space for 15 such young scholars of color.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So is that talking about the doctoral track that you mentioned earlier?

VITA RABINOWITZ: Yes. Yes, that's right. Right... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Okay.

VITA RABINOWITZ: So... and uh yes, yes
(inaudible).

GINGER WATERS: One other program that we're still developing right now; we are going to start looking at creating a database of potential faculty who are out there who might be interested in coming to CUNY. I think one of the things that we have not done well is recruiting. I think recruiting needs to be much more targeted and much more individual.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes, I agree and I've heard that since my first hearing and I'm disappointed to know that it has not gotten better results and I think that everyone should know that that's one of the top issues and I'm disappointed that it wasn't a part of your testimony and I would hope to be able to get the responses to the questions that we're asking. And just one last question; in terms of the committees that are responsible for making the selections, I read an article, I think in yesterday's *Chronicle*, that talks about the fact that the members of that committee need to go through a type of training [background comment] so that they understand they may have some subtle biases

[background comments] that they're not even in touch with and we need to make sure that the persons who are making those decisions get some kind of training and workshops where they get put in touch with that, not only in terms of the ethnicity, but also, interestingly, in terms of the thought, the group-think; you have a group of people who all think the same, you may not get as much progress [background comment] as people who have different approaches and different mindsets. So I would hope as a part of that there's going to be a targeted effort to help people who are making the decision, 'cause we know it's made in whatever settings it's made and with people who have their own mindsets, to bring them in touch with things that they may not be aware of. I'm gonna move quickly to my colleague, Council Member Vacca, who has questions.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you Chair.

[background comments]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I want to acknowledge we've been joined by Council Member Rodriguez as well. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you Chair and thank you for your testimony. I do wanna note

that of all the protected groups, the only protected group that saw a decline in faculty was the Italian American number, so I want to create an awareness and ask you to be sensitive to that mandate and we were the only... we... I'm an Italian American, but that group was the only group that declined and it is a protected group at CUNY, so I thank you for your awareness.

I'm very encouraged by much of the report; now the number of transfer students who were denied credit, dropping from 33-12%, that is phenomenal; I wanna know how you did that; I have an idea or two, but tell me what did you do?

VITA RABINOWITZ: One of the most important and frankly, most arduous aspects of Pathways -- of all the wonderful transfer data that I introduced, Council Member Vacca, the most... the one that I'm quite certain is a Pathways effect, is just that. Pathways creates a virtually automatic transfer of courses whereby students no longer need to go to department chairs or have a case by case examination process; as long as two courses are regarded as equivalent in our in-house system known as TIPS, a course from BMCC will transfer to Baruch

College and will fulfill the general education requirement **(inaudible)** as appropriate. So streamlining, removing the case by case evaluation achieved that and that is an enormous achievement, and again, I believe an undeniable Pathways effect.

What I did not discuss was Pathways in the majors. In order to have an even greater Pathways effect, we would like to make sure that the introductory courses to all of the popular majors -- psychology, English, nursing -- also be harmonized so the few -- and we've made progress, but that's not working quite as well as the general education requirement that we began with and devoted so much attention to. So we wanna make sure that if you're transferring from LaGuardia with an intro to psych course, that the psych department at Brooklyn College or Hunter College will accept that course for major credit; not simply for elective credit or even for general education credit; that would mean a great deal to our students and that would launch them on their way. So we're only three years into Pathways and there's a lot to learn, but again, I do think that the effect of students not losing credits, not being told that a course you took in good faith at

Kingsborough transfers to another CUNY school; that alone is an achievement for our students. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Yeah, the number is fantastic and immediately attracted my attention.

I wanted to discuss also about the remediation issue and inherent in my question is; what percentage of our students in CUNY are adults versus young people, because I know we have an increase in adult population. I say that because collaboration with DOE is very much needed...

VITA RABINOWITZ: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: many of the remedial courses in the community colleges should be given at the high school level and we should be having students entering the community colleges, ideally, who do not need remedial courses. That's the ideal situation; that may or may not ever happen, but I wanted to point that out, but my other point was about adults. Many adults, if they go to a community college and are given remedial courses and they find it difficult, they drop out and they don't continue and these are people who have two children at home, who are trying to make ends meet; they have different requirements than a younger person would

have out of high school, so can you explain how we deal with this remedial issue in both populations?

VITA RABINOWITZ: Yes. You ask wonderful questions and I must say you also touch upon what is my current preoccupation, which is the effectiveness and efficiency of developmental education at CUNY. Very quickly, I want to note that your point about cooperating more intensively, deepening our relationship with the Department of Education is absolutely the case; we are working hard on that, the Department of Education is open to us and identifying students early and participating in college for all, computer science for all, algebra for all, identifying students when they take the PSATs, that there might be a math issue, because Councilman Vacca, math is the problem here -- it's math; we'll be frank -- identifying the problems early and intervening as soon as possible so the students come to us already proficient is our goal, reducing the number of students placed into remediation in the first place. The fact is; the percentage of adults or returning students at CUNY has been declining in recent years, declining fairly precipitously. I have our Director of Admissions here, who... and enrollment

management who can speak more about this, but adults are declining at CUNY and one of CUNY's goals in the next plan will be to be more hospitable to adult students. We want to open a front door for adult students; we've got nearly a million people living in New York City who have some college and no degree, 1.8 million in New York State with some college and no degrees and those folks will have much stronger careers and different life trajectories if they can get their degrees.

Now to your question about the requirements on adult students and how developmental needs can serve as barriers to their progress. We are looking very carefully, and revisiting in fact, requirements of returning students when it comes to developmental math and math proficiency at CUNY; we understand that test scores taken by adults are not a good reflection of what they actually know and can do. Frankly, all of us in this room probably did very well on our SATs and our GREs and none of us wants to retake those tests today, so recognizing that those tests are less predictive for adult students than they may be for traditional age students, we are looking very carefully at those

requirements and as soon as those are finalized, you know, we are happy to come before the Council and discuss them, but I want you to know that that's a very serious issue.

