

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

----- X

February 24, 2014

Start: 1:40 p.m.

Recess: 4:23 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Hearing Rm,
16th Fl.

B E F O R E:
ANTONIO REYNOSO
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Andy King
Costa Constantinides
Vanessa L. Gibson
Steven Matteo
I. Daneek Miller

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Anusha Venkataraman
Director
Green Light District, El Puente

Joan Levine
Co-Chair of Board of Directors
Morningside Heights/West Harlem
Sanitation Coalition

Gavin Kearney
Director of Environmental Justice
New York Lawyers for the Public Interest

Maya Pinto
Research Analyst
The Alliance for a Greater New York

Eddie Bautista
Executive Director
NYC Environmental Justice Alliance

Bertha Lewis
President
The Black Institute

Lorraine Johnson
Volunteer
Pledge 2 Protect

Kelly Nimmo-Guenther
President
Pledge 2 Protect

Elsie McCabe Thompson
Advocate
Asphalt Green

Carol Tweedy
Executive Director
Asphalt Green

Annietje Montross
Volunteer
Pledge 2 Protect

Sherry Sowell
Compost Squad Coordinator
Parks Slope Food Co-op

Eric Goldstein
NYC Environment Director/Attorney
Natural Resources Defense Council

Ron Bergamini
CEO
Action Environmental Group

Austin Shafran
NY State Legislative Director
The Working Families Party

David Dobosz
Steering Committee Member
OUTRAGE Williamsburg/Greenpoint

Laura Hofmann
Co-founder
Barge Park Pals

Eric Bruzaitis
Steering Committee Member
OUTRAGE Williamsburg/Greenpoint
Chair
Truck Enforcement Task Force

John Shehas
Employee
Teamsters Local Union 813

Rich Kassel
Senior Vice President
Gladstein, Neandross and Associates

Pedro Cardi
Trustee
Board of Teamsters Local 210

Bernadette Kelly
International Representative
Teamsters Joint Council 16

Sean T. Campbell
President
Teamsters Local Union 813

Rebecca Rosado
A.C.T.I.O.N Program Manager
The POINT Community Development
Corporation

Kellie Terry
Executive Director
The POINT Community Development
Corporation

Anthony Winn
Chief Operating Officer
We Stay/Nos Quedamos

Angela Tovar
Director of Policy and Research
Sustainable South Bronx

Samantha MacBride, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor
Baruch College

Brendan Sexton
Chair
Manhattan Solid Waste Advisory Board

Vince McGowan
President
United War Veterans Council

Debra Menich
Donation Director
United War Veterans Council

Maite Quinn
Business Development and
Marketing Manager
Sims Municipal Recycling

George Morin
President
Gracie Point Community Council

Tanya Bley
Volunteer
North Brooklyn Compost

David Buckel
Co-founder
NYC Community Compost Roundtable

Thomas Toscano, Esq.
Chief Financial Officer
Mr. T Carting Corp.
Chair
National Solid Wastes and
Recycling Association

Vandra Thorburn
President
Vokashi, Inc.

Daniel Tainow
Education Director
Lower East Side Ecology Center

Maggie Clarke, Ph.D.
Environmental Consultant
NYC Waste Prevention

Greg Todd
Member
Brooklyn Allied Composters and Carters

Jennie Romer, Esq.
Founder/Director
plasticbaglaws.org

Ann Kaplan
Member
Pledge 2 Protect

Andrew Morrison
Statewide Outreach Director
NYPIRG

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Now it's in
3 session. [laughter] Alright, so again, for the
4 record the Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste
5 Management is now in session. Good afternoon. My
6 name is Antonio Reynoso and I am the new chair of
7 the Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste
8 Management. [applause] Thank you. Please allow me
9 to welcome you all to the first hearing of this
10 committee for the City Council session entitled
11 "Sanitation Policy in New York: Ideas for the Next
12 Four Years." I am joined today by my fellow
13 committee members, Council Member King and Council
14 Member Constantinides. Thank you, guys, for being
15 here. I think we eventually will be joined by
16 Council Member Gibson and Council Member Matteo as
17 well.

18 I can't tell you how excited I am to be
19 here today chairing this hearing. I may be new to
20 the committee, but I'm not new to the issues of
21 managing the city's waste because the district I
22 represent and the neighborhood where I grew up is
23 the home to more garbage transfer stations with
24 more permanent capacity to handle waste than any
25 other in the city of New York, and those transfer

2 stations and the trucks that service them have
3 impacted our health, our quality of life and our
4 environment. So that is, in part, why we are
5 having this hearing today to move the conversation
6 forward on how we can do better; a better job of
7 handling commercial and residential waste, recycle
8 more, reduce trash and otherwise improve
9 performance in this area. The good news is that we
10 have an excellent solid waste management plan that
11 moves up in the right direction in terms of borough
12 equity, so we're going to build on that and
13 continue to make things better.

14 This hearing is intentionally open-
15 ended. I wanted to give the public a chance to
16 come in today and tell this committee what you
17 think we should go over for the next few years;
18 what policies we should pursue, what problems do we
19 need to solve and how we can handle waste in a way
20 that's fair to everyone. These types of questions
21 I'm hoping we can start we can start to answer
22 today. So here are some topics I think will come
23 up today: How can we reduce the permanent capacity
24 in districts most impacted by waste handling? Is
25 there a better system of handling commercial waste

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 9
2 that could reduce trash and improve recycling and
3 labor practices in the waste handling sectors? How
4 are we doing putting SWMP in place and are things
5 we can do to expedite that implementation? What
6 would be the best way to reduce plastic bags and
7 their impact on the environment? And I could go
8 on, but you get the point. We're looking for the
9 big ideas; the game changers; the things that we
10 can launch a discussion on today and pursue going
11 forward. So with that said, I will now turn it
12 over to for the first panel that I will be inviting
13 up, but first, I just... I'm aware of the terrible
14 tragedy of Gedalia Gruntzweig being struck and
15 killed by a sanitation truck yesterday morning. My
16 thoughts and prayers go out to his family and to
17 that whole community. I will work with the Police
18 Department to fully understand what happened and to
19 see if there is anything we can learn to help
20 prevent such tragedies in the future. Alright, now
21 I would call up my first panel, Anusha; Joan
22 Levine; Gavin Kearney; Matt Ryan and Eddie
23 Bautista. Yes, I also would like to just make a
24 quick announcement. We have a lot of folks waiting
25 to come in today to speak, so what we're going to

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 10

2 ask is that after your testimony, if you are to
3 speak, that you please give an opportunity for
4 folks that are currently in an overflow room to
5 come in so they can also make their own testimony.
6 Thank you. Also, every speaker is going to get two
7 minutes to speak because of the long line we have
8 of speakers and we're going to give our council
9 members an opportunity to answer any questions they
10 have; up to three minutes any questions to any
11 panel member and also to hear their reply. Thank
12 you. So Anusha?

13 ANUSHA VENKATARAMAN: There we go.

14 Thank you, Chairman Reynoso and council members,
15 for the opportunity to testify today. I am Anusha
16 Venkataraman. I'm Director of the Green Light
17 District at El Puente. I'll save the El Puente
18 spiel 'cause I know you're very familiar with us as
19 our council member. So we work with you and
20 Environmental Justice, Education and the Arts and
21 we're a member of the New York City Environmental
22 Justice Alliance. We're here today because our
23 community is heavily impacted by these policies.
24 North Brooklyn has the highest concentration of
25 waste transfer stations in the city, 15 at last

2 count, which process over 7,000 tons of garbage
3 each day. This means that this garbage is trucked
4 through residential streets of Williamsburg,
5 Bushwick and Greenpoint affecting air quality and
6 overall quality of life. We, as a result, suffer
7 from asthma, cardiovascular disease and many
8 quality of life issues that really affect you know,
9 young people of every family in North Brooklyn. So
10 we specifically are in support of policy
11 initiatives that reduce the waste burden in our
12 community and others that are overburdened such as
13 the South Bronx and redistribute waste management
14 in an equitable way. One way to do this is
15 capacity reduction legislation. Capacity reduction
16 would ensure that the communities that already
17 handle most of the city's waste are not forced to
18 handle even more, so by reducing that excess
19 capacity, we make sure that the total amount of
20 waste that any one community should have to take is
21 capped and that any new locations are redistributed
22 in a fair and modest way. Secondly, we're also a
23 member of the Transform Don't Trash NYC Coalition,
24 as many members in this room, which builds upon the
25 successes of the Solid Waste Management Plan to

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 12

2 deal with the commercial waste sector. This is the
3 next frontier. Commercial waste facilities are
4 especially concentrated in our community and the
5 South Bronx...

6 [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And can you
8 please wrap it up? Thank you.

9 ANUSHA VENKATARAMAN: Yep, I will. So
10 basically this would make sure that there are fair
11 standards for where commercial waste facilities are
12 sited; that we can have one truck route for an
13 entire district instead of nine or 10, and that the
14 work standards for workers for those commercial
15 haulers can be regulated in an efficient way.
16 Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. So we
18 don't have a timer here because we're at capacity
19 at other hearings and this is actually the
20 cafeteria. [laughter] We figured the cafeteria
21 would be a great place to have a trash talk
22 meeting, right? So be mindful that we have our
23 very handy iPhone with a two minute timer and every
24 time I see two minutes, I will ask you to wrap up,
25 okay? Thank you, guys. Joan?

2 JOAN LEVINE: Good afternoon.

3 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Good afternoon.

4 JOAN LEVINE: My name is Joan Levine
5 and I'm co-chair of the Sanitation Coalition, a
6 grassroots environmental justice group in the West
7 Harlem and Morningside Heights area of Manhattan.
8 I want to thank the Sanitation Committee for giving
9 us this opportunity to speak. We are from
10 Manhattan, but unlike some others, believe strongly
11 in the New York City Charter's provision of fair
12 share. Furthermore, our members have been to
13 Metropolitan Avenue in North Brooklyn and seen the
14 steady stream of noisy trucks belching pollutants
15 into the air on their way to or from the nearby
16 land transfer stations. Obviously, for the sake of
17 our brothers and sisters in North Brooklyn, South
18 Bronx and Northeast Queens, capacity reduction is
19 long overdue, as is putting the Solid Waste
20 Management Plan into full effect. However, even
21 we, in the borough of Manhattan, feel the effects
22 of this dysfunctional sanitation system. Look at
23 the stickers on the front door of every commercial
24 store in our neighborhood and you'll see a sticker
25 indicating a different carter. Thus, instead of

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 14
2 one garbage truck coming to the block, perhaps as
3 many as a dozen arrive each night. Each truck
4 spews out pollutants as it idles. Commercial
5 haulers cut corners to provide the cheapest service
6 so they can get more customers. Many trucks rattle
7 through every neighborhood in New York City
8 polluting the air, disturbing the sleep of those
9 who live over the businesses and jeopardizing the
10 workers who man these trucks.

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: 15 seconds.

12 JOAN LEVINE: Millions of tons of waste
13 that could be recycled or composted is instead
14 buried in landfills or burned in incinerators.
15 This chaotic system must be fixed. The group
16 Transform Don't Trash, to which we proudly belong,
17 strongly recommends a franchise system for
18 commercial waste.

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Will you
20 please...

21 [crosstalk]

22 JOAN LEVINE: Other members...

23 [crosstalk]

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Wrap it up,
25 ma'am?

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 15

2 [crosstalk]

3 JOAN LEVINE: Of our group will discuss
4 in more detail.

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you so
6 much, Joan.

7 JOAN LEVINE: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Gavin Kearney?

9 GAVIN KEARNEY: Good afternoon,
10 Chairman Reynoso and members of the committee.
11 Thank you for the opportunity to testify today. My
12 name is Gavin Kearney. I direct the Environmental
13 Justice Program at New York Lawyers for the Public
14 Interest. I submitted written testimony and in the
15 interest of moving this along I'll just hit a
16 couple of points. One is essentially we would
17 strongly urge two main policy agendas for the
18 Sanitation Committee over the next four years and
19 for the broader council. One is full and expedient
20 implementation of the Solid Waste Management Plan.
21 Many of the pieces of the plan are moving forward,
22 some with delay. We would encourage the council to
23 use its oversight authority and whatever means it
24 has to ensure that it moves forward quickly and on
25 time, and one particular key piece that remains

2 outstanding is the relief to overburdened
3 communities as we create new capacity. As I think
4 members of the committee know, last session, a bill
5 was introduced and nearly passed, Intro 1170,
6 before the end of the session. We would encourage
7 the committee to move forward quickly with moving
8 the pass the reduction legislation in 2014. In
9 particular, there's urgency because as the new
10 moving transfer stations come on line, which for
11 the first couple will happen relatively soon,
12 there's an opportunity to take advantage of that
13 new capacity by offsetting capacity in those
14 communities that have been overburdened with waste
15 for too long.

16 The second main policy agenda, and Joan
17 spoke to this already, New York Lawyers for the
18 Public Interest is also a proud member of Transform
19 Don't Trash NYC. As folks may know, New York City
20 generates over four million tons of commercial
21 waste every year, more than any other city in the
22 U.S. My partner, Maya Pinto's going to talk a
23 little bit more about the impacts of that in New
24 York City. I'll just quickly touch on what a
25 franchising system could do for New York City.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 17

2 Essentially through an efficient franchising
3 system, the city would be divided into franchise
4 zones and then bid out to haulers. It encourages
5 high road hauling; it encourages truck efficiency,
6 as Joan suggested, rather than 10 trucks servicing
7 a street. I'm guessing that's my timer.

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah.

9 GAVIN KEARNEY: Alright, so let me just
10 quickly wrap it up by saying that through...
11 [laughter] wow. Yes, someone else is keeping tabs
12 on me too. A franchising system can be done in a
13 flexible way. It's cost-effective. It can be done
14 in a way that doesn't hurt businesses, particularly
15 small businesses. It can take us from a system
16 that's woefully inadequate where 26 percent of our
17 waste gets recycled to a system where double or
18 triple that gets recycled and in so doing creates
19 jobs, improve quality of life, lessen air pollution
20 and so on. Thank you for the opportunity.

21 [crosstalk]

22 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Gavin,
23 appreciate it. [background voices] Matt Ryan?

24 MAYA PINTO: Thank you, Chairperson
25 Reynoso and members of the Sanitation Committee for

2 the opportunity to provide testimony today. My
3 name is Maya Pinto and I'm here representing Matt
4 Ryan from ALIGN, the Alliance for a Greater New
5 York. We're a long-term alliance of worker and
6 community organizations united for a just and
7 sustainable New York. Firstly, I'd like to commend
8 Council Member Reynoso and members of the committee
9 for calling this hearing to explore long-term
10 policy ideas for sanitation. As most people are
11 aware, commercial waste is a troubling problem for
12 our city. New York City commercial establishments
13 generate a staggering 3.2 million tons of
14 commercial solid waste every year. The vast
15 majority is sent to landfills and incinerators far
16 away, and the system to handle that waste, as many
17 have already sort of described, is fraught with a
18 number of problems; low recycling rates, very dirty
19 trucks; overlapping routes. The waste is taken to
20 a small handful of low-income communities;
21 communities of color in North Brooklyn, Southeast
22 Queens and the South Bronx and you know, it doesn't
23 have to be this way. ALIGN and our coalition
24 partners in Transform Don't Trash NYC in October
25 2014 proposed a new path forward through an

2 exclusive franchising system, and in our report;
3 our coalition report we demonstrated how our
4 franchise policy is actually a smart way to promote
5 a race to the top that will increase diversion from
6 landfills and incinerators, boost recycling and
7 composting, improve truck routing efficiency and
8 promote safer living wage jobs. Moreover, by
9 increasing diversion, exclusive franchising is an
10 economic development strategy. According to a
11 recent study by the Tellus Institute, every 25
12 percent increase in landfill diversion can create
13 up to 5,000 new jobs in recycling reliant
14 manufacturing, and also achieving an 80 percent
15 commercial diversion rate would eliminate five to
16 seven million tons of greenhouse gas emissions in a
17 single year, which is like taking 1.5 million cars
18 off the road. I'd like to also say that it's
19 really important to note that franchising is
20 consistent with the current Solid Waste Management
21 Plan. Marine and rail transfer stations will
22 remain vital to handling waste that still needs to
23 be disposed of and you know, a franchise system
24 will build upon the relief that capacity reduction

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 20
2 legislation, which we support, will provide to
3 overburdened communities...
4 [crosstalk]
5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. Thank
6 you very much and can you...
7 [crosstalk]
8 MAYA PINTO: By increasing recycling
9 and reducing the amount of commercial...
10 [crosstalk]
11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And I...
12 [crosstalk]
13 MAYA PINTO: Waste.
14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I'm going to
15 actually... I'm actually going...
16 [crosstalk]
17 MAYA PINTO: Oh, okay.
18 [crosstalk]
19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: To ask a follow-
20 up question regarding that.
21 [crosstalk]
22 MAYA PINTO: Yeah.
23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: It's just how
24 would it last in the capacity of these low-income
25 communities? How would franchising assist in

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 21

2 bringing down the burden of 20,000 tons of capacity
3 in my neighborhood...

4 MAYA PINTO: [interposing] Yes.

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: To something
6 that's more reasonable?

7 MAYA PINTO: Well so, part of the
8 franchising plan is to create diversion benchmarks,
9 so thresholds where companies would have to
10 maximize recycling, which would in turn reduce the
11 amount of waste that's going through these
12 neighborhoods, but also in terms of being able to
13 incentivize haulers for using marine and rail
14 transfer stations to the more equitably distributed
15 facilities. Because all of these facilities have
16 commercial waste capacity, it would also reduce the
17 amount of waste that's coming to overburdened
18 communities.

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And will it also
20 lessen truck traffic and mileage?

21 MAYA PINTO: Yes, because you would
22 completely eliminate the overlapping routes. You
23 would have in each zone one hauler having a very
24 you know, efficient route, so that would greatly
25 reduce the number of trucks.

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright, thank
3 you and I would just... if my colleagues have any
4 questions that they would like to ask just to the
5 folks have talked already or who have testified
6 already. Alright, so let me finish with... it's a
7 large panel. Eddie Bautista. Thank you.

8 EDDIE BAUTISTA: Thank you, Chair
9 Reynoso and members of the committee for the
10 opportunity to both testify and for your leadership
11 on this issue. I just want to say three quick
12 things. One is the Solid Waste Management Plan.
13 We're in year seven of a 20-year plan, so calls for
14 its upending or revisiting are beyond premature,
15 particularly and if... we find it really
16 interesting that communities that have been at the
17 forefront of delaying this plan are the ones that
18 are saying it needs to be upended. What people
19 always forget is that the marine transfer station
20 and rail transfer station options are not just in
21 other communities. They're also in the communities
22 that are burdened with the land-based waste
23 transfer stations, so you got to ask why do our
24 communities support this? We support this because
25 as we assume if everyone wants to reduce polluting

2 truck traffic, you do so by switching to barge and
3 rail export. By their own estimates, the city has
4 estimated that the reduction in vehicle miles
5 traveled in New York City within city limits every
6 year will be below... it'll be 5.5 million vehicle
7 miles traveled reduction in New York City every
8 year. Each barge will remove the equivalent of 48
9 tractor trailer 18-wheel trucks. Every rail car
10 will remove the equivalent of four tractor trailer
11 18-wheel trucks. So this is not just something
12 that's going to benefit our communities, but it has
13 a regional air quality impact that no one in their
14 right mind would want to oppose. For us, this is
15 really about moving forward. How do we address the
16 really big unanswered parts of this plan? Too much
17 attention is paid to one or two marine transfer
18 stations. There were two others that are slated
19 for Manhattan. Where is the Gansevoort Marine
20 Transfer Station? Where is the West 59th Street
21 Marine Transfer Station? So from our perspective,
22 it isn't that Manhattan is getting too much. It's
23 not getting enough when it comes to marine transfer
24 station capacity. We need every ton of capacity in
25 this system because at the end of the day, our

2 communities are still going to be faced with
3 transfer station impacts, which leads me to the
4 second point. We need transfer station; land-based
5 waste transfer station reduction capacity. It's in
6 the SWMP. The whole point of switching to marine
7 and rail is to reduce the impacts of land-based
8 waste transfer stations. So we've got to move on
9 this. The Department of Sanitation...

10 [crosstalk]

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: 10 seconds.

12 EDDIE BAUTISTA: Negotiated voluntary
13 reductions; it's not enough, and finally, the
14 Transform Don't Trash Coalition proposal. We have
15 got to find a more sane way of handling commercial
16 waste. Reducing the amount that we send to
17 landfills...

18 [crosstalk]

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Eddie.
20 I just want to make sure...

