

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

----- X

January 27, 2016
Start: 1:10 p.m.
Recess: 3:22 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers- City Hall

B E F O R E: DANIEL R. GARODNICK
Chairperson

I. DANEEK MILLER
Chairperson

ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Vincent J. Gentile
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Karen Koslowitz
Ruben Wills
Donovan J. Richards
Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Daniel Dromm
Costa G. Constantinides
Inez E. Dickens
Mathieu Eugene

Peter A. Koo
Carlos Menchaca
Paul A. Vallone
Eric A. Ulrich

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Katie Gaul-Stigge, Executive Director
Mayor's Office of Workforce Development

Jackie Mallon, First Deputy Commissioner
NYC Department of Small Business Services

Mary Ellen Clark, Executive Director
New York City Employment and Training Coalition

Betsy Plum, Director
Special Projects
New York Immigration Coalition

Marjorie Parker, Executive Director
Jobs First New York

Sasha Kesler, Government Relations
UJ Federation of New York
Appearing for: New York City Coalition for Adult
Literacy, NYCCAL

Christian Gonzalez Rivera
Senior Researcher
Center for an Urban Future

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

4

[sound check, pause]

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Good afternoon,
everyone and welcome to a joint committee hearing. I
am Dan Garodnick, and I have the privilege of
chairing the Economic Development Committee of the
New York City Council. Today is Wednesday, January
27, and I am co-chairing this hearing on the subject
of the Mayor's Office of Workforce Development's
Structural Reforms in the City's Workforce
Development Systems with my fellow council members
Robert Cornegy who Chairs the Small Business
Committee, and Daneek Miller the Chair of the Civil
Service and Labor Committee. Unfortunately, Chair
Miller has an emergency in his family. He will not
be joining us today. Today's hearing is the second
opportunity this Council will have to hear testimony
from the Mayor's Office Workforce Development, an
office that was created in 2014 with the goal of
transforming the city's Workforce Development
strategies by coordinating and improving the city's
many Workforce Development programs. The focus of
this hearing will be to check in on the metrics,
programs and initiatives at the Mayor's Office of

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

5

Workforce Development as outlined in the office's
recent report entitled Career Pathways Progress
Updates, and as reflected in the Mayor's Management
Report. In 2014, the Office of Workforce
Development's Career Pathways Report outlined a
programmatic shift in the city's Workforce
Development strategy from so-called rapid attachment
programs. Which often placed job seekers in low wage
jobs with limited mobility to a system that hoped to
build on the skills that employers seek that would
improve job quality and increase agency coordination
and accountability. The city's economy in the
interim has swelled to a record 4.26 million jobs.
Unemployment has dropped to the lowest rate since the
Recession, and perhaps most importantly for hearing
overall wages are up. However, the program has
undertaken by the Office of Workforce Development
need to be evaluated on their own merits, which we
hope to do at the hearing today. And one of the key
features of the Career Pathway's framework is
building a shared data system to standardize metrics
for agency evaluation across all workforce programs.
These metrics offer a common set of performance
measures to allow the city to better evaluate agency

workforce programs. The outcome of these performance evaluations is tied directly to Workforce agency reimbursements. That is a measure that may result in cuts to under-performing program. We want to talk about that a little bit today. So the committee has a number of questions for the administration and how it anticipates these metrics will impact the agencies and how the Office of Workforce Development plans to evaluate its own initiatives. The Progress Update released by the Office of Workforce Development--I'm going to have to think about how to speak of your office in shorthand here. During the course of this hearing we'll come to some agreement on what it is, and we will use it. I highlighted how initiatives to reform the City's workforce system are progressing such as Career Track Trainings via existing industry partners, bridge programs for entry-level positions and the Employer Standards that were set by Hire NYC. However, notable issues remain such as difficulty ensuring employer support for some of these programs and an overall decline in job placements through Workforce 1 centers. The committees today hope to hear from the administration about the progress that has been made on how the Council in its legislative

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

7

capacity may be able to assist agencies in addressing
outstanding issues. So we're going to look forward
to your testimony today. I am also--Chair Cornegy
and I flipped a coin and it was decided that I will
be the one reading the statement of Chair Miller
today. So for the purpose of the next moment or two,
I am Chair Miller. So you all will follow with me,
and his statement goes as follows:

Good afternoon. My name is Council
Member Daneek Miller, and I'd like to thank Council
Members Garodnick and Cornegy for convening this
important hearing including the Civil Service and
Labor Committee of which I am the Chair. As Council
Members Garodnick and Cornegy have already gone into
detail on what to expect from this hearing, partially
correct, I'll be brief. This hearing is perhaps one
of the more important we'll hold as an elective body.
With an increasingly diverse young and poorly paid
workforce, it is imperative that the structural
reforms of the City's Workforce Development systems
result in more effective training and career
employment. Just this month's example of Cumberland
Packing dismissing up to 320 employees and moving
much of its operations out of the Brooklyn Navy Yard

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

8

to the Midwest is a painful reminder of the
vulnerability of New York City business. As I
mentioned at our first hearing on this topic back in
2014, December, before I was elected to the Council,
it was very apparent to me that that Workforce
Development system in this city under the previous
administration was broken. It seemed as though money
was being infused into a system that did little more
than place workers into low-end, dead-end jobs.
Certainly the millions of dollars that go into these
programs can be spent more wisely and efficiently. I
rise (sic) and continue to look forward to the
overhaul of the system, which the Mayor's Office of
Workforce Development had been working on for the
last year. The updated Career Pathways Report has
some encouraging data. And I look forward to hearing
more from the Administration. He was appropriately
was going to move on to acknowledge that members of
this committee, and we are--I'm going to leave the--
the honors for introducing members of all of the
committees to Chair Cornegy, and with that, Mr.
Chair, why don't take your opening and also introduce
the members of our committee who are present.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

9

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you, Chair
Garodnick. I hope that this hearing shapes up to be
as exciting as you summed it up to be. Just--I see
Council Member Koo is here and joined us already. My
statement goes as follows:

Good afternoon, I am--Oh, I'm sorry, and
Council Member Borelli. I'm sorry. I am Council
Member Robert Cornegy, Chair of the Committee on
Small Business. I'd like to thank my co-chairs
Council Member Garodnick on the Committee of Economic
Development and Council Member Daneek Miller on the
Committee on Civil Service and Labor for convening
today's hearing on the Mayor's reforms to the City's
Workforce Development System. In 2014, when the
Mayor released his Career Pathways plan for Career
Pathways restructuring the city's Workforce
Development programs housed in 12 agencies the
Council raised concerns that it set forth no metrics
for success. While it set sensible goals of
realigning priorities to train a workforce for high
wage jobs in fields with upward career mobility
rather than merely placing workers in low wage jobs
with little mobility, the Career Pathways Report
didn't indicate what metric we should use to judge

it. When we received the 2015 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report, we didn't find new metrics in there either. For example, the metrics used to measure the success for the Workforce One programs at SBS were limited to information about the number of new registrants at Workforce One centers, and the number of registrants placed in jobs through the Workforce 1 centers. Both of these numbers declined significantly from 2013 to 2014. But from the data provided, there was no way to tell whether the decrease in the number of registrants was due to an improving job market, or the quality and wages of jobs offered. Such qualitative--qualitative information might be inferred from data about the number of applicants per job. But the administration doesn't provide us with such data. The Career Pathways Program is a sprawling interagency initiative that involves the reallocation of hundreds of millions of dollars in more centralized management. It's a bold undertaking and I look forward to hearing from the Administration about the program's progress to date. But I hope that as part of today's dialogue, we will come closer to agreeing on metrics that the Administration can provide as

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

11

part of its regular required reporting to enable the
Council to more effectively fulfill its oversight
mandate. I'd like to acknowledge the president's--
the presence of our committee members. Donovan
Richards has also joined us. I'd also like to thank
the committee's Policy Analyst Michael Kurtz; our
Finance Analyst Kendall Stephenson and committee
counsel Jeff Campagna.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you very
much, Mr. Chair, and with that, I think we are ready
for the testimony from the Administration. So, why
don't you go right ahead introduce yourself and--and
we'll look forward to hearing from you. Thank you.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Thank you so much.
I'm Katie Gaul-Stigge, the Executive Director of the
Mayor's Office of Workforce Development, shorthand
Work Dev, Chairman. So thank you Chairperson
Garodnick and Chairperson Cornegy and Chairperson
Miller for the opportunity to speak about the
transformation in the City's Workforce Development
system to connect our workers to quality job
opportunities. In December of last year, I testified
regarding our report Career Pathways: One City
Working Together. Last month, we released Career

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

12

Pathways Progress Update on the progress that the
city has made towards the efficient and effective
workforce systems that helps New Yorkers connect with
careers that provide economic stability and mobility.
As way of introduction, in 2014, we convened the Jobs
for New Yorkers Task Force comprised of 30 members
from government agencies, businesses, educational
institutions, organized labor, non-profit and
philanthropy. The Work Dev office is a policy and
strategy making body. We oversee the Workforce
Development Board, a body majority of business
members required under the Workforce Innovation and
Opportunity Act, as well as coordinate the Mayor's
Fund Center for Youth Employment. I'm joined here
today by Jackie Mallon, First Deputy Commissioner at
the Department of Small Business Services who will
speak to the value of the transformation happening in
the City's Workforce 1 Career Center system as well
as with our industry partnerships. Career Pathways
is a guiding strategy describing how elements of the
City's Workforce system should align and connect to
one another to support growing economic sectors and
thriving businesses in New York City. The Career
Pathways Career Pathways approach connects

progressive levels of education, training, support
services and credentials while working with employers
to grow a pipeline of skilled workers for in-demand
occupations all to result mobility and increased
wages for workers and success for business. The
Career Pathways Report in 2014 outlined three key
pillars.

1. Building Skilled Employer Seek.

Moving away from the previous administration's focus
on quantity of hires, Workforce programs now focus on
connecting New Yorkers to quality jobs with wages
that can support a family, and to careers that
provide opportunities for advancement. The industry
partnership approach to training and career
development provides robust feedback loops from
companies in growth sectors of New York City's
economy.

2. Improving Job Quality. To improve

the economic stability of New Yorkers, the City is
taking steps to support businesses that demonstrate
worker friendly practices such as consistent
scheduling, access to commuter benefits, and
financial empowerment. In addition to providing
stability for workers, these common sense practices

support the bottom line for employers by increasing
employee morale and lowering turnover costs; and

3. Increasing System and Policy

Coordination. To address workforce and industry
needs at the appropriate scale and in a durable way
systems change is required. Systems change
strategies include action by industry, education
providers--sorry, education and training providers,
public partners and workers to better align our labor
market needs, job quality and Workforce Development
services. To maximize system wide efficiency and
coordination, the city is aligning our Workforce
Initiatives using a new set of common metrics, which
are being rolled out this year.

Our One-Year Progress Update. In the
past year, has been a tremendous growth in New York
City. As of October 2015, New York was home to a
record 4.26 million jobs and the unemployment rate
was the lowest since the Recession. Wages rose by 4%
in 2015, the first such improvement since 2010. As
New York City's economy continues to rebound, the
Career Pathways framework is critical to ensure that
all New Yorkers can benefit from the city's
development, and that businesses throughout the city

are connected to local talent. One year after Mayor de Blasio released the Career Pathways Report, New York City has marked significant progress in the areas recommended. First, we've increased investments in training and bridge programs. Cities invest--the City's investments in Workforce Training nearly doubled to 54.3 million translating to 4,000 more New Yorkers who will build their skills over this year. An estimated 18,700 New Yorkers will benefit from Bridge--Bridge Occupational Skills Training and Entrepreneurship Programs in the current fiscal year. Career Pathways pledged to bring this investment up to \$100 million within five years. This year's total included \$5.7 million to train more than 3,000 women, immigrants and other entrepreneurs looking to expand their businesses. The City has allocated \$6.4 million to launch bridge programs for individuals looking to build basic skills--basic skills in preparation for job training or further education. This additional funding is estimated to serve close to 1,000 New Yorkers with literacy--literacy levels of fourth through eighth grade.

We expanded resources for youth employment. This past year marked the creation of

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

16

the Center for Youth Employment a public-private
partnership between the Mayor's fund and local
business leaders to support 100,000 jobs, internship
and mentorships for young New Yorkers each year.
Additionally, with support from City Council, DYCD
created a year-round program for 4,000 of summer
students called Work, Learn and Grow. The Department
of Youth and Community Development increased the
number participants in the Summer Youth Employment
Program to over 54,000, the highest number in recent
years. Thus, we're maximizing job opportunities for
New Yorkers. In October of 2015, the City launched
Hire NYC, a targeted hiring program aimed at
leveraging the city's purchasing power and economic
development investments. Hire NYC will ensure that
large contracts, which make up over 90% of the city's
non-emergency spending as well as construction and
development investments will help provide New Yorkers
with access to thousands of jobs ranging from jobs
like security guard and administrative assistant to
design coordinators and project managers. We're
building a connected system. In the Career Pathways
Progress Update it shares data and descriptions of
budgets, programs and shows the progress from 18

agencies and a total of 137 Workforce programs. The City delivers a number of its Workforce programs through public-private partnerships with some of New York City's several largest philanthropies, educational institutions, companies, non-profits and unions. The three agencies that serve hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers, HRA, DYCD, and SBS have begun to align resources along Career Pathways lines through new RFPs to be released this year. Each of these new contracts will serve to embed key elements of Career Pathways framework, including incorporating the common metrics, building hand-offs between programs that have been siloed in the past, shifting programmatic design to focus on preparing individuals for entry into skills training and creating the steps to achieve the vision of system and policy coordination.