May I turn to Jim Murphy to ask about the percentage of adult students who enter CUNY now... please.

JIM MURPHY: I don't know if you wanna swear me in for a quick question, but I'll be more than happy to.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee?

JIM MURPHY: I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

JIM MURPHY: So about 25% of the total CUNY population is classified as adult students at this point in time...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Please state your name for the record.

JAMES MURPHY: Sorry, James Murphy; I'm the University Dean for Enrollment. Again, about 25% of the students in CUNY are classified as adult students; some of them entered as younger students

1 and have stayed long enough that they're now
2 classified as adult students. Though education today
3 is going towards online education and CUNY's trying
4 to expand our footprint in the online education,
5 right now we have some initiatives going on at
6 central office to do so, but you know, quite frankly,
7 I think adult education; moving forward, a lot of it
8 is going to be through online education.
9

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well I thank you
11 for that; I can just add that if we go with adult
12 education and we do the online, as you indicated;
13 many adults lack... many adults will need help with
14 structure, online learning requires structure, it
15 requires discipline and with their obligations and
16 all, although I do agree with you; this is a good way
17 to get to adults -- I mean, weekend college is
18 important, where adults can go Saturday-Sunday; I
19 think that's another tool, but I also think that we
20 have to look at counseling services for adults
21 because if they do the online, they need supports in
22 place.

23 JAMES MURPHY: Yes we do. [sic] And I
24 just wanna mention also that we had a welcome center
25 at the central office and 29% of the students who

visit that welcome center are classified as adult students; not all enroll, but 29% are adult students, well potential adult students.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Can you define briefly, at least for those who may not know, what is an adult student; is there an age; is there... tell me... [crosstalk]

JAMES MURPHY: Well you know the... it's 25 and over is considered an adult student, yeah... [crosstalk]

[background comments]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: And older. Okay.

JAMES MURPHY: We could have a lot of discussion about whether that should be the benchmark or not...

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: No, no, no, I got it. I got it; it's okay. I wanted to go into the other issue that I'm concerned about and that is mental health services and counseling [background comments] and we have to talk about this and I tell you; the First Lady has been tremendous on this issue, [interpose, background comment] but we need to know; at CUNY, are you addressing this issue; what

are we doing insomuch as counseling and outreach concerning mental health to our students?

VITA RABINOWITZ: Councilman, you raise a critical issue; in fact, my next meeting, after I leave the Council today, will be to meet with the Mental Health Workforce. CUNY is working on ThriveNYC through the CUNY Graduate School of Public Health and Health Policy and Hunter College's venerable School of Social Work. But we at CUNY are extremely supportive of the First Lady's work; my meetings today are in two areas; it's the Mental Health Workforce and how we strengthen the mental health workforce and create pipelines for CUNY students to enter that workforce, but I will -- again, our partnership in this initiative is relatively new, but I will be happy to report back to you on the state of CUNY's participation in mental health initiatives for the City and within CUNY. Is there a colleague... I know many of my Student Affairs colleagues are at IDNYC this morning, including the Vice Chancellor for Student Affairs. Is there a Student Affairs colleague who can add anything on the mental health initiatives? No, I... Councilman Vacca, **(inaudible)**... [crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I appreciate if you take that back. This is not something you could probably implement overnight, but I do think we've come to a point where all faculty should have a sensitivity to these issues and that there should be a staff development component [background comment] for faculty members to understand the signs that they should be looking for to be a little more sensitive to students who may have mental health issues, because that impacts attendance, that impacts... home conditions always impact attendance; mental health issues, depression, anxiety affect students and [background comments] although I know many students have their own educational programs to a degree where many times professors are advised of it; I do think that there are other things that people should be sensitive to and in this day and age, definitely...

VITA RABINOWITZ: Definitely.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: this may be something you wanna look into.

VITA RABINOWITZ: Thank you. Point well taken... [crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: But I... I thank you for all you've done and I just wanna makes sure we do more...

VITA RABINOWITZ: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: as in almost every area, we wanna do more, but... [interpose]

VITA RABINOWITZ: You bet and uh, thank you for your question... [crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I thank you for your hard work. Thank you Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Before I move to my next colleague, Council Member Vacca brought up the issue of math and I believe in your report you said that you're changing the requirement in terms of passing the algebra and that you're using QuantStart or Statway; I'm not sure if I got this... this correct [background comments] and I wanna know; are we lowering the bar?

VITA RABINOWITZ: Absolutely not, but Councilwoman Barron, you raise a critical question. We are not lowering the bar; what we wanna do is lower the barriers. Year after year city, state; federal taxpayers are spending an enormous amount of money investing in our students' education; our

students are investing hope, time; money on getting an education and developmental education stands, as Councilman Vacca says, as the single biggest barrier to student success, not simply at CUNY, but across the nation. So I wanna raise the bar for the effectiveness and efficiency of developmental education and President Gomez... [crosstalk]

DAVID GOMEZ: And if... if I may; I think, with all due respect to my colleagues throughout CUNY, I think we're a little late to the game... [interpose]

VITA RABINOWITZ: Yes we are.

DAVID GOMEZ: nationally, the use of quantitative reasoning and statistics for people who are not in the STEM professions have been in place in some of the most prestigious universities throughout the country for over a decade and you know clearly, I would not want to prepare an engineer who does not have a very strong background in calculus and algebra, but you know where we have those professions where, you know, quantitative reasoning, competency in the interpretation of and the use of statistics, which is more applicable across a broader range of careers is where we wanna put our energies and our

efforts, so I think it's a legitimate concern, more in terms of the perception, but it's certainly not our intention at any level, whether it's at the senior colleges or the community colleges, to lower the bar.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, great. Thank you. And at this time I'm gonna to Council Member Rodriguez; you have questions?

