

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION
AND THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION
AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

----- X

May 15, 2014
Start: 10:08 a.m.
Recess: 4:15 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers
250 Broadway - Hearing Room,
16th Fl

B E F O R E: JULISSA FERRERAS
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Ydanis Rodriguez
James G. Van Bramer
Vanessa L. Gibson
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Laurie A. Cumbo
Corey D. Johnson
Mark Levine
I. Daneek Miller
Helen K. Rosenthal
Vincent Ignizio
Daniel R. Garodnick
James Vacca

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Margaret S. Chin
Stephen T. Levin
Deborah L. Rose
Mark S. Weprin
David G. Greenfield
Costa G. Constantinides
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Antonio Reynoso
Andy L. King
Steven Matteo
Brad S. Lander

Polly Trottenberg, Commissioner
New York City Department of Transportation

Joseph Jarrin, Deputy Commissioner
Finance, Contracting, and Program Management
New York Department of Transportation

Jeff Lynch, Assistant Commissioner
Contracting and Program Management
Intergovernmental Affairs
New York Department of Transportation

Douglas Johnson, Director
Management and Budget
Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA)

Craig Stewart, Senior Director
Capital Programs
Metropolitan Transit Authority

Aaron Stern, Director
Office of Management and Budget
New York Transit Authority

Lois H. Tendler, Vice President
Government and Community Relations
New York City Transit Authority

Meera Joshi, Commissioner
Taxi & Limousine Commission (TLC)

Conan Freud, Chief Operating Officer
Taxi & Limousine Commission (TLC)

Kathryn Garcia, Commissioner
New York City Department of Sanitation

Larry Cippolina, Deputy Commissioner
Administration and Financial Management
New York City Department of Sanitation

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Good morning, and welcome to the opening day of the City Council's hearing on the Mayor's Executive Budget for FY 2015. My name is Julissa Ferreras, and I chair the Finance Committee. Today, we are joined by the Committee on Transportation, chaired by my Colleague Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez. We've been joined by Council Members Vacca and Gibson, and more members will be joining us shortly. Last week on May 8th, the Mayor released his FY2015 Executive Budget, which totals \$73.9 billion. The Finance Committee is responsible for recommending a budget to the full Council in just a few short weeks.

This Executive Budget hearing provides one last opportunity for council members and the public to hear from agencies concerning the impact that the Executive Budget will have on the agencies' operations. Also, to ensure that we address issues that are important to the residents of the city. The public will have an opportunity to voice their comments and concerns on June 6th, which is the last day of the Budget Hearings. The public session will begin approximately at 4:00 p.m.

1
2 Although the Council holds Executive
3 Budget hearings every years as required by the
4 Charter, this year is very different. When the Mayor
5 released the Preliminary Budget in February, it
6 reflected the values of the new administration. We
7 were happy to see that this so-called "Budget Dance"
8 was on its way to being a thing of the past. With
9 restorations in areas very important to the Council,
10 such as firehouses and funding to the Parks
11 Department for their job training program. With the
12 new administration and new leadership in the Council,
13 we will now set priorities in the budget with an eye
14 toward efficiency, transparency, and equity. The
15 Council's Budget Response, which was released last
16 month, was the Council's first step in helping to
17 shape the priorities and values of the City that
18 should be reflected in the Executive Budget.

19 Our recommendations in the response were
20 the culmination of exhaustive and comprehensive
21 budget hearings held by Council committees throughout
22 the entire month of March. Where we examined in
23 detail how the City allocated these resources, in the
24 Council's Budget Response we focused on many areas to
25 make sure that this document reflected the City's

1
2 priorities. We focused on tax reform, transforming
3 the City's budget to allow greater transparency and
4 specificity in units of appropriation; strengthened
5 the City's infrastructure; strengthened the City's
6 safety net; supporting New York City's students;
7 protecting the City's workforce; job creation and
8 economic development opportunities; reforming law
9 enforcement and criminal justice; stabilizing New
10 York City's housing; and innovating government
11 operations with technology. As elected officials, we
12 are all responsible for every single taxpayer dollar
13 that is spent in our city. For the duration of the
14 Executive Budget hearings, we will hear from agencies
15 about how Executive Budgets reflect the
16 administration's priorities, and how it incorporates
17 the Council's priorities as learned through our
18 hearing process.

19 Today, we will begin our Executive Budget
20 Hearing with the Department of Transportation. The
21 Department of Transportation budget totals \$829.8
22 million, which reflects and increase of \$100.8
23 million from last year's adopted budget. The
24 agency's revenue for FY15 includes approximately
25 \$355.4 million from previous -- from various sources

1 including \$206.6 million in additional revenue from
2 parking meters. There are few new needs in the
3 Executive Budget for the Department of Transportation
4 including \$2.3 -- \$21.3 million and 53 positions for
5 the Vision Zero Initiative; \$7.1 million. And 18
6 positions for the design of nine new Select Bus
7 Service routes, and \$7.6 million for 44 positions for
8 the maintenance and operation of additional 120 speed
9 cameras associated with the Vision Zero program.

11 I'm so happy to say that DOT's budget
12 also includes an additional \$49 million to help
13 resurface a thousand main miles of streets throughout
14 our city. This particular piece is important because
15 this additional funding was called for by the council
16 members during the Preliminary Budget Hearings, and
17 expressing the Council's budget response news. So
18 I'm glad that the Council's voice was heard.
19 However, additional areas of concerns were expressed
20 during the Council's budget hearing and in our budget
21 responses that are not fully addressed in the
22 Executive Budget, including funding to expand 30
23 services citywide, as well as a full funding for
24 Vision Zero rather than partial funding. It is my
25 hope that after this round of budget hearings, the

1
2 Administration will heed the concerns expressed by
3 council members, and the public regarding DOT's
4 proposed budget. And work with the Council to ensure
5 that the adopted budget reflects all of our voices
6 and values.

7 I'm looking forward to hearing from the
8 new Department of Transportation Commissioner Polly
9 Trottenberg to learn more about ways this Executive
10 Budget affects the Department of Transportation.
11 Before we hear from the Commissioner, however, I will
12 turn the mic over to my Co-Chair, Council Member
13 Ydanis Rodriguez, Chair of the Council's
14 Transportation Committee.

15 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
16 Chair Ferreras. It's a happy day having the
17 opportunity to be called in these hearings with
18 someone like you, the great leadership. It's very
19 important. I also would also like to recognize the
20 other council members who are here, Mark Levine,
21 Cornegy, Reynoso, Menchaca and -- What's the name?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic]

23 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good morning
24 and welcome to the Finance and Transportation
25 Committee's hearing of the Fiscal 2015 Executive

1
2 Budget. My name is Ydanis Rodriguez, and I'm the
3 Chair of the Transportation Committee. Today, we
4 will begin by hearing testimony from the City's
5 Department of Transportation and the DOT. They will
6 be followed by the Metropolitan Transportation
7 Authority, MTA; and then followed up by the Taxi and
8 Limousine Commission, the TLC. The Department of
9 Transportation's Executive Expense Budget for Fiscal
10 Year 2015 is approximately \$830 million. In
11 addition, \$2.2 billion is also budgeted in Fiscal
12 2015 for the Department's Capital Program. I am
13 particularly pleased that the Executive Budget
14 included funding for the Department's component of
15 the City's Vision Zero Program, and funding to allow
16 DOT to resurface more lane miles of the city's
17 streets. Two issues were addressed during the
18 Preliminary Budget Hearing.

19 They also included funding for the
20 expansion of Select Bus service, which is encouraging
21 as we seek to expand public transportation options to
22 underserved communities. This is funding that would
23 allow the DOT to expand Select Bus Services by an
24 additional nine routes. We look forward to the
25

1
2 Commissioner updating the committee on the planning
3 and scope of these initiatives.

4 In addition, we hope to hear from the
5 Commissioner about the Department's effort regarding
6 the implementation of the City's bike lane, and Bike
7 Share programs. The effort to improve road in a
8 sweet condition, including potholes mitigation, and
9 the Department's effort to improve pedestrian safety
10 citywide. The MTA's Calendar Year 2014 Adopted
11 Budget is balanced, and includes more than \$800
12 million in the City's expense funding. It also
13 includes fares and toll increase 4% beginning March
14 1, 2015. Another fare increase is also planned for
15 March 2017, and we hope to hear from the MTA of any
16 plans they may have to -- they may have that we help
17 will help avoid or minimize the planned fare hike.

18 Additionally, we would like to hear from
19 the MTA on other issues of importance, including the
20 continuing effort to recover from Super Storm Sandy.
21 The potential impact of the recently announced
22 contract settlement with the TWU, the Authority's
23 efforts to identify inefficiencies and control costs,
24 the Authority's Calendar Year 2010-2104 Capital Plan,
25 and efforts being made to secure funding for the next

1
2 Capital Plan, the 2015-2019 Capital Plan. Regarding
3 the upcoming Capital Plan, we must be sure that the
4 plan is fully funded upon adoption to avoid cost
5 overruns, and delays in the construction process.

6 Lastly, we will hear from the Taxi and
7 Limousine Commission. The Commissioner -- the
8 Commissioner will update the committee on the status
9 of the Borough Tax Initiative, and when we can expect
10 to see the next set of 6,000 green cars on our roads.
11 They will discuss their ongoing efforts to increase
12 accessible taxicabs, and implement programs to
13 increase enforcement on illegal streets hails, and
14 service refusals citywide. The Commission will also
15 update the Committee on how we plan to contribute to
16 the Vision Zero program and impact drivers' behavior
17 within the industry to create safer streets for all.

18 I would like to end by proposing a new
19 initiative to help with grassroots outreach;
20 educational services the community to get involved in
21 Vision Zero on their own. We have so many great
22 groups interested in promoting street safety in
23 neighborhoods across the city, and this will be a
24 great way to help them do just that. I will be
25 working toward this goal in the coming weeks, and the

1
2 Council and I hope to have the support of the
3 Administration in this effort. Now, before we begin
4 from Commissioner Trottenberg, let me take a moment
5 to recognize other council member Weprin; Council
6 Member Miller;

7 COUNCIL MEMBER: [interposing] I'm sorry.
8 My bike broke down.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: -- and Rosie
10 Mendez. And before I turn it back to the Finance
11 Chair, I also would like to thank the Committee
12 staff, Counsel Lyle Frank; Policy Analyst Jonathan
13 Masserano; and Gafar Salov[sp?] as well as my staff
14 Interim Legislator and Body Director, Russell Murphy
15 and Legislator Aid Noel Caramarcos [sp?]; and Johnny
16 Arroyo.

17 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay. Well, thank
18 you, and you may begin your testimony Commissioner.

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Good morning
20 Chairwoman Ferreras, Chairman Rodriguez, and members
21 of the Finance and Transportation Committees. My
22 name is Polly Trottenberg, and I'm the Commissioner
23 of the New York City Department of Transportation.
24 With me today are Joseph Jarrin, Deputy Commissioner
25 for Finance, Contracting and Program Management, and

1
2 Jeff Lynch, Assistant Commissioner of
3 Intergovernmental Affairs, and I think a man many of
4 you know well. Thank you for inviting us today to
5 discuss DOT's Fiscal Year 2015 Executive Budget. I'm
6 honored to be the first Commissioner to be testifying
7 on Mayor de Blasio's Budget, and I'm proud to say it
8 makes infrastructure investment a high priority.

9 The Mayor has also made an unprecedented
10 commitment to his Vision Zero plan for making our
11 streets safer, and to enhancing mobility and access
12 for all New Yorkers with Select Bus Service. I also
13 want to thank the Council for their leadership in all
14 these key priorities. This upcoming fiscal year will
15 allow DOT to better execute our five priorities:
16 safety, state of good repair, innovative project
17 delivery, mobility, and livability. DOT's Proposed
18 Expense Budget for Fiscal Year 15 is \$830 million,
19 including \$332 million for Traffic Planning and
20 Operations; \$177 million for Roadway Maintenance;
21 \$129 million for DOT Operations, including site-off
22 management; \$120 million for Ferry Operations and
23 Maintenance; and \$91 million for Bridge Maintenance
24 and Inspection.

1
2 We've discussed Vision Zero here at the
3 City Council several times and DOT, NYPD, and TLC
4 have attended remarkable Vision Zero town hall
5 meetings and workshops in neighborhoods across the
6 five boroughs with many of you here. From
7 Springfield Gardens to St. George, Manhattan to
8 Midtown, DOT has heard directly from New Yorkers who
9 want intersection improvements, more bike lanes, and
10 slower vehicle speed. So that we can be safer on our
11 streets.

12 I want to thank Speaker Mark-Viverito,
13 Chairman Rodriguez, Chairwoman Gibson, Chairman
14 Ferreras and so many other council members for your
15 commitment to public engagement on Vision Zero. On
16 behalf of the Mayor, I also want to express our
17 gratitude to the Council for passing Resolution 111
18 to allow New York to lower the citywide speed limit
19 to 25 miles per hour. Your action yesterday will be
20 invaluable to us as we lobby in Albany for this
21 change.

22 The Mayor's FY15 Budget provides \$52
23 million in new capital and expense funding to make
24 our streets safer. The new funding allocation
25 includes the following: \$23 million in capital and

1
2 expense funds to procure, install, operate, and
3 maintain 120 new speed cameras recently authorized in
4 Albany. We anticipate beginning the procurement
5 process for these new cameras once Governor Cuomo
6 signs the legislation recently championed by Speaker
7 Silver and Senator Majority Co-Leader Klein. Our
8 budget includes \$13 million to comprehensively
9 redesign problematic corridors and intersections,
10 including \$10 million to update and maintain street
11 markings, and \$3 million to pay for planning and
12 implementation staff.

13 We included \$2 million for speed humps.
14 This will allow DOT to respond to individual
15 requests, reduce speed limits near more than 50
16 schools, and implement 16 new neighborhood slow zones
17 by 2016. Include \$11 million for improvements to the
18 signal and street light network. DOT will also
19 enhance lighting at one thousand key intersections.
20 We will re-time the signals along high crash
21 corridors, and at dangerous intersections in
22 conjunction with reduced speed limits. We will also
23 use \$3 million to purchase new safety classroom
24 materials and launch the new Vision Zero Media
25

1
2 Campaigns, teaching kids and adults alike safer
3 behavior on our streets.

4 In addition to major safety enhancements,
5 our FY15 Budget includes \$7 million in expense
6 funding for the Select Bus Service Program starting
7 in Fiscal Year 15, and over \$49 million in capital
8 funding for Fiscal Years 15 through 18. This money
9 will help DOT and MTA ultimately expand the Select
10 Bus Service Program to up to 20 routes as promised by
11 Mayor de Blasio. Select Bus Service is a proven
12 success in New York delivering on average 20% faster
13 travel time and attracting 10% more riders per route.
14 I would like to thank the MTA and New York City
15 Transit for their partnership in instituting the SBS
16 Program, which has vastly improved the daily commute
17 of more than 200,000 bus riders. And we're very
18 interested in expanding that service to areas all
19 over the city that are in need of better transit
20 connections.

21 The FY15 Budget also includes funding for
22 the operation of the Staten Island Ferry, including
23 bike lanes. By improving our transportation options,
24 DOT is giving all New Yorkers better access to jobs,
25 education, and opportunity. I'm also very pleased,

1
2 and I know many of you will be as well that the
3 Mayor's Executive Budget provides DOT with \$7.3 more
4 in expense funding this year for filling another
5 100,000 potholes. We have been working at a record
6 pace after this difficult winter. We have filled
7 over 340 potholes so far this year, and I want to
8 thank our dedicated roadway crews who work tirelessly
9 everyday. I think New Yorkers owe those public
10 servants a big debt of gratitude.

11 Thanks to DOT's recent Hamilton Avenue
12 Asphalt Plant Redesign, which I announced yesterday
13 with the Mayor and Council Member Menchaca, DOT is
14 also focusing on the environmental sustainability of
15 our road work -- of our roadway work using more
16 locally made recycled asphalt, reducing truck trips
17 emissions and oil consumption. Our new Hamilton
18 Avenue plant will save the City as much as \$5 million
19 annually, meaning the \$25 million design will pay for
20 itself in about five years. DOT plans to replicate
21 these cost savings and efficiency measures through a
22 similar \$25 million upgrade to the Harper Street
23 Asphalt Plant in Queens. To make New York a more
24 livable, walkable city, the FY15 Budget also includes
25 \$19 million for adding public plazas and \$8 million

1
2 for installing way finding signs and city benches to
3 the city's sidewalks.

4 Moving to DOT's Capital Budget, the
5 Mayor's Budget proposes a \$6.7 billion capital
6 investment for DOT for Fiscal Years 2014 through
7 2018. This will help renew our roads and bridges,
8 and represents a \$500 million increase in city
9 funding over the FY15 preliminary plan. This
10 expanded commitment to the City's transportation
11 infrastructure is a very good start in restoring
12 needed funds to DOT's ten-year capital plan. And
13 from now through January, the key capital agencies
14 including DOT will be working closely with OMB and
15 City Hall to craft a ten-year capital plan that
16 prudently invests in the City's vital infrastructure
17 over the long term.

18 DOT's Proposed Five-Year Capital Plan
19 Budget includes \$3.1 billion for bridge
20 reconstruction; \$2.3 billion for street
21 reconstruction and resurfacing; \$460 million for
22 streetlights and signals; \$427 million for the Staten
23 Island Ferry; \$175 million for sidewalk
24 reconstruction; and nearly \$200 million for
25 facilities and equipment needed to support the DOT

1
2 operations around the city. The budget funds
3 critical capital construction projects in all five
4 boroughs.

5 In FY15, DOT will start construction on
6 the West Street and Flushing Avenue segments of the
7 Brooklyn Greenway, and on a major intersection
8 project at East 177th Street and the Sheridan
9 Expressway in the Bronx. We will begin the 185th
10 Street's Streetscape Improvement Project in
11 Manhattan, and a complete street reconstruction
12 project in South Jamaica, Queens to address flooding
13 conditions. We will also deliver five different
14 capital projects to bring busy Staten Island
15 intersections up to a state of good repair and
16 mitigate traffic congestion.

17 As the Chairwoman mentioned, the Capital
18 Plan also provides an additional \$49 million to allow
19 DOT to repave a thousand lane miles of city streets
20 next year. The Capital Plan includes an increase of
21 \$346 million for bridge repair. I'm so proud of the
22 work we are currently doing on some of the city's 789
23 bridges. I recently toured the Mill Basin Bridge in
24 Brooklyn, which is a great example from our \$1
25 billion Belt Parkway Bridges Program. The Mill Basin

1
2 project will begin construction next year, and
3 improve safety and traffic flows; [sic] better
4 visibility for motorists; increase lane widths; added
5 shoulders on both sides of the roadway; and removal
6 of an obsolete draw bridge.

7 DOT will also start construction next
8 year on \$181 million project reconstruction the
9 Harlem River Drive Viaduct in Manhattan and on a \$110
10 million reconstruction of the Roosevelt Avenue Bridge
11 over the Van Wyck Expressway in Queens. But in the
12 future, DOT could bring the cost of capital projects
13 down by tens of millions of dollars, and speed
14 delivery of improvements through the use of Design-
15 Build fitting. Design-Build can eliminated the
16 costly and time-consuming process of procuring design
17 and construction work separately.

18 I want to thank the Council for their
19 support of the State Legislation for the
20 authorization of allowing the City to use Design-
21 Build. I look forward to working with you to see
22 this bill pass in Albany. In conclusion, this
23 testimony highlights just some of the many ways DOT
24 will continue to execute our top five priorities with
25 cost to taxpayers in mind. We look forward to

1
2 working with all of you on the Council to pursue
3 Mayor de Blasio's vision for a safe, equitable, and
4 accessible transportation system for all New Yorkers.
5 Thank you again on behalf of the Mayor, and I look
6 forward to taking your questions.

7 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very
8 much for your testimony, Commissioner. We have been
9 joined by Council Members Johnson, Rosenthal, Rose,
10 and Cumbo. So we have a full house, and I thank the
11 members for being here today. I wanted to speak and
12 I know that you didn't specifically mention your work
13 with Super Storm Sandy. I know some of these lanes
14 may help address that, but in specific in the
15 Executive Budget the commitments of \$620.2 million
16 for street reconstruction, including \$308 million for
17 street damage by Super Storm Sandy for Fiscal 2015.
18 Can you update this committee on the status of the
19 recovery work that are being done by DOT Sandy
20 affected areas? Also, I just wanted to know the
21 rate at which we are with reimbursement for this
22 work?

23 COMMISSIONER POLLY TROTTENBERG: Yeah,
24 I'm going to give a quick overview and I'm actually
25 going to turn it over to Deputy Commissioner Jarrin,

1
2 who I think who can really get into the heavy
3 details. And I think we are focusing a lot of time
4 and attention, as you know, administration wide on
5 Sandy recovery. We are at DOT as well. And
6 certainly, I think there have been a bunch of
7 challenges to getting the dollars out the door, and
8 getting the reimbursements. But I just want to
9 assure you it is a very high priority for us, and I
10 will let Deputy Commissioner Jarrin get into the
11 details of where we stand in terms of dollar out the
12 door obligations, et cetera.

13 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you.

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Thank you,
15 Commissioner. I'm Joseph Jarrin. I'm Deputy
16 Commissioner of Finance, Contracting and Program
17 Management. Chairwoman, as you mentioned, we have a
18 fairly large Sandy Program in our budget. We are
19 making progress on that program. Just right now
20 we're progressing on the resurfacing, and traffic
21 signals, streetlight repair that have been delayed
22 for some time due to federal approvals that we were
23 waiting for, but which we have gotten recently to
24 move forward with. So that's actually progressing
25 now this spring and summer.

1
2 The street reconstruction work that I
3 think relates to both of the funding is beginning
4 design now, and we're working closely with the
5 Department of Design and Construction who is doing
6 the design contracting and construction for that. We
7 should see construction start next spring for that
8 road repair for the Sandy affected areas. But
9 regarding reimbursement, we have completed about \$40
10 million worth of work and we've been reimbursed at
11 this point close to \$15 million, and we have now
12 these all down to get reimbursement for some of the
13 additional work. The work that has been reimbursed
14 at this point has been all the debris removal that we
15 conducted right after the storm, some of the
16 emergency response repairs that were done immediately
17 after the storm. And then since then we have
18 replaced parking meters, and a couple of other small
19 items that have been reimbursed in full at this
20 point. As we're progressing with the resurfacing and
21 traffic work, we'll be getting much more
22 reimbursement.

23 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Have you seen any
24 challenges to any of the federal interactions with
25 being able to get reimbursed on repairs? Besides the

1
2 timeline on the actual reimbursements, have there
3 been challenges that may not fall into the federal
4 cash amount that the city is now burdened with
5 repairing, and you may not be getting reimbursed?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Yes, I'm
7 sorry to say there have been challenges with the
8 federal agencies. We're subject to three federal
9 entities: FEMA, FFS [sp?] and FTA who each pay for
10 different things that were damaged with Sandy, each
11 one has their own process for approval. Each agency
12 has had a team sent to really evaluate very strictly
13 with what they're willing to pay for, and we work
14 very closely with the Office of Management and Budget
15 and City Hall to work through those issues with them.
16 Some of the issues go beyond DOT vehicles that were
17 damaged. They were questioning whether they really
18 reimbursable or not. I think we won that fight with
19 them. So there have been a lot of discussions that
20 are ongoing, but very recently we resolved a number
21 of those issues, which is why we're able to move
22 forward now with the traffic signal work and the
23 resurfacing.

24 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay. I know
25 we're putting together a federal agenda, so I just

1
2 wanted to have a better understanding on what we need
3 to be advocating from our city's perspective so that
4 we don't see these dollars still lingering 2016,
5 2017, 2018 because we're still dealing with the
6 reimbursement issue.

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I think on
8 that we would be happy actually to sit down and give
9 you I think a pretty specific list of some things we
10 think might help in our work with the federal
11 government having come myself from USDOT, I can sort
12 of see both sides of the pressures they're under.
13 They're under a lot of scrutiny to make sure that
14 they are documenting everything we do in a great
15 amount of detail. But in a lot of ways, I think it's
16 slowing things down. So we would be happy to give
17 you more details on that. It would be very -- I
18 think if you have that, it would be useful.

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay, very good.
20 I just -- I'm going to ask one question, and after
21 all my numbers, all the numbers ask questions, circle
22 back for a second round of questioning. I saw that
23 in your testimony you spoke about \$19 million for a
24 park -- for community plazas, which I'm really
25 excited. But having done a plaza that I find

1
2 successful in my own district, Corona Plaza, one of
3 the challenges that we had is that when talk about --
4 Although we highlight in particular in our brief in
5 Union Square, it was kind of more established as a
6 business sector.

7 When we talk about the outer boroughs,
8 the other boroughs or other smaller communities, we
9 have a challenge when we have -- we don't have
10 necessarily the business improvement district or the
11 non-profit partner that you require in order to do
12 the maintenance after the work. So I'm very excited
13 to see the investment from DOT -- from the
14 Administration. However, I find that we have a
15 challenge with non-profit organizations in some of
16 our local communities. So how are you going to be
17 addressing that obstacle that a lot of our
18 communities face?

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: You are
20 correct. It is a real challenge, and I actually
21 visited the Plaza in your district. It's very nice,
22 but I agree there's a real difference obviously in
23 some of the major plazas let's say in big commercial
24 parts of Manhattan where you have bids that have a
25 lot of resources versus some of the smaller community

1
2 plazas. And DOT the way we had approached this
3 program was we thought it was a great opportunity to
4 have a local partner that would take over and own the
5 plaza, do the programming and do the upkeep.

6 I think we now need to go back and take a
7 look at how that's working, and if there's some
8 creative solutions we need to bring to the table.
9 There are some non-profit organizations that are
10 actually interested perhaps in being partners with
11 some of these communities. And I think we're going
12 to take a look at how we might work with them, and
13 what kinds of resources they can bring to the table.
14 We are aware that this is a challenge in some parts
15 of the city.

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: I would recommend
17 you looking at the Corona Plaza model, and working
18 with the Horticultural Society, and working with the
19 Queens Museum, and other organizations that have
20 helped really. And do a wraparound service that's
21 really required and necessary for the upkeep. I just
22 don't -- I'm concerned with the Administration puts
23 this money in for the capital improvement, and then
24 we're just -- we just leave the formula the same.
25 And if we're not changing it to reflect what we're

1 meaning these plazas to be, then it's a challenge.

2 And thank you, and I will do my second round of
3 questions. We've been joined by Council Member
4 Garodnick and Council Member Levin. First for
5 questions is Council Member Vacca followed by -- Oh,
6 I'm sorry. My questions will be by Chair Rodriguez?

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes, I have a
8 few questions and definitely before we have other
9 colleagues who ask a question. One is about Vision
10 Zero. First of all, I'd like to say thank you. You
11 are amazing. So I have no doubt that --

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: No, I think
14 that when the Mayor grows idea and recruit you for
15 this position. And we said before, I have never seen
16 -- I have never seen many commissioners that have
17 stayed up to the last minute when the family member
18 that they have lost a loved one are giving the
19 testimony. We usually get to see those commissioners
20 leaving someone of the staff. And knowing from your
21 busy schedule that you were -- have been so committed
22 to hear this testimony, and going outside and
23 building that coalition with everyone is so
24 important.
25

1
2 I also would like to thank the Families
3 for Safer Street. I know that it was very difficult.
4 It was not an easy one for everyone that have been
5 advocating for the 20 miles an hour to be able to
6 compromise and bringing everyone, the administration,
7 the Speaker, and Mayor de Blasio and his team,
8 Melissa Mark-Viverito the Speaker and us, and the
9 Families for Safer Street and say, Let's come
10 altogether as New Yorkers. And let's go to Albany
11 with one voice even though we've been advocating for
12 20 miles per hour for month a year, we are one voice
13 advocating for 20 miles an hour. So thank you for
14 the role you play as the Families for Safe Streets.

15 First I would like to start with the
16 Vision Zero. The question is like can you please
17 provide us a breakdown on you plan to spend the \$21.3
18 million allocated to Vision Zero, and how much will
19 go towards education? And do you support the idea
20 that to create a Vision Zero fund dedicated for
21 grassroots education or initiative?

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I'll
23 actually answer the second question, and thank you,
24 Mr. Chairman. I, too, want to thank Families for
25 Safer Streets. They were I think showed some

1
2 leadership and spirit of compromising. And I think
3 that we're so happy that we're going to have a united
4 front between the administration, and the City
5 Council and our delegation up in Albany. And we're
6 really looking forward to making a push to lower New
7 York City's speed limit. I hope we'll meet with
8 success up there. I think we are certainly
9 supportive of the concept that you have of some kind
10 of an educational fund.

11 And, you know, we'd love to sit down and
12 talk to you about it. I know there are different
13 models of how that's worked working with different
14 city agencies, and thin that could be tremendously
15 beneficial. Because as we've always aid about Vision
16 Zero, it is -- there's a lot of culture change and
17 education that needs to occur, and it can't all come
18 from City Hall. We need to have community partners
19 all over the city that are helping us. So maybe we
20 can sit down with your team afterwards and really
21 start to flesh that out. We think it's a terrific
22 idea. I can give you for the total we had in our
23 Vision Zero proposal capital and expense money a big
24 chunk of that \$23 million is for the new speed
25 cameras that we're going to have in Albany, and the

1
2 governor, we're looking forward to him signing that
3 bill hopefully very soon.

4 And we're really looking forward to
5 deploying those cameras around the city. We really
6 think they're going to help save some lives.

7 Thirteen million on work with intersections and
8 marking. Some things I've traveled around the city
9 to town halls and neighborhoods. I've certainly
10 heard a lot about street markings. And obviously
11 we've had a tough winter, but we're really getting to
12 work in putting those back. Two million on speed
13 humps, which we used to put in neighborhood slow
14 zones, and around schools.

15 Eleven million on street lighting and
16 signals, which is another area I certainly hear a lot
17 about in my travels around the city. And then \$3
18 million on safety education, and that's going into
19 schools. That's our ad campaigns, and we are luckily
20 -- we are working with New York City and Company to
21 tap into some of the advertising space that the City
22 has allocated. Through our Cemusa contract we're
23 also going to be working with the MTA to get signs up
24 on buses and trains. So we're going to really try
25 and get as far as we can with that money to reach out

1
2 to people all over the city. And we're hoping
3 obviously that some of the advocate groups out there
4 will also help spread our message.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you and
6 related to Cemusa, as you say 22% of the space that's
7 Cemusa had used in the bus shelters not only here in
8 New York City, but through other work. Twenty-two
9 percent is the bus space that is dedicated free to
10 New York City as part of the contract, which is a
11 good thing so that we can promote from Brazil,
12 Beijing and other places New York City. So from
13 those 22% that the City get not free, but the Cemusa
14 provided free of charge because of the good contract
15 they get. Do you have any idea what percent is in the
16 budget? Twenty-two percent are we expecting to use
17 for Vision Zero?

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I don't have
19 that yet because we're working, as I say, with New
20 York and Company, which kind of handles coordinating
21 all the public service announcements, but we're in
22 the midst of working that out, and we'll get back to
23 you with a specific number when we finish those
24 negotiations. But I think we're going to have a
25 chance to run a pretty robust ad campaign.

1
2 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, and
3 what about under Section 19.152 in the New York State
4 Administrative Code, Property owners are responsible
5 for installing, repairing, and maintaining sidewalks
6 adjoining their properties. Does DOT receive 100%
7 reimbursement from property owners for these repairs?
8 And if not, how of this bill that automatically goes
9 uncollected annually?

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, you
11 know, I will actually have Deputy Commissioners
12 Jarrin jump into that. I will say this much. I
13 think we're collecting. A lot of the sidewalk work
14 we're doing right now, just so you know, sidewalk
15 work that we don't bill for. That's involving city-
16 owned properties. So let me -- I'll actually go
17 through and give you the breakdown in the numbers.
18 It's something we've actually spent a lot of time
19 looking at recently.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Thank you
21 Commissioner. The number this year we have assessed
22 closed to \$6 million of work that the property owners
23 --

24 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How much?
25

1
2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Six million,
3 and we have collected \$5 million. So we're doing
4 fairly well as far as getting back about the same
5 dollar amount that we have assessed.

6 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And what are
7 the consequences for those that they have not paid
8 back DOT?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: The
10 Department of Finance has a process to follow through
11 with that, and I think that we'll have to get back
12 specifically on what they will be doing.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: That's
14 important for us to know because especially during
15 the snowstorm many of the sidewalks got damaged. So
16 we want to be sure that the building owners they
17 really do the repair. If they don't they should have
18 some consequences with the City. I just want to say
19 before I hand it to my other colleagues, and my
20 colleagues ask questions, that one thing that I would
21 like to see in your leadership with the new
22 Administration with a new leader at DOT. I believe
23 that -- And you also heard this part, and I think
24 that we have great departments, but the experience
25

1
2 that we have in the press is that there were a lot of
3 no for many requests that we have in our district.

4 And I hope, and I know with your
5 leadership, it takes time for the staff to adjust to
6 changes that we make in the city. And as I praise
7 and congratulate for your level of inclusion that you
8 have with us. Also that we would like to see
9 happening in other City Council districts. Because
10 who would say that we would have a class on 42nd
11 Street in Times Square? And in the past when we went
12 for those requests in some area in our district,
13 there was a lot of argument why no. Many of them
14 because of traffic. So as you come in with a new
15 idea and new vision that the rest of the staff also
16 they are more into working together with us.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah and I --
18 thank you for that. I mean it's interesting. That's
19 something we've been debating internally. I think
20 one of the strengths of what DOT has been doing in
21 recent years is having a lot of inclusive processes
22 where we ask people to apply for neighborhood slow
23 zones, or for traffic lights. Then we have our own
24 internal processes about whether they're appropriate
25 given the crash rates in the areas or resource

1
2 constraints. So I think we're really trying to work
3 through how we can have a more proactive approach.
4 And they'll be less known, but we'll get good results
5 give the resource constraints with us.

6 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But for the
7 record, Commissioner, that's not true. The level of
8 inclusion that DOT in many cases did not work with
9 council members in the past. And I say I think that
10 I'm so happy that you're the Commissioner, but I also
11 -- You know, we need that leadership also to transfer
12 into like a change of culture on how DOT work in the
13 past. In many cases they did not work. In many
14 cases, DOT heard they are here, and they come out
15 with all those excuses how a lot of things were
16 happening in the Midtown area. And what we would
17 like to see happening is that the same level of
18 collaboration in the Midtown area.

19 And other parts in the bus community
20 where many changes have happened, also to happen in
21 the South Bronx, in Brooklyn, in Washington Heights.
22 And those communities that usually are more easy for
23 someone to go and say no. That the other community
24 where you have 80% of your constituents having a
25 bachelor degree and peers with a degree because they

1
2 know that their voices will be stronger. So, you
3 know, I would just like to see that level of
4 leadership of you also be sure that what had happened
5 in the past, was not happening in your
6 administration.

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, and I
8 think, look, as you know, I work for a Mayor who has
9 made a big commitment in his campaign, and as he's
10 taken the reigns as Mayor to making sure that all of
11 the things City agencies that we're charged to making
12 sure that we're working with every part of the City.
13 And obviously working with the leadership of the
14 Council and community boards, et cetera is a very
15 important piece of that.