We've also focused on high road employer strategies best for New York City. In early 2015, the New York City Economic Development Corporation launched Best for New York City, a campaign formed to inspire and equip businesses to measure and improve the impact on workers, the community and the environment. Through Best for New York City,

businesses can assess their practices using the leading global tool for measuring, benchmarking and improving economic and social impact, the B Lab Impact Assessment. The tool examines a variety of practices including diversity and inclusion, compensation benefits, and governance. The business that compete--sorry--that complete the assessment and commit to seeking ways to improve their practices will this year compete for the Inaugural Best for NYC Awards in 2016. As of January, 540 businesses have started this assessment, exceeding our goal of engaging with at least 500 employers. Companies such as Uncommon Goods and a Little Bit Sweet are some of the companies that are part of the movement. After complete Best for NYC Assessment, businesses are offered services from both SBS and EDC to support the adoption of high road business practices and access to financial empowerment. To help connect low-wage workers to financial empowerment resources through their workplaces, the Department of Consumer Affairs is launching the NYC Free Tax Prep at Work Campaign, which gives employers the opportunity to provide valuable financial assistance to their employees for free.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 19

Fundamentally, the system shifting changes lay the groundwork for realizing Career Pathways' goals of helping every New Yorker access and maintain stable employment, and earn a family supporting wage while ensuring that businesses in the city can find the talent that they need. I look forward to the second year of implementation at the Mayor's Office of Workforce Development. Thank you for your support, and I'll be happy to take questions at this time.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: But before you do--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --I think we're going to hear from the Department of Small Business Services, Jackie Mallon.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Good afternoon. Thank you for--for hearing my testimony. My name is Jackie Mallon, and I'm the First Deputy Commissioner of the New York City Department of Small Business Services. At SBS we work to foster a thriving integral city by connecting New Yorkers to good jobs, creating stronger businesses, and building a fair economy. In support of Mayor de Blasio's

Workforce Development strategy, Career Pathways: One City Working Together, SBS is significantly increasing investments in training New Yorkers, expanding industry partnerships, improving access to employment opportunities, and supporting local job creation by empowering entrepreneurs to launch and grow thriving businesses in New York City. SBS has significantly increased our investment in occupational skills training this fiscal year, helping New Yorkers prepare for 21st Century jobs. Through this investment, we help New Yorkers enter in advance in the key sectors that drive New York City's economy. All of our training investments share two characteristics.

1. The trainings are designed to help low-income New Yorkers gain access to living wage jobs that they otherwise struggle to find and secure.

2. They are informed by industry and designed to meet employer needs.

One of the primary ways we ensure alignment with industry is through our industry partnerships. In the past year, we've expanded our healthcare industry partnership, NYACH or the New York Alliance for Careers in Healthcare, and our Tech

Industry Partnership, the Tech Talent Pipeline.

Collectively, these industry partnerships represent more than 200 large and small employers and more than 140,000 jobs. Industry Partnerships work with industry, organize labor, non-profits training providers, private philanthropy and workforce organizations to build a pipeline of local talent to fill New York City's jobs. SBS is also in the process of launching new industry partnership in the construction, industrial, food service, and retail sectors. While industry partnerships help uncover and help employer demand and design trainings to meet that demand, our Workforce 1 Career Centers focus on connecting New Yorkers across the five boroughs to those opportunities. Through our network of 17 Workforce 1 Career Centers, SBS trains and connects job seekers to family supporting jobs and offer businesses cost-saving improvement services. We serve between 125,000 and 150,000 New Yorkers annually, and connect roughly 25 to 30,000 people to jobs. Hire NYC, one of the largest and most impactful, targeted hiring programs in the nation leverage in the Workforce 1 Career Centers to connect New Yorkers, to open positions created to the City's

purchases and investments. Every year the City of New York spends billions of dollars on everything from social services to playgrounds. Through Hire NYC and the Workforce 1 Career Center system, we are making sure that more New Yorkers have a first shot at jobs related to city projects, and that employers have access to an expanded pool of talent. In support of the objective to help workers secure good paying jobs in fast growing sectors laid out by Career Pathways, SBS has instituted a job quality policy, which requires businesses receiving free recruitment services through our Workforce 1 Career Centers to hire employees for full-time positions of pay wages of at least \$11.50 per hour. As a result, to date, we have seen a significant increase in the percent of New Yorkers connected to full-time work, from 45% in 2013 up to 71% in 2015. We've also seen a significant increase in the average wage of that work from \$10.71 in 2013 to \$12.56 in 2015. In addition, SBS recently launched two Workforce 1 Career Center partnerships. In December, we launched the Rockaways Economic Advancement Initiative in Rockaway Workforce 1 Career Center in partnership with the New York City Housing Authority and the

Center for Economic Opportunity. And the Rockaway Center is the first Workforce 1 Center to include a dedicated training lab equipping Rockaway residents with the skills necessary to secure in-demand jobs by providing industry approved occupational trainings, and an easily accessible location right on the Peninsula. The flexible training lab space will offer trainings focusing on a range of occupations in healthcare, transportation, construction and other sectors. Earlier in 2015, we also launched Pre-Apprentice--Pre-Apprenticeship Training Scholarships available to low and middle-income residents of Sandy impacted areas in partnership with the Mayor's Office of Recovery--Housing Recovery. Sorry. These scholarships are offered primarily through the Sandy Recovery Workforce 1 Center at 1906 Mermaid Avenue in Coney Island as well as Staten Island and now in the Rockaways. This Workforce 1 Initiative is part of the de Blasio's Administration to create an equitable recovery both physically and economically in New York's most hard hit communities.

Lastly, SBS will also invest \$5.1 million this year to train more than 2,500 women, immigrants and other entrepreneurs looking to start and expand

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 24

their businesses. Included in these efforts is the
Woman Entrepreneurs New York City Initiative. We
call it WENY, that specifically build resources for
women entrepreneurs and the Immigrant Business
Initiative, which helps foreign born New Yorkers to
start and expand their own businesses. Through these
efforts and the vision laid out through the Career
Pathways Plan, SBS is equipping New Yorkers with the
in-demand skill necessary to built--to build
successful careers in the 21st Century economy, and
ensuring that local businesses have access to world
class talent that they need right here in the five
boroughs. I'm happy to answer any questions that you
may have and thank you.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Great. Thank you
very much. I want to note that we've been joined by
Council Members Dromm, Eugene and Vallone. Welcome,
and I am going to kickoff the questions, and I'm not
sure for whom they'll be most appropriate, but I know
you will know for whom they are most appropriate.
The first one, and this actually may be SBS because
Ms. Mallon, you just noted it. The first
Recommendation in the Career Pathways Report, and the
first one that is highlighted in terms of the update

1 is the launching and expanding of the industry
2 partnerships, and that was really the--one of the
3 marquis elements of this plan. And the plan was to
4 expand the two existing. Healthcare existed. Tech
5 existed and then to create partnerships with a few
6 others including construction, manufacturing and food
7 service and retail. From your testimony it sounds
8 like we have not yet created those new partnerships,
9 but we have somehow expanded the old ones. Can you
10 tell us why we have not yet created the new
11 partnerships, and what you have done to expand the
12 existing ones?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Sure. So
15 the-the first step in--in creating the industry
16 partnership is to find a--a very talented person from
17 industry to lead them for us, and we've been in the
18 process of identifying folks and, in fact, our--the
19 three of them we've identified and we're in the
20 process of on-boarding them, and the fourth one we're
21 pretty close as well. So I do expect that we will
22 launch them in the next month or two. The industrial
23 manufacturing leader, in fact, starts on Monday. So
24 that's the story there. That answered your question
25 on that part, and in terms of expanding--so the

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

26

healthcare industry partnership is--is a little older
by a couple of years actually than the Tech Talent
Pipeline, and so the work in healthcare we've
expanded so that we are now focused on designing
training models that will benefit people who are
farther away from the start. Or, from the starting
line rather meaning folks that--that don't have a
high school equivalency or perhaps don't have--aren't
as proficient in English or some adult basic skills
we're building contextualized training models that--
that get them into healthcare. And, in Tech Talent
Pipeline we're just--it's only a year old and so a
lot of the work to expand there is to deliver models
actually across the spectrum including bridge
programs as well as areas in tech where--where there
aren't any training models that exist today. Does
that make sense--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]

Yes.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: --that we've
said it. (sic)

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Yes. So it's--
from what I'm--what I'm hearing you say is that the
manufacturing will be launched--

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

27

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

[interposing] Monday.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Monday.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Monday.

Well, the person will come on board on Monday and
they'll get their feet wet, and they'll begin.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]

Okay, so you have a person.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: But yes.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So your executive
search yield a person--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

[interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --who is starting
on Monday.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yes, I'm
very excited.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Your goal is two
months from now. I'll give you two months since you
said one to two. I'll just give you two months--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

[interposing] I thinks that's very fair.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --for the rest of
them.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 28

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yep.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: And what you are
saying will happen within that time is that you will
have a person who will be able to give that feedback
loop on, you know, what is needed in those additional
sectors. Is that right?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: That exactly
and then the person will be charged with leading the
industry partnership. So probably the first thing
that they'll do is they'll--they'll engage industry
and--and develop a contract by which to engage them
on a regular basis. So like with both Tech and
Healthcare we have--in Tech we have what's called an
advisory board. In healthcare we have a partner's
council, and in both cases, they are employee
representatives that have agreed to a common agenda,
um, that--because these are not short-term
initiatives. These are long-term initiatives, but
the common agenda articulates what the group has
decided to do in the--in the first year or the first
two years or whatever, and then we'll begin the work.
So the first step is to find somebody to lead it who--
-who has a real good sense of the industry, has good
connections in the industry, can--can convene an

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

29

industry in a meaningful and effective way. The next
step is design the structure. My guess is they will
be similar in nature that will have some form of
advisory board or council. And then the third is to
get to work--get to work to establish the a common
agenda so we all know what we're working toward.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: A common agenda
so that--say the last part again.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: So we all
know what we've agreed. Like--because, you know,
people in industry are busy doing their work, and so
we want to be as effective and efficient with their
time, and we want to make sure that we are on a--we
are both in agreement in terms of what, um, problems
and issues and challenges we're going to tackle
first. So in tech it was please give us--as an
example--please give us computer science as you were
dying. We really need to work together to figure out
how to create, for lack of a better word, more of
them. I mean in healthcare it the Affordable Care
Act, the Medicaid. The Medicaid Redesign has
completely disrupted employment composition. Let's
work on identifying what the new skills are. It
could be any number of things. In those two cases

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 30

it's all about labor shortages for them, people
skills.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So, the--the
challenge--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
[interposing] I might have had too much coffee or too
little coffee. I'm not really sure. So give me the
clue if I'm not making sense.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: No, I think you
got it. Just pull the microphone a little closer. I
think that's part of my issue.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: But I think I--I
think I got it. The problem for us as we sit here in
the ghost of the--to Chair Cornegy's opening is that
it's a little amorphous to be able to really sink
your teeth into from an evaluative perspective.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So, my question
for you would be well, how--how do we--how would you
evaluate whether any of this is worth anything. We
know that--we know that--the--the time it takes to at
least get a person to organize essentially a task

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 31

force to--to make recommendations on what the needs
are of the industry.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: But, you know, is
that more effective than you picking up the phone and
calling ten industry leaders and see if they have the
same things to say to you about what their needs are?
How do we evaluate that this is effective than that?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Um, I can
guarantee you it's definitely more effective than me
picking up the phone.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]
Okay, well--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: --but I
understand--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --tell me, but
tell me, tell me, tell me why.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: --I
understand your point. One thing I--I think I'd like
to--to begin by saying is the--the idea of--I can't
emphasize this enough--the industry partnership
strategy is a long-term strategy and our--and our
objective is to almost not be necessary in an ideal
world, right? What we're trying to do is--is--is