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: **(inaudible)**. And we are late in the game, because you know this is... well we have created like, as a former chairman of this committee, like I always say that unless we do better from K-12, when the children go to community college, too late, and that's why we cannot save many of them; we can keep you know, going around saying all the things that we do, all the service that we provide, but when we compare data 10 years ago, 8 years ago; now, you know we cannot even compete, especially those of us that are raising children that we know that when many of our children are in 4th grade is the same level of many children who are in 9th grade in a New York City public school. So unless that's fixed, we've still got challenges; it doesn't matter how beautiful we can

put the picture. You know as my brave friend and our colleague Jumaane Williams says, it's not that the system is broken, you know we as a society have built this system, but unfortunately, inequality is real, it is based on the **(inaudible)** of any student.

Hillary, when she came to the Schomburg Center and she gave her speech about breaking the **(inaudible)**, I think; I don't know if **(inaudible)** was there, but no, she was clear, she say that's the issue that we have and she presented her plan for Harlem and Mississippi and she committed that if she will win she will invest in billions of dollars to provide more opportunity **(inaudible)** black and Latino and she has said, the group of people, the ethnic group [sic] that I belong to, we need to have a conversation among ourselves about privilege and opportunity that we have had that others do not have in our society, so now that's point blank; if you are born and raised in a certain area where the average income is \$20,000, you will not be able to get the same quality education or you will not be prepared at the same level of a kid that lives in community board **(inaudible)**; that they don't know what it is to have quality programs in art, in music and gymnastics and

I think that this plan, they're great; we cannot give up. You know I was walking with my daughter; I have a meeting at DOT on Water Street and I say come, walk with me and we took a photo in front of 1 Battery Plaza; I say, "Here I was watching this in 1989 from the 6th floor," and it was more, you cannot, you know, disconnect those of us that already made it, regardless if we live paycheck by paycheck, but we're doing better than what our grandfathers were doing when they came from Europe, when they came from Asia, when they came from Latin America, even moved from the south to New York City. So I have invite you know every one, stop your going to breakfast **(inaudible)** celebrate what Rosa Parks did or Martin Luther King was able to do and **(inaudible)** was able to do it, because they did what they were called to do; now it is our call; what is the legacy that we would like to leave, more than what we're doing in those hours that we work by contract or those hours that I work in government; it doesn't matter where we are **(inaudible)** the business community. You know we have to take back the **(inaudible)**; let's go back to the community; we don't have the answer to all those questions, we don't have a solution to all those

1 problems, but what I know is that we have still a
2 **(inaudible)** to go, to attract more youngsters who are
3 **(inaudible)**, more students who they're doing great,
4 those who are retiring, until that generation dies,
5 parents, you don't have to send those kids to Costa
6 Rica or Africa; join the Peace Corps and feel that
7 you can make a difference helping people through
8 other work; here in your own background, in our own
9 city, we have generation **(inaudible)** children that we
10 have left behind. So we have to do better; ASAP is
11 working; I don't know why, you know it's like we live
12 in this bubble where we like to be talking to each
13 other and this type thing and we ask questions
14 **(inaudible)** the answer and come on, ASAP is working;
15 students **(inaudible)** with the resources of ASAP, they
16 graduated on time, they are able to get the support
17 they need with their remedial courses. So it is
18 working; what else do we need to do? **(inaudible)**
19 from this seat to Albany to the City, say we need to
20 do the right investments, convince the business
21 community, say if we turn our city into a middle-
22 class city, it will be good for everyone. We are not
23 begging, not a person **(inaudible)** we are begging
24 helping those poor people leaving the black and
25

Latino community or the new coming that come from the former Soviet Union that also go through the same challenges of poverty that we're also doing; this is about how can we persuade those in different levels that sit in the table and made a decision, where does money have priority, because that's where we can put all the programs; that's we can say, how much it will take to provide ASAP to very single student. You can call your experts and they can give you the answer and you know what they'll say, \$200 million, whatever it is; why don't we do it? Because this has not been a priority. So I believe CUNY has been our entry door to most of us; professors at CUNY, they have to be treated with our respect, because you know, we have to... I'm happy to see that finally you know, that we were able to renegotiate the contract; we have to be able to do better on diversity. I am raising a 9 and 3 years old, I want my daughter to be **(inaudible)** and that's the generation that we are also raising. Most of all, establish friendship with people who didn't look like us when we were in high school and college. Now our children, they're being raised in places where their best friend, they black, they be raised by another two parents, so we are raising the

1
2 diverse. I would like to finalize with this; CUNY
3 should reflect the diversity of our city; as a
4 Dominican American, I can tell you, we are the
5 largest **(inaudible)** students at CUNY per country in
6 our city; if you look Dominican, **(inaudible)** or
7 Mexican, we are the largest one; we are 26,000, close
8 to 26; **(inaudible)**; we don't have a Dominican
9 president at CUNY and that's unfair; it's not lack of
10 candidate; it's not lack of the process; it's about
11 you know, our great effort and approach. How, from
12 8.5 million people that we have in the city, having
13 700,000 being Dominican; Dominican being 25,000
14 students; the largest **(inaudible)** 250,000 that we
15 have at CUNY, we don't have a Dominican president.
16 And again, for me it's coming from... I believe that it
17 is a benefit for a student who are white to have
18 professors who are black, Asian, Latino; a Latino or
19 black to have professors and leadership who are
20 white, because we need to build that city; we are not
21 there yet; we can go around this in cycles, but we
22 are not there yet. I don't know how we go to sleep
23 and do **(inaudible)** to each other, say I... I was saying
24 this, but is that real. So what I hope again; I
25 trust CUNY, I trust the leadership; I know that CUNY

1 is doing the best they can; we rely on CUNY when it
2 comes to amount of research and the study and
3 **(inaudible)**, but we need the money and I think that
4 we as a coalition also have to keep pushing the state
5 to instead of having conversations trying to reduce
6 budgets of CUNY, say we need more money; we from the
7 Council to say, we need to increase the budget,
8 because that's the only way **(inaudible)** then go to
9 Hostos, to Hunter, to everyone say, we need to... we
10 have... the resources are there. I have concern; when
11 I was a student at CUNY, City College, 80% of the
12 students were black and Latino; today I don't think
13 that that number reach to 75; we have seen a
14 reduction of black and Latino in the top college at
15 CUNY, Hunter, Brooklyn College, City College, even
16 though the population has been growing there's still
17 a population **(inaudible)** have been reduced; I don't
18 think it's a lack of initial interest from the
19 leadership at CUNY; I think it involves everyone and
20 I hope that in the new plan, not the one that we are
21 ending right now, the 2012-2016, but the one 2017 to
22 the next four years, we'll **(inaudible)** initiative
23 that we can say we create initiative and support
24 those kids when they are born; we can take many more

of them into the Hunter, the John Jay, the City College and the Brooklyn College; the numbers have been doing down, declining. Thank you. Sorry Chair **(inaudible)**.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you my colleague.