21 [crosstalk]

22 EDDIE BAUTISTA: And increasing job...

23 [crosstalk]

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: That you stick to
25 your two minutes.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 25

2 EDDIE BAUTISTA: Absolutely.

3 CHAIRSPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you...

4 [crosstalk]

5 EDDIE BAUTISTA: Yes.

6 [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Sir. Now, if any
8 of my colleagues have any questions? Yes, Council
9 Member King?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Good afternoon
11 and congratulations to Mr. Chair...

12 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing]
13 Thank you, yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: On hosting our
15 first committee hearing on waste. I am no expert
16 on trash removal or on waste other than taking it
17 from my kitchen into the outside to the yard, but I
18 want to ask a number of questions because I did
19 hear some things in your testimony and I just want
20 some clarity because as I could see, it looks like
21 everybody in the room is on the same page to
22 understanding that we need to have equitable waste
23 transfer stations across the city. Me,
24 representing one of the districts in the Bronx, I
25 know when I travel on the Bruckner Expressway, from

2 time to time I get to absorb those beautiful
3 fragrances in the air [background voices] that come
4 from you know, someone didn't use the Febreze, but
5 even though to say that you mentioned something
6 about in Brooklyn, which we know that district is
7 the largest district that handles all our trash.
8 You talked about children and asthma rates. I'd
9 like to know, and if you don't have it today, I'd
10 like to know really what are the asthma rates that
11 are coming and the children being sick and how many
12 days that children are missing school because
13 they've gotten sick? I really need to know because
14 now... [background voices] yeah, we need to put a
15 real human component to all the people who are
16 fighting against this; how the plan is to making
17 sure that trash is you know, and waste is done you
18 know, equitably around the city. Second
19 question... third question I want to ask is that
20 I'm hearing about franchising and outsourcing and
21 grabbing new... you know, privatizing this. I want
22 to know how does that have an impact on the
23 Department of Sanitation and the work that our
24 professionals do in the Department of Sanitation
25 because anytime we start looking to give it to

2 somebody else that's not you know, a unionized or
3 city worker, what are the standards that they live
4 by and codes to make sure that they're delivering
5 what they should be delivering? And I say this you
6 know, with all humble respect to you, but I know
7 the training that the members that you know,
8 sanitation gets and if it has any indication that
9 some of the snow removal; some of the people that
10 were doing that job, I'd say we got to make sure
11 that we have qualified, trained people to do this
12 job whether it's snow removal or waste management.

13 EDDIE BAUTISTA: I'm going to begin
14 with at least the South Bronx childhood asthma
15 rates. In Hunts Point, one neighborhood in the
16 South Bronx, the childhood hospitalization asthma
17 rate; the amount of the rate that kids go to the
18 hospital emergency rooms is 12 times the national
19 average, and in the South Bronx you have five
20 percent of the population handling over 25 percent
21 of the city's waste, so that's just one
22 neighborhood snapshot.

23 ANUSHA VENKATARAMAN: I don't have the
24 numbers for North Brooklyn in regards to the asthma
25 in front of me, but I do know that children,

2 especially those under five years of age if they
3 live within I think it's 200 feet of a highway or a
4 truck route they are two-thirds more likely to
5 develop asthma and you know, that's significant
6 since there are many truck routes in our community.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Mm-hm. Alright.

8 GAVIN KEARNEY: Okay, the question
9 about franchising and how it affects the Department
10 of Sanitation. So in New York City residential
11 waste is collected by the Department of Sanitation.
12 What we're proposing would have no effect on what
13 the Department of Sanitation collects. It's the
14 commercial waste sector. It's what comes out of
15 businesses, restaurants, office buildings that
16 right now is purely privatized with very little
17 oversight. So in New York City you need a license
18 to haul waste from a business. We have over 200
19 licensed haulers. We have over 4,000 commercial
20 trucks picking up this waste. If you pick a block
21 that had 10 businesses we could have 10 different
22 companies each driving a truck down that street to
23 pick up that waste. So what we're talking about
24 for franchising is you create a rational system.
25 It's still private like it is today, but the city

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 29

2 uses its authority to regulate that system in a way
3 that improves working conditions for sanitation
4 workers. You'll hear today from a number of folks
5 that support this that are dealing with the
6 conditions in the private sector today. It
7 improves recycling rates. It creates jobs, et
8 cetera, but just to emphasize it doesn't gouge out
9 at what the Department of Sanitation currently
10 does. It's a complement to what the Department of
11 Sanitation does.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Okay well, does
13 it complement... fine, I just want to see...

14 GAVIN KEARNEY: [interposing] Sure.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: One system that
16 works. 10 different owners coming down the street
17 doing what they want to do. This is where we get
18 the chaos...

19 [crosstalk]

20 GAVIN KEARNEY: Yes.

21 [crosstalk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: And our children
23 can't make it to school because they've gotten
24 sick. So I just want to make sure that we...
25 however this conversation continues to play out...

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 30

2 GAVIN KEARNEY: [interposing] Yeah.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: That the
4 administration's on the same page; that we create
5 one system that works with you know, so when
6 something goes wrong we're looking at one person.
7 We're not looking at nine different owners trying
8 to track them down to find out what went wrong and
9 if you can; if you can find out I really want to
10 put a child component to this piece, especially
11 since our new administration; our Mayor is talking
12 about Universal Pre-K so much and making sure our
13 children have access, but we need to make sure our
14 children have access to better health issues also
15 too, so I'm saying if you can find the real number
16 of how many children are missing school each and
17 every day because of these trucks and sanitation
18 problems. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Well, thank you
20 and I just want to note two things; that
21 franchising opens up the opportunity to regulate an
22 unregulated system, so we might be able to look at
23 how we can regulate it to ensure that we have high
24 quality work, and also as chair of the Black,
25 Latino and Asian Caucus, 75 percent of the trash

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 31

2 that is currently handled in the city of New York
3 is handled by three communities; Southeast Queens,
4 North Brooklyn and South Bronx and all communities
5 of color, so it is an issue that I think is
6 important that we should address in the caucus as
7 well and I believe Council Member Constantinides
8 has a question.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank
10 you and thank you, Mr. Chair. First, I want to
11 extend my congratulations to you and I've known you
12 a long time working in the council and you've
13 always been a fierce advocate for your community
14 and a fierce advocate for the people of the city of
15 New York, so looking forward to the many great
16 things you're going to do for this committee.

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: But I
19 have a really quick question about franchising. I
20 definitely recognize... and it's always good to see
21 you as well, my good friend. I definitely
22 understand the need. One, we need to protect our
23 workers and secondly, we need to reduce the amount
24 of truck traffic on the street. I just have a
25 question about when you talk about zones, so giving

2 someone a zone. We're also sort of taking away
3 that competition in pricing; you know, making sure
4 that the small business has a challenge in a
5 particular zone with that hauler. How are we
6 planning on addressing those things? We protect
7 our small businesses; that they aren't getting
8 harmed as we do the right thing environmentally,
9 which is so, so important.

10 GAVIN KEARNEY: That's a great
11 question. So under the current system small
12 businesses are getting hurt. They're the
13 businesses that have the least leverage to
14 negotiate competitive rates and if you're a small
15 business in New York City, the likelihood that
16 you'll actually get multiple bids to take your
17 waste is very limited, so you're already operating
18 at a deficit and what we've seen in other cities
19 that have done franchising is they've moved to a
20 system where big businesses have the leverage to
21 negotiate competitive hauling rates, small
22 businesses lack it, to a system where everybody
23 pays the same rational price. The other thing
24 we've seen from other jurisdictions is you can
25 achieve these higher road gains without increasing

2 costs. The way you can do that is you build in
3 certain efficiencies to the system. So a hauler
4 that had 500 customers spread throughout the city
5 now can have 5,000 customers in a dense area. That
6 efficiency can translate into cost savings to
7 businesses as well as higher road practices. You
8 also get a guaranteed stream; 10 years, 15 years
9 depending on how you design the system. That
10 guaranteed stream allows the haulers to make a
11 profit while also operating at relatively lower
12 profit margins on a day to day basis. So that's
13 absolutely a critical concern; keeping cost in
14 check, but it can be done and in terms of the
15 competition, there's two ways you can build in
16 competition. One is the bidding process at the
17 front end. The city has the leverage to negotiate
18 on behalf of the franchise zone to ensure that
19 they're getting the most for the least possible
20 cost and then over time there's renewed competitive
21 bidding each time the franchise comes up for
22 renewal.

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Gavin.
24 I just want to say also our intention here is that
25 when it comes to the franchising opportunity that

2 we might have here, which I think is great, looking
3 forward to four years or eight years, is the fact
4 that we don't raise costs, so we don't put this
5 burden of managing the waste onto business owners.
6 That's the last thing we want to do. We want to
7 figure out a way to maintain prices, but also do
8 the work smarter. Thank you guys so much for
9 testifying and I'd like to call up the next group.
10 Bertha Lewis and for full disclosure, she was my
11 former boss when I worked at ACORN. Yeah, she's
12 still my boss, right? Things don't change. Carol
13 Tweedy; Elsie McCabe Thompson; Kelly Nimmo-Guenther
14 and Lorraine Johnson and I apologize if I messed up
15 any of those names. If you have any testimony,
16 please hand your testimony to the Sergeant-at-Arms.
17 [background voice] So Miss Lewis, please.

18 BERTHA LEWIS: I'm going to be very
19 brief because I've given written testimony that
20 goes into a lot of detail on the recommendations.
21 I am Bertha Lewis, the President of The Black
22 Institute, and the mission of The Black Institute
23 is to shape intellectual discourse in dialogue into
24 impact public policy uniquely from a Black
25 perspective, and that is a perspective which

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 35
2 includes all people of color in the U.S. and
3 throughout the Diaspora. We have four issue areas.
4 That is education reform, economic fairness,
5 immigration and environmental justice. I do want
6 to thank the chair, Mr. Reynoso, and the members of
7 the Committee on Sanitation for holding this and
8 going so right at the serious problem right out of
9 the box. My advocacy on environmental justice
10 issues and specifically in regard to sanitation and
11 solid waste policy has spanned decades. In my
12 previous organization, ACORN, was the lead
13 plaintiff against the Bloomberg Administration's
14 Solid Waste Management Plan, in great part due to
15 the environmental injustice. While some people
16 claim that the SWMP will help correct a century or
17 more of environmental injustice, the reality is
18 that attempts to shift the burden to another large
19 population of black and brown people once again.
20 MTSS do not belong in any residential neighborhoods
21 anywhere in the city. In fact, regulations exist
22 today that prohibit MTSS from being built close to
23 public housing, parks, playgrounds and schools, but
24 unfortunately, the Bloomberg Administration
25 successfully sought a waiver from these laws. I

2 urge to go back and look at this and decide why
3 Bloomberg would say that we can build more transfer
4 stations next to public housing, parks and
5 playgrounds. It's a flawed plan from the
6 beginning. I'm just going to go very quickly in
7 some ways in which as this hearing is about, ways
8 to reduce and to tackle our waste problems for the
9 next four years. Source reduction and reuse:
10 Source reduction involves the reduction of waste in
11 the design, manufacture, purchase or use of
12 materials. Many retailers are doing that right
13 now. As others have said, recycling and
14 composting: Let's get serious about it. We are
15 behind other cities and in this country. The SWMP
16 plan was supposed to reduce by... was supposed to
17 get to 25 percent diversion of recyclables by
18 curbside program by 2007, but that again, has not
19 happened and this is seven years. Recycling is a
20 smart job policy. Composting is another way the
21 city can reduce the waste stream. The city should
22 lead by example and launch an aggressive recycling
23 and composting program for all NYCA development,
24 energy, recovery, waste to energy...

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 37

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing] And
3 Miss Lewis, if we could just wrap it up?

4 BERTHA LEWIS: Clean up... yeah.
5 Commercial trucks and I would like to say
6 unfortunately, cleaning up private trucks that
7 carry commercial waste will not eliminate the
8 concerns of our communities of color. I again want
9 to thank you all and the committee for holding this
10 hearing. I look forward to working with you to
11 create a sane sanitation policy for the next four
12 years.

13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay, thank you,
14 thank you, Miss Lewis. I would like to ask Miss
15 Lorraine Johnson to speak next. Hello, Miss
16 Johnson, and I would just like to recognize Council
17 Member Gibson from the Bronx has arrived.

18 LORRAINE JOHNSON: Good afternoon. My
19 name is Lorraine Johnson. Can you hear me?

20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yes, I can.

21 LORRAINE JOHNSON: I am a volunteer
22 with Pledge 2 Protect. Pledge 2 Protect is a
23 growing coalition of diverse citizens of the city.
24 We're working together to protect the health and
25 safety of New Yorkers by raising awareness of

2 physical, environmental and community impacts of
3 the city's current Solid Waste Management System
4 and Plan. Since 1979, I've been a tenant of NYCHA
5 Stanley Isaacs houses, which together with its
6 neighboring building, The Holmes Tower, are homes
7 of more than 2,200 residents. This five-story
8 community is located one block from the proposed
9 East 91st Street Marine Transfer Station. I would
10 like to thank Chair Antonio Rosado...

11 [crosstalk]

12 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Reynoso.

13 LORRAINE JOHNSON: Reynoso, excuse me,
14 and the members of the Committee on Sanitation for
15 holding this hearing on sanitation policy over the
16 next four years and providing me with a chance to
17 express my views. When the 91st Street Marine
18 Transfer Station was running, I suffered greatly
19 with asthma and I needed to be taken to the
20 hospital several times for treatment. Since it
21 closed in 1999, I have not needed to use nebulizer
22 pumps, steroids or other treatments. I fear with
23 this opening of the new MTS, I will get sick again.
24 I have nightmares about this. The situation before
25 the old Marine Transfer Station closed was awful

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 39
2 because of the horrible smell; the rats; the
3 traffic. Now the city wants to build a new MTS
4 station, much larger and even closer to my
5 building. I want to make this point clear; that I
6 am not here to insist that East 91st Transfer
7 Station get put someplace else in another community
8 of New Yorkers. Instead of putting a new mega-MTS
9 next to my building or a new MTS anywhere in any
10 other location, I believe the city should consider
11 these options. I would like to discuss many
12 problems with the Bloomberg 1996 Solid Waste
13 Management Plan.

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And if you can
15 just wrap up your three points again.

16 LORRAINE JOHNSON: Excuse me?

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: If you can just
18 speed up the three points, so we can hear them all.

19 LORRAINE JOHNSON: Okay. Okay.

20 [Pause]

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And if you
22 submitted your testimony in writing, we will
23 definitely read the three points to make...

24 [crosstalk]

25 LORRAINE JOHNSON: Yes.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 40
2 [crosstalk]
3 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: To show that we
4 listened to it and I think I have some follow-up
5 question for you...
6 [crosstalk]
7 LORRAINE JOHNSON: Okay.
8 [crosstalk]
9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: After the panel
10 has spoken so just...
11 [crosstalk]
12 LORRAINE JOHNSON: Sure.
13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Keep looking
14 through your paperwork...
15 [crosstalk]
16 LORRAINE JOHNSON: Okay.
17 [crosstalk]
18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: There, alright?
19 I'd like to call up Kelly.
20 KELLY NIMMO-GUENTHER: Hi, I'll also
21 just not read from my testimony since we both
22 submitted to you all to read.
23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Absolutely.
24 KELLY NIMMO-GUENTHER: So my name is
25 Kelly Nimmo-Guenther and first off you know, thank

you so much for having this hearing. Just to introduce myself and who I am, I'm actually a West Sider. I live at 66 Street; West 66th, so blocks away from the 59th Transfer Station, so I might be a little bit unique in here as maybe one of the few West Siders, but... [background voices] no, I live; where I live. That's alright. So I'm a mom. I'm a mom of two girls; I'm a wife; I'm a friend and what I've become lately is I've become an activist, so when I first heard about the East 91st Street Marine Transfer Station, my first reaction was well, everyone has to their fair share and then as my daughter, my young one plays soccer and my older one's a gymnast there; I thought as a mom, I really need to investigate this. I need to understand what does this mean. And so I started getting knowledge and started doing research and what I came to realize is there are many health and safety issues as it relates to this; the pollution that you know, we have many people coming up to talk about and what is the risk to the children, and the risks to the children are far and are many, and Mr. King asked those questions about the children, and I know Carol Tweedy's here with Asphalt Green and

2 she'll talk about it. But my organization, as we
3 studied the East 91st Street Marine Transfer
4 Stations; that certainly is my springboard and what
5 I've realized in getting into it is that there are
6 issues all across the city. There are communities
7 who have been overburdened with trash for too long
8 and so we've come up with a report. I've sent it
9 to all of you all. It's "Talking Trash," and I'm
10 really asking you to put aside political rhetoric;
11 put aside everything that you've seen, enough to at
12 least read and get information about what is
13 happening. We have to make the city reduce our
14 waste. We have to reduce our tonnage through
15 recycling; reusing; waste to energy. It's
16 something that the city has to take seriously.
17 We've also proposed in our plan about the
18 commercial haulers and the commercial waste. You
19 know, quickly said, we have to be able to help the
20 private haulers clean their commercial trucks. We
21 can reduce pollutions by 70 percent by just helping
22 the commercial haulers and it's all in the report
23 and you'll see it in there.

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you very
25 much for your testimony.

2 KELLY NIMMO-GUENTHER: Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Elsie McCabe
4 Thompson?

5 ELSIE MCCABE THOMPSON: I'm Elsie
6 McCabe Thompson, also known as the wife of Bill
7 Thompson. I'm the person who brought him to
8 Asphalt Green and said, "You need to take a look at
9 this. It's not to be politically... you know,
10 people will say you're supporting a seemingly white
11 Upper East Side. This is going to be a political
12 nightmare if you step into this, but it's the right
13 thing to do." I brought him to Asphalt Green
14 because I'm an Asphalt Green mom. My children from
15 when they were toddlers were weaned at Asphalt
16 Green; they learned to swim at Asphalt Green, and
17 so many kids. We lived on the West Side. We lived
18 right next to 97th and Broadway, where there are
19 constant traffic fatalities and injuries. I worked
20 a block from Queens Boulevard, another site where
21 there are constant traffic fatalities. I applaud
22 this council and your leadership in wanting to put
23 a halt to traffic fatalities. You know, kudos to
24 the de Blasio Administration for wanting to do
25 that, but moms can recognize danger when they see

it; a dangerous intersection and where the ramp for the 91st Street Waste Transfer Station intersects directly through Asphalt Green and the children will not recognize you know, that there is a road there. They're going to go straight, as my kids always used to do; straight from the Aquatic Center to the basketball courts and you know, the soccer field, and it's not just my kids. It's kids like you know, Evante [phonetic] and you know, his was a tragic case, but they not only serve you know, Upper East Siders you know, children from Stanley Isaacs and home houses in the area, but Kelly's kids from the Upper West Side, my kids when we were from the Upper West Side and children from around the city, children who are... many of whom very vulnerable. You know, they do water-proofing for you know, autistic kids from the Center for Autism; PS 71 in East Harlem; the Gillen Brewer School at 92nd and York because nobody else is going to do it. We need a place where they can go in safety and you know, be supported and learn to do... you know, to live safely such as you know, learning how to deal with water.

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you very
3 much, Miss Thompson. I appreciate it. I'd like to
4 call Carol Tweedy.

5 CAROL TWEEDY: Good afternoon.

6 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Good afternoon.

7 CAROL TWEEDY: I'm the Executive
8 Director of Asphalt Green and thank you for this
9 hearing, and thank you also for agreeing to
10 consider a tour of the site where this 91st Street
11 dump is being planned. Asphalt Green is committed
12 to making people healthy through sports and
13 fitness. We're a not-for-profit. We have about a
14 million visits a year. We provide free services to
15 35,000 people. Our concern is the health of
16 children and it is astounding that the terrible
17 things that we know happen in some low-income
18 communities created by both commercial and city
19 garbage dumps can now also happen somewhere else
20 without providing any relief to those communities.
21 The rationale behind that is some big words;
22 borough equity, five borough plan, environmental
23 justice, but behind these words is the
24 misinformation that the 91st Street Station
25 relieves problems elsewhere and in other boroughs.

