CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK ----- Х TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES Of the VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING ----- X May 7, 2014 Start: 6:15 p.m. Recess: 8:30 p.m. HELD AT: CURTIS HIGH SCHOOL BEFORE: Chairperson Ydanis Rodriguez COUNCIL MEMBERS: Melissa Mark-Viverito Daniel Dromm Vanessa Gibson Corey Johnson Vincent Ignizio Steven Matteo Deborah Rose

1

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Thomas Chan Chief of Transportation, NYPD

Meera Joshi Commissioner Taxi and Limousine Commission

Tom Coccola Borough Transportation Commissioner

Polly Trottenberg Commissioner Department of Transportation

Warren Gardner Department of Transportation

Juan Martinez Transportation Alternatives

Charles Fall[**sp?**] Representative Community Assistance Unit

Deputy Chief Mike Morino Executive Officer New York City Police Department

Anthony Bologna Deputy Inspector of Special Projects New York City Police Department

Terence Hurson Commanding Officer of the 121 Precinct New York City Police Department

Captain Matt Harrington COO of the 123 Precinct New York City Police Department Captain Tom Kemper Executive Officer of 120 Precinct New York City Police Department

Captain Ken Noonan Executive Officer of 121, And covering for the 122 New York City Police Department

Daniel Castorina Representation from Council Member Matteo's Office

Staten Island Residents:

Anthony Magnavito James Fred Rodriguez Dan Icaleri Boris Sukov Andrew Blanchero Linda Cohen Amorica Graywahl[[Sp?], Laura Barlament

Robert Palmieri Lighthouse Meisner Avenue Civic Association

Kathleen Rivera Executive Board Member of Curtis High School

Michael Reilly, Member Community Education Council 31 School Board for Staten Island

Joshua Hottel[Sp?]

Priscilla Marco President Van Duzer Street Area Civic Association

Roy Fishman

3

Gonzalo Mercado

Laura Solis Bike New York

Edward Jones Staten Island NAACP

Tom Weiss Publisher *Upfront News* 

Kidder[Sp?] Jean Marie

Deborah Young

John Lewesy[Sp?]?

Fatmada Va [Sp?] Senior at Curtis High School

UmVet Bah[Sp?]

Charmaine Soldierna[Sp?]

Professor Paul Gamarano[Sp?] Graduate Safety Course Professor, former Safety Manager, Risk Manager and Defensive Driving Instructor

John Kilcohen[Sp?]

Roy Moskowitz

Jacqueline Junttonen Teacher of Adults and Children how to bike Bike New York 4

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN HALL TOWN HALL MEETING 5
2	COUNCIL MEMBER YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Good
3	evening everyone, first of all I would like to
4	apologize for being late, eh, my colleague and the
5	commissioner, the know that we been starting on time
6	eh, but traffic you know, I have two daughters so I
7	had to do my arrangement to pick up from school, take
8	`em to the program then driving from Riverdale -
9	121 <sup>st</sup> and then going all over, crossing the bridge to
10	be here, but for me it is a great opportunity to be
11	here in Staten Island. Eh, eh, in our for town home
12	meeting relating to Vision Zero. I think that
13	everyone here we should celebrate from the men and
14	women, the NYPD to eh, the Commissioners, elected
15	officials, eh, because of the data that being shared,
16	studied by the Daily News[?] and all the media saying
17	that we being reducing the number. You know in order
18	to address the Mayor issue that affect our city when
19	it come to safety I always say that we can have
20	agreed, disagreed, disagreement in many area about
21	the end of the day all of us want to have a safe
22	city. So, eh, knowing that the, eh, New York City
23	has a Mayor has established and the data confirmed,
24	has a major crisis where the first cause of death
25	are there in our city for children under 14. It's

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 6 1 not drugs, it's not guns but is car crash accidents. 2 3 In a way that those of who have children we know, well we have our, eh, mother or father, we work 4 around senior citizens. We know how dangerous it is 5 to walk, to walk in our street, and this is the б reason why, eh, we being embracing Mayor de Blasio 7 8 Vision Zero goal to reduce to zero. Eh, the number of fatality, eh, that we have in our city, that's his 9 10 goal by his plan, that by 2024 we should reduce it to zero and we are committed to work with him leadership 11 12 to be sure that we bring that number down. So thank 13 you again everyone, eh, for being here. I wouldn't 14 take more time and I would go straight to hear from my colleague, who represent, also this district, 15 Council Member Deborah Rose. 16

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: I'm qonna So, um, this was the first test for, um, the 18 sit. Commissioners and the Council Members to see if they 19 20 can get to Staten Island without any incidents, so 21 we're glad to have them here. I want to welcome and say good evening to, um, my council colleagues, to 22 Chairman Ydanis Rodriguez the Chair of the 23 24 Transportation Committee, Council Member Gibson, who is the Chair of the Public Safety Committee, to, um, 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 7 1 our DOT, Department of Transportation Commission -2 3 Polly Trottenberg, to our Taxi and Limousine Commissioner - Meera Joshi, and to our borough 4 Transportation Commissioner - Tom Coccola, NYPD Chief 5 6 of Transportation - Thomas Chan and our Community Assistance Unit - Representative Charles Fall[Sp?], 7 members of Transportation Alternatives and Staten 8 9 Island Residents and everyone who took the time out 10 of their schedules to come here tonight.

11 I want to welcome you to the North Shore of Staten Island. I want to say that again, I want 12 13 to welcome you to the North Shore of Staten Island. 14 [CHEARS AND CLAPPING] It's good to see you here this evening. We're all here to learn about a very 15 important issue. An issue that has been a priority 16 of mine in the last 4 plus years on the City Council 17 and that is the safety of ALL who utilize our 18 streets. In my years representing this district I 19 20 have advocated for the expansion of speed cameras, of 21 the speed camera program to include ALL school zones. I've introduced the past legislation last year that 22 requires the installation of speed bumps on all 23 24 streets adjacent to our schools. I've worked with the MTA to move dangerous bus stops and successfully 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 8
2	secure two sweeping slow zones on the North Shore,
3	and we are, Commissioner, pushing for more. Um, but
4	much more needs to be done and that's what Vision
5	Zero is about. In 2013 we had 14 traffic deaths on
6	Staten Island. Of those 10 were pedestrians. This
7	year we weren't even six hours into 2014, when 29
8	year old Felipe Avilla was struck and killed by a hit
9	and run driver in New Brighton. Now, in early May,
10	we see a total four traffic deaths on Staten Island
11	this year alone. Tonight, we are looking at a plan
12	to reduce the number of deaths on our streets to
13	zero. Among those Vision Zero components, which is
14	most important to me and my constituents, is the
15	enforcement of existing traffic laws. It is NOW and
16	has been illegal to speed on our roads. It is
17	illegal to text while driving. These behaviors lead
18	to traffic deaths, not just statistics but lives cut
19	tragically short and yet we witness unchecked
20	reckless behavior on our roads every day. Our City's
21	Vision Zero plan includes targeted enforcement of
22	speeding, texting and other dangerous violations.
23	Experience has taught us that enforcement saves lives
24	and that's why we're here tonight, to save the lives
25	of Staten Islanders. And finally, as the Chair of

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 9
2	the Waterfront's Committee and as Council Member
3	representing the North Shore, I am looking forward to
4	welcoming New Yorkers, more of New Yorkers to the New
5	York Wheel, Empire Outlets and several new retail and
6	residential hotel and entertainment complexes. I've
7	worked hard to make these projects a reality, and
8	when they do come to the North Shore, I want to be
9	sure that our roads will be safe for all Staten
10	Islanders and our visitors to use. I want to see
11	pedestrians, cyclists and drivers, all using our
12	roads safely as they enjoy our waterfront and
13	surrounding neighborhoods, and that is why I support
14	this vision. And that is why I will continue to work
15	with my colleagues to make New York City a safer
16	place to walk, bike and drive, and I look forward to
17	hearing to what, hearing from you, to hear what you
18	have to say about Vision Zero. Thank you.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank
20	you, Council Memeh, eh, Council Member Rose and now
21	let's now hear from the Co-chair of the Vision Zero
22	Town Hall Meeting, the Chairman of the Committee of
23	Public Safety, Vanessa Gibson.
24	CHAIRMAN VANESSA GIBSON: Good evening
25	everyone! It is my honor and pleasure to join with

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 10
2	all of you, my family and friends in Staten Island.
3	It is an exciting time for us I am proud to be here
4	and I want to thank my distinguished colleagues in
5	the City Council, Council Member Debbie Rose and the
6	Chair of Transportation Ydanis Rodriguez, and it is
7	exciting to be here I am from the Bronx, um and
8	certainly proud to join with all of you this Vision
9	Zero Town Hall. I too want to thank all of the
10	panelists that are here, our TLC Commissioner,
11	Commissioner Trottenberg, Steve Thomas Chan, TLC
12	Commissioner Joshi, the Mayor's Officer,
13	Transportation Alternatives - Safe Streets, um,
14	Streets PAC, BikeNY… Families for Safe Streets, all
15	of the advocacy groups that REALLY do all of the
16	incredible work each and every day to help educate
17	legislators on what we can do collectively to provide
18	livable and safe streets for each and everyone. I'm
19	really honored that Mayor de Blasio had this vision
20	of Vision Zero. This 63-point plan is truly a
21	framework, it's a foundation and a platform to
22	stimulate conversation to address the on-going
23	pedestrian injuries and fatalities unfortunately that
24	we have across the City and, so, in addition to what
25	my colleague has talked about in terms of enhancing

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 11
2	some of our streetscapes in the schools and in our
3	communities. I am also extremely supportive of
4	neighborhood slow zones, arterial slow zones,
5	pedestrian plazas, dedicated bike lanes and dedicated
6	bus lanes, increasing speed cameras in residential
7	and school communities, count-down cross walks,
8	ensuring that all of the work that we do we must have
9	resources for the enforcement behind it. We must
10	make sure that the NYPD has sufficient resources to
11	enforce all of these regulations that we are talking
12	about. I'm truly honored to be here and thankful for
13	all of you so that you can provide that critical
14	input that is needed so that at the end of the day,
15	we can truly achieve Vision Zero. Thank you Staten
16	Island for being here and I look forward to working
17	with you. Thank you.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Now
19	let's hear from a great commissioner, the
20	Commissioner of DOT, Commissioner Trottenberg.
21	COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Thank you. Am
22	I on here? Thank you, I am so glad to be here on
23	Staten Island as well and I want to thank you
24	Chairman Rodriguez, Chairwoman Gibson and Council
25	Woman Rose for organizing this town hall meeting and

