CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK -----Х TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES Of the SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND CONCESSIONS ---- Х July 20, 2015 Start: 01:26 a.m. Recess: 02:26 p.m. HELD AT: 250 Broadway- Committee Rm, 16th Fl. BEFORE: INEZ E. DICKENS Chairperson COUNCIL MEMBERS: ANDREW COHEN DARLENE MEALY MARK TREYGER YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road - Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502 Phone: 914-964-8500 * 800-442-5993 * Fax: 914-964-8470

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Seth Meyers Executive Vice President Economic Development Corporation

Ted Varvatsas Executive Vice President S&L Aerospace Metals

Tracy Bell Vice President Economic Development Corporation

Glenn [sp?] [unknown] Attorney S&L Aerospace Metals

Larry Schnapf Counsel for Environmental Matters S&L Aerospace Metals

Artie Pearson Director of Land Use Office of Governmental Affairs - HPD

Bianda [sp?] Simmons Deputy Director Manhattan Planning

Ralph Declet Vice President of Development Acacia Network Organization

1 CONCESSIONS

2

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Good afternoon. I 3 4 am Council Member Inez E. Dickens, Chair of the 5 Subcommittee on Planning, Dispositions, and 6 Concessions. I would like to welcome everyone to 7 today's hearing and I want to thank and acknowledge 8 the Sergeant of Arms, Eddie Collazo and the two new 9 interns that are with us, Justin Roa [sp?] and 10 Ahlen Raj [sp?], my Land Use Director Raju Mann, 11 Deputy Director Amy Leviton [sp?] and my attorneys 12 Ann McCoyhee [sp?] and Dillon Casey. I want to 13 apologize for the lateness. But the weather is hot. 14 I know the air conditioner is not operating at its 15 best but this is the... this is some of the effects 16 of government in action. I want to acknowledge my 17 esteemed colleagues who are members of the Planning 18 Subcommittee; Council Member Andy Cohen, Council 19 Member Mark Treyger who gets the gold star, Council Member Darlene Mealy, and we've also been joined by 20 21 Council Member Paul Vallone in whose district Land 22 Use Item 253 is in. We have three items on our 23 calendar, two of which are related. We will be 24 hearing and voting on all. I now open up the 25 hearing for Land Use Item 253, the S&L Aerospace

1

2 Metals proposed by the New York City Department of Citywide Administrative Services for the 3 disposition of one city owned property located in 4 Council Member Vallone's district in Queens. We 5 have before us three people, two from EDC and one 6 7 from S&L to give testimony. I'm going to ask that you turn your mics on, pull it close to yourselves, 8 and identify with your name and your title. 9 SETH MEYERS: Good afternoon. I'm Seth 10 Meyers. I'm an Executive Vice President at the 11 12 Economic Development Corporation. TED VARVATSAS: [off mic] Good afternoon 13 Ted Varvatsas Executive... [on mic] Executive Vice 14 15 President S&L Aerospace Metals. 16 TRACY BELL: Good afternoon I'm Tracy Bell, Vice President at Economic Development 17 18 Corporation. CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: EDC I'm going to 19 20 ask you to begin testimony please. SETH MEYERS: Thank you very much. And 21 22 good afternoon again. My name's Seth Myers. I'm 23 the... the Director of Project Implementation and Executive Vice President at the New York City 24 Economic Development Corporation. I'm here on 25

CONCESSIONS

1

2 behalf of the city to testify in support of S&L Aerospace, the intended purchaser of the Northern 3 portion of Block 4317 Lot 1 in College Point Queens 4 5 contemplated in the ULERP under discussion today for disposition approval. As a result of a 2012 RFP 6 7 S&L was selected to develop an industrial facility on the city EDC owned land in order to expand their 8 operations currently located on the western portion 9 of block 4317. The transaction if approved would 10 result in the expansion of S&L Aerospace's 11 12 manufacturing and assembling facilities from 45,000 13 square feet to 80,000 square feet. Following the 14 intended closing S&L would move into a 10,000 15 square foot existing building on the current EDC 16 owned lot followed by the new construction of a 24,000 square foot building on the current city 17 18 owned lot. We are excited to support this longstanding Queens business and their plans to 19 20 expand. S&L has 85 employees today. Approval would allow them to bring on more than 20 new high 21 22 quality manufacturing jobs to the College Point 23 Corporate Park paying at or above living wage to New Yorkers. During the RFP selection process in 24 25 the recent public review the community and all of

1 CONCESSIONS

2 the elected representatives have given clear and strong support to S&L Aerospace. S&L is here today 3 4 to speak in greater detail about their success 5 about a company. But first I would like to take a few moments to address the concerns that we have 6 7 heard from Queens Community Board 7 about ongoing environmental remediation on the site. These 8 concerns are entirely separate from the ULERP 9 10 action under consideration today. However we realize the community is deeply concerned with 11 12 these issues and accordingly we'll address them. 13 RJR, a prior owner of the land that we intend to 14 sell to S&L assumed liability for an oil spill on 15 the property by entering into a stipulation 16 agreement with the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation, or DEC in 2007. This 17 18 stipulation states that RJR is obligated to clean up and remove contamination related to the oil 19 20 spill. As stated in the letter from DEC that I will read into the record following this testimony RJR 21 2.2 has been working in good faith to remediate the 23 spill since entering into the stipulation 24 agreement. It should be noted that oil spill rememediation can take long and often undefined 25

