

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

October 7, 2015
Start: 10:05 a.m.
Recess: 12:49 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E:
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

ANTONIO REYNOSO
CARLOS MENCHACA
COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES
DANIEL R. GARODNICK
DAVID G. GREENFIELD
DEBORAH L. ROSE
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
I. DANEK MILLER
JAMES G. VAN BRAMER
JAMES VACCA
MARGARET S. CHIN
STEPHEN T. LEVIN

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Polly Trottenberg
Commissioner
New York City Department of Transportation

Ryan Russo
Deputy Commissioner of Transportation Planning
Management
New York City Department of Transportation

Jeff Lynch
Assistant Commissioner of Intergovernmental and
Community Affairs
New York City Department of Transportation

Keith Kerman
Deputy Commissioner of Fleet Management
Department of Citywide Administrative Services

Bill Heinzen
Chairman
Taxi and Limousine Commission

Debbie Kahn
Families for Safe Streets

Veronica Vanterpool
Executive Director
Tri-State Transportation Campaign

Paul Steely White
Executive Director
Transportation Alternatives

Eric McClure
Executive Director
StreetsPAC

Alex Slaciom [sp?]
AAA Northeast

United Taxi Driver Association

A P P E A R E N C E S (CONTINUED)

Steven Bellman

Michael O'Loughlin
Campaign Director
Cab Riders United

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good morning and welcome to today's hearing of the New York City Council Transportation Committee. I'm Ydanis Rodriguez, Chair of the Committee. And I am joined by my colleague Council Member Vacca. Last year our city embark on... on process aim of reducing to zero the number of injuries and deaths occurring to our in... on our streets. During the time since Mayor de Blasio committed to achieving vision zero in New York City the DOT has been hard at work carrying out his vision. Through streets redesigning and construction, rethinking intersections, and building bike lanes and speed bumps we are moving forward. This committee and the council have been... have done its part as well. Passing a series of bill... bills last spring to bolster our city's efforts. Through a... through this work we saw traffic related deaths drop to... But with our street goal... our true goal of making that number zero understanding that all traffic deaths are preventable. And just this morning we saw the results of the... hard work. Zero pedestrian fatalities by city... code this year. So thank you

Commissioner and the whole administration for accomplish this important goal. This is another great step forward. But what lies in our future and how we can translate this victory is a... is... is still something that we will be talking about it today. Today's hearing is meant to be a review of the work done over the past year. What measurable statistic are we prioritizing? Where have we hitting our target and where can we improve? What programs have been efficient in producing results and which programs need some extra attention. What funding needs exist... exist at your agencies and what can... how can we help? One particular area of interest for myself is around the capital project carry out by DOT and looking at way in which we can be... we can be more aggressive in the construction. Changing our streetscape is a proven method of lowering the numbers of traffic related injuries and deaths across the five boroughs. And if additional capital dollars are necessary to ramp up this process we should be working to allocate. Additionally, much of this work in achieving vision zero related to enforcement... is related to enforcement or traffic... by the NYPD. We want to

know if this enforcement has been up to par if police have been sufficient in taking bad actors off of the road and holding accountable those who drive recklessly and injure or kill others. A large part of this plan also related to cyclists in the other is partial to dangerous traffic. Early this week I outline a vision for our cities street... streetscape and transportation as a whole and strategies on improving the efficiency and safety in the ways New Yorkers move our... move about our city. While cycling remains efficient there are real safe... safety concern that continue to warrant apprehension. The landmark we hit a couple of weeks ago was a testament of this goal. A thousand miles of bike lanes. But to better encourage cycling people must feel safer, meaning protected bike lanes are most effective and even have a spillover effect making a street safer for all. Yesterday at my ...stop NYC lunch I announced my dedication to helping the Department of Transportation install an additional 1,000 lane over the next 14 year as well as expanding the protected lane program so that 200 of those 1,000 additional lanes can be protected. I also committed

to working to fund the DOT to increase operational capacity so more vision zero related projects can be completely... quickening our pace to achieving our goal of zero pedestrian deaths by 20... 2024. Today I interested... interested in hearing what the challenge have been, not only around bike lane installation but around the plan as a whole. How the administration being made we push back on achieving these goals. And where do you see your biggest road blocks in implementing your best policies and projects? Finally I'm interested in hearing how education has factored into the Vision Zero plans both for our children and for adults. We must relearn appropriate practice when driving. How much has the DOE been involved in this process? And how is the Vision Zero curriculum being shape? Some advocate have pointed to the educational aspect to this as a victim blaming under the believe that education is attempting to teach kids to avoid cars rather than teaching car to avoid kids. I hope that any education are being done with young people is pedestrian and cyclists oriented with the understanding that those behind the wheels have a greater propensity for harm and must therefore be

most carefully in their approach. I can say first hand that children can teach the parent a great deal and encourage the DOE and DOT to be thoughtful in what message we are relating... relaying to our youth and citizens. In addition to education in our schools I will like to inquire about the resources... on our broader public awareness campaign. Though I have been a numerous ad... a... I have seen numerous add throughout my district and the city this campaign can yet reach the level of public dis... dis... discourse as Mayor Bloomberg anti-smoking campaign. And I know that this administration with the... Mayor de Blasio is also committed to increase this campaign. We can continue to boost this message across numerous platform and outlets so that the citizens of our city can change they minds and we truly achieve a real cultural change where we learn how to interact cyclists, drivers, and pedestrians. I would like to thank my committee staff Counsel Kelly Taylor, Policy Analyst Jonathan Masserano, Gafar Zaaloff, and Russell Murphy as well as my staff Carmen de la Rosa, and Lucas Acosta for the great leadership helping me in my role as a chairman of this committee in putting

1 together this hearing. Now I welcome... before I also
2 like to recognize Council Member Garodnick and
3 Council Member Miller. And now I would like to
4 welcome New York City DOT Commissioner Polly
5 Trumberg... Trottenberg and ask our committee counsel
6 to administer the affirmation to the representative
7 of the DOT who are here and then invite them to
8 deliver their testimony.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL TAYLOR: Can you
11 please raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell
12 the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the
13 truth in your testimony before the committee today
14 and to respond honestly to council member
15 questions? Thank you.

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Thank you Mr.
17 Chairman. Good morning Chairman Rodriguez and
18 members of the Transportation Committee. I'm Polly
19 Trottenberg, the Commissioner of the New York City
20 Department of Transportation. Today I'm joined by
21 Ryan Russo, DOT's Deputy Commissioner for
22 Transportation Planning and Management, and Jeff
23 Lynch, DOT's Assistant Commissioner of
24 Intergovernmental and Community Affairs. Also
25 joining us is Keith Kerman, Deputy Commissioner for

Fleet Management at DCAS. We're glad to be here today to discuss the city's progress on Mayor Bill de Blasio's Vision Zero initiative to eliminate traffic deaths and serious injuries. As we close in on our second year of Vision Zero it's clear that our combined efforts have begun to save lives and change the safety culture on our streets. But we have much more to do. Even one traffic death is too many. I first want to thank Speaker Mark-Viverito, Chairman Rodriguez, and the city council for your support and partnership in pursuing Vision Zero. I also want to express the city's deep appreciation to Transportation Alternatives and Family for Safe Streets whose leadership and forceful advocacy on Vision Zero have been essential to our street safety work. This has been a great team effort by the de Blasio administration as members of the Vision Zero task force including the Mayor's Office, DOT, NYPD, DCAS, TLC, Department of Health, and MTA have been hard at work developing and implementing strategies to keep pedestrians, motorists, cyclists, and motorcyclists safe. So far more encouraged by our progress in 2014 we recorded the fewest pedestrian fatalities on our streets

1 since the city started keeping records in 1910 and
2 we had one of the safest years overall. And as of
3 today 2015 has the potential to be even safer.
4 While it takes over a year to get full data
5 regarding injuries from the state we do know that
6 in 2014 the NYPD saw an eight percent decline in
7 pedestrian injuries reported as compared to 2013.
8 So far this year the numbers are even more
9 encouraging. From January through August 2015 NYPD
10 reports roughly 950 fewer pedestrian injuries as
11 compared to the same period of 2014, 13 percent
12 decline. While it's still early and we know
13 progress on Vision Zero will not always be linear
14 we do believe that many of the key initiatives the
15 city is pursuing are making a difference,
16 particularly stronger NYPD enforcement, our ongoing
17 street projects, the 25 mile an hour speed limit,
18 and expanded speed camera enforcement. I'm happy to
19 announce that the city recently achieved an
20 important milestone for our fleet of 27,000
21 vehicles. It has been more than a full calendar
22 year since a city government vehicle has been
23 involved in a fatal crash. This accomplishment is
24 due in part to DCAS' work to make vehicles safer
25

with new technology and their efforts to encourage safe driving behavior. I also want to thank the dedicated city employees who've embraced Vision Zero and are driving safer and smarter. This year DOT released our five Vision Zero borough pedestrian safety action plans, I'll hold up the Bronx. These data driven... data driven plans thoroughly analyze the unique conditions of each New York City borough and identify characteristics of pedestrian fatalities and severe injuries within that borough. To develop these plans, we work with the council and many of you to host 28 Vision Zero town halls and hands on workshops throughout the city. We combine that local community input along with over 11,000 responses from our interactive website with five years of detailed crash data. All of this input shaped our comprehensive work plans which focused DOT and NYPD resources at the most crash prone locations in each borough. These priority corridors and intersections disproportionately account for pedestrian fatalities and severe injuries. On average half of all pedestrians who were killed or seriously injured from 2009 to 2013 were struck on only eight percent

of each boroughs corridors. Further, approximately one percent of each borough's intersections account for 15 percent of pedestrian fatalities and serious injuries. Our borough plans guide our work providing the where and how for our safety engineering improvements, targeted enforcement and educational campaigns. Some of the priority streets and intersections are highlighted on the maps over here to my right and include many streets we know throughout the city; in the Bronx, Grand Concourse, Fordham Road, Bruckner Boulevard, in Manhattan Canal Street, 34th Street, and Broadway, in Queens Jamaica Avenue, Queens Boulevard, and Northern Boulevard, in Brooklyn Flatbush Ave., Atlantic Ave., and Ocean Parkway, and in Staten Island Richmond Ave, Highland Boulevard, and Victory Boulevard. In the eight months since our pedestrian action plans were released we've completed 26 new Vision Zero safety projects and another 28 are underway. One exciting project we just completed which is on the board over here to the side is located at the intersections of Atlantic, Washington, and Underhill Avenues in Brooklyn. At this complex intersection we improved safety by

shortening crosswalks, adding new crosswalks, improving turns to reduce conflicts, and banning problematic turns. On the first segment of our signature Vision Zero great streets project on Queens boulevard... we also have the poster up there, we've constructed pedestrian islands, added a bike lane and new pedestrian space, upgraded pedestrian ramps, and made changes to better organize the traffic. We are nearing the completion of the operational phase of this exciting project and capital work will commence in fiscal year '18. I'm also pleased to announce today that we will be kicking off our efforts to tackle the next segment of Queens Boulevard from 73rd Street to Elliot Street at a community workshop this fall... Elliot Avenue, excuse me. Additionally, as part of the borough plans we've installed nearly 300 Leading Pedestrian Intervals, known as LPIs. LPIs provide pedestrians with a head start before turning traffic is released thereby reducing conflicts. We're currently proactively evaluating every school crosswalk on a priority corridor and every priority intersection for this treatment. We've also installed 245 speed humps this year, calming

1 traffic on our neighborhood streets. After
2 successfully passing the speed camera legislation
3 with the support of our Albany partners in the
4 council in 2014, I'm proud to report that we
5 completed the installation and activation of all
6 120 additional speed cameras in time for the first
7 day of school this year. We focused our 100 fixed
8 speed cameras in school zones around the city with
9 a particular emphasis on high crash locations and
10 locations with high rates of speeding. DOT also
11 deploys an additional 40 mobile units which can be
12 repositioned daily for maximum effectiveness. Over
13 the past year we found the daily speed camera
14 violations have dropped by an average of 60 percent
15 at fixed camera locations. Also as part of our
16 speed camera program we've installed 38 hundred
17 speed limit signs with the photo enforced message
18 to remind drivers to watch their speedometers and
19 that speed cameras may be active in the area. Under
20 Vision Zero we're also focusing on cycling safety.
21 Well-designed bike lanes not only protect
22 bicyclists but also reduce excessive speeding,
23 organize traffic flow, and protect pedestrians
24 crossing the street. They're a fundamental part of
25

Vision Zero's strategy to increase safety for all roadway users. New Yorkers today can ride on our 1,010-mile bike network of which over 380 miles are protected from traffic and nearly another 380 miles are exclusive bike lanes. We are on track to build over 12 miles of protected lanes by the end of 2015, an unprecedented pace for our department. One long anticipated problem... project, excuse me, that will soon be completed is on the Pulaski Bridge where we're adding a protected bike lane.

Additionally, our partner agency DCAS has implemented a series of important initiatives as part of Vision Zero. They have trained over 23,000 city staff in a one-day defensive driving and safety course. This course also includes screening of a powerful film featuring Members of Family for Safe Streets. DCAS has outfitted nearly 20,000 city government vehicles with tracking devices known as canseeverers [phonetic] to monitor speeding, hard braking, hard acceleration, and seatbelt use. We'll be able to use records from these devices to make our streets even safer. DCAS is also making advancing... advances with new physical improvements to the... the fleet such as truck sideguards. So far

160 trucks from 20 agencies have been retrofitted with truck sideguards. In addition, consistent with local law 56 passed in 2015 DCAS is now requiring sideguards as part of new city truck procurements.

I want to compliment Council Member Johnson for his leadership on this bill and of course thank my

colleague Keith Kerman for all his leadership and

that of Commissioner Cumberbatch. In closing, I'd

like to talk about some of the next steps we'll be

taking in our Vision Zero efforts. First I want to

announce that in order to reinvigorate our 20-year-

old red light camera program we will be relocating

approximately 30 of 150 cameras to new locations.

