CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

----- X

March 20, 2014 Start: 11:26 a.m. Recess: 11:44 a.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm.,

16th Fl.

BEFORE:

DAVID G. GREENFIELD

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Vincent Gentile

Annabel Palma

Maria del Carmen Arroyo

Inez E. Dickens Rosie Mendez Peter Koo Stephen Levin

Mark Weprin

Daniel R. Garodnick

Ruben Wills

Donovan Richards
Antonio Reynoso
Ritchie Torres
Mark Treyger
Vincent Ignizio
Darlene Mealy

Brad Lander
Ydanis Rodriguez
Ben Kallos
Inez Barron
Jumaane D. Williams

2	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: [gavel] Good
3	morning. My name is David Greenfield. I'm the
4	council member from the 44th Council District in
5	Brooklyn and I'm presently serving as the chair of
6	the Land Use Committee. I want to welcome my
7	esteemed colleagues, who are members of the
8	committee: Council Member Gentile, Council Member
9	Palma, Council Member Arroyo, Council Member
LO	Dickens, Council Member Mendez, Council Member Koo,
L1	Council Member Levin, Council Member Weprin,
L2	Council Member Garodnick, Council Member Wills,
L3	Council Member Richards, Council Member Reynoso,
L4	Council Member Torres, Council Member Treyger and
L5	Council Member Ignizio. I want to thank all of you
L 6	for your prompt attendance. You will see on the
L7	table before you several items relating to the
L8	committee. First is the agenda prepared by the
L 9	committee staff, containing those matters which
20	have had a hearing and been reviewed and fully
21	vetted by the subcommittees. Those are the matters
22	on which we will be acting today. [background
23	voices] Shh I'd also like to also recognize
24	Council Members Mealy and Lander and I'd like to
> 5	thank our subcommittoe chairs. Chair Mark Wonrin

the Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises; Chair	
Peter Koo, the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public	
Siting and Maritime Uses and of course, Chair Inez	
Dickens, Subcommittee on Plannings, Dispositions	
and Concessions. Also before you are joint reports	
of the Land Use Committees and applicable	
subcommittees for each item we are voting on today	
with a resolution for each item. What the	
committee is voting on today is to approve each of	
the resolutions before you for presentation and	
full vote by the full council. The resolutions	
reflect the recommendations of the applicable	
subcommittees. In addition today, we'll also find	
a briefing sheet, which give the additional	
information about roles, matters and other matters	
which have been scheduled to be heard by the	
subcommittee.	

Today we have five applications on our calendar for our consideration. We have two unenclosed sidewalk cafes that are recommended for approval, the White Horse Tavern and Maison O. The White Horse Tavern is located in Council Member Johnson's district at 567 Hudson Street and has 24 tables and 48 seats. Maison O is located in

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

2.2

23

24

25

Council Member Chin's district at 98 Kenmare Street and will have 14 tables and 28 seats.

The third the council has recommended

for disapproval, and that is Nonna's Pizzeria and Trattoria, which is located in Council Member Vallone's district at 22-30 154th Street, and proposes to open an enclosed sidewalk café containing 11 tables and 22 seats. Questions are raised as to the numerous large sidewalk obstructions observed by council staff when they visited the site. There were unanswered questions from the community board as to the accuracy of the plan submitted to them and the subcommittee was concerned about whether there could be violations of the requirements of the zoning resolution. applicant did not appear to address these questions despite notification of this hearing by council staff. The subcommittee therefore voted to disapprove the application, which is before us now.

We also have before us an application from NYCEDC to amend the zoning resolution NYCZR62813 to establish a chair certification to allow operations of water taxis with a vessel capacity of up to 99 passengers in R6 to R10

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

Lastly, we have the first floor interior of the Bronx General Post Office at 560 Grand Concourse as a historic landmark. The designation was supported by borough president Diaz

shelters and ticketing machines. This application

was approved by Community Board 1 and approval with

conditions by the borough president, Council Member

Levin, is supportive of these changes.

and by Council Member Arroyo and was approved by
the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Siting and

4 Maritime Uses.

2.2

These items have been fully vetted by
the Zoning and Franchises Subcommittee and the
Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Siting and
Maritime Uses, which has recommended approval of
these items with the exception of LU 22, Nonna
Pizzeria enclosed sidewalk café, which the
subcommittee recommends disapproval. All of the
members... all of the members... thank you very
much, Council Member Arroyo, good to see you. All
of the members in these districts projects approve
of these designations. The chair recommends an aye
vote on all these matters. I just want to
recognize Council Member Rodriguez and Council
Member Kallos, who have joined us as well.

