

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

----- X

March 6, 2015
Start: 10:17 a.m.
Recess: 1:29 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: INEZ D. BARRON
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

James Vacca
Fernando Cabrera
Jumaane D. Williams
Laurie A. Cumbo
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Vanessa L. Gibson

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Judy Bergtraum
Interim Vice Chancellor
Facilities Planning and Management
City University of New York (CUNY)

Matthew Sapienza
Vice Chancellor Matthew
Budget and Finance
City University of New York (CUNY)

James Murphy
Dean for Enrollment
City University of New York (CUNY)

Sarah Truelsch
Director of Policy and Research
City University of New York (CUNY)

Frank Sanchez
Vice Chancellor
Student Affairs
City University of New York (CUNY)

Steve London
First Vice President
Professional Staff Congress

Mike Fabricant
Professor at Hunter College in Social Work
Treasurer of Professional Staff Congress

Joseph Awadje
Chairperson
University Student Senate and Trustee
City University of New York (CUNY)

Donovan Borrington
Student at Baruch College
Vice Chair of Fiscal Affairs
University Student Senate

Juliana Tedesco
City University of New York (CUNY)

Marina Asaro
Student
City University of New York (CUNY)

Jose Fernandez Nunoz
Student
City University of New York (CUNY)

[sound check, pause]

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good morning.

Welcome. I would ask if you have your electronic devices that you would put them on vibrate, and we will be having our Finance Committee Hearing on the Higher Education Budget. Good morning and welcome to the hearing on Fiscal 2016 Preliminary Budget for the City University, CUNY, and the Fiscal 2015 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report, PMMR. CUNY provides higher education to approximately 270,000 degree seeking students, and more than 248,000 adult and continuing education students at 24 institutions. CUNY's Projected Expense Budget for Fiscal 2016 is \$3.1 billion. The City support's CUNY's seven community colleges and two-year programs offered by four of its senior colleges. CUNY's Projected City Expense Budget is \$200--is \$923.1 million in Fiscal 2016. This will be the focus of today's hearing. The Preliminary Budget has a \$21 million decrease from the Fiscal 2015 Adopted Budget. This budget does not yet include any Council initiative support, which explains a good deal of the difference. On the other hand, it also fails to account for the final

installment of CUNY's Predictable Tuition Increase Plan, and it does not anticipate any increase in State funding. I hope that we can have a more detailed discussion of CUNY's revenue expectations for the coming fiscal year.

Once again, I am concerned about how the tuition increase impacts on students, and the affordability of CUNY for those who wish to attend. There was a time when CUNY provided a free education for all New York City students who graduated with a grade point average of 85 or better. And I would like to discuss with you again today what it would take to restore that tuition. I would also like to discuss other ways in which we can--in which we might support our students, particularly with regard to expansion of the advanced strategies for associate programs otherwise known as ASAP.

The issue of affordability goes beyond tuition costs. I look forward to hearing how CUNY is working support its student outside of the classroom. I'm also troubled by the \$500,000 cut to CUNY Child Care in the Executive State Budget, and the impending closure of the City College Child Care Center. On-campus child care enables many of our students who

are also parents to further their education. And I think it would be important for us all to learn how CUNY will protect these services. I also feel it is very important to have full-time instructors whose priority is to teach CUNY students as well as upper level management that is representative of CUNY's student body. Today, I would like to talk about how CUNY is using its resources and prioritizing spending to attract more diverse full-time faculty and leadership. Meanwhile, CUNY has a number ongoing and proposed capital projects that are critical to the ultimate goal of educating CUNY's students. CUNY's Preliminary Capital Commitment Plan for Fiscal Years 2015 through 2018 totals \$409 million. While its Ten-Year Capital Commitment Plan for Fiscal Years 2016 through 2025 is only \$119 million. I am interested in how CUNY arrived at these estimates, and whether they accurately reflect plans for the University's next ten years of capital improvements. And while generally I want to discuss capital needs of CUNY's buildings and how CUNY prioritizes its capital dollars to keep up with enrollment and maintain designated space for student use.

I would like to thank the CUNY staff for coming to testify about its Fiscal 2015 Preliminary Budget, and I look forward to a productive discussion. Following CUNY's testimony and our questions and other answers, we will begin public testimony. Any witness who wishes to testify must register with the Sergeant-at-Arms. Thank everyone for coming, and I want to acknowledge the Counsel Jeffrey Campagna. The Committee's Finance Counsel Jessica Ackerman and my staff person Monique Washington.

And just before we begin the hearing, we need to know that this is designated as Woman's History Month. So I have a short bio that I want to share with you about Shirley Chisholm. She was born in 1924. Died in 2005. Born in Brooklyn. Lived in Barbados and returned to Brooklyn. She attended Brooklyn College of CUNY and the reason--one of the reasons that she attended she was accepted to several Ivy League colleges, but could not afford the room and board. So since Brooklyn had free tuition, she attended Brooklyn and she graduated cum laude. She also attended Teacher's College at Columbia. While at Brooklyn College she was part of a debate team,

and really began to become interested in politics, and joined her local political club. But challenged them because they limited the role that women could play. And because they did not expect the membership to go against the established party line, and she did both of those. And she adopted a policy. Her policy--her campaign slogan was "Unbought and Unbossed" because she couldn't be bought at any price. She stuck to her values, and she could not be told what it was that she should say. She served in the New Yorkers State Assembly from 1964 to 1968, and she was a part of a group of legislators who established SEEK, Search for Elevation, Education and Knowledge. She served in the U.S. Congress. She was the first woman to serve representing the 12th Congressional District, and she won that race running against James Farmer of CORE. Her platform was fighting against police brutality, prison reform, gun control, drug abuse, and fighting for women's rights. Again, her slogan was "Unbought and Unbossed". She's one of my heroes, and she talks about the struggle for women's rights as well as the struggle for civil equality. And she says, In particular, I'm certain that more and more American women must be involved in

politics. It could be the salvation of our nation. If a larger portion of women in Congress and in every other legislative body would serve, it would be a reminder that the real purpose of politicians is to work for the people." So that's our little highlight for Women's History Month, and at this time we're going to hear from our first panel.

I want to welcome the Interim Vice Chancellor for Facilities Planning and Management, Judy Bergtraum, and the Vice Chancellor Matthew Sapienza of Budget and Finance. If you would raise your right hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth--but the truth in your testimony before this body, and to answer all members' questions honestly?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Right.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. You may begin.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you. Good morning Chairperson Barron, and the Members of the Higher Education Committee. I am Matthew Sapienza, CUNY's Vice Chancellor for Budget and Finance. I am joined by Judy Bergtraum, Interim Vice

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

10

2 Chancellor for Facilities Planning Construction and
3 Management. We are grateful to have the opportunity
4 to speak with about the Mayor's Fiscal Year 2016
5 Preliminary Budget and its effect on the City
6 University of New York and its community colleges.
7 BMCC, Bronx, Guttman, Hostos, Kings Borough, La
8 Guardia and Queens Borough.

9 I would like to begin by thanking you,
10 Chairperson Barron, and this entire committee for its
11 strong and continuing advocacy of our community
12 colleges. Your commitment to student success has
13 enabled some outstanding advancement at the colleges.
14 And I'd like to talk briefly about that before
15 speaking in more detail about the Fiscal Year 2015
16 Preliminary Budget and the University Budget Request.

17 CUNY students won more than 100 national
18 awards including 17 National Science Fellowships,
19 five Jack Kent Scholarships, two Ford Foundation Pre-
20 Doctoral Fellowships, and a record breaking 29
21 Fulbright Student Awards. Just this year we had
22 record breaking numbers of students attending our
23 winter session, and more students transferring from
24 community colleges to senior colleges than ever
25 before. CUNY's innovative Accelerated Studies and

Associates Program, ASAP, has been recognized nationally including this past January when the program was singled out by the White House in connection with President Obama's recently announced America's College Promise. I was pleased to provide testimony to this committee just last week on the President's proposal, and we at the University are all grateful to the City Council Higher Education Committee for drawing attention to the issue of access to community colleges. Today, CUNY's enrollment stands at all-time high of 274,000. We serve and additional 260,000 of adult continuing students, a total of over half a million students. Fifty-eight percent of 2012 New York City public high school graduates who enrolled in college did so at CUNY. The vast majority of our graduates tend to remain in New York. Their education enables them to earn higher wages and this in turn increases the tax base of both the State and City. Therefore, the positive return of public investment in the university is clear.

Now, let me speak to the City's Preliminary Budget. We are very pleased that the City's financial plan includes continued significant

support for Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics programs, the STEM Initiatives that was added in the Fiscal Year 2015 City Executive Budget. This funding increases in Fiscal Year 2016 by \$10.3 million to \$29 million. The Preliminary Budget also funds fringe benefit cost increases; the Fatherhood Academy at La Guardia Community College; and CUNY's Solar Initiative, which is part of Mayor de Blasio long-term One City Built to Last Plan to reduce significantly New York City's greenhouse gas emissions and rely more heavily on renewable energy sources. CUNY's seven community colleges serve almost 100,000 students, and about three-quarters of those graduated from New York City high schools. Community colleges are the primary point of access to the ladder of upward mobility particularly for students from economically disadvantaged backgrounds.

While we are grateful that the State-- that State and City resources for community colleges have stabilized recently, many challenges remain. As compared to Fiscal Year 2009, the State Based Aid Rate for community colleges had decreased by almost 6.7%, which is a loss of \$187 per full-time equivalent student. Our Fiscal Year 2016 Budget

Request, which has been approved by the CUNY Board of Trustees, asks the State to reinstate \$250 per FTE as part of its adopted budget for next year. We are hopeful that the State Legislature will be successful in restoring these critically needed funds.

In addition, the State Executive Budget Proposal eliminates \$1.7 million in funding for the previously mentioned ASAP Initiative. The most recent independent studies show that students in ASAP graduate at more than three times the national average for urban community colleges. As noted above, the program has been held out as a model to be emulated and the State of Ohio has already made plans to replicate it at three of their community colleges this spring. The State of Tennessee has also reached out to CUNY to learn more about the ASAP program.

The State Executive Budget also reduced child care funding at the community colleges by \$544,000. Twenty percent of CUNY's undergraduates support children. Quality in affordable child care is essential to the retention and the long-term success of these students. Research demonstrates that not only their career prospects, but also those of their children are considerably enhanced by the

completion of associates degrees. Flexible licensed on-campus care will meaningfully advance that much to be desired end. One funding stream that has provided additional resources to our community colleges is tuition revenue. The dollars generated by the annual \$300 tuition increase this past fall semester, which was authorized by our Board, are being utilized by our campuses to ensure that our students receive the most direct and positive impact of the funds. Plans on how to utilize the additional revenue were developed by the individual community colleges in consultation with elected student and faculty leaders. CUNY's core priorities remain the retention of talented faculty and staff, the recruitment of more full-time faculty, increased academic support, and broadening our student's services.

Over the last decade, we have achieved a 23% net increase in full-time faculty. However, these gains have been countered by an unprecedented growth in enrollment during the same period slowing our ability to increase the percentage of classes taught by full-time faculty. This year, we are planning to hire 325 new faculty members, and through our Fiscal 2016 Budget Request, we hope to hire 500

more. While this may seem ambitious, please consider that in 1974, CUNY had over 11,000 full-time faculty and 249,000 students. We now have 7,500 full-time faculty, and 274,000 students. We must compete for talent in a national, and in some cases, international marketplace. And nothing is more important than our ability to track and retain the best faculty. This fall, we have already hired 250 new full-time faculty across our colleges, and many of them scholars of international renown. Each of them brings a wealth of scholarly and pedagogic experience to our classrooms.

The University's Collective Bargaining with our faculty expired in 2010, and the faculty and staff covered under this agreement have not had a raise since October 2009. The University is seeking support of the State and the City for an agreement that would be in line with those of our unions. CUNY remains one of the best valued college options in the nation with the availability of financial aid including the State Tuition Assistance Program Awards and Federal Pell Grants. Nearly 7 out of 10 CUNY Community College students attend tuition free. For so many of our students, TAP and Pell are the life

blood for the completion of a college degree. In regards to Pell, we are grateful that the Federal Budget Proposal calls for maintenance of current year award levels of \$5,730, and would lead to a maximum grant of \$5,775 for award years '15/'16, and \$5,915 for award years '16/'17. The University will continue to coordinate efforts with our local elected leaders at the federal level to ensure that this vital financial assistance program continues to be a priority in Washington.

In regards to the financial aid, however, please be aware that the City Preliminary Budget does not include funding for the City Council Merit Scholarships. We are extremely grateful that the Council led by the Higher Education Committee provided \$10.9 million in the current year's budget to fund this critical financial aid program modeled after the Vallone Scholarships. This initiative provides financial aid to students who graduated with B average from a New York City high schools, and who maintain that B average at the university. These new merit based awards are available to deserving students at both the senior colleges and the community colleges. Unfortunately, funding for the

City Council merit scholarships was not baselined in the City's Financial Plan. In order to continue the program at current levels, and add a new cohort for incoming students in the fall, we are projecting that \$17 million will need to be added to CUNY's Fiscal Year 2016 Budget. The City Council has always been a fierce advocate for the University and its students and we look forward to partnering with you in ensuring that these critical financial aid awards are protected. These awards demonstrate to our students in a tangible way that their city makes it possible to pursue an excellent post-secondary education right here at home.

Another program that has proven to be successful is, CUNY Prep, was facing significant programmatic reductions in last year's budget cycle. This program was established in 2003 and is a collaboration of the Mayor's Center for Economic Opportunity. The program helps students ages 16 to 18 earn their high school equivalency diploma and enter college. CUNY Prep's mission is to develop an awareness where the academic, personal and social skills are necessary for high education. Thanks to the Council's unwavering support, a restoration of

\$2.7 million in the University's Operating Budget was included in the current year. We will need the Council's intervention to once again ensure that this vital program is fully funded in the Fiscal Year 2016 Budget. We also seek operational support for a number of other needs critical to our students. For example, the Single Stop Initiative. In 2009, CUNY partnered with Single Stop USA, a national program that offers one-stop assistance to students for benefit screening, tax preparation, legal services, and healthcare assistance. The goal is to increase student retention by connecting low-income students with government benefits and services that they and their families are entitled to but not receiving. Since 2009, CUNY's community college students access benefits including tax refunds, legal services and food stamps valued at \$133 million. We are seeing \$750,000 to enhance Single-Stop Services at our community colleges. And we are also seeking State funds in order to expand the program to the SUNY College population.

Another population for which we are seeking support is our student veterans. Currently, more than 4,000 student veterans and reservists are

enrolled at CUNY. As you all understand, veterans experience considerable challenges in their transition from military to college and civilian life. Those circumstances place them at high risk for attrition. In order to support this important segment of our population, CUNY wishes to appoint a specially trained student affairs professional on each campus whose sole responsibility is to coordinate services for veterans. Chairperson Barron and members of the Committee, please be assured that the University deeply appreciates your continued commitment to a highly quality community education, which is the vehicle that so many New Yorkers rely on for the path of upward mobility. I would now like to ask Judge Bergtraum, Interim Vice Chancellor for Facilities, Planning, Construction and Management to talk about CUNY's Capital Budget.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Good morning everyone. I'm Judy Bergtraum, Interim Vice Chancellor Facilities, Planning, Construction and Management at CUNY. It is a pleasure to be here this morning. The City Council has been an outstanding partner to CUNY and especially to our community colleges by providing support for critical

maintenance as well as for new major buildings. With your support we were able to complete Freeman Hall at BMCC, and North Hall at Burns Community College, both of which opened in 2012, and have added much needed space and enriched those campuses with modern, well-designed facilities that inspires students. Thank you for helping CUNY to complete these buildings. Your support has enabled us to complete smaller, but important projects such as the \$22 million Medgar Evers Library renovation that was completed late this year. With the Council and the Borough President's financial support, we modernized and reorganized the library and added 12,000 square feet of student study space.