2 This is not true. There is no residential garbage
3 that goes to any other borough from Manhattan and
4 the amount of commercial garbage it'll take is only
5 1.6 percent of the total. So we are going to build
6 a garbage dump 11 feet from where children play and
7 I would pass to you as a part of the "Talking
8 Trash" book and map that shows how this ramp comes
9 right through the middle of the Asphalt Green
10 campus. So we're going to build a garbage dump 11
11 feet from a playground; 11 feet from a playground.
12 Is that what environmental justice looks like? And
13 so I want to ask this terribly politically
14 incorrect question. Based on the fact that the
15 91st Street neighborhood is incorrectly labeled
16 "white and rich," and we know that there are 2,000
17 people in public housing there, does this boil down
18 to socking it to white kids 'cause black kids now
19 suffer? If we did a study of number of children
20 near another transfer station, that would not add
21 up to the number of children at Asphalt Green.
22 35,000 children among our 56,000 people used
23 Asphalt Green last year. Could this be payback?
24 Even the Mayor says we need to talk more to the
25 community, so let's pause on this. Let's come

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 47
2 together on all children; a common standard for all
3 boroughs. Let's see that those transfer stations
4 that now negatively affect children, that they get
5 closed, the ones near schools and public housing
6 and that would provide an immediate solution to the
7 worst offended and create a common standard for all
8 children in all boroughs. Will we continue this
9 experiment with children's lives?

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you very
11 much for your testimony. Does anyone have any
12 questions for the panel? I would just like to ask,
13 so in regards to the Asphalt Green situation, if
14 there was a route that didn't involved cutting
15 through the middle of the two sites, would that be
16 something you would consider?

17 CAROL TWEEDY: Absolutely.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you and a
19 route that you...

20 [crosstalk]

21 CAROL TWEEDY: Did not affect also the
22 public housing.

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Exactly, so I was
24 going ask the public housing as well; a route that
25 doesn't affect the public housing as well would

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 48
2 that be something you guys would consider? Alright
3 and I would just like to make a point. Especially
4 while I'm here, no one's sticking it to anyone.
5 It's extremely important that we recognize that.
6 This is about... you know, it truly is about
7 equity. You might have Asphalt Green in
8 Williamsburg soon from what I hear. I just want
9 you to know that there's 16 waste transfer stations
10 in Williamsburg and it'll be a tough for you to...
11 [crosstalk]
12 CAROL TWEEDY: We don't like that.
13 [crosstalk]
14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Sit on two
15 chairs.
16 CAROL TWEEDY: No, no, we don't... they
17 shouldn't be anywhere where there are children.
18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So the second
19 thing is...
20 [crosstalk]
21 CAROL TWEEDY: They should be shut
22 down.
23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: The last thing is
24 that it's a capacity issue, right? We need to
25 handle our trash and we need to be smart about it

2 and we all want to do everything we can to be as
3 creative as possible to handle our waste, but we
4 can't just shut them down because the trash needs
5 to get taken care of. So we need to find an
6 alternative that makes sense and that happens
7 quickly. While I'm here in four years I can't ever
8 go back to my community with 20,000 tons of trash
9 and tell them that I couldn't figure it out. The
10 burden that we're putting on the Upper East Side is
11 900 tons. That's less than a percent of the
12 capacity that people in my district are handling
13 and that is... and...

14 [crosstalk]

15 CAROL TWEEDY: With due respect, sir,
16 you are not relieving that problem in your
17 community...

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Well, you're
19 one...

20 [crosstalk]

21 CAROL TWEEDY: By this...

22 [crosstalk]

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: You're...

24 [crosstalk]

25 CAROL TWEEDY: Transfer station.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 50

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Right. I believe
3 that the Upper East Side is one part of a bigger
4 plan and everyone has to do their part.

5 CAROL TWEEDY: And I urge you to read
6 the study...

7 [crosstalk]

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And we...

9 [crosstalk]

10 CAROL TWEEDY: "Talking Trash."

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And by the way
12 and everything... I've read it three times. I read
13 it...

14 [crosstalk]

15 CAROL TWEEDY: Just three times.

16 [crosstalk]

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I care about this
18 a lot. I read it and I just wanted to make sure
19 that I got every single point and to let you know
20 that I think I've committed alongside Council
21 Member Donovan Richards to have a hearing
22 specifically on SWMP so that we can in more detail
23 discuss an issue that we think is extremely
24 important, and that we do want to listen to every
25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 51
2 single side and make sure that we have the best
3 plan. So I really appreciate...
4 [crosstalk]
5 CAROL TWEEDY: Okay, thank you so much.
6 [crosstalk]
7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Your time.
8 CAROL TWEEDY: And you should be aware
9 that the Parks Department and the contractor
10 prepares to bring down trees and fences this week.
11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay, thank you.
12 Thank you so much. I wasn't aware. Thank you for
13 that. [background voices] Do you want to... yeah,
14 Miss Montross, would you like to come up and speak?
15 Miss Montross; Annietje; Annietje Montross? Yeah,
16 she's coming up. She's also a person that's in
17 opposition, so I would like to you know, just give
18 her an opportunity to speak. And thank you guys
19 again.
20 CAROL TWEEDY: Thank you so much.
21 ANNIETJE MONTROSS: Good afternoon. My
22 name is Annietje Montross and I am a volunteer with
23 Pledge 2 Protect. [off mic] I'll put it higher up.
24 You're a big help. I want to thank Chair Antonio
25 Reynoso and the members of the Committee on

2 Sanitation for holding this hearing on sanitation
3 policy over the next four years and providing me
4 this opportunity to express my views. I would like
5 to talk about the fast increasing financial tolls
6 that Mayor Bloomberg's 2006 Solid Waste Management
7 Plan, SWMP, are taking on our city. Costs for
8 implementation of the SWMP have ballooned far
9 beyond the original estimate. According to the
10 Independent Budget Office, IBO, the construction
11 and operation costs of the East 91st Street MTS are
12 now projected to exceed more than \$1 billion over
13 the next two decades. This is more than \$600
14 million above the cost to manage the same waste
15 using the current system, referred to the
16 Department of Sanitation DSNY as the interim plan.
17 Recent construction delay, permits and zoning
18 issues and necessary retrofitting to protect the
19 facility from future Sandy-like superstorms will
20 increase cost estimates even further. The
21 projected capital costs for the MTS have grown
22 dramatically since the SWMP was adopted in 2006.
23 For example, the original projection of the capital
24 construction costs to build the East 91st Street
25 Marine Transfer Station, MTS, was \$43.9 million.

2 In 2009, that amount was revised to \$421.8 million.
3 Today, the city contracts show that it will cost
4 \$181.6 million and counting. In 2006, the capital
5 budget for the MTS was \$194 million. That number
6 was grown dramatically to \$708 million according to
7 the most recent DSNY budget, an astounding 265
8 percent increase. This is, by the way...

9 [crosstalk]

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you very
11 much. If you can just... so we have a lot of
12 people waiting, so and I'll just reiterate it just
13 in case some people couldn't hear exactly what you
14 were saying, but she was talking to the increased
15 financial burden on DSNY by closing the East 91st
16 Street Station and also a sustainability issue
17 after Superstorm Sandy and also zoning issues in
18 regards to East 91st Street. I wanted to make sure
19 people heard that clearly, so thank you so much for
20 your testimony. I appreciate your time. Thank you
21 and if we could please ask anyone that's already
22 testified to please exit so that we can allow more
23 folks to come in to testify. I'd like to call up
24 the next round of folks. Alright, this is just a
25 random group of folks, so we like random. Sherry

2 Showell, if you can please come up. Eric
3 Goldstein, if you can please come up; Ron
4 Bergamini; Austin Shafran and Rich Kassel. Rich
5 Kassel. [background voices] Well, if you're not in
6 the room you can't sign up, so Richard got his
7 chance. So we're going to just wait for him to get
8 into the room and then we'll call him up. Okay, so
9 Sherry, if you can please be the first speaker.
10 Thank you so much for doing that.

11 SHERRY SHOWELL: Thank you for holding
12 this hearing. We're going to take a little break
13 from the waste transfer stations. I'm speaking on
14 compost.

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you very
16 much. [laughter]

17 SHERRY SHOWELL: My name is Sherry
18 Showell and I have been the coordinator of the
19 Compost Squad of the Park Slope Food Co-op since
20 1999, and it's in this capacity that I would like
21 to give this testimony. I'm here for two reasons.
22 One is to encourage this committee to develop
23 community composting to the maximum extent and two,
24 to strongly express my concern about how the
25 Business Integrity Commission is actually

2 preventing this from happening. The Park Slope
3 Food Co-op is a not-for-profit member-owned and
4 operated grocery store. Two of our missions are to
5 be good and ethical neighbors and to do as little
6 harm as possible to the environment in the course
7 of doing our business. We have 16,000 members
8 throughout the city and in exchange for the
9 privileges of shopping at the co-op these members
10 provide about 36 hours of labor each year to the
11 co-op and also to the community. Shortly after the
12 Food Co-op started in 1973, there was a group from
13 down the street that knocked on the door and asked
14 what we were doing with our food scraps and if they
15 could please have them because they were
16 transforming a rubble strewn vacant lot into a
17 community garden and so we gave it to them, and
18 we've been doing that for many, many years and
19 today that community garden, the Garden of Union is
20 one of the most beautiful gardens in the city.
21 Over the last 40 years, this relationship
22 benefitted the coop; it benefitted the garden; it
23 benefitted the neighborhood. So over the last 40
24 years, we have been nurturing similar relationships
25 with many gardens in Brooklyn, and they now take

2 all of our waste. The Garden of Union used to take
3 all of it with three bins. They now take half of
4 it with 10 bins and the rest goes to the other
5 gardens.

6 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: If you can just
7 speak to what solutions or what ideas...

8 [crosstalk]

9 SHERRY SHOWELL: Sure.

10 [crosstalk]

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: You have to
12 expanding composting in the city of New York. That
13 would be very interesting to hear.

14 SHERRY SHOWELL: So the main concern
15 that I have with BIC is that what we are doing we
16 basically have to do in secret because recently one
17 of my workers, who helped to take the food scraps
18 to the gardens, was cited; was given a citation for
19 hauling illegally and this concerns us a lot. It
20 means that what we have to do... we're a model for
21 not only New York City, but I get visitors from all
22 over the world looking at our full system and what
23 we're doing to reduce waste and I feel like I have
24 to hide that. We have to operate in secret because
25 technically we're hauling waste and now that one of

2 my workers; you know, these are the volunteers who
3 are giving their labor in exchange for shopping
4 privileges; was cited for taking food scraps to a
5 garden. It is ridiculous. What we're doing should
6 be encouraged and developed to the maximum extent
7 possible within the city. There are hundreds of
8 businesses that would love to be getting rid of
9 these food scraps in responsible, local, green,
10 sustainable ways.

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So...

12 [crosstalk]

13 SHERRY SHOWELL: All of this compost
14 goes to greening the city.

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So I just want to
16 say I know there's Department of Sanitation
17 officials here and we're very focused on composting
18 and increasing that and making it as easy as
19 possible. We think it's part of the big picture
20 plan as to how we reduce capacity, so noted.
21 Hopefully, in a couple of years you'll be very
22 satisfied with the work that we're doing to
23 increase composting.

24 SHERRY SHOWELL: Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 58

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. And
3 BIC is here as well, so I think they heard you and
4 I'll keep them away from you.

5 SHERRY SHOWELL: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So, I'll advise
7 them for you. Eric Goldstein.

8 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Thank you very much.
9 Congratulations, Mr. Chairman, on assuming this
10 responsibility and...

11 [crosstalk]

12 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.

13 [crosstalk]

14 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Congratulations to you
15 also, Costa. I think you have a very helpful
16 partner here.

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah, yeah.

18 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: With your new
19 committee. My name is Eric Goldstein and I'm an
20 attorney with the Natural Resources Defense
21 Council, a national environmental group. The
22 sentient challenge that the city faces is to
23 transform waste system from landfilling and
24 incineration to primary reliance on recycling,
25 composting and waste prevention. NRDC has been

2 working to accomplish that here in New York for
3 almost 30 years. We want to do so in a way that
4 protects city taxpayers, creates good, clean jobs
5 for city residents and provides fundamental
6 fairness to all. We have 10 recommendations that
7 we'll outline in our written submission to you
8 later today. I'll quickly list those 10. Number
9 one is implement the 2006 Solid Waste Management
10 Plan. After more than two decades of deliberation,
11 the council adopted a waste plan that was designed
12 to advance recycling and composting, reduce
13 citywide air pollution and enshrine for the first
14 time the concepts of borough equity and
15 environmental justice in the siting of waste
16 facilities. This plan was the subject of prolonged
17 discussions and in-depth analysis. NRDC supported
18 the plan in 2006 and we support the plan today.
19 The last thing we need is to reopen a debate on
20 this plan instead of fully implementing its
21 programs. On the other hand, we recognize the
22 legitimate concerns of our Upper East Side
23 neighbors, and want to work with them to ensure
24 that the 91st Street facility operates at the
25 highest standards for trucks and tugs with

2 enforceable commitments to protect the community in
3 the way that safeguards the health of all members
4 of that community. I'll quickly list the other
5 nine items and set forth them in more detail in our
6 comments. We urge you to support and expand the
7 city's fledgling program for curbside collection of
8 organics, which represent 25 percent of the waste
9 stream. That strategy is essential to making our
10 whole waste plan work. Third, we urge you to
11 strengthen the city's core recycling program by
12 focusing on poorly performing districts. Opinion
13 polls show that all New Yorkers want to recycle and
14 we need to have the city and our residents work
15 harder in the areas that aren't fully participating
16 in recycling today. Fourth, we urge you to press
17 for expansion of recycling programs for electronic
18 waste and textiles. Fifth, we urge you to ensure
19 that recycling and composting programs are up and
20 running in every public school. Sixth, we urge you
21 to continue to expand the public space recycling
22 programs. Still more than 95 percent of the
23 Sanitation Department's on street trash receptacles
24 are not designated for recycling. Seventh, we urge
25 you to continue to fund the GrowNYC's Office of

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 61

2 Recycling Outreach and Education. OROE remains
3 absolutely essential to the success of the city's
4 overall solid waste agenda, and the council should
5 consider an expanded role for them in the coming
6 years. Eighth, we urge you to work with the
7 Sanitation Department and the unions to make
8 recycling collections more efficient. That, in and
9 of itself, is the subject for a separate hearing.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah.

11 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Ninth, we urge you to
12 enact legislation to deal with the meddlesome
13 problem of plastic bag, and tenth, we urge you to
14 reform the system for collection of commercial
15 waste in New York City. This commercial waste
16 sector has improved in some ways, but defies reform
17 in other ways, and that too ought to be the subject
18 for another hearing.

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you and
20 yes, you are right and we're have a lot of great
21 hearings moving forward, but thank you so much for
22 your testimony.

23 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Thank you, Council
24 Member.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 62

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Absolutely and
3 I'd like to ask Ron to speak now.

4 RON BERGAMINI: Hello.

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: How you doing,
6 Ron?

7 RON BERGAMINI: Good, how are you?

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Doing well.

9 RON BERGAMINI: Congratulations on your
10 position.

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, sir.

12 RON BERGAMINI: My name is Ron
13 Bergamini. I'm the CEO of the Action Environmental
14 Group, which is the city's largest hauler. We
15 have...

16 [crosstalk]

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Hm...

18 RON BERGAMINI: We have transfer
19 stations and we have recycling facilities. I'm
20 essentially here to introduce myself to the
21 committee, but to also point out a few things and
22 comment a little bit on what's been testified to
23 here today. 2013 certainly ushered in a year of a
24 lot of changes in the solid waste and recycling
25 market. The global buying patterns in the

2 recycling market is a fundamental shift, that is
3 probably the subject of another hearing, that
4 people need to be aware of. We fully support
5 efforts to increase recycling. I daresay we're the
6 largest recycler in the city and we've recently
7 invested and made a big investment to a state-of-
8 the-art recycling facility in the Bronx, where
9 today we employ about 200 people in so-called
10 "clean jobs," and we also support the composting
11 efforts as well. The caution lies in that these
12 types of efforts take a lot of investment and with
13 the uncertainty you don't get that investment, and
14 that uncertainty includes a restrictive rate cap
15 and a stifling regulatory environment. We're here
16 to say that the simple truth is that folks have to
17 work together; that's the public and the private
18 sector to come up with solutions. We've always
19 done that since we've been here about six years or
20 so and we want to continue to do that. Despite the
21 efforts you see in Washington where no one can talk
22 to one another we reject that entirely. We think
23 all people need to talk together and that's why I
24 appreciate you guys having this hearing today. We
25 also embrace a good neighbor policy. We work with

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 64
2 Sustainable South Bronx, Center for Employment
3 Opportunities, Manhattan Midtown Community Court, a
4 couple schools in the Bronx so we can be involved
5 in our community. The one other note of caution is
6 the word franchising. I'm not exactly sure what
7 that means. I know in one sense, but not in
8 another because it can be pretty complicated and
9 part of me worries that it looks like the days of
10 limited choice from a couple decades ago, so I
11 think we have to be very deliberative when we
12 discuss those things. So I look forward to working
13 with you all and if there's anything I can do, call
14 on me and we're happy to have a dialogue.

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And we'll have
16 some follow-up questions for you.

17 RON BERGAMINI: You got it.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And also we'll
19 probably have a follow-up hearing to answer any
20 questions you have regarding franchising.

21 RON BERGAMINI: Thank you very much,
22 sir.

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Absolutely and
24 last, but not least Austin. How you doing today?
25

2 AUSTIN SHAFRAN: Good. Thank you,
3 Chairman Reynoso, appreciate the opportunity to
4 speak with you and Council Member Constantinides.
5 My name is Austin Shafran. I'm the State
6 Legislative Director for the Working Families
7 Party. The WFP supports an equitable distribution
8 of waste facilities in a manner that would be
9 efficient, sustainable and fair to all New York
10 City communities. We strongly recognize that
11 currently waste facilities are concentrated in low-
12 income communities; communities of color and this
13 is a problem that's particularly prevalent in
14 certain overburdened outer borough communities such
15 as the South Bronx; North Brooklyn; Southeastern
16 Queens. We've seen thousands of collection trucks
17 that are driving millions in needless miles each
18 year of overlapping and oftentimes inefficient
19 routes. We've seen worker safety standards get
20 sacrificed as haulers are forced to cut corners,
21 provide cheaper service and waste work that's you
22 know, among the most dangerous, if not the most
23 dangerous occupation in New York and you know, we
24 really think that we're seeing millions of tons of
25 waste that can be recycled or composted instead of

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 66
2 buried in landfills and burned in incinerators, and
3 we need to find solutions that take an
4 environmental issue such as this and create a broad
5 benefit for both the environment and the economy.
6 The WFP strongly supports the Transform Don't Trash
7 New York City Coalition's call for an exclusive
8 franchise system for commercial waste, where New
9 York City can address these problems in the
10 commercial waste industries. An exclusive
11 franchise system we feel can incentivize fair
12 siting standards and give haulers a dense customer
13 base that allows them to drive more efficient
14 routes. It requires a safe workplace, which is
15 very important to our workforce; very important to
16 members of local communities, and mandate a base
17 level of recycling and composting and create
18 incentives for haulers to perform about those
19 standards. You know, also franchising we feel is
20 consistent with the current Solid Waste Management
21 Plan and the WFP strongly supports borough equity
22 and believes that under a franchising system, the
23 marine and rail transfer stations will remain vital
24 to handling waste that still needs to be disposed
25 of. You know, bringing relief to overburdened

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 67
2 communities; communities that have long handled the
3 vast majority of the waste generated in New York
4 City while ensuring that the city's ability to meet
5 its waste management needs is a matter of both
6 economic and environmental justice and the WFP
7 stands ready, willing and eager to work hand-in-
8 hand with members of the committee, members of the
9 full council and of course, members of the
10 administration to achieve that goal and I thank you
11 for allowing us the opportunity to testify and I
12 should apologize in advance 'cause unfortunately, I
13 do have to leave, so I don't think I'll be
14 available here for questions, but I'm sure that
15 just...

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing]

17 Alright.

18 AUSTIN SHAFRAN: Cuts down on the time
19 for everyone else.

20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Absolutely, thank
21 you very much...

22 [crosstalk]

23 AUSTIN SHAFRAN: Thank you again.

24 [crosstalk]
25

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: For your
3 testimony. So I just want to speak to a couple of
4 things. First, with commercial franchising, we
5 understand that there are trucks that right now,
6 for example, are carting from the Bronx that go all
7 the way to Brooklyn and then to Staten Island and
8 then back to the Bronx. We don't think that makes
9 any sense. We think that if you're in the Bronx
10 you should just pick up trash in the Bronx, limit
11 the amount of mileage that every truck makes to
12 these other communities and that everybody should
13 take care of a sector. It doesn't mean that we
14 limit competition. It doesn't mean that we limit
15 one carting company to just do the Bronx. If you
16 bid well, Action Carting could be the dominant
17 member of franchising to a certain degree, but with
18 that we also want to talk about opening up the cap,
19 as we're more responsible and will give you an
20 opportunity to compete and to invest and that makes
21 more... there is more sense to it, and also the
22 regulations would allow for us to start talking
23 about... this was about 50 years ago when it made
24 sense for BIC to be this tough. I think right now
25 I think that...