The red light camera program has been proven

effective at deterring red light running. Over the

life of the program the average number of

violations issued daily by each camera has dropped

by 71 percent, from 31 in 1994 to nine per day in

2014. DOT is also at the forefront of exploring new

technology to improve safety. Last month I was

honored to stand with you as DOT Secretary Anthony

Fox, you Chairman Rodriguez, Council Member Van

Bramer to announce that the city had won a highly

competitive 20-million-dollar federal grant for a

connected vehicle pilot deployment program. The program will deploy cutting edge wireless technology in up to 10,000 New York City DOT vehicles, taxis, MTA busses, and UPS trucks that will alert drivers to hazards on the road, help pedestrians and cyclists safely cross the street, warn truck drivers of height restrictions and sharp turns ahead, and hopefully significantly reduce crashes. This pilot will enable us to learn how this potentially game changing safety technology can operate successfully on our busy city streets. We also have many exciting upcoming street safety improvement projects including a plan for a protected bike lane on 6th Avenue between 14th and 33rd Streets in Manhattan which we'll be presenting to the community board this fall. In Queens we are reengineering sections of Astoria Boulevard to improve safety by shortening crossings, adding new crossings, and normalizing the street's geometry. As we move forward with Vision Zero we continue to rely on the council's support on projects like these throughout the city. You all... you all are our partners in Vision Zero work on our local safety projects, education, and enforcement and our

legislative efforts both here in the city and up in Albany. And I know that all of us rely on the dedicated, creative, and hard-working team at New York City DOT. I want to thank our borough offices, our traffic engineers, our planners, our safety educators, our legal policy and government affairs experts, and all the other DOT staff and leadership who help make the goals of Vision Zero a reality. Thank you again for inviting me to speak today. I'm happy to answer any questions.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Commissioner. I like to recognize my other colleague who was here, Council Member Van Bramer, Lander, Greenfield, Menchaca. I have few question and then my colleagues also has question. A... how... you know one thing that I... the... the... in this conference that took place during the... section there was one with major leaders around the world. And one question that I... in those conversation with some of those leader one of the question that I ask was how does... how does other city in the world look at New York City as we are moving on Vision Zero and the new changes. And one thing that one of the person say was enforcement. How the city... for this

1 is like... you know what other people are seeing from
2 the outside. And their comment was that no doubt
3 that New York City with Vision Zero is you know
4 moving great, having a major impact in the
5 perception how people see the city outside the
6 country. But the question was how much are we
7 enforcement... how are we doing enforcement? Because
8 you know it's not just a policy that we put in... put
9 in place it's like are we sending the message to
10 New Yorker, to the five borough, that there's a new
11 rules on how we drive in New York City and... on
12 Vision Zero? How much do you think we have made
13 progress on enforcing the new regulation that we
14 have put in place on Vision Zero? And what
15 challenges do we see on doing like a full... fuller
16 enforcement of all the rule and regulation part of
17 Vision Zero?

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: It's a good
20 question. And look I think we are very proud again
21 from the de Blasio's administration at the fact
22 that we have a great coalition of so many agencies
23 and that our leadership and direction comes from
24 the Mayor and as you know NYPD under the leadership
25 of Transportation Chief Channing, Commissioner

Bratton has been very very engaged and has really I think stepped up their enforcement all over the city. I mean it's very interesting working closely with them. They have a lot of enforcement challenges, a lot of things that they're called to do but I certainly think particularly with these are our borough safety plans where we have targeted real geographies where the two agencies work together to get at dangerous behavior. I mean I would also say Mr. Chairman that automated enforcement is also an incredibly important piece because the NYPD Commissioner Bratton says it himself can't always be everywhere all the time. And so you know we are excited that we were able to get all the speed cameras that we... were authorized up in Albany up in time for the school year. As I mentioned in my testimony we're going to be redeploying some of our red light cameras to put them in some fresh locations. So we're going to try and make the best possible use we can of our automated technology. And I know many of us think at some point we'll be wanting to go back up to Albany and see if we can't get some further authorization to make better use of that

1
2 technology. We also think too and you have been a
3 big champion of this you can't do everything
4 through enforcement. Public education is an
5 extraordinarily important piece of the puzzle. And
6 you know one thing we've been pleased to do... we've
7 done a lot of polling as we rolled out the new
8 speed limit and the cameras and we have really seen
9 a great increase in the percentage of New Yorkers
10 that are aware of our efforts and aware of the
11 things we're doing. So we really hope that public
12 awareness is also helping you know bring out better
13 behavior.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I will go to
15 the public awareness but before getting there I...
16 does it... NYPD share the data information of... with
17 DOT or and how much do they enforce or how many
18 ticket they give to drivers who park the car in
19 bike lane or block the bike lane area.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: I mean we... we
21 communicate with them throughout the city at the
22 borough command and the precinct level and you know
23 I think they have been ever refining their data
24 collection. I think you know probably good to also
25 have them in to talk in some of the details about

1
2 some of the advancements they're making there. And
3 I think they are trying to you know increasingly
4 compile and be transparent about the... that type of...
5 those types of enforcement actions that they're
6 taking.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I... I just think
8 that you know first of all you been a leader of
9 expanding the bike lane. You know so we celebrate
10 1,000-mile accomplishment, goal for the future. But
11 I think that we need to send a message louder and
12 clear through the education and through enforcement
13 that driver cannot block bike lane. And I can yes a
14 father of two daughter when I go and get a bike
15 with my daughters even today I don't feel that... you
16 know I prefer it to be driving around the Hudson
17 River Drive or going to Central Park but I don't
18 feel that the street is it still safe today as
19 should be for a parent to say my child... my child is
20 safe driving his bike in a bike lane. So I think
21 that you know as we continue working together with
22 educational but also I think that enforcement have
23 to be taken to a higher level so that we are really
24 protected bike lane a... from a car... a... from drivers
25 in our city. So my other concern is the educational

1
2 part of Vision Zero. When... when we measure how much
3 we are doing our advertising in the public radio or
4 television and... I know that we have since run ad...
5 it's not that we have not seen, I think that we
6 have, and of course like we also allocated the
7 money, the five million dollars I think from the
8 council to work with... how much was it five or...

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Two... two and
10 a half.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Two and a half.
12 So whatever amount we put there I know that we
13 would talk about how to use that 2.5. And the goal
14 is for educational advertising. But so far I have
15 not seen the level of advertising of educational
16 warnings in the city as we have done with the anti-
17 smoking campaign. What is... what can we do to take
18 that public awareness of Vision Zero to that level
19 that we took anti-smoking campaign?

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Right. And...
21 and first again I want to thank you Mr. Chairman
22 and the council for providing us with those
23 additional resources. I... I think we have been very
24 proud of the... particularly the... the advertising
25 campaign we've had this summer. It's been very

1 powerful and I... certainly I know a lot of people
2 have just mentioned it to me anecdotally. As you
3 know we do work in 500 schools every year. We work
4 with senior centers. We do a tremendous amount of
5 both hands on training with kids and other New
6 Yorkers and then also our larger public advertising
7 campaign. We ran it a lot this summer. We are now
8 doing some evaluation trying to gage effectiveness
9 which is particularly in terms of looking at when
10 you poll people or you do focus groups whether they
11 heard the messages, whether they resonated, whether
12 they think it's going to help change behavior. I
13 think moving forward we... we hear you. We want to I
14 think continue to work with the council about how
15 we stretch the dollars we have and make sure we're
16 maximizing the impact. And I think we have... we have
17 talked to the Department of Public Health. There
18 are definitely some lessons to be learned about
19 some of the great campaigns about some of the great
20 campaigns like the anti-smoking campaign that have
21 been so effective.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. So today
24 it... it was announced right that we... we have a zero
25 pedestrian death of handle... of the... of the larger

1
2 municipal fleet. What was done by the city agency
3 to be able to bring to zero, the number of people
4 being killed by... by city cars?

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I think
6 Deputy Commissioner Kerman just has been a great
7 leader on that.

8 KEITH KERMAN: Hi, thank you. Keith
9 Kerman from DCAS. We've done our... a number of
10 things and so I'll go through a few. One we created
11 the first citywide tracking system for collisions
12 for all the city agencies. You know up until two
13 years ago each agency tracked collisions and trends
14 and managed those issues independently. So we
15 couldn't have reported these statistics. And... and
16 that has helped us tremendously including
17 identifying a lot of interesting things including
18 that... you know something like that rear-end events
19 which are among the most preventable result in over
20 half of injury relating events allowing us to
21 target a very particular theme. So the first thing
22 was actually creating a collision tracking system
23 for traffic preventable collisions. Number two
24 we've trained... we've brought... we're bring...
25 basically all the authorized drivers into... for...

1 into DCAS or their agencies for training. So we're
2 over 23,000 city employees who've gone through a
3 full one-day safety defensive driving training
4 including as the commissioner mentioned a very
5 specific discussion of Vision Zero, a very
6 powerful, showings of some of the Safe Street's
7 videos that have been produced and it's been very
8 impactful. We think that... that's mattered. In
9 addition, we have placed speed tracking devices now
10 on 20,000 city vehicles. It's probably the largest
11 telematics vehicle effort in the country or
12 certainly one of them. We still are completing
13 that. We're getting to kind of the more difficult
14 technical units, the more specialized units which
15 aren't as easily to install. But that's been a big
16 change you know. So if you're driving a city
17 vehicle now what goes on... your speed, your
18 accelerating, your braking... that's all being
19 tracked in the matter of record. And in that I
20 think is an important you know signal and I... gets
21 the attention of city drivers. We're also doing a
22 lot of other things looking at the specifications...
23 other specifications for vehicles, testing the
24 mobile I driver alert system. And on November 5th

1 we'll have our second forum where we communicate
2 and bring in private fleets across the city to talk
3 about their best practices. So a... a lot of
4 different efforts happening and... and really it's
5 you know the progress we've made and we still want
6 to make a lot more progress. But the progress we
7 made really is a result of employees from 50
8 separate agencies. There are 50 city agencies that
9 operate our fleet and it's really everybody moving
10 together that... that's making progress on this front
11 for us.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And again I
14 don't... I don't know if it's doable or no but if
15 it's doable I just also make the suggestion that
16 you... the DCAS or with the leadership with DOT as a
17 Vision Zero, the agency leading Vision Zero to sit
18 down with the private sector and share the same
19 practice that has been able to produce that zero
20 fatality by city cars and vehicles to the private
21 sector. I think especially starting with those
22 doing business with the city or providing business
23 with the city. Those new contracts in DOT on
24 construction or UPS FEDEX... anyone that have like a
25 large fleet of truck or car I think that they

1
2 should be able to be to bring... to be bring to the
3 table in a volunteer base so that you can share the
4 group practice that you have done that have produce
5 the zero. You think this is something that the city
6 is an ability to do?

7 KEITH KERMAN: Oh sure, absolutely. So
8 on November 5th at the Queens theatre in the park...
9 in Flushing Meadow Park, we will have our second
10 fleet forum. And the focus of that forum is in fact
11 to bring in private fleets. And we had a great
12 forum last year. And this is bringing in the same
13 fleets that you just mentioned, the... you know the
14 private bus companies, the private waste haulers,
15 the private you know van companies and... and other
16 business companies and to share ideas, to have them
17 present on what they're doing for us to kind of
18 push some of the ideas... And I'll give you an
19 example which obviously your leadership was
20 critical to. We presented with the federal
21 government, with Volpe last year on the sideguard
22 report that we did. And that report of course is
23 now law. And the waste industry which is part of
24 the law the... the regulated commercial waste injury
25 we know that they're beginning to install side

guards because they're coming... [cross-talk] to us and asking about that.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. So we would like to be a partner in that... in that event and working with you and DCAS and DOT even to expand the number of private sector that they can bring to the table. Because I just looking as how great it is that... so that we can say that... the... the city vehicle fleet have produce zero death in... in the street of New York City. So I think that this is a moment to share everything that come with a group practice and training and experience with whoever is doing business in the city and the rest of the... or any private sector who also can be interest or be part of this trend. Council Member Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you Mr. Chairman. Commissioner welcome again to this committee. Several things I wanted to bring up. I very much like the defensive driving course idea that was given to so many of thousands city employees. I'd like that extended to all city employees. And I think we have to find a way to do it interagency or through your agency. I think it

should be a requirement at this point. And I wanted to know your feelings on that and how we can do that.

KEITH KERMAN: Hi. Yeah it is being managed through DCAS in partnership with DOT and... and Sanitation and Parks and other agencies. And yes it is... it is right now basically offered to all city employees and required of all authorized drivers. So there are about 30...

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: You... you... you mean it's required of all people who drive a city car?

KEITH KERMAN: Who are... right who are authorized to drive a city vehicle... [cross-talk]. That's about 30,000...

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Right.

KEITH KERMAN: ...people [cross-talk]. Separate from fire and police on emergency response who do a different training because that's... they also train for emergency response events which are... are somewhat differently addressed since they're the only ones who... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: So you're saying that all city employees now are offered the

opportunity to go to defensive driving even... even if they don't have a city owned car? They're offered the opportunity?

KEITH KERMAN: We have not turned anyone away. Our focus on tracking is the authorized drivers list which is about 30,000 people but we have taken everybody who wants to take this course.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay. And how about requiring it? It's not now required?

KEITH KERMAN: It's not required of non-authorized drivers. That... that... you know we are not at the resource level to provide that at this point. We're... our focus has been to move through... and we're about 23 24 thousand of the... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay.

KEITH KERMAN: ...30,000. People who drive... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well I... I... I believe we have to look toward that. I would like us to look toward that to see how we can do it, what it would cost, how other agencies cooperate. But I think it should be a requirement. Speed cameras. I understand that we've been doing pretty well with summonses. 940,000 since the beginning of

1
2 last year I understand have been issued based on
3 the speed cameras near schools. And I wanted to
4 know do you intend to go back to Albany to try to
5 get more speed cameras during the next legislative
6 session and if so how many would you request?

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Well I think
8 yes. The... the... I think the speed camera program is
9 working effectively and again we're glad we were
10 able to get them all up in time for the start of
11 the school year. There are two separate issues as...
12 as I think the council is well aware. One is the
13 number because right 140 for a city the size of New
14 York's is still a pretty small number. But then
15 also the fact that they have a lot of restrictions
16 on them. We can only deploy them within a quarter
17 mile of a school that abuts the street when that
18 school is in operation. And you know unfortunately
19 many many fatalities and serious injuries happen
20 outside of school hours on major roadways that
21 don't necessarily abut a school but maybe roadways
22 that children are using to get to school. You know
23 the... the administration is still putting together
24 what its... what its legislative agenda for Albany is
25 going to be in the next session but certainly this

1
2 is an issue that has been high on my list and high
3 on the mayor's list.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Again I would
5 urge... I've always been an advocate of speed
6 cameras, especially near schools. And knowing the
7 number of schools we have in New York City and then
8 knowing that we should, in my opinion, also include
9 parochial and charter schools I... I think children
10 are entitled to a level of safety. So I would be
11 supportive of more speed cameras near schools in...
12 in Albany. And I would want to offer you my
13 support. And I think we should go back and we... we
14 should try to get more. I... I did want to say also
15 that we did in... we did approve here at the council
16 and Albany did approve a 25 mile an hour speed
17 limit and I understand that you're not the
18 enforcement agency of the city but I would like to
19 know if you are aware of how many summonses have
20 been issued since the 25 mile an hour speed limit
21 was enacted into law?