1 CONCESSIONS

2 periods of time to complete. However RJR has made progress cleaning up the spill since entering into 3 4 the agreement with EDC RJR has completed the following actions, removed the failed underground 5 fuel tanks, associated piping, and the surrounding 6 7 contaminated soil, removed the free product that had been floating on the water table, disposed of 8 the nearly 15 hundred pounds of contamination via 9 soil vapor extraction and removed over 1.5 million 10 gallons of impacted ground water. And progress 11 12 continues. As of this month DEC has approved a new 13 work plat to delineate the remainder of the 14 impacted soil and groundwater. The results of the 15 work plan will be used to develop a remedial action 16 plan. We sympathize with community board 7's 17 frustrations regarding the pace of remediation and 18 have confirmed commitments from RJR and DEC that the site will be fully remediated. Following my 19 20 testimony I will read a statement from RJR reaffirming their commitment to completing the 21 2.2 site's remediation. RJR and DEC stipulation 23 agreements obligates RJR to complete the remediation work. But in the event that RJR does 24 25 not complete the remediation DEC will take over the

CONCESSIONS

1

2 project as a special remediation spill case. This means that regardless of the responsible party the 3 remediation work will be completed. RJR has also 4 5 stated that going forward they will keep Community 6 Board 7 and the College Point Corporate Park 7 updated on their progress on a quarterly basis or more frequently as needed. S&L is well aware of the 8 ongoing remediation and their expansion into the 9 10 existing EDC owned building will not be inhibited by RJR's remediation efforts. Additionally prior to 11 12 constructing a new building on the side of the city 13 owned vacant land S&L will complete an 14 environmental phase 2 and remediate as may be 15 necessary for construction. It should be further 16 noted that the plume from the original spill does not appear to be located in the footprint of S&L's 17 18 new development. And again RJR's remediation work will not impede S&L's expansion. S&L has provided 19 20 access to its current facility to RJR for ongoing investigatory work and will continue to provide 21 2.2 access to RJR for completion of the remediation 23 work through their expansion into the existing building. I would like to remind the committee that 24 25 S&L Aerospace is a model manufacturing company that

CONCESSIONS

1

2 provides high quality career pathways to New Yorkers of all backgrounds and skill levels. In a 3 growing sector that is vital to New York City's 4 5 economy approval of this ULERP action will support 6 S*L's plans to invest in their community and create 7 additional high tech manufacturing jobs. We urge the city council to separate the complicated 8 history of the site from its... from the future of 9 10 this thriving college point jobs creator. I will now read the afore mentioned letters for the 11 12 record. The first letter is from RJR Realty 13 Associates. To Council Member Paul A. Vallone, dated July 17th, 2015. Dear Council Member Vallone. 14 15 On behalf of my partners and I, I would like to 16 thank you for taking the time to meet with us recently in your office and at our site. We want to 17 18 ensure you and Community Board 7 that we are committed to completing the environmental 19 20 remediation to current accepted standards and installing a new state of the art asphalt 21 2.2 manufacturing facility including the tax lot 23 separation work on the site as expeditiously as possible. I would like to highlight what we have 24 25 accomplished over the last several years. In 1998

CONCESSIONS

1

2 an oil leak was discovered on site upon removal of underground storage tanks. In 2007 RJR signed a 3 4 stipulation agreement with the New York State DEC abbreviated here as NYSDEC to remediate the site, 5 6 submit it and received approval of a remediation 7 action plan and installed the DEC approved remediation system. From discovery of the spill 8 through January 2014 RJR removed over 275 cubic 9 10 yards of impacted soil, removed approximately 15 hundred pounds of contamination via soil-vapor 11 12 extraction and extracted, treated, and discharged approximately 1,600,000 gallons of impacted ground 13 14 water. The majority of the construction and 15 demolition work required for the new tax lot was 16 completed by Fall 2014. The remainder of the tax lot work includes various inspections and sign offs 17 18 from DOB. From June 2014 through June 2015 we submitted a ... work plan to DEC, performed additional 19 20 investigation work, and submitted and received approval of a work plan for the final round of 21 2.2 investigation which should be completed by the end 23 of July. Upon the completion of the final round of 24 environmental investigatory work it will take two 25 to three months to analyze the data, prepare the

CONCESSIONS

1

2 report and meet with DEC to discuss the results and agree on what additional remediation may be 3 required. Cofire Industries has ordered all of the 4 equipment for the new facility. Approximately half 5 of the equipment with a value of approximately 6 7 800,000 dollars has been paid for, delivered, and is being stored in the Bronx. When the tax lot work 8 is completed we will promptly submit the 9 10 applications for the permits to install the new asphalt plan. Upon receipt of the necessary permits 11 12 we are committed to immediately commencing the site 13 work and installing the new asphalt plan within one year of the construction commencement date. Our 14 15 agreements with EDC will reflect this timing. I 16 just want to re ... reiterate that we are committed to completing the tax lot and remediation work and 17 18 getting the new plant up and running as soon as possible. Each month... each month that the new 19 20 asphalt facility is not in operation we lose over 900 thousand dollars in potential revenue. Lastly 21 22 we understand that Community Board 7 and the 23 College Point Corporate Part Taskforce are unhappy 24 with a lack of updates on the progress of this 25 project. Going forward we will present to the

