

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

March 6, 2014  
Start: 10:13 a.m.  
Recess: 1:42 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers  
City Hall

B E F O R E: YDANIS RODRIGUEZ  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

James Vacca  
Helen Rosenthal  
Margaret Chin  
Stephen Levin  
Antonio Reynoso  
I. Daneek Miller  
Jimmy Van Bramer  
Deborah Rose  
Brad Lander

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Conan Freud  
Chief Operating Officer  
NYC Taxi and Limousine Commission

Ashwini Chhabra  
Deputy Commissioner  
Policy and Planning  
NYC Taxi and Limousine Commission

Gary Weiss  
Deputy Commissioner  
Licensing  
NYC Taxi and Limousine Commission

Raymond Scanlon  
Deputy Commissioner  
Enforcement  
NYC Taxi and Limousine Commission

Douglas Johnson  
Director  
Management and Budget  
Metropolitan Transportation Authority

Lois Tandler  
Vice President  
Government and Community Relations  
Metropolitan Transportation Authority

Steve Berrang  
Director  
Capital Program Management  
Metropolitan Transportation Authority

Aaron Stern  
Director  
Office of Management and Budget  
Metropolitan Transportation Authority

Polly Trottenberg  
Commissioner  
NYC Department of Transportation

Joseph Jarrin  
Deputy Commissioner  
Finance, Contracting and Program  
Management  
NYC Department of Transportation

Kate Slevin  
Assistant Commissioner  
Intergovernmental Affairs  
NYC Department of Transportation

Juan Martinez  
General Counsel  
Transportation Alternatives

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, good morning, everyone and thank you for coming to our City Council Transportation Committee's hearing on the Fiscal 2015 Preliminary Budget and the Fiscal 2014 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report. My name is Ydanis Rodriguez and I am the chair of the Transportation Committee, and before we begin I would like to introduce and recognize my colleagues, Council Member Vacca, Rosenthal and Margaret Chin.

We are here to begin the Fiscal 2015 Transportation Budget process. We will hear from the New York City Taxi and Limousine Commission, the Metropolitan Transportation Authority and the City Department of Transportation. We will begin with the TLC, who will discuss the budget projected to be \$61 million in Fiscal 2015. I am interested in hearing updates about the Commission's recent and expected sales of taxi medallions and how this process is shaping out. Additionally, I would like to hear about TLC's ongoing process of phasing in the outer borough taxes and the Green Carts we have seen around in our city. Finally, in keeping with the Vision Zero initiative, put forward by Mayor De

Blasio, I would like to hear especially about the enforcement of rules and regulations by TLC. In addition to the enforcement of illegal street hails and service refusals, it will be crucial to hear about what TLC has done and plans to do to address violations directly relating to traffic safety. But it is also important to learn more about any educational initiative that TLC has or plans to put in place to support the drivers and to promote safer driving.

Following the TLC, we will hear from the MTA on their continuing efforts to identify budget efficiencies and control costs in the 2014 Budget. I am happy to state that as it approaches Calendar Year of 2014, that the budget is balanced and includes nearly \$800 million in city expense funding. We know that the MTA has plans to implement a four percent fare and toll increase for March 2015, as well as a second increase in 2017, but we also hope to hear about increased service to coincide with asking New Yorkers to pay more. We hope to hear from the MTA on any plans they may have that could help avoid or further reduce the planned fare hike. We hope that MTA is exploring

opportunities for greater revenue, including developing MTA owned property in my own district, which is larger than the Hudson Yards. With the right partnership, this could be developed into affordable housing and create revenue to abstain fare increase in the future. Several key issues that have been in the news recently that the committee would like updated are related to the ongoing major capital projects, such as the East Side Access project and the Second Avenue subway that have repeatedly been pushed back and reassessed at higher costs. It is imperative that the MTA do everything it can to keep the costs for this project in check and that the timeline be made more rigid.

Another issue that the committee would like clarification on is the ongoing labor dispute with unions representing workers on the Long Island Railroad. Recent efforts to reach an agreement did not work out, and we would like to hear what the MTA plans to do different in a second round of mediations so that the millions of people traveling to our city every day are not left stranded and are able to go to work.

Finally, we will hear from the City Department of Transportation on the DOT Preliminary Expense Budget for Fiscal 2015. It is approximately \$791 million. In addition, \$1.2 billion is also budgeted in Fiscal 2015 for the Department Capital Program. We look forward to the Commissioner updating this committee on the department's efforts to maintain the city's roadways, including pothole remediation, efforts to improve parking through the use of technology, the department's efforts to improve pedestrian safety and its role in the implementation of Vision Zero Action Plan released by the administration last month. With such an ambitious plan, one that I believe was a major step for eliminating traffic deaths in our city, we must be sure that the funding is in place for the many projects necessary. I would also like to hear about any updates on the timeline for these plans with specifics about targeting goals for the new slow zone and physical infrastructure improvement. In the effort to expand options for transportation in our city, especially for goals isolated from mass transit, expanding the Citi Bike program can go a

1 long way for many residents and visitors to our  
2 city. I would like to hear where we are in this  
3 effort, as well as hear about the revenue and  
4 projection for this program. It has been very  
5 successful from ridership perspective, but we have  
6 not had any details when it is related to the money  
7 the city has received and whether an expansion in  
8 the program is self-sustainable or needs additional  
9 funding. Additionally, we will hear the  
10 department's four-year capital plan, particularly  
11 in terms of its goals and priorities for the next  
12 four years, the scope and the progression of work  
13 on the planned purchase of new ferry boats, the  
14 reconstruction of passenger ramps and roadways  
15 citywide and an update on the department's plan New  
16 York City 2030 goals.

18 Finally, I would like to thank the  
19 Transportation Committee staff, Unit Head Shema  
20 Ovisher, [phonetic] Counsel Lyle Frank, Policy  
21 Analyst Jonathan Maserano [phonetic] and Gafar  
22 Sallo, [phonetic] as well as my Staff Legislative  
23 and Budget Director, Carmen de la Rosa, my  
24 Communication Director, Rosa Murphy and Legislative  
25 Aide, Nokel Mathis [phonetic].



Now we will hear from the TLC Chief Operating Officer with the hope that we will have a new Commissioner in the near future. Thank you.

CONAN FREUD: Good morning. Good morning, Chair Rodriguez and members of the Council Committee on Transportation and Finance. I am Conan Freud. I am the Chief Operating Officer of the New York City Taxi and Limousine Commission, and I'm joined today by Ashwini Chhabra, who is our Deputy Commissioner for Policy, and some other members of our Senior Staff. Thank you for the opportunity to speak to you today regarding the TLC Fiscal Year 2015 Preliminary Budget, but before I talk about the budget, I would like to update you on what we have accomplished during Calendar Year 2013 and what our plans are for 2014.

Our licensing, enforcement and safety and emissions divisions were extremely busy in Calendar Year 2013. Our licensing division approved close to 5,000 new drivers. This brings our total number of driver licensees to over 115,000. Additionally, with the sale of new yellow taxi medallions, issuance of street hail livery permits and the increase in the for-hire industry,

we have licensed an additional 11,000 vehicles in Calendar Year 2013.

We are also seizing more unlicensed vehicles. In Calendar Year 2013, our enforcement division seized more than 9,600 vehicles operating illegally without a license, an increase of 59 percent or more than 3,700 vehicles compare to Calendar Year 2012. Last, but not least, our safety and emissions division saw an increase in both medallion and FHV inspections. The number of inspections in Calendar Year 2013 grew to 96,600, an eight percent increase from the previous year. The increased number of inspections can be attributed to the new street hail liveries, which are required to be inspected by the TLC twice per year.

As you know, on February 18th, Mayor de Blasio announced the Vision Zero initiative to eliminate street fatalities in New York City. On February 24th, I testified before the Committee on Transportation and the Committee on Public Safety about how we plan to contribute to the Mayor's goal and bring our proposals from ideas to fruition. TLC staff is already hard at work on implementing

policy objectives outlines in the Vision Zero Action Plan. As discussed in detail in the report, the TLC will work towards promoting and ensuring that there are safe TLC licensees on the streets by increasing driver education, utilizing new technology and dedicating more enforcement resources. It is our goal to increase the number of safe TLC licensed drivers on the road by incentivizing and rewarding safe driving, but more importantly, removing unsafe drivers from the road before tragic events occur.

Now I will move onto the Preliminary Budget for Fiscal Year '15. The TLC Preliminary Budget for Fiscal Year '15 is just over \$61 million. Of that amount, \$33 million is for Personal Services and \$28 million is for Other Than Personal Services. Of the \$28 million in the OTPS budget, \$18 million is allocated for issuing grants for the street hail livery permit holders who are bringing a wheelchair accessible vehicle into service. These grants are being issued to cover the additional costs of purchasing a wheelchair accessible vehicle. As of March 3rd, we have issued 63 grants to accessible street hail livery

1 permit holders, with close to 100 more in the final  
2 approval process. The agency's head count for  
3 Fiscal Year '15 has also increased from 598 to 609.  
4 The 11 additional positions are being added to our  
5 safety and emissions division to address an  
6 increase in yellow taxi and street hail livery  
7 inspections.  
8

9 This concludes my testimony on the TLC  
10 Preliminary Budget for Fiscal Year 2015. I thank  
11 you for the opportunity to testify today about what  
12 we plan to accomplish in the coming year and to  
13 improve our safety of our licensees and the public.  
14 At this time, I would be happy to answer any  
15 questions that you have.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you and  
17 before I get into my own questions, I'd like to  
18 give the opportunity to Council Member Rosenthal,  
19 who also has some questions, but she also has to go  
20 to another hearing.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I really  
22 appreciate that, Chair Rodriguez. Thank you very  
23 much. Thanks for holding this hearing, and Deputy  
24 Commissioner Freud, thank you so much for your help  
25 and all the work that you guys are doing in

1 stepping up to this task. It's been a really  
2 impressive showing. Someone was talking to me  
3 recently about TLC's ability to investigate  
4 accidents and suggesting that we put... that we ask  
5 TLC to have a larger staff to do its own  
6 investigations independent of the Police Department  
7 because the Police Department can sometimes put  
8 these investigations on their back burner and it  
9 can take a long time. My gut reaction to that was  
10 why would we ask TLC to duplicate the work of the  
11 Police Department, but I just wanted to run it past  
12 you to make sure that I'm not missing something.

14 CONAN FREUD: You're not missing  
15 something.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, thank  
17 you. Secondly, you mentioned in... oh, no, it's  
18 not... so there's a report that council members get  
19 that shows what's in your budget, so there's a  
20 point in there about there was an EIS on the taxi  
21 medallion sale. Can you tell me what the findings  
22 were in the EIS?

23 CONAN FREUD: I'm sorry?  
24  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 14

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: The \$178,000  
3 in Fiscal '14 that you guys did an EI... is that  
4 accurate? You guys did an EIS on the sale...

5 CONAN FREUD: [interposing] Mm-hm.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Of the new  
7 taxi medallions.

8 CONAN FREUD: Yes, that's correct.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: What were  
10 the important findings from the EIS? Do you  
11 remember?

12 CONAN FREUD: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: You don't  
14 have to...

15 CONAN FREUD: I mean the important  
16 finding was that there was no environmental impact.  
17 [background voice] You know, that there was no  
18 negative impact on the environment from the  
19 additional sale. That was the essential finding.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: How many  
21 medallions?

22 CONAN FREUD: 2,000 over the next four  
23 years.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Does that  
25 mean 2,000 more cars?

CONAN FREUD: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, so  
wouldn't there be an impact?

CONAN FREUD: There was an impact...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Does that  
means...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: But there was no  
significant impact.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Help me with  
the definition of a significant... let's talk about  
it another time. I don't mean to... I just want  
to...

CONAN FREUD: [interposing] I mean we  
went... I mean it was a very... it's a very long  
document. We can certainly...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah, yeah,  
yeah.

CONAN FREUD: Brief you if you'd like  
to go through it with you, but this conclusion it  
read... it resulted in was that there was not a  
significant environmental impact.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: On  
congestion or pollution or on...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: There were some traffic  
impacts, but some of them we believe we can  
mitigate. There are some... you know, there were  
no air quality or noise impacts or significant...  
you know, I mean there's obviously going to be  
some. There was no significant economic impacts  
'cause the industry was concerned about whether  
there would a loss seen...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Sure.

CONAN FREUD: In fare... you know,  
fare...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Sure.

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: Box revenue, but...

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: It does  
strike me as odd that there wouldn't be an impact  
on air quality, but it's not my area of expertise.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: We had many  
people from many departments review this you know,



from DOT, from DEP, from the Law Department, from the Mayor's Office of Environmental Coordination. It's a public process. Everyone participated...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay.

CONAN FREUD: Who wished to participate.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That's fine.

CONAN FREUD: Uhm...

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Fine, fine, fine.

CONAN FREUD: And we moved forward once we completed it.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you, and then just speaking to you with the hat on now of the contracts... chair, chair of contracts, your contracts budget is \$3 million roughly I think?

CONAN FREUD: I think it's more... well, it depends on what code you're talking about.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: It always comes down to the budget code.

CONAN FREUD: The object codes, yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah, okay.

2 CONAN FREUD: I spent a lot of time on  
3 object codes in my earlier career, so.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay well,  
5 you know them way better than I do.

6 CONAN FREUD: I do.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So I'd love  
8 to follow up with someone on your staff if you  
9 could point someone out to me to just talk about  
10 the contracts that you guys have to understand them  
11 better and why you need them and why you're  
12 coming...

13 [crosstalk]

14 CONAN FREUD: I mean the basic... I  
15 mean probably the largest contract that we have is  
16 we have a vendor who provides; helps us with our  
17 inspection system. This computer system's  
18 called... the vendor is currently... I think their  
19 name is Systech, but they're changing their name to  
20 something else. So that's probably our largest  
21 vendor. We also have a mailing... a printing and  
22 mailing contract; we have a security guard  
23 contract. We hire a psychologist to evaluate new  
24 recruits.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 19

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Right. Okay  
3 well, if you could break out because the biggest  
4 category that we see is half of the budget is for a  
5 group called Contractual Services General.

6 CONAN FREUD: Right, right.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Which I'm  
8 sure is the name of the object code but...

9 CONAN FREUD: [interposing] That's 600,  
10 yeah.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: If that...  
12 if there's some way of breaking that down for us.

13 CONAN FREUD: Yeah.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That...

15 [crosstalk]

16 CONAN FREUD: Absolutely.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That would  
18 be really helpful and do you have a sense of what  
19 percentage are minority and women-owned  
20 enterprises?

21 CONAN FREUD: I can give you... I knew  
22 that question was coming. Hopefully, I have an  
23 answer. For Fiscal Year 2012, which is... that's  
24 for the first... is 12 percent.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 20

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And what's  
3 your aspirational goal, 20?

4 CONAN FREUD: Well, we're in a  
5 different category because we don't really do... I  
6 think... we don't have a particular goal because we  
7 don't meet the \$5 million threshold.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Mm...

9 CONAN FREUD: So our aspirational goal  
10 is to do as many as we can.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, it's  
12 something that's on your point system...

13 [crosstalk]

14 CONAN FREUD: Absolutely.

15 [crosstalk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Or whatever?

17 CONAN FREUD: You know, we're always...

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL:

19 [interposing] Okay.

20 CONAN FREUD: We're always looking to  
21 increase the number of vendors who are providing  
22 services to us because we get better prices that  
23 way.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Makes sense.  
25 Alright, thank you so much.

CONAN FREUD: No problem. [background voice]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, so we also have others coming to testify, so we're going to be limiting now on 10 minutes. I have a few questions. One is how important; how critical is it for the TLC to have the Commissioner?

CONAN FREUD: You know, it's a charter mandated position. It's an important position. We hope to have one soon.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Having absent a Commissioner would create any situation where some business had to slow down because we're lacking a Commissioner?

CONAN FREUD: No, we're still doing business. I mean we're providing services to our licensees and to the general public. I mean the most important thing is to have the right person in there, so we're going through the process and hopefully we'll have that soon.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Right, and how much has the agency put aside to dedicate a fund to implement Vision Zero?

CONAN FREUD: Well, we're in a sort of unique position because some of the things that we asked for or were proposed in our Vision Zero Plan don't require dollar... you know, don't require in dollars. Some of the things are... I mean we've already started them. We've been starting to put PSAs in the yellow and the green taxis reminding people about you know, pedestrian safety. We've been sending messages to drivers to remind them about safety. The items that do require funding we are working out now with OMB as to what the appropriate funding level will be, so we expect to have answers from them relatively soon.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, look,  
I... I...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: But we're still doing... many of the things we can do without resources or without direct city resources.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It is important for us to... when we entered this project process...

CONAN FREUD: [interposing] Mm-hm.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: To have a set figure and when it comes to how much money we'll be investing on Vision Zero. I understand it that some will require for... from the partners on business that a... such as the owners of the medallions who will also be in partnerships, but they also have an indicator as also the drivers, but for me this is important and this is something that I hope and I know that we are on the same page with the Mayor's administration. We want to say on July 1st there's X amount of million dollars...

CONAN FREUD: [interposing] Mm-hm.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: That is dedicated to Vision Zero and from that amount of money, X is coming from TLC; XY is coming from DOT because it is... you know, timeframe and money is critical for us to send a message to the whole city that we are entering into the Vision Zero as a new phase to improve safety in our streets.

CONAN FREUD: Absolutely. I mean I think the administration kind of shares that goal, and I think by July that you will see that.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

CONAN FREUD: Just right now we're still working out some of the details and also as I said, some of the things, at least in the TLC world, we can do you know within our existing resources and again, and also some of things we've also said are going to take longer than July because we're going to be doing pilot programs to explore new technology. We may not have all of those in place on July 1st, but we're going to be working with... we're working every day to get Vision Zero implemented as quickly as possible.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great and do other council members have questions? Council Member Vacca?

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I thank you, Chair Rodriguez. I'm going to get to the point very specifically. I have continuously been worried about cabs that drive our streets that are not cabs. I have brought this up many times. You give the number of 9,600 vehicles that you have seized who are operating without a TLC license.

CONAN FREUD: Mm-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Now, you give that number, but if you seized 9,600, what is your



1 estimate as to how many cabs are on the street  
2 pretending to be cabs that are not cabs? You've  
3 seized 9,600, so what is your estimate as to the  
4 extent of the problem we face in the city of New  
5 York? Now, before I get an answer, let me clarify  
6 my statement to you. Not only do these cars often  
7 not have TLC licenses, we have many individuals who  
8 determine that they are a taxi for the day. They  
9 often do not have driver's licenses. They often do  
10 not have insurance on their vehicles and the  
11 unsuspecting public or sometimes the public that  
12 maybe does suspect, but is in a rush to go to work;  
13 to go to their homes they take their lives in their  
14 hands too often in this city. These cars have got  
15 to be off the streets and these individuals have  
16 got to understand that we mean business, so back to  
17 my original question. You seize 9,600. What  
18 estimate does TLC have as to how many of these  
19 illegal cars; one type of illegality or another or  
20 variations of illegality, what is the extent of the  
21 problem in your estimation?