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: First of all,
23 thank you for your pledge of support on the speed
24 cameras. And again as... as the... as the
25 administration puts together its Albany agenda I'm

sure we will be in close communication with the council and seeking your support on what are our next steps on Vision Zero. I don't... I have to admit maybe some... but I don't have the NYPD statistics on their 25 mile an hour enforcement. We have seen certainly with our speed camera enforcement and as you pointed out yourself you know robust... robust summonses. Although I want to really point out about the speed cameras that number goes down pretty dramatically once people are caught basically going you know pretty high over the speed limit they usually modify their behavior pretty quickly and start to drive at a safe speed. So I... I think we feel you know we're looking at why... when we look at the numbers this year so far they're... they're looking... they're looking very promising. We always want to be careful. We won't know until the year comes to an end. But we do think the speed limit change that you all helped us get you past here and you helped us get and Albany has been a real decisive factor. One thing I've learned as I continue to do this Vision Zero work is speed is probably the most overriding and important thing we can affect. Whatever's happening behind the wheel

1
2 or on the street, people are inattentive, whatever
3 it would be if the vehicle is going at a slow and
4 safe speed on a city street if there is a collision
5 hopefully the results will be less catastrophic.
6 And so... [cross-talk]. And so we're going to
7 continue to...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I...

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: ...focus on
10 speed.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I... I thank you
12 Commissioner. I feel though that we cannot gage how
13 effective the reduction in the speed limit has been
14 until we see the number of summonses that have been
15 issued. And I need to have that information. And
16 now we... I guess we have to go to PD to get it. Over
17 the years I have found that speed limit signs have
18 too often been ignored when it was 30 miles an hour
19 they were ignored. And unless we put a... our... our
20 money where our mouth is whatever expression we
21 have to... have to use, unless we show that there's
22 going to be an accountability factor those speed
23 limit signs will not be as effective as they should
24 be. So I wait... I... I await for that answer. Two
25 things quickly I wanted to bring up. Sideguards...

1 there's three things... sideguards, I know you did
2 equip many city... city vehicles with sideguards but
3 we have many more vehicles that have not been
4 equipped with the side guards. And I understand
5 it's going to take eight years to get all the
6 vehicles equipped? [cross-talk] And I thought that
7 was a long period... [cross-talk]

8
9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Turn to my
10 colleague in... on that one.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: So if it's
12 working so well why can't we quicken that eight-
13 year period for the installation of sideguards?

14 KEITH KERMAN: Well the... the local law
15 provides I believe eight or even 10 years. We'll do
16 it quicker than that but there is a process. So you
17 know we have 160 installed. We'll have at least 240
18 done by the end of this year, about 320 installed
19 by the end of the fiscal year by June 30th. That's
20 always retrofits. And you know one of the things
21 that we found is there is a limitation, a technical
22 limitation to the ability to retrofit vehicles that
23 we already have that were not purchased with the
24 idea of this guard for whatever reason but they
25 weren't... you know there's a limitation to that. So

1 the... the other thing that we're doing is we have
2 required effective this fiscal year in all
3 contracts going forward right now we have rewritten
4 the specs for city trucks so that all the new
5 trucks we buy going forward will have guards. And
6 last week we actually got in the first truck bids
7 from all three of our major truck manufacturers for
8 the first set of contracts were actually DOT
9 trucks. And so all our major truck manufacturers
10 kind of have adopted and... and learned this
11 technology. So we normally buy you know about four
12 to 500 eligible trucks a year. So we should get
13 there between the retrofits and the new trucks you
14 know I think we'll get there a lot quicker than
15 eight to 10 years but it is still a process. This...
16 this is a new technology that the city has lead on.
17 We're building an industry to develop them. So
18 there're... there are more and more vendors getting
19 into the business of selling and designing guards
20 and that's very positive. But there are some
21 technical limitations that we have to work through.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Quickly I've
24 always felt that inherent in reducing pedestrian
25 fatalities is looking to reduce the number of

1 people who drive... especially who drive into the
2 central city. And I don't know what we're doing in
3 that regard. What are we doing to incentivize
4 people not to take their cars especially into the
5 central city. I've come out for the Move New York
6 plan originally. I think that's the way to go. I
7 don't think we can say that that's dead on arrival
8 in Albany and just say I'm not say... I'm not going
9 to admit that because something must be done. This
10 administration has seen fit to deny neighborhoods
11 like mine and others ferry service. Ferries are
12 another option for transportation starved deserts
13 which is my district and other districts in the
14 city. They have submitted a ferry plan which is a
15 spit in the ocean in my opinion no... no pun intended
16 but that's what it is. So what are we doing to get
17 people to not use their cars and buy... to improve
18 options.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Look for now
21 Council Member Vacca in absence of something like
22 Move New York which obviously would be a pricing...
23 you know would be a pricing and scheme and... and for
24 that one... look the mayor has said he wants
25 everything on the table in terms of considering

option. But for now we can focus very much on providing options that make it a good... you know make it an affordable and efficient alternative to using your car. And I think you know if you... it's interesting the city has experienced a lot of population growth. We have not experienced growth in at least registered auto ownership. And I think that's in part because people are as you know using the subways and busses more. They're biking. They're turning to alternative services like Uber, like Car2Go, like Zipcar. So I think one step in that is providing people with affordable and efficient choices. The ferry system will hopefully be another piece of that. Absent of what we would need to do up in Albany which is to get some kind of authorization to tackle also the... the pricing which affects the demand side.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Lastly, I want to be a little provincial, or parochial is the word, but it's a citywide issue. And that is painting yellow lines down the middle of a two-way street. I was out in my district yesterday on Country Club Road. It's a two-way narrow swerving road and you have parking on both sides, one lane east, one lane

1 west. And the yellow line is basically missing.
2 It's gone. So people who were driving were in the
3 other lane going both ways. So I noticed this
4 throughout my district. I bring it to your
5 attention because we need these yellow lines that
6 represent the divider between north and south east
7 and west... whatever it may be. We need a regular
8 schedule to we... to make sure that they are visible.
9 And what I saw yesterday on Country Club Road in my
10 district was a stock example of where they're not
11 visible. These issues... the likelihood of a accident
12 I feel increases. And I wanted to ask if you could
13 look into this as a citywide... is... is it a citywide
14 problem? I think it is but it may be something you
15 want to address.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right and
18 look we're... we're always happy obviously to look if
19 there are particular locations. But certainly... look
20 it's no secret the past couple years we've had
21 tough winters and we've been trying to catch up on
22 all our markings. We have got a brand new contract
23 in place and we are looking now at a lot of
24 techniques we think that are going to make the
25 markings last longer, using different types of

1 materials. Scoring the roadways so the markings
2 will stick. One good news about the mayor providing
3 us with addition... and the council providing us with
4 additional resources to do resurfacing is when you
5 resurface a road the markings are much likely to
6 stick as opposed to when you have a chewed up road.
7 So we... we hear you. We know this has been an issue
8 around the city and we're working very hard to get
9 ourselves caught up. But again if there are
10 particular... particular places in your districts
11 where you think there's something we really need to
12 take a look at obviously let us know and we'll...
13 we'll come take a look.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And before
16 calling my colleague I would... I'm happy to hear...
17 know that my colleague Vacca is in fully support of
18 Plan Move New York.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I supported it
20 before you, what are you...

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I just hope... I
22 just hope that he also... I just hope that when we
23 move on and... introducing a resolution on the 15
24 looking to get a council support this that MTA see
25 this as a New York City contribution to the MTA as

1
2 we make 74 percent of expense contribution to the
3 MTA. So at this moment when there's good
4 conversation going on I'm happy and I'm fully on
5 board. I'm moving a resolution. But I hope again
6 that this will be seen as another contribution that
7 New Yorkers make to the MTA. Council Member Miller.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Chair
9 Rodriguez. Thank you so much for your leadership on
10 this Vision Zero initiative. And Commissioner great
11 to see you and your team again. Several questions
12 but how would you quantify the success of Vision
13 Zero over the past few years and... and... and what
14 data do you have to support other than the
15 reduction in fatalities as it pertains to city
16 vehicles?

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean
18 Council Member I think for us fatalities and
19 serious injuries are the main ways we look to see
20 if we are succeeding. And again I think we saw last
21 year turned out to be a... a... you know a relatively
22 good year. We... we may be on track to do well this
23 year too. I mean beyond that we're tracking... we're
24 trying to track through polling and focus groups,
25 public opinion, public awareness. You know we're

1
2 also trying to... I mean part of our Vision Zero work
3 I would say is a little more intangible but we
4 think is also included which is we're tracking how
5 we're doing in remaking the city streets in making
6 them safe and attractive for all users and putting
7 in bike lanes and putting in medians and greenery
8 and some of the work we're doing around the city.
9 But the ultimate measure for us, the ultimate
10 measure of Vision Zero is reducing fatalities and
11 serious injuries.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So certainly...
13 but that was as it relates to the city owned fleet
14 right? Where are we in terms of overall vehicles
15 throughout the city?

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well we...
17 [cross-talk] we... you know last year was our second
18 lowest year for pedestrian fatalities. We were at
19 130... low... excuse me my lowest year... lowest year for
20 pedestrian fatalities at 139, second lowest for
21 overall traffic fatalities 257 since the city kept
22 records in... started keeping records in 1910. This
23 year... and this data is a couple days old because
24 there is a lag and unfortunately we've had a couple
25 fatalities. So we are at the moment at 165

1
2 fatalities year to date. This time last year we
3 were at 199. So we are... you know we are lower than
4 we were last year. But again the numbers jump
5 around and I always want to be cautious and... and
6 not... not get too confident about the data until we
7 hit our year end.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So I... I know
9 that there's a lot of varying initiatives involved
10 in Vision Zero but what... what are some of the
11 things that you would say were the greatest
12 contributionist to the reduction?

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah I've... I...
14 I mentioned before in my testimony that I think we...
15 we think of really had an effect... NYPD enforcement,
16 the street reengineering that we're doing. And
17 again I want to make clear we're... we've been doing
18 a lot of projects under the Vision Zero banner but
19 that's been a process the city has been doing for
20 many years of... of reengineering our streets,
21 reclaiming space for pedestrians and cyclists. I do
22 think we think that both the 25 mile an hour speed
23 limit and the full complement of speed cameras are
24 also having an effect.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So... and I want
3 to thank you for coming out and visiting the
4 district and you and your team and you... and you
5 guys have really been good on that. And our... Queens
6 Commissioner we were just out last week and
7 throughout the district and I think we've made some
8 real progress. But I do want to say that there
9 continues to be in my opinion a... disparity in the
10 attention that gets paid in the outer boroughs in
11 terms of number one enforcement. And I do recognize
12 that enforcement officers are of a premium. And...
13 but we tend to focus on certain areas... the downtown
14 areas and... and once those vehicles leave those
15 areas there's no real enforcement. I think we've
16 had that kind of conversation whether it was the
17 certain industries that was involved with that as
18 well as well as the actual electronic apparatuses
19 whether they'd be the... the light signals, cameras,
20 as well as these speed cameras we don't often see
21 them in some of the areas where I believe requires
22 more enforcement in the outer boroughs. So... which
23 kind of leads in... into my... my next question is who
24 are outside of your obvious partners that are in
25 this room when you go into communities... deep into

1 communities into... into within the five boroughs who
2 are the stakeholders and partners that we're
3 dealing with and... because I know that quite frankly
4 that I have not really been a major role player in...
5 in terms of... or been involved in Vision Zero. We
6 have conversations. And unfortunately usually after
7 a... a bad incident. But there are many people who...
8 who really want to play a real role in this and...
9 within the community. I know that because we get
10 those complaints. But I don't think that every
11 community has had real... really a voice access. So
12 what are we doing to make sure that we reach out to
13 those who... who want to be involved and really bring
14 something to the table?

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Yeah let... let
17 me... I think there's a couple questions there. Let
18 me try and tackle them in order. On the enforcement
19 question... as I had mentioned in my testimony we
20 really are trying to work closely with the NYPD to
21 target their enforcement and the use of our speed
22 cameras in all our enforcement areas where the data
23 sends us. That said we also look very much to input
24 that we get from local elected officials, from
25 community boards, from community groups. We want to

1 make sure we're also getting local input. So I
2 don't often get council members saying they wish
3 they had more speed cameras in their district. But
4 you know if you have areas where you think we need
5 to do more we'd love to talk to you about that and
6 obviously get with the NYPD. In terms of working
7 with local communities on the ground one of the
8 things I think that I have really found wonderful
9 about vision zero is that has been embraced by
10 neighborhoods all over the city of great diversity.
11 And again we... we often work with the local elected
12 officials, with community boards, with community
13 groups, sometimes just with interested groups of
14 citizens. If there are folks in any of your
15 communities who you would like us to come and meet
16 with, make presentations, hear ideas we really
17 welcome the chance to do that. I mean we very much
18 feel and you know this is something that's near and
19 dear to Mayor de Blasio that an initiative like
20 this, it needs to have a grassroots component, that
21 the people who... you know there in their
22 neighborhoods they know locally what they need to
23 see to have safer streets. So we... you know please
24 we would welcome the chance to meet with whoever

you thought in your district you know wanted to work with us on Vision Zero.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Certainly and... and I hope to be able to facilitate that. Just as a matter of clarification we weren't asking for more cameras. We were... we... we... but we were saying in lieu of obvious deficiency in physical enforcement, the lack of officers and... and... and manpower there that we have to come up with and what mechanisms and so whatever those mechanisms are we want to be able to share in those as well. And I know that recently something that was also near and dear consistent with some legislation that we just introduced in... which is TLC vehicles, licensed vehicles, being... being taken off the road by the agency had just been struck down in... in the courts. Do we... how are we looking at... obviously that was a real tool. We... have we gotten anywhere in terms of replacing that?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah and I... I'm sure you'll... you'll probably want us to come back at some point with TLC. Obviously there are still a lot of issues on the table there and ongoing dialogue how we're going to deal with that...

that court ruling and... and where we go from there.
And you know I know that Chairwoman Joshi has a lot
of thoughts on... you know she's been fiercely
committed to Vision Zero and working as best she
can within all the legal constraints... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yeah.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: ...that... that
she has.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I... I hope that's
not the end that... that we do have a response. And
certainly I would hope that the council would be in
support whatever the TLC would do moving forward
because that's an important tool in... in safety. So
thank you so much for coming out. Mr. Chairman
thank you for your leadership.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.
Council Member Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very
much Mr. Chairman. And I also will associate myself
with... I know separate from this hearing and Vision
Zero. But I think... for the... the record will show
that I was a supporter of Move New York in... pricing
even before either Council Member Vacca or the
Chair. But I really want to praise you for your...

