Commissioner, New York City Department of Environmental Protection before the New York City Council Committee on Environmental Protection concerning the FY 2015 Executive Budget

Thursday, May 28, 2013 Council Chambers, City Hall, 2:30 p.m.

Good afternoon Chairpersons Ferreras and Richards and Members. I am Emily Lloyd, Commissioner of the New York City Department of Environmental Protection (DEP). I am joined today by Steven Lawitts, DEP's Chief Financial Officer; Joseph Murin, DEP's Assistant Commissioner for Budget; and other senior managers. Thank you for the opportunity to testify on the Fiscal Year 2015 (FY15) Executive Budget.

Before I review the Expense and Capital budgets I would like to review with the Members the water rate increase adopted for FY15. Although we understand that no increase is ever welcome, the need to maintain and improve the delivery of water and sewer service is critical. In the absence of state and federal assistance for drinking water and wastewater infrastructure, water-and-sewer rates paid by our customers are the only source of revenue to support this service, which is essential for local public health, quality of life and economic development, and which is highly regulated at the state and federal levels. On April 23, DEP proposed to the New York City Water Board a 3.35% increase in the water rate to take effect on July 1. At its Annual Meeting on May 23, the Water Board adopted the rate proposal. The adopted rate represents the lowest increase in nine years and is less than half the published projection of 7.8% anticipated for FY 15. We were able to reduce the FY15 rate increase by 57% compared to the projection last year due to the following factors:

- Mayor de Blasio's return of an additional 10% (\$22 million) of the FY14 Rental Payment to the water and sewer system. When combined with the \$14 million that will be returned as part of the rental-return pilot initiated in FY12, a total of \$36 million, or 16.4% of the FY14 Rental Payment, will be returned to the system;
- strong revenues—as of April 21 revenues were \$166 million or 6% ahead of projections, due in part to the substantial completion of the automated meter reading initiative;
- negotiations with our regulators that have enabled us to better control our capital budget;
- debt service payments that are \$153 million lower than projected for Fiscal Year 2014 (FY14) due to continued low interest rates; and
- DEP's continued commitment to efficiency and cost-cutting while improving the quality of the services we provide to New Yorkers.

Under the adopted rate, a typical single-family homeowner will see an increase from \$992/year to \$1,025/year for water and sewer bills in FY15—less than \$3/month, based on an average consumption of 80,000 gallons of water per year. A typical multi-family unit with metered billing will see an increase from \$645/year/unit to \$666/year/unit—less than \$2/month, based on an average consumption of 52,000 gallons of water per year. Customers who use less than approximately 100 gallons per day are billed at the minimum charge of \$1.27 per day, which has

been frozen at the FY 14 rate and will not increase at all in FY 15. Approximately 25% of singlefamily bills are issued at the minimum charge, so a large percentage of our customers will benefit from the freezing of this rate. DEP is also implementing a number of additional measures to improve service and make it easier for rate payers to pay their bills, including:

- Creation of a low-income assistance program;
- Expansion of the leak forgiveness program;
- Freezing the minimum charge
- Extension of the deadline for customers to file an appeal with the Water Board;
- Halting the lien sale process for customers with a pending appeal; and
- Suspension of interest for customers with a "catch-up" bill after Automated Meter Reader (AMR) installation.

The FY 2015 Expense Budget

The projected expense budget for the current fiscal year, FY14, is \$1.57 billion. This includes approximately \$372 million in Community Development Block Grant funds for the Build it Back program and \$84 million in other Sandy-related funds, for which DEP serves as the contracting entity for the City. For FY15 we expect DEP's expense budget to be \$1.2 billion, a net increase of \$60 million from the Preliminary Budget estimate.

Highlights of the net changes to the Preliminary Budget include the following items:

- An increase of \$13.3 million to the Water for the Future water conservation program, which is related to the Delaware Aqueduct shutdown that is planned as part of the repair of the Rondout-West Branch Tunnel;
- Increases totaling \$11.0 million for equipment repairs at the wastewater treatment plants; in maintenance contracts at the Croton Filtration Plant and the Third Water Tunnel; and for costs related to the Capacity Management, Operations, and Maintenance (CMOM) program;
- An increase of \$8.3 million to fund investigative studies related to the EPA listed Superfund sites at the Gowanus Canal and at Newtown Creek;
- A \$7.3 million increase related to items that now have to be listed as expenses based on the Comptroller's Directive 10, which governs capital eligibility;
- Projected increases of \$4.6 million in property taxes for land owned in the upstate watersheds;
- Savings of \$12.5 million from re-estimates of the heat, light and power, and fuel budgets for the Agency; and
- Savings from biosolids of \$3.0 million as a result of new, lower-priced contracts.

The expense budget breaks down into the following large categories:

Personal services—The FY 2015 budget projects \$455 million, 39% of the total, in personal services to pay the salaries for our nearly 6,000 funded positions. As with other agencies, changes in employee benefits are not shown in individual agencies.

Taxes on upstate watershed lands make up the next-largest category, accounting for \$160 million or nearly 15% of the expense budget. The ownership of watershed lands represents a critical

investment in maintaining the high quality of New York City's drinking water by protecting it at the source and ensuring that it does not require more expensive treatment, such as filtration. I am pleased to report that we have successfully negotiated agreements with upstate jurisdictions to make our tax obligations more stable and predictable and, in some cases, to reduce them.

Heat, light, and power—DEP's energy costs—account for \$101 million or 10% of the FY15 expense budget. DEP is the third-largest municipal consumer of electric power in New York City after the Department of Education and the Health and Hospitals Corporation, and our consumption will grow as we bring new treatment facilities on line for both drinking water and wastewater. To control energy costs and reduce our greenhouse gas emissions, DEP is investing in projects to reduce energy needs. One of these is a cogeneration plant at the North River Wastewater Treatment Plant that I will mention shortly.

Chemicals, such as chlorine and fluoride, that are used in the treatment of drinking water, and other chemicals used during the wastewater treatment process, account for \$53 million, which is 5% of our total budget. Finally, management of 1,200 tons per day of sludge is projected to cost about \$37 million in FY15, or about 4% of our projected FY15 expenses.