22  
23 CONAN FREUD: I don't think we have an  
24 exact number, but I do want to kind of walk back a  
25 little bit about the history of what we've been

doing. If you go back two, maybe three years ago, what would happen with TLC was that we were constrained on how many vehicles we could seize by the amount of pound space that the police would give us every day, and we would call the police up every day and we would... I mean they were very cooperative, but there were days where they just didn't have much pound space, so we could not seize a car that day. You know, there were days we had to stop seizing. We put out through a procurement process a contract for a tow vendor, who basically today gives us unlimited capacity. We can seize as many cars as we can; as we want. We don't have you know... so you know, when we go out there we try to get as many... as many vehicles as we can done. So that is how we were able to kind of move from the position where we were seizing 1,500 cars a year to close to 10,000 this past year. We still have not completely staffed up. We are about to hire I'm hoping in June another [chime] 60 inspectors, which will probably bring our force to about over 240, so I do think there's still more for us to do. I wouldn't try to hazard a guess exactly how many

more, but there's definitely business to happen;  
for us to do.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: And whatever the  
number is, you're saying to me, because this was an  
issue in the past...

CONAN FREUD: [interposing] Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: That we  
discussed in this committee.

CONAN FREUD: Mm-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: This was an  
issue that I experienced in my own district where  
when cars were seized we had no place to put them,  
so therefore, we seized less cars and then...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: And therefore,  
those cars remained on the street.

CONAN FREUD: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: So you're saying  
that we now have an unlimited capacity.

CONAN FREUD: Unlimited, mm-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay, that's  
good news. How long will it take you to hire up  
who you want to hire up? What is the process?

CONAN FREUD: Well...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: How many  
vacancies...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: I mean you know the...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: How many  
vacancies... how many vacancies are there and when  
will we be fully staffed so that this unit is going  
to be 100 percent up and running?

CONAN FREUD: No, you're never 100  
percent staffed because the day you hire everybody  
then someone leaves, so you know, that's sort of  
natural life, but we have about 54 vacancies today.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: 54 out of how  
many?

CONAN FREUD: Out of about 250 give or  
take.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: So we have a 20  
percent rate...

CONAN FREUD: [interposing] Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Of a...

CONAN FREUD: [interposing] We have a class of inspectors who we've... who've already passed the civil service exam who've already been sort of somewhat pre-cleared by DCAS who now need to get medically cleared and who need to have a psychological exam done on them, and then we're ready to start them.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: So money's in the budget.

CONAN FREUD: Money's in the budget; PAR is approved. We need to buy them uniforms and stuff, but they're ready to go, so we...

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [interposing]  
And one last question.

CONAN FREUD: Sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: The money you derive from penalties and fines that money is in the budget as well; you're anticipating that revenue?

CONAN FREUD: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay, thank you, Mr. Chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: A reminder to the colleagues, please stay within three minutes

1 because MTA is also coming very... and the other  
2 agencies. Given that only 400 medallions can be  
3 sold prior to the city receiving approval on  
4 Disability Accessible Plan from the state, can you  
5 describe to the committee what it is your next step  
6 of action would be to ensure that we are able to  
7 sell the remaining 1,600 authorized medallions?

9 CONAN FREUD: I mean the next step is  
10 to get the Disability Access Plan approved by the  
11 state, which we believe we can do by June, and then  
12 once that's approved you know, we know... we've  
13 done two auctions; we have another auction to go in  
14 March. We know how to... the mechanics of actually  
15 selling the medallions are... we have you know...

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But we will not  
17 be able to sell the 1,600 medallions.

18 CONAN FREUD: That's correct. We need  
19 to get the Disability Access Plan approved by the  
20 State Department of Transportation, yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So definitely  
22 we need to work harder because...

23 [crosstalk]

24 CONAN FREUD: Yes.

25 [crosstalk]

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 31

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You know this

3 is money...

4 [crosstalk]

5 CONAN FREUD: Absolutely.

6 [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: That was

8 already counting in our revenue for this coming

9 2015...

10 [crosstalk]

11 CONAN FREUD: For Fiscal Year '15...

12 [crosstalk]

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Fiscal Year.

14 [crosstalk]

15 CONAN FREUD: Yes, it's critical that

16 we get it done.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

18 Council Member Levin? 'Kay, Council Member Miller?

19 And also, I also wanted to recognize Council

20 Members Levin, Reynoso and Miller.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Good morning.

22 CONAN FREUD: Good Morning.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, good, you

24 were here about three weeks ago and we had touched

25 on some of these things here.

CONAN FREUD: [interposing] Mm-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I kind of want to revisit that one in particular, but I'll start out where our chair left off on the medallions, and forgive me for my tardiness if this is something that was already answered, but in terms of the percentages of medallions that are currently out, are they in... are the majority of them owned by individuals?

CONAN FREUD: No, the... the...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Or the...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: Actually the council has a law that was passed in 1937 called the Haas Act that says that 58 percent of the medallions can be owned by corporations... you know, it could be anybody can own them and...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing]  
Mm-hm.

CONAN FREUD: You don't have to drive those medallions and 42 percent have to be owner-driver, and when we sell new medallions we have to follow those percentages.



COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So right now that's where your numbers are, 58 and 42?

CONAN FREUD: Yes. No, no, we'll be there when we sell the next 32. We'll be at that then.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So the corporate number is where it should be, but the individual...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: Yes.

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Is a little below and...

CONAN FREUD: No, it's actually the other way around. The individual is higher 'cause we have a few more corporate to sell.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay.

CONAN FREUD: But just as anomaly, you know, until we sell the next round of corporate, then everything will be back in balance.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: In terms of the corporates, how many companies are involved here? Is there a specific... is it dominated by a specific number of companies or is it...

CONAN FREUD: There are...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: It's pretty general?

CONAN FREUD: 15 largely.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Do you have that number?

CONAN FREUD: I mean the... I have to... there are different holding companies, so it's kind of hard to tell, but there are I would say between 15 and 20 large corporate owners. Yeah, that's about right, yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, 'cause this is about budget, but there are certainly things about the industry that I am interested in...

CONAN FREUD: [interposing] Generally?

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: As it pertains to owner-operators; as it pertains to operators, non-owners and...

CONAN FREUD: [interposing] Mm-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Responsibilities that are placed on them making it almost impossible for them to earn living wages and

so as we move forward, I think that this should be part of the dialogue and...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: Absolutely.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So I would like to include that. So as I digress to go back to where we were three weeks ago when we talked about unregulated and untrained and often underground industry of dollar vans, which often ride in the outer boroughs of the city, particularly in Southeast Queens, where I represent. You have mentioned that you had a program and as you just indicated, that there was a pound; a new pound with additional space and that there was an opportunity for some seizure of [chime] illegal vehicles.

CONAN FREUD: Mm-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: We have over the last... I've been monitoring over the last two weeks and quite frankly, I have yet to see a vehicle or TLC enforcement out there. Could you give me numbers based on the vans and not the cars that we see?

CONAN FREUD: Vans in the 103rd?

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: That is correct.

CONAN FREUD: Okay, as through for the beginning of the fiscal year, we have seized 38 vans.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Could you give me the number of licensed vans in the city of New York?

CONAN FREUD: Licensed vans is probably around 200... 250.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: 250.

CONAN FREUD: That's right.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: How many vans do you think are on the street?

CONAN FREUD: A lot more than 250.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Right, in the tens of thousands throughout the city or thousands...

CONAN FREUD: [interposing] Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Throughout the city and only 250 are licensed and like...

CONAN FREUD: [interposing] Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: You guys need a much bigger pound.

CONAN FREUD: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, thank  
you.

CONAN FREUD: Thank you, Councilman.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: The outer  
borough taxi plan TLC already has sold 6,000,  
right, permits?

CONAN FREUD: We sold 6,000, yes. That  
is correct.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How much  
revenue did you raise with selling those 6,000?

CONAN FREUD: I believe it was \$13  
million, but I have to... my memory may not be 100  
percent.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, who  
bought those 6,000 other permits?

CONAN FREUD: The people who could buy  
those permits were some... the only people who were  
eligible to buy those permits were people who had  
for-hire vehicles licenses for the... remember the  
two class... there are two classes of outer borough  
permits. There are wheelchair accessible and non-  
wheelchair accessible, okay? For the wheelchair  
accessible you could only buy one permit per

2 person, okay? For the non-wheelchair accessible...  
3 for the wheelchair accessible you could only buy  
4 five.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 'Kay.

6 CONAN FREUD: They were...

7 [crosstalk]

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Who can buy? A  
9 driver, right?

10 CONAN FREUD: What?

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: A driver or  
12 someone that has a corporation.

13 CONAN FREUD: Could buy them?

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah.

15 CONAN FREUD: Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Who? Then who  
17 can buy those permits; the driver or a corporation  
18 can buy those?

19 CONAN FREUD: Either. But you can  
20 only...

21 [crosstalk]

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Are you sure?

23 [crosstalk]

24 CONAN FREUD: Buy one, yeah.  
25

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Isn't the permit also only created for a driver to buy?

CONAN FREUD: I mean the owner of the base could buy one if they had a license.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: If he's a driver, right?

CONAN FREUD: No, not necessarily.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But he can...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: But he can only buy one.

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Buy one. He can buy one.

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: Yeah, he can only buy one.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Right. What...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: So...

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]  
What...

CONAN FREUD: I don't know if any of them did. I mean they may have. I don't... I don't...

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: When are you looking to sell the other 6,000 that we can sell this year?

CONAN FREUD: I mean obviously that's something that we need a new chair to have a sort of dialogue with about...

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]  
Okay.

CONAN FREUD: When we're going to do that.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great and...

CONAN FREUD: [interposing] And also, we can't do it until June, so it's not something that we have to do today.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Exactly, June, yeah.

CONAN FREUD: Right. Yeah, we have... we only... the state law says we're only allowed 6,000 a year and once we've sold them out, then we have to wait 'til the next year starts. The clock starts on June 6th.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great and of course, we're looking to you know, have that dialogue and... and...



[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: Councilman...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I wanted to let you know so that you know this is going to be one of the hearings they're going to be calling very soon, is like to go over how the outer borough plan has been working and see areas that we can identify that still can be improved.

CONAN FREUD: Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And the waiting time to do inspections has been an issue in the past, right?

CONAN FREUD: Yes, it has been.

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It's still... it is an issue?

CONAN FREUD: Uhm...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: With drivers that they had to do the inspection?

CONAN FREUD: I think our inspection waiting time has been relatively stable. I'm trying to remember exactly. I mean we had a

significant increase in the number of inspections,  
but I think our waiting time was an hour. No, for  
the... at Woodside itself or waiting to get  
scheduled?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How many... and  
how many places can do the inspection?

CONAN FREUD: Oh, we only do the  
inspections in one central place, but are you  
talking about the waiting times to go through the  
inspection or the waiting time to get an  
appointment?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Both.

CONAN FREUD: Ah. [background voices]  
Yeah, it takes about 48 minutes to go through the  
inspection and that's been...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And to get...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: Relatively...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: To get the  
appointment? And to get...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: What?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And to get the appointment?

CONAN FREUD: To get an appointment you have to wait... [background voices] five days to get an appointment.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Look, I used to be a livery taxi driver, 'kay, and that's how I started in this country and I was once running Bailey Car Servicing, Carlie Car Servicing when I was at City College and at that time it was completely different. You know, you go Route 46 Jersey; \$1,400; you get one \$300 permit. You're ready to get a radio and get passengers. Today, we know it's much expensive, especially for people that they have a livery taxi driver just make like \$10,000, a \$10,000 investment. There's a lot of complaints that I get from many people that they need to do inspections and the time to get their appointment and also their waiting time. I believe that... and of course, like this is something I just hope that we can talk and see...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: Mm-hm.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How can we identify areas to improve.

CONAN FREUD: Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I believe that only having one location, as we have addressed this in the Committee of Transportation before, it's something that we believe that provides area to grow because we can identify all the locations where to do it. The other thing is that have you seen most of the inspections taking place in one particular period of time?

CONAN FREUD: No.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: No.

CONAN FREUD: The inspections we start at 5:15 in the morning and we go 'til about 5:30 in the afternoon.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And just...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: So...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Go like 365 days a year?

CONAN FREUD: No, we do it five days a week.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Is there any particular period of time of the year that there is more demand for inspection than others?

CONAN FREUD: Mid-February and April, end of May it's a little higher demand.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Why? Why is it? Because of...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: Uhm...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Insurance renovations too?

CONAN FREUD: Yeah. [background voice] Gary, come on up, come on. This is Gary Weiss. He's our Deputy Commissioner for Licensing and Raymond Scanlon is our Deputy Commissioner for Inspections and Enforcement. Gary, you want to go?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER WEISS: No, but I will.

CONAN FREUD: Go.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER WEISS: Primarily what happens is it's beginning around the beginning of February the insurance companies tend to start changing their insurance rates. States allow for

1  
2 certain types of changes to take place or certain  
3 resets to take place in that month. We generally  
4 see a 40 percent or 50 percent increase in the  
5 amount of requests to get new vehicles out on the  
6 road, which then increase... would then... relates  
7 to or ends up with an increase in the number of  
8 vehicle applications that come into the facility,  
9 usually a 40 percent increase over the three-month  
10 timeframe. That will push out the wait time for an  
11 inspection slightly, right 'cause there's a higher  
12 volume and there's only a limited amount of time  
13 that Woodside is open.

14 CONAN FREUD: But we also open on  
15 Saturdays when we need to, so when we have a rush  
16 we will open on Saturdays and we'll ask... you  
17 know, schedule people to come in on a Saturday.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Is there any  
19 possibility depending on the relationship that you  
20 have with the insurance company that we can work  
21 with them so that the insurance doesn't expire I  
22 guess necessarily between February and April?

23  
24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER WEISS: [off mic]  
25 Well, we can talk to them about that.

CONAN FREUD: We can talk to them, but I think that may be due to state regulations, not necessarily things that we can control, so it would have to be more of a discussion with us, the insurance companies and the State Department of Financial Services.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 'Kay, well, thank you and before letting you go, first I would like to invite TLC for a Town Hall meeting that with the leadership of the Speaker and my other colleagues we're going to be holding together about Vision Zero.

CONAN FREUD: [interposing] Okay.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And we'll be having one hearing per borough, and most likely the first one is going to be at the end of March in Manhattan and then we're going to the Bronx, Brooklyn and the idea is that we will get feedback from New Yorkers about Vision Zero and some idea of all the legislation we need to know how to make our city...

CONAN FREUD: [interposing] Okay.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Safer...

[crosstalk]

CONAN FREUD: okay.

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Than today, and also I would like to say thank you for all the hard work. I know that even though there's not a Commissioner in the agency, through your leadership and your team you've been doing a great job and I hope that we will continue working together.

CONAN FREUD: Thank you. It's all the team's good work. I'm just trying to help them move it along, but thank you very much.

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.  
Thanks.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So the next panel is Lois Tendler; Douglas Johnson; Steve... is that right? Is that right? [background voice] Berrang and Aaron Stern.

[Pause]

[background voices]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So the next section is a hearing with MTA, and we will hear from them their testimony and then we will get into



asking questions. And when you're ready, identify yourself, please.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: 'Kay. Hola. Good morning Chairman Rodriguez and the members of the City Council. I'm Douglas Johnson, the MTA Budget Director. Thanks for holding the hearing and inviting me and the group to testify here today. I'm joined by Aaron Stern, Director of the New York City Transit's Office of Management and Budget; Lois Tendler, New York City Transit's Vice president of Government and Community Relations and Steve Berrang on my far left, MTA Director of Capital Programs. We are here today at the council's invitation to discuss the Mayor's Fiscal Year 2014 Preliminary Budget, particularly as it relates to the city's contribution to the budget of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority.

The MTA just released its 2014 Budget and Financial Plan, which presents a fully transparent view of our current and four year financial outlook. Overall, the MTA has a \$13.5 billion operating budget for 2014, some \$885 million of which will be funded by New York City. The city's contribution is an important source of

funding representing 6.5 percent of the MTA's budget. City-sourced funding is used to support the operation of New York City Transit, MTA Bus, Staten Island Railway, as well as the support of commuter rail station sited within New York City. Additionally, the Mayor's 2014 budget proposes to allocate \$100 million to the MTA Capital Program. Let me give you the break-out of the \$885 million in operating funds from New York City: \$45 million, of which is for free or reduced school fares; \$14 million is for a reduced fare program for the elderly; \$153 million for paratransit, representing about one-quarter of its costs; \$90 million is for station maintenance at 36 commuter rail stations within New York City \$161 million is to pay the local match for state aid payments; \$390 million for the cost of MTA Bus and that's the agency created by the MTA to operate the former private bus lines, which was done at the city's request; finally, \$32 million to reimburse the MTA for the cost of the Staten Island Railway Operating Authority. These reimbursements are all very important to the MTA; however, it should be noted that they don't come close to covering the actual

cost of the transportation services provided to riders each and every day.

The city's investments in the MTA generate tremendous dividends. The MTA's subway, bus and commuter rail operations provide the foundation for the economic well-being of the city and the region. Countless jobs, educational opportunities and social mobility are available to the 8.5 million riders who use our services each and every day. Current ridership levels have reached all-time highs. Last year in a single day, we moved nearly six million customers on our subway system alone. That's more than any day since we started keeping daily records in 1985. Our transit network supports four times the employment and population density of the next largest U.S. city, and it's the engine that drives the most valuable real estate market in the nation. The \$1.4 trillion regional economy rides on the steel rails and rubber tires of the MTA transportation network.

Going back to our budget, MTA's 2014 Budget and Financial Plan strongly reaffirms our organization-wide commitment to cost cutting and it shows that we've already cut nearly \$1 billion out

of our annual operating budget, and here are just some of the things we're doing to make our organization more efficient, thereby reducing the upward pressure on fares, tolls, taxes and fees. We have refinanced \$6 billion of our long-term debt to capitalize on lower interest rates. We're using these savings of more than \$1 billion as a downpayment for our next Capital Program. In fact, we've increased annual pay-as-you-go funding by \$40 million a year on top of the \$80 million increase we originally anticipated in July for a total of \$370 million a year to be used for our next Capital Program. [chime] We're using greater than expected real estate revenues and unused general reserve funds. These are funds that are good news, but we consider them one shots and not necessarily likely to recur, and those are being used to pay down unfunded pension obligations that will save us \$15 million a year for the next 20 years. And after Hurricane Sandy, we're thinking creatively about how to protect our network and save money at the same time. About six month ago, we secured \$200 million of insurance protection through the capital markets to help pay for repairs in the event of a

storm similar to Sandy. The insurance was funded through catastrophe bonds, and our premiums are well below quotes we received this spring for additional property coverage, so we really thought outside of the box to try to save the MTA money.

But we're not finished. Our latest financial plan increases our savings targets by \$50 million this year, growing by an additional \$50 million annually to ultimately reach \$200 million in incremental annual savings by 2017. New savings initiatives are being identified in the areas of prompt payment discounts, workers compensation, energy management, consolidations, purchasing, inventory, and employee benefits. These initiatives are increasing our total annual savings target that currently we've reached \$1 billion a year in savings and those savings programs would grow to \$1.5 billion a year by 2017 with recurring costs savings thereafter.

Another key element of our plan is to address long-term costs like pensions, healthcare and debt service, areas that for many years have been viewed as beyond our control. In total, we expect costs in these three areas alone to increase

7.5 percent a year through 2017, at which time those costs in total will be \$1.5 billion a year higher than they are today, and that's even after we cut our paratransit costs by \$250 million a year through more aggressive management. They're still rising nine percent a year just based on volume expectations. At the same time, the costs we can control are projected to increase just 1.5 percent a year from 2013 to 2017, lower than the consumer price index. I'd like to add that our total cost growth between 2013 and 2014, including those formerly uncontrolled costs, was less than two percent.