CONCESSIONS

1

2 taskforce on the current status and projected completion and provide the taskforce with updates 3 on a quarterly basis or more frequently as needed. 4 5 Again we thank you for your interest and 6 involvement in our project and would welcome any 7 assistance that you may offer in expediting its completion. We look forward to continuing our 8 longstanding relationship in the corporate park and 9 surrounding community, sincerely RJR realty 10 associates. The second letter I'll read is from the 11 12 New York State Department of Environmental Conservation. To Council Member Paul Vallone. Dated 13 July 15th, 2015. Dear Council Member Vallone, This 14 15 letter updates our letter to the city planning commission dated June 2nd, 2015 for its use during 16 the hear ... hearing for ULERP number 150173PPQ. The 17 18 letter discusses the enforcement activiti3es of the Department of Environmental Conservation, DEC 19 20 related to the Cofire or Cofire asphalt plant and their affiliate RJR realty associates. Cofire was 21 22 issued an air facility registration by DEC on March 23 28th, 2007. And at that time our regulations did not require end dates with regards to air facility 24 registrations. Our regulations have since been 25

CONCESSIONS

1

2 updates and Cofire will need to renew their air facility registration by March 27th, 2017. Their 3 registration indicates that they are burning number 4 two fuel oil, nitrous oxide emissions are capped at 5 12.5 tons per year and the facility will limit the 6 7 annual asphalt production to no more than 200,000 tons. Our last inspection of 3/31/2015 showed that 8 they produced the following tonnages; 2012 38,176 9 tons of asphalt, 2013 48,189 tons of asphalt, 2014 10 60,371 tons of asphalt all of which are well below 11 12 the maximum permissible 200 thousand tons. At this 13 time please note that there are no air related 14 enforcement matters. Regarding the stipulation with 15 RJR realty associates that controls the clean-up and removal of discharge from spill number 98-11754 16 it has been in effect since February 2nd, 2007. 17 18 Cofire has been working on removing petroleum that has been absorbed by the soil under the site and 19 20 dissolved in the ground water. This process had been slow as is typical with this type of 21 22 remediation but progress is being made as all 23 floating product has been removed from the water table. DEC believes that Cofire has been working in 24 25 good faith to remediate the spill. The next step is

CONCESSIONS

1

2 to delineate and remediate impacted soil and ground water. To this end Cofire and DEC met on May 27th, 3 2015 in order to finalize the details of a 4 perspective work plan. The results of the meeting 5 were that additional groundwater monitoring wells 6 7 and soil borings will be installed to more fully delineate the extent of the contamination. In 8 addition triennial groundwater monitoring will 9 continue. Progress since the June 2nd letter. A 10 work plan for the delineation was submitted to NYS 11 DEC by Cofire on June 19th, 2015 and approved on 12 July 1st by NYSDEC. The new York City Office of 13 Environmental remediation also submitted a separate 14 work plan dated June 19th, 2015 for additional 15 16 investigative work at the site. This plan was also approved by the NYSDEC. Field work for both plans 17 18 is scheduled for late July. The work plans submitted by Cofire includes a schedule that will 19 20 result in completion of the delineation report some time during the late summer after which the 21 22 remedial action plan will be developed. The 23 Department is continuing to work with Cofire to move the remediation process forward. If you have 24 any questions as to the status of the remediation 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND 15 CONCESSIONS 1 2 or any other concerns regarding the regulated environmental performance of this facility please 3 don't hesitate to reach ... reach out to me at 4 (718)482-4949. Sincerely, Venetia Lannon, Regional 5 Director New York State Department of Environmental 6 7 Conservation, Region 2. Thank you very much. CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you very 8 much. Ms. Bell do you have anything you want to add 9 to that lengthy testimony? 10 11 TRACY BELL: No ma'am. I am here to 12 respond to any questions on the environmental 13 matters. 14 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Mr. Varvatsas? 15 TED VARVATSAS: Correct. 16 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Do you have any 17 statement as it relates to your position as 18 executive VP at S&L? TED VARVATSAS: As far as the 19 20 environmental? Well I'd like to read a brief statement pertaining to that. Until recently we 21 2.2 expected that our expansion would not be 23 significantly impacted if at all by ongoing remediation and the DEC stipulation agreement. We 24 understand that a new remedial action plan was 25

1 CONCESSIONS

2 produced by Cofire and approved by DEC. Upon review of this plan we will better understand how the ... how 3 our expansion ... During this time we also plan to 4 5 perform a phase two to determine whether there are 6 any other environmental issues at the property. 7 Particularly upgrading of the spill. This will give us the information necessary to appropriately plan 8 our expansion. 9

10 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you very much. And before I open it up for questions I'm 11 12 going to ask Council Member Vallone to ... to make a statement. However I... there's one statement I want 13 14 to make and that's in response to Mr. Myers asking 15 us to separate the concerns of the community board 16 from the fact that this is ... will open up jobs that are ... uh will hire ... and I assume from within the 17 18 community and have above average rates. We cannot do that. We listen to the community. That's how we 19 make a determination. And although that something 20 may be an excellent proposition that's being 21 2.2 brought to us we do take into consideration ... we do 23 not forget the people that are actually residents 24 in the neighborhood. And that is very important to 25 us that we listen to them and take their concerns