1 the leadership that you're taking. Well we'll have
2 to look at the... well go to the tape. But... but I
3 want to praise the leadership that you took earlier
4 this week. And I think pushing those issues forward
5 especially at this moment is... is absolutely
6 critical. And you know if we are serious both about
7 reducing congestion and about funding mass transit
8 the only question is when we will implement some
9 version of the Move... Move New York or congestion
10 pricing plan and not if. And those who are saying
11 otherwise should get on the right side of history.
12 So thank you for your leadership there. Alright to
13 the topic of the... the... at hand first I want to say
14 thank you for really the leadership that you have
15 taken here to... you know to see the numbers come
16 down, to see enforcement numbers go up, to see the
17 number of places around the city where things are
18 moving forward. And then in my own district you
19 know you came out right after Mohammad Uddin was
20 killed just about a year ago, little over a year
21 ago and the speed with which you have moved forward
22 and we have moved together to bring dramatic safety
23 improvements, you know that school right across the
24 street from where he was killed open a month ago.
25

1 And we were all worried at the time we would not be
2 able to address the issues on Caton Avenue and... and
3 thanks to your leadership an enormous amount of
4 work has been done there that has that community
5 much much safer than it was. And I'm... I'm pleased
6 to hear from my other colleagues that's not a... you
7 know a one place thing that the work is being done
8 around the city driven by data and in partnership
9 with elected officials and... and community boards.
10 So thank you on all of that. The one area where I
11 want to focus on how I think we can still do even
12 better really does go to enforcement. And then the
13 links between enforcement and education and
14 behavior change. And the model here for me really
15 does remain. I think the advocates have done a good
16 job helping identify this. What happened around
17 drunk driving which you know 20 year... 25 years ago
18 was... was an accepted cultural practice and a
19 assertive campaign that linked enforcement,
20 education, and behavior change has helped transform
21 that. And while there is good education efforts and
22 while there is more enforcement than there... than
23 there was previously I still think there's a lot
24 more we could be doing to link them. We've started

1 in Brooklyn, working with the Brooklyn DA... with DA
2 Ken Thomson whose convened working with our office;
3 reckless driver... driver accountability taskforce
4 that Transportation Alternatives and Families for
5 Safe Streets have really been... been driving. But we
6 need that more coordinated, more systematic, more
7 thoughtful. NYPD as the numbers clearly show have
8 increased the number of failure to yield than... and
9 speeding tickets. But I don't... I don't feel like we
10 yet have a... a clear and coordinated strategy where
11 we know where that's happening, that it's target at
12 the intersections. There's dialogue between PD and
13 DOT and the DAs so that we get smart enforcement
14 both from the point of view of where it needs to be
15 but also then linked with dispute resolution and
16 behavior change overall. So the... the two things
17 we're trying to do in Brooklyn are one, make sure
18 there's real accountability so when someone does
19 hit and seriously injure or kill someone follow
20 that through the courts and make sure that the
21 judge knows that the community expects safety and
22 expects justice in those... in those incidents. ...we
23 continue to track the case of... of Mohammad Uddin
24 but others as well. Then on the other side to be

smart about how we link enforcement to behavior change. So somethings being pilot at the Red Hood Justice Center now which tries to take people who have been charged with a more minor you know non... not yet with a... a victim reckless driving, failure to yield and implement new model data driven programs that lead to behavior change. And what I hope we can do is then increase the places. You know the 78 precinct when... when Inspector Ameri who's now leading the... the Highway Division was the precinct commander in the 7th precinct, 78th precinct starting doing these sting type operations where you really watch for failure to yield. You stand at an intersection you're going to see failure to yield a great deal of the time. Let's get busy aggressively enforcing that. But rather than just have people pay a fine let's have them go through the kind of defensive driving or safe driving course and let's get the word out about it so people not only are seeing the billboards but are thinking huh if I fail to yield there's some chance I'm going to get a ticket for it whether I hit or kill anyone or not and the linking that with smart education and... and... and is sort of a bigger

platform. So some of that work has to be done with the DAs and we need them to be partners with us. We do need the leadership of the NYPD to make that work. So I guess what do you see as the next steps in working together on stronger enforcement and enforcement really designed over time to help continue to move behavior?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Alright now look Council Member Lander you... you're clearly asking about what is the next big frontier for us and one where I think we've started to do some of what you're talking about, collaborate more with the NYPD and with the district attorney's offices. But I would definitely say it's still... it's still pretty... Just as it took I think time and evolution and... and frankly some federal resources and you know federal effort to really change the national attitude about drunken driving we're now on that path with I guess what you would just now call reckless driving could be... could be caused from a number of sources. And look I'm... I'm police. You know we... we did have Secretary Fox here last month giving us another grant. And there is some real interest at the federal level. And I think they

1 will put some wind in our sails. But this is
2 certainly the next frontier. We... we do have regular
3 meetings with the DAs and the NYPD and we're
4 certainly I think thinking through how we're going
5 to have better enforcement strategies for that. I
6 do think we have some way to go. And certainly
7 getting even to what you're talking about which is...
8 the next level of sophistication which is not just
9 you're getting a summons but we're tying it to
10 potentially driver education and other things. I
11 think it's a great thing to... to shoot for.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Good. Well
14 that's good. I think we'd love to invite you out
15 with a... a... the... the Brooklyn DA, the Red Hook
16 Community Justice Center, Transportation
17 Alternatives, Families for Safe Streets. That's
18 just a... a pilot but I think it may have some
19 instructive value and then I know the advocates are
20 working with the... the DAs and the other boroughs as
21 well. So we would love to follow up and talk about...
22 [cross-talk]

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Good. We'd
24 love to do that.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...what we can do together. Thank you. Thank you Mr. Chair.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Hello Commissioner and team. Thank you for coming and I... I guess what... what I... what I want to do is... is... is kind of pick up on Council Member Vacca's conversation about cameras. And I have a resolution that I'd like to... to kind of get your take on that really helps think about the school cameras and as school started turned on, data's coming back, looks good. I like to push the state to make a big move to... to put these cameras and turn them on all 24 hours. Is this something that's part of your kind of agenda in Albany as well. It's something that we're going to be talking as a council to kind of support. And tell me how that kind of fits into... while we... we don't get outside the radio area of a school it gives us more time around the school... around the schools.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right I... I think certainly that's one issue is keeping the cameras on all the time. And the other issue that we see in so many places is that potentially the... the... the street that abuts the school well we're

1 required to... to put the limit where we put the
2 cameras there's a school in... in Queens near
3 Northern Boulevard that is one where we've now done
4 several Vision Zero events. The main dangerous
5 roadways... Northern Boulevard but that may not be
6 the one where the children have to cross. That may
7 not be the one where we're allowed to put the
8 camera. So there are a couple of sets of
9 restrictions we're dealing with. As I had said
10 before the city has not yet finalized exactly what
11 its legislative agenda's going to be up in Albany
12 next year and I... I don't want to get ahead of my
13 city hall on that. But I think obviously we're
14 keying to engage with the council and talk about
15 what makes sense as the next legislative step and
16 what we think we can have success with up... up in
17 Albany in the... [cross-talk]

18
19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Right and... and
20 this is going to continue. And so we're... we're...
21 we're talking about it. We're... we're trying to
22 understand if you have any understanding of... of the
23 timeline for... or I should say the use of the camera
24 time and what kind of jurisdiction you have as
25 Commissioner here in New York... New York City to

1
2 actually make that choice now and whether or not
3 you need Albany approval in the first place.

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: No we... we... we
5 do need... we do have in the legislation that Albany
6 passed very tight restrictions. The cameras can
7 only operate when school is in session or the
8 building is being used for some sort of a public
9 purpose a half... I think it's a half an hour before
10 and a half an hour afterwards. And we are... we are
11 very meticulous. I often get asked this question.
12 We're very meticulous about that legal requirement.
13 We contact each school individually, determine what
14 their school calendar is. We try and be very
15 careful about it but I think it's well over 80
16 percent of the fatalities and serious injuries
17 happen outside of when and where we can deploy the
18 cameras. So it is not catching... they are not
19 catching much of the dangerous activity that's
20 happening on a roadways. That said I... I... you know
21 I'm grateful that we have what we have. And I think
22 it's... it's clearly... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Well we'll
24 partner up in... in adding that to I think both of
25 our legislative agendas. Now that we specify in

1 looking at... and I don't want to repeat a lot of
2 what council members before me talked about as far
3 as the achievements that we've made in Vision Zero
4 I want to kind of extrapolate a little bit out of
5 some of the work that's happening in... in districts
6 like mine around the city where we have an
7 industrial business zone mix with residential. And
8 when I think about Vision Zero and I think about
9 the... the... the bike lanes coming out what can you
10 tell us from even just this last... this last year
11 and a half of work with Vision Zero that can help
12 us think about the next chapter of Vision Zero
13 especially in these... in these neighborhoods. I... I
14 feel like there's... there's... there's more to do in
15 this. And if there's anything that you can tell us
16 from the data and the work that you're doing thank
17 you for putting a lot of those intersections in 7-2
18 precinct in Sunset Park. A lot of that has
19 something to do with Industrial Business Zone which
20 we are very much in support of. And we're waiting
21 for the mayor to make... make some very strong
22 statements in support of our industrial businesses
23 but we can't do that without making sure that we
24
25

1
2 have safe streets at the same time. And... and so I'm
3 kind of curious to see what... what you've learned.

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'm going to
5 take a crack at your question and then I think I
6 also want Deputy Commissioner Russo and it... it... to
7 say a few words. And it's very interesting
8 actually. You mention your district in particular
9 where we have been at work on continuing the... the...
10 the bike connector along... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yep, on... on
12 Hamilton... [cross-talk] 3rd Avenue.

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And I
14 actually went there myself this summer because it
15 is a challenging site as you say where you have an
16 industrial zone where now you're having increasing
17 residential activity. That particular stretch there
18 is one where DOT has a facility, where the
19 Department of Sanitation has a facility. We have a...
20 I think... forgot it's a Lowe's or a Home Depot. So
21 we are very much thinking through with careful
22 engineering how we tackle I think what is
23 definitely kind of one of the next phases of Vision
24 Zero and building out our bike network how do we
25 continue in parts of the city that were

traditionally industrial but are now becoming residential how do we build out really safe infrastructure that enables you know in the case of that particular bike lane our own city agencies to continue to operate safely. So I don't know Ryan if you want to...

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And before Deputy Commissioner Russo speaks I'll... I'll add to your list as a... sounds like you have most of it is the park at the end of that greenway just opened up almost a year ago now where we're building some new entrances into the park. And so this one particular last stretch that will connect the southern end of the greenway with Red Hook in the northern part is going to be a very challenging one. And... and I'm glad it's on there so if you can just always add the park component to it. And that's another agency.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: It is on our radar screen and I haven't gotten to be... visit that beautiful park and we... we do think we need to do a lot to improve access to it.

COUNCIL MEMBER: Great thank you.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Here I'll
let... I'll let...

RYAN RUSSO: All I will just add to that
is... you know other cities especially that... very
segregated industrial zones completely separate
from residential zones. And we're not going to get
past the reality in New York City that we are a
mixed use city. And we often... the notion of say
building bicycle or pedestrian facilities in
primarily industrial zones we get a lot of
skepticism with that but we have you know history
around places like the Brooklyn Navy Yard or
Williamsburg Waterfront or even... even the Hudson
River Greenway be... the... the... the Manhattan
Waterfront is still in... in many ways a... a working
waterfront. And what we find is you know there's a
risk to it and people can be quite skeptical of... of
mixing these things, these vulnerable road users
and this industrial and trucking based activity.
But what we... what we find is that designing for
whether it's putting in a greenway or pedestrian
facilities, bike lanes, that... that there's an
awareness level that goes up. The... the growth and
the volume of use by pedestrians and cyclists

1 actually well... well sort of there's a safety in
2 numbers effect to that. So we deal with that in a
3 lot of neighborhoods around the city. Hunts Point's
4 another great example where we have the food
5 distribution. And there's a greenway going on Food
6 Center Drive there. And we work with the Hunts
7 Point Community on... on that but we think we can...
8 you know these things that are seemingly very much
9 intentioned can be made to work together.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Great. And...
12 and... and really the last main point is there are
13 ways right now that we can begin having those
14 conversations with our communities. We have a very
15 foreign born... high percentage of foreign born
16 community members in Sunset Park are Chinese and
17 Latino communities. And what we are seeing a lot of
18 energy right now is in participatory budgeting. And
19 so we're hoping... and this isn't just for Sunset
20 Park, it's for Red Hook as well. And all the other
21 participatory budgeting now 27 members are part of
22 this to have these kind of conversations at the
23 ground level with community members. So these can
24 end up on ballots and increase the awareness of it,
25 increase constituency support very particular

1 intersections and then leave at the end of this
2 process and inform citizenry residential community
3 at the... at the... at the end of this process. And so
4 we're hoping that we can kind of partner up in this
5 process. I just started now. We're still collecting
6 ideas. And... and sometimes they just come with...
7 there's a problem in this intersection that we
8 really work with you to advance your team's
9 connection. And we've... you've... we've already seen
10 you all do that in big ways but really with this
11 Vision Zero focus.
12

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: I would just
14 say we... we... look we love the particip...
15 participatory budgeting. I mean it... it's... it's a
16 great thing the city is doing. Some of you know
17 Rebecca Zach in our office tries to work very
18 closely to make sure as you work with your
19 constituents to come up with ideas there are things
20 that are going to work in terms of budget and
21 ability. So we... we'd love to keep working with you
22 on that and we... we love it when it's Vision Zero
23 projects. We think that's a... you know it... it... it's
24 great for us and it's great for buying in local
25

community to... to really be a part of these projects.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Great. Looking forward to that this year. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Council Member Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Hello Commissioner. How are you doing? Hope you're doing well. I'm pretty sure you are because of the successes of Vision Zero and how happy I am and my constituents are to see these results and to be able to see the future as well, that we're going to keep getting better. I wanted to ask a couple of things. First, hoping that we work towards Making Meeker Move is a big project that's pushing... that's pushed in my district alongside Council Member Steve Levin. Meeker is a... still a street that we think is extremely dangerous who had a lot of... deaths and fatalities on that intersection. And it's a complicated inter... it's a complicated section of my district so I understand why it would take time to get it right. But we're hoping that you guys really look at that intersection and start seeing if we can make some progress there. I wanted

1
2 to ask what role... official role the community
3 boards play in deciding what plans you guys are
4 going to propose are going to do.