In recent years, the Council has proved over \$150 million to CUNY and funded probably 100 projects, and particularly at the community colleges where the need is the greatest. Because of this support, CUNY has been able to address some of the most challenging, critical maintenance issues at these campuses. For instance, I am happy to report that we have begun construction on a \$120 million plus new facade for La Guardia Community College Center 3 building. The building's enormous terra

cotta facade is 100 years old, and must be replaced if the building is to be preserved. Thanks to the City Council's support and funding, CUNY can now construct the project in one phase thus saving money and expediting its completion. Other major projects that have benefitted from the City Council funding are ongoing campus wide utility upgrades at Bronx Community College, the phase renovation at Hostos Community College 500 Grand Concourse building, and numerous other roof replacements, bathroom upgrades, central plan upgrades and modernization of heat and cooling systems.

The Council has been very good to CUNY's senior colleges as well by providing funding for new programs, special initiatives and equipment. You have provided support recently for Brooklyn College's new Graduate Film School at Steiner Studios; library renovations at Lehman College; upgrades to the soccer field at the College of Staten Island; science lab upgrades at Queens College; and renovating the Performing Arts Center at York College. Thank you for your commitment. That being said, critical maintenance continues to be a major capital priority at our community college campuses. And we are still

in need of your support for a long-term effort. The community college facilities comprise over 7 million square feet, three-quarters of which is over 40 years old. Recently, we updated our State of Good Repair Analysis of the community college. The study showed that the most serious need remains in infrastructure systems that support facility operations. Continuing problems with these systems could lead to costly emergency repairs, and in some cases major system failures. We have made progress in reducing the backlog of deferred maintenance thanks in no small part to the funding of the Council and the Borough President have provided. But nearly \$750 million is needed to keep the backlog of deferred maintenance from growing. So you will continue to see requests for critical maintenance funding from our colleges. This year approximately \$200 million in identified projects need funding to cover critical facilities items such as fire alarms, roofs, central plants, heating, ventilation, and air conditioning, and facades and windows.

We are seeking additional City and State funding for the new Allied Health and Science Building at Hostos Community College. The 170,000

square foot facility will provide modern classrooms and science labs for the college Allied Health programs in dental hygiene, radiological technology and nursing, and its growing engineering and natural science programs. In addition, the building will offer dental and wellness clinics where students will gain practical experience, and the public will receive dental hygiene and wellness education. Several years ago, the Council generously gave \$2.5 million and the Bronx Borough President provided \$2 million, which the State matched in the Fiscal 2016 Executive Budget. We just kicked off design of this exciting new project.

I want to briefly mention the initial result of the State Budget for Fiscal 2016. The community college received \$21 million in new State funding to match City funding provided last year. This means over \$40 million for projects for the community college. Most of this funding will address critical maintenance on the community college campuses. Included in this amount is the State's match for the Hostos' new building that I just mentioned. Also in the budget is the third \$55 million allotment of CUNY 2020 Challenge Grant

funding. We are working with the Governor's Offices. We advanced the first round of CUNY 2020 funding to create innovative projects that provide significant economic impacts from job creation; advance academic research; and student success; encourage collaboration and leverage other funding sources. We look forward to implementing round 2, and I'm excited about its potential benefit. The future years of the State Budget call for continued funding for CUNY 2020 at \$55 million a year, and the continued funding for critical maintenance of the community colleges of \$10 million a year.

On behalf of all of us at CUNY, let me thank you again for your support of our Capital Program. The funding you have provided is helping us work towards a state of good repair on our campuses, and is also helping us ensure that we provide facilities to support strong academic programs that meet the needs of students and the city. We look forward to working closely with you on the budget in the weeks ahead. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you for your testimony. I do want to acknowledge we've been joined Council Member Cabrera and Council Member

Rodriguez. We've got lots and lots of questions. So, we'll start with the--let's start with the one about--Which one of my questions shall I start with? If CUNY were to--if CUNY were to go back to-- No, that's not the first one. What would be the impact of going--what would be the financial impact of having the ASAP extended? This year it wasn't--it's additional costs that are going to be borne because it's a new incoming class.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Correct. The current plan for the expansion of ASAP this year we had about 4,300 students, and the plan is to expand it to about 13,000 students in 2017. The funding for that expansion is included in the City's Financial Plan. Last year, in the Mayor's Executive Budget, funding to expand up to 13,000 ASAP students was included in the plan. So, we do have the funding for that, and we'll continue to work up to--scale up to those numbers.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, there's a chart that says the expansion of ASAP and creation of a new program for STEM students, the funding amount is \$14 million?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Correct for our Fiscal '16.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: For Fiscal '16. So how is that money going? Is it going to be expanding ASAP? Is it going to be new programs? And how is that going to be--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing] That's for the expansion of ASAP. That's to help us get towards that 13--that ultimate goal of 13,000. So this year we had 4,300. Next year we'd like to get up to over 8,000. Like I said, on that eventual goal to ratchet it up to 13,000. And so that's what the \$14 million would be used for to--for the current students in the program and also to expand it to a little over 8,000.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So when it says creation of a new program, what is that? It says expansion and creation of a new program. So my question is there something else that's going to be created?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: As part of the expansion to get us to 13,000 we want to have more of a focus on the students who are STEM programs. So right now in ASAP we have about 1,400 students and

about 22% of those are in STEM programs. So about 900 students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So that--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
Eventually-- I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Go ahead.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Eventually,
when we get up to 13,000 students, we'd like to have about 30% of that population be in STEM programs. SO, not only will we have more students, but a greater percentage of them will be in STEM programs. And that's--that's what that language refers to.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, great. And in a part of the testimony you said that the \$300--the increase in tuition--the \$300 increase is for students benefits. Do we know--does each school have its own mechanism to determine--determine how to use that money?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How do we know how?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Every dollar goes back to the colleges, and the community colleges it generates about \$24 million a year at the community colleges. And so as part of our internal

financial plan process at the university, each college has to submit a plan to us as to how they're going to utilize those dollars. And we mandate and have been mandating since the tuition increases were enacted in 2011 that every college president has to consult with elected student and faculty leaders as to how those dollars are going to be used. Because we want the students and the faculty to be involved in the crafting of those plans. So the majority of the dollars go for additional full-time faculty. As I talked about in my testimony, this year we're planning to hire 325 new faculty at all of the campuses the senior and the community colleges. But there are also other things for student advisors, improvement of facilities, for financial aid to the students. So we don't mandate to the colleges that you must spend this much on faculty. You must spend this much on facilities maintenance because we know every campus has different needs. And we want it-- those dollars to be used for campus-specific items. And so, each college crafts their own plan with, of course, the approval of the university, but in consultation with the elected student and faculty leaders.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, could you share that with us--this committee so that we would see how

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: -- each college did that. I'd be interested to know what percentage went towards faculty, towards student advisors, and you say improvement of facilities. Was it just in general the facade of the building, or did it go to the students' space? So I'd be interested--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
Okay.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --to know because we're talking about-- And I understand we want our students to have a--to function in pleasant, safe environments and the maintenance and the infrastructure. But I would be--I would want to know exactly how that--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --\$300 might go.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: We can share those plans with you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. And if CUNY were to follow a single incoming class over the course of six years, which is how CUNY usually gives the data that I would like to see it in two years and four years. But if CUNY were to follow an incoming student--an incoming cohort class over a course of six years, how many students within that class would receive consistent financial aid across the six years? Or, fewer if they did less than six years:

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-huh. Do you have that data, Jim. I'm sorry the University Dean Jim Murphy.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: But that's okay, Chair, I'm going to ask him to answer that question. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: If you could state your name for the record, please?

DEAN JAMES MURPHY: Hi, I'm James Murphy. I'm the University Dean for Enrollment. The question is basically how many students would be able to retain consistent financial aid funding for six years. The answer to that unfortunately is none. They would be able to receive their Pell awards for

six years but the TAP would expire after eight semester or four years. We have attempted to get the state to fund a fifth TAP for those students who are in remedial programs. There was at one time that funding in the State Budget, but it was taken out of the budget during the fiscal crisis in the late '90s.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So students receive TAP for years--

DEAN JAMES MURPHY: [interposing]
Correct.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --and Pell for six.

DEAN JAMES MURPHY: That's six years,
yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So what percentage of their assistance does TAP cover? Do we know?

DEAN JAMES MURPHY: Well, the max--the maximum TAP award is \$5,165 plus the students gets-- well, the community college students would get up to their tuition. So if their tuition is \$4,000, their TAP award would be \$4,000. Pell is not based on tuition, it's based on expenses. So the maximum Pell award for all students is \$5,775 for next year.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's the maximum?

DEAN JAMES MURPHY: For Pell, correct.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. I'm going to formulate my question as I think about it. I'll be back to that question, but I'm--I'm going to pass it now to Council Member Cabrera, and I'll be back.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Madam Chair, may I pass it onto Council Member Rodriguez? He has a confirmed place to go, and then can I come right back?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You can defer. That's fine.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's fine. You'll be next.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you very much, Chair.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. We are in crisis, right? New York City is in crisis of building our middle-class. I can you that what happened in my district is similar to what happened in most of the schools that--schools that are without CUNY for when they started with the Early Childhood Education. Because I know that CUNY is doing the best you can, but you are working with a human

resources that need to be prepared to be in college.

So in my district, School District 6, 82%--81% of the students who take the State Exam in third grade, they are level 1 and 2. That number doesn't move from third to eighth grade. In eighth grade it's 81--80% or more of the students in School District 6 are level 1 and level 2. As a former teacher that I was for 13 years of high school, I can tell you that level 1 and level 2 means 55, 65 or 70. So from there they move to our high school. Then, in my district I have George Washington High School, 3,000 students, four schools.

The first floor of school intermediate [sic] get 3% of those who are college level to go to a city college. The second floor who get those-- First of all, the school overall only get 32% college ready students in the city year. The first floor, the one intermediate [sic] 3%. Second floor, college academy, 7%. Third floor, school low [sic], 4%; fifth floor, the school low, 5%. That's all we are sending from our high school to our senior colleges. And the reality that we face is that the population of Black and Latino in our senior college has been reduced. And, of course, we are dealing with a

domino affect. Because if we do not prepare our kids for UPK to a senior year, then we send- In those four schools, no one even go to a community college. But those who went to a community college, as you know, more than 80% they need remedial courses. So for me it's how can all of us-- And I know that we always talk about the money.

We don't have enough money. I believe that ASAP should be provided to every single student of those 86% who need remedial courses. And if we don't provide ASAP to those 86%, when we know that it will make a difference, those 86% first of all as we know, it takes more than 26 years--only 26% were graduated with an associate after two years--after six years, another two years. And what is the outcome from those students? Single mother, working class people living on the poverty line. Average income and most of the working class community only 35%, and on Rikers Island where we are investing \$80,000 per inmate. So, I don't think that we should put a number on how much is needed to provide ASAP to every single student who needs remedial courses in our community college. And I know that you will say we need to go to Albany. We need to negotiate in

this country. We need to find the money because what we are saying is if provide ASAP for every single student, there is a higher probability that those students will be able to graduate from the community college and continue to a senior college.

And my question is how can we get CUNY or from city college-- Can city college conduct three deduct three or four--City college means the school of education. Expand and that be more schools, and come back and say city college is responsible for three high schools in your district. Which campus in Brooklyn we can say they will be adopting three or four more? How can we, you know, expand a level of agreement where our senior colleges? And, I know that that's happening. You know, I know that information, but for me it's more because we are in crisis. So how can we address this crisis where Black and Latino students in our senior colleges have been reduced. And if we continue going that that way, we will not be able to be dominating [sic] class that we need in our city.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Well, Councilman Rodriguez, first of all, I very much appreciate you raising these issues because they are

critical issues to our city. I'm glad you brought up the ASAP program. As you said, it's been a tremendously successful program. It's been held up as a national model and, you know, as I've been saying it doesn't get much better than when the President of the United States is holding up your program as a national model that should be emulated throughout the country. And I just want to recognize our Deputy Director of the ASAP Initiative Danielle Boykin [sp?] who is here this morning. So I want to recognize here, and, of course, I want to also give so much credit to the terrific faculty that we have at our community colleges who have been on the front lines of making sure ASAP is successful.

But as you pointed out, this--we have plans to significantly scale up ASAP over the next several years, and, of course, we'd love to provide it to as many students as we can. Going back to your question about the public schools, and again I'm glad you raised it because as I mentioned in my testimony, 75% of our students come from the New York City Department of Education. So it's so vital for us to have collaborations with the public schools. And we do have tons of work that we are doing with them. We

have high schools on our campuses. And I think that if you look at the high schools that we do have on our campuses, they're amongst the best high schools in the city. So there's a close collaboration there. We have a College Now program. That's at 17 of our campuses and at 350 high schools throughout the city, and that's a program that's been around for many years, and has been really successful.

You mentioned, and it was a great point, and this actually came up when we testified at the State Legislature several weeks ago. About getting to the students at an earlier age, and not waiting until they're 11th and 12th grade and say, this student needs some additional work. We're trying to get to them at an earlier age. And so we have a program through the Department of Ed that's called, you know, the Middle Grades Initiative. We have early--we have the Early College Initiative in which again we partner colleges with schools. And some of those programs begin as early as sixth grade. And one other point I wanted to mention about collab-- collaborative initiatives that we have at the Department of Ed because I think it's such a terrific

program is we have something called At Home in College.

And it's not that the students are doing their college work at home. What this means is there's basically three components of this program. And so, there's a pre-college program in which CUNY works with the high schools while the students are in high school to help them prepare for the CUNY assessment test to hopefully get them out of having to do remedial work. So that's the first component. The middle component is called Bridge to College. And what'd done here is that CUNY partners a current CUNY student at one of our colleges with the high school student to be a mentor, and to help them get through the process of applying to college and being in college. And, they're matched with CUNY students who graduated from their own high school and/or from the same socio-economic status.