2 [crosstalk]

3 RON BERGAMINI: I thought you were
4 going to say Draconian[sic], I was gonna say...

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah, well, we
6 can... and they are and we can...

7 [crosstalk]

8 RON BERGAMINI: This poor woman's
9 experience.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Right, exactly.
11 So I think we can start modifying that and bringing
12 it up to the 21st Century and it also allows for us
13 to really bring about the commercial carting system
14 and regulations for better pay; better workers or
15 not workers, but better work conditions; better
16 trucks. It'll just allow us all to grow and I
17 think that's what we're looking for, but we're not
18 going to do it unreasonably, but I just want to...

19 [crosstalk]

20 RON BERGAMINI: I'm with you and I'm
21 all for those things. It all costs a lot of money
22 and that's the flip side to it. You can't have it
23 both ways and it's clearly the subject of a longer
24 conversation, and I know there's plenty of people
25 that want to testify, so I look forward to...

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 70

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing]

3 Absolutely.

4 RON BERGAMINI: Working with you.

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Just know that
6 we're not just saying things for the sake of saying
7 them. We have a plan and we do want to be smart
8 about it and we know it might cost a lot of money.

9 RON BERGAMINI: I'm for that and I look
10 forward to talking further. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Absolutely, thank
12 you and we will be working on composting in no
13 time. Thank you, guys. The next panel, Laura
14 Hofmann; Eric Bruzaitis; Dave Dobosz and John
15 Shehas. [background voices] [off mic] What was the
16 order again? So Miss Hofmann, how are you doing
17 today? I'm doing very well. It's nice to see you
18 guys. If you want to go first, Dave Dobosz,
19 please. Dave Dobosz will go first, then Laura,
20 then Eric and then John. We'll do it in that
21 order, okay, guys?

22 DAVE DOBOSZ: Yeah.

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So go ahead,
24 Dave.

25

2 DAVID DOBOSZ: Okay, good afternoon.

3 As a new and progressive city administration and
4 council begin their work on behalf of all the
5 citizens of this great metropolis, OUTRAGE of
6 Williamsburg/Greenpoint thanks you, and
7 particularly our new councilman, Antonio Reynoso,
8 for holding this hearing on sanitation policy. I'm
9 David Dobosz, a member of the Steering Committee of
10 OUTRAGE, which stands for Williamsburg/Greenpoint
11 Organizations United for Trash Reduction and
12 Garbage Equity. My urgent recommendation to the
13 new council is implement the SWMP. Like too many
14 policies and programs, in which legislation is not
15 implemented as authorized, we waste time. Too many
16 of us are getting sick in Williamsburg from
17 garbage. The SWMP authorized way back in 2006
18 included three essential provisions to reduce the
19 toxins that have plagued the health of the three
20 city neighborhoods that are most overburdened with
21 waste transfer stations. Williamsburg has 15 sites
22 alone and processes 40 percent of the city's
23 garbage, while suffering from outrageously high
24 respiratory and cancer illnesses as a result. That
25 cause is specifically 20 tons of waste every day

2 coming in by trucks. The first excellent SWMP
3 provision is to promise to implement a fairer
4 distribution of waste transfer stations across the
5 boroughs of this city. Any reduction of waste
6 transportation through our streets, past our
7 schools, our parks, our homes, particularly Cooper
8 Park public housing and commercial areas would have
9 done wonders for our lungs and cells. But due to a
10 lack of implementation, our children, our mothers
11 and our seniors crowd the emergency rooms and
12 clinics of Williamsburg, Greenpoint and Bushwick in
13 North Brooklyn. It's simply not fair. How long
14 must we cry, "Borough garbage equity; process your
15 fair share." A second and very related SWMP
16 provision is the promise to implement capacity
17 reduction at existing stations to provide long
18 overdue relief to the three communities that
19 currently handle three-fourths of the city's waste,
20 Williamsburg being at the top of the list. But
21 again, due solely to the lack of implementation
22 over these past years, garbage trucks have risen
23 from 20 to 80 an hour in just over the last five
24 years. Capacity reduction is a laudable goal, but
25 worthless without implementation...

2 [crosstalk]

3 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Dave.

4 [crosstalk]

5 DAVID DOBOSZ: And enforcement.

6 [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Can you wrap up,
8 Dave, please?

9 DAVID DOBOSZ: And... huh?

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Can you wrap up?

11 DAVID DOBOSZ: Yeah and the third
12 provision is of course, the marine transfer
13 stations that have not gotten off the way they
14 should. It's certainly a no-brainer to reduce the
15 1,500 diesel trucks a day through the marine
16 transfer stations but again, it's got to happen.

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Dave.

18 DAVID DOBOSZ: So...

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing] And
20 we need to keep it moving, Dave.

21 DAVID DOBOSZ: Yeah.

22 [crosstalk]

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And now...

24 [crosstalk]

25 DAVID DOBOSZ: That's fine.

2 [crosstalk]

3 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: The next person?

4 DAVID DOBOSZ: I just... air quality
5 does not discriminate against persons.

6 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you so much
7 for your testimony. Laura, please?

8 LAURA HOFMANN: 'Kay, can you hear me?

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yes, I can.

10 LAURA HOFMANN: Hello, my name is Laura
11 Hofmann and I'm the co-founder of Barge Park Pals,
12 which is a member organization of Organizations
13 United for Trash Reduction and Garbage Equity. I'm
14 also a lifelong resident of Greenpoint and my
15 family suffers from a number of environmentally
16 related diseases. The communities of Greenpoint
17 and Williamsburg have received no relief from the
18 waste related truck traffic since the Solid Waste
19 Management Plan was approved in 2006. Rather, it's
20 clear to the Greenpoint and Williamsburg residents
21 that the community's solid waste issues have become
22 even worse since our community study was done. We
23 see more and more garbage trucks. OUTRAGE's 2004
24 and 2009 comparative truck and air quality study
25 showed sharp increases in truck traffic and an

2 increase of particulate matter on the days that
3 waste transfer stations are open. Even in New York
4 City Business Integrity website Trade Waste
5 listings of waste related licensing is telling of
6 the community's issues and the lack of citywide
7 garbage equity. Since asthma and other
8 environmentally linked diseases are still rampant
9 and clearly studied in Brooklyn Community Board 1,
10 given the cumulative nature of the environmental
11 problems, it's even more urgent that the Solid
12 Waste Management Plan moves forward and that
13 citywide garbage equity is achieved. And now that
14 developers are preparing to move forward on their
15 waterfront plans related to the
16 Greenpoint/Williamsburg rezoning, we can expect to
17 process the garbage that will be generated by all
18 those developments, thousands of residential units.
19 The mere thought of even one garbage bag coming
20 from each one of those units is frightening unless
21 the rest of the city does its fair share and each
22 borough processes its own garbage. Our community
23 has not yet experienced a remediation of all the
24 brownfield superfund sites, oil and chemical plumes
25 and so on and the community is prettied up by new

2 buildings and amenities. Folks who have been
3 displaced have brought their medical health
4 histories with them and their
5 Greenpoint/Williamsburg related environmental
6 health statistics is recorded elsewhere, but
7 newcomers to the community are also vulnerable to
8 the cycle of health issues surely to develop from
9 environmental health threats such as an
10 overburdening of garbage. Therefore, garbage
11 equity will not only protect longtime residents,
12 but our future residents as well.

13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: If you could wrap
14 it up.

15 LAURA HOFMANN: And thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, thank
17 you...

18 [crosstalk]

19 LAURA HOFMANN: And that's it.

20 [crosstalk]

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So much and I'm
22 going to come back with questions. I just want to
23 acknowledge that Council Member Matteo is here.
24 Looking forward to our next hearing on snow
25 removal. I hear you and I think it's very well

2 represented. Can we please get Eric now, please
3 and moving... we're going to try our best to keep
4 to the two minutes just because we have probably
5 over 50 speakers left and at this rate, we'll be
6 out of here in four hours, so I'm going to start
7 slowing it down or asking people to wrap it up a
8 little faster. Thank you.

9 ERIC BRUZAITIS: Well, I know I can't
10 read this in two minutes, so I'll just kind of
11 summarize it and you have my testimony.

12 [background voice]

13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah.

14 ERIC BRUZAITIS: Yes, three light
15 pages, but I can't do it in two minutes. So thank
16 you for the opportunity to testify. Good morning,
17 Antonio and congratulations.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.

19 ERIC BRUZAITIS: On not only the
20 election, but also this chairmanship, and to the
21 new members of the committee, it's good to see you.
22 My name is Eric Bruzaitis and I am also a member of
23 OUTRAGE and I am also the chair of the Truck
24 Enforcement Task Force, which was put together by a
25 former Councilwoman Diana Reyna and ourselves, and

2 the purpose of the task force is to bring different
3 agencies with enforcement power together to address
4 the issues pertaining to not only truck traffic,
5 but also the violations around waste transfer
6 stations 15 to 16 and then you can add to that the
7 number of scrap yards and other facilities that we
8 deal with in North Brooklyn. As it is, as you've
9 heard already, we deal with about 5,000 truck trips
10 every day. About half of those are waste haul
11 trucks. That's about 80 trucks per hour in a
12 particular intersections and that's gone up from
13 2004 to 2009. The OUTRAGE's main goal, as you've
14 heard, is to implement the SWMP. We feel that the
15 way to reduce that truck traffic and to improving
16 enforcement is to implement the SWMP fully as it
17 was conceived and passed. It should've been
18 implemented by 2012 despite the unnecessary delays
19 through lawsuits and other stalling tactics, and
20 out of the task force we have four recommendations
21 that we want to make on a policy level to just kind
22 of discuss over the next four years. One is
23 obviously truck enforcement; truck and waste
24 transfer station enforcement. In Community
25 District 1 we have a lot of problems with trucks

crisscrossing the... well, wow, crisscrossing across residential streets. There needs to be a larger enforcement by DSNY...

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing] Mm-hm.

ERIC BRUZAITIS: And I can do this in 30 seconds. DSNY, NYPD, DEP and DEC to make that happen as well as the constant violations that are happening at the transfer stations. Two is communication among agencies. We've had a good relationship with DOT and with the NYPD 94th Precinct...

[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Can you please speed it up, Eric?

ERIC BRUZAITIS: Yeah, I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So part number three?

ERIC BRUZAITIS: And number three is strategic deployment of enforcement agency resources, so those agencies with enforcement power should work with the community to identify problem spots.

CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 80

2 ERIC BRUZAITIS: And four is education,
3 and that's education not only within agencies
4 getting it together, but also with waste haulers
5 and commercial drivers that may be under the law
6 and then because they're all under regulations and
7 we don't want them to get tickets unnecessarily,
8 and waste transfer stations that are bad actors
9 need to be reminded of the problems because if
10 they're not getting ticketed because the DSNY
11 doesn't have the resources to you know, do this
12 strong enforcement that we need, then they're just
13 going to... it's going to become part of their
14 culture so...

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you so
16 much, Eric, for your testimony.

17 ERIC BRUZAITIS: Thank you very much.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I appreciate it.
19 John, thank you for being patient.

20 JOHN SHEHAS: How you doing? My
21 name...

22 [crosstalk]

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Very well.

24 [crosstalk]

25

2 JOHN SHEHAS: Is John Shehas. I just
3 want to talk about the franchise and I'm a 22-year
4 veteran. I work for Local 813. I'm on the street
5 and I see it. The franchise would help eliminate a
6 lot of problems. I'm on the street and you see
7 like six carters. They're... I know carters that
8 drivers don't even have licenses and they're
9 driving these trucks. Smoking comes out of the
10 exhaust; no lights. I'm lucky enough to work for a
11 good company. Everything is clean; the lights;
12 they're all on top of the stuff and now with the
13 neighborhoods; like I work in Astoria. In the last
14 22 years the population grew so much that you only
15 have like an hour that the people are not on the
16 streets and that's like 4:00 to 5:00. The whole
17 night there's tons of people in the street; trucks
18 all over the place. I think it's... it's just
19 doesn't make sense. If you just step back and look
20 it just doesn't make sense. I think it'd be safer
21 for the community, for the people, for the kids.
22 Mm... you know, that's really it.

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright. Thank
24 you, guys and I just wanted to say two things.
25 First, do you guys know how many people live in

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 82
2 Cooper Park houses? [background voice] 2,800
3 people. Okay.
4 DAVID DOBOSZ: [off mic] I wanted to
5 mention are you aware of a pilot program of taking
6 recyclable waste from the schools making a
7 flurry...
8 [crosstalk]
9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yes.
10 DAVID DOBOZS: Of it and so you've got
11 that one now.
12 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yes, we do.
13 DAVID DOBOSZ: Okay.
14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: What...
15 [crosstalk]
16 DAVID DOBOSZ: Good.
17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: A recent
18 panelist...
19 [crosstalk]
20 DAVID DOBOSZ: Right.
21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Spoke regarding
22 that, yeah.
23 DAVID DOBOSZ: And have you seen the
24 documentary "Trashed" on waste to energy
25

2 incinerators that we would fight to the death never
3 to have in this city.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yes, I've
5 definitely seen it and I think that...

6 [crosstalk]

7 DAVID DOBOSZ: Okay.

8 [crosstalk]

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Also

10 DAVID DOBOSZ: Good, good.

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah, so...

12 [crosstalk]

13 DAVID DOBOSZ: Good.

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Staten Island and
15 Brooklyn, yeah.

16 DAVID DOBOSZ: Great.

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: We fought
18 successfully in our neighborhoods. You got a lot
19 more fighting to do, and I guess Council Member
20 Constantinides has a question.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Very
22 quickly. I know that my colleague, Andy King,
23 before had brought up the negative numbers, the
24 numbers that if we... that are currently going on
25 in the communities that are overburdened. Give me

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 84

2 some of the good numbers. If we do implement the
3 SWMP what sort of positive outcomes are we going to
4 see in communities that are currently overburdened?
5 How will the asthma rates go down? How will the
6 quality of life improve? Just quickly you know,
7 talk to me a little bit about that and...

8 DAVID DOBOSZ: Well, Eric, talked about
9 the truck traffic.

10 [crosstalk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Tell
12 us...

13 [crosstalk]

14 DAVID DOBOSZ: Yeah.

15 [crosstalk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Yeah.

17 ERIC BRUZAITIS: Well, just in terms of
18 truck traffic, if the SWMP is fully implemented you
19 know, it goes down by a couple hundred truck trips
20 per day. Now, North Brooklyn is never going to get
21 away... well, I shouldn't say never, but it's going
22 to be a long way before we really realize the
23 borough equity in North Brooklyn, but when you talk
24 about 5,000 truck trips down to something like
25 4,000 you know, that's going to be a difference in

2 diesel exhaust that has a large impact on asthma
3 rates and also dust, which is something that people
4 don't really think about. If you've been to the
5 north side, you will see that these trucks drive
6 through a slurry of whatever they're hauling plus
7 mud and everything else. That all gets aerosolized
8 out as it dries on their tires and so you have not
9 only the particulate, but you also have all the
10 effluent from the trucks. So any reduction in
11 truck traffic in North Brooklyn helps us out health
12 wise, pedestrian and traffic safety wise and you
13 know, just from a cost perspective you're going to
14 save your roads because those trucks eat the roads
15 up and you can see the results of that now on the
16 streets of the city just from all the snow, so.

17 LAURA HOFMANN: I'm pretty much able to
18 map out community health impacts involved right in
19 my own family. The people in my family who've
20 remained in the neighborhood have come up with
21 autoimmune diseases and brain cancers and the ones
22 that moved away escaped those outcomes. So as I
23 speak, I have lacunar infarction of the brain and I
24 believe it's all environmentally related, not just
25 to garbage trucks, but all of the other stuff that

2 comes along with the environmental injustice
3 communities, the superfunded sites and all of that.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And I'd just like
5 to make note that for every ton we lose... we gain
6 somewhere else we lose in the three overburdened
7 communities, so it's about spreading it out, not
8 getting rid of it. Right now, if we can get rid of
9 it, that would be the best plan, but we're working
10 on that through recycling, through composting and
11 through trying to be smart with this franchising
12 model, but it's about going up so it has to go up
13 somewhere else and go down in these neighborhoods.
14 So thank you so much for your time and again, I'm
15 going to try to be as tough as possible in regards
16 to the two minute timeline. [background voices] So
17 I'd like to call Rich Kassel now. I think he's in.
18 There you go. Pedro Cardi; Bernadette Kelly; Sean
19 T. Campbell. I think Sean went twice unless
20 there's two Seans. Alright, so guys, I'm going to
21 be aggressive. Please, I'm not trying to be rude,
22 but we need to make sure we get to all these
23 speakers, and if we can turn up the air in here, it
24 would be great. Thank you very much. So let's
25 start with Rich, Rich Kassel. How you doing, Rich?

2 RICH KASSEL: I'm good, thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: We had somebody
4 call you up, but you weren't here, so we apologize
5 for that.

6 RICH KASSEL: I was down in 14 where I
7 used to spend a lot of time with Jim Gennaro and
8 crew, but there's no videotape down there, so...

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Welcome to the
10 16th...

11 [crosstalk]

12 RICH KASSEL: Thanks.

13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Floor.

14 RICH KASSEL: Thank you for inviting me
15 back...

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing]
17 Absolutely.

18 RICH KASSEL: Up here. My name is Rich
19 Kassel and I'm a Senior Vice President with
20 Gladstein, Neandross and Associates. We're an
21 environmental consulting firm that works with
22 clients in the private sector; the public sector;
23 environmental groups; ports around the country on
24 projects and programs that are designed to reduce
25 transportation emissions while reducing costs.

2 We're managing the Clean Truck Program up at Hunts
3 Point and we were central to the implementation of
4 the Truck Replacement Program at the Port Authority
5 and we have a lot of experience thinking through
6 how do we reduce truck emissions quickly and cost-
7 effectively? Today, I'm here because of technical
8 work that we've done on behalf of two clients in
9 New York; Asphalt Green and Pledge 2 Protect. I've
10 distributed to you a full copy of my testimony, but
11 also a recent report; technical report that we've
12 done on emissions and cost analyses related not
13 just to East 91st Street, but to the implementation
14 of the SWMP overall. In the interest of time, I
15 won't go through everything, but I want to make two
16 quick introductory comments and then I'll hit four
17 quick points. The first is I think it's important
18 to underscore our support at GNA and our clients'
19 support to the objectives of the SWMP, whether
20 we're talking about environmental performance;
21 reducing disproportionate impacts; borough equity;
22 reducing costs; finding a way for innovative new
23 technologies to come in, these are the right
24 objectives. The second is to just underscore that
25 we agree that for far too long communities in

2 Brooklyn, in Queens and the Bronx have suffered
3 from disproportionate impacts. There's no question
4 about that. Unfortunately, our technical analysis
5 shows that implementing the SWMP as it's currently
6 constituted will not meet the objectives of the
7 SWMP. We're now eight years into a 20-year plan.
8 We have a lot of evidence of what's actually
9 happening out there and as you've heard today,
10 people are still hurting. So let me use the last
11 few seconds I have for four...

12 [crosstalk]

13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah.

14 RICH KASSEL: Quick points. Number
15 one, without taking further steps implementing the
16 SWMP will not sufficiently reduce truck traffic or
17 pollution in the communities that are currently
18 disproportionately impacted by commercial waste
19 management. This was a staggering finding to us.
20 We did an analysis that compared current status quo
21 against a full SWMP implementation and found that
22 with the SWMP fully implemented, trucks mileage in
23 the city will be reduced by only...

24 [crosstalk]

25 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And Rich, if...

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 90
2 [crosstalk]
3 RICH KASSEL: Four percent.
4 [crosstalk]
5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: You could just go
6 through the four points...
7 [crosstalk]
8 RICH KASSEL: Okay.
9 [crosstalk]
10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Without
11 explaining any of them.
12 RICH KASSEL: Okay.
13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And we'll be
14 done.
15 RICH KASSEL: Okay, number two,
16 implementing the SWMP fully will not hit our air
17 pollution goals. Why? Trucks carrying commercial
18 waste are dirty, dirty, dirty to sum up a lot of
19 work to just say that. 93 percent of the pollution
20 related to moving solid waste in the city is
21 related to those trucks that are hauling commercial
22 waste in the communities.
23 [crosstalk]
24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: We know.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 91

2 RICH KASSEL: You know, so the critical
3 piece for this committee and for the council and
4 the administration to undertake are steps that are
5 going to accelerate the clean-up of those trucks,
6 number one and number two, to deal with the
7 commercial routing issues that keep these trucks in
8 the neighborhoods.

