

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION
SELECT COMMITTEE ON LIBRARIES
COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES, AND
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

-----X

May 6, 2013
Start: 10:18 a.m.
Recess: 2:01 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers
City Hall

B E F O R E:

ROBERT JACKSON
VINCENT J. GENTILE
JAMES G. VAN BRAMER
Chairpersons

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Charles Barron
Lewis A. Fidler
Helen D. Foster
Daniel R. Garodnick
G. Oliver Koppell
Jessica S. Lappin
James Vacca
Albert Vann
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Daniel Dromm
Karen Koslowitz
Stephen T. Levin

A P P E A R A N C E S

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Deborah L. Rose
Mark S. Weprin
Vincent M. Ignizio
Eric A. Ulrich
David G. Greenfield
Leroy G. Comrie, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Inez E. Dickens
Domenic M. Recchia, Jr.
Andy King

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Gregg Betheil
Executive Director
Office of School Programs & Partnerships
New York City Department of Education

Lawrence Becker
Chief Executive Officer
Division of Human Resources
New York City Department of Education

Robert Estrowski
United Federation of Teachers

Christine Hatami
Retired Librarian
United Federation of Teachers

Jeff Roth
Vice President for Finance and Strategic Initiatives
New York Public Library

Richard Reyes Gavallon
Chief Librarian
Brooklyn Public Library

Bridget Quinn Carey
Chief Operating Officer
Queens Library Systems

Tula Junini
Dean of the School of Information and Library Science
Pratt Institute

Christian Zubrisky
Executive Director
Urban Librarians Unite

John Monahan
Member
Regents Advisory Council on Libraries

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jessica Hawkman
Assistant Professor
School of Information and Library Science
Pratt Institute

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Good morning, everyone. It's a beautiful morning out today. It's May 6th, 2013 at about 10:19 am. I'd like to welcome all of you to this joint hearing of the Education, and Cultural Affairs, Libraries and International Intergroup Relations Committees and the Select Committee on Libraries, and the topic of today's hearing is the availability of certified school librarians in the New York City public school system. Before I begin the rest of my statement, let me introduce our colleagues that are present this morning, our co-chair is Jimmy Van Bramer from Queens. He is the chair of the Cultural Affairs, Libraries and International Intergroup Relations Committee and our colleague, Vincent Gentile of Brooklyn, who is the chair of the select committee on libraries. Joining us on today's hearing are our colleagues to my right all the way at the end is Dan Garodnick of Manhattan, next to him is Leroy Comrie of Queens, next to Leroy is Andy King of the Bronx, Asia Schaumberg [phonetic] is our counsel to the Education Committee, Jimmy Van Bramer as I indicated, the chair of Cultural Affairs, Libraries and

1 International Intergroup Relations Committee, Tai
2 Meah [phonetic], the counsel to both the Cultural
3 Affairs and Select Committee on Libraries, Vinny
4 Gentile, our colleague chair of the Select
5 Committee on Libraries and Debbie Rose, our
6 colleague from Staten Island and myself Robert
7 Jackson. I chair the Education Committee.
8
9 According to the New York State regulations every
10 school, elementary through high school is required
11 to have a school library; however, only secondary
12 schools--that is middle school and high schools,
13 but not every elementary school are required to
14 have a certified school library and media
15 specialist commonly known as a school librarian as
16 well as a certified library assistant for any
17 secondary school with more than 1,000 students.
18 According to data provided by the Department of
19 Education, there is currently a total of only 306
20 librarians system wide. That is a makeup of 178
21 in high schools, 95 in middle schools and 33 in
22 elementary schools. That is 306 librarians for
23 more than 1,700 schools and 1.1 million students.
24 Those are shocking numbers. Clearly, New York
25 City is out of compliance with state regulations

and the situation has gotten worse over time. In 2011, according to the New York Times article, there were 365 licensed librarians which means that there has been a 16 percent decrease in just two years. Further, the New York Times analysis showed that there was one librarian for every 2,146 students in 2011 compared with one per 1,447 students in 2005. Based on 306 librarians for 1.1 million students, we currently have approximately one librarian for every 3,594 students. What is the cause of this steep decline in a number of school librarians? Much of the explanation is related to tight economic times where most schools and districts face serious fiscal constraints, school libraries and librarians are often among the first targets of budget cuts. There are actually libraries at some schools sitting unused for lack of someone to staff them. I have to say that I find this trend of eliminating school libraries truly alarming, and totally unacceptable. When I attended city schools a long, long, long, long time ago, just about every school had its own librarian. I know that was a very long time ago, but when my kids attended

1 schools, which was not as long ago as when I
2 attended school, they all had librarians in their
3 schools. The huge decrease in school librarians
4 is even more alarming, given more than 20 years of
5 research evidence that school libraries and
6 librarians can improve student outcomes. Findings
7 from these "school library impact studies" show
8 that effective school library programs lead to
9 increased student motivation, higher assessment
10 scores, higher graduation rates and play a major
11 role in closing the achievement gap, and at a time
12 when we are searching for ways to improve student
13 achievement, eliminating positions of school
14 librarians or cutting operating hours or access to
15 school libraries is extremely shortsighted. Some
16 experts say that this investment in school
17 libraries and librarians has already cost us in
18 terms of reduced literacy levels. Some school
19 officials view librarians as expendable since
20 students can now do research from any computer,
21 but others maintain that school librarians are
22 even more important in the internet age to guide
23 students through searching and analyzing online
24 information and to teach ethics and responsibility
25

1 in the use of social media. School libraries and
2 librarians are also essential to closing the
3 digital divide for low income students and others
4 who lack access to computers and technology at
5 home. The role of school librarians has evolved.
6 They provide technical support to teachers and
7 collaborate in designing curriculum. Also,
8 according to the state school libraries and
9 librarians are deeply engaged in implementation of
10 the new common core learning standards, and before
11 we hear from the Department of Education, I have
12 to comment on the fact that in today's age
13 everyone wants answers right away, and obviously
14 you know, we expect it sooner rather than later.
15 So I hope that we can get answers today from the
16 DOE now rather than have to wait down the road.
17 Today's hearing will provide the committees with
18 an opportunity to examine the availability of
19 certified school librarians in New York City
20 public schools and whether city schools are in
21 compliance with state regulations regarding
22 library staffing requirements. The committees
23 will seek clarity from the Department of Education
24 about factors that affect availability of
25

1
2 certified school librarians. The committees also
3 expect to hear testimony from parents, students,
4 advocates, union leaders, higher education
5 institutions, public libraries and other members
6 of the public regarding their issues and concerns
7 about the availability of school librarians and
8 recommendations for improvement therein. I'd like
9 to remind everyone to testify today you must fill
10 out a witness slip. The sergeant of arms
11 indicated that earlier and to allow as many people
12 as possible to testify, testimony will be limited
13 to three minutes per person and council members,
14 five minutes. If you want to continue, we can
15 sign on on a second round. Now I would like to
16 turn to our colleagues, the co-chair of the
17 Cultural Affairs, Libraries and International
18 Intergroup Relations chairperson, Jimmy Van Bramer
19 for his opening remarks. Chair Bramer?

20 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you
21 very much, Chair Jackson. My name is Council
22 Member Jimmy Van Bramer, chair of the Committee on
23 Cultural Affairs, Libraries and International
24 Intergroup Relations and I want to thank our co-
25 chairs in particular the chair of our Select

1 Committee on Libraries, Vincent Gentile, who I
2 know really cares a great deal about this issue,
3 and we talked about having this hearing for quite
4 some time, and as someone who worked in the Queens
5 Public Library System before I was elected and as
6 someone who had a terrific school librarian at
7 P.S. 70 in Astoria, Queens many years ago, I care
8 deeply about this issue. The focus of today's
9 hearing--the lack of availability of certified
10 school librarians in our public schools is not
11 unique to New York City. According to federal
12 statistics more than 90 percent of American public
13 schools have libraries, but less than two-thirds
14 employ full-time certified librarians. It has
15 been written that budget belt-tightening threatens
16 to send school librarians the way of the card
17 catalog--extinct. Obviously, we can't have that
18 happen, and we can't have school librarians be a
19 distant memory of past generations. Schools are
20 forced to make impossible decisions, deciding
21 whether to cut teachers who work with kids all day
22 long in the classroom, or cut teachers working in
23 a support capacity, including school certified
24 librarians. Now we will hear from the Department
25

1 of Education, but then we will also hear from our
2 public library systems who have some innovative
3 programs and I look forward to asking them some
4 questions about how they are working with schools,
5 but of course, the work that they are doing is no
6 substitute for a certified public librarian.

7 Districts all over the country have eliminated
8 droves of librarians. If the school is lucky,
9 parent volunteers are ready and available to step
10 in and help out, and while this is a welcome form
11 of assistance, even the most well-intentioned
12 parent cannot replace what certified librarians
13 spent years to learn and master through various
14 exams, practicum and the time spent training in
15 school libraries. We all know in library land
16 that lifelong learners begin their appreciation of
17 books, reading and learning at the youngest of
18 ages. It is why our library systems work with
19 expectant mothers in hospitals, and we have
20 programs working with people to make sure that
21 reading comes a part of family life really early
22 on, but it is because of that that it is
23 particularly disturbing that the fewest amount of
24 certified librarians exist in our elementary
25

1 schools when we particularly want to make sure
2 that young people are getting everything they can
3 in terms of learning to love to read. Every year
4 we have terrific local institutions of higher
5 education including Pratt, St. John's University
6 and Queens College that produce hundreds of
7 librarians, some of whom will become public
8 librarians, some school librarians. They are
9 eager to apply their skills they have honed, and
10 with any librarian, it is a passion, a passion to
11 care for people, a passion to provide information.
12 It is a wonderful calling, and far too often, it
13 is a passion unfulfilled because they are not
14 being hired. It is at times even the case that a
15 school can staff a certified librarian, but the
16 person may be underutilized. It seems that there
17 is a gap between what a librarian is trained for
18 and sometimes what they are being used for. It is
19 our hope that at today's hearing we can better
20 comprehend the full scope of this problem in our
21 public schools, why the dearth of certified school
22 librarians, what's the fix, how we are affecting
23 this much needed change, what is the Department of
24 Education doing about this? Certainly there are

1
2 no easy answers. There is no panacea, but we look
3 forward to shedding light on this important issue
4 today and to begin a conversation that has been
5 delayed for too long, and with that I will call on
6 our co-chair of the Select Committee on Libraries,
7 Vincent Gentile.