FY2015-FY2018 Four-Year Capital Plan

DEP's FY15 Capital Budget is \$7.6 billion for FY15-18, as presented by Mayor de Blasio on May 8, 2014. Highlights of the Four-Year Plan are as follows:

Wastewater Treatment

The Four-Year Plan projects a \$2.7 billion investment in wastewater treatment projects, \$2.2 billion of which is for the reconstruction or replacement of components of the wastewater treatment plants and pumping stations. The remaining \$525 million investment will be used to mitigate combined sewer overflows, with \$360 million for green infrastructure such as green roofs and bioswales, and the remainder for gray infrastructure, such as improvements to aeration systems at English Kills and regulator modifications in Newtown Creek and Flushing Bay. In addition, \$175 million is budgeted for the construction of a new cogeneration plant at the North River Wastewater Treatment Plant. The new cogeneration plant will use renewable digester gas produced by the wastewater treatment process to both power equipment and heat the facility. It will help us reduce our energy use and help the City meet the ambitious greenhouse gas emission reduction goals in PlaNYC.

Reservoirs, Dams, Treatment Facilities and Water Mains

Over the next four years, the Administration is proposing to invest an additional \$2 billion in protecting the quality of our reservoirs and the integrity of our dams, and maintaining and repairing the water main system conveying potable water to all New Yorkers. We have budgeted \$253 million for the reconstruction of dams in our three watersheds and \$16 million to pressurize a two-and-one-half mile segment of the Catskill Aqueduct, which will increase the volume of water available to the City and re-establish DEP's ability to bypass the Kensico Reservoir when necessary to access the highest quality water. For the continuation of our current Filtration Avoidance Determination programs, the FY15-18 Capital Plan includes \$194 million, covering all our capital needs for the current FAD, including \$90 million for land acquisition.

The Rondout-West Branch Tunnel and Water for the Future

Although this project extends even beyond the Ten-Year Plan, in the FY15-18 period the Executive Budget provides \$560 million for construction of the bypass tunnel and over \$143 million for other projects related to providing supplemental sources of water during the Delaware Aqueduct shutdown. Increasing the capacity of the Catskill Aqueduct—a project distinct from pressurization—accounts for an additional \$146 million.

City Water Tunnel No. 3

The FY15-18 Capital Plan allots \$125 million to upgrade the main control works for the chambers at Hillview Reservoir, replacing original equipment dating back to the construction of the reservoir in 1915. Stage II of City Water Tunnel No. 3 includes a section running through lower Manhattan as well as a section running from Astoria, Queens to Red Hook, Brooklyn. Although the Manhattan leg and the Manhattan shafts for Tunnel 3 have been substantially completed, we are budgeting \$48 million in FY 15-18 for additional work related to the activation of shafts 17B and 18B in Queens and completion of the Brooklyn Downtown Interconnection, which connects Tunnel 3 to Staten Island. The Department of Design and Construction completed those water mains critical to activating the Manhattan leg and, on October 16 of last year we marked the activation of that section of Tunnel 3, enabling us to provide much-needed redundancy to City Water Tunnel No. 1.

Sewers

The FY15-18 Capital Plan projects \$1.3 billion of spending on sewers including:

- \$303 million for replacement of sewers (storm, sanitary, or combined);
- \$696 million for new sewers (of all types) of which:
 - Storm sewers (either new or reconstructed) account for \$521 million of projected spending, of which \$163 million is for high-level storm sewers, including Third Avenue in Brooklyn; and
 - \$192 million of the total is for both the conventional sewers and the lands necessary to create Bluebelt systems, which are also being extended beyond Staten Island to Springfield Lake in Queens, Van Cortlandt Park and the New York Botanical Garden, as well as other locations.

FY15-18 Capital Plan Highlights by Borough

In Queens, the Executive Budget allocates a total of \$1.2 billion for projects of all types. Sewers account for \$272 million. Work on two shaft sites connected with the Brooklyn/Queens section (Stage II) of City Water Tunnel No. 3 is budgeted for \$43 million. We project \$143 million to evaluate, assess, and restore groundwater wells in Southeast Queens for the purpose of providing additional water during the Rondout bypass construction, and during any drought or other instances in which the City's surface water supplies are not adequate.

In Staten Island, the Executive Budget projects a total of \$492 million, of which \$321 million is for sewers and \$182 million for the Bluebelt program. The Snug Harbor Bluebelt project is budgeted for \$23.9 million. Repairs to the Oakwood Beach Wastewater Treatment Plant and to the Hannah Street pumping station are projected to cost \$79.6 million.

I note that the Executive Budget does not include the cost of repairing damage to the Staten Island siphon project caused by Sandy. The costs of the damage to that project, which will replace the two existing, underwater water siphons that supply drinking water to Staten Island, are under discussion. Some of the costs may be covered by the contractor's insurer. We are expecting that the federal government will cover any uninsured costs.

In the Bronx, the Executive Budget projects \$533 million of capital spending from FY15-18. Approximately \$143 million is budgeted for the Hunts Point Wastewater Treatment Plant, including \$50 million for new centrifuges and \$91 million for new digesters. Restoration of the Mosholu driving range, clubhouse, and related work is budgeted for \$46 million in FY 2015. To reduce combined sewer overflows into Pugsley Creek and the Long Island Sound, DEP has budgeted \$72 million in FY 2015 for construction of a parallel sewer that will help divert flow away from the Creek.

In Manhattan, the Executive Budget allocates \$720 million between FY15 and FY18. The largest single project is the \$175 million cogeneration project at the North River Wastewater Treatment Plant. As mentioned above, the cogeneration project will replace existing equipment for recycling digester gas with a more efficient system that will allow more of the plant's energy needs to be generated by the plant itself, thereby reducing energy costs and air emissions. Another \$270 million is for several projects at the Wards Island Wastewater Treatment Plant: reconstruction of final tanks; reconstruction of the boiler complex; and installation of new dewatering centrifuges. In addition to the funds budgeted for City Water Tunnel No. 3 mentioned previously, \$116 million will fund the construction of water mains connecting two of the City Water Tunnel No. 3 shafts with the local water distribution system.

In Brooklyn, the Executive Budget includes \$860 million of planned commitments. The 26th Ward Wastewater Treatment Plant and associated sewer work to reduce CSOs into Fresh Creek account for \$282 million. An additional \$102 million is projected in FY15-18 for Coney Island sewers.

Unfunded Mandates

I want to take this opportunity to remind the committees that DEP remains concerned about unfunded state and federal mandates that threaten our ability to provide real value and services for every dollar we receive from our ratepayers. As you know, we have expressed doubt about the timing or need for certain federally mandated projects that place enormous pressure on the rates. For example, we do not believe that building a concrete cover over Hillview Reservoir in Yonkers at a cost in excess of a billion dollars is necessary to protect our drinking water, but a blanket EPA rule that we do not agree applies to our system says otherwise. We are very involved in sponsoring scientific research and in promoting sensible solutions, and we are certainly committed above all to protecting public health.