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Yes.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So we
18 certainly commit to that.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you,
21 Commissioner, and we will have Council Member Vacca
22 followed by Council Member Cornegy.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you, Madam
24 Chair, Mr. Chair, and thank you, Commissioner. You
25 are a breath of fresh air, and I say that because I

1
2 have previous experiences. I welcome you, and I
3 thank you for all you've done. I had a couple of
4 questions. You did mention in your testimony part of
5 the budget \$552,000 for snow removal on overpasses.
6 I wanted to bring to your attention that for years,
7 there's always been conflict among City agencies
8 about who does what. To the best of my memory, there
9 was an attempt to resolve this. There was something
10 called the Leventhal Memo. This probably was 1987.
11 It was named after a former Deputy Mayor Nat
12 Leventhal. That memo is often weighed, and people in
13 different agencies interpret the memo differently
14 even though it was designed to be very clear. So I
15 do think, and perhaps you could lead that discussion,
16 or be part of that discussion that we need that memo
17 to be revisited. Because people in my district and
18 other districts need to be clear because too many
19 times -- because on too many occasions it still
20 happens is that we all about snow removal, and
21 different agencies tell us different things. So I'd
22 like to bring that to your attention.

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes, and let
24 me just comment on that. And certainly, I think this
25 winter unfortunately with so many snowstorms, it came

1
2 to light that there were certainly areas that no
3 question had fallen through the cracks. I mean in a
4 couple of instances one that the New York Times wrote
5 about up in the Bronx. It turned out quite honestly
6 no agency had that particular stretch on its books.
7 And that's not a good excuse, but it was just the
8 truth of the matter. And look, we were all
9 challenged this winter in keeping up. It is an area
10 that the Mayor has really actually tasked us
11 personally with focusing on. And so we have been
12 talking to Sanitation and MTA and Parks, and all of
13 our sister agencies. That we are sure that we can
14 figure out exactly who owns what, and be reading next
15 winter with a game plan that we can execute on. But
16 it's funny. I have heard about the legendary
17 Leventhal Memo, and there is a feeling that we need
18 to revisit it, and figure out whether we're all still
19 abiding by it.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you, and you
21 spoke about speed bumps and allocating money for
22 speed bumps. I think you mentioned \$2 million, but
23 is that money above what was allocated this year? Is
24 that more money because I do have a concern about
25 speed bumps. My concern is that it takes too long to

1
2 install them from the day they're requested. It
3 takes too long to survey the location, install the
4 location. I can give you instances where it's taken
5 more than a year to a year and a half from the day
6 that the bump was requested to the day the bump was
7 installed. So I need to know from you is this
8 additional money for more speed bumps, and can you
9 also quicken up the time period from request to
10 installation?

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I have heard
12 the frustration, and I know it takes a long time, and
13 it certainly has been a resource question. And
14 there's no question right now we have a backlog and
15 that \$2 million is going to help us get through it.
16 But I do know that this is an area of big priority.
17 It's probably an area we're going to need to revisit,
18 because right now we have one crew that does them.
19 And it's true, they can't I think in a given year
20 keep up with the volume, and there's certainly I
21 think a growing interest in getting them all around
22 the city. So I think moving forward it's something
23 we need to work with you all on. This is clearly
24 becoming an area in which we're hearing more and more
25 from communities that they want them. And one thing

1
2 I've learned, too, is when you put them on a roadway,
3 and then you later resurface the roadway, you have to
4 take -- You know, you scrape them off and you have to
5 rebuild those. So, as we also try and resurface the
6 city streets, that sort of adds. That can add to the
7 backlog sometimes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well, I first want
9 to thank you for what you're doing in my district
10 this year. The resurfacing schedule is beyond
11 anything I've ever seen, and not in my 26 years with
12 Board 10 and now here. So I thank you. We needed
13 it. But I want to put the Bronx on your agenda for a
14 second. We are the 99%. The Mayor talks about
15 equity. My borough does not have rich people. I do
16 not have hipsters. [laughter] I have -- my borough
17 has been left behind for years. We are increasing
18 ferry service. The previous administration increased
19 ferry service for neighborhoods in close proximity to
20 Manhattan, while those of us in the far reaches of
21 the City including my borough were ignored. And I
22 never understood that. EDC has traditionally stalled
23 on this, and when you mentioned ferry service, I have
24 to bring to your attention the fact that the Bronx
25 Waterfront is basically unused. It is a resource

1
2 that's unused. We could get people to Manhattan very
3 quickly from Co-op City from Bronx Neck [sic], from
4 Soundview, all along the East Bronx. Yet, we have
5 people with the longest commutes in the city living
6 in my district. And we are just consigned to being
7 omitted while people who already have good access,
8 who live in the ring of Manhattan, not only have good
9 access by train and by bus, but then they get ferry
10 service, too.

11 So there is a two-city tale, and my
12 borough represents that, and somebody has got to
13 speak up and say something. Now, the Council, when
14 we submitted our response to the Mayor the Council
15 included ferry service, and I thank the Speaker. It
16 was one of the items I brought to the attention to
17 leadership, and she included it and I thank her. But
18 what can we do at DOT and EDC to make sure that my
19 borough has attention that has been long overdue?

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, let me
21 say first of all, I hope you feel at least from DOT's
22 point of view and in our day-to-day work we really
23 are trying to pay attention to the Bronx. And I have
24 spent a lot of time up there, I'm happy to say in the
25 past few months. I'm really trying to visit the

1
2 different communities and hear what the needs are on
3 the ground, and will continue to do so. We have
4 started talking to EDC about ferry service citywide.
5 This is -- I hear it form you, but I hear it all over
6 the city. People really love it. The challenge of it
7 is, as you know, it's a -- it tends to be very
8 costly. I has to be heavily subsidized. There is
9 not state funding for it or much federal funding. So
10 if you start the service you've got to make sure
11 you're going to have the ongoing resources. But I
12 certainly hear what you're saying loud and clear, and
13 I've heard it from others. And I know we need to
14 spend some time with EDC really taking a careful
15 look, and I recognize -- I now have someone here from
16 your area who has a very long commute, and so I
17 certainly know that the --

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I'm going to talk
19 to him later, too. Don't worry.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, all
21 right, I'm sure. So, look, we know it is a huge
22 issue, something that the Mayor is committed to
23 looking at the parts of the city where people have
24 the longest commutes, and figuring out how we can
25

1
2 speed up their travel time so they can access the
3 jobs and opportunities of the center city.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: And lastly, I do
5 remind you, and I know that we spoke previously about
6 making express service from the Bronx to Manhattan
7 truly express. Getting us out of the borough quicker
8 so people don't use their cars, and just give up out
9 of frustration. And we do have express buses, but we
10 need your help in trying to get them into the city
11 quicker. So I thank you, and I thank you for City
12 Island. I cannot thank you enough for being
13 collaborative, and for being more than responsive,
14 and helpful. So I thank you for that, and thank you,
15 Madam Chair.

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Council
17 Member Vacca. Members, we're going to start the
18 clock. We're going to have a five-minute clock for
19 the first round; a three-minute clock for the second
20 round; and we will have Council Member Cornegy
21 followed by Council Member Menchaca.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Good morning
23 Commissioner, good morning Deputies. It's great to
24 see you here this morning. From a small business
25 perspective, some of the changes have hurt some small

1
2 businesses. So the increased sidewalks, the limited
3 parking when you've done the Express Service in my
4 district in particular. And so I wanted to know if
5 you're interested in revisiting that. I don't know
6 what rubric you used in measuring the unintended
7 consequence on small business and micro businesses or
8 some of the things you've done in the outer boroughs.
9 Now in Manhattan, I noted it may not have the same
10 impact, but in districts like mine where the Express
11 Bus Service or Select Bus Service has been
12 implemented and sidewalks for beautification have
13 been increased, the size. It has limited parking,
14 which has decreased the amount of traffic that
15 generally goes to businesses. And it has limited the
16 ability for the delivery trucks to do their job. So
17 its had an unintended consequence on small business.
18 And I was just wondering if you are willing to
19 revisit some of that, and if you could tell me what
20 the, if you know, what the Rubrics that were used to
21 measure the unintended consequences to small
22 businesses of these great developments that have
23 happened throughout the city?

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, thank
25 you for that question. We do try with all our

1
2 projects with Select Bus Service and others to go in
3 afterwards, and sort of continuously monitor and look
4 at how it's affecting the businesses in the area. We
5 try in a lot of those projects to actually, even if
6 we're taking parking out in the bus lane, to add
7 parking in other parts of the neighborhood. If you
8 think that there are areas where we need to revisit
9 in more detail, we'd be happy to do that. I mean we
10 want these projects to be tremendously successful for
11 local businesses, and if they aren't then we
12 certainly want to see what we can do to improve that.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: So, I will tell
14 you guys, as the Chair of Small Business, I'm getting
15 those complaints -- challenges. I won't say
16 complaints. We're getting a lot of concern about the
17 challenges that are presented to small businesses.
18 So they want the beautification, and they want to be
19 a part of our city that's growing. But there are
20 negatives. There has been a negative impact in my
21 district and around the city from communities like
22 mine who have small business, and commercial
23 thoroughfares. So, you know, we'd like to integrate
24 these things in a way that makes sense to help grow
25 small business; not decrease the amount of pedestrian

1
2 traffic and those kinds of things that drives small
3 business.

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, you
5 know, this Administration really, as you know, we're
6 pro small business. But I think one of the nice
7 things in the Mayor's budget is he's trying to ease
8 up on some of the fines and other things that small
9 businesses in New York are struggling with. So we'd
10 be happy to sit down and meet with some business
11 groups, if that would be helpful. Obviously, if
12 there are concerns, I'd like to hear what they are,
13 and see how we could mitigate that.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I think most
15 people agree that the Administration has done a lot
16 for small business. This may just be an under -- And
17 I've articulated as an unintended consequence. So if
18 we could just revisit that, I'd greatly appreciate
19 it.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We would be
21 happy to.

22 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Council
23 Member. We will now have Council Member Gibson
24 followed by Council Member Menchaca.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very
3 much, Madam Chairwoman, and thank your Mr. Chair and
4 good morning. Welcome Commissioner, Deputy
5 Commissioner, Assistant Commissioner. That has a
6 nice ring to it, Jeff. But thank you so much for
7 your presence today, and truly I go to the sentiments
8 of my Bronx colleague in just saying that it's truly
9 refreshing, Commissioner, to work with you. I can
10 attest to all of the incredible work that you've
11 already done, your commitment. And you really have
12 been all over the place. I join with Transportation
13 and all of the Vision Zero Town Halls. We have one
14 later on this month in the Bronx, and certainly a lot
15 of the individual workshops working with many of our
16 colleges. So I guess I just had just three very
17 quick questions, and many of the other issues have
18 already been spoken out. With the Vision Zero
19 implementation and the number of positions you're
20 looking to acquire, do you specifically know what
21 types of positions you're looking for? And also, the
22 workshops that are currently going on, are you
23 looking to continue those so that you continue to get
24 feedback from community residents on further
25 implementation of Vision Zero?

1
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: First of all,
3 and thank you. As I was saying to you the other
4 night, you and I have been to all five boroughs
5 together --

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [interposing]
7 Yes, we have.

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --in Vision
9 Zero Town Halls, and it's been a fascinating
10 experience hearing from such a diverse set of
11 communities all over the city. I've really, really
12 enjoyed it. I'm going to actually -- I'll let the
13 Deputy Commissioner run through the breakdown on the
14 positions. And I would say I think what we're going
15 to do with this first round is the feedback that
16 we've gotten at the town halls and the workshops is
17 boil it down, and really look at where we think the
18 priorities are, and match them with our resources.
19 But I think then at some point fairly soon, we'll
20 want to start a fresh round of those. I mean I want
21 to make sure at some point we digest the first set of
22 information we've got and we put it into action. But
23 this is certainly going to be -- You know, we look
24 at Vision Zero as this is an ongoing initiative --

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [interposing]

3

Right.

4

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: -- that we'll

5

be working on every single year, and public

6

engagement and outreach will always be a part of it.

7

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Thank you,

8

Commissioner. Regarding the positions funded, newly

9

funded for Vision Zero it includes a mix of

10

positions. To answer your question, we do have a very

11

specific list of titles that we need to fill now with

12

this funding. It includes a number of different

13

types of positions for the speed hump crews. We need

14

the highway repair titles that do that work for

15

traffic signal retiming. We have engineer positions

16

the traffic engineer positions that conduct that

17

work. There are some planners, a few other titles

18

for the -- on the outreach side that are more of the

19

community coordinator title. So I mean we can give

20

you a more detailed schedule if you'd like.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, and I also

22

just want to emphasize as well. I know I am a part

23

and have worked with you, and I'm really excited

24

about the arterial slow zones, and the one that was

25

implemented on the Grand Course in the Bronx. And I

1
2 really have to encourage and emphasize the agency to
3 really focus on education. While the signage has
4 started to go up on the Grand Concourse, you really
5 still don't notice it. There are different types of
6 signage, and I know we have a certain model that
7 we're using. But working within the schools, the
8 community board, the local precincts and councils, we
9 really have to embark on a major campaign for people
10 to now understand that the speed limit on certain
11 parts of our streets is no longer 30 but 25 instead.
12 So I certainly encourage you, and certainly will work
13 with you to do that as it relates to the Bronx.

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you, and
15 there is no question that education is a huge part of
16 this, and certainly you're right on very big wide
17 streets like the Grand Concourse, sometimes it is
18 hard to make the signage big enough to pop out.
19 We're going to be using some speed boards that we
20 hope will attract motorists' attention. But we're
21 obviously going to be working closer with NYPD to
22 step up education and enforcement. We know this is
23 going to be an evolution as people adjust to a slower
24 speed limit around the city.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Right, and in
3 addition, I know within Vision Zero we have borough
4 specific plans, and as Council Member Vacca talked
5 about the lack of ferry service and other increased
6 opportunities in terms of access. I would hope that
7 is something that could be a part of the Bronx
8 Borough plan because we recognize every borough has
9 unique challenges and characteristics, and certainly
10 out of those workshops we would get a lot of feedback
11 on that. The other point I wanted to bring up, and
12 you talked about it at the town hall at we had in
13 Hunts Point.

14 Many of the requests that go to your
15 agencies from community boards and elected officials
16 about the different street enhancements, whether it's
17 countdown, crosswalks, speed bumps, reducers,
18 flashing yellow lights, all points stop signs. Many
19 of those while the timeframe does take a long time,
20 but all of them are always approved. Based on
21 certain guidelines the agency has as well as federal
22 guidelines that a lot of our constituents are not
23 aware of.

24 You mentioned in the Bronx that what the
25 agency will now look to do is to start to look in

1
2 advance at some of the requests that were coming in,
3 and how we can maybe go back. Or even before a
4 request comes in, maybe the agency can recognize a
5 dangerous intersection before you get the official
6 request. I think that would make a lot of New
7 Yorkers happy if they see the DOT is ahead of game,
8 and understands that this is a dangerous
9 intersection. God forbid there's ever an accident or
10 an injury at that location.

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: And for the
12 record, we actually -- I guess we do a bit of both,
13 which is as we're taking in requests from community
14 boards, and local citizens and from your offices, we
15 are also pursuing proactively re-engineering a lot of
16 intersections around the city. And we've committed
17 to doing 50 of those this year. But I do think we're
18 in a cycle now that I'm working with the staff to see
19 if we can make easier. Where we're looking at the
20 crash data around the city, and trying to instead of
21 waiting for requests to come in, see if we can be
22 more transparent about here or where we think the
23 priority areas are in the city that we need to focus
24 on. Given the resources we have, and it may raise
25 the question, Well, if we had more resources where

1
2 would we go next? But I agree. I think we can
3 perhaps find a better working model that will be less
4 frustrating for everybody.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Right. Well, I
6 thank you again, and look forward to working with
7 you, and I will see in the Bronx on May 22nd.

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'm looking
9 forward to it.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Council
12 Member. We will now have Council Member Menchaca
13 followed by Council Member Reynoso.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chair
15 Ferreras, and Chair Rodriguez, and welcome
16 Commissioner and staff. I had such a great time
17 yesterday on at the Hamilton Avenue. The plant looks
18 great. The technology is green. We're going to save
19 money, and we're going to recycle our asphalt, and do
20 a lot more. So it's just really great to have you in
21 the district the other day with the Mayor. The
22 question that I had, and what I want to focus on
23 today is just the kind of new funding that you've
24 kind of outlined today focusing on the jobs and the
25 positions for the maintenance and operations of the

1
2 additional 120 speed cameras. When we looked at it,
3 it looked like it was about one, maybe worker,
4 employee to three -- every three cameras. Can you
5 tell us a little bit about the work that they're
6 going to be doing per camera?

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, and I've
8 actually gotten to look at the -- been to Queens and
9 seen the operation. And first, the work of
10 installing and calibrating the cameras, it's
11 significant --

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing]
13 Yeah.

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: -- and time
15 consuming, and it's a significant investment. And
16 then the work of monitoring the violations that come
17 in, and making sure -- Again, I want to emphasize we
18 do careful work. We want to make sure that the
19 cameras are properly calibrated, that the resolution
20 of the photos is accurate, that we're being fair and
21 accurate as we track people who are speeding
22 throughout the city. So it's fairly labor intensive
23 as all the violations come in to look at them, make
24 sure that we're doing accurate work. And then
25 process them with the Department of Finance. And

1
2 sometimes obviously adjudicate where there may be
3 people who think that they didn't deserve the
4 summons, the ticket, so to speak. So it is actually
5 a fairly labor-intensive operation.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thanks for
7 explaining that. This is something that I think kind
8 of came up as started out analyzing the budget.
9 Another part of the budget is the capital dollars
10 connected to the allocation specifically for sidewalk
11 extensions, which really enhance the safety for
12 pedestrians including our seniors, our New Yorkers
13 with disabilities. And they reduce the walking
14 distance, and provide better visibility for the
15 oncoming traffic. It's something that in the
16 district in Sunset Park that I hope we will continue
17 to talk more about. And are they included in part of
18 the capital project plans?

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No, I don't
20 think so. I'm looking over here to Joe. We do have
21 some capital funding for sidewalks. But I also just
22 want to say I think it's an area that we at DOT have
23 started to talk to DDC about. We do a lot of the
24 sidewalk work with them, and I do think there are a
25 lot of challenges there that I want to walk through.

1
2 So that honestly we can speed up the pace of our work
3 and perhaps lower the cost. And I don't know, Joe,
4 if you want to add to that.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Sure. I
6 could just mention that we have funding in the
7 Capital Budget for our school safety program, which
8 has a lot of the sidewalk extension work that you
9 referred to. I was just checking, and I have a few
10 sites in your district, in fact, that should be
11 starting soon with that funding. And so that is
12 definitely in the Capital Budget. We also have in
13 our Expense Budget as part of this new Vision Zero
14 money funding for in-house crews that also do
15 sidewalk extension work. And that's part of our
16 funding that we mentioned there for intersection
17 design is what that is actually accomplishing.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Great. Thank
19 you so much. That's the end of my questions.

20 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very
21 much, Council Member Menchaca. We will have Council
22 Member Reynoso followed by Council Member Crowley.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you,
24 Chair. I appreciate the time. I thank you,
25 Commissioner, and to the staff as well. I just want

1
2 to say that in Williamsburg we are tended to be known
3 for our bikes, and our bike lanes, and the
4 transportation access. So we are not starved as some
5 other parts of the city are. But because of it, we
6 also suffer a lot of fatalities, pedestrian
7 fatalities and bike riding fatalities and crashes.
8 More so than any other part of the city. So we deal
9 with the traffic crashes. So I want to just speak to
10 any pilots or any who really want to be treated as
11 the guinea pig for Vision Zero. Anything that you
12 think might work, apply it in Williamsburg. We'll
13 take it. We really want to make sure that everything
14 starts there, and I call it the Ground Zero for
15 Vision Zero. And I really want to see if you could -
16 - if there is a level of commitment that I can
17 receive from you in attempting to do that.

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No, thank you,
19 and look we are keenly and sadly aware of the high
20 volume of fatalities that you have in your district.
21 And certainly when we're looking at where we're going
22 to some of our Vision Zero work, again because we are
23 trying to be data driven that is an area where we
24 obviously want to have some real intervention. And
25 look, we would be happy to. It's interesting. I was

1
2 just in Staten Island a couple of days ago where we
3 pledged that we would do some new experiments on the
4 roadway resurfacing front. And we'd be happy to do
5 the same with you all in Williamsburg on Vision Zero
6 front. I think we -- You again, we're trying to come
7 up. We have a great team at DOT that has a lot of
8 creative ideas, but that said, if you all have
9 looking at the New York Times we're also talking to
10 folks in Sweden, and we're looking anywhere we can
11 for creative ideas. We'd be happy to work with you
12 on that.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I appreciate
14 that. Speaking on the budget, the Truck Traffic
15 Study I see here, or the Truck Traffic Impact Study
16 where we put \$610,000 last year, is there any way that
17 we could get the outcome of that study, or has it
18 been released? Where can we access it?

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, a good
20 question. I'm wondering if you know. I think we're
21 going to have to check on that one. You certainly
22 should get the results of it as soon as it's ready.
23 I mean I would like to make it public. So let us get
24 back to you on that one.

25

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay, thank you.

3

I also want to speak to street lines, the painting of

4

the street lines, which some folks might not even

5

know it's a thing we do or see. I know that the

6

contract right now is in New Jersey. The contract to

7

do the painting of the lines in the streets comes

8

from a New Jersey based company. I believe its a \$2

9

million contract. I wanted to speak. There is a

10

group or a business working in my district that said

11

they bid on it for \$800,000. So I want to know why

12

it would be outside of New York City, a contract

13

given outside of New York City when the bid -- And

14

they did it in the past as well. So they had

15

experience, and they resubmitted the contractor. So

16

I just want to speak to why it had to leave the city,

17

and why it had an increase from \$800,000 to \$2

18

million. And my numbers might not be perfect, but

19

I'm pretty sure that the New Jersey company is

20

charging more to do it.

21

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'll have to

22

take a look at that. New York City has a pretty

23

complex regime in terms of procurement. So we go

24

through a pretty careful process when we put out some

25

type of a contract to bid and taking bidders, and we

1
2 look at cost and value, et cetera. So let us take a
3 look at the particulars on that one, but in terms of
4 sort of how we award our contracts, it's a pretty
5 prescriptive process. It's not like I can swoop in
6 and pick people or not pick people that I like. It
7 has a lot of very careful safeguards built into it in
8 hopes of getting best value for the City. So let us
9 take a look at that one.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Please look at
11 it because I think we might have -- It could have
12 been one that fell through the cracks.

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Okay.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So we just need
15 to see. I also want to speak to in FY2014 there was
16 an additional \$552,000 inserted for snow removal on
17 overpasses, and it's not seen in the FY2015. Is that
18 -- does that money -- Well, how does snow get
19 removed for FY15, and did it get moved to another
20 agency or who is responsible, and why is it not there
21 for FY15?

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, again, I
23 think now because the agencies are going to sort of
24 sit down, and inform our game plan for what we're
25 going to do next winter. And I think one thing I

1
2 would point out, in the end I think you all know this
3 past winter turned out to be such a difficult one.
4 And the Mayor working with you all did provide the
5 resources that the Department of Sanitation needed
6 and that DOT needed for snow removal and for filling
7 potholes that were the casualty of the winter. So
8 moving forward we're going to sit down and figure out
9 what are the potential scenarios for resources that
10 we need. But I think I can safely say on behalf of
11 the Mayor, we're going to try and make sure if we
12 have another terrible winter the resources will be
13 there to keep the streets and the overpasses clear.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you.

15 Thank you, Chair.

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Council
17 Member Reynoso. We'll have Council Member Crowley
18 followed by Council Member Rose.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Good morning,
20 Commissioner. I'd like to also thank you for the
21 Vision Zero plan. I know that you've already had a
22 number of lines changed just by comparing accidents,
23 well crashes from this year to last year. And
24 there's a significant number in decrease in
25 fatalities. And I'm thrilled that this has been the

1
2 focus of the de Blasio Administration. Because I've
3 been very frustrated the time that I've been in the
4 Council, you know, for five years now.

5 The number one complaint that come into
6 my office are DOT complaints, and they have to do
7 with making our streets safe. And the majority of
8 the letters that go out, go out to our Borough
9 Commissioner with requests for modification, and nine
10 out of ten times or even more than that we're met
11 with there is nothing we can do. About six months
12 ago I had an emergency meeting at a public school on
13 Grand Avenue in Queens, which is next to two other
14 public schools, a high school, an elementary school,
15 and a middle school.

16 Because there was a serious accident on
17 Grand Avenue where four kids were hit by a car that
18 was out of control. And they were seriously injured.
19 One later died. We're not sure if he died directly
20 because of his injuries, but he had an asthma attack.
21 But still to this day, I have yet to get a response
22 from DOT after our emergency meeting. There are no
23 changes that have been suggested about ways that we
24 could modify Grand Avenue, but it's really
25 frustrating.

1
2 Only a few blocks from there a woman was
3 killed in January. So that is definitely a focus of
4 mine. I thought I have hundreds of thousands that
5 are unspent in the DOT budget because I want to make
6 safe routes to school a major focus. But I funded
7 one project that still is not complete early in like
8 2010, around that time. And that project is going to
9 go out to them. But my question is like I appreciate
10 the focus and that you are going to hire more people
11 that are going to work on making the areas in and
12 around schools safer.

13 But what is a realistic timeline that we
14 could work with to make sure that we could implement
15 some serious changes. I'll mention just one avenue
16 that three schools are on, but almost every single
17 one of the schools in my district, and I know many of
18 my colleagues share the same feeling, there is so
19 much we could do, too. How quickly could we start to
20 see changes, and what is a reasonable timeframe? We
21 met six months ago. I know it's a new
22 administration, but what can we communicate to our
23 constituents about the changes that are going to
24 happen?

1
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: First of all,
3 I'm going to make sure that Jeff follows up with your
4 office to see. I mean if there are some areas where
5 we were supposed to get back to you in terms of
6 requests you had, and we haven't let's make sure that
7 nothing is falling through the cracks. I think on
8 the answer of how quickly we can do things, of
9 course, I have to give the answer, Well, it depends.
10 There are certain types of projects that DOT can
11 actually get on the ground very quickly.

12 Let's take for example the Arterial Slow
13 Zone program. We're rolling that one out this
14 summer, half of the roots we're doing that in a few
15 months. For large complex capital projects that may
16 involve other city agencies, and perhaps even federal
17 funding those can take a long time, and I know it can
18 be very frustrating. One of the things that this
19 Administration is really going to try and do, and
20 it's a real priority of mine personally, is to see
21 how we can improve project delivery.

22 Because I hear you. I think some of the
23 projects in the city are taking a very long time,
24 particularly when many agencies and funding sources
25 are involved, and there are a lot of challenging

1
2 issues there. But I really think we need to work
3 through them because your constituents aren't getting
4 the projects that they're expecting. It makes them,
5 as you say, it makes them unhappy, and we're not
6 getting good value --

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing]

8 But they do get worried.

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: -- for
10 taxpayer dollars. So, we're keen to see if we can
11 speed things up, but, you know, our --

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: And another
13 example is like a bridge in my district 15 years ago
14 we were told that it was in the capital budget, and
15 things were going to happen, and the chair kept
16 getting cut off. And it was supposed to start
17 construction in this fiscal year, but it's been put
18 off another. The plans we recently see are not in my
19 opinion are not good, no did the community board
20 approved of the plans because it takes away --
21 Underneath the bridge is the Long Island Railroad.
22 It takes away the opportunity for that railroad ever
23 to become a commuter rail again. Right now freight
24 is moving on that. But the bridge actually has a
25 gaping hole in it that, you know, just a barrier is

1
2 covering it so people don't walk in that area. Our
3 president yesterday it's terrible. You don't need to
4 be an engineer to know that something is not safe,
5 but when you could see holes and look down at what's
6 happening underneath, it's scary.

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Which bridge
8 is it?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: It's Fresh Pond
10 Road and Metropolitan Avenue, and a lot of trucks
11 pass that route. And you know, just -- My last
12 question is the truck route map. We've been able to
13 make changes on making sure that certain streets are
14 not through streets for truck traffic, but the maps
15 are not reflecting that. And those are changes that
16 we made over two years ago, and we're going on three
17 years. And when trucks are violating the law, we may
18 get police officers to penalize them, and ticket
19 them. But when they go to the judge, they often get
20 the tickets dismissed because the maps don't reflect
21 the changes. And so, if I can make a request to do
22 whatever you can to speed up the process of
23 developing new maps, it would be helpful to the truck
24 traffic that is happening in Queens.

1
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I certainly
3 want to take a look at the maps, and I don't know if
4 Jarrin has something on the bridge.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Regarding
6 Fresh Pond Road, and it is one of our most important
7 projects for the coming year and we're working
8 through the design issues still, and we do still need
9 to get the State approval for the -- DDC's [sic]
10 approval before we can complete the designs. I know
11 there have been some delays on that project, but
12 we'll check it through.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing] I
14 know it was a hot topic at the Community Board last
15 night just that they are not happy with the current
16 plan because it takes away two of the tracks that are
17 underneath it that are Long Island Railroad tracks.
18 And at one time that was a stop on the Long Island
19 Railroad. As more and more people are moving to
20 Ridgewood and Maspeth, the Community Board would like
21 to get that commuter train as well going in the
22 future. So they certainly don't want the current
23 plan to move forward.

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, let us
25 follow up with you on that because that sounds like

1 something pretty significant and we want to make sure
2 we learn more about it.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, and
6 Commissioner I know that almost or a significant
7 portion of your Capital Plan Budget is on bridge
8 repair. And in the past we've had the conversations
9 of ratings of good, poor. So as you are looking over
10 all of our city bridges, are we getting bridges that
11 are poor to fair, fair to good? What is your vision
12 in repairing our bridges, and what's taking priority?

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean we have
14 a --the State does bridge inspections, and has a
15 rating system. Look, our goal is to keep all bridge
16 in -- get them to good if we can. Right now actually
17 the -- our inventory is in very good condition, but
18 we have a number of bridges that are going to -- the
19 State is potentially in the next few years going to
20 downgrade to poor. We are trying to figure out how
21 we best prioritize bridges, looking at those that are
22 going to fall into a poor condition, as well as
23 looking at which bridges are most central to commerce
24 usage, et cetera. And I think as I mentioned in my
25 testimony, this is a huge area of importance and

1
2 focus for this Administration. And as part of our
3 OMB exercise, we're going to go through this year on
4 the ten-year capital plan; bridges and bridge
5 conditions, and how we invest in bridges, and how we
6 deliver bridge projects in a timely way is going to
7 be a very important piece of what we're going to take
8 a look at. It's a big challenge. I won't deny it.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: I appreciate it,
10 and if you would be able to share any type of
11 breakdown that you have with the ratings, and what
12 the priorities are with this committee, I would
13 greatly appreciate it.

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I think
15 we've potentially brought -- we brought something on
16 for you all in anticipation of this question.

17 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Oh, that would be
18 great. So, if you get that to me --

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
20 Yeah.

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: --we can share
22 that with the colleagues -- my colleagues on both
23 committees. And now we will have Council Member Rose
24 followed by Council Member Cumbo.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you, Madam
3 Chair. And I'm going to dispense with any rambling
4 soliloquy, but I want to start with several thank
5 you. I want to thank you so much for coming to State
6 Island, meeting with the elected officials, and
7 working out some plans. Especially the fact that you
8 are going to give us a list of the mapped streets for
9 paving and that we will be able to have some input on
10 that. And I want to especially thank you for making
11 sure that the speed humps around schools would be an
12 investment that's going to be made. As the prime
13 sponsor, I found that that is very important to the
14 safety of our students.

15 And as the district that's going to have
16 the first waterfront pedestrian plaza, I wanted to
17 say thank you. And with that, having grown up on an
18 island all my life, ferry service is very important
19 to me. So in the Executive Plan, which includes
20 \$357.7 million including the \$333 million for the
21 reconstruction and replacement of ferry boats at the
22 Staten Island Ferry and Ferry Terminal facilities
23 improvements, do you have a timeline for the letting
24 of these contracts, or when the new votes will
25 actually begin be put into passenger service?

1
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, you
3 know, I think I do have a timeline. Yeah, right now
4 we're looking at the design, we're pressed for
5 proposals, and I think we're hoping to register it in
6 August of this year, is that correct? We think the
7 design -- As you know, this is going to be a big
8 project, and we're looking really to make safe,
9 state-of-the-art, environmentally friendly very
10 modern ferries. So that's actually going to take a
11 year or two to complete, and then a couple more years
12 after that before passenger service can start. So
13 we're looking at timeline probably around 2019 when
14 everything is said and done. It's a long timeline,
15 but this is a big -- this is a big important project,
16 as you know.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Do you think that
18 there are going to be at least online in time to deal
19 with the increased capacity that we're expecting with
20 the North Shore Development Projects?

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I sure
22 hope they can help with that development. I think
23 we'll have to see how quickly that happens, and how
24 quickly we get through our design and procurement
25 process, and work out all the funding issues. But,

1
2 look, we're keenly aware of how much new traffic that
3 development is going to generate, and how important
4 it is in your district and for all of Staten Island.
5 So we're very mindful of that as we get this process
6 underway.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And we are -- we
8 are also looking simultaneously at the training and
9 certification for the ferry captains and assistants
10 that will -- So that everything will be online at
11 the same time.

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: That is
13 certainly our intention, yes. There are a lot of
14 moving parts to this, so to speak, but yeah that is
15 our -- That's how we're hoping this is all going to
16 work out.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And do the Staten
18 Island Ferry figures include the increase for the
19 24/7 30-minute ferry service? I want to thank you
20 that we went into the weekend 30-minute ferry
21 service, but does the budget include the 24/7?

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No, it
23 provides funds for us to study how we would do that,
24 what would be the most cost-effective way to do that.
25 The estimate right now is to provide that additional

1
2 service, would require extra crews, extra boats, and
3 potentially cost around \$8 million. So the budget
4 tasks us with looking more deeply into that and
5 seeing what could be the smartest ways to do that in
6 a way that's cost-effect. And obviously, we'll be
7 working closely with the Staten Island Delegation on
8 that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Commissioner, is
10 there a timeline for this study? Because we've been
11 inundated with studies, and not seen results. So is
12 there a timeline for the completion of this study?

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: You know, I
14 mean I can't give you the timeline yet because I'm
15 still waiting for the budget to pass. But as soon as
16 it does, we're already starting to talk internally
17 about how we would do the study, who would do it, and
18 what would be the timeline. But I don't want to --
19 let me give you a better answer to that when we've
20 had a little more time to refine exactly what the
21 process is going to look like.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, so you're
23 going to give the answer to maybe the duration of the
24 study?

25 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Okay.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And the other -- my
3 other obsession has been with countdown clocks, and
4 accessible pedestrian signals. I think they're very
5 important to Vision Zero, and the success and safety
6 of our pedestrians. Could you tell me what your plan
7 is? I know what the plan is for countdown clocks,
8 but could you tell me why members have to allocate
9 funds for these clocks? Why hasn't more money been
10 allocated in the budget for countdown clocks seeing
11 how important they are, and accessible pedestrian
12 signals.

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, and I'm
14 going to give a quick answer on that, but then I
15 think turn it over also to Deputy Commissioner
16 Jarrin. I mean I guess the best answer I can give
17 you is the budget up until now, they are balancing a
18 lot of different needs and priorities. And I think
19 given all the things we hear about all over the city
20 that people want from resurfacing roads to speed
21 humps to what are we going to do about things like
22 Select Bus Service. You name it. I mean obviously,
23 we have a lot of competing needs, and a lot of
24 important priorities. I know -- I think in terms of
25

1
2 we had some good news on pedestrian signals, did we
3 not on audible pedestrian signals?