So for the record, the application
numbers in Council Member Johnson's district are LU
Number 18, White Horse Tavern, 20145268TCM,
Manhattan Community Board 12 for a revocable
consent to continue to maintain and operate an
enclosed sidewalk café located at 567 Hudson
Street. In Council Member Chin's district LU

2	Number 21, Maison O, 20145310TCM, Manhattan
3	Community Board 12 for a revocable consent to
4	establish, maintain and operate an enclosed
5	sidewalk café located at 98 Kenmare Street. And ir
6	Council Member Vallone's distict LU Number 22,
7	Nonna's Pizzeria and Trattoria, 20145354TCQ, Queens
8	Community Board 7. This is a vote to disapprove a
9	revocable consent to establish, maintain and
10	operate an enclosed sidewalk café located at 22-30-
11	154th Street. And in Council Member Levin's
12	district LU Number 20, East River Ferry Text
13	Amendment N140099ZRK, Brooklyn Community Board 1
14	for an amendment to the zoning resolution
15	pertaining to the regulations governing ferry and
16	water taxi docking facilities in Community District
17	1 in the borough of Brooklyn. And finally, Council
18	Member Arroyo's district LU Number 34, Bronx
19	General Post Office 20145279HKX in Bronx Community
20	Board 4 regarding the landmarked designation of the
21	Brooklyn General Post Office first floor lobby
22	located at 560 Grand Concourse Ave, a historic
23	landmark. I remind you that an aye vote on LU-22
24	is a vote to disapprove the application per the
25	recommendation of the subcommittee. With that, we

will ask if any members have any questions. Hearing none, we will ask the clerk to call the roll. COMMITTEE CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk. Roll call vote Committee on Land Use. Council Member Greenfield. COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile. COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma. COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo. COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes. COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez. COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.	1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 9
COMMITTEE CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk. Roll call vote Committee on Land Use. Council Member Greenfield. COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile. COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma. COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo. COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens. COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes. COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	2	will ask if any members have any questions.
COMMITTEE CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk. Roll call vote Committee on Land Use. Council Member Greenfield. COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile. COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma. COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER PARROYO: Yes. COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	3	Hearing none, we will ask the clerk to call the
Committee Clerk. Roll call vote Committee on Land Use. Council Member Greenfield. COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile. COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma. COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes. COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes. COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	4	roll.
COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile. COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma. COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo. COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes. COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	5	COMMITTEE CLERK: William Martin,
COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile. COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes. COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.	6	Committee Clerk. Roll call vote Committee on Land
COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile. COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma. COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO. Yes. COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.	7	Use. Council Member Greenfield.
COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma. COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo. COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes. COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	8	COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma. COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo. COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes. COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.	9	COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.
COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo. COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes. COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	10	COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo. COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes. COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	11	COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.
COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes. COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	12	COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens. COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	13	COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo.
COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	14	COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick. COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	15	COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.
COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	16	COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	17	COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.
COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	18	COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	19	COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.
COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	20	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.	21	COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.
	22	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.
COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.	23	COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.
	24	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

25

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 10
2	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.
3	COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander. [Response
4	not heard]
5	COMMITTEE CLERK: Weprin.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.
7	COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye.
9	COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.
11	COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.
13	COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.
15	COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.
17	COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.
18	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council Member
19	Torres.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Yes.
21	COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger. [Response
22	not heard] Ignizio.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: I'd like to
24	vote aye and commend the chair for his best micro
25	machines, if you remember that from when we were

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 11
2	kids, the guy who was a speed reader.
3	Congratulations, Chair.
4	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Appreciation
5	for your time. Thank you, sir.
6	[Pause]
7	COMMITTEE CLERK: By vote of 18 in the
8	affirmative, zero in the negative and no
9	absentions, all items have been adopted. Members,
10	please sign the committee reports. Thank you.
11	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.
12	We're going to keep the vote open for 15 more
13	minutes until 11:49 a.m. Thank you.
14	[Pause]
15	COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye on all.
17	COMMITTEE CLERK: Vote is now of 19 in
18	the affirmative. [background voices]
19	[Pause]
20	COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.
22	COMMITTEE CLERK: The vote is now 20 in
23	the affirmative.
24	[Pause]

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 12
2	COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member
3	Williams.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.
5	COMMITTEE CLERK: The vote now stands
6	at 21 in the affirmative.
7	[Pause]
8	COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member
9	Treyger. [background voices]
10	[Pause]
11	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye. I vote
12	aye.
13	[Pause]
14	COMMITTEE CLERK: The final vote of the
15	Committee on Land Use now stands 22 in the
16	affirmative, zero in the negative and no
17	abstentions. Thank you.
18	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: The Committee
19	on Land Use is now adjourned.
20	[gavel]
21	
22	
23	
24	

${\tt C} \ {\tt E} \ {\tt R} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt F} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt C} \ {\tt A} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt E}$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.



Date: 04/14/2014