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

32

engage industry and academic partners and--and labor
representatives and non-profits. All of the various
players that are part of our work development--
Workforce Development Ecosystem, if you will, and
we're trying to work together to build a much more
sustainable system that connects--directly connects
industry's needs to all the providers that help
deliver people in--into jobs. And so, it's--it is a
little bit difficult to measure systems change
because it does sound amorphous. You are correct.
One--and so we have undertaken a lot of work. We've
really engaged the Aspen Institute to try to help us
develop specific metrics for these, and we're in the
process of--of defining them, but, you know, people
automatically go to well how many people did you
train? And--and so, you can count those.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: And we will
surely there.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yes. No, I
understand.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Because we have--
we have to. If we don't--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

[interposing] But, I would argue and you should and--

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

33

and--and we--we're going to be very proud of--of the
investments that we make in training, but that's not
really the point of industry partnerships because
you're right because we could do that without
industry partnerships. We could have, you know, a
small--we could call employers. We--we've done it in
the past in--in less system change sort of
constructs. And this is a newer thing, and this is
intended to take a longer time, and result in much
more sustainable and effective Workforce Development
Ecosystem.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: And the--the
people who are participating--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --the folks for
whom you, and I--I don't mean to harp too--too long
on this--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
[interposing] That's okay.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --because this
is--there's--there's other questions, and--and I'm
not sure how--how much time we should be spending on
this. But, the people who you identified, they are

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 34

like the person who's starting on Monday. They are
hired by SBS-

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
[interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --for, and
they're--they're there for a period of time for as
long as they wish or I mean whatever. We don't know
how long they're--they're there. The partnerships,
the people who are involved in--on this, the people
who are otherwise busy and engaged in their--their
own work and industry may not be committed to these
sorts of things for the long haul. So you may have
turnover, changeover. It's hard for something like
this to become self-sustaining I guess is my only
point. Just based on the natural element of this
being a little bit of a push the boulder up the hill
exercise--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
[interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --we are asking
industry to struggle and grapple with things that
they-- You know, some may be obvious, and if it's
obvious we don't really need the--the group. But if
it's--but the stuff that's less obvious that they may

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 35

have commonality, and may have similar challenges to
figure out. Is that right?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I--I think
that that is right. Yes.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I think it
is--it's Sisyphean task, but--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]
Okay.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: --worth
trying and--and worth investing in, and--and one of
the, I think, clear ways to see longer term change,
um, and not a lot of duplication effort. And not a
lot of people not connecting to opportunities that
they would be really good for, and companies going
some place else to find talent when we actually could
kind of grow it here.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, a couple
more from me and then we'll go to Chair Cornegy. The
Recommendation 9 in the report was about First Look,
and we had some conversation about that at our last
hearing. And for those who are less familiar, it was
noted in the testimony, but this was giving people an
opportunity through our eco--our economic development

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

36

investments and city contract an opportunity to get a
first shot at a job opportunity. And this was
launched very recently. I mean this is not really--
we're not yet really in a place where we can evaluate
it I don't think unless I have that wrong.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: No, that's
correct.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Right. Okay, it
was launched in October of 2015, but I guess there is
a question of about what it will mean for a--an
entity that has a contract with the city or is the--
is the recipient of subsidy of some sort to give a
first look at--at a potential candidate. What--what
does that mean? I mean there's a look and there's a
look here. I mean there's a--there's a--a courtesy
and then there's an obligation. What--what--what is
this? What does it mean to give somebody a first
look in this context?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Um,
essentially it means that if they are a contract
that's over the threshold and--and meets the
requirements that they are obligated to engage with
us, which means they have to sit with us. We will
work with them to develop a customized recruitment

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

37

plan for the--for the positions that are--are--sorted
(sic) to Hire NYC, and they have to interview
candidates that we both--based on their
qualifications we send them folks. They need to
interview them. We--it--it's--that's--that's as far
as it goes, but we have pretty, you know, like
Workforce 1 has been--does this everyday. They find
candidates for people everyday. And so, it's kind of
a little bit on us to ensure that we have--do our
part and--and we--we find them candidates bon their
requirements, which we believe we can based on our
track record.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, let's fast
forward--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
[interposing] Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --our hearing on
this subject in January of 2017, and we are all here
together again, and we're going to ask you the
question--Well, why don't you--why don't you tell us
what the question should be as to what we should ask
you in a year to determine whether or not this
program was successful. What is the right question?

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 38

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I would
3 assume you would ask how many positions were filled
4 through Hired NYC.

5 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Actually filled.
6 Not just--

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
8 [interposing] Yes, and filled.

9 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --preferred but
10 filled

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yes,

12 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: And what do you
13 think would be a--a, um, a number which you would
14 deem successful?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: In terms of
16 a percentage or an absolute number?

17 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: The total number
18 of jobs.

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah.

20 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Total number of
21 jobs.

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: It's, you
23 know, good, you've got it--

24 KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: I think at this time
25 the way that it's rolling out is the launch in

October of '15 means that we now add this as part of steering business to our contract. So I think, you know, that's just--and so there--as new contracts come open in the RFPs and then they become contracts, and then so in January 2017 it really just depends on how many contracts and the type of contracts that have registered at that point. Whether if they are contracts that have large amounts of hires then we would be able to give you a higher number. So at this time, we're working hand-in-hand--hand-in-hand with MOCS, hand-in-hand with all the agencies to figure out what are the contracts that are coming up? Making sure they understand how this first look will work, and how it's a benefit to their contractors. Um, and that we can create the opportunity for New Yorkers. So it's just hard for me to estimate at this time how many contracts and they're for how job would--would even be eligible in the--in the bucket that we could look at how many--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]

Well, do you have a sense of how many would have been eligible over the course of the past year had this been in place?

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 40

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: I know what we've got
to say. (sic)

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: It's--it's--
so, it's very, very difficult to come up with an
accurate estimate you would have to take-- So, first
of all the jobs have to be here in New York, right.
So in a case where we're--we're buying goods for
example, which, you know from other places that would
have to be. Then you'd--you'd have to develop some
relationship between the value of the contract and
the number of new positions that generates and that's
a very sort of slipper slope to try to use, um,
published metrics that do that. So, we have gone
through the exercise of like trying to figure out
some very wide range of what it might be, but I
don't--I wouldn't--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]
Okay, let's ask it a different way--I--I
understand your point and, you know, I do think that
it would be useful to have some--some goals and
metrics here for us to be able evaluate where it was
a success or failure. But let's try it the way that
you I think initially had started--

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 41

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: [interposing]
Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --which is what
percentage of jobs referred over to these potential
employers that are actually hired would you deem to
be a success.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I think it's
somewhere in the range of like 50 to 75%. Why do I
say that? Because we can't make someone take a job
so there's going to be fall off. I don't know.
There's--it's just year one. I would say that that's
a reasonable goal.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: And--and you
think that, if I'm understanding you, you think year
two the goal could even be higher?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah, a
higher percentage, yeah. I think, you know,
everything I mean that's new and it's--it's--we're
such a huge system and--and a multi-legged octopus
that you--you--you have to allow for I think people,
you know, learning and getting in the groove, and
then I think it could ratcheted up for sure. (sic)

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, thank you.
I--I'm going to turn over the microphone. I want to

recognize that Council Member Ulrich and Gentile have
joined us, and Chair Cornegy has questions.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you, Chair
Garodnick and thank you for that thorough round of
questioning you did. It allows me to actually drill
down a little bit deeper and more specific because of
the way you've asked your questions. So I appreciate
that. So at the--at--at the joint December 2015
hearing on MWBEs, I noted that when we fight for
fairness and equal access to MWBEs, we really fight
for all New Yorkers because these businesses are key
job provider for residents and, of course, they also
support our local businesses. So I'm pleased to see
that today's committee report includes information on
the city's progress and commitment in the MWBE arena.
I'd like to hear more about how MWBEs are being
brought into the Hire NYC system. As I understand
it, the new program run by EDC since October requires
city vendors for contracts over a million to list
available jobs with the city. I'm familiar with the
difficulty the city has had getting vendors to enter
up-to-date information in payment information portal
and delays in data entry their impact MWBE payment
metrics. How does E-W--how is EDC working to avoid

similar problems getting data into Hire NYC, and how
is SBS and EDC--and I had MOCS, but they're not here--
collaborating to ensure that MWBEs move smoothly into
the new system and participate fully?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: So, I'm going to
answer--I'm going to clarify just one point on that,
and then we'll try to answer and/or get you the
information to answer your specific MWBE question. So
Hire NYC we did take the name from a program that was
run at EDC prior, but since October it's now a
citywide effort. So it's not just run by EDC. It's
actually all contracts and sort of--and now we sort
of put this under this larger umbrella. So, it's all
contracts that are over a million dollars. It's
going to--it's going to cover development deals and
different, um, types and it also includes the Social
Service contracts that used to be called contractor
hiring. Um, so we have--we were sort of--just to
clarify, we're using the Hire NYC brand to mean a
first look for any kinds of purchasing, not just
through EDC. And so, to your specific questions on
MWBE, we can certainly get back to you specifically
on those--on those registrations but how MWBE works
with Hire NYC is mainly that if there--if the--the

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

44

contractors hire folks that they would provide and
give us the registration. The MWBE really talks
about the owner of the company, and what we're
talking about here is the positions that they're
hiring for because they've got the contract. So
they're---they're sort of two separate things, and we
don't always bring them together. So some of your
specific questions about the registration and the
issues for MWBE I'm not--I'm not able to answer
today, but we see that those are both powerful ways
that we can engage with businesses.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So I will follow up
with your office because to me, while we're having
this--this very robust MWBE conversation with the
administration, and while administration has show a
true--a true commitment to MWBEs in other ways, I
think this is an excellent opportunity to--to
enhance, you know, what's been stated by the
Administration--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: --in this
particular space. So I--so I will following up.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Okay. I'm going to
quote that.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 45

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: And in the interest
of time, I have several more questions, but I'd like
for--before I lose my colleagues to get them engaged
in this--in this conversation as well.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Next up is
Council Member Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you
chairs. This is a great hearing and I want to thank
Jackie and SBS for the work we're certainly doing out
in the Rockaways I guess so far so good, but there's
always better we can do. So, one of the--the
questions I had was on how do we track (1) retention?
You know--you know, our people--how long are our
people holding onto these jobs on average, and then
also just from a transparency point of view, you
know, I think as a local member I'm always interested
in knowing, you know, how many of my locals are
hired. Um, and I think most council members
certainly would appreciate, you know, keeping track
and knowing exactly what's happening in a district
these census come in. So I really appreciate the
work you're doing. I know we have a task force that
will be working hard together to keep together to
ensure that we are promoting the Workforce

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

46

Development Center in the best way we can. But, also
interested in knowing what the process looks like in
SBS, and how can we be more collaborative in ensuring
that we're sharing information?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Sure, um,
and thank you for--for all of your help as--as well
out there. Um your question on retention, I don't
have a--a great answer for you because it's very,
very difficult for us to track it. Um, the way that
we have a sense that an aggregate in terms of the
retention rates for folks that use the career center
system is through metrics that are reported by the
State. And, we just hope, though, in the future that
working with the Mayor's Office of Workforce
Development and the Mayor's Office of Data Analytics
that there could be some backend data transfer that
would help us get a better sense. Yeah, but today
all we have really to go on that's reliable is what
we get from the state, and it's at an aggregate level
and it--we could use a lot better data.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, I would--I
appreciate that, and certainly--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
[interposing] Yeah.

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 47

2 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: --would hope that,
3 you know, and perhaps it's something easy, you know,
4 checking in with the employer that you have the
5 relationship already to say hey, is this person still
6 on after six months. You know, or something like
7 that.

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
9 [interposing] Yeah.

10 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: I don't know what
11 that looks like, but I think that that's something
12 that, you know, certainly I'm interested in. Also
13 for, um, under-employed areas. So obviously, Rock--
14 at least my portion of the Rockaways, you know, we
15 have probably one of the highest unemployment rates
16 in the city. So how are you working with employers
17 pretty much citywide to make sure. How are you
18 focusing in particular to ensure that we're doing
19 proper outreach in the areas that really--really are
20 hurting the most. Not just for the Rockaways, but in
21 particular, you know, across the city as well.

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: To reach
23 people? Is that what you mean?