Resiliency

In October 2013, on the first anniversary of Hurricane Sandy, DEP released the "NYC Wastewater Resiliency Plan," a comprehensive assessment of the risks that climate change poses to our wastewater collection and treatment system. The study, initiated in 2011 and expanded after Hurricane Sandy, was based on an asset-by-asset analysis of the risks from storm surge

under new flood maps at all 14 treatment plants and 58 pumping stations, representing more than \$1 billion in infrastructure. If no action is taken, we project that damage to the equipment from repeated coastal flooding at projected rising sea levels could exceed \$2 billion over the next 50 years. We estimate that if we invest \$315 million now to protect valuable equipment and minimize disruptions to critical services during future storms, we will help protect this infrastructure from that \$2 billion plus in repeated flooding losses. We anticipate that we will receive approximately \$200 million in combined zero-interest loans and grants through the Storm Mitigation Loan Program being administered by New York State to support this effort. DEP will coordinate this work with the broader coastal protection initiatives, such as engineered barriers and wetlands, described in the 2013 report, "A Stronger, More Resilient New York," and continue to implement the drinking water and drainage strategies identified in the report to mitigate the impacts of future extreme weather events and climate change.

On behalf of the almost 6,000 employees of DEP who make a difference each and every day for our environment, I want to thank the Chairs for their support of our agency and express our continued commitment to work with the Council and your committees going forward.

That completes my prepared statement. Thank you for the opportunity to present testimony. I look forward to answering any questions that you have.

Commissioner, New York City Department of Environmental Protection before the New York City Council Committee on Environmental Protection concerning the FY 2015 Executive Budget

Thursday, May 28, 2013 Council Chambers, City Hall, 2:30 p.m.

Good afternoon Chairpersons Ferreras and Richards and Members. I am Emily Lloyd, Commissioner of the New York City Department of Environmental Protection (DEP). I am joined today by Steven Lawitts, DEP's Chief Financial Officer; Joseph Murin, DEP's Assistant Commissioner for Budget; and other senior managers. Thank you for the opportunity to testify on the Fiscal Year 2015 (FY15) Executive Budget.

Before I review the Expense and Capital budgets I would like to review with the Members the water rate increase adopted for FY15. Although we understand that no increase is ever welcome, the need to maintain and improve the delivery of water and sewer service is critical. In the absence of state and federal assistance for drinking water and wastewater infrastructure, water-and-sewer rates paid by our customers are the only source of revenue to support this service, which is essential for local public health, quality of life and economic development, and which is highly regulated at the state and federal levels. On April 23, DEP proposed to the New York City Water Board a 3.35% increase in the water rate to take effect on July 1. At its Annual Meeting on May 23, the Water Board adopted the rate proposal. The adopted rate represents the lowest increase in nine years and is less than half the published projection of 7.8% anticipated for FY 15. We were able to reduce the FY15 rate increase by 57% compared to the projection last year due to the following factors:

- Mayor de Blasio's return of an additional 10% (\$22 million) of the FY14 Rental Payment to the water and sewer system. When combined with the \$14 million that will be returned as part of the rental-return pilot initiated in FY12, a total of \$36 million, or 16.4% of the FY14 Rental Payment, will be returned to the system;
- strong revenues—as of April 21 revenues were \$166 million or 6% ahead of projections, due in part to the substantial completion of the automated meter reading initiative;
- negotiations with our regulators that have enabled us to better control our capital budget;
- debt service payments that are \$153 million lower than projected for Fiscal Year 2014 (FY14) due to continued low interest rates; and
- DEP's continued commitment to efficiency and cost-cutting while improving the quality of the services we provide to New Yorkers.

Under the adopted rate, a typical single-family homeowner will see an increase from \$992/year to \$1,025/year for water and sewer bills in FY15—less than \$3/month, based on an average consumption of 80,000 gallons of water per year. A typical multi-family unit with metered billing will see an increase from \$645/year/unit to \$666/year/unit—less than \$2/month, based on an average consumption of 52,000 gallons of water per year. Customers who use less than approximately 100 gallons per day are billed at the minimum charge of \$1.27 per day, which has

been frozen at the FY 14 rate and will not increase at all in FY 15. Approximately 25% of singlefamily bills are issued at the minimum charge, so a large percentage of our customers will benefit from the freezing of this rate. DEP is also implementing a number of additional measures to improve service and make it easier for rate payers to pay their bills, including:

- Creation of a low-income assistance program;
- Expansion of the leak forgiveness program;
- Freezing the minimum charge
- Extension of the deadline for customers to file an appeal with the Water Board;
- Halting the lien sale process for customers with a pending appeal; and
- Suspension of interest for customers with a "catch-up" bill after Automated Meter Reader (AMR) installation.

The FY 2015 Expense Budget

The projected expense budget for the current fiscal year, FY14, is \$1.57 billion. This includes approximately \$372 million in Community Development Block Grant funds for the Build it Back program and \$84 million in other Sandy-related funds, for which DEP serves as the contracting entity for the City. For FY15 we expect DEP's expense budget to be \$1.12 billion, a net increase of \$60 million from the Preliminary Budget estimate.

Highlights of the net changes to the Preliminary Budget include the following items:

- An increase of \$13.3 million to the Water for the Future water conservation program, which is related to the Delaware Aqueduct shutdown that is planned as part of the repair of the Rondout-West Branch Tunnel;
- Increases totaling \$11.0 million for equipment repairs at the wastewater treatment plants; in maintenance contracts at the Croton Filtration Plant and the Third Water Tunnel; and for costs related to the Capacity Management, Operations, and Maintenance (CMOM) program;
- An increase of \$8.3 million to fund investigative studies related to the EPA listed Superfund sites at the Gowanus Canal and at Newtown Creek;
- A \$7.3 million increase related to items that now have to be listed as expenses based on the Comptroller's Directive 10, which governs capital eligibility;
- Projected increases of \$4.6 million in property taxes for land owned in the upstate watersheds;
- Savings of \$12.5 million from re-estimates of the heat, light and power, and fuel budgets for the Agency; and
- Savings from biosolids of \$3.0 million as a result of new, lower-priced contracts.

The expense budget breaks down into the following large categories:

Personal services—The FY 2015 budget projects \$455 million, 39% of the total, in personal services to pay the salaries for our nearly 6,000 funded positions. As with other agencies, changes in employee benefits are not shown in individual agencies.