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah it... it...
6 it actually sort of depends on the project. In some
7 cases they've had more of a formal role and in some
8 cases more of an advisory role. And this has
9 obviously been a topic of great discussion about
10 when the community board isn't wanting to do a
11 particular project should we just go and you know
12 basically roll over them. And... and something that
13 we think a lot about because I... I believe wherever
14 we can we really want to have the support and the
15 buy in of the local community. I think you know
16 transportation in particular is a field I'd say
17 particularly in minority communities where we've
18 had an unfortunate legacy of forcing a lot of bad
19 projects on communities that didn't want them. And
20 I think we have to be sensitive to that legacy. And
21 look I'm also fully aware of the fact that you
22 council members and the borough presidents select
23 those community board members. And you know so we
24 look to you to really help us in our work with
25 them. But that said we do what we feel is necessary

1
2 and sometimes for safety projects and other things
3 to go even if the community board won't give us
4 their blessing but it's... but it's... it's frankly not
5 our preferred course of action.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So I just want
7 to say that the support of the local community,
8 that being you kind of... you're kind of implying
9 that the community board is a reflection of the...
10 the local community and its needs and wants and I
11 would just say that community boards are extremely...
12 they... they encompass large areas of districts. And
13 sometimes a project might be very specific to one
14 portion of that district then other... other
15 interests outside of that community might be at... at
16 play. Also you know in some cases the community
17 boards are not a reflection of what the community
18 is... who the community is. Now I want you to be
19 mindful of that... and that... I think I had one of my
20 colleagues and I... I don't want to quote them
21 because I don't know exactly how they said it but
22 if you have something that you want to put in place
23 because it's going to increase safety for
24 pedestrians for bicyclists and for vehicle drivers
25 that you move forward with that. You have the

1 evidence. You have the information. You are the
2 experts and you are the agency that we... we've
3 entrusted to take that on and that you don't let
4 our local politics kind of drive or... or thwart the
5 progress that you're making on keeping the city
6 safe. And I just... maybe that's not a universal I
7 guess note in the city council but in... for me it
8 is. I want you to do what you have to do to make
9 sure that the streets are safe. And I... and I'm
10 trusting you as the commissioner to make that
11 happen. So that's very important.

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Thank you for
14 that. And look again I'm... we do do that when we
15 feel we need to. But again I mean councils are not...
16 the community boards are not always perfectly
17 representative but they are another piece of New
18 York City's democracy. And I have to say it's
19 interesting in this job I get to meet with some of
20 my counterparts who work in other cities. And they
21 actually... they have a fair amount of envy for our
22 community board system because it does give... albeit
23 sometimes imperfectly but it does give another
24 level of community input a way of getting a real
25 sense... not always perfect I'll... I'll certainly

1 admit that. I don't know that democracy is ever
2 completely perfect. We have a represent...
3 representational form of government so it... it's
4 never quite perfect but giving another layer of
5 input and impetuous in... in most instances to let us
6 go forward with our work and to let us go forward
7 getting good input from local residents. Believe me
8 some of my counterparts in other cities are jealous
9 that we have it. It... it... it works better than
10 sometimes you might think when you're in the middle
11 of it. But we take your point. If we think there's
12 something really essential we need to do sometimes
13 we move ahead.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: You guys
16 proposed metropolitan Avenue bike lane. Our
17 community board shut it down. Metropolitan bike
18 lanes should happen regardless of what the
19 community board thinks. It's increasing safety.
20 It's improving safety. And... and that's what I'm
21 talking about. And... and also this... this
22 understanding of community boards as well for
23 example are... the parking is extremely important.
24 And people don't understand that parking is a
25 privilege. It is not a right in any way shape or

1 form. And that sometimes you have to forego parking
2 for safety. And that's important as well. And those
3 are possibly nuances that they might not all get.
4 But I... I've been voted in to be the elected
5 representative of my district of 150,000 people
6 community boards are appointed individuals. So I
7 just wanted you to know that as a representative of
8 my community safety is extremely important and I
9 want you guys to take that very seriously. And
10 that's a huge... right now you're saying that you
11 guys have made the street safe for New York City.
12 If you would have had less... in cases where safety
13 was a priority and you had less interference from
14 some community boards for example I could imagine
15 how much safety this... this city would be. In cases
16 where there's evidence that... that the work you're
17 doing would make it safer.

18
19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Yeah I... I
20 would just say a couple of things on that. There
21 certainly are some high profile projects where
22 we're in disagreement with the community boards.
23 I'd have to say I think in the majority of the
24 projects we wanted to push ahead on we've gotten
25 support from community boards and good suggestions.

1
2 And they are appointed but they are appointed by
3 you all and the borough president. So you all get
4 to have some say in who those individuals are and
5 what their priorities are. And you know look I... I
6 urge you all when you're thinking about who to put
7 on the community boards it's wonderful to have
8 folks who are open to a lot of the safety things we
9 want to do. Thank you for your time. I also want to
10 say huge vision zero supporter I think we can make...
11 we can always improve on everything we do here. But
12 anything we can do to put more money into our
13 transportation system would be extremely important.

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And you support
16 Plan Move New York too right? You going to say... he
17 was... before Lander you... when I was in the sixth
18 grade I thought about that plan. I... I swear I
19 thought about that plan. I was the first person... I
20 was the first person to think about that. Okay
21 thank you. Commissioner before calling my colleague
22 I know that in the last hour changes of... for this
23 hearing on this topic we are not able to bring the
24 other commissioner that you... bring TLC and NYPD. Is
25 there anyone from TLC also that can respond or can

1
2 explain how is TLC doing on making the taxi driver
3 industry part of Vision Zero?

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah I don't...
5 I don't actually have... I have to admit I didn't
6 have time to get the latest TLC statistics. And
7 maybe that's... I want to make sure I get what they
8 have, their most up to date information so Mr.
9 Chairman let us get with them and get back...

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: That's... that's a
11 big... that's a big... [cross-talk] You know this is...
12 Vision Zero cannot be... analyzed. We don't have in
13 the present an explanation for one of the sector
14 that represent the largest fleet in the street from
15 yellow, black, livery, and green car. So I think
16 that it is necessary that you know someone can
17 explain in order to have a complete... or how are we
18 doing in Vision Zero someone from TLC should be
19 able to explain how are we doing today and what is
20 the plan for the future.

21 BILL HEINZEN: I'm Chairman Bill Heinzen
22 from TLC and we... we did come prepared today just in
23 case there were any taxi related questions. We
24 didn't think we were going to be testifying...

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And so I have a question. If you don't mind if you can sit down we'll have a question of... for TLC. As you know first of all the stakeholder of the taxi industry most of them have been part of Vision Zero. And they have been part of a different sector disseminating information on how important is... for everyone to embrace this great initiative led by Mayor de Blasio and other commissions. And... sector who push back I can say that most of them understood that this about changing the culture of everyone; drivers, pedestrian, and cyclist and that everyone is accountable and that there's a big responsibility when someone get behind the wheel in the street in New York. So one of my question on the... on the TLC is like what having the experience that you can be able to accumulate when it come to the role of all the second stake holder, the taxi industry being part of Vision Zero. How much have all sectors contribute on this initiative?

BILL HEINZEN: Well I can speak to for example the education that we're doing for drivers. And we... we offer all... we just... we just announced that we're going to be requiring driver education

1 of all segments of the industry starting in January
2 currently we offer that education to the yellow and
3 greens. That education program consists of...
4 consists of what we call taxi school or FHV school.
5 And beginning in... beginning next year as I said it
6 will be offered to all TLC license, FHV drivers
7 when they renew their licenses and then all
8 incoming drivers. It's a huge undertaking force
9 that we're... we have a lot of staff dedicated. We're
10 wrapping up with that. We're going to be offering
11 that in four languages. So English, Spanish,
12 Bangali, and Urdu we have just been finishing up
13 our video drive like your family lives here. We
14 shortened it rather. It had already been cut.
15 Requiring not only our... the yellow and green
16 drivers to... to view that. But also I know that Uber
17 just told us that they would be showing it to all
18 of their drivers.

19
20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. There's 75
21 at a company registered at TLC unless there's a new
22 one but there... there's not a new one got licensed
23 in the last two months. And as you know the ad
24 company they are one of those more connected with
25 social media. And today one of them Uber say that

1 they have 30,000 car in the street of New York.
2 When you get behind the seat in the yellow taxi you
3 will see the Vision Zero education awareness. In
4 many of the green car and Livery you see the
5 sticker behind the wheel has the ad services
6 company in this case leading with Uber with 30,000
7 car in the street discuss and be part of any role
8 on how they are educating our zero... our zero in
9 Vision Zero.
10

11 BILL HEINZEN: I understand your
12 question. I just want to talk with my colleague and
13 see if I can give you... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

15 BILL HEINZEN: ...an answer. So I know
16 that the... the... the stickers that you just referred
17 to have been offered to all segments of the
18 industry. I don't know if we have information right
19 now about the extent to which those cars... those
20 other segments of the industry are... are using
21 those.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. I... I just
23 suggest that you know with the TLC and Livery DOT
24 as a main leader of the Vision Zero that we also
25 try to find out how to engage the ad services

1 company since they are very effective sending
2 message to see also how they can be part and
3 helpful on the education awareness of Vision Zero
4 because of what we have said. We've been doing a
5 great job, everyone together from TLC, NYPD, DCAS,
6 led by DOT but this conversation is not... usually is
7 having a hearing between to see how we've been
8 doing. This is about how can we take Vision Zero to
9 a higher level. So I just like to put that
10 suggestion to TLC that as you will discuss with a
11 many of stake holder yellow, green, black car, and
12 ask them to contribute in the education awareness
13 campaign that those who have a lot of access to
14 social media also play a role helping us to
15 educate.
16

17 BILL HEINZEN: We will definitely do
18 that and just... just to clarify... are you... are you
19 also suggesting that maybe the ad companies in... in
20 their interplay with the drivers when they're
21 locating passengers for them that there could be
22 messaging to them reminding them about... about safe
23 driving...

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah.

25 BILL HEINZEN: ...etcetera?

1
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: My concern and
3 what I would like to say Vision Zero is that after
4 the city with an anti-smoking campaign... [cross-
5 talk] and that's my situation with cigarette and
6 hookah. Like everyone knows that when you smoke a
7 cigarette a lot of people think twice before
8 getting into a smoking a cigarette because we been
9 educating so much that we know that a cigarette is
10 bad for health. I think that... and then of course
11 with the Hookah... 40 cigarette hookah is equal to
12 120 cigarette. But since we don't know the effect...
13 so it's cool for many teenager get into the hookah,
14 they don't know what in getting into. And that's
15 the data that we... the research that we have done. I
16 think that again 2015 there's a lot that we can
17 celebrate on how New Yorkers now we've been... we're
18 thinking more on the responsibility when the driver
19 is behind a wheel but I would say that we have a
20 large percent to accomplish a goal to reach to 100
21 percent on how critical is when someone is behind a
22 wheel and the responsibility that it come with. So
23 I just hope that we continue using any resources
24 that we have. And one of those again is those 75 ad
25 company that... with the TLC and as then can you help

us disseminate information using the resources you have.

BILL HEINZEN: Okay we... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

BILL HEINZEN: ...we will absolutely do that and we'll you know continue talking to your staff about that. I appreciate what Commissioner Trottenberg said about TLC's commitment to Vision Zero. I think we really have...

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great.

BILL HEINZEN: We have been on the front lines as much as possible for an agency of our size but we are very committed to it. Great, thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you Chairman Rodriguez and Commissioner always great to see you. Want to thank you again for all of your great work in our district on 21st Street, implementation of the new slow zone in southern Astoria. I also want to make sure I publically commend Nicole Garcia, the Queens Commissioner who's been doing a great job since her taking on the new role. So I want to thank you. I just have a few questions. You know early this year... some things that we've spoken with Commission... Nicole

1 Garcia about. Earlier this year we had a tragic
2 accident of... quantify as... it's not an accident. It...
3 a young woman was... was hit by a car in the
4 crosswalk around Astoria Park. It's not an
5 accident. This individual was... was... was drunk and
6 this is a... it's a death that needs to be
7 prosecuted. But we are very focused on traffic
8 safety around Astoria Park. It's the jewel of our
9 community. You know it's a huge green space. And
10 you know we have motorists, bicyclists, and
11 pedestrians all who want to come to that park on a
12 daily basis. Sometimes in the thousands. And we
13 have the fireworks to the tens of thousands so it's
14 a huge priority for us to see a comprehensive plan,
15 not just one street but really a comprehensive plan
16 evaluating the numerous streets around Astoria Park
17 seeing how we can better improve safety there. And
18 I know that you've been a partner so far and I want
19 to thank you for that and see if you have any
20 thoughts on what else we can do.

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah we... we...
23 we certainly heard a lot from the community after
24 that terrible crash and... and I know we've been
25 taking a look. And actually I'm going to see if

1
2 Ryan... I think it's an area we're starting to see
3 what we might want to do that would be more
4 comprehensive. I don't know Ryan if you want to...
5 you had anything to add to that?

6 RYAN RUSSO: No, I... we're excited about
7 Astoria, the connections to the park, the potential
8 of the bike network, with the growth of city bike.
9 We want to expand the bike network and work with
10 you there. We think we get more people riding
11 bikes. It'll help not just the mobility but the
12 overall safety. I think the... we're looking at
13 treatments. The all way stop sign that the vehicle
14 disobeyed where we had that crash. I think there's
15 maybe some innovative things we could do on the
16 streets around there. So we're looking forward to...
17 to working with you in that... in that area.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Yeah I
19 know I mean it's... it's a huge priority I think for
20 both of us. Making sure that people can enjoy the
21 park in a safe way is a... is a huge priority. Also
22 going back to slow zones. I didn't see that... how
23 will the slow gone... slow zone program going? What
24 do you envision for 2016 implementation because we
25 have several areas in Astoria that we'd like to

1
2 suggest that the community board has also suggested
3 for slow zones. And... and how is that going, what do
4 you see implementation being in 2016 and we'll move
5 forward?

6 RYAN RUSSO: We're... we're still wrapping
7 up implementation of the last round of neighborhood
8 slow zones so we're implementing in places like
9 Prospect Heights and Brooklyn Heights and things
10 like that. And what we've been doing is the... the...
11 the core element of the slow zone is the... is the
12 speed reducer... the speed bump if you will. And what
13 we're very excited about is under Vision Zero we've
14 been doing more than we've ever done. We did... like
15 we said in the testimony 275. We put a target of
16 250 a year. We used to average like you know around
17 a hundred a year. So we're doing over 250 a year of
18 those. We have a very... And what we're finding is
19 that the growth in requests for the... the speed
20 bumps have gone up. So we're working with and we
21 have a lot of Council Members who want their sort
22 of speed bumps. So we haven't announced sort of a
23 next round for the overall neighborhood slow zone.
24 We're still working and evaluating that. It's been...
25 and we think it's been a good program. But we are

1
2 still trying to be data driven in the Vision Zero
3 borough pedestrian safety action plans to make sure
4 we're working where the crashes are highest.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Alright.
6 And that clearly makes sense. I mean we have areas
7 that... I mean we've had crashes, fatal crashes in
8 the... in the... in the past. And they abut schools in...
9 in Northern Astoria. We've spoken with DOT and I
10 look forward to seeing how we can get those moving
11 forward in the future. Lastly I see in the... at the
12 end of the testimony about Astoria Boulevard. Just
13 want to know a little bit about how we can extend
14 that into District 22. You know I... I now represent
15 a very large swath of Astoria Boulevard from 92nd
16 Street going west all the way to the bridge. And
17 Astoria Boulevard's a huge challenge for safety.
18 And how... you know what... what do you envision coming
19 our way in the future?