4 [background conversation]

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Well, for
6 pedestrian countdown signals, I know we're moving
7 forward with a -- we've got contracting pretty far
8 along now with the pedestrian countdown signals.
9 We've gotten bids in place, and we should be ready to
10 start that work fairly soon for the pedestrian
11 signals, which is a very key part of our Safety
12 Program. I know in particular -- You're asking I
13 think also about the bus countdown clocks, right?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yes, and the
15 accessible pedestrian signals, are they audible for
16 people with handicaps?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Yes, we are
18 definitely planning to move forward with that program
19 as part of our signal contract already. So, I think
20 what -- if there was an interest from the Council to
21 participate in the funding for that, that would be
22 welcome. But we are moving forward with that program
23 regardless. We know it's an important program to
24 move forward with.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So it is a line
3 item in the budget?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: For the
5 audible signals --

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: The audible --

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: -- it's
8 already part of our -- and accessible signals, it's
9 part of our baseline budget, yeah.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: I just want to
12 urge my colleagues that everyone is in the queue, and
13 we have about six members left. We've been joined by
14 Council Member Greenfield. We are supposed to be
15 starting MTA in three minutes. So if you can make
16 your statement -- your questions a little more
17 concise so that we could get everybody through, I'd
18 greatly appreciate it. We're going to have Council
19 Member Cumbo followed by Council Member Johnson.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Madam
21 hair, I won't take any offense to the fact that the
22 speed up always comes before my questions, but that's
23 fine. I'm getting the answer quickly. Commissioner
24 Trottenberg, I'm so happy to have you here, and as
25 Chair of the Women's Issues Committee it is so

1
2 exciting to see a dynamic woman in charge of this
3 dynamic agency. And you've got some dynamic deputies
4 on ether side, which is pretty incredible.

5 And I also want to give kudos to you
6 because you have made me and my district feel so
7 absolutely special in terms of listening to what the
8 challenges were of the district and responding very
9 quickly. And that's a gift because you made all of
10 us seem quite so special when I thought it was just
11 me. I want to go right into my questions. I want to
12 just reiterate what Council Member Vacca spoke about,
13 the speed bumps, and their implementation are
14 critical to me and to my district.

15 It's probably the number one issue that
16 comes up in our district in terms of what people want
17 to see. I also wanted to talk about signage, and
18 wanted to know -- I didn't see it in the budget
19 specifically. It was brought up by Council Member
20 Vanessa Gibson in terms of is there a capital line
21 item for the signage to be implemented in any great
22 and meaningful way this year? And also wanting to
23 know what is the average cost of the implementation
24 of the slow zone, and what all comes in the package
25 of a slow zone.

1
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Let me --
3 maybe he can dig up the number on the signage. I
4 will talk a bit about the slow zones. It turns out
5 it costs a little more than you would think. The
6 cost of installing speed humps in New York City at
7 the moment is somewhere around \$12,000, which is
8 high, and kind of looking into why and putting up the
9 sign. So slow zones can cost I think 150, \$200,000
10 to implement. And again, as you read -- if you go to
11 resurface the road, you have to -- you take off the
12 speed humps and then you have to reinstall them.

13 The parameters of the slow zone, the
14 neighborhood Slow Zone Program has been really to
15 look at areas that are tied to crash thing. And I
16 think one thing I'm discovering as we dig into it, is
17 there are neighborhoods where there is a big desire
18 to slow down traffic. That may not be the highest
19 crash prone areas of the city. And I want to try and
20 make sure that as neighborhoods come to us with
21 things they want to do, that it's matching well with
22 the particular program or request.

23 I think that's one of the other sources
24 of frustration. I want to make sure that when
25 neighborhoods come to us asking for things they

1
2 really want, that they're coming to us asking for
3 things that it makes sense for us to provide given
4 crash rates around the neighborhood and given
5 resource constraints. So I hear that from all of
6 you, and it's an area -- You know, it's not an area
7 we're going to fix overnight, but it's something that
8 we're really taking a look at.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So does it come
10 with in many ways -- does it come with a certain
11 amount on average of speed bumps? Does it come with
12 a certain amount of cameras? Does it come with a
13 certain amount of street improvements, a certain
14 amount of all these different kinds of things? Is
15 there like a general package that comes with it so we
16 can articulate that to our districts?

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I mean
18 we -- I think that the principle behind the slow zone
19 is just sort of an area of -- it's a square area --

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Of signage, right?

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: -- of four to
22 five blocks depending. Some have been bigger than
23 that. You want to put in speed humps at appropriate
24 spots, put up the signage, paint the markings. And
25 one thing that I know can be a source of frustration

1
2 is if the route is one that's used by buses or
3 emergency vehicles, that can really be a problem for
4 putting in speed humps. For the slow zones we also
5 try and look at neighborhoods that you sort have a
6 defined area that makes sense to send a message to
7 drivers this is an area where you slow down.

8 And I think there's been some confusion
9 about how that works around the city. So moving
10 forward, we're going to try -- Again, I think of
11 doing a good job of working closely with communities
12 on what exactly are the problems they're trying to
13 solve. In some cases it may be with the neighborhood
14 Slow Zone Program makes sense, but I think in some
15 areas even though that's what people think is going
16 to make sense, it may not be the right solution.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: How many do you
18 anticipate will be implemented by the close of 2014?
19 How many slow zones will be completed?

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, the
21 program is doing eight slow zones a year. So that's
22 the other thing is I think there's a hope and an
23 expectation that we're doing them all over the city,
24 but we're doing eight a year, not that many. And I
25 think now we have selected through the end of FY15

1
2 the -- We've already selected those slow zones. So
3 starting some time next year, we're going to figure
4 out how the program works. And I would just say that
5 if it turns out that we meet with success in Albany
6 in terms of getting a change in the citywide speed
7 limit, that may very much change the way we're doing
8 some of these programs, the slow zones, or the
9 arterial slow zones. So if we meet with success up
10 there, that may also require DOT to take a fresh look
11 at some of these programs and adjust them as needed.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
13 Now we have Council Member --

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I just want to ask
15 just one more very quick question.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sure.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Will it also
18 include on Eastern Parkway and Schenectady, they have
19 put in a request for gates. Will gates in terms of
20 on the parkways, or some of them also be included in
21 the capital process as well.

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: That's
23 interesting. The first I heard of gates.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Do you understand
25 what I'm referring to?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: They're like gates that you put on the major thoroughfares to block people let's say coming out of the train station. Let's say Eastern Parkway from crossing in the middle of the block. They can no longer --

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]

Oh, you mean pedestrian gates?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Yes, I do.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Oh, okay.

Yeah, I think that when we look at different intersections we consider a whole bunch of remedies, and I think we've used gates in some places. I don't know if you have any more on that.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: I'm sorry.

We'll have to check. That's probably the plan for Eastern Parkway, but I'm not sure. I think they're reviewing a lot of options.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay, thank you.

CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks and we will stay only with the five minutes because the MTA is already here. So we're already running late. Council Member Johnson following by -- with Karen

1
2 Rosenthal, and I'd like to recognize Council Member
3 Constantinides.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I'm going to go
5 fast. It's good to see you this morning. I have a
6 lot of questions. This marks the one-year
7 anniversary of Citi Bike, a hugely successful
8 program. Seven million trips or more than that.
9 You've been very frank about the financial situation
10 that Citi Bike is in with the operator. I know
11 you've said that they need to come up with a
12 solution, and the City doesn't want to it to go away
13 -- doesn't want to see it go away. We actually I
14 think want to see it expand. I would love to hear if
15 there's an update from DOT's end. What are the
16 options? What could the Council be doing in this
17 budget cycle, if anything, on Citi Bike to make sure
18 it continues to succeed?

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, thank
20 you, and by the way, 8.3 million trips. That's the
21 right number.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: [interposing]
23 8.3 million?

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: It has been a
25 huge successful.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: The population
3 of New York.

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I know.

5 It's been a remarkable success. People love it, and
6 we are very committed to make sure not only that the
7 operation continues, but that we strengthen it that
8 it provides a better service, and that we can expand
9 it to other parts of the city. You have heard me
10 talk about this topic before. I think there has been
11 some --there's been some news in the press about
12 this. We are in negotiations with Alta, the company
13 that has the City contract. They are looking at
14 getting investors. They're looking at improving
15 their operations, frankly having a stronger operation
16 here in the city, which I think is tremendously
17 important.

18 Alta is a company that's based in
19 Portland, Oregon, and their management is kind of
20 scattered around the United States. So we're looking
21 at all those things to try and strengthen the
22 operation, and I'm hoping -- I know there's been a
23 lot of interest in the Council, and members who are
24 potentially interested in investing some of their
25 funds in additional stations. I'm hoping that very

1
2 soon we can have a real -- a more substantive update
3 for you. But at the moment, we're still in a state
4 of ongoing negotiations. Although, I think I'm
5 hopeful that we're going to have some good news to
6 announce.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I would just add
8 that as those conversations occur, there are ways
9 they need to improve with certain bike stands, with
10 getting refills of bikes and stations that are used
11 frequently. So I hope that expectation is
12 communicated to them.

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Absolutely.
14 It is front and center to our discussions with them
15 that we need to have software fixes, improve the
16 rebalancing of the bikes, improve the service
17 overall. And there's recognition that needs to
18 happen. They're a start-up venture in New York City,
19 and I think it has been wildly successful, but the
20 challenges of operating in New York City are
21 significant, and Hurricane Sandy was an unexpected
22 blow to the company. I think they understand they're
23 going to need to up the game going forward.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you.
25 People have mentioned speed humps. I hear the

1
2 message: We want them. The same with slow zones
3 especially around schools. I have a request into the
4 borough office on some of these issues in my
5 district. I look forward to working with you. I
6 have a very good relationship with the Borough
7 Commissioner Margaret Forgione, and I want to thank
8 her for her responsiveness.

9 I have a question on the contract that's
10 existed for a long time with regard to Cemusa the bus
11 shelters, the newsstands, the bike parking stands
12 that have existed on sidewalks. And then, there are
13 conversations that talk about the location of public
14 bathrooms in places. How do you feel that like the
15 company has done thus far? How has the revenue been
16 through the city? Are we seeing that the newsstands
17 are actually generating revenue in a real way? I'd
18 just like to hear an update overall this elusive
19 contract, given that it really did change the
20 streetscape in many ways with them coming into the
21 city.

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I'm
23 going to -- I'll ask Joe to comment. My sense is
24 that the City is relatively pleased with the
25 contract, and the level of service has been good, and

1
2 the revenues have met our projections. One thing I'm
3 certainly interested in is getting the rest of the
4 bathrooms -- the public bathrooms that were in the
5 contract up and built, and have actually asked our
6 team at DOT to figure out how we expedite that. But
7 that is on us to mete that out.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: We'll take one
9 in my district.

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, I think
11 we're as a -- Of course, we discovered like
12 everything in New York it turned out it was more
13 complicated to slate the bathrooms as we would have
14 hope. You need an ability to hook up to a water
15 system. But I am -- I think we really need to get
16 that done, and it's something we want to focus on. I
17 don't know if you have more comments on the contract.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: No, just
19 what the Commissioner mentioned, and that we did --
20 we're happy we brought in the \$46.9 million in
21 revenue last year through the Cemusa Contract. We
22 expect to meet that again this year, if not exceed.
23 So that's where we are.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Great, and in my
25 final 30 seconds I just want to say I know there has

1
2 been -- and I know you coordinate quite frequently
3 with the MTA with New York City Transit on the type
4 of work that they're doing. In my district on the
5 West Side I think I have more Port Authority
6 facilities than maybe any other district. In the
7 city is the Mulholland Tunnel, the Lincoln Tunnel,
8 the Port Authority Bus Terminal. We're going to have
9 Hudson Yard. It's 17 million new square feet of
10 development, and expansion of jobs, New Moynihan
11 Station. All of these massive projects going on at
12 once. There is disruption as these go on, and I know
13 there's work that's done, but I think it would be
14 very helpful just to ensure that there is pretty
15 frequent smart coordination between DOT--

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
17 With the Port Authority.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: -- with the Port
19 Authority as well given how massive and important
20 these projects are, and the impact they have on the
21 local community.

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you,
24 sir.

1
2 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Now, before
3 Weprin has a question, Council Member Daniel
4 Garodnick [sic] has one question.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you, Mr.
6 Chairman. Commissioner, just very quickly. I noted
7 that there is \$21.3 million in new funding for the
8 Vision Zero Initiative, and it reads that that is
9 all, those are new dollars that have not previously
10 been allocated within the DOT's budget. Is that
11 right?

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Correct, yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [interposing]
14 Okay.

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Actually, the
16 number is bigger than that. The number is -- is --

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [interposing]
18 The total of the revenue budget is \$28.8 million, is
19 that -- ?

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, the
21 total is 52 divided between capital and expense
22 dollars?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Oh, I see,
24 okay. So I'm -- I think I'm looking down at the
25 expense dollars only.

1
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, you're
3 looking at the expense.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing]
5 Okay, so we're talking about just the expense
6 dollars, 21 new for Vision Zero, 28 total. And my
7 one question: The \$7 million that are not in the
8 DOT's budget that are attributable towards Vision
9 Zero, where are they? And are those new dollars, or
10 have they been reallocated from another place -- yet
11 another place in the spectrum?

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'm not sure I
13 know which -- Well, maybe Joe can jump in. Which
14 seven are you referring to.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Well, you
16 cited \$21 million in new funding in the DOT budget
17 for Vision Zero, but a total of \$28 million in the
18 entire Executive Budget for Vision Zero, is that not
19 correct?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: I'm sorry --

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
22 Maybe I just don't understand here.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: -- what's
24 the number? I'm not sure what you're referring --
25 but I can tell you this, we have \$28 million of new

1
2 Vision Zero money in our budget if you add the speed
3 camera money in there. So that may be explaining
4 what --

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [interposing]

6 And it's all in the DOT?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: It's all in
8 the DOT.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay, thank
10 you.

11 [Pause]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: I want to point
13 out that was three questions in the end, maybe more.
14 Commissioner, it's good to be here. I want to
15 welcome the Assistant Commissioner as well. It's
16 good to see you, Jeff. It must be a pleasure getting
17 away from your old boss. That's nice. I know he's
18 left, but I want to follow up on something the old
19 boss said, and do a little out-of-borough discussion.
20 Because I know there were some questions before about
21 Administrative Code 19-152 on Sidewalk Repairs, but
22 that's always been a sticking point with areas like
23 mine, Daneek Miller's, Jimmy Vacca's, the other
24 places.

1
2 The way the question was asked me sound
3 like, Oh, have these people paid back their fines?
4 Very often these people, and we get this complaint
5 all the time, are homeowners who through no fault of
6 their own all of a sudden their sidewalks come up
7 because the roots of trees have brought them up, city
8 trees, by the way, and we get this complaint a lot.
9 And they get hit with a violation and then have to
10 pay thousands of dollars to replace their sidewalk,
11 and they always go very -- get very angry about that.
12 And I was just curious because hearing it, I said,
13 This is something that needs to be dealt with.

14 I know DEP a couple of years ago did the
15 Water and Sewer Service Line Protection Program,
16 which is like an insurance policy where you pay a
17 certain amount of money in order to protect you in
18 case your water or sewer line breaks. And that's a
19 much more expensive outlay, and I thought it was a
20 great program, and most of my homeowners have gotten
21 a part of that program. I wonder if there's any --
22 anybody has looked at the idea of coming up with a
23 very small amount of money that homeowners could pay
24 in order to protect the sidewalk repairs.

1
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: That's a good
3 question. Certainly, you are right. We hear a lot
4 from folks in Queens, and just for the record, if
5 it's a City tree that's affecting the sidewalk the
6 homeowner get a notice that there's a violation. But
7 they don't have to pay. The City actually does do
8 the repairs. That's said, I think I agree. I'm just
9 starting to learn the intricacies of how the Sidewalk
10 Program works. It is complicated. I think it's
11 confusing for homeowners. There might be some
12 smarter ways to do it. I mean in a lot of cases the
13 City does the repairs, and bills them. Sometimes
14 they do the repairs. Sometimes the repairs don't
15 happen. So, look, I think we're open to if there's a
16 smarter way to go for sure. We certainly would be
17 interested in taking a look at that.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: The Trees and
19 Sidewalks Program is really underfunded, and what
20 happens is that the sidewalk becomes a hazing and it
21 could take years for the City to fix it under the old
22 administration, of course, but years to fix it. And
23 then homeowners sometimes do it themselves and get
24 stuck with that cost. But anyway, be that as it may.
25 Let me ask a couple other questions. I don't know if

1
2 it's come up today, but Citi Bike, I don't know what
3 the latest is on Citi Bike. We had read that they
4 were having problems financially and all that. I'm
5 just curious as far as where that program goes.

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]

7 Yeah, I just did a quick update on that. On the one
8 hand Citi Bike has been a tremendous success here in
9 the city, as I just noticed 8.3 million rides so far,
10 which is really an incredible number. As I testified
11 before, and some of you heard me speak about it,
12 certainly the operation has faced some financial
13 challenges over this winter. We are in discussions
14 with them right now about how they can get a capital
15 infusion, improve the operation, and hopefully
16 ultimately expand to other parts of the city.

17 We know there's a real interest in seeing
18 Citi Bike go into the other boroughs, go further up
19 into Manhattan. So I'm hoping that we can have news
20 on that very soon, but right now we are still in the
21 negotiation stages. But I think a lot of the
22 discussion is happening, and I'm really hoping we can
23 come back to you all with a good proposal.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Okay, just a
25 couple quick ones. Speed cameras, when they do go

1
2 in, how will the sites for those speed cameras be
3 determined.

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, as you
5 probably know, the legislation in Albany once the
6 governor signs it has some pretty specific
7 requirements for us about how we install the cameras.
8 They need to be on roads adjacent to schools. They
9 can only be implemented during school hours. So we
10 will have a survey of all the possible sites in the
11 city, and then it will be mainly data driven. We
12 will be looking in areas where the crash data tells
13 us we ought to install the cameras.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Will there be
15 signage warning of the speed cameras or we're just
16 going to leave them?

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, for the
18 -- I know that's been a real concern that we have
19 signage, and it's interesting again in talking to
20 some of our counterparts in Sweden. They take a very
21 different approach. They use a lot of cameras, and
22 they put signs up. We're going to look at putting up
23 more signs, but also perhaps using the signs to our
24 benefit, which is having signs that might say "This
25

1
2 school maybe monitored by a speed camera" so that we
3 can get more bang for the buck.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Right.

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: But we are
6 sensitive tot hat issue, and as I've said before, we
7 really want to use these cameras to slow people down.
8 If we slowed everyone down, and the City collected no
9 revenue, that would -- I would consider that a
10 victory.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Yeah, I think
12 that's a good compromise having signs that are dummy
13 signs, too. Only because it's a -- You want to be
14 able to not look like you're just doing it to raise
15 revenue, and to prove that, say, Hey, you've got to
16 slow down here, or there's a red light camera or
17 whatever it is. On the other hand, you don't want
18 people just slowing down, or just stopping at red
19 lights when they see the sign.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Correct, and
21 that's exactly the dilemma. So we're looking at
22 creative ways, again to enhance the value of the
23 cameras that we've got to keep there, and not make
24 people feel that we're using them to nail them, so to
25 speak, which is not our intention.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Okay, I hear the
3 bell. So I just want to -- I want to thank you all
4 for the work that you've been doing on Vision Zero.
5 The strength of those families that lost loved ones
6 has been incredible, and has been an inspiration to
7 me. And I look forward to working with you to try to
8 save lives as well. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Council
10 Member Weprin. Just a time check for the committee
11 members. We are now about 17 minutes behind. So if
12 you can take into consideration, and not use all five
13 of the minutes, we would really appreciate it, I
14 would really appreciate it. Council Member Rosenthal
15 followed by Council Member Levin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.
17 This will be really quick. I have three quick
18 questions. I appreciate that, and Council Member
19 Ferreras and Council Member Rodriguez, thank you so
20 much and to the Finance staff for helping us prepare
21 for this hearing. Commissioner, it's great to see
22 you, and thank you, as Carlos said just a moment ago,
23 thank you for coming to my district the other day for
24 part of the kickoff with Vision Zero. We have high
25 hopes for that intersection, and I really appreciate

1
2 the effort that DOT has put in there. I have three
3 quick sort of random questions. One is do you have
4 just internally, and understand -- a number
5 understanding of which bikes lanes are on residential
6 streets, and which are on commercial streets? Do you
7 have a sense of that breakdown there?

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'm sure we
9 have that inventory. I don't -- I can't say I have
10 that number off the top of my head. I don't know if
11 my colleagues do.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah, if you
13 would --

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: It's something
15 we'll probably have to get back to you on.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: It would be
17 interesting to see. I -- you know, we have just as
18 Council Member Cornegy was talking about with the
19 commercial -- the bike lanes around the commercial
20 route streets, it's challenged in my district, too.
21 And, you know, this is just for me, one of those
22 situations where it always comes back to bite you. I
23 pushed very hard for a bike lane on Columbus Avenue,
24 which is a main commercial thoroughfare, and now I'm
25 somewhat regretting that we didn't do it on West End

1
2 Avenue. So, it's something I'd be interested in sort
3 of watching for the next few years, and I wanted to
4 put that on your radar. Secondly, in terms of this -

5 -

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]

7 We will get you those numbers.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great. In
9 terms of sidewalk repairs, which I know Council
10 Member Rodriguez talked about, would it be possible
11 for you to give us the information on sidewalk
12 repairs by district? I'm interested in going after
13 those properties in my district that have not done
14 the repairs, and where DOT has gone back and maybe
15 done the repairs themselves, and are now trying to
16 bill them. Or people have just not done the repairs,
17 and I'd like to get more active in going after those
18 property owners.

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I think
20 that's a great idea, and as I was saying before,
21 we're really open to see what we can do on the
22 sidewalk fund. It is a big area of concern, and I
23 think all of us want to see if we can pick up the
24 pace and improve the safety and quality of the city
25 sidewalks while making sure we're treating homeowners

1
2 fairly and not scaring them with notices. So I think
3 there's a lot of room for improvement --

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
5 Great, and you think --

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: -- and working
7 with all of you on that.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So you think
9 we could get that by district or just my district?

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, I don't
11 know. Let's see if we can get it by district --

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great.

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: -- and then
14 see what we can do.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thanks. I
16 appreciate that. And lastly, and this is a little
17 bit out of context. But for all the bridge repair
18 work that you're going to be doing coming up, which
19 is really terrific, I know this city has -- I think
20 DOT has a mix of bridge painters that are on staff,
21 and those that are contracted out because it can
22 often be seasonal work. Is this an opportunity with
23 the New Friends Community bring back more bridge
24 workers that DOT would hire directly?

1
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: That's a good
3 question. I don't know if maybe you could give an
4 answer on that one.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: I can tell
6 you, Council Member, that there's always been a good
7 mix between the two. The contract painters, though,
8 I really focusing more on capital type painting that
9 the in-house workforce, the Bridges Division has
10 typically not conducted. So it's not exactly
11 something that can be transferred as easily. I know
12 we have had budget reductions to the in-house
13 painters because that there's a seasonality to that
14 work. In the winter there is not enough for them to
15 do. I know there have been suggestions that we
16 should have them do the capital work But the capital
17 work is a very different type of painting. But I
18 know this is a new issue that we can discuss, if
19 you'd like.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So is the new
21 work coming on going to be Bridge or Capital?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Well, it's -
23 -

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I don't quite
25 know what capital means.

1
2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Capital
3 painting means it's longer term protective coating.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: It's not
6 just paint. It's actually more involved. It's
7 removing old paint and showing that there is no
8 contamination. It's a much more involved project.
9 It's capitally funded in the capital budget for that
10 reason.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Sure. So the
12 new bridge work that's going to be done with the new
13 money?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Most of the
15 new money is actually specific to bridge painting.
16 It's actually for bridge reconstruction that we've
17 been newly funded over \$300 million to do major
18 rehabilitation and reconstruction on a number of
19 bridges. Some portion of that will be for protective
20 coating, but it's really premised more on major
21 rehab.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Would you
23 consider for the protective coating piece hiring more
24 bridge workers in-house?

1
2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: That's what
3 -- I mean we would certainly consider whatever would
4 be appropriate. I think in this case that the actual
5 work we do for capital protective coating is not
6 something we conduct in-house. It's actually
7 something that we require contracts to perform. It's
8 much more involved and is done in collaboration with
9 other rehab work that is being done on the bridge.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That's
11 helpful. If you could get back to me on that because
12 I'm concerned. I think it was 120 FTEs going south.
13 So that's something like you said -- I'm sure I have
14 the number wrong. Thank you very much.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Council
16 Member. We've been joined by Council Members Lander
17 and Constantinides, and we'll have questioning from
18 Council Member Levin followed by Council Member
19 Miller.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
21 much, Madam Chair. Thank you Commissioner. I want
22 to add my voice to the chorus here of praise and
23 appreciation for the spirit in which you've taken the
24 helm over at DOT, and bringing us all around the
25 table. And being so responsible to concerns that we

1
2 have had, and for reacting quickly in unfortunately
3 doing things that we didn't think could be done
4 before. In particular around the Arterial Slow Zones
5 or arterial speed limit at McGuinness Boulevard and
6 Atlantic Avenue. That is going to have a major
7 impact, and I know my constituents feel that DOT is
8 being responsive.

9 I want to ask a couple questions with
10 regard to -- I know a couple questions have been
11 asked about this already, but with regard to Citi
12 Bike and expansion. In my district we're faced this
13 summer with the situation in Greenpoint where the
14 main mode of public transportation, which is the G-
15 Train at Greenpoint Avenue is going to be going
16 offline for a few months for repairs due to damage
17 during Sandy. So that's the one train station for
18 all of Northern Greenpoint, the northern half of
19 Greenpoint. In addition, right now that -- and
20 hopefully this will be fixed -- But that ferry
21 landing that had some structural problems over the
22 winter has yet to be repaired.

23 We'll hopeful that it will be repaired by
24 the time the G-Train Station goes down for repair,
25 but we're looking at the possibility of having no

1
2 transportation, public transportation options in most
3 of the neighborhood. Is there -- are we looking. I
4 know that's a neighborhood that's supposed to be in
5 the next phase of Citi Bike expansion. Are we
6 looking at -- are all options on the table right now
7 in terms of whether there could be public financing
8 for Citi Bike, and whether there could be matchers or
9 how we're working with private industry so that it's
10 -- I know that it's all branded Citi Bike at this
11 point.

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I mean
13 look we know that this Greenpoint issue is a serious
14 one this summer. I mean the last that I had heard
15 the ferry dock was going to be finished before the G-
16 Train went down. I hope that's true. And we have
17 been talking about what we might be able to do, at
18 least improve bike service and availability in the
19 area. And that's something actually probably we
20 should sit down and talk about in more detail in
21 terms of where we are on Citi Bike. And how Council
22 Members might be able to pitch in because I know this
23 is a huge, huge issue in your district. And we can't
24 have your district with no transportation options
25 this summer.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Right.

3

4

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: That would not
be a good outcome. So let us try and figure that out
with you. I do know it's a pretty pressing issue.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Right, right, okay

because time is tight. So we probably have about a
month to figure it out. But it would be great to --
From our end we'd be willing to play a role in that.

But I think in looking towards how to expand the
service and go into neighborhoods where it could be
well utilized, where there is great demand for it, it
would be great to have some public support for it.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I wanted to, and
this may have been addressed. You spoke about it in
your testimony, and it may have been addressed in
subsequent questions, but the situation with Design-
Build capabilities for DOT, that's -- that requires a
State law change. Where is that standing in terms of
this session right now in Albany. Is the City up
there making the case for such a law change? Does it
have sponsors in the Senate and Assembly?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, the City
is certainly making the case, and we've had a bunch

1
2 of members from the New York Delegation that have
3 been interested in helping us with that. It was --
4 as you all may recall, it was originally in the
5 Governor's -- The Governor had last year gotten
6 Design-Build authority for the State, and that's how
7 they were able to do the Tappan Zee Bridge so
8 successfully so quickly. It was such a great
9 savings, and in the Governor's original Budget
10 Proposal he had extended that authority to
11 localities, which would have included New York City.
12 The debate became a little complicated how exactly to
13 do it, and it fell out in the final negotiations.
14 But it is still a high priority on the City's list,
15 and you all have been supportive, and we'd love to
16 continue working with you on it. We really think it
17 could save the City a lot of money, and speed up a
18 lot of their projects, which would be terrific.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Strictly from a
20 budgetary perspective, how much money do we think
21 that that could save annually in the ballpark?

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: When we took a
23 look at our Bridge Program, I think we estimated it
24 could save tens of millions of dollars is the number
25 we came up with. I can't put an exact dollar figure

1
2 on it because you'd have to see exactly how the bids
3 came in, but it's interesting. But, it's
4 interesting. Council Member Menchaca mentioned the
5 Hamilton Asphalt Plant that we reopened yesterday.
6 That was a project where DDC was able to use Design-
7 Build. It was a \$25 million project that came in \$4
8 million under budget.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yeah.

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: So there are
11 real savings to be achieved.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Right and time as
13 well. Okay, thank you very much, Commissioner. I
14 look forward to working with you.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Council
16 Member Levin, Council Member Miller, followed by
17 Council Member Greenfield.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Good morning,
19 Chair and Co-Chair. Good morning Commissioner.
20 Great to see you again. I see you brought your
21 Cracker Jack staff with you today, the Assistant and
22 Deputy Commissioner. Thanks for coming out and good
23 afternoon almost. A couple of questions and there's
24 a wide range. Obviously, the issues that we face in
25 Queens and Southeast Queens are a lot different than

1
2 some of the other things that were discussed earlier,
3 but I do want to jump back some of the sidewalk/curb
4 issues that we talked about, some curb repair. In my
5 district, according to my Community Board some of the
6 -- the waiting list to have the curbs repaired are
7 almost a decade.

8 And I appreciate the investment in such
9 infrastructure, but there -- it has to be consistent
10 with some of the roadwork that's being done
11 considering the volume of floods that take place in
12 Southeast Queens in particular. They have repair
13 streets, and when they repaired the streets, they
14 elevate the side of the streets. And without those
15 curbs being in place, then that creates additional
16 flooding. So that's a problem that -- and hopefully
17 it's something that we can address, if you can speak
18 to that. If you would actually just --

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah. No,
20 happy to and as you all may know, the new DDC
21 Commissioner just started a few weeks ago, and we've
22 already met with him a couple of times. And that is
23 high on our list. We coordinate a lot of our roadway
24 and sidewalk and sidewalk ramp work with them, and
25 we're going to look for ways to do a better job of

1
2 coordinating and speeding the projects up as well as
3 lowering their cost. The cost of these projects have
4 gone up and up over the years, and it's partially now
5 slowing down our ability I think to deliver as
6 quickly as we should.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, so now that
8 we're on the agency coordination, there are a number
9 of projects that have been held up because they
10 require a DEP Drainage Study. I know we've had this
11 conversation. Where are with that study, and some of
12 these projects are like really --

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Again, as you
14 say another area of agency coordination, and we have
15 been sitting down with DEP, and starting to go
16 through some of the areas where things have really
17 slowed down. And that's one I'd really like to ask
18 Jeff to make sure we follow up with you. I think we
19 need to spend maybe a little time really sitting down
20 with you, and going through some of these projects in
21 your districts. And figuring out which ones in
22 particular maybe we can unstick them, so to speak.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, so maybe we
24 can bypass those studies, and now that we have the
25 MTA in the room we can really jump on that one. And

1
2 that would be the service of our -- of mass transit
3 in the outer boroughs. And obviously you talked
4 about SBS. And when you look in a district that has
5 the longest commute into Manhattan anywhere in the
6 city, we have to be creative. Obviously, we have
7 constraints in this budget in terms of the City
8 didn't really allocate any funds for capital
9 improvement. So we're going to have to be creative.
10 So when we start talking about SBS and things of that
11 nature there, what are some of the things that we
12 have in mind?

13 Some of the other things in terms of
14 capital that we had suggested some back was our bus
15 hub, transportation hub in Flushing to kind of
16 eliminate some of the congestion over there. But to
17 go back to the interagency coordination, I know that
18 that's been a problem in the Main Street area, and
19 that in between the MTA and New Yorker Transit Bus
20 Operations and Planning and DOT, streets get changed
21 every other week, and no one knows what's going on.
22 And hopefully that's something we can coordinate.
23 And I raise that question because they're in the
24 room, and I hope that I can be the facilitator of
25 that.

1
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, if I
3 can, Council Member, we -- our budget does include
4 \$49 million in capital dollars for Select Bus Service
5 of the coming five years, and we are looking at what
6 the next set of projects will be. Certainly your
7 district is an area where we know Select Bus Service
8 is much needed. So we're going to be unfolding that
9 process working with the MTA and working with all of
10 you. But the Mayor has put money in the budget to
11 honor that commitment to create more Select Bus
12 Service where it's all over the city. Again, we're
13 keenly aware that your district is one where better
14 bus service is needed.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: We'll appreciate
16 that. I'll kind of hold off on the rest of that in
17 capital to the MTA because I don't believe that the
18 infrastructure really exists in the district to allow
19 that to happen. But that's what I talk about being
20 creative. What do we do in the interim? But as long
21 as we can kind of focus on some of the flooding
22 issues, and how do we make these repairs, I think
23 that we're on the right track. I'm going to leave
24 you with this. In terms of the road repair that's
25 being done, and I know better than anyone there's

1
2 been a tremendous amount of road work done. How do
3 we determine is it a priority needs basis because I
4 have like our major throughway. Hillside Avenue is
5 an obstacle course with potholes and not being
6 repaired.

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, one
8 thing I would encourage you and all your colleagues
9 it takes a lot of work to coordinate the roadway
10 repair schedule, and our crews try and do it taking
11 into account being efficient in their movements. So
12 hitting a particular neighborhood, looking at when
13 they have to do roadway closures. How they
14 coordinate with bridges and other parts of the
15 infrastructure. If there are particular important
16 routes that you think we're not getting to in a
17 timely way, please let us know. And we try and come
18 up with our schedule for the season, but we really
19 welcome your input, too. If there are ways we need
20 to adjust the schedule, let's try and figure those
21 out.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you so much
23 for coming out and thank you for your time.

24 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Council
25 Member Miller. We're going to have Council Member

1
2 Greenfield followed by Council Member Chin. We've
3 been joined by Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer, and
4 Council Member Ignizio.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you,
6 Madam Chair. I'm actually told the MTA is waiting.
7 I'll try to hurry up despite the fact that I
8 routinely wait for their buses and trains. My
9 question actually, and I first want to refer you to a
10 story in the Daily News a few days ago regarding
11 utility companies ripping up the street without
12 permission. Something that I've been focused on for
13 quite a few years, and to me seems unbelievably
14 egregious. Over 2,000 streets in this city if you
15 ride your bicycle the wrong way down a street,
16 apparently you get arrested. But if you take a jack
17 hammer, and you rip up the City's property, you
18 simply get slapped with a fine. Well, I know you've
19 been trying to step up enforcement on this issue and
20 I appreciate it. What more can we do? Perhaps the
21 City should, in fact, and I'm happy to sponsor a
22 piece of legislation that would make it a criminal
23 violation for a company to simply come in and rip up
24 our streets.

1
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: This is a good
3 question and I'm dying to -- First, I want to thank
4 you again for your leadership, and yesterday the
5 Council's action on the 25 mile an hour speed limit.
6 I really appreciate that, and I was just saying
7 before you got here in my testimony, It's really
8 going to help us in work up in Albany. And the
9 Administration is so appreciate of your leadership
10 there. That article it's interesting. It's sort of
11 a good new/bad news story, which a bit of the good
12 news is we have been in recent years with our
13 inspection program been using better technology,
14 iPads, mapping, et cetera.

15 So part of it is we are doing a better
16 job of catching violations, and the violations fall
17 into a couple of categories. One is cases where
18 we've given a permit for the work, but the work took
19 longer. And so, the permit expired. Another is, and
20 I'm learning this is probably less true with the big
21 utilities like Con Ed, but perhaps more true with
22 smaller plumbing firms or whatever that they are the
23 ones perhaps trying to get away with doing some of
24 the work without a permit.