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND CONCESSIONS 1 2 seriously. So although it ... we maybe cannot make community benefits agreements and other things a 3 4 part of a deed or a part of a ULERP process we 5 certainly can impact upon it with our vote. Thank you. Alright Council Member Vallone. 6 7 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I... I can't thank you enough Madam Chair for your comments and 8 my fellow council member support. There is a long 9 10 and lengthy history. And I thank you ... and everyone for going over it. And you can't really separate 11 12 the two. And no one's here to create a burden for S&L who's been the example of what College Point 13 14 has been looking for for decades, that good tenant 15 with good jobs, with no environmental impact on the 16 community, that really the whole country can use as an exemplary company. We thank you and we want to 17 18 keep you at all costs. However not everyone is like you and College Point has seen its share of broken 19 promises. So what this process has done though has 20 really brought ... and I thank EDC for being a partner 21 2.2 with me and this part at the end and all the ... all 23 of the agencies to step up to hear our concerns and 24 realize that the community boards are the anchors

for us as Council Members. And when they are

25

CONCESSIONS

1

2 concerned we're concerned. So pulling this process up for the ULERP and the work that was done in the 3 4 last couple of months was astronomical and ... and thankful for how much was done. And a lot of it 5 even the community board wasn't aware of. And I 6 7 think even when we just had our most recent site visit a lot of the comments and testimony there is 8 we didn't know that, why didn't you tell us. So I 9 think we've all kind of learned through this 10 process when there is a ... this type of impact ... when 11 12 you're talking about oil spills in a local community and the concern lingering in a 13 14 neighborhood we have no other duty but to do 15 exactly what we did. And I thank you for stepping 16 up to reassuring everyone's role in what the cleanups will be, what the stipulation was and what 17 18 the stipulation now is, how S&L even through this whole process has agreed to go forward and do what 19 20 they have to do with the site. And now that we've met with Cofire and they've reissued their 21 2.2 commitment to do the final steps ... So much has gone 23 on underground a lot of people weren't aware of 24 what was gone on there. But uh they can't switch to 25 the green plant that they promised until a lot of

CONCESSIONS

1

2 building permits and brings in our favorite building department, until that's all done. So 3 there's so many issues at play here that nothing 4 else could have been done but pull this up for 5 today. And that's why I thank our council members 6 7 for giving me a couple of minutes to explain this because it wasn't an easy situation and we do 8 follow our community boards. And as a result of 9 10 these commitments and the remedial action plan which is going to be a work in progress, so we're 11 12 going to hold you ... and I know EDC's just really the least partner of that whole but it really you're 13 14 bringing them all to the table. So whether it's the 15 state, or the city DEC or any department that's 16 involved at this site in College Point the remedial action plan to me and our community is going to be 17 18 key ... We've made commitments to go forward with it. A lot of testing's going to be happening at the end 19 20 of this month. So we're going to have to continue on... make sure S&L is not hindered in any way. And 21 2.2 now that I know that Cofire has agreed to continue 23 their commitment as well as DEP and EDC and the 24 Building Department is trying to get involved we have done what I believe which was answer the 25

1 CONCESSIONS

community's concerns, answer the community board's
call, stepped up and given these additional levels
of protection at College Point so right we deserve.
So thank you Madam Chair and my fellow Council
Members. As a result of today's letters and
stipulations I now approve this plan. And I leave
it up to the committee for their final vote.

CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you so much 9 Council Member. And., and Council Member Vallone was 10 very concerned after I received a briefing and ... and 11 12 a lengthy discussion with EDC I ran into Council Member Vallone whom I was going to call in any case 13 14 and he gave me a ... a small briefing on exactly what 15 had occurred... the history of lots 1 and 60 and 16 exactly what was going to be built. And his ... his support in general of this plan ... just the concerns 17 18 of the community Board. So I want everyone to know that Council Member Vallone really showed 19 20 dedication and due diligence before approving this ... this action. So I thank you. Do any of my 21 2.2 colleagues have any questions? Council Member 23 Mealy? 24 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you. I'm 25 glad that you worked that out. I just have a

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND 21 CONCESSIONS 1 2 question on environmental. For EDC have ... when was the last time you did a environmental study that a 3 4 party did not keep up to their part of the contract and then ED... EDC would take over and complete the 5 6 remediation? Could you tell me what you did on one 7 of those before? SETH MEYERS: I... I think there may be a 8 confusion over the similarity in initials of EDC 9 and DEC. 10 11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: EDC. 12 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: D. SETH MEYERS: And... and I think the ... the 13 instance that I referenced was as... as the ... the kind 14 15 of guarantee if you will that the remediation work 16 will be complete regardless of who it's performed 17 by, whether it's... it's RJR continuing what they're 18 doing... have been doing or in the case that they default or stop work for whatever reason that DEC 19 20 is prepared to complete it as a... as a special remediation spill case. 21 22 TRACY BELL: DEC has... [cross-talk] 23 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Please pull the 24 mic closer to you. 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND 2.2 CONCESSIONS 1 2 TRACY BELL: I'm sorry. DEC actually has 3 a... a fund for oil spills that are ... that are 4 orphaned. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Is it a time 5 frame on it? Because I see this started in 2007 and 6 7 we still cleaning it up now. [cross-talk] TRACY BELL: We are and ... 8 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: 2016. 9 TRACY BELL: ...DEC has informed us that 10 RJR has been moving forward as directed. So they 11 12 are not... and they don't feel that ... that RJR is in bad faith in any way. They think that they're 13 14 moving forward satisfactorily. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay thank you. 16 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Just for my 17 colleagues to understand Lot 1 in College Point is 18 the ULERP. And that's the city owned lot. And ... and lot 60 already has a building on it and there's 19 20 going to be expansion of that building as well as 21 new construction on lot one. 22 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Yes. Council 23 Member Mealy that ... that was at the heart of a lot 24 of our questions was who's going to perform the 25 clean-up. And ...