[background comments, laughter]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I do have a few more questions before we call our next panel. The City Council, through ACS, has added \$1.4 million to the FY 2017 budget to provide financial resources to ensure that youth in foster care can attend and successfully graduate from CUNY. So on average, how many youth in foster care attend college and do we have data on that and what kind of outreach are you doing to, I would imagine the DOE schools, to let them know that this money is there?

VITA RABINOWITZ: Yes. So that's wonderful. Donna; may I ask you again to join the table and I know you have.. you just got **(inaudible)**?

DONNA LINDERMAN: So uh... Hello?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

DONNA LINDERMAN: Uhm so I'm very pleased to have been part of a negotiation of an exciting MOU

between CUNY and ACS; this year funds were put in place to support up to 50 youth in foster care so that they... [interpose]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You said 50?

DONNA LINDERMAN: up to 50 this year...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

DONNA LINDERMAN: who can dorm at the Queens College Summit and the College of Staten Island Dolphin Cove Residence; this is year-round housing to allow students to not have to worry about, you know, a secure place to live for the year. It also includes meal plans and other unmet cost of attendance needs; this includes transportation, textbook support; everything that they would need to live year-round so that they don't have to relocate at vacations; they can live there in the summer and students are supported so that they can go full-time, so any gap between tuition and fees is waived. So ACS is providing funds after students' financial aid and transfer vouchers are taken into account; any unmet need is covered. Students can attend any college of CUNY and those living in the residence also receive wraparound support services through a foster care agency selected by ACS. To date, New

York Foundling, one of the leading foster care agencies in the city, has had staff fully imbedded at the Queens College Summit, providing counseling, mentoring, transition advisement, and support for students. We have 42 students altogether currently residing in the dorms; there are 9 at the College of Staten Island; the remainder are at the Queens College Summit. All the students that are at CSI are part of the ASAP and/or CUNY Start Program and at the Queens College site we have about 10 students in CUNY Start and ASAP; we have 10 students that are in SEEK CD that are residing at Queens College and the remaining students are regular matriculated students attending a range of colleges. So what's exciting about it is that students can have residency in one of those sites even if they're attending another college. So it's an incredibly exciting initiative; the goal is for this to increase to up to 200 students by FY19 and the goal is to support students so that they can graduate in a timely manner.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So at this point there are 50... [crosstalk]

DONNA LINDERMAN: So there's...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: or it's just 50 that are dormed?

DONNA LINDERMAN: There is... At this point uh there are funds in place to support 50; 42 are currently dorming at one of the two sites and there's room to bring another 8 students in in the spring semester. But it's really quite a groundbreaking relationship between the two systems, because securing housing is one of the single biggest barriers for foster care students who are attending college.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How are the students selected; do you know?

DONNA LINDERMAN: So ACS provided the lead; they, as you know, subcontract with agencies across the city, so all of the foster care agencies were recommending students who were planning to attend CUNY to be considered for this opportunity. The programs I oversee, CUNY Start and ASAP, we have a grant with the Hilton Foundation, so we're also in contact with many of the agencies as well as students directly; we let them know about this opportunity, and then our SEEK CD colleagues have funding from the state for their Youth Matter program, so it really

was a collaborative effort, but ACS was kind of the linchpin in kind of identifying students through all of their agencies citywide, intermediaries like The Door, New Yorkers for Children, so it was kind of an all hands on deck...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

DONNA LINDERMAN: effort to make sure that every student who is in care who wanted to attend CUNY this year knew about this opportunity.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, great. Thank you. And there's another question from Council Member Vacca about dorms; I don't know **(inaudible)**... [crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I wanted to ask about Lehman College; are there plans for a dorm there; have you thought about plans for a dorm there?

VITA RABINOWITZ: Actually, I don't know, Councilman Vacca; I will ask Vice Chancellor for Facilities, Judy Bergtraum to address that. Thank you.

JUDITH BERGTRAUM: You know, we have... we have about 4,000 spaces for dorms of which a little more than half are our own dorms and basically what we do when there's a request, we basically do a

1 study, a demand study and what we're doing at Lehman
2 right now is; we're doing a demand study, and after
3 we basically do the demand study, we then basically
4 figure out how many students it is, what we could do
5 and where we could put it. So you asked that at the
6 appropriate time, so we're doing a demand study for
7 Lehman College at the moment, and that's how all our
8 dorms started; that's basically what the process is.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I have
11 just a few more wrap-up questions. In regards to the
12 nursing programs; again, your master plan talks about
13 utilizing the DUE [sic], which is the... what is it
14 called, the preceptorship with hospitals, so I'd like
15 to know what is the status of that, because when we
16 had a hearing, students expressed concern that the
17 number of opportunities to be a part of a
18 preceptorship program were dwindling and in the
19 master plan it talked about having affiliation with
20 Long Island Jewish Medical Center as well as two
21 other locations, so what is the status of that?

22 VITA RABINOWITZ: Okay. Chairwoman
23 Barron, I'm gonna have to get back to you on the
24 status of the DOE, the preceptorships and
25

affiliations with -- that was Long Island Jewish and you asked about another...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Well it said in the master plan there was a connection with Long Island Jewish Medical Center and two others I can't **(inaudible)**... [crosstalk]

VITA RABINOWITZ: Okay, that's fine; I've got the master plan... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

VITA RABINOWITZ: and I'll have an update; I know we're in a transitional moment for nursing training and it's a timely question, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And then also, in terms of the nursing; what about the dual enrollment program that you have where after three years they I believe I have the associate's and then after the fourth year...