8 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Good morning
9 and thank you. I have been told that giving the
10 third opening statement is like being the third
11 leg of a ladder, but in any case, I will - - I do
12 want to welcome you and take the opportunity to
13 thank Council Members Van Bramer and Jackson for
14 conducting this hearing on a very important topic
15 to me. The situation and circumstances
16 surrounding school libraries and the state of
17 libraries in our public school system has long
18 been of deep concern to me, so I am thankful that
19 both Chairs Van Bramer and Jackson have cleared
20 time on their committee schedules to air and
21 explore these concerns. Studies have shown as you
22 have heard that school librarians have a positive
23 effect on student outcomes. For example, school
24 librarians provide teachers and students with
25 materials and research tools needed for class

1 assignments. School librarians are an asset to
2 teachers because they can assist with curriculum
3 and lesson development. Furthermore, having a
4 school librarian helps to improve student academic
5 performance, retention and graduation rates as we
6 will hear during the testimony; however,
7 proportionately speaking as you heard, very few of
8 the city's public schools have librarians. We
9 have been given data that we will talk about today
10 in terms of the number of librarians in our
11 schools. In fact, the New York State Education
12 Law as you heard doesn't even require elementary
13 schools to have a certified school librarian or
14 any librarian at all. This seems to be an
15 injustice considering that just last year, the New
16 York State Regions Advisory Council of Libraries
17 and they will be testifying last today also,
18 released a report that included recommendations
19 for libraries. One recommendation was to require
20 that a certified elementary school librarian be
21 staffed in every school. Another recommendation
22 by the advisory council was for school libraries
23 to collaborate with other libraries, such as
24 public libraries and libraries of higher education
25

1 institutions. The good news is that DOE and the
2 city's three public library systems have a
3 collaborative pilot program, a program, which
4 encourages students reading by expanding student
5 teacher access to public library books and other
6 materials. We will hear about that program. It
7 was launched in 2011 with the New York Public
8 Library and 86 participating schools, but due to
9 its success both the Brooklyn and Queens public
10 library systems have been added and serves I
11 believe around 300 schools now, and we will hear
12 about that. So we look forward to hearing more
13 about this collaborative effort from DOE and the
14 library systems. Also on schedule to give
15 testimony today our members from in addition to
16 the DOE, the three public library systems, New
17 York State Regions Advisory Council on Libraries,
18 the Pratt School of Information and Library
19 Science, the United Federation of Teachers, the
20 Urban Librarians United also known as ULU, and
21 members of the public, who have signed up to
22 testify, so thank you again for your attendance.
23 I very much look forward to hearing from our
24 witnesses and finding out to what extent libraries
25

1
2 and librarians are an indivisible part of our
3 right to a public school education.

4 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you,
5 Chairs. We have been joined by additional
6 colleagues this morning--Margaret Chin directly in
7 front of us from Manhattan, Oliver Koppell to her
8 right--to her right, I'm sorry is Danny Dromm of
9 Queens, and next to Danny to his right is Oliver
10 Koppell of the Bronx, Jessica Lappin of Manhattan
11 was here next to him, and next to that empty chair
12 where Jessica was was Charles Barron of Brooklyn,
13 and up here next to Andy King is Domenic Recchia
14 of Brooklyn... and anyone else? Inez Dickens of
15 Manhattan was here and Vincent Ignizio of Staten
16 Island. With that, we will turn to the Department
17 of Education officials, and ask them to introduce
18 their names and their titles and responsibilities
19 within the Department of Education so that we can
20 hear directly on what they have to say.

21 GREGG BETHEIL: Thank you. Good
22 morning, Chairs Jackson, Van Bramer, and Gentile
23 and members of the Committees on Education,
24 Cultural Affairs and the Select Committee on
25 Libraries. My name is Gregg Bethel. I am the

1 executive director of school programs and
2 partnerships in the division of academics
3 performance and support at the Department of
4 Education. Among my responsibilities at the
5 Department is oversight and support of the Office
6 of Library Services. I am joined today by Richard
7 Hasenyager to my left, our director of library
8 services and - - Becker, the DOE's chief executive
9 officer of the division of human resources. Thank
10 you for the opportunity to discuss library
11 services in the New York City public schools
12 today. At the outset, I would like to thank the
13 Council for its longstanding commitment to
14 supporting school libraries. This year alone, the
15 Council has directed several million dollars to
16 schools to support library and media center
17 upgrades and renovations to cover the cost of
18 computers, smart boards and furniture. With your
19 help, the support of the city's three public
20 library systems and our other partners, we are
21 beginning to make headway toward providing library
22 services to all students across our schools. This
23 is especially valuable as we continue to raise
24 expectations for teaching and learning to ensure
25

that all students are college and career ready. As you have stated, state commissioner's regulation 91.2 outlines staffing levels for secondary libraries based on the number of students in a school. The regulation allows for a shared or - - librarians in schools with 700 or fewer students. It also allows for the delivery of library services in schools to equivalent service provided by an alternative arrangement approved by the commissioner. I'd like to acknowledge at the start as you have said in your opening statements, we know as a system that we are not fully compliant. We also know that many of our secondary schools includes those that are fully and partially compliant and they are providing library services in a range of means. Currently the department employees 333 certified librarians, 27 of which are currently on leave, with just the 306 number that Chairman Jackson shared before. 300 of those librarians are providing services in secondary schools. As you know over the past several years, the Department has experienced several budget reductions driven by cuts to the federal and state funding. The

city with your support has worked to try and fill those gaps, but principals are still required to make difficult choices among competing priorities. With these fiscal challenges, schools across the city are working creatively to provide library services to students. Many school campuses are maximizing their resources by sharing library services and the cost of a librarian. Others are assigning teachers to the library using parent volunteers and the internet to access online information and databases. Some are creating smaller classroom libraries and media rooms to promote research and reading across classrooms. That said, we clearly have more work to do. High quality 21st century library programs provide an invaluable role in our mandate to prepare all students for college and careers. Our students deserve access to effective library programs with up to date resources and the opportunity for powerful learning experiences. We have already taken concrete steps to improve our principals' ability to hire highly qualified school librarians as required by regulation 91.2. These efforts include one educating school leaders and school

1 support teams about the regulation and the
2 benefits of a quality library program allowing
3 principals to request exemption from the DOE
4 hiring freeze in order to hire qualified
5 librarians from outside the Department; three,
6 promoting cost sharing among small schools in
7 order to meet the requirements of the regulation
8 exploring pathways for teachers assigned to
9 secondary school libraries to become fully
10 certified. We are partnering with the Institute
11 of Museum and Library Services at Syracuse
12 University, which recently awarded a grant to
13 educate up to 15 New York City teachers to become
14 certified librarians. We are also in contact with
15 the state to explore opportunities for the
16 flexible delivery of equivalent library services
17 where appropriate and will seek formal approval
18 from the education commissioner later this summer.
19 In addition to our efforts to addressing staffing,
20 the Department's Office of Library Services is
21 supporting school libraries, librarians and
22 teachers assigned to the library in the areas of
23 instruction, professional development, collection
24 development and program administration. The
25

Office of Library Services helps schools develop strong K-12 library programs that promote information fluency and the implementation of the common core learning standards, which aim to prepare students for both college and careers. These programs help foster a love of independent lifelong reading while helping students learn the skills required to locate, evaluate, select and organize information as well as to draw conclusions. In our increasingly digital world, these programs also support students' understanding of the ethical behavioral in digital environments. In addition our library team is working to provide access to a broad array of resources for use in the common core aligned [phonetic] instruction and to prepare librarians to be resource experts in their schools. The library services staff provides consultation and professional development to help schools strengthen their library programs, annual conferences and specialized workshops are for training and library automation and the common core learning standards integration. Over the past three years, 1341 librarians and teachers

assigned to the library have participated in professional development offered by the Office of Library Services. Some examples of this support include our annual spring conference at the New York Public Library, which is a full day professional development conference. This year's conference workshops will focus on the common core learning standards implementation through the library program and building 21st century library program. Presentations offered by building level librarians will inspire and stimulate participants to implement new and innovated instructional practices in their own library programs and exhibits will include information on summer reading, eresource integration, primary resources and digital citizenship. That conference is coming up next week. Professional development for newly assigned library personnel, this is a three day course designed for educators with three or fewer years of experience in the library and focuses on creating and maintaining an effective library program. It also covers instruction aligned to the common core standards and ways to develop collection to support to needs of students

1 and teachers in the school community. We also
2 provide automation training. This is a series of
3 workshops that provides introductory through
4 advanced training in the use of our automated
5 library platform. Workshops cover how to build a
6 basic library home cage [phonetic] in the
7 automated system catalog as well as procedures for
8 managing the online catalog. We are also working
9 to provide common core and information fluency
10 continuum workshops. Here participants work in
11 teacher/librarian collaborative teams to refine
12 their common core lesson planning skills and learn
13 how to identify and locate complex informational
14 text including article, book excerpts, and
15 encyclopedia articles for instructional planning
16 and design. The fund for public schools is also a
17 valued partner in our school libraries. Most
18 recently the fund has provided funding and support
19 for the following programs: the library reach
20 grants, which support schools in high need
21 communities, allowing eligible schools to apply
22 for up to \$10,000 to upgrade their books,
23 technology and furniture for their library. In
24 2012-2013 school year, 15 schools received the
25

library reach grant. New Yorkers Read provides books and other resources to schools to encourage students to read non-fiction texts. In 2012-2013 67 schools participated. Family reading nights help librarians, parent coordinators, reading coaches, and/or teachers to engage elementary students and their families in after school literacy activities. The program provides reading incentives and books to students for their homes and supports families to improve reading techniques. The final family reading nights connects parents and students with their local public library branch for summer reading. This year 71 schools are participating in family reading nights. We also continue our strong partnerships with the city's three public libraries. My library NYC is a pilot program of the New York City Department of Education and the Brooklyn Public Library, the New York Public Library serving the Bronx, Manhattan and Staten Island and the Queens Library. The project was originally launched to meet the New York State library system's expectation that the city develop what is called a union catalog allowing the search

1 and discovery of library resources across school
2 collections. My library NYC encourages student
3 reading by expanding student and teacher access to
4 public library books and removing common barriers
5 to borrowing them. The program offers book
6 delivery to schools and fine free borrowing for
7 educators and students. Through their computers,
8 smart phones and tablets, students and teachers
9 can search their school collection or access more
10 than 17 million digital and print resources in the
11 catalogs of the three public libraries including
12 downloadable books, music and movies. In the
13 current year, my library NYC reached 292 schools.
14 The program was targeted to schools with a
15 certified school librarian and automated library
16 catalogs. For the 2013-2014 school year, we have
17 invited 686 schools to continue or to join the
18 program. My library NYC is expected to expand to
19 more schools each year until the program is
20 available throughout the system. In collaboration
21 with my library NYC, the DOE has been working with
22 schools to transition to the destiny library
23 manager for library automation. This includes
24 automating school libraries that are still using
25

1 cards and pockets to check out books and to
2 transition libraries that have older automation
3 products. This year we have automated or migrated
4 71 libraries to destiny. Summer reading dot org
5 is the summer reading website of the three New
6 York City public libraries in partnership with the
7 Department of Education. The New York City summer
8 reading program is designed to fight summer slide-
9 -the phenomenon in which students who don't read
10 over the summer lose some of the reading skills
11 they develop during the previous school year,
12 which they then need to relearn in September. We
13 encourage students to get involved in New York
14 City summer reading program by creating accounts
15 on summer reading dot org, visiting public
16 libraries and inviting librarians to visit
17 schools. Reading opens our students to worlds
18 they might not otherwise enter and helps them
19 prepare to succeed in college or career. A
20 library card represents access to a world of
21 information in books and magazines and film and
22 increasingly in digital form on ereaders, tablets
23 and computers. The Department continues to engage
24 in a concerted, ongoing effort to encourage all
25

1 students to obtain a public library card. For
2 example, in accordance with local law 8 of 2010
3 enacted by the City Council under the leadership
4 of Chairs Jackson and Van Bramer, and at the start
5 of each school year, we distribute the expect
6 success guides to every public school student and
7 family. The guide, which is translated into nine
8 languages includes a library card application and
9 dedicates a section to explaining how parents and
10 students may apply for a free library card and
11 details the many resources offered by the three
12 public library systems. Additionally as part of
13 our expanding partnership with the city's public
14 libraries in the last two years, we have issued
15 over 1.5 million library and enhance my library
16 NYC cards to our students and teachers. Finally
17 during our annual pre-K enrollment drive, we send
18 parents information on how to obtain a library
19 card and directions to their local branch.
20 Representatives from the public libraries attend
21 pre-k information sessions in all five boroughs
22 and explain how to obtain a library card and how
23 to apply online using public computers. As we
24 experience significant transitions in how we
25

1
2 access information, the need for robust libraries
3 and skilled librarians to help us navigate the
4 evolving information landscape has never been
5 greater. We welcome the Council's ongoing support
6 and partnership as we continue to revitalize our
7 school libraries. With that, I would be happy to
8 answer any of your questions.