20 RYAN RUSSO: So the... the section we're
21 doing the work on Astoria Boulevard is very
22 interesting in that it has a... sort of a center
23 median and a lot of very large distances between
24 crossing opportunities which can both discourage...
25 encourage you know crossing with... without the

benefit of a crosswalk by pedestrians and high speeds particularly off peak in between. So we're creating... we're doing something pretty dramatic which is creating new intersections which requires significant amount of construction, signal construction, that sort of thing. So we're very excited about that and I think we're planning on doing some planning both learning from that and coming to further west to discuss what we can do in... in the next sections. I think that's going to be happening later this year to start that conversation.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I definitely look forward to it because I know that the... the... the Jackson Heights portion of my district along Astoria Boulevard, that which you just described are the long areas where there aren't any...

RYAN RUSSO: Mm-hmm.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: ...crosses. It just sort of lends itself to as you said people trying to get across the street in an unsafe manner where people are driving at high rates of speed. So anything we can do to calm

1 Astoria Boulevard. We've also heard from residents
2 into Astoria as well that... which I know it's going
3 to be much more complicated because we have the
4 Grant Central Parkway that sort of pops up around...
5 around that point, different street but same... same
6 boulevard but different challenge. But we've heard
7 that same thing from other people as well is how do
8 we make Astoria Boulevard safer that way, over that
9 way as well so I look forward to having those
10 conversations with you. Thank you. Thank you Mr.
11 Chair.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you Chair
14 Rodriguez. Hi Commissioner. We haven't talked
15 recently but...

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: ...in your
17 borough though.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And we still have
19 a lot of issues right. But I was very pleased that
20 we did have the one town hall where we discussed
21 Vision Zero on Staten Island. And arguably Staten
22 Island is very... I think the most driving dependent
23 of the boroughs. And in particular it seems that
24 vision... the Vision Zero input map features
25 relatively low participation from Staten Islanders

1 and I was wondering what you might attribute this
2 to... do you think that there was insufficient
3 outreach or is it that our streetscape... or our
4 streetscapes are much more safer than other
5 boroughs or... or what you know do you attribute that
6 to?
7

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah it... it...
9 it's... it's... look just say a couple of things about...
10 about Staten Island. And look I... I think
11 unfortunately you... you know this we've just had a
12 couple fatalities unfortunately on Highland
13 Boulevard.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Right.

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: and even
16 though as I had said in my testimony I think
17 overall the fatality data is looking promising.
18 We're not having a good year in Staten Island and
19 we are... the mayor has tasked us and NYPD to go back
20 and take a deeper look and see what else we can be
21 doing. One common theme we've seen this year in a
22 lot of the crashes in Staten Island whether it been
23 fatalities is they tend to happen very late at
24 night. They often involve DWI or some kind of
25 reckless behavior. So we're... we're clearly going to

1 be working with the NYPD on that. Look I think it's
2 no secret some parts of the city are more excited
3 about Vision Zero than... than others and
4 particularly in places where you have fewer
5 pedestrians. I think you perhaps had fewer people
6 turn out and go to our website. But you know I...
7 I've done a town hall with you and spend time there
8 and I have met a lot of people who care deeply
9 about roadway safety on Staten Island and we've
10 done a lot of work out there in recent years. I
11 think probably it's... it's time to come back and
12 have another big forum and... and see what folks are
13 thinking particularly perhaps in light of
14 unfortunately the recent fatalities that we've seen
15 on the Island.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yeah I... I think
18 public education is... is really the key especially
19 on Staten Island. As you mentioned we had two
20 fatalities this week. One... a young woman running
21 for a bus and the other is still under
22 investigations. But one of my... one of the areas,
23 I'm not sure that we've done our best work is in
24 public education of pedestrians where we've... you
25 know we are... we're holding drivers accountable.

1 We're holding busses and taxis. But I don't think
2 we're getting the message out appropriately to
3 inattentive distracted pedestrians. When I leave
4 City Hall every day I have pedestrians that are
5 crossing against the light, distracted. I really
6 would like to know what... what type of campaign have
7 we geared toward pedestrians and are there any
8 plans to sort of ramp it up?

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah I mean
11 we... we always say about Vision Zero that everybody
12 has a role in making our streets safer, motorists
13 and cyclists and pedestrians absolutely.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: But there doesn't
15 seem to be much emphasis put on pedestrian
16 responsibility.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well we... we...
18 we are... we... we... we do run a pretty big public
19 education campaign and we particularly go to high
20 crash areas. We hand out literature; DOT and the
21 NYPD together. We talk to motorists and
22 pedestrians. And we do a lot of work in schools
23 particularly with our kids to teach them what are
24 the safe practices you need when you're walking on
25 the streets of New York. I'm often asked why can't

1 the NYPD do more enforcement on pedestrians and
2 give them lots of tickets if they're jaywalking. I
3 don't know whether we'll ever... we'll ever cross
4 that bridge. I do think we need public awareness.
5 But I do also think and it... you know it's
6 particularly relevant I... I say in Staten Island
7 where we're seeing a lot of these crashes are
8 happening late at night at high speed. Speed is a...
9 if... if someone is distracted via the driver or the
10 pedestrian if the vehicle is going at a safer speed
11 you're less likely to have obviously a fatal
12 result. So we're going to continue our public
13 education working again. I think in light of what's
14 just happened on Staten Island we're going to
15 really renew our efforts there and see what else we
16 can do to try and bring that message home to
17 everybody; motorists, pedestrian, cyclists,
18 etcetera.

19
20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And I just really
21 you know would like to recommend that I... I really
22 think there should be a public campaign also to
23 remind pedestrians of you know their responsibility
24 in... in you know Vision Zero. I... I see it all too
25 often where they're distracted. They're not

1 following the signs. They're... So I... I would just
2 like to see that. And an enforcement on Staten
3 Island as you said many of the drivers are
4 intoxicated or inebriated so maybe we need to
5 revisit enforcement efforts and... in regards to your
6 Vision Zero and safety.

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah I... I
9 think that's certainly something we want to explore
10 with the NYPD whether they think it would be
11 appropriate to do you know some sobriety
12 checkpoints and really crack down on that... on that
13 piece of dangerous driving.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And we're working
15 with the DA's offices with... in that particular
16 regard.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah I mean I
18 guess we're... we're... with an interim DA right now
19 but yes it's something we actually talked about
20 earlier in this hearing that we want to continue...
21 we... we do meet regularly with the DAs and the NYPD
22 and that's definitely become the next frontier for
23 us. How do we improve that coordination and that
24 enforcement piece?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And you believe that the channeling and the streetscapes on Staten Island are sufficient for pedestrian safety?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: No I mean we're... we're... we're going to continue our work in all five boroughs. We... we've laid out and these are our... our safety action plans, the key priority corridors and... and we have some in Staten Island. Highland Boulevard is one of them where we're going to continue engineering work. But I think also on Staten Island again just looking at... at least the profile of a lot of the recent crashes we had there. I think in a lot of ways they were in some cases less about the geography of the street but more about unfortunately getting DUIs and excessive speeding. But we're going to... I think we want to take a holistic approach. There's no one magic... you know one magic solution. You... you need to tackle on all fronts.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And... and one thing you mentioned also was about the lighting... the... the street lighting. Or maybe you didn't... maybe I... I'm thinking it. But... actually the lighting grids in some of these areas are... are not as either the

intersections aren't as illuminated as they could be. Is that something that maybe DOT could look at?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Yeah I mean if there are particular... if there are particular locations you want us to take a look at we're happy to do that.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Chair. Sorry being late. I was chairing another meeting, hearing next door. Thank you Commissioner. Sorry I missed a testimony. But I... I'm glad to see that canal street is on one of your priority street. And thank you to the chair. I mean we have introduce legislation to try to collect more data on truck routes and in my district... Canal Street to see in terms of you know the number of crashes because NYPD right now do not capture those data to see how we can make that area safer. And I mean even along Canal Street it's just like we just got to tell the pedestrian they got to really... and there's been a lot of education effort for people to be more careful when they're crossing the street. I mean you just have to make sure that... not just you have the light that... that there are no trucks or cars

1 coming off the bridge at you. And every time I
2 cross that intersection I have to be very careful.
3 I don't look at my cellphone, I don't look anyway.
4 I just want to make sure that I can cross that
5 street safely. But on Canal Street I mean people
6 are still asking me that we should definitely look
7 at the countdown clock do really have more time for
8 pedestrian especially the street is... is so wide and
9 you have a lot of people crossing at the same time.
10 And recently with you know the festival and you
11 just... so many people crossing the street. And
12 especially on the weekend. And I know that there's
13 some safety measure being put in place. I, myself,
14 is still very uncomfortable with people crossing
15 Canal Street right at the mouth of the Manhattan
16 Bridge. I know the DOT right now is working you
17 know as some safety measure but that is still a
18 various... very dangerous. I don't know if we can you
19 know educate pedestrian not to go that route. But
20 you know sometimes people like to take shortcuts
21 and they like to save time. And I even have
22 community leader telling me that we should build a
23 pedestrian bridge that way because they've done it
24 in Hong Kong and... and they say why couldn't we do
25

1
2 it here because so many people die you know has
3 crossing that... that intersection. So I think that's
4 something that we have to look at that is... even no
5 matter how much safety measure you put in there if
6 people still cross that area it's... it's just... it's
7 just... very dangerous.

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Let me talk
9 about. I'm... I'm going to turn to... to Ryan as well.
10 And look there's no question we... we all know Canal
11 Street is just one of the most challenging streets
12 in the city for... for a whole bunch of historical
13 reasons. And you know we're... we're really trying to
14 spend more time thinking about how we can make it
15 safer. And I want Ryan to talk particularly about
16 what we're doing around the Manhattan Bridge.
17 Because I think we're... I think we're excited about
18 the work we're doing there. And we... we really think
19 it's going to be a safety enhancement. I am asked
20 sometimes about the pedestrian bridge idea over a
21 roadway. And I know that they do it in Asia. I've
22 seen it in China and other places. IT's a
23 particular challenge in New York City. You need a
24 wide sidewalk that can support the strength of
25 something. Because of our Americans with Disability

1
2 Act requirements it has to be wheelchair accessible
3 which means you either have to have a very long
4 spiraling ramp or you need elevators. And you have
5 to design it to such a height that it won't get hit
6 by trucks. All of that makes it incredibly
7 challenging to do in the city. So I know people see
8 it in Asia and they think it's a great solution it...
9 it just may not be one unfortunately that... that
10 would work here. But... but let me... let me turn to
11 Ryan to talk a bit about the Manhattan Bridge work
12 which I... I think is really exciting.

13 RYAN RUSSO: Well I... I just wanted to...
14 thank you Commissioner... just say we are in the
15 process of implementing the project that you have
16 been so instrumental in moving forward. And we
17 recognize the challenges of the touchdown of you
18 know a major regional bridge onto city
19 intersection. But you know what we have done is we
20 have dramatically changed the operation of that
21 bridge in order to help us facilitate doing a
22 pedestrian friendly intersection treatment. We're
23 going to have a new signalized crossing where
24 pedestrians have had no benefit of a crosswalk
25 travelling against traffic coming off that bridge.

1 And we have stopped reversing the lower roadway of
2 the Manhattan Bridge to send traffic towards the
3 Brooklyn in PM peak period. That is a dramatic
4 change to our old transportation network system in
5 order for us to implement this project that'll have
6 benefits on both the Manhattan and the Brooklyn
7 side. And I think it's truly emblematic of our
8 commitment to Vision Zero and our work there. You
9 know it's not done yet so we're implementing it.
10 But once we do we want to work with you and look at
11 it and see how we think it's... it's going but we're...
12 we're... we're tremendously excited about that
13 project.

14
15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah I think we
16 have to really look at when it's... at a time where
17 we could do a presentation to the community so that
18 we... all the... And also there might be some
19 possibility where you do have to block off certain
20 part of the street so that people kind of get to
21 the crosswalk and not cross ahead of the crosswalk
22 or... so that to really guide people where they
23 should be crossing at that intersection. I think
24 that's... that's something that we really should look
25 at the possibility of doing that.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No I... I think... we would be happy to do a walkthrough with... with you in the community if you think there are other things we should...

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: ...look at. We welcome the chance to do that.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: And another... the other section... intersection is Chatham Square. I mean like crossing from Lot Street over. I mean it just like every traffic is coming from every direction at you and because of the closure of Park Row. We still cannot get Park Row open fully right. Now only the bus or... or certain vehicle gets through. And that really jams all of the traffic along Worth Street... St. James. So I mean... was luckily she was not hurt seriously a couple months ago crossing that area. But I think that in that area we really have to look at some temporary solution before we can reopen Park Row that's the ultimate solution that would be helpful. But really to look at maybe possibility of doing some midblock crossing so that you don't have to deal with cars turning at you while you're crossing and other cars

1 coming at you. I mean it just like I don't know how
2 people manage to cross there. I avoid that corner
3 as much as I can. But it just like... it just
4 accident waiting to happen. I mean I'm glad that
5 you know throughout the city we made a lot of
6 progress on Ground Zero chair. I mean but in my
7 district we saw a lot of collision you know
8 especially seniors getting hit and... and dying you
9 know last year. And it just... we just don't want you
10 know more of that to happen. So I think I would
11 really want to work with DOT to really look at the
12 Chatham Square and see if we can do some temporary
13 fix. I think... I think some midblock crossing there
14 might be helpful. And so that... today I see you
15 directly I don't want staff to tell me that I got
16 to write a letter and then request and you do a
17 survey. Let's do a walk through there and see if
18 there's some... because I really think that setting
19 up some barriers on the... on the sidewalk help to
20 tell people where they should cross. And that's the
21 whole pedestrian issue. Sometime we have to guide
22 pedestrian. Like this is the safe way to cross and
23 don't just cross anywhere you want to cross so that
24 at least we can help create some safer situation
25

there. And hopefully you know we can prevent accidents from happening as much as possible.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Yeah well we'd love to go do a walkthrough with you and see what we can do. And... and we know we... we've heard from the whole community the frustration with... with Park Row and the closing. And we've been part of some discussions about whether there can be something done to mitigate it. As you know it hasn't... hasn't born fruit but we know it's... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I know it's like the federal government they... you know the city said it's the federal government's problem and there's jurisdiction so... This is New York city. Park Row belongs in the city so we should be able to do something to reopen. I mean it's almost 15 years. So thank you Chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Commissioner.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Council Member Vacca has a...

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you Chair.