And so, I think a really exciting initiative to have them partnered with someone who went to the same high school as they went to. And are now in CUNY and are going through the things that they are going to be going through in a few years. And the third component is once they get to CUNY to

work with them, to provide them with additional advising to help them try to persist to getting their college degree. So we have a lot of programs with the Department of Ed. We have a lot of collaboration, but, you know, you're certainly dead on in saying that, you know, more needs to be done to help students so that they don't have to take remedial courses when they get to CUNY. That they'll already have the work done so they can get back into their degree program at CUNY.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

You know you have great professors at CUNY doing a great job. They also need to be--continuing being supportive as much as possible. I was a teacher at George Washington High School, and I'm committed to working with my chair of this committee and all of those. Because, you know, we cannot continue seeing that how the Black and Latino population has been decreasing in our senior colleges. If I was able to make it to city college after doing all the hard work, and then become a teacher for 13 years and being here today, every single student that we have in our city public schools and in our community

colleges, they should be able to get a degree and be part of the middle class. Thank you.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I have a question about ASAP, and then we'll come to Council Member Cabrera. How are students selected to participate in the ASAP program?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And the second part is we know that ASAP overall decreases the cost of the CUNY degree. Why don't we expand it to all full-time students?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Well, the first part of your question about how students get into the program they have to be current CUNY students. They have to be accepted into a community college program. There are some other criteria that they have to meet as well. They have to be either a city resident or eligible for in-state tuition. They have been willing to participate in a full-time program. They have to be a full-time student, and they have to have some type of-- They have to be eligible for some type of needs based financial aid. Because we want to help the students that--that have

financial needs as part of ASAP. And so, there is a very aggressive recruitment that's done in our campuses. We have an ASAP coordinator at each of our community colleges, and they have their teams that go out and try to recruit students who meet these eligibility requirements. And meet their own individual campus goals in terms of the enrollment for ASAP. So students can, you know, speak to folks at their campus and say I'm interested in being in the ASAP program. But there are already people at the campus who are reaching out to the students and trying to get them to enroll in ASAP.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So if every--can we accommodate every student who wanted to participate in ASAP, could they all be accommodated?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Unfortunately, we can't because of funding constraints, and as you pointed out Chair Barron, there are savings in terms of costs of degree. Because we are graduating students at a much higher rate with ASAP the cost of A CUNY degree is much less with ASAP. But getting students into the program, and making sure that they persist in the program does cost money for additional faculty, additional advisors. We provide them with a

free Metro Card. So all of those costs are needed in order to scale up the program. And so, we are very grateful to the Mayor for including that in his Executive Budget last year for us to, you know, quadruple the amount of students that we have now. And that will get us up to--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So it saves the student costs, but the college then incurs additional costs for the faculty and the other supports. Is that what you're saying?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Correct, and through the funding we receive from the City and the State funding that's been in the last few years, we've been able to cover those costs at the campuses. But we've had to cap the enrollment. So this year was 4,300 because that's the amount of funding that we have. We had funding for a level of 4,300 students this year.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Okay, Council Member Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much, Madam Chair. Welcome. You know I have always been a fan of CUNY, and every opportunity I get to encourage young people to go to CUNY especially with

the high cost of private colleges today that are just horrendous. And the large amount of debt that they accrue, and with the level of expertise in coming to see that you have professors have. You are the best deal in town. I have a couple of questions. Number one, it's regarding Bronx Community College. It's regarding capital. Every year that I come here, I always ask the same question, and I always get the same response, which college throughout the city is in the greatest need of capital improvement. And I always get the same response, Bronx Community College. What are you prepared to do this year?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, if you asked me that question, I have the same answer. However, we have made a tremendous amount of--a tremendous success on our infrastructure project. We have basically--we're broken the project. The project costs somewhere around \$160 million. We've broken it up into phases. We've completed Phase 1, 2 and 3. We are now up to basically Phase 4, and to understand this, we are basically working on the infrastructure outside the building. The infrastructure that brings the heat, hot water, it's all pipes. So that's Phase 1, 2, 3 and 4, 5 and 6,

and then we basically move into the building. So it sounds like every year you come back and it takes a longer. But we really are getting there, and if you go to the campus you can see less and less construction. But it's really the quad area. We've broken the quad area up into four different sections. So we are getting there. It is getting better.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]
Is that a better answer?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Oh, a tremendously better answer. So my question to you, once you finish all the phases, what would still need to be done in Bronx Community College?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, the phases are just bringing the piping, the water to the buildings. Then we basically have to go into each building and do upgrades there.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: And I get that, but the \$160 million is to cover also the buildings, right?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: No.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Oh, no, so you don't have money for the buildings?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Not yet.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay. Not yet,
so is the not yet--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]
But just five or six years ago--six or eight years
ago we didn't have this money.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: So, it's--
it's a positive.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay, so good--
good, we're moving. Progress. I love it. So, is
there--is there intentionality there that there will
be funding provided for the buildings coming up or is
it that we have built the infrastructure for it, but
still there is no funding?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, the--
the--we're basically up to basically Phase 4, which
we have the funding for. And then we're going to
have to get the funding for the phases that come
after that.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So that would be
what, next year?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]

So it's going to take--this--this phase will be-- No, this phase will probably take two years.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Two years.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: So it's going to take some time.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: And there's-- there's no way to do both at the same time, by the way? Is it a money issue or is it a construction issue?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: It's a construction issue.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: It is a construction issue. Oh, interesting. I know the building very well. I know it used to be the former NYU.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, if you think about--if you think about just the Quad, and we've broken that school into like four sections, you have to basically build the pipes all the way to each building.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Got you.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: So-- But we are betting there. It's getting better. We're very

happy. Yeah, by the way, the--the library is state-of-the-art. It has to be the best. I'm not just saying this because this is my district, but it has to be the best looking library in the CUNY system bar none. It's just--it's something to behold. My--my second question is regarding professors.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Uh-huh.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Being a former college professor I have to ask this question. How long would it take you to get to where you need to be? What's your projections. So right now it sounds to me you're down 3,000, 4,000 professors from the highest point that we had. How long is it going to take you to project to where you need to be?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Well, I guess the--the best way to answer that, Council Member Cabrera, is that it depends, and it depends on the resources. And are we going to have the resources to hire those faculty? As you pointed out, you know, 40 years ago when you looked at CUNY, we had--we had less students than we have now. We had about 250,000 and now we have about 275,000, but we had 4,000 more faculty. We have 7,500 and we had a little over 11,000 forty years ago. So, it was a different, you

know, time and--and unfortunately with the fiscal crisis in the '70s and other disinvestment in the university that has changed. So, through out Compact Initiative that we've had for the last several year, and through the additional tuition revenue that's been generated since 2011, we've made significant strides in bringing that number back up. And net we're up over 1,000 faculty if you go back, you know, five or six years. So, our campuses have done a terrific job in hiring new faculty. We want to hire 500 next year. That's what's in our budget request. And if we have the resources, we'll certainly do our best to do that. So, we'd like to get there. I'd like to give you a timeframe and say we'll get there in five years or ten years. But it really depends on are we still going to get the investment from the State and the City, and is the tuition revenue still going to be there for us.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So I'm going to close with this thought that I also bring up every year. Every year we come to you and we say basically how come you don't? And every year I come back, and I talk to myself how come we don't? The reality is we're not giving you the funding to do the job

especially on the State level. I mean they have the big bucks. So, the reality is if we want this program, we've got to give you the resources. You cannot produce something out of nothing. The only one I ever know to be able to that is God himself. And so, you need the resources, and without those resources we're not going to have this wonderful program to be able to expand the wonderful programs to get more professors. You need the funding. Without the funding it's not going to happen. And I know, Madam Chair and this committee we will--we're going to continue to knock on the doors. We're going to continue to push so you get the funding necessary. So you could have the staff, the professors, ASAP, and to get the ASAP to you. Thank you so much, Madam Chair.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I want to acknowledge we've been joined by Council Member Kallos, and before I go to him for questions, I have a few other follow-up questions. In terms of ASAP, do you see an opportunity to partner with private entities to get additional funds?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And then what is CUNY's policy in terms of having additional funds come into the college from private entities? Do the college presidents have that responsibility? Does CUNY overall do that in terms of getting additional funds to come in. And do you have any idea of how much money does come in with those private contributions?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: It's a very good point about the ASAP Program and we've been fortunate to have good partnership on the ASAP Initiative. The ASAP Initiative started with a grant from Robin Hood. And so that public/private partnership is critical to getting ASAP started. Since then, we have had additional foundations give money towards ASAP. We've had the Helmsley Foundation give money. We've had the Guttman Foundation give money, and anything else, Danielle? Any other private sources of funding?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [off mic]

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: And the Helmsley Foundation. So we have had additional funding from private foundations for ASAP. And certainly would be interested in partnering with any

other private organizations that want to support that successful program. In terms of your second question about colleges and private funding, there are really two main sources that our colleges utilize for private funding. One is our faculty go out and get research grants from mostly the federal and state government. And so that's a big part of the research capacity at the university in which we're partnering with--with private sources. And the other is the very significant fundraising operation that we have throughout the university. Not only at the university level, but more importantly at each of the campus levels. Most fundraising that comes in is through alumni of the university, but again, most of our campuses do have partnerships with private organization for fundraising. The overwhelming majority of the dollars that the colleges privately raise goes towards scholarships for our students. But often times private organizations may give money for a specific program, or a specific use. But since 2005 when we began a campaign, a fundraising campaign for CUNY, and it's almost ten years now. Collectively we're raised over \$2.8 billion. And so, again our campuses have done a terrific job in terms

of turning to the private sector, and trying to raise funds that way.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. [pause]

Oh, back to the ASAP question. Are there parts of ASAP that you think would be of benefit to students who are part-time students. I know ASAP is for full-time students.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So are there parts of the ASAP program that could be applied to those students or part-time students?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: You know, Madam Chair, we think one of the most important components of why ASAP is successful is the fact that it requires students to attend full time. That's one of the most critical components, but to your point, we are looking at ways to try to help those students who may have challenges with attending full time whether it's due to family concerns or commitments or working issues. So for--one example is that BMCC what they've done as part of their ASAP component is they have a weekend program as part of the ASAP. So the students that are in that program can do all of their work on Saturdays and Sundays. Now it's more

intensive because they're doing it in only two days. But there is a certain cohort of students that BMCC had in that program that can work, or take care of their family during the week. And then do their--do their academic work on the weekend at BMCC.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So all of their courses are offered to them on weekends?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Correct, but they are full-time students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: But it's concentrated?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: It's concentrated on the weekends. So we are looking at ways to try to give students more flexibility. But--but we do think that that is one of the most critical underpinnings of ASAP's success has been the fact that the students are required to go full time.

[pause]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I have another follow-up question, but I'm going to--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing] Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --go to my colleague, Ben Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you to Chair Inez Barron for your leadership in the Committee on Higher Education, and for your Introduction of a resolution to support President Obama's America's College Promise Program, of which I'm a proud co-sponsor. Thank you to CUNY's Hunter School of Social Work for my graduate students in social work who are doing their field placements in my office. And as we speak are helping thousands of my constituents every year. Thank you to CUNY Law School for the Free Housing Clinic, that I currently operate in my office on Thursdays every other week. And thank you to CUNY's faculty, staff and retirees like my mother for all that you do every day. I'm Council Member Ben Kallos. I'm a graduate of not one but two public universities in New York, and without a public option, I could have afforded to pay for a higher education. But sadly, I like so many Americans remain saddled with that debt that at times can be crushing. I've been advocating for free CUNY and debt forgiveness for some time now. President Obama has proposed America's College Promise offering free community college to many students. And Governor Cuomo has proposed debt forgiveness for

college graduates whose income remain low after graduation. That's public university graduates.

Does CUNY support these initiatives? And how much will it cost to implement them? I'm just going to follow along with my additional two questions, which is: According to data from CUNY, 58% of full-time undergraduates are receiving enough Federal or State tuition assistance to attend CUNY tuition free. With many more receiving partial tuition assistance. Rather than just trying to figure out the cost piece by piece, what additional resources would CUNY need or funding in order to provide all CUNY students to earn a four-year degree tuition free. And last but not least, in terms of return on investment, how much more do CUNY graduates make with an associates degree, college degree, or graduate degree than they would with no degree?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Okay. Thanks, Council Member Kallos. I'll talk about the--the programs at the federal level, and at the State level. And then talk a little bit about you know, your other question but what a free CUNY might look like. So at the federal level, as you mentioned, President Obama proposed America's College Promise,

which would call for essentially the first two years of community college to be free to students who have a 2.5 grade point average over that time. And as you mentioned, Chair Barron had a hearing on this last week. And we're certainly grateful to the Chair for calling attention to this--to this issue of access to community colleges. And we are certainly grateful that President Obama is calling attention to the needs of community colleges. I think it's great that on the federal level that folks are focusing on the community colleges. Because when you look throughout the country, you know, the overwhelming majority of students are in community colleges. So they are a place of needs. As we stated at the hearing last week, we certainly support the premise of trying to make community college more accessible for students. We do have some concerns about the President's proposal and some questions that I think we need some further clarification on. And we talked about those at last week's hearing. But in terms of certainly the concept of making community college more accessible to students, you know, we think it's a good thing. But we do have some concerns about-- about the details of the program.

At the State level, Governor Cuomo proposed that to get on your feet on a loan forgiveness program. And what that program would do is students who graduate from a college in New York State and remain in New York State for five years, and who earned less than \$50,000, if they are part of the Federal Pay As You Earn Program. Which helps students pay back--it stretches out the payments that they have to make if they have federal loans. What the Governor is proposing is for the first two years, the State will pick up the difference. So the Federal Pay as You Earn Program doesn't totally forgive students. They still have to make some payment. It just--it stretches it out longer, which is helpful. So the Governor is proposing that they'll--they'll cover the first two years. And again, conceptually, we strongly support anything that will help our graduates in terms of getting on their feet. And getting accustomed to, you know, being in a post-graduate situation and having to pay back their loans.

In terms of CUNY, only about 15% of our graduates, graduate with federal debt. So we're very, very fortunate, and just to give a comparison,

at NYU the last data point that I saw on this it's about 43%. So in terms of private colleges, we know that many more students are graduating with debt. But we do have about 15%, and certainly anything that can help those students in their post-graduate, you know, life, we're supportive of. Getting to your question about, you know, free--what a free CUNY would look like and what it would cost. So we do have tuition revenue at the university. That's a-- that's a very large component of our total operating budget. As was mentioned earlier, so many of our students get Pell, and so many of our students get TAP. And so the amount that students are paying out of their pocket would be the amount that would have to be covered if we wanted to have a free CUNY. But, as much as Pell is supportive of our students, as much as TAP's portions, it's still a large number. It's well over half a billion dollars that students are paying out of pocket. So, you know, that's what it would take in order for it to be totally free. But again, that we can--that we can do to provide additional access to the university, we are certainly willing to listen to, and to consider.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And then the final piece of that was just the return on investment.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Oh, I'm sorry.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So, we as a government have to invest our dollars. So, do CUNY graduates with associate degrees, college degrees, or graduate degrees earn more income than somebody without any degree, and do you have those estimates?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, we'll have to get back to you on that, Council Member. We--we'll get that data, and we'll share it with you, and with the rest of the committee.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: All right.

SARAH TRUELSCH: [off mic]

SERGEANT-A-ARMS: Quiet please.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: We ask that if you're--if you're going to give testimony, if you would identify yourself into your testimony.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thanks, Sarah.