9 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

10 We have been joined by our colleague, Lew Fidler
11 of Brooklyn all the way to our left, and let's now
12 turn to Chair Van Bramer for some questions and
13 remarks.

14 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you
15 very much, Chair Jackson and thank you for your
16 testimony, and thank you for the shout out for the
17 library card act, which was my very first bill
18 that I passed, and I am very proud of. I had a
19 couple of questions--one, thank you for
20 acknowledging that you are not in full compliance,
21 and I think that we should all be striving to get
22 there as soon as possible. I had some questions
23 about some of the terms you used with respect to
24 sharing of librarians. What kind of sharing is
25 going on, and how many schools for example could

1
2 be sharing a certified school librarian and how
3 thinly stretched is the service than if it is too
4 shared or over shared?

5 GREGG BETHEIL: It is an important
6 question, and when we look at regulation 91.2 it
7 requires a fulltime certified librarian in any
8 school with 701 or more students. Under 700
9 students, it actually articulates the amount of
10 time each day that a school must have someone in
11 the library, a certified librarian. With schools
12 fewer than 100 students, it is only one period a
13 day. As you go from 100 to 300 students, it goes
14 to part of the day and between 300 and 700
15 students, a larger part of that day. Clearly, we
16 have particularly in co-located situations schools
17 many of which have 400 or fewer students, and so
18 those are places where we want to take advantage
19 of the flexibility that the regulation provides.
20 When we talk about the sharing of a library, I
21 think the most obvious case of it is a school that
22 is now a campus of schools that has a functioning
23 library, has a certified librarian, but that
24 librarian is shared across four or five schools on
25 that campus together add up to the requirement

1
2 for a full time librarian, helping schools begin
3 to figure out how they can identify that resource,
4 what it takes to locate it in their budget, how
5 they make sure they are sharing the library space
6 adequately in terms of scheduling is an important
7 part of the continued work that we have to do, but
8 when we talk about sharing librarians, we are
9 talking about sharing them within the domain and
10 the outline of 91.2, which recognizes that with
11 fewer than 700 students a full time librarian
12 across a full day is not necessarily required, but
13 we do need to share library services at the
14 appropriate ratios.

15 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Are there
16 cases of school librarians being shared outside of
17 the same building?

18 GREGG BETHEIL: There are cases
19 where there are - - librarians that are being
20 shared outside of one building, yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Which
22 seems like quite a task and if you are not in one,
23 you can't be in the other, and vice versa, so it
24 seems like a way out of doing what is right by the
25 kids. Equally curious to me is the equivalent

1
2 library services phrase, which seems overly broad,
3 and I am not sure what it means because either
4 there is a certified librarian in the library in
5 the building providing those services where there
6 is not, so what do you mean by equivalent library
7 services?

8 GREGG BETHEIL: When I reference
9 the words equivalent library service, I am
10 actually referencing the regulation itself.
11 Currently the regulation allows for the provision
12 of equivalent library services with an alternative
13 plan approved by the commissioner.

14 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: so what
15 does that mean in - - ?

16 GREGG BETHEIL: [interposing] It is
17 one of the questions we are exploring right now.
18 When we think about library services we think
19 about collection development, we think about
20 administration, we think about support for
21 instruction. Those we expect to be played by a
22 certified librarian. We do not have any approved
23 equivalent services at this point. We are
24 exploring as you are suggesting what that could
25 possibly mean as we think about delivering

1
2 services across the city, and that is the work we
3 need to do with the state Department of Education
4 as we go into the summer.

5 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: You have
6 no approved plan by the commissioner?

7 GREGG BETHEIL: That is correct nor
8 have we submitted a plan yet.

9 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: How long
10 have you been working on that plan and when do you
11 intend to submit it?

12 GREGG BETHEIL: As I said in my
13 testimony, we had planned to submit it this
14 summer. Mr. Hasenyager is our director of library
15 services. He was hired this summer, has been
16 assessing the situation on the ground in schools
17 and has been working to submit that plan in a
18 timely manner.

19 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: I can't
20 encourage you more strongly and I am sure my co-
21 chairs and other members would agree that that
22 should happen as soon as possible. I just have a
23 couple more and then I am going to throw it to
24 Chair Gentile, and I'll come back if I have to.
25 Why are there so few certified school librarians

1
2 in elementary schools when we know that reaching
3 children in elementary school and even before they
4 get into elementary school in terms of learning
5 and appreciation of books, reading, lifelong
6 learning begins at the very beginning of life, so
7 why so few in elementary school?

8 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Just identify
9 yourself for the record.

10 LAWRENCE BECKER: Sure, Mr.
11 Jackson. My name is Lawrence Becker, the chief
12 executive officer for the division of human
13 resources. It is partially a staffing question.
14 The real reason is as Mr. Betheil alluded to in
15 his testimony, it is not a mandate to have a
16 certified librarian in an elementary school, and
17 so the concentration of certified librarians is in
18 secondary schools. That does not mean that there
19 aren't individuals in the libraries in elementary
20 school, but they are not as we said certified
21 librarians. We know that, but that is really the
22 reason. It is a state education regulation that
23 mandates where the librarians need to be. We have
24 some in elementary schools, but as you point out,
25 not very many.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Whether or not it's the regulation it certainly seems to me the smarter thing to do to make sure that we have certified school librarians in all of our elementary schools. It is just so critical in terms of the derailment [phonetic] of young people, and I know it was for me at P.S. 70 in Astoria where we had a terrific school library and librarian at all times and we are going to obviously talk about my library NYC, the partnership with our three public library systems, which I have some concerns about, but I wanted to just say one last thing before I turn it over to Chair Gentile. There is a lot of talk about laptops and iPhones and tablets and how young people use all of these technologies and somehow they won't need librarians or libraries. It is the way of the future as one of the deputy chancellors says in this New York Times article, but I would argue that there will never be a substitute for libraries and librarians, and what they do is indispensable and - - those technologies are not broadly accessible, and there are vast numbers of people who don't have access

1
2 to those same kinds of technologies because of
3 their family's income, and so it is creating this
4 digital divide. The true equalizer are librarians
5 and libraries whether they be public libraries or
6 public school libraries and librarians because all
7 children regardless of income, regardless of
8 status can access those technologies there and the
9 information therein. That is why it is so
10 important that we have and maintain an increased
11 access to all of these services, particularly in
12 our public schools, so I just want to say that and
13 put it on the record. There is no substitute for
14 public school libraries and librarians. Chair
15 Gentile?

16 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Thank you,
17 Mr. Chairman. Mr. Bethel, so we have 306
18 librarians--active librarians in the system as of
19 today, which is down as we have talked about
20 significantly over the last several years, and
21 especially over the last five years. Are all
22 those 306 librarians certified librarians?

23 GREGG BETHEIL: Yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: They are all
25 certified? Okay. So we are talking about then if

1
2 you take out the elementary school librarians and
3 look at the required certified librarians for
4 secondary and for middle school and high school
5 you have 273 certified librarians in the middle
6 and high school level, so with 273 librarians at
7 that level, how many schools are now out of
8 compliance, middle and high schools?

9 LAWRENCE BECKER: How many schools
10 are out of compliance?

11 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Well, we have
12 273 librarians--

13 LAWRENCE BECKER: [interposing] But
14 let's remember as Mr. Betheil and others have said
15 that for certain schools with a population below
16 700 to be in compliance not that this is the state
17 we want to be in, but to be in compliance, you
18 only need library services for a portion of the
19 day. Some of our librarians as Mr. Betheil
20 pointed out are itinerant, approximately 49 of
21 them are itinerant and they cover about 180
22 schools. So to estimate the number of schools
23 that is out of compliance, we would have to do a
24 run--I could say...

25 GREGG BETHEIL: I think as we

1
2 acknowledged at the start of the hearing, a
3 significant number of secondary schools that are
4 out of compliance and we have worked to - - on
5 that. I think the complexities of the regulation
6 in terms of the part time staffing and the numbers
7 are why we don't have that figure today, but there
8 is no question at all we have work to do, and the
9 issue you are pointing to is an accurate one.

10 LAWRENCE BECKER: We could also
11 venture that we certainly have a couple hundred
12 schools that are below, partial compliance or
13 below compliance.

14 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Now just to
15 harp on a question that Councilman Van Bramer
16 brought up, this is not a situation that has
17 developed in recent time, this has been developing
18 over the years, and that being the case and there
19 is this term out there about equivalent services
20 to be in compliance. A, why hasn't anyone defined
21 what equivalent services are, number one, and why
22 have we waited until this year to attempt to put
23 together a proposal for the commissioner to
24 approve for New York City?

25 GREGG BETHEIL: I would say two

1 things in response to that. One, one of the
2 reasons that we have hired a new director of
3 library services is to begin to focus on this
4 issue. With Mr. Hasenyager joining us earlier
5 this summer he brought to our attention some of
6 the flexibility inherence in the regulation. We
7 did not want to run forward blindly nor did we
8 want to skirt our responsibilities for providing
9 library services. The regulation does not provide
10 for a waiver from providing library services. It
11 uses the language equivalent library services, and
12 we think there are a number of dimensions to that
13 and running a library. We have been in contact
14 with the state to begin to understand what that
15 means as we have been doing a more thorough
16 assessment of what the issues are in the school so
17 we can target interventions appropriately at the
18 point at which we believe that there are
19 alternative equivalent services to offer. We will
20 put that to the state, but our primary goal is to
21 continue to enhance the opportunity for schools to
22 hire certified school librarians. It is not a way
23 around the regulation. It is one of the tools
24 available to us to begin to advance the goals of
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

the regulation.

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: So at this point, do you know whether or not there are any other jurisdictions within the state of New York that have gotten approved equivalent services from the commissioner?

GREGG BETHEIL: I am not aware of any sitting here today, no.

RICHARD HASENYAGER: Rick Hasenyager, director of library services.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Can you please pull the mic up to you, so we can hear you - - and people in the other room?