1
2 That said, I would love to sit down with
3 you, and talk with you about how we do a better job
4 here. It is a huge challenge in the city. There's a
5 certain amount of this work that can happen as of
6 right, and making sure that we are on top of it and
7 that our roadways are restored to a good condition is
8 very, very important. In this difficult pothole
9 season I think we can all see roads where it was
10 obvious that some kind of work was done, the road was
11 cut into. The road was repaired, and now it's
12 ripping up again. And I think getting on top of that
13 and making sure that those who are digging into our
14 streets are putting them back together, and having
15 the proper permits is really, really important.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Just one
17 other quick question. Can you explain to me some of
18 the challenges we have that we see between potholes
19 and sink holes? I have a few of those in my
20 district. I called DOT. DOT says it looks like a
21 pothole, it acts like a pothole, but really it's a
22 sinkhole. DEP says it's a pothole, and there is sort
23 of like a lot of back and forth on this.

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, I'm
25 sorry if you're getting back and forth. You

1
2 shouldn't be. I mean pothole -- I've learned this
3 myself this winter, and had to deal with all kinds of
4 holes in the road. Potholes are when basically a
5 piece of the surface of the road comes off, and they
6 are fairly common. Sink holes are really when
7 there's some kind of a subsurface condition. It can
8 often be a leak. That's why DOT gets involved, and
9 you really see a more major chunk of the roadbed
10 falling in, and I apologize. It actually should be
11 clear about which is which, and if you're having ones
12 where the two agencies are ping-ponging you, let us
13 try and help resolve that.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you,
15 Commissioner, and thanks for your Vision Zero
16 leadership. We're very grateful.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you for
18 yours.

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Council
20 Member Greenfield. We'll have Council Member Chin
21 followed by Council Member Lander.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Madam
23 Chair. Commissioner, it's always great to see you.
24 My question is on the Intercity Bus Permit Program.
25 I'm happy to see that there are some budget

1 allocated, but it's such a tiny little bit; \$16,000
2 for the remainder of this fiscal year, and only
3 \$65,000 for Fiscal Year 2015. Is there enough staff
4 to really monitor the program, and implement the
5 program? I started the program started about a year.
6 It's really time for us to really take a look to see
7 how it is working, whether there is enough monitoring
8 going on. Site, how do you identify a site whether
9 it's appropriate, and also are there too many permits
10 being given in a particular area? Especially in my
11 district, I mean right now it's really timely for us
12 to really visit how this permitting system is
13 working.
14

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I think
16 we do think the resources are adequate. But that
17 said, I agree with you. There are a lot of
18 challenges to implementing this, and one thing we've
19 discovered there's a lot of complexities in terms of
20 state and federal law in this area. And one thing
21 I'd be happy to do with you, and perhaps some of your
22 colleagues in other parts of the city where this is a
23 big issue is sit down and give you a real update on
24 where we stand in terms of how we are implementing
25 this program. And how we think it's going to work

1
2 and get your feedback on it. I won't deny it. I
3 think it's -- this is going to be a complicated
4 implementation task.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I think that's
6 really necessary because now we're seeing some new
7 companies coming in, and the ones that we them to get
8 permits are not getting a permit. So we haven't
9 solved the program that this program was intending to
10 solve. And so, an area gets really inundated with
11 the bus stop. And so, we really need to have a
12 longer in-depth sum up of what's going on.

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I very much
14 agree. I do think this one is going to be
15 complicated, and it's going to be iterative. We're
16 going to try some things, and we may need to make
17 adjustments as we go forward. I know it is true the
18 volume of intercity buses that now want to come into
19 the city, it's growing by leaps and bunds. And it
20 presents a real challenge.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. So,
22 we'll follow up with you on that. And the second
23 question I have is on Bike Share. I mean, we
24 mentioned to your department about changing some of
25 the locations because we don't know what the funding

1
2 situation is. But there are some Bike Share stations
3 that's really not in the best locations, and then we
4 have other areas in the district that really wants
5 the Bike Share. So I think it's important to really
6 look at whether some are working or not, and see how
7 to do that. So if I can move the Bike Share in my
8 district from Elizabeth Street to the South Street
9 Seaport on the Front Street area, I think that would
10 really help. But we definitely need to revisit it in
11 terms of the siting of the Bike Share Program.

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, and I'm
13 happy to work with you on that. One thing I've
14 discovered in learning more about this program, it is
15 very difficult to figure out where to site these
16 stations in New York City, and what kind of manholes
17 and subway entrances and other things are below them.
18 But, yeah, we'd be happy to work with you on that.
19 Again, it's another area where I think we're
20 constantly trying to revisit our performance, and
21 make adjustments if we need to.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Good. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: And I just wanted
24 to add when we're talking about Bike Share programs,
25 it would be great -- it would be very helpful for us

1
2 as council members in areas where we know there are
3 bikes. It's very frustrating to see that I have a
4 community full of people using bikes, especially the
5 undocumented community. They don't necessary -- they
6 can't get licenses, so they travel on their bicycles
7 and we have no bike lanes. I have one bike lane on
8 34th Avenue that goes from nowhere to the parkway,
9 and that's it. Yet, the community is filled with
10 bicycles everywhere. Many going in all types of
11 directions, which we're trying to work with you on.
12 But I think it would be a great way for -- to see how
13 we can get that information to you, and plan out our
14 communities a little bit more effectively when it
15 comes to the biking community.

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We would love
17 to work with you on that, and planning good bike
18 connections throughout communities, and particularly
19 coming into communities that have not been well
20 served but have a big population that are using
21 bikes, it's a big priority for us. So let us make
22 sure we follow up with your office on that.

23 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you. We're
24 going to have Council Member Lander followed by and
25

1
2 the last question from our Majority Leader Van
3 Bramer.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you to both
5 the Chairs. Thank you, Commissioner. Welcome to the
6 Deputy Commissioner, and thanks so much for hitting
7 the ground running. There is so many thing Vision
8 Zero has certainly done in many other ways as well.
9 It's truly wonderful and inspiring leadership. I was
10 excited to see the additional money for the BRT for
11 Select Bus Service both the additional expense money,
12 and the capital money in fulfillment of the Mayor's
13 commitment to 20 new BRT routes. As you know, I've
14 introduced a bill to require a real BRT plan, and my
15 question is less about the bill and more about how
16 are you thinking about making sure that it's not just
17 what individual routes. A lot of people want routes.
18 How do we make it a real network, thinking about
19 whether we can get the Brooklyn route for the bridge
20 into Manhattan? And how do we advance the whole BRT
21 network to make it better and really worldwide BRT
22 using this investment?

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, and part
24 of that obviously is our partnership with the MTA.
25 One thing I think we like to remind people New York

1
2 City is not necessarily an easy comparison say to
3 what's been done in Mexico City or somewhere, which
4 is we have an enormous subway network obviously. So
5 you want to make sure as you're investing your
6 resources you want to complement this subway system,
7 and you don't need to build a BRT system where you've
8 got a major subway corridor that's serving the
9 community well. So that really takes a lot of
10 planning, and I really have to say I think we have a
11 terrific team at DOT, and a lot of great folks at
12 MTA. But as we're looking at this routes around the
13 city, we're thinking very deeply about how we connect
14 them to the larger bus network, to the subway
15 network. And I hear you. I think in the long run,
16 we have to continue to build out a connected system.
17 It is a resource question. That is part of it, but I
18 can tell you I know my own team at DOT. I am really
19 impressed by the thoughtful work they have done
20 around SBS and thinking about how really to connect
21 it to existing transportation system.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: That's great to
23 hear. We could follow up on it whether by
24 legislation or because you just do it, the
25 development of a plan to make it really live out that

1
2 more comprehensive network vision I think is really
3 important. I was also very encouraged to see \$19
4 million new dollars for public plazas, and some
5 additional resources for benches and way finding.
6 The Council's budget response spoke to the
7 Neighborhood Plaza Partnership work to help make sure
8 those plazas can really serve all communities where
9 there aren't bids. Is there work underway to kind of
10 work with them and us to help us figure it out?
11 Maybe you already spoke to it.

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
13 Yes, your chairwoman.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I came in late.

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Your
16 Chairwoman asked about that question. And, you know,
17 we recognize that it can be very different for a
18 community bid at Corona Plaza than what you're going
19 to have in Midtown Manhattan, and figuring out how we
20 can ensure that these plazas all over the city can
21 thrive and be great centers for community activity.
22 And have the resources they need to be maintained.
23 One thing we don't want is a plaza program where the
24 plazas aren't well maintained and they become filled
25 with garbage and criminal activity. So, we're

1
2 mindful that we want to set up plazas that are going
3 to be in a good state of operation in perpetuity.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: That's great, and
5 we look forward to working together to help make that
6 happen. And my last comment -- I won't to ask a
7 question here -- is just on Bike Share. I took a
8 city bike this morning over the Brooklyn Bridge as
9 part of Bike to the Council Day. I was with Council
10 Members Menchaca and Reynoso, and we'll hear what the
11 Chair has to say about the breadth of interest in
12 improving the bike network and expanding Citi Bike.
13 We're not talking about something that's a luxury
14 good. We all want it, and as I've said before and
15 said at the Preliminary Budget Hearing, as you will
16 do when you're thinking about its future and
17 renegotiating that franchise agreement, I do think
18 it's a public transportation system. And that public
19 funding either from the Administration or from the
20 Council is an appropriate use of -- it's an
21 appropriate public investment. So I hope you'll keep
22 thinking about that as we move forward because that's
23 how I think it will be necessary to achieve expansion
24 to the scale that we want. Thank you very much,
25 Commissioner.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Council
3 Member Lander. Majority Leader Van Bramer.

4 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
5 very much to both of our Chairs, and I apologize. I
6 missed your testimony, but we had the September 11th
7 Memorial Museum opening this morning that I was
8 privileged to attend. But I did read your testimony,
9 and I'm thrilled to see \$153 million for the
10 Queensboro Bridge. And I trust that that includes a
11 very, very significant rehab of the pedestrian and
12 bike paths on the bridge as well as the lighting.
13 We've had issues with both. So I don't know if
14 that's a level of detail that someone can speak to,
15 but --

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We'll check
17 and just having had the fun of riding over that
18 bridge and the Five Borough Bike Tour, yeah, we'll
19 make sure it's -- I think a big priority for us.

20 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: As you
21 know, it is extensively used increasingly. So we
22 have -- the Queensville Plaza has really changed
23 markedly, and the protected bike lane there is very
24 well utilized as a lead into the bridge, and folks
25 coming back from Manhattan. So I just want to

1
2 encourage because we get a number of constituents
3 writing in about that. Way finding we have some
4 degree of way finding in Long Island City, which is
5 great. And I was wondering about your expansion
6 plans to other neighborhoods and whether or not
7 that's contained in the allocation that you have in
8 that.

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We did contain
10 some funding for way finding. I can't remember how
11 much. [sic]

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Yes, we have
13 a phase two for Way Finding in the -- around I think
14 another \$8 million or so. It's all federally funded.
15 So it's subject to all applications that we submit
16 for the next phases. But the selection of the
17 neighborhoods is still being firmed up.

18 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Good. Come
19 east, and I want to also dovetail on Council Member
20 Lander. As you know, I'm a huge proponent and
21 supporter of Bike Share, and Western Queens is very,
22 very much anticipating that arrival. And I want to
23 continue working with you to make sure that that
24 happens as quickly as possible. And like Council
25 Member Lander, I am open to allocating funding as

1
2 well should we all agree that that is a viable path
3 forward. Vision Zero I just want to say thank you.
4 You've been simply terrific and hit the ground
5 running or biking literally. And I really have
6 appreciated the partnership with you on Northern
7 Boulevard. I know we have some more work to do on
8 Queens Boulevard, but thank you so much. And last, I
9 just want to ask because our friends from the MTA are
10 coming as well. Long Island City is a growing
11 community. We need expanded bus service long term.
12 So I'm hoping that the agency is looking at thinking
13 about funding in the future SBS, DOT, including Long
14 Island City desperately expanding a need of increased
15 bus service.

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: I'll turn that
17 one over to the MTA. I will just say on Queens
18 Boulevard just so you know, TA reached out to me on
19 it as well. And what I had offered him, I'm happy to
20 have you or someone from your office come. We're
21 going to go walk. We're going to take our traffic
22 experts and take some of the advocates, and take a
23 look and sort of hear what our concerns are, and hear
24 what their concerns are. So I'm happy to --

25

1

2

MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER:

3

[interposing] That's terrific. It does not surprise

4

me that you are willing, ready, and able to do that.

5

So I thank you for that and I look forward to joining

6

you.

7

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Okay.

8

MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Thank you

9

very much.

10

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very

11

much. We are just going to have -- I have one more

12

question, and my Co-Chair will also have wrap-up

13

questions. My district is home to the artery that

14

goes straight to La Guardia Airport, and as we are

15

discussing the expansion with the Port Authority and

16

a great deal of investment is going into the

17

expansion of the airport with increased travelers.

18

And I see more and more people getting off the 7-

19

Train and onto the 272 to get up to the airport. And

20

it's really a challenge, but also I'd like to get

21

some plans and listen to as the airport grows, how

22

we're going to address this major artery that goes

23

straight to the airport?

24

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Again, I think

25

that's another one where we're going to have to work

1
2 with a partnership not only with the MTA but with the
3 Port Authority as well. We certainly know they have
4 big plans with the airport, and we're going to need
5 to get the land side of the transportation better
6 synced up with that to accommodate all the growth.
7 So it is certainly on our radar screen as an area we
8 need to work together on.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, and
10 before getting into my last questions, I want to
11 include that the Chairman of Finance she is sitting
12 right now, we need to be sure that the \$4 billion
13 that the Mayor would provide to the Port Authority to
14 renovate La Guardia also includes money for the
15 streets that are around La Guardia Airport, too.
16 That airport will increase the capacity to 70 million
17 people. So it is great that we are bringing that
18 airport to that standard, to that capacity. But we
19 need to be sure also that in one voice as we did
20 asking for the 25 mile per hour, we go together to
21 the Governor and the Port Authority and say, It is
22 not being responsible when the \$4 billion is only to
23 renovate the airport. And there's no money included
24 on how people will be moving from La Guardia to mass
25

1
2 transportation. So I hope that we can continue that
3 conversation.

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And in that
6 direction, too, I also will need your support when it
7 comes to the Bus Terminal 178 at the George
8 Washington Bridge. The Port Authority also is making
9 \$135 million renovation, and very irresponsible. A
10 developer that's getting a good deal, a Port
11 Authority that would make the renovations in a way
12 that the community will lose a whole second floor
13 open area, access to the A-Train that people have
14 right now. And they have not put in one dollar from
15 the beginning to do a traffic study. I think that
16 even though we've been having this conversation, and
17 as we have made, and that we are committed to find a
18 solution. But the Port Authority they fail because
19 when they met with the developer, they should include
20 the money that is needed if it is a half a million
21 dollars, if it's a million dollars for someone that
22 is getting a good deal from the City, --

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]

24 For the study?

1
2 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: -- they should
3 have the money before they started construction.

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And I know we
5 did discuss this when we met with you up in your
6 office, and this is one we need to follow up with you
7 on. I hear your frustration, and I want to figure
8 out what we can do with the Port Authority to get
9 that study done. And make sure as they do the
10 station renovations, it's going to work for the
11 community.

12 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.
13 So, first I would like to as the Chairman of Finance
14 you will follow always, but I think we would get
15 answers for all those questions that we have in
16 Transportation that we didn't have the time to ask.
17 But one I would like to get a report from you and
18 your team on the progress that the Department have
19 made on PlanNYC project. We have a 20, 25-year
20 project. So I think that it is important. Again,
21 for the amount of time, if you can send an updated
22 progress of that report, that would be very
23 important.

24

25

1
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, and we
3 actually have that Progress Report for you, and I
4 think we've mad good progress.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So let me go
6 onto the question, --

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
8 Oh, okay.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: -- and if you
10 want -- the three questions. If you have an answer
11 for that great. If you can the -- if you can send
12 the an already report [sic], it would be good, too.
13 One, who from the DOT is responsible to coordinate
14 with the NYPD the enforcement of buses that are part
15 of the Intercity Bus Stop Permit Program?

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, that's
17 actually on our part an agencywide effort that
18 involves our commissioners, that involves our Law
19 Department, that involves some of our operational
20 folks. We have a lot of different parts of the
21 agency that are trying to coordinate with on the
22 legal elements, on the enforcement elements, and on
23 the transportation elements.

24 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, and as
25 you know, I want to connect it with Vision Zero. We

1
2 in New York City has a number of buses picking up
3 passengers, dropping passengers in our street without
4 having their permits. And as the State mandate, as
5 the State give the City, DOT is the one to regulate
6 the permits. We want to be sure that NYPD go after
7 any particular bus that is coming to New York City
8 without the proper permit that they should get from
9 the DOT. My other question is about with the Bike
10 Share Contract. Since this is a contract that you
11 inherit. So you did not participate on doing that
12 contract with CitiBank. Have you had time to go over
13 that contract, and did you feel that it was a good
14 contract for the City?

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I have
16 had time to delve in pretty deeply on the details of
17 it, and I would say this: For a brand new start-up
18 venture, I think Citi Bike was very successful, and I
19 think the spirit of the contract was we're not going
20 to put City dollars in. We're going to try and have
21 performance requirements that we want the contractor
22 to meet, and that was the spirit under which the
23 contract was developed. I think moving forward, I'd
24 like to see the contract be something that's a little
25 simpler and streamlined while continuing to maintain

1
2 that we get a good service from Citi Bike. And we're
3 looking now again at what type of a duration we'd
4 have. How we would look at any potential revenue
5 questions. And I know that's an area of interest.
6 So far, the operation has not made money. It may at
7 some point. I'm sure whether it will or it won't and
8 the question is if it's either starting to become
9 profitable, or owing us parking revenue as well as
10 other things, what would we do with that? Would we
11 plow that back into expanding service? Which I think
12 would probably make sense. So there are a number of
13 those issues we're trying to work through. I really
14 want to try and make sure we get it right.

15 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I
16 appreciate that you're sending a copy of the
17 contract, but, you know, they really did not open the
18 book to the City Council before. And I believe that
19 the Citi Bike is a great one. I think that we should
20 continue expanding, but no doubt that they will -- I
21 hope that we can go over those details. I believe
22 that Citi Bank and Master Card, they got a great
23 deal. Putting in this one-shot deal \$40 million
24 where they have the right to be promoting their logo
25 through all the city on dirt [sic], they should be

1
2 more responsible. They should improve their line of
3 contribution. And if they're not up to that
4 increase, then we should be opening to the market and
5 see who else in the private sector would like to be
6 our partners in expanding Bike Share. And I hope
7 also that we can go -- that we can work with a local
8 rental bicycle that we have in different communities.
9 I think that there actually that we have a community
10 especially those areas where we don't have the Citi
11 Bike Program, we should be working at those rental
12 bicycles that we have in many of our other
13 communities.

14 And my last question is about the Fiscal
15 2015 Executive Contract Budget, NWB 8%. The Fiscal
16 2015 Executive Budget includes \$200 million for 583
17 contracts for the Department. Of that amount, \$109
18 million of 54% is for maintenance and operation and
19 construction. I would like to divide it into two
20 questions. One, what was the Department's NWB
21 percentage for all contracts for the calendar year
22 2012 and 2013, and what is your goal for the next
23 fiscal year?

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I'm
25 actually going to turn that one over to Joe, and I

1
2 think we have a track record we're pretty proud of on
3 this score. It's been a big priority for the agency,
4 and will be for this administration.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Absolutely,
6 in 2013, we met a goal of 24% for subcontracting. As
7 you know, there are different goals established for
8 different levels of contracting. I think you were
9 referring specifically to the larger contracts, if
10 I'm not mistaken. Because we obviously for micro
11 purchases and purchases we have higher goals
12 established. We actually hit 26% for micro purchases
13 and small purchases; 17% for our P cards. And this
14 actually exceeded the goals that were established for
15 2013. Our goal for 2014 right now for subcontract is
16 at 9.14%, and we're well on our way to making that.
17 For small purchases, we're actually at 42%, which is
18 we're one of the leading agencies that do that now,
19 and we would lead [sic] when it comes to small
20 purchases, and we're very proud that now.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: -- that
22 forward to be careful on how we work with that
23 particular sector of a minority of the NWB because
24 one thing that happened at the construction level,
25 and it's like an open secret. I would have no doubt

1
2 that it could happen in other areas, too. But
3 sometimes some companies are created by the same --
4 by a corporation that they are not necessarily
5 minority, woman or minority. And they get a few
6 minorities and they cure this company, and they raise
7 your asset base of minorities. So I want to be sure
8 that contracts dedicated to minorities really go to
9 those groups.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very
11 much, Commissioner. I really appreciate all of your
12 responses. As mentioned by the Co-Chair, we actually
13 had questions that were not answered. I would like
14 to forward them to you --

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: That's fine.

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: -- and if you
17 could get those answers back to us expeditiously,
18 that would be great for us so that we can move
19 forward with our budget negotiating here.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We would be
21 happy to do that. Thank you all.

22 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you. Okay,
23 we're going to very quickly transition to the MTA.

24 [Pause]

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: We will now resume
3 the City Council's Hearing on the Mayor's Executive
4 Budget for FY2015. We just heard from the Department
5 of Transportation, and now the Finance Committee.
6 We'll hear from the Metropolitan Transportation
7 Authority. Before we do, I will open the mic up to
8 my Co-Chair Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez. And
9 thank you for being -- I'm sorry that we kind of ran
10 over time. Thank you for being here. Council Member
11 Greenfield who was here said he often waits for
12 trains, so you kind of understand. All right, my Co-
13 Chair.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes, thank
15 you, Co-Chair, and the Chair of Finance, Julissa
16 Ferreras. As I said before, we will hear from the
17 MTA on other issues of importance, including the
18 continuing efforts to recover from the Super Storm
19 Sandy. The potential impact of the recently
20 announced contract settlement with the TW -- the
21 Authority's effort to identify inefficiencies and
22 control our costs. The Authority's Calendar Year
23 2010 to 2014 Capital Plan and the efforts being made
24 to secure funding for the next capital plan. The
25 2015-2019 Capital Plan regarding the upcoming capital

1
2 plan, we must be sure that the plan is fully funded
3 upon option to avoid costs overrun, and delays in the
4 construction process. With that, I turn it over to
5 you.

6 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Good morning,
7 Chairwoman Ferreras, Chairman Rodriguez, and members
8 of the City Council. I'm Douglas Johnson, the MTA's
9 Budget Director. Thank you for holding this hearing
10 and for inviting me to testify here today. I'm
11 joined by Craig Stewart, MTA's Senior Director of
12 Capital Programs; Aaron Stern, Director of New York
13 City Transit Office of Management and Budget; and
14 Lois Tendler on my far right, New York City Transit
15 Vice President of Government and Community Relations.

16 As you may remember, I testified before
17 this committee in March regarding the Mayor's Fiscal
18 year 2014 Preliminary Budget as it relates the MTA's
19 budget. I discussed the fact that the MTA's
20 Operating Budget is \$13.5 billion, of which New York
21 will provide \$885 million or about 6-1/2%. I
22 outlined each of the recipient agencies explaining
23 that New York City funds are used to support MTA and
24 New York City Transit including Paratransit, MTA bus,
25 MTA Staten Island Railway, and the maintenance of

1
2 commuter rail stations within New York City. I also
3 mentioned that the Mayor's 2014 budget proposed to
4 allocate \$100 million to the MTA's Capital Program.
5 To reiterate, the funds we get from New York City are
6 critically important to the MTA and very much
7 appreciated. Since that time, there's been one
8 critically important development in terms of our
9 budget. Thanks to Governor Cuomo's help, we are
10 working to reach a labor agreement with Transit
11 Networkers Union Local 100, by far our largest group
12 of unionized workers. There is not much I can say
13 publicly while the TWU contract waits for advocacy
14 from its members, but I can say this: The contract
15 offer, if ratified, will not require us to cut
16 service or raise fares higher than the rate of
17 inflation in 2015.

18 In closing, I want to remind the Council
19 that we'll present the 2015 to 2019 Capital Program
20 to our board in September for submission Capital
21 Program Review Board in Albany on October 1st. Some
22 of you may have heard that last week Governor Cuomo
23 directed us to create a transportation reinvention
24 convention in advance of the next program. This
25 panel of experts will focus on how climate change and

1
2 rapidly growth to affect our next program. And we
3 couldn't agree more with the Governor's directive.

4 We need to do more than keep our network
5 reliable through the Capital Program. We need to
6 prepare for a change in climate and adapt to changing
7 demographics and travel needs. Make no mistake,
8 protecting the MTA Network against future storms will
9 carry huge costs in time and resources. But as Sandy
10 proved, all too painfully, the cost of inaction was
11 simply unacceptable. The truth is a healthy capital
12 program is our best path forward, and our only path
13 forward. Beyond restoration, beyond long-term repair
14 all the way through a super storm ready network, a
15 super storm ready New York. Again, thank you for
16 inviting us here today. My colleagues and I will now
17 be happy to answer any questions you may have. Thank
18 you.

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you so much.
20 I just want for clarification purposes. You meant
21 2015 for the Mayor's Budget, right?

22 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: At the time --

23 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: [interposing] Or
24 you just --

1
2 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: -- At the time that we
3 came in March we were describing a 2014 budget.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay.

5 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: We haven't done a 2015
6 budget yet, but --

7 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: [interposing] Oh,
8 I see. Yeah, I got you, right.

9 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: -- our first 2015
10 budget--

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: [interposing] I
12 got it, yes.

13 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: -- was will come in
14 July.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Your calendar
16 year.

17 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Uh-huh.

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay, I just
19 wanted to get that on the record. Thank you. So I
20 want to discuss your Capital Plan. I know that the
21 Governor has requested you create this new
22 commission, but I wanted to have -- get the impact of
23 the additional borrowing on the operating budget. Do
24 you believe that you have the capacity to absorb any
25 additional borrowing for the next Capital Plan?

1
2 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Right now, the debt
3 service that we're capturing within our plan is the
4 existing capital program. And we're also -- we're
5 making KAGO [sp?] investments that will -- some of
6 which will be converted to debt service and it's
7 certainly within the capacity of our debt service.
8 We don't really have a full funding for our 2015 to
9 2019 program. So I think it's probably too early to
10 speculate exactly how much debt service would be
11 required. We would have to manage that effectively.

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: And currently,
13 what is your outstanding debt?

14 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: It's roughly \$2.3
15 billion a year. I'm sorry. That's the debt service.

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Right.

17 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: The debt is roughly \$30
18 million.

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: 33?

20 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Thirty -- low 30s. I
21 don't know the exact number.

22 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: So we're close to
23 the 36 cap?

24 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I'd have to get back to
25 you. I don't know the exact number.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Can you please?

I'd appreciate it. So I know that you said that you can't really make a clear estimate on next year's Financial Capital Plan. So at what point do we -- before it actually comes -- before you roll it out for the five years, is there a point where you can get -- have a closer estimation as to what the plan will look like or cost?

CRAIG STEWART: We --

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: I'm sorry. Could you just say your name for the record?

CRAIG STEWART: My name is Craig Stewart. I'm the Senior Director of Capital Programs.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay, thank you.

CRAIG STEWART: We will be briefing our board in July about the preparation, and perhaps offering some targets in terms of the amount. But right now we don't have it.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay. The City's Proposed Budget includes an annual contribution of \$100 million to the MTA's Capital Program this calendar year. If this funding is reduced or not appropriated, what impact would that have on the Authority's budget?

1

2

MALE SPEAKER: [off mic]

3

4

CRAIG STEWART: That would have a significant cost to -- impact to our plan. I believe the overall State and City contribution makes up about 6% of the existing plan. So it would have a significant impact.

5

6

7

8

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay, thank you.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

And I just want to now focus in -- I'm in my Finance Chair hat, but I'm also a Council member of the local district. And I did a lot of work on negotiating the new Willets Point deal, and this would create an entirely new community, and a, you know, many predict a very successful mall. Increasing ridership on an already taxed system. For a full disclaimer, my father was a transit worker on the 7 line for 30 years. He just retired so I just want to put that out there. So the 7 line is very dear -- near and dear to the hearts to many council members across the three Council Districts. But we also see the challenges when you're trying to get on at 74th Street, and you can barely stand on the platform. To add now this new community, and not take into consideration -- And honestly, I lived on Roosevelt Avenue. The train rolls by every three minutes. So

1
2 I don't know how many -- how more often. So, it's
3 not about how often the train comes, it's coming
4 pretty often. But the issue that we have where I
5 feel that you don't -- We're not taking into
6 consideration the LIR. We have this Willets Point.
7 I don't know if that's the proper name of the stop
8 over at the USCA and Flushing Willets Community Park.
9 It's used only during game day, and both with the
10 Mets and the USTA where I believe this is an
11 opportunity to have our residents be able to use that
12 as a possible opportunity for your intercity program
13 adding more affordable rate clearly. But it would
14 help get some people off that 7 Line, which it's
15 completely taxed, and really a big challenge.

16 CRAIG STEWART: Yeah, we recognize that
17 we're over-subscribed on the Number 7 Line, and our
18 approach to it is to put in a signal system, the
19 communications-based signal system that's been
20 significantly underway. I think it's been under
21 construction for two or three years right now. And
22 that will add -- We'll be able to put many more
23 trains, and improve the throughput on that line
24 significantly. So we'll be able to get far more

25

1
2 trains, many close together in a safe operating
3 distance. So with those trains.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: [interposing] And
5 I understand that. I personally don't -- and, of
6 course, you're the expert. But just being a resident
7 that lived on Roosevelt Avenue, the train comes by
8 all the time, and the train is packed all the time.
9 So I understand that you -- this signal program will
10 -- which I'm sure Majority Leader Van Bramer has his
11 own, and he'll add on. I don't want to -- with the
12 charges of you just stopping service in that whole --
13 that's a whole conversation that I know is going to
14 be had. But I really do believe that we should
15 immediately take a look into the opportunities of the
16 Long Island Railroad House.

17 LOIS TENDLER: I think that's a wonderful
18 idea, and we're happy to do that. We will reach out
19 to the railroad, and see whether there's any
20 synergies. I would just say to echo what Craig had
21 already said, the signal system is probably the
22 biggest constraint we have to running more service.
23 Of course, we need cars to put on the track, but the
24 signal system constrains how many cars we can run,
25 and as people now, for instance in Williamsburg, are

1
2 realizing the improvements from putting CBTC on the
3 airline, that's coming to the center. And it really
4 will -- I understand what you're saying about every
5 train being crowded. But if you have more trains
6 maybe they'll be less crowded. I mean that's the one
7 thing short of building new subways routes --

8 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: [interposing]
9 Right. But I know what will --

10 LOIS TENDLER: -- capacity.

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: -- increase - -
12 definitely guarantee there will be less people on the
13 train is if you probably parallel behind railroads.

14 LOIS TENDLER: We'll reach out to the
15 railroad and see what could be worked out.

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: I appreciate it,
17 and then I just want to talk about, before I turn it
18 over to my colleagues -- and then we'll come back for
19 more questioning -- is maintenance of the elevated
20 trains. It seems like it's a -- it's a very big
21 challenge, and I think I've said this before, and
22 you've heard me and I have to say it again. You
23 know, whenever it is opening day for the New York
24 Mets and the USTA, the train right in front of the
25 looks amazing every years. Where the people live,

1
2 not so much. There's chunks of rust. It's besides
3 the -- And I think you educated me last years with
4 what -- the grease that leaks off it.

5 LOIS TENDLER: Kerosene.

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: The kerosene that
7 actually does permanent damage to my car, let alone
8 all the residents' cars, and it just seems that we
9 can't get this right. And we need to have a more
10 effective plan on how we're painting the trains, and
11 how often we're doing the elevated trains because it
12 creates blight. We already have the elevated train
13 that creates a shadow in our communities. Having a
14 dirty elevated train, or a train that's rusting
15 really makes our communities, as much as we'd like to
16 make them better and create a positive business
17 environment underneath the elevated train, having the
18 elevated trains in these disrepairs is not fair. And
19 it's definitely a very big problem for us.

20 LOIS TENDLER: We've had this
21 conversation before. So I believe that most of the 7
22 Line structure, because that's what you're talking
23 about Council Member, painting the structure. Most
24 of the structure has been painted except for a piece,
25

1
2 which is in your district, but I understand that it
3 is a --

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Well, I want to
5 get to my district pretty soon.

6 LOIS TENDLER: [interposing] Yeah, yeah,
7 yean.

8 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: I'm just saying.

9 LOIS TENDLER: So, we recognize it needs
10 to be done, and we hope to be able to do it in the
11 next plan. It's the next piece filling out the line.

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay, I'm going to
13 hold you to it. Okay. We will have Co-Chair
14 Rodriguez have his questioning followed by Council
15 Member Miller.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. In
17 our plan, in our New York City 2025 Plan, when it
18 comes to transportation, we realize that by that time
19 2025, we're going to be adding an additional 550,000
20 new New Yorkers that they will use mass
21 transportation to go to work. How is MTA planning to
22 fulfill our plan to move some of those 550,000 new
23 people who will need mass transportation?

24 CRAIG STEWART: Okay. Again, part of our
25 approach to this is increasing our capacity to add

1
2 trains through the CBTC effort. Our new plan coming
3 out will have significant -- have several signal
4 projects that add capacity to lines. Also, we'll
5 continue with our extension of Second Avenue, and we
6 have several projects coming to completion right now.
7 Seven West should be done by the end of the year.
8 Also, the expansion of the CBTC Program should
9 significantly impact the capacity.

10 LOIS TENDLER: We have underway now --
11 we're doing preliminary work before CBTC. So we're
12 working on the Queens Boulevard Line and the Culver
13 [sp?] Line, and doing interlocking. So we're making
14 steps getting into CBTC. Each steps gives us a
15 little more reliable service for sure, and when we
16 actually go to CBTC there's a capacity for more
17 trains.

18 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I would like
19 to see a more complete plan from the MTA connected
20 with our challenge on mobilizing that number that the
21 previous administration already has come out with
22 that data. Saying that in the New York City Plan
23 2025, 450,000 new New Yorkers will use mass
24 transportation to go to work. So I know that you're
25 doing a great job, and I know that you're responsible

1
2 for -- being in charge of one of the largest urban
3 transportation systems when we come to the MTA in the
4 budget.

5 So I have a lot of respect for you, but I
6 would like to -- Not right now, but I would like for
7 you to get something back when it comes to seeing if
8 we get -- put some funding together so that we can
9 have a more complete plan on adjusting our MTA Plan
10 with the 2025 NYC one. And in that direction, I have
11 issues and I hope that we as New Yorkers, we also can
12 advocate on it. As I said before, it's not being
13 responsible to increase the capacity of La Guardia
14 Airport to 17 million with \$4 billion of investment
15 coming from the State, and not plan on connecting La
16 Guardia with our train system.

17 I know that we have the buses. That's
18 not the solution. Okay, that's alleviated. But
19 having a few buses going from La Guardia to Harlem or
20 the other even not the be the solution for the number
21 that's so great for the Governor is putting to the
22 Port Authority, the \$4 billion. But what about after
23 those passengers get to La Guardia. And I think that
24 in the past they was conversation on connecting our
25 train with La Guardia.

1
2 I believe that we have, as New York City,
3 to be a voice. Go to the MTA -- I mean to the
4 leadership and say, We need to advocate to them. And
5 I know that sometimes we cannot get a thing by
6 ourselves. We need to get all the players to come,
7 too. But I believe it will be very beneficial for
8 the city if we have a 10, 15 year plan. I'm not
9 saying it is even for the year that are going to be
10 other council to connect La Guardia with the train
11 station. Is there any conversation going on in that
12 area or not?