24 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Yeah.
25

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 48

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: So, we do a number of things. We have a very large list of members' emails and they an electronic communication in social media on a regular basis. We also have a fairly large network of community partners who we're also--we have a structured program where we're communicating with them on a regular basis so we can get new job opportunities and training opportunities now and more so in the future, out to them so that they can reach their--their folks as well and refer people to us. And, that--it's a--the list is about 300 or so organizations. I would say 100 of them are--are probably, you know, more active or not than others, but, um, any ideas additional thoughts that you guys have on how we could reach even more people would--would be great. We go to community boards. We go to CBOs. The clergy in some--in some cases are really good partners. Anything that you can-- You can never do enough I think to--to--to improve our outreach. We're trying.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So I would definitely suggest, and I'm--and I'm a partner in this--

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

49

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

[interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: --so, you know, I
don't really have much of a question. I think we
just started, and I'm very interested and happy at
certainly the work that we're going to do together.
But certainly as we move forward, making sure that we
really are hitting, you know, the underserved
communities, and hitting people on the ground because
sometimes the community boards--no offense to them.
I hope my community board is not watching.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: [laughs]

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: You know, but they--
they don't interact with the every day--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

[interposing] Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: --people sometimes.
So, I just want to make sure that our strategy is to
hit and reach people on the ground as we move
forward. So thank you for your work.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

[interposing] Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: I really appreciate
the work we're doing in--in the Rockaways and look

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 50

forward to a continued relationship. Thank you,
Chairs.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you very
much, Council Member. Let me jump back in with a
couple more. I want to go for a moment to
Recommendation 3 in the Career Pathways Report, and
one was to invest \$60 million annually by 2020 in
bridge programs that prepare low-skill job seekers
for entry-level work and middle skill job training.
It is our understanding that the State Department of
Education gave \$10 million as part of the investment
in bridge programs that are discussed in this
recommendation here. And this money would include a
partnership with CUNY's Adult Education Department--
is that right?--to develop a curricula in eight
different sectors.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Correct.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, first
question is, is that--is that \$10 million included in
our \$60 million or is that an extra bonus round \$10
million?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: It was--first of all,
we're thrilled that New York State has called for
this. This is a real cat. You know, this is real

1 catalyzation for our--we catalyze this I guess from
2 putting this in there. The idea of bridge programs
3 was just to clarify is to talk about low literacy
4 folks contextualizing the--the work. So not just a
5 GED class, but a GED class with healthcare, or a GED
6 class contextualized to technology or some other
7 growing field. So that's the concept. We're
8 thrilled that New York State in their Adult Education
9 Department has taken this on, and really the plan
10 there just that we understand that we've been working
11 in partnership with them is to put in \$10 million of
12 planning and working with CUNY for this year. So
13 CBOs and organizations that receive New York State
14 funding can try out, contextualize, work with
15 industry and figure out how to make these curricula
16 work. So it's fantastic. Then, what we anticipate
17 and what they've told is that in the future when they
18 release their RFPs, they will actually administer
19 direct monies to serve individuals. So at this time,
20 that \$10 million I am counting in this because it is
21 planning and structural and curriculum development
22 for this kind of work. You know, you would not be
23 able to count the number of people. Therefore, I am
24 not counting it at this time.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 52

2 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay.

3 KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Does that make sense?

4 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: I think so, yes,
5 and it sounds like it is really kind of start-up--

6 KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] It's--
7 it's really great--

8 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --element.

9 KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: --and it's very
10 exciting. You know, that they took this on. I mean
11 the--New York State is the larger of the funding when
12 it comes to literacy in New York City. So it's
13 great.

14 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So the--the
15 amount that New York City itself is investing in the
16 bridge programs, the goal was \$60 million by 2020.
17 Your progress report had us at \$6.4 million. I--if
18 I'm reading it correctly, as of Fiscal Year 2016--is
19 that this one or the one we're in?

20 KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Is that what that
22 said?

23 KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Yes.

24

25

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 53

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, and what--
what does Mayor's Budget have for it in the
Preliminary for 20--for Fiscal 2017?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: So, um, for--it's the
same. Right now, we've got \$6.4 million for '20.
It's preliminary. For 2017, it still is at 6.4.
However, there are several things that are happening
in Fiscal 17 that will alter that, which include the
release of the HRA RFP, and the Concept Papers that
we have seen call increased investment in bridge from
that--from that agency. So, there's the potential
for additional money without adding monies that would
go into investment there. The \$6.4 million--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing] I'm
sorry. Can I just stop you there--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Sure.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --for a second.
You said which RFPs did you say these were that were
go generate more money for the bridge Program?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: So the Human
Resources Administration has--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]
HRA, yeah.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

54

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: --has four concept
papers on the street or, you know, open right now
that discuss how they were going to--how Commissioner
Banks is going to prioritize the way he wants to do
employment services. One of the concept papers is
called Career Bridge. It is about creating
programming for low literacy New Yorkers who are at
HRA, and-- So, therefore, we have expectation and
hope that there will--that will turn itself in from a
concept paper to an RFP, and then there would be
additional monies that way.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: And you think
that's going to happen

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] It's--
with that price.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --between--
between now and June 30th.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: I believe
Commissioner--oh, no. I believe that the RFP--or
actually the--Commissioner Banks had--I'm--you know
I'm not sure on record or, you know, had been saying
that he definitely wants this RFP out between now and
June, and he wants new contracts to start, you know,

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

55

thereafter. You know, I--I can't commit for him. I
certainly--I hope I am not--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]

Okay, well, I guess, I--it's--it's hard to know what
to do with reports from the--the Mayor saying our
goal is--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --to invest X, Y
or Z by a certain date--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] And

then--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --and then, you
know, not see it go up in the budget.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: I don't know what
to do with that. It would--you would think that if
your goal was to get from here to there to create a
time either you just go from here to there or you--
you move slowly from here to there. But for it to be
at \$6.4 million and then to stay at \$6.4 million,
with the possibility of an additional component,
which may or not happen within the timeframe
relevant, what--what do we do with that?

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 56

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Well, the budget is
not final--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]
This is true.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: --first.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Correct.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [laughs] Second,
we're certainly offer to--that I would definitely
strong say that. Second, there are these like HRA
pieces in place and process that take time that we
are hoping will-- That are--not hoping. We know that
our--our diligent work with CUNY. Our diligent with
the Young Men's Initiative and other things are
talking about transforming some of the literacy
programs that they have now into bridge programs.
And part of what we learned in this first year
actually was not that people didn't want to do
contextualized learning for adult literacy, but
simply that they needed help on how to do it. And
so, that's why New York State is investing \$10
million in helping develop these curricula through
CUNY. We have done something called Developing and
Curating something called a Bridge Bank, which is
website of free and publicly available very good high

quality bridge curriculum. What this means is CBOs all over the city, it means DOEs all over the city can use and access these curriculums and then start developing. So, we're trying to lay the foundations and make sure that CBOs and teachers are strong and are able to do this going forward. And so, that's where we're putting, you know, connecting to bridge building, talking about figuring out ways to do this and creating resources so people can start doing it. So while I understand your frustration in not seeing it yet, number one it's not over and, you know, we are working on the budget. And then number two, there are steps in place and concrete steps that we've taken to create the technical ability for teachers and courses to teach bridge going forward, and this is the foundation work that we have to do to get that far. If we just put the \$60 million, people wouldn't know how to do it, and we want to make sure we're creating those real connections.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So, what is your trajectory?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] So we appreciate your patience with this.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

58

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: What is the
trajectory then just from the--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --\$6.4 million to
a--what expected to be a \$54 million increase over
three or four years. That is a--that is an
extraordinary jump based on even what you just said
that you can't go and just allocate the \$60 million
all at once. As we get closer, it is as if we are
allocating the \$60 million all at once. So what is
the trajectory from your perspective to go from \$6.4
million to \$60 million in a way that actually able to
be absorbed and productive and--and useful with
having real programs?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: At this time we have--
-we are working with the--our partners I really will--
-I will say our fantastic partners at CUNY and the
Department of Ed have the majority of adult basic
dollars. So if you look whose basic ed dollars we've
got \$87 million in basic ed dollars. We don't
anticipate that all of that would change into bridge
at all. In fact, that is not success. We want to
make sure that some of the \$87 million does change
into bridge or experiment with bridge and we want to

1 make sure that we're adding new dollars. And so,
2 part of it is proving that the model works so we can
3 draw down more money. So one of the things that
4 we're doing in this year is that we are creating
5 evidence at DYCD with CEO to look at younger--to look
6 at youth in our Young Adult Literacy Program who are
7 testing between fourth and eighth grade in literacy.
8 So a very--those are folks that sometimes can't even
9 enter a GED program because of the way they're
10 scoring. We're trying to create a program that's
11 going to identify for them, and then show how they're
12 being successful. And as we're building that
13 evidence, and we're--and we're helping the
14 practitioners do--gain the curriculum, we anticipate
15 that can ask for money. Philanthropy has expressed a
16 great interest in this kind of work. It's really an
17 important group and we really--I have a lot of
18 confidence for whatever that's worth in that
19 partnerships and the catalyzation already has shown
20 some success and will continue to.

22 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, I--look it
23 all sounds--

24 KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Yeah.

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 60

2 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --it all sounds
3 good. It's just that, you know, if one of the core
4 recommendations of the report is a very precise
5 dollar amount at a very precise time, I might have
6 expected you to say okay we're \$6.4 million--

7 KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Yes.

8 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --today. At--
9 come Fiscal 18 we're going to be at \$18.8 million on
10 the basis of the following three additional programs.

11 KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Uh-huh.

12 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Come fiscal, you
13 know, '19, we're going to be here. I don't hear you
14 saying that. So I--I do wonder whether it's actually
15 possible for us to get to a full \$60 million in a
16 legitimate and productive way fro this--this part of
17 the report. It's just that you don't--you don't
18 actually need to answer it. I'm just saying I--that's
19 what I--

20 KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] I
21 understand.

22 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --I deduced from--

23 -

24 KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Okay.

25

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --from your
answer, and if I'm wrong you should feel free to tell
me.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: No, I--I you're not
incorrect, I think that--I understand your concern.
I think--you understand that what we're investing in
and how we're building the foundation for that, we
see as being able to be building blocks in increasing
it. But you're right. I'm not at this point giving
you the--the exact amount. It doesn't mean that we
are certainly not with our partners holding them
accountable to a map. (sic) But we are not--we are
not publicly positioning ourselves to hold--hold our
partners to that. We want to have them commit to
making these changes, and feel empowered to do so.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, the--the
sectors, which--which were committed to be
established here--there are eight sectors in the CUNY
Adult Education Department?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Oh, yeah, uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: What are these
eight sectors, and is there any overlap between those
sectors and the ones for which you guys are looking
to do the--the industry partnerships?

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 62

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: It's our six. So OUR
SIX being healthcare, technology, food service,
retail, construction industry partnership, and two
that they added, education and social service.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Is our six a term
of--? What--what is R6? I'm sorry.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] No, I'm
sorry.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: What is R6?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: It's the six--the six
industry partnerships that we call out--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing] Oh.
[laughs]

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: --in our--I'm sorry,
I'm--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: R6.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: I live there.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Oh, our six.
Okay. [laughs]

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Sorry.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, I thought
maybe it was Recommendation 6. Okay.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Sorry, the Career--
the Career Pathways six. The Career Pathways thing.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

63

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Plus? I'm sorry,
you did have two more.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Plus education--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]
Yep.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: --and social service.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay. Okay, one
more question for me and then I'm going to go back to
Chair Cornegy, and they (sic) let me know we've been
joined by Council Members Crowley, Ferreras-Copeland
and Dickens. Recommendation 5 in the report talks
about emphasis on improving college readiness and job
preparedness for high school graduates, and this was
supposed to be addressed through more communication
between the Department of Education and CUNY, and in
the report they are all in--they are all cited to be
in progress. No checks, no actual accomplishments in
the course of the year, at least none that have been
delineated here. It seems to me that of all of the
things out there that we have any control over,
getting the Department of Education and CUNY to talk
to one another would actually be among the easiest.
Why is that not so? What is happening with
Recommendation 5?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: You're--you're correct, very correct in your observations. The only one that we are completely in progress with and have no successes. I would explain it in the positive that CUNY was very--as you know, they received a considerable sum to improve ASAP, and, um, it, um, which increases graduation rates. That focus on--for them on expansion of ASAP really was one of the reasons that I think that they felt that they were not able to maybe make the progress together that we were able to--that we wanted to do, that we had set out to do. I would say that while agree with you it should some of the easiest connections, and there are certainly a lot of--a considerable amount of incredibly dedicated people on both sides, we are continuing to work to develop a couple of specific things that we can work on. In fact, the--we are--we are--I guess I'm--I guess I'll just end by saying, you know, we're continuing to figure out exactly how we can come to consensus on our agenda for making sure that these both in creating an alternative credit policy, making sure career counseling is supported, and making sure that we can better support students' long-term employment prospects.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

65

[pause]

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [off mic] Okay,
I'm sure--[on mic] I'm sure we'll--we'll hear more
about that one as you progress. Okay, I'm going to--
I'm going to turn back to--to Chair Cornegy and I--I
have a few more myself.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Again, thank you,
Chair Garodnick. I'd like to for a moment focus on
the healthcare sector training programs that have
been developed through the New York Alliance for
Careers in Healthcare. This bill is enormously
important to residents of my district, and I know
that many New Yorkers have been taking--taken in by
advertising. They see you on trains and buses for
for for-profit programs that promise access to
specific healthcare jobs. Some of those programs are
not reputable, leaving folks who've invested and
sacrificed in the hope of getting ahead even further
behind. I believe the Department of Consumer Affairs
is even investigating some of these programs as we
speak. So, I'd like to understand how the trainings
the city has developed differ in content and in
placement rate, how much they cost, if anything, and
if there is a cost, how students are financing those

costs. And finally, how New Yorkers are meant to
access these programs?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Thank you
for your question. So, I--we talked a little bit
earlier about this healthcare industry partnership,
and trying to build a better training infrastructure
and part of it is to ensure that New Yorkers are not
misled and--and--and the only option is to go to
these private schools that are--are sometimes not
delivering what they promise to. So, um, our--all of
the investments--investments that we're making and,
and 95% of the--the--the training programs that we're
developing are in partnership with CUNY. Um, and the
way that we're--it works is we--we engage with
industry. They--they--we work together to figure out
what the requirements are, develop the training model
and then pilot it through CUNY with funding that we
deliver for the most part, we at SBS. And we're
working with--with the CUNY schools for--on a longer
term strategy so that they will then be able to adopt
these models and deliver them to their continuing ed
school as well without our funding longer term. But,
and how do people--I'm sorry, is the other part of
your question how do people access them, right? And

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 67

2 so we--the same point I made earlier we do our best
3 through all the challenges that we have to get the
4 word out, and to ensure that everybody that is a
5 great fit for--for careers in healthcare, and can
6 benefit from more training knows about it. But we
7 welcome any help that anyone has to offer because we
8 always know we can do better.