VITA RABINOWITZ: Right, move to the... uhm the BSA program. Those programs are doing very well; as I'm sure you know, it is difficult in recent years -- our associate's programs in nursing do superbly well; our students graduate, their NCLEX scores are strong, but there are... and they are eligible for jobs

in hospitals, but they are not hired in great numbers because they are competing with too many people with bachelor's degrees. President Gomez can speak to this.

DAVID GOMEZ: Yeah, I think... Yeah, the question and the concern is not only appropriate, but one that we're attacking through the dual enrollment issue. So in our case, for example, where our students graduate with an associate's degree and receive their RN but still find challenges in terms of getting employment, being able to have that dual enrollment with other sister institutions that allows them to pursue seamlessly the baccalaureate, is our ultimate solution and it's not because of level of preparation; I wanna emphasize that; our students are extraordinarily well prepared and our faculty see to it, but when the employers keep raising the bar because of the number of candidates with baccalaureates, and the feedback that we're getting from places like Montefiore Hospital, Bronx-Lebanon and others; Albert Einstein, that we're close to, is that they are also looking at these baccalaureate candidates as people to move into managerial positions; now that's good for us, given where our

1 students come from, but it requires a different
2 strategy in the University to attack that issue. So
3 the short answer is, we're making progress, but as
4 the requirements for employment continue to rise, we
5 have to change our strategy.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So if you
8 could get back to me and give me information on... I'm
9 really interested in finding out how the things that
10 were laid out in the Master Plan for 2012-2016 were
11 achieved, where we fell short; what we need to do
12 differently.

13 VITA RABINOWITZ: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: In terms of CUNY TV,
15 the hearing that we had that addressed that, I asked
16 about programming to reflect African American
17 history; culture and I was told that of course there
18 was Dr. Roscoe Brown who had the African American
19 Legends program; we know that he has passed, but I
20 wanted to know what is in place, what are the plans
21 to bring forth; make sure that we have that reflected
22 and also, a reflection at management of other than
23 just what they gave us at that... chart that they gave
24 us; what's moving in that regard?
25

VITA RABINOWITZ: Thank you Chair Barron and I believe that Senior Vice Chancellor Jay Hershenson can speak to this issue. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Mr. Hershenson, we are sharing injuries here, uh...

JAY HERSHENSON: Yes, we are; I was inspecting a city street with my head and my knee the other day.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Would you just uh affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee today?

JAY HERSHENSON: Yes I do Madam Chair...
[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Give us your name.

JAY HERSHENSON: My name is Jay Hershenson; I am the Senior Vice Chancellor for University Relations at the City University of New York and Secretary of the Board of Trustees. I appreciate being here and I also want to extend that appreciation to Council Member Vacca and the Committee Counsel.

A 30-second commercial. CUNY TV is the broadcast TV and cable TV service of CUNY, with programming 24 hours a day, 7 days a week; 365 days a year; it reaches into the homes of 1.7 million cable viewers in the five boroughs and it reaches 7.3 million households on broadcast channel 25.3.

Let me answer the specific questions that the Chair raised. I do want to preface my remarks by paying tribute to Dr. Roscoe Brown, who, while he was the host of African American Legends, I think everyone in this room would agree that he was one of our most prominent African American legends and he was a personal friend of mine from my student days and of course he was the president of Bronx Community College in addition to all of his extraordinary accomplishments; not just for New York City, but for our nation. So I really do not wanna say that his show was replaced; I would rather say that there is a television show that moves CUNY TV to the next level; it is entitled *Black America* and it's a weekly television show hosted by the award-winning television journalist, Carol Jenkins that highlights African Americans in America in up close and very personal 30-minute conversations that take place on a

weekly basis; many people in this room know Carol Jenkins; she is a real treasure for CUNY TV and I would like to report that just in the first few shows, which by the way, led off with Darren Walker, the President of the Ford Foundation, in the first one of those shows. Some of her guests already have been Misty Copeland, the first black female principle dancer for American Ballet Theatre, Dr. Khalil Gibran Muhammad, the Director of the Schomburg Center, actor Courtney Vance -- these are all one-on-one interviews, which frankly, rely on the incredible, I don't wanna say Rolodex, because Rolodex is no longer... have the same meaning that they used to have, but certainly her network is extraordinary -- Vanessa De Luca, the Editor-in-Chief of *Essence*, which of course the leading magazine serving black women not only in America, but... B. Smith, the notable restaurateur, Lisa Lucas, the Executive Director of the National Book Foundation, Christina Swarms, the Litigation Director of the NAACP -- I really could go on and on because her network is vast and as a result, *Black America* has now been accepted by PBS for national distribution, which will begin in January of 2017. So I know that my friend Roscoe is

smiling down on us. So that's a really terrific development.

With respect to the second question that the Chair asked in the context of where were we compared to where we are today; in 2013, 12.5% of the senior staff that the Chair was referring to at CUNY TV were people of color; today 41% of the senior staff at the highest levels of CUNY TV are people of color and it's about a similar percentage, about 40% female; 40% male.

And then third, with respect to diversity of programming, I really don't think today, in 2016, there is any other station anywhere that has the diversity of programming that CUNY TV has; we've come a long way, it's taken a few years to reach that point; we've talked about *Black America; Nueva York*, which is an unprecedented television show about all the different Hispanic communities in New York City; it's the only show of its kind to focus along those lines; it's the winner of several Emmy awards; *Asian American Life*, which celebrates all Asian communities in the USA; of course, *Canape*, which has had a huge run at CUNY TV. There actually is also... there is a show on CUNY TV now that is entitled *Diversity* and it