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 12 1 inviting me to speak on Vision Zero. Um, it's an 2 3 honor to have partners like you working with the de Blasio Administration on, what is one of the Mayor's 4 top priorities, reducing traffic crashes and 5 fatalities to zero. Um, I also want to give a shout 6 out to Tom Coccola, who is DOT's Borough 7 8 Commissioner. I think many of you know him, um, he is the man on the front lines here on Staten Island 9 10 and we're so grateful for his work. Um, at DOT, 11 we've shown in recent years that pedestrian-oriented 12 projects and street designs can really save lives. 13 We've done a lot of work all over the City, we've 14 done all kinds of things to make it sof -- easier for pedestrians. I think my mic just cut out. Um, make 15 it easier for pedestrians to cross, to improve 16 17 visibility, to slow down traffic in some places, to make it clearer how the road should be used between 18 motorists, cyclists and pedestrians, and our projects 19 have reduced traffic fatalities around the City. Is 20 21 the mic cutting out? [UNKNOWN FEMALE VOICE] Yeah. 22 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Maybe Mr. 23 24 Chairman I'll borrow yours? We'll see if this one is better, okay. Sounds like it's better. Um, we've 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 13 1 had success with projects around the City that have 2 3 reduced [INTERPOSE] It's on, and I'm talking loud too. Um, we've had successs with projects that have 4 reduced fatalities anywhere from 20% to 88%, um, and 5 6 we do a lot of common sense things and we're gonna actually show you a lot of them on the screen. 7 8 Again, crossing short - crossing, shorten crossing 9 distances, changing signal timings, you name it. In 10 the coming months we're going to be doing a lot more 11 work, we're going to be doing some here in Staten 12 Island, we're gonna make improvements along Richmond 13 Terrace. We're gonna do traffic calming measures 14 along Richmond Avenue. [applause] Yay. But as part of Vision Zero, the Mayor has cast us with doing even 15 16 more. And we're doing a number of things, including 17 arterial slow zones, uh, we announced one here on Forest Avenue, um, ad campaigns, education in 18 schools. We have a really robust agenda and we are 19 20 looking forward to achieving it with our partners 21 here. And now I'm gonna actually call up Warren Gardner from DOT and he's gonna give, just sort of a 22 quick overview of Vision Zero. [applause] 23 24 WARREN GARDNER: Good evening everyone. Can you hear me? As the Commissioner I am going to 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 14
2	give you a brief presentation on, um, the Mayor's
3	Vision Zero Action Plan. So you know, as you've
4	heard, you know, when Mayor de Blasio first got into
5	office. You know he charged to the DOT, the TLC,
6	NYPD and several other agencies to come up with a
7	plan to reduce the number of traffic fatalities.
8	[LOW MICROPHONE 00:13:26 - 00:14:00] [laughs]is
9	this better? [laughs] No?, damn, I'll be right back
10	[WORKING WITH MICROPHONE ISSUES] Um, as I mentioned,
11	this is uh, you know, [MICROPHONE ISSUES GOING ON,
12	they're trying to adjust 00:14:13 - 00:14:33] Um,
13	just as I mentioned, you know, this is a very bold,
14	exciting, um, plan that the Mayor has put together
15	and he's charged, you know, with the DOT, the NYPD,
16	the TLC and several other City agencies to come up
17	with the action plan and we came up with a 63-point
18	plan, um, that, not just involves our agencies, but
19	also involves all of you here today, and you know,
20	the Mayor's vision in DOT and the other agencies, we
21	felt that it was very important to involve everyone
22	because we all have a responsibility, um, when we
23	step out into the streets, whether we are drivers,
24	pedestrians or cyclists. You know, when we go out in
25	the street, we all make choices and these choices not

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 15
2	only affect our lives but the lives of other people
3	in the communities. You know, so, um, Vision Zero
4	is, um, is not just, uh, uh, you know a dream, or a,
5	um, you know, our policy initiative, it is actually a
6	culture and a mind-set change that we're really
7	trying to get out to folks, um, who use our streets.
8	You know so, um, you know, at DOT, as the
9	Commissioner mentioned, we're going to be doing a lot
10	of, um, um, street redesigns and some really bold
11	initiatives to, um, to change some of the, some of
12	the behavior on the streets, but the NYPD is also a
13	big partner here, they're going to be doing a lot of
14	stepped up enforcement. The TLC is going to be doing
15	a lot of work with, with their drivers as well, so,
16	and we really need you to step up, up in, and help
17	us, uh, in different initiatives as well that I'll
18	mention. Um, you know, um, as you can see, you know
19	the statistics are, um, pretty glaring, you know, we
20	have 4,000 people who are, are severely injured in
21	our streets and 250 people who are killed each year,
22	um due to crashes on our streets and you know, a lot
23	of these are caused, um, by poor driver choice, you
24	know, where they'd be failing to yield to pedestrians
25	or um, or speeding. You know, as I mentioned
I	I

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 16 1 earlier, we all have a choice when we step out into 2 3 the streets and a lot of times, you know, we see New York City, we think big busy streets, a lot of 4 people, so you know crashes are inevitable, and um, 5 you know, deaths and, um, injuries are just gonna б happen, but, um, we have to change that mind-set. 7 8 You know, um, 30 years ago you can go have a drink with some friends after work, or on a weekend and 9 10 get, you know, behind the wheel of your car and drive 11 home, but we can't do that anymore because it's 12 illegal. But before we can make that illegal, we 13 have to change the way people viewed, you know, 14 having a drink and getting behind the wheels of their car. You know, even now, we kind of changed our 15 mind-set a little bit negatively where, if you know, 16 17 ever crossing on a cross walk, we kind of yield to the car that's turning. Obviously it is with self 18 reservation, but sometimes the driver feels that they 19 have the right of way, you know, over the pedestrian, 20 21 so that's another part of our mind-set that we have to, we have to have to change out here on our 22 streets. So, you know, when we see 4,000 people, 23 24 that's about 11 people per day, for being injured on our streets, um every single day here in New York 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 17
2	City and it's normally due to, um, poor driver
3	choices, and we see that, that causes about 70% of
4	the, um, crashes that we're seeing. SO you know, as
5	we mentioned, you know Vision Zero really really is
6	gonna need you to st…you… the citizens to step up and
7	to help us, you know, figure out how to best
8	implement, um, some of these initiatives, that we are
9	going to be pushing forward. So you know, we're
10	gonna be coming back here to Staten Island. We're
11	gonna actually be coming back here, literally, to
12	Curtis High School, and we're gonna be holding
13	workshops, um, later on in this month, or actually in
14	in, June, we're gonna be coming back, and that's
15	gonna be an opportunity for you to pinpoint on maps,
16	to tell us, where you think Vision Zero needs to be
17	implemented in your streets, `cause, you know, we
18	don't know the streets as well as the people who live
19	in them. You know your blocks and your corridors a
20	lot better than we do, so we are really gonna be
21	relying on you to come and help us out. Um, we are
22	also gonna be working with, um, schools and senior
23	centers throughout the City. As part of, um, Vision
24	Zero, we're gonna be working directly with 500
25	schools and after-school programs throughout the

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 18 1 City, and earlier today, we just announced, um, one, 2 3 one of our new initiatives toward our educational platform, it's a video that we're gonna be doing at 4 the schools, teaching kids to properly cross in the 5 crosswalks and how to really use the streets. б We're gonna be doing a lot of interactive things with, with 7 kids and senior centers because we're finding that, 8 they are the majority of the victims of these 9 10 crashes, and you know as part of the mind-set change 11 too, we have to think about how we label these 12 collisions. You know, we call them accidents, but, 13 you know, they are, they are preventable, so, um, DOT 14 and the other agencies, we view them as crashes and, um, we have to really look at them as things that can 15 be prevented if we all play our role while using the 16 17 streets. So you know, we're gonna be stepping up, you know, some of our education, outside of schools 18 and, um, senior centers as well. We're gonna be 19 20 handing out some flyers and some materials in some of 21 the high-crash corridors that we're seeing throughout the City. So you're gonna be seeing, um, a lot of 22 this, um, you know this is some of our folks handing 23 24 out some stuff to drivers, and, um, we're also, um, targeting drivers, pedestrians and cyclists 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 19 1 throughout the City, um, and, you know this is 2 3 another one of our, um, our campaigns, our anti-drunk driving campaign. You know the Mayor put it best, he 4 5 said that when we, when we get behind the wheel of 6 our cars it's a choice that we make. You know so we can choose to, if you had anything to drink, you can 7 choose to take the subway, take a cab home, as 8 opposed to, um, to getting behind the wheel of a car, 9 10 so we're looking to, to, try to really change 11 people's minds and have them make the right choices 12 while they're out as drivers. Um, one of our major 13 partners as well in Vision Zero is the TLC, and 14 they're gonna be stepping up a lot of work that they're doing with their drivers, so they're gonna be 15 doing more driver training and working with a lot, 16 17 like, the, um, you know the commercial fleet operators, and, um, um, you know, local car services, 18 who, um, we often times see these folks kind of set 19 20 the tone of how we drive on our streets, and how we 21 move about on our streets, because they may be more sometime, um, driving more aggressively, so the TLC 22 is really going to be really working with them to, 23 24 um, bring them on board to Vision Zero, um, you know, they can be more along the lines of, um, helping us 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 20 1 2 maintain safety. And as we mentioned earlier, the 3 NYPD is also gonna be stepping up and enforcement in some of the areas where we see, um, the highest level 4 of crashes, so, you know, speeding, failing to yield 5 to pedestrians, texting, making improper turns. б We are seeing that those are contributing to the highest 7 number of crashes, so, NYPD is gonna be doing some 8 additional enforcement in those areas as well. 9 And 10 both the DOT and NYPD are gonna be, um, putting in 11 more resources, into, um, how they investigate 12 crashes, and you know, to help district attorneys and 13 other law enforcement, um, in investigating some of 14 these crashes and in training more officers and more of the TLC inspectors on, um, the use of the radar 15 guns, and different technology, and TLC is also gonna 16 17 be using some black boxes and some different speed trackers to, um, in, in their cars too, um, help keep 18 drivers honest and to, to, better investigate some of 19 these crashes, and, um, so this chart here, as you 20 21 can see, um, you know, we're gonna be stepping up our, um, automated enforcement as well in the City, 22 23 and that we thank the State Legislature, last week, 24 they, um, authorized us to have more, um, speed cameras through the City, so you know, this graph 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 21 1 here shows red light cameras, where we use red light 2 3 cameras in the past 20 years in the City, and, the locations where we've used them, we've seen that the, 4 um, injuries have gone down by 31% in those areas, so 5 we know that they work, and, uh, you know, we finally б have the opportunity to use more of them, and we're 7 8 seeing that these numbers, are, um, going down in other major cities as well, like Chicago and 9 10 Washington, D.C. Um, but you know unfortunately we don't have control over where we can use our red 11 12 light cameras and what time of day we can use them. 13 That control is in Albany and this is where you get 14 really involved in Vision Zero and you can help us by speaking to your state legislators and asking them to 15 be able to give us local control down here. Um, 16 17 currently the law states that we can use speed cameras only, um, near schools and only during school 18 hours, but we're finding that the majority of, a good 19 20 portion of crashes are happening outside of school 21 hours and, um, away from schools, so we're looking to put these in locations where, um, it can be most 22 effective and, um, another one of our huge 23 24 legislative push is, is, to lower the speed limit. You know, currently the speed limit here in the City 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 2.2 1 is 30mph, and that is just way too fast, so, we're 2 looking to lower it to 25, um, and really get people 3 to change their mind sets. Thank you, um, and we're 4 also looking at ways to outfit some of these large 5 6 trucks with side and rear guards. We find that, you know, some of these trucks are making turns people 7 are getting knocked over in their, um, falling 8 underneath these trucks, and they're being run over 9 10 by the rear whe, by the rear wheels, so you know, 11 some, doing some of these simple, um, redesigns on 12 some of these trucks will, um, help save a lot of 13 lives. So you know, and we're working with the 14 Mayor's Office with disabilities, um, you know Vision Zero is encompassing, um, everyone, and we're trying 15 to make the streets safer for everyone who uses them. 16 17 Part of the redesigns we've been doing at DOT, and we're gonna continue to be doing, is, um, adding some 18 more audible pedestrian signals and tactile services 19 20 for the people who need extra time to cross the 21 street or for people who can't see as well when they're crossing. And you know, as the Commissioner 22 mentioned, you know in the past, um, few years, we've 23 been doing a lot here at DOT and some of the street 24 designs we have been implementing have reduced 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 23 1 crashes from 20% to 88%, where we've been doing them, 2 3 and some of these simple designs, you know, have really, really saved lives in a lot of these areas. 4 Just part of Vision Zero we're going to be committing 5 to doing, um, you know, 50 each year throughout the 6 City and so you know, as you can see here, this is, 7 8 um, an example of one of our street designs. This street has unclear markings, but, some of the designs 9 10 that we've done, so we put down you know, some clear 11 lane markings, some additional signalization for 12 turns. Um, you know, so everyone using the street 13 kinda knows where they are supposed to be. This is 14 another example of, um, where we kind of extended the curb a little bit to make the streets more visible. 15 Um, part of being safe on the street is being visible 16 17 and, um, being able to predict what other street users are gonna be doing, so, um, we're, we're also 18 really focusing on that as well as at DOT. 19 But one 20 of our major focuses are arterials on some of the 21 larger streets where we're a majority of where crashes occur. So, you know, some of the work that 22 we're doing is um, as I mentioned, extending curbs a 23 24 little bit to make the crossing distance shorter for people who need extra time to get across the street. 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 24 1 We're redesigning streets where everyone who uses the 2 3 streets, whether you're a pedestrian, cyclist or motorist, you know where you're supposed to be on the 4 5 streets, um, so we're putting down some um, some um, ways to reduce the lanes and the crossing distances 6 to folks on the streets. Many of you are familiar 7 8 with this, um, street, um, Newton Avenue here on 9 Staten Island and we also, um, you know, we've 10 included some um, some um, additional markings on the 11 street to make it more visible, make people more 12 visible on these streets. Um, so these are some of 13 the simple designs that we've done. In addition to 14 those designs, we're gonna be, and I know it was mentioned earlier, um, slow zones, you know folks who 15 are looking for more slow zones. Part of Vision Zero 16 17 is gonna allow you the opportunity to, um, apply for some of these, um, additional slow zones in your 18 communities, and you know, we're gonna be, you know, 19 20 enhancing lighting at a thousand intersections in the 21 streets to make it, make it more visible for folks, and, um, we have already did some work with some of 22 our arterial slow zones throughout the City where 23 24 we're gonna be slowing the speed limit on some of these major thorough fares throughout the City. 25 And