9 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Sure.

11 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, and--and my--my
12 point for bringing that up was--

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

14 [interposing] Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: --I recognize that
16 there is a void that we could potentially fill.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah.

18 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Um, especially for
19 constituents in my district, and I want to make sure
20 that--that we're clear on that--on that mandate, and
21 that we do something different, and we provide a
22 different outcome for these particular set of--of
23 individuals attempting to do better.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Terrific,
25 and we--

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 68

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: [interposing] So
that was--that was only point in--in bringing that
up.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: No, we
really appreciate it and look forward to working
together on it.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Um, and then before
I move to colleagues, Hire NYC so we talk about that
a little bit. I just want to talk about it a little
bit more. What capacity does Hire NYC have to target
job referrals locally? For example, it's very useful
for development projects to have site supervisors and
security people who live near--very near to sites--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
[interposing] Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: --where they
operate. This becomes particularly important in a
storm like the one we just had, but it also can help
to alleviate some community concerns about
development when other residents see their neighbors
getting jobs, and it helps ensure that the project
can easily receive and quickly respond to concerns
expressed by neighbors. What kind of geographic
targeting, if any, is possible in Hire NYC?

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

69

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: So--so--
targeting is very, very and very, very committed.
So, the--the way that Hire NYC is--is set up is that
the--the--the filling of the jobs will primarily be
delivered through the Workforce 1 Career system. And
so, you know, we have 17 locations, and--and we will
target residents of a specific area when there's a
development project happening in their area, and--and
present the most--folks who will qualify for the
positions that the--the developer or the construction
companies or the subs are going to fill. And through
that method, we're hoping that we will connect local
folks to the local jobs.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: But just for me--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
[interposing] Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: --as a novice,
literally, how does the targeting happen?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Sorry,
[laughs] So, um, through the--the--the partnerships
we have with the local community-based organizations,
and other community partners who can help us access--
access folks in the community through the fire
distribution, street teams. Whatever it would take

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

70

to--to--to best connect it to folks who would be
interested in the opportunities and live in the
community, and they would invited to come and be
screened for events, and sometimes we do that when we
have partners who have space in the community. We
send our recruiters in and sometimes we hold it at
our--at our centers. It's whatever kind of works.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So offline I'd like
to talk to you about that in my district and how it
happens and be as helpful as I possibly can in--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
[interposing] Sure.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: --in disseminating
that information to those people that need it.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Great,
great.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Thank you so
much.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you, Chair
Corney. I now want to focus on Recommendation No.
10, which has a bunch of metrics in it--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
[interposing] Yes, they have.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

71

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --and this is something, which as you know, this--these committees we like those sorts of things. And for those who don't have the paperwork right in front of them, the--the metrics that are relevant here are about reimbursing workforce agencies on the basis of a variety of different components. And, actually, you know, there's a whole list of them in the report including number of clients served, full-time hires, part-time hires, wages, academic based enrollments, et cetera, et cetera, continuity, retentions. It's a lot of good metrics, and if I understand it correctly, these 13 metrics were distributed to agencies in July of 2015. Is that right?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Correct.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Now tell us what, you know, this is not that long ago, but tell us what you have learned, if anything, from any reports back that you have gotten from these agencies both of some metrics, and how reimbursements have changed, if all--

-

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --as a result of the way they have responded to you?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Great so let me tell you a little bit about--let me step back a little bit about what we--how we're implement Common Metrics. I know you're a big fan. I'm a really big fan of this because this really does unify and create a system. This would mean that everyone in no matter which agency, no matter which CBO you go to would be looking at some of the same issues. So, we could come in and answer the question what is the retention rate, and you could ask each agency the same kind of questions. So that's the power. The way you get there, the way we are getting there is by having the Mayor's Office of Operations and our Data Analytics team be the lead. What they've done in--since July is work with the biggest agencies to line-by-line in everything they collect in their data system currently, take an inventory of what they collect that would map back to these 13. And see does it exist? Yes or no. If not, what will it--and now we're at the stage of--and that's pretty laborious. I mean, and then if not, what would it take to create this--this field. Could it be optional, or is it already optional, but it needs to be mandatory? Is it in text, but it needs to be in numeric. You know

these kinds of level of detail. So, um, we are now at the point where we are writing the specs, the actual detailed specs with the agencies on how they can change their databases so they can take in this data as the step one. So, it's--it is that allows us then to centralize and have those reports come in, and actually have them be the same, and have them be useful. So that's where we are. Probably farther away than you would have liked, but really building again a solid foundation where we know that that specs are the same and that every single thing is really going to go. I also--so--so it has not at this time changed reimbursement strategy. It has, though, been included in DYCD's RFP that was released just in the fall, the first RFPs that's released since the report. And it was included there, and all the contractors now know these are the metrics. I--will be evaluated on in addition or in conjunction with the metrics that must be evaluated on due to the federal or state funding stream that exists. So, that is included. That will be included in the future, and we again are building this, you know, solid foundation that it can rest on.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So, that's great
and, you know, interestingly enough it seems to me
that this is Recommendation 10. It probably should
be Recommendation 1. I mean it really is that
important for you to be able to do apples to apples
comparison on all of the metrics that you are most--
you and we are most interested in.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So that's--
that's--that's very good. Um, the--the question that
arises, though, is when will this be in place fully
from your best estimate so that you would have the
ability to for agencies make determinations on how
well they're working? Like when will this be in
place?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: So I can say for the
first three agencies, which are the biggest, HRA,
DYCD and SBS, that the when is to work with them and
then in the next-- I would say by next year at this
time that their databases should be updated, and
MODA, our Mayor's Office of Data Analytics should be
receiving that data, or we should be able to--to
analyze that, fix any bugs. You know, work on all of
those pieces absolutely at that time--

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 75

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing] So
beginning in--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: --and then rolling it
out to agencies that have smaller impact, you know,
smaller numbers of clients.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So the beginning
of calendar year 2017 this thing should be--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing]
Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --up and running
for almost all?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: For almost--for--for
the--for the--for the first--we're starting with
three, the biggest. So, it's going to be--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing] The
biggest represent what percentage?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Almost 80%.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: How much, 80%?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Yeah, yeah, 80%. Um,
so what we would be--so that's where we would be in
that time. I do want to maybe get my--just answer a
little bit of a question that you said, um, at the
beginning of, um, understanding when you are--when
your introduction on common metrics. We are learning

about the retention rate, job continuity, and wage growth both pre and post. This is going to require us to connect to the state's system, WRS, which we have the legislative right to do. We think that these three metrics may take longer to verify and work with than the other ten. These are probably the most important, but you have to realize--but we are learning from experts, data experts in the field and other states how long it takes to actually make these connections to the State Labor data, and correctly do this analysis. So, while next year at this time I absolutely have confidence that we should be in right shape and collecting the right data, I'm not sure if these last three metrics retention rate, job continuity and wage growth will be fully baked because of the need to work with the state, and the deep analysis that needs to happen. There's lags of it. It's just a--it's a huge data set. So, MODA can definitely handle it, and I know they're, you know, eager to do it, but those are--are different than the other ten.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: That is the expectation here that if an agency continuously underperforms that reimbursements will end or

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

77

contracts will end. I mean that--that presumably is
the--the--the presumption here. It's not just--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] But
it's the presumption, yes.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: It's not just--
it's not just we're going to compare everybody and
then congratulate the winners. It is a we are going
to--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] We're
going to make smart fiscal decisions based on
evidence. The thing that is different between
agencies would be who they serve, in what
neighborhood or how old they are or, you know, I mean
the apples to apples is a great start, but we will
also obviously keep in mind any important factors
like comparing youth outcomes to outcomes of adults.
You know, things like that just to--to be noted. It
won't be so simple, but we can always just say X or
Y. We'll need to have that context.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, let's talk
about underemployment for a moment. Because as you
and I observed in our opening the unemployment rates
are low, and the lowest they have been since 2007,
which is a very good thing. One of the primary

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

78

focuses of the Career Pathways Report was to deal
with--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --under-
employment through strategies like transitioning
skilled and qualified workers to work for higher wage
jobs, or positions or opportunities where there's
some more mobility. Um, can you give us a sense as
to how you are tracking or measuring under-employment
rates in New York City? The top line one,
unemployment is an easier one to measure. How do you
track under-employment and how are you measuring your
own success in dealing with it?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: So let me answer the
second, um, part of how we would--how we're measuring
our own success in dealing with it. One of the key
things that we're doing, and that I'm very excited
about starting here is the importance of looking at
the retail and food service industries. As we know
there are--they've added and grown hundreds of
thousands of job. We also know that those two
sectors pay some of the lowest wages. SO, in our--
one of our main strategies here is to figure out ways
that to work with employers to help show the

possibility of how they can increase job stability,
job resources, financial empowerment, wages and all
of the things that can go into job quality for those
jobs. So we can both interact with under-employment
as well as we can help industries be stronger, more
vibrant and grow in New York. So really our strategy
around under-employment meaning I--as I'm describing
it here is sort of a low--a low overall income is--is
the way that we're addressing that. For your first
part of your question, we are not specifically other
than obviously working with the Mayor's Poverty
Commission and others tracking. We let the Mayor's
Poverty Commission, another track (sic), under-
employment and do the analysis therein.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Let's go to
Recommendation 6 for a second, and this one you also
noted in your opening involves work-based learning
opportunities for young people and for high need job
seekers. There--there was one thing that stood out
for me in--in your progress report, and that was the,
um, the progress toward the 100,000--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --because it
looked like we were at an estimate of 65,000 in

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 80

Fiscal Year 15 and then up to 76,000 in Fiscal Year
16.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Can you just help
us understand where that differential comes from?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Absolutely. It came
from two main places. Number 1, DYCD Summer Youth
Employment Program grew, and number 2, the City
Council launched the Work, Learn, Grow Initiative,
and so that's absolutely where both of those joined--
came in. And you see it also reflected in the
budget.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [pause] Okay,
let's--let's go--I'm bouncing around a little bit,
but I do want to cover all them. Recommendation--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Cover them all.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --8.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: And Chair Cornegy
touched on it a moment ago, but this was about
expanding access to financial empowerment resources
in partnership with at least 100 employers.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Uh-huh.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 81

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: We know from your
Progress Report that DCA is expanding it's taxis and
campaign and has launched its employer-based--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --Financial
Empowerment Campaign, but can you tell us how many of
these 100 employers have joined in partnership with
you to date? Forgive me if I'm--if I'm missing it
here.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: No, no, um, I--I will
get back--I will have to get back to you. We're
currently in the process of recruiting for tax time.
These employers still--I think it's actively in
process. We're working with our Workforce
Development Board and others with DCA to actively
recruit right now. So, I don't have a--a final
number for you, but at the end of tax season we'd be
happy to share how many actually are able to
participate in that NYC Tax--Tax Prep at Work
program. So the idea was to launch it. Now we're
going to do it, and then we're going to hold
ourselves accountable to that number.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [pause] Chair
Corney.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 82

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: [coughs] So, at a
Higher Ed hearing two weeks ago, we learned that
there is a DOE-CUNY working group that addresses a
myriad of issues. It was news to the Higher Ed
Committee here. Do you know about it, and can it--do
you believe that it can facilitate the type of
interaction that Pathways envisions.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: I did not know about
it. It sounds very useful.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So we should circle
back on that, too?

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Yes,
let's go back.

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: As--as all of us
are finding new relationships and partnerships--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Yes, I
mean our--

CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: --we should share--
I feel compelled to share them.