1 is about conversations about race and class by a
2 professor who talks with an audience about the
3 issues. Not all of CUNY TV programming is produced
4 by CUNY TV, as you know; it's about a 60%/40% ratio
5 and so when we can acquire from other universities,
6 like we have in this particular case, a show about
7 diversity, with conversations being the focus, you
8 know as opposed to bringing in prominent people; that
9 is being shown now on CUNY TV. And of course there's
10 a whole series of hosts, from Bob Herbert, of course
11 the Brian Lehrer show, brings many viewers to CUNY
12 TV, as does *Time Star* [sic]. And in terms of
13 American theater, when more actors, actresses,
14 producers, directors in the incredible world of
15 theater come through the doors of CUNY TV on a
16 regular basis and that opens up another kind of
17 diversity, diversity in the arts and diversity in
18 culture. So I think that, at least in terms of the
19 period of time that I indicated, I'll stop because
20 this hearing is really focused on where we've come
21 from; the last plan to now, and we'll be happy to
22 keep the Chair and the Committee informed as we
23 continue to make progress.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I just have a few more wrap-up questions. The pipeline connection between CUNY and high schools; does every CUNY campus have a high school or two that they're connected with in terms of trying to establish a pipeline? I know that a few of them do, but does every campus have a pipeline connection?

VITA RABINOWITZ: I would like to refer that question to our University Dean of Education, Dr. Ashleigh Thompson, who is [background comments].

ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: Good morning.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good morning. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee?

ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good. Please give us your name.

ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: I'm Ashleigh Thompson; I'm the University Dean for Education.

CUNY and the DOE have a very close relationship in a variety of areas. In the one that you asked about high schools, CUNY has, certainly

through admissions, representatives for every single high school in the city...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: College Now, which is our wide network of collaborative programs and college courses for high school students, is offered at every high school in the city. In terms of schools of education, our teachers do student teaching throughout the city and our colleges have partnerships with districts across the city. So in a variety of ways the colleges are very closely tied to the high schools.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So every college has a partnership with at least one high school and some connections or manifestations of [sic]...

ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, good. And next question is; there was mention made earlier in your testimony, and I do appreciate your patience being here; we've been quite lengthy, but I think it's important that we get [background comments] this. You mentioned online courses; are most of the courses or all of the courses that are taught at the School of Professional Studies, are they online

courses? Someone told me that that's the mode of presentation; is that accurate?

VITA RABINOWITZ: By no means are all of the courses at the School of Professional Studies online, but... and I do not know the percentage of them that are; if someone from the Office of Academic Affairs could help me; that would be great. But it is true, certainly, that many if not most of their degree programs are fully online. I do not know the percentage, but... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, if you could get that for me; I'd appreciate it... [crosstalk]

VITA RABINOWITZ: Yes, that's very... it's a very good question.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And then, how do you address the considerations that come with online courses where people are on different sides of the country and at different time zones and how do we promote interaction and dialogue and interactive work between the students; how do they relate to the faculty and get the appropriate time they need; how do you... do you find that there is an optimum number or a maximum number -- of course it's online, so it's all the way -- but what's that number that you find

optimally is an appropriate number; you can't have 10,000 students in one class... [interpose]

VITA RABINOWITZ: No, you are absolutely right; that's a... right, a very good question. First of all, and this will relate also, Chair Barron, to something Councilman Vacca noted; students need to be prepared to take online courses; they can't simply register and think no more about it until class time. Our School of Professional Studies does a superb job of orienting students and developing faculty to teach these courses; they have taken extraordinary care to do this so that the quality of the experience for students, and I've gone and heard testimonials at the School of Professional Studies from students who've said, "I've been a CUNY student for 20 years; every year I would take one or two courses at Brooklyn, at Hunter, in-person classes, and then I found SPS and now I'm finishing my last eight courses in one year; it's changed my life." So you raise an important point; online teaching and learning are not easy, they do need institutional vigilance, they do need care; there are optimal ratios, and I don't know if it's 25 students to one instructor; I'm sure it depends on the course. Again, I don't know that I

1 have the expertise in this room to answer that, but
2 what we do know now is that the fully online programs
3 that the School of Professional Studies offers are
4 programs of value; it's not just the national
5 rankings; I know I offered some gaudy statistics to
6 start this; I've seen the experience of students who
7 if not for the School of Professional Studies would
8 not be getting a college education and a college
9 degree and it is powerful. But again, they do it
10 very, very well; it's not every program that works
11 online. In fact, if I may, Dean Thompson spearheaded
12 our first fully online certificate programs in
13 Teacher Education this year; we struggled with
14 whether Teacher Education was even the right
15 candidate for fully online program -- Dean Thompson,
16 can I ask you to quickly give the Council...

17 [crosstalk]

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Please, because you
19 saw my face respond to that.

20 VITA RABINOWITZ: Yes, I... I know... I know,
21 I did... very quickly... [background comments] uhm
22 teaching online, uh Teacher Ed online.

23 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: Sure. So these
24 programs would be designed for teachers who are
25

1 already at the DOE, already certified and want to add
2 an extension to maybe a gray band [sic] in an
3 additional certification area. So they're offered in
4 Special Education, Gifted, Early Intervention,
5 Bilingual Ed, TESOL... two in TESOL; those are the six.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. As you know...
7 [crosstalk]

8 VITA RABINOWITZ: And we **(inaudible)**...

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I taught 36 years
10 and I was an assistant principal, I was a teacher
11 trainer, [background comments] I was a reading
12 teacher, I was a math lab teacher; I was a principal;
13 I would love to be able to go online and audit some
14 of these [background comment] so that I can have a
15 direct interaction and perhaps share my feedback with
16 you...

17 VITA RABINOWITZ: Ah, you know what Chair
18 Barron **(inaudible)**... [crosstalk]

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: because I have found
20 that the key to getting an effective teacher is the
21 principal interacting with that teacher in the
22 classroom, role modeling, taking over the class,
23 showing the teacher what it is that you want the
24

teacher to be able to do. So I have lots of questions... [interpose]

VITA RABINOWITZ: Questions.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: about that, so I'd love to be able to go online, you know if you could make that arrangement, if it's not out of order; you know, Conflict of Interest Board doesn't come and put me out, I would love to be able to [background comment] do that.

VITA RABINOWITZ: I'm sure there would be a way that we can do that; do you think any time soon we can **(inaudible)**? [background comment] We'll find out... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thank you.