SARAH TRUELSCH: Sarah Truelsch, CUNY Director of Policy and Research. The Federal Reserve Bank of New York estimates that the annual return on wages for a bachelor's degree above a high school

degree is 56% per year, and that accumulates over a lifetime. The average return for an associate degree above a high school degree is 21% per year, which accumulates again each year over a lifetime. We are doing some research to speak to CUNY specific differences in those. We don't currently have CUNY specific numbers.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you very much. So it sounds like since our city earns its expense revenue, a \$77 billion budget in large part to income tax. Something we could do short of having more billionaires would be more New Yorkers with a CUNY education earning a living wage, which would help build our base. And I think last but not least, I'm working on making our government as transparent as possible. I've been lucky to have support from MIT, now NYU's Gov Lab. But as a graduate of a public university, I would really love to have support from CUNY. So beyond the CUNY Law School support, and CUNY Hunter Social Work School support. To the extent CUNY has students who are interested in making their government more transparent, I would be honored lucky to have your support.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, Council Member. We've been joined by Council Member Cumbo, and before I got her for questions, back at ASAP would you say that the key component of the ASAP program success is the free tuition or the services that students receive above what other students get?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-huh. I think it's--the services are certainly critical, but, you know, I'm glad you raised the financial components and, you know, the--the tuition part is certainly important. But another part of that that I want to mention that's been real critical. And we have survey the students who have been in ASAP, and asked them, you know, what's the best financial benefit that you've received as part of ASAP? And overwhelmingly the response was the free Metro Cards. And that's something that we're interested in not only for ASAP, but in looking towards--for other students as well. Because as mentioned, you know, earlier, so many of our students get Pell. So many of our students get TAP. But we have thousands of students. I think it's 10,000, and Jim will correct me if I'm wrong, that report no taxable income that have zero net taxable income. And so, while they're-

-while they're eligible for Pell and TAP to cover their tuition and their living expenses, for students who get a free Metro Card is a--is a great benefit for them to make sure that they get back and forth to the campus, and make sure that they're attending classes. And so, that's been a huge benefit to the ASAP students as well is having that free Metro Card.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Council Member Cumbo.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [off mic] Thank you. [on mic] Thank you, Chair Barron. I appreciate the opportunity to ask questions at this time. Wanted to ask questions in regards to diversity. One of the things that we often hear across the board are issues around diversity as far as how the different institutions are funded. So one of the things that I would like because on the individual school level it's difficult to discern specifically how much money is spent from looking at the City budget. So we don't have the ability to understand how much each school is getting in expense and capital and that sort of thing. Would you be able to break down those numbers for us so that we could have those numbers so that we could review?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: The other thing is what factors does CUNY consider in setting the budget for each community college? Like what is that rubric? Because specifically in my district, there's Medgar Evers College, which I'm very excited and proud to have in my district. But when they look at the other colleges in terms of things such as dormitories some institutions have, others don't, how do you make the determination, which schools get more resources, and others get less for different programming--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]

Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: --or capital?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah. No, those are--those are terrific questions. I'll talk about the operating side first, and then I'll turn it over to Vice Chancellor Bergtraum for capital. On the operating side for the community colleges, we have an allocation model. And so, what we do is at the beginning of every fiscal year, and we're gearing up for the--for the opening of the new fiscal year, we look at what are our available resources? How

much are we getting from the city? How much are we getting from State Aid for Community Colleges? What are our projection of tuition revenue is going to be. So what is the overall amount that's available to community colleges? And then we have this allocation model that is--is basically generated from student enrollment. There are other factors that are in there as well. It's not just straight how many students we have. But that's the factor that generate the most dollars that's due to the enrollment. And so, at the beginning--the--it's basically a zero based process. So whatever your budget was the previous year, it doesn't matter because we generate this allocation model. We run this allocation model at the beginning of every year for the community colleges based on a three-year history of their enrollment. It's a weighted three-year average. So that's how the community colleges receive their funds.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [off mic] Are there [on mic] additional resources then change the rubric, or the way that different schools are able to attract students? So, for example, here in the Council without a discretionary budget, we each now

for the first year all get the same amount of money. But there is a slight variance or decrease based off of the need in their communities citywide.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
Uh-huh.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Would you say that there is some sort of equitable distribution of funds throughout all of the institutions in that way? Or, is it based--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
Well, for the--

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: -- on a newer model?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --for the base budget that each campus has, the community college model they say is mostly based on enrollment. However, for colleges that have certain needs and, you know, part of what we do every single day is not only monitoring the colleges and they're spending, but also working with them to understand what their needs are. So, if colleges come to us with certain needs, that we need to find outside of the allocation model, we'll certainly consider that, you know, on an individual campus basis. So, that's--that's really

how that process is played out. It's not something that would be funded as part of their base budget, but it would be funded separately through--through a needs request and through working with the colleges. And understanding what their--what their individual needs are. Because, as you pointed out, the campuses are so different.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Do you recognize that some colleges have been systemically underfunded over the years? Do you all recognize that as just a fact?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Well, I think overall as a university, I certainly would not say that we're a well funded university. And so I think that, you know, goes to our colleges as well. But, you know, in terms of the individual campuses, they are also different, as I just mentioned. And I think all of them can make arguments to say we're not equitably funded compared to the other campuses because we're a younger campus, or because we're an older campus. Or, because we're in Manhattan we have, you know, a dense type of building where other campuses were-- And other campuses might say we have needs because we have a big campus, and when it snows

we have a lot of snow removal to do because we have acres of land. So there are, you know, different needs at different campuses, and I think that all of them can make arguments as to why they should be funded at a higher rate.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] So then CUNY does not think that some colleges have been systemically underfunded in comparison to their colleagues and other institutions?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yeah, I think that--I think at the community colleges the fact that we're using an allocation model provides equity in terms of having model that the colleges know. And when we work with the colleges, you know, we make changes to the models. So it's something that they agree to it. At the senior colleges we don't use an allocation model. It's more of base budget incremental funding, similar type with city funds. It's individual agencies. So in the senior colleges, there are certainly when you look at cost per student, and when you look at the individual historic funding levels, I think that there are some who are either side of the median, either side of the average that can make the argument that they have been

2 systemically underfunded. But again from the
3 university's perspective, we try to do our best to
4 make sure that there is as much equity as possible.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay. I thank you
6 for that, and I will look forward to that ability to
7 see the allocations--

8 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
9 Sure.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: --by institutions,
11 and I'd like to also share that with our Chair,
12 Council Member Barron. Wanted to just finally talk
13 about the Black Male Initiative at CUNY.

14 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-huh.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And for many years
16 before its budget was baselined in 2014. Could you
17 please give us a brief update on how the initiative
18 is moving forward, and where do you see room for
19 growth in the Black Male Initiative whether through
20 additional programs, or through a higher number of
21 participants? So if you could speak to how
22 successful the program is, and how do you evaluate or
23 quantify that, and how is the program moving forward?

24 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Sure.
25

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And what does it look like throughout CUNY's campus?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Sure. Well, first of all, I just want to, on behalf of the University, acknowledge the--the leadership from the--from this committee in ensuring that those funds were baselined. Because as you mentioned, every year it was part of the budget dance to get that money in there. So, the fact that it was baselined in 2014 made a big difference for us. So, we appreciate that. In terms of growth, where we're focusing our efforts right now is at the State level. And part of our budget request, we have asked the State to match the City's commitment to the Black Male Initiative. So as you mentioned, the City funded--has funded in our base \$2.5 million. So we have asked the State to match that so that we can double the amount of participants that we have in the program. And so, we're continuing to talk to the State Legislature about that. It's part of our lobbying efforts that we're making up in Albany right now. And we hope that we will be successful with it. And in terms of evaluation of the program, we'll have to get back to you with the data on how we evaluate it, what the

successes have been. What the outcomes for students have been. But I'll make sure that you--you and the rest of the committee get that data.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And what is the Black Male Initiative focused on. How--what does it look like for example in any particular institution? How do they recruit Black men to participate in it? How do they evaluate? How do they evaluate their success versus what is the outcome of the evaluation?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
Uh-huh.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: What is the--the goal and objective, and how is it achieved?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: And--and one thing I want to point out about the Black Male Initiative is that it's--although it started at Medgar Evers College as an initiative to assist Black males, at the rest of our campuses it's really been expanded to focus on students who come from under-represented groups. So it's not specifically for Black males, although it is called the Black Male Initiative because we modeled it after the wonderful program that began at Medgar Evers College. And so the goal of the program is really to help those

students coming from under-represented groups get acclimated to being part of a college campus, and doing college level work. So there's intensive advisement that's provided by the campuses for students that are in the Black Male Initiative. There's--there's mentorship that is provided. Each campus works with the University in crafting their own individual programs for their students. And again, in terms of evaluation data for the campuses, we'll have to get back to you on that.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay, thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you and to follow up on the question from the Council Member, you talked about funding to community colleges basically being generated by the student enrollment.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
Uh-huh.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Does that also apply at senior colleges? We know the State has that major responsibility, but how does it work at the senior colleges?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Right, senior colleges we don't use an allocation model. How the

senior colleges are funded, and how we allocate funds to the senior colleges, it's very similar to how the city allocates to its individual agencies. It's an incremental based budgeting. So each senior college has their base budget. They'll have that base budget next year. So they have some certainty as to what their base budget is going to be. And then we'll provide incremental funding for mandatory cost needs, or other initiatives that the university might be funding across all the senior colleges. You know, in years post-recession when we had state budget reductions, we had to, you know, do incremental reductions every year. But the last few years unfortunately we've been able to--to add to college based budgets. So, senior colleges had incremental based budgeting. The community colleges have a zero based allocation model, and so we do the two--we allocate to the two sectors differently.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. A few more questions. In terms of the student--the Child Care Centers, we know that City College is planning on closing its Child Care Center, and I believe they've offered parents the opportunity to have a voucher. But, many of those parents have said they would

prefer to have the opportunity to enroll their children at other CUNY facilities, child care facilities. What is your response to that request?

[background comments]

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, let me just explain what's happening at City College. We're not closing it. We're closing--we're basically renovating it. It's in a building that is--I guess it was a housing. It's about 2,000 square feet. We are renovating it to make it ADA compliant. We are renovating it to basically meet the requirements of the Health Department. You know, in these kinds of facilities, you've got to have little sinks. You have to have, you know, small toilets. And basically, that's what we're doing and it's--it's--it's two levels. So we're doing it to basically provide a better service when we are--when we are more complete. The issue about providing it at other campuses, that question we're going to have to get back to you on. Because I'm not sure how each campus how you get into a child care facility at each campus.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what's happening with the staffing at the facility during the time of this renovation?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Chair Barron, with your permission, Vice Chancellor Frank Sanchez is here and we would like him to answer that question.

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: Good morning, Frank Sanchez, Vice Chancellor for Student Affairs. Just a little bit of context about our child care centers. So we have 18 child care centers across CUNY. We're serving nearly 1,400 students. Specific to CCNY and talking to the Administration, like you I was very surprised at the idea of possibly closing the child care center. I learned about it this past fall. But, in talking to the Administration, what I've learned over the last several years they've seen a consistent decline in the number of students participating in their child care center. In fact, I think today there are only about ten students taking advantage of it.

FEMALE SPEAKER: [off mic]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Please, there is no interruption from the floor, please. Thank you.

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: This response from the Administration that we've received. And we certainly can gather more data on that. And so, they're left with kind of the question of how do we effectively use the space with all their space needs across the university. My response was to see if there was--we could do a survey and gather more data to see what all child care needs might be on the campus. In terms of the staff, I'll need to get with the Administration in terms of what are the plans for the remaining part of the semester.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, you talk about a decline in student enrollment. What kind of outreach has been done to, in fact, make sure the students know? And what about the opportunity of providing spaces to the community? I'm sure that there are people who are in the community that can benefit from having the opportunity of using the services at that center located on the college.

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And we talk about getting a mindset for having students aware that college is an objective, and that it's something that they can do. Certainly, having them in an

environment of being on a college campus, being surrounded by that. Their parents also having the opportunity to have that kind of exposure. So what about offering those spots to persons in the community who would be interested in having their children take advantage of that?

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: Sure. Let me answer the first part of the question

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Yes.

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: --in terms of outreach. That was actually the very question I asked, and they have struggled at least for the last year having a full-time director in that position. And they've shared with me that one of the challenges in outreach was the leadership of the center at the time. And so, naturally, I said well what, you know, what other ways can we do outreach either through social media or just flyers? And just generally supporting the Child Care Center so we get a better response. And they said they would look into that, but as of right now, there are still no enrollments.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And--

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: [interposing]
In terms of--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: --in terms of community access to the community, I think--it's my understanding the community has quite a bit of access on campus. I don't know exactly--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] No, I'm talking specifically about specifically--

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: --what the child care--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --the child care.

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: Yeah, so about a year ago, in fact, about a year and a half ago, we changed the Child Care Policy actually to open it up. Of course, students have to be the priority in terms of access to childcare. But after those seats have been filled, or if they're not filled. If there continues to be a vacancy, we actually adapted the policy to allow for then faculty and staff to have access. And then community members to have access in that order. And so, there is the opportunity. If they're unable to fill those spots, there is opportunity to also open it up to the community at city rates, or at market rates.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, I'm going to follow up on that because I don't know that the community has had notice given to them that they are, in fact, eligible to apply at the faculty and staff with other vacancies being there. And in terms of the staffing that's there during this renovation, what--what is happening with the staffing? Have they been released? Have they been reassigned? What's happening on that?

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: I don't believe they've been released. I'll get specifics for you and follow up.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I few other questions. Thank you.

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: As we're talking about perhaps student services, what--what is CUNY doing to track and assist homeless students?

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: Hi,
***Commissioner. [laughs]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, you're back again. We know that CUNY has a homeless population because sometimes--

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: [interposing]
They do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: -- they're featured
in news stories and how they're struggling and the
challenges that they face in terms of being homeless,
being able to travel. Not having a definite food
source.

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So what is CUNY
doing to track--

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: [interposing]
Well--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --identify, track
and assist these students.

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: Well, I don't
think we're doing enough to identify and track our
homeless students. One of the challenges that we
have, we actually had a very good conversation with
all of our Vice Presidents of Student Affairs on this
very topic of homelessness. And what I got back from
the Vice Presidents of Student Affairs they said one
of our challenges is that a student today who is
homeless, may not be homeless next month. They may

find a place. They may find a family. They may find a place where they're--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] I find that hard to accept--

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: [interposing] Well, so--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --understanding the homeless population, families that are homeless in New York City.

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: So again, this is feedback I got back from vice presidents--vice presidents. They would also say that a student that is not homeless today may be homeless in their next month or two or six months, or certainly by the end of the year. So that number fluctuates quite a bit. And this is--this the challenge we have in trying to track and consistently identify students who are homeless. As we know, there are students who are homeless, but it's, you know, when they-- How long will they stay homeless, is another question. So we've done a couple of things to try to address this. We know that on our campuses often times a student that's homeless is identified by a staff member or a faculty member or another student or administrator.

And so what we did is we said, well, shoot, can we create one central kind of clearinghouse website where a faculty staff, administrator or student can direct and make a referral for that student. Where they can find not only campus resources, but city resources that are eligible to them. So now, we have an emergency shelter website that brings together a lot of these city resources and campus resources that are--that homeless students may be eligible for. That was the first step. We said we simply have to connect information, resources, and service the students that are homeless.

Another area where we made progress, for many, many years the Petrie Foundation provided emergency funding for our four-year institutions. But through the good work of our development office folks there were able to work with the Petrie Foundation to expand the emergency funding for our students at our community colleges.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So that's a partnership you have with--?

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: With the Petrie Foundation. So they provide emergency funding at our four-year and now our two-year institutions. And

many of our students when they're identified as being homeless can access those funds for temporary support. And so those are--those two things that we've done to help our students that are homeless.