Next, I want to point out that all of this work is making a real difference for our customers in a few important ways. Thanks to these savings, the plan projects a fare and toll increases of only four percent in 2015 and 2017, which is about the rate of inflation and about half of what had been projected in earlier plans. These savings have also helped us put dollars where everyone wants them, more and better service. Last year, we announced \$19 million in service enhancements and improvements, \$14 million of which

was for New York City Transit. [chime] In total, over the last two years, we've increased service enhancements by \$48 million MTA wide. \$32 million of that went to New York City Transit.

At the same time the MTA is investing in several areas designed to bring better service to our millions of daily riders. We are increasing the footprint of select bus service, completing the citywide deployment of bus time and moving forward with the purchase of new subway buses, cars and buses.

Our deployment of new technology communication devices is also moving forward. HelpPoint and On The Go! Travel Information Kiosks are just two examples of technology we have deployed to keep riders safe and informed. These additions to the city's transit system will ease commutes, speed trips and allow us to move more customers more efficiently.

The Financial Plan contains certain risks, however, most notable among them being labor costs. Contracts with the vast majority of labor unions within the MTA are open, and the MTA Financial Plan assumes that each new labor contract

1 will include three years of what we call net zero  
2 wage increases, meaning that we can give wage  
3 increases, but only if they're offset by  
4 productivity improvements or contributions to  
5 benefit costs. Any slippage in that achievement  
6 would result in a need to increase fares and tolls  
7 at a greater rate than currently anticipated or we  
8 would have to reduce critical funding for our  
9 Capital Program.  
10

11 In closing, I want to say a few words  
12 about our Capital Program. Prior to Hurricane  
13 Sandy, the MTA's five-year 2010 to 2014 Capital  
14 Program was about \$24 billion. Today, when you  
15 include repair and resiliency projects associated  
16 with the storm, the program increases to \$35  
17 billion. Bear in mind, the MTA's network is \$1  
18 trillion in assets and part of it are more than 100  
19 years old. That means our current Capital Program,  
20 even with all the Sandy projects, represents an  
21 investment back into the system of less than four  
22 percent of the system's total value over five years  
23 or less than one percent of reinvestment a year,  
24 quite a modest amount. We have four overachieving  
25 priorities for Capital investment. In order of



1  
2 priority, they are safety and security,  
3 reliability, service and system improvements and  
4 customer experience. With these priorities as a  
5 guide, we then invest capital funds in all of the  
6 indispensable components that keep New York moving;  
7 tracks, switches, pumps, lines, structures and  
8 thousands of components and systems that our  
9 customers never see.

10 This coming September we will present  
11 the 2015 to 2019 Capital Program to our board. It  
12 is expected that it'll be roughly the same size as  
13 our current Capital Program prior to the addition  
14 of the Sandy-related projects.

15 Again, thank you for inviting us here  
16 today and my colleagues and I will now be happy to  
17 answer any questions you may have.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

19 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: You're welcome.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: About the  
21 budget include a scale back fare and a toll  
22 increase in 2015 and in 2017 of four percent. Does  
23 scaling back as not as well do to improving  
24 financial conditions?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah, we had some improvements. We've had some additional expense reductions and we had additional increases in our real estate related revenues, and like I said, but those additional MTA efficiencies on the increment will allow us to in fact make those trimmings of the anticipated fare and toll increases assuming nothing else changes within our financial picture.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Where are we at this moment when it comes to the jointly owned building that the city and the MTA included as part of their revenue to sell some of those buildings?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Do you want to do it?

LOIS TENDLER: As you know, Chairman, we joined into an initiative with the city through its EDC, through the Economic Development Corporation. New York City Transit holds a lot of property pursuant to its master lease with the city, and that lease requires that if the property is no longer needed for transit purposes, it reverts back to the city. So we partnered with the city and EDC and put together a list of seven properties which the Transit Authority had no current use for and didn't foresee a future use and

1  
2 partnered with the city and I am pleased to report  
3 that three of their properties have... one is  
4 closed, one is going through a ULURP process and  
5 the third one is about to close as well. We have  
6 sold an abandoned substation on East 211th Street  
7 in the Bronx. We have a deal on a piece of  
8 property that's at... on Houston Street between  
9 Broadway and Crosby and we have another deal on  
10 property that's adjacent to our Gun Hill Bus Depot  
11 up in the Bronx and we've gotten good money for  
12 them. We continue... the other four properties are  
13 in different stages of being marketed and hopefully  
14 sold.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How many  
16 properties are we talking about?

17 LOIS TENDLER: Well, those are seven  
18 properties in that project. We also are entering  
19 into... we're looking to sell a ground lease for  
20 our Madison Avenue properties, 341, 345 and 347  
21 Madison Avenue and that's an ongoing process. And  
22 we keep... and as we identify more properties.  
23 Another property that wasn't part of those seven  
24 was 370 Jay Street and that property now belongs to  
25 NYU-Poly.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: One of my suggestions to the MTA, and I know that you're willing... you have to include many players from the Mayor, MTA, the Governor, is to look at the development of the rail yard at 207th Street. That rail yard at 207th is larger than the Hudson Yard, so if your project development division or whatever division the MTA has, we can look at the potential and of course, what I look at is if we put a platform you can develop from affordable housing to economic development and I think... as I say, it's larger than the Hudson Yard and I think that being close to the Beacon and central to traffic also it can provide some opportunity for developers that also... to look at that opportunity and also to allow also to give MTA more revenue so that we can always work hard trying to scale back some of those fare increases.

LOIS TENDLER: We're happy to look at it. I mean yards present unique challenges because of security issues, but we're happy to look at it.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, the select bus services... what is the timeframe? When do we anticipate that we will be expanding the

select bus services? I know that the Mayor is committed. Mayor de Blasio has said that he wanted to work with MTA so that we can add an additional 20 bus select services. Why don't you...

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: Okay, as you might know, we currently have six select bus service routes up and running and we will add a seventh one, the M60, which travels across 125th Street to LaGuardia Airport. We expect to begin that service later this spring. We've been working closely with DOT, which is our partner in the SBS creation and running them. We're beginning... we, a couple years ago, did a Phase II study to identify the next round of SBS routes. We're working with DOT to refine those routes. You know, it's a lot of the devil's in the details. It's not... you know, we just don't draw a line on a map and have SBS. I mean you have to order the machines; you have to do street work; bus lanes can only be painted when the weather allows, so it's... 20 is an ambitious goal in the next four years, but we're happy to try to make it.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

LOIS TENDLER: And there are also funding implications, so it costs us money; it costs DOT money, but we're working with DOT and we will reengage the community on where we think the next best routes are for Phase II and we'll be sharing that with the council as well.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay and the East Side access started with I believe a \$4 billion project to be done in 2009. I think that the project right now is around \$10 billion, 2020 or 2021.

STEVE BERRANG: The East Side access project is currently...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Can you please identify yourself?

STEVE BERRANG: I'm Steve Berrang. I'm the Director of Capital Program Management for the MTA. The East Side access project is currently going through a risk assessment and reexamination of its budget and schedule. When we talked to our board in January, we gave a range from 2021 to 2023 for completion of the project and a range for the budget that was you know around \$10.1 to \$10.7

1 billion. We're working to refine both the schedule  
2 and the budget range and we hope to report back to  
3 our board in the next few months on that.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So okay, great.  
5 So definitely this is one of the topics that we  
6 would like to talk and potentially like to also  
7 hold a hearing in the future because you know, and  
8 I know that it's a big project, but that delay from  
9 moving in from 2009 to any...

10 STEVE BERRANG: It's a range of dates  
11 from 2021 to 20...

12 [crosstalk]

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah.

14 [crosstalk]

15 STEVE BERRANG: 23.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, 'kay.  
17 And what about the amount of money? How did we  
18 move from \$3 billion to I believe it's now \$10  
19 billion?

20 STEVE BERRANG: Well, as I said, it's  
21 undergoing a risk assessment right now and the  
22 range of budgets that we've to our board about is  
23 between \$10 and \$10.7 billion and we hope to finish  
24 that risk assessment and fully understand the  
25

implications of it and report back to the board in the next few months on the total cost of the project.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But how it was moved from three to 10?

STEVE BERRANG: Well, you know it's... the last...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 'Cause we're not talking about millions. We're talking about a billion dollars.

STEVE BERRANG: Well, it's a project that has taken place over a long period of time and time is money is the construction world; that's one thing. Secondly, as we had bid projects contracts have come in a lot higher than we expected and so you know, it's cost us more money to do the civil work; the signals work; the power work that we originally projected when we started this project.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 'Kay, what is a risk assessment?

STEVE BERRANG: A risk assessment is you look at the project and its implementation, you identify potential challenges that might be out



1  
2 there, and then you assign a probability to that  
3 and there's a cost associated with that and you  
4 know, and you determine what the likelihood of that  
5 risk coming to fruition is and then you know, the  
6 cost associated with that then is determined to be  
7 added to the budget, and you try to mitigate those  
8 risks. You take actions to you know, to try to  
9 mitigate the risk through either how you are  
10 managing the contract or your procurement strategy.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How did the 2nd  
12 Avenue subway change when figured? What number did  
13 we start at and what number is projected?

14 STEVE BERRANG: I don't know what it  
15 was when it originally started, but the current  
16 budget is \$4.451 billion and it's been at that  
17 level for a number of years.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, but now I  
19 assume that again, if we... I do understand that a  
20 project will always be moved as to the date to be  
21 completed and to be extended. There's always going  
22 to be some increase, but you open a lot of  
23 questions when something is moved from three...  
24 three something, right; from three to 10.  
25

STEVE BERRANG: Well, the East Side access the last budget that we had was closer to \$9 billion when we... and so it hasn't been \$3 billion for quite some time. \$3 billion probably dates back 15 years ago. It hasn't... you know, it's been in the \$7 to \$8 billion range in the last four or five years and so this is an increase, but it's not an increase from \$3 billion. It hasn't been \$3 billion for quite some time.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But it started with \$3 billion.

STEVE BERRANG: Maybe 15 years ago.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, 15 years. Like percentage like what's the period that it started? So let's say it was 15 years old to be completed 2009 at \$3 billion and now it's moved to \$9 billion, almost \$10, 2021.

STEVE BERRANG: It's in the \$10 billion range and we have a '21 to '23 range for completion. We hope to nail that down shortly, but as I said, you know, over time things cost more money and time is money in construction and that is basically the main reason for the change. You

know, the \$3 billion number was... it's quite out of date, to be quite honest.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I got it, but you know, if you're talking about our grandfathers; you know, people who like 40 years ago started with \$3 billion and now we expect that the \$3 billion will now be moving to \$9 billion. I don't understand it. By a project that 15 years ago was scheduled to be in 2009 to be done with \$3 billion; moving that project to 2021 for \$10 billion is a huge difference.

STEVE BERRANG: I agree. It is a big difference, yes.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, so my last question before I call my colleagues is about the Long Island Railroad strike issue. [background voices] I would like to get an update about what is...

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: The conversation going on; like...

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: We had one Presidential Emergency Review Board ruling that we are absolutely rejecting. We can't afford that ruling. We have petitioned... we'll be doing a second... it's called a PERB Board and there'll be a second set of... it's not really an arbitration, but it's a recommendation that they will issue and that's something that will be happening in the next couple of months, so at this point there's no planned strike or anything if that's what you're worried about.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: What is... do you have any plans in case that strike would take place since millions of people will be affected?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well, at this point we're not anticipating that. Right now, we're preparing for that second Emergency Review Board. At that point... the earliest the strike could even happen at that point would be July I believe. At this point, we're not planning anything. We're hoping to resolve... we're hoping to resolve you know, this with the unions themselves you know, in the due process that we're undergoing.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. So thank you, and now I'm going to be calling my colleague. I'm going to be extending from three minutes to five so that we have enough time to ask all the questions. Council Member Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I first want to thank the MTA. Especially during Sandy, the MTA performed very well; admirably and I thank you for your communication with me and my office; Lois especially, Rob Marino and all have been great. But you know, I'm a straphanger, so I take the train here 95 percent of the time and I have to tell you something; that the delays have become a little much. I was delayed again today on the 6. We just sat there at Hunts Point Station and the train did not move. Now, take away the winter we've had, because in 2014 we've had a terrible winter, but there was a survey done concerning the delays. Average monthly delays in 2013 increased 28.3 percent compared to the prior year. December alone saw 36,485 delays, a nearly 60 percent increase from December of 2012. Now, there are a variety of reasons why we've had these delays, and I do note that the predominance

1 of the delays happened on the 4, 5, 6 trains in my  
2 borough of the Bronx, surprise, surprise, and we  
3 are transit starved neighborhoods. We are out in  
4 the far reaches of the city. We depend on good  
5 train service. Even with good train service, it  
6 takes us 60 minutes to get to Manhattan. That's  
7 how far out some of our neighborhoods are in the  
8 borough. So I need to know what is our plan of  
9 action to reduce the number of delays and get us  
10 back on track? No pun intended.

12 LOIS TENDLER: Alright, let me take a  
13 stab at this. The numbers you cited were in the  
14 paper I guess *amNewYork* this morning and they come  
15 from reports we, the New York City Transit, make to  
16 our board every month. Yes, they've gone up. Yes,  
17 we're paying attention. Yes, we're watching it.  
18 Yes, the weather has impacted it. The one thing  
19 that was buried in the story, which I would just  
20 like to highlight, is that what has not... if  
21 delays have increased, what has not deteriorated is  
22 the measure of wait assessment, and wait assessment  
23 is the measure that is most meaningful to our  
24 customers because it's the measure of how long it  
25 is between trains coming to pick them up. For our

1 customers waiting on a platform it's more important  
2 that a train come every four minutes and that it  
3 arrive at its terminal on time, so I just wanted to  
4 make that distinction. I would also say that you  
5 know, the increase in delays just supports our  
6 argument for a robust Capital Plan. As I think  
7 Doug said in his testimony, it's 100-year old  
8 system, which we totally underinvest in terms of  
9 its maintenance and its upgrade, but you have to...  
10 the guys who run the subways spend a lot of time  
11 looking at the cause of every delay, whether it was  
12 preventable or not. And as I just said... my  
13 colleague just shared with me that the 6 was  
14 delayed this morning because a train had brakes in  
15 emergency... well, there's... a train went into  
16 brakes in emergency along the line. So yeah, we...  
17 you know... our president tortures our senior vice  
18 president of subways, who tortures his guys about  
19 what happened this morning, so we are very aware  
20 and we're trying lots of different strategies to  
21 reverse the trend.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: One thing that  
24 the article cited was the overcrowding that exits  
25 on the 4, 5, 6 and I can attest to it. Now, I know

1 we need a more supportive Capital Plan for the MTA,  
2 and certainly we will fight with you for it, but  
3 what can we do in the intervening period because  
4 the overcrowding on the 4, 5, 6 is unbelievable.  
5 When I leave here sometimes at 5:00 to go back to  
6 the Bronx, I have to have trains pass me by. We  
7 literally cannot even relegate... we even... we  
8 cannot even become the sardines we are often. I  
9 don't get the privilege to be a sardine. I cannot  
10 get in the train at 5:00 on the 4, 5, 6. So what  
11 do we do in the meantime?

12 LOIS TENDLER: You know...

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [interposing]  
14 It's not fair to us. It's not...

15 [crosstalk]

16 LOIS TENDLER: Well...

17 [crosstalk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Fair to the  
19 Bronx.

20 LOIS TENDLER: The Lex Line, as you all  
21 know, and the rationale; one of the rationales for  
22 building 2nd Avenue subway is that the Lex Line  
23 is... on a good day the Lex Line is overcrowded.  
24 You can just fit so many trains through the line.  
25



1  
2 When you have a hiccup; when you have a brakes into  
3 emergency; when you have a sick passenger it causes  
4 delays down the line. I mean we're using platform  
5 conductors; we're trying to clear delays as quickly  
6 as possible; we are doing counts. It's been a  
7 very, very rough winter for us, and I see it in my  
8 own commute. You know, trains are more crowded;  
9 people are more bundled up, but nobody wants to be  
10 outside. So you know, but the Lex Line we can  
11 just run as many trains as we can run. Our job is  
12 to run them as best we can and we try to do that  
13 every day.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Can we run more  
15 trains? Is there...

16 [crosstalk]

17 LOIS TENDLER: No.

18 [crosstalk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Any way we can  
20 do anything differently than what we're doing now?  
21 Are we at capacity when it comes to service  
22 because...

23 LOIS TENDLER: [interposing] On the Lex  
24 Line yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: On the 4, 5, 6  
there's...

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: Yes.

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Nothing that can  
be done at all.

LOIS TENDLER: You know, there's  
nothing in the short-term. I mean ultimately, the  
2nd Avenue subway will take pressure off of the  
Lex, but ultimately, [chime] capacity in this  
system can most be effective by upgrading the  
signal systems, so as we did with the Yellow Line,  
which was our first line to get CBTC communication-  
based train control, that investment not only  
allows us to run a more reliable service, it allows  
us to run more trains. We are in the process...  
and painfully, with Council Member Van Bramer and  
his constituents in installing CBTC on the 7 Line.  
That will allow us at the end of the day... which  
is 2017. That will allow us at the end of the day  
to run more trains on the 7 Line, so ultimately, in  
terms of capacity on lines that are maxed out now,  
CBCT is the best hope for more, so.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 75

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: When is that coming for the 4, 5, 6?

LOIS TENDLER: I couldn't...

[crosstalk]

COUBNCIL MEMBER VACCA: There's no plan.

LOIS TENDLER: I couldn't even give you a date.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well, we need to be given a priority. We are the most overcrowded lines in the city and the MTA acknowledges that. Why is there no plan for it?

LOIS TENDLER: Well, because we believe that the situation on the Lexington Avenue Line is abated with the opening of 2nd Avenue subway.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well, when is...

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: Uhm...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: That... but... but...

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: That's 2016.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: If 2016. That project...

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: That's 2016.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: That project's been delayed for so many years...

LOIS TENDLER: [interposing] That's not... yes, the fourth time; the fourth start it was delayed like over decades, but we've been keeping pretty close to the schedule that we started with when we broke ground on this iteration of the project in '07.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Rosenthal?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And thank you, Council Member Rodriguez, for holding this important budget hearing. I really appreciate it. It's nice to see you. Thanks for coming today. I have a couple of questions. I'm wearing different hats, so I'm going to start with... also I'm on the Finance Committee, so I'm going to start with that hat. You mentioned a variety of savings that you've implemented that gets you to \$200 million

1 over the span of four years and the way you've...  
2 in your testimony, you talked about it sort of \$50  
3 million annually, and I'm sure that's an average of  
4 ups and downs, but does that imply it starts in  
5 Fiscal Year '14, which is right now? So you've  
6 implemented a bunch of things now that have gotten  
7 you savings and that'll be continued to be  
8 implemented every year? Is that how that works?

9 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: We always strive to  
10 have recurring savings.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Right.