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 25 1 so, as I mentioned earlier, you are gonna be coming 2 3 back here to Curtis High School on June 26 and we're gonna be holding our, um, work shop, where we're 4 gonna be allowing folks to pinpoint on maps of the 5 borough exactly you feel Vision Zero needs to be б implemented in your communities. And I really need 7 you to come back out and bring your neighbors and 8 your friends and really lend your input to, um, these 9 10 workshops. And if you haven't already, we invite you to check out the Vision Zero website. It is a great 11 12 opportunity for you to learn where we're gonna be 13 next and, um, some of the different works shops and 14 town halls and initiatives that we're gonna be doing and it also is an opportunity to give us additional 15 feed back as well. So um, as previously mentioned, 16 17 Vision Zero really encompasses us all and we're gonna really need you to come out into, um, you know, voice 18 your opinions to your legislators but also to us, 19 20 and, um, various agencies who are also involved. 21 Thank you. [applause] CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: All the 22 23 depart...most of the Department DOT, and, the 24 Commissioner and also who are here from the NYPD and TOC, they've been doing a great work embracing and 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 26 moving forward this initiative. Now let's hear from, Commissioner you have anything else to say? Now let's hear from Meera Joshi, eh, who is also the Commissioner of TLC, who also is doing a great job and she will continue.

MEERA JOSHI: Good evening, um, and thank 7 8 you for having us at Curtis High School. Also thank you very much, Chair Rodriguez, Council Member Rose 9 10 and Council Member Gibson, um, and thanks to my partners at DOT at City Hall and the Police 11 12 Department. This is truly a collaborative effort and 13 thanks most of all to everybody who has come tonight 14 to provide input, um, you know I sort of say it, I get tired of hearing myself say it, but I do believe 15 it, we can't make policy in a vacuum, um, unless we 16 17 hear from people, um, who are experiencing particular incidents with drivers and intersections to inform 18 how we make policy, our policy is not effective. 19 So 20 I think everyone who has come here tonight and 21 everyone who shared their input with us. Under Mayor de Blasio's leadership, TLC is the smallest of three 22 agencies that's tasked with Vision Zero, meeting the 23 Vision Zero goals, but we're critical in the sense 24 that we regulate hundreds of thousands of drivers and 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 27
2	these are drivers that, um, drive full time, so they
3	occupy the streets definitely of Manhattan, um,
4	almost completely. It's a sea of yellow in mid-day.
5	Um, but they also move people around in the boroughs,
6	um, you know, at a tremendous pace, or tremendous
7	volume I should say because we're looking at lowering
8	the pace. Um, and that is the yellow taxis, green
9	taxis, livery cars, black cars, luxury limos,
10	commuter vans and para-transit vehicles. So here on
11	Staten Island, we have 21 FHB bases, that's livery
12	bases and 434 licensed livery cars. Um, Staten
13	Island is also home to at least a thousand medallion
14	taxi drivers and home to at least 2,000 livery
15	drivers, and TLC also has offices now on Staten
16	Island which it hadn't previously, inspection
17	facility for vehicles and also licensing facility,
18	which is gonna be expanded by April 2015. We'll have
19	a brand new building and vehicle licensees and base
20	owners don't have to travel to Long Island City.
21	They can come to the new facility on Staten Island to
22	get their licensing work completed. Um, but our task
23	is really all about changing driver conduct, and,
24	and, anybody who's tried to change a pattern in their
25	personal life knows that this is no small task. It

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 28 1 takes um, you know, of, sort of a multi-faceted 2 3 approach. We have to first educate drivers about why safe driving is important and how to adopt safe 4 driving skills. These are not instinctual skills, we 5 6 sort of want to get where we want to get quickly, we don't think about slowing down unless we have to. 7 8 Um, we also need to look at technology. There's a lot that's happened in the world of, um, automotive, 9 10 you know, building cars and there's a lot of things 11 that are much better that we can leverage. There's technology that governs speed. There's black box 12 13 technology which can inform us on typical reactions 14 right before a collision that can inform how we educate drivers. Um, we can always use incentives, 15 which is another, you know, use the carrot or the 16 17 stick, so we have sort of carrot programs that we'd like to roll out honoring safe drivers, um, to 18 incentivize those that don't make the honor roll, to 19 20 maybe make the honor roll over next year. And then 21 finally, when those don't work, there's enforcement. So, we're moving more towards much more ramped up 22 enforcement, as well as stricter penalties, because 23 24 on the whole, TLC licensed drivers are safe drivers. Um, for the amount of miles they put in every year, 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 29 1 they get into remarkably few collisions, but there's 2 3 those that do get into collisions and those are derserving increased enforcement and increase in 4 penalties, and the deterrent of that approach would 5 hopefully be wide-spread. Um, but I also want to б make a plug for a, um, something more I mentioned, 7 the DOT video, which I just saw today, which is 8 It's called "Cross this Way" and I urge you 9 great. 10 all to go home and show it to your kids because it is 11 kid-friendly, it sends an excellent message, it's 12 easily absorbable, and I think it's just the kind of 13 public outreach this program needs to really get the 14 message out there. So if you have five minutes, I think it's worth your time to check it out. Um, I'm 15 really looking forward to the feedback we get tonight 16 17 and um, hopefully we'll have a productive session and what we learn will be part of the end-goal, which is 18 making the streets safer for everyone. 19 Than you. 20 [applause] 21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Commissioner, now let's hear from Thomas Chan, who is 22 the Chief of Transportation for the New York City 23 24 Police Department. 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 30	VISION	ZERO –	STATEN	ISLAND	TOWN	HALL	MEETING	30
--	--------	--------	--------	--------	------	------	---------	----

1

THOMAS CHAN: Uh, thank you Councilman 2 3 Rodriguez, Chairman of the Transportation Committee. Also, the Chairman of the Public Safety Committee, 4 Vanessa Gibson, Council Woman, and also Council Woman 5 Rose. Um, one of my elected officials, my partner is б here, the Department of Transportation, TLC, and the 7 other city agencies who have been working closely 8 The New York City Police Department has 9 with us. 10 been working very closely with our partners here, and in particular today, I just wanted to point out, um, 11 12 [Joe Bruno 00:34:25]? Staten Island who is present 13 here with us today. While, uh, the Chief of 14 Transportation's Office, uh, quite often has been at many of the meetings, the actual officers and the 15 operational end of it, are the officers in here and 16 17 in Staten Island working here and I would like to point them out. We have Deputy Chief Mike Marino, he 18 is the executive officer for Triboro of Staten 19 20 Island, [applause]. We have Deputy Inspector Anthony 21 Bologna, um, the Special Projects Inspector, Deputy Inspector Terence Hurson, the Commanding Officer of 22 the 121 Precinct, Captain Matt Harrington, COO of the 23 24 123 Precinct, um, Captain Tom Kemper, the Executive Officer of 120 Precinct, and, uh, Captain Ken Noonan, 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 31 1 uh, he is the Executive Officer of 121, but he is 2 3 covering for the 122 at this time. Again, the transportation is part of Vision Zero but I'm major 4 partners within the NYPD, uh, is our patrol officers 5 and also our community affairs. Now, uh, part of the б strategy NYPD, engineering, education and 7 8 enforcement. Uh, we have our partners in the engineering, we're part of the education process and 9 10 certainly the enforcement area. We've targeted specific violations which we feel that will make an 11 12 impact in terms of pedestrian fatalities injuries. 13 Um, we're looking at speeding, we're looking at 14 failure to yield to pedestrians, signal light violations, disobeying signs and improper turns, cell 15 phone and, uh, texting while operating your motor 16 vehicle. Oh, I'd like to commend Staten Island in 17 particular, DWI arrests in Staten Island, year to 18 date they're up 30% compared to last year. 19 In terms 20 of 511 or suspended license, uh, arrests, those are 21 individuals to who basically, when they do receive summonses, they disregard it. We not have in Staten 22 Island, an increase in 27% in 511 arrests. 23 Those are 24 the individuals who are, who get involved in motor vehicle accident with a pedestrian or another 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 32 1 motorist, they're gonna take off, they're gonna leave 2 3 the scene because when they know when the police officers arrive on the scene they're gonna be 4 arrested because they are not, um, they're licenses 5 are suspended at the time, so again, I'd like to б commend Staten Island for a wonderful job in that 7 8 area. Um, other areas that we are looking at in the New York City Police Department, very quickly, 9 10 training, we're looking to train new officers in the 11 academy, also our old officers who are currently in the precincts. We're updating our equipment, also 12 13 our technology, in terms of how we analyze the data 14 in terms of the crashes and the, um, collisions. Traffic Stat, some you, many of you may have heard of 15 Com Stat, where the form we look to reduce crime? 16 There is a similar form called Traffic Stat. 17 On that, for example, today, um, Patrol Boro Manhattan 18 on South was present at headquarters. The borough is 19 represented by the Executive Officer who is 20 21 coordinating Vision Zero and all the Executive Officers from each precinct from Manhattan South. 22 SO 23 when Staten Island comes through headquarters, at Traffic Stat, their coordinator, uh, Chief Marino and 24 all the executive officers from each precinct will be 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 33
2	present. They will tell us what their strategy is,
3	what their analysis of the collisions, injuries,
4	fatalities are occurring in Staten Island. We'll
5	take a look at their plan, we do an analysis. We'll
6	compare our notes and come up with a best plan how to
7	tackle that situation along with our partners and the
8	Department of Transportation, and also our community
9	and advocacy groups present with us. So again, it's
10	a collective, a collaborative effort that we're
11	working together with the community, the city
12	agencies, elected officials, to come to our Vision
13	Zero, so anyway I'd like to thank all of you for
14	taking time from your busy schedules to join us here
15	tonight. [applause]
16	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Before we hear

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Before we hear 17 from the next person, I would like to recognize, eh, many of the people that have been very supportive of 18 19 the town meeting, Jonathan Alio [sp?] from the Committee on Transportation, Rosa from my, eh, staff, 20 and also, eh, Rafael DeSayo[Sp?] from the speaker, 21 other council who also do a great job, eh, also from 22 23 the community outreach, Yvonne George and Steve 24 Felles [sp?], Yusey Pfiza Corrina [sp?], and the great team that, eh, having a long day, and the 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 34 1 council, even though it was a whole day there they 2 3 also been here supporting us and for the staff of the They also are here and providing the 4 school. communication at the facility, so. Thank you and I 5 would like to hear [applause] ... let's give them a big б round of applause [applause]. Now the next person to 7 meet Charles Fall [sp?] for his acting as Board of 8 Director, Mayor's Communication Affair Unit. 9 10 [Interpose]...Yes.