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing]
10 Yes.

11 RICH KASSEL: Number three, the SWMP is
12 not going to bring us to the recycling goals that
13 the city has set for itself since 2006, nor will it
14 meet cities like Los Angeles and Seattle that are
15 recycling at three times this city's rates, and
16 that's lost money; tens of millions...

17 [crosstalk]

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah.

19 [crosstalk]

20 RICH KASSEL: Of dollars a year that
21 we're leaving on the table. And last, there's been
22 so much talk about the symbolic importance of
23 building the East 91st Street MTS. That's what
24 originally brought us into this debate, but then we
25 realized that there's so much more going on here.

2 The reality is that by looking at IBO, Sanitation
3 Department, CBC and other financial documents, we
4 have analyzed and concluded that the city would be
5 able to save roughly \$90 million in the next four
6 years in operating costs, more than \$600 million
7 over the next 20 decades and...

8 [crosstalk]

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Doing what?

10 RICH KASSEL: By looking for a better,
11 more cost-effective way to reach borough equity
12 without that facility that, by the way, is in
13 directly adjacent to NYCHA public housing.

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay.

15 RICH KASSEL: And Asphalt Green.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you so much
17 and I apologize.

18 RICH KASSEL: Thank you very much.

19 [crosstalk]

20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Rich.

21 [crosstalk]

22 RICH KASSEL: I think I got the points
23 across. I appreciate it.

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 93

2 RICH KASSEL: And I look forward to

3 working with you all.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Absolutely.

5 RICH KASSEL: I know there's a lot of

6 work ahead.

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Absolutely.

8 Pedro? Now, I don't want to be mean, but I'm going

9 to have to start being mean. Alright, that was

10 nice. I'm talking about being mean now.

11 PEDRO CARDI: No, no, right?

12 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah, Pedro...

13 [crosstalk]

14 PEDRO CARDI: No.

15 [crosstalk]

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: You might get...

17 [crosstalk]

18 PEDRO CARDI: That's alright.

19 [crosstalk]

20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: The mean...

21 [crosstalk]

22 PEDRO CARDI: I can handle it.

23 [crosstalk]

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: The mean

25 chairman.

2 [crosstalk]

3 PEDRO CARDI: No big deal.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright, go
5 ahead. You got one minute 50 seconds.

6 PEDRO CARDI: Good afternoon and
7 greetings. My name is Pedro Cardi. I'm a trustee
8 on the Board of Teamsters Local 210 and it is an
9 honor to be here today to talk about the future of
10 recycling in New York City. Teamsters Local 210
11 represents over 11,000 workers in New York City,
12 including Sims Metal Management. There are
13 tremendous gains to be made if we transform the way
14 commercial waste has been handled in New York City
15 by establishing a franchise system. Teamsters are
16 in 100 percent support of the effort of Transform
17 Don't Trash and in standing up for workers and for
18 the communities that have been disproportionately
19 shouldered with the city's garbage. We can
20 drastically improve ways and working conditions for
21 thousands of waste haulers and recycle workers.
22 Our local is proud to have a contract relationship
23 with Sims Metal Management Recycling, one of the
24 good employers in the sanitation industry. We
25 don't want to burn and bury. We want to recycle

2 and create jobs while protecting our environment.
3 New York City is only recycling 25 percent of the
4 commercial waste. Our reliance on landfilling and
5 burning garbage is not only disastrous to the
6 environment, but ignores the possibility of
7 thousands of local working class jobs in the
8 recycling industry. New York City is a challenging
9 place to make sweeping changes, especially in the
10 industry that is so resistant to regulations and
11 standards, but it can be done. In San Jose,
12 California recycling rates tripled in commercial
13 recycling after the establishment of a franchise
14 system. Like New York, the commercial recycling
15 rate was only 22 percent. It's now over 77
16 percent. The franchise system provides all
17 businesses with simple recycling guidelines and
18 consistent services in addition to cleaning up
19 garbage trucks, raising...

20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing]

21 Thank you so much, Pedro, for your testimony, thank
22 you.

23 PEDRO CARDI: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Miss Bernadette
25 Kelly.

2 BERNADETTE KELLY: Thank you, Council
3 Member Reynoso. I'm here on behalf of George
4 Miranda, Joint Council 16. We represent over
5 120,000 in the Greater New York area, including
6 Teamsters Local 210 to my right and also Local 813
7 here to my left. We also represent over 8,000 men
8 and women that collect the city's garbage, both in
9 the private and in the commercial sectors. We
10 believe that we can make New York a cleaner, better
11 place to live and work for everyone. The former
12 Mayor had made some great strides in creating some
13 major initiatives with recycling and organics. We
14 were part of that plan, but we at Joint Council 16,
15 we believe that more can be done. We are
16 witnessing a race to the bottom in the commercial
17 waste industry. It's been going on for 20 years.
18 Many of the people that you see here in this room
19 and in the other room are teamsters that work in
20 this industry that are demanding a change of our
21 leadership and also of the council. Bad actors
22 undercut the good companies on wages and benefits,
23 pensions and health and safety. A handful of waste
24 carters that Teamsters Local 813 represents, they
25 try their best to maintain really high standards

2 like the employer that John Shehas mentioned.
3 They're not afraid of change. They're ready to
4 move forward, but they're worn down by competitors
5 who put profit before the health and safety and
6 benefits of their workers. For years the wages
7 paid to thousands of waste industry workers have
8 steadily declined. In 2011, new hires for waste
9 companies in the Bronx, Brooklyn and Staten Island
10 earned less than \$20,000 a year. Often they work
11 12 hour days in dangerous conditions with little or
12 no safety precautions, and the scope of their work
13 is absolutely staggering. Each year, they collect
14 two million tons of commercial waste generated by
15 thousands of restaurants, offices and businesses in
16 the city. Many commercial waste workers live in
17 those same communities forced to endure all of the
18 trucking and the transfer stations. Our friends in
19 the environmental justice community here have been
20 fighting that injustice for many years and we're
21 very happy to be partnering with them. Together we
22 believe the size of these problems suggest very
23 sizeable solutions. We formed an alliance called
24 Transform Don't Trash New York City to change the
25 way commercial waste is handled in our city. A

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 98

2 report by the coalition points this way: New York
3 must increase recycling rates for commercial waste.
4 It must introduce labor standards that raise the
5 floor of workers. We must administer a plan that
6 cleans up our neighborhoods facing the most refuge.

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you so much
8 for your testimony, Bernadette.

9 BERNADETTE KELLY: I have so much more.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I know you do.

11 BERNADETTE KELLY: Why do you have to
12 be mean to the teamsters?

13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I have no idea,
14 [laughter] but it's a lot of you guys. You guys
15 are making up in numbers and just to...

16 [crosstalk]

17 BERNADETTE KELLY: You have my full
18 testimony.

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Absolutely and
20 just to be mindful, I am fully aware in order to
21 have a change that we might need to work on this
22 cap issue. Right now it's limiting...

23 [crosstalk]

24 BERNADETTE KELLY: Yes.
25

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: The work that we
3 can do and also the enforcement issues. In one of
4 our pieces of legislation that we were proposing,
5 it made it so that the bad players were the first
6 ones that were going to lose capacity.

7 BERNADETTE KELLY: Yeah.

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So and that
9 threat would've motivated them to start being up to
10 snuff, but we also need to make sure that we give
11 them an opportunity to increase wages and to...

12 [crosstalk]

13 BERNADETTE KELLY: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Buy better
15 equipment.

16 BERNADETTE KELLY: [interposing] That's
17 right.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And to have more
19 capacity to invest in their companies, so we're
20 aware and I'm fully on board and I think it'll be
21 good for the city of New York and it'll be good for
22 a lot of workers that are doing this work...

23 BERNADETTE KELLY: [interposing] That's
24 right.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 100

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Underpaid and
3 under-regulated.

4 BERNADETTE KELLY: The most vulnerable
5 workers...

6 [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Absolutely.

8 BERNADETTE KELLY: In the city.

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Very well. Thank
10 you so much for your testimony, and now Sean
11 Campbell, please.

12 SEAN T. CAMPBELL: Good afternoon. My
13 name is Sean Campbell. I'm the President of
14 Teamsters Local 813, and I commend you, Council
15 Member Reynoso, for scheduling this important
16 hearing so that we can begin to move forward with
17 the next stages of handling New York City's garbage
18 issues. I'm from Red Hook, Brooklyn, a
19 neighborhood that has experienced firsthand the
20 effects of an unfair waste structure that
21 systematically carts its garbage to poor and
22 working class neighborhoods. As President of Local
23 813 and a sanitation worker by trade, I know
24 firsthand that most of the families I represent
25 both work and live in these harsh environments that

2 pollute our air and wreak havoc on our streets.

3 Growing up, jobs in the private sanitation industry
4 were good paying jobs with benefits and the

5 security of good pension plans. In fact, the

6 working standards were, in many cases, on par with

7 the New York City Department of Sanitation. This

8 is not the case today. In the '90s the Business

9 Integrity Commission was created to rid the

10 industry of corruption, to license carters and set

11 maximum rates for commercial waste collection to

12 prevent extortion. The BIC has been successful on

13 its focus in eliminating organized crime; however,

14 the rate cap and the absence of a rate floor,

15 stagnates wages and benefits has led to a race to

16 the bottom depressing labor and environmental

17 standards. My members and non-union workers are on

18 the receiving end of this system. Today, we have

19 highly trained and valued personnel from DSNY

20 working alongside commercial garbage men that are

21 underpaid with little to no benefits and terrible

22 safety and health training. Today, the majority of

23 private carters pay low wages, little on benefits

24 and no job security. Even worse, non-union

25 companies do not invest in safety programs in an

2 industry that is cited as the most dangerous in our
3 country. These same companies seek out the most
4 vulnerable to work for them, for example, the
5 undocumented and those with criminal records so
6 that they can undermine legitimate union organizing
7 drives.

8 At Local 813, we also know that there
9 are thousands of workers who do not have the
10 protection of good union contracts and go to work
11 day after day fearful of raising their voices in
12 opposition to unsafe workplace practices at
13 privately operated transfer stations and private
14 carting companies. Local 813 has been in the
15 trenches trying to raise the floor and at the same
16 time protect good contracts we have in the private
17 sanitation industry, but we cannot do it alone.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you, Sean,
19 and I just want to note for folks that don't know,
20 while we're talking about it that there's a public
21 sector and then there's a private sector, and in
22 the public sector there seems to be very tighter
23 standards and better standards overall, but in the
24 private sector it's sort of like the wild, wild
25 west out there. The person that can get the

2 contract for the least amount of money is the one
3 that's going to win, so the least amount of money
4 means that you have trucks that are out of date;
5 workers that are getting paid almost nothing with
6 no benefits. So what we want to do is try to bring
7 the regulations to at least be equal to what the
8 city of New York is today. If we have a standard,
9 it should be citywide. It shouldn't just be for
10 one sector. So we're looking into it. It's not
11 going to be as easy as we want it to be, but we're
12 going to work and we're going to make sure we can
13 do something about it. I really thank you guys for
14 the opportunity to speak to you and...

15 [crosstalk]

16 SEAN T. CAMPBELL: Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: We'll get the
18 next panel up here. Thank you. Alright, Anthony
19 Winn; David Shuffles; Kellie Terry and Rebecca
20 Rosado. [background voices] And I'd just like to
21 note that Harry Nespoli, the President of the
22 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Association also
23 submitted testimony for the record, and thank you,
24 guys. Yes, so it's Anthony, David, Kellie and
25 Rebecca, alright. [background voices] You

2 absolutely can. Did you also submit a card to
3 speak? Alright, two birds with one stone.
4 Absolutely and we appreciate it. So we're going to
5 ask Rebecca first to speak. Please pass the mic.
6 Thank you so much.

7 REBECCA ROSADO: Good afternoon. My
8 name is Rebecca Rosado. I am Program Manager of
9 A.C.T.I.O.N, which stands for Activists Coming to
10 Inform our Neighborhood, a program that runs out of
11 The POINT Community Development Corporation, so
12 this statement is on behalf of all members of our
13 team group A.C.T.I.O.N. A.C.T.I.O.N is a group of
14 youth from the South Bronx who meet three times a
15 week after school as part of a program at The POINT
16 CDC. We work to identify social environmental
17 justice issues facing the Hunts Point section of
18 the South Bronx with the goal of creating and
19 implementing ongoing youth led solutions. The
20 Point is a member of the New York City
21 Environmental Justice Alliance. As representatives
22 of the Hunts Point community, we feel compelled to
23 explain the burden that handling waste has had on
24 our community. There are nine waste transfer
25 stations in the South Bronx permitted to handle

2 nearly 12,000 tons of waste each day. On a typical
3 day, nearly 6,000 tons is hauled in and out of the
4 South Bronx, requiring about 1,400 diesel truck
5 trips. Not surprisingly, asthma rates in the South
6 Bronx are sky high, eight times the national
7 average. So are rates of other diseases and
8 illnesses tied to air pollution. In our role as
9 youth community organizers, we strive to represent
10 the voices of our communities and communicate needs
11 and solutions that will improve the overall quality
12 of life of our neighbors. We are here today on
13 behalf of our community and communities like ours
14 that do not have the privilege of hiring high-
15 priced lobbyists or pour tons of money into media
16 campaigns to win empathy for what we have been
17 living with for generations. We are here on behalf
18 of our community that has been in the shadows
19 dealing with a disproportionate impact of handling
20 the majority of the city's waste for decades.
21 Capacity reduction provides long overdue relief to
22 the three communities that handle over three-
23 fourths of the city's waste and will take hundreds
24 of garbage trucks off the street in these
25 overburdened communities. So in very real terms,

2 Hunts Point forms a portrait of environmental
3 racism. The Peninsula bears a disproportionate
4 amount of the region's industrial infrastructure
5 with the majority of land zoned for heavy
6 industrial use. Hunts Point has one of the highest
7 concentrations of truck traffic in New York City,
8 already home to the largest... [background voice]
9 Okay, sure. So in essence, it is because of all
10 the other statistics and staggering facts that you
11 will read in the paper that we submitted that we
12 are here today on behalf of truly disproportionate
13 impacted communities to call on our City Council to
14 do what is right and just in the face of privilege,
15 and support the city's Solid Waste Management Plan
16 and furthermore to pass a capacity reduction bill
17 that will go a long way in providing some overdue
18 relief to the children and families that have been
19 suffering for far too long.

20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you and
21 I'm working on the capacity reduction bill now.
22 Hopefully, we can get it passed as soon as
23 possible, so just be mindful and I grew up in
24 Williamsburg on the south side, so I know in the
25 same way you went through the waste transfer

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 107

2 movement, if that's what you want to call it. We
3 had 30 at one point and we're down to 15 and it's
4 still...

5 [crosstalk]

6 REBECCA ROSADO: We want to be down
7 to...

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing]
9 Exactly and we're still at 20,000 tons of...

10 [crosstalk]

11 REBECCA ROSADO: Yes.

12 [crosstalk]

13 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Of trash, so I
14 get it. Thank you...

15 REBECCA ROSADO: [interposing] Thank
16 you.

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: For your
18 testimony. Kellie.

19 KELLIE TERRY: Good afternoon, Council
20 Member. Thank you so much for calling this
21 hearing. My name is Kellie Terry. I'm Executive
22 Director of The POINT Community Development
23 Corporation. I echo all of what Rebecca was
24 saying, and officially on the record I am calling
25 for the full implementation of the Solid Waste

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 108

2 Management Plan, passing of Intro 1170 or whatever
3 it's going to be called now, which is formerly
4 capacity reduction, and also in full support of the
5 Transform Don't Trash NYC franchising movement to
6 bring some order and some long relief in terms of
7 the commercial waste industry. And what I'm going
8 to say here is going to be... you know, I have full
9 testimony to submit and this is just really going
10 to be to the point of it is... it saddens me in
11 some ways to see communities and low-income
12 communities of color sort of pitted against each
13 other and it is not really about one community
14 being better than another, but as you've pointed
15 out several times, it's about looking for a way and
16 a solution to improve very imperfect system and the
17 fact is that right now we have boroughs, as you
18 know, that are handling the majority of the city's
19 trash. As we speak right now, there are
20 communities that are suffering, and I just want to
21 point out that we can study this all day long. We
22 can study until I'm 100 years old; until my kids
23 are in college and we've been at this for decades
24 and we're not saying that what is currently in
25 front of the city is perfect, but we are saying

2 that it's fairer; it is more just. Right now we
3 have a borough that has no waste transfer stations
4 and what we're asking is for a little bit of relief
5 from this. We're not saying that this community
6 you know, isn't more important than ours, but you
7 know, we have children that are right down a block
8 from our nine waste transfer stations and even if
9 this does go forward; when this does go forward and
10 marine transfer stations are built, we will still
11 have those transfer stations. It's not as if the
12 problem's going to disappear, but it will provide
13 relief. Currently, recyclables from the Upper East
14 Side come to our community.

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Right.

16 KELLIE TERRY: And that's not going to
17 happen if the Solid Waste Management Plan moves
18 forward, so we thank you all for being here today
19 and hearing this issue. We look forward to working
20 with you in partnership.

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you very
22 much for your testimony. Anthony?

23 ANTHONY WINN: Thank you very much,
24 Council Member Reynoso. I want to thank you again
25 for this opportunity to testify. I am Anthony

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 110

2 Winn, Chief Operating Officer for Nos Quedamos; We
3 Stay/Nos Quedamos, a Melrose Commons community-
4 based development corporation and we're also a
5 member of the New York City Environmental Justice
6 Alliance. I will skip through all of the intro
7 verbiage and really get to the point, which is the
8 future of trash in New York City must be a burden
9 shared and planned with an emphasis on fairness and
10 equity. We can no longer allow the travesty of the
11 status quo to exist. The children of the South
12 Bronx and the other three communities that have
13 mentioned over and over must not be left to suffer
14 while options for improvement are overlooked.
15 Please, we ask that you support the full
16 implementation of the Solid Waste Management
17 Program. We ask that you support capacity
18 reduction as a real policy to end this
19 overburdening of our communities, and we ask you to
20 look at the franchise system and other
21 opportunities that really look at making our
22 commercial trash management a smart and effective
23 system rather than currently leaving us with what
24 we have, which is sickness, dangerous streets and
25 an overburdened history that everybody is aware of,

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 111

2 and this is not about one community over another.

3 It's about everybody sharing the burden and we

4 think that's a worthy cause. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you so much
6 for your testimony, and David Shuffles, being
7 represented...

8 [crosstalk]

9 ANGELA TOVAR: Shuffler, Shuffler.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Shuffler, I'm
11 sorry, Shuffler being represented by...

12 ANGELA TOVAR: Angela Tovar from
13 Sustainable South Bronx.

14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you so
15 much.

16 ANGELA TOVAR: Okay, thank you for the
17 opportunity to testify, Chairperson Reynoso. My
18 name's Angela. I'm from Sustainable South Bronx.
19 I'm the Director of Policy and Research. I'm also
20 a North Brooklyn resident. I think that my
21 colleagues did a very good job of summarizing some
22 of the statistics for you that are happening in the
23 South Bronx. I just wanted to make one other
24 point. We actually handle 23 percent of the city's
25 waste overall and 100 percent of the Bronx waste,

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 112

2 and as Kellie mentioned as well, that includes some
3 of the recycling from Manhattan as well. So it's
4 time to put a plan in motion and I think that we've
5 outlined a lot of really great ideas and plans to
6 move forward. One thing about waste is that you...
7 even though this whole plan is tied up in lawsuits,
8 we're still generating tons of thousands of waste
9 every day. That's not something that we can press
10 pause on, so while this is all you know, playing
11 out and hearing we're still generating this waste
12 and it's still disproportionately overburdening
13 communities of color, and so that's a solution that
14 we need immediate relief from. So we believe that
15 the next step is immediately moving forward with
16 the full implementation of the Solid Waste
17 Management Plan. Of course, we also believe, as my
18 colleagues mentioned, the next step is addressing
19 capacity reduction legislation. We know that
20 that's not a full solution. We understand that
21 that wouldn't provide all of the relief that our
22 community needs, but every single truck makes a
23 difference and so for us, it's about minimizing the
24 amount of trucks that come in and out of the
25 community. Our current transportation

2 configuration is that we don't have an exit that is
3 from the Bruckner Expressway, which accesses the
4 Hunts Point Peninsula, so because of that, trucks
5 come on local streets. So somebody mentioned
6 before that, you know, these trucks would be coming
7 through parks if the marine transfer station would
8 be built on East 91st Street. That's something
9 that happens every day. Our truck routes are
10 parallel to all of the neighborhood streets, so
11 that they're going by senior centers; community
12 centers; schools every single day. It's a reality
13 for individuals in the South Bronx. And then just
14 quickly you know, just to be on the record also you
15 know, obviously the franchising campaign Transform
16 Don't Trash is something that we urge you to look
17 at in the future and then finally, supporting more
18 recycling programs...