12 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: You know, if it's  
13 fares and tolls give us recurring revenues; expense  
14 increases that impact our baseline are recurring,  
15 so we focus on recurring savings programs, so when  
16 I talked about the \$1 billion growing to \$1.5  
17 billion, those are, in fact, baselined and  
18 inclusive and included within our financial plan  
19 projections. When we were trying to figure out how  
20 do we, in fact, reduce the fare and toll, which  
21 admittedly, we think the 7.5 percent we realized  
22 was very difficult for our customers, so we said if  
23 we could get that down to something closer to  
24 inflation. We had some positive things coming in  
25

with... we had done... you know, some expenses were a little lower; some of our revenues. Even the past year in toll revenues we're doing a little bit better, but like I said, the real estate revenues are doing significantly better, so our...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Right.

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Our internal thought was what else can we do besides that which we've already accomplished in terms of expense reductions, so that's where we came up with that 50/100, the increment. It was a 50, you know, incrementally...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Sure.

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Growing to 200. We have concepts behind that you know, which I mentioned, where we had the prompt payments discounts; the workers comp; energy demand; the consolidations.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL:

[interposing] I saw those.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: All those things that we described. Due to... at this point, they may not... they're to increase. Of course, when you implement programs, you have delays and the savings tend to ramp up over time. We will, however, meet our targets even if it means doing other... even if it's broad... you know, broad based cuts, but we're...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: 'Kay.

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Going to meet our expense targets.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: God bless you.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: A lot of that...

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL:  
[interposing] I hope you do.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah, well...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I...

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Thanks.

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That's great.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I don't have a problem with it. So now with my contracts hat on, if you have Best Practices in there that you think would be applicable to other agencies could possibly Miss Tendler follow up with me on those?

LOIS TENDLER: Sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Sure, and by the way, we're in the process of looking at... at doing a procurement MTA wide consolidation, so we're actually studying and doing things that we think will overall reduce our costs and be part of that 50/100/150 sequence.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Could you please invite me to some of those meetings? I'd...

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Oh.

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Really be interested in learning...

[crosstalk]



DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Sure.

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: More.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I don't have the authority to do that, but I will make that recommendation. [laughter]

LOIS TENDLER: I do and we'd be happy to.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: You're welcome.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And then in terms of the financial impact of Superstorm Sandy, one thing that jumped out at me was the billion that you're expecting to come from insurance coverage. Has any of that come in to date?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Uhm...

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: How is that going? And again, the reason I'm asking is because many institutions like NYCHA buildings are having troubles getting insurance companies to pay and if you have had some successes for some reason; again, I'm hoping to share Best Practices; or are you having problems as well?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I don't think there's problems. I think that an insurance company is going to make sure that the claims are legit and obviously they don't want to pay out on claims that they don't think are valid. At this point, we've received approximately \$144 million in insurance, but that's an ongoing process. I'd be happy to get you more detailed information on that, but that's...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: What...

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: What we've received to date.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So \$144 million of the \$1 billion in claims.

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: \$1 billion, that's exactly correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And when you put in those claims in your budget, did you put it in as a one shot or did you do \$200 million...

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Uhm...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: A year for five years?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: We had it spread out. I don't recall the exact spread, but we certainly did not expect to get that money right up front. You know, and of course, we have different capital funding you know placement.

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So I'm guessing that Council Member Treyger might follow up with you about that.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: 'Cause he's very [chime] concerned. Can I just ask... with permission? I wanted to follow up on the chair's questions about the East Manhattan Access Capital project and the jump from whatever billions to \$10 billion. You know, a billion here, a billion there, pretty soon it starts to add up and you have real money. Could we just go from... could you guys do a report back to the chair to this committee that trails from the \$8 billion to the

\$10 billion and sort of what the important pieces were that got you there?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] \$3 billion, yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well, so the chair would like you to go back to \$3 billion. So there you go, but if you hone in on the eight to 10, just so we have the most recent jumps; you know, the numbers that you're familiar with working with. Why... I mean a billion dollars; even a billion is... could pay for a lot of UPK and after school programs, so it'd be interesting to see why those jumps have occurred.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: We'll be happy to do that.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, great, thanks and then my last question has to do with minority and women-owned businesses. Can you give me a sense of both for the expense and for the capital budget how many contracts you have that are minority women-owned business and the dollar amount for expense and capital for whatever fiscal years you have?

LOIS TENDLER: I... yes, if you'll just give me a second to find it. Our goal was 20 percent on the contracting end and we exceeded our goal for 2013 to 20...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Of course you did.

LOIS TENDLER: With 22 percent.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yes!

LOIS TENDLER: And I think if I could just find it I can tell you how many contracts are covered by that. But we do have it somewhere here. Sorry. I already have these on this one. I'm sorry.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Do you want to get back to me afterwards?

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: Sure, sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: There are other council members...

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: Yeah, I have...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That want to ask questions. Thank you very much.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very much, Mr. Chairman and thank you all for joining us this morning. I just had a couple of questions and I apologize. I was in the other room, so this may have been asked already, but we had a hearing at the Transportation Committee last week on the Mayor's proposed Vision Zero Plan, talking about various city agencies; what the Mayor would like or DOT would like to see happen in those city agencies, including the TLC, DOT; ways in which they are interrelated, responsibilities that each have individually and then in a coordinated fashion. MTA was conspicuously absent from that document. Can you explain to us was the MTA approached to be part of Vision Zero? If so, did the MTA decline to be part of Vision Zero and are there costs associated with that? And then I have a follow up question on that.

LOIS TENDLER: Okay, so I don't know exactly when the report came out, but I do know that President Bianco and Commissioner Trottenberg have had discussions and both are cognizant of the

fact that the MTA asked to be part of the discussion and we're happy to be at the table. So we will be working with the city on implementing Vision Zero and seeing what our role is and how best we could help accomplish those goals. We're happy to be there.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And in an official way so like when they revise the Vision Zero document it'll actually as one of the agencies like...

LOIS TENDLER: [interposing] Well, you know I mean the truth...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: MTA?

LOIS TENDLER: The truth of the matter is, Councilman, we're not a city agency, so I can't answer that question. I'm not sure what the scope of that document is, but we do expect to and welcome the opportunity to partner with the city on this endeavor. As to whether or not there are budget costs, I mean hard to believe that there wouldn't be, but it's hard to know what they are until you know what the recommendations are.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, so I'm going to throw one out right now actually.

LOIS TENDLER: Okay, I... okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Uhm...

LOIS TENDLER: [interposing] I think I know what it is.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So there was a... there's a fatality in my district this past Friday night. A 21-year old woman was killed when she was struck by a city bus, and one measure that... and I'm not saying that it necessarily would've been prevented by this type of measure, but one measure that other cities have adopted, including Los Angeles and Chicago and Washington D.C., are S-1 Gards on the rear right wheels of their city bus fleets. Why... is the MTA considering retrofitting our city buses with S-1 Gards and how much would the cost associated with that be? And that's the question.

LOIS TENDLER: Actually we are aware of S-1 Gards and we years ago had conversations with their manufacturer and ultimately, we think they don't work for us, and I'm not the person... the best person to explain that, but I'm happy to



1  
2 arrange such a briefing for you. We think that  
3 they would not help guard the kinds of accidents  
4 we've been seeing. It has to do with right and  
5 left and what we've been seeing on the road, so we  
6 are aware of it. We did look at it. I know we  
7 spoke to the manufacturer a couple of years ago.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Mm-hm.

9 LOIS TENDLER: We're happy to continue  
10 a conversation I mean, but we just don't think that  
11 it works for us.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, do... I  
13 think what I would be interested in seeing is a  
14 cost estimate from the MTA of what it would cost to  
15 retrofit...

16 LOIS TENDLER: [interposing] But I just  
17 want to make a...

18 [crosstalk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: City buses...

20 [crosstalk]

21 LOIS TENDLER: Point...

22 [crosstalk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: With...

24 LOIS TENDLER: I think our logic and  
25 our reasoning was not dependant on cost. I'm happy

to you know, figure out what it would cost, but that wasn't why we didn't pursue it.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Understood, but I'm drawing it back into the...

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: Mm-hm.

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Hearing context and I would like to see kind of what the cost would be associated with it.

LOIS TENDLER: Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So that we can just have an informed conversation on it.

LOIS TENDLER: Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: One other thing that I would... in kind of a related matter that I would like to see is perhaps... and this is also going to be related to the budget, is increased training for bus drivers and we've had you know, numerous incidents, and just most recently the other day and so I think that that would be something that we heard a lot from... that came out of our hearing last week, is that in particular additional training for MTA bus drivers around

failure to yield issues and speed issues [chime]  
and other things. I know that there is extensive  
training, but I think that maybe additional  
training is warranted and that resources should be  
provided to make that happen.

LOIS TENDLER: We will look into that.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you.

Thanks.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer?

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you  
very much. Lois, I know you're thinking I'm going  
to start with the 7 train, but I'm going to start  
with the East Side Access, so... [laughter]

LOIS TENDLER: Always full of  
surprises, Councilman.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I do want  
to piggyback on what Council Member Rodriguez and  
Council Member Rosenthal were asking. As some of  
you know, I overlook the East Side Access project  
at Sunnyside and see it from my window. So we live  
it every day, so the announcement that it's going  
to take several more years obviously is not greeted  
very warmly by folks in Sunnyside. So you've

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 0
- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 0
- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5

9  
0  
1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6

7  
8

9

20  
21  
22

23

24

25

that we have going on; these are the future activities; these are the you know, potential problems that we could face and this is the percentage likelihood and then you know, the cost associated with that. So it's a forward looking exercise. It's not...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So...

[crosstalk]

STEVE BERRANG: Backwards.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Right and is the forward looking exercise meant to curtail or minimize delays and cost increases?

STEVE BERRANG: Correct, because what follows on a risk assessment is a mitigation. You know...

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER:

[interposing] Right.

STEVE BERRANG: And the numbers that we're talking about are unmitigated risks that...

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER:

[interposing] Right.

STEVE BERRANG: You know we are assigning to the project and so we will then look

for solutions to minimize the impact of that and that will hopefully bring down the cost.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: But if you follow that logic, then your prior risk assessments did not work or they failed, right, because if it's a forward looking exercise and it's meant to see problems up ahead that minimize cost overruns and delays and you said you've done a few risk assessments previously, but then the net result was even more delays and even greater cost overruns in the billions. So I guess my question is what effect if any are these risk assessments having and why should we believe that this one will be any different and that the 2021 or 2023, whatever you've come up with, is going to be real and this \$10.7 billion price tag is going to be real? The risk assessments in the past didn't work I take it.

STEVE BERRANG: Well, as I said, the risk assessments in the past have been on a contract by contract basis, and so this is a project-wide risk assessment 'cause it's looking at the activities going forward. We're hopeful that you know, these will be successful with this and that the mitigations that we've proposed and

introduced will bring down the cost and bring the schedule in. A risk assessment is an art; it's not a science. You know, it's people who are construction experts, engineers, architects, signal engineers, et cetera getting together you know, looking at what's coming forward; producing a list of challenges that they face; that we think we face and what the cost of that and then the likelihood and then assigning a percent you know, of a cost to that and so it's not a mathematical exercise. It's a... like I said, it's an art, not a science.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Sure, but the math is important.

STEVE BERRANG: Well, that's true, absolutely.

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Pretty important I would think. So I get the complexity of the project probably more than most. I probably know more about East Side Access than most laypeople because we're so intimately married to it in my neighborhood, but it is disturbing that such a large and important project continues to suffer from these enormous, enormous delays in both time

and money and in speaking to that issue, I think you said labor equals cost or something. There's obviously a direct correlation, right, between the cost overruns and the labor, so...

[crosstalk]

STEVE BERRANG: No, I said...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Is this...

[crosstalk]

STEVE BERRANG: I said time is money and so yeah, taking more time to do a project...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Sure.

[crosstalk]

STEVE BERRANG: Costs more.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: And one of the reasons that time is money is because we're talking about [background voices] the labor, right?

STEVE BERRANG: Correct, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: And so is the cost overrun really driven by this time continuously [chime] changing and why does the time continuously change that?



STEVE BERRANG: The cost overrun at the time is factor in the cost increase. It's not the only factor. There's third party contracts that are bid. One of our larger contracts came in significantly over budget and we have to... we you know, broke it up into three contracts in an attempt to continue to advance the project, minimize the impact on the schedule and to lower the cost, so it's a multi-faceted challenge and there are lots of opportunities to focus on all those different challenges. It's not one single... it's not a really single source problem. It's a different aspect of it.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Well, I know my time is up and I know we look forward to the report of \$3 billion to \$10.7 billion and if there's a second round I'll come back 'cause I know Lois would be disappointed if I didn't ask her some questions. [laughter]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Mm-hm. Good morning and thank you for coming out. Mr. Johnson, here we are again. So we could... I'm all over the place. Labor cost was out there; service; capital goods and we could probably start with and talk

about risk assessment. That's a good segue into labor costs, right? And we talked about... as I go through your summary, we look at the cost of the interest arbitrations as per...

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So I want to go all the way back to the Zuccotti award and how many of the MTA labor unions have arbitrated that same issue up until this point?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: As of right now, we have one signed agreement with the PEB. We've had a couple of arbitrations where there's like the supervisors and several union that tend to follow the TWU pattern and we had assumed in our financial plan that instead of getting the four, four and the three, they would get... in the three-year contract, they, in fact, got a four, four... we assumed a four, four and a zero. That was our bargaining position and that's what we assumed in our financial plan. In a couple instances, we've gone... we've had a couple of rulings where it was a four, four and a three.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So... so...

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: [interposing] Which we actually recognized recently in the... I can't read that... in the February Financial Plan we...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So...

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Stated that...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Again, how many exactly arbitrations have we... have you engaged in since the Zucchotti and obviously following that pattern where those bargaining units were looking for the same money?

AARON STERN: I'm Aaron Stern, the Operating Budget Director for New York City Transit. So there have been two arbitrations. One arbitration covered [chime] the ATU unions, the locals that represent Staten Island and Queens, Department of Bus.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Mm-hm.

AARON STERN: Hourly employees.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: With the conclusion of that arbitration, all hourly employees received the TWU pattern increase.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Uh-huh.

AARON STERN: Recently, as Doug referenced, the arbitration was concluded that covered the SSSA and TSO bargaining unit that covers over 98 percent of the supervisory employees.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So that's four. It still counts.

AARON STERN: For the two... so there were two arbitration proceedings covering four bargaining units that essentially covers over 98 percent and then the...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Then the MTA bus? MTA bus 1,179?

AARON STERN: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Mm-hm.

AARON STERN: So... I don't... I'm not sure where they are. They...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: It's over. They got the same contract as well. My point is we talked about risk assessment. Why do you keep arbitrating the same thing you lost in 2009? Do

you think at some point that you're going to get a different decision and what is the cost of you doing that?

AARON STERN: I think that's a debate that could... that could be had...

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah, that's probably not...

[crosstalk]

AARON STERN: Our board sets our labor policy...

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: [interposing] Yeah.

AARON STERN: So...

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: That's not... we're really not here to answer policy questions.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: It's not a policy question.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: It's a...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: It's a fiscal question.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well, the question...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Do you share costs associated with that?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: We, of course, share costs associated with that, yes.

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Exactly.

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Hiring...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So why do you keep... do you expect different results?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well, we do, in fact, expect different results and we think that...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So good, that would...

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: We think that we have a reasonable argument and we think that...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So how many times did you have this same reasonable argument is my question.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well, Aaron answered that question. We...

AARON STERN: I think the... the...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing]  
Six?

AARON STERN: I... there were two arbitration proceedings and they came to the same decision, but I think the important point is this issue is essentially over. The cost associated with that arbitration decision...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing]  
So it's over? You have no... so you have no one else within the MTA looking to absorb that same pattern?

AARON STERN: As I said, over 99 percent of...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing]  
And that would include also the Bridge and Tunnel Offices? They're not looking for the same pattern?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yes, they're looking for the same pattern.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Oh, okay, so...

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah, that's in arbitration now.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Oh, okay, so at what... what was the total cost to that?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: This...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Those arbitrations up at Proskauer Rose, how much money did you spend?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I'd have to get back to you on that. I don't have that with me.

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yeah, we really want to know that. We want to know you keep spending money on that.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: It seems to be an exercise in futility. So anyway, we've gone from capital... I'm sorry, we're going to go over to the capital side now and my question is on the transit side is the majority of the capital funding being spent on the 2nd Avenue subway number 7 extension? [chime]

STEVE BERRANG: No, Transit's 10 to 14 Capital Program is about \$12 billion.



COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing]  
Mm-hm.

STEVE BERRANG: And 7 West is outside  
of the MTA Capital Program. It's being funded by  
the city and 2nd Avenue subway is in a separate  
budget. It's \$4.5 billion. It...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing]  
So what does that \$12 billion include?

STEVE BERRANG: \$12 billion includes  
rolling stock, so that's subway cars, buses, track  
work, statement...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Buses?

[crosstalk]

STEVE BERRANG: Work. Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Uh...

[crosstalk]

STEVE BERRANG: ...work.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Could we stop  
there?

STEVE BERRANG: Sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Because I  
represent Southeast Queens, which Bob Bartner has  
the longest commute into the city anywhere in the

1  
2 city, including Staten Island because of the lack  
3 of buses and the lack of infrastructure. Does that  
4 Capital Plan include the Jamaica Depot upcoming  
5 that you're anticipating?

6 STEVE BERRANG: I'm not sure that  
7 there's any work right now at the Jamaica Depot,  
8 but we're buying 2,400 buses in the 10 to 14  
9 Capital Plan.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So let's see  
11 where the buses... where we are in the bus  
12 situation currently. I know that this... since  
13 January 1 and I understand we had a freeze the  
14 first week and I don't understand the logic or I  
15 would anticipate that we'd have a more aggressive  
16 maintenance campaign to keep the buses from being  
17 outside and so that we don't have more than 50  
18 buses where the lines freeze up and 50 buses  
19 amounts to thousands of people being left on the  
20 street, but the fact of the matter is every day I  
21 get that phone call. Every day I know that we are  
22 lacking in buses in terms of equipment. Buses are  
23 being transferred from borough to borough and all  
24 over the place and we've been hearing this for  
25

about two years now, so when are we anticipating new equipment to service these communities?

AARON STERN: Well, let me just respond to the service levels. So each month, as part of our board reporting, we report our vital operating statistics, so Department of Buses has consistently met its goal of actually completing over 99 percent of all scheduled trips, so it is not true that... we do not have a shortage of buses.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay.

AARON STERN: Now it's true that we've had...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Mm-hm.

[background voice] No, that's okay, good.

AARON STERN: We have had some very difficult weather that has disrupted operations...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay.

[crosstalk]

AARON STERN: In the last month.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, thanks.