Charles Fall[Sp?]: Yes, So, Good Evening 11 12 everybody, as we know the Mayor is committed on 13 bridging the gap between City Hall and the community 14 and by doing so, we try to help out with these events, you know, to figure out exactly what is 15 needed to be done to address these issues in the 16 17 communities. So in order for us to, uh, you know, have Vision Zero implemented, we need to know from 18 you, the community, what are the areas that need 19 20 improvements? That need, uh, street...stop signs, 21 street bumps, or, uh, you know, speed cameras, you know, and, uh, you know we also want to also thank 22 all the city agencies, all the heads, all the elected 23 24 officials, 'cause they have been working extremely hard to, um, get Vision Zero, where it's at, again, 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 35
2	you know, with the community's involvement, by
3	hearing from you today, you know, it's definitely
4	gonna help us out, um, in seeing what we need to do
5	to, uh, better our streets and make them safer for
6	our children. Thank you. [applause]
7	When Mayor de Blasio announced Vision
8	Zero, a number of Council Members we had started
9	looking at previous legislation and introducing new
10	legislation. And we had like six to eight
11	legislation at the beginning. After we started doing
12	these Town Hall Meetings starting in Manhattan,
13	Brooklyn, and other necessary boroughs; and also the
14	DOT Commissioner, and everyone at NYPD, TLC, other
15	transportation advocate groups. Today, as I said at
16	the beginning, 22 legislation and resolution will
17	have a hearing on the 30th.
18	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: We did it in a
19	good amount of time, eh, now it is the time also then
20	to hear from the audience[something dropped
21	00:40:50-55].
22	[Man's voice]: Nice…[laugh]
23	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ:so the way
24	another, another borough, the, we just took two
25	minutes from the elective and, eh, and the, and the

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 36 1 the commissioners, then one minutes from the 2 audience, but here, eh, I will give you the 3 opportunity from my colleagues to be the one calling 4 5 on, eh, the members from her district and, and, other 6 district, here from Staten Island, we will have two minutes and we are very, eh, rigid in the time, so 7 8 two minutes, eh, this person, I, I recommend also 9 that if you hear somebody else that already has a 10 say, similar thing that you would like to say, 11 please, pass it to somebody else, or focus on 12 something else. Our idea is that we can be, eh, 13 straight to some suggestion on Vision Zero. Eh, last 14 two weeks ago, we have a hearing of 22 eh, early requests... and resolution, eh, probably in the four 15 year that I been on the council, the first time, that 16 17 we have a hearing so many, eh, new early requests ... and resolution, and we are moving guick. 18 As you heard, like, everything that are DOT, TLC, eh, the 19 NYPD, they are doing it. So we are now waiting for 20 21 September to announce that we are starting on Vision So as a Mayor's Commissioner, they are moving 22 Zero. quick, the council also, eh, eh, following the same 23 24 pace. So at the end of this month, we hopefully, will be voting with five or six bills connected to 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 37
2	Vision Zero. So most of those bills, were also the
3	results of getting, the, the, the, our, eh, eh,
4	participants in the Town Hall Meeting feedback and
5	with all the Council members that they met with their
б	constituents, so your suggestion, your ideas, are
7	very important. And we are taking official note, so
8	we been recording the town meeting, eh, the staff,
9	they taking the details of all the notes, and our
10	planning to translate some of the idea into new
11	suggestions for potential legislation or initiative
12	that they can be incorporating Vision Zero. So with
13	that I will turn the microphone to my colleague,
14	Council Member Rose.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Thank you
16	Chair Rodriguez, and, um, when you come to the mic
17	please identify yourself. Um, Anthony Magnavito.
18	And you have two minutes. Uh, oh, you have three at
19	a time? Okay. Anthony Magnavito[Sp?], James Fred
20	Rodriguez and Dan Icaleri[Sp?].
21	ANTHONY MAGNAVITO[?]: This mic on? Oh,
22	okay. Yes, good evening everyone, I have a serious
23	problem, to address here, my name is Anthony
24	Magnavito. On, about four years ago, traffic heading
25	north on Richmond Avenue was diverted onto Oakdale

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 38 1 Street between Richmond Avenue and Arden Avenue. 2 3 They took away the turning lane on Amboy Road so cars couldn't make that turn. Now we have speeding cars 4 and trucks, motorcycles, you name it, they're 5 6 reaching speeds at 61 miles per hour and that's recorded by the DOT Engineer that was outside my 7 8 home. Uh, I've gotten in touch with Councilman Ignizio, uh, Bryan Powers, of Senator Lander's [Sp?] 9 10 Office, and, uh, Assemblyman Borelli [sp?]... and they 11 all agreed that traffic is going too fast and 12 something must be done. Uh, this is a residential 13 area. We shouldn't have commercial vehicles going 14 by. There were times I'm outside I can't breathe from the diesel fumes. The buses are racing by, 15 trucks, these a field tankers. It's a dangerous 16 I've asked for stop signs and nothing has been 17 area. done. Uh, on October 30, 2013, there was a school 18 bus accident. They were special needs children, the 19 buses flipped over. Now I don't know what the 20 21 circumstances were, but there were no skid marks but he bus was on its side. Thank God nobody was killed, 22 but something has to be done to slow these people 23 24 They refuse to slow down. Then if the red down. light, then if the red light is on Arden Avenue and 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 39
2	Oakdale Street they make a left, left turn on Arden
3	Avenue, which is where I live, right on the corner.
4	I've almost been hit numerous times. There are
5	children playing in the streets, they, there's no
6	regard for the children, they just speed up, blow
7	their horns, and they keep going. One day one of
8	these children are gonna be killed and I'm trying to
9	stop it. I hope something can be done and I
10	appreciate if anyone can help us. I see my time is
11	just about up, so thank you very much for listening,
12	and I appreciate it.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Thank you
14	so much. [applause]
15	JAMES FRED RODRIGUEZ: Good evening my
16	name is Fred Rodriguez and I'm a Staten Islander,
17	lifelong, and I have three questions, uh, one
18	concerns, two of them concerns the ferry terminal.
19	Now New York, uh, the DOT just improved our ferry
20	terminal quite a bit and if you come in from the post
21	office in St. George and you come down around the big
22	red brick wall that is built there, I think from
23	World War Two, you go up the ramp and you enter where
24	the buses come around, like this, and as soon as you
25	come off of Bay Street, you have this area that has

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 40
2	been divided off for bicycles. You go up the bike
3	area and you turn around and there's a dead end.
4	Bicycles cannot enter in from the Upper Level. My
5	question is why is that bike area ever put there and
б	how much money did that cost to install all of that?
7	And in the Manhattan Terminal underneath, the bicycle
8	people are very cold during the winter time and my
9	third point is this, the St. George Theater is a
10	great place, I remember going in there as a Police
11	Athletic Member, uh, ten cents to see the movies back
12	in the 50's, now they bus in the school children.
13	Great idea, but while the buses are sitting in St.
14	George, their engines are running and they don't turn
15	them off. There's a lot of pollution coming out from
16	those buses and I think that needs to be addressed to
17	make our air cleaner, thank you. [applaue]
18	DAN ICALERI: Good evening, my name is
19	Dan Icaleri and I'm a Staten Islander, a walker, and
20	a member of Transportation Alternatives. I've read
21	the Vision Zero Action Plan and was pleasantly
22	surprised by its recognition in the challenges
23	pedestrians face every day by the many sensible

24

25

Here's my response to the Vision Zero Team's request

solutions it proposes and by its sense of urgency.

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 41
2	for citizen input boiled down into four points.
3	Before I give you those four points, I want to thank
4	you for understanding what this is about is change in
5	culture, we are in an island, uh, we are in a place
6	where the car, the car waives supreme and pedestrians
7	are an after-thought if they're thought of at all and
8	so I'm very grateful for this event and for the
9	initiatives that are proposed in the document. Okay,
10	the first thing I want to say is that there is a
11	calming zone, uh, a slow zone, right around the
12	corner, across the street from my house on Westervelt
13	Avenue and Hamilton Avenue, which is, I'm sorry,
14	bogus. It's bogus because it has been installed as a
15	place where cars are accelerating to get to the crest
16	of the hill and suddenly they are expected to slow
17	down to 20 miles an hour. It's absurd. No one
18	observes it and I think slow zones are a great idea.
19	I just think that the implementation here was deeply
20	flawed, it doesn't work and it can't work given the
21	way people, you know, are expected to drive to reach
22	the top of the hill. Okay, four points:
23	• One - recognize that older people
24	depend on clear, highly-visible
25	street markings, not just in safe

1	VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 42
2	zones from ongoing, oncoming
3	traffic, we also depend on them for
4	guidance about how to negotiate
5	complex intersections, particularly
6	when streets don't adhere to a grid,
7	as many streets on Staten Island
8	don't.
9	We need muchdid I? I'm done, well thank
10	you for listening, I appreciate it. [speaking away
11	from the podium]By the way, if anyone wants my
12	comments I have a copy.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Can you
14	give that to us? Thank you Dan. Um, the next three
15	folks are Boris Sukov, Andrew Blanchero and Linda
16	Cohen. Please just start your name when you start
17	speaking.
18	BORIS SUKOV: Hello, my name is Boris
19	Sukov, I'm a resident of Midland Beach. Uh, I drive,
20	bike and walk in my neighborhood. Uh, I'm, I feel
21	endangered in all of these modes. Um, driving,
22	because of the people, because of other drivers
23	passing me unsafely, um, not waiting their turn, and
24	so on, and biking, again, because of speeding
25	drivers, walking, because of lack of sidewalks, um,

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 43 1 and various obstacles. Um, and um, you may have 2 3 heard that, um, people always say that Staten Island is exceptional, or somehow different, or, uh, regular 4 solutions don't work here, and I would say that's 5 true. We need a much more comprehensive, uh, a 6 culture change, that has to go beyond, uh, paint and 7 Um, we have a lot of very wide residential 8 signs. streets and narrow arterial streets, which cause a 9 10 problem because people think there's no space for biking or walking, or for safety features. 11 This is 12 not true, we simply, um, don't have a grid, like the 13 other boroughs. And, um, I would encourage, uh, DOT 14 and NYPD to take a very comprehensive look at the entire borough and, uh, look for patters, and uh, see 15 what can be done beyond the, sort of, regular, normal 16 17 treatments that are, that have been proposed, which are great, but again, it has to go beyond that. 18 19 Thank you. [applause] 20 ANDREW BLANCHERO: Hello, my name is 21 Andrew Blanchero, and, uh, like Boris, I walk, I'm a