And I... I really thought this hearing was very constructive. And I support Vision Zero and I think you're doing a great job Commissioner. Let me ask you one thing though. My recollection is... oh and need more speed bumps before I make my statement. I know you... you said you installed a lot, almost 300, we need more. But the other thing I want to tell you is there was... I remember back in the 1980s that there was a federal regulation under the clean air act that where you had faculty parking only at a school that if the signs came down they could be replaced but that there would be no more designated parking at schools for faculty only. And it was an incentive... this was a way to incentivize people to use mass transit but I do remember this back in the 1980s. So if I have signs that come down, DOT has replaced them, and that's what we understood the law was... was going to be. This year DOE has put up signs saying faculty parking only. And I don't know where they got the authorization. I was at a school in my district the other day and I walked out of the school with the three principals that I didn't notice it. But they said Jimmy do you know where

1 these signs came from? And there were signs, took
2 away five parking spaces from the community or from
3 the other teachers or whatever and it says permit
4 parking only. So I contacted DOT who referred it to
5 DOE correctly because the signs say DOE. And then I
6 was told are you a renewal school. I says I... I
7 don't under... I don't think that school is a renewal
8 school. But whether it is a renewal school or not
9 because I don't understand on what rational how
10 many schools got this new... this new signage and why
11 were renewal schools picked for this and does... does
12 your... is your agency aware of this?

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: My agency is
15 aware and I would just say that this was a mayoral
16 directive to try and do everything we can to help
17 the renewal school succeed, attract the best
18 teachers, and I think that was the thinking behind
19 the parking permits. But beyond that you know again
20 this was sort of a city hall priority.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well I have to
22 tell you that in the school that I visited in my
23 district the... the... the three... we have four schools
24 there. And the four principals there told me that
25 no teachers in the building have any parking

1 permits yet there's a sign saying permit parking
2 only. I looked at the cars that were parked there.
3 Nobody had permits. They were just parking there
4 hoping that they wouldn't get a ticket I guess. But
5 I'd like you to review that. I don't know... even if
6 the mayor... I mean the mayor's intentions may have
7 been nice but I think if it goes against the
8 federal clean air act it can't be nice. You have to
9 obey the federal clean air act right?

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well I think
12 we're... I... I think we're... some... a couple things
13 you're raising I think we're looking into. I
14 didn't... I didn't know the DOE had posted its own
15 signs and I... I had known it was city policy about
16 the parking around schools. I didn't know actually
17 that it went back to a 1980s cleanup. But I do
18 know... Jeff is just informing me that I think our
19 legal experts are kind of doing the due diligence
20 on this.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Yeah and I
22 contacted DOE about the one school in particular.
23 And I certainly am supportive of DOE trying to help
24 renewal schools, I'll put it that way, but there's
25 got to be a consistent policy on this parking

1
2 issue. There's got to be signage. DOE doing this
3 when DOT has a different policy just didn't make
4 sense to me so I bring it to your attention. I'm
5 glad you have your legal people working on it but I
6 wanted you to know. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...question?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Commissioner I... I
9 just wanted to... to clear... to clear something up.
10 Did you take away from my questions that I was
11 blaming pedestrians for the fatalities?

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: No.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. Because
14 I... I just want to be really clear that I think the
15 public education piece of Vision Zero needs to be
16 expanded and that it should include all of the
17 sectors. And so... and... and that... that I thought that
18 there were some things or issues on Staten Island
19 that I think could help secure the safety of
20 pedestrians. I talked about channelization,
21 lighting, and whatever. I just wanted to make sure
22 that the takeaway from you know... you know my
23 statement here was not that pedestrians are the
24 cause of the fatalities nor that you know I'm
25

absolving vehicular... vehicles and... and drivers. As long as you didn't get that I'm good.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: I... I did not take your statements to mean that...

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: ...Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner before I... I... I will let you go I will like to take this moment also to ask DOT and this guy DCAS to start thinking about this initiative that I launched yesterday which is to make a... a car free day on earth day 2016. And as you know 1.5 New Yorkers has car. And I think that to take New York City to another level we should aim to reduce that number to one million by 2030. I believe that the city is already working... providing some incentive to developers and there's other... initiative that we working on it. I think that we should think about doing more sharing car especially in the city agency such as the 20,000 car... vehicle that DCAS oversee. And I just hope again as we will continue conversation with administration and all the agency

1 we make earth day a... April 22, 2016 a day car free
2 so that we send a message loud and clear that we
3 are committed to reduce the numbers of cars in New
4 York City. So again like I... I wanted to bring that
5 suggestion so... and let... letting you know that this
6 is going to be very important for me as a chairman
7 this committee. And I hope that I can work with all
8 the city agency and the administration to work
9 toward this goal not only on Earth Day but also
10 reducing the number of cars in New York City. Thank
11 you.
12

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Now we're
15 calling the next panel; Debbie Kahn from Family For
16 Safe Street, Paul White Transportation Alternative,
17 and Veronica Vanterpool from Tri-State
18 Transportation Campaign.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: May begin.

20 DEBBIE KAHN: I'm first. Good afternoon
21 Council Member Rodriguez and the Transportation
22 Committee. Thank you Council Member Rodriguez for
23 being such a strong leader for always working on
24 behalf of traffic justice. You are a Families for
25 Safe Streets Vision Zero hero. And thank you to the

entire Transportation Committee for taking the time to listen to what I have to say to you today. It will be six painful years this November 4th that our only child Seth Kahn was run over and killed by a man driving a 20 ton bus and speeding through the intersection. We were told by the police at the time that these things happen every day and that it was only an accident. What can you do. No charges were filed. The bus driver was given a ticket two weeks later for failure to yield but the ticket was thrown out of court because the police officer failed to show up in court. The bus driver is now on permanent disability for his stress. My husband and I, well, our lives have not been the same. We are broken. Seth was the very center of our family. He was a joy to be around always smiling and happy with a quick sense of humor and amazing stories to tell. Creative and talented he strived for perfection in all that he did. He was always helping others and at work he was promoted quickly. He had many friends that were inspired by him, his work ethic, and his creative energy and kind spirit. Everyone always expected great things from him and saw in him the next Jim Henson. The street

corner where Seth was killed at 9th Avenue at 53rd Street was looked at by Transportation Alternatives and the Community Board due to so many individuals being injured and killed because of the large amount of traffic and the high volume of pedestrians in that area. They came up with a plan to put bike lanes with green space islands and parking along 9th Avenue. This fixed the problem and immediately had an impact on reducing pedestrian and bicycle injuries in this neighborhood. But it shouldn't... [coughs] excuse me. [coughs] Could you get me water? But it shouldn't take a death to redesign an intersection. [coughs] Sorry. But it shouldn't take a death to redesign an intersection. Thankfully because Mayor de Blasio's leadership we now have Vision Zero and this means prevention must be our guiding principal. Queens Boulevard which has been a street where countless deaths and injuries have occurred through the years can also become a model for all of the huge streets in our city where death and injury happen every single day. Families for Safe Streets work tirelessly for this street to be fixed and now we hope it will be a model for all of the other big

1 wide dangerous streets in New York City. We must
2 expand the budget for this important work and
3 expand the DOT's ability to do this work faster.
4 Last year families for safe streets worked
5 tirelessly as we wept in our grief against all odds
6 to fight to get the speed limit lowered in New York
7 City to 25 miles an hour. But this needs to be
8 enforced. We also push for the right of way law.
9 And these two laws used together are powerful tools
10 that need to be used and need to be enforced. I do
11 not want my son's death to be in vain. Please help
12 us get to Vision Zero. We want the city council to
13 push the Vision Zero taskforce to produce a clear
14 timeline with agency outcomes for injury and death
15 reduction each year. I'm almost finished. I manage
16 the Families for Safe Streets Facebook page and I
17 do not want to have any more conversations with
18 bariffed [sp?] moms, dads, sisters, brothers, sons,
19 daughters, crash victims with PTSD about their
20 crashes in New York City, their physical and
21 emotional pain, their struggle against the system
22 that is New York City, and the ignorance around
23 people that do not understand that they could be us
24 in a New York minute. Because all it takes is a
25

1 second for your entire world to change when that
2 motor vehicle comes crashing down the street at you
3 or your child or your mother hitting you or running
4 you over. Yes, all it takes is a second and then
5 you know. Please I beg you, for us this is urgent
6 and we cannot wait. We cannot wait for more people
7 to die or be injured. We need this now, please.
8 Let's get to Vision Zero now. We are watching. The
9 world is watching. And we, no I cannot wait.

11 VERONICA VANTERPOOL: Good afternoon my
12 name is Veronica Vanterpool. I'm the Executive
13 Director of Tri-State Transportation Campaign. And
14 thank you Chairman Rodriguez and Council Member
15 Vacca for remaining here to listen to our... our
16 testimony this afternoon. So I just want to make a
17 few quick points. Tri-State Transportation
18 Campaign; we're a regional organization. We work in
19 New York, New Jersey, and Connecticut. We've
20 partnered with many of our colleagues on Vision
21 Zero here in New York City. And one thing that I
22 want to impress is this region is looking at how
23 New York City is advancing Vision Zero, how they're
24 implementing it, and how they're pushing it
25 forward. And we're very pleased to see some of the

progress from this very big public policy agenda. Over the past year we've seen some significant decreases and reductions. We know pedestrian fatalities and bike fatalities have decreased by eight percent. We've also seen a decrease in motorist fatalities. And I think that's incredibly important to point out because Vision Zero is about making streets safer for all users and that includes motorists as well. So I think that often gets lost in the discussion. We talk about our most vulnerable users of the streets and that's always pedestrians and cyclists. But there is... there are improvements that benefit drivers as well and I think that's worth pointing out. I want to also talk about right of way. You've been very supportive of right of way. We glad to see that it has been upheld but it has opened up a larger conversation about the needs of our transit system, more specifically busses and the MTA needs to moving forward be a more dedicated partner in terms of procurement to retrofitting busses with mirrors and signal technology and sideguards to reduce fatalities. And we... you know are looking forward to seeing that advance. And we know the MTA's looking

at a pilot program for signal technology in particular. And we think that that... will be on the pilot stage. New York City's approach to camera technology I want to point out again from a regional perspective is very smart. The way New York City has rolled out its program has been data driven and that's incredibly important to winning the support of the community and the legislators. So I really want to acknowledge DOT's role in... in having done that and working particular council members and of course the mayor to roll that out successfully. I lastly want to end with a conversation... or rather a point about distracted pedestrians. We... we've often heard in the media many people... many elected officials as well tend to blame a distracted pedestrian for his or her injury or death on the street. And I think the entire point of Vision Zero is about reducing the conflict and reducing the incidences of these crashes and these fatalities. And all of these improvements are important to... to that goal. We should not be blaming any pedestrian. And... and I think that was the impetuous behind lowering the speed limit as well from 30 to 25 citywide when you are lowering

1 that. It does not matter if one is distracted.
2 There life is then better preserved by these sorts
3 of measures. So I'm going to keep that at the
4 forefront that I think that's a dangerous way of
5 characterizing anyone's blame here when we have our
6 streets designed for all users of the roadway it
7 does reduce that conflict and it does not matter
8 how you know one may be looking at their phone even
9 though there's a responsibility that everyone use
10 the road safely and I would never advocate for
11 anyone; motorist, cyclist, or pedestrian to not
12 follow the rules of the roadway. We are the most
13 vulnerable on our streets. Everyone else is
14 operating a weapon if they're behind a vehicle.
15 Thank you.

17 PAUL WHITE: Hello, I'm Paul Steely
18 White, Executive Director of Transportation
19 Alternatives. My written testimony is very thorough
20 and comprehensive. For now I will be brief and just
21 make a few points. The first and perhaps most
22 important is that the DOT has gotten very good at
23 saving lives. Their engineers, urban designers know
24 how to redesign streets so that there's a dramatic
25 decrease in fatalities and injuries. 40 60 percent

1 decrease is not uncommon when they are allowed to
2 do their jobs. The problem as Council Member
3 Reynoso so aptly pointed out is that we still have
4 this policy, the DOT still has this policy of
5 negotiating those safety improvements, watering
6 them down with unelected community board members
7 who are not experts in traffic safety. And that's
8 inappropriate in the era of Vision Zero. We have to
9 get to a place where safety is not negotiable with
10 local nimbies. We have to get to a place where
11 these are routine lifesaving improvements that are
12 done as a matter of course not as a result of a
13 broken local community board process. Second, and
14 it has to be said, I mean the mayor has done a
15 tremendous job leading Vision Zero but the truth
16 is... is that the mayor is still underfunding Vision
17 Zero. This city council made recommendations in the
18 last budget process that would have significantly
19 increased the DOT's ability to make these
20 lifesaving improvements. We know that there are
21 hundreds of intersections that need these
22 improvements from the DOT's own borough safety
23 action plans and yet their funding only allows them
24 to fix about 50 or 60 of these locations per year.
25

1
2 There was a significant increase in the budget to
3 fix potholes. Tens of millions of new dollars.
4 Actually I think it was more than 100 million
5 dollars. I submit to you that people are more
6 important than potholes and that we need to get the
7 funding that Vision Zero deserves. Thirdly, and
8 lastly for now, the NYPD is not doing its job. We
9 have some precincts that are doing less enforcement
10 on fail... failure to yield and speeding. We have
11 precincts that are cracking down on sidewalk
12 cycling while turning a blind eye to SUVs jumping
13 the curb and killing children. That is a warped
14 priority and that has to change. We need to get
15 ahold of the NYPD and enforce Vision Zero practices
16 and data driven enforcement across the department,
17 not precinct by precinct. Too many lives are being
18 lost because the NYPD still does not have the
19 proper priorities when it comes to enforcement and
20 Vision Zero. Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I first wanted to
22 definitely stay to hear your testimony. And I'm
23 sorry for your loss. I cannot fathom how
24 devastating it is and that yourself and that
25 families like you who have lost a loved one can

1 even come to these hearings is a testament to your
2 strength that I do not know I would have under the
3 circumstances. Being here is the least we can do
4 but you should know that your loss is not in vain
5 and that we're doing all we can. And we're very
6 committed to Vision Zero; the chair, myself, and
7 this council. I... I... I did want to go into the issue
8 of enforcement. So much is predicated on
9 enforcement. And we continue to stress that. I'm
10 disappointed today that we do not have statistics
11 yet on how many summonses have been issued as per
12 the 25 mile an hour speed limit reduction. We need
13 that information. We need that transparency. We
14 have to know what the level of enforcement is. I'm
15 a driver... I don't... most times I don't drive here, I
16 take the train. But in my community I'm in a place
17 where a car is needed many times and I don't view a
18 car as an enemy. I view a... an irresponsible as an
19 enemy. And there are too many of those who go too
20 quickly, who ignore stop signs, ignore red lights.
21 I was at a red light the other day and there was a...
22 another person next to me in the car and I thought
23 the light had changed but no he went right through
24 the red light. And I had somebody else in the car
25

1 and I said but... I can't fathom this. So we could
2 get all the traffic calming measures in the world
3 which I support but it's a question of enforcement,
4 sending out a message because we could lose a life.
5 So I... Mrs. Kahn I thank you for coming, Mr. Kahn I
6 thank you. And please know that we're doing all we
7 can and... and my prayers are with you.