VITA RABINOWITZ: and we will get back to you... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, great.

VITA RABINOWITZ: and I appreciate your comments.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And my last question, uhm at this point at least, is about the Murphy Institute, soon to become the Murphy School...

VITA RABINOWITZ: School.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: so I'd like you to just bring us an update on that. [background comments] And if I think maybe one of those mics could go on. [background comments] Okay, thank you.

VITA RABINOWITZ: As a matter of fact, Dean Barron... uh dean, listen to me, I'm sorry; I'm meeting the dean **(inaudible)**... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, you're being prophetic, okay.

VITA RABINOWITZ: but I'll just mention... **(inaudible)** dean. Chair Barron, I am meeting this week with the senior college that we hope will become the home for the new Murphy School, which we are indeed committed to founding. Murphy has always understood and we've all understood that while it will be a standalone school, it will be a standalone school within a larger CUNY structure that is not of course the central office. So finding the right host that will enable Murphy to flourish has taken us a while but we think we are there and again, I am meeting on Monday, it's actually on Monday, to begin some serious negotiations about how we can make this transition as quick and smooth as possible.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much.

I do thank you for your patience, your indulgence and thank you for your forthrightness to answering the questions and look forward to getting responses [background comments] to those other questions that were... Great, thank you so much.

VITA RABINOWITZ: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And to the rest of the audience that's here, we thank you also for your patience and we're going to now call the next panel -- Sharon Persinger, from PSC and Harris Khan from CUNY Student/NYPIRG. [background comments] We wanna thank the panel for coming and we're gonna ask... [background comments] we're going to ask if you would present your testimony and please try to keep your testimony -- we're gonna go onto the clock -- if you would please try to keep your testimony to three minutes; I'll extend some extra time if you go a little beyond that. Please raise your hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony before the Committee and to answer questions honestly?

SHARON PERSINGER: I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Please give us your name and you may begin.

SHARON PERSINGER: Wanna go first?

[background comment] Good afternoon Chairperson Barron and other members of the Committee. My name is Sharon Persinger. I'm a professor of mathematics and computer science at Bronx Community College. I am also the Treasurer of the Professional Staff Congress (PSC) and a graduate of City College and the Graduate Center. I am speaking today on behalf of the 27,000 instructional staff members at CUNY that the PSC represents. Thank you for giving us the opportunity, thank you Chairperson Barron and the members of the Higher Education Committee for holding the hearing, for giving us the opportunity to testify; it's been valuable to review the 2012-2016 Master Plan, to recognize the gains that were made under the Plan and then to point out some areas where we all acknowledge that improvements still need to be made. I want to make some comments on the 2016-2020 Master Plan, the one to follow; people, in testifying, have mentioned it from time to time and I think that they are connected, because we can still

see some of the areas where, as I said, those improvements still need to be made.

To begin with, there should be more formal and wide-reaching discussion of the Plan before it's brought before the Board. I'm sure you know many of the members of the Board of Trustees, including the Chair, are new; they were only confirmed this June, and I'm sure that some of them have not had the opportunity to study and to raise questions about the Plan that the University will be implementing. Of course the Board of Regents sets timing constraints for approval of the Plan, but there are significant new directions for the University outlined and there should be broad discussion of those.

While PSC representatives would welcome the opportunity to engage in fuller discussion of the Plan, we support a number of its goals, particularly those for increased full-time faculty and staff. However, I wanna point briefly to a number of key concerns; again, some of these which have been mentioned already in the discussions.

The Plan aims for an expansion of online instruction and that raises some serious questions.

The PSC acknowledges that there will be a need for significant capital investments in server and software to accomplish this goal of expanding

1 online education. However, the faculty and
2 professional staff cannot tolerate a repeat of the
3 situation with CUNYfirst, the fairly recently
4 implemented management of everything software at CUNY
5 where hundreds of millions of dollars were spent for
6 an off-the-shelf software package which did not meet
7 the needs of the University.
8

9 Furthermore, such spending should not be
10 at the expense of hiring more full-time faculty; the
11 Plan makes almost no mention of the fact that a
12 majority of the courses at CUNY are taught by part-
13 time faculty, many of them do not have office hours
14 to meet with students, they are not integrated enough
15 into their departments to participate in discussions
16 about curricular changes. At the School of
17 Professional Studies, which has been mentioned
18 several times, likely to play a vanguard role in
19 implementing this goal of expanding online
20 instruction, almost all of the faculty are part-time
21 and there is not a rigorous practice of engaging
22 those faculty in curriculum development.

23 Next item. We've had mention of
24 Pathways; Pathways was I think in some ways a
25 solution in search of a problem; it had the intention

of establishing course equivalencies and easing transfer -- I don't have time to restate all of our objections to Pathways -- as noted in the 2016-2020 Plan, there have been improvements, but they're somewhat uneven. I want to raise this persistent caution though, that in a university as large and complex as CUNY, with a student population that has the broad range of preparation that CUNY students have, there is a serious risk of reducing course content to a lowest common denominator in the name of "easing transfer credits." That potential result does not serve our students of CUNY well. Above all, it is essential that widespread curricular adjustments, if there are to be any, be developed by elected faculty representatives, through faculty governance. If CUNY and the Board of Trustees do not want a repeat of the response by the faculty and staff to the initiation of Pathways, they must observe the essential rights and expertise of the faculty in the development of curriculum.

And then, one unstated goal that's not explicit in this new plan but is obvious and needed, is increased operating funding, which has been mentioned several times.

The Plan acknowledges the widespread understaffing of student support services -- from counseling and advising to administrative services -- where many employees work countless, uncompensated hours on behalf of students because there are not enough of them to meet students' needs. It's worth noting that City funding increases in the past two years have made a difference at community colleges, by permitting the hiring of more advisors, but increased support staffing must be addressed university-wide.