Andrew Blanchero, and, un, like Borls, I walk, I'm a pedestrian, I ride my bike every single day to and from work and I operate a vehicle when I have to. Uh, I'd have to say that I really appreciate this opportunity to speak to you and for having you

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 44 1 seriously consider the needs of pedestrians and 2 3 cyclists because I've spoken on both those accounts to the public on Staten Island before and I feel 4 5 often that I am received with an "eye roll" or a chuckle or a murmur, uh, I have been, sort of mocked 6 in public. And if you count being struck by vehicle 7 as assaulted, then I've been assaulted twice, uh, on 8 Staten Island. Both times the drivers' attitudes 9 10 were sort of, "Well, what were you doing there? You 11 know, there's not usually somebody there when I drive 12 this way. I didn't THINK to look for a cyclist..." So 13 that is part of the culture that you have to combat 14 here. There are people that feel SO privileged that not even, a level of shame, when something like this 15 does occur. Uh, I do also hope that we're able to 16 17 change the culture in our media. Something that I read today, uh, in the Advance was "Potholes and 18 Parking on the Agenda for Transportation Meeting -19 20 Closed Door Transportation Meeting Next Tuesday." Ι 21 wish I had the same opportunity to speak there that there is more to consider than potholes and parking 22 here on Staten Island. Uh, I think I'd just like to 23 24 close since I see my time is running out. Once again, thanking you for this opportunity to speak to 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 45 you and seriously considering us as citizens who deserve space on the road. It is public space and often times on Staten Island it is only considered private roadway, uh, for automobiles. Thanks very much. [applause]

LINDA COHEN: Uh, hello, my name is Linda 7 8 Cohen. I'm also a bicycle advocate and I feel that 9 we desperately need bike lanes and protected bike 10 lanes on Staten Island. Um, and, um, tonight I'm 11 here to talk to you about Oaksdale Street, which was 12 mentioned before. But I live on the other side of 13 Oakdale Street and it's a big problem. It is in 14 Community Board 3, and I really wanted to be included in Vision Zero Traffic Counting Measures because, 15 and also, I think it's important because its 16 17 represented by many of the wide residential streets on Staten Island. Um, it's a speedway, especially 18 during rush hours. I've used a speed gun and I 19 20 clocked people often times going over 40 miles an 21 hour. It's a street with one and two family homes, lots of children, and people come from other blocks 22 to Oakdale Street because they feel like they can go 23 24 faster on Oakdale Street, um, if they are in a hurry. There are stretches that are seven blocks long with 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 46 1 2 no traffic counting measures. Um, and the other 3 hand, commercial streets nearby have many traffic lights so people want to avoid, avoid them. Um, my 4 neighbors and I have tried since 1989, to bring 5 6 traffic counters to Oakdale Street without success. For 25 years we've asked for speed humps, stop signs. 7 We also applied for a neighborhood slow zone and we 8 were rejected. Uh, to my knowledge, nobody in Staten 9 10 Island's Community Board Three are got a slow zone, 11 although many applied. Um, I've met with some 12 officials who told me that they don't want to do 13 anything that will impede the flow of traffic and I 14 do agree that we have to do something for Staten Island commuters, which I am also, because we already 15 16 have the highest commutes in the country, but at the 17 same time it should not be at the expense of the safety of residents. Um, last year, um, this 18 gentleman told you about the school bus that was 19 20 carrying children that crashed, um, so I'm just 21 asking, that was on Oakdale Street, I'm just asking, we've been pleading for years and years for people do 22 something about wide residential streets on Staten 23 24 Island, including Oakdale Street. Thank you.

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 47
2	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Thank you,
3	Um, I'd just like to acknowledge that, uh, we have a,
4	representation here from Council Member Matteo's
5	office, Daniel Castorina. [applause] Um, and the
6	next group will be Amorica Graywahl[ <b>[Sp?]</b> , Laura
7	Barlament, and Robert Palmieri. Please state your
8	name when you come to the mic.
9	AMORICA GRAYWAHL: Hello and thank you,
10	my name is Amorica Graywahl, um, I'm really glad
11	you're here because I feel so many times like I've
12	been utterly disenfranchised, um, I echo my fellow
13	neighbor, um, considering us as citizens, if I were
14	shouted at and called something because of he color
15	of my skin or my gender, I can report it as a "hate
16	crime", but as pedestrians there's not much I can do.
17	I live in a neighborhood. I live on Howard Avenue
18	where a young man was struck and killed. Um, and, we
19	don't have weekend bus service. We don't have a way
20	to get off of this place that we live unless we use
21	our feet or we have a car. Um, even if you have a
22	car, we're silent victims. Vehicles speed so fast on
23	Howard Avenue that almost every one of my neighbors
24	has been, a, vehicles have been damaged as a parked
25	car. They've had, um, mirrors struck off. I've had

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 48 1 neighbors come home and think they're car was stolen 2 3 and said it's been towed it was so damaged, um, after an accident. So, um, we, we talk about "twenty is 4 plenty" and having safe streets, we talk about, "if 5 you see something, say something". Well when you're 6 speeding past a neighborhood at 50 miles per hour, 7 8 you can't see anything. Slower streets are good for 9 our neighborhoods. They're good for our children, 10 but they're good for everybody. They're good for adults who need a little more time crossing the 11 12 street, they're good for our adults who don't have 13 time to talk to neighbors when we have to get into 14 our car and sit in traffic. So, um, after Hurricane Sandy, I had friends and neighbors that could not get 15 16 to work because the only way to leave the island was 17 by car and there was no gas. They were only a few miles away from their places of work but they were 18 stuck on Staten Island. So as you look at everything 19 20 that you're doing, one of the things that I ask you 21 to do is, connect the city to the other boroughs. Look at ways that people who don't have cars can get 22 between boroughs. Can get from Brooklyn to Queens. 23 24 Staten Island to Brooklyn. Get from the Bronx to Brooklyn. So again, thank you so very much for 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 49
2	having, um, this forum here, and for giving me a
3	voice because it means more than almost anything else
4	that I've seen so far. Thank you.
5	LAURA BARLAMENT: Hi, my name is Laura
6	Barlament. Um, I live in West Brighton, I work at
7	Wagner College with Amorica, she's a colleague of
8	mine, and, um, I've gotten to work with Tom Coccola
9	before. She was just talking about Howard Avenue, you
10	know, and the problem with speeding there, and, the
11	student who was killed on Howard Avenue, which is
12	what really activated me to become involved in these
13	issues, I'm the Chair now of Transportation
14	Alternatives of Staten Island Activist Committee.
15	And, so, with the help of Tom Coccola, you know, a
16	lot of changes were made on Howard Avenue, to make it
17	safer, after that horrible accident, and I'm still
18	biking to work every day or I walk, and it has made
19	an improvement, and he even lowered the speed limit
20	to 25 miles per hour on Howard Avenue, but like
21	Amorica says, people just are not observing that,
22	and, so, every day I struggle with this as I bike
23	along that, that, street, I kind of, um, I'm willing
24	to, I guess, be a little crazy and, and bike along
25	there and just try to show drivers I have a right to

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 50
2	be there as a bicyclist. I don't think that there
3	should be any reason, uh, under the laws that we
4	have, that it should be dangerous to bike, or walk on
5	almost any street in New York City if the speed limit
б	is 25 or 30 miles per hour, if people actually
7	observe the speed limit. So I am so eager to see
8	that Vision Zero comes to Staten Island. I've seen
9	all these wonderful things happening in Manhattan and
10	I enjoy riding over there and it has helped a lot,
11	and I would really like to see these kinds of, um,
12	changes made in Staten Island. TA, our group has
13	been advocating actively for Clove Road, for Richmond
14	Terrace and we're so thankful for Debbie Rose for
15	supporting us in that, and we're also looking at
16	Forest Avenue. These are roads we pinpointed that we
17	think will be very important and very beneficial to
18	our community to see complete street treatments made
19	on. Thank you very much. [applause]
20	ROBERT PALMIERI: Hello, my name is
21	Robert Palmieri, and I'm here representing the
22	Lighthouse Meisner Avenue Civic Association. Um, we
23	recently had a meeting and we wholeheartedly agree
24	with the whole, a, Vision Zero concept and, um, I
25	just, I'm here tonight to kind of, put us the Vision

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 51
2	Zero map. Uh, the Lighthouse Hill area, for many
3	years we tried to get some kind of help, um, in
4	regard to the traffic situation. It turned out to
5	be, the area turned out to be, a, um, a cut-through
6	for people who don't want to stop at the lights on,
7	and, a, you know, traffic, normal traffic, a, areas,
8	um, so they cut through the residential, it's a 100
9	percent residential area. They cut through, and,
10	it's hard to find an area on Staten Island one mile
11	long that doesn't have a stop sign, and this, a, a
12	residential area with streets that range from 16 feet
13	wide to 20 feet wide and, um, Tom has been working
14	with us for, a, a while, but the problem is, it's a
15	very unique area. People are literally coming up to
16	one of the highest points on Staten Island and they
17	are going back down, just to by-pass traffic. Now we
18	have commercial traffic trying to do the same thing.
19	And, um, it, it, it's just not conducive to that kind
20	of volume, and, and, it, well the two way traffic is
21	very difficult on those narrow streets. Um, for a
22	long time now, we've been, you know, like I said,
23	with Tom's help and we've been working with Steve
24	Matteo and Jim Otto. I guess you're in the process
25	of some studies, but I think I'm here tonight just to

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 52
2	kind of put us on the map and officially say, let's
3	do something about this because it breaks every DOT
4	guideline rule, the entire pass through, there's no
5	signs, there's no stop signs, no cross walks, there's
6	nothing, the only, we, we, we have, uh, uh, two speed
7	humps that, uh, Tom had gotten us, and that's the
8	only form of traffic calming. Thank you again for
9	the opportunity. [applause]
10	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Kathleen
11	Rivera, Michael Reilly, and Joshua Hottel[Sp?].
12	KATHLEEN RIVERA: Uh, good evening, um, I
13	am a West Brighton resident, an Executive Board
14	member of this school and my two concerns are very
15	specific to this area. One of them is, has been
16	referenced, the corner of Westervelt and Hamilton.
17	It is a completely bind crest of the hill when you
18	come up it, when the sun is in your eyes, our
19	children are crossing there and it is absolutely
20	horrifying to see these kids wandering out into the
21	street. There is yes, a slow zone and you've already
22	heard, it is not being, uh, obeyed. My second
23	problem is directly in the front of the school. St.
24	Mark's Place and Hamilton Avenue. Yes, we have stop
25	sign on St. Mark's, however, Hamilton Avenue is very

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 53
2	often a speedway. There is a bus stop directly
3	across the street from the front of the school.
4	Children are getting off that bus, cars are flying on
5	Hamilton, the City buses. There is no stop sign with
6	a blinking light so they're not gonna get a ticket,
7	so they speed right through. Kids are coming off the
8	buses. They're teenagers, they're looking at their
9	cell phones, they're talking to their friends. I
10	have seen kids almost get hit. I do not want a
11	repeat of what happened in Tottenville, to a young
12	lady that was getting dropped off. So, these are my
13	two concerns and, um, I've heard from other parents
14	in the school. Thank you.
15	MICHAEL REILLY: Hi, my name is Michael
16	Reilly, I'm a member of Community Education Council
17	31, which is a school board for Staten Island. Uh,
18	thank you for having this meeting. Uh, first I'd
19	like to commend the NYPD Patrol Board of Staten
20	Island. Uh, I have to say back in October, uh, we

21 had a meeting about traffic safety around schools, 22 and they're actually at the forefront of this, uh, 23 and Chief Pellatore[**sp?**] his crew, uh, they deserve a 24 round of applause, uh, because they already attacked 25 some traffic plans for schools and I'm happy to see