8 DEBBIE KAHN: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I just wanted to
10 acknowledge the Kahn family's efforts and... and your
11 dedication in being here hearing after hearing and
12 making sure that, that you are keeping Seth's
13 memory alive and... and striving for good to come for
14 so many other families and so many other potential
15 victims of... of... of vehicular violence and... and so
16 we... we thank you and we acknowledge your dedication
17 and your advocacy and you're organizing because
18 you're... you also give voice to so many families.
19 And... and the long term benefits from your advocacy
20 will... will... will be there but not... not in... not
21 unless you continue. And so we... we really
22 appreciate you being here and advocating for
23 greater resources and for advocating for clear time
24 lines and clear goals and clear you know that we're
25

1 meeting our benchmarks. And you know Paul to your
2 point you know we need to prioritize where our
3 capital dollars go. And that needs to be you know
4 safety above all needs to be the priority. And so I
5 join you in... in advocating for greater resources
6 for... for infrastructure, redesign, and improvements
7 that are all aimed at improving safety in our
8 streets and... and I join Council Member Reynoso. I
9 think I know a little bit about what he's talking
10 about. And... and I think that we need to make sure
11 that in all these conversations safety is the
12 paramount issue. So thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I'd just like to
15 say that you know as a father of two daughters you
16 know there's no way of how we can understand the
17 pain, that those of you who has lost a loved one is
18 being going through. It doesn't matter when did it
19 happen. And I thank you for keeping your son in the
20 Family for Safe Street, all the love one alive by
21 fighting so that other family doesn't go through
22 the same pain that you've been going through. And I
23 know that there's no way to write the chapter on
24 Vision Zero and have... we have been able to improve
25 transportation in New York City without the Tri-

1 State Transportation Campaign, Family for Safe
2 Street, and Transportation Alternative. For you
3 being a strong and important voice when it come to
4 working hard as a team to reassure that New York
5 City improve safety in the streets so that
6 everyone, especially cyclists and... and pedestrian
7 are safe. So thank you and as you know we will
8 continue having conversation discussing your
9 suggestion. And also your input on whatever plan I
10 have or we have will always be very important.
11 Thank you.

12
13 PAUL WHITE: Thank you.

14 DEBBIE KAHN: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [background, off
16 mic comments] And again following Transportation
17 Alternative if you have a testimony you can give
18 your testimony and summarize it but we're going to
19 limiting it two minutes. Thanks.

20 ERIC MCCLURE: Good afternoon. And thank
21 you. My name is Eric McClure. I'm the Executive
22 Director of StreetsPAC. On behalf of my colleagues
23 at Streets Pack I'd like to thank you Chairman
24 Rodriguez, Council Member Vacca, Council Member
25 Levin, your fellow committee members and staff for

holding this hearing today. When Mayor de Blasio just two weeks into his term in January 2014 announced the formation of the Interagency Working Group on Vision Zero it marked the setting of an ambitious yet crucial mission for New York to reduce traffic deaths to zero within ten years. To be sure we've made some notable progress toward that goal lowering the citywide speed limit to 25 miles per hour, activating the city's full complement of speed cameras how... however short of an optimal number that is, passing a law that makes it a crime to violate the right of way of people on foot and on bikes, rendering the vast majority of the central and prospect park drives car free and beginning the transformation of Queens is notorious boulevard of death to a modern complete street are all important milestones. Pedestrians deaths fell to a record low in 2014 and we just might reduce that number again this year. The... the numbers that Commissioner Trottenberg mentioned are... are very encouraging on that front. While this is progress though we still must acknowledge that we have a long long way to go on the road to Vision Zero. Just last evening another New Yorker was killed on

a sidewalk when a red light driving, red light running SUV driver in Richmond Hill triggered a crash that caused her to lose control and mount a curb, a crash that also injured a toddler. In Staten Island on Monday night two drivers killed pedestrians in separate crashes on Highland Boulevard just three and half hours apart. Last week an out of control for hire driver struck a mother and four children in the Bronx on a sidewalk at high speed as they made their way to school. Miraculously none of the five victims were killed. But crashes that cause death or life altering injuries remain all too common and dangerous driving remains too often the norm. to have any hope of achieving Vision Zero by 2024 we must redouble our efforts. We must spend more, considerably more, to reengineer our streets because while better enforcement and better education are important and laudable the central tenant of Vision Zero is that people make mistakes and therefore we must design our streets for human fallibility. We applaud Chairman Rodriguez' commitment to better fund the Department of Transportation in order to increase operational

1 capacity as well as its call to build 400 miles of
2 protected bike lanes by 2030. That type of world
3 class infrastructure has been proved again and
4 again to significantly reduce injuries and deaths
5 not only among people on bikes but among walkers
6 and drivers and transit riders alike. It's a type
7 of engineering that saves lives and its key to
8 Vision Zero. We must rapidly expand the great
9 streets program to tackle the redesign of more
10 dangerous corridors every year and take on the
11 redesign of our intersections where far too many
12 New Yorkers are injured or killed while crossing in
13 crosswalks while they have the right of way. In
14 short we must be bolder, we must think bigger, we
15 must act faster. We need to summon the political
16 will necessary to implement the lifesaving changing
17 that will inevitably engender grumbling from some
18 if we're going to achieve Vision Zero for all.
19 Thank you.

21 UNKNOWN MALE: Good afternoon everybody.
22 My name is... I'm the Representative United Taxi
23 Driver Association. I have been driving since 1997.
24 I have a lot of experience. I was on the... I... I am
25 the eye witness. The... says couple of things the DOT

1 that needed... designed when it coming from the...
2 some... bars. When it come... the public this time the
3 middle of the street they'll hail a cab because...
4 the design... ask because a green arrow... middle... same
5 thing on the 6th... 6th Avenue... on the... on the green
6 arrow they make a left turn. People who... who...
7 walking... following... the design there because
8 they're very dangerous. If you follow the... Queens
9 coming to Manhattan... Street... no indication... there's
10 only those coming from the city that have a turn...
11 right... sign... this is very dangerous. If you follow
12 the Vision Zero we need to must change this... this
13 point. And other things all... all the major... like...
14 there's no green arrow. The both side traffic...
15 fast, no one's stopping. No one can get... other way...
16 traffic... green arrow there's... Also I've... custom...
17 all custom... don't have any green arrow. That is
18 very dangerous... 7th avenue up to 7:00 you can make
19 a turn... from the other side traffic don't... don't
20 get a change. Still... intersection like that's... 7th
21 Avenue down... I have to make a red light to make a
22 turn and that is... understand who walking... change
23 those kind of things. And other things sometime I
24 see this in... close they make a drop like a... I

1 cannot go... before the... of 57... people have a choice.
2 They go to the left and right taking a detour but
3 up to 57 the... people cannot go. There's one street...
4 all traffic... I am the left lane. I'm going the
5 westbound and I have to make a left and left and
6 right all the... four or five lane. This is very
7 dangerous. Thank you very much.

9 ALEX SLACIOM: Good afternoon. My name
10 is Alex Slaciom here representing Triple A
11 Northeast which serves a membership of over 570,000
12 drivers in the five boroughs in... and 1.6 million in
13 the New York metropolitan area. And I'd like to
14 thank you Chairman Rodriguez for holding this
15 hearing and... and thank Council Members Vacca and
16 Levin for... for sticking around. And this city has
17 really made remarkable strides since the
18 introduced... introduction of the Vision Zero action
19 plans in... in early 2014. I mean there's a lot... been
20 a lot of street redesigns, increased enforcement of
21 failure to yield and speeding and a lot of
22 education efforts with the Vision Zero street team,
23 paid media. And it has produced dramatic reductions
24 in... in severe injuries for... for both pedestrians
25 and I think, as Ms. Vanterpool pointed out before,

1 for drivers as well for vehicle occupants and I
2 think that is a very important component and very
3 important to... to point out. And... and there's a lot
4 more things to come that we're excited about. I've
5 listed some of them in my testimony. I just want to
6 talk about three particular initiatives that... that
7 we think that the city could be doing. First and...
8 and I'll be brief. I know the city is... is
9 supportive of removing the exemption of... for... of...
10 of the seatbelt law for... for hire vehicles and
11 we're supportive of that change. We also encourage
12 them to include removing the exemption for adult
13 rear seat occupants as well. New York passed the
14 first seatbelt law 31 years ago and now we've
15 fallen behind most states. Most other states
16 require seatbelts for all vehicle occupants. New
17 York doesn't and... and we'd encourage the... the city
18 get... to get behind that call. The second one in
19 terms of enforcement priorities for the NYPD there
20 are some... there are some summons data Council
21 Member Vacca that I've included in my testimony
22 that is available on the NYPD website. I have
23 through January through August because that's the
24 last data we have for 2015. And failure to yield to
25

1
2 pedestrians, speeding, that's been the... the big
3 priority. But one thing that has fallen by the
4 wayside a little bit is cell phone use. Tickets
5 have declined by more than a third for cell phone
6 use. And I... I know the city has included that as a
7 dangerous violation. The... they are being data
8 driven but the problem is often times cell phone
9 use is not encompassed in the data. I mean just as
10 an example there were 3,471 reported injury or
11 fatal collisions this past august. Cell phone use
12 or texting was reported as a contributing factor in
13 19 crashes. I don't think anyone believes that
14 number. And so I encourage the NYPD to maintain
15 their previously high levels. I know it's a zero
16 sum game sort of when it comes to enforcement but
17 I... I'd encourage an uptake in those numbers. And
18 then lastly I just want to talk about... sure. With
19 red light cameras and speed cameras we support them
20 as long as they're operated transparently. And I
21 think there's some requirements in terms of
22 individual locations that the city is not satisfied
23 and I... I think they... we'd like to see that
24 satisfied before they go up to the state. Thank
25 you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

STEVEN BELLMAN: My name is Steven

Bellman. I have a prepared remarks but just distill

it to four points. First with regard to the

progress on Vision Zero with regard to lowering the

speed limit. We should have seen a 33 percent

reduction in fatalities to date according to

Commissioner Trottenberg's analysis to date we've

seen only a 14 percent reduction in fatalities.

They're saying the reason for that I believe is

that the speed reduction to 25 miles an hour is not

being enforced. And the reason is motorists have no

fear of being caught. And I lay this to the lack of

enforcement or... and publicity by New York's NYPD.

There are some things that they could do which

would actually get the message across which costs

nothing and that is that the statement issued at

the scene of an accident... at a... of a collision by

the local precinct person should be based on the

pedestrian's injuries. The car was most likely

disobeying the speed limit, exceeding it. That

would get... that cost nothing but rather than

speculating whether or not the pedestrian was in

the crosswalk or not that should be the only

statement made and this is true in 80 percent of crashes that you have. It would do a long way to educating the public because if that's the only thing the Newspapers printed people would know that speeding is important. Finally, with regard to one point, one question that Chairman Rodriguez made is I do have a solution for eliminating car parking in bicycle lanes. It's fairly simple. Develop an app for a cell phone, for a smart phone and allow any citizen to snapshot a vehicle in the lane. Split the 115-dollar parking violation 10 percent for the person who takes the shot and a \$1.50 for the app developer. Have it all done that it's a 10 percent finder's fee. You'll eliminate it in a couple of weeks. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

Michael.

MICHAEL O'LOUGHLIN: Thanks. Good morning. I speak today for Cab Riders United, a voice for the 1.2 million daily passengers who ride in taxis and for hire vehicles. Our priorities are safety, the quality of service, and the environmental impact of that industry? I beg your pardon? Yes, I thought I did, I'm sorry. Michael

O'Loughlin Cab Riders United. As such we're very strong supporters of Vision Zero. I'm going to try to speak pretty quickly on this topic. Oh and my phone is going off. Regarding... and thanking Mr. Chair for... for focusing attention on this part in... in your earlier questioning. Training and certification it is great that taxi school is being expanded. We think it's important that a real spotlight is thrown on what the curriculum will be. And we continue to advocate for a road test. Dana Learner, the mother of Cooper Stock who's one of the members of our advisory board I know it is unfathomable to her that we have tens of thousands of professional drivers on our streets who have never shown that they can drive on the streets of New York as a condition of their licensing to... to be professional drivers. Enforcement... we would associate ourselves with the comments of transportation alternatives and others specific... that TLC regulated industries we need more CIS investigations and better coordination. We also particularly for professional drivers need to look at crashes that are serious but not critical or deadly. These are drivers who are driving up to 12

hours a day seven days a week. We need to have a real high standard there. Technology. Let's keep pushing on black boxes. We agree with a lot of the other witnesses in support of speed cameras and red light cameras. In written testimony I'll address some other issues. Driver safety, thank you for highlighting that in your recent report Mr. Chair. Driver pay, studies show that better paid drivers are actually safer drivers. We should all keep that in mind. I want to actually take a minute to just look at vehicle design issues. The partition. Decades ago when the partition was first required for yellow taxis the TLC chair at the time said this will be a gift to New York City's plastic surgeons. Unfortunately, tragically he was right. You go to any ER in the city today and peoples' injuries from the partition are so common they have a name for it. They call it partition face. We now need to have partitions that are proven safe before they're approved for use in taxis. They influence the rigidity of the vehicle and how it absorbs stress. They create a new barrier for... for peoples' faces. Airbags. It's 2015. We should have passengers for passengers as a standard feature in

1 New York City's taxis and for hire vehicles. There
2 is at least one vehicle that is approved for use as
3 a taxi by the TLC that includes not a single airbag
4 for passengers. Pedestrian impact and bicycle
5 protection standards. In a dense pedestrian rich
6 environment like New York City if we're going to be
7 licensing professional driver... professional
8 vehicles to provide service on the streets we
9 should hold them to the highest standards of
10 pedestrian protection, design, and that also applies
11 for bicycle protection. There are global standards
12 for that and sliding doors will help prevent
13 dooring... I'll summarize.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Ten seconds.

16 MICHAEL O'LOUGHLIN: Wheelchair
17 accessible vehicles, it's great that we're moving
18 to 50 percent accessibility. We need to make sure
19 that those vehicles meet the same original
20 equipment manufacturer standards to make sure that
21 they are safe for the passengers whether they are
22 in a wheelchair or not. In a final point in terms
23 of equity across the city many of these... these
24 design issues that I've just highlighted are
25 actually addressed through the Taxi of Tomorrow

Program but 94 percent of the yellow taxis are in Manhattan or the airports. They don't serve upper Manhattan or where I live in Brooklyn or other parts of the city. So please let's look for that equity. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Your testimony is very important. And I also should thank my colleague who stay up until the end. And with this this hearing is adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 12, 2015