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND 23 CONCESSIONS 1 2 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: And the time 3 frame? COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: And the time 4 5 frame. We pushed very very hard to get a time frame 6 because we didn't want anyone to walk away and they 7 leave it up to a governmental agency to come in and clean-up which has already been since 2007. So for 8 College Point that has seen its share of whether 9 it's Willets Point Police Academy Waste Transfer 10 Stations, you name it they've been stuck with it. 11 12 They've seen so many broken promises. You can feel 13 the frustration no matter what you touch down there. So it's time for some good news for college 14 15 point. And a lot of the visions for EDC and what we 16 were talking about is ... is to create some of that good news. But this project was something in order 17 18 to go forward they had to get out of the past. And ... and we were not going to get to this point until 19 they met with us numerous times and they met with 20 the chair and the community board. And they even 21 22 went back to the community board like we has to re-23 explain it which was a huge help. And ... and I think that's what we needed to see. 24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND 2.4 CONCESSIONS 1 2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you Madam 3 Chair. 4 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you. Are there any members of the public wishing to give 5 6 testimony? Did you sign up? 7 [pause] CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: They might open up 8 Pandora's Box. Please turn your mics on and ... and 9 give your name and title and your affiliation. 10 GLENN: There's... okay. Glenn... . I'm an 11 12 attorney for S&L Aerospace as is Larry Schnapf who 13 is Counsel for Environmental Matters. I just wanted to add a little bit because I was listening to 14 15 concerns and I... I... testify unless there was 16 something that came up that I could add. But I will say that we've recently just within the last 17 18 several days did have additional talks with EDC. And S&L has always prided itself on being a good 19 20 neighbor to and ... and we appreciate very much the strong support that Community Board 7 has given 21 22 this project. One of the things that I just wanted 23 to bring in is... is addressing the concerns of the 24 community board ...

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND 25 CONCESSIONS 1 2 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: It wasn't this 3 project, it was your company. 4 GLENN: The company. 5 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Just make sure ... 6 GLENN: Okay. The company. But one of 7 the things that we wanted to address was the groundwater remediation. And as ... as you may know 8 that DEC has revised its ... its work plan on this. 9 And part of what they discovered was the ... the 10 ground... the soil contamination. What I just wanted 11 12 to inform the ... the city council of was that recently we we are exploring with the office of 13 environmental remediation of the city its new 14 15 program under which actually S&L is willing to try 16 to place itself to do some of the soil remediation. Our understanding and our assumption is that as we 17 18 perform this environmental remediation that's going to ... that's they think the source of this ground 19 20 water contamination. And to the extent that we're willing to step up and do ... and ... and do a little bit 21 2.2 more to clean that up that's going to help the 23 ground water situation as well. I want Larry to 24 just talk about the environmental OER process a little bit. 25

1

2 LARRY SCHNAPF: Hi I'm Larry Schnapf of 3 Schnapf LLC Environmental Counsel. So one of the 4 things we're concerned about is to ensure that the 5 cleanup is done properly. So we approach the office 6 of environmental remediation or the mayor's office. 7 They have two programs. One's called the voluntary cleanup program. The other one is no... is a new 8 program called the jumpstart for brownfield sites. 9 10 And one of their benefits of this program first of all it's got a very transparent, very robust public 11 12 participation process. So I know the DEC process is a little less transparent in the spills program and 13 14 that's been a problem with the community. Even 15 though there was a lot of work done on the ground 16 water we had every move ... the ... product had to get removed first before you could actually clean up 17 18 the ground water. And unfortunately that wasn't communicated well to the community. But the city ... 19 20 the city program has very robust public... public participation both at the application stage and 21 2.2 during each process the investigation, the clean 23 up. And so what we propose to do is we're going to investigate lot 1 which has not been investigated. 24 If there's any contamination there that would we 25

CONCESSIONS

1

2 would encounter as part of our construction we would address that soil contamination as part of 3 the OER program. The community would be notified 4 and at the end of the day we would get a letter 5 6 from the city giving us liability protection. We've 7 completed the work. It'll be ... the community will see that. And then with respect to lot 60 maybe 8 that we could as part of our build out excavate 9 under the slab to remove the source material which 10 is continuing to contaminate the ground water. 11 12 Because if we don't do that the only way to get to it is to put some sort of system underneath the 13 slab. So it may be beneficial to do that. In any 14 15 event S&L will be getting liability protection from 16 OER and DEC. So... [cross-talk] Oh okay I'm sorry. 17 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you so much. 18 Council Member Vallone do you have anything you want to respond to? 19 20 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Yeah ... [crosstalk] 21 22 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: In reference to 23 the Pandora's Box that was just opened up? 24 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I... yeah I... sometimes best left unsaid. But you brought up a 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND 28 CONCESSIONS 1 2 whole another lot and a whole another slew of questions and threw in a bunch of maybes. We don't 3 like maybes. So now that you've addressed the lot ... 4 5 So is S&L going to, as they do the expansion and do 6 the work and uncover some additional ... may uncover 7 an additional environmental issues, are they now going to clean those up? 8 LARRY SCHNAPF: Yes. We're going to 9 10 submit... [cross-talk] COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: A yes is 11 12 different from maybe. That's ... LARRY SCHNAPF: Yeah. So lot ... lot 1 was ... 13 14 which was the green where they're building the 15 building that has not been investigated. You know 16 the... the... what's going on so far has been an investigation of the spill which was on Lot 60. So 17 18 we're putting a building on Lot 1 which is that green lot that was up there. So we're going to do a 19 phase 2 under the oversight of OER. If we find 20 contamination we will clean it up under the 21 2.2 supervision of OER so that we get a no further 23 action letter. 24 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: And the phase two is above and beyond isn't it? [cross-talk] 25