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing]

20 Yeah.

21 ANGELA TOVAR: Particularly on the
22 community level. Sustainable South Bronx is
23 involved in one with... we've partnered with a lot
24 of different people, but the Department of
25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 114

2 Sanitation has been very supportive of our work and
3 it's allowed us...

4 [crosstalk]

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.

6 ANGELA TOVAR: To...

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing]

8 Thank you so much.

9 ANGELA TOVAR: Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And I just want
11 now to make... everything that we hear regarding
12 the recycling; the franchising; the capacity
13 reduction I think those are all items that should
14 be parallel to the SWMP plan being pushed.

15 ANGELA TOVAR: Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And we are going
17 to have more conversations to really open up the
18 discussion, but those are assisting the bigger
19 picture; speeding it up for us.

20 ANGELA TOVAR: Yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And I also have
22 over 1,200 trucks a day that pass through us;
23 Cooper Park. It's also a housing development and a
24 park and you know, we just have to bear the burden
25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 115

2 of it at this moment, but not for long. Thank you
3 so much for your testimony.

4 ANGELA TOVAR: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Samantha
6 MacBride; Maite Quinn; Vincent McGowan... McGowan
7 hopefully; Debra Menich and Brendan Sexton. So if
8 Samantha is going to be the first speaker, then
9 we're going to have Miss Quinn and McGowan, Debra
10 and then Brendan. So if we can pass the mic to
11 Samantha, please. Thank you so much.

12 DR. MACBRIDE: Thank you, Chairman
13 Reynoso, for having me here today. My name is Dr.
14 Samantha MacBride. I am a professor at Baruch
15 College and author of a book on the history of
16 recycling policy in New York City and I also worked
17 for the Department of Sanitation in the Recycling
18 Bureau up until 2012, and it is in these capacities
19 that I'm here to offer my suggestions for a more
20 equitable and sustainable waste future for New York
21 City. I echo the sentiments of the last panel for
22 borough-based equity moving forward with the Solid
23 Waste Management Plan and getting the burden off
24 the two communities, South Bronx and
25 Greenpoint/Williamsburg, who bear the, you know,

2 terrible brunt of all of the waste truck traffic
3 through the city. This is really important, but
4 it's only a first level solution. Closing some
5 garbage transfer stations and utilizing others only
6 shifts the location of waste disposal
7 infrastructure. It doesn't improve how we deal
8 with waste overall. Each year, we send millions of
9 tons of mixed municipal garbage to landfills. A
10 lot of it moves through transfer stations in New
11 Jersey in overburdened communities and it makes its
12 way as far as North Carolina to burden those
13 communities as well with greenhouse gas emissions.
14 The majority of these shipments consist of rotting
15 materials; food scraps, unrecycled paper, yard
16 trimmings and other decomposable items. If you'll
17 excuse my language, such materials are why garbage
18 stinks, why it decomposes and causes health threats
19 and why it generates greenhouse gases when
20 landfilled. But this organic material doesn't have
21 to be treated as trash. At present, there are a
22 host of innovative programs and established
23 endeavors taking place all over New York City to
24 route organics towards composting. These are
25 community-based projects and larger scale projects.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 117

2 To conclude, let me say that in order for them to
3 succeed, the Department of Sanitation has to get
4 behind the effort 100 percent, and in my
5 experienced, while those in the Recycling Bureau at
6 Sanitation have worked tirelessly over the decades
7 to promote composting and recycling, there has not
8 been the incorporation of alternatives to disposal
9 into the overall mission of the Department of
10 Sanitation. Only with that kind of commitment
11 starting from the very top and moving down through
12 all facets of the department can we move to a
13 situation where we can have systemic change and
14 move away from a method of managing most waste by
15 sending it to landfills to ones that will create
16 local jobs and green our communities and the
17 communities around us.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you so much
19 for your testimony, and we are aware of the lack of
20 education we think that we have regarding
21 composting. There is a pilot program currently in
22 several communities that...

23 [crosstalk]

24 DR. MACBRIDE: Yes.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 118

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: We're looking to.
3 We still think we need to more education and if
4 education doesn't work we might have to mandate it,
5 but we are having those conversations and hopefully
6 whoever the next sanitation chair is or sanitation
7 commissioner is that they are visionary and that
8 they really...

9 [crosstalk]

10 DR. MACBRIDE: Mm-hm.

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Look to moving
12 the city forward into the next century. Thank you
13 for your testimony. I have Brendan. Brendan,
14 please get the mic first, thank you.

15 BRENDAN SEXTON: Hi, thanks very much
16 for inviting us here today. My name is Brendan
17 Sexton and I'm here today as Chair of the Manhattan
18 Solid Waste Advisory Board, and we are very
19 grateful for the opportunity to get to know you and
20 the committee. We have over the last few years had
21 a really great relationship with the council. We
22 were early advocates with the council of recycling
23 in the city, and I don't think I want to go over
24 all the details of my testimony, but mostly
25 establish some priorities and let you know that

2 we're there. Our chief role we think has been to
3 help the council and sometimes the Mayor and
4 certainly the department and people within the
5 department who are interested in waste reduction,
6 recycling and so on. We have focused on landfill
7 diversion. We feel, as just described by Samantha,
8 that the... who is a member of the Solid Waste
9 Advisory Board, who the city has engaged; has
10 entered into an engagement with far away landfills
11 that require us to truck garbage throughout the
12 city and then throughout the country in ways that
13 are extremely environmentally detrimental to our
14 local neighborhoods and to the planet generally.
15 We have been supporters over the last few years of
16 community composting. We have, in fact, raised our
17 own money to run a grant program every year with
18 the New York City Citizens Committee and the
19 borough president. We have raised our own money to
20 give out grants to community composters often at
21 community gardens as well. Until a year or so ago,
22 it was just for the Manhattan installation since
23 we're the Manhattan Board, but as of this year we
24 have been giving out grants to local composters in
25 all five boroughs. We've become increasingly

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 120

2 concerned that community composting is not
3 appreciated for the possibilities of the... you
4 have to understand each facility may do only 100 or
5 200 tons at a time, but there are now dozens and
6 dozens of local communities that are organizing to
7 handle their own organic waste and they need the
8 support of the city of New York. The new Deputy
9 Commissioner for composting in the department has
10 been supportive. This has to become a key part of
11 the city's approach. We have also been supportive
12 of the polystyrene ban recently passed by council.
13 We were I don't want to say disappointed 'cause
14 it's unfair, but we are patient with the one year
15 extension, but we assume and we hope the council
16 will be on our side in making sure at the...

17 [crosstalk]

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.

19 [crosstalk]

20 BRENDAN SEXTON: End of the year
21 grant...

22 [crosstalk]

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: For your
24 testimony and I just want to make mention that
25 we're working...

2 [crosstalk]

3 BRENDAN SEXTON: God, that goes by so
4 quickly.

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah, it does.
6 And we're trying to work on regarding composting to
7 build a market for it and figure out a strategy
8 where we can... what's happening now is that you
9 know, they don't think that we have the capacity to
10 handle the composting. Where are we going to send
11 it? What are we going to do with it? So we're
12 trying to be smart about building a system in which
13 there is a...

14 [crosstalk]

15 BRENDAN SEXTON: Yes.

16 [crosstalk]

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Market and the
18 more composting we do we know that there'll be a
19 place for it.

20 BRENDAN SEXTON: And I think composting
21 and anaerobic digestion you know, in fact, is the
22 wave of the future for organics. I did want to say
23 one thing on behalf of the people from Transform
24 Don't Trash NYC. We also have been very supportive
25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 122

2 of that effort and I think it's a critical effort
3 for restructuring the commercial business...

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing]
5 Yeah.

6 BRENDAN SEXTON: Going forward and if I
7 can just make a plea, we also think recycling
8 enforcement has to be a key priority for the city
9 going forward. There's...

10 [crosstalk]

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah.

12 BRENDAN SEXTON: Tremendous problems
13 with poaching and with people not cooperating with
14 the laws and rules.

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. Debra
16 and then Vincent or it's the other way around.

17 VINCE MCGOWAN: We'll start by saying
18 thank you to the City Council, particularly Chair
19 Reynoso, for convening this hearing. My name is
20 Vince McGowan and I'm the President of the United
21 War Veterans Council. We are a 501(c)19 that was
22 formed in 1985 and we primarily produce events that
23 honor service to New York City service personnel
24 and we also provide services for those men and
25 women, many of who are coming back from these wars

2 now. We're expecting an influx of 44,000 on top of
3 our 250,000 veterans in New York City. Our purpose
4 is to support and promote a wide range of
5 initiatives that provide vital services to the
6 veterans community and in that regard, we find that
7 our veteran service offices are capable of
8 producing from \$400 to \$2,500 per veteran per month
9 in additional income that they can spend in New
10 York City when they get their benefits from their
11 service in the U.S. Military. We need to increase
12 their ability to access those benefits since the
13 federal government is running 500 days behind and
14 that is going to... it already has caused problems
15 of both keeping people in New York City and
16 encouraging those that have left from New York City
17 to serve, to come back and rebuild their lives
18 here. So that's part of why we're interested in
19 recycling. Our clothing and recycling goods
20 program we're following the city's PlaNYC 2030
21 initiative. UWBC is contributing our collective
22 services in an effort to help divert clothing and
23 household goods from the waste stream. We promote
24 an environmentally sustainable business model that
25 facilitates the reuse and resale of textiles,

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 124

2 electronics and household goods, and we reduce the
3 amount of waste diverted at public expense by 100
4 tons each month. That's what we're currently
5 doing. I want to say that we are members of
6 Chairman Sexton's SWMP program, the Board, and we
7 are very interested to add our 25 trucks per day
8 that are operating in New York City. They're all
9 driven by highly trained and insured contracted
10 drivers. We operate a 24/7 website that's
11 available 15 hours a day for scheduling pick-ups.
12 Our trucks guarantee... unlike other recyclers, our
13 trucks guarantee a pick-up schedule of the
14 scheduled donations in three to five days and we
15 also have 24-hour service; what we call our white
16 glove service available.

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.

18 VINCE MCGOWAN: And...

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing]

20 Thank you so much for your testimony, and you guys
21 handle mostly electronics? Is that...

22 VINCE MCGOWAN: No, we handle mostly
23 textiles.

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Textiles.
25

2 VINCE MCGOWAN: And we also handle
3 electronics and what we... and if you'll notice on
4 our submittal, we've used a flash drive in order to
5 reduce the amount of paper that you have to read.

6 [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Oh, it's...

8 [crosstalk]

9 VINCE MCGOWAN: So we hope...

10 [crosstalk]

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Beautiful.

12 [crosstalk]

13 VINCE MCGOWAN: You get a chance on
14 that.

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Nice, nice.

16 VINCE MCGOWAN: And there's a note to
17 the members on the back with our concern that the
18 10-year textile recovery program contract is
19 unclear and it does not include a (c) 19
20 opportunity to address it, so in those terms it
21 would be considered exclusionary. We'd like a
22 chance to address that.

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay, I'll see
24 what we can do and thank you so much for your
25 testimony, and Debra would like to go now.

2 VINCE MCGOWAN: Oh, oh, the mic.

3 DEBRA MENICH: Good afternoon. I'm

4 Debra Menich. I run the clothing and household
5 goods recycling program for the veterans. Just
6 quickly, just to reiterate what we offer. We are
7 already lessening the burden on the community by 90
8 to 100 tons per month out of the city. We are
9 looking and have continually attempted to partner
10 with as many not-for-profit as well as city
11 agencies that we can in order to grow our business,
12 so in the packet that you have that you can take
13 home and look shows you how we go about doing that.
14 We offer a white glove approach. We do not use
15 bins. We say please log on; call us; we will be
16 there in three to five days. If it is urgent we
17 can reroute trucks that day to come pick it up.
18 What do we collect? We collect all kinds of
19 clothing; textiles; household goods; yes,
20 electronics. What do we do with that? We take it
21 and we repurpose it and we follow a closed-loop
22 philosophy. That closed-loop philosophy means that
23 if you donate a shirt hopefully it will end up on
24 your back, reducing the amount of extra energy
25 coming out of the carbon footprint because we are

2 repurposing as much as we can efficiently within
3 the local area. All the proceeds go to the
4 veterans in the local area. So within that social
5 business model we are, without a burden on the city
6 whatsoever, doing this completely independently
7 where 98 percent of the proceeds then go to the
8 local veterans.

9 VINCE MCGOWAN: And come to your house.

10 DEBRA MENICH: We come to you.

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And is there
12 anything that's in our system right now that makes
13 that more difficult for you guys to do?

14 DEBRA MENICH: Yes, we are really in
15 need of parking permits because any type of parking
16 violation that we receive lessens the amount of the
17 money that goes to the veterans.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay, alright.

19 DEBRA MENICH: The other thing that we
20 would like to bring to your attention, back to that
21 textiles bid in 2010, the textile recovery program
22 bin. To the layman's eye, because I am not a
23 lawyer, it seems to be unclear and does not account
24 for the transparency and accountability of the end
25 use, which is what I was talking about with that

2 closed-loop and trying to get it... you know, using
3 that exact shirt and not sending it offshore or not
4 you know, trying to keep it out of a landfill or a
5 dump as much as possible, and it also... the life
6 of the collected items. The point of that closed-
7 loop is keeping the life of that item. We pick it
8 up, we take it very carefully and people care what
9 they give.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing] Mm-
11 hm.

12 DEBRA MENICH: Even if it's coming out
13 of their closet they still want... all of these
14 cared for items can definitely be reused in the
15 life cycle within the same area.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And thank you so
17 much for your testimony.

18 DEBRA MENICH: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.
20 Maite? I'm sorry if I said that...

21 MAITE QUINN: Maite. You said it
22 exactly right.

23 [crosstalk]

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Oh, good,
25 alright.

2 [crosstalk]

3 MAITE QUINN: Thank you. Good
4 afternoon. Thank you for the opportunity to
5 testify today. My name is Maite Quinn and I'm the
6 Business Development and Marketing Manager for Sims
7 Municipal Recycling. We have a long-term contract
8 with the New York City Department of Sanitation to
9 receive, process and market all the metal, glass
10 and plastic collected by DSNY through its
11 residential curbside recycling program. In 1992,
12 the New York City Council passed Local Law 87,
13 which requires commercial establishments to
14 recycle. Commercial office buildings are required
15 to recycle paper, cardboard, textile, bulk metal
16 and construction waste, but not plastic and glass.
17 The food and beverage service establishments are
18 required to recycle cardboard, bulk metal, metal,
19 glass, plastic and construction waste. The
20 regulations address what must happen at the
21 commercial establishment in terms of source
22 separation of designated recyclables. The
23 regulation addressed the issue of recyclables
24 collection and subsequent recycling. There appears
25 to be different interpretations as to what is

2 allowed with regard to collection of metal, glass
3 and plastic, with the principle distinction being
4 whether source separated recyclables must be
5 collected in a separate truck or whether bags of
6 recyclables can be collected in the same truck as
7 bags of refuse and then subsequently separated for
8 recycling at transfer stations. Based on our
9 experience and what we know of the recycling
10 industry in New York City, we believe that there is
11 a significant amount of recycling occurring at
12 commercial buildings. These recycling efforts are
13 focusing on paper, which makes up the majority of
14 the waste stream in the office buildings. However,
15 to our knowledge there's very little metal, glass
16 and plastic recycling occurring at food and
17 beverage service establishments as required by law.
18 To be specific, many food and beverage service
19 establishments have established recycling bins and
20 programs to keep recyclables separated on site, but
21 few if any establishments have separate metal,
22 glass and plastic collection of designated
23 recyclables, and for establishments that are set up
24 for post-collection separation, to our knowledge
25 the post-collection separation hardly occurs and

2 metal, glass and plastic that may have been
3 carefully separated by the restaurant or bar are
4 simply landfilled in participial waste. What is
5 happening with metal, glass and plastic produced by
6 the food and beverage service sector is not only
7 against the law, it is also a disservice to the
8 establishments that have gone to the effort to set
9 up recycling bins and educate their staff and
10 customers on separation requirements. Therefore,
11 we recommend this committee look into commercial
12 recycling in general of metal, glass and plastic
13 recycling in particular in order to determine if
14 the current laws and enforcement are working. If,
15 as we suspect, these programs are not working, we
16 recommend that you work with the relevant parties
17 and take necessary steps to bring New York City
18 commercial recycling into the 21st Century.

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay, thank you.

20 MAITE QUINN: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I would like to
22 ask you a quick question, Maite.

23 MAITE QUINN: Yep.

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Are you saying
25 that folks in the businesses recycled it and the...

2 MAITE QUINN: [interposing]

3 Collections.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: The collectors or
5 the private collectors just dump it in the same
6 truck?

7 MAITE QUINN: It's a very gray area.
8 So the businesses are required to separate that and
9 there is enforcement on that, but as far as
10 collection on the metal, glass and plastic they are
11 allowed to put that into the same truck and then
12 from there on there's no enforcement whether
13 they're actually sort of separating that at
14 transfer stations and from experience we see that
15 it's not happening.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So right now
17 there's no let's say a permit that states you have
18 to hire someone that's going to do the recycling
19 portion of it or are they just saying...

20 [crosstalk]

21 MAITE QUINN: You... you...

22 [crosstalk]

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Hire anyone you
24 want?

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 133

2 MAITE QUINN: Yeah, you have to... as a
3 customer you have to say that someone's doing it,
4 but on the other end no one has to say that they're
5 actually doing it number one.

6 [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I'm guessing your
8 company does do it though.

9 MAITE QUINN: Well, we do the
10 residential. Well, actually we do...

11 [crosstalk]

12 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So you don't
13 even...

14 [crosstalk]

15 MAITE QUINN: Residential...

16 [crosstalk]

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Go out... you're
18 not on commercial.

19 MAITE QUINN: We don't do anything on
20 commercial, but we would be able to accept the
21 metal, glass and plastic. We just built a
22 recycling center in Sunset Park, Brooklyn.

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah.

24 MAITE QUINN: So.

25 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay.

2 MAITE QUINN: We have the capability of
3 doing it and maybe they didn't have the
4 infrastructure before.

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright, thank
6 you so much for that 'cause that's good
7 information. Thank you, guys so much for your
8 testimony.

9 MAITE QUINN: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright.
11 Alright. [background voices] Mario Figueroa; Ryan
12 Hegg; George Morin; Tanya Bley and David Buckel.
13 [background voices] [off mic] Thank you guys so
14 much for your time. Thank you, guys. Thank you.
15 Thomas Toscano and Vandra Thorburn or Thorburn, so
16 Vandra Thorburn; Thomas Toscano; David Buckel;
17 Tanya Bley and George Morin. So we're going to go
18 George; George Morin, you're first, sir. Okay.
19 Alright, so George, we're going to go ahead and
20 start you.

21 GEORGE MORIN: Okay, thank you very
22 much for this opportunity. This is the second
23 appearance I've had over the last 10 years, and my
24 affiliation...

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing]

3 Check if the mic is on or speak... there it is.

4 Speak into the mic as best you can.

5 GEORGE MORIN: Okay, I'll start from
6 the beginning. Thank you very much for having me.
7 This is my second appearance in the last 10 years.

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Mm-hm.

9 GEORGE MORIN: And I represent the
10 Gracie Point Community Council as the current
11 president and I am here to... I'm very impressed
12 with all the talk of the recycling that is planned
13 and will hopefully be installed. My issue today is
14 the siting on the Gracie Point of a transfer
15 station that will, at last report, handle garbage
16 trucks; big, gigantic garbage trucks; larger than
17 they were when it was opened I guess 10 years ago.
18 At that time, the trucks lined up on the avenue
19 from Gracie Point all the way up to 86th Street.

20 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Mm-hm.

21 GEORGE MORIN: In any case, in that
22 time we had a field of not asphalt; we had a field
23 of cinder and glass and in that time the community
24 build a playing field for kids from all over the
25 city. We had a wonderful community room at Asphalt

2 Green, which also had people from all over the city
3 use it and the return of the using this as a
4 transfer station is just something we really,
5 really must object to. Our arguments got four to
6 five after Sandy; after the superstorm from Sandy,
7 which flooded the area all the way up to the... up
8 over the sidewalks.