You know, I... I have been intimately involved with the operations of buses in New York Transit for a number of years now and I sincerely beg to differ

1 with those numbers, and I would, in fact, so  
2 strongly that I want to see them 'cause there's  
3 absolutely no way that 99 percent of the trips was  
4 made in Queens this year. So my final question is  
5 the Business Service Center, course of operations  
6 and savings and have you reached your anticipated  
7 savings? The Business Center... and first of all,  
8 could you explain for the committee what the  
9 Business Service Center is? [chime]

11 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah, okay, yeah, the  
12 Business Service Center was designed to take  
13 various administrative functions that had been  
14 housed at all the different agencies and through  
15 economies of scale by consolidating them you'd be  
16 more efficiently carrying out the same service,  
17 thereby having reductions in staff on a net basis,  
18 right? So the fact of the matter is that we had  
19 significant savings from the BSC. Now, the  
20 question you asked about have we realized those  
21 savings. I would say the answer is yes; however,  
22 there have been certain costs that would have been  
23 incurred in any instance that were probably not  
24 anticipated like systems costs and the like that  
25 were not perhaps anticipated in the early forecast

because it's a forecast. Any time you do a forecast...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing]

Mm-hm.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: You're just doing... you're giving your best estimate at the time, so really to summarize, it's been a success. We've had significant savings of head count. We've had significant dollar savings. Probably the dollar savings might be a little less than the initial projections, but if you factor in additional costs with the system that were not included in those initial projections, those actually would erode some of the savings, but the bottom line is we've saved a significant amount of money on the BSC.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And before we call in the Commission on DOT, I have a few questions and we'll bring all of them so that you will decide who will be capable of answering; who will take those questions. One is how will the MTA ensure that we'll stick now to the 10-year delayed timeline for the East Side Access? That's one question, okay? How do we assure that the plan that we have right now; 2021, \$10 billion dollars

1 we will stick with that figure and that date to  
2 complete the project? Second is what is MTA doing  
3 on assuming organization in replacing the Metro  
4 cars? The third one is how clean and safe are our  
5 Metro North Train Station since we, as a city, we  
6 pay so that the train station used by the Metro  
7 North should be clean and safe. The next one is  
8 can the MTA develop its own Vision Zero style plan  
9 going forward to protect subway riders at the  
10 platforms. You know, we had hearings last year on  
11 the number of incidents that ended with many New  
12 Yorkers losing their lives pushed by somebody or  
13 also jumping to the train and I would like to hear  
14 first of all, if in that particular aspect for  
15 reducing the number of deaths on the platform, we  
16 also can have our Vision Zero Plan so that we work  
17 toward that goal. In the same direction of Vision  
18 Zero, I also would like to hear how MTA is planning  
19 to participate with the Vision Zero that Mayor de  
20 Blasio has presented since it also includes buses  
21 and other services provided by the MTA. The next  
22 one is what are we doing, the MTA, to increase  
23 services to other communities that do not have  
24 access to mass transportation? Have we done a  
25

study and have we identified communities throughout the city that still there are challenges for us to connect them with transportation? I can say that you know, even in my own district, thanks to the MTA, we were able to get M-100 now to move from Rotary to 9th Avenue where I have an important number of senior citizens and they benefit. So but as we were able to work together and provide buses through areas that was not connected before, what are we doing to connect certain communities that have been isolated with some level of transportation? And my last one is the MTA has partnerships with many building owners that they are responsible to keep their stations clean and I have one of those in Dikeman and Rotary, and I know that we were in communication and we were able to address the issue and now it's clean, but it was dirty for years. I would like us to have a plan starting with the building at 53rd and Lexington Avenue. I would like that that building should be taken as one of those that should be always clean and we should be taking care of that one, the one on 53rd and Lexington, but I would like to hear what is your plan. How comfortable are those

1 building owners on keeping [background voices]  
2 those stations clean? Besides those questions,  
3 there is a number of other questions that we will  
4 send to you and we expect to have answered in  
5 continued conversation. You know, you provide an  
6 important service and I praise the leadership of  
7 the MTA. We can come... we can be back and forth a  
8 number of questions, always expecting that we  
9 continue improving transportation, since we also  
10 recognize that this is one of the largest  
11 transportation systems that we have in the world.  
12 So there's a lot of challenges, but we always have  
13 to have that vision of improving transportation, so  
14 I would like to hear some real... of those  
15 questions.

17 LOIS TENDLER: Okay, I'm going to start  
18 and then defer to my colleagues on some of these  
19 questions. Where am I going to start with? The  
20 Vision Zero Plan for platform safety, and we did  
21 have a hearing with the council last year on this  
22 subject. A good goal; we're always trying to  
23 reduce incidents of what we call collision with  
24 cars of people falling into tracks. We have...

25 [crosstalk]



2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But we... for  
3 the purpose of timing, we don't have a Vision Zero  
4 Plan in our...

5 [crosstalk]

6 LOIS TENDLER: What I wanted to get to  
7 was...

8 [crosstalk]

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, but what  
10 I say... I know that we don't have a plan...

11 LOIS TENDLER: [interposing] Well, we  
12 have...

13 [crosstalk]

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So what I...  
15 what I hope is that the MTA... when I invite the  
16 MTA is to come back with a proposal. We did start  
17 at that hearing and we even went through a number  
18 of initiatives where we can look at reducing the  
19 speed when the train is approaching the station...

20 [crosstalk]

21 LOIS TENDLER: Well...

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: To have  
23 other... we...

24 [crosstalk]

25

LOIS TENDLER: We told the committee when we spoke about it that we were going to investigate the use of platform intrusion systems, and I can now tell the committee that we're well on the way of doing that. We have installed two different systems, which actually detect through different technologies something on the track. We're going to install two more. There will be four different systems. They were all installed in one station and we are running a study through the end of the year to see whether or not... how effective they are; if they're false negatives; which of the four systems has the most promise. That would be platform intrusion technology. As we also told the committee, we have undertaken or are in the midst of a feasibility study about platform doors. Our goal is to procure a consultant later this year, who will then design a platform door, which we will pilot in one station, as we also have told the committee. It's a very, very challenging and daunting task for us. For one, there's 68 stations; different models of cars; different stopping, but we're looking at those things. We recently ran a campaign, a public information

1 campaign, about staying away from the track. If  
2 you're in a station for two minutes, you'll hear an  
3 announcement saying stay away from the track, so we  
4 are working aggressively on that front. You asked  
5 about some...

6 [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I'm sorry, so  
8 in that particular one or and what I... again, and  
9 I will be working to have a hearing on important  
10 measures that we should take to continue improving  
11 safety in our train stations. So what I... my  
12 question is on that one, can the MTA... can we work  
13 together so that the MTA can put a proposal or  
14 put... creating our own Vision Zero for the subway  
15 riders?  
16

17 LOIS TENDLER: I'm not sure we would  
18 call it Vision Zero, but we're certainly going for  
19 the same goal.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, can we  
21 have a commitment that we can have conversation in  
22 looking at the possibility of creating a Vision  
23 Zero for our subways?

24 LOIS TENDLER: Well, sure.

25 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, thanks.

LOIS TENDLER: Do you want me to go through the rest of these?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Of course, yes.

LOIS TENDLER: Signal modernization; new fare payment systems. We are working on replacing the Metro card with a next generation of fare payments. Do you want to talk a little bit more... what's the date on that?

STEVE BERRANG: We anticipate that the new fare payment system will be in place during the next five-year Capital Program, which runs from 2015 to 2019.

LOIS TENDLER: And Steve can probably help me out here with the signal modernization I already said we were involved in putting CBTC on the 7 Line, and the next line we're moving to is the Queens Boulevard Line, [background voice] but we also are updating other signals as we go along and we can send you a...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sorry, and I need to pause for one minute to go and report to the next room and come back, 'kay?

LOIS TENDLER: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So give me one minute, okay.

[Pause]

LOIS TENDLER: So in addition to the CBTC projects, we also have many signal modernization projects throughout the system and we're happy to provide you a list with those. The Metro North, as are the Long Island Railroad Stations, which are in the city; within the city confines, those agencies; my sister agencies have a responsibility for keeping those stations clean. I would be happy... I don't know if they're not clean. If you have complaints about the Metro North Station in the Bronx, I would be happy to share them with my colleagues from Metro North.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And to the residents of Marble Hill at the 225th Train Station for years, even when we hold Town Hall meetings, it's a back and forth on who's responsible...

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: It is Metro...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: To clean...

[crosstalk]

1	COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION	118
2	LOIS TENDLER: It is Metro North who	
3	is...	
4	[crosstalk]	
5	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Metro North...	
6	[crosstalk]	
7	LOIS TENDLER: And...	
8	[crosstalk]	
9	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And Marble Hill	
10	to clean...	
11	[crosstalk]	
12	LOIS TENDLER: And we will make sure	
13	they live up to their...	
14	[crosstalk]	
15	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes.	
16	[crosstalk]	
17	LOIS TENDLER: Responsibilities.	
18	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But you know,	
19	more than that, I would like to... and again, I	
20	don't... we can have a hearing later on; we can	
21	have meetings and conversations. I would like to	
22	hear from the MTA how safe and clean are our Metro	
23	North Train Stations.	
24	LOIS TENDLER: Alright and then I think	
25	the last question for me is what are we doing to	

1  
2 increase services to other communities. I mean the  
3 amount of new service we can put out there is a  
4 function of how much money we have. We have  
5 recently... in the last year, we created a new  
6 route to serve the Hunts Point Peninsula. We call  
7 that the BX-46. We have created... we have  
8 extended the B-67 to serve the Brooklyn Navy Yard.  
9 We are looking at communities which need bus  
10 service to get them to a train 'cause we think  
11 that's the most efficient way to get people quickly  
12 to work and to the extent we have money, we are  
13 happy to serve the needs that are out there, and I  
14 think that's it for the rest.

15 STEVE BERRANG: Well, no, there was...  
16 he said access... how we're going to... I think  
17 there's a committee on the board, the Capital  
18 Program Oversight Committee. It's chaired by our  
19 chairman, Tom Prendergast. It's responsible for  
20 you know, looking at the oversight of the Capital  
21 Program. East Side Access and all the mega-  
22 projects report to that committee on a quarterly  
23 basis. We also have an independent engineering  
24 consultant, which is charged with oversight of our  
25 implementation with our Capital Program and one of

our funding partners, the FTA, does... they're our project management oversight consultant, which is charged also with the oversight of East Side Access since they're our funding partner. So those are the oversight activities that we have underway.

LOIS TENDLER: I didn't respond to one last thing, the easement issue. We have better partners in our easement and worst partners. The guy off of Dikeman Street's a nightmare. We aggressively... we have... people have to maintain entrances because they got something when they built their building. I'm surprised that you singled out 53rd and Lex because we've had issues with the easement holders there, but they have more to do with the escalators there than station conditions.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It is... I'm sorry, it is the escalators.

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: The escalator...

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It is.

LOIS TENDLER: They've just replaced one. There are two different guys. Two different developers own different escalators in that station



and one of them is new. One of the escalators is new. We understand how important those escalators are because they're very important. If they go out, we have a problem at the station, so.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So when will the escalator issue be...

LOIS TENDLER: I think unless you know something I don't, which is fully possible, I think... it's been quiet up there. I think they're working as planned.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, if you...

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: So...

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Can look at it.

LOIS TENDLER: Yeah, I...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So.

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: Think everything's quiet up there.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It was brought to my attention through a number of people, so let's...

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: I think we're...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Let's...

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: Doing good.

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Let's look at  
it. The Tunnel... I have 1 Tunnel and 1 Train...

LOIS TENDLER: [interposing] Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Connecting  
191st to Broadway. It's never clean. Who is  
responsible to clean that, Tunnel?

LOIS TENDLER: What, you said the  
tunnel? I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

LOIS TENDLER: We are responsible.  
We'll... 191st.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]  
So I want to see that Tunnel...

LOIS TENDLER: [interposing] Oh, oh,  
oh, you're talking about Tunnel Street. I'm sorry,  
you're talking about Tunnel Street.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

LOIS TENDLER: Tunnel Street belongs to the New York City Department of Transportation.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, so we don't have... the Commissioner is ready waiting for roads and I know that she... and again, like as the chairman of this Transportation Committee, I always want to have the best dialogue working together, getting things done. That's our responsibility and that's my approach, so I'm just looking to continue having conversation and having dialogue and please, let's check out the rail yard 207. I think that that is a great project if we get some state, federal or city money where we can look at it to... it will help everyone; my community to create and have jobs and the MTA also to get revenue. I want to end by saying thank you to the MTA for the renovations on Dikeman Street and the whole renovation, that includes 207 and 215, is like \$35 million. But before closing, I know that one of my colleagues here has a question, Margaret Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair. I just ran back here from the Rules Committee and I'm glad I did not miss the MTA. I have a very short question. Of course, we need more bus

services, especially in neighborhoods where there's not that many public transportation, and in my district in the Lower East Side, we need bus service to really run longer hours on weekends, like the M-22. But my focus is on the Capital rehab of the F Train Station on East Broadway. I mean we're happy that the escalator is finally running. Hopefully, it will not break, but that station I would invite you to come down and take a look. It really needs some major, major capital dollars.

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: I've been to the station several times and I wouldn't disagree with you. It's a big dang station. That being said, I will get back to you on how it ranked in our latest condition survey, which is...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Not... not...

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: Structurally driven, not... not...

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: It's a big station, but it's got to be really taken of and

1 when it rains; I've gone there myself; you got to  
2 walk through puddles of water, so that station  
3 needs some tender loving care and a lot of people  
4 use that subway station, so part of your capital  
5 dollars you should allocate some funding towards  
6 there because a lot of commuters use that subway  
7 station, not just... it's Brooklyn; connecting  
8 Brooklyn to Lower East Side to Queens to all over  
9 the city. So thank you, Chair. So we'll follow up  
10 on that.  
11

12 LOIS TENDLER: My pleasure.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So we...  
15 Commissioner Trottenberg is waiting, so we won't  
16 have a full opportunity, Lois...

17 [crosstalk]

18 LOIS TENDLER: Understandable.

19 [crosstalk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: And I know  
21 you're disappointed, but I do want to say I look  
22 forward to continuing to work with you all on  
23 mitigating the effects of 7 Train weekend closures.  
24 I know there have been some meetings and there'll  
25 be more meetings, but we definitely need relief in

my district on the 7 Train issue and we won't have an opportunity to delve into it here, but I look forward to continuing to work with you all on making sure that everyone in Western Queens has the service they need.

LOIS TENDLER: You have our commitment and you have the president's commitment. Anything we can do we're going to try to do for you.

[background voices]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. I'll be really brief. I thank you for your indulgence. I was wondering, where are the... where are you with the restorations of bus lines that were discontinued four years ago? As you know, on Staten Island we have no subways and I lost quite a few of my bus lines.

LOIS TENDLER: I know...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Have you restored the funding for restorations for bus lines?

LOIS TENDLER: We have made two rounds of service enhancements; one 2013 and one rolling out this year in 2014. In 2013, we added about \$22 million or \$22.5 million back and some of it was

subway; it wasn't all bus and in 2014, we're looking at \$10.6 million. I will say it wasn't just restoring what came off the list. It was creating some new routes. It was serving areas that proved not to be served, so while we're constantly looking for new opportunities for service, it doesn't necessarily mean we're just going to put back what was there in 2010 when we eliminated it. I know that we... I guess the S-76 is yours. We restored weekends...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yes.

[crosstalk]

LOIS TENDLER: On the S-76 is one thing.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing]  
Yes.

LOIS TENDLER: I could go through a long list, but I would suggest that...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Will there be conversations about restorations as opposed to you know, new iterations of lines because of the lines

that were cut were critical and based on the topography, they're absolute necessities.

LOIS TENDLER: Of course. We would love to come meet with you and talk about where you see the needs are because we've been very successful in addressing the needs, though perhaps in different ways, which have more vibrant bus routes, so we'd love to come out and talk with you and walk around.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And I understand you have to go, but Chairman Vacca and I introduced a fare-beater bill last year, which we're reintroducing this year. Do you have any sense of any of the revenue that you might have gotten from clamping down on fare-beaters?

LOIS TENDLER: [off mic] Do we know what we got from TAB?

AARON STERN: The tab revenue in 2013 was pretty similar to the tab revenue in 2012, so there wasn't a significant increase in revenue. Some of that though is due to... there was a special program to get tab collections through... coordinated through the State Department of Treasury using the tax mechanism for people who owe



taxes and that'd diminished over time. That's part of why...

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] So you're going to continue the initiative to collect... try to collect the fares that we're not collecting right now?

AARON STERN: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I have just a few questions more. In this understanding that the Governor has proposed diverting \$40 million from the MTA to service debt; that the state has committed to underwriting out of a general fund and as you know, some transportation advocate groups they have suggested that this action will have severe financial impact on your purchase budget. What is your assessment on how this reduction of \$40 million will impact the agency?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: The actual appropriate... we budget based upon anticipated appropriations from New York state. The \$40 million came from funding that is included within the funds that get passed on to the MTA and others

1 out of these MM telefunds, but in fact, the amount  
2 that's appropriated by the state was about \$5.5  
3 million more than we projected actually in the  
4 budget, so in terms of its impact on our immediate  
5 finances, it's actually... there was no adverse  
6 impact. So the point being is the appropriation  
7 was higher than what we had projected. And higher  
8 than last year's amount, and then so we'll be  
9 receiving more from New York state than what was  
10 budgeted and certainly more than what we received  
11 last year.  
12

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But I would  
14 assume that the need that we have is also higher  
15 than the one that we had before, so no doubt...

16 [crosstalk]

17 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well...

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: That cutting...  
19 or losing \$40 million or diverging \$40 million has  
20 to have some negative impact.

21 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well, the \$40 million  
22 was never anticipated to be appropriated in this  
23 budget. The \$40 million is in a funding pool that  
24 could've been used down the road at some point.  
25

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But if those \$40 million would not be diverging, how will that benefit the agency?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well, we don't... like I said we budget based on discussions with the state and projections on appropriations, so with the \$40 million came out... [off mic] Pardon me? [background voice] Yeah, in preparation for the July Financial Plan we'll be looking at all the subsidy projections as well as all our own expense projections, so we will be at that point issuing a revised subsidy projections and their own... we'll be reprojecting everything and we will come up with a brand new financial plan.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I think that the city... first of all, as you know, we, as a city... the MTA budget is what, \$9 billion? How much is the budget?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: \$13.5 billion.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 13.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And we, as a city, we are contributing more than \$1 billion, right?

1	COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION	132
2	DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I would say...	
3	[crosstalk]	
4	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Expenses and	
5	Capital.	
6	DOUGLAS JOHNSON: 800... getting close	
7	to a billion, right?	
8	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: To a billion.	
9	DOUGLAS JOHNSON: So \$885 plus...	
10	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah.	
11	DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah, 100 so just	
12	under...	
13	[crosstalk]	
14	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And... and...	
15	[crosstalk]	
16	DOUGLAS JOHNSON: A billion.	
17	[crosstalk]	
18	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: As a city we	
19	also when there's a... is there any small	
20	percentage when in a property taxes that also is	
21	going to the MTA?	
22	DOUGLAS JOHNSON: The...	
23	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Is there any	
24	percentage of property taxes...	
25	[crosstalk]	

1	COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION	133
2	DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Uhm...	
3	[crosstalk]	
4	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: That go to the	
5	MTA?	
6	DOUGLAS JOHNSON: There is a small,	
7	local match that was included in the list of	
8	subsidies that I read earlier.	
9	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So if someone	
10	sells a house for \$10 million there's...	
11	[crosstalk]	
12	DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Oh.	
13	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: There's...	
14	DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Are you talking about	
15	the urban tax?	
16	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes.	
17	DOUGLAS JOHNSON: That's correct.	
18	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So our	
19	contribution is not just the \$1 billion. It is...	
20	[crosstalk]	
21	DOUGLAS JOHNSON: It didn't... that's	
22	right.	
23	[crosstalk]	
24	CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: That's all the	
25	contributions, right?	