RICHARD HASENYAGER: Richard Hasenyager, director of library services. I am unaware of any other such arrangement throughout the state.

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: So what are we proposing as the equivalent library service that we are putting forth to the state this summer?

RICHARD HASENYAGER: The details haven't been firmly in place. I have already reached out to Bernie Margales [phonetic] at the

1 state ;library to talk about what such an
2 arrangement might look like, so with some of the
3 guidance from the state will create a plan that
4 will go forward. I would anticipate that a part
5 of it is is that we have some schools that do use
6 teachers that are assigned to library that have
7 had a number of training aspects within their role
8 that are providing excellent services to their
9 school, and so there are places where we are
10 seeing some great things from people that may not
11 be a certified librarian and of course, we always
12 encourage them to become fully certified, but
13 there is also a component of that of how can we
14 get people to certification that are in those
15 roles currently.

17 GREGG BETHEIL: The role of a
18 school librarian is a complex one, and I think the
19 chairmen have spoken to it eloquently. Librarians
20 are not just the folks sitting in the library
21 putting books on shelves and maintaining the card
22 catalog. If that were the case, we would be
23 sitting here today telling you we could automate
24 this process. This has happened in other routine
25 processes. It is clearly not the case.

1 Librarians play an important instructional role in
2 the library, both in accessing and locating
3 materials, particularly as we talk about the need
4 for a balance of text to reach the common core
5 standards. So when we talk about equivalent
6 services, we are not looking for who is going to
7 replace the librarian. The question is what is
8 the range of services that a student and teachers
9 should expect in their school. There are aspects
10 of professional development that some of our
11 librarians provide and technology access, digital
12 citizenship, acceptable use. Is it possible that
13 there are other teachers in the school that are
14 skilled in providing that? It is certainly
15 possible. We wouldn't say that any teacher is
16 necessarily doing it. We would want to understand
17 if a school can demonstrate in fact that they are
18 providing those services through equivalent means,
19 and part of that is to be in conversation with our
20 schools as we begin to create a framework for
21 that, but we sit here today and welcome the
22 conversation with the Council because this is not
23 something we are rushing ahead to do blindly. We
24 believe in strong library services in our schools
25

1
2 and want to take advantage of every available
3 lever to make sure we are putting those in place
4 in an equitable and transparent way.

5 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Well, just to
6 follow up on what you said about the complexity of
7 being a librarian, the fact is that that
8 complexity would then cut against what you said in
9 your opening in your statement about putting in
10 parent volunteers or other volunteers who come,
11 retired people or others in the library given the
12 fact that the complexity of that position is such
13 that are you really doing anything by putting
14 someone in there that doesn't meet those
15 qualifications?

16 GREGG BETHEIL: With respect to the
17 Councilman, I was not suggesting in my earlier
18 testimony that that was the path forward, I was
19 simply describing what is happening currently in
20 some of our schools. We need to examine that and
21 make sure it is of the quality that we would
22 expect for equivalent library services if we get
23 there, but again as Mr. Hasenyager has said, our
24 primary goal is to continue to inform school
25 leaders and their school support organizations of

1
2 what the regulation is and create pathways for
3 folks to move towards certification and be able to
4 staff libraries appropriately.

5 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Let me ask
6 you then just explain in the briefing paper it
7 goes over for us what it takes to become
8 certified. There is a temporary and a permanent
9 certification, and it is pretty complicated. It
10 is pretty intense. What does that mean? Tell us
11 in terms what does it mean certified librarian?
12 What can we expect from a certified librarian that
13 we wouldn't otherwise?

14 GREGG BETHEIL: I'll start by
15 saying I am not a certified librarian and so I can
16 say certified means you have achieved the state
17 school librarian certification, but that is why we
18 hire a director of school libraries, who is
19 certified, and I'll allow Rick to explain what it
20 means to do his job.

21 RICHARD HASENYAGER: So the
22 certified librarian has several different ways in
23 which they can get there. Probably the easiest
24 route is that full master's degree in library
25 science or information science. There are other

1 pathways to certification, so if you have another
2 master's degree and you are a teacher already,
3 there is a smaller number of courses that you
4 would have to take in order to sit for the test,
5 so once you pass the certification test and you
6 are deemed certified then it talks more about the
7 role, and what is that role of the certified
8 librarian, and I would say that there are four
9 main areas in which we really break that down
10 into. One is an instructional purpose of how do
11 you collaborate with teachers, how do you work
12 with groups of students and individual students.
13 It is also the professional development, whether
14 it is in technology or instruction that you are
15 providing to other teachers at the school. Part
16 of that is being part of that leadership team at
17 the school in order to institute that. There is
18 also a program management aspect of okay, we have
19 these systems whether it's automation or databases
20 or other instances within that school program that
21 somebody has to be in charge of in order to push
22 through, and then the fourth one is definitely the
23 resources, the collection development, how do I
24 curate various artifacts and books and other
25

1 materials for teachers and students to use for
2 instruction or in their pleasure reading, so those
3 are probably the four broad aspects of what that
4 certified librarian is responsible for. Does that
5 answer your question?
6

7 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: To a certain
8 extent, and you have either a permanent or a
9 temporary certification, is that correct?

10 RICHARD HASENYAGER: The
11 librarians, yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Are they
13 classified as teachers?

14 RICHARD HASENYAGER: They are
15 classified as teachers.

16 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Okay, so if
17 it came to it, a principal could move them out and
18 put them somewhere else then?

19 RICHARD HASENYAGER: They could.
20 They could be placed in another teaching
21 assignment, whatever they are certified under.

22 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Right. Do we
23 know by the way how many school libraries are
24 closed that are not being used at all or being
25 used for classroom space instead?

1
2 GREGG BETHEIL: In terms of how
3 many schools have a library, approximately 85
4 percent of all schools have a library in the
5 building. 1100 share libraries in approximately
6 400 buildings--

7 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: How many
8 share?

9 GREGG BETHEIL: 1100 share
10 libraries. 1100 schools share libraries across
11 about 400 buildings.

12 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: So those are
13 libraries in the schools in the same building?

14 GREGG BETHEIL: The schools in the
15 same building. 1010 buildings have at least one
16 library and about ten percent of these buildings
17 have more than one library. In school year 2012-
18 2013 just as context there were over 1700 schools
19 in over 1200 buildings, and in 2012-2013 there
20 were 895 unique district and charter school
21 organizations co-located across 328 buildings.

22 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: I am sorry.
23 I didn't hear the question. How many buildings do
24 not have libraries?

25 GREGG BETHEIL: About 15 percent of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

our 1700 schools.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: What is the number?

GREGG BETHEIL: About 200.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: About 200 no libraries whatsoever. Is that correct?

GREGG BETHEIL: Schools, some of those schools may be sharing a building.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: No, but you had indicated that - -

GREGG BETHEIL: I am not trying to complicate the matter. We have as everyone knows a number of schools that are co-located in the same building. I just want to make sure I am distinguishing between the number of buildings that don't have libraries that may impact a number of schools and the overall number of schools that do not have a library.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: I am sorry. How up to date are your stats? And I am asking the director of library services. How up to date are those stats?

RICHARD HASENYAGER: The stats that we have are actually from this month.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: So there is approximately 200 schools that do not have libraries? Is that correct?

RICHARD HASENYAGER: Correct or active libraries as we could say - -

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: [interposing] What is the difference? I understand what don't have a library--what do you mean don't have an active library?

RICHARD HASENYAGER: It may be used for another purpose at this time that they actually have a space for a library or they may not, but that space may be used in a different way.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Okay. So I am sorry.

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: That 200 number represents middle and high school?

RICHARD HASENYAGER: That would be all schools. K-12.

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: It is still a large number and that represents many, many, many students obviously. I just know some other members have questions. I just wanted to ask a

1 couple of other things, and then come back later.
2
3 The regents report says that the school librarians
4 are deeply engaged in implementing the common core
5 learning standards. Can you explain to us how
6 they are deeply engaged in that?

7 GREGG BETHEIL: So I will turn the
8 microphone to Mr. Hasenyager in a second, but I
9 will take the opportunity to acknowledge the work
10 that our directors of library services and our
11 office of library services have been doing, both
12 here at the city level, the state level and the
13 national level on exactly that question--the
14 introduction of the common core standards and its
15 focus on literacy could be seen as a challenge to
16 the library program. Our school librarians saw it
17 as an opportunity and have been discussing for the
18 last three years as part of the larger city wide
19 instructional expectations how libraries and
20 librarians could take advantage of that. They
21 have worked to promote the information fluency
22 continuum, which is the easiest way to describe
23 the standards for libraries in terms of the kind
24 of work that is going there, and that has been
25 adopted at the state level, and they have also

1
2 been working with the American Library Association
3 and school library journal to talk about the
4 efforts that librarians can take across the
5 country to play an active role in the library, but
6 when it comes to what are they doing on a day by
7 day basis to support that in the classroom, I will
8 defer to Mr. Hasenyager.

9 RICHARD HASENYAGER: So the
10 information fluency continuum, I will probably
11 reference it as IFC from now on just to speed it
12 up. The IFC is a series of benchmark skills in
13 which students should be able to accomplish by the
14 time they finish any grade level.

15 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: I understand.
16 I am curious about how are these librarians
17 trained to do this?

18 RICHARD HASENYAGER: So one of the
19 professional developments Mr. Bethel described
20 earlier was that we have professional development
21 workshops with groups of librarians and teachers
22 in order for them to work collaboratively in order
23 to create lessons that are common core aligned
24 using the IFC, so we do that either through
25 individual trainings where it is one full day and

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

24

25

1
2 in our schools the value that a librarian can give
3 to that increases?

4 GREGG BETHEIL: We have said from
5 the start we believe in the value of librarians
6 and of library services and need to continue to
7 work to make sure that all of our schools have
8 access to the appropriate level of service.

9 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Just one
10 final question, and then I will turn it back. Is
11 there any information literacy skills, any type of
12 information literacy skills tested on the state
13 mandated test?

14 GREGG BETHEIL: I think if one
15 examines the common core standards, there are a
16 range of information literacy skills that are
17 embedded in that work and are certainly tested the
18 ability to understand an author's perspective, the
19 ability to understand the main point, the ability
20 to answer questions, to locate information across
21 a wide range of sources. I think there is clear
22 alignment between what Rick calls the information
23 fluency continuum that the library had worked
24 under and the common core standards that has
25 created the opportunity that I think you are

1 speaking to.

2
3 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Well, you
4 call it an opportunity, but at the one hand we are
5 testing students on information literacy and then
6 on the other we are cutting the avenues by which
7 they learn how to cope with this information
8 literacy and become literate in the information
9 age. Would you agree? We are testing them, but
10 we are not giving them the resources to learn it
11 in the first place?

12 GREGG BETHEIL: I don't know if I
13 would agree with that overall. While there has
14 been attrition in librarians over the last few
15 years as we have implemented the common core
16 standards, we have talked about the support needed
17 in the library and the work that we need to do to
18 help an entire school community play their role in
19 developing literacy standards and librarians play
20 an important role in that. There has been no
21 active effort to cut. I think the reality of the
22 numbers that you have talked about speak for
23 themselves in terms of the attrition that we have
24 had, and we have work to do, and we are
25 acknowledge that plainly, but I think we have

1
2 taken advantage of the opportunity over the last
3 three years as we have helped schools become aware
4 of the expectations of the common core and
5 supported teachers and school leaders in their
6 broader community and putting in place the
7 supports needed to help all of our students become
8 college and career ready.