One other thing that we've done, as you know, and you noted earlier, a number of our schools have developed residential housing on campus. And so through this conversation with our vice presidents, we started to just simply communicate between campuses that if we have vacancies available, for example at Queens College, and you may get a vice president at CCNY who says hey I have a homeless student. Is there, you know, is there a chance we can find housing at least temporarily for this student? There have been agreements made where that has actually occurred. In fact, last year at Queens College that took place. I know at Hunter College they provide housing for a number of homeless students. But this is, as you know, a very, very broad issue. We are on this front, and on a similar front we're doing extensive work for students in foster care. You know as a lot of students age out of foster care, one of the biggest challenges is housing. In fact, Housing and Urban Development now

is looking to possibly--possibly partner with CUNY and the Single Stop Initiative to try to find additional housing for our students in care. The City University of New York has taken this particular issue very seriously. And we launched our CUNY Foster Care Collaborative. Where we've brought together number of community based organizations, not-for-profits, foundations and a city agency, the Administration of Children's Services to look very specifically at our new 1,000 students that are orphans and wards of the court. Our goal here, really our vision is to provide every--every student who is an orphan or a ward of the court, every student those resources and services and support that they're eligible for. Again, not just at our colleges, but throughout the city. And really working to connect the dots for those students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So do we have a number that identifies students in those--in those categories, either homeless or aged out of foster care? Do we have the ability to know the number?

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: Before nine--or I should say really a month ago, we did not. Between the good work of--I don't see the staff here, but we

actually partnered with the Administration of Children's Services to establish an MOU a data sharing agreement. So now we can do that. Now, we can very specifically identify students who have been through the Administration of Children's Services, and who have applied and enrolled with the City University of New York. And this is going to help us, as you can imagine, on many, many fronts. But one, now we know who our students are that may be eligible for additional resources. One of those resources, for example, is the ETV. I don't have the have the acronym right. It's the Educational Technical Voucher I think. It's about \$5,000 that we know--we have about 315 students that receive that ETV, but we're pretty confident that's not all of the students that are eligible for those additional resources. Through this MOU in this data sharing agreement, we're going to be able to identify all those students who should apply for those additional funds.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And could you expound on what the ETV is?

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: I wish I could.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, okay--

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: [interposing]

Other than--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --if you could you get it to us?

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: Yeah, other than it's--I believe it's State funding or federal. State funding and it's students who have been--who have been part of the foster care system.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thank you, and if you could please share with us the written policy that says that the community--the community has an opportunity to use the facilities, the child care facilities at city or whatever other colleges may have that, I would appreciate that. Because I've been told that they are not aware. So I would like to have a written policy that I could share that with them.

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

VICE CHANCELLOR SANCHEZ: Thank you.

Talking about student space, what is the expectation for having dedicated student space for student to come together to be supportive, to be able to do what students on a college campus in that type of

environment are expected to do in terms of clubs?
What is the expectation as to the amount of square
footage each college should have based on the number
of students. Or, based on the facilities that would
support that, and allow for that to exist?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, if--if
you go back. I don't want to say how many years
because that will date me. When I went to Hunter
College that was not a concern.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: It's now the model.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Okay.

[laughter]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: We'll talk.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: That was not
a concern, and some of our colleges never even
started out as colleges. You know, like 500 Grand
Concourse was like an insurance building. So way
back, nobody considered this. But what we do is when
we basically plan to build new buildings, we plan for
this. And I'll give you an example. Fiterman Hall,
if you walk into Fiterman Hall, student space was all
different kinds of student like the student space
near the window with all these soft chairs that you
could relax in. The next level of Fiterman is in the

center area there are tables and chairs where you can probably have a bite to eat. Then there's another area that basically has small rooms. Then there's another area where you work, and you basically go in and you, you know, it's--it's really basically you have to remain quiet. So we plan for every single building. If you--if you--if you look at the build--the building at Bronx Community that was mentioned by the Council--Councilman, it's a library, but what the library looks like is, it's got tremendous amount of areas for students to get together. It's got separate rooms. It's got furniture that's set up. So for every single new building, that is probably our number one priority. Then when we do renovation, and if you look at the amount of money we spend on renovation and critical maintenance, we look at that. Every place that we go, any building that we touch, we try to find areas for basically students to--to gather. So, it wasn't modeled, you know, 20 years ago, but right now it is. So anything that we touch, that's what we-- Anything that we touch, we look at ADA. Anything that we touch, we look at spaces for students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: It's good to know that you're having the consideration of the ADA. I think that's very important especially going forward, and making accommodations in the existing facilities. Students at the MCC, however, have complained that Fiterman Hall, they have been bumped out of space for time to time because Fiterman has been used by other outside entities, which have usurped their ability to use that space. SO, I don't know if that's still the issue. It was brought to us a few months back, and we would certainly want to make sure that there are some types of guarantees that some students space is sancrosanct--sacrosanct and for students themselves, and being able to be reserved for them. So they know they can always have that access. I would appreciate that. And then in terms of--you spoke earlier about the Challenge Grant and SUNY 2020. If you could expand on what those monies are--and you also talked about the fact that you're in a second round. My understanding is that the Governor has put this money into a system where you have to compete with other colleges to get the awards. So if you could expand a little on that Challenge Grant process, how that works.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: The program is, you know, to increase economic development. So we have \$55 million. We went through Round 1, and-- and schools put in proposals basically that are going to show that they are either going to produce more jobs, or they're going to increase education in different fields. But it's all about economic development. And as a matter of fact, we just received funding for the first--for the first round. And I'll just give you an example. Queens Borough Community College they put in a proposal to basically partner with an HMO. And the HMO, the community board purchased the building, and the HMO would be in a partnership. And the HMO would provide a training facility for their students. So this building would have classrooms, and this building would have, you know, regular clients. So, that's going to basically improve the training, and it's going to increase jobs. Because you would hope that after they're trained then they're going to be able to--to get employment there. Some of the other--some of the other programs that were awarded grants that are on a smaller scale, Hostos was awarded a grant to basically buy equipment for their Allied Health

Programs. So it ranges from something that's very, very small to something that's large, and you basically have to show that you're going to produce jobs. You're going to increase the scope of a program. And we're up to the second round, and they want the second round to be ready for technology. So it's really interesting, and it's really providing-- it will provide more jobs and more programs in the end.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So round one is completed, and that money has already been awarded and now there's a--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing] Round one is completed. There are eight campuses. We're about to basically give the money to the campus--money to the campuses, and we're about to--to start round two, and it's really interesting. Round two, every campus is calling to--to talk to us about some idea. So I believe that the program is really working, and it's going to make a difference.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So the individual colleges would submit their proposal to you, and then you would advance them to the State?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Right, and there's a committee that's set up between the State and CUNY, and the campuses basically may even do it with other campuses. So it's a partnership. So the campuses are really working together.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, and can you tell us about the status of Start-Up New York? Which CUNY colleges are a part of Start-Up New York and is that related to the challenges? Is that separate from the challenges?

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: Well, it's interesting that you ask that because they now want-- for round two they want to relate the 2020 to basically start. Start-Up it's a State program.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: There are five campuses that the community board basically voted it had to be at economically distressed campuses. It's York, City College or City College, Bronx Community, Medgar Evers and--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
Staten Island.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: -CFI.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: And they're-- basically they built a partnership with a business, and the business if it's accepted by CUNY, gets all these tax benefits. And Bronx Community happens to be the first one up, and there was a business I can't talk about. We're negotiating with them now. A business that's going to open in a building, and there is going to be a partnership with Bronx Community, and Bronx Community is going to get internship. Bronx Community is going to get a new curriculum in this area. So, it's really going to benefit the campuses.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So it's not necessarily a financial benefit to the campus in terms of dollars coming in, but a partnership, internships--

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: [interposing]
Right.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ---and other kinds.

VICE CHANCELLOR BERGTRAUM: But basically, it's not a financial. It's educational and providing jobs.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, great. I think--I haven't asked all my questions, but I think

I've asked most of the questions that I wanted to get to. I do want--I do want to thank you for coming. Thank you for your testimony, and ask that you please get back to us in terms of-- Oh, there is a final question. The Murphy Institute--

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --the Murphy Institute Center for Worker Education.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing] Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Can you talk about that just briefly before you leave?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Sure the Murphy Institute is a part of our school professional. They have space on 43rd Street, and as you mentioned they provide worker education programs. They partner with a lot of the unions here in the city and provide programs to their members. We're concerned about the Murphy Institute right now, and I'm glad you brought it up, Chair Barron, because in the State Executive Budget, we're looking at a loss of a million dollars for the Murphy Institute for next years. So that's something that again, we've been making members of the Assembly and Senate aware

of, and it's been part of our lobbying efforts to try to get that funding restored in the State Adopted Budget.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: There's a request that's come before me that the Murphy Institute would want to become a school. What does that mean in terms of the status, the qualifications, the staffing and whatever else you think is important?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-huh. In order for, you know, an institute like that to become its own free-standing college, there are a lot of accreditation issues that have been looked at. There are a lot of issues with the State Education Department. The Board of Regents have to be looked at. There are a lot of funding considerations that have to be taken into consideration. So there would be, you know, a lot of hurdles that would have to be jumped over in order for that to happen. But right now it's housed at the School of Professional Studies. And we think, you know, they and the School of the Professional Studies are both doing a terrific job. So we think the model that's there now is working. So, I think that, you know, we're happy with it--with the current model that's there.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. If I have any further questions, I will forward them to you and I would appreciate a response. As you have always been cooperative. We do thank you in that regard, and look forward to working-- Oh, I do have another question. [laughter] One of my--how could I have forgotten. Diversity in the faculty.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That, as you know, has been an issue that has been the one that I've been very concerned about. I understand that there are programs that are dedicated to do the outreach, to bring in more Black and Latino faculty. But as the data that has been shared with us through your reports indicates, the--the success rate is less than acceptable in terms of getting Blacks into--coming into the system, and then moving them up. And I understand it's been told to me, Well, you know, it goes through the departments. So the departments have their own types of culture that they use to determine. Because, in fact, if I went to one school's department, and applied, I might not be seen as the candidate, the preferred candidate. But another school with the same types of credentials

would say, oh, this is a great candidate. So it's very subjective, and we can't wait for these department people to leave. I don't want to say die off. We can't just wait for them to leave or for seeing for us just to get the equity that we need in terms of that. So what is CUNY? What can CUNY do?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Uh-huh. Well, we--we know that this it's an area of concern for us, and we know that, you know, Chair Barron, you've had hearings on this. And we know that it's an area of concern for you, and this entire Higher Ed Committee. So just to give you some--some data that you may have already received, but just to--to milk the data. For our faculty, for faculty that were hired in calendar year 2014, about 36% of the new faculty that were hired in 2014 were--were minority, and--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] You mean under-represented? Not minority, right? Because they are certainly not the minority in terms of numbers.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Right. The total minority would be the Black, Latino, and Asian groups. And of that I just want to point out just going back to, you know, where we started this

hearing, and you point that it's Women's History Month.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Over 52% of the--of that population new faculty we hired in 2014 are female. So we are--we're pleased about that. The 36% that we hired in 2014 was an improvement on the percentage on 2013. 2013 of the new faculty we hired, 30% were from those minority groups. So we're showing improvement. We certainly agree that there is more than can be done there, and we will continue to work with our campuses to try to--to try to improve those numbers.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And in terms of persons moving from the assistant professor up to professor, Black Latino and Asian has there been any improvement in that regard?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: I don't have any data on that, but we'll try to get that to you. But one thing that I just want to point out about not only faculty recruitment but faculty retention. That is a critical issue for us at the university especially when it comes to minority faculty is that we're in a different situation than when--

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] You
3 mean under-represented faculty, not minority, right?

4 VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Sure.

5 [laughs] We're in such a different position than
6 most other organizations that are funded through the
7 government in that we are really in an intense
8 competition for our talented faculty. Especially
9 those in under-represented groups. With private
10 colleges and with public colleges throughout the
11 country that are trying to recruit these folks, they
12 might come into the university and do a few years
13 here. And before they get tenure, get recruited by a
14 private college here in New York or a public
15 institution somewhere else. So, that's something
16 that we think is a real critical issue, and we think
17 a lot of that goes to why the settling of the new
18 contract with our faculty is so critical to us. We
19 think that will help in terms of retention. So, it's
20 just another issue, but that's out there that's
21 important. But we will try to get you the data in
22 terms of how faculty are persisting to hire--to hire
23 salary levels and higher titles.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And then in terms of
25 retention, is there some type of document that could,

in fact, substantiate the reasons why a person is leaving? Do we have any way to capture that data, whether they're relocating or just felt that they didn't have enough opportunity within CUNY. Or, whether they had gotten a better offer.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: [interposing]
Yeah, I--I--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is there a way to capture that data?

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: I'm not certain that we have that, but I--I will check with our folks in Human Resources--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Okay.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: --and we'll see if we can get that to you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much for your time, and for your presentation.

VICE CHANCELLOR SAPIENZA: Thank you.
[pause]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: As CUNY is leaving, we'll move onto the next panel, and that will be Steve London from Professional Staff Congress, and Michael Fabricant who will join us at the panel. Thank you.

[background comments, pause]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Please raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee, and to answer all questions honestly?

PANEL MEMBERS: I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. You may begin.

STEVE LONDON: Good afternoon, Chair Barron. I'm Steve London, First Vice President of the Professional Staff Congress, and I'm joined by Mike Fabricant, Professor at Hunter College in Social Work and Treasurer of Professional Staff Congress. On behalf of the 27,000 faculty and staff of CUNY represented by the Professional Staff Congress I thank you for the opportunity to testify here today. And for your continued advocacy on behalf of the students, faculty and staff at CUNY. Funding from the Council has often made the difference between survival and elimination of critical programs at CUNY. I'm here today to ask you to continue to fund essential programs. But, I also want to step back and urge you to begin a more ambitious discussion

about funding CUNY, a discussion worthy of a progressive city and progressive leadership.

President Obama has called on states and cities to invest more in college education. And legislators on both sides of the aisle in Washington are seeking to make college more affordable. When he unveiled his proposal for free community college, President cited CUNY's ASAP program as a model, and we've had a lot of discussion about ASAP today. It has been shown that by investing in smaller classes and more support for community college students, graduation grades can be dramatically raised. Of the most recent cohort, 56% graduated from community college within three years as a result that is far-- that far out paces the national average. With an additional investment of \$3,900 for full-time faculty--full-time equivalent students above the standard community college allocations, ASAP has resources to provide smaller classes, sharply focused counseling and mentorship, free tuition and other critical supports for students.

Because of these bigger upfront investments, students success skyrockets and students spend less time in resources before graduation. I

want to make an important point here about all the discussion that we've heard concerning ASAP. Without a doubt, ASAP is a stellar program and has shown success. There are other programs that have equally shown success. For example, SEEK and College Discovery. We talked about the Black Male Initiative. There is one thing that unites all these programs, and that is that there is a greater investment per FTE student. These are resource rich programs that provide full-time faculty. They provide mentoring. They provide counseling. They provide the kind of individualized attention that students need to succeed. While it is absolutely important to talking about ramping up ASAP, what is more important is to recognize that over 25 years--and I'll speak about this more in a moment--over 25 years the core of CUNY has been hollowed out.

And the recent gains over the last 10 or so years have already been compromised by the recession. And we haven't recovered from that period of the disinvestments of 25 years or the more recent disinvestments from the recession period. With a hollowed out core, the students at CUNY are not getting the resources that they deserve and that they

need. So it's important to both understand that ASAP is a specific program that takes students and invests in them. But, the broad student body of CUNY, and especially in the community colleges need similar investments. They need to have faculty who are present. They need to have faculty who have time. They need smaller classes. So we are talking about a much more generalized funding issue, and that's what we want to address here as well. Each of these programs are important, but you don't build a university by discrete programs. Discrete programs are built upon a fully resourced university.