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: That's true.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 'Kay.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So what I hope is that you know, at the end of this State Budget, that we also can be able to persuade the Governor of the importance of putting this \$40 million back because I understand what you're saying; that it was not in the projection...

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: [interposing] Mm-hm.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: However, with \$40 million we can provide more services to our senior citizens or to this car; on the Metro cars and other services that we can provide and also increasing the number of selected buses.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah, the only... the one thing you need to keep in mind is when you talk about a funding amount of money, that's a one shot, but when you add service it's a recurring, so you always have to keep that in mind; recurring costs versus one time revenues.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 'Kay and we also contribute 50 cents for the surcharge, right?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: For... oh, yeah, yes, the riders, that's right.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Have we...

[crosstalk]

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: That's part of the MTA...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Quantified... have we quantified how those contributions together come from the city to the MTA?

DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well, we... the numbers that I quoted earlier were the direct contributions from New York City, so those actually are contributions from you know, the taxi businesses.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, okay, in 2012, we had 42 victims of people who lost their lives because they committed suicide or because they were pushed in our train stations. I know that after 2012, we've been holding a number of conversations, but I just hope that we're committed and that we definitely come together for the Vision Zero and we say that this... we will do whatever it takes to be sure that we don't repeat similar

number of 42 deaths in 2014 on the platforms.  
People, again, some of them committed suicide.  
Sometimes we don't control, but if we bring the  
tonality and we can reduce those numbers, it would  
be good for everyone. I also hope that the MTA...  
together we'll look at a 20 or 30-year plan when it  
comes to transportation in New York City so that  
not only will we look to our East Side Access on  
the 2021, \$10 billion that we expect; that it will  
stay with that they think; we expect that you will  
stay with the same figure number, but also to look  
about our communities that have been isolated and  
they should be benefitting with selected bus  
service. Thank you. We're now going to be taking  
a five minute recess and coming back with the DOT  
Commission.

[Pause]

[background voices]

[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Now that we  
have our DOT Commissioner and I would like to  
remember what I said at the beginning of the  
opening of our hearing, which is that we will hear  
from the City Department of Transportation the DOT



Preliminary Expense and Budget for Fiscal 2015, which is approximately \$791 million. In addition, \$1.2 billion is also budgeted on Fiscal 2015 for the department's computer problems. We look forward to the Commissioners updating this committee on the department's efforts to maintain the city's roadways, including pothole remediation; efforts to improve parking through the use of technology; the department's efforts to improve pedestrian safety and its role in the implementation of the Vision Zero Action Plan released by the administration last month. With such an ambitious plan, one that I believe was a major step toward eliminating traffic deaths in our city, we must be sure that the funding is in place for the many projects necessary. I would also like to hear about any updates on a timeline for these plans with a specific about targets and goals for the new slow zone and physical infrastructure improvements. In an effort to expand options for the transportation in our city, especially for those isolated from mass transit, expanding the Citi Bike program can go a long way for many residents and visitors to our city. We also would

1  
2 like to hear where we are in these efforts, as well  
3 as hear about the revenue and projection for this  
4 program. It has been successful from ridership  
5 perspective, but we have not had any detail in the  
6 past when it comes to the... related to the money  
7 the city has received and reinvested, and whether  
8 an expansion in the program is self-sustainable or  
9 needs additional funding. With that, I will call  
10 on you.

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you,  
12 Mr. Chairman and members of the Transportation  
13 Committee. My name is Polly Trottenberg. I'm the  
14 Commissioner of the New York City Department of  
15 Transportation. With me today are Joseph Jerrin,  
16 our Deputy Commissioner for Finance, Contracting  
17 and Program Management and Kate Slevin, Assistant  
18 Commissioner for Intergovernmental Affairs.

19 Thank you for inviting me to discuss  
20 DOT's Preliminary Budget for Fiscal Year 2015. DOT  
21 has an ambitious agenda for the coming year and is  
22 committed to five priorities to guide our work:  
23 safety, state of good repair, innovative project  
24 delivery, mobility and livability. We do face  
25 financial constraints at all level of government

and delivering on these priorities. In the last five years, DOT has managed a 30 percent reduction in City Capital Funds, as well as multiple rounds of PEGS programs to eliminate the gap in our expense budget. Nonetheless, I am proud to note that even as the agency realized over \$80 million in cost savings over the last six years, we continue to expand and improve our service to the public.

DOT's Fiscal Year 2015 Budget Proposal is guided by the same core values Mayor de Blasio outlined for the city's overall budget. DOT will be fiscally responsible, progressive and transparent. DOT's Capital Plan for Fiscal Years 2014 through 2018 is \$6.3 billion, with city funds making up over half that amount and federal, state and private funding providing the rest. As you can see in your package, this Capital money will be used for key elements of our infrastructure: nearly \$3 billion for bridge reconstruction; \$2.2 billion for street reconstruction and resurfacing; \$475 million for ferry programs; \$435 million for street lights and signals and \$180 million for facilities and equipment needed to support DOT

1  
2 operations. This funding will allow us to make  
3 great strides in maintaining the city's  
4 infrastructure, but as we all know, this brutal  
5 winter has taken its toll on our roadways and  
6 bridges and a robust capital investment will be  
7 needed in the coming months and years.

8 DOT's 10-year Capital Plan has been cut  
9 by \$4.2 billion over the last six years. We're  
10 making sure right now that we can improve our level  
11 of capital investment in the future, and I hope  
12 that we can count on the support of the council for  
13 that.

14 DOT's Preliminary Expense Budget for  
15 Fiscal Year 2015 is \$791 million. This funding  
16 includes \$300 million for traffic operations and  
17 planning; \$176 million for roadway maintenance;  
18 \$122 million for DOT operations, including sidewalk  
19 management; \$100 million for ferry operations and  
20 maintenance and \$91 million for bridge maintenance  
21 and inspection. As part of this budget, we're also  
22 pleased to propose funding for the speed camera  
23 program; repairing pedestrian bridges; advancing  
24 technology for parking meter payments and  
25

increasing half hour Staten Island Ferry service on the weekends to 2:00 a.m.

I'd also like to discuss DOT's priority in a little more depth. The first priority is safety for all New Yorkers, whether they're a senior walking to a bus stop, a passenger on the Staten Island Ferry or one of our dedicated roadway crews at work on our city streets. Just last week, I came before this committee to testify on Vision Zero with my agency colleagues, and I'm very grateful for the support and partnership you have already offered. Mayor de Blasio's Vision Zero Action Plan outlines ambitious safety proposals to dramatically reduce traffic deaths and injury, including an exciting new partnership between DOT and the NYPD.

And I know this committee is interested in hearing more specifics on proposed funding and staffing levels, as well as timelines. As you heard from OMB Director Fuleihan yesterday, we're currently reviewing agency resources and personnel needs and will be working closely with City Hall to ensure Vision Zero can be realized. We're also working with the Mayor's Office to provide real

time online tracking of Vision Zero actions and metrics, and our work is already underway with recent community board approvals of two important pedestrian safety projects: Park Avenue in East Harlem and Hillside Avenue in Jamaica Hills.

The second top priority for the agency is maintaining the state of good repair of the city's 789 bridges and 6,000 miles of roadway. This is an investment in New York's long-term safety, quality of life and economic competitiveness. Due to this rough winter, DOT is on track to fill approximately 100,000 more potholes than usual and perform targeted repaving on our most impacted roadways. I am grateful that Mayor de Blasio is allocating an additional \$7.3 million for this, and I'm thankful to DOT's dedicated roadway repair and maintenance crews for their hard work during this difficult winter. Once the weather permits, we will begin street resurfacing operations to provide more extensive repairs throughout the city, and I know many of us are looking forward to that.

Another top DOT priority is innovative project delivery, allowing us to execute projects

on time, on budget and at better value for the taxpayer dollar. For example, this past fall, DOT used innovative technology to make roadway repairs on 1st Avenue on the Upper East Side that finished on time and underbudget, saving the city millions of dollars. Last year, also saw the completion of other major projects on or ahead of schedule, including the St. George ramps, the Belt Parkway Bridge over Fresh Creek and the cable replacements on the Manhattan Bridge.

In the future, DOT hopes to expand our use of Design-Build, which reduces schedule and costs by overlapping the design and construction phases of a project and shifting more of the risk to the contractor. DOT estimates that Design-Build could save city taxpayers tens of millions of dollars on projects in the next 10 years. However, we need legislation in Albany to make Design-Build savings a reality for New York City, and I ask for the council's support in this request.

A fourth focus for DOT will be to carry out Mayor de Blasio's vision to improve transportation options in underserved neighborhoods so that all New Yorkers have access to jobs,

1 education and opportunities to improve their daily  
2 lives. DOT looks forward to briefing this  
3 committee on efforts to expand the select bus  
4 service network citywide in the coming years. In  
5 the meantime, we will continue to make improvements  
6 to existing bus routes, including the B-46 on Utica  
7 Avenue in Brooklyn, the second busiest bus route in  
8 the city; the X-41 Webster Ave in the Bronx. This  
9 spring, we will launch the M-60 select bus service  
10 on 125th Street in Manhattan, with dedicated bus  
11 lanes east of Lenox Avenue serving local Harlem  
12 riders and those traveling to LaGuardia Airport,  
13 and planning for a select bus route in Woodhaven  
14 Boulevard in Queens is currently underway.

15  
16 DOT will also continue to expand and  
17 enhance the city's bicycle network, including new  
18 routes and more bike racks. In Fiscal Year 2015,  
19 we will begin construction on two Brooklyn  
20 waterfront Greenway segments, West Street and  
21 Flushing Avenue and in addition, design is underway  
22 for the Greenway Sunset Park Connector.

23 The Chairman mentioned New York City's  
24 Citi Bike program. The program has been a  
25 tremendous success. Since its launch in May 2013,



riders have taken 6.7 million trips and over 98,000 New Yorkers have signed up for annual membership, and we know there is a real support and appetite to expand the program. However, New York City Bike Share, the private company that operates the system, is facing a number of financial and operational challenges and we are working diligently with them to try and resolve the challenges they face and seeing what we can do to strengthen the program going forward.

Lastly, a priority for us: walkable, livable streets. Public plazas are a key element to that and DOT is working hard to meet community demand for new pedestrian spaces throughout the five boroughs. Our plaza work this year will include Humboldt Plaza in Bushwick and Plaza de la Americas in Washington Heights. DOT will also expand our pedestrian wayfinding program with new signage in all of Lower Manhattan, areas of the Bronx and along the bustling 42nd Street Corridor in Midtown.

In conclusion, we look forward to working with all of you to execute Mayor de Blasio's vision for a safe, equitable and

accessible transportation system for all New Yorkers while providing value for every taxpayer dollar invested. Thank you and I look forward to your questions.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 'Kay, thank you for inviting us also a few days ago with the Secretary of the Department of Transportation.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I can tell you...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great.

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: How much he enjoyed it. He really did. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Well, thank you. There was an article in today's news by Lucius Riccio, former DOT Commissioner, expressing concern that the city does not surface enough roads this year, and again, for the record, we also know that we are so lucky at the city to have someone; a Commissioner that also comes with a portfolio of being the third one in charge of the Department of Transportation nationwide. As someone new with this responsibility, but with a big portfolio

1 nationwide, have you looked on the quality of the  
2 surface that we do every year? Do you anticipate  
3 some challenges?  
4

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, and  
6 look, I've seen the former Commissioner's article  
7 and you know, let me serve comment on it for a  
8 second. I mean there's no question that the city  
9 needs to make a robust investment every year in  
10 resurfacing our roads and you know, the truth is  
11 we've averaged about 1,000 miles in recent years,  
12 but the number has gone up and down and it is very  
13 much just been a question of resources. And look,  
14 I'm the DOT Commissioner, so of course, I would  
15 argue you know, we need as many resources as my  
16 department can get, but of course, you all and the  
17 Mayor have to balance all the city's needs, every  
18 department. You know, the New York City streets  
19 pose some, I would say, unique challenges that you  
20 actually don't necessarily see in other parts of  
21 the country. I mean one, we just have tremendous  
22 wear and tear given the incredible volume of  
23 traffic here and we have a tremendous amount of  
24 infrastructure under the roads: pipelines, cables,  
25 subway systems and so that means we actually cut

1  
2 into our roads a lot, so you know, and this winter  
3 too has presented us, as you all know, with amazing  
4 challenges. We've had nearly five feet of snow, a  
5 lot of salt on the roadways, a lot of plowing, a  
6 lot of tire chains, so you know, there's no  
7 question that I think a robust investment is going  
8 to be needed to keep our... you know, to keep our  
9 roads in a state of good repair.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And have you  
11 looked... first of all, you know our climate change  
12 is real and this is not a matter where Republicans  
13 can say that it's not real anymore. Everyone now  
14 has to agree, especially in New York City. In the  
15 last seven years, we've been hurt by you know,  
16 major natural disasters, so including this severe  
17 winter that we got. Also it brings us to some  
18 challenges about the quality of the materials you  
19 use to surface our streets. Is there any... as  
20 someone that is coming from the national  
21 perspective, is there another city here or in  
22 another part of the world that faces similar  
23 challenges that the city has with many trucks on  
24 our street that you think that we should learn from  
25 when it comes to using a different material with

1  
2 better quality so that we don't do the pothole  
3 right now and then three months after then we have  
4 to...

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yeah, I mean  
6 I actually think New York City uses pretty high  
7 quality materials. I don't... but I will say I  
8 think there are lessons to be learned. I think a  
9 lot of cities now are grappling with how to make a  
10 more resilient transportation system in face of  
11 what's happening with... you know, with climate  
12 change. I mean there's no question and clearly, in  
13 this region Hurricane Sandy was obviously a big eye  
14 opener for everyone and you know, we've been  
15 working very closely at U.S. DOT and I know MTA has  
16 too with U.S. DOT to sort of figure out what are  
17 some of the ways now going forward we can better  
18 protect our infrastructure. It is a huge challenge  
19 and there's no question that it takes resources.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: What about  
21 Vision Zero and again, I know that you have been  
22 one of the important voices also together with the  
23 Mayor and other... and the NYPD when it comes to  
24 taking ownership with this initiative. How are we  
25

doing when it comes to the timeframe and the money part related to...

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yep.

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Vision Zero?

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: And I know, Mr. Chairman, that's a big concern of yours and for some of your colleagues and you know, one thing I want to say is Vision Zero's already underway as far as you know, New York City DOT is concerned. I mean we're already getting our schedule ready for projects we're going to be doing all over the city. We're going to in particular, and I've been talking to some of your colleagues and I want to mention to all the rest of them here, we're going to try this month to start doing Town Halls around the city to get a sense from local elected officials and communities about what their needs are, and then we're going to try and do the month afterwards much more granular workshops where essentially we will put maps up and we'll really drill down on areas where we think we need to do some work. I know there's a lot of questions about exactly what are

the resources going to be and the funding levels and you know, I think you heard from our OMB Director yesterday we are in active discussions with them. We're looking at how we best organize our resources within our own department, but we're also going to talk to them about future resources we may need and I think you'll... if we decide we need that, you'll be hearing about that in April.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. I have other questions, but I would like to call my colleague, who also has questions. Council Member Vacca?

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Yes, thank you, Commissioner.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And we will stay within five minutes, please, instead of three, so please stay with the five minutes...

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [interposing]  
Thank you...

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Everyone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Mr. Chair. Commissioner, there were two things I wanted to mention and first was a district matter, which is a citywide matter in reality, and that was the City

Island Bridge. I first want to thank you for meeting with me so soon after you took office and I know at that meeting I had requested that we look at the scope of that bridge and the design.

Residents on City Island have felt that the design is not in keeping with the nautical nature of the island, and that we could save the city a lot of money if there was a better designed bridge that was more in keeping with the character of the island. Can you indicate to me the status of what has happened since my meeting with you and...

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Is there any reconsideration...

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'd be happy to do that, Council Member Vacca and look, I heard from you and other leaders in the community and look, it's no secret that this bridge is... it's been a long-standing issue and there's been a lot of controversy and I think you know, coming in new, as I have, one of the challenges I face is that unfortunately, the current bridge is in very poor



1 condition. It's actually one of the worst rated  
2 bridges in our whole inventory, so I feel pressured  
3 to try and come to a quick resolution on this, but  
4 I understand the community's concerns and I think  
5 we've had a little bit of some good news here,  
6 which is the firm that we awarded the contract to,  
7 Tutor Perini, is a well-known national firm and  
8 they have some very innovative engineers and  
9 they've agreed to sit down with DOT's engineers and  
10 take a fresh look and see if there is something we  
11 can do that would improve the design of the bridge.  
12 You know, there are... again, we have issues with  
13 the safety of the bridge and sort of going back and  
14 looking at what the environmental documents we got  
15 for this project, what they'll allow us to do, but  
16 as I said to you, we're going to take a fresh look  
17 and I'm hoping we can do something that will you  
18 know, make a bridge that everyone can be happy  
19 with.  
20

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I thank you,  
22 Commissioner, and that's all I can ask, is that you  
23 and Tudor Perini take a fresh look, try to work  
24 with us and we would want to work with you, so I  
25 thank you for your openness and this is good news

for City Island and it's good news for those of us who think that we can do better with the design, and we can save the city money in the process.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, I will just say you know, for better or for worse, because we're pretty far along you know, and again, maybe we could sort of... this is sort of sins of the past, but we're pretty far along, so I'm hoping we can find something that will not cost us money. It would be fantastic if it would save us money, but I just... I don't want to get people's hopes up quite yet and...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Right.

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Just you know, we're just taking a preliminary look at it.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: 'Kay, thank you. Secondly, Commissioner, I am very happy that you mentioned issues of equity in your testimony. I represent the Bronx, so any discussion of equity I think lands up in my borough one way or another. From a transportation point of view, we have major issues. We have Express Bus Service in the Bronx,

but I don't know where it got the name Express Bus Service. It's not express.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Mm-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: It should be called non-Express Bus Service because we are stuck in the same traffic as any driver or car would be stuck in, and people complain about how long it takes, that the traffic jams are impossible, so truly often they're not express. Now, I did meet with Commissioner Sadik-Khan, has to be two years ago, and I met with her staff and they put forth a plan to give us better access once we get into Manhattan via dedicated lanes. We made... I made other suggestions. We spoke about off-board fares, which have worked well at the MTA. We spoke really of getting these buses, once they leave the Bronx, getting them better access to the central city because express buses serve as a disincentive to drive if the express buses truly get you to where you want to go quicker. Those discussions, I felt great after we had those discussions and then nothing ever happened, so I would like you to have your office revisit those issues. We had very good ideas. I need your help to make this a reality.

1  
2 The people of the Bronx would be very appreciative  
3 if we can get our people to the city quicker via  
4 express buses. Make them live up to what they've  
5 been called all these years. So are you aware of  
6 this issue, Commissioner? Is this something that  
7 we can look at again?

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'd be happy  
9 to look at it and as you point out, I think one of  
10 the great things that we've learned working with  
11 the MTA in doing the select bus service program is  
12 there's actually kind of a spectrum of things you  
13 can do you know, from improving the lane markings  
14 to the signaling to you know, off-board  
15 collections, so let us take a look. I mean  
16 obviously, one of our major priorities is to try  
17 and provide people faster service into the city.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you,  
19 Commissioner.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]  
21 Council Member Miller followed by...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Good afternoon  
23 again, Commissioner, always a pleasure to see you,  
24 and thank you so much and as I mentioned to you,  
25 your County Commissioner was out at the district

and we really... I think we were able to get to the meat of some real issues and so I don't have much, but I do have a few simple questions. The highway clean up is that something that is specifically done by DOT or do you contract out a portion of depending on the location?