13 LOIS TENDLER: No, as President Bianco
14 shared with you when we met up in your office,
15 Councilman, there was eight years ago an effort to
16 study rail to La Guardia, and that fell apart because
17 of a lot of community opposition. Mr. Bianco heard
18 what you asked for, and we're happy to participate in
19 any discussions that would further what your intent
20 is to get better mass transit service to La Guardia.

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay, and I would
22 like that we continue following up, having more
23 conversation. I think that is important. This is a
24 city of people, men and women with vision, and I
25 think that sometimes we have to think about not only

1
2 doing -- having our role during the year that we can
3 serve, but also leaving some legacy for the future
4 generation. And I think that La Guardia have to be
5 connected with a train system here in New York City.

6 In the calendar year 2014, the City will
7 contribute \$95.3 million to the MTA for Operational
8 System and Maintenance of the Commuter Railroad
9 Station in the five boroughs. Please provide the
10 committee with a breakdown on how the \$95 million the
11 City provides for operation and maintenance of the
12 30-city Metronome [sp?], and Long Island Railway
13 Station that the city has spent, particularly how
14 much is budgeted for each station?

15 AARON STERN: Well, we don't have that
16 right now. We'd have to get back to you. We have
17 that information. Keep in mind that the way that the
18 station maintenance agreement works is that it's
19 based on an inflater index. So every five years or
20 so we take a look at those costs, and we adjust it
21 for inflation. But we would be able to get you that
22 information. It would just take a little detail
23 because like you said, it's a substantial number of
24 stations.

1
2 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I'm going to
3 leave, and I will stop having more questions so that
4 my colleagues could ask, and I will be back.

5 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Chair
6 Rodriguez. We'll have Council Member Miller followed
7 by Council Member Johnson.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Good afternoon.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: I'm sorry, just a
10 reminder. I'm sorry, just a reminder. Colleagues,
11 we're going to have a four-minute clock for
12 questions. Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam
14 Chair. Thank you for coming out again. So, I first
15 want to follow up just as a matter of clarification
16 on the Number 7 Train. We talked about, and we used
17 the acronym and for most folks, they don't understand
18 what your talking about. But we're talking about an
19 improved signal system that will improve the
20 efficiency of the train, which will allow for a
21 larger capacity?

22 LOIS TENDLER: Yes, CBCT is a
23 Communication-Based Train Control, and it allows
24 trains to travel safely, closer together, less
25 headway.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, so you want
3 to decrease the headway?

4 LOIS TENDLER: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: But you don't
6 plan to include more train costs?

7 LOIS TENDLER: Yes, it allows us -- once
8 it gives us the capacity to do that, we plan on
9 running more service.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, because I
11 know in March the panel said that you could not add
12 more train cars to that line. So a lot has happened
13 in the last two months, huh?

14 CRAIG STEWART: That's actually -- it's
15 been happening for a good while now. The CBCT
16 contract is underway. New cars have been on order
17 for that line to expand many more cars. So it's
18 significantly underway.

19 LOIS TENDLER: You can't realize the
20 capacity improve until the system is done, and CBTC's
21 installation is going to be complete on the 7-Line in
22 2017.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay. So, I
24 don't know what we're calling it. We talk about the
25 growth in the City of New York. The majority of that

1
2 growth statistically has occurred and will continue
3 to occur in the other boroughs or the outside
4 boroughs. And a lot it seems to be the capital guys
5 have been spent on Second Avenue, an extension and
6 things of that nature there. We had a conversation
7 back in March. We talked about the bus service, New
8 York City Transit in my district in Queens and the
9 depots that represent -- that service those
10 communities, in particular the Jamaica Depot.

11 I know there was some -- recently some
12 land that had been purchased that had been -- they
13 had been trying to purchase for a number of years.
14 Now, what is the plan for over there, and what is the
15 real long-term plan, capital plan, if any, for a
16 facility there. A decade old survey said that that
17 facility was operating at 75% necessary -- of
18 capacity necessary to service that community, and had
19 not been addressed. What are you plans to address
20 that?

21 LOIS TENDLER: With the acquisition of
22 the properties adjacent to the depot, it's our
23 expectation that we're going to rebuild the depot
24 larger in place.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So that what
3 capital plan? Where are the dollars going to come
4 from? Because I'm not seeing it just yet.

5 LOIS TENDLER: [off mic]

6 CRAIG STEWART: We are planning to put it
7 in our Capital Program Proposal for 2015, 15 to 19.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, you know,
9 I'm going to be all alone now. So the other thing is
10 Chairman Prendergast indicated that he did not
11 support the Lockbox legislation, which secures the
12 fine and dedicated funding. Does that remain the
13 case? Because obviously with the continued deficits
14 that you incur, and given the fact that these dollars
15 are specifically dedicated to MTA and mass transit,
16 why wouldn't we insist that we get those dollars?

17 AARON STERN: Again, that's a very
18 political question. All we do know is -- what we can
19 say though is there's been annual significant
20 increases in the level of state support. In fact, in
21 2014, the amount that the State authorized is
22 actually a little bit higher than what we had
23 budgeted. So the issue of the Lockbox it's kind of
24 that it's not really in the purview of what I do. I
25 can just tell you what revenues we budget and what we

1
2 get. So we weren't really disappointed in the amount
3 that was appropriated to the MTA.

4 CRAIG STEWART: Okay, but, and I'm just
5 going to leave you with this one. As we put it on
6 the scale, all the monies that all the MTA surcharges
7 and taxes that we pay that's dedicated to that --
8 In fact, that fund is rated every year. When you add
9 it up and put it on the scale, are we losing money
10 with the increase?

11 AARON STERN: No.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Do know that?

13 AARON STERN: What it is, is it's the
14 State makes sure that -- that there's reserves large
15 enough to ensure that the appropriation that they
16 passed that there will, in fact, be enough funding to
17 meet that appropriation. And they've done so in
18 every instance. Obviously, if those reserves are
19 being taken, theoretically that could at some point
20 pose a problem, but it hasn't as of yet.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: But at some point
22 do the reserves exceed the amount of money that would
23 be dedicated?

24 AARON STERN: [interposing] Well, what
25 happens is --

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Do we know that?

3

4

AARON STERN: Yeah, well, what the
reserve is, is it's an educated guess on the part of
the State just to make sure that should the actual
revenues that are generated through economic activity
fall short, the reserve would be there in order to
ensure that the actual appropriation -- there's
enough money to fund the actual appropriation. So
those monies have come from the reserves.

10

11

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [off mic]

12

AARON STERN: Yeah.

13

14

15

16

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Council
Member Miller, who snuck away with more clock. Now,
we'll have -- Oh, thank you. Council Member Johnson
followed by Minority Leader Van Bramer.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I thank you for
being here today. I wanted to ask about the
extension of the 7 Train, which I'm very excited. I
believe it's going to be opening toward the end of
this year, the beginning of next year, which is very
excited for the Far West Side of Manhattan and
crucial for its success in the future. I know the
MTA and the City made a huge amount of investment in
making sure that it got done. I know that in the

1
2 Hudson Yard's Proposal, and the Far West Side
3 rezoning that occurred, there was not money at the
4 time for an additional station at 40th Street and
5 Tenth Avenue.

6 I wanted to understand where the MTA was
7 on that currently. I know that the land over there
8 was kept intact so that a shell is beneath ground in
9 case a station was funded in the future, how much
10 money do you think it would cost? Are you relying on
11 federal funds to make it happen? I would understand
12 that it's not currently in the MTA's budget. But I'd
13 love to know where you are on an additional station.

14 LOIS TENDLER: As you know, Councilman,
15 the 7 extension was totally funded by the City, and
16 that was the terms in which we took on the project.
17 So, while Tenth Avenue Station presents a really good
18 opportunity, somebody would have to fund it. At the
19 moment, it's not in the MTA Capital Plan, nor do we
20 plan it to be there. So the money would have to be
21 identified. We, as you know, have competing
22 priorities. So it's not quite on that list or our
23 list.

24
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: But you're
3 supportive, of course, of an additional station going
4 there.

5 LOIS TENDLER: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Good. Yeah. I
7 wanted to ask I think. I apologize if this was asked
8 before I walked in about additional countdown clocks.
9 I know psychologically they made a big difference for
10 riders both on bus lines, and on the subways and
11 understanding what future plans for rolling them out
12 at all stations in the system?

13 LOIS TENDLER: Okay, so I'm just looking
14 for some numbers. As you might -- New York City's
15 subways are divided into two division, the A and the
16 numbered trains. The B Division are the lettered
17 trains. The whole numbers -- all the numbered trains
18 with the exception of the 7 have countdown clocks,
19 and that's because we made an investment called ATS
20 and that allows it. The 7 Train will have countdown
21 clocks concurrent with the implementation of CBTC in
22 2017. The B Division of the clocks we have not done
23 ATS.

24 We're approaching the need for countdown
25 clocks, and we recognize how much our customers

1
2 appreciate them. It's our intent to get them out
3 there as quickly as we can. The B Division is a
4 trickier proposition. So what we are doing is we're
5 -- So to answer the question it's three to five years
6 for it all to be done. As we get to the three to
7 five years, we're working on sort of implementations
8 that will give customers information. It might not
9 be the same information you get on the A Division
10 trains. So it might say, Next uptown train two
11 stations away --

12 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: [interposing]
13 Got it.

14 LOIS TENDLER: -- as opposed to two
15 minutes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: And I know I
17 only have a few moments left. Wi-Fi?

18 LOIS TENDLER: Wi-Fi is done by a
19 contractor. It's going to be done in seven phases.
20 That, too, I think is 2017.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: It's not working
22 right now at 14th and 7th or 14th and 8th.

23 LOIS TENDLER: We will check into that
24 because that's the station that --

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I have a lot of
3 problems in the morning. [sic]

4 LOIS TENDLER: Okay.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. It needs
6 the Wi-Fi working there.

7 LOIS TENDLER: Okay, we will report that.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: And lastly, what
9 are the plans for potentially changing the Metro card
10 system and doing something different as other cities
11 have done like London and other places?

12 CRAIG STEWART: Yes, we do have plans in
13 this program as well as we expect as part of our
14 Capital Program Proposal implementing a new fare
15 payment system. It will be an open payment system is
16 what we're looking at. In other words, you'll be
17 able to pay with devices that you may have in your
18 packet, your credit card, your cell phone. We also
19 want to make sure that it's inter mobile that you can
20 go from the Long Island Railroad or --

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: What's the
22 timeline?

23 CRAIG STEWART: We're looking at having
24 it completed by 2019.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: One very last
3 quick thing. When are we going to get the alarms
4 disabled on the doors so we don't have noise
5 pollution? The MTA made a commitment that they
6 weren't needed. What do we need to actually make
7 sure that we don't have the [MIMICS ALARM] eh-eh-eh
8 when people open the doors, which happens when every
9 train opens up.

10 LOIS TENDLER: I'm not aware that we've
11 made a commitment to. I mean we make them
12 everywhere. We are looking at there are pros and
13 cons and we understand where our customers come out.
14 We have disabled them at some stations?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: How is that
16 decision made?

17 LOIS TENDLER: What?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: How is that
19 decision made?

20 LOIS TENDLER: We have a case-by-case
21 basis. So now at the Agency we're looking at it as
22 an agencywide issue, and then it gets somewhere. We
23 have a policy.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Okay, thank you
25 very much.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Council
3 Member Johnson. We'll have Majority Leader Van
4 Bramer followed by Council Member Chin and then
5 Council Member Rose.

6 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
7 very much, Madam Chair. I want to start by saying
8 thank you the response to the Woodside derailment.
9 When I got out there, I was not surprised but pleased
10 to see Chair Prendergast, and President Bianco there
11 as well as some of you all who are here in the
12 audience. And your concern for the people, and the
13 professionalism of your staff was very much
14 appreciated. So I just want to say thank you
15 publicly to everyone for that. Having said that, do
16 you have an update on why that happened, and if not,
17 do you have a timeline for when you might be
18 reporting back on the investigation?

19 LOIS TENDLER: We still don't know why it
20 happened. It happened on May 2nd. We took out a
21 broken rail. That rail has been sent for forensic
22 analysis. We're checking out the rail itself, and
23 checking out like sort of the pieces of the puzzle
24 because it could be so many things. So while there
25 is a broken rail, we don't know definitively that

1
2 that was because of the derailment. And that's what
3 the investigation is focused on fining out what
4 happened.

5 MAJOIRITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: But that
6 certainly seems to be the focus of the investigation
7 is the broken rail?

8 LOIS TENDLER: It's one piece of the
9 puzzle. It's the most concrete piece of the puzzle
10 we had when it happened.

11 MAJOIRITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Right, and
12 I think speeding was ruled out, right, and other
13 factors were pretty much ruled out at this point?

14 LOIS TENDLER: I think so, yes.

15 MAJOIRITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Adam is
16 shaking his head yes. Okay, so I look forward to
17 following up with all of you on that very important
18 piece. Two, the 7 Train, and -- which lots of folks
19 have talked about which I'm grateful obviously
20 Finance Chair Ferreras and I share equal concerns on
21 different ends of the system where there's growth and
22 development happening in Chair Ferreras' district,
23 which is great. There's also great growth and
24 development happening at the western most end of
25

1
2 Queens, and it is difficult to get on the 7 Train on
3 74th Street.

4 Try getting on a Birney Jackson. So, we
5 all care about this capacity versus growth question,
6 right. And obviously we have endured great pain in
7 Long Island City over the installation of CBTC. But
8 the question still remains even post CBTC, is your
9 increased growth going to meet the increased need?
10 Right. So you have some estimates, and I know you
11 actually shared them in the past about exactly how
12 many more people do you think you're going to be able
13 to move as a result of CBTC being installed and
14 finished?

15 But I wonder if you've compared that with
16 the projections of growth in terms of the population
17 all along the line like Council Member Koo's
18 district, Council Member Ferreras' district, Council
19 Member Johnson's district, my district. And, of
20 course, because 74th and Roosevelt Junction and
21 Willets they're all hubs, they're actually pulling
22 from other districts, as well. You all know this
23 very, very well. So that's sort of like the multi-
24 billion dollar question here, right? What's your
25

1
2 number crunching tell you post 2017, we get there, if
3 you're going to be able to meet the demand?

4 LOIS TENDLER: I'll have to get back to
5 you on that. I mean I believe we have studies. I
6 just don't know what they show.

7 MAJOIRITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Okay, I
8 mean because I know you -- I forget the estimates of
9 it like 2,000 more as we work CBTC, you know, both
10 the frequency of the trains, which is going to
11 increase, right?

12 LOIS TENDLER: Uh-huh.

13 MAJOIRITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: As with
14 CBTC and the numbers, I think it's really, really
15 critical, and I think Chair Ferreras would agree with
16 me, right, to compare and contrast that with the
17 anticipated growth. Some of which we know. Some of
18 which we don't know, but it's really, really
19 important because the pain and the suffering that
20 Long Island City and others have had to endure with
21 the installation of this, which we know has gone on
22 longer than two or three years. But we'll continue
23 to press, and I know I don't have much more time but
24 this is so important to the future of not just my
25 district, but really all of Queens.

1
2 The 7 Train, as evidenced by the number
3 of people who have mentioned it, is the life blood of
4 so much of Queens. And I echo Chair Ferreras'
5 comments about the quality and the conditions of the
6 7 Trains and our elevated lines. But that answer
7 that you will provide us is so critically important.
8 And obviously I look forward to working with you to
9 mitigate some of the effects of the closures, and
10 will continue to press for that. But we have to get
11 hold of this. We have to plan for the future, and I
12 look forward to working with you on that. And maybe
13 if there's a second round I can approach East Side
14 access. But for now, I thank you, too, Chair.
15 Thanks a lot.

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you,
17 Majority Leader. Council Member Chin followed by
18 Council Member Rose followed by Council Member
19 Gibson.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chairs.
21 The first question is escalators. With capital
22 dollars being spent, are you looking at how to get
23 these escalator repairs quicker? Like one in my
24 district is four way. It took more than year. of
25

1
2 course, it was also an expansion, but at Delancey
3 Street we always have escalator problems there, too.

4 LOIS TENDLER: First off, what was going
5 on at East Broadway and also at Valorie. Actually,
6 they were escalator replacements. They weren't
7 repairs. They were brand new escalators, which were
8 installed. Those jobs were delayed mostly because of
9 Sandy because the response to Sandy require that we
10 pull of staff power to go deal with the after effects
11 of the storm. So a lot and general orders,
12 diversions we needed to do work were cancelled for
13 jobs like those escalators so we could get into other
14 parts of the system that needed to be pumped out. So
15 that's the major reason why those two jobs, because
16 they were the same contractor. There was a third
17 one. It was it was Whitehall, Valorie, and East
18 Broadway were all on the same contract. So they all
19 have brand new escalators now, and it took us longer
20 than we would have liked, but it had to do with --

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [interposing] So
22 your sum up was that it took longer because you had
23 to pull staff away to deal with what did you say --

24 LOIS TENDLER: [interposing] Well, it
25 wasn't the staff. It was just like to the extent

1
2 that they needed general order. To the extent that
3 they needed us to take a train out because the -- We
4 plan train outages like months, and months in
5 advance, and if you have to cancel they all fit
6 together. So we don't want people to be totally
7 without transportation. So for instance, when the 7
8 Train comes out, we never take the E out because it's
9 an alternative service. So what happened was because
10 of the response needed for Sandy, general orders,
11 which would have been needed for those escalators got
12 cancelled in favor of general orders, which we needed
13 to do things like pump out the system and make --

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [interposing] So
15 going forward, I guess the second question I have
16 relating to that is the flood prevention measurement.
17 I mean you guys know what happened in Sandy. So
18 going forward, how were you spending the capital
19 dollars to make sure this doesn't happen again
20 especially with a subway station right above and the
21 train -- our train is still not running to Brooklyn,
22 and South Ferry. So you good some of your
23 experience, and looking ahead, how are you doing
24 flood prevention measures?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CRAIG STEWART: We have a number of resiliency projects that we're working on. They're - we have applied in a competitive grant program for -- made available by the federal government of about \$3 billion. We have a \$3.8 billion application in. There are many approaches to this. Flood walls covering of vent gratings, mechanisms and devices that prevent water coming through the doorways, and vent shafts. So we're looking at all of those options, and we're evaluating them on a case-by-case basis.

LOIS TENDLER: Also, Councilwoman, we're actually moving. We've looked, and we're continuing to look. We're moving ahead with some projects. So one of our first projects are covers, and it's all Lower Manhattan. We did different mechanisms to cover an entrance to a subway in advance. So they're being, if not piloted because we think this is the way to go. We're rolling that out first in Lower Manhattan. We shared with the Community Board a list of locations and I'm happy to get that to you as well.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yes, I would love
3 to follow up with you on that. Thank you. Thank you
4 Chair.

5 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Council
6 Member Chin. Council Member Rose followed by Council
7 Member Gibson.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you, Chair.
9 I have a few questions. Could you give me an update
10 on the status of bus time and the countdown clocks?
11 And why I need to pay out of my money to have some on
12 my bus stops if I want them?

13 LOIS TENDLER: Okay, bus time is now
14 operational throughout the City. So no matter where
15 you live, you can find out where you bus is, and when
16 it's coming. We're talking about --

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing]
18 Countdown.

19 LOIS TENDLER: -- countdown clocks bus
20 stop

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: At buses.

22 LOIS TENDLER: Right. That's a program
23 that DOT has put together in response to lots of
24 interest in having it occur. When the bus shelter
25 franchise was negotiated, there was thought given to

1
2 having the ticker like an LED screen within the
3 shelter that would provide this information. When
4 that was done, though, we didn't have the capacity to
5 give them the information. That did not come to be a
6 requirement of the franchise. We approached Cemusa
7 who holds the franchise, and they wanted a ridiculous
8 amount of money for providing that space. We crossed
9 the information. It's going to be provided on a
10 pole, a street pole and DOT does street furniture.
11 In fact, DOT is actually responsible for all bus
12 stops. We facilitate, but the actual placement of
13 bus stop is done by DOT.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: By you pay for the
15 installation of these --

16 LOIS TENDLER: [interposing] We pay for
17 the actual --

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: -- countdown
19 clocks?

20 LOIS TENDLER: That's right.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And how many have
22 you installed, and are you going to installed, and
23 are you going to install any?

24 LOIS TENDLER: We have not installed any.
25 All the bus clocks that exist have been installed by

1
2 DOT. We're very supportive of the program. We think
3 it's great.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay. Could you
5 also bring me up to date on the status of the Bus
6 Rapid Transit on Staten Island?

7 LOIS TENDLER: As you know, we had a
8 process. We did alternatives analysis about
9 transportation options for the North Shore. That
10 analysis resulted in a recommendation of a bus way or
11 an SBS route. We amended -- we put money in the plan
12 for it if it would be considered a resiliency
13 project, and we don't.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So the lowest
15 amount we've been waiting for I can't even tell you
16 how many years because we thought we were going to
17 get light rail or some sort of rail. You decided
18 that we were going to get Bus Rapid Transit. So what
19 is the timeline? When does this become a reality?

20 CRAIG STEWART: It's a proposal for the
21 next plan.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: A proposal for the
23 next plan?

24 CRAIG STEWART: Right.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: When is the next
3 plan?

4 CRAIG STEWART: The next plan is '15 to
5 '19. It goes to Albany in October.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Could you tell me
7 the statistics that you have for the fare beater
8 arrests, and if any money was saved using this
9 process?

10 LOIS TENDLER: I don't have anything
11 here. I'm happy to send them to you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, and I
13 received a request that Metro Cards, Metro Card
14 machines that currently only provide receipts for
15 people that use debit or credit cards to purchase
16 cards at the Metro Card machines. Currently, there is
17 no system in place to provide receipts of people who
18 pay with cash. So if the Metro Card is lost or
19 damaged, there is no way for the transaction to be
20 tracked. Therefore, the card cannot be replaced. Do
21 you have any plan in mind to change the machines so
22 that people -- to provide receipts so that people
23 when they make Metro Card transactions can, you know,
24 don't lose their money?

1
2 CRAIG STEWART: Okay, we can look into
3 that, but as part of the new fare payment system that
4 we're developing right now, we will -- we can look
5 into new -- we'll be looking at new machines doing
6 different functions. We can certainly keep that as a
7 recommendation.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And it will ensure
9 that people will be able to recoup lost funds if they
10 are -- ?

11 CRAIG STEWART: Yes, we can consider
12 that, yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Council
15 Member Rose. Thank you for bringing up that
16 question. My counsel and I are -- our brain is
17 going. [laughter] Council Member Gibson followed by
18 Council Member Cumbo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you. Good
20 afternoon everyone. Thank you for coming today. I
21 will try to make my remarks as brief as possible, but
22 I guess my first question. I refrained from my
23 previous service as an Assembly Member, and the
24 wonderful and ever so popular MTA Payroll Mobility
25 Tax. And I know that over the past several years,

1
2 you have received quite a number of an increase in
3 that dedicated revenue stream. And what I'd like to
4 know in reference to the projected 4% toll and fare
5 increase from March of '15, as well as another 4%
6 plan for March of '17, do you think that with this
7 projected growth over the several years, that these
8 two projected increases are still necessary in '15
9 and '17. And as well as do you think that you will
10 continue to see this type of trend happening as you
11 work with the State Legislature?

12 AARON STERN: Everything you said is
13 factually correct. Our Financial Plan assumes the
14 revenue from the 2015 and 2014 fare and toll
15 increases with those revenues, and the robust
16 increases in PMT and other subsidies still we stay in
17 slight balance through 2016 with actually deficit
18 projections in 2017. That without, of course, is
19 without the labor settlements that you've, I'm sure
20 you're read about. So at this point we need all that
21 money.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay.

23 AARON STERN: So it's not like that would
24 replace it. We've already -- our financial plan
25 assumes all of that -- all of those numbers.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Right, and I
3 guess I emphasize that it's a little concerning
4 because many New Yorkers know and face the everyday
5 reality of mass transit. It's one of the largest
6 infrastructures we have, and it's an aging system.
7 The ridership continues to go up, and people don't
8 necessarily feel that their money is being used
9 because they're on crowded trains each and every day.
10 So that's the frustration that we hear everyday, and
11 it's our job to try to find some balance, and either
12 be able to justify this or talk about how with the
13 expected increase in ridership we can increase the
14 frequency of many of our trains and buses that has
15 already been mentioned.

16 AARON STERN: Well, the frequency again
17 is going to be a commission that is going to look at
18 MTA in a much broader spectrum. The 4% was actually
19 a reduction from prior plans. Prior plans had a 7.5%
20 reduction on down. The management of the MTA decided
21 that the people had paid a lot, and what can we do if
22 we had some increases in certain revenues. But what
23 could we do ourselves to try to help that. And we
24 came up with a plan called MTA Fare Reduction
25 Efficiencies, and we came up with yet a new -- I

1
2 don't know if you noticed but since 2009, MTA has
3 come up with savings that now annualize to about \$1.5
4 billion.

5 We said, Okay, what else can we do? So
6 we came up with yet another set of expense reduction
7 programs that started at \$50 million in 2014. It's
8 going to grow incrementally by \$50 million a year.
9 That extra money that we won't spend is in large part
10 responsible for our ability to reduce those fare and
11 toll increases from 7.5 to 4%, which we consider a 4%
12 a bi-annual is 2% a year, which is pretty darn close
13 to inflation. Given that a lot of our expenses that
14 we call uncontrollable expenses were pensions and
15 health and welfare are increasing much, much great.
16 So we're doing a balancing act trying to do the right
17 things for all our constituents. And we're totally
18 cognizant of what these fare increase mean. We think
19 the 4% is very reasonable, and we work very hard to
20 come with that.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, I have two
22 quick questions, and I'm going to get them out [bell]
23 as quickly as I can. I'm sorry. If it's okay, Madam
24 Chairwoman? Very quickly. So I like our Chairwoman
25 I represent Yankee Stadium in the entire four line in

1
2 the Bronx going up to the Burnside. So many of the
3 concerns the Chairwoman expressed, I also express as
4 well. But in terms of capital projections and
5 renovations, we have first of all the Bronx I
6 represent is a hill. So many of my residents have to
7 come out of the community and get to the train
8 station. The elevator and escalator requests that we
9 continue to put in, I know there are some federal
10 regulations. In your Capital Plan, are you looking
11 at making any more additions of elevators and
12 escalators -- Lois, you know very well Burnside
13 Avenue -- in the future?

14 LOIS TENDLER: Okay, there is no plan for
15 escalators because escalators don't satisfy ADA. So
16 in terms of elevators, our ongoing commitment was to
17 make 100 stations ADA accessible by 2020. We are on
18 target to meet that. We just opened our 81st
19 elevator, and we have five in construction; six in
20 design; and then nine we hope to get in the next
21 plan, which gets us to 100. We recognize, however,
22 that we just can't stop. We can't say we did 100 and
23 we're done. So we're in conversations now with the
24 affected community, the disabled community and the
25 other parties to see if we can fashion a proposal

1
2 from where do we go from here? So we know we need to
3 do it, and I'm going to figure out what it is we need
4 to do and then I'm going to figure out how to pay for
5 it. Hopefully, with your help.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay. We will
7 talk. Thank you very much.

8 LOIS TENDLER: Thanks.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam
10 Chairwoman.

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very
12 much. Council Member Cumbo and then we're going to
13 have a second round that we're going to kick off with
14 Council Member Johnson.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Chair
16 Ferreras. Thank you for the additional time. I
17 wanted to thank you all for coming today. My
18 questions are very brief, and they'll be a bit
19 localized, and I apologize for that. In my district
20 the B-151 Bus was very instrumental particularly for
21 our senior community in transporting between Brooklyn
22 and Manhattan. And as our communities continue to
23 age, this bus and our ever-growing population in
24 Brooklyn, New York becomes more and more in demand.
25 I wanted to know were there conversations, ideas,

1
2 plans, implementation for this bus line that was cut
3 in 2010 to be restored? And allowing for so many of
4 our seniors the ability to travel back and forth? So
5 that's my first question.

6 LOIS TENDLER: Okay, actually no. The
7 B51 was a dupe, it went over the Manhattan Bridge.
8 It went from Brooklyn Heights to City Hall. It was a
9 bus that traveled in incredible traffic. It was
10 incredibly unreliable, and took a vote on time to get
11 there. It had a limited ridership. I understand
12 that people who liked taking the bus like taking the
13 bus. There are alternative subways for that trip.
14 It had very low -- and I can get you the actual data
15 from 2010. But the cost recovery ratio was really
16 poor, and that's how we did the first cut. We looked
17 at what was going to come off the table. So the B51
18 was not a route that we would be looking to restore.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: The challenge that
20 I have with that is that so many of our
21 transportation options in Brooklyn, New York are not
22 accessible to our seniors. So if you look at
23 Franklin Avenue where the shuttle is or the two,
24 three, four, and five, there's no escalator or
25 elevator there. If you look at the Clinton-

1
2 Washington Train Station, which is hugely popular,
3 it's got to be one of the most frequented train
4 stations in Brooklyn, New York. Certainly topping in
5 terms of residential areas, in terms of ridership.

6 But there's this overwhelming challenge
7 that in that community from the G-Line to the A and
8 the C-Line to many of the other lines within the
9 district in a fast growing borough. But particularly
10 in the 35th Council District, we either can't take
11 the bus to get to Manhattan, and the other elements
12 are too inaccessible, making it very difficult for
13 our seniors to travel in that way. And just last
14 year 60,000 people moved to the borough of Brooklyn.
15 So with all of this change, with all of this
16 development, with the growing infrastructure in terms
17 of our -- Excuse me, our growing aging population, I
18 would really request that MTA re-look at that policy
19 in terms of cutting that particular bus line.

20 LOIS TENDLER: We can look at it, sure.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Are there any
22 other bus lines, or any other way for bus
23 transportation to go from Brooklyn to Manhattan that
24 would make that ride easier?

1
2 LOIS TENDLER: There is only -- I don't
3 want to misspeak, but for express buses I believe
4 there is one local bus in Brooklyn that goes over a
5 bridge, and that's the B-39, and it travels between
6 Marcy Avenue on the J and Delancey Essex. But that
7 is the one bus that goes over.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Let me ask you
9 also another question. With the increase in the --
10 you have to pay an additional dollar for a Metro
11 Card. How financially successful and viable has that
12 been?

13 AARON STERN: That program has been very
14 successful. It was anticipated that there would be a
15 net gain of approximately \$20 million from the Green
16 Fee. In fact, the --

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: What do you call
18 that fee?

19 AARON STERN: The Green -- the Green Fee.
20 In other words, the intentions of the fee was to
21 reduce waste and encourage people to reuse their
22 cards. And the actual rate of reuse has exceeded our
23 expectations, and now 90% of Metro Card transactions
24 are refills. So nine out of ten times people are
25 refilling their card and not buying a new card.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: What about the
3 financial gain from purchasing replacement cards?

4 AARON STERN: So, as I said, the -- it
5 was assumed that we would have a net improvement in
6 revenue of \$20 million. That assumption took into
7 consideration the revenue from the Green Fee, and
8 also the loss of expired card value. So the --
9 compared to the original projection on the revenue
10 side, we're slightly lower, about \$2 million lower
11 than we had anticipated. We haven't actually
12 determined the actual loss of revenue from the ECV.
13 That's being done right now. So we know we're close
14 to the \$20 million original forecast, but we don't
15 have an exact answer yet.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Just one question
17 just to close. How much does it cost to run an
18 individual bus line on average per year?

19 AARON STERN: I don't have that with
20 that. I could get that back to you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay.

22 LOIS TENDLER: We'll get you the right
23 one.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Council Member,
3 we're going to start the second round, which is a
4 total of an entire minute. Okay, two. Council
5 Member Johnson followed by Council Member Gibson.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I take my orders
7 here. Council Member Chin and I share a station,
8 West Fourth Street Station, which is sort of a
9 gateway to Greenwich Village major hub line where
10 multiple lines come together. It's a station that
11 needs serious capital improvements. It's actually a
12 bit -- Don't take this personally, but a bit of an
13 embarrassment actually how bad a condition that
14 station is in. 14th Street and 7th Avenue is
15 actually a pretty bad station as well. I know that
16 there's a capital plan. I would like to understand
17 what are the time schedules for real improvements for
18 those stations. 14th and 7th and West 4th.

19 LOIS TENDLER: Our Station Program is
20 focused on component repairs, and those component
21 repairs actually speak to structure elements not
22 aesthetic elements.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Tile work, paint

24 --

25

1
2 LOIS TENDLER: [interposing] Those are
3 all aesthetic.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: -- leaks.

5 LOIS TENDLER: Leaks --

6 CRAIG STEWART: In our next proposal we
7 propose to address about 40 stations in terms of
8 renewal, and component repairs.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: And are these
10 stations in those 40 stations?

11 CRAIG STEWART: I'd have to take a look
12 and get back to you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: That would be
14 helpful, too. Could you please send me that
15 information?

16 CRAIG STEWART: Sure.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you. And
18 then the other question is between 14th Street and
19 6th Avenue, and 14th Street and 7th Avenue is a
20 tunnel that people use to get underground. There
21 used to be a tunnel from 14th Street and 7th Avenue
22 to 14th Street and 8th Avenue. That tunnel has been
23 closed for a very long time. I was wondering why
24 it's been closed. I know that decision was probably
25 made a long time ago, and if there's any possibility

1
2 to get it open, and it's an easy way to transfer. I
3 don't know if there are structural issues, but I have
4 always wondered what issue was there.

5 LOIS TENDLER: Actually, it pre-dates my
6 time with the Transit Authority, and I've been there
7 forever. But I would suspect it was closed per the
8 police. I mean we closed a lot of passage roads like
9 that in the '80s.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: For what?

11 LOIS TENDLER: For security reasons we
12 closed a lot of passageways in the '80s, early '90s.
13 We could look at the passageway between 7th and 8th.
14 I'm not sure if it's amenable to being re-opened
15 because what we did in several places was build
16 communications, build rooms, build communications
17 rooms, which just have the station functions in
18 things like closed passageways. But the first that
19 would be -- I'll let you know whether or not it's
20 right to being reopened and what it would take to
21 reopen it. And then you have to have conversations
22 with the NYPD about how they feel about it.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you. I
24 want to say thanks on the restoration of service on
25 the Far West Side bus ride coming from Columbus

1
2 Circle down to Greenwich Village, on increased
3 services, which is coming on the L-Train in both
4 directions at peak times. So thank you on that, and
5 I know that when I asked previously you said it was a
6 case-by-case basis and not to be obsessed with the
7 noise from the doors. But --

8 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Council
9 Member.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: -- what is the -
11 - I would like to understand why. I want to
12 understand more about the doors. So let's have an
13 offline conversation about noisy doors. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay, offline.
15 Thank you. Council Member Gibson will wrap us up so
16 we can have TLC who is patient over there waiting --

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay.

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: -- come up.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Oh, it's like
20 closed. Great. I just have one quick question about
21 our Paratransit Access-A-Ride. You indicated that
22 you've achieved a savings of about \$280 million based
23 on some of the diversity in terms of full ridership
24 of low cost vouchers. So I guess my question is
25 what's the role the diversion of ridership and some

1
2 lower cost vouchers has played in achieving these
3 savings of 280? And what has been the responsiveness
4 from some of our customers at Access-A-Ride that are
5 now getting one system versus another type of
6 service. And I guess I say that because I know some
7 have called and expressed concern because they're no
8 longer being picked up at their location, and dropped
9 of elsewhere, at train stations, et cetera. So I
10 just wanted to see what type of feedback you received
11 on some of the changes in this program?