President Obama initiated a national conversation about higher education as a public good like P12 education, higher education should be free and properly funded. It is in the public's interest to have a well educated and productive citizenry. I think that we have learned that when education is treated as a privately acquired commodity, it benefits those of means. And leaves those without proper preparation or resources at a great disadvantage, and in serious debt. Under such circumstances higher education reproduces inequality rather than promoting opportunity in a more equal and

democratic society. That is why we call on the city and state to provide all CUNY community colleges with ASAP level investments. To get there, we need Albany to do its part, but we also need to build on the investments the city had made and moved toward fulfilling the aspiration for CUNY that Mayor de Blasio has articulated to ultimately increase City funding for the university by \$150 million per year.

The City Council can put a down payment on that investment by negotiating with the Mayor for operating funds to CUNY over and above the Mayor's proposed increase. Twenty-four City Council members laid the groundwork for such a discussion last year when they co-signed a letter from you, Chair Barron, requesting funding for two new Council initiatives providing \$10 million to hire 100 new full-time faculty and staff to begin to address CUNY's full-time faculty shortage. And second, providing \$5 million for need-based financial aid to fill gaps in the current system of state and federal financial aid. And complement the City Council Merit Scholarship. Those investments were not included in the final budget for this year, but the effort to establish them was an attempt to address critical

needs at CUNY. It showed that a significant portion of the Council is ready to aggressively champion the cause of CUNY students, faculty and staff. The PSC urges you to renew your call for City Council investments in full-time faculty and need based financial aid.

An urgent and essential step in restoring support for CUNY is funding a new collective bargaining agreement. CUNY faculty and professional staff have not had a contract since 2009. Our salaries are already low in comparison to other comparable institutions and have now become completely non-competitive. At the end of our last contract, which was 2010, the average full professor at Rutgers earned \$141,000 a year. The average full-time professor at four-year CUNY college earned \$114,000 the same professor would earn \$170,000 at Columbia, and \$176,000 at NYU, and that was in 2010. Both of which frequently vie with CUNY for the same candidates. And a profession in which universities compete nationally for faculty, CUNY is finding it increasingly difficult to recruit and retain the faculty we need. And that is particularly true of

faculty from under-represented groups, which you were just discussing.

Meanwhile, decades of under-investment by the City and State have led to a massive reliance of adjuncts whose underpaid labor allows CUNY to stay afloat as enrollment rises. An adjunct who carries a full load of courses earns less than \$30,000 a year, and does know from one semester to the next whether she will have a job. Theirs are not the smiling faces you see on the--in CUNY ads on the subways. But they are doing the bulk of the teaching, especially of the highest need students. Right now, adjuncts teach 54% of all undergraduate instruction. That is no way to run a university. The PSE in CUNY have worked productively together in preliminary negotiations and share the goal of reaching a contract that allows the university to offer the best possible education. It is time for this contract to be settled, and we ask for your support to settle this contract, and allow CUNY to recruit and retain the academic workforce it needs.

I've provided you with a budget book. It has a lot of facts and figures in it, and it tells a story. And I'll just--my testimony details it, but

I'll just paraphrase here from the testimony. The story is very clear and an all too-familiar one. What we have seen is both from the City and the State, a 25-year history of this investment. In recent years in the last year or two in seeing a small uptick from the City, and that's very welcome. But what has also happened, especially since the recession is that our students who are among the poorest who make--who come from families making under \$30,000 a year. And especially in the community colleges, almost half of them are from families making under \$20,000 a year. They have been asked to do more. And so they have over the last four years seen \$1,200 increase in tuition and another \$300 coming soon in the next--the next semester. And that has been used by and large simply to fill the gap of state disinvestment.

We have seen a tremendous disinvestment in full-time equivalent student funding from the State. We are not even back up in nominal dollars let alone inflation adjusted dollars to where we were in 2008. So, what this has meant is that more and more CUNY is relying on student funding. We're at about 44% in the community colleges. Close to 50% in

the senior colleges, and that has more than doubled over the course of the 25-year period that we've-- that I've been discussing. So, we need this fundamental program and its support. President Obama has called on the State and City--states and cities to do their part, and we would urge the Council in this budget not to do it all. We know that's a lot, but to make a clear statement that we consider, and this Council considers CUNY to be an important resource, and needs the investment. It's a small amount of money in the scheme of things, but it would politically be very important. And now, I'd like to turn it over to Professor Fabricant to talk specifically about our budget request.

PROFESSOR FABRICANT: It's good to be here and thank you for the opportunity, Chairwoman Barron. What I would like to start with is the fact that, you know, we talk about the university, and a number of the Council people spoke about the sort of desires as to what the university should do and needs to do. One of the things we know is that CUNY apart from being this opportunity machine, which it has been over the course of--over the course of decades. Is that presently it's struggling to overcome some of

the deep, deep problems that exist in K through 12 throughout the city. So when the students come to us, they often come with profound issues that have to do with academic challenges as a result of really not getting what was needed in the K through 12 experience. That means that CUNY in attempting to pick that up across the city is in a circumstance now more than ever where the kinds of investment in mentoring faculty supports in order to make the difference both in the community colleges and senior colleges such as ASAPs, as Steve pointed out, become ever more important.

And so, what I want to talk about, as well, is that we've seen in the last State Executive Budget no new funding for community colleges, and tuition hikes and under-funding for the senior colleges. And it's a--and that stands in stark contract to the reality at the university given the new--the students who are coming in. The kinds of needs that exist, and what we know works in relationship to those students' circumstances and their challenges. Mayor de Blasio and the City Council on the other hand have started an important direction of change for the university, and that

needs to be underscored. You know programs that range from differences in community--I'm going to not name them all, but differences in community college funding. A significant investment in ASAP at the same time that the State is threatening to disinvest in ASAP or Science, Technology, and Engineering or STEM programs. There are a whole array of programs that the City through the Mayor and the City Council have begun to invest in new ways. We understand the full needs of the students we serve, and we also understand the lives of the staff and faculty we represent. And believe the proposal we're about to make are proposals that will advance the interests of both students and the learning conditions that exist for them as well as the working conditions that ultimately define the learning conditions for students. So let me proceed to our proposals.

To begin with, we are proposing the City Council needs to take a look at the merit scholarships. It was wonderful that the City Council made--developed that initiative and invested in it. But the investment represents an investment for a first cohort. We are now going to see second, third, and fourth cohorts. The funding needs to reflect not

a \$10.9 million for a first cohort, but the additional cohorts going forward. Otherwise, we're going to have to do--as a university what will end up happening is decisions will be made to cut the amount of dollars dedicated to each student in order to invest in a second cohort. There are a series of other investments here that we've bulleted from Civic Justice Court to the Dominican Studies Institute to the Center for Puerto Rican Studies to Creative Arts Teams to the Murphy Institute, which was mentioned earlier.

Our most ambitious proposal is a proposal that we've named One City Fellows. We're asking, and Steven mentioned this earlier, the City funded 100 new faculty lines now for \$10 million, and over time has supported 1,000 new full-time faculty and professional staff lines. We need in this moment bold proposals if we're--and an ambitious investment if we're going to produce significant changes in outcome for the student body. We think that this represents that kind of bold proposal. But it will require ambitious investment consistent with what the Mayor has promised earlier regarding \$150 million investment in the university.

It is true as university officials indicated that we've seen the number of full-time faculty increase by 23% between 2004 or '05 and 2014 or '15. However, as the results so indicated by university officials, those full-time faculty lines in at relationship to faculty to student ratios were swamped by the rapid expansion of students throughout the university. And so, what we see right now is for example at Queens Borough Community College the full-time--the student to full-time faculty ratio is 40 to 1 and at La Guardia 37 to 1. What does that mean? As the class sizes for full-time faculty grow, the capacity for faculty to meet the range of needs of students, and this is particularly in community colleges but also comprehensive in other senior colleges is diminished. Fundamentally, you can't do the same work for 40 students in a classroom and outside, but you can for 20, 25 or even 30. And as I indicated earlier, that has particular implications for some of the students who come to the university with particular kinds of challenges as result of what was not experienced in K through 12.

What we're talking about here is not simply access. Access is very, very important. But

it's access to what? Access to what? What we've seen in the university over the last number of years is it's access often to a diminished capacity to hold to the standards over time in terms of class size, out of classroom experience, the replacement of full-time faculty with part-time to a quality of instruction that every student deserves. And that every faculty member deserves in relationship to what they can provide to students. Too often that's being challenged and we're sort of in a pivotal moment regarding our ability to sustain that quality.

PSC proposes calling this new cohort of a thousand faculty of CUNYs One City Fellow to honor the role they play in increasing opportunity and reducing inequality in our city. And by the way, Chair Barron, this is also a way to really rapidly address some of the questions about diversity. All right. And you talked earlier about it, and it is clearly within the purview of departments to hire. We know how to create departments and models. It's something that the PSC has been working on, exemplar departments, pursuing matters of faculty diversity, our exemplary departments. We are learning from what they do to try to pollinate that across the

1 university. That takes time and that's--that is, in
2 fact, part of the agenda for both I think the
3 university, but particularly for the Professional
4 Staff Congress. That said, if we were to move to a
5 postured of hiring a thousand new faculty, One City
6 Fellows, it allows us to incentivize in new ways
7 particularly if, in fact, what we have are funds
8 earmarked to promote diversification of faculty. A
9 different kind of outcome.
10

11 So a City Council investment of \$10
12 million this year would pay for 100 full-time faculty
13 lines or about three positions per campus. But it
14 would importantly signal the City's readiness to
15 tackle CUNY's biggest need, and it is its biggest
16 need. Its need for increased number of faculty--
17 full-time faculty across the university and staff who
18 would set the course for greater investment in the
19 coming years. And the money will be used by the
20 community to create full-time opportunities, right,
21 for qualified adjuncts. And by the way, qualified
22 adjuncts--adjuncts are one of the pipelines for
23 diversification of the faculty. We've seen it time
24 and time again. So this creates that kind of
25 opportunity. As well as the more independent hiring

outside the university of Black and Latino personnel to address the disparity and ethnic composition or under-represented groups of faculty.

I want to move on now to fund--so this is a clear centerpiece for us, and we're hoping it can be a centerpiece for the City Council as well. Fund needs-based financial aid to cover students' unmet needs, and complement the City Merit Scholarship. We know and you know that it's a myth that financial aid protects every poor student's access when tuition increases. We know that for most part-time students who exceed TAP, at the time of eight semesters and undocumented students who can't receive TAP, that there are real issues to relationship to financial aid and access. Financial independent students without dependents have a hard time qualifying for TAP and receive smaller awards when they do qualify.

Faculty and student groups in the university system are pressing the legislature to reform TAP. But until it does, the City needs to fund a needs-based financial aid program open to all. So CUNY can target aid to students who fall through gaps in TAP. It's very important if we're talking about access that we look at those groups

particularly those groups who are having difficulty being eligible and tapping into TAP both immediately and over time. We also know that 24 City Council members support the call for a \$5 million needs-based scholarship program in the last year, and we want to call on the City Council to do this again, and perhaps get it over the goal line. This is an investment that would transform the lives of thousands of the most--of the neediest students across this university.

So PSC is here to ask for new direction, and I know that we've begun to make that turn. But the City Council is a big ship and the university is a big ship, and we know it takes time to move that ship. But the hundred lines that we're talking about will make a major difference in moving that ship. As well as some of what we've talked about in terms of investment in students through both merit and through TAP rather and needs-based. What we all know, and the reason we hold CUNY as a precious resources is that it has represented the most critical gateway for the most often marginalized and poorest populations across the city over decades. It's bridge into middle-class. It's a bridge--more than a bridge as

Council Member Rodriguez talked about earlier, a bridge into the middle-class. It's been a bridge into another life, a life that allows those who attend the university to not only enter a middle-class lifestyle, but also be able to build a life as an active critical citizen of the city, and reproducing this city as we imagined it. That's been the role of this university over decades. I would say that that demands a well-resourced public higher education system. President Obama has opened the door to an important conversation particularly about community colleges, the investment, the matching funds. It's a role that we in a conversation that we hope and we expect that the City Council will fully engage with the Mayor to invest in the university. That not only faculty and staff deserve, but critically this generation and future generations of students across the city deserve. Thank you.

[pause]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you both for your testimony. I just have a few questions. I may have heard it before but it really resonated today when you said that 54% of the undergraduate instruction is done by adjunct faculty. Is that just

in the community colleges, or is that community and senior colleges?

STEVE LONDON: Well, that's--I believe that figure is CUNY wide. I can get you the exact figures broken down by senior and community college.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Please that--it hit me today. You may have said it before, but today it resonated. So, what is the workload of these adjunct faculty that's on the campus--on the campus? How many courses are they teaching? How many hours do they have to have? Do they time to have counseling?

STEVE LONDON: Adjuncts typically will teach two courses a semester on a campus. They can teach up to three on a single campus, and often times what happens is they will go to other colleges to teach as well. In our contract we've provided for payment for one office hour a week. It's actually called a professional hour, and that is if an adjunct is-- So if an adjunct is teaching two courses, they're paid for one hour a week.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And would an adjunct make more if they were teaching three courses as opposed to two courses?

STEVE LONDON: Yes, they're paid by the course.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So they're paid by the course. So will you have an adjunct who carries a full load of courses. They're teaching two courses, and earning \$30,000 a year.

STEVE LONDON: Typically, well, an adjunct--typically, an adjunct makes about \$3,000 a course. So in--throughout the entire year if they maximize their ability to teach within the CUNY system, along with the professional hour, their salary would mount up to less than \$30,000.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So now have you compared that salary to a full professor at CUNY making \$114,000. And what would their course load be, and what would be professional hours be for that full professor?

STEVE LONDON: For a full professor, first I would like to say that most adjuncts are at the lecturer level. So it would be more--it would be probably better to compare most adjuncts with lecturers who make somewhere in the neighborhood of around in the high 70s, low 80s. So they're--they're making quite a bit. The lecturers, the full-time

lecturers are making quite bit more. Lecturers will teach seven courses throughout the-- No, I'm sorry. Nine courses throughout the course of the year.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Nine courses for \$70,000--\$70 to \$80,000, nine courses?

STEVE LONDON: Throughout the course of the year plus they do advising, plus they do additional committee work, and they are members of the faculty.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you. The merit scholarships, as we know, were instituted last year. And I do support looking at needs-based scholarships. We did the submission. We sent that in, and we expect to do that again for the \$5 million. But what number of students could be benefited by that? How many students and what amount are we talking about? We know that the merit scholarships it's \$800 for the two semesters. So with the \$5 million that's being proposed, how many students would that benefit, to what amount of the scholarship, what amount would that scholarship be?

STEVE LONDON: Let me explain how this was done before there was a social--there was a safety net scholarship--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Right.

STEVE LONDON: --that former Chair

Barron--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Yes.

STEVE LONDON: --sponsored. And I

believe that was funded at the level of \$4 million

before it was discontinued. That money went to CUNY

and was distributed, as I understand it, to the

Financial Aid Officers throughout the university.

That money was used for all kinds of special needs.

A part-time student who couldn't afford the--to

attend. Somebody who didn't have books or couldn't

afford textbooks. As I understand--again, as I

understood it, there were a number of needs that were

addressed because the funding was somewhat flexible.