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 54 1 that it's included in the Vision Zero Plan in going 2 3 city-wide. Uh, there are a couple of things that I'd like to speak about, to maybe assist with this, uh, 4 we know that speed cameras have been expanded, uh, 5 currently we only have 20, they're gonna go up to 140 6 city-wide. I believe that we should have camra..., 7 8 that we should have signs that say "Speed Camera Enforced". Uh, I know that there's some push back 9 10 for that because, uh, you don't want to let motorists 11 know where they are. Think about it this way, we 12 have 1,400 school buildings in New York City. That's 13 a lot, that's a lot of signs to put on streets to 14 change driving behavior. Right? That's the ultimate goal. So getting a summons, 30 days later, in the 15 mail for \$50 to registered owner probably wasn't 16 17 driving the car, maybe, doesn't really change driving behavior. Having signage, increasing slow zones, 18 will definitely help do that. 19 Uh, it doesn't 20 necessarily mean there has to be a camera all the 21 time, but just the thought a driver may slow down, they think they may get a summons, alright? Our slow 22 zones, we actually work to communicate with council 23 24 31 ... Council Member Rose and our other council members, Tom Coccola, we actually got four approved 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 55
2	for Staten Island, uh, I would love to get more. We
3	have 12 more that are pending. I'm hoping to put
4	them in again to the next round. Uh, we also,
5	Oakdale Street, that's P.S. 55, that's where my kids
6	go, that's one of the slow zones that were denied.
7	Uh, I put it in, in the last two rounds. I'm hoping
8	that we'll get another chance and, and, included in
9	that as well, and I think just one last point. I'm
10	sorry to go over. I think we need more man power and
11	I know that the City Council and the police
12	department have a little push going on now
13	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Mike?
14	MIKE REILLY:about increasing man
15	power, I also do have a plan…
16	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Mike?
17	MIKE REILLY: to uh,
18	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Michael?
19	Michael? Wrap it up.
20	MICHAEL REILLY: Can I bring this up to
21	you?
22	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Yes. And,
23	Commissioner Trottenberg would like to respond.
24	POLLY TROTTENBERG: Thank you and I just
25	want to take a second on the cameras and we are very
l	

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 56 1 pleased that Albany has now increased the number of 2 3 speed cameras that the City can deploy from 20 to 140. And just so you know, I think we're gonna be 4 experimenting with signing in some places and trying 5 6 to sort of increase their presence say at school. Perhaps saying at different schools there may be a 7 8 camera here so we can kind of get a multiplier effect, so we're open to seeing how we can make the 9 10 best use of them. Uh, one thing that is frustrating for us is the majority of traffic fatalities in the 11 12 city happen in places and in times that we cannot 13 deploy our cameras. So, we have now gotten a bigger 14 number of them but there's still tremendous restrictions on how we can use them so they are a 15 good tool but we are not nearly able to use them 16 17 really in a way that we think we need to to get the best results out of them, but thanks for the 18 19 suggestion. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Thank you, 21 um, Priscilla Marco, Roy Fishman, and Ganzalo[Sp?] Mercado. 22 Hello, my name is...I was 23 JOSH HOTTEL: 24 Josh, I was supposed to go in the, uh, other batch. 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 57 1 COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Could you, 2 3 um, identify yourself? JOSH HOTTEL: Hello, my name is Joshua 4 Hottel, I'm a resident of Staten Island. 5 6 COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Um, I'm 7 sorry, were you called? JOSH HOTTEL: Yeah, I was called. 8 I was after Michael Reilly. 9 10 COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Okay. JOSH HOTTEL: Yeah hello, my name is 11 12 Joshua Hottel, I'm a resident of Staten Island. Ι 13 don't like the way Vision Zero is being implemented. 14 I think speed cameras are a waste of money. The only people that make money off of them are companies like 15 Xerox. I'm tired of motorists being ATM's. 16 I'm 17 tired of like, the motorists, uh, people taking advantage of motorists. I think speed limits should 18 be based on the 85 percentile what driver's drive. 19 20 Staten Island should have more, um, expressways. 21 They should extend the Richmond Parkway relieve the 22 traffic to the Verazano Bridge. I'm very disappointed on how Vision Zero is being implemented. 23 24 I think it's ridiculous, you have to lower speed limits on auto roads, like Hyland Boulevard, when 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 58 1 motorists need to travel like about 14 miles to get 2 3 to the bridge. [SLIM APPLAUSE] COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Priscilla 4 Marco, Roy Fishman and Gonzalo Mercado. 5 6 PRISCILLA MARCO: Good evening, my name 7 is Priscilla Marco and I'm the President of the Van Duzer Street Area Civic Association. As Tom Coccola 8 well knows, the Van Duzer Civic Association was 9 10 founded 10 years ago. On the issue of speeding traffic, Van Duzer Street is a small narrow one-way 11 12 street that goes from the ferry terminal to the 13 Staten Island Expressway, that, that, uh, people use 14 to avoid going to, uh, Bay Street where there's more traffic lights. We have had incidents where people 15 have had their property damaged, their cars damaged. 16 On Beach Street and Van Duzer there's a deli that has 17 been hit by cars, literally, three times that I've 18 been aware of. There's another house on Van Duzer 19 Street that was hit twice. Um, we had a member last 20 21 night at our civic meeting who talked about, he's on 22 Van Duzer Street near where it meets Richmond Road. He has to try to pull out of his driveway. He can't 23 24 pull out of his driveway and he was almost hit by a car, uh, during, uh, snowstorms when he was shoveling 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 59 1 So this is a big issue for our big civic 2 snow. 3 association. We also are concerned with the fact that we have applied twice for a slow zone. We've not 4 been able to get it. On St. Paul's which goes into 5 Van Duzer Street we have two schools. On Targee 6 Street, which runs parallel to Van Duzer Street, we 7 8 have a couple of day care centers and we really need 9 some traffic-calming measures along Targee Street. 10 We are also concerned, uh, with the upcoming 11 construction along Bay Street, that there will be 12 large trucks, uh, going through there and that 13 there's an increased chance that there will be 14 pedestrian accidents because these cars, these trucks, will not see the pedestrians trying to cross 15 Bay Street. So again, we are very supportive of 16 17 Vision Zero and we thank you for bringing this to Staten Island. [APPLAUSE] 18 ROY FISHMAN: Good evening, and thank you 19

for bringing the town hall meeting to Staten Island. I just want to, uh, state that, um, all the people who use the road, besides the motorists, since I am a member of the running club, the Staten Island Athletic Club, which of course, there are not enough sidewalks to run exclusively. So we often use the

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 60 1 roads and I'm a member of the Staten Island Bicycle 2 3 Association, which also use the roads, and I'm a member of the Staten Island Transportation 4 5 Alternatives Activists Committee. And, um, I would 6 urge you to use the ideas of the Transportation Alternatives for traffic calming. I know they are a 7 part of this effort. They often talk about neck 8 downs to narrow the roads and I think in terms of 9 10 trying to get drivers to change their attitudes, 11 that's a very sensible way, because, it's not a 12 matter of convincing them, they are actually forced 13 to slow down with traffic calming measures which 14 usually works better with signs and speed bumps. So again, I commend you for your efforts and I hope to 15 see some positive improvements to Staten Island. 16 17 Thank you.

GONZALO MERCADO: Good evening everyone, 18 my name is Gonzalo Mercado, I'm a Staten Islander. 19 Ι live in Sunnyside, um, and I work in Port Richmond. 20 21 I am a driver, I am a pedestrian and I am also a biker, and I am really really happy that we're having 22 this conversation here. Um, I'm also the Executive 23 Director of El Centro del Inmigrante, which is an 2.4 immigrant resource center based in Port Richmond, 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 61 1 uh, but our members live all over the island, from 2 3 Port Richmond down to Tottenville. Um, our community is mostly pedestrians and bikers. Uh, they have to 4 rely on our very inadequate public transportation on 5 Staten Island. Uh, and especially during the summer 6 months, we see a lot of people, like some, another 7 8 young man said, being hit by cars on their bikes, uh, many hit and runs. Uh, we actually did know a person 9 10 Felipe Avila who passed away this year, as well as 11 Clara Almazo, who was the grandmother, who was killed 12 on Cary Avenue in 2012, um, by a hit and run as well. 13 Im, we really want to make sure that, uh, everyone in 14 the community has an opportunity to, uh, tell you about the problem areas and we really welcome the 15 next time around we meet, uh, we're gonna be able to 16 17 have the opportunity to pin-point those areas. Um, as well as, uh, the area that we are located at is at 18 Castleton Avenue in Port Richmond, which is a very, a 19 There's a lot of activity out 20 commercial corridor. 21 in the avenue, uh, and yet we have a lot of speeding, uh, happening. This is not only to the members there 22 on a daily basis at El Centro, but we also offer 23 services that actually benefit the whole community 24 like our food pantry which is one of our, the largest 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 62
2	food pantries and it is mostly attended by senior
3	citizens. Uh, and we've had a couple incidents where
4	people leaving our food pantry, um, have been almost
5	hit by cars, sometimes because they are actually
6	carrying the boxes with food, uh, going back home as
7	well as our tutoring program, which is mostly young
8	kids, uh, the everyday come and a try to do the
9	homework, so, again, we're happy that we're having
10	this conversation. We really welcome Vision Zero on
11	Staten Island. [APPLAUSE]
12	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Thank you,
13	thank you. Um, Laura Solis, Kidder <b>[Sp?]</b> Jean Marie,
14	and Edward Jones. Please identify yourselves when
15	you come to the mic.
16	LAURA SOLIS: Good evening everyone I'm
17	Laura Solis from Bike New York, if you can guess it.
18	Um, and I do have notes here so please forgive me.
19	I've ridden on Staten Island, um, a particular
20	intersection that I'm concerned about is on Front
21	Street and Thompson. I was actually there when I
22	went to a Staten Island TA meeting. Whoops, it's
23	very dark, it's not very well lit, although there's a
24	bike lane there it's not encouraging for whether
25	you're a cyclist or pedestrian, we are already

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 63 1 vulnerable to make use of that street, so that is a 2 3 street that I would like to call your attention. Um, in addition to that, Bike New York used to be at 4 Midland Beach but Super Storm Sandy saw to it that we 5 were no longer welcome there. We're gonna find our б new home at Fort Wadsworth, where we were this past 7 8 Sunday, for the five-borough bike tour. A shout out to Commissioner Trottenberg, who did ride a five-9 10 borough bike tour and, uh, the five-borough bike tour 11 did actually funds our free bike education 12 programming, which is what I want to actually bring 13 your attention to now. In the summer we host our 14 camping programming for our existing camps where kids can learn how to ride bikes. We actually take them 15 16 on field trips throughout the Island so we can make 17 use of the Island as, uh, sorry, Council Member Rose mentioned, making use of the waterfront, making use 18 of the neighboring communities is really important 19 for both kids and adults and Bike New York does offer 20 21 free programming. Now if you are looking to have that for children, please let us know. 22 I have *ample* literature and business cards where you can request 23 24 that and you can go to where you are, as far as where the children are, and with adult programming, we will 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 64
2	be at Fort Wadsworth if you provide the bike, we
3	provide the helmet and we will teach you how to ride
4	safely on Staten Island while on Staten Island, so
5	there will be, you will actually know, how do I
6	actually get from this part of town to the next part
7	of town and a marshal will show you how to do that.
8	Um, lastly, I wanted to mention, or say thank you to
9	Ydanis Rodriguez because I saw you up in Albany
10	yesterday, I was there as well. Speed cameras came
11	up a few times, and as Commissioner Trottenberg
12	mentioned, speed cameras, thankfully, because of
13	legislation in Albany, we can now deploy more of
14	those however, there are lots of restrictions.
15	Please reach out to your senators and your assembly
16	people because they have the right and the power to
17	change those restrictions. Thank you very much.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: [laugh]
19	Don't talk, your time will start.
20	ED JONES: Ok thank you, [laughs], My
21	name is Edward Jones of Staten Island NAACP. I've
22	been on Staten Island a long time, North Shore, South
23	Shore and I just can't believe the traffic I see
24	sometimes all over Staten Island, and I see the
25	traffic getting worse because I see all the