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Is there a specific location you're...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Belt Parkway and... yeah.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: On the Queens end, and is that you 'cause it's...

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Some it's us; some of it's the state's, but if there... you know, in some cases we share the roads just to make things...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yeah, there's...

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Extra complicated, but...

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: 'Kay.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: If there are areas where you have concerns...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MILLER: Filthy.

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: You know, we... filthy, okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: It's continuously filthy and it's pretty amazing that considering how it was maintained at one time, in the summer and the spring you know, the weeds are high and in the winter it's just filthy and so I was wondering if we were directly responsible or if it was something that was being farmed out. So that is one issue. You mentioned the... some of the safety provisions that were going to be you know, on Hillside Avenue and could you elaborate on that?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No, actually I'm going to turn to Kate for that one. I think she has the details.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER SLEVIN:  
Essentially it's a roadway redesign. It's a

complicated intersection, so we're going to make it safer and clearer for everyone using the street.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Mm-hm.

[background voices]

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER SLEVIN: It's Homelawn and Hillside Avenue.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Ah...

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER SLEVIN: And it's a complicated intersection right there, so we're going to redesign the intersection and make it clearer and safer for everyone using it.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Good. I hope...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Please identify yourself.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER SLEVIN: Oh, Kate Slevin with New York City DOT.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yep, okay, so in doing that I'm very, very much familiar with that. I know that there was a proposal to make that a pedestrian way some years back and the community for obvious reasons; safety reasons there was big opposition to that. That's not what we're

looking to do now, right? Okay, that is great.

Actually I heard some... my thought is on the traffic study on Downtown Jamaica, specifically Arch Avenue Corridor. Are you familiar with that and if so, where are we with that?

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yeah, I don't know. I don't know.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER SLEVIN: We can look into that for you and get back to you.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, than I have no further questions. Thank you again for coming.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Jimmy?

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you. Good afternoon, Commissioner. I have a couple of questions. One, the Town Halls, are you doing one per borough or are you going to do them in other districts as well?

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yeah. No, it doesn't have to be limited one per borough, so.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Okay, 'cause I know... I think you have one scheduled in Astoria. I represent a portion of Astoria, so if there's a way to be included in that I would very



1 much appreciate that and then we can do one in  
2 other parts of my district as well. I wanted to  
3 ask about a few things. Some stop signs, speed  
4 bumps, traffic calming requests that we've made in  
5 the past have I think been a problem for a lot of  
6 us in terms of the time that it takes to get stop  
7 signs and speed bumps and the hoops that we have to  
8 go through. I know some folks have introduced  
9 legislation to this effect, but I'm hoping that  
10 we'll be able to start anew and streamline that so  
11 that communities don't have to wait two and three  
12 years to get stop signs and speed bumps, including  
13 sometimes on blocks where there are schools. That  
14 is an issue that is citywide and I know it affects  
15 a lot of us.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I kind of  
18 can an answer to that 'cause I'll say a couple  
19 things, which is one, I think we do want to  
20 streamline the process and I don't want people to  
21 jump through excessive hoops, but I guess I do,  
22 having probed into this a little bit, I mean there  
23 is also a resource question here. You know,  
24 unfortunately, we don't have infinite resources to  
25 grant everyone's requests right when they request

it, so I mean it's a little bit of both. I think we need to improve our process, but you know, there's also a dollar question in some cases.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Sure and I know that you would agree that if there is a site that is particularly dangerous and people are very, very concerned that we would all want to do that to make our streets safer, and I realize that there are resource questions, but that the first priority is always safety and...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG:  
[interposing] Absolutely.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: And you know, and I look forward with working with you on that, Commissioner. Vision Zero, the 50 potential sites, the report was issued. Is there a timeline with respect to choosing where you're going to focus and where is that process now?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, and I mean we're in the midst of that process, but that's part also of what both the Town Halls and the workshops are going to help us do, so we want this to be you know, very much an inclusive process

where we hear from elected officials, community boards, et cetera.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Okay.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: But you know, I would just say you know, DOT has... you know, as you know, been doing a lot of good work in recent years to pick important areas of the city and prioritize, so the work is well along but obviously, I think with the new Vision Zero push, we want to get more input from you know, all different parts of the city to go into that list.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Right, but even more important to have those Town Halls all over. So then is there a timeline? So we're going to have this community-driven process, which is great, but is there then an end date or end game?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, I mean our goal is 50 projects per year, so you know, I think you'll see pretty quickly we'll be declaring them as we start rolling them out and I said before, the Mayor's Office of Operations is going to do online tracking of our progress, so I'm hoping... I know people are wanting more details. I'm hoping pretty soon we'll have something pretty

transparent that everyone can take a look at and track our progress.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: And I very much appreciate your comments on Bike Share. Obviously, that is a discussion in and of itself that would be quite lengthy. I will just simply say I look forward to working with you to making sure that Bike Share is expanded to my district and all over, so we'll continue to have that dialogue privately and publicly, but I know it's a big complicated funding and logistical situation.

So I want to ask a bit about the ferry budget; \$475 million for the ferry program. How do you break that out? Where is that money spent and how is that money spent?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, you know, maybe I will turn to our budget expert here, Deputy Commissioner Jarrin, to give the breakdown.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Thank you, Commissioner. Joe Jarrin, Deputy Commissioner Finance, Contracting and Program Management. The number you said is our Capital Budget number, which includes the expectation of federal funding for the replacement of our ferry boats that we're still

pursuing and we have in the budget to replace the two Barberi fleet vessels, as well as our swing vessel, which is a Kennedy Class [chime] vessel, which is as you know, from the 1960s, so it needs to be replaced. So that's the majority of the money that you see in the Capital Budget there.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Got it and last question, bike lanes. We have a community in Western Queens that is anxious to have the network expanded and we've worked with our community board to identify several sites that I believe you all have selected and...

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG:  
[interposing] Mm-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I'm wondering if you had an update on the timeline and when that would happen.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yeah, the staff has just informed me springtime.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Springtime.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yep.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Early spring, late spring?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, I'm going to say spring for now, but let me see if I can get back to you and I'll refine it a little bit. Let me get back to you on that.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Okay, good. Thank you, Commissioner, for... I just want to say you've started hitting the ground running and I'm just very, very pleased with your communication and I know that you're accessible to us and I look forward to working with you for many, many years.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. [off mic] Council Member Lander followed by Council Member Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, very much, Mr. Chairman. Commissioner, great to see you again. Thanks for being here and I think my comments are in somewhat of the same vein with enthusiasm for a lot of things DOT's being doing on safety and more livable neighborhoods with enthusiasm for Vision Zero and for your leadership and with the belief that over time, if not this year, that commitment to street safety and livable

neighborhoods is going to mean we have to be willing to spend some more money in different ways and I'll give you an example. That great project last year DOT did that was along Hicks Street.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Mm-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Which was done with thermoplasty and sticks, but of course, this morning I noticed a couple of places where the cars have started just pulling over the thermoplasty and sticks and so having established that level of safety expectation, we're going to have to build those out to achieve it and I just think over time the commitment to the 50 projects and to the Vision Zero is going to drive us in the direction of needing to be willing to commit more Capital dollars for street safety if we're serious. That's not to say you should increase the budget this year, but I believe that's going to be a long-term requirement that comes out of the work we're doing together.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, thank you. I mean I can't disagree with you, and as I said in my testimony though, you know, one thing that we are going to commit to on our end is try

and use the dollars we get, the Capital dollars and the expense dollars, as carefully as we can and you know, look into more innovative technologies.

Again, if we can Design-Build, that can save a lot of money and really speed up projects, so you know, in the question of resources, at least we're going to try and be as efficient as we possibly can with every dollar you know, that you all will give us.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Which is great to hear and I think the combination is what we'll need; you know, resource efficiency and creativity and a willingness to prioritize this at a level that will... and I asked a question actually yesterday of the Budget Director about a willingness to look at the Capital Budget itself in some way as a reflection of infrastructure priorities, which we just haven't done as a city before, and we either need to be willing to take on more debt service or not do something else if we're going to be able to invest more over time in the capital required for street safety, so that's not for this year's budget, but in the future. You mentioned the plazas and I think this is another area where both capital and ongoing operating and



1 maintenance funds are required, and I know you're  
2 aware of the neighborhood plaza's partnership and  
3 the effort to attend to the operating and  
4 maintenance needs of the plazas in lower income  
5 communities that can't necessarily through a bid  
6 fund maintenance and operations. Have you started  
7 to talk and work with that?

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yeah, I mean  
10 I've started to take a look at that and I think  
11 there's some great ideas on the ground and it's  
12 something you know, the Horticultural Society has  
13 been a terrific partner and you know, I think the  
14 plaza program has been a terrific success and you  
15 know, it is really spreading throughout the city,  
16 but we always want to make sure... sort of what the  
17 MTA was talking about it, right? It's one thing to  
18 build, but it's another thing to... you know, in  
19 perpetuity, maintaining it properly and we want to  
20 make sure we always do that 'cause if the plaza  
21 isn't maintained properly, obviously...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [interposing]  
23 Absolutely.

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: You know, it  
25 will fill with trash and soon it won't be nice, but

1  
2 I think we're... you know, we're very committed to  
3 trying to work with lower income areas where maybe  
4 a bid is not going to be the entity and you know,  
5 help with some capacity building to make sure you  
6 know, they're going to be able to maintain it going  
7 forward

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: That's great,  
9 and I know some council members who have plazas in  
10 neighborhoods like that have started to talk to  
11 each other and I hope will be able to talk to you  
12 as the...

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG:  
14 [interposing] We'd love to.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Time goes on.  
16 Picking up the comments on Bike Share and I brought  
17 my file. I can't say I rode in today, but and I  
18 appreciate your comments here and that you guys are  
19 taking seriously the need to have the system  
20 operating well and address the issues and do that  
21 forthrightly, so I'm confident you'll get through  
22 that. I have said before, and I said this in past  
23 administration, that you know, I see Bike Share as  
24 a piece of public infrastructure and it's  
25 appropriate to pay for the public infrastructure

1 with public funds. My constituents are so eager  
2 for it and have asked me, and I have this  
3 participatory budgeting that you know and am I  
4 willing to put some resources up out of  
5 discretionary capital, and so I have been on the  
6 record as saying I think it's an appropriate use of  
7 public funds. The prior administration wanted to  
8 get it started with private funds and it was great  
9 to get it started with private funds, but I think  
10 to achieve full build out in the neighborhoods we  
11 wanted to go, not just in neighborhoods where there  
12 might be a corporate sponsor that sees it as  
13 valuable, but I think it's going to take public  
14 funding and so I don't know if you're ready to go  
15 there yet today.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Well,  
18 obviously, I've heard from you and some of your  
19 colleagues. I know there's a great interest in the  
20 council and in putting in some of your own funds  
21 and right now, look, I'm not prepared to say what  
22 the city wants to do on that front. We're not  
23 there yet. Right now, to be honest with you, as I  
24 mentioned in my testimony, I think we need to make  
25 sure that the current system is stable and has a

good viable operation and they faced some challenges this winter, but you know, we are very keen to figure out a longer term plan; to figure out how it might be funded, public private, however it would be and get it expanding to more districts around the city. I mean that is the Mayor's goal, that is our goal and we're going to get there as quickly as we can, but it's going to take us a little time.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: That's great and you know, we want a system that works, so we appreciate you taking...

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Absolutely.

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: It seriously, but you have partners here that want to help you do that.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Well, I appreciate that.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I'll skip asking about bus countdown clocks because my time is about to come out, and Council Member Chin's going to ask about bus countdown clocks, [chime]

2 but I just want to say one more thank you, which is  
3 in the participatory budgeting process that we've  
4 had, residents of our district work with a lot of  
5 different agencies and without doubt DOT has come  
6 the farthest and done the best at working with us  
7 to find ways to make that work in our communities  
8 and I don't know if you... you've got to learn,  
9 some of you, but they have developed a little two-  
10 pager on how communities that do PB can work with  
11 DOT...

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG:

13 [interposing] Yeah.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And it really  
15 is...

16 [crosstalk]

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No, I've  
18 seen it.

19 [crosstalk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: A great  
21 model...

22 [crosstalk]

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I think it's  
24 terrific, yeah.

25 [crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So thanks to  
your staff for it.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, thank  
you. I have a terrific staff, no question.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.  
Thank you, Mr. Chair.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair.  
It's great to see you again, Commissioner.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Good to see  
you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: So yeah, on the  
countdown clock, I mean a lot of us, like the  
Council Member, we are really interested in having  
that in our community, especially with bus lines  
that doesn't run that often, so I guess also we  
want to see if DOT is willing to start making some  
investment on doing that and then if not, you know,  
to start, I think I'm willing to see how we can use  
some of the discretionary dollars to get some pilot  
projects going on specific bus lines...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG:  
[interposing] Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: In our districts.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: And we have a pilot project that we're doing in Staten Island and we're evaluating that and I think we're definitely... you know, we're evaluating that and we're happy to take a look at another part to... there's no question it's a resource question, and so if it's something you're interested in you know, we'd love to sit down and talk to you about it. You know, we're talking about many of our resource priorities here and I know this is one a lot of folks care about, but we obviously have to figure out how we would come up with the resources to expand it around the city.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: The other is that from the briefing documents we have, I mean some of the issues... some of the items like the Lower Manhattan Borough Commission Office and even Bike Share or Safe Streets for Seniors, these kind of projects get other sorts of funding, non-city funding, and it looks like that in FY 2015 they're zeroed out, so...

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Hm...

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Are...

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 176  
2 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: I don't...  
3 [crosstalk]  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: DOT have you  
5 had...  
6 [crosstalk]  
7 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: I don't  
8 think those things...  
9 [crosstalk]  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: By 20...  
11 [crosstalk]  
12 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Are zeroed  
13 out, but here, let me let Deputy...  
14 [crosstalk]  
15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah.  
16 [crosstalk]  
17 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Commissioner  
18 Jarrin comment on that.  
19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Council  
20 Member, DOT's budget for many of the grant items  
21 does not baseline the grant items, so we schedule  
22 the grants once we're sure the grants are secured  
23 with the new Fiscal Year, so we may see grants  
24 ending in Fiscal '15 that will likely not, and that  
25



we will be modding into the budget at the right time.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: So okay, so this is not 100 percent sure yet, okay, 'cause when I look at it I say all these are great programs and it's necessary and we just want to make sure that we get funding to continue those programs.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: Yeah, we are definitely intending to continue those programs and it's just our practice would always be and our policy has been to schedule grants once we're 100 percent sure we have them obligated and secured, so I... but for those programs there's no current indication that those would end.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay, the other question that I have it's like I'm just going out there in terms of is DOT thinking about rational tolling; I mean like what Sam Schwartz has proposed; because like in my district, and some of the other districts we get a lot of thru traffic. They don't really come into the community. They just pass through and create a lot of congestion and soot and really we want something to be done,

especially in my district along Canal Street and traffic going to the Holland Tunnel.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I know on Canal Street that's the biggest issue you've got. I'm not going to make news on that topic today, but it's a very good question and look, one I think you know, in the coming months we'll certainly talk to you about.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay, we'll follow up on that, and then some other issues like curb cuts. Are they in the DOT Capital Plan to really try to complete as many as possible...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG:  
[interposing] Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: In the district?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah. No, we know that's a high priority all over the city.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: And also with... like in my district, we have pedestrian managers, which focus on helping pedestrians cross the street. I mean traffic agents are there, but a lot of times they just move traffic, so if DOT is looking at it with Vision Zero, how to make sure like whatever we have people that we have... that

your staff is out there; whether it is traffic agents; that the priority should be on helping pedestrians cross the street safely.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yeah, I mean for Vision Zero we're going to take a look at what's going to make sense in every part of the city and, you know, you're absolutely right. In some parts of the city moving pedestrians is the highest priority, so you know, again, part of the outreach process we're going to be doing over the next couple months is to get very localized input on what we need to try in different neighborhoods throughout the city.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: And the last question I have is that I know it's not just in my district. Many other districts also have problems with placard parking.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Like what kind of problems?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: You know, they don't pay. They just take up the parking space with their placard. Some of them might not be legal placards; whether it's Police Department, the courts or whatever and I think it's really

important for DOT to issue tickets. If they don't pay the muni-meter, just like any ordinary citizen, they should get a ticket because we don't know if some of them whether they are fake or they're real and that law should just be enforced across the board.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I think that's an NYPD enforcement issue, but I think it's something we can certainly work with them on.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah, because I think that is something that is really... it's a problem that hasn't gone away yet.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: 'Kay.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Alright, thank you, Chair. [chime]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very much, Chair. Thank you, Commissioner and I want to echo my colleague's sentiment about how happy we are at your level of engagement with us at the City Council; with our communities. It's really something to speak to this administration's commitment with Vision Zero and what a priority it

1 is and that is something that we all embrace and a  
2 lot of the communities that I represent in  
3 Brooklyn; in Downtown Brooklyn and Williamsburg  
4 Greenpoint are very excited about getting this off  
5 the ground. I'm just going to ask one question  
6 about... and this may have been asked and I  
7 apologize; I was running in and out. The  
8 neighborhood slow zones and I have one of... I have  
9 the first neighborhood that was designated in  
10 Brooklyn in Boerum Hill. Brooklyn Heights is...  
11 and that's been implemented. Brooklyn Heights has  
12 been designated, but has not been implemented yet.  
13 That's due to be implemented I think in either 2015  
14 or 2016.

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Well, I'm  
17 happy that... it was 2016, but I'm happy to say  
18 it's now 2015.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Excellent.  
20 Alright, and it's something that is I think as the  
21 word gets out there, a lot of neighborhoods are  
22 excited about this, so Greenpoint's excited about  
23 it, South Williamsburg is excited about it and I  
24 was wondering if... is the limitation in terms of  
25 the timeframe is that due to budgetary constraints

and if we... if there were more money put into it could we get more slow zones implemented throughout the city?

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yeah, I think this answered the question before. Look, I'm still learning how our system works to get a lot of these things approved and up and running and you know, I commit to you all we're going to try and be as streamlined and as efficient as we can, but there's no question more resources would help do more of all the types of treatments that I think now, as you correctly point out, you know, neighborhoods all over the city are asking for.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: 'Kay, so if we could work with you we're more than happy and willing to do that and make sure that we're not out there you know, creating unrealistic expectations in our communities about how quickly things can get done, but to the extent that they can we want to encourage our communities to participate and advocate and put the pressure on us so that we can put the pressure on you to make sure that those things happen.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Fair enough.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you.  
Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]  
Council Member Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Hi, Commissioner.  
I want to echo a thank you about the plaza program.  
Staten Island will have the first plaza and it will  
be in my district and there's been talk of others,  
so we're really thankful about that. In terms of  
ferry services, there's... I know we recognized  
that it's a valued service and there's talk about  
increasing private ferry services throughout the  
Metropolitan area. Does the budget reflect the  
increase in private ferry services and to other  
areas...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG:  
[interposing] No, I mean our budget is addressing  
just the Staten Island Ferry and addressing the  
requirement now that we run half hour service on  
weekends 'til 2:00 a.m., although that's going to  
take some time to implement. EDC is really the  
city agency that spearheads the private ferry  
services and we're certainly in communication with  
them and I think we want to really sit down 'cause

we know it can be you know, speaking of one of the Mayor's priorities of greater accessibility around the city, obviously...