It could be used for undocumented students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I don't know that

CUNY funds can be used for undocumented students.

STEVE LONDON: [interposing] Okay.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: There's a

restriction on that because I know of a particular

instance where a lady had done some work, and she was

an intern and she couldn't be paid. So I don't

believe that that's the case.

STEVE LONDON: All right. Then I stand corrected, but certainly, you know, we can make inquiries and find out the policy. We can get the policies that were in place for the--the needs-based scholarship.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh.

MIKE FABRICANT: I just want to suggest when we look at the question of \$5 million, and we break it up into thousand dollar amounts, you're looking at about 5,000 students that might get a \$1,000 grant. We know that the university at the moment is serving 275,000 approximately students. That's our FTE, you know, looking at the continuing education, which would add that many more. We also know that the tuition gaps in the--what I recited earlier are substantial far exceeding, and we can multiply beyond that \$5 million how much might be needed. But I want to point to is the whole question of books. You know, I've--the cost of books has increased. The capacity of students to purchase those books has diminished. The need to find some way to fill that gap. I was speaking to a student yesterday, and she said that one of the--the pecking

order now for many students--and I was unaware of this.

Instead of going to the library, are those students that are basically using the library and trying to figure out how they are going to have to get to the library or do some part of this electronically and those who aren't able to purchase the book. And within that--within that kind of cheering are further gradations. So the access to books has begun a way in which students actually perceive each other relative to resources and a relationship fundamentally to the university and the learning. So right there we have a very serious problem. It's growing and this is a kind-- Maybe some part of it could be targeted to addressing. But is \$5 million going to meet that range? We all know and we well know that's not the case. You add multipliers of four, five, six to this, and probably not even address the range of needs that might come underneath the umbrella of our needs-based grants.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, and I have one more question. Oh, yes, in terms of the comment that the departments, in fact, have their own culture for advancing staff and it's going to take time. It

brought to mind the comment by Dr. Martin Luther King why we can't wait. We can't wait for these departments to evolve over time to bring us to the equity that we need in terms of establishing diversity. So I haven't yet come up with that--that ultimate plan that's going to move it, but just as the Civil Rights Movement had those sparks that made the reality come to bring the equity. There's got to be that spark to get people off of their positions, and their limitations and their own prejudices to move us beyond that.

MIKE FABRICANT: We agree with you, Chair Barron, and I think some part of the research we've done and which we will be publishing shortly. And which does have case studies on a couple of departments that have done much better jobs in terms of--and really tells the story of how they've managed to do this better. For example, one department in the Natural Sciences where you--the of the argument is we-- You know, we can't recruit if the pipeline is not there. Well, you know, that's a myth, and this particular department burst that myth by finding ways to develop and nurtured and then recruit faculty of color.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Has that been released yet? I would love to see that.

MIKE FABRICANT: [interposing] It has not been

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, as soon as it is--

MIKE FABRICANT: [interposing] As soon as it is--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --I want to be on top of the list.

MIKE FABRICANT: --you will be on the top of the list.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And I would be interested to know if there are particular disciplines that you've found that it existed in--

MIKE FABRICANT: [interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --as opposed to other disciplines. I would be interested in knowing that.

MIKE FABRICANT: [interposing] Sure.

STEVE LONDON: You know, I just wanted to also--I want to add that PSC has taken this very seriously, and we've done an extensive and intensive investigation and we'll--we'll share the results. We

take as one very important component the department culture. And so, we have--and we will be sharing our results. Also, it's important to understand that the low salaries, the working conditions at CUNY, the lack of a contract. All of these things are also important factors. So our report will present a comprehensive view of all the various factors.

MIKE FABRICANT: But I--I just want to sort of echo Steve's remarks because one of the things we've found, particularly in the sciences, is that many of the faculty who are attracted to CUNY they were attracted because of the diversity of the student body. That's one factor. They want to come to CUNY. But the real lift had to do with resources. They had--the faculty--these faculty had other offers. They made the choice to come to CUNY and often, by the way, taking less money. And that's the--that's an outlier experience. Most folks don't make those choices. So we've got to find a way to fix the faculty side of this in terms of, you know, our lack of competitive position and salary.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And I'm also--I just want to cite one other point in your testimony, which I think is important, which I didn't get to put on

the record when I talked to the Administration.

Which is at the bottom of page 2 you said: "While CUNY's senior colleges are not admitting a class of first-time freshmen that are as diverse as in the past. Community colleges continue to be a major point of access for New York City residents." And I appreciate your putting that into your testimony because it is very accurate. Although we can talk about absolute numbers being improved and increased, in terms of percentages, that is not the case. So I'm glad that you have that in your testimony.

STEVE LONDON: [interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: It gave me an opportunity to put it on the record.

STEVE LONDON: Yes, and it's--it's also important to put on the record the--the disparity in resources between the community and--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Yes.

STEVE LONDON: --senior colleges. So if you took all of the resources, right, all the operating funds that come from the City and the State, and also from student tuition and philanthropy, you took all those resources and you put them in one pot. Right now community colleges

1 have somewhere in the neighborhood of \$12,500 per
2 full-time equivalent student, a little less. And,
3 you know, that's got to--that's not just for
4 instruction. You know, that turns on the lights and
5 buys the oil for heating and everything else. For
6 senior colleges, it's between \$17 and \$18,000. Now,
7 I can tell you that that's--that both those figures
8 are low. When you look at resources in private
9 colleges and League colleges, and so within CUNY,
10 though, what becomes clear is that when the community
11 colleges become the access point--

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Uh-
14 huh.

15 STEVE LONDON: --they are getting even
16 less in terms of resources per student than you see
17 in the senior colleges. And, you know, this whole
18 issue was brought up when back in the 1990s when
19 remediation was ended in the senior colleges. And
20 one of the--and the study showed at the time, and I
21 think we see continuously that when students come
22 into community colleges as opposed to senior colleges
23 their success rate and graduation rate from the BA,
24 with a BA, is less than if they immediately go into a
25 senior college. So those studies are there. I think

that we are very interested in having more resources to go into our community colleges at this point in time.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thank you for your testimony. Thank you.

STEVE LONDON: I--I should finish my thought--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Okay.

STEVE LONDON: --as well as greater access for under-represented students to the senior colleges.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes. Great. Thank you very much.

STEVE LONDON: Okay. Thank you.

[pause, background comments, pause]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: We'll now call the next panel. Donovan Borrington from CUNY USS, Joseph Awadje from CUNY USS, and Julianna Tedesco, CCNY Parent and Students.

[background comment]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, you're with another panel?

[background comment]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So you will be with the next panel. Okay, thank you. If you would raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee, and to answer all member's questions honestly?

PANEL MEMBERS: Yes. [in unison]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. You may begin.

JOSEPH AWADJE: Okay. Good afternoon, Chairwoman and Ms. Barron and members of the New York City Council Higher Education Committee. My name is Joseph Awadje, and the Chairperson of the University Student Senate and a Trustee of the City University of New York. I'm here to represent the 500,000 students of CUNY and also Brooklyn College graduate students. In February, Mayor de Blasio put forth a Preliminary Budget for the City of New York, and within it we find support for numerous city services, programs and initiatives. Our students are often forgotten, but we are also citizens and residents of this great city, hard-working employees, parents, renters, homeowners, customs. We fill every corner of the city in every capacity, and we are thankful

for any assistance we can get. We also hopeful that if more can be done, that leaders--if more can be done that the leadership will take the extra steps to make it happen. We applaud the increasing support for New York Colleges, a \$13 million from Fiscal Year 15.

These increases include \$1.7 million for also study in associate--associate programs, ASAP at the community colleges; \$544,000 for child care funding; and \$26,500 for college discovery. At the February 23rd hearing President Obama's American College Promise Proposal, we testified to the vitality of community colleges in the City and State of New York. We are encouraged by the continued support of the--for community colleges, and we are hopeful that this support will continue. We also applaud support for the STEM Support Expansion Program. In this increase, there is support for expansion for ASAP, and the creation of a new study program for STEM students that will impact over 4,000 in Fiscal Year 2015 and over 13,000 in Fiscal Year 2017. STEM research fellowships will be--will enable students to work directly with faculty on STEM leaders research and receive laboratory training,

academic support and counseling. Which would impact over 200 students in Fiscal Years 15 or over 200 students in Fiscal Year 16.

The STEM Incorporated Medication [sic] Program, which would allow STEMs to gain experience working full-time in technical positions in their field for studies while taking courses. Also the summer tuition programs to allow CUNY to pay summer tuition for students in STEM leader [sic] disciplines, which will impact over 4,500 students in Fiscal Year 2015 and over 6,000 students in Fiscal Year 2016. And academic advisement improvement, quality academic support and identify and face academic challenges early in their college careers. Particularly for those students then who often face complex degree requirement, and would impact and affecting thousands of students for Fiscal Year 2015. There was mention of the New York City Council Merit Scholarship, which was restored for Fiscal Year '15. This was when teachers [sic] stepped in support for students. The City Council located \$12 million for New York City high school graduates with a grade of B or higher entering educating. This equated to nearly 14,000 students benefitted for this scholarship

program. Now, we are asking to not only maintain the commitment you have made last year, but to strengthen the commitment. We asking that the City Council make a \$17 million commitment not only to the current recipients of this scholarship who kept up their end of the bargain with their new perspectives to the students who met their criteria and who will enter CUNY this upcoming fall. Thank you for your time, and we thank you for your leadership and foresight to support all initiatives that have been discussed today.

DONOVAN BORRINGTON: Greetings,
Chairwoman Barron and members of the New York City Council. I'm Donovan Borrington, a current resident of City Council District 31. I'm a student up in Baruch College majoring in corporate communications and I serve as the Vice Chair of Fiscal Affairs for the University Student Senate. I'm also a member of the CUNY Board of Trustees Committee on Facilities, Planning and Management. It is an honor to come before you and present a testimony on behalf of the 500,000 students I represent. This testimony reflects the collective interests of my fellow students. May Bill de Blasio's Preliminary Budget

for Fiscal Year 2016 gives us hope that New York City can once again be the place where citizens can live, survive, and raise their kids. We thank Mayor de Blasio for providing additional funding to support community colleges, STEM support expansion and CUNY's The Accelerated Studies Associate Program also known as ASAP. It's great to know that our Mayor is providing an opportunity for more students. These programs give New Yorkers the opportunity to develop skills that we can use to build our city and enhance the quality of life for millions. We believe the best way to build our city is by building strong communities. And the first step to building a community is ensuring that it has a solid foundation. We believe this foundation should not be made of cement. It must be forged together with knowledge acquired for some institutions of learning. This will allow us the ability to build something that can be built on for generations and generations. We believe building is important, and this is why we ask Mayor Bill de Blasio to provide necessary funding for capital projects. We support CUNY's \$6.8 billion Five-Year Capital Budget Request for Fiscal Year 2015 to 2016 through Fiscal Year 2019 to 2020. However,

we believe CUNY will need more capital funding. If STEM and ASAP programs are to expand, then students will need necessary space and equipment to achieve their goals. It would be great if students majoring in STEM had more labs available outside of class time. It would be great if campus libraries had study rooms like City College and Baruch College. Which allows students to work on group projects and help one another study for exams. We believe providing funding for capital projects is just as important as providing funding for student's success programs and initiatives. As author Jim Rohn once said, Whatever good things we build end up building us. Let us build an education system that is accessible to all citizens. Let's build facilities that knowledge can be accessed. Then, let us build a city that the world can admire, and a city where all can live. It's important to us that, you know, the City Council understands that these programs are very important. But to the students they come with burden. We need space, and as you mentioned earlier, there is not much space on every campus. Especially at a campus like mine at Baruch. At this time, mid-terms every corner is very crowded. Students spend

10 to 12 hours in the library on their off days, and it's just hard for us to study. We have other students that may come from another campus because their library isn't open as many hours as ours is.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you very much for your testimony. So are you saying that students from other CUNY campuses come because the amenities and facilities and space of their own home campuses?

DONOVAN BORRINGTON: Yes, during finals and sometimes at mid-term Baruch is open 24 hours. So you may have a student come from another campus and want to study with their partner. And also we have study halls that you could rent out space to do group projects. So sometimes a friend of mine may say, Hey, can I come to your campus and we could study and work on a project. My campus doesn't have that 24-hour access or the study rooms. For a student like myself sometimes I end up going to my former campus, La Guardia Community College because it may not be as crowded, and I have the space to study.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And is that a 24--is that a 24-hour police year round, or only at certain times during the semester? Do you know?

DONOVAN BORRINGTON: Only during finals.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: During finals?

DONOVAN BORRINGTON: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, 24 hours.

Okay, and then were there--You talked about capital funding, the needs for additional spaces to be allocated. Did you see any other areas where you felt the capital funding would be appropriate?

DONOVAN BORRINGTON: Not on any specific campus I can think of off hand, but it's just looking at the current situation. And some--most of our classes the--all the seats are filled up. You know, it's about 38 students, and we're looking at some of these programs like STEM. You know, where you can provide the funding, but then the student also needs that additional support like the labs to be available so they can study to meet with the tutors. If we had the programs there, and students are in it, but there's no equipment for them, how do we expect them to succeed?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thank you so much. Are there any other comments that you wanted to offer?

DONOVAN BORRINGTON: We still want to thank you for your time, you know--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Well.

DONOVAN BORRINGTON: --and allowing us the opportunity to speak.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. We're glad that you're involved, and that you're representatives for a large student population. We've worked on many issues in the past. Most recently, as you know, the issue of making sure that students were not criminalized for not wanting to testify against themselves. And we look forward to working with other projects as we go forward. Thank you.

DONOVAN BORRINGTON: Thank you.

[pause]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And at this time we'll call our next panel. Juliana Tedesco from CCNY Parent and Students; Jose Fernandez Nunoz, CCNY Child Development Center; and Marina Asaro, CCNY Child Development Center. If you would take your positions at the table please.

[pause, background comments]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Please raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee, and to answer all questions honestly?

PANEL MEMBERS: Yes, ma'am.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. You may begin. Give us your name and your testimony.

JULIANA TEDESCO: Hi, my name is Juliana Tedesco.

SERGEANT-A-ARMS: [off mic] Get closer to the mic so we can hear you and--

JULIANA TEDESCO: Okay. Sorry. I've never been to one of these before. I'm going to read my testimony. There is a stereotype among some Americans that immigrants come to this country looking to sponge off the system. To take advantage of government hand-outs by soaking up financial, nutritional, and medical assistance. While in reality this stereotype is fair--is far from true. What should we think when the system suddenly forces an immigrant, or another hard-working individual, to become the very sponge that some Americans resent? If the Child Development Center closes, this is

exactly what will happen to many of us. Only that sponge might not be effective for us to survive the financial flood we will suddenly find ourselves in. By closing the Child Development Center, City College is in effect interfering and in some cases destroying the dreams of not one, but potentially two generations. For while many of us as immigrants are trying to further our economic and intellectual opportunities, all of us are parents trying to raise young children. It is already a struggle for us to balance raising a family with getting an education. And for many of us the City seek closing is the tipping point that we're--that may force many of us to interrupt or even cease our studies. My personal experiences with alternative day care in the Hamilton Heights area is this: Having my son sitting in front of someone's home day care parked in front of a TV set all day. For \$1,200 a month, he learned about Ninja Turtles, Sponge Bob Square Pants and Power Rangers all while developing a love of Mozzarella sticks and chicken nuggets. I started this letter talking about stereotypes. I know the stereotypes--I know the stereotypes Americans have is that universities are places where idealism is still

alive. There are places that still promote the idea of a meritocracy, a level playing field in which everyone has a fair chance if they are willing to work hard. In the case of City College, how I wish this stereotype to be true. I leave you with this thought: Everyday we bring our children to the CDC and we look over our shoulders at the brand new huge multi-million structures being built only a step away from us. And we ask you, is that not some small place you find for our children? Thank you, ma'am.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [off mic] Thank you. Okay.