Taxes on upstate watershed lands make up the next-largest category, accounting for \$160 million or nearly 15% of the expense budget. The ownership of watershed lands represents a critical

investment in maintaining the high quality of New York City's drinking water by protecting it at the source and ensuring that it does not require more expensive treatment, such as filtration. I am pleased to report that we have successfully negotiated agreements with upstate jurisdictions to make our tax obligations more stable and predictable and, in some cases, to reduce them.

Heat, light, and power—DEP's energy costs—account for \$101 million or 10% of the FY15 expense budget. DEP is the third-largest municipal consumer of electric power in New York City after the Department of Education and the Health and Hospitals Corporation, and our consumption will grow as we bring new treatment facilities on line for both drinking water and wastewater. To control energy costs and reduce our greenhouse gas emissions, DEP is investing in projects to reduce energy needs. One of these is a cogeneration plant at the North River Wastewater Treatment Plant that I will mention shortly.

Chemicals, such as chlorine and fluoride, that are used in the treatment of drinking water, and other chemicals used during the wastewater treatment process, account for \$53 million, which is 5% of our total budget. Finally, management of 1,200 tons per day of sludge is projected to cost about \$37 million in FY15, or about 4% of our projected FY15 expenses.

FY2015-FY2018 Four-Year Capital Plan

DEP's FY15 Capital Budget is \$7.6 billion for FY15-18, as presented by Mayor de Blasio on May 8, 2014. Highlights of the Four-Year Plan are as follows:

Wastewater Treatment

The Four-Year Plan projects a \$2.7 billion investment in wastewater treatment projects, \$2.2 billion of which is for the reconstruction or replacement of components of the wastewater treatment plants and pumping stations. The remaining \$525 million investment will be used to mitigate combined sewer overflows, with \$360 million for green infrastructure such as green roofs and bioswales, and the remainder for gray infrastructure, such as improvements to aeration systems at English Kills and regulator modifications in Newtown Creek and Flushing Bay. In addition, \$175 million is budgeted for the construction of a new cogeneration plant at the North River Wastewater Treatment Plant. The new cogeneration plant will use renewable digester gas produced by the wastewater treatment process to both power equipment and heat the facility. It will help us reduce our energy use and help the City meet the ambitious greenhouse gas emission reduction goals in PlaNYC.

Reservoirs, Dams, Treatment Facilities and Water Mains

Over the next four years, the Administration is proposing to invest an additional \$2 billion in protecting the quality of our reservoirs and the integrity of our dams, and maintaining and repairing the water main system conveying potable water to all New Yorkers. We have budgeted \$253 million for the reconstruction of dams in our three watersheds and \$16 million to pressurize a two-and-one-half mile segment of the Catskill Aqueduct, which will increase the volume of water available to the City and re-establish DEP's ability to bypass the Kensico Reservoir when necessary to access the highest quality water. For the continuation of our current Filtration Avoidance Determination programs, the FY15-18 Capital Plan includes \$194 million, covering all our capital needs for the current FAD, including \$90 million for land acquisition.

The Rondout-West Branch Tunnel and Water for the Future

Although this project extends even beyond the Ten-Year Plan, in the FY15-18 period the Executive Budget provides \$560 million for construction of the bypass tunnel and over \$143 million for other projects related to providing supplemental sources of water during the Delaware Aqueduct shutdown. Increasing the capacity of the Catskill Aqueduct—a project distinct from pressurization—accounts for an additional \$146 million.

City Water Tunnel No. 3

The FY15-18 Capital Plan allots \$125 million to upgrade the main control works for the chambers at Hillview Reservoir, replacing original equipment dating back to the construction of the reservoir in 1915. Stage II of City Water Tunnel No. 3 includes a section running through lower Manhattan as well as a section running from Astoria, Queens to Red Hook, Brooklyn. Although the Manhattan leg and the Manhattan shafts for Tunnel 3 have been substantially completed, we are budgeting \$48 million in FY 15-18 for additional work related to the activation of shafts 17B and 18B in Queens and completion of the Brooklyn Downtown Interconnection, which connects Tunnel 3 to Staten Island. The Department of Design and Construction completed those water mains critical to activating the Manhattan leg and, on October 16 of last year we marked the activation of that section of Tunnel 3, enabling us to provide much-needed redundancy to City Water Tunnel No. 1.

Sewers

The FY15-18 Capital Plan projects \$1.3 billion of spending on sewers including:

- \$303 million for replacement of sewers (storm, sanitary, or combined);
 - \$696 million for new sewers (of all types) of which:
 - Storm sewers (either new or reconstructed) account for \$521 million of projected spending, of which \$163 million is for high-level storm sewers, including Third Avenue in Brooklyn; and
 - \$192 million of the total is for both the conventional sewers and the lands necessary to create Bluebelt systems, which are also being extended beyond Staten Island to Springfield Lake in Queens, Van Cortlandt Park and the New York Botanical Garden, as well as other locations.

FY15-18 Capital Plan Highlights by Borough

In Queens, the Executive Budget allocates a total of \$1.2 billion for projects of all types. Sewers account for \$272 million. Work on two shaft sites connected with the Brooklyn/Queens section (Stage II) of City Water Tunnel No. 3 is budgeted for \$43 million. We project \$143 million to evaluate, assess, and restore groundwater wells in Southeast Queens for the purpose of providing additional water during the Rondout bypass construction, and during any drought or other instances in which the City's surface water supplies are not adequate.

In Staten Island, the Executive Budget projects a total of \$492 million, of which \$321 million is for sewers and \$182 million for the Bluebelt program. The Snug Harbor Bluebelt project is budgeted for \$23.9 million. Repairs to the Oakwood Beach Wastewater Treatment Plant and to the Hannah Street pumping station are projected to cost \$79.6 million.

I note that the Executive Budget does not include the cost of repairing damage to the Staten Island siphon project caused by Sandy. The costs of the damage to that project, which will replace the two existing, underwater water siphons that supply drinking water to Staten Island, are under discussion. Some of the costs may be covered by the contractor's insurer. We are expecting that the federal government will cover any uninsured costs.

In the Bronx, the Executive Budget projects \$533 million of capital spending from FY15-18. Approximately \$143 million is budgeted for the Hunts Point Wastewater Treatment Plant, including \$50 million for new centrifuges and \$91 million for new digesters. Restoration of the Mosholu driving range, clubhouse, and related work is budgeted for \$46 million in FY 2015. To reduce combined sewer overflows into Pugsley Creek and the Long Island Sound, DEP has budgeted \$72 million in FY 2015 for construction of a parallel sewer that will help divert flow away from the Creek.