9 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Okay, Mr.
10 Chairman, I'll defer to other questions later. I
11 think Chairman Van Bramer had a question.

12 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Just one
13 quick follow up, Mr. Hasenyager, you mentioned one
14 potential piece of your application to the
15 commissioner and since you said it is going to be
16 done this summer, I am sure you are heavily
17 involved in it. Can you tell us if my library NYC
18 is going to be one of the pieces of your
19 equivalent library services?

20 RICHARD HASENYAGER: I would say
21 that when it comes to providing additional
22 resources for schools that my library NYC would be
23 mentioned in it, but it wouldn't be considered a
24 replacement of those library services.

25 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: But you do

1
2 consider it part of the equivalent library
3 services piece?

4 RICHARD HASENYAGER: I would
5 consider it a way to infuse additional resources
6 into a school. I wouldn't necessarily consider it
7 a replacement.

8 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Not a
9 replacement, but it will be part of your rationale
10 or what DOE offers in terms of equivalent library
11 services.

12 RICHARD HASENYAGER: Yes, and if I
13 could very clear, the state requires us to
14 implement what is called a union catalog. For
15 anybody that ever took a book out of the library
16 and your library didn't have it, they have the
17 ability to make that request of another library
18 across the library system. Most of us may have
19 experience that at some point, perhaps in college.
20 In order to put in place the state requirement of
21 the union catalog, we engaged in the my library
22 NYC effort. That gave us the ability to do that.
23 When we talk about--so it is something that we
24 needed to do. It was the most efficient way to
25 begin to get there and brought us not only access

1
2 to the school libraries across New York City, but
3 the 17 million items in the public libraries of
4 New York City. When we talk about equivalent
5 service, and again, it is still work that we are
6 doing right now, we believe my library NYC speaks
7 both to the need for a union catalog and
8 enhancements to a school's collection, but my
9 library NYC isn't providing professional
10 development on how to be a librarian. It is not
11 talking to teachers in the school. It is not
12 playing the role of the school librarian, nor
13 would we propose it does.

14 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Sure. A
15 few people understand public libraries better than
16 I do. I agree with all that you said, I just
17 would hate, and we will get into it more when the
18 public library systems testify, for my library NYC
19 to be used as a rationale for not needing to have
20 certified school librarians and that being a basis
21 of your application to the commissioner because
22 the truth is my library NYC would only truly
23 success if it was done jointly by having certified
24 school libraries on the other end of all of those
25 collections coming to the place, and this is not

1
2 just where you currently have the certified school
3 librarian, which I know - - my library NYC, but
4 when you expand to schools that doesn't have
5 certified school librarians.

6 GREGG BETHEIL: Chairman Van
7 Bramer, I would say we were very cognizant of
8 exactly the line that you are drawing when we
9 piloted in the first year of expanding my library
10 NYC. We only targeted schools that had a
11 certified librarian for exactly the reasons that
12 you are articulating. As we move forward, I think
13 we are going to have attention and attention is
14 simply as we do the work to appropriately staff
15 our libraries, there is a set of resources
16 available in the collection that we wouldn't want
17 to withhold from students and from schools, but we
18 shouldn't confuse the two is the point that you
19 are making and we would agree.

20 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Well, thank
21 you. I have a couple of questions, so Mr.
22 Betheil, how do you pronounce your last name, sir?

23 GREGG BETHEIL: Gregg Betheil, and
24 thank you for asking.

25 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Okay. You

1
2 indicated that you recently hired or the
3 department recently hired Mr. Hasenyager as the
4 director of library services. When was that
5 please?

6 GREGG BETHEIL: That was in August
7 of 2012.

8 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: And how many
9 staff do you have in the office of library
10 services besides the director?

11 GREGG BETHEIL: There are five
12 professional staff members, professional
13 librarians, certified librarians and then we have
14 four support staff.

15 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Now a lot of
16 the questions are--so when I was listening to the
17 fact that you were looking into putting in an
18 equivalent approved plan by the commissioner of
19 education, and I was glad my colleagues fleshed
20 that out because you don't have a plan, and in
21 fact, I think the response was you don't know of
22 any system that has an alternative plan, isn't
23 that correct?

24 GREGG BETHEIL: I want to be very,
25 very clear about this. Mr. Hasenyager was brought

1
2 on back in August to replace Barbara Stripling
3 [phonetic] who was our previous director of
4 library services. Ms. Stripling is now a
5 professor at Syracuse University, and also the
6 president of the American Library Association. We
7 are proud of the library services work that has
8 gone into the department--

9 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: [interposing]
10 I am sorry. Excuse me, sir. No. I have asked
11 you a very simple question, and I don't want an
12 explanation about the previous director. That
13 previous director is no longer in the picture. I
14 am asking you whether you have a plan and
15 basically what I have heard you don't have a plan.
16 You have asked the director of library services to
17 come up with a plan even though there is no other
18 system in New York State based on what the
19 director said that has an alternative plan, and
20 you don't even know if you submit it, it would be
21 approved by the commissioner of education. Am I
22 right or wrong in that?

23 GREGG BETHEIL: We are saying that
24 Mr. Hasenyager is responsible for delivering
25 library services across the New York City--

1

2

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: [interposing]

3

But in compliance with the state education law, is

4

that correct, sir?

5

GREGG BETHEIL: - - as we said

6

before, we have work to do there.

7

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Let me just

8

say to you as the chair of the Education

9

Committee, and I am sure that I speak for the

10

other chairs that Department of Education are

11

failing our students when it comes to library

12

services. I am telling you. It is totally

13

unacceptable, and I don't care what you have to

14

say and try to explain it. It is totally

15

unacceptable, and I am not happy about it. Let me

16

just tell you that. Let me turn to Larry Becker.

17

Larry, can you tell us how many librarians were

18

laid off or reassigned within the past three

19

years?

20

LAWRENCE BECKER: We didn't lay off

21

any librarians, Mr. Chairman.

22

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: What happened

23

to all of them?

24

LAWRENCE BECKER: They attrited

25

[phonetic] out--resigned, retired, left the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

system.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: And you
didn't replace them?

LAWRENCE BECKER: Well, we have
hired about 20 librarians, 24 librarians over the
past couple of years, but we have not kept pace
with attrition.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Why not?

LAWRENCE BECKER: That is a simple
answer, Mr. Chairman--

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: [interposing]
Not a priority.

LAWRENCE BECKER: Mr. Chairman,
everybody knows on this panel and in this room
that for the past four years schools' budgets have
been cut or not increased. Everybody knows
choices have to be made. When you say it is not a
priority, that doesn't mean we don't count
librarians as important, but principals have to
make choices about math, science, social studies,
English, phys ed, everything is a priority. So
did principals not hire as many librarians as they
should have? Yes. That is exactly what we told
you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: And so you
are out of compliance and--

LAWRENCE BECKER: [interposing] We
told you that from the start. We are out of
compliance.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: So what are
you doing to--how long is it going to take you
meaning the Department of Education when I say
you, not Larry Becker, but the Department of
Education? How long is it going to take you to
come into compliance?

LAWRENCE BECKER: Okay. You can--

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: [interposing]
Three years? Five years? Ten years? 20 years?
Or never come into compliance?

LAWRENCE BECKER: Well, here is
what I would say, coming into compliance means
that each school--compliance is a regulatory
driven issue.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Of course it
is.

LAWRENCE BECKER: So when you say
compliance, it means that every school of over 100
students has some form of library service. I

1 would say two things about that. Number one, we
2 can increase the number of librarians that are
3 itinerant. Although I have to say to the Council,
4 that is not a particularly good way to recruit
5 people. If you tell them they are itinerant, it
6 can hurt us in terms of our recruitment. Two, we
7 can work with the state education department when
8 you talk about innovative things, Councilman
9 Gentile, about what we can do. Perhaps if someone
10 is in the library and they are continuing their
11 education towards becoming a certified librarian
12 that would be an acceptable program where we could
13 say it is an equivalent alternative services.
14 Three, we can look at the state education
15 department's requirements to be a certified
16 librarian. Perhaps, there are ways we can work
17 with the state ed. Perhaps, there are people that
18 are currently working for us that would like to
19 become certified librarians, but they don't want
20 to do everything that is required. Perhaps, if
21 they are already teachers and they already have
22 some skills, they can be exempt from some, not all
23 of the requirements. - - pass the test. I am
24 going to answer your question right now.
25

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Then answer my question. How long do you think it would take for the Department of Education to be compliant with the state regulation, not New York City regulation, state regulations?

LAWRENCE BECKER: I'd say depending on the budget, the next three to five years.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: So let me ask a question. In response to one of my colleagues indicated that librarians are represented by the United Federation of Teachers. Is that correct?

GREGG BETHEIL: They are.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Have you had a conversation or consultation via the labor management process discussing with UFT about your proposal for equivalent library services that must be approved by the education commissioner? I am asking that question of whoever.

GREGG BETHEIL: Yes, Mr. Chairman. The UFT has filed a formal complaint against the department with the state education department and as a result it has--

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: [interposing]
About what?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

GREGG BETHEIL: About the issue that is under discussion today.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Library services?

GREGG BETHEIL: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Okay. That is one thing, but have you had any discussions that you are exploring other approved methodologies by the state education commissioner to deliver library services? Have you opened the door for that discussion regardless of their filing an issue with the state education commissioner?

GREGG BETHEIL: I would say two things, pending the outcome of that complaint, no, and prior to moving forward with any plan, we certainly would.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: So the answer is no you have not, even though you can. Let me ask you what is the specific complaint that UFT has complained to the state commissioner of education about? That is public information.

GREGG BETHEIL: That we are not complaint with regulation 91.2.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: I ask you, Mr. Betheil, the executive director of school programs and partnership, how long ago was that complaint filed?

GREGG BETHEIL: There were two complaints that were filed over the last two years.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Those have not been resolved by the state education commissioner?

GREGG BETHEIL: As far as we understand, they have not.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Okay. Have the city Department of Education been fined or otherwise sanctioned and/or penalized as a result of being out of compliance?

GREGG BETHEIL: - - relation to this hearing? No.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Not in relationship to this hearing. In relationship to being out of compliance.

GREGG BETHEIL: No.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Let me turn to my colleagues. Let me just say as the chair of

1 the Education Committee, I am sitting here. I am
2 very upset. Let me just tell you that loud and
3 clear. I am very upset that the Department of
4 Education about you are not being in compliant
5 with the state regulations that basically in my
6 opinion but for this hearing you would still be
7 not in compliance for years to come, which is
8 totally unacceptable to the children of New York
9 City. I am telling you. Let me turn to my
10 colleagues. First let me introduce additional
11 colleagues that are present this afternoon--David
12 Greenfield of Brooklyn, Steve Levin of Brooklyn,
13 Eric Ulrich of Queens, Fernando Cabrera of the
14 Bronx. That is it. Thank you. Let me turn it to
15 our colleague, Council Member Charles Barron,
16 followed by our colleague, Danny Dromm.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Let me say
19 that this is incredible. All the hearings with
20 the Department of Education are incredible to me--
21 the answers and the non-answers and the people
22 they have in expert positions and ain't even
23 librarians and just incredible. Let me ask you
24 this, the charter schools, what percentage, how
25 many of your charter schools have libraries in

1
2 terms of the charter schools and the percentage of
3 them have libraries?