12 AARON STERN: Okay, so basically the
13 current estimate is that we've achieved approximately
14 \$34 million of annual savings from the increase in
15 the percentage of trips accounted for by the voucher
16 and taxi service compared with the primary carrier
17 service. The percentage of trips accounted for by
18 vouchers and taxis increased from a little over 10%
19 when we started the initiative in 2010 to
20 approximately 30% today. The --

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: What has the
22 response been?

23 LOIS TENDLER: I think Councilwoman,
24 you're sort of mixing up two separate initiatives.
25 One is diverting from our carriers to taxis

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Right.

3

4

LOIS TENDLER: -- and cab services. And
it's been very positive. I will tell you that
there's some people who really want to speak with a
carrier, and then other customers who only want the
voucher. But it's a been a successful initiative.
But you're talking about people getting dropped off
was an initiative where we reviewed everybody's
eligibility, and some people were conditionally
eligible. So they couldn't walk more than two
blocks, but if the bus stop was within two blocks,
they were expected to make a trip on a bus. And that
where the people were affected has not been so
popular.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, thank you

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Council
Member Gibson. We'll have Co-Chair Rodriguez before
we wrap up today.

CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

Two points of information. One is the Rail Yard
[sic] 207 and I had a good conversation with Yanko
[sp?] and the team. You know the Rail Yard, 207 Rail
Yard is 35 acres. It's larger than the Hudson Yard.
I believe that that can be a great potential for the

1
2 MTA to get revenue, and for the City to build a tech
3 community with affordable housing. As we have said
4 before, I hope that we can have conversation. I have
5 mentioned to some of them -- to Yanko and others, but
6 I think that it is time for us. I would like to see
7 how open we are so that we can come out and bring
8 some ideas and proposals. I will have a meeting also
9 with Alisha Bling [sp?], from the Mayor's office to
10 see how we can start a real conversation of building
11 a tech community in rail yard that as in Hudson Yard
12 we put in a platform that in the top we should be
13 able to use that space. So this is something that I
14 want to bring to your attention, and hopefully my
15 question is can we follow up with some conversation?

16 LOIS TENDLER: Yes, as President Bianco
17 told us we were looking forward to receiving a
18 proposal from you so we can engage the appropriate
19 people at the MTA.

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Right. Thank
21 you. The second thing is Port Authority, 177 George
22 Washington Bridge. We've been losing access to the
23 A-Train Station. Has the MTA participated in any
24 conversation with the Port Authority expecting the
25

1
2 local access that the community will have at that
3 location?

4 LOIS TENDLER: We have. It is as you
5 know, Councilman, a Port Authority project to rebuild
6 that bus in terminal. It affects our services. It
7 cuts off a passageway from the 175th Street Station,
8 which led right into the terminal, and it also
9 required us to relocate a lot of that terminal.
10 We've been working with the Port Authority. We've
11 been working with your office and the Community Board
12 with deal with the short-term.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, and you
14 should know that the community is angry,
15 disappointed. Tomorrow we will have a large rally
16 with all the elected officials in Lower Manhattan and
17 New York for Change because what the Port Authority
18 has done is that they made our community lose a whole
19 open space on the second floor. But something that
20 is related to the MTA because the Mayor promised the
21 Port Authority. We will lose access to the 173 Train
22 Station. That is very important because right now
23 someone that get on 176th, they can exit at that
24 terminal. So someone coming from Jersey or moving
25 here or any New Yorker they will lose their access.

1
2 And for us, it's a big loss that we have, and we want
3 to see how we can work together.

4 LOIS TENDLER: Okay, I'd be happy to.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Thank
6 you. The next is about the next budget, in the next
7 budget can we please consider funding a study on the
8 feasibility of connecting La Guardia Airport to
9 train?

10 LOIS TENDLER: I think that it would
11 behoove all of us to review the study we did last
12 time for this before we commit to funding a new
13 study, and I --

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
15 Well, I hope that you can check with the rest of your
16 team and see because the last study was about
17 particular in one train station that the community
18 thought it was not the best thing to do this.
19 There's other options. It's not necessarily that
20 particular train. At least I believe that a study
21 cannot be taking -- It cannot take more than million
22 dollars. And I hope that if we can put the money
23 together with a contribution that the City make, that
24 it's not only the \$800 that they only pay \$800
25 million. But also the \$2.8 billion that we

1
2 contribute at the state level with the Transit Tax
3 Revenue I believe that at least we should be
4 committed to allocate a small amount of money to do a
5 study on the flexibility of connecting La Guardia to
6 airport -- to La Guardia Airport Train System. Can
7 you check and get back us and let us know?

8 LOIS TENDLER: Sure, yes.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: My last one is

10 --

11 [Pause]

12 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: -- the NWB
13 eight percentage.

14 LOIS TENDLER: I know that one.

15 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Can you please
16 provide the committee with the NWB percentage from
17 the MTA contract --

18 LOIS TENDLER: [interposing] I can.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: -- for the
20 current year 2013?

21 LOIS TENDLER: [interposing] Right now.
22 Just give me one second. There -- there -- we
23 operate in a state rules. So the Governor Cuomos's
24 mandate is 20%. In 2013, we exceeded that. We came

1
2 in at 22%, and this year we're running at -- you've
3 heard, year-to-date, three-quarters --

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
5 Can you provide us a link of all those NWB 8 that
6 they would benefit in those contracts?

7 LOIS TENDLER: I should be able to get
8 that for you, yes.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very
11 much, and I want to thank my colleagues for being
12 considerate in their questioning. Thank you for
13 coming to testify. There were questions, I know
14 shockingly that we did not get to you, or we forgot
15 to ask. I am going to forward them, and I would ask
16 that you respond to us expeditiously so that we can
17 have the proper budget negotiating conversation here
18 in the Council. Thank you very much for testifying.
19 We're going to take a two-minute break, and we'll
20 bring on TLC. Thank you.

21 [Pause]

22 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: [gavel] I am
23 Council Member Julissa Ferreras, Chair of the Finance
24 Committee. Will now resume the City Council's
25 hearing on the Mayor's Executive Budget at FY2015.

1
2 We just heard from the MTA, and now the Finance
3 Committee and the Transportation Committee will hear
4 from Chair -- from Taxi and Limousine Commission.
5 Before we do, I will open the mic up to my Co-Chair
6 Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez for his statement.

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
8 Commissioner. As I mentioned or referred to DOT
9 Commissioner, like Commissioner like Joshi is like as
10 soon as she got this responsibility to be our new TLC
11 Commissioner have been also another instrumental
12 partner when it comes to Vision Zero, and I really
13 appreciate it. We will hear from the Taxi and
14 Limousine Commission. The Commission will update the
15 Committee on the status of the Borough Taxis
16 Initiative, and when we can expect to see the next
17 step of 6,000 Green Cars on our roads.

18 They will disclose their ongoing effort
19 to increase accessibility in taxi cabs, and implement
20 programs to increase enforcement on the illegal
21 street hails of services refusal citywide. The
22 Commission will also update the committees on how it
23 plans to contribute to the Vision Zero program and
24 impact drivers' behavior within the industry to
25 create safe streets for all. I would like to end by

1
2 proposing the new initiative, which is the one that I
3 also mentioned to the DOT to create and educate --

4 A Vision Zero Initiative, a funding
5 initiative focusing on providing funding for the
6 grassroots groups safe --the Coalition for Safe New
7 York. And whoever is just doing work already that
8 been -- that they've been helpful to our agenda. I
9 think that if we can get some funding committed from
10 all of us, the Administration and the Council, I
11 think that we will send them a clear message that
12 they will get our support to continue doing their
13 educational grassroots work.

14 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Co-Chair
15 Rodriguez, and now you begin your testimony. Thank
16 you, Commissioner.

17 MEERA JOSHI: Thank you, and good
18 afternoon Chair Ferreras, Chair Rodriguez and members
19 of the City Council Committees on Finance and
20 Transportation. I'm Meera Joshi, Chair of the Taxi
21 and Limousine Commission. First, Chair Ferreras,
22 thank you and I look forward to working with you and
23 the Finance Committee to ensure that TLC is managed
24 in a fiscally prudent manner and that we're
25 appropriately resourced to help our licensees provide

1
2 the safe and reliable taxi and for-hire service
3 across all five boroughs of New York City. Chair
4 Rodriguez, thank you very much for your support of
5 Mayor de Blasio's Vision Zero Action Plan, and for
6 being such a strong voice at our Vision Zero Town
7 Hall events. I appreciate the open line of
8 communication, and I look forward to working together
9 on legislation in the future. And thank you both for
10 giving me the opportunity to speak on TLC's Budget
11 for Fiscal Year 2015.

12 The Budget for Fiscal Year 2015 is just
13 under \$63 million. Of that \$34.4 million is for
14 personal services and \$28.6 million is for other than
15 personal services. The Budget for Fiscal Year 2015
16 also includes \$1.1 million in new funding dedicated
17 to TLC's Vision Zero initiatives, including the
18 addition of 15 more positions. The Vision Zero funds
19 will allow us to create a Safety Squad, Safety PSAs
20 for the riding public, and educational and outreach
21 material for our licensees. Within these additional
22 funds -- with these additional funds in our budget,
23 we will have the means to fully and effectively
24 support Mayor de Blasio's Vision Zero initiatives.
25 The most effective way to keep our streets safe is to

1
2 take wholly unlicensed vehicles off the road. The
3 Tow Pound Contract that went into effect in April
4 2013 has drastically increased our ability to do this
5 work. Prior to the Tow Pound Contract, we only had a
6 limited amount of space to store vehicles and,
7 therefore, only a limited capacity to seize. Today,
8 there's no cap on the number of unlicensed vehicles
9 we can take off the road. So far, in this fiscal
10 year, the Commission has seized over 8,000 unlicensed
11 vehicles, a 3% increase over Fiscal --

12 MALE SPEAKER: 30.

13 MEERA JOSHI: -- a 30% increase. I was
14 going to say I knew we did better than that. A 30%
15 increase over Fiscal Year 2013, and we still have a
16 month and a half to go. We also continue to partner
17 with the Police Department to seize unlicensed van
18 operators. And together we've seized over 500
19 unlicensed vans this fiscal year. In addition, we've
20 ramped up our seizure efforts at JFK Airport now that
21 the TLC has a satellite office on the airport
22 grounds. In this fiscal year, TLC inspectors seized
23 over 2,000 unlicensed cars, and approximately 50
24 unlicensed vans at JFK alone.

1
2 Our drivers, unlike drivers who do not
3 have TLC licenses, must pass background checks and
4 drug tests in order to operate a TLC licensed
5 vehicle. And TLC licensed vehicles are inspected
6 several times a year and carry insurance well beyond
7 the State's minimum. These are the protections that
8 we believe all New Yorkers deserve, and thus our
9 continued efforts to get unlicensed vehicles off the
10 streets is a high priority.

11 Since November, 2013, TLC auctioned 400
12 wheelchair-accessible Medallions, which is expected
13 to generate over \$400 million in revenue for the City
14 over the next two fiscal years. The sale of these
15 Medallions increased New York City's wheelchair-
16 accessible Yellow Taxi fleet by approximately 170%.
17 This increase, together with the potential auction of
18 additional wheelchair-accessible Medallions, and our
19 recently passed rules to make 50% of the Yellow Taxi
20 fleet wheelchair-accessible by 2020, will ensure that
21 persons who use wheelchairs will have greater access
22 to the taxi system. This concludes my testimony for
23 TLC's Budget for Fiscal Year 2015. And I'd like to
24 thank you for the opportunity to testify, and for
25 allowing me to share some of TLC's accomplishments

1
2 with you. At this time, I'd be happy to answer your
3 questions.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very
5 much, and I really appreciate your testimony today.
6 I'm going to pass it over to my Co-Chair Rodriguez
7 for questions.

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
9 Chair Ferreras. Commissioner, why is your testimony
10 that is not related to the street hail, especially on
11 the overall plan? Can you ---?

12 MEERA JOSHI: I anticipated you would ask
13 me that question. So I'm going to let you ask the
14 question. I'll be happy to explain.

15 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great.

16 MEERA JOSHI: So under the Hail Law, the
17 earliest time that the TLC can issue a new round of
18 Street Hail Livery Licenses is June 12, 2014. Where
19 we are right now is we've begun stakeholder
20 engagement, which is a process by which where we need
21 to speak to all of our stakeholders, including
22 passengers, which is a group we don't hear enough
23 from to get a good understanding of how the program
24 has worked thus far. And we're also looking forward
25 to your hearing, which I anticipate will be in June

1
2 to get additional feedback from the public, and from
3 licensees and different members of TLC's groups on
4 how the program is working thus far.

5 And another major contributor to our
6 engagement process is the disability advocates
7 because we also have to submit a plan to the State on
8 June 12, 2014 that explains to the State DOT our plan
9 to provide meaningful access to the disabled
10 community in all sorts of TLC licensed vehicles. So
11 that is Green taxis as well as Yellow taxis. Today,
12 we have about 5,000 Green taxis on the street. They
13 were issued in the first wave. A thousand additional
14 permits were sold. Those cars have yet to appear on
15 the street so we haven't quite finished copulating on
16 the street the first wave of Green taxis.

17 And the primary -- the largest group is
18 700 that are wheelchair-accessible taxis, which take
19 a longer time to get on the road. And we've give
20 several extensions because there's vehicle
21 availability issues in getting the wheelchair-
22 accessible vehicles ready. So we are going to use
23 the engagement process to inform our going forward
24 plans. But we truly look forward to your hearing,
25 and to all of the input that we're going to get on a

1
2 program was rolled out quickly, and seems to have
3 lots of popularity and resonate in many boroughs. But
4 we need to understand a little bit more about it to
5 inform our going forward plan.

6 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. And
7 one idea that I've been thinking about is the
8 importance of putting together like a live town hall
9 meeting with taxi drivers, especially when it comes
10 to Vision Zero. I think that even though I
11 appreciate the contribution of many members of the
12 industry, in our town hall meeting, and they've been
13 present and contributing ideas. And taking also
14 responsibility of being part of making New York City
15 safer for everyone. But I hope that we can put
16 something together. When working with the basis on
17 the Black Car, we can bring them together in one
18 occasion, and we'll make a big presentation about
19 Vision Zero because I think that when --

20 As a father that I am and those of us
21 that have children we know, that when we see those
22 images and we get to be connected with the reality of
23 those families that they have lost a loved one. It's
24 like putting the human into this problem that affect
25 all of us. So this is something that I hope that

1
2 when it come to Vision Zero, not necessarily the
3 Outer Borough Plan. With the Outer Borough Plan, I
4 agree with you. We will have a hearing in the
5 future, but going back to the Vision Zero, I just
6 want to see if we can agree to continue conversation
7 to pull a big - a large town hall meeting in New York
8 City with taxi drivers.

9 MEERA JOSHI: I think it's an excellent
10 idea, and I do agree with you that there are some
11 very strong and potent messages that we can convey,
12 especially through the individual stories of the
13 family members who have lost loved ones. And that
14 sort of short out powerful message is much stronger
15 than probably any long pamphlet we could distribute
16 about statistics and driving habits. So I --

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
18 Thank you.

19 MEERA JOSHI: -- completely agree with
20 you on that point.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah. My next
22 question is about on the taxi cab Medallions. As you
23 know, in March 25, 2014, a Taxi Medallion Auction
24 conducted by the TLC brings the total numbers of
25 Medallions sold since last November to 1,200

1
2 Medallions. Given that only 400 Medallions can be
3 sold prior to the City receiving an Approval of
4 Disability Accessibility Plan from the State, can you
5 describe to the Committee what is your next step for
6 action? A step for action will be to ensure that you
7 are able to sell the remaining 1,600 authorized
8 Medallions?

9 MEERA JOSHI: Sure. The first step in
10 the process is to engage with the disability
11 advocates to discuss what exactly our ideas about
12 meaningful access are. So what percentage of the
13 various TLC licensed vehicles need to be accessible
14 as well as what are the parameters or expanding or
15 the dimensions of an accessible dispatch program.
16 We've begun that process, and so we're discussing
17 with the advocates different perspectives on how to
18 get more accessibility within our fleets in all the
19 different types of cars in our fleets.

20 The next step in that process is to
21 present to City Council a draft disability access
22 plan that incorporates the feedback that we've gotten
23 from the disability advocates. And we expect to do
24 that within the next weeks as the due date for the
25 Disability Access Plan is June 12th. So in the not

1
2 too distant future, we'll be submitting to Council
3 the draft Disability Access Plan. Council will then
4 get back to us with comments and feedback, which
5 we'll incorporate or not incorporate depending on
6 what they are and our continued engagement with the
7 advocates and other stakeholders. And then by June
8 12,2014, we submit to the State Department of
9 Transportation our Disability Access Plan. And the
10 State then has 60 days to approve, modify, or reject
11 the plan.

12 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. You
13 know, like one concern that we hear from any taxi
14 driver, especially the community that I know my best
15 because I used to be a livery taxi driver. I used to
16 be one for the Garvey Car Service and Bailey Car
17 Service when I was at City Cab. So, I know how
18 difficult it is for a driver also to get behind the
19 work and work 60 hours, and make \$700, including
20 working during the weekend. They would like to spend
21 the time with their family and the children. So I
22 bring more perspective, the one about a teacher, a
23 Council Member, but I've also been a driver. A
24 concern that we hear a lot is on how the team that do
25

1 enforcement on the TLC sometimes. Are they the same
2 people who also play the role as a judge?

3
4 MEERA JOSHI: No. We have an
5 enforcement, a group of field enforcement inspectors
6 who are out in the streets doing various kinds of
7 field enforcement, and the -- I can give you a quick
8 overview. They do the field enforcement, and issue a
9 summons based on activity they see in the field.

10 Then, there's the second group that's within TLC, our
11 Adjudications Group. Those are the prosecutors who
12 would then bring that summons, the charges. They
13 present that in a court, which is an administrative
14 court, which falls under the auspices of the
15 Administrative, the Office of Administrative Trials
16 and Hearings, an agency that's completely separate
17 than TLC. The judges that hear those case are
18 employed by the Office of Administrative Trials and
19 Hearings. They are not employed by the Taxi and
20 Limousine Commission.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. I just
22 hope that especially when we are working on passing
23 some legislation on Vision Zero that we will continue
24 conversation. Especially since when we have the
25 hearing on your nomination we also talked about the

1
2 importance to revise the policy that TLC has been
3 using to give summons and tickets to the drivers. We
4 believe that it is true that those related to safety
5 should be strongly enforced. But we also believe
6 that sometimes the drivers are right. When they say
7 about being stopped and getting 10, 12 tickets.
8 Sometimes, though, because in the past the city saw
9 many sectors, including the small business and
10 drivers as a source of revenue.

11 So sometimes we'll be knowing the
12 Commission's goal about the whole vision of the city.
13 So what I hope that we can continue conversation, and
14 be able to look on what is the policy that have been
15 used that we've been missing? And will there be any
16 opportunity to revise how we should be emphasizing on
17 safety when it comes to going after drivers and
18 giving tickets?

19 MEERA JOSHI: Absolutely, and several of
20 the violations that you sort of have referred to fall
21 into TLC Rules, which is within the Commission's
22 ability to amend those rules. And I think it is
23 important to take a fresh look at those rules, and
24 really make sure that the penalties that are related
25 to safety are adequate enough to be a deterrent

1
2 against future conduct. But that penalties against
3 non-safety violations are not overly punitive,
4 because this a source of income. This is a source of
5 employment, and we don't want to create barriers in
6 places where there should not be barriers.

7 [Pause]

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, and the
9 driver defenses is a problem, right, where a driver
10 who gets ticket for the motor vehicle they take those
11 courses. They get some experience from whatever
12 infraction they make, and they get some of those
13 pointed being reduced. The concern is also that we
14 need to revise because they're saying that some of
15 those points aren't being reduced in the larger
16 numbers when those points are given from -- by the
17 motor vehicle comparing to those given by the TLC.

18 MEERA JOSHI: Could you just clarify for
19 me the question.

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: They say a
21 driver get 12 -- he or she get 12 points on his
22 license.

23 MEERA JOSHI: Yes, yes I'm familiar with
24 the --

1

2

CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]

3

And the motor vehicle it have a completely different

4

policy --

5

MEERA JOSHI: [interposing] Exactly.

6

CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: -- and the

7

TLC.

8

MEERA JOSHI: [interposing] The critical

9

driver.

10

CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And how many

11

points do they get reduced after they take those

12

courses?

13

MEERA JOSHI: Exactly. So there's two

14

programs in the Ad Code, the Critical Driver and the

15

Persistent Violator. DMV sets the Critical Driver

16

points, and if you take the defensive driving, you

17

can get a reduction in those points depending on the

18

timing that that you -- when you take the course.

19

And then, there's another system, the Persistent

20

Violator, and if you take a refresher course, and

21

each point system is set by the TLC, you can get a

22

reduction in the Persistent Violator. But again,

23

dependent upon when you take the course. And both of

24

those are in the Ad Code. But is your question

25

1
2 whether the court -- whether the reduction is
3 effective?

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: No, the
5 question is why are the points given by the DMV, the
6 Department of Motor Vehicles? When the drivers take
7 those courses, they get more points reduced if those
8 points are given by the Department of Motor Vehicles
9 --

10 MEERA JOSHI: [interposing] Okay.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: -- compared to
12 what the TLC gives. [sic]

13 MEERA JOSHI: [interposing] Than the TLC
14 gives them. Okay, so the TLC and the Critical Driver
15 is in the Ad Code. It's a two point reduction, and
16 your question is why does DMV reduce it more than the
17 Critical Driver? And that we're happy to discuss
18 further with you. That would be an Ad Code
19 amendment, I believe, to give that defensive driving
20 a greater point reduction than what's currently in
21 the Ad Code.

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good. I just
23 hope that, you know, with the Vision Zero that we
24 take the proactive educational efforts. [sic]

1
2 MEERA JOSHI: [interposing] Yeah, I mean
3 the first line of defense is education incentives.
4 Enforcement should be your last resort. But what we
5 need to do is change driver behavior through
6 education.

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. My
8 last question before calling on my other colleagues
9 is about my concern with the environment. Is there
10 anything that TLC is doing, working with the industry
11 or the Black Car, Yellow Car, or Green Car to help
12 control the emission of pollution from cars?

13 MEERA JOSHI: We have some ability to set
14 rules around the types of cars we use, but we don't
15 have the ability based on a line of Federal Court
16 cases to sort of mandate that you use high or greater
17 fuel-efficient cars, which would probably be the
18 easiest way for us to control emissions. We do have
19 an electric vehicle pilot, which has been somewhat
20 successful. There is a -- it's dependent on the
21 infrastructure that's available in New York. And
22 that's -- if the infrastructure was more robust, our
23 pilot would probably be more robust. And we'd be
24 very open to be able to expand that. But where we
25 are not is encouraging through our rules the ability

1
2 to use a clean energy vehicle. But we cannot mandate
3 that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic]

5 MEERA JOSHI: Yeah. I mean it's true.
6 On the yellow side we have a retirement schedule,
7 which forces people to get new cars. And the hope is
8 the newer cars are more fuel-efficient, and they
9 release fewer pollutants.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: What I would
11 like to bring to your attention is a product that
12 they are already in the markets right now. That a
13 different city here, Brazil, Beijing they already
14 have it, which they install like a filter. And by
15 putting in a filter, they've been reducing their
16 emissions that contaminate the environment.

17 MEERA JOSHI: Well, that's an excellent
18 idea that we'd love to explore with you.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
20 So, if we can look what's going on in another city I
21 hope that this something that probably working with
22 everyone, Black Car, Yellow Car, everyone together I
23 think that -- You know, I have a lot of concern. We
24 have this article coming out in the New York Times
25 about climate change is becoming worse. And I think

1
2 that everyone should be thinking about how can we be
3 contributing, and also so that we can have some
4 controls on it. [sic]

5 MEERA JOSHI: Yes. Now, we would
6 definitely be open to looking into anything that
7 would help control emissions in the city we all live
8 in and breathe in.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, and
10 by the way, there's a great initiative of the United
11 Nations led by a group of Japanese that they're going
12 -- they also are working with different industry. I
13 know that a group of they are coming from Japan to
14 the U.N. talking about the echo, how can drivers also
15 be more environmental friendly. So, I just hope
16 that, you know, that we can --

17 MEERA JOSHI: [interposing] Yeah, that
18 would be, yeah, a good source. I just want to -- I
19 was -- we missed in introducing our Chief Operating
20 Officer, Conan Freud, who's with me today.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good. Council
22 Member Rose.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. Hi
24 Commissioner. I want to thank you so much for coming
25 to Staten Island, and not leaving us out of the

1
2 conversations and the dialogue. And I also want to
3 thank you for the inspection center there. And I
4 just wanted to ask you about the other -- the
5 additional funding of \$690,000 for nine positions for
6 -- to help absorb the increases in the licensing
7 applications.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Did Ydanis ask that
10 question?

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: No, he didn't.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: No, he didn't. Can
13 you tell the Committee what improvements have been
14 made this year in inspection wait times, particularly
15 the time from the initial request for an appointment
16 for the time the inspection is completed? And given
17 the need to improve the average wait time for
18 inspection, do you consider that additional funding
19 would be adequate to accomplish this task?

20 MEERA JOSHI: So, if I understand the
21 question correctly, it is the time that you get -- go
22 to Long Island City, and you request to get an
23 appointment to go to Woodside. And on average that's
24 been about ten days. For our last -- the fourth
25 quarter of 2013, we actually for each category, the

1
2 Black Car, livery car were averaging under ten days,
3 more like six, seven and eight days. So there's been
4 some improvement in that area.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Between the ask and
6 the actual appointment?

7 MEERA JOSHI: Right. That's come down a
8 little bit off of ten days. We also in our budget
9 got four positions for processing and licensing. So
10 we hope that that helps to expedite the process. But
11 we also have vacancies that we need to fill in
12 inspections with inspectors to do the line
13 inspections when the vehicles come in. And
14 obviously, the more capacity we have in our
15 inspection facility, then the easier it is for
16 someone to schedule. What they do is they schedule
17 for the next available time.

18 And right now, the average in some
19 categories is seven days, but to bring that down we
20 literally need more capacity through probably more
21 manpower in our inspections facility. We have the
22 lines to do that. It's just a matter of getting --
23 hiring the inspectors, and finding qualified people.
24 They have to get police officer status because they
25 write violations. They must be 21 years old. They

1
2 need DMV certification, and it's a combination that's
3 just not extremely easy to hire in.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Do you know how
5 many vacancies there are?

6 MEERA JOSHI: We have about 20, right?
7 About 20.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: About 20 vacancies.

9 MEERA JOSHI: Yeah.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So, would the
11 addition -- the filling of the vacancies, and the
12 additional four, what's the total number of
13 inspectors you have. The four that I mentioned
14 earlier are in our licensing. So they're not
15 inspectors. But the total number of our inspections
16 inspectors would --

17 CONAN FREUD: Sixty today. About 80.

18 MEERA JOSHI: We would end up around 80.
19 We now have about 60.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, thank you.
21 And in regard to the Five-Borough Taxi, the City
22 required that financial assistance up to \$15,000 be
23 granted, per grant be given individuals who purchased
24 the licenses, restricted to accessible vehicles to
25 either retrofit or purchase a wheelchair-accessible

1
2 vehicle. To date, how much has the Commission paid
3 out to individuals that purchased restricted licenses
4 --

5 COUNCIL MEMBER: [interposing] [off mic]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSES: -- and licenses?

7 And will there be any restrictions as to who can
8 apply for Hail Licenses issued under the Inter-
9 Borough Taxi Program?

10 MEERA JOSHI: To date, we've approved 180
11 grants. So that's a total of \$2,668,000
12 approximately in funds. And your second question
13 was, Who can purchase the Hail?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yeah, will there be
15 any restrictions on who can apply for a Hail License?

16 MEERA JOSHI: [interposing] Yes, the Hail
17 -- the State Hail Law, which also provides the grant
18 mechanism restricts purchasers, initial purchases as
19 well as people who purchase through transfer to FHV
20 licensees who are driving -- they either hold a
21 driver - FHV drive's license or an FHA vehicle
22 license.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, I missed
24 something. They did -- restricted it?

1
2 MEERA JOSHI: Yes, it's restricted in the
3 State law to one group, and that is holders of an FHV
4 driver's license or an FHV vehicle license. And that
5 restriction continues to future issuances.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, does that
7 leave out -- I'm not sure that I know what that
8 category is. So does that leave out a large number
9 of people who would potentially be interested?

10 MEERA JOSHI: There are lots of people
11 that are interested in the licenses that are
12 precluded from purchasing them because of this
13 restriction. So I think the short answer is yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, thank you so
15 much. Thank you, Chair.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: My last
17 question is about the TLC -- the new office facility.
18 The proposed budget includes \$36 million and the
19 Department of Citywide Administrative Service Budget
20 for the TLC new office facility. What are the
21 details on the scope of this project, and what is the
22 timeline for completing this budget?

23 MEERA JOSHI: The timeline is we'll start
24 probably in 2017, and we don't expect to be completed
25 until 2023.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CONAN FREUD: 2020.

MEERA JOSHI: 2020.

CONAN FREUD: Or 2021.

MEERA JOSHI: 2021. Basically, DDC did a review of the facility, and the facility is two parts. It's our inspection facility, which has lanes where the TLC licensed vehicles come everyday to be inspected as well as sort of an office facility, where our enforcement personnel turn out of everyday. It's the enforcement side that DDC reviewed and found that the foundation is not, to put it bluntly, it's not perfect. So the building needs to be torn down, and rebuilt. So the plan is that we will be able to start that rebuild in 2017.

CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] -- control more, and I know that the DDC Commissioner like one part of his vision is work harder to be sure that the product is delivered on time.

MEERA JOSHI: And we're very acute -- I think we'll be complaining customers because we have to move into swing space while this is going on, which will not ease our operations. It will be difficult for us. So we will definitely be sort of

1
2 the gad fly to make sure that we're on time once we
3 break ground and start the project.

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

5 MEERA JOSHI: You're welcome.

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very
7 much, Commissioner. I have one quick question so we
8 can wrap up. My district is including of La Guardia
9 Airport, and we have some challenges with both the
10 Black Cars. Not necessarily the Yellows because the
11 Yellows seem to park on the property of La Guardia
12 Airport. However, the other cars, some of which are
13 from Connecticut, New Jersey, many of which are from
14 our local bases are parked throughout the community.
15 And it seems that we have an enforcement issue, but
16 also I don't know what the outreach that is done when
17 drivers are -- either renew their license or what
18 their culture is. But right now, it's a total
19 disrespect of the communities that surround La
20 Guardia Airport. They park, they're idling. It's
21 kind of just very not considerate of the residents in
22 our community. And I know that there is some type of
23 parking provided at La Guardia Airport, obviously not
24 being used by many of these car services.

1
2 MEERA JOSHI: And I can appreciate that
3 there is, you know, anti-idling rules, but there's
4 another, I think partnership that we need to leverage
5 more in addressing problems that you've described is
6 working with the NYPD to make sure that those cars
7 that are parking beyond the limits are ticketed. And
8 that that message gets sent out swiftly in order to
9 keep them moving. There are the bases that right now
10 that have a requirement for parking. So they should
11 be utilizing that parking -- those parking facilities
12 rather than --

13 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: [interposing] I
14 thinks a whole other conversation about that --

15 MEERA JOSHI: [interposing] Yeah.

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: -- the base
17 parking issue that we have, but the reality is that
18 in many ways, and we have done some enforcement in
19 the past with NYPD. It's often a one-short kind of
20 enforcement.

21 MEERA JOSHI: [interposing] Yeah, it
22 needs to be consistent so that there's --

23 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: [interposing]
24 It's not consistent.

1
2 MEERA JOSHI: -- you know, a real change
3 of behavior in how they treat the cars, and also
4 working with La Guardia to see if we can ameliorate
5 the problem that way.

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: I would like to
7 have follow up with you on --

8 MEERA JOSHI: [interposing] Definitely.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: -- this specific
10 issue. Thank you very much for coming to testify
11 today.

12 MEERA JOSHI: You're welcome. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: We appreciate it,
14 and we have -- Obviously, we have questions that were
15 not asked today. My committee is going to follow up
16 with you.

17 MEERA JOSHI: [interposing] Excellent.

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: We have some
19 questions. If you can get them back to me so we can
20 properly engage with the correct information while we
21 negotiate on the budget.

22 MEERA JOSHI: That would be great. Thank
23 you very much.

24 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: We appreciate your
25 time. We will resume with the Department of

1
2 Sanitation at 2:45. We are currently taking a -- I
3 guess 20-minute break. Thank you.

4 [Pause]

5 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: We will now resume
6 the Council's hearing on the Mayor's Executive Budget
7 for FY2015. The Finance Committee has joined the
8 Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management.
9 Chaired by my colleague, Council Member Antonio
10 Reynoso to hear from Sanitation Commissioner Kathryn
11 Garcia. In the interest of time, I will turn the mic
12 over to my Co-Chair Council Member Reynoso.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you Madam
14 Ferreras, and our Finance Chair. Good afternoon. I
15 am Council Member Reynoso, and this is a hearing on
16 the Fiscal Year 2015 Executive Budget for the
17 Department of Sanitation held jointly with the
18 Committee on Finance. Today, we will hear testimony
19 from the Department of Sanitation about it's \$1.5
20 billion Fiscal FY15 Expense Budget, and \$1.3 billion
21 Fiscal Year '14 to '18 Capital Commitment Plan and
22 general agency operations. The Committee looks
23 forward to hearing about such important issues as:
24 An update on the construction of the marine transfer
25 stations that are an integral part of the City's

1
2 Solid Waste Management Plan designed with goals to
3 achieve borough equity in reducing truck miles
4 driven. How the Waste Export Project and operations
5 will change the Hamilton Avenue and North Shore
6 marine transfer stations that are to come on line in
7 Fiscal Year 2015. And Fiscal Year 2015 staffing of
8 uniformed sanitation, who as this winter reminds us,
9 are so critical in keeping our streets clear, and New
10 Yorkers safe during snow events.

11 As a reminder, during the Executive
12 Budget Hearing cycle, all public testimony is to be
13 given at one hearing. This year, it will be held
14 Friday, June 6th starting at 4:00 p.m. to allow for
15 the people to come after traditional work hours. I
16 would like to introduce my colleagues in the Council
17 that have joined us today. We have Matteo from
18 Staten Island. Hello, sir. Costa Constantinides
19 from Queens; Council Member Ferreras and myself. The
20 Committee will now hear testimony from the
21 Commissioner Kathryn Garcia of the Department of
22 Sanitation. Thank you.

23 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Good
24 afternoon, Chair Ferreras and Chair Reynoso and
25 members of the City Council Committees on Finance and

1
2 Sanitation. I am Kathryn Garcia, Commissioner of the
3 New York City Department of Sanitation. With me here
4 today is Larry Cippolina, Deputy Commissioner for
5 Administration and Financial Management. We
6 appreciate this opportunity to testify on the
7 Department's Expense and Capital portions of the
8 Mayor's Fiscal Year 2015 Executive Budget.

9 The Fiscal Year 2015 Executive Budget
10 allocates \$1.384 Billion in operating funds that
11 allows the Department to deliver core essential
12 services, along with necessary staffing to all of the
13 City's 59 community districts, including:

14 Maintaining current collection schedules for refuse
15 and recycling; pickups in every community; providing
16 mechanicalized broom cleaning of curbside areas;
17 managing approximately 10,800 tons of Department
18 managed refuse we collect daily; and 10,000 tons of
19 recyclables the Department collects each week.