In Manhattan, the Executive Budget allocates \$720 million between FY15 and FY18. The largest single project is the \$175 million cogeneration project at the North River Wastewater Treatment Plant. As mentioned above, the cogeneration project will replace existing equipment for recycling digester gas with a more efficient system that will allow more of the plant's energy needs to be generated by the plant itself, thereby reducing energy costs and air emissions. Another \$270 million is for several projects at the Wards Island Wastewater Treatment Plant: reconstruction of final tanks; reconstruction of the boiler complex; and installation of new dewatering centrifuges. In addition to the funds budgeted for City Water Tunnel No. 3 mentioned previously, \$116 million will fund the construction of water mains connecting two of the City Water Tunnel No. 3 shafts with the local water distribution system.

In Brooklyn, the Executive Budget includes \$860 million of planned commitments. The 26th Ward Wastewater Treatment Plant and associated sewer work to reduce CSOs into Fresh Creek account for \$282 million. An additional \$102 million is projected in FY15-18 for Coney Island sewers.

Unfunded Mandates

I want to take this opportunity to remind the committees that DEP remains concerned about unfunded state and federal mandates that threaten our ability to provide real value and services for every dollar we receive from our ratepayers. As you know, we have expressed doubt about the timing or need for certain federally mandated projects that place enormous pressure on the rates. For example, we do not believe that building a concrete cover over Hillview Reservoir in Yonkers at a cost in excess of a billion dollars is necessary to protect our drinking water, but a blanket EPA rule that we do not agree applies to our system says otherwise. We are very involved in sponsoring scientific research and in promoting sensible solutions, and we are certainly committed above all to protecting public health.

Resiliency

In October 2013, on the first anniversary of Hurricane Sandy, DEP released the "NYC Wastewater Resiliency Plan," a comprehensive assessment of the risks that climate change poses to our wastewater collection and treatment system. The study, initiated in 2011 and expanded after Hurricane Sandy, was based on an asset-by-asset analysis of the risks from storm surge

under new flood maps at all 14 treatment plants and 58 pumping stations, representing more than \$1 billion in infrastructure. If no action is taken, we project that damage to the equipment from repeated coastal flooding at projected rising sea levels could exceed \$2 billion over the next 50 years. We estimate that if we invest \$315 million now to protect valuable equipment and minimize disruptions to critical services during future storms, we will help protect this infrastructure from that \$2 billion plus in repeated flooding losses. We anticipate that we will receive approximately \$200 million in combined zero-interest loans and grants through the Storm Mitigation Loan Program being administered by New York State to support this effort. DEP will coordinate this work with the broader coastal protection initiatives, such as engineered barriers and wetlands, described in the 2013 report, "A Stronger, More Resilient New York," and continue to implement the drinking water and drainage strategies identified in the report to mitigate the impacts of future extreme weather events and climate change.

On behalf of the almost 6,000 employees of DEP who make a difference each and every day for our environment, I want to thank the Chairs for their support of our agency and express our continued commitment to work with the Council and your committees going forward.

That completes my prepared statement. Thank you for the opportunity to present testimony. I look forward to answering any questions that you have.

City of New York Parks & Recreation www.nyc.gov/parks



Hearing before the New York City Council Committee on Finance jointly with the Committee on Parks & Recreation Oversight: Fiscal Year 2015 Executive Budget May 28, 2014 Testimony By: Mitchell J. Silver FAICP, Commissioner

Good afternoon City Council Finance Committee Chair Julissa Ferreras, City Council Parks Committee Chair Mark Levine and members of the Council Finance and Parks committees. I am Mitchell J. Silver, the new Commissioner of the New York City Department of Parks and Recreation. It is a joy and a pleasure to appear before you for the first time today.

I am joined here today by a number of Parks Department staff. With me on the panel are First Deputy Commissioner Liam Kavanagh, and Deputy Commissioner for Community Outreach Larry Scott Blackmon. Additionally, I am joined by key staff of our agency including: ______. I want to publicly thank the staff of the Agency for the work they have done to date.

Today officially marks my 16th day as Commissioner of the Agency and I am learning a great deal. I want you to know that while I may not be able to address every issue personally today, I look forward to meeting with you to better understand your concerns. Additionally I look forward to working with you to make our districts and New York City Parks better for all New Yorkers.

I come to you by way Raleigh, NC where I served as the chief planner for the city. In Raleigh, we built a government that was efficient, innovative, and most importantly, responsive to the citizens in that city. We resolved issues before they became major problems. We cut down bureaucracy. Those items were important to me in Raleigh and they are equally important to Mayor Bill de Blasio and me. We will work to provide similar experiences for the people of this city during my tenure at Parks.

Mayor de Blasio and I are completely aligned as it relates to our goals for the Agency. We will work to continue to build a 21st Century park system, using innovation, transparency, and technology to improve efficiency. I have not waited. In my first week I convened the senior management team to discuss my goal of addressing the Parks Capital process that, as a number of you have shared with me, currently takes far too long. I share your view that when you fund a project, you want it built quickly. Our review of the Capital process is underway.

As I mentioned, I believe in transparency and understand that a number of you have asked for the ability to know where publicly funded capital projects stand. In an effort to improve communication during the capital process, we are going to create an online database where individuals can track the progress of projects. This database will be assessable to the public so that they can be kept abreast of park developments in their communities. While much of the capital process involves our partners in government, we will do our part to address this issue with a fresh approach, increasing communication throughout the capital journey.

Park equity is important to Mayor de Blasio and is as important to me as it is to all of you. We will work to address these concerns, ensuring that there is an equitable distribution of resources throughout our park system. In assuring an equitable distribution of resources we will specifically examine the allocation of Parks' maintenance, operations, and programming.

Parks are vehicles for healthy communities, and I will look to incorporate our many growing partners in our plans. As you know, a healthy community also involves active recreation. I want to make certain that individuals are aware of and have access to our recreational facilities where we provide attractive indoor and outdoor programming that is cutting edge and fun for our patrons.

Resiliency is also an all-important element of our plans as our Parks and facilities must be built to withstand current and future changes in our environment. I will share a few of our resiliency highlights later in the testimony but as resiliency is important to the de Blasio administration, our agency will be on the forefront of resiliency efforts and continue to push forward.