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: I'd very much
appreciate that.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, um, I--I
only have one or two more, and in the absence of
further questions from my colleagues, you guys may--

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 83

may be spared from too much, um, in a--in a couple
minutes. But let's just talk for a moment about the
Workforce 1 Career Centers for a second. So, one of
the things that has been established of the past year
as we've noted, is setting a job quality standard--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --for employers
that are recruiting employees out of our Workforce 1
Centers. And the recent Mayor's manage--Mayor's
Management Report stated that that standard is one of
the reasons why there has been a reduced number of
placements--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

[interposing] Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: It was a big
drop, though. The number of placements--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

[interposing] It's about 38% I think.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: I'm sorry.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: About 38% I
want to guess.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Well, it went
from--in Fiscal 14 it was 36,000 and in Fiscal 15 it
was 26,000. Now, of course, in Fiscal 13, it was

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

84

28,000. So I--I--what I'd like you to explain to us
is whether we should be comparing 28,000 to 26,000
and whether something weird happened in Fiscal Year
15, and if so, what happened in Fiscal 14. Or, why
there was such a big drop for 36,000 to 26,000 in the
course of one fiscal year. And while you're at it,
I'll just throw them all in together, where are we in
Fiscal 16 to date, if you know?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Sure. So
the reason for the drop is because we put the--the
Job Quality Standard in. So, if it's not--just
because I say that doesn't mean that--that you
understand the reason. So obviously the--the--the--
we anticipated the drop, but it's--we actually
anticipated a 40% drop. And like I said, I think the
next drop is about 38% because we want to focus more
on full-time jobs, and--and better paying jobs, and
try to begin the process of inching our way up to the
Living Wage Rate. And all of our contracts are on a
one-year renewal basis, which happens on April 1st,
and we couldn't in the middle of a contract year just
implement a standard. We had to do it right as the
contract started. So, there are fewer--the--the--
Another thing I should say maybe is obvious to me

because I wrote it, but maybe not obvious to the world at large. We do not have enough resources to ever fill all the open positions that we could put--that exist in the City of New York. So, it's--it's, we're only like this much of it. Um, and so--but there are more lower paying jobs because there is more turnover. It's much easier to fill jobs for companies that aren't paying--aren't paying very much and don't offer full-time positions. If you want to get to scale that's a way to do it. We didn't want that. We wanted an emphasis on--on quality, and so as we expected, our volume dropped, and we ratchet it up every year. So, again April 1st the--the floor will be \$13.13 instead of \$11.50, which is what it's been for this year. So once we get to sort of a steady state, I--I do--and we do see a--a recapture of some of the volume, and I do expect that we will over time return to some point. Probably not the 35 without additional funding, \$35, \$40,000 that we've done in banner years before, but I do expect that we will recover some of the volume. And I believe we're on track to--to do so this year.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]

Okay, well--

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 86

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: --but I
don't have the number off the top of my head.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: You don't? Okay,
so you don't--you don't know--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
[interposing] I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --you don't know
where we are to date?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I don't.
I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: I can get
back--easily get back to you.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, that would
be great, but the--the, um, so--I'm--I'm--I'm still
not sure I'm--I'm clear as to what happened in Fiscal
Year 14. What--why was the--so from Fiscal 13 it
went up to--from 28,000 to 36,000 placements from
Workforce 1, and then back down to 26,000. So we--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
[interposing] Yeah, the back down was the--was the--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: I understand the
back down--

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

87

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

[interposing] --the job, yeah.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: But what I don't--
--what I don't understand is the--the jump up at that
point in New York City's history. What's--what's
going on there, and why--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

[interposing] It--I can--I can get back to you for
sure. There's a--there's probably something that--
that drove that. It might have been yeah, the--the--
National Emergency Grant expansion sites, right, that
there was a lot of staffing. Something like that is
probably what happened. Something unusual or
temporary and where there are a lot of jobs
associated with it. That's my--that's a very good
guess, but we can--I can get back to.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, and then
what is the--what is the target? What--what do we
want to see? I mean, Fiscal Year 15 was--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

[interposing] I think it's 25,000 for--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Fiscal Year 15
was 26,952.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah.

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
3 COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 88

4 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So, you think
5 that our target is--it should be lower than that.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Again,
7 because we ratcheted up the--the--the quality
8 standard so--

9 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Oh, Fiscal 15
10 didn't include any of the--it didn't.

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: No, each
12 year we are--so--so since--since the--and I'm going
13 to confuse Fiscal Years with Calendar Years for the--

14 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]
15 Yeah, no, no, that's all right.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: But from the
17 beginning of the de Blasio Administration the first
18 opportunity we had would have been like April 1st of
19 that year 2013, the standard was in--instituted.

20 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: That was Fiscal
21 Year--that was Fiscal 14, right?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: So that
23 every year--with a few months left in Fiscal 15.

24 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So Fiscal 15 was
25 a full year of--

26 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
27 [interposing] Yeah. Yes.

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

89

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --of this?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yes, and--

but again, starting at \$10 and then it went to
\$11.50. Now we're going to \$13.13. So, I don't--we--
we expect again to--to identify fewer jobs, and--and
adjust to a--a higher wage job.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: All right, the--
so the--in your view, 25,000 is [coughs] more or less
the target that you would view as a successful
placement under the standards that you have now set,
and that's--that would be--that would be--that would
be a point of success at the end of the year?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah, that--
we have now set and we are about to reset, right,
because we're in--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]
Yeah, I got you. It's still going down. I mean it
was 26,952 in Fiscal 15. You expect it will probably
be lower this year, and maybe even--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:

[interposing] That's the target, (sic). Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --and maybe just
stabilize around there, but that's where you think it

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 90

should be. Do you think it can--do you think that
will that will then go back--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
[interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --up. Now, then
what would be the aspirational number when it's
still-- After it stabilizes, what's the aspirational
number?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: It's a
little bit hard to--to say because I'm not sure
what's going to happen with--with the minimum wage,
and--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]
Unemployment and all of that.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: --you know,
and things like that in the plan. (sic) So it's hard
for me to--to say, but--

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]
That's okay.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: --but--and
the--the level of investment, but if everything
stayed the same, I mean I don't think it would--it
would be unreasonable to think that we could get

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 91

ourselves back up to \$30,000 after some, you know, a
period.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Now, one--one
additional point about this--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON:
[interposing] Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --which was that
there was a decrease, a significant decrease in the
number of new job seeker registrants in Fiscal Year
15 also.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yep.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: But that may be
just reflective of the economy and the unemployment
numbers.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Nope.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, then what
is it reflective of?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: It think
that straight up that 95% of the time when people
come to see us, they're coming in response to a
specific job that they are interested in--in getting
and if we are--have fewer of those Because like I
said we put the wage--the Job Quality Standards in,

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 92

then we're going to just see fewer people. It's as
straightforward as that.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, understood.
We have been joined by Council Members Constantinides
and Menchaca. Welcome. We have questions from
Council Member Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
Chairs and, you know, this--this is an ever-evolving
commitment to our communities and getting them jobs.
In Sunset Park, we have a real conundrum there as we
think about the immigrant community that continues to
feel disconnected from the opportunities as we pump
energy and excitement to our manufacturing district.
How in--in this--this kind of conversation, this
general conversation about our Workforce Development
systems are we allowing for a kind of real targeted
effort for neighborhood by neighborhood instead of
what I think the Workforce 1 Centers have been, a
kind of generalized system that has not really worked
well. How--how can you show us a real different
pathway or Career Pathways for communities like mine
that are Chinese speakers, Spanish speakers, Arabic
speakers, Polish, et cetera?

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 93

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: [pause] I
will--

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And--and like a
fine-tuning. Sorry. Go ahead.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yeah, no,
that's okay. I'll take just a little bit of an
exception with the--with the characterization that
the system doesn't work well, because I think--

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing] Of
course, I mean--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Just a
little bit.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing]
You--you have to. I mean you really have to.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: [interposing]
Not that there's not room for improvement and we're
trying all the time, and--

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing]
And there's new one coming to Sunset Park, by the
way.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: [interposing]
There is.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So that's--
that's what I'm talking about. So I--I don't want

what I've seen. I want something different. How can you guarantee now that we're closer, we're not talking concepts any more. There's brick and mortar coming its way. How--how--how are you really thinking about this in a different way?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: A--a couple of different ways. So, the--one of the things that we have as a system is that we have a very effective method--and it took years to build--of engaging employers and--and--and being relevant to them by filling their open positions. I mean we're just very good at that. In our Hub Centers, we have one--we call them Hub Centers, but the big--large centers that are located in--in each borough, we will continue to--to have a focus in engaging employers. I mean everybody will, but they'll be the primary site. With the smaller centers that are located in--in communities like Sunset Park or Far Rockaway, or Coney Island, we're doing something different. We're trying to--to experiment with leveraging the--the strength of the hub centers and the--and the connections to employers. But we're beginning to tailor services to the specific residents of the various communities to see if we can't get better at

addressing, you know, their--their specific needs.

In your community you have--you sit in one of the--
folks sit in one of the pockets of--of manufacturing
employment. It's the highest concentration of
manufacturing jobs in the city. And so, you can bet
we're going to tailor our--our service to--to
ensuring that we--we leverage that, and we connect
them to--to jobs. We're also working on and--and
are--have a number of different, um, services in
development that are addressing the needs of--of far
more New Yorkers who may, you know, need some pre-
trainings or bridge programs that will be helpful to
them in--in connecting the better paying jobs. So,
and there are many examples like that, but
conceptually the idea is use the big job--the big
centers to--to continue to engage employers and--and
use the scale of it, and then tailor services in the
communities. And then, if we're successful there,
figure out where else we need to roll them out
because there are similar communities probably in
other parts of the city. Does that make sense with
you? (sic)

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 96

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah, yeah, and
again it's--it's so conceptual still, and we're going
to have to just see--

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: [interposing]
Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --how it works.
But the last question, and then I'll hand over--back
to the Chair. There are other people doing the same--
trying to get to the same result.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And in our
neighborhood we have this big, um, development called
Industry City where they are creating something
Innovation Lab.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yep.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Are you
familiar with them? Are you working with them? Do
you create synergy as a Career Pathways Initiative
with other similar entities doing similar things,
and--and how important is that in your--in your--in
your mission?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Yes, I am
familiar. We are working together, and I'm sorry.
What's the second part of your question?

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 97

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Well, so you're
familiar with it. How are you working with them?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: [interposing]
We are--

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: What's the
synergy? What's the--what's the policy around
working with others who are trying to do very similar
things?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MALLON: Our team in
Sunset Park is actually a team that is a--an
organization that is based in Sunset Park, the job
that's performed in--in Industrial Development
Corporation. They're the ones who are going to run
our Career Center there, and they are repping--
providing a representation to Industry City on an
Innovation Lab, but we also have a network of other
community-based organizations in Sunset Park who
aren't necessarily as business focused. You're
right. We're working the Center for Family Life.
We're working with Turning Point. We're working with
Lutheran Family Services, and we've had--and we're
using the approach in other neighborhoods as well.
We're like--listen, we all do something that similar.
We're all trying to get to the same objective, which

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 98

is to connect them to better jobs. Let's create synergies, and let's design services that leverage each other's strengths, and let's make sure we have structures in place where we're--we're in constant communication--constant is an exaggeration, but frequent communications so that we can adjust as we learn. Is that--?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Time will tell.
Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you, Council Menchaca. We've been joined by Council Member Barron, and with that, we--we have no more questions from this panel, and we thank you very much for testimony--

KATIE GAUL-STIGGE: [interposing] Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --and we wish you well in your progress and we will--we will be following up with you. Thank you very much. We're going to call--we have one additional panel of witnesses, and we're going to invite them all up together. We've got four chairs and four people. So Mary Ellen Clark, Betsy Plum, Sasha Kesler, and Marjorie Parker come join us. [pause] We've got the

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

99

clock at five minutes. Obviously , if you don't need
it, don't feel free to go the distance, but you're
welcome to it. [pause] All right, would you--would
you like to start us off? Okay, just hit the button.

MARY ELLEN CLARK: Good afternoon and
thank you for having this hearing and inviting us to
testify. My name is Mary Ellen Clark and I'm the
Executive Director of the New York City Employment
and Training Coalition, which is an association
representing the expertise of over 150 community-
based organizations, education institutions, and
labor unions that annually provide job training
employment services to over 800,000 New Yorkers.
These include public assistance recipients, under-
employed workers, low-wage workers; at-risk youth,
individuals involved with the Criminal Justice
system, immigrants, veterans, the homeless, elderly
and individuals with disabilities. The Coalition has
a responsibility to give voice to what makes sense
for these communities, and we're happy to be here to
share with you our experiences. The one-year
anniversary of the Career Pathways Report gave us an
opportunity to reflect on what the community needs to
be an effective and successful partnership to this

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 100

new model. We're encouraged by the transformational
concepts advanced by Commissioner Banks, and the HRA
team. And to that end, we've already taken steps to
provide collective feedback and at times appropriate
criticism of the city's new concepts for DYCD and HRA
workforce programs, ensuring that there's adequate
funding and consideration for how these systems can
work effectively based on our members' extensive
experience. We strongly feel that the changes called
for in the in the Career Pathways Report must
leverage the expertise of our members who have been
implementing innovative and effective programs for--
for decades. We're happy to see focus and funding on
bridge programs, and there are already a wealth of
recognized high quality Bridge programs in the city.
LaGuardia Community College bridged a careers program
for Per Skolas (sic) on the Door. 1199 SIEU Bridge
Phipps New York, Henry Street Settlement, Project
Rise and Opportunity for a Better Tomorrow, and
Goodwill Industries to name a few. Personally, I've
had the privilege of being on the Young Women's
Initiative Task Force, and we applaud the City's
efforts to highlight the need to help our young girls
of color to have access to a more level playing

field. The Career Pathways model requires not only increased funding, but continued focus and attention on vulnerable populations such as these.