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] Mm-hm.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Ferries have a role to play, but we're going to work with them and they're really the lead agency on the private ferry side.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So there's not DOT dollars that go into subsidizing private ferry services.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: No, just the Staten Island Ferry.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, and do you when that contract for the new ferries; the Staten Island Ferries will be let or when we'll see new ferries in service?

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yeah, I think we're through the design phase now and that we've got the design contract awarded. I think the design processes takes about a year to two and then we would do the contract for construction probably around 2017 and as the Deputy Commissioner



mentioned, we're hoping to get federal funds for that. It's a large amount of money we're going to need and so we're going to be spending this time really working through different funding scenarios. You know, we know that is a very, very high priority for Staten Island.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Do you think that we'll be able to accommodate the fact that we will now have half hour service 24/7?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, we'll have it 'til... the legislation that the council passed is we'll have it 'til 2:00 a.m. on weekends and just so you know, I mean it's not just a matter of money. We're going to need a new crew for that. A crew on a ship is...

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing]  
Right.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: 23, 24 people. They have to be trained; Coast Guard certified. They have to work their way their way through the ranks. It's highly skilled work.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yeah, right.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So you can't just make that happen overnight. That takes... you

1 know, that takes a long lead time to do the 24-hour  
2 half hour service; sort of the next part of what  
3 was in that legislation, that's going to take a lot  
4 of resources and a lot more crew, so that's  
5 something we're going to need to I think come back  
6 and have further discussions on.

7  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, I think  
9 Council Member Chin and I live in the same district  
10 because we have the same concerns about congestion  
11 and pricing; countdown clocks and some of those  
12 issues, but in terms of the countdown clocks, how  
13 many pedestrian crossing signals were updated with  
14 countdown clocks in Fiscal '13 and how many will be  
15 done in Fiscal '14?

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Alright.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And are there  
18 plans to increase accessible pedestrian signals  
19 throughout the city?

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I  
21 think that we're... I'm just having us check on  
22 that. I think we have 4,300 countdown clocks now  
23 and I think we're adding another 4,500, if I'm  
24 correct, so we're moving pretty aggressively on  
25 that front. We know they've been hugely popular

all over the city and they're a fantastic safety improvement.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Is there a move to totally signalize all of the pedestrian signals with countdown clocks?

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Well, I think there's certain requirements you have to look at; you know, the distance involved and I mean you know, they're not inexpensive, so you...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Mm-hm.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: You have to make wise decisions about where to put them, but I think there are many parts of the city where clearly we will eventually put them in and I think they've been tremendously successful.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And are signals for the visually handicapped included in the cost to... or are you looking at...

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: We are looking...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Going in...

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: At that and I know we've started to do that around the city. It's another area where I think we're starting to look at you know, the success of how it's working and what sort of a sensible approach to take to go citywide and what the costs are.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And are you aware of that Move NY project, Faster. Smarter. Fairer that Sam Schwartz, the borough...

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG:  
[interposing] I am.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Well, the...

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: I am indeed.

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Traffic engineer and the past Commissioner? Are there any conversations about looking at that? Where are we with that?

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Not at the...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Is that something...

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yeah, not at moment. [chime]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Rosenthal?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you and Commissioner, it's so nice to see you again. Thanks for... I'm sure everyone's been praising you up the wazoo about all the good work you've been doing with Vision Zero, so...

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: [interposing] Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I want to add to my thanks... add that, my thanks to their thanks. Just a couple of very quick questions. I'm wondering about... I'm getting a lot of complaints in my district about... this is the Upper West Side of Manhattan, about environmentally appropriate salt and I'm wondering... you know, I know that in some of the northeastern states they've been able to use some more environmentally

friendly products, and it's also my understanding that this is a state contract where we purchase our salt through the state maybe and it comes from Chile. I don't really know all the details, but I'm wondering if you would consider exploring environmentally appropriate...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, and as you know...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Only Transportation...

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Really it's Department of Sanitation that is sort of the buyer and user of salt. That said, one of the things that we're going to do you know, in the light of this very difficult winter, is sit down with them and sort of talk together about how... 'cause obviously now as we're facing pothole season and it's been a tough winter...

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL:  
[interposing] Exactly.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Plowing, salt and everything, we're going to sit down and

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

11

12  
13  
14  
15  
16

17  
18  
19  
20

21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I don't know. You know, get an intern on that. So I'm chair of the Contracts Committee and just want to let you know about a couple of issues that we're looking at. One is in general areas where you've had cost overruns and are there any areas in particular that where you've found that in the past there have been cost overruns that you're looking at maybe to contract differently or think about differently moving forward?

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Well, I'm going to actually ask our Deputy Commissioner to comment on that, but one thing I do want to say sort of going back to my testimony, it's one of the reasons that I am so interested in Design-Build because the traditional way that we do procurement we do the design and we bid it to a contractor; any problems, change orders, et cetera we have to sort of eat the difference and...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah.

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: The nice thing about Design-Build is that the risk goes to



the contractor, and it's really a model that frankly, most of the rest of the country is using and the rest of the world and I think it can get at through one of the major sources in the transportation construction field of cost overrun, so...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Exactly.

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: That's something we're very enthusiastic about and hope you'll be a supporter and I don't know whether Commissioner Jarrin has something to say on that or not.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: I would just comment, Council Member, that we have analyzed our cost estimating and the estimates in the bids that we receive and how that then translates to the cost overruns afterward and we have found that with the great majority of our contracting we always fall within the 10 percent that's customary...

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL:

[interposing] Oh, wow.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER JARRIN: With a few very notable exceptions, which always have very good explanations. So I think on balance our DOT has a good track record on this topic, but if your committee has specific concerns about what you see, then we'd love to hear from you.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Or good ideas.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah and similarly, with your Design-Build if it's appropriate for the Contracts Committee to be helpful or be a part of it, perhaps we can learn about Best Practices for other agencies, so I'd be interested in participating in that.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Great. We would love to do that.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay and then one thing just to let you know, but I'm not expecting an answer today, that's been on the radar for the council is minority and women-owned businesses and last year, we asked agencies to set some aspirational goals and start to track that kind of thing, so to the extent that you have data on where you stand, both on the expense side and on

the capital side with women and minority-owned businesses for a number of sort of total contracts and numbers that are in this category; dollar amount and actual number and then percentage, I'd love to start seeing...

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: We... we...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That information.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yeah, we actually have a terrific program and we have a lot of data we'd be happy to give you and I...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Sure.

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: I think... I've just gotten a briefing on it myself and I was very impressed. I think we're doing a very good job on women-owned and minority-owned business contracting, but we'll be happy to give you all the data we've got and you can meet the folks [chime] who run that program and they're terrific.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner, I have a few other questions. When a major project such as Port Authority, they are renovating Bus Terminal 178 crossing the George Washington Bridge, you will increase traffic big time. It's an \$185 million renovation. Does the Port Authority work with the DOT so that we reorganize our streets and that... you know, that any renovation that is meeting a street to deal with the high increase of traffic to those locations is taking care of?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, it's a good question. We actually have a couple of forums in which all the transportation agencies in this region get together. One is NIMTECH, basically the New York Metropolitan Planning Organization. We also have TRANSCOM, where all the agencies get together and the goal is yes, to try and keep each other apprised of big projects and both day-to-day traffic issues and then longer range things. You know, is it a system that could probably constantly use revisiting? Yes and you know, I've already been talking fairly regularly with my counterparts

1  
2 at the MTA and the Port Authority and if there are  
3 particular areas of concern, would love to hear  
4 them, but we do try and... I mean the agencies do  
5 try and coordinate. You know, it's a very  
6 complicated region because there are so many  
7 transportation agencies you know, pursuing their  
8 own projects, et cetera.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Well, right  
10 now, with the Governor's commitment to invest I  
11 believe it's \$4 billion on renovating the LaGuardia  
12 Airport, I think that it will increase the capacity  
13 to 17 million people, so how will the city also get  
14 some funding so that we take care of all those  
15 streets in the surrounding airport because there's  
16 going to be higher numbers of drivers using that.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah. No,  
18 that's...

19 [crosstalk]

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And...

21 [crosstalk]

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: A very  
23 question and I don't know the answer to it, but  
24 certainly I'm very excited actually now to sit down  
25 with particularly the Aviation Department at the

Port Authority and start to talk through in more detail what the plans are for the airports and obviously, what will be needed on the city side to ensure we can accommodate whatever is the growth there.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. So going back on the specifics on the budget, can you tell us if the proposed budget includes any baseline parking rate increase in the Fiscal 2015 beyond the 20 percent increase we agreed to in Fiscal 2013? And if so, can you tell the committee what is your plan to do? Will you be seeking additional state funds to help defray the increase?

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yeah, just so you're aware, Mr. Chairman, actually the parking rate increases that the council approved last year are currently on hold. We have not implemented them and we have not proposed new increases for this fiscal year.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Right. How much parking meter revenue was collected in 2013?

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Yeah, I... let's see.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And what are the projections for the fiscal...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG:  
[interposing] I think it was... I'm going to... well, we've got the number right here.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: What is the projection for 2015?

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: It was... for Fiscal Year '13 it was \$178 million. We're projecting \$208 million for FY '14, but there can be some variation in the parking number for a variety of factors.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 'Kay.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And for Fiscal Year '15 we're projecting \$206 million.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. What about... how much revenue was DOT able to collect from Cemusa contract in...

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah.

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Fiscal 2013?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: \$47 million from Cemusa in Fiscal Year '13 and we're projecting \$48 in '14 and almost \$50 in FY '15.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 'Kay, and as you know, as I've been told, Cemusa provided the city 22 percent of the advertising space free to the city as part of the contract. Is the city or is DOT committed to get some percentage of those 22 to be assigned on the Vision Zero...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, that's a good question. I don't... I know you've asked me that before and I apologize. I don't have an answer yet. It is on our list of things to look into and you know, we'll get you an answer as soon as we can on that. It's a good question.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. So I had a question that constituents need for me to ask, which is about is there a way that the DOT can put markings on the on the fire hydrants that would show the actual distance requirement that people are allowed to park in the street. As you know, we are... as far as the drivers, I have been told and it's 12 feet, the distance that we can park the



car, but in most of the locations, that area is not painted.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: You mean the yellow paint that goes...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Along the... yeah, I mean I'm looking at my colleagues here. I assume we have a program to regularly update the paint. I will say, in particular, this winter has been tough on all our street markings and, you know, I apologize. It is going to take us a while to restripe and repaint everything we need to do throughout the city. They've taken a beating with all the bad weather.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But, you know, Commissioner, like you heard just something that is not just new because of this past winter. The city has failed in the past in not painting most of those locations, so this is like a constant complaint that we get citywide, so I think that if we can work together to be sure that we say you know what, September... from September on we will

1  
2 be sure that all those fire hydrants will be  
3 painted so that giving a ticket will not be subject  
4 to a police interpretation or the driver about his  
5 space about the drivers know where can they park  
6 the car; how... the distance that they have.

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, let me  
8 take a look and get back to you on it and look, I  
9 know the frustration. People get a ticket and they  
10 don't think they deserved it and obviously, we have  
11 to work with the NYPD on that on the enforcement  
12 end as well, so let us get back to you on that one.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Right. Well,  
14 on the Staten Island Ferry, will we be getting new  
15 ferries in the next couple of years?

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, as I  
17 said, we're going to start now the design process  
18 and that is going to take a couple years and then  
19 we should be ready to put out the contract to bid  
20 for the actual boats, but look, we are still going  
21 to need to identify funding sources, and again,  
22 we're looking at federal funds and other  
23 alternatives, but I don't think we've resolved that  
24 question yet.

25 CHAIRPERSON TROTTEBERG: Great.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: But we are keenly aware of what a very high priority this is.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And last, as I said in previous conversations, I would like to say publicly to everyone first of all, that what you have shown is a great level of inclusion when it comes to hear from our ideas and suggestions from all of us and I think that this is a change on the DOT because there has been many moments where the DOT did not listen and they went there with a particular project; this is what we're doing, no consultation with the local council members and I believe that at the end of the day a great leader is someone who listens and works together as much as possible, and I believe that in your leadership I hope that we can you know, build that level of sharing ideas in our community. I believe that you know, continual working together to build more plazas is important. It is not only New York City, but worldwide there is a lot of ideas on how we can turn our streets into a common place where people can interact and socialize, and there's a need that we have in some areas to hear from the community. Which plaza would you like to build? And the

1 council members, we are committed even to put the  
2 money. There's going to be some... on some  
3 occasion probably we'll come and say can you please  
4 include more money to build more plazas? On other  
5 occasions, we can say you will find... some council  
6 member will say I would like to see additional  
7 plazas in my district and I am committed to put the  
8 capital money and get a CBO who also is in  
9 partnership and I think that I'm looking forward on  
10 having those conversations and seeing how we can  
11 work together.  
12

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, well,  
14 thank you and look, I want to just thank Mayor de  
15 Blasio, 'cause he's really the one who gave me the  
16 charge to make sure to work closely with all of you  
17 and your communities and to listen to you and make  
18 sure that we have a real partnership going forward.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Council  
20 Member Rosenthal has a follow up question.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yes, I'm  
22 sorry. I have a quick follow up question about the  
23 red light camera cost overruns. So before you got  
24 here, it's unclear looking at the information  
25 exactly why the red light camera program went from

1  
2 its original value at \$26 million to the current  
3 spent value of \$65 million with the maximum  
4 contract amount of \$77. It looks like a lot of the  
5 reason is because more red light cameras, upgrades  
6 on wireless; lots of good reasons, but you know it  
7 strikes me... and more is better. I mean it's  
8 obviously a priority and we end up with really  
9 great outcomes, but it just sort of strikes me that  
10 with the push again for more red light cameras is  
11 the agency... is it possible over time has the cost  
12 of implementing the new red light cameras... is  
13 there some sort of learning curve that possibly the  
14 agency has gotten to so that with more red light  
15 cameras coming on you can... it doesn't have to be  
16 such an emergency that you spend more money because  
17 you have to get it done so quickly? Is there some  
18 way of using past practices and what you've learned  
19 from adding just over a short period of two years  
20 for you know, more than doubling the size of the  
21 budget? How does it look moving forward?

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Yeah. No,  
23 that's a very good question and look, one that's  
24 going to be pressing 'cause you know, I think we're  
25 all hopeful we're going to maybe have some success

in Albany and we'll be adding more cameras to the program, so let me take a look at that. It's a good question and...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah.

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Again, you know, one thing I'm pledging to you all is we're going to try and be as efficient and innovative as we can on our end, so.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL:

[interposing] Yeah.

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: You know, we're again, hoping to expand the camera program and obviously, we're going to want to...

[crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Exactly.

[crosstalk]

COMMISSIONER TROTTERBERG: Do it in a way that was as cost effective as possible.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Exactly and it looks like there's a track record... possible things that the agency probably has learned over the last couple years on it.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'm sure,  
yeah and usually with technologies like this  
there's a learning curve...

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL:  
[interposing] Yeah.

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And you  
discover there are actually things you need to do  
to fix it to sort of optimize its performance and  
then over time if you're doing it right, costs go  
down.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner,  
thank you for all your work and my last question as  
someone that was a person nationwide to oversee the  
Department of Transportation, what should we expect  
to see in your leadership as the DOT Commissioner  
when it comes to taking our transportation to  
another level to work with our goals to accomplish  
our 2025 city planning transportation ideas,  
challenges whereby 2020... I'm sorry, we will be  
adding an additional 550,000 new New Yorkers who  
will use mass transportation to go to work. How...  
what should we expect?

COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right.  
I'm...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How can...

COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG:

[interposing] I mean look, I'm coming from U.S. DOT, but New York City is you know, one of the global cities and you know, you've already done a lot of terrific and innovative things here. I want to build on that and look, we're going to find even some more creative things to do moving forward and you're certainly right, Mr. Chairman and we have a pressing charge here in New York City and we actually have it nationwide and our population is growing. You know, our transportation system is kind of bursting at the seams and we're going to have to find some really innovative ways to make sure we can get all the citizens of this city and you know, connect them with the jobs and the opportunities that they need to succeed in life. Thank you all.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: We will have now Juan Martinez from the Transportation Alternatives.

[Pause]



JUAN MARTINEZ: Good afternoon, my name is Juan Martinez, here on behalf of Transportation Alternatives. I wanted to thank you for the opportunity to testify. I'm just going to run through it very quickly, if you don't mind.

First of all, one important point on transit and then the rest of my conversation will just be about MTA. I'm sorry, about Vision Zero. Regarding transit, the transportation advocacy groups have agreed on a goal for this year's city budget and the city's contribution to the MTA to double the contribution to the MTA. If we were to do so this year, we would be investing \$200 million in the MTA, which is still about 60 percent less than what we were investing in 1982 if you correct for inflation. In today's dollars we were doing \$500 million, half a billion dollars to the MTA, and now we're only doing \$100 million.

But the substance of my remarks is really focused on Vision Zero and it's really focused on Vision Zero and it's really focused on the importance of creating a Vision Zero fund to make sure that the ambitious plans outlined in the Mayor's Action Report become a reality. You know,

the Commissioner testified that for years the DOT has very successfully managed to do more with less. Obviously, at this moment we have to do more with more. Creating the change that is needed with the Vision Zero Plan requires new funding. It can't be done simply by reprioritizing existing dollars and it's obvious from the just sheer scale of the challenge ahead of us, and we really do have to address it as an impending emergency and when we look at the budgets that are going to be proposed in the coming months, we're going to be looking for three large buckets of funding, right? The Action Plan very appropriately is focused on the arterial streets, the biggest, most difficult and expensive streets to redesign, but those are the streets that cause the most danger. That requires a whole lot of capital funding because you need a whole lot more in terms of concrete and signs and so on, but it requires all sorts of new engineers and designers and planners in order to create the redesigns. These projects are more complex, so we just need more brain power. We need more people working on the designs and then also, in order to have a continuing discussion with the community

that's going to ensure Vision Zero's success, we are going to need much more in the way of community outreach. Everything in Vision Zero is something that we all support citywide, but inevitably, when it comes to specific projects there's going to be some disagreement and that disagreement will always be reduced the more people we can involve in the conversation. When it's a small number of folks who have a particular grievance with redesign, the simplest answer is to make sure that the community at large is consulted and that we really make an effort to involve stakeholders before the project is designed to identify the problems as the solutions are being chosen and then again at the conclusion of the project to fine tune it. That's quite a bit of work with 50 intersections and corridors being slated for every year, so in addition to the capital and the personnel to plan and design these projects, we're talking about really a new perspective on community outreach, clearly, a very large investment that we're going to have to make in our streets. The good news is that we currently spend quite a bit of money. There's more detail in my testimony about it. We

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

212

spend quite a bit of money responding to these  
crashes that we'll save in the out years and this  
investment will pay dividends for generations to  
come. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.  
Thank you, Juan, for all the hard work and on  
bringing some ideas and initiatives on  
transportation. Thank you. And with that, this  
hearing is adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.



Date: 04/04/2014