As you can tell, I have a fairly ambitious agenda and am looking to initially address a number of these items as soon as possible. Understanding that a number of these items require continued dialogue, I am most interested in meeting with each of you in upcoming weeks and furthering these conversations. For the purposes of today's hearing, I would now like to take a moment to review elements of the executive budget for Fiscal Year 2015.

FY 2015 Executive Budget

The FY 2015 Executive Budget provides for operating expenses of \$392.3 million. This represents an increase of \$12 million over the FY 2014 adopted budget of \$380.3 million. From the Preliminary FY 2015 budget, seven new positions were added at parks

2

to our 5 Boro Shops Office. This will allow for the expansion of our maintenance operations.

I want to take this opportunity to thank Mayor Bill de Blasio and the City Council for ensuring that much of the Parks department's funding remains baselined. The guaranteeing of funding for our pools makes certain that all of our swimming facilities will remain open for every New York City resident, without the threat of shortening the season. The assurance of funding allows Parks to plan for full staffing of its facilities rather than making contingency plans to operate our facilities on an ad hoc basis.

I would also like to thank the Mayor for ensuring that his Fiscal 2015 Executive Budget preserves staffing added to the Parks Department's ranks which has allowed us to improve service and launch new initiatives. Park and playground conditions, as measured by the Parks Inspection Program, currently stand at 87% acceptable for overall condition and 91% acceptable for cleanliness, exceeding the targets set in the Mayor's Management Report. We continue to use technology to maintain that standard as we started issuing new mobile technology for field staff as part of our "Ops 21" initiative to modernize daily Parks operations.

During Fiscal Year 14, we received additional allocations to hire Parks Enforcement Patrol Officers (PEP). The Fiscal Year 15 Executive Budget maintains this increase of PEP Officer staffing level. PEP officers are often the public face of Park with special Peace officer status. Their visible presence acts as both a deterrent to criminal activity and a source of information, education, and security for park patrons. PEP officers and the individuals of our Urban Park Service immediately address unsafe conditions, encourage park stewardship, provide equal access to all park goers, and develop new ways to improve their service to the public. Being able to maintain the level of PEP Officers that we now have Parks is making great strides in increasing the safety of our parks.

<u>Capital</u>

Throughout the last decade there have been over \$6 billion in capital investments made to parks citywide. The Fiscal Year 2015 Capital budget moves Parks forward by providing \$537.8 million in capital investments. Highlights to the FY 15 capital plan include \$12 million for the renovation of Columbus Park which is adjacent to Brooklyn Borough Hall, \$12 million for the expansion of Starlight Park in the Bronx, and \$82 million towards the rehabilitation of Parks-owned bridges. A major project underway is the Washington Lighthouse Link in Manhattan where \$3 million has been allocated towards this project. The link will allow the public greater access to the Manhattan Waterfront Greenway by providing a one mile connection at Dyckman Street and continuing along the Hudson River.

We are also excited to tell you that we began the renovation of Lance Corporal Thomas P. Noonan Playground on April 14, 2014. When the renovation is complete, Noonan Playground will have upgraded facilities including a new spray shower and play equipment. Parks is also taking steps to perform construction at Noonan in stages so that it can remain open for the entire summer season. I would like to take this opportunity to publicly thank Deputy Commissioner Therese Braddick and the staff at our Capital division for their work to date.

First Deputy Commissioner Kavanagh reviewed many of our agency's highlights at the preliminary budget hearing in March, but I thought I would take a few moments to share a few items that have transpired since that time.

Resiliency

As we have mentioned previously, we have continued to work to repair our beaches in the aftermath of Superstorm Sandy. Most recently, the sand replenishment project we have worked to deliver in partnership with the Army Corps of Engineers began with 3.5 million cubic yards of sand being pumped onto Rockaway Beach. In Brooklyn, another 600,000 cubic yards of sand were pumped onto Coney Island.

One of our largest recovery projects has been the rebuilding of the boardwalk at Rockaway. Parks has worked tirelessly with the community to make the boardwalk a feature that protects their homes as well as provides access and recreational opportunities for all. Parks is committed to spending \$274 million towards a new Rockaway boardwalk that is stronger, more resilient, and integrated into a multi-layer system of coastal protection.

The Parks Department's commitment to resilience in the aftermath of Superstorm Sandy is evident with the rebuilding of the Midland Beach Promenade Plaza. This includes a "Splaza," an interactive water feature that is flush with pavement. The Midland Beach Promenade also has a new ornamental fountain with a mechanical infrastructure that is more resilient to storms. Additionally, there is a multitude of family friendly amenities on the Promenade. This renovation has a budget of \$5.8 million and will be open for all New Yorkers to enjoy this summer.

4

Recreation

We were pleased to be joined by several community stakeholders including Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez for the unveiling of the improved Highbridge recreation center on May 5th. This renovation allows us to operate the facility uninterrupted by the elements. Additionally, we were fortunate to equip the center with new, high-quality fitness equipment. We are more than certain that our patrons will enjoy the modifications, especially when the pool season begins in a month. We thank Council Member Rodriguez for his continued partnership.

The Executive Budget also provides funds to operate and staff the Ocean Breeze Park Track and Field, our new indoor track facility that will be opening in Staten Island. We thank the team at the Department of Design and Construction who have been working diligently to deliver this world-class facility.

Community

Community engagement, partnership and volunteerism are thriving at Parks. Throughout the month of May and specifically on May 17, 2014, we celebrated our annual It's My Park Day event. Partnership for Parks, our volunteer program that is jointly operated by NYC Parks and the City Parks Foundation, led our efforts. As you may know, this bi-annual event allows for the mobilization of Parks volunteers throughout the City via exciting volunteer opportunities. At Kaiser Park there were more than 150 volunteers who pitched in to weed, turn soil, and remove damaged tree branches. Kaiser Park was heavily damaged during Superstorm Sandy and these volunteers were extraordinary in their dedication to helping their local park recover.

In all, there were over 4,000 volunteers who assisted Parks during, "It's My Park Day" events thus far, and we look forward to another exciting season.

Closing

In closing, I am pleased and honored to sit before you today. These past few weeks have been extremely pleasurable and revealing. I will have conversations with the Administration about agency needs as the process develops. Thank you for all that you have done to date to assist the agency. We rely on your partnership and again, I look forward to working with you. I thank you for your time and I look forward to any questions you may have.