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 65 1 development on the North Shore, and it's very 2 3 important that you put your program into action as soon as you can, because I don't think the people 4 really understand what some of these stop signs mean. 5 6 They think a stop sign means "slow down", then proceed. I see it time and time again, and also on 7 8 Mannor Road, as you approach the post office from Victory Boulevard, there's a sign that says "no left 9 10 hand turn". And as you approach that sign, people 11 stop and make a left hand turn. When they do that 12 all the traffic behind them backs up because you're 13 not supposed to make a left hand turn, but they stop, 14 blow their horn like crazy, complete chaos down there, so I would hope that at some point that sign 15 can be made much larger so people can see or else the 16 17 police department give out tickets down there because it's just horrendous down there, and, um, basically 18 speaking, the traffic I see getting worse and worse 19 20 because development is getting worse and worse and 21 and worse, and those Savo Brothers with that there, uh, 250-units going down there on the road. 22 That's gonna make it terrible down there, so I just hope you 23 24 can get your program into action as soon you can because it is really needed around here. And people 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 66 1 should not, only not drive and text, but don't walk 2 3 into the street and text at the same time, that's equally as dangerous. Thank you. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: 5 Is Kidder Jean Marie here? Okay. The next group, um, Tom б Weiss, uh, Silatin[Sp?] Tahari[Sp?], and Deborah 7 8 Young. Please identify yourselves when you get to the mic. 9 10 TOM WEISS: I just did, my name is Tom 11 Weiss, I live in Stapleton. I publish Upfront News 12 and I'm something of a thorn in the side of various 13 elected officials. Um, on various transportation 14 matters, uh, Council Man Rodriguez is already somewhat aware of a matter involving harassment, at 15 16 least of me, by some MTA people who seem to think, 17 who seem to be operating on a quota. I spoke to his chief of staff about the matter, I think it's being 18 looked into and the so-called "re-judication bureau" 19 20 at the New York City Transit Authority, it can only 21 be described as a "kangaroo court". They seemed to be involved in primarily revenue enhancement, rather 22 than administration of justice. I think it needs to 23 24 be looked into. As far as the DOT is concerned, um, who's the DOT person up there? Hello? That's you? 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 67 1 Um, which operates the ferries, you know of course 2 3 there is, is an interlock between the MTA and the ferries. Um, one thing, I think, uh, there needs to 4 5 be a better police presence. Certainly, and I'm not complaining about the police. When they're there, б they do a good job and I am glad thy are here 7 tonight. Um, I've seen situations in which there 8 have been near fist fights, particularly on the 9 10 Manhattan side. I was threatened last night, called 11 for a cop. Nobody around. There's a police office 12 there. It's often empty. There needs to be a 13 constant presence in the terminals, particularly on a 14 Friday and Saturday night, where half of Staten Island is drunk coming home from Manhattan. 15 The 16 other half is drunk going to Manhattan. Uh, and 17 that's dangerous. I also have a question, I know that for many people at the ferry terminals are a 18 defacto-shelter. We have a homeless problem, but I 19 have seen on occasion, there's this policy, I don't 20 21 know if it's written or unwritten, where the maintenance people sort of tell everybody "you gotta 22 leave now" and go downstairs or something like that. 23 24 I'm curious as to what the purpose is since many homeless people have not used the shelters and I'm 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 68
2	including "project hospitality" in that, but I'm also
3	concerned about the tone that's used. I'm wondering
4	what the rationale is behind that. That's my comment
5	and I'd like an answer to some of those questions,
6	and I'll be in touch with you Mr. Rodriguez about my
7	case, thanks.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Thank you
9	Tom, next?
10	KIDDER <b>[SP?]</b> JEAN MARIE: Good evening, my
11	name is Sergent Tiye [sp?] and I'm new on Staten
12	Island by a year ago. I just moved and, uh, I just
13	see my neighborhood by South Beach, we'll probably
14	need the traffic light. It is in Sand Lane and
15	Rebenson [Sp?]. It's getting very busy, supermarket
16	opens across the street. And I see there, uh, we'll
17	probably need a traffic light for it, and also, and,
18	uh, Arthur Avenue, going to McClean, when you cross
19	the center, there's no traffic lights from Sand Lane
20	to Oceanside, there's no even stops signs. So when I
21	go to Arthur Avenue up to McClean, you don't see
22	anything there, you have to road to have to see is
23	there two-way traffic. So either have can put it
24	where car can move it, or to put stop signs so it can
25	

1 VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 69
2 be easy to cross at that area. Thank you, good
3 night.

DEBORAH YOUNG: Hello everyone, thank you 4 for holding this, um, it is very helpful and great 5 6 forum for all of us to be able to express our opinions. Um, my name is Deborah Young, and I'm a 7 resident of Westervelt Avenue. We've heard it 8 mentioned several times before. It's a residential 9 10 thorough-fare for which is pretty close to Curtis. You can take a drive on it. I'm sure many of you may 11 12 have used it on your way here. Um, it's about a mile 13 long, it's a hilly street, with numerous blind 14 curves. Um, since I've lived there I've had my car smashed twice, um, my neighbors also. Uh, I had 15 16 somebody end up in my front yard after, um, being 17 chased on a high-speed chase across the borough, but the curve around my, uh, corner, is such that, that 18 19 where he lost control. Um, and it has been problematic for a while, and residents have 20 21 petitioned for, a, more traffic controls, for quite a while. So, needless to say we became very happy when 22 we became part of the New Brighton Slow Zone. 23 Um, 24 and there were, um, many speed humps put on the feeder streets to Westervelt, to slow the flow of 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 70
2	traffic, but there weren't any speed controls put on
3	to Westervelt Avenue. Again, it's a mile long
4	residential street, um, but before this, this slow
5	zone was put into place, the speed limit is marked at
6	15 miles an hour. Now when you enter it's marked at
7	20, but that doesn't deter drivers, they're going 30,
8	maybe 40, and I've seen more. This is also a street
9	that's used as a pedestrian thorough-fare to the
10	ferry. They're young kids. In fact, I saw the other
11	day, elementary-aged kids walking by themselves to
12	school running in fear across that street. Um, and
13	so, where Ithere's about a three-quarter mile
14	stretch without any traffic control whatsoever. Um,
15	there are a, a, eight intersections and there is
16	nothing there to slow the flow of traffic. So what,
17	um, I would like to have the corner of Hendricks and
18	the corner of Corson, very blind curves, and you can
19	drive it right now and take a look and see, um, that
20	would be really helpful, and also more enforcement
21	because if you have a slow zone you can't call it a
22	slow zone if people continue to speed. It just
23	doesn't work. Thank you.
24	

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 71
2	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Thank you,
3	John Lewesy[Sp?]?, Fatmada Va [Sp?], UmVet Bah[Sp?],
4	and um, Charmaine Soldierna[ <b>Sp?]</b>
5	JOHN LEWESY: Good evening everybody, my
6	name is John Lewesy. I'd like to thank everybody for
7	coming here and listening to our issues and I'd like
8	to thank my favorite council member Debbie Rose, for
9	bringing everybody to Curtis High School. Um, I live
10	in St. George. I walk, run - slowly, bicycle and
11	again, drive when necessary. We at St. George, have
12	a particular issue with the fact that it is the
13	center of the borough government. We have a lot of
14	municipal offices here and it seems to be every, or
15	nearly every, civil servant's approach that they're
16	entitled to park on the street, within 20 feet of the
17	entrance of their building. The parking situation
18	has created many, many safety problems in our area
19	and, uh, you know, for example, a while back, I
20	believe it was in response to Transportation
21	Alternatives, uh, the DOT put in daylighting in
22	certain intersections where there's no parking for
23	two or three car-lengths. Uh, that is used by the
24	people, who with permits. A lot of these permits are
25	actually bogus permits that are, are, people make

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 72
2	photocopies with, and they stick them in their
3	dashboard and there is zero, zero enforcement. Uh,
4	we have a "no permit zone" that is constantly filled
5	with cars, uh, that's supposed to be for safety also.
6	We have double parking in front of the 120 Precinct,
7	which I respect the fact that police officers are
8	part of the prob, part of the solution, but in this
9	case, also part of the problem creating a bit of a
10	bottle-neck here. It's very unsafe for everybody
11	driving as well, as cyclists. We have placquard[Sp?]
12	parking, everywhere, I guess it was a couple of years
13	ago, maybe three or four years ago, I participated in
14	an uncivil servants program at Transportation
15	Alternatives had where we checked to see how many
16	metered parking spots were used by people with
17	permits and every single spot on a few of the streets
18	was used by people with permits and as a result, the
19	businesses cannot have anybody park anywhere there.
20	We also have parking at crosswalks…
21	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: John you
22	have to wrap it up
23	JOHN LEWESY:fire hydrants and lots of
24	other situations. Thank you.
25	

1	VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 73
2	FATMADA VA: Hi my name is Fatmada Va and
3	I'm a Senior at Curtis High School. So, first I
4	would like to welcome you guys to Home of the
5	Warriors, and, um, one of my concerns are, um,
6	sidewalks and cross walks in getting to school,
7	because as students at Curtis we have to walk up a
8	hill and get to school every single day and one of
9	the concerns that the students face is, like,
10	physically having to dodge cars when you're trying to
11	cross to get to school, and lots of children, some
12	Freshmen. Freshmen are younger and younger these
13	years, and they're very short and it's hard to see
14	them, so, it's kind of difficult to watch, like
15	sometimes you can't really watch while you see your
16	fellow classmates almost get hit by a car, so, and
17	one of my other things that I wanted to talk about is
18	how do you guys intend to have, um, more students
19	involved in these kind of meetings? Because the time
20	schedule, honestly, does not work for the students'
21	advantage and more students take the bus home or, who
22	like have to walk home, and 8:30 the, um, Metrocards
23	expire so how do you guys, are gonna work that issue
24	out? Because I feel like more students will show up
25	

1 VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 74
2 if you guys did have a more accommodating time.
3 Thank you. [applause]