4 GREGG BETHEIL: I would ask Mr.
5 Hasenyager to speak to it, but the reality is the
6 New York State library system does not allow the
7 New York City school library system to support
8 charter schools the way their regulations are
9 written.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Even the
11 oxymoron public charters, what about the public
12 charters?

13 GREGG BETHEIL: The regulation in
14 terms of how their funding comes to them does not
15 provide for support to charter schools.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So you are
17 saying that the co-location mess chaos that has
18 crowded in lunchrooms and auditoriums and you
19 mentioned libraries are being shared by four
20 schools in a building and many of those schools
21 are charter schools.

22 GREGG BETHEIL: I am not suggesting
23 that some charter schools aren't served. I'm not
24 sure those are the words I used in full. What I
25 am saying is that the mandate of the New York City

1
2 school library system does not extend to charter
3 schools. We try to invite them and let them
4 participate.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So you
6 don't have an obligation, library service
7 obligation--

8 GREGG BETHEIL: [interposing]
9 According to the New York State library system,
10 the answer to that is no.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Did you
12 ever go to the mayor and ask the mayor how can he
13 assist you? Is funding a problem? You do have a
14 \$19 billion budget, and if you add on the pension
15 and debt service, about \$24 billion, so you are
16 having financial problems? And you did increase
17 the contracting budget by \$700 million, so more
18 contracts can be received by people that we can do
19 insourcing and not even have to have--are you
20 having a money problem is the reason why you--
21 'cause if you all don't know how to manage \$19
22 billion and get some library services and hire
23 librarians, I don't get that. Is it a money
24 problem?

25 GREGG BETHEIL: I think as Mr.

1
2 Becker said before, clearly resources are a part
3 of the challenge--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:
5 [interposing] How much money do you need to come
6 into compliance?

7 GREGG BETHEIL: It would be helpful
8 if the federal or the state government through c4e
9 met their obligations relative to - -

10 [crosstalk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That is not
12 my question. My question is how much money do you
13 need to be in compliance?

14 GREGG BETHEIL: We don't have that
15 number.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Here we are
17 talking about a problem about hiring librarians
18 and you come to us and say it's a fiscal problem.
19 You are having financial problems, and you don't
20 even know how much money you need. You are
21 telling me you don't even know how much money you
22 need to solve the situation, so how seriously can
23 you be about solving it if you come before this
24 body and say I don't even know how much money I
25 need to solve it; we will get back to you on that?

1
2 Do - - have any concerns about that? What do you
3 think about that that you don't even have that
4 number so we could help you get the money?

5 GREGG BETHEIL: We would welcome
6 the Council's--

7 [crosstalk]

8 GREGG BETHEIL: --get back to you
9 with that number.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'll show
11 you how to get it out of your budget. It's in
12 your budget. How many librarians would you need
13 to hire to be in compliance? Do you have that
14 number, and at what salaries would you hire them?
15 This is a rough job I have here... educators...

16 GREGG BETHEIL: Councilman Barron,
17 there are about 286 additional librarians that we
18 would need. I want to be very clear here.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: You don't
20 have to say very clear because that is what we
21 want you to be.

22 GREGG BETHEIL: Let me say what I
23 have to say then. Staffing libraries is not as
24 simple as--

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:

1 [interposing] No, I don't have time. He is going
2 to cut me off in a minute. How many librarians do
3 you need to hire to be in compliance and what
4 would their salary be?

5 GREGG BETHEIL: Approximately 280.
6 Their salary would depend on their experience and
7 seniority. We will be happy to get back to you
8 with more information when we have more time.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: What would
10 be the range of the salary since you are saying
11 experience and all of that?

12 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: The range of
13 salary of whom, Council Member?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: The
15 librarians that they need to hire to be in
16 compliance.

17 GREGG BETHEIL: Councilman, the
18 range is probably--most librarians will come in
19 with some kind of experience, I would say probably
20 between 50,000 and 80,000.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So if you
22 multiply that number 80,000 by 200 and some odd
23 that you need how much money would that be?

24 GREGG BETHEIL: About \$24 million.
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: \$24

million. See how easy it is to get to the amount of money that you need? I know you probably need more for some other kinds of things, but \$24 million and you would be able to hire. There is nowhere in this \$19 billion that you can find \$24 million? I mean this is ridiculous, and I'll end it. You say in your comments you mention that reading opens our students to worlds they might not otherwise enter, and helps them prepare to succeed in college and a career, yet you won't open your pocket to make that happen.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

We want to hear from our colleague, Danny Dromm, followed by our colleague, Andy King, by our colleague Debbie Rose. Council members, we are on a five minute clock. I am so sorry. If you need additional questions, you can come back again. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay. Thank

you, Mr. Chair and all the Chairs today that we have here. You know, I was a New York City public school teacher for 25 years and I have to tell you out of the 25 years that I was a teacher, only one

1
2 year did my kids get library out of those, so all
3 other 24 years the kids in my classroom never went
4 to a library, and I am going to tell you how that
5 is possible, so you don't have to give me all the
6 faces, but I will tell you in a minute how it is.
7 And as a matter of fact in the beginning of my
8 career what I did is what they eventually did
9 later on with teacher's choice is that I had book
10 baskets, and I would bring in carts, and I would
11 go to flea markets and I would buy used books so
12 that the kids could have library and I would give
13 them a little bit of a library period in my own
14 classroom, but really that depended on me going
15 out and buying those books. Then in some years,
16 the classes that did get library they would go
17 down, but there really were not enough periods to
18 cover the whole school, so I think a librarian
19 works 20 periods a week if I am not mistaken
20 'cause they also had to have an administrative
21 prep to be able to prepare and they get their
22 regular prep as well on top of that. So at my
23 school we had 44 classrooms in the main building
24 and 4 in one annex and 4 in another, so they only
25 got 20 out of those 44, 50 or so classes actually

1
2 got one period of library per week, so the real
3 question to me is not only having a librarian in
4 the school, but also the number of periods that
5 are allotted for children to go to the library, so
6 I just want to go back, and I am going to also say
7 that in my school, when computers came in probably
8 around '96, '98, shows you how old I am, the
9 library was eliminated and the books were put into
10 the basement and then they got a library teacher,
11 cluster teacher, who had a cart and she would go
12 from classroom to classroom and then offer kids to
13 take a book from the cart--the classrooms that she
14 could cover, the 20 periods per week. I am
15 wondering first of all, how many schools--you said
16 there are 200 that don't have libraries--how many
17 actually have a physical library that kids go to?
18 Are you including classroom libraries in that
19 number?

20 GREGG BETHEIL: The numbers I
21 shared before about 85 percent of our schools
22 having a physical library in the building, we were
23 not including classroom libraries.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So those 200
25 schools, they have no library, then in the schools

1
2 that do have a library, how many periods are
3 covered per week? How many students in those
4 schools actually get to go to the library?

5 GREGG BETHEIL: As was said before,
6 the regulation is based on the number of students
7 that are in the school with requiring students
8 have access to libraries - - one period up to the
9 full day depending on the number of students in
10 the school.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: That is not
12 exactly the question I am asking. I am asking
13 like in my school when we had 44 classes in the
14 main building and 20 periods of library, that
15 meant 24 classes did not get library at all for
16 the whole year, right, 'cause the other classes
17 would go on a weekly basis, so out of those
18 schools that you have libraries, how many kids are
19 really serviced? How many classes are serviced?
20 How many kids can go to those libraries on a
21 weekly basis?

22 GREGG BETHEIL: I appreciate the
23 Council Members acknowledgement that this is not a
24 new problem that we are grappling with and dates
25 back to well before this administration--

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM:

[interposing] 25 years, and I think another Council Member asked how long--Councilman Chair Jackson asked how long it would take to rectify it, and we were given three to five years as the answer, and I have never seen that in 25 years of teaching in the Department of Ed.

GREGG BETHEIL: I am simply thanking you for acknowledging this is a significant problem, and it is our intent to work on it. To your question specifically about the number of periods, it is going to vary by school based on their schedule, and their instructional program if there is...

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: And how will you handle annexes? We had two annexes, four classes in each annex. Those classes would have to walk over to the main building when we did have a library. Eventually there was a new principal, we had to crowd up the other classes because it became a priority, so the class size went up to about 34 and then we were able to open the library, but the annexes were never able to come over to go to the library. How would you deal

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

with annexes?

GREGG BETHEIL: Either moving the students or having an itinerant librarian serve.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: But if you don't have the periods, what do you do?

GREGG BETHEIL: If you don't have the periods, then depending on enrollment at the school, you would have to reprogram.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So that is what happens. The kids in the annex don't get library because they don't have the periods.

GREGG BETHEIL: The amount of time a student is in the library really should be based on a flexible schedule opposed to a fix schedule, so there would be a number of times throughout the year where everyone would be able to engage with the librarian within the library space, and so there is a different scheduling, so being part of the cluster isn't always the best alternative, but for schools that - - in, sometimes it is not every week--it's every other week.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: You can't have elementary school children just going to the library on their own. It's physically impossible

1
2 to just say walk down the hallway and go get a
3 book. That's like physically impossible. My time
4 is almost up. Let me just wrap up with one final
5 question if the chairs will allow me. The other
6 issue is that in your classroom libraries as well
7 was that there was no non-fiction books, well,
8 very few, limited amount of non-fiction, most of
9 them were fiction books. That may be changing and
10 I am hopeful that it is, but my question is not
11 really around that, it is more to do with library
12 book selection in general and how that is
13 determined if there is no librarian in the school,
14 and even if there is a librarian, how is book
15 selection done by those librarians in the schools
16 with a particular eye to the selection of LGBT
17 history, lesbian, gay, bisexual transgender
18 history books being put in the school on the
19 library shelves?

20 GREGG BETHEIL: I'll turn it to Mr.
21 Hasenyager, but in terms of the non-fiction
22 question, there is certainly an increasing amount
23 of non-fiction aligned with the common core
24 standards being introduced both in the classroom
25 libraries and our school libraries overall.

1
2 RICHARD HASENYAGER: So the
3 purchase of and securing of library materials is
4 guided through our collection development policy,
5 which states that librarians should be using
6 review sources in order to determine which books
7 they would like to include into their library
8 collections, and it is very much specifically
9 stated that that collection needs to mirror the
10 needs of the school, so we don't have a
11 prescriptive way of determining what books go into
12 what schools, but instead for that school to
13 determine what are their needs and to make sure
14 that whichever books they purchase align to that
15 policy.

16 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: So it's my
17 understanding--correct me if I'm wrong. I know
18 they have like a food nutrition committee in every
19 school, most schools should have if they don't
20 have a school leadership team, is there supposed
21 to be a library committee in each school - - make
22 up of parents and educators? Is that correct?