5



<u>TESTIMONY OF NYC SCHOOLS CHANCELLOR CARMEN FARIÑA</u> <u>ON THE FISCAL YEAR 2015 EXECUTIVE BUDGET</u> <u>BEFORE THE NYC COUNCIL COMMITTEES ON FINANCE AND EDUCATION</u>

May 28, 2014

Good morning, Speaker Mark-Viverito, Chairs Ferrer as and Dromm and all the members of the City Council Finance and Education Committees here today. Thank you for this opportunity to discuss Mayor de Blasio's proposed Fiscal Year 2015 Executive Budget as it relates to the Department of Education (DOE) and our public schools. Seated with me are Kathleen Grimm, Deputy Chancellor for Operations, and Ray Orlando, our new Chief Financial Officer. Ray comes to DOE after serving 14 years at New York City's Office of Management and Budget (OMB), most recently as Deputy Director for Budget, Administration, Capital and Communications. He is going to be an integral part of our team, tasked to ensure that our strategic fiscal initiatives are moving DOE in a positive direction. I am delighted to have someone of Ray's caliber on my senior leadership team.

This morning, I would like to provide an updated overview of our fiscal condition, and highlight some new developments, which have occurred since I last appeared before the Education Committee in March.

The FY2015 Executive Budget includes an allocation of approximately \$20.6 billion of operating funds and another \$5.3 billion of education-related pension and debt service funds. This includes an increase of \$300 million for high-quality full-day universal pre-k, an additional \$145 million for expanded after school programs, and an increase of \$424 million in pension and debt service costs. Our funding is a combination of City, State and federal dollars, with City tax levy dollars making up the largest share at 55 percent, State dollars at 38 percent, and federal dollars at 7 percent.

The Mayor's budget makes unprecedented investments in education, which reflects this Administration's deeply held value that children are our top priority. The budget also reflects the core values that have informed my 40-year career as an educator—and the four pillars that are guiding my work as Chancellor. I shared the pillars with you in March and, briefly, they are to:

- Return dignity and respect to the teaching profession;
- Improve student achievement by aligning all instruction to the Common Core standards;
- Engage parents in every aspect of school life; and
- Create new collaborative and innovative models within our City and schools.

This year's budget gives us the unique opportunity to transform our values into historic gains for our public school students—by ensuring that they have access to early education and high-quality after-school programs, particularly for the middle school grades. Early education and middle school are two important stages in a child's academic growth and development and strengthening those programs will help to ensure that our students graduate ready to compete in the 21st century economy.



The universal, full-day pre-kindergarten initiative is phenomenal and will be our foundation moving forward. I have seen the impact of full-day pre-k on children's learning and, beginning in September, it will be a reality for a record number of New York City families. To make this program possible, the FY2015 executive budget includes an investment of \$300 million to fund 53,000 high-quality full-day prekindergarten seats, moving up to 73,000 seats the following year. As you've heard me say before, critical growth in language and speech occurs **before** kindergarten. Children go through significant phases of development between the ages of three and five, so getting them into language rich environments as early as possible is critical to their academic success. We will offer high-quality programs aligned with the Common Core Learning Standards that emphasizes science. The first phase demonstrated significant demand for pre-k: we saw a 36 percent increase in enrollment compared to public school applications submitted last year. Beginning in early June, families will be able to apply for thousands of additional full-day pre-k seats in Community-Based Early Childhood Centers.

After-school programming is another priority, and I am thrilled that next year's budget includes an unprecedented \$145 million to fund 34,000 new middle school after-school seats for a total of approximately 100,000 children. Additionally, this funding will support the expansion of summer programs that will serve approximately 33,000 students beginning in FY2015, a 48 percent increase from the previous year. After-school programs will offer enrichment activities such as arts, leadership development, and academic support—including independent reading—as well as sports and other physical activities geared towards the promotion of healthy living. These after-school programs will serve as a safe haven for so many children who would otherwise go home alone at the end of the school day. Middle school students will also be able to take advantage of the extended learning time, which will supplement their classwork, as well as hone non-academic skills essential to success in high school and beyond. We've worked closely with our partner, the Department of Youth and Community Development (DYCD), in the design and development of the after-school expansion and will continue to work closely with DYCD to implement and evaluate these programs and support our middle schools.

I would like to express my gratitude to Speaker Mark-Viverito and Members of the Council for being our partners in this extraordinary achievement.

Overall, school budget funding will remain stable in FY2015. We will release the school budgets next week.

While the increased funding from the State has allowed us to expand full-day pre-kindergarten and other initiatives, the State still falls short in fulfilling its obligation in other areas. As you know, in 2007, the New York State Legislature and Governor acted on the Campaign for Fiscal Equity Court of Appeals ruling. The State's obligation to ensure every student's constitutional right to a sound, basic education should have ended the unfair distribution of State aid to local school districts. And yet, since 2009, the State has not met the court-ordered obligation to our City and other school districts elsewhere in the State. In Fiscal Year 2015 alone, there is a shortfall of \$2.5 billion of outstanding additional foundation aid to New York City schools. We need this additional school aid to reduce class size, to provide academic intervention in the early grades, and to increase school budgets. We will continue to fiercely advocate for our students' fair share.

2



Due to projected enrollment increases associated with both new and existing charter schools, we will increase funding to charter schools by \$93 million, an amount which will help offset the statemandated increase of \$250 in the tuition we are required to pay for charter-enrolled students, and other facility costs. As you know, these are expenditures driven by State law, which sets the per capita tuition rate for New York City students enrolled in charter schools.

The budget will also allow us to focus on arts education, which has—sadly—been placed on the back burner in many schools, behind content areas such as math and English language arts. The FY2015 budget directs \$23 million to increase arts education. I want to thank Comptroller Stringer, and Chairs Dromm and Van Bramer for the work they have done to highlight this issue and who share our commitment to increasing arts education in our schools. I am a proponent of arts education, not only because it enables students to showcase their talents, but because it teaches them how to think critically and master the complexities of language and communication—skills that align beautifully with the Common Core. Make no mistake; we are committed to providing every child with an education that includes chorus or drama, band, dance, or the visual arts. These are the kinds of experiences that will help level the playing field and enhance students' ongoing success. These areas also return joy to the school day.

A major goal is to integrate the arts with other content, when and where appropriate. Social studies and American history are natural partners to the arts. Our new Teen Thursdays museum after-school program will expose seventh graders to arts education that emphasizes American history. They'll learn in small groups under the instruction of a trained docent.