On Monday of this week [bell]the Coalition convened 160 workforce professionals who spent the day in working sessions identifying policy changes and actions we'd like to see, and the message is clear. The City must adequately fund high quality programs that prepare New Yorkers for good jobs paying living wages. At the forum, Kate Gaul-Stigge said, "We know that low-touch inexpensive programs do not work" and we could not agree more. A strong and effective system is not created by short-term investments. If we want to change the system [bell] we need to fund it appropriately so we ensure access to quality programs for all New Yorkers and the most vulnerable. While the Coalition applauds the new SBS' focus on quality placements at the Workforce 1 Centers, the work that many of our member organizations do in training of placements are not recorded in this system. Remember I told you we serve 800,000 people. Our member organizations work with marginalized individuals who may never be able to compete for middle wage jobs, and thus these city

dollars never reach the communities. You may ask yourself where do the people go once they're turned away from Workforce 1 and aren't eligible for these jobs? Funded by private philanthropy who have quadrupled their investment in community-based organization to fill the gap, [bell] the work with the most vulnerable is outside what the cities consider a system. Unfortunately, we've seen the pool of middle-wage jobs decline, and the increase in the city is in low-wage jobs in retail and the service industry. So I think we all need to continue to demand employers raise the floor, and pay higher and competitive wages. Employers are important stakeholders in this system, and in addition to living wages they need to provide quality work environments, full-time work with benefits and fair schedules. So in summary, more funding is needed to match the bold equality agenda, which is advanced by the Mayor. We would request that the City Council consider specialized population contracts to help bridge the gap between the public system and the CBO community similar to what the Council is currently funding Jobs to Build On Initiative. Individuals [bell] who are marginalized are most likely to

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 103

utilize the quality, convenient programming in their
neighborhood, and the on-ramps that our frontline
organizations provide. We encourage the City and the
City Council to capitalize on the knowledge and the
capacity offered by the New York City Employment and
Training Coalition Training provider community, which
yields strong and long-lasting economic success. So
thank you for the opportunity to testify today, and
we look forward to continuing to work with you to
ensure that all New Yorkers have access to quality
jobs.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you very
much. Please.

BETSY PLUM: Skipping out of order. Good
afternoon. My name is Betsy Plum, and I am the
Director of Special Projects at the New York
Immigration Coalition, an umbrella and advocacy
organization working statewide. My testimony today
is on behalf of the NYC, but we also an active member
of the New York City Coalition for Adult Literacy or
NYCCAL. Thank you to the Chairs for the opportunity
to testify at today's hearing on the Mayor's
Structural Reforms to the City's Workforce
Development Systems. With perhaps the largest of

these reforms, of course, the Career Pathways Plan,
we wish to also thank the Mayor's Office of Workforce
Development for their partnership and transparency in
the preliminary implementation of this plan over the
past year. Our testimony today highlights many of
the issues that we have remained in active
conversation with the Administration over, and which
placed the City's Workforce system in the greater
context of adult learners and their needs. For low-
income adults and immigrants in New York, education
is the key to securing employment and building a
foothold in the job market. And Workforce
Development programs are critical to creating and
sustaining a thriving economy. A strong equitable
and successful workforce system will thus be
dependent on the strength of the greater literacy and
basic education system. Parallel investments made to
both systems equip adult learners with the foundational
literacy and numeracy skills required for social
navigation and success as well as access and success
in Workforce Development Programs. Unfortunately,
such parallel investments in the greater literacy
system are a critical missing element in priority in
the restructuring of the city's Workforce system.

While we commend the city's plan to invest \$60 million in bridge program--programming under the leadership of Work Dev, with over 1.7 million adult New Yorkers lacking English language proficiency, a high school diploma or its equivalent or both. The vast majority of adult learners particularly those in need of Workforce Development are at the lowest literacy levels. For these individuals, bridge programming that integrates or contextualizes basic education to training or Career Pathways programs is still too advanced. Many individuals have such low literacy levels that they essentially need what we've termed a bridge to a bridge. Which, in fact, this exists as traditional basic education, English for speakers of other languages, adult basic education and high school equivalency of HSE preparation. New York City's investment in such community-based adult literacy, a foundation for the success again of the entire Workforce system is millions dollars short of the level of investment made under the former administration. Despite a number of key Council adult literacy initiatives that were baselined in the City's Fiscal Year 2015 budget, the decision in Fiscal Year 2016 to eliminate over \$6 million an

adult literacy program has been devastating to
thousands of individuals. It is these exact programs
that offer the critical on-ramp or bridge to a bridge
that allows access to a Workforce program to become a
reality for a low level learner who needs either
basic skills or English language acquisition. But
this action eliminated the capacity of providers to
serve over 6,300 immigrants and adults. With actions
like this, New York City's Workforce system will
remain at a critical crisis point, and will exclude
those most in need. Without English proficiency and
access to basic skills, thousands of monolingual
immigrants will still find themselves isolated and at
the mercy of unscrupulous employers unable to better
their Workforce success and development. For all of
the commendable strides made for the greater New York
City Workforce Development system, without an
intervention to better investments in adult literacy
education, we run the risk of excluding over 25% of
the City's adult population, and we threaten the
success of the entire system. Moving forward, we
believe New York City must take a new comprehensive
and urgent approach to educating and building the
skills of our low-income adults and immigrants,

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

107

especially given the new Workforce Innovation and
Opportunity Act that since it will likely make much
harder to use federal pass-through funds to serve the
undocumented and those with the lowest skills. We
need to take a long-term view toward the education of
the over 1.7 million New Yorkers lacking English
proficiency and/or a high school diploma, and a
comprehensive view to the implications of state and
federal laws that impact adult learners, immigrants
and others most likely to benefit from Workforce
programs. We look forward to a renewed commitment
from this Council and the Administration to develop
this vision and unlock the tremendous potential of
these New Yorkers. Thank you.

[pause]

MARJORIE PARKER: Good afternoon,
Chairman Garodnick, the representative for Chairman
Miller, Chairman Cornegy. My name is Marjorie
Parker. I'm the Executive Director of Jobs First New
York City. We're a non-profit agency with focus on
connecting young--young adults to the economic life
of New York City. [bell] Thank you for the
opportunity to address you today. I am going to talk
just a little bit about the out-of-school, out-of-

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 108

work and on the unemployed New Yorkers that we talked
to you about last time we were here. Employment in
New York City is booming. Unemployment is
significantly lower than it has been since 2008. The
city is flush with new jobs, and we have seen wage
increases up about 4%. That's all in the report
that I'm sure all of you have. However, one group of
New Yorkers continues to miss out on this economic
bounty, 18 to 23-year-olds who are out-of-school,
out-of-work or under-employed. In 2014, we testified
to the same committee about the 35% of young New
Yorkers constituted in the schools. The
recommendations embodied Career Pathways Report have
potential for a real progress towards creating a
Workforce system worthy of the city. In 2014, Jobs
First New York City called for an integrated
comprehensive strategy to address the crisis of 18 to
24-year-olds out-of-school, out-of-work and under-
employed young adults through our policy paper
unleashing the economic power up to 35%, which we
shared with many of you. The centerpiece is the
creation of these opportunity centers, and I know--I
heard the tail end of the discussion here about
specifically targeting in some communities. These

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

109

centers will connect them to education, training,
work experience services--and services that will
ultimately qualify them for well paying jobs.
Similar centers exist in Los Angeles and in Boston
where they reduce the out-of-school, out-of-work
numbers. In addition, we advocated for expansion of
training programs to qualify young adults for in-
demand occupations, the creation of industry
partnerships that affords in-roads to jobs, and the
development of a virtual one-stop portal--lap (sic)
portal with comprehensive information concerning
potential careers, education and training sources,
and descriptions of organizations that young adults
could go to become gainfully employed. So we are
happy to see that the city has made some progress
towards implementing some of our recommendations.
And we're a little bit emotional on this side of the
year because the de Blasio Administration continues
to fail the population in great need of more
intentional support. City plans have consistently
lacked a bold, audacious initiative similar to those
put forth to address the crisis of childcare,
homelessness and housing. A year ago, the city
released it's Career Pathways Report, and has now

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

110

produced a progress report that in many ways we'd
like mission accomplished. However, if I were an
young adult in neighborhoods like Motthaven, Bedford-
Stuyvesant or East New York we're raised (sic) with
young adults where out of school and out of work are
30% or higher, I'd probably ask the question:
Mission accomplished for whom? It is not enough for
the de Blasio Administration to say it is
restructuring the public workforce system to align
training with market demand, policies across
agencies, as well as improve job quality. As the
Career Pathways, and now a subsequent progress report
indicates, it is not enough for our population that
continues to be under-resourced, and has spent the
last 24 years already looking up at the workforce
economic level and wondering how can I get on? It is
not enough for a population that the Mayor has all
but ignored. That's where you see the activity (sic)
is calling on Mayor de Blasio to make a bold,
audacious, mayoral level plan to address the crisis
of out-of-work, out-of-school young adults in New
York City. The private sector and philanthropy is
doing it. J.P. Morgan Chase and Company through its
new Skills at Work Initiative. Howard Schultz and

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

111

Starbucks through it's 100,000 Opportunities
Initiative. These serve as two very good examples of
philanthropy solutions for this very population. We
believe that the City of New York certainly do this,
too. So as Jobs First, we're focusing on advancing
economic opportunities for all New Yorkers, and I
hope that you will join me in supporting the adoption
of specific measures that enable out-of-school out-
of-work young adults be fully integrated into a
growing healthy economy. Thanks.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you very
much. [pause]

SASHA KESLER: Thank you, Council Member
Cornegy, Council Member Miller and Council Member
Garodnick for hold this oversight hearing to Review
the Mayor's Structural Reforms to New York City's
Workforce Development System. My name is Sasha
Kesler, Government Relations at UJ Federation of New
York, and I will be testifying today on behalf of the
New York City Coalition for Adult Literacy otherwise
known as NYCCAL. We are grateful for the Mayor's
leadership in working to reform the Workforce
Development system through Career Pathways, and other
programs. And we also wish to thank the Mayor's

Office of Workforce Development for their
collaboration and openness in the preliminary
implementation of this plan over the past year. Our
testimony today highlights the role of adult learners
in the Workforce Development system. For low-income
adults in New York City education is an essential
element to help them secure stable employment. To
create a strong and equitable workforce, we must
ensure that all individuals have access to basic
education and literacy programs that will set them up
for future employment success. Parallel investments
made to both basic education and workforce skill
systems will equip adult learners with the
foundational literacy skills required for social
navigation and success as well access to and success
in workforce development programs. Unfortunately,
current investments in the Workforce Development and
Literacy systems are missing a critical basic
education aspect of basic education programs. There
are over 1.7 million adult New Yorkers lacking
English proficiency, a high school diploma or both.
As a result, the vast majority of adult learners,
particularly those in need of Workforce Development
are at the lowest levels of literacy. For these

individuals bridge programs that integrate or
contextual basic education with training or career
pathways programs are too advanced for them. These
students need a bridge to a bridge through
traditional basic education such as English for
Speakers of Other Language, ESOL, Adult Basic
Education; and high equivalency preparation. New
York City's investment in community-based literacy
and traditional basic education service is millions
of dollars short of the level of investment made
under the previous administration. Although there
are a number of City Council adult literacy
initiatives baselined in the FY15 Budget, the
decision in FY16 to eliminate over \$6 million in
adult literacy programming through DYCD and CUNY has
had a devastating impact on thousands of adult
learners. And, this is at a time when the waitlist
for these classes is estimated to be over 14,000
people if these exact programs that offer the
critical bridge to bridge to support students in
accessing Workforce Development programs.
Restructuring of the Workforce Development system
required a long-term view towards the education of
over 1.7 million New Yorkers lacking in the English

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 114

proficiency and/or a high school diploma. Until we
develop an inclusive vision of Workforce Development,
New York City's workforce system will continue to
exclude those most in need. Without English
proficiency and access to basic skills, thousands of
immigrants will continue to find themselves isolated
and at the mercy of employers unable to better their
workforce success without English language access.
While the Workforce Development plan put forth is a
positive first step, and will have positive impact on
New York City, without investment in adult literacy
education, the City will continue to exclude over 25%
of the city's adult population from long-term
meaningful employment. Thank you again, for the
opportunity to testify, and NYCCAL looks forward to
continuing to work in cooperation and in partnership
in the future. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you very
much and the final word.