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And I apologize,
10 but we have to move onto another testimony. I just
11 want you to be mindful, I hope your third meeting
12 with us is going to be hopefully in April or May.
13 We're going to have a dedicated hearing on SWMP,
14 and I think it would be great for you to speak to
15 the history and speak to how you see it moving
16 forward and we'll be there to listen, 'kay? But
17 thank you so much for your testimony.

18 GEORGE MORIN: Thank you. That was
19 George. Tanya? Thank you, Tanya.

20 TANYA BLEY: Good afternoon, Council...

21 [crosstalk]

22 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Good afternoon.

23 [crosstalk]

24 TANYA BLEY: Reynoso.

25 [crosstalk]

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 137

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: How are you?

3 TANYA BLEY: My name is Tanya Bley, and
4 I'm going cut to the chase.

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Mm-hm.

6 TANYA BLEY: I would like to make some
7 specific suggestions in five distinct areas.

8 First, the Siting Task Force: The SWMP had
9 established a Compost Facility Siting Task Force
10 that was required to submit a report by July 1st,
11 2008. This report has never been produced.
12 According to the DSNY 2013 Annual Report, the
13 Bureau participated in the composting and
14 alternative Waste Management Technology Task Force,
15 established through the SWMP. My ideas are to set
16 a new date when the report ought to be submitted,
17 make transparent who serves on this task force and
18 establish a Community Advisory Committee for this
19 task force that can provide advice, among other
20 things, as to the siting of decentralized small and
21 medium scale composting and anaerobic digestion
22 facilities. Second, the Business Integrity
23 Commission, BIC: I agree with ideas that will be
24 brought before this committee here today by David
25 Buckel and Greg Todd, among others, who suggest

2 that there ought to be a review of the city's code
3 that governs BIC and that BIC ought to create a
4 separate license type for small scale community-
5 based carters. Third, the SWABs, the Solid Waste
6 Advisory Boards: The SWABs were created in each
7 borough with Local Law 19. We know all that, so my
8 ideas are to re-establish SWABs in those boroughs
9 in which they have lapsed and to encourage support
10 for the SWABs from borough presidents; local
11 community groups; local council persons; community
12 boards and other stakeholder groups; establish
13 regular round table meetings of each SWABs
14 chairpersons, intra-borough SWAB summits. Fourth,
15 Annual Organics Conference: Just as the Million
16 Tree Initiative hosts their annual Grow Our
17 Grassroots Summit in order to engender enthusiasm
18 for tree stewardship among New York City residents,
19 the local Community Composting Initiative in New
20 York City should hold an annual Organics Summit in
21 order to engender enthusiasm for compost
22 stewardship. The ideas are to encourage
23 collaboration with the SWABs, the borough
24 presidents, the NYC Compost Project and other
25 stakeholder groups to make such regular summits

2 possible and to find funding for them. And lastly,
3 DEP oversight over the food waste pilot at the
4 Newtown Creek Wastewater Treatment facility.

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing]

6 Okay well, a real quick...

7 [crosstalk]

8 TANYA BLEY: New York City's prime...

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing]

10 Just a quick question here.

11 TANYA BLEY: [interposing] Sure.

12 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: 'Cause I have to
13 cut you short and I apologize. The new data on
14 what report exactly that's been submitted? I think
15 you wanted to change that. In the beginning you
16 had made mention to a report that you think...

17 TANYA BLEY: Yes, it's the Siting Task
18 Force that was established by the SWMP.

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And when was that
20 supposed to really go out; be received?

21 TANYA BLEY: Their report well, July
22 1st, 2008 and to my knowledge there has never been
23 a report submitted; at least it's not publically
24 available.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 140

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright and the

3 next thing... I think, by the way, it's a great

4 idea, a separate license for small carters

5 regarding...

6 [crosstalk]

7 TANYA BLEY: Mm-hm.

8 [crosstalk]

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Composting. I

10 think that that's a great idea.

11 TANYA BLEY: Mm-hm. Lovely, mm-hm.

12 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: You know, I don't

13 know what standard we would raise and...

14 TANYA BLEY: {interposing} Yeah, that

15 should be...

16 [crosstalk]

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: What committee...

18 [crosstalk]

19 TANYA BLEY: A separate discussion, mm-

20 hm.

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And I don't think

22 they necessarily... it was never a part of our

23 committee originally.

24 TANYA BLEY: Mm-hm. Yeah.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 141
2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: It was just
3 entered into it.
4 TANYA BLEY: Oh, hmm...
5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So it's something
6 that the Sanitation...
7 TANYA BLEY: [interposing] Hmm...
8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Chair could not
9 look into, so...
10 TANYA BLEY: [interposing] Very good.
11 Mm-hm.
12 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I'll make sure
13 that I pay attention to that and...
14 [crosstalk]
15 TANYA BLEY: Mm-hm.
16 [crosstalk]
17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I think it's a
18 great idea.
19 [crosstalk]
20 TANYA BLEY: Mm-hm.
21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: For really
22 figuring this composting out 'cause...
23 TANYA BLEY: [interposing] Mm-hm.
24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: It looks like by
25 the way...

2 [crosstalk]

3 TANYA BLEY: It should. Mm-hm.

4 [crosstalk]

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: There's a lot of
6 energy for this...

7 TANYA BLEY: [interposing] Oh, there
8 is, yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: For siting this.

10 [crosstalk]

11 TANYA BLEY: Mm-hm.

12 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So I'm excited
13 about that. Okay, thank you much for your
14 testimony.

15 TANYA BLEY: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: David.

17 DAVID BUCKEL: Yes, thank you to the
18 committee and thank you to the chair for giving us
19 this opportunity. My name is David Buckel and I'm
20 a co-founder of the New York City Community Compost
21 Roundtable. I see the chair is encouraging
22 efficiency, so I'm going to try to just pick out a
23 few pieces of my testimony, and otherwise I've
24 attached to the submitted testimony a policy paper
25 that is in form by the discussions at the

2 roundtable over the past year. Other points have
3 been made, but one I wanted to add to community
4 compost in terms of describing its advantages is
5 that community compost we find consistently is one
6 of the best ways to engage the public in recycling
7 goals because residents can create the benefit for
8 their neighborhood with their own hands and better
9 connect the larger goals of recycling and
10 environmental stewardship, and that's a big feature
11 of a lot of the community composting sites is that
12 we seek to bring in residents to participate in the
13 process. Sanitation has provided substantial
14 support for a handful of the larger community
15 compost sites already, but there are hundreds of
16 neighborhoods that need such sites and to have a
17 good balance we need to develop financially
18 sustainable sites that do not depend on taxpayer
19 money. We need to have a mix of models that way.
20 There are two obstacles and I want to highlight one
21 Tanya has referenced is the Business Integrity
22 Commission, also known as BIC. It's a city agency
23 with the Sanitation Commissioner as the director.
24 It successfully conducts an important job of
25 finding corruption in the hauling industry, but

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 144

2 BIC's regulations were fashioned to address large
3 hauling businesses in a pre-sustainability era.
4 They now stifle growth of community composting. A
5 community composter cannot stop by the local coffee
6 place to pick up one of the best ingredients for
7 compost; the coffee grounds that otherwise go into
8 the trash. A small business cannot get off the
9 ground even if there's merely a part-timer hauling
10 food scraps by bicycle to one community compost
11 site. We partnered with the Manhattan Solid Waste
12 Advisory Board and met with BIC over a year ago to
13 pursue changes, but to no avail. We need to review
14 the city's code that governs BIC so community
15 composters are encouraged rather than discouraged
16 in greening the city. The second and last point
17 I'll make is about the lack of a citywide
18 coordinator. At its best, our work grows from
19 within a community and draws in a community members
20 who volunteer their time at community compost
21 sites, but rarely are there resources to manage
22 things like registering and filing reports for the
23 State Department of Environmental Conservation,
24 understanding how to avoid fines from the city's
25 BIC or replicating the protocols that have

2 successfully eliminated odors and rats at existing
3 sites.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Absolutely and I
5 apologize. I'm going to have to... and...

6 DAVID BUCKEL: [interposing] Sure.

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Just so you'll be
8 mindful that we know that a lot of BIC intention
9 is... the intention has outweighed what exact...
10 what exactly is happening, so right now small
11 attempts at composting or to move us into the New
12 Age is being thwarted by antiquated systems and
13 regulations and we are very well aware of that, and
14 I'm glad that BIC is under my I guess oversight or
15 purview, so I'll make sure that I pay attention to
16 that and that we try to find changes to it
17 immediately. I'd just like to acknowledge Council
18 Member Miller here from Southeast Queens, which is
19 also one of the districts that is immensely
20 affected by the waste transfer stations. Thank you
21 for being here. Do you have any questions or...
22 [background voice off mic] Absolutely. Thank you
23 so much for being here, and just for you to be
24 mindful that there's three community boards that
25 handle 75 percent of the city's trash and of

2 course, they tend to be in low-income minority
3 communities and we're just trying to find a more
4 equitable way to do it and a responsible way to do
5 it. We've had a lot of testimony from other
6 communities that are... you know, where their
7 intention is to open up a waste transfer station
8 and it looks like we're going to have a meeting in
9 a couple of months and see if we can address those
10 issues and those concerns and come to an
11 understanding about the best way to do that. I
12 appreciate you being here today. Thomas, you're
13 next, sir and I'm sorry, we're just flipping them
14 around. Thank you. So Thomas.

15 THOMAS TOSCANO: Good afternoon,
16 Chairman Reynoso and members of the committee and
17 distinguished guests. My name is Tom Toscano. I'm
18 the Chief Financial Officer at Mr. T Carting,
19 medium-sized carting company based in Queens in
20 Brooklyn and we employ about 80 people. I also
21 serve as the chair of the National Waste Solid and
22 Recycling Association in New York City's chapter,
23 which represents numerous carters, recyclers,
24 transfer station owners, equipment manufacturers
25 and distributors who all operate in New York City.

2 The association's a non-profit trade organization.
3 It represents the waste and recycling companies
4 that operate in all 50 states. I wanted to speak
5 today directly regarding the franchising issue that
6 was put forth. We believe that this is a bad idea
7 and I'll give you five reasons why. First, it
8 establishes local monopolies, which means higher
9 prices as competition is eliminated. In addition,
10 some of the conditions discussed for winning a
11 franchise would mean radically higher costs for
12 businesses in New York City. For example, if
13 franchisees are forced to bring their waste to the
14 East 91st Street Marine Transfer Station and other
15 MTSSs, we estimate based on the Pledge to Protect
16 study issued earlier this month in a 2012
17 Independent Budget Office letter that disposal
18 costs would more than double. The net result will
19 be at least a \$250 million annual increase to the
20 restaurants, bodegas, office buildings, small
21 retail stores and other customers will be forced to
22 pay for waste collection services. Also, I'd like
23 to point out that most of these marine transfer
24 stations are on the water and they're in flood
25 zones, which could cause issues if, God forbid, we

2 ever have another storm like Sandy. Second, the
3 franchise plan would take away customer choice.
4 Customers have a wide variety of waste collection.
5 They have different types of waste, different sized
6 containers and they put their waste out at
7 different hours. Restaurants in particular don't
8 want their waste picked up before a certain time.
9 It is naïve to think that a single truck will be
10 able to go down a commercial street and pick up all
11 the waste generated on that street at that time.
12 Third, there is no evidence that franchise systems
13 have higher recycling rates than local markets.
14 The biggest franchise system in New York City is
15 DSNY and their recycling rate is 15 percent,
16 whereas the commercial sector is 40 percent.
17 Fourth, franchises can force hundreds of licensed
18 carters currently operating in the city to shut
19 down, and fifth, and most important, the companies
20 are being asked currently to invest in new
21 technologies, in cleaner trucks, in organics, in
22 putting more and different recycling streams on the
23 road. You're telling them that there's a good
24 chance that the city may decide to franchise and
25

2 take away some of these businesses. You're taking
3 away the incentive to invest in these companies.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you so much
5 and I'm going to have to cut you short, but I do
6 want to ask you a question if I may very quickly.

7 THOMAS TOSCANO: Sure.

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Currently a lot
9 of the carting services have antiquated systems
10 themselves and investments haven't been happening
11 already. They currently operate with a system that
12 is not up to date, so we would love to see the
13 investment. We know that there are some industries
14 that have been moving to recycling, for example,
15 like the Sims factory, which is something that is
16 new, but it's recycling-based, but when it comes to
17 the carters, the majority of the carters have done
18 nothing to invest, which the current system that
19 keeps carts low is not regulated, so I would say
20 that I think opening it up will make it so that for
21 them to compete they're going to have to invest,
22 and I think that that's significant. I also want
23 to say it's a customer's choice and right now we're
24 talking about three, maybe four carting companies
25 on one block picking up trash. Now, how do four

2 trucks make any sense in one block? Maybe one
3 doesn't, but four definitely doesn't make any sense
4 either and we're talking about how much the roads
5 are getting taxed, how much miles they're putting
6 in regarding pollution. We need to think of a way
7 to deal with it, so I would be open to having a
8 conversation where we do consider this in a more
9 broader sense, but I do want to say that the model
10 in itself as a foundation is looking to fix a
11 problem that if you've been here for the entire
12 time, you would see that there's been a lot of
13 folks that are extremely concerned, and you also
14 mentioned to the cost scale. We're looking at a
15 scale issue here. If you're a company that does
16 great recycling, then you're going to have pay less
17 for your garbage pick-up. If you do terrible
18 recycling where you just don't care, then you're
19 the ones that are going to be paying to subsidize
20 the good workers and the people are doing it right.
21 In that case, we hope that everyone wants to
22 recycle and if everyone recycles, then the costs go
23 completely down and it's less cost for barging for
24 sending it to another state when those costs go
25 down. So we do have plans in which we're looking

2 to think creatively on how we could bring costs
3 down by incentivizing recycling and composting, all
4 of which allow for less trash that has to be carted
5 out. But I do want to say that we absolutely want
6 to make sure that companies like yours that are
7 mid... you know, not the huge ones; the ones that
8 are in the middle of the pack; that there is an
9 opportunity for you guys during bids to still
10 compete and it is something that we're going to
11 look at deeply. We don't want to take the middle
12 man or the small or the middle guy or those mom and
13 pops type of situations out of the system entirely,
14 but it is going to be that we're going to have to
15 do a lot of work when it comes to the bidding
16 process and we're paying attention to that. So I
17 just wanted to be... make you mindful to a couple
18 of concerns that I have with the current
19 industry...

20 THOMAS TOSCANO: [interposing] Mm-hm.

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And the lack of
22 investment. Yeah, absolutely.

23 [crosstalk]

24 THOMAS TOSCANO: Is there a... did you
25 want me to respond to that?

2 [crosstalk]

3 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Absolutely.

4 THOMAS TOSCANO: Okay.

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah, I wouldn't
6 do all that without giving you an opportunity to
7 respond.

8 THOMAS TOSCANO: As far as investment,
9 it's been mandated that we have to replace any
10 truck pre-2007 by 2012.

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Right, but
12 outside of mandates there's no invest... right, we
13 have to keep...

14 THOMAS TOSCANO: [interposing] Right.

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Mandating for the
16 things... the changes to come. I want to stop
17 mandating. What would incentivize you to do the
18 work without us asking? And we're talking about
19 bringing your trucks up to technology that was in
20 2007; that was built in 2007 and giving you up to
21 2016 to make it happen, so we gave you a long time
22 and we're asking for a very basic 2007 model. So
23 I'm just saying that was a mandate. That wasn't...
24 the carting company didn't come to us and say, "We
25

2 think this is terrible. We're going to do
3 something about it."

4 THOMAS TOSCANO: Right. I understand
5 what you're saying and...

6 [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Mm-hm.

8 THOMAS TOSCANO: You're saying it's a
9 long time. You realize that we have a fleet of 28
10 trucks. That's over \$5 million in equipment
11 upgrades that we're willing to do, okay, and we're
12 willing to do it in that time, but at the same time
13 you're saying that these franchising systems you're
14 going to put all these things to compete, but I
15 have no idea what the size of my business is going
16 to be after this system is in place.

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing] Mm-
18 hm.

19 THOMAS TOSCANO: You know and the
20 trucks that I'm going to spend the money on that
21 I'm going to take out loans to buy...

22 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing] Mm-
23 hm.

24 THOMAS TOSCANO: Won't be worth the
25 same if I have to sell them if that's ultimately

2 the way this goes, so my point is is that your
3 regulations, in essence, are... or the threat of
4 regulations are, in essence, discouraging.

5 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Gotcha, okay. So
6 I would say we're going to have a conversation.
7 We're going to open it up, but if you're a good
8 player now whatever system we have in place is
9 going to reward people that do it the right way,
10 and that's important to note as well, but we'll...
11 I think we're going to have a hearing specifically
12 on commercial franchising and we would love your
13 testimony then as well.

14 THOMAS TOSCANO: Right and just to
15 respond to one other point you made about recycling
16 and the ones that recycle it's going to be cheaper,
17 recycling in and of itself is not cheaper because
18 every time you add a stream you require another
19 truck and more equipment and another set of workers
20 and all the other aspects that come with it. Yes,
21 you can sell the recycling and not pay for the
22 dumping of it, but there's a lot of labor involved
23 in getting that recycling stream separated and
24 getting it to the right facilities. The organics
25

2 facilities are over 80, 90 miles some of them away
3 from the city.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I see.

5 THOMAS TOSCANO: So you're adding truck
6 miles on the road to recycle that type and I'm not
7 saying we don't want to do it. I'm saying that
8 there has to be you know, a look at the cost and
9 the benefits of this.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I agree and so I
11 do agree that right now we have a lot of... the
12 systems we have in place are not built for this.
13 If not, we would've done it already, right? The
14 recycling would get done and the composting done,
15 but it's old, so yes, investments need to be made;
16 serious investments and serious... and there's
17 going to be money involved. We can't expect to
18 grow out... it's like you know, being in Madison
19 Square Garden.

20 THOMAS TOSCANO: [interposing] Mm-hm.

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: They had to
22 invest to move forward into the new century and
23 we're going to have to do the exact same thing as
24 the city 'cause communities like mine can no longer
25 bear the burden of having to deal with the same

2 crap for 20, 30, 40 years, so you know we need to
3 figure something out and if you can help us do
4 that, we're on the same team here, but if you guys
5 are going to impede progress it's not going to be a
6 good show. So I think... did you want to say
7 something? Alright, we need a... what I'm saying
8 is you need to help us figure out how to get into
9 the future, not tell us we're doing it wrong,
10 right? Be a part of the conversation that fixes
11 the problem. Be solution oriented and we're going
12 to be good.

13 THOMAS TOSCANO: Listen, we were one of
14 the first companies out there to engage in organic
15 recycling. We've had organics routes now for four
16 or five years, okay? At the time we were doing it
17 there was only one other company I knew of. We did
18 invest.

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So we're going to
20 be okay. I'm letting you know while I'm chair
21 here, you're going to be the type of company that
22 we want to support; that we want to make sure
23 succeeds and we're going to figure out how to do
24 that together, alright, and we're going to have a
25 meeting; like I said a hearing specifically on

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 157
2 commercial franchising. I don't want to hold
3 anyone up. I...
4 [crosstalk]
5 THOMAS TOSCANO: Fair enough.
6 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Also have... I'm
7 already late, but it doesn't matter. This is my
8 hearing. So thank you, guys. Oh, there's...
9 VANDRA THORBURN: Yep.
10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Poor Vandra.
11 VANDRA THORBURN: Yeah.
12 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I'm sorry.
13 VANDRA THORBURN: Thank you.
14 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: That was good
15 because a lot of folks haven't come out from that
16 side, so I'm glad to hear...
17 VANDRA THORBURN: [interposing] No, no.
18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Something
19 different.
20 VANDRA THORBURN: Yeah, no and actually
21 so my name is Vandra. I have a small composting
22 service called Vokashi and I use the Japanese
23 method of fermenting food waste. It's called
24 Vokashi. My service is Vokashi because my name is
25 Vandra. We provide the necessary buckets and

2 fermenting bran to help our subscribers manage all
3 of their food scraps, including scraps generally
4 not accepted at traditional composting sites like
5 meats, dairy and processed food. Our process model
6 is simple. It is to collect your bucket of food
7 scraps and process at community gardens public and
8 private green spaces, creating a rich humus and a
9 valuable natural soil amendment. I've heard from
10 Tanya and from David and I'm certainly in the
11 community composting milieu, but the thing that I
12 really want to point out, and I've come before
13 Sanitation for the last couple or three years, and
14 really what I want to just speak out for is this
15 whole notion of pickling our food waste. It is
16 actually if you consider how many black bags there
17 are out on the street right now after three weeks
18 of snow with all the organic waste that's in those
19 plastic bags, if we had been fermenting them there
20 would be no trouble for pets and no trouble for
21 humans. The notion of fermenting food waste is
22 something that I would love Sanitation to get
23 behind to say, "Well, show me, how does this work?"
24 I can take you to the households that I'm
25 collecting from. I collect one five-gallon bucket

2 of fermented food waste from many households.
3 Imagine a sanitation system where you're only
4 collecting one five-gallon bucket of organics a
5 month. I would love to have the Sanitation come in
6 and have a closer look at what I'm doing and then
7 seeing if we can't do some sort of pilot. I
8 actually process most of the food waste at Marine
9 Park at the golf course. They invited me to come
10 in there a couple of years ago because they thought
11 I had compost. I said I didn't have compost at the
12 time, but I would make compost for them. So I've
13 been out there using fermented food waste as a
14 natural soil amendment. We don't have to worry
15 about all of the greens. We've got that soil.
16 We're just adding this fermented food waste to the
17 soil and making a great amendment.