CHARMAINE SOLDIERNA: Good evening my 4 name is Charmaine Soldierna, I'm from New Brighton, 5 Jersey Street. There's shootings out here, I have 6 fear and I'm afraid of the kids out here. On Jersey 7 Street and Hendricks last night, we go to the 8 Community, after the community, there was a shooting, 9 10 okay? Kids can't go to the store, we cannot do 11 anything with our kids. You know, I mean, we need 12 more protection, you know, and 61 bus? You know, um, 13 the 42 bus? It starts with the kids, it doesn't go 14 back to the, um, they don't go to 61 no more, to drop the kids off. I feel they shouldn't have to walk 15 because there's kids, be fighting, you know, we don't 16 want our kids to get hurt, and I really think you 17 know, do more to help us, because I'm for, I'm for 18 the kids. I'm a grandmother 24 and I really want, 19 you know, a, I'd rather, I love these kids like my 20 21 own, but I really want you to try to help us on Brighton because we need more protection. 22 COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: 23 Ms. 24 Soldierna, are you saying the 61 doesn't go to....[interpose] 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 75 1 CHARMAINE SOLDIERNA: [interpose] 2 61... I 3 61... go The 42 bus used to take the those kids to the You know and they stopped. They had, they 4 school. stopped them from, um, where good you [sic] ... and they 5 had them walk to the school ... 6 COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: and that's 7 the S42? 8 CHARMAINE SOLDIERNA: 9 S42. 10 COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Thank you 11 so much. 12 CHARMAINE SOLDIERNA: You're welcome. 13 [applause] 14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: Professor Paul Gamarano[Sp?] and John Kilcohen[Sp?]. 15 PROFESSOR PAUL GAMARANO: Thank you for 16 17 being here. Speaking here as a Graduate Safety Course Professor, former Safety Manager, Risk Manager 18 and Defensive Driving Instructor, and as a multiple 19 times survivor as a 30,000 mile-plus bicyclist, um, 20 21 kudos to the DOT on the count-down lights and on acting on our recommendations. Commissioner, if you 22 would drive home, if you drive the opposite way 23 24 tonight you will see that our Staten Island Expressway is in desperate need of completion these 25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 76 1 days, so it can't be completed fast enough. 2 Vision 3 Zero speaks to the importance of lane painting visibility, um, and sharing the roads. 4 The recommendations here, painted intersection walkways 5 at every private and public school entrance and б parking lot. I personally witnessed many near-7 8 accidents on a daily basis. I can give you an 9 example which would be a New Dorp High School, but as 10 indicated with every public and private school and 11 also I can't speak highly enough of more left-turn 12 arrows at every intersection for the sake of traffic 13 flow. That single step would immensely improve 14 traffic flow in every borough. Thanks very much and the time that I have I guess I'm a fast talker. 15 The 16 opportunity to put a walkway-bikeway on the Verazano 17 Bridge, at some point in time, at least in our lifetime, cannot be understated. [applause & 18 whistles] 19 Thank you. JOHN KILCOHEN: John Kilcohen 20 21 representing the New Brighton Coalition. I'd like to thank the DOT and City Council for allowing me to 22 Um, I want to thank Tom Coccola again for New 23 speak.

Brighton's slow zone. Um, I did want to add that we

need to extend the zone to include all of Jersey

24

25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 77 1 Street and York Avenue. With the coming wheel, 2 3 Jersey Street will be a thorough-fare from Victory Boulevard down to Richmond Terrace and as the 4 previous speaker mentioned, Charmaine, that, there 5 are a lot of pedestrians there on a daily basis, б morning, noon and night, and the police department is 7 8 doing a great job in helping with, you know, the 9 quality of life issues that we have on Jersey Street, 10 but we do need to include that in the slow zone. And 11 I also echo what Deb Young mentioned. Westervelt 12 does need more enforcement, um, kudos to the police 13 department about a year ago, they were doing speed 14 stop, you know passing through, blowing through the stop sign at Hendricks and Westervelt. They must 15 16 have gotten at least ten people in a row, so thank 17 you. But we do need more enforcement there, and that is a critical intersection just as I was walking over 18 tonight, there was a near near-miss, and, um, I was 19 20 in the other car. My car, three of my cars have been 21 hit, so I am the other person that Deb has mentioned, that I'm at the curb, so we do need the enforcement 22 23 on Westervelt and we do need the inclusion of Jersey 24 Street and York. Thank you.

25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 78 1 COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: 2 That 3 concludes the questions from the audience and, um, we [SPEAKING TO THE AUDIENCE] have no card for you. 4 5 Okay, you were supposed to turn it in to the Sergeant. Come on Roy, come to the mic. and then б we'll... 7 ROY MOSKOWITZ: Hi, I'm Roy Moskowitz, a, 8 thanks for indulging me. Uh, I'm a non-driver, uh, 9 10 the world's a safer place because of it. I moved to Staten Island 20 years ago from Manhattan, um, when I

11 12 lived in Manhattan. Uh, when I lived in Manhattan, I 13 used to occasionally run, uh, on a track by the East 14 River Park, and, uh, in order to get to that track there were foot bridges. Uh, both on 69<sup>th</sup> Avenue and 15 I think that's a solution to a number of dangerous 16 17 crossings we have on Staten Island. Again, I don't know the logistics, I don't know the expense, but, at 18 least at a few of the crossings I think that might be 19 20 a solution and you would enter the foot bridges by a 21 ramp rather than stairs, simply, so people with uh, shopping carts and baby carriages and people who are 22 handicapped could get up the foot bridge. Uh, you 23 24 can do it on Hyland Boulevard, Richmond Avenue and Victory Boulevard, uh, I think it is something we 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 79
2	really need to look into. Um, one of, Staten Island
3	is known as a borough of parks, the borough of
4	greenery, but also a borough of no sidewalks. I
5	don't know is there anything we can do to add more
6	sidewalks and streets like Rockland Avenue, Forest
7	Hill Road, Victory Boulevard, Travis, uh, the entire,
8	uh, Corporate Park zone? Again, that's also, a, a
9	cause of many traffic and, uh, pedestrian injuries
10	and fatalities. Thank you. [applause]
11	JACQUELINE JUNTTONEN: It's Jacqueline
12	Junttonen. I'm a resident of Staten Island and also
13	a native. I teach adults and children how to bicycle
14	at Bike New York. I do this at other boroughs
15	because it is very difficult to do this on Staten
16	Island because I'm afraid for what's going to happen
17	to the students that I teach. I hold in my hand,
18	this is a spoke cart. Spoke carts usually represent
19	something joyous. This spoke cart was used last
20	month on a ride called "New York City Ghost Bike
21	Ride" and we memorialized 12 cyclists and 168
22	pedestrians who were killed last year by vehicles.
23	So I suggest you look at this and look at the names
24	of the people who died in New York City streets, and,
25	uh, street modifications could prevent this in the

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 80 1 future. And, uh, hopefully have more people cycling 2 3 in the city streets and not making cards like this. Thank you. [applause] 4 5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So now let's give 6 the opportunity to my colleagues and the commissioners to engage one or two minutes in case 7 8 they would like to clarify or add anything else. THOMAS CHAN: I understand that 9 10 commuting, the motorists, um, do spend a lot of time on the roadways. Our officers, we are in the process 11 of getting additional equipment, radar equipment, 12 13 laser guns that are utilized for speed enforcement. 14 We look for the additional, the highway officers, do enforcement on our highways. We also look for our 15 local precincts to increase their enforcement on 16 17 these specific streets, uh, that may not necessarily that the officers from highway would be working on. 18 So again, additional equipment, additional training 19 20 and then we'll get speed enforcement on Staten Island 21 because it is important. MEERA JOSHI: Thank you very much for 22 your comments and hearing the individual stories of 23 24 speeding. Um, I just wanted to mention that we are going to be ramping up enforcement in all the five

25

VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 81 boroughs, including Staten Island. So, if that speeding is taking place by TLC, with TLC vehicles, and TLC licensed drivers, then our goal is to catch those drivers and get them off the road. So thank you very much for your input.

POLLY TROTTENBERG: I want to say my 7 8 thanks too, we heard a lot of great suggestions here, both some specifics - Westervelt, I heard it. 9 I was 10 driving on it tonight, actually. We took a look, and 11 obviously, we are working with Tom and we will follow 12 up on the specifics, but also on some of the bigger 13 things you all talked about that we really want to 14 try to focus on. Schools, safety around schools for our kids, the issue of culture change, look, part of 15 Vision Zero is us bringing culture change, but 16 17 obviously culture change is also organic, the City government can't make it happen, it also has to 18 happen locally and I hear there are a lot of great 19 20 leaders in this community who are focusing on that. 21 And Staten Island Expressway, I'm happy to say, that's a New York State DOT, uh, Project. 22 I hear you, we wish it was going faster too, but that one 23 24 you'll have to talk to the State, but thanks again, we really enjoyed hearing from everyone tonight. 25

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 82
2	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH GIBSON: Thank you
3	to each and every one of you tonight who spoke with
4	such conviction, commitment and passion. I truly
5	appreciate it as someone that comes from the Bronx,
6	and understanding a lot of the unique challenges that
7	are faced by Staten Islanders and I must give a lot
8	of credit to the majority of the constituents that
9	are in Council Member Debbie Rose's district. All of
10	you just gave her much more work to do, but I know
11	she's up to the charge, because, obviously this is
12	truly about changing a cycle of systemic bad behavior
13	and removing that obstacle and making sure that all
14	of the work we do focuses on a balance, focuses on
15	making sure that these are streets for all of us.
16	For bikers, pedestrians, drivers and a lot of the
17	work that we can do we really truly can do it
18	together. So I want to thank all of our stakeholders
19	who are here tonight. All of the work that you do an
20	I especially want to recognize the fact that someone
21	spoke up about the disability community and the fact
22	that many residents have visual and hearing
23	impairments and we must always remember and keep that
24	in mind with any of the initiatives that we do
25	implement. So this is truly a campaign about two

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 83
2	things: education and enforcement. And I thank all
3	of you for being here. Thank you for allowing me to
4	cross the bridge and come tonight, and I'm looking
5	forward to working with all of my colleagues and all
6	of you to make Vision Zero a reality for New York
7	City, so thank you so much for coming out tonight.
8	[applause]
9	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: On behalf of

9 maybe before we get an official closing of council, 10 member, eh, I would like to say on behalf of our 11 12 leader and speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito. We'd like 13 to say thank you everyone for being here, eh, we are 14 committed to being working with all the commissioners and with the leadership of Mayor de Blasio to make 15 Vision Zero a reality that's why this is so exciting 16 to hear so many feedback and new ideas and the next 17 Town Hall meeting is gonna be May 22<sup>nd</sup> at Lehman 18 19 College, eh, most likely at the end of this month or at the beginning of next month we will have, we will 20 be voting. We expecting to be voting on good bills, 21 and you, you, and all of us all those initiatives 22 that the DOT, TOC already working. The NYPD too, so 23 this has been a great evening and now we have 24 official closing for our Council Member Debbie Rose. 25

1	VISION ZERO - STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 84
2	COUNCIL MEMBER DEBORAH ROSE: I want to
3	first thank you all for coming and I want you to know
4	how appreciative I am, as a Council Member from
5	Staten Island, that you articulated our issues so
6	well. Um, it is a shame that we have so many issues
7	that need to be addressed. Many of them are long-
8	term problems, and, um, I'm excited that through
9	Vision Zero we will get some relief and that we are
10	going to change the culture here on Staten Island so
11	that there is a mutual respect for all. For our
12	drivers, pedestrians and bikers. Um, I have a motto
13	in my office that says, "We are one", and so now
14	we're going to have traffic enforcement and changes
15	to our roads that will clearly re-enforce, that we
16	are one, that we can work together and this is a
17	great partnership. I want to thank NYPD for coming
18	out in full force, um, and being so supportive. I
19	never thought that I would say, I'm glad to see
20	officers out there enforcing so many of the traffic
21	laws, um, but I am, because it is going to change,
22	um, the safety of our pedestrians and our drivers,
23	um, and the mind set. So I want to thank all of the
24	commissioners from, uh, from Manhattan, um,
25	Commissioner Josey, and, um, Commissioner

1	VISION ZERO – STATEN ISLAND TOWN HALL MEETING 85
2	Trottenberg, and my colleagues. Um, I want to say to
3	all of you, be safe and we expect to see you back
4	here June 25 at the workshop, where we, um, oh $26^{th}$ ,
5	June 26 <sup>th</sup> , um, here, right here at Curtis, where you
6	can give us the specifics so that we can then address
7	these issues. Thank you so much for being here.
8	[applause].
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
I	1

## CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date \_\_\_\_\_May 21, 2014\_