CHRISTIAN GONZALEZ RIVERA: Okay. So
good afternoon, Council Members. So, my name is
Christian Gonzalez Rivera. I am Senior Researcher at
the Center for an Urban Future, which is a non-
partisan public policy think tank based here in

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

115

Manhattan that publish the students about how New
York can expand economic opportunity and grow its
economy. We publish studies ranging from the
importance of ESOL in adult basic education programs
to the need to improve the city's Youth Workforce
Development system. We've been writing about
influencing workforce policy in New York City and in
the state for over a decade. So thank you for the
opportunity to--to testify. The need for cities to
strengthen and modernize their Workforce Development
strategy in the face of a rapidly transforming labor
market is very clean. After all, we know that decent
jobs have become scarce for high school graduates and
non-existent for dropouts. That lifelong learning is
now essential to keep up with changes in employer
demand, and the increasing numbers of workers are
working on a contingent basis. Importantly,
policymakers around the country not least right here
in America's largest city, increasingly understand
that a bachelor's or bust approach to training the
workforce of tomorrow has serious limitations. Post-
secondary options that include occupational training,
community college programs and certificate programs
all have a role to play in preparing students to

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

116

compete in labor markets. Rather than assuming that
only a four-year college degree can get New Yorkers
on the path to self-sufficiency wages. Fortunately
for us, New York City is only one of a handful of
cities in the United States to rethink its workforce,
education and social services programs to respond to
these important changes in the labor market. And to
its credit, the Career Pathways Initiative is
arguably more comprehensive in its vision, and
certainly in its scale than that of any other
American city. Though it's not perfect, it draws
from the evidence and experience of great programs
here in New York City and in other cities. A need to
succeed for the sake of our city's future prosperity
and we believe that it can succeed. After one year,
so much is still in the pipeline, but most
importantly the contract that will determine what
providers are asked to do, and the metrics with which
the City will measure success, as many of you have
brought up. But I can make some preliminary
observations on research that the Center for an Urban
Future is conducting for an upcoming study. And the
first observation is that the Human Resource
Administration has come the furthest in the past

year. HRA adopted its work first--work first strategy in the mid 1990s, even before passage of the Personal Responsibility and the Work Opportunity Act of 1996, but they maintained that strategy through the high unemployment era of the Great Recession. But now, HRA is moving on a multi-faceted plan to replace the out--outmoded Work First strategy with a more sophisticated approach that incorporates career counseling, education and training, and coordinated service delivery all in alignment with the Career Pathways framework. Importantly, HRA posted concept papers, and took public input to improve the final product, which is essential. The second observation is that the two industry partnerships are--are finding their way as--as we heard from--from Kate Gaul and from Jackie Mallon. The New York Alliance for Careers in Healthcare and the Tech Talent Pipeline are both up and running, executing strategic plans and building programs with employers, with providers and other partners. They've been working closely with CUNY to develop training curricula that's informed by input from the respective industries. While the idea of having a formal system for soliciting and acting on employer input is

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

118

promising, it's still an open question as to whether
the model that has been applied to industries with
more clearly defined Career Pathway and skill
requirements like healthcare and tech can be applied
to industries that lack clear road master
advancement. Most notably, food service and retail.
The manufacturing and construction industries also
have complex challenges that need to be addressed.
And that leads us to the--to the--to the third
observation, and that is that City agencies should be
transparent in their implementation of Career
Pathways. HRA has been fairly open about its plans
for implementing Career Pathways, but we still need
to hear more from SBS about how it will implement
Career Pathways. For instance, four industry
partnerships still remain to be established, as you
already heard, but the workforce community has
limited information about the strategic approaches
that SBS envisions for each one. There are also open
questions about the Workforce 1 Centers and, you
know, you--you actually asked many of them. For
instance, how will the Workforce 1 Centers be
reconceived to harmonize with Career Pathways? What
role will Workforce 1 Sector Centers play? How will

provider contracts embody these changes? SBS hasn't really yet, as you see, I mean it hasn't disclosed plans in these areas. But a concern here is not so much purely government transparency and accountability, but effectiveness. As we know, I mean SBS has traditionally been among the strongest entities in the--in the city development Workforce policy and running programs, and engaging employers. But despite the demonstrated capacity, these highly complex initiatives benefit from the input of experts, stakeholders and, of course, elected officials. [bell] More input is better than less so the policy dialogue should be open as widely as possible. The next observation is that CUNY is highly important, yet it's not adequately integrated into Career Pathways, which again, it's something that's come up in this hearing. In a system that relies on the education and training, all roads lead to CUNY. Some aspects of CUNY's role appear to be going well such as its participation in industry partnerships and--and its expansion of CUNY ASAP. But key elements of the Career Pathways framework do not appear to be making headway at CUNY such as Credit for Prior Learning, Stackable Credentials and

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 120

Competency-Based Learning in general. These elements are important for CUNY's ability to support the career needs of adult students, engage more effectively with employers, and coordinate its programs with those of non-profit workforce providers. This is another area that would benefit from more open conversations about what progress has been made. And the last is that New York State--this is really a call to advocacy. New York State lags behind in developing its own Career Pathways initiative, and supporting New York City. The state role in Career Pathways is really very critical. Governor Cuomo oversees the Regional Economic Development Council--Corporations, disburses that we owe our governors, set-aside funds, and manages the Tuition Assistance Program. The Department of Labor oversees the city's implementation of the State Workforce Plan. The Board of Regents disburses all adult literacy funding, and approves new career and technical education programs. The State Legislature has an important voice in all of these, and many other workforce related decisions. Unfortunately, state policymakers have not yet come to grips with changing--the changing labor market in the

1 intentional way that New York City has. So,
2 educating these policymakers over time will be
3 essential to the city's ability to operationalize the
4 Career Pathways strategy. So these are few of our
5 concerns, but our overall assessment is that Career
6 Pathways framework as it's being implemented bears
7 much promise to radically improve the city's ability
8 to improve the lives of people who face barriers and
9 disadvantages in achieving self-sufficiency through
10 work. And if we were to pick one achievement in
11 Career Pathways that stands a head above the rest,
12 it's the very fact that through the efforts of the
13 Mayor's Office of Workforce Development, the New York
14 City Employment Training Coalition and--and others,
15 New York City's workforce community is now speaking
16 the language of training, basic skills, job quality,
17 and meaningful employer engagement.

19 The primary discussion about public
20 workforce development programs used to be about the
21 hustle to meet job placement targets. Today, the
22 workforce community is now more aware that getting
23 someone to his job is not the end goal, but only the
24 beginning of a job seeker's path to self-sufficiency
25 through employment. Closely related to that big

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 122

achievement is the city's newly enlarged appetite for
innovation in the workforce area. Recognizing that
many of the strongest and most effective programs in
the city have been catalyzed and funded by private
philanthropy, the city particularly HRA, SBS and the
Mayor's Office Workforce Development have been
working more closely than ever with the Workforce
Funders Group, a group of foundations that
collectively represent the most generous infusion of
public--of private money by far of any American city.
By joining forces to build on philanthropy's legacy
of innovation, the Workforce system stands a better
chance of lifting up what works and measuring what
matters. Thank you for the opportunity to testify.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Well, thank you
very much for thank and thanks to all of you for
your--your testimony today. And I will note that I
think that most of us share the view that it is very
good that--that the administration is now speaking
the language of quality employment. We also want to
make sure that they are still measuring how they are
doing, and that we have goals and timetables for even
their--their higher aspirations. So, we appreciate

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

123

that. We're going to go to a question from Council
Member Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very
much, Mr. Chair, and the co-chairs that are having
this hearing. I have a question for Mr. Rivera,
Gonzalez Rivera.

CHRISTIAN GONZALEZ RIVERA: Uh-huh.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: In your
testimony, you cited CUNY as having a highly
important yet not adequately integrated--being
integrated into Career Pathways. And as the Chair of
Higher Education, I'm very much concerned about that.
And you indicate that there--they did not appear to
be making headway at CUNY such as credit for prior
learning, staff worker credential and competency base
learning, stackable credentials, and competency-based
learning in general. So are there some timelines,
that they have not met that they're falling behind
on, or some goals that they have not reached?
Because I certainly would like to ask them what's--
what's their situation on that?

CHRISTIAN GONZALEZ RIVERA: Well, I mean
as--as you know, a few of the recommendations in the
Career Pathways Report actually direct connect--

connect directly to--to CUNY's role in--in building
up the system. And the--the concern really has been
that we haven't really seen what progress has been
made outside of curriculum development for the--for
the industry partnerships. We already heard from--
from Katie that she believes that some of the--the
holdup might be that CUNY has been working on, on an
ASAP program and building up the base of that program
right now. But what we're hoping to see is that in
the next year that CUNY is going to start moving on
these other areas, and start coordinating with the
City much more closely because one of the issues, of
course, is that you have some people that have maybe
one year of college, maybe a few--a few credits, et
cetera. But haven't been able to really leverage
that and build on that to get the credentials that
they need in order to be competitive in the labor
force. And so, right now there's not an easy system
for people who have only partially completed their
degrees to be able to go ahead and finish that. So,
we're hoping that CUNY and the City are going to be
able to move further on that in the coming year.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And one other
brief question. Jobs First, in your statement you

1
2 said that there is a program J.P. Morgan Chase and
3 Company through its New Skills at the Work, and the
4 Howard Shultz Starbuck program through its 100
5 Opportunities. They serve as examples of
6 philanthropy solutions. Aren't those programs,
7 though, that are for people who are already working
8 in their workforce in there? Because I know the
9 Starbuck's if you work, they give you some support
10 for going to--towards tuition. Is that the program
11 that you're talking about?

12 MARJORIE PARKER: No, so that was the
13 first Starbuck's program. So initially when Howard
14 Schultz got involved was just his concern around the
15 number of young people who are out of work in all the
16 schools. So, they started the first initiative,
17 which is to try to get Starbuck's to hire locally.
18 So they train them, and they get access to college.
19 This initiative is a national initiative. There are
20 40 private sector employers on board. They're
21 launching in Chicago with the Mayor of Chicago.
22 That's not for right now, but endorsing that, and
23 they have 400 employers who showed for a job fair.
24 They hired 800 kids, 18 to 24-year-olds, 24-year-old,
25 yeah, an adult. They want to launch in New York

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS 126

City, and they--they've not gotten a good reception because people think of it most as a job fair, but this a long-term strategy. All these employers who have an interest in the talent develop--development pipeline for their industries recognize that a fifth of the U.S. future workforce actually sits in the crowded school out-of-work population. It's 5.5 million nationally, and so it's a different initiative. It is--it is 100,000 young adults, 18 to 24 by 2018, and they're launching in about six to seven cities. And New York is one of the targeted cities, and they're looking to launch here in 2017, if the Mayor can come on board.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

MARJORIE PARKER: May I answer your CUNY question just a little bit expound on what Christian about CUNY?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Sure.

MARJORIE PARKER: Sure. So--so CUNY, I mean we've--we also do research in--in a lot of the issues that we discussed here today, and we, you know. We talk to CUNY a lot. CUNY has deep issues. It has the worst college graduation rate across the two-year college system in the entire country. They

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

127

have issues that they need to address internally, and
the alignments that they need to work on with the
high schools in order to make sure that people
getting up to the colleges don't exhaust their
financial aid taking a lot of remedial courses--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]

Right.

MARJORIE PARKER: --which is what ASAP
aims to do, and we feel like in many ways they need
to address some of those infrastructure issues before
they can even engage in some of the other things that
the city is asking them to because they--they need to
figure that out. And so, there's a lot work to be
done throughout the city for recognizing that CUNY is
where people should go to get these vocational
trains--some of these vocational training skills.
The colleges are better recognized by employers, but
they have a lot of work to do.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I thank you for
that, and I realize that and I've had discussion with
CUNY about that, and part of what they have responded
to me is that not everyone who's coming into the
city--the CUNY system wants a degree, but that they
certainly want some kinds of certificates or

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

128

programs. So, they're--they don't --they don't yet
have a metric to be able to validate that students
are dropping off or dropping out, and that they
didn't just want to come for particular classes. So
we're working on that, and we're looking on that, but
thank you for your testimony.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Well, we thank
you all again, and we're going to leave it there, and
I'm going to thank everybody who has participated in
the hearing today, my colleges, the staff who helped
prepare us for the hearing, and we look forward to
continuing this conversation. Obviously, we've made
some progress here, but we have a long way to go both
on measurement and delivering of the right outcomes.
So with that, we thank you and this hearing is
adjourned. [gavel]

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR AND THE
COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS

129

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 30, 2016