There is reference to the importance of recruiting and retaining world-class faculty, a goal that the union certainly supports, but I urge you to remember the importance of the "journey person" faculty -- and not just in the STEM fields, but social sciences and humanities as well. CUNY needs more full-time faculty and more diverse faculty. Too many courses are already taught by part-time faculty; as people have observed, an entire generation of full-time faculty will be retiring over the next 10 years. Large-scale full-time faculty hiring will be needed to replace all of us to move CUNY closer to the goal of 75% of courses taught by full-time

1 faculty, and that large-scale hiring, as we have
2 noted, will provide the University, in many expanded
3 opportunities to diversity the faculty.

4 Opportunities for scholarship and student mentoring
5 -- not just for the "stars" but for all faculty --
6 are critically important. CUNY will not attract the
7 faculty it needs without offering adequate time to
8 all professors for these aspects of their work and
9 that requires adequate funding.

10
11 On behalf of the members of the PSC, I
12 urge Committee members, Council Members, new and
13 long-serving and everyone here to come to the
14 campuses; see the work we do, see the achievements of
15 our students. Those achievements are not always
16 measured in graduation rates.

17 Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Next.

19 HARRIS KHAN: Thank you, thank you Chair.

20 Good morning, my name is Harris Khan; I'm a
21 Queensborough Community College student, a member of
22 New York Public Interest Research Group's Board of
23 Directors, Parliamentarian of my Student Government,
24 and a delegate to the University Student Senate. We
25 appreciate this opportunity to share our perspectives

on the 2012-2016 CUNY Master Plan. This is a brief summary of our written testimony.

I am an ASAP student and I know firsthand the benefits of this program. Students like myself involved in the nationally recognized Accelerated Studies in Associate Programs graduate at more than double the rate of non-ASAP students, with increases in graduation rates after three years of at least 30%. NYPIRG believes that funding for opportunity programs must be increased and expanded to accommodate the growing influx of college applicants at CUNY each year. The nation's economy will increasingly rely on individuals with advanced degrees and CUNY has so far done an excellent job in providing **(inaudible)** toward college accessibility.

Personally it is has helped me in many ways; it has helped reduce the burden of tuition, textbooks and transportation costs for my family; it has made a real and lasting difference in my life. It's our hope that ASAP will continue to grow and will touch more students like myself.

NYPIRG thanks the Speaker of the City Council, Mark-Viverito, Higher Education Committee Chair Barron and the rest of the Committee for

1 championing the fight for higher education
2 accessibility and affordability at CUNY. The City
3 Council understands how integral CUNY is to the
4 success and prosperity of New York City. NYPIRG
5 looks forward to working with the Council in the
6 ongoing effort to ensure that all New Yorkers, no
7 matter their economic means, have a shot at a college
8 education.
9

10 Thank you for this opportunity to
11 testify.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you for
13 condensing your presentation; we do have it in its
14 fullness, and I certainly am going to read all of it.

15 Did you attend one of the DOE schools, a
16 City school here?

17 HARRIS KHAN: I did not; I'm a first-
18 generation immigrant and I came here with a high
19 school diploma.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You came here with a
21 high school -- and you applied and you went straight
22 into...

23 HARRIS KHAN: Queensborough Community
24 College.
25

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Queensborough.

Okay. So what year are you in?

HARRIS KHAN: I am a... I'm a freshman;
almost sophomore... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, so you just
started. Okay.

HARRIS KHAN: 'cause I'm taking extra
classes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, great. And
what are your plans?

HARRIS KHAN: I intend to be a community
organizer...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yea.

HARRIS KHAN: making sure that tuition is
much, much lower... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

HARRIS KHAN: making sure that everybody
has a chance to succeed in this country.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good. Thank you. I
appreciate your testimony.

And in terms of the PSC testimony; as you
spoke about the online classes, I was, as you heard
from my questioning to the first panel, concerned
about the quality of instruction; I don't know that

that's a format, online is a format that can really get at what needs to be done; perhaps for some departments it might be appropriate, so do you have an opinion as to what types of departments that might be appropriate to use? [sic]

SHARON PERSINGER: Well I was particularly interested in your questioning about the education courses...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

SHARON PERSINGER: and in the follow-up that was provided, it was made clear that these were programs for people who are practicing teachers...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

SHARON PERSINGER: who already have a bachelor's degree, [background comment] who have already demonstrated in their job a great deal of discipline and independence; I think that discipline and independence are characteristics that seem to me unnecessary for a student to be successful in an online course, so I certainly wouldn't recommend them for introductory courses, for students who are new to college. I know that their record of success at community colleges has been somewhat spotty, so yes, I could see that in certain majors and majors that

are perhaps more writing intensive than my own of mathematics, where the software doesn't exist to do it very well online, that it might be appropriate, and for students who are much further along in their education.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And in terms of your background of math, the previous panel talked about more appropriate assessment being the quantitative reasoning and statistics and developing competencies and using statistics; is that your opinion as well?

SHARON PERSINGER: I found that a bit upsetting at times. Your question was; are we lowering the bar? I think that we are certainly changing the expectations for a baccalaureate degree; we're saying you don't need to master elementary algebra, which is, honestly, is a high school subject, and it is much -- and I agree with everyone in this room, that students are more successful when they master that in high school...

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yeah.

SHARON PERSINGER: I think that the difficulty for me with that has to do with, again, these ideas of changing the requirements, but of also kind of limiting students, 'cause if you say that,

1 from elementary algebra that you need to have in
2 statistics; what the Statway course does is integrate
3 them into the course and also do them in supplemental
4 workshops, but that even with that approach they feel
5 there are concepts from this basic statistics course
6 that they leave out, so again, it's limiting; of
7 course, my interpretation; I've never taught it
8 myself; it's from conversations with other people who
9 have.
10

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thank you; I
12 appreciate that, because I did teach 7th and 8th
13 grade math and it's important that students have that
14 basic understanding of algebra.

15 I wanna thank you both for coming and for
16 presenting your testimony. Thank you so much.

17 SHARON PERSINGER: Thank you.

18 HARRIS KHAN: Thank you Chair.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Seeing no others to
20 present testimony; this hearing is adjourned. Thank
21 you so much.

22 [gavel]
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date September 28, 2016