1

2 LARRY: Well we were required as 3 part of the Neg Deck [phonetic] to do some 4 investigation to protect workers. So we're 5 basically going beyond that, yes. We're going to be 6 doing a... a comprehensive investigation. Under the 7 supervision of OER we will clean up any dirty soil that we find in Lot 1 which is again upgradient 8 [phonetic] from the spill so that'll ... we will do 9 10 that. GLENN: But let me just say we haven't 11 12 done the phase two that we're just about to do it. 13 LARRY SCHNAPF: Yeah. 14 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Part of the 15 concerns with Chair Dickens and I and everyone is 16 that so much is happening at the end of this month but due to the timing of the ULERP process in a 17 18 perfect world we would have loved to have held this meeting next month if we could. So we couldn't lose 19 20 this window. We had to have this hearing. I mean it would have been better to have this in the first 21 22 week of august because all these things would have 23 been up but we could not control the timeline. So 24 this remedial action plan now ... I think you need to 25 be part of that.

CONCESSIONS

1

2 GLENN: We ... we understand that the 3 timing is not ideal in this and we couldn't ... you know the sequence really wasn't up to us. On the 4 other hand we wanted to be clear as to S&L's 5 willingness to step up to do this because we heard 6 7 so many concerns from the community board. We ... you know these are all can... there are some 8 contingencies of this. You're saying what if ... what 9 if ... Again the sequence of events wasn't up to us 10 11 but we're willing to follow through. I just really felt that that had to be on the record, that S&L 12 13 was willing to go through these steps. 14 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Well that's 15 what we needed today for because otherwise each 16 party was going to walk away and say it was the 17 other party's responsibility ... 18 GLENN: Exactly. COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: ...and College 19 20 Point is left where it's always been, with broken promises. 21 22 GLENN: We think ... 23 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: So that's why 24 we... [cross-talk] 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND 31 CONCESSIONS 1 2 GLENN: We think that this is a... a way 3 forward. And it's certainly ... we looked at it as a 4 benefit for all parties. We don't ... You know we 5 fully anticipate that what RJR and DEC are going ... 6 are doing ... are still going to go forward. That's 7 not going to diminish at all. If anything this is 8 going to add value to the whole thing. COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: It's an extra 9 10 layer on top. 11 GLENN: Correct. 12 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [cross-talk] 13 but thank you... [cross-talk] got a little ... [cross-14 talk] got a little carried off topic. 15 LARRY SCHNAPF: What we learned ... what 16 Seth had said in his testimony about an OER approved plan, that's what we referring to ... OER ... 17 18 we've already submitted a... a plan to OER for conceptual approval. And then we would be 19 20 submitting ... we would do the investigation end of this month and then submitting both the report and 21 2.2 the remediation plan and the application to join 23 the OER program by the end of August. 24 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you.

	SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND
1	CONCESSIONS 32
2	CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Council Member
3	Treyger you have a
4	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Yes thank you
5	thank you Chair. We're hearing just about
6	contaminates other things What types are we
7	talking about? There… are there any specific
8	examples that you already know of right now of what
9	exist at any of the spill sites or is there any
10	information about that?
11	CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Tracy re-identify
12	yourself please.
13	TRACY BELL: Hello, I'm Tracy Bell with
14	Economic Development Corporation vice president.
15	It… in coming up here I forgotten what the question
16	was. Oh what kind of contaminate So the kinds of
17	contaminates that you would expect in lot one are
18	probably not oil problems, at least not from this
19	bill that's been identified because the ground
20	water flows away from lot one. So what you would
21	expect is typical kinds of historic contamination
22	that you might find in any site… in any site in New
23	York City. So there might be historic fill. There
24	might be small amounts of metals or or other
25	source of contaminates.
I	

1 CONCESSIONS

2	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGR: But I I I hear
3	you but it is there any specific information
4	there anything that is there anything you're
5	you're… so you're assuming… But is there anything
6	that's has been studied and evaluated already?
7	TRACY BELL: No we don't have we don't
8	have any evidence that there's any problem at all
9	but you always have to check.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay. Because
11	there are also regulations that govern how to
12	handle these contaminates as well how to remove
13	them how to transport them how to make sure that
14	they're done on accordance with state laws and
15	rules as well. So we're just going to make sure
16	that that's all being complied with and we have a
17	sense of exactly what we're dealing with. That's
18	that's very important.
19	TRACY BELL: Yes sir that that is the
20	mayor's office of of environmental remediation. It
21	has a program in place that makes sure that all of
22	those things are followed.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And DEC also
24	has many regulations in their state law that
25	governs this issue as well [cross-talk]

	SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND
1	CONCESSIONS 34
2	TRACY BELL: DEC is actually works
3	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Yeah.
4	TRACY BELL:very closely with OER.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay thank you.
6	CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you. Council
7	Member Mealy.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: No it was enough
9	said. I just like my colleague Vallone when he said
10	uh maybe I wrote something down right right away
11	because I know when environmental things happen
12	they say they going to do it and then it never gets
13	done. It goes year after year. But you said that
14	you thought the problem is the water is the real
15	problem the source. So if you find out it's not
16	the source it will still be your responsibility to
17	find out where the source is coming from or
18	TRACY BELL: So there are two different
19	concerns at this site. One is lot 1 that we already
20	talked about
21	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Mm-hmm.
22	TRACY BELL:and the other one is the
23	the area that we already know is [cross-talk]
24	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Right.
25	TRACY BELL:contaminated.
I	I

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND 35 CONCESSIONS 1 2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But he just stated that he think it's the water source. 3 TRACY BELL: Well when you do a ... an oil 4 spill remediation you have to deal with first the 5 floating product which... [cross-talk] 6 7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Ground. TRACY BELL: ...they've already done. And 8 then there's a combination of the soil and the 9 groundwater sort of... [cross-talk] 10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Ground. 11 12 TRACY BELL: ...interacting together. And 13 so what they're saying is once you get rid of the contaminated soil the groundwater isn't going to be 14 15 picking up any more contamination so it'll 16 automatically become less. 17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay he just said 18 maybe but then you still don't know. It could be something else but long as it's still your 19 20 responsibility to find out right? 21 LARRY SCHNAPF: When I said maybe I was 2.2 referring to the way to address the soil 23 contamination. So we could ... we might ... we have to 24 you know find out after the investigation is 25 complete it might make since to just dig up the

CONCESSIONS

1

2 soil under the slab or the other way that the DEC suggested was to do a... a system that would suck the 3 vapors out. It's just ... there's different ways of 4 addressing contamination. They'll be ... it'll ... it'll 5 6 be addressed one way or the other. It's just a 7 question which way it goes. And they'll be both done under supervision of the regulator so it'll 8 meet all the requirements. 9

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay I just know 11 I have one in my district happening now so I'm 12 going to be looking at yours very closely. So thank 13 you. Sorry for the... the delay but... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Please do not be 15 sorry because that is what you're supposed to, ask 16 questions. I ... I want to thank you for the testimony. I am going to ask Council Member Vallone 17 18 to please know that... that the community is relying upon you to continue to see that the remediation 19 20 really is completed. There was a commitment by Mr. Myers that if it was not done within a timeframe, 21 2.2 but no timeframe was given that DEC would step in. 23 DEC's letter did not sole state that. So you know I am going to ask that you for the protection of your 24 community continue to monitor that situation. I'm 25

CONCESSIONS

1

2 not trying to stop the… ULERP from going through 3 because of the jobs that will be created and that 4 there will be a build out within College Point.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: No madam Chair 6 we are 100 percent committed. As long as I'm there 7 in that office College Point has the friend we have been promising to be. And as long with the district 8 we will be there. And I think EDC and DEC and 9 10 Cofire and every company that's part of this and S&L's relationship we want to use that relationship 11 12 as an example for the expansion of proper expansion for College Point. And I think the commitments 13 14 they've made today no one ever wanted in short S&L 15 to be responsible for Cofire's mess. And what we've 16 gotten today is commitment, not just today, throughout this process that this is not going to 17 18 happen, that it's a universal ... proud of Cofire 19 stepping up, S&L, EDC, everyone to do what needed 20 to be. We're not going to walk away from this. We're going to watch this and bring ... like we said ... 21 2.2 good news get College Point going in the right 23 direction.

CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you so much.And again I want to thank you for your due

CONCESSIONS

1

2 diligence and following through up until the very last minute before giving your approval. Thank you. 3 And I want to thank EDC and DEC and DEP and Cofire 4 and whatever other acronym that's involved with 5 this for your due diligence, for answering all of 6 7 our questions, and for staying here to give us testimony. Thank you. I am now closing the public 8 hearing on Land Use Item 253. I'm now opening up 9 the hearing on two related items; Land Use 254 an 10 Land Use 255, the Promesa Acacia Gardens. The 11 12 action before us is to seek a zoning map change and designation disposition and project approval for 13 14 property located in speaker Melissa Mark Viverito's 15 district in Manhattan. Artie please don't forget to 16 identify and ... Ms. Sims and Mr. Declet? 17 ARTIE PEARSON: Afternoon Chair Dickens 18 and members of the subcommittee. I'm Artie Pearson, Director of Land Use from the Office of 19

20 Governmental Affairs within HPD and I'm joined by 21 Bianda Simmons [phonetic] who's a Deputy Director 22 for Manhattan Planning and Ralph Declet from the 23 Acacia Organization. The Land Use items before the 24 Planning Subcommittee are related ULERP actions for 25 a new construction project under HPD's extremely

CONCESSIONS

1

2 low... low income affordability program and is known as acacia gardens. Land Use number 254 consists of 3 4 the Urban Development Action Area Designation, 5 Disposition, and Project Approval for vacant ... vacant city-owned land located at 413 East 120th 6 Street which is block 1808 part of lot 8 within the 7 speaker's Manhattan district. Approval of the 8 proposed project will facilitate construction of a 9 10 12 story mixed use building with approximately 178 units of affordable rental housing plus one unit 11 12 for the superintendent. The building will contain a mix of unit types including studios one, two, and 13 three bedroom units. The AMIs will be from 30 14 15 percent to 90 percent and rents will average 16 between 368 for a studio and 1,740 for a three bedroom unit. The project also includes 5,370 17 18 square feet... fleet... feet of commercial space, 4,334 square feet of community facility space, 29 parking 19 spaces, 9,410 square feet of private outdoor 20 recreational space. The development side is 21 22 currently occupied by an underutilized parking lot 23 and the vacant wing of an HRA multi-service center 24 that is sometimes used for storage. Upon completion 25 of the development the new community space ...