20 Plowing and salting over 6,000 linear miles of city
21 roadways during winter snow and ice storms. Cleaning
22 up debris from undeveloped vacant lots, and removing
23 abandoned vehicles from the city's roadways; and
24 repairing New York City's fleet of heavy and medium
25

1
2 duty and off-road vehicles and testing and applying
3 enhanced state-of-the art green fleet technologies.

4 Waste can be a resource, which is why the
5 Department will build on its ambitious recycling and
6 sustainability agenda consistent with our commitment
7 to increase recycling participation in this city. As
8 you know, we are currently in the process of
9 implementing a phased rollout of organic collection
10 pilot areas. I got my bin this week. The Mayor got
11 his bin this week. Through mid-June to reach 100,000
12 households serving approximately 240,000 city
13 residents living in single-family homes and small
14 residential buildings in the four boroughs. And
15 we'll implement a final small rollout this fall.

16 As I stated at the hearing last month,
17 DSNY's pilot is on the scale of a small city of in
18 the -- We also have 43 high-rise apartment buildings
19 currently enrolled in the pilot organic collection in
20 Manhattan and Brooklyn, and overall 100 more in the
21 enrollment process. And by the end of this year, we
22 will exceed 400 schools in portions of all five
23 boroughs. We anticipate the pilot providing a wealth
24 of information regarding how participation is
25 impacted by outreach and collection frequencies. The

1
2 pilot collection of residential and school organics
3 will cost approximately \$10 million in the current
4 fiscal year, of which \$2 million has been spent
5 through January of 2014.

6 We view these costs as an investment in
7 systematically changing the relationship of city
8 residents with what they discard. We continue to
9 expand outreach to apartment buildings for
10 individuals to drop off unwanted used clothing and
11 electronics through our Refashion NYC and E-Cycle NYC
12 programs. As well as continuing to add public space
13 recycling receptacles throughout all five boroughs.
14 There are presently a total of 2,816 public space
15 recycling receptacle citywide, exceeding Local Law
16 38's mandate of 1,000 sites by August of 2020. To
17 leverage our investments in public space recycling,
18 we continue our partnerships with BIDS and other
19 commercial corridor organizations.

20 Additionally, this weekend we will
21 complete the last of our five annual spring safe
22 disposal events in each borough. Over the first four
23 disposal events this year, the Department has
24 collected over 460,000 pounds of potentially harmful
25 household or hazardous products that could otherwise

1
2 have entered our curbside collection program.
3 Including approximately 2,000 pounds of medications
4 and pills; 180,000 pounds of electronics; and 280,000
5 pounds of other harmful household products, primarily
6 paint. But we get 20 pounds of mercury at one site,
7 which was pretty amazing.

8 Department outreach staff also continue
9 to provide education and assistance to apartment
10 building managers and superintendents to help them
11 achieve greater diversion of recyclables generated by
12 residents in their buildings. Our strategy is to use
13 our knowledge of the waste stream, and identify
14 recycling programs for the various materials. These
15 programs need to be easy and convenient for New
16 Yorkers. While we are making steady progress, we
17 still have lots more to do and will continue to
18 challenge ourselves to increase the recycling
19 diversion and participation rates in the city.

20 In the area of clean energy and
21 technology, 100% of our entire fleet either utilizes
22 electronically controlled clean diesel engines, and
23 99% of our fleet is equipped with the best available
24 diesel electric technology. Our fleet is among the
25 greenest in the entire United States utilizing

1
2 alternative fuel, hybrid population technology, CNG,
3 and Pure Electric. In recognition of its excellence
4 in performance, the Department was recently made a
5 recipient of the Federal EPA Northeast Diesel
6 Collaborative Breath Easy Leadership Award.

7 Since 2005, we have reduced our fleet's
8 overall particulate matter emissions by 90%, and cut
9 nitrous oxide emissions by 74%. In the current
10 fiscal year, the Department acquired and put into
11 service 18 new Pure Electric Nissan LEAFs, and 23 new
12 CNG Powered Nat Collection Trucks. Today, the
13 Department operates 42 electric vehicles, and 42
14 dedicated CNY refuse trucks. We also currently
15 operate 15 new diesel-powered production based hybrid
16 hydraulic collection trucks, and expect to take
17 delivery of 32 additional trucks in Fiscal 2015.

18 Also in the current fiscal year, we
19 installed 18 additional level-2 electric vehicle
20 chargers at our district facilities citywide. And
21 the department currently has 49 and anticipates
22 growing the number of EVs. We also operate 766 light
23 duty hybrid electric passenger vehicles, and have
24 plans to purchase a hundred new vehicles and 30
25 medium duty clean vehicles in 2015. As you know, we

1
2 continue to utilize the B20 seasonally during the
3 summer months, and B15 from November through March.

4 The Department is also testing the world's first
5 hybrid electric street sweepers. Six units are
6 currently under test by the Department today, and
7 seven second-generation hybrid sweepers will be
8 delivered to DSNY before the end of this year. This
9 second generation hybrid sweepers will also have the
10 potential to provide electric generator power to aid
11 in the even of power blackouts. Meaning, we can plug
12 the facility into the truck if we're in a blackout,
13 rather than having to maintain portable generators.

14 Improving the fuel efficiency of our
15 medium and heavy duty fleet continues to be an
16 important departmental that helps build on the
17 progress achieved to date, and dramatically reducing
18 air pollution across our communities and across the
19 region. Consistent with the Department's pioneering
20 efforts, we will continue to do our part to transform
21 New York into a leader of 21st Century green energy
22 innovation by proactively advancing the environmental
23 profile of the Department's fleet and achieving
24 important clean air and energy goals. We also look
25 forward to working with this committee, and the

1
2 Council to support our programmatic and legislative
3 efforts to promote sustainable growth and greener
4 communities across the city we proudly serve.

5 Turning now to our Capital Budget, the
6 Department's Capital portion of the Fiscal Year 2015
7 Executive Budget is approximately \$398.6 million, of
8 which \$240.5 million is for construction. \$138
9 million is for replacement equipment; and \$20 million
10 is for technology. Funding for large-scale
11 Department capital projects in Fiscal 2015 includes
12 ongoing construction of the new Manhattan 1, 2, 5
13 Garage, which we expect to be completed by the end of
14 the year. And if we have good weather for a period
15 of seven to ten days, we'll make the move.
16 Purchasing replacement collection trucks, mechanical
17 brooms, salt spreaders, and other essential
18 equipment.

19 Ongoing construction of the North Shore
20 MTS and the Hamilton Avenue MTS both for which we
21 expect to be completed in Fiscal 2015. Ongoing
22 construction of the East 91st Street MTS, which we
23 expect to be completed in Fiscal 16. Construction of
24 the Southeast MTS, which we expect to be completed in
25 Fiscal 17; and refurbishing of the West 59th Street

1
2 MTS and demolition of the Gansevoort MTS. As to the
3 Gansevoort MTS and Recycling Education Center, this
4 administration has been continuing to work with the
5 State to secure the Memorandum of Understanding
6 between the City and the State regarding additional
7 funding for the Hudson River Park Trust.

8 In addition the Department finalized its
9 20-year service contract for the use of Waste
10 Management Review Avenue Transfer Station in Mastiff
11 for containerized and export by rail of the Queens
12 Watershed formerly served by the Greenpoint MTS.
13 Additionally, a 20-year agreement was finalized in
14 2012 with Port Authority of New York and New Jersey
15 for the use of the Essex County Resource Recovery
16 Facility for the receipt of a portion of Manhattan's
17 waste. Also, as we continue to implement the long-
18 term export component of the Solid Waste Management
19 Plan, the Fiscal 2015 Expense Budget allocates \$350.1
20 million in export tipping fees for the Department's
21 current interim and long-term export operations.

22 Last week, several member of the Council
23 joined the Department's Deputy Commissioner for Solid
24 Waste Management and me in touring some of the City's
25 Marine Transfer facilities that currently receive, or

1
2 will soon begin to receive department managed waste
3 for disposal outside the city. As you know,
4 development of the Marine Base Transfer system is an
5 important component of the City's comprehensive Solid
6 Waste Management Plan that will result in a decrease
7 in truck traffic, more equitable waste transfer and
8 the creation of environmental and sound and state-of-
9 the art waste infrastructure. Which will ensure our
10 ability to meet the daily and emergency needs of the
11 city's residents. The City is committed to the fair
12 and equitable development of Waste Management
13 infrastructure, but ensures and promotes a
14 sustainable New York City in the years ahead.

15 Lastly, finding space for a critical
16 municipal facility is no easy task particularly in
17 Manhattan. The Department has put together a
18 responsible garage plan that addresses the Department
19 needs for Sanitation Districts 6, 6A, and 8 for the
20 foreseeable future, and agency staff has already met
21 with many different stakeholders. The proposed
22 multi-participant real estate transaction also
23 provides critical capital funding to make this a
24 reality. I know often we are not the first choice
25 amenity in neighborhoods, but it is absolutely

1
2 critical to meeting our core mission of providing
3 collection, cleaning, and snow plowing to have
4 operating facilities. We want to continue to engage
5 with the many community stakeholders to develop a
6 project, which meets the needs of the City, and
7 allows the Department to be a good neighborhood. We
8 do hope to begin design shortly, and start
9 construction in 2017. We do look forward to working
10 with you and the community and other stakeholders.

11 The Fiscal 2015 Executive Budget ensures
12 funding for the Department to maintain the City's
13 highest levels of street cleanliness. Through April
14 of this current fiscal year, the scorecard rating for
15 the city average 83.1%. Also during this time, no
16 district had a rating that averaged less than 80% of
17 their streets being acceptably clean. And this was
18 after a particularly challenging winter of snow
19 clearing and cleaning following up. Additionally,
20 the Department's Snow Budget for Fiscal 15 is funded
21 for \$16 million, which is an increase of \$21.9
22 million funded in the Fiscal 2014 Adopted Budget.
23 Due to the past unusually severe winter snow season,
24 our Fiscal 2014 Snow Budget is currently funded at
25 \$132.1 million, including an additional \$39.7 million

1 provided in this Executive Budget. During the 2013-
2 2014 winter snow season we had 56.25 inches of snow
3 fall on the city, and overall, the Department has
4 spent \$128.2 million to date for snow plowing, road
5 de-icing operations and overtime to handle this
6 season's ten snowstorms.
7

8 We will also hire approximately 450 new
9 sanitation workers between July and October of this
10 year. We'll undergo snow operations training
11 hopefully before winter starts. But given the
12 current way it's been acting I'm hoping for no snow
13 in October. Snow fighting is a core agency mission
14 and all of our workers are trained to perform the
15 best they can under some of the toughest conditions
16 imaginable. But they know that their performance is
17 critical to keeping this city function 24 by 7. I'
18 confident that going into the next 2014-15 snow
19 season, we will be adequately staffed with over 6,300
20 sanitation workers available for deployment.

21 In closing, I would like to thank you for
22 this opportunity to testify today on the Department's
23 portion of the Fiscal 2015 Executive Budget, and to
24 highly our initiatives to advance the
25 Administration's commitment to promote sustainable

1
2 development, and minimize the City's environmental
3 footprint. The Council and particularly these
4 committees have always recognized the vital role the
5 Department plays in keeping communities across the
6 city clean, healthy, and safe. With your assistance
7 and support, we will continue to maintain and improve
8 the quality of life here in the City, and advance New
9 York City as a global sustainability leader to come.
10 And my staff and I will be happy to answer your
11 questions.

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very
13 much, Commissioner Garcia, and congratulations. I
14 don't think we've actually had the opportunity of
15 meeting --

16 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:
17 [interposing] No.

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: -- but I'm sure
19 we're going to be working closely together.

20 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: So, we're going to
22 have Council Members who are going to be on a five-
23 minute clock for the first round and a three-minute
24 clock following that

25 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Okay.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: And again, thank
3 you. I know we were running a little bit past your
4 time, but I appreciate you being here. I'm going to
5 ask three questions, and then I'm going to open it up
6 to my Co-Chair, and then we'll go into the Council
7 Member's questions. I'd like to start out, and I
8 know in your testimony you mentioned a little -- a
9 small portion to Super Storm Sandy.

10 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:

11 [interposing] Uh-huh.

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: And I -- we held a
13 hearing about reimbursements, and the challenges that
14 the City is having, and I know that we're currently
15 closely on reimbursements after Super Storm Sandy
16 issues. We are currently working our Federal Agenda,
17 and want every opportunity to be able to include in
18 our conversations anything that can help us as the
19 City expedites reimbursements. Specifically, the
20 question is how much funding has FEMA obligated in
21 public assistance funding, and how does that compare
22 to what the Department we should be qualified for?

23 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: So I'm
24 going to answer this, and I'm going to make sure that
25 Larry corrects anything that I say.

1

2

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay.

3

4

COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: So we have approved worksheets for \$146.8 million of which \$123.5 has been obligated to date. We have actually received \$100 million in public assistance to date, and \$2.7 million is in the final approval process. Do you have anything to add?

8

9

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CEPALINA: No.

10

COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:

11

12

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: So you're actually getting reimbursed at a pretty good rate?

13

COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Yes.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Good. So maybe we should have you replicate this in other agencies because we're having a big of a issue there. In post-Sandy New York, what emergency equipment have garages been equipped with? And I was very excited to read in your presentation about the possibility of having the street sweepers be generators. I think that's fantastic.

22

23

24

25

COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Right, it's a really new technology that's coming out in the fleet world that's really exciting.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Yeah, that sounds
3 like a wonderful opportunity that we can have. So
4 just because I am not an expert on this, do the
5 street sweepers still need to plug into the fire
6 hydrants to have water added? They do need to still.
7 They still need to have water added at least in the
8 summer months. We don't actually add water when it's
9 below freezing.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay, so in the
11 summer months we still need to get the sweepers on
12 the hydrants. Okay. I'm going to more specifically
13 talk about something that impacts directly to my
14 district, which is the North Shore Marine Transfer
15 Station.

16 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Certainly.

17 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: So I know that you
18 mentioned that you mentioned that we are almost at
19 completion.

20 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Uh-huh.

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: When the watershed
22 -- I need to have a better understanding of how were
23 the SWMP watersheds determined. And specifically,
24 how was it decided waste from the -- Potentially,
25 what I've reviewed on the maps would have waste from

1
2 the Rockaways because Queens was divided from west to
3 east as opposed to north --

4 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:

5 [interposing] To south.

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: -- to south, which
7 would probably -- would determine that there would be
8 less distance. So the SWMP is to address less
9 traffic and less truck mileage in our city and in our
10 communities. Obviously, coming from the Rockaways
11 all the way up to East Elmhurst College Point is a
12 lot further in distance. So if you can walk me
13 through that process and why that makes sense the way
14 that it is now. And also, how could we begin to
15 address this if -- or do we have the opportunity to
16 be able to reconsider where Far Rockaway would
17 potentially be disposing of their garbage across
18 Queens? And where is current -- where is Far
19 Rockaway's garbage being disposed of now or waste
20 being disposed of now?

21 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: So that
22 when the SWMP was developed, and the transfer
23 stations were identified, they were actually based
24 off of the historical watersheds that used to be when
25 you had fresh [sic] doors open. So when they used to

1
2 go to the marine sections back before Giuliani was
3 Mayor that is how we identified which portions of the
4 waste would go to which station. One of the things
5 about Far Rockaway is that part of the SWMP is a
6 commitment to boroughs caring for their own waste.
7 So you might say the southwest is going to be a lot
8 closer to Far Rockaway than the northern portion of
9 Queens, but the Rockaway's waste has always been
10 disposed of in transfer stations in Queens. And is
11 currently actually disposed of in a transfer station
12 in Jamaica.

13 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: In Jamaica?

14 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Right, but now we
16 would potentially have that transfer station be in
17 East Elmhurst College Point?

18 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Uh-huh.

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: So -- ?

20 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Well,
21 because we're building the facility. So these are
22 the interim contracts that we have in place now to
23 dispose of waste. We won't have those contracts in
24 the future because we will have the facility on the

25

1
2 North Shore. And so it's the North Shore Facility
3 and then there's the facility at Review Avenue.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Right. I'm just
5 trying to understand --

6 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:
7 [interposing] But it will be the pre-disposal. [sic]

8 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: -- there is no other facility.

9 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: There won't
10 be another facility for residential in Queens.

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: So that absolutely
12 makes no sense to us, right, --

13 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Okay.

14 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: -- the residents
15 in the area because we're going to have more trucks
16 delivering to a community that currently already has
17 private card -- Not carding but we deal with the
18 tallies, [sic] and so on of the world over at Willets
19 Point and College Point. So we have that trip impact
20 besides the asphalt. And now adding additional
21 routes to that community is a bit of a challenge to
22 help grasp. But we can continue. You know, this is
23 very small in the bigger picture of our great budget,
24 and I have colleagues that are eager to answer. So
25

1
2 I'd love to continue this conversation with you.
3 Because it does concern me greatly.

4 Especially with the traffic impact that
5 we will have in my community considering that we're
6 building out a brand new community right next to
7 that, which is Willets Point. We're expanding the
8 airport with billions of dollars. We're doing a lot
9 of expansion in a very small geographic area, and
10 this trucking, and this amount of increase when SWMP
11 was supposed to address the opposite, the very
12 opposite of that impact, it would be challenging. So
13 we would like to speak to you about that.

14 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Certainly.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very
16 much, and I will pass it over to Mr. Co-Chair, Chair
17 Reynoso.

18 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.
19 Thank you, Chair. I do actually want to know if we
20 can -- If I can follow up on that question. Truck
21 traffic is a big issue and a lot of folks focus on
22 most the trash, and the fact that the transfer
23 stations are in their districts. But it's about
24 truck traffic and the reduction of truck traffic is a
25 big portion of this, and specifically in communities

1
2 that are overburdened like South East Queens,
3 Northbrook, and South Bronx.

4 So, what I think what we have here is a
5 logistical issue where Far Rockaway, which is not
6 called "Far Rockaway" for nothing, right? To have
7 its trash go all the way over to Elmhurst seems to me
8 not to make sense if we're trying to reduce truck
9 traffic. We're actually increasing there, or could
10 be increasing it because what traditionally goes to
11 Hamilton, or it goes to --

12 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: No, no,
13 traditionally it -- traditionally it had gone to the
14 North Shore when the North Shore was operating
15 previously by DSNY. It's just been closed for a long
16 time. So, there's an interim contract for disposal
17 now, but we are also changing the long-haul trucking.
18 So you have to remember that we're going to be by
19 barge once it's delivered there to that portion of
20 Queens.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah, we should
22 follow up with that, too, that carryon, exactly what
23 that looks like. I wanted to ask a question
24 regarding. You actually upgraded to the new Smart
25 system, and whether or not that's progressing. And I

1
2 had a conversation on whether or not BIC or the
3 Business Integrity Commission and Sanitation can use
4 the same programming, or are they using the same
5 programming. Or there are different languages,
6 different programs, and is that going to be part of -
7 - Will we have a big issue with interagency
8 communication in this Council. We don't understand
9 why the left hand can't talk to the right sometimes.
10 So we're hoping that with this IT upgrade that it's
11 uniform to some degree. So I'm hoping you can answer
12 there.

13 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: They're two
14 answers that we'd be happy, of course, to share the
15 software. A lot of the software is designed to meet
16 our needs around staffing. It is very driven by the
17 staffing model, and who's on what truck. Because you
18 get paid different amounts based on what your job is
19 that day. So a of the DSNY piece of it wouldn't be
20 applicable for BIC. They don't need to know that, or
21 they don't have any employees that they're managing
22 for payroll reasons. But in terms of it, they would
23 want to use it for any other reporting pieces, we can
24 certainly share. I'm looking forward to meeting the
25 new BIC Commissioner. The Smart System is a very

1
2 large, and very complicated system. So it does all
3 of the personnel management. It also is tracking all
4 of the vehicles and the weighs of garbage, and all of
5 those particular different metrics. It is somewhat
6 delayed. We are working on a settlement negotiation
7 with the System Integrator, who we asked to stop
8 working in March. We anticipate, though, that we
9 will have Phase I roll out in the spring of next
10 year.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay, do we know
12 where the Phase I roll out is going to happen? Do
13 you have the route?

14 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: The phase
15 for Smart?

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah

17 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: For
18 computer system. It will roll out across the
19 organization.

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: All right, so we
21 -- so it's a tracking system a certain degree. So I
22 just want to get clarity on that?

23 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: We'd have
24 to just show it to you because it's hard to describe
25 exactly what it is. It really is a business

1
2 information system for us. So it allows you to say I
3 have an extra supervisor. You need a supervisor.
4 You drag and click and you move that person from one
5 district to the other district. Then you are able to
6 track where they are. We know whether or not we've
7 put you on a refuse truck or a recycling truck or
8 you're running baskets for the day. And all of that
9 happens by -- Right now it happens on a board with
10 people's names on paper. So this replaces all of
11 that paper.

12 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Something that
13 Council Member Ben Kallos would like actually, all of
14 the technology upgrades. And I also want to speak to
15 the Memorandum of Understanding that we had regarding
16 Gansevoort, and it seems that we entered into a
17 contract with the State or -- ?

18 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: We have not
19 signed the MOU. With the State we are still working
20 through the City's Legislative Affairs Office to
21 finish the negotiation on the Gansevoort MOU.

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Do we know who
23 in the Mayor's office is working on that? Do you who
24 would be the liaison to --?

25

1
2 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I'm
3 assuming that the whole office I hope is working on
4 it at this point in time.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay, we hope to
6 --

7 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I hold the
8 top of the office accountable actually at this point
9 in time.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: We just -- it's
11 important.

12 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:
13 [interposing] Yes.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: We can't move
15 forward with it without getting that contract. I
16 know they have promised us a certain amount of
17 funding, and --

18 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Yes,
19 they're supposed to put \$25 million in as are we.

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Exactly. So I
21 just want to make sure to make that point already
22 moving forward.

23 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Okay.

24 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Chair.

25 We've been joined by Council Members Kallos, Crowley,

1
2 Miller, and Johnson. We, again, a reminder to my
3 colleagues, we're going to be a five-minute clock
4 with a three-minute follow up. We will have Council
5 Member Constantinides

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Good
7 afternoon, Commissioner.

8 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Hi, how are
9 you?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Great to
11 see you in person. Just wanted to quickly talk about
12 street littler baskets.

13 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Uh-huh.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I know
15 your predecessor, Commissioner Doherty the last time
16 he was at the disciplinary hearing had indicated that
17 he felt there wasn't enough resources going there.
18 And that we could do better. We definitely as a city
19 need to do a little bit more. I know I felt this
20 way. We sent a letter to my colleagues in
21 government, Senator Gianaris. And we sent a letter
22 to Sanitation regarding street litter baskets that
23 one pickup a day was not sufficient in our community
24 that's been growing and thriving. And that the
25 overflowing baskets really presented us with a

1
2 challenge. We've help meet that challenge, and we've
3 met with DOT and the Department of Sanitation, and
4 Abe Cara Nova [sp?].

5 This community has been wonderful, but
6 we're still not quite there yet. We've brought the
7 Doe Fund to west neighborhoods, but through member
8 items. So we're really trying to do more with the
9 local street trash pickups. Because local business
10 thoroughfares as we're trying to compete seeing that
11 litter in the street, it just doesn't present our
12 communities as putting our best foot forward. So I'm
13 hoping that in this budget we're going to get --
14 we're going to sort of move forward. If not this
15 budget, the next budget to kind of move forward to
16 see that -- to meet that goal of us getting more than
17 one a week -- or one day. Sorry.

18 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: So I mean
19 we think that we are adequately funded. We think
20 also the arrival of additional dual-bin trucks to
21 service the public space recycling bins will also
22 help. We are constantly trying to adjust and shift
23 to make sure we don't have overflowing baskets.
24 Because I completely agree with you that nobody wants
25 to be walking around in a dirty city. And it's one

1
2 of the things that I focus on with my frontline
3 staff. I'm not going to deny that if we had more
4 funding, we'd be able to figure out how to use it to
5 service more baskets. But we think that we can
6 manage it currently.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay, but
8 I know definitely in the story we're looking for me.
9 We definitely need. I'm sure that that is a unique
10 situation. But on the weekends especially as we have
11 additional traffic, and we're trying to bring people
12 into Queens for tourism, for other --

13 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: If I had
14 more funding, we'd do more Sunday service. That
15 would be probably where it would go.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: And then
17 also just quickly. It's not in my district, but it's
18 close enough that it does affect it. I know it's not
19 in this budget as well, but I'll ask one of my
20 colleagues, Jimmy Van Bramer. Council Member Van
21 Bramer would probably echo this. The garage on 21st
22 Street right between 34th and 35th Avenue is a
23 constant issue for the community. There are trucks
24 that double park. They're not washed. The folks in
25 the Ravenswood house, which is not my district, but

1
2 the Queensview -- residents of the Queensview Co-op,
3 and North Queensview Co-op, are consistently having
4 to deal with the smell, the double-parked trucks.
5 Are there any plans to expand that garage to help
6 alleviate some of those community concerns?

7 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: So I mean
8 if you go through our Capital Budget, there is not a
9 lot of funding for garages. There is really only
10 funding for the new one on the east side of
11 Manhattan, which is a profit from the sale of another
12 piece of property. My intention is to go back to OMB
13 in the next round of capital. I don't think we have
14 a good handle on everything we need for facilities.
15 And I want to make it so that we have a very cogent
16 plan. Because in part I know exactly what you're
17 talking about. It's not the only place where the
18 trucks don't fit.

19 They don't fit inside any more, and so
20 they end up being outside. And it's worse during
21 winter because they're bigger during winter with the
22 plows. But I'm having the same issue. If you drive
23 down 11th Avenue in Manhattan, there are white trucks
24 parked all the way up 11th Avenue, because we lost
25 where we used to park. And that's - we're getting

1
2 squeezed tighter and tighter in all of our
3 facilities. So we're trying to figure out a very
4 clear plan so we can prioritize across communities to
5 make sure that we're not impacting them. Because
6 we're -- we want to be good neighbors, and we also
7 want to be able to operate.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I
9 appreciate that. Thank you, Commissioner for all
10 your good work.

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Council
12 Member. We will have Council Member Kallos followed
13 by Council Member Crowley.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Good afternoon.
15 Thank you Finance Chair Julissa Ferreras, and Chair
16 of Sanitation Antonio Reynoso, and my fellow
17 Committee members for allowing me to speak today, and
18 get answers our city deserves. Welcome to Sanitation
19 Commissioner Kathryn Garcia. Thank you for joining
20 me last Friday and Pledge to Protect on a day-long
21 tour of Transfer Stations in Staten Island, Brooklyn,
22 Manhattan, and then Brooklyn again.

23 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: And a lot
24 of the bequey [sp?].
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And a lot of the
3 bequey [sp?]. Our new Administration has already
4 done so much to fix damage done by the previous
5 administration. We ended Stop and Frisk; overturned
6 vetoes on paid sick leave; made good on promises to
7 the universal Pre-K; new contracts for those who
8 haven't had them for years; and a commitment to
9 affordable housing over stadiums. Please continue to
10 reverse poor policies from the previous
11 administration. Please this Marine Transfer Station.
12 This station is being placed between an Olympic
13 training ground serving 30,000 children from all five
14 boroughs and a housing development with 1,173 units
15 within feet of six schools, 22,056 residents, and
16 6,755 residents of color.

17 These staggering numbers demonstrate a
18 greater impact in one location than nearly all six of
19 the other planned locations combined. Please stop
20 this marine transfer station. Both of the Chairs of
21 this hearing had asked you questions about the Solid
22 Waste Management Plant, and I quote, have both said
23 either, "It makes no sense" or "It doesn't make
24 sense." The marine transfer stations violate borough
25 equity by dumping Manhattan trash in Staten Island,

1
2 another borough, instead of New Jersey, another state
3 that actually wants our trash. The marine transfer
4 stations have become a billion dollar boondoggle that
5 is already exceeding the cost overruns seen in the
6 City's time scandal.

7 The marine transfer stations will force
8 radioactive trash trucks to drive a children's park.
9 Please stop the Marine Transfer Station.

10 Commissioner, I ask you to put your considerable
11 talent to working with the Council and my community
12 to stop this marine transfer stations, and focus on a
13 modern 21st Century solution that improves recycling,
14 and ends the cycle of waste to marine transfer, to
15 landfill that these stations represent. We're the
16 greatest city in the world, and we can do better than
17 this.

18 In the interest of time, and the fact
19 that I only have two minutes and 30 second left, I'm
20 going to ask a whole series of questions, 18 in
21 total, and if you can try to give ten-second answers
22 or yes or no where that's directed. The first
23 question is: Have you read the Talking Trash Report?

24 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Will you -- do
you agree with the findings of the report?

COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I'm going
to answer that as a yes, no. It's a much longer
conversation. There are parts of it that I feel are
very --

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing]
Have you provided a response to the findings that you
disagree with?

COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I have not
provided a written response, but to protect--

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing]
Will you?

COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I actually
told Kelly yesterday that I would sit down with her
and go through the findings.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So as a Council
Member, I'm asking that you provide --

COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:
[interposing] I'm happy to provide a written
response.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you very
much. Where does Manhattan's residential waste
currently go?

1
2 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: It
3 currently goes to New Jersey or to Yonkers.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Does all of -- Is
5 New Jersey a borough?

6 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: New Jersey
7 is not a borough of the City of New York.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Under the SWMP,
9 will Manhattan trash go from 91st Street to Staten
10 Island?

11 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Yes, it
12 will go to the New Jersey -- into the New York
13 Container Terminal.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Is Staten Island
15 a borough?

16 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Staten
17 Island is borough.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Is burdening on
19 borough, Staten Island, with another borough's,
20 Manhattan's trash, borough equity?

21 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: We think
22 that we are consistent with borough equity under this
23 plan. And they do not feel that since it stays
24 containerized the whole time it's on the island that
25 they have not raised issue with it.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: You just told the
3 Chair of the Finance Committee that you could not
4 send something from Far Rockaway to another part of
5 Brooklyn even though the Sanitation Chair agreed that
6 it might be better to with less truck traffic because
7 of borough equity. Because hard and fast, you cannot
8 take trash from one borough to another because of
9 borough equity. So I find that this is a clear --
10 this clearly a violation of that term. In terms of
11 cost overruns, the estimated cost for 91st Street
12 Marine Transfer Station was \$43.9 million in Fiscal
13 Year 2002 to 29005?

14 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Uh-huh.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: \$121.8 million
16 Fiscal Year 2008-2009 and \$181.6 million in Fiscal
17 Year 2013-2014. What is it now?

18 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: \$215.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So that is a 489%
20 increase. So almost five times the original cost.

21 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Right, but
22 you have to ask --

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing] So
24 this is the same track as City Time that was added.
25 The only --

1
2 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: No, this is
3 a very, very -- Actually that's -- this is a very
4 different issue. City Time was registered contract
5 at \$75 million that escalated by ten times. These
6 were not registered contracts. These were
7 preliminary designs, which did not get registered for
8 many years. So you have escalation, and you have
9 redesign that happens prior to bidding the contract.
10 Many of the items that caused this cost overruns are
11 to make it so we can be a good neighbor to the
12 community. Such as having negative air pressure
13 within the facility to hold odors in.

14 And so, that we have a facility that
15 mitigates noise. And so we have a facility that has
16 odor neutralizers. And so that we have a facility
17 with rapid roll-up doors. So we are getting trucks
18 in and out as quickly as possible. So that we can
19 mitigate any trucks on the ramp so that there's no
20 queuing on York Avenue. So these are all things that
21 changed the design of the facility over time. Having
22 a preliminary estimate before you've actually done
23 design, is a very different situation than what
24 happened during City Time, which was a criminal
25 situation. So the comparison is not applicable.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you, Council
3 Member Kallos, and we will have Crowley followed by
4 Council Member Miller.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Good afternoon.
6 I want to thank both of our Chairs. I know for the
7 Finance Chair, it's been a long day already, but I do
8 welcome you, Commissioner, here to the Chambers. I
9 have a number of questions. First I want to start
10 with street waste paper or waste baskets.

11 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Okay.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I know that one
13 of my colleagues earlier asked about --
14 Constantinides -- about situations that are happening
15 in his district. For me, as it relates to sanitation
16 concerns, it's the number one complaint we receive as
17 it relates to our various different business
18 districts. Some of my colleagues in their
19 discretionary budget pay for private companies like
20 Ready, Willing, and Able. They're very expensive. I
21 want to really work with the Department to have the
22 City make sure that our business districts are clean.
23 Is there any plan in the budget for making that
24 happen?

1
2 Because those districts that pay for
3 private maintenance are getting more shoppers, and it
4 gives them an advantage when I believe that we should
5 all have a level playing ground, and be able to keep
6 all of our business districts as clean as possible.
7 So the question is really the waste pickup on these
8 busy streets unfortunately a lot of residential waste
9 is going into these baskets. Some business districts
10 are saying, We don't want any baskets because we
11 believe it's attracting the garbage that the baskets
12 can't contain. Is there any plan to look at
13 improving the different -- the conditions that are
14 happening in these business districts?

15 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: And we
16 certainly would want to work with you on this. We
17 try and look at each business district individually
18 because sometimes taking away the basket actually
19 reduces litter. I don't understand why households
20 use the litter baskets. We're willing to come to
21 their house and get it. We do not have additional
22 funding for cleaning -- for basket pickup in this
23 particular fiscal year. Obviously, as I stated
24 before, if there was additional funding we would
25 probably increase the number of Sunday pickups going

1
2 forward. But let's sit down and talk because we'd
3 like to look at each business district individually
4 to see whether or not we are meeting the needs of
5 those business districts.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: We're going to
7 have a meeting in June. We have it on the calendar
8 already.

9 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Okay.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: So I look
11 forward to discussing that and other concerns as
12 well. My second and last question has to do with the
13 marine transfer stations. And I would like to know
14 how much of our garbage is taken out through these
15 transfer stations as it is compared to how much goes
16 on rail and how much goes on trucks that go elsewhere
17 out into the city. There's three different ways to
18 take the garbage out of the city. What is the
19 percentage that garbage goes into each of those
20 categories.

21 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: So right at
22 the moment the marine transfer stations are not yet
23 operating. The North Shore and Hamilton Avenue are
24 nearly complete.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Is there not
3 even one that's operating in our city?

4 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: 59th Street
5 is operating for paper recycling, and that goes to
6 Staten Island to Pratt where they convert it into
7 pizza boxes. The other long-term contracts that we
8 have, the one in Brooklyn and the one in the Bronx,
9 both go out by rail. So in the long term, the
10 disposal for household waste will be primarily rail
11 and barge, and those are both through container.
12 Staten Island currently has a transfer station going
13 by rail. So the long term is for all of New York
14 City's garbage to go by rail or transfer station
15 except for the portion on the west side of Manhattan,
16 which will be trucked to the Covanta Waste Energy
17 Facility in New Jersey.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Now, the rail
19 that leaves from Staten Island I believe goes down
20 south to Pennsylvania, but the rail that leaves from
21 the rest of the city has to go all the way Upstate
22 before it goes back down.

23 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Uh-huh.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: But when you're
25 building these different transfer stations, there has

1
2 to be long-term goals the Department is looking at
3 for the percentage of overall garbage moving through
4 marine transfer stations.

5 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Right, and
6 so all of New York City, the residential garbage
7 except for the west side of Manhattan will leave the
8 city from the transfer station by barge or by rail or
9 barge to rail.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: What I'm trying
11 to figure out is how much of the four boroughs
12 outside of Staten Island -- Because I see how that
13 goes down on rail, how much of our city will be using
14 rail to get the garbage Upstate before it goes down
15 to Pennsylvania.

16 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: This is how
17 much will go onto North Shore and --

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Well, I'm
19 thinking once it goes on barge or gets passed through
20 a marine transfer station, it's just going south. I
21 mean it's going in the direction of wherever the
22 garbage ends up.