23 GREGG BETHEIL: It's not a
24 requirement, but we do recommend that.

25 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: You do

1
2 recommend it. I am not trying to put you on the
3 spot. Do you know approximately, if you know, how
4 many schools have library committees if at all,
5 and if you don't know, that is...

6 GREGG BETHEIL: And I don't know
7 that.

8 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: If it is
9 possible, can you find that out? I don't expect
10 an immediate answer. If you don't have that in
11 your offices you might have to then put the word
12 out to get the read out. Okay.

13 GREGG BETHEIL: We can do that.

14 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Okay. Thank
15 you very much. Let's turn to our colleague, Andy
16 King of the Bronx, followed by our colleague,
17 Debbie Rose of Staten Island.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Good morning,
19 and I thank you for your testimony today, and as I
20 always say always learn something new every day I
21 sit in these hearings, and I appreciate the
22 information you brought today. I want to make a
23 statement, just ask a couple of questions. Not
24 trying to throw you underneath the bus or anything
25 like that, but I heard earlier in regards to there

1
2 isn't--the laws right now really don't state that
3 it is mandated that you have a certified librarian
4 in elementary schools. Am I correct?

5 GREGG BETHEIL: That is correct.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I am going to
7 ask you if you can put it someplace on your agenda
8 to make it somewhat of a requirement. Why I ask
9 that is because elementary schools is where kids
10 actually get the standards of what it is to be a
11 student, how did they learn how to utilize what
12 the education system provides for them, and if
13 they don't understand the importance of going into
14 a library and having a librarian who can explain
15 the whole process to them, by the time they get
16 into junior high school from elementary school,
17 our library might not be important to them. So I
18 am asking you that information is transforming
19 each and every day, how do we make this a reality
20 for their young people so these have these common
21 core standards within them to appreciate
22 librarians? That is my first statement. I want
23 to just ask of you to do that and kind of mandate
24 it within your own selves to help our young people
25 learn because they know when they go to colleges,

1
2 a library is so very important, but if it hasn't
3 been instilled in them, the importance of it, they
4 will lose the essence of the importance of a
5 library, so that is the first thing. We have
6 heard a lot of things about compliance, and you
7 readily admit that you are not in compliance. So
8 my first question would be whether elementary or
9 not what kind of plans do you have to try to ever
10 get in compliance, and I heard something about
11 three to five years. can we put something
12 together that can bring those numbers down, those
13 years down? I'll stop right there before I ask my
14 next question.

15 GREGG BETHEIL: There are two
16 questions in what you asked, and I think both are
17 very important. In terms of the practical
18 differences between coming into compliance in our
19 secondary schools and in our elementary schools, I
20 think the concern that the Council has represented
21 today gives us urgency around the secondary
22 compliance issue and one we plan to work on. If
23 we talk about where we are prioritizing right now,
24 there are a range of services that are provided in
25 elementary schools right now. I mentioned in my

1
2 testimony that we begin those conversations as
3 early as our pre-K engagement with families and
4 trying to connect them with the public libraries
5 and certainly making literacy an important part of
6 it. I can't sit here today and say that we would
7 bring all of our elementary schools into
8 compliance with a regulation that doesn't exist,
9 nor require them right now, and think we need to
10 focus our attention on doing the work in secondary
11 schools and continuing to support literacy and
12 library use in elementary schools through the
13 range of supports that are currently available--
14 teachers assigned to the libraries, parent
15 volunteers, partnerships with the public
16 libraries, and in some of our elementary schools,
17 that is the hiring of a certified librarian.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you for
19 - - that. In addition, is there anything that we
20 can do at the Council that can help improve this -
21 - getting in compliance or any of the challenges
22 that you are having, other than money? Other than
23 money, is there anything that we can do to help
24 you get to where we know the system needs to go?
25 And in addition, I would also like to know, how

1
2 actively involved--we know we just talked about
3 library committees in each school. What is the
4 constant communication between the educators in
5 the library system of what they can do to help
6 improve the system and coming in compliance - -
7 delivering the services to all the kids in New
8 York City?

9 GREGG BETHEIL: I would welcome the
10 opportunity to continue the conversation with the
11 Council, I would say this, and this is some of
12 what I was trying to clarify before, and Chairman
13 Jackson, my apologies, if I wasn't as clear as I
14 could have been. We have a plan for the provision
15 of library services. We have not submitted a
16 particular part of that plan for approval to the
17 state until we clarify many of the questions that
18 were asked today. We had to submit as part of the
19 New York City school library system, a five year
20 plan to the state library system as part of the
21 requirements, and now we are looking at what does
22 it mean to implement those things as we move
23 forward. I just wanted to distinguish the
24 difference between the overall provision of
25 library services, which we do plan for and support

1 through the range of things I talked about and
2 where appropriate the narrow set of things that
3 might help us to do that more flexibly, which
4 would require approval from the commissioner. We
5 would welcome the opportunity as we continue to
6 flesh out that work over the coming months to work
7 with the Council and other partners to make sure
8 we are moving forward in concert because we agree.
9 This is a very important issue for our students
10 across all grade levels, and anything that we can
11 do in the interim as we are moving closer to full
12 compliance is going to benefit our students, and
13 also would benefit our city. Just as you
14 understand that money is tight, we believe the
15 same, but that can't be an excuse for us moving
16 forward and working to improve the services
17 provided to our students.
18

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I thank you
20 for that. Co-Chairs, I want to thank you for this
21 day's hearing. I am just going to ask you this
22 one thing. I know you are very articulate, and I
23 know there is a commitment here, but I am going to
24 ask whenever we come into road blocks on how do we
25 get things done, that we just leave that on the

1
2 side and do everything that we can to make sure
3 that our young kids, our young children and in the
4 city of New York get the best representation by
5 all of the adults that are in the room that are
6 making these decisions. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you,
8 Council Member. Council Member Debbie Rose of
9 Staten Island followed by Council Member Levin of
10 Brooklyn.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you,
12 Chair Jackson, Van Bramer and Gentile for holding
13 this very important hearing, and I thank all of my
14 council members for flushing out the questions
15 regarding the number of librarians, where they are
16 placed, and how the mandates are determined, and
17 so I just wanted to say before I ask my question
18 that I also concur with Council Member King that
19 it really seems counterintuitive and detrimental
20 to the learning experience that library services
21 are not mandated in elementary schools. It
22 doesn't actually even make sense, but with that
23 said, I would like to know do all the title 1
24 schools have librarians on staff?

25 GREGG BETHEIL: I don't have the

1
2 specific break out by title 1, but I think as we
3 have said earlier, we are not in compliance, so I
4 assume that would extend to some of our title 1
5 schools, and some of the are elementary schools as
6 well; it wouldn't be required.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And that is
8 my point. The elementary schools and they
9 wouldn't be mandated to have and you have no--you
10 can't tell me right now how many title 1 schools
11 do have library services?

12 GREGG BETHEIL: We can't tell you
13 right now. - - .

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: With the
15 disparity in reading scores in many of the title 1
16 schools, why would it not be mandated for title
17 ones to have across the board elementary, junior
18 high school and high school to have mandated
19 librarians on staff?

20 GREGG BETHEIL: As we said before,
21 it is not currently the state regulation, and we
22 are working to come into compliance with the state
23 regulation. - - .

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: My point
25 really is do you think it should be mandated since

1
2 you know, the value it has to improving literacy
3 and in regard to the test scores that have
4 demonstrated that there is a need for improved
5 literacy, why would it not be mandated or since it
6 is not mandated by law, why would it not be
7 something that would be required of title 1
8 schools, which have the bulk of them--most of them
9 are deficient in their reading schools or below
10 level?

11 GREGG BETHEIL: I am certainly
12 appreciating the Council Member's question. I
13 can't speak to the legislative or regulatory
14 intent. We need to do everything--

15 [crosstalk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing]
17 I also changed it to regulating it since it hasn't
18 been legislated.

19 GREGG BETHEIL: As I said earlier,
20 we need to do everything we can to improve the
21 literacy of our students across grade levels, and
22 we are faced in this period of constrained
23 resources with some difficult choices. I think
24 the goals that you are aspiring to are certainly
25 ones that we share.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Am I to then
3 believe that I should say to Chair Jackson that we
4 should look at mandating elementary librarians in
5 elementary schools, and specifically title one
6 schools, who have a disparate number in terms of
7 their reading test scores? Is that - - ? Chair
8 Jackson, I am making that recommendation.

9 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: I think we
10 will take that clearly under advisement and
11 consult with counsels, and I don't know whether or
12 not we can mandate that if that is not in
13 compliance with the state regulations, but we will
14 check into that.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Our
17 colleague, Vinny Gentile, said clearly we can do a
18 resolution basically expressing the will of the
19 body overall versus a law, which it may go against
20 a state regulation. You are welcome. Next we are
21 going to hear from Council Member Levin followed
22 by Council Member Dickens.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you
24 very much, Mr. Chairman, Chair Jackson, Chair
25 Gentile, Chair Van Bramer. Thank you all for

1
2 being here. I got here a little bit late. I know
3 in your testimony you addressed the issue of I
4 guess there is a lawsuit that has been filed to
5 get the Department of Education in compliance with
6 state regulation. Is that correct?

7 GREGG BETHEIL: There is a
8 complaint to the commissioner of education and a
9 separate lawsuit. Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Are you
11 negotiating with the plaintiffs at all? It seems
12 clear. If you are out of compliance, right, then
13 that is illegal. That is against the law. You
14 have to get in compliance to be complying with the
15 law. State regulation is the law. I don't see
16 anything--I don't see a game plan here. I see
17 some ideas thrown out. I don't see a game plan
18 that is hard and fast facts how you are going to
19 get in to compliance with the law, so can you
20 explain to me how are you going to get into
21 compliance with the law? It is going to require
22 hiring more librarians, right, and require more
23 money in the budget. Are you requesting more
24 money? Is there more money that is going to be
25 allocated in FY '14s budget for school libraries?

1
2 I looked at our education preliminary budget. I
3 didn't see an increase in library services. Is it
4 going up? Is FY '14 going up from FY '13? In
5 terms of money allocated in the unit of
6 appropriation for libraries, is it? What is the
7 UA for libraries?

8 GREGG BETHEIL: I don't know the
9 number, but I am sure it is pretty flat.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: It's pretty
11 flat?

12 GREGG BETHEIL: Yeah.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So it's not
14 going up?

15 GREGG BETHEIL: No.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So FY '13 to
17 FY '14 in terms of resources allocated there is
18 nothing that is a plan that is going to get us to
19 where we need to be, which is compliance with
20 state regulations?

21 GREGG BETHEIL: In one year, no,
22 and that is why we talked about it being a three
23 to five year time period.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: But if there
25 is no more money in the budget, then it is not

1 even moving forward. Say it is going to take a
2 couple of years, okay, we could probably have that
3 discussion because it's \$24 million and several
4 hundred librarians. Okay, I get it, but if you
5 are not going to increase the funding from one
6 year to the next from FY '13 to FY '14 then you
7 are not going to be able to even take that very
8 first step because money talks.