MARINA ASARO: Hello, my name is Marina Asaro, and I'm remaining in the City College as a dedicated [sic] student. My doctorate is with the City College Child Development. I moved to New York six years ago from Nigeria [sic] after completing my bachelor degree there. I was looking to spend nine months back in to my country and family. I end up falling in love, getting a job and a Visa and staying in New York. After my daughter was born, I thought I needed to go back to school and acquire new managing skills. The Child Development Center offered to specific college students was a major factor in

deciding if and where I would pursue my masters. As a single working mother living in a country that is not my own, I felt actually relieved and comfortable going back to school because the college offered high quality and affordable child care.

My daughter has now been attending the Child Development Center for almost three years. And both my daughter and I have benefitted immensely from this support we received. [sic] My life as a single mother is so hectic, but I am comfortable in knowing that I have a stable environment to go. She has had the same teacher and friends for the past two years, and this kind of stability is very important to young children. And that one thing I managed to work, to go to school in the area of child development and do social work in my own community. And I think we became part of a community that balances education and families. Parent and teacher work together in developing each child's abilities, strengths, interests and needs. At the location with students I'm also pleased to see the important role arts play in the center. There are children investigating the arts all day.

When I discovered that a large amount of money was donated to the center, and it was going to be closed for renovation, I panicked. I got worried for myself and my daughter's education. After all, the students and parents are planning to attend City College and the center next year. I would not have even not start studying at New York City College if there was not already day care, and the same is for many of the parents. I believe that this money that was donated was made with the best intention. I believe the objective was toward a valid education where parents receive while attending with respect to the City College in the Child Development Center. It is right that we take the money. I believe this was not his intention to have the center closed for almost two years. And all state and private funding cut off. All teachers fired and no support for student parents as a consequence of this operation. With parents I believe the best option now is to let the center do the renovation. The City College Administration has been telling us that this is impossible. We would like to ask for developing alternative funding to get an alternative space towards the center while renovation takes place.

JOSE FERNANDEZ MUNOZ: Good afternoon, I guess. My name is Jose Fernandez Munoz and I'm a student and a father that the City University of New York especially the City College of New York, CCNY. I came to the City of New York eight years ago from the Dominican Republic, and my verbal and written communication skills are very limited--in English were very limited to say the least. However, I had a--I had and have a dream of becoming an engineer, in particular a civil engineer. And I have been giving all I have to make this dream a reality. In this process I have overcome many obstacles that I will leave to your imagination to not consume much of your time. But finally I can see the light at the end of the tunnel. I am three semesters or 36 credits away from graduation. However, this does not mean that the challenges before graduation have disappeared. Currently, my daughter Elana, who is three years old is attending the City College Child Development on campus. This has been a lot-- This has been-- I'm sorry. The Center has changed my daughter's life with an early childhood education that includes writing, reading, coloring and much more. However, the CCNY Administration has officially announced the

closure of the service and the facility by May 24, 2015 for a one-year renovation. I put the one year in quotation marks because many projects that have been going on at the CCNY have been prolonged before for a great amount of time. (coughs) This renovation being possible with \$1.6 million donated from the former Council Member Robert Jackson three years ago. As you can imagine, this--this represents a huge problem to student parents that have children at this Child Development Center because we get top quality education for our children at affordable price with a minimum [sic] of classrooms.

As background information, the CCNY claims the Child Development Center is running under a deficit of \$60,000 annually, and the relocation of the Center during--the center--and renovating the Center--and relocating the Center during renovations would be costly as well as tedious. In this sense, in the sense that there are many city regulations and permits that have to be approved and granted in order--for relocating the center. Therefore, I want to ask a question. Why hasn't the Administration before been involved in order to discuss all these issues with the students affected in advance. I have

many ideas of why. However, I want to use my time to ask the Council for help and advice on keeping this service available for a student like me who has dreams and desires of success through education. Thank you.

MARINA ASARO: Another--another testimony of a parent who is not being able to--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Yes.

MARINA ASARO: --to make it today?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You can do that.

MARINA ASARO: Should I read it then?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes, you may.

MARINA ASARO: Okay. My name is Anna Diaz [sic] and I'm a student parent at the City College of new York. I became pregnant with my daughter LaReyna Mendez [sic] as a 19-year-old as sophomore in college. She was born in May 2012 during my last semester, I took the spring 2012 semester off. During her first year of life, I was very fortunate to have a family member watch over my child. As soon as my daughter turned one, my life was forcing me to stop breast feeding. [sic] I found that I suffered as though a war had been on me. I was only 20 years old and had no clue what was

going to happen to me, to my one-year old, her and me. Many thoughts came to mind, and that's when I said while I continue my study or even keeping my part-time job, who is going to watch over my child. My daughter isn't even capable of defending or expressing herself. When I want to watch my child, I will be forced to stay on for a long period of time.

Fortunately, for me having a friend with a license for her own child care, I felt comfortable leaving my daughter with her. But this comfortable means only lasted so not so long. And once again I felt lost, and this time very angry. I was not able to afford a private day care center because I was a full-time student at CCNY New York University and a part-time employee making only \$50 a week. My daughter's child care was \$100 a week, and I couldn't bring this burden up on my mother or anyone else. It was my responsibility to pay for the care of my child. I was now put in a situation where I felt helpless. I was in a four-year college. So, also I didn't qualify for any government subsidies. I couldn't apply for ACS or an HRA because I was furthering my education. Where was my child going to stay? Does it mean I have to stay with my child

until she is able to attend public school? Will I be able to go back to school, or will I be forced to work because my daughter will be at an age where her needs are greater?

That would mean I will no longer have the opportunity to become a professional. I could only think of the food on the rent. [sic] Once again, I was lucky enough to find out about the CCNY Child Development Center. I spent my summer potty training my child because I knew the problem under which children who accomplish this--the age window and also because I knew it was going to be my only opportunity for attending school and providing the best for both my child and myself. She was potty trained and enrolled in the center for 2014, which was the best decision of my life. At first the tuition for the program was only \$75 a week and it was easier for me financially to pay \$75 than to pay \$160. Over the semester, I was told that I qualified for a Grant AD program and pay absolutely nothing for the rest of fall. The program not only emptied my pockets, it left me on the financial border. But the program was for love of my daughter in everyway possible.

In less than three months, it has become already an expanding thing to see. [sic] I was laughing when listening to her express herself in sentences. She has been able to have a complete conversation with me, recall all her friends and most of the events of the day. And after reading a book, she is able to recall her favorite part of the story. She comes home signing every night and asking to paint or cut a picture for her collage. I find that my daughter has been exposed to so much as a two-year-old, and she reciting all the information and interaction provided by the Child Care Center at CCNY. If it were not for this program early, my baby would probably be in someone else stuck inside in front of the television all day. The Center focus on the little things like the ABCs and 1-2-3s, but they concentrate on the special things that allow a deeper understanding and critical thinking.

They force the child to use all their senses to discover and communicate the new ideas and activities. For the past, I've paid absolutely zero dollars a week, I felt as though I had won the lotto. Because my daughter was getting a free education from 7:35 a.m. to 5:10 p.m. with an amazing teacher and a

beautifully crafted age-appropriate education age curriculum. I truly look for the Council to provide a center with fast location so that the Center continues to remain open. The Center is communication to students of CCNY and their children. Completely closing the Center down for two years without being relocated due to a ton of renovation means putting a number of fathers and student parents out of school for the amount of time. The college should promote the knowledge and support student parents. Completely eliminating the option of child care will leave many parents in the college out of school for an unnecessary longer period of time. We ask for you to finally decide to look at our teachers, our children and our centers so that we may continue to further our education semester after semester without any interruption. And I would also like to add---

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [off mic] Can you please come--

MARINA ASARO: Yeah. Can I please add that I personally I was surprised to hear Frank Sanchez, which is plain because I personally brought him the name on December--50. [sic] There is a

petition online to him, which is explained also that the teachers are going to be let go in June. And he state there is no social media campaign to promote the center. The flyer that encompasses it, the flyer that we--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Would you say that again? What was his response?

MARINA ASARO: He--when we were outside said that he was going to--not it did not apply to my me right then. [sic] But he was like, however, I want to receive the student/parent award and they brought it to bear and it passed. And when everything came out in November, I brought it to him stating the situation asking for the right. She replied put it in to see, and I replied to them saying that I was hoping for their support. Before I explained that the center it was advertised, that it was planned to advertise the center through social media and flyer. This is not really true. The flyer that you see in the college campus, the flyer that we parents put on. Which I have in our understanding is not open to staff in the community. He just acknowledged that maybe we are being wrong, but this is what we have been informed to. And the staff have

been told that in June they will be let go. This is information that we had. It was a surprise meaning that he didn't tell that information actually. And also one thing, also while LaReyna was like--we have student affairs. That's LaReyna. She brought us in the main. Is there any job placement assistance provided for the child care center staff since the facility will be closed while admission takes place. So like we are inviting these people to. [sic]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Well, that was why I asked the questions because when I spoke with the President and I went and spoke with the President, she did not, in fact, acknowledge that slots are open to the community, and pretty much said that they weren't. So I was very pleased to hear that that is not the case, and that, in fact, are open to the community. Because now, it's on the record that that's the case. So perhaps the president wasn't aware, but it's on the record that that's the case. And we've asked for the written policy to be shared with us so we can pursue that. But in terms of the immediacy of the situation, do you have any suggestions as to where the relocation of the center could take place during this time of renovation?

JULIANA TEDESCO: We firstly would like to see what are the renovations that the Administration is planning to do. Like Ms. Bergtraum, the CUNY person.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

JULIANA TEDESCO: When you asked her about the renovations, she said oh the center needs to have some small toilets and things like that.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] What she indicated is that they're trying to become ADA compliant, which means that they've got to make adjustments for the height of certain facilities so that persons who are disabled--

JULIANA TEDESCO: [interposing] All right, the Center has been operating for over 30 years. We are in compliancy with all of the needs and all of the rules.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Do you have ramps and all of that? That's a part of ADA.

JULIANA TEDESCO: [interposing] We have ramps walking into the center. We have small toilets, and small-- Walking in yes. I mean they are--they are telling us that it's going to take 26 months to renovate the place. But when we asked them

for-- I mean what are you going to--why is this going to take so long? I mean, what is that you would need to do that would take that long? They don't call it--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] But we can get more specifics on what the plan is.

TRANSLATOR: And then when someone like the trustee is asked, they say well they need small-- small toilets and things like that. I mean the Center has been operating years. We don't personally think that whatever renovations that need to be done should take that long.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: We can find out, but if it's been there for 30 years I don't think that they are ADA compliant based on what they constructed 30 years ago. We can certainly get the details on that. Yes.

JULIANA TEDESCO: Okay.

JOSE FERNANDEZ NUNOZ: Definitely we have been discussing what we should do with the Center--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Yes.

JOSE FERNANDEZ NUNOZ: --where it should be relocated. Yesterday, we met with the Student Government, and we gave them a few options actually

because we want the service to keep in-- You know, we want the Administration to keep the service in place during the renovation. And what we want is a space close to the--to the campus. That way we can access our children, and we can drop them--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Have you identified a particular location that you would be interested in?

JOSE FERNANDEZ NUNOZ: We haven't.

JULIANA TEDESCO: [interposing] Well, the Center--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You haven't yet?

JULIANA TEDESCO: The Center had needed like one--Matrella was the Director. About three years ago the Center had some--something happen, and they needed to close for about a month. And the school gave them a room inside of the campus to use, you know, while the place was being fixed. So we have asked them. There's a lot of space within the campus. I mean, they have new buildings being built every day, and new facilities that look empty. So we asked them to look within the college to give us-- All we need is a room. I mean if the--the renovations take as long as, you know, they need to

take we don't think it should be 26 months. We should be able to be in the campus, you know, while we're waiting. They should be able to finish over the summer and, you know.

JOSE FERNANDEZ NUNOZ: And I wanted--I wanted to ask--add to this that this money for renovation was given three years ago, and we just find out last semester that they wanted to shut it down at the end of the semester in December. And because we as the parents were opposed to this, they extended it to May 24th of this year. And they haven't given us much time. They haven't sat down with us and discussed--

JULIANA TEDESCO: [interposing] Any of this.

JOSE FERNANDEZ NUNOZ: --any of this issue. So we've been affected by this, but they are taking a stand. And yesterday at the student government meeting, we--we find out that they are part of the board of New York--of--

JULIANA TEDESCO: [interposing] So like they just see--

JOSE FERNANDEZ NUNOZ: --of the board that makes the decision towards the Center, and they didn't know any--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] They who, the students?

JOSE FERNANDEZ NUNOZ: The student government--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Okay.

JOSE FERNANDEZ NUNOZ: --what was part of the board that take--take the decision about the Center, and they were notified that the Center was supposed to, you know, was--was going to close in May just in January. But they planned it to close last, you know, the semester before by December. So who is making these decisions? Why haven't the student government been involved? Why haven't the student parents that are being directly affected by this been involved since the beginning of this? So, we have many questions. We don't have any answers. And that's why we're here today. We have tried to contact everyone that we can in order to support our cause, and--and the service that the child care is providing is a service that we can't find in the community. Our school ratings are the lowest I think

1 in the whole city, and--and I--I don't know. I'm
2 going to school because I want to provide a better
3 opportunity for my family. And my daughter is the
4 family that I have, and taking her to a place where I
5 know that I know the parents are concerned about
6 their education made me feel good. And that's why
7 I'm pursuing my education to--to give her a better
8 opportunity. You know, I moved to--to--close to the
9 campus a couple of months ago last year for October
10 just for--for this service particularly. And now
11 when--when I went to the campus, when I went to look
12 for the service, I just find out that the service--
13 You know, I wasn't going to get the service. You
14 know, so it's frustrating as parents to try to pursue
15 your education, to try-- You know, you're making
16 plans and the decisions outside are forcing you to--
17 to go or to feel lost in many sense. When you think
18 you--when you go inline, you do your research, you
19 ask. The service is provided there. So, you know,
20 you feel a sense of security in a sense. And now
21 this sense of security is no longer here so--

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Well, what we will
24 do is follow up. We will compose a letter to CUNY,
25 and ask them to follow up and to respond to the

issues that you've raised and see how we can perhaps get some resolution. And you might also want to reach out to your current Council Member to ask how he can be supportive and get involved--

JOSE FERNANDEZ NUNOZ: [interposing] We have.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --in making that a reality.

JULIANA TEDESCO: We need it.

JOSE FERNANDEZ NUNOZ: [laughs] Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much for your testimony. We do appreciate it.

JULIANA TEDESCO: Thank you, Madam Chair, for all your time.

MARINA ASARO: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Seeing no further witnesses, this hearing is adjourned. Thank you.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 25, 2015