We also want to ensure that <u>all</u> students, including those who do not enter our schools as native English speakers have as much of a chance to succeed in school as their native English-speaking counterparts. Our English Language Learners (ELLs) account for over 14 percent of our total school population, or more than 150,000 students. As a former ELL, I am committed to building inclusive school environments that honor the contributions of our ELLs and ensure that they have access to rigorous Common Core-aligned instruction. The addition of the \$13 million in the FY 2015 budget will allow us to expand central supports for our ELLs in critical ways including: increasing the number of bilingual general and special education programs at all school levels; expanding professional development opportunities to support teachers and central staff in deepening their understanding of second language acquisition; literacy development; and how to design Common Core-aligned lessons that meet the diverse linguistics needs of ELLs.

While we support Speaker Mark-Viverito's and Public Advocate James' goal to increase our students' daily access to a healthy school lunch, the universal free lunch program changes the way kids are counted for federal Title I funding. While this would not affect the total amount of Title I funds received by the City, the Department has concerns about how the implementation of this program would affect the distribution of funding among schools serving many low-income families. The Administration will continue to work with the City Council on this issue and is looking into options as we move forward.

We are convinced that the groundbreaking initiatives made possible by the FY 2015 budget will create greater opportunities for our City's children to thrive; however, we must not discount the crucial role teachers' play in improving our schools. I am thrilled that the preliminary agreement the



City reached with the United Federation of Teachers (UFT) on May 1st—if ratified—will provide educators with the support they need to enhance teaching and learning.

As with the Mayor's education budget, everything in the contract is aligned with our four pillars. This was done very consciously and deliberately. We want teachers, administrators, and parents to understand that this Administration is totally committed to putting educators at the forefront of our work. In order to continue developing as professionals, teachers need time to learn from and collaborate with one another. This contract reconfigures professional development (PD) time to ensure that teachers have a block of time for professional learning each week. On Mondays, teachers will have 80 minutes of PD at the end of the school day to engage in a variety of professional learning activities.

Partnering with parents is critical to ensuring that students have the continuous support necessary to succeed. This contract will build in additional time for teachers to communicate with parents, including 40 minutes each Tuesday to contact parents through emails, phone calls, meetings, or a class website or newsletter. There will also be two additional parent-teacher conferences during the school year, something I've long advocated for.

We will also harness our teachers' knowledge about how to serve our students well by developing a new career ladder that will create more opportunities for effective teachers to grow. Through a provision in the new contract, we will introduce Teacher Ambassadors who will change school assignments for a year to support and engage in activities to promote the sharing, implementation, and development of instructional best practices. Model teachers will take on additional responsibilities to support the instructional practice of other teachers in their schools, and in partner schools where appropriate.

In only a few short months we have instituted several meaningful reforms that will make a real difference in our students' lives, and we have an aggressive agenda going forward. We will soon release a strategic plan to support struggling schools—this will be a sea change for our students and represents a new, positive approach to public school reform. Over the summer, we will finalize additional initiatives that we plan on launching during the next school year. I will continue to meet regularly with Speaker Mark- Viverito and Chair Dromm to discuss the Council's priorities and additional ways to collaborate with the Council. The more we empower our stakeholders with information on our education policies, the better the results for our kids. To that end, on Friday we will hold another training session for elected officials, this time on Career and Technical Education.

I testify before you today confident that our school children's futures have never looked so bright. As I visit schools, I am constantly uplifted by the energy and commitment of our teachers and principals.

Our new teachers contract and our targeted investments in universal pre-K, after-school programs, arts education, and programs for English Language Learners are nothing short of transformational and will put New York City on track to becoming the premier education system in the nation, if not the world.

Thank you for this opportunity to testify. I would be happy to answer any questions you may have.

	THE COUNCIL
	THE CITY OF NEW YORK
	Appearance Card
	I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No
	in favor in opposition
	(PLEASE 'PRINT)
	Vari Avel rival
-	Name: Fug Offance
	Address:
l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l	I represent:
	Address:
· .	THE COUNCIL
	THE CITY OF NEW YORK
	Appearance Card
	I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No
	in favor in opposition
	Date 0 28 1019
	(PLEASE PRINT)
	Name: Carmen Favina
	Address: (hance//m
	I represent: NIC DEPARTMENT CF
	Edulation
	Address:AAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAAA
	THE COUNCIL
	THE CITY OF NEW YORK
	Appearance Card
	I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No
	in favor in opposition
	Date: 9 128/26/4/
	C (I ((PLEASE PRINT)
	Name: Kuthinkein Ordmin
	Address: DEVOLATARADONO
	1) UGEND AFT AND DAG
	I represent: <u>PIVI SI VI OL OPERETIVIS</u>
	Address:
•	Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms
1 -	

.

.

THE CITY OF NEW YORK
Appearance Card
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No in favor in opposition Date: 5/28/14
(PLEASE PRINT) Name: Mitchell J. Silver
Address: 8.30 5th Ave, NY, NY 10065
I represent: NYC Parks
Address:
Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms THE COUNCIL
THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK Appearance Card I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. Res. No.
THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK Appearance Card I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. Res. No. in favor in opposition
THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK Appearance Card I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. Res. No. I in favor I in opposition Date: Sli281.141
THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK Appearance Card I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No in favor in opposition Date:
 THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK Appearance Card
THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK Appearance Card I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. Res. No. I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. Res. No. I in favor In opposition Date: Sli281.14 ICST (PLEASE PRINT) Name: Liam

2

.

THI	THE COUNCI E CITY OF NEW		,
	Appearance Card		
I intend to appear an			
- diohawi	(PLEASE PRINT) Scott - 1 Blackman		
Address: 830	5, the Avel of ANY NY	10065	
I represent: <u>NYC</u>	111 Nanks		, · · ·
Address:			
Please compl	ete this card and return to th	o Norgeant-at-	Arms 🗧 🗧
			Υ
	THE COUNCI CITY OF NEW		
	THE COUNCI		
THE	THE COUNCIL CITY OF NEW Appearance Card		
THE I intend to appear an	THE COUNCIL CITY OF NEW Appearance Card d speak on Int. No in favor in oppose	YORK	
THE I intend to appear an	THE COUNCIL CITY OF NEW Appearance Card d speak on Int. No.	YORK	
THE I intend to appear an	THE COUNCIL CITY OF NEW Appearance Card d speak on Int. No in favor in oppose	YORK	
THE I intend to appear and	THE COUNCIL CITY OF NEW Appearance Card d speak on Int. No in favor in oppose	YORK	
THE I intend to appear and Name: <u>EMIL</u> Address: <u>Comm</u>	THE COUNCIL CITY OF NEW Appearance Card d speak on Int. No in favor in oppose	YORK	

.

•