23 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I'm going
24 to let Deputy Commission Dennis Diggins answer that
25

1
2 as to what the percentage was. You'll have to come
3 to the microphone.

4 [Pause]

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DIGGINS: Good
6 afternoon. I'm Dennis Diggins, Deputy Commissioner
7 for Solid Waste Management, Department of Sanitation.
8 The marine transfer stations are going to be broken
9 up into two pairs, the north pair and the south pair.
10 The north pair being the North Shore Transfer Station
11 91st Street. The waste from two marine transfer
12 stations will be barged to the New York Container
13 Terminal and Staten Island, be translated down to
14 rail cars, and railed to either one of two waste
15 energy plants, one in Niagara up in Buffalo and one
16 in Chester, Pennsylvania, Delaware Valley Covanta
17 Transfer Station.

18 I'm sorry, Waste Energy -- Waste Energy
19 Facility. They also have a third back-up facility,
20 which is Lee County Landfill in South Carolina. The
21 transfer stations, Hamilton Avenue and Southwest, the
22 waste for that is scheduled to go, though the
23 contract has not been signed yet. But the waste for
24 those is developed to go to the Greenville yard
25 Intermodal facility. It will be offloaded, loaded

1
2 onto a rail car, and taken up to Seneca Meadows
3 Landfill in Waterloo, New York.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: And so that's a
5 borough of the Bronx.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DIGGINS: That is --
7 not that's Brooklyn. That's Hamilton MTS and
8 Southwest MTS.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: So that'll go --

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Council Member
11 Crowley, if you can just wrap up your questions.
12 Your time is up.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I just want the
14 complete answer.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Yeah, I
16 understand.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: So that will go
18 on the rail through Brooklyn, through Queens, through
19 the Bronx, Upstate New York

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DIGGINS: No, no,
21 it's going to go by barge. Just the first step is
22 the North Shore. It's going to go by barge to Staten
23 Island to Intermodal Facility, the New York Container
24 Terminal. It's going to be loaded onto a rail car,
25 and then shipped through New Jersey. It will go over

1
2 the lift bridge into New Jersey, and up through the
3 system, the CSX line up to either Buffalo, New York
4 or south to Chester, Pennsylvania.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I know that
6 sometime in early June I'm meeting with the Office of
7 the Department of Sanitation. If you could just put
8 all those plans together before hand, I would like to
9 --

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DIGGINS: Absolutely.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: -- take a
12 serious look at that.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DIGGINS: Absolutely.

14 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Council
15 Member Crowley. We will have Council Member Miller
16 followed by Council Member Johnson.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam
18 Chair, and thank you Chairman Reynoso. Good afternoon
19 Commissioner. Thank you for coming out. My line of
20 question is I represent Southeast Queens, and that is
21 a community of about 65% homeownership. It's also a
22 community that handles 25% of the garbage here in the
23 city, and that's kind of oxymoron. It shouldn't
24 happen. In fact, a good portion of it sits right in
25 the middle of truly residential district with a major

1
2 park right across the street, and its impact is
3 devastating to that community. So we should -- so my
4 line of questioning is about that. But as we started
5 talking about the North Shore and the marine
6 transfer, what impact would that have on alleviating
7 some of that garbage that is presently being handled
8 in the district there?

9 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Are you
10 talking about the facility that is in Jamaica,
11 Queens?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: That is correct.

13 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Right. We
14 would be taking it instead to the North Shore
15 facility.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: You will be
17 taking it to the North Shore facility?

18 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Right.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: What happens to
20 those stations that currently exist there?

21 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Well,
22 they're private institutions. We would regulate
23 them, but we would no longer be sending New York City
24 residential waste to them. So that's what the future
25 looks like for your community.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So what would be
3 the decrease in the amount of garbage that will come
4 through the community then?

5 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Well, we're
6 not going to -- about 1,100 tons per day.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: All right. Okay,
8 I'll have to figure out that numbers.

9 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:
10 [interposing] So you're not happy, Councilman?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: On what
12 percentage wise, but that being said --

13 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: That's
14 about ten percent of the city's refuse.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, so, which
16 is still pretty significant. So we talked about the
17 investment in some of the infrastructure and the rail
18 and so forth. Is it feasible, because we have a rail
19 yard obviously right there at Jamaica that you bypass
20 that you get all the additional truck traffic and the
21 waste station totally by allowing those quarters
22 [sic] there to kind of pack and rail, and --

23 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:
24 [interposing] Are you talking --

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: -- and disposing
3 of the garbage right there.

4 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Are you
5 talking about commercial, or are you talking --

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Commercial.

7 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: So we
8 regulate what their permit requirements are. We
9 don't regulate how they end up with their final
10 disposal situation. So are asking whether or not we
11 could look at --?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Whether or not
13 they have to go to --

14 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:
15 [interposing] So adding a restriction to their
16 permit. You can add a restriction to a permit that
17 they have to leave a facility by rail. I don't
18 believe that your facility has it, but I think that -
19 -

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing] No.

21 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: -- most of
22 the -- most of the --

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing] No.
24 My question is whether or not they would be obligate
25

1
2 for garbage to go to North Shore as opposed to being
3 on the rails right there and going out?

4 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: If it's New
5 York City residential, it will go to North Shore.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, and --

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Can I just --
8 just for clarity to have -- Just so -- I think what
9 they're saying is do we eliminate truck traffic if
10 garbage goes from where it is to Jamaica to these
11 facilities, and then goes from there and where to
12 North Shore. Is there a reduction of truck traffic?

13 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I don't --
14 I don't know if you can go there -- from Jamaica to
15 North Shore. I think that's not where the rail line
16 is. I don't believe there's a rail line between
17 Jamaica and North shore.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic]

19 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: No, I
20 understand there's one in Jamaica headed out towards
21 the Island. It all goes through Manhattan. I don't
22 think goes to North Shore, though.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I understand that
25 there was an investment made, but it seems like we're

1
2 duplicating and crating more truck traffic where the
3 garbage is already there. Why not put it on a rail,
4 which is essentially a block away? Why send it --

5 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: So, why
6 don't we sit down and talk through how the whole
7 entire SWMP fits together because it is a complicated
8 plan with a lot of different pieces, and a lot of
9 different thinking it. But I think that it's
10 something that it would be nice to have more time to
11 discuss at length.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yeah, because I
13 know that with some of those businesses there that it
14 was the conversation about them making the investment
15 necessary, which would allow them to do that. And
16 that it would be ultimately a significant savings for
17 the City in allowing them to do that, and we would
18 eliminate hauling garbage throughout the borough.

19 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Right,
20 though the capital investment in North Shore has
21 already occurred, and we spent it all.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Well, that I get,
23 but there would be necessary investment that had to
24 be made by the Carters [sp?] in Jamaica in order for
25

1
2 them to do the railing and facilitate travel through

3 --

4 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:

5 [interposing] Okay, let's sit down and talk through
6 the whole plan and what your thinking is regarding
7 what you're envisioning around there.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay.

9 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Okay?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Council
12 Member Miller, and actually Chair Reynoso and myself
13 we will probably -- we would want to suggest that
14 perhaps we can have a borough-by-borough conversation
15 on SWMP in particular.

16 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I'm happy
17 to do that either with the whole Council or to do it
18 borough-by-borough, whatever --

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Let's do it
20 borough by borough because --

21 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:
22 [interposing] Okay, whatever you prefer

23 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: -- some boroughs
24 are more challenging than others, and that way we can
25 -- So we -- there's within the borough, which is what

1
2 SWMP is. The purpose of SWMP I think the
3 conversation could be mitigated a little bit better
4 if we do it borough by borough.

5 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I also
6 think a map could help.

7 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay, thank you.
8 We will have Council Member Kallos on the second
9 round. Again, we've been joined by council member --
10 I'm sorry. Council Member Johnson for the first
11 round. He does not look like Kallos, and then I'd
12 also like to acknowledge that we've been joined by
13 Council Member Cumbo. Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I thank you
15 Commissioner for being here today, and for your
16 testimony. A few questions. In the Capital Projects
17 part of your testimony you listed the ongoing
18 construction of the new district garage for 1, 2, and
19 5 in Manhattan.

20 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Uh-huh.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: That's the
22 Spring Street Sanitation garage.

23 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: That's the
24 Spring Street Garage, yes.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Which is located
3 in my district. There were considerable borough
4 efforts fighting it when it came up there.

5 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:
6 [interposing] Isn't it pretty now?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: What did you
8 say?

9 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Isn't it
10 pretty now?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: It looks good.
12 I'm very impressed. I want to understand when you
13 believe that garage will be up and fully functional.

14 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: So we are
15 anticipating that it's completed by the end of the
16 year. The challenge we have is depending on the snow
17 season. I need seven to ten days of no snow to move
18 a whole garage. So if we're doing back-to-back
19 snowstorms, we're not going to move in until we're --
20 we have a clear window. So we're hopeful that we
21 have very clear skies at the end of the year, and we
22 can do that right away. But that's really what we're
23 looking at the moment.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: So construction
25 is on track to be done by the end of the year?

1
2 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: As far as I
3 know, construction is on track to be done by the end
4 of the year.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: And how many
6 vehicles do you expect to be in that garage?

7 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I don't
8 actually have the exact number, but I can certainly
9 get that for you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Okay, great.
11 Thank you. Chairman Reynoso mentioned the Gansevoort
12 Peninsula and the marine transfer stations there.
13 Again, there was considerable opposition when that
14 took place asking that the facility actually remain
15 in the park, but be further north, and not closer to
16 the children's playground which it's at right now. I
17 think there is -- You can never say never, but I
18 think that the State may not come up with the money
19 as part of the MOU for the Hudson River Park. I
20 believe it's \$25 million from the City and \$25
21 million from the State.

22 It's been languishing for quite some time
23 now. I think it will be helpful. I know that you
24 talked about Legislative Affairs is working on this.
25 But it would be helpful I think to actually sit down

1
2 and have a conversation about what we realistically
3 think is going to happen, and if the State is moving
4 on it. And if it looks like there's going to be
5 continued intransigents in moving it forward, we
6 should consider and talk about what other plans may
7 be needed. Because I do think we really need to do
8 our fair share, but it's going to told things up for
9 the park for everything if a concrete plan isn't
10 devised with a time on moving forward.

11 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Right. No,
12 I don't disagree with you. We are planning to do
13 some design work on it. I've spoken to the DDC
14 Commissioner. He definitely wants to engage with the
15 community around how we do that design. So that it's
16 something that you think you will be happy with. So
17 we should certainly sit down, and any help you can
18 give me with the state will be appreciated.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Happy to do
20 that, I have only a few moments left, but soon the
21 facilities are going to be knocked down Gansevoort
22 Peninsula, and then all of those trucks are moved to
23 the Spring Street Sanitation garage. That's right?

24 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: That's
25 correct.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Right, and then
3 lastly, I just want to echo, and not for us to be a
4 broken record here today. My district covers
5 Greenwich Village, Chelsea, Hells Kitchen, Canal
6 Street to 63rd Street. We have the higher line.
7 We're adjacent to Times Square, the Theater District.
8 The number of overflowing garbage cans it literally
9 is the number one thing I hear about on a weekly
10 basis. So maybe we can talk about individual avenues
11 and blocks where it's a big problem.

12 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:

13 [interposing] Because you also have a lot of big.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Yes, and I'd
15 like to understand if the Council was able to,
16 through the budget, come up with additional funding,
17 how much funding would the department need to
18 actually increase service on individual bins on the
19 street? And you don't have to give me a number now,
20 but it would be helpful to understand the scope of
21 what a certain amount of money would go for in
22 helping to increase services in areas where there is
23 a problem with overflowing cans on the streets.

24 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Okay.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you very
3 much, Commissioner. I look forward to working
4 together.

5 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Yes, I do,
6 too.

7 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Council
8 Member Johnson, and we will now have Council Member
9 Cumbo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. Good
11 afternoon. Thank you for being here. I wanted to
12 ask you a question in terms of NYCHA development, and
13 please correct me in this. I believe that NYCHA
14 previously was paying for New York City Police
15 Department Services as well as Sanitation Services as
16 well out of their NYCHA budget. And so, wanted to
17 know now that NYCHA residents are no longer paying
18 for police services, are they also not paying for
19 sanitation services in that way. And can you also
20 talk about NYCHA's relationship with your agency?
21 And one of the other issues I'd like to discuss, too,
22 would also be recycling.

23 It's something that we've produced a lot
24 of policy papers about as well in terms of talking
25 about just on the campaign trail we saw from being in

1
2 a lot of the NYCHA developments that there were no
3 recycling bins. There was even a mattress left in
4 one of the Farragut houses. There was a mattress
5 left in the lobby that was lit on fire, scorching the
6 entire lobby. And so, there are all of these
7 different sorts of things that are happening because
8 there's not a recycling program available to the
9 NYCHA residents.

10 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: So, you
11 have a lot of questions in just one statement. So if
12 I mess one, just remind me. Yes, they are still
13 paying about \$750,000 for Sanitation Services. In
14 terms of working with NYCHA around recycling, I am
15 extremely interested in doing that. Grand houses is
16 the poster child of how well it can work, but that's
17 been the commitment of one very dedicated tenant to
18 making sure that the recycling is really happening
19 there. I have a meeting scheduled with the Chair of
20 NYCHA to start talking about that, and figuring out
21 how we can do a better job, and what the barriers are
22 for the tenants.

23 Because what I end up hearing a lot is
24 that the way that the facilities are designed, there
25 is only one chute in the hallway. There isn't

1
2 actually a room on the floor and, therefore, you
3 can't put recycling bins on the floor because they're
4 a fire hazard. So I want to work with NYCHA to see
5 what we can do in partnership, and try and figure out
6 how to get those rates up. I mean we know that this
7 could be actually a very valuable way stream if we
8 can end up diverting some of it to the recycling
9 facilities.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And just wanted to
11 make sure because I understood that that number was
12 much higher than \$700,000 that NYCHA was paying out
13 of their federal funds.

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CIPPOLINA: [off mic]

15 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Apparently,
16 it used to be \$2 million a year.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Apparently, it
18 used to be \$2 million, and it was reduced to
19 \$700,000?

20 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: \$750,000.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: \$750,000.

22 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Because the
23 way we collect the refuse right now is we're
24 collecting it in containers, which is actually a one-
25 person job and is much less expensive for us.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay. All right,
3 thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you Council
5 Member Cumbo, and now we will begin the second
6 rounds, three minutes. Council Member Kallos.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you,
8 Commissioner for your brevity in the first line of
9 questioning. Absolutely. According to the
10 Independent Budget Office Report in 2012, the current
11 Waste Management cost of \$90 per ton while this
12 marine transfer station will increase the cost to
13 \$238 a ton, more that \$148 more per ton. And at the
14 last hearing, your previous Commissioner,
15 Commissioner Doherty admitted that it would, in fact,
16 be more expensive. Do you concur?

17 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Will the
19 Department of Sanitation or the City ever offer
20 incentives to commercial haulers to use the 91st
21 Street Marine Transfer Station?

22 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Offer
23 incentives like pay them to use it?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Yep.
25

1
2 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I don't
3 think we'll be paying them to use it, no. Like
4 asking them, like we'd give them money if they'd come
5 to the center?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: You'd give them
7 incentives, you'd give them a rebate based on what
8 the actual cost is to the City --

9 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:
10 [interposing] What the cost will be? What we will
11 charge them --

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: -- where they're
13 not paying full market rate.

14 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: -- to tip
15 has not been determined.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Will there be any
17 discounts for commercial haulers in order to
18 incentivize them to use 91st Street versus another
19 commercial facility in the city?

20 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I do not
21 know what the other commercial facilities are
22 charging them. We will determine what we will charge
23 them when we get to that point.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: When is that
25 point? Is 2016? Is it 2014? Is it 2018?

1
2 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Well, we
3 are quite -- we're not done yet. We are still
4 building the facility. We believe that the facility
5 is going to be done in 2016. We're going to operate
6 all of our facilities for at least a year with just
7 DSNY trucks to work out all the bugs about how the
8 operations need to be managed. So we're several
9 years away from having to make that determination.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: The costs have
11 already gone up almost 500%, more than quint --
12 almost quintupling. At what point is it too much?
13 If it hits \$400 million, is that too much?

14 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Well, we've
15 already --

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing] Is
17 it yes or no?

18 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: It's not a
19 yes or no question. In fact, it's --

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I have three
21 minutes to ask you all the questions I need to.

22 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: The premise
23 of the question is so much more complicated than --
24 and how you think about money and what you've already
25

1
2 spent. So, I can't answer that as a yes or no
3 question.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So does cost
5 matter?

6 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Cost
7 absolutely matters, but it's one factor --

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing] But
9 this costs more?

10 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: -- among
11 many. Among many factors, around equity, and around
12 fairness for all city residents because I think what
13 we're hearing today is that nobody like a transfer
14 station in their neighborhood. And so I think that's
15 the challenge.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Do the DSNY
17 trucks carry radioactive materials, yes or no?

18 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: The DSNY --
19 the DSNY trucks pick up medical waste, and
20 occasionally we do have -- they have detectors at all
21 of our transfer stations, as do all transfer
22 stations.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing] Is
24 it safe for those radioactive materials to be around
25 children.

1
2 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: The
3 protocol it is safe. The Department of Health and
4 Mental Hygiene has actually determined that it is
5 safe to our employees who are driving the trucks. We
6 have a protocol.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing] Are
8 they small children? Are these small children? Are
9 you driving the trucks past these small children with
10 radioactive materials in them?

11 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: We are
12 driving the trucks that we drive [bell] through the
13 streets of New York every single day in the same way
14 that we have done for many, many years. These are
15 primary issues with low grade medical waste from
16 people who have cancer.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Is there any
18 other marine transfer station site in the city where
19 you have to drive past six schools, 22,056 residents,
20 and 6,750 residents of color in order to get there
21 within the quarter mile radius? Do you have to drive
22 past this scene to put anything into one of your
23 marine transfer stations?

24 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Well,
25 actually we probably will near Nelly Blythe in

1
2 Southwest because we have to turn the corner right by
3 the amusement park where I do believe that small
4 children actually play.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I don't think
6 that's a good site either. I don't think anybody's
7 playground is a great site for a marine transfer
8 station.

9 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I would
10 agree with you, but there are -- but there is no
11 place in the city where people feel that marine
12 transfer stations are actually something that they
13 are inviting me to build.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: We have
15 industrial zones for a reason.

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you. Thank
17 you to our Council Member Kallos, and now we will
18 have some more questioning from our Co-Chair. Thank
19 you.

20 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Certainly.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, and I
22 just want to state that in the industrial zones are
23 there for economic development and give great
24 opportunities to the City of New York. It just
25 happens to be that when the industrial zone were

1
2 built, or where they were situated because of that
3 planning it just happens to be that poor black and
4 brown kids, and families had to station there. No
5 one else would live there so we had to. So when it
6 comes to planning, I think it's a mess, to say the
7 least.

8 We have 16 bridge transfer stations that
9 are currently located in North Brooklyn, and we have
10 over 20,000 tons of capacity. I applaud and thank
11 the City of New York and the Department of Sanitation
12 to be willing to pay more money for environmental
13 justice. To bring justice to our community, and I do
14 applaud them. Very rarely does the City of New York
15 or I personally feel that the City of New York invest
16 in poor communities. This is an example where
17 they're willing to put their money where their mouth
18 is. So I am grateful for it.

19 I also want to talk about the expansion
20 or the increase of funding or money that it costs to
21 make this plan. I think it's deceptive to ask yes or
22 no questions to things that are very -- that are very
23 important to hear the entire answer to. And one of
24 them is it's \$47 million that originally was put
25 forth by the Department of Sanitation as to what the

1
2 entire budget was going to be. And it's a place
3 order. It's an attempt to begin a process that is
4 much more comprehensive. And in that time the money
5 that has been increased was to mitigate a lot of the
6 concerns that your residents are going to have to
7 deal with in the long term.

8 We're talking about noise. We're talking
9 about pollution. We're talking about pest control.
10 We're talking about air control. All of it is
11 extremely valuable, and you should also -- be
12 thankful that if the facility is going to be built, it
13 is going to be a state-of-the-art facility that is
14 going to mitigate circumstances -- mitigate pollution
15 and issues that your residents would be dealing with.
16 I also do want to say that you talk about kids in
17 your district, Council Member Kallos, and you talk
18 about the environment or the surroundings, 16 waste
19 transfer stations.

20 I have 170,000 people in my district just
21 as you do. You're going to handle 900 tons. I'm
22 handling 20,000 tons. So I would put you up against
23 my community any day in regards to what other
24 communities dealing with this many -- these many
25 issues. So I just want to let you know, both you and

1
2 the rest of the folks that are in this room that we
3 have a lot of issues that we obviously have to talk
4 about. And the Commissioner has been helpful in
5 addressing a lot of those issues I think today by
6 answering those questions. But I will not fault the
7 City for willing to invest in environmental justice.
8 So I just wanted to have that statement.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic]

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: One second. I have
12 questions. Thank you, Chair. I actually have
13 questions on capital investments in the process.

14 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Certainly.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Currently, there
16 are 19 department sites where there is no separate
17 dressing room or a bathroom for women. Please explain
18 how the Department will address this issue. Are
19 there funds allocated in the budget to build separate
20 facilities for men and women?

21 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: So this is
22 something that's very close to my heart. I'm not
23 sure where the total 19 facilities -- I looked at
24 the list and some of them I know we have female
25 facilities. I actually don't know if we have male

1
2 facilities because I've been in the female
3 facilities. But we do have an issue with making sure
4 that we have enough facilities for women across the
5 organization. We've completed designs for five
6 facilities, and we do have funding, and anticipate
7 registering that contract within the next 30 days.

8 Many of the other facilities while they
9 may be garages, they're on a campus with another
10 garage that does have a facility. So it may require
11 them to walk within a campus, you know, how we
12 sometimes co-locate a 6, 6, 8 and 8 if there is some
13 places where we have co-location. But is something
14 we're rolling out plans to address these very
15 systematically. So we have the first five funded
16 anticipated to go forward, and we're forward with
17 finding long-term solutions for this issue.

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: And then
19 specifically, I know that Council Member Crowley had
20 mentioned that it is a challenge, especially now that
21 we're going through budget this process, where we
22 need to invest discretionary dollars for garbage
23 pickup. In the past, I had allotted monies of
24 discretionary dollars for garbage pickup. Towards
25 the end of the last -- Well, I would say, I think

1
2 within the last year with the past administration the
3 former Commissioner agreed to picking up some of the
4 responsibilities.

5 I'm talking about specifically the
6 Roosevelt Avenue Corridor, which at one time was
7 picked up six times a week, and now I believe we're
8 at 14 times a week. And I remember -- and it's
9 definitely needed, but I had to put in the
10 discretionary dollars for that. So I urge that when
11 you look at our districts and our communities that
12 you look at them with a fresh eye. And understanding
13 that in areas like this where there isn't a bill,
14 even though we're trying to get one a 37,000 or other
15 areas in our communities that are now becoming the
16 new hot spot.

17 Where traditionally we might not have had
18 the volume that we have not. But there also is a
19 consideration, and thoughtful look at our garbage and
20 the waste. And I also wanted to talk about the
21 enforcement, and the need for additional -- I don't
22 know if they're called officers, but additional
23 sanitation workers for enforcement. One of the
24 challenges I face in my community, and I know many of
25 my colleagues do is home waste dumped on the corners.

1
2 I know that there is an aggressive when you find
3 those -- I think there may be some criminal charges
4 that can be brought up. But if we don't have the
5 enforcement --

6 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:

7 [interposing] Right.

8 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: -- it doesn't
9 work.

10 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: There are a
11 couple of things there. One, please reach out to us
12 if you're having issues with street litter baskets.
13 We do try and be proactive around going out and
14 seeing what's happening in communities. But there
15 are some communities, particularly in Queens, that
16 are changing really, really fast. So I'm not going
17 to say that we always have the best information, and
18 so definitely let's keep working on that. In terms
19 of enforcement, we also have a program for you to
20 help us with illegal dumping where residents can send
21 us information that we can actually prosecute on.
22 We'll provide you with that information. To the
23 extent that you have sites, and you have any idea and
24 want us to stake something out, we can attempt to

1
2 that. You sort of have to be there when it happens,
3 which can make it very challenging.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Yes, I can imagine
5 so. I think we have some problem areas, and many of
6 the members here can probably work with you. I will
7 definitely follow up, and I would ask your team to
8 follow up with my office. But, there is, you know,
9 there are the problem areas. I'm sure we can do some
10 type of set up there. We'll have the people coming
11 on and on continuously.

12 [Pause]

13 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay. And how we
14 will have another follow-up question by Council
15 Member Kallos, who will be on the three-minute clock.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: This is just to
17 respond to earlier comments. We can't invoke justice
18 for a zero sum equation. We left eye for an eye
19 behind in the Sinai Desert. Right now, Manhattan's
20 trash, as the Commissioner said, is going to New
21 Jersey. It's going to New Jersey, not Brooklyn. New
22 Jersey, and we can't be turning on each other as
23 council members when there are a number of council
24 members today who have said that the Solid Waste
25 Management Plan does not make sense.

1
2 And so we need to engage the problem, and
3 we have to figure out how we can handle our trash
4 better. And we have to work with our Commissioner to
5 make sure that Manhattan trash isn't going to another
6 borough. It's going to New Jersey where everyone
7 seems to be fine with it going. And I don't want to
8 send it to Staten Island, and I want everyone on the
9 body to support me in saying, We're done dumping on
10 Staten Island. But the last thing, I just want to
11 object to is -- and I don't care if the number of
12 answers to questions that weren't answered here but
13 are going to be answered in meetings later behind
14 closed doors.

15 I'm really, really about transparency.
16 We just introduced an open FOIL bill. That can't
17 happen. When people ask you ask you questions, it's
18 an answer here or you get it in writing and it's
19 public information. And this idea of meeting as
20 boroughs because our interests are somehow unaligned,
21 that's not okay. We need to be all noticed. We all
22 need to be invited because we're in this city
23 together. The Tale of Two Cities is a campaign
24 slogan. We are one city, New York City, five
25 boroughs unified together. And I think that with all

1
2 the things that have come up, and the fact that there
3 are so many things that need follow up or meetings,
4 we need another hearing on it. So this can happen in
5 public in front of everybody here, and anybody
6 watching online. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you. We've
8 been joined by Council Member Rosenthal, and we'll
9 have a follow-up question by Council Member Johnson
10 before we wrap up for the day.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you,
12 Commissioner. I wanted to understand a bit more the
13 Compost Plan for the city, how you're engaging local
14 communities, the facilities that are going to be up
15 and going. In my district, every weekend we actually
16 have our local composting is done in Addington [sp?]
17 Square. People come on 23rd and 8th Avenue now, and
18 it's very, very, very popular. So I wanted to
19 understand how the city was going to engage in that
20 more.

21 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: So there
22 are a couple of pieces to the Compost Program.
23 There's one, the New York City Compost Project, which
24 is really more what I call the retail side. Where
25 it's being at weekend markets. It's about all of

1
2 those sort of -- Where you're bringing the waste to
3 a central area. There is also the larger one, which
4 is the pilot program where we will be in 100,000
5 homes by the end of June. So that is mainly for
6 single family, and for small apartment buildings.

7 We're experimenting with how frequently
8 we're picking up in the different areas to find out
9 whether or not we get more or less participation.
10 When we're picking up in different frequencies, does
11 it matter to people? It's obviously a voluntary
12 program, which tends to skew it a little bit. But
13 they'll do the organics program when they feel like,
14 and when they don't feel like it they don't. We need
15 to make sure that that pilot gets an opportunity to
16 really roll out. In addition, we have engaged with
17 apartment buildings in Manhattan and Brooklyn, very
18 large apartment buildings.

19 And done lots of outreach with them, and
20 brought many into the program. We're primarily
21 adding them as we have trucks available from the
22 school routes. We now have -- we will by the end of
23 this year be in 400 schools. We're hoping to --
24 Well, we're hoping they that they get biodegradable
25 plates and trays and silverware soon. But we think

1
2 that we want to mesh all of the different ways that
3 you can compost together. So to be in the schools,
4 to have that same thing happening at home for the
5 children we think is very important.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you. I
7 appreciate that. I'm glad that the Department is
8 actually doing stuff on this. I think a lot of New
9 Yorkers are excited about purchasing abating on this
10 program. I appreciate your testimony today. I would
11 just like to end by saying I would love to go on a
12 tour of the new Spring Street Sanitation garage.

13 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA:
14 [interposing] Any time.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: That would be
16 great if we could arrange that with your staff, as
17 well as having a follow-up meeting to discuss
18 Gansevoort Peninsula, the future of it looking at
19 what PDC wants to do, and what the timeline is on
20 that. So we can work together for a solution for the
21 marine transfer station there.

22 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Absolutely.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you very
24 much.

1
2 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Thank you,
3 Commissioner. We're just going to have one more
4 council member, Council Member Rosenthal. This is
5 her first round. So she'll have five minutes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you very
7 much. Commissioner, it's nice to see you after
8 meeting you a while back and your announcement and
9 congratulations and welcome. I'm learning about
10 being a council member so I'm asking a question.

11 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Okay.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: The first
13 thing that just jumped out at me the composting in
14 the schools, and you were talking about the
15 biodegradable plates and trays. Who pays for that,
16 the Department of Education, the Parent Association?

17 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Well, these
18 would Department of Education contracts. I know that
19 they've let many of the contracts. I don't believe
20 they're registered them yet. I think they were
21 hoping to have them in place prior to the start of
22 the school year, but it looks somewhat delayed due to
23 procurement issues.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I'm sure of
25 contracts. We can work on that with you.

1
2 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: If you can
3 fix it, I'd be happy.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah. But I
5 can see the link, and that's sort of one of the
6 things holding it back?

7 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Well, it
8 just means that we end up with more contamination.
9 Sometimes the kids are very good, and sometimes
10 they're not. So it's just more challenging to
11 separate, and get that really good product.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, the other
13 real thought was when the pilot was fixed, and one of
14 our problems was as you upped, the Sanitation
15 Department upped the composting truck it means that
16 we lost a rung of recycling. Have you been able to -
17 - has the Department been able to address that or
18 think about that?

19 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: We're
20 definitely thinking about what the -- because the
21 last thing I want to do is -- It's one bucket of
22 what's disposed of, and it's how we cut it up. It's
23 it organics, metal, glass and plastic, paper, and
24 then the rest is refuse. We know that for the
25 schools in particular we're having some -- They're

1
2 only getting metal, glass, and plastic once a week,
3 but for them that's milk cartons, which tend to be
4 more challenging to store. So we're really trying to
5 re-evaluate what -- how best to meet that obligation.
6 We're thinking that when we have the dual-bin trucks,
7 we need play with what we're picking up on what day,
8 and figure out what's the optima. We don't actually
9 I think know the answer. And so we're trying to work
10 with the schools to figure out what works the best.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So I
12 appreciate your answer a lot, and I realize you've
13 been on the job a minute. So I appreciate how well
14 you understand what the issue is. This has been a
15 problem for the whole school year, though, and we're
16 pretty much at the end of it. So is this something
17 that you think will be addressed by the end of this
18 school year, or are we going to wait until next
19 school year?

20 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Changing
21 routes is extremely intensive. So I'm not going to
22 guarantee that we're done by the end of this school
23 year because my children think that the school year
24 is almost immediately over. But there is still a
25 little time left. I think that we will have a --

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]

3

We have until the end of June.

4

COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I know but

5

they -- they're feeling spring. I think that we can

6

probably look to have something better in place by

7

the fall because I -- the next few weeks I think to

8

make a change right now when we're going into the

9

summer school, we'd probably be -- we'd be rushing

10

it. We will try and do it as quickly as possible,

11

but rats are not the easiest thing to change quickly.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah, I

13

appreciate that, but as you say the storage is

14

causing a big rat problem around the schools. So I'd

15

love help on that.

16

COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Okay.

17

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And then just

18

lastly, your processing for organic waste I love it

19

when you talk about, you know, all the waste, and how

20

you're going to dispose of things. Could talk about

21

timelines?

22

COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: So what?

23

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And whether or

24

not you need more money to do this?

25

1
2 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: You know,
3 it's so hard to have OMB in the room and say that --.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
5 I know. That's why I asked.

6 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: And say,
7 Oh, I'd love more money. I'm trying not to get in
8 trouble. They have to sign off on everything.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I used to be
10 one of those OMB people who would sit there and go,
11 Don't say it, don't say it, don't say it.

12 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Yeah, but
13 that's why they're here. So we have the compost
14 facility that's on Staten Island, which is real very,
15 very well run, and produces some beautiful material.
16 We also are transferring it through the City's
17 Organic Transfer Stations to some other facilities
18 across the region. And then we have been using the
19 DEP Newtown Creek Digesters, and making natural gas
20 out of it.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: You are?

22 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: But it's
23 really a very small portion of what they are
24 producing on any given day. But we're looking to do
25 more of this.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I know could you could the universities have them as well. You might want to consider including. Like I know Columbia has one. You might want to consider putting them in other digesters as well. God, I love your technology, and your wordage in Sanitation. It's really good. Anyway, keep going. Sorry. And the siting task force, and you contemplating putting that back together.

COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: I mean we would be open to putting it back together, but I think that the challenge that we have is that the task force also had never found any place to site anything. You know, any solid waste facility will have to go through ULA [sp?], and, therefore, there's a lot of opportunity for the Council to be involved. So we never found that it ended up being effective tool for us. But if it's something the Council feels would be very useful, we can look to recreating it.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very much, Madam Commissioner. I appreciate you coming

1
2 out today. We are going to -- I'm going to push it
3 over to my Co-Chair, and then I'll wrap up.

4 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Okay.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: This will be the
6 last question. I just want to make sure that we get
7 it on the record so it didn't cause some rumors. Has
8 certain types of construction work been stopped
9 during certain hours at the East 91st Street MTS?

10 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: So the East
11 91st Street MTS all the water work has been
12 continuing. They operate basically 7:00 to 6:00. We
13 did stop for a moment to figure out if we could save
14 some of the trees along the ramp. We have determined
15 with the Parks Department that we can't, and we will
16 imminently be taking those down. We do intend to
17 stop demolition during their summer camp period, but
18 we will still be moving construction equipment in and
19 out, and we will still be continuing water work.
20 This is really not dissimilar from other capital
21 projects across the city where you try and coordinate
22 with the community. You know that there have been
23 occasions back in my former life where we
24 accommodated Fashion Week or the Big Apple Circus, or
25 Fordham University is loading on that period. We

1
2 don't view this as being significantly different than
3 that.

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.

5 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Okay. Again,
7 thank you, Commissioner for coming to testify today.

8 We have additional questions that were not asked. So
9 I'm going to forward them to you in a letter, and I
10 hope that you can respond to this quickly. So it can
11 be part of our budget negotiating as we move forward.

12 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Absolutely.

13 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you.

14 COMMISSIONER KATHRYN GARCIA: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: This concludes our
16 hearing for today. The Finance Committee will resume
17 Executive Budget Hearings for FY15 tomorrow at 10
18 a.m. in this room. We will hear from the City
19 University of New York, the Department of Youth and
20 Community Development, and the Department of Consumer
21 Affairs. As a reminder, the public will be allowed
22 to testify on the last day of budget hearings on June
23 6th beginning at approximately 4:00 p.m. For members
24 of the public who wish to testify on June 6th, but
25 cannot make the hearing, you can fax your testimony

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
TRANSPORTATION AND THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

313

to my Counsel Tanisha Edwards, and she will make it a
part of the official record. Her fax number is
212.788.7061. Again, 212.788.7061. Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON
TRANSPORTATION AND THE COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

314

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 24, 2014