18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you so much
19 for your testimony.

20 [crosstalk]

21 VANDRA THORBURN: Come and see me.

22 [crosstalk]

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And like I said
24 we're looking to figure out a way infrastructure to
25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 160
2 allow for you to do your job better so that we can
3 have less waste being carted out. Thank you...
4 [crosstalk]
5 VANDRA THORBURN: And it's a business
6 model. By the way, mine is...
7 [crosstalk]
8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: 'Kay.
9 [crosstalk]
10 VANDRA THORBURN: A business model.
11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So there's...
12 [crosstalk]
13 VANDRA THORBURN: Too.
14 [crosstalk]
15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: There's a market
16 there, right, so that's good to hear.
17 VANDRA THORBURN: At Green Jobs.
18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So thank you guys
19 again. Thank you to the panel and hopefully we'll
20 see a couple of you guys at a couple of the other
21 hearings. We're down to two more panels. I'm
22 excited. [laughter] [background voices] Daniel
23 Tainow; Jennie Romer; Audrey Grieco; Greg Todd and
24 Maggie Clarke. Okay, guys, do you guys mind if I
25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 161

2 take like a two minute break to go... [background
3 voices] I'll be right... thank you, guys.

4 [Pause]

5 [background voices]

6 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright, we
7 tried. Okay, we're going to start with Daniel.
8 Your time starts now.

9 DANIEL TAINOW: Thank you, Chairperson
10 Reynoso, for convening this hearing just to look at
11 ideas for how to advance solid waste management in
12 NYC. I'm Daniel Tainow from the Lower East Side
13 Ecology Center. We're a non-profit that has
14 offered community-based recycling programs since
15 1987. We've played a leadership role in community-
16 based recycling by implementing a composting
17 program starting in 1990, and now we're celebrating
18 20 years of collecting from the Union Square
19 Greenmarket compost and we serve 1,500 New York
20 City households, handling about 200 tons of organic
21 waste a year and we also are part of the New York
22 City Compost Project, which receives funding from
23 the Department of Sanitation to do outreach and
24 education and now we also have expanded our
25 collections to commuter composting at two sites in

2 Lower Manhattan. From our experience with
3 composting, we'd like to give some recommendations
4 to expand community composting. First, to support
5 the growth of community-based composting programs
6 by facilitating access to land for small groups and
7 helping them to clear regulatory hurdles. We'd
8 also like to see the city bring back the yard waste
9 collection program that was discontinued in 2008 I
10 believe, which very cost-effectively was able to
11 remove 19,000 tons of yard waste a year, and we'd
12 like to see it expanded to include Manhattan, which
13 it did not include before that. And we'd also like
14 to see the Compost Facility Siting Task Force
15 reconvened. We also run an electronics recycling
16 program, which is very important for... it's only a
17 small part of the waste stream, but it has a lot of
18 the toxic waste that ends up in our landfills, and
19 some policies to support that that we'd like to see
20 to support reuse and extended producer
21 responsibility.

22 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay and just a
23 quick...

24 DANIEL TAINOW: [interposing] Yes.

25 [crosstalk]

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yard waste; can
3 you explain to me what that is?

4 DANIEL TAINOW: So that is organic
5 waste that's generated from yards; leaves and
6 residential leaves...

7 [crosstalk]

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I got it, yeah.

9 DANIEL TAINOW: And yeah.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay, thank you
11 so much and this composting is the hot topic of
12 today, which I'm really excited about and of
13 course, we're going to have to take tours and
14 figure out a way that this gets done the right way
15 so just when the time comes just making yourselves
16 available, whoever is into this composting, and
17 that we do our best to present this to the City
18 Council in a way that makes a lot of sense and we
19 got to work together to make sure we do that right.
20 But thank you...

21 [crosstalk]

22 DANIEL TAINOW: Thank you.

23 [crosstalk]

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: For your
25 testimony. Maggie.

2 DR. CLARKE: It's great to be here.

3 I'm Maggie Clarke, Ph.D. and I present these
4 recommendations concrete as former chair of the
5 Manhattan SWAB and New York Waste Prevention
6 Coalition; having served for many years; come to
7 the City Council with many ideas over the last 25
8 years, and currently board member of the National
9 Recycling Coalition and its New York state
10 affiliate. So I have... I'll breeze through this
11 very quickly 'cause I have six pages for you there.

12 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay, thank you.

13 Thank you very much.

14 DR. CLARKE: So the first idea is to
15 pass a Zero Waste resolution. That's the starting
16 point; to join other City Councils like San
17 Francisco, Oakland, Berkeley, San Diego, Seattle,
18 Austin and so forth. Zero Waste here, just so that
19 you understand the term, it's defined as discard
20 prevention, collection and management system that
21 minimizes and eventually eliminates disposal of
22 resources. So in other words, it's waste
23 prevention reused, recycling and composting.
24 That's a Zero Waste System and from my point of
25 view, addressing your question of what should we be

2 doing in the next four years, we should be heading
3 in that direction towards Zero Waste. And so the
4 second item here is to write and execute a detailed
5 long-term Zero Waste Plan. I understand Sanitation
6 would do that, not you, but hopefully that could be
7 something you could get them to do. Our current
8 SWMP is 10 years old almost and it needs to be
9 rewritten. Fortuitously, I was part of a group 10
10 years ago that wrote a good Zero Waste Plan
11 directed for New York City. You have a PDF here
12 that you can look at it. It's over 200 pages and
13 it details lots of things and there are you know,
14 short-term, medium-term and long-term goals, as
15 well as how to get there. Well, just to go through
16 the rest quickly then, the council in the past has
17 been asked by Mayors to you know, cut recycling
18 programs and so forth and that, of course, is not
19 helpful. I hope that you will fight any attempts
20 such as that. I hope to... that we expand organics
21 piloting, but that we go citywide soon because I
22 have seen too often how pilots just go on for 10
23 and 20 years and don't get implemented. The
24 participation gap, in my opinion, after the
25 organics and composting is the next most important

2 area and that is that we are only collecting about
3 half of what we target and that's imperfect
4 education, imperfect enforcement and not enough...

5 [crosstalk]

6 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah.

7 [crosstalk]

8 DR. CLARKE: Persuasion. I did a
9 doctoral dissertation on this and I can...

10 [crosstalk]

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: 'Kay.

12 [crosstalk]

13 DR. CLARKE: Be helpful to you if you
14 like.

15 [crosstalk]

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Absolutely.
17 Thank you. I will definitely be mindful and it's
18 something that we actually had a discussion on
19 regarding what work we need to do to get the
20 recycling rates up to where they should've been
21 maybe six, 10 years ago.

22 DR. CLARKE: And waste prevention...

23 [crosstalk]

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: But I think
25 that...

2 [crosstalk]

3 DR. CLARKE: And reuse is at the top of
4 the hierarchy and there was only a page and a half
5 in the last SWMP on it so...

6 [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Uh-huh.

8 DR. CLARKE: We need to be doing more
9 on that.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. Greg
11 Todd? If you could get the mic, please.

12 GREG TODD: Good afternoon, Chairman
13 Reynoso. My name is Greg Todd and I am
14 representing the Brooklyn Allied Composters and
15 Carters, a new subcommittee of the Brooklyn Solid
16 Waste Advisory Board. We appreciate the
17 opportunity to speak at this hearing and thank
18 Sanitation for inviting the community
19 participation. I'm going to just again try to
20 abbreviate in the interest of brevity here. Last
21 year, the city spent about \$330 million through the
22 Sanitation Department hiring private for-profit
23 carters to haul residential waste from local
24 transfer stations to out of state landfills.
25 Previously, these monies had been paid by the city

2 to hire city workers to haul these same wastes to
3 landfills. We are trying to get those monies back
4 into our communities now. We believe that an
5 important focus would be to invest in community-
6 based, medium scale compost and bio-digesting
7 facilities. DSNY packer trucks are now aging out
8 and replacing these costs; these truck costs
9 \$65,000 to \$75,000. In lieu of replacing some of
10 these trucks, DSNY could invest in medium scale
11 composting and bio-gas facilities employing in-
12 vessel machines and bio-digesters. Similarly, we
13 note that the city is demanding environmental
14 upgrades for commercial waste hauling trucks. As
15 an alternative to upgrading these trucks,
16 commercial waste carters might consider investing
17 in community composting facilities. There are
18 currently 59 council managed districts in New York
19 City. BACC believe that the city should establish
20 at least one medium scale facility in each district
21 capable of handling 10 tons of organics a day.
22 This would amount to diverting 590 tons from the
23 landfill representing about 25 percent of the
24 city's residential organics. We estimate that
25 opening such facilities would be a natural business

2 and work opportunity for the community. Each
3 facility would employ up to five community
4 residents and more if we can expand organic
5 collections to the local commercial sector. Such
6 facilities would also help in community education
7 about the need and value of organic recycling.

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you for
9 your testimony. Thank you so much and please
10 submit your testimony because we're going to be
11 looking for models and hopefully something you have
12 in there is exactly what we're looking into.
13 Audrey? Oh, Audrey's not in. Jennie.

14 JENNIE ROMER: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Jennie, thank
16 you.

17 JENNIE ROMER: 'Kay, good afternoon.
18 Thank you for having me. My name is Jennie Romer
19 and I'm the founder of plasticbaglaws.org. I'm an
20 attorney and a sustainability consultant and a
21 Manhattan SWAB member and so I'm here to speak on
22 behalf of... or I'm a member of the BagItNYC
23 Coalition and they're a coalition of environmental
24 and community groups in New York City that support
25 the legislation to reduce the consumption of

2 plastic bags. So last session, we introduce Bill
3 Number 1135, which would impose a 10 cent charge on
4 all carry-out bags in New York City and it garnered
5 15 co-sponsors, but did not make it to a committee
6 hearing, so we plan on working with council members
7 to reintroduce that bill this year pretty much in
8 the same format, and it will be heard in the
9 Sanitation Committee eventually, so I'd just like
10 to I guess really reach out to individual
11 Sanitation Committee members, but just to let you
12 know that this BagItNYC Coalition exists and
13 includes a lot of large as well as small
14 environmental groups in New York City. And the
15 bill would... the 10 cents would stay with the
16 retailer and the goal of it is to get people to
17 think of plastic bags just like any other product
18 and decide whether they want one or not while
19 they're at the register and this is shown to work
20 in cities all over the country. There are about
21 109 cities that have adopted similar legislation
22 and I helped a lot of... or I helped cities write
23 this type of legislation in order to make it be a
24 successful as possible and it's led to 60 to 90
25 percent reduction and had a positive public

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 171

2 reaction for the most part. And that's it as far
3 as plastic bags, but I'd also like to say that I'm
4 a resident of Greenpoint, so I've been you know,
5 that... our neighborhood is impacted by haulers and
6 I also have many friends that own businesses and
7 restaurants in Bushwick and I help them try to get
8 haulers for composting and recycling...

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing] Mm-
10 hm.

11 JENNIE ROMER: And that's... it's a
12 really difficult thing to do with the current
13 system, so I think looking at a franchising model
14 is important for the business owners.

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay.

16 JENNIE ROMER: Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you so much
18 for your testimony and you're saying that the law
19 will make it so we have to pay 10 cents per plastic
20 bag that we use and that the..

21 [crosstalk]

22 JENNIE ROMER: Mm-hm.

23 [crosstalk]

24 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Business owner
25 keeps that money.

2 JENNIE ROMER: Mm-hm.

3 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay.

4 JENNIE ROMER: So it would be then
5 because we want to see an overall reduction in all
6 types of single use bags, so this law would apply
7 not just plastic, but to any type of carry-out bag
8 at the register and all that money would stay with
9 the retailer.

10 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So we want people
11 to bring their own bags, right?

12 JENNIE ROMER: That's the point and
13 they magically do that once they have to pay for
14 it.

15 [crosstalk]

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Once they find
17 out they got to pay 10 cents a bag.

18 JENNIE ROMER: Exactly.

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright, thank
20 you so much for your time. The next panel is the
21 last panel, not the least. Pauline Dana; Anne
22 Kaplan and Andrew Morrison. Is anyone here that
23 didn't get called that wanted to get called?
24 Alright, thank you so much. So we're going to
25 start with Pauline. Yes.

2 ANN KAPLAN: [off mic] Well, my name is
3 Ann Kaplan.

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Oh, I'm sorry, I
5 said... so Pauline's not... Ann, go ahead, Ann.

6 ANN KAPLAN: Okay, my name is Ann
7 Kaplan. I'm going to try to keep this short and
8 sweet 'cause I know you must be exhausted.

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: That's alright.

10 ANN KAPLAN: I worked as a school
11 psychologist in East Harlem for many years. I'm
12 retired now and I just wanted to talk about... I
13 know borough equity and I understand that and it's
14 really awful in a lot of the boroughs that this is
15 going on, but I also want to talk about
16 neighborhood equity. I feel that when I ride down
17 the East River and I go from 79th Street to 125th
18 Street, we don't have anything there. We don't
19 have ferries; we don't have a nice esplanade like
20 on the West Side, so if this is going to happen and
21 our neighborhood is feeling kind of down and
22 depressed about it, make us feel like we count by
23 giving us a ferry; giving us a nice esplanade and
24 making our neighborhood happier and more accessible
25 because it's kind of like we feel like we're being

2 punished and we're not all rich you know, and I
3 think everybody has to share the burden, but I feel
4 like our neighborhood is taking the burden of all
5 of Manhattan and I'm wondering... [background
6 voice] and I'm wondering what happened to the
7 Marine Transfer Station in the West Village and in
8 the meat packing district. It seems like our
9 neighborhood doesn't have as much clout and I think
10 we all have to share.

11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Mm-hm.

12 ANN KAPLAN: But and I think that we
13 also should look at how other cities handle their
14 garbage.

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Absolutely.

16 ANN KAPLAN: And that's basically it.

17 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you for
18 your testimony and we're working on figuring out
19 what 59th Street and Gansevoort are doing as well.

20 ANN KAPLAN: Yeah.

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: We think everyone
22 is behind...

23 [crosstalk]

24 ANN KAPLAN: Right.
25

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And we're trying
3 to catch up, but the thing is with Gansevoort it
4 seems more like a policy delay and East 91st was
5 more of a legal delay, so it's just two different
6 types of delays that were happening.

7 ANN KAPLAN: [interposing] Uh-huh.

8 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: But I've noted in
9 regards to possibly getting some give backs to the
10 community for taking on possible...[crosstalk]

11 [crosstalk]

12 ANN KAPLAN: And it should happen to
13 the other boroughs too. Their communities should
14 get give backs also.

15 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: If we could give
16 give backs for every 16... for every one of the 15
17 we'll take it, let me tell you...

18 [crosstalk]

19 ANN KAPLAN: Yeah.

20 [crosstalk]

21 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: But it's not...

22 ANN KAPLAN: Right, yeah.

23 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: It's feasibly
24 impossible in our district to get any give back and
25 the Newtown Creek is a disaster.

2 ANN KAPLAN: Because Manhattan Downtown
3 gets all the city bikes...

4 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: [interposing] Mm-
5 hm.

6 ANN KAPLAN: And it gets all the bike
7 routes and everyone else is just kind of
8 disregarded.

9 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I want a city
10 bike to be all... in all of the city of New York,
11 so we're going to see what we can do, but you
12 should be part of that hearing and make suggestions
13 regarding requests from the community to get more
14 amenities for taking on the station.

15 [crosstalk]

16 ANN KAPLAN: 'Cause we've suffered with
17 this... I know we're going to have a 2nd Avenue
18 subway, but we've suffered with it. We don't have
19 a bike route that's safe that goes from Uptown to
20 Downtown because...

21 [crosstalk]

22 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So...

23 [crosstalk]

24 ANN KAPLAN: The 2nd... you know, the
25 2nd...

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 177
2 [crosstalk]
3 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Let's talk about
4 it. We might be able to work out a Sanitation and
5 Transportation Committee hearing. We don't know
6 yet, but...
7 [crosstalk]
8 ANN KAPLAN: But the thing is people
9 wouldn't feel...
10 [crosstalk]
11 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: We will be open to
12 it.
13 [crosstalk]
14 ANN KAPLAN: So bad if they felt like
15 they were listened to and we know that you're going
16 to give us high-tech garbage trucks in the...
17 [crosstalk]
18 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Mm-hm.
19 [crosstalk]
20 ANN KAPLAN: Neighborhood and make it
21 okay.
22 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright, well
23 noted, well noted. Thank you so much and...
24 ANN KAPLAN: Sure.
25

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Andrew, you are
3 the last one, so you better make this good.

4 [laughter]

5 ANDREW MORRISON: Mm-hm. So I don't
6 have to rush then, right?

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: No, your two
8 minutes are just as fast as everyone else's.

9 ANDREW MORRISON: Alright well, thanks
10 to the chair and the committee for commencing this.

11 I'm Andrew Morrison from NYPIRG, Campaigns
12 Director. NYPIRG's been working on solid waste
13 issues for many, many years and I want to talk in
14 the spirit of the three Rs; reduce, reuse and
15 recycle. I have four recommendations. They're
16 the four Rs; raise New York City's recycling goals,
17 reduce the waste stream, reform New York City's
18 commercial waste system and reject garbage
19 incineration. Raise New York City's recycling
20 goals. Right now, our recycling rate is around 15
21 percent. Cities like San Francisco have committed
22 to a Zero Waste goal by 2020, and is already
23 diverting 80 percent of its waste stream from solid
24 waste disposal facilities. This is the
25 sustainability goal that New York City should be

2 striving for. Unfortunately, the current goal is
3 only 75 percent according to the Bloomberg
4 Administration's PLaNYC. That's woefully
5 inadequate. Number two, reduce the waste stream.
6 Legislation last session 1060A and 1062 were great
7 and we encourage you to pass Intro 1135, mentioned
8 in the last panel, to reduce the use of disposable
9 bags in New York City. It's proven effective in
10 other areas and it can be done here. Number three,
11 reform New York City's commercial waste system.
12 Each year, more than 3 million tons of solid wastes
13 are produced through the commercial sector in New
14 York City, most of which is not recycled. There's
15 a coalition of labor, environmental justice and
16 health groups inventing a proposal to reform the
17 waste hauling system, and lastly, reject garbage
18 incineration. This is a new and emerging waste to
19 energy technology that the city was considering
20 entering into contracts with under Bloomberg.
21 Luckily, they did not. This is bad. It's used to
22 burn mixed MSW that poses many of the same
23 environmental and public health hazards as
24 conventional mass garbage incinerators; significant
25 sources of air emissions, toxic residues and

2 greenhouse gas emissions, so we encourage you to
3 reject that as a solution. And in conclusion, we
4 look forward to working with the City Council to
5 advance these and other sensible solid waste
6 solutions and thank you very much.

7 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: 'Kay, thank you
8 and just be mindful the garbage incinerator would
9 have been in Williamsburg, by the way. You were
10 one of the sites that they were looking for to put
11 it into and we were able to fight it, and then they
12 said, "Okay, we won't put it in yours. We'll talk
13 to the South Bronx and...

14 [crosstalk]

15 ANDREW MORRISON: Right.

16 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: The Southwest...
17 Southeast Queens so just...

18 ANDREW MORRISON: [interposing] Right.

19 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: We're just as
20 happy as you are there.

21 ANDREW MORRISON: Great.

22 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And we'll look at
23 everything else and thank you so much for your
24 testimony.

25 ANDREW MORRISON: Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 181

2 CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright, this
3 hearing is adjourned. [gavel] Thank you.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.



Date: _03/14/2014_____