10 GREGG BETHEIL: I think that is an
11 accurate description of the financial constraints
12 we are faced with right now.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Well, that
14 is a problem, and that is I think what Council
15 Member Barron was saying was that that is up to
16 you guys. You guys have a \$19 billion expense
17 budget with the Department of Education. You
18 could reallocate--you have the discretion within
19 the Department of Education--the chancellor has
20 the discretion to allocate funding to unit of
21 appropriations that they seem necessary--that he
22 deems necessary to meet needs. I would think the
23 responsible thing to do is to make funding
24 decisions, budgetary decisions that are aimed
25 towards getting the Department of Education into

1 compliance with state law. I mean I could-- if
2 you look at the unit of appropriations for
3 charters, I can tell you how much that is going to
4 be going up from FY '13 to FY '14--about \$100
5 million. That is the increase from '13 to '14, so
6 that is not staying flat. That is going up by
7 \$100 million. The libraries are staying flat from
8 '13 to '14. That is a problem. That is a
9 question of priorities. When I asked you, you
10 said that you have already taken concrete steps to
11 improve our principals' ability to hire highly
12 qualified school librarians. These efforts
13 include allowing principals to request an
14 exemption from the DOE hiring freeze in order to
15 hire qualified librarians from outside the
16 Department. How many of those exemptions have
17 been granted by DOE?

18
19 MALE VOICE: Any time a school asks
20 to hire a librarian, we allow it.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: How many in
22 the--

23 MALE VOICE: [interposing] In the
24 last year about eight.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Eight? So

eight were requested throughout the entire - -

MALE VOICE: Eight librarians were hired. Yes.

CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Larry, that was I would assume that is for the intermediate and high school based on certification requirements. Is that correct?

LAWRENCE BECKER: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So whenever they are requested they are granted, but eight across the city, that is not a lot.

MALE VOICE: No, it is very little.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. I am going to cede the rest of my time, but I do want to just encourage you all. I don't think it is your fault to--I only have 15 seconds--I don't think it is your fault, but I want to encourage you to take a look at the DOE budget and see where costs are going up, and say hey, why are they going up by \$100 million for charter schools, \$100 million from one year to the next, and we are staying flat, and we are out of compliance with state regulation? That is a question that I think you all need to ask of the chancellor's office.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

Council Member Dickens of Manhattan?

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you, Chairs and thank you for coming in for your testimony. Do you have a timeframe to get into compliance with the state regs?

GREGG BETHEIL: We have said multiple times today that we are working to do that within three to five years.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: So in three to five years, now that leaves us out of compliance for that length of time. Are there any - - within the regulations that - - monetary damages that could be accrued if we fail to do it, and we have already failed, so we are already in the failing period.

GREGG BETHEIL: Not that I am aware of.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: You could go for ten years of not being compliant?

GREGG BETHEIL: I think as one of the council members pointed out, this is not a new problem. We have been out of compliance for a

1 while. Our schools are growing. The fact that
2 the regulation requires only partial service if
3 you have less than 700 students is a problem as I
4 mentioned before. the way to do that best is by
5 servicing schools with itinerant librarians,
6 meaning they go to more than one school. It is
7 not a particularly attractive position to recruit
8 for. So yes, I don't think there--it is not that
9 we don't want to be in compliance. I think there
10 are particular challenges that have affected us--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS:

12 [interposing] I bet your pardon. I didn't intend
13 to say that it was an intentional non-compliance.
14 What I was asking was if there was anything within
15 the regulations that if you failed to get into
16 compliance within the timeframe what happens or
17 can it just go on for an indeterminate amount of
18 years?

19 GREGG BETHEIL: The regulation
20 simply articulates the staffing requirements for
21 library services or the provision of equivalent
22 service. It does not articulate any penalties.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Alright,
24 so that means that our kids could essentially go
25

1
2 on for an indeterminate amount of time, and that
3 is an answer to your question, Council Member
4 King, without being in compliance for the
5 secondary schools?

6 GREGG BETHEIL: It would be our
7 hope to work with you to begin to mitigate that
8 problem.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: And work
10 with us for additional funding or what does that
11 mean? Is funding the main problem?

12 GREGG BETHEIL: It is certainly the
13 easiest thing to quantify in terms of what the
14 problem is, but when we talk about the pool of
15 available folks coming out of graduate schools to
16 serve as librarians some of this has been a
17 challenge for a long time, and it isn't that
18 appealing. We are not only competing with public
19 school librarians, librarians who go to school
20 want to go out and work in private schools, in
21 public libraries and a range of other things.
22 There are not 5,000 people sitting out there
23 banging down our doors to become librarians and we
24 are certainly going to have to look at how do we
25 enhance the incentives and the pathways for folks

1
2 to consider school librarianship. The work we are
3 doing with Syracuse University is a small start,
4 but those are 15 teachers that are currently
5 working in our school libraries, that we are going
6 to support in getting to that certified library
7 credential so that they are helping our schools
8 come into compliance. It is not a question of
9 waiting three to five years. it is a question - -

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS:

11 [interposing] So part of the problem is the fact
12 that there is a smaller pool available of those
13 interested in being librarians.

14 MALE VOICE: I would say that is
15 true. I would also say, Councilwoman, that to be
16 fair as council members who pointed out since we
17 have not hired many over the past couple of years,
18 it is somewhat unfair to say that if we reached
19 out now we couldn't find people because we haven't
20 been hiring anyone. I think if you look at the
21 number of people it would take to get us into
22 compliance, yes, I think you would find--you look
23 at the state education department documents they
24 publish about the number of certified librarians
25 graduated from graduate schools in the New York

1 City area and statewide, you would see that there
2 are some, but not enough. That is why I think
3 what Gregg was saying before to the Councilman's
4 question. We would love to strategize with you
5 about what are some other ways we can think about
6 individuals becoming a librarian, what are some
7 other ways we could approach the state education
8 department. The UFT is sitting right over there,
9 and they are going to get up here, and they are
10 going to talk to you about all of the things we
11 are doing wrong. I have no doubt about it, but
12 one of the things that we can do right with the
13 Council's help is think about what are other ways
14 folks can be encouraged or make it easier to
15 become a certified librarian, not to dilute the
16 quality of the individuals, but with your help, we
17 can think about that.

18
19 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Well,
20 thank you. I do strongly support the UFT because
21 they have done a magnificent job of standing to
22 the forefront for public education. Now that
23 doesn't mean against charter schools. That means
24 I support public education for my kids because a
25 public education is here for all children

1
2 regardless of their ability or their parents'
3 ability to participate within the system. Thank
4 you.

5 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: We are going
6 to turn to our co-chair, Vincent Gentile.

7 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: I just want
8 to ask before you leave that you submit to us the
9 report that you are submitting to the commissioner
10 for the equivalent service because it will be
11 interesting to see what you come up with in terms
12 of what you are asking the state to grant to the
13 city of New York.

14 GREGG BETHEIL: When that plan is
15 fleshed out, we would be happy to.

16 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: And you are
17 thinking about July?

18 GREGG BETHEIL: We are looking at
19 July, certainly this summer.

20 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Great.
21 Chairman Van Bramer?

22 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: One last
23 comment before we let you guys go, I just want to
24 say again because everyone has said it a million
25 times, and I think you know this. The importance

1 of being in compliance, the importance of having
2 certified school librarian in every school
3 including the elementary schools even if you are
4 not currently required to do so is so critical
5 because what you are asking of young students not
6 is more than ever to test, to test, to test, and
7 one of the things that librarians can do and do do
8 is to teach young people how to organize, how to
9 think, how to prepare, how to plan, and so the
10 very service, the very kind of professionalism
11 that would actually help young people prepare,
12 plan, organize their thoughts, organize their work
13 product, is one where we are severely deficient
14 and you acknowledge out of compliance, so it's
15 nonsensical to ask more of students to require
16 them to be better test takers, quite frankly, all
17 the time and then to not even though you are
18 actually compelled to do so, provide them with all
19 of the tools necessary to succeed, and that is why
20 librarians and certified school librarians and
21 certified school libraries are so important and so
22 glaring is the absence because of what young
23 people are being asked to do more and more and
24 more. It is absolutely essential that you provide
25

Librarians are those people who can and do get the job done. I just want to say that before we close out this particular panel.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Let me thank you for coming in. Let me just say earlier I was a little annoyed. Let me just say that to you. I am not as annoyed as I am now as I was before rather. I do believe that we as a system have a long way to go to be in compliance. Clearly you acknowledge that. I am glad you have a relatively new director of library services and clearly you have your job ahead of you, and clearly I think that if in fact it is true my colleague solicited a response at about 24 million or let's round it off to even 30 million for salaries to be in compliance and clearly in my opinion as he indicated within a \$19 billion expense budget - - the flexibility. Let me just give you this one example, which has nothing to do with library services. About eight years ago, I was out in Sara Gonzalez's district, and they have been fighting for a high school for decades, decades, and someone asked me a question. Why don't we

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

See you later. So ladies and gents, this is the second panel. The first was the administration. This is the second panel, and the third panel will be the library systems. So with that, you may introduce yourself, your position with UFT and/or school libraries and begin your testimony.

ROBERT ESTROWSKI: Good morning, Chairman Jackson, Chairman Van Bramer and Chairman Gentile and members of these distinguished committees. My name is Robert Estrowski, and I am the assistant secretary for the United Federation of Teachers. On behalf of our members, I want to commend the Council for convening this hearing on the topic of school librarians and to thank you for this opportunity to share our views on the subject. At a time when schools are implementing new common core learning standards and looking for ways to strengthen college and career readiness amount our students, the role of school librarians and library programs is critical. One needs only to look at the need to improve literacy and reading proficiency among our students, particularly in those high needs communities to

1 understand the importance of strong library
2 programs. We live in an information age. Our
3 students are using laptops, tablets, ereaders and
4 other mobile devices as part of their daily lives.
5 They are able to connect to anywhere in the world
6 at any time. That change in our culture has
7 changed everything about the way students read and
8 study, but while access to information has never
9 been easier, having the skills to process and
10 analyze that information is something that needs
11 to be learned. It is not enough to know how and
12 where to gather the right information. It is what
13 you do with that information. It is learning how
14 to discern what information is reliable and
15 credible and understanding how to use and
16 synthesize that information to support your work.
17 These are skills that the 21st century workforce
18 needs and qualified librarians and strong library
19 programs are key to making sure they get them, and
20 strong library programs are key to making sure
21 they get them. Recognizing this, the New York
22 State education regulations rightfully require
23 middle and high schools to have certified library
24 media specialists in their building every day
25

1
2 either on a full or part time basis. These
3 regulations also require all 7th and 8th grade
4 students to receive at least one period per week
5 in the library information skills. Unfortunately,
6 the current administration has largely ignored
7 libraries, librarians, and libraries failing to
8 fill the hundreds of vacancies that exist or
9 provide additional librarians in schools where
10 state regulations are required. System wide
11 budget cuts have also limited the resources
12 available for new materials and programs leaving
13 schools without outdated books and technology. It
14 is worth noting that the DOE has kept two dozen
15 librarians in excess instead of placing them in
16 schools where they are needed. Additionally, the
17 establishment of campuses of small schools are a