CONCESSIONS

1

2 facility space will be used by the sponsor who will select a provider that will offer the same type of 3 social health services as the HRA multi-service 4 5 center. A tenant for the commercial space has yet to be identified. Land Use number 255 consists of 6 7 an application for an amendment to the zoning map that changes an R7-2 district to an R7X district 8 with a commercial overlay. And Council Member Mark 9 10 Viverito was supportive of the projects. And we are available to answer any questions that you have. 11 12 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Ms. Simmons do you 13 have anything you want to add? 14 SIMMONS: Good afternoon Chair Dickens 15 and the council members. No I'm in full support of 16 everything that Ms. Pierson mentioned. 17 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Mr. Declet do you 18 have anything from... you're from Acacia Gardens ... RALPH DECLET: Oh, good afternoon Madam 19 20 Chair and good afternoon... [cross-talk] CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Identify your name 21 22 and your... [cross-talk] 23 RALPH DECLET: Ralph... 24 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: ...where you're

25 from.

1

2 RALPH DECLET: Yes, Ralph Declet [sp?]. 3 I'm Vice President of Development for the Acacia Network Organization. Thank you for giving us this 4 opportunity to in support of our... our project 5 Acacia and affiliated entities have been working on 6 7 this particular project for over 10 years. And today we're... we're happy to be here at a... at a 8 significant benchmark to proceed with the 9 development of the property that's... that's the 10 subject of this hearing. 11 12 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Alright. Now the ... 13 I have a question on the zoning. The R72 to a R7X does that allow for increased FAR with a C15 14 15 commercial overlay? I'm asking that of anybody that 16 knows the answer. 17 SIMMONS: Yes it does. 18 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: What's the increase in the FAR? 19 20 SIMMONS: Okay we'll get that answer for you in a minute. 21 2.2 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: I'm patient. 23 [pause] 24 SIMMONS: So the existing R72 zoning district permits a maximum FAR of 344 for 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND 42 CONCESSIONS 1 2 residential uses and 6.5 FAR for community facilities. So the R7X zoning would permit a 3 maximum of FAR for five residential units... uses 4 along with five FAR for community facilities. And 5 the new district would be C15 for the commercial 6 7 overlay. CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Okay. So then in 8 essence they'll get ... be able to build an additional 9 floor or thereabouts? 10 SIMMONS: Yes, originally there were 11 11 12 stories and now there are 12 stories, there will be 13 a 12 story building. 14 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Alright and it's 15 income based is what the rents will be based upon? 16 SIMMONS: Yes. 17 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: On the AMIs? 18 SIMMONS: Yes that's correct. CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: What were the AMIs 19 20 again? Please refresh my memory. SIMMONS: Sure, it's 30 percent AMI rent 21 22 set at 27 percent, 40 percent AMI rents set at 37 23 percent, 50 percent AMI with rent set at 47 24 percent, 60 percent AMI with rent set at 57 25

	SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND
1	CONCESSIONS 43
2	percent, and 90 percent with rents set at 80
3	percent.
4	CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Very impressive.
5	Can I get that. I just thought I'd ask anyway. Do
6	you have anything you want to add
7	UNIDENTIFIED: No that's it.
8	CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Alright are there
9	any members of the committee have any questions?
10	Council Member Mealy you have something you want to
11	add on the record? Alright seeing none are there
12	any members of the public wishing to give
13	testimony? Seeing none I'm closing the public
14	hearing on Land Use items 254 and 255 both related.
15	I am now going to put the items up for a vote. I
16	know for the record that the applications that we
17	are voting on today has the full support of both
18	council members Vallone and Speaker Melissa Mark-
19	Viverito and I give my support to both. I will now
20	call on my counsel to call the roll for a vote to
21	approve. We've been… before please we've been
22	joined by Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez. Proceed.
23	COUNSEL: Chair Dickens.
24	CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: I vote aye and I
25	ask my committee members to vote aye also.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND CONCESSIONS 44 1 2 COUNSEL: Council Member Mealy. 3 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye on 4 both. 5 COUNSEL: Council Member Rodriguez. 6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye. 7 COUNSEL: Council Member Cohen? 8 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye. COUNSEL: Council Member Treyger. 9 10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye. COUNSEL: Land Use numbers 253, 254, and 11 12 255 are approved by a vote of five in the affirmative, zero in the negative, zero... zero 13 abstentions. They're referred to the full Land Use 14 15 Committee. 16 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Alright I've been asked for something unusual and that's for Council 17 18 Member Mealy to make a statement. I have not asked her what it is so I'm taking a chance but go ahead 19 20 and proceed. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: No I just want to 21 2.2 say happy belated birthday Chair Dickens. 23 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Oh ... That's an allowable statement. I want to thank the members of 24 25 the public and my colleagues, my counsel, the Land

	SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS, AND	
1	CONCESSIONS	45
2	Use staff, and of course Council Member Vallone	
3	for for giving testimony and sharing with us all	
4	of his knowledge about this for attending today's	
5	hearing. This hearing is hereby adjourned.	
6	[gavel]	
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
I		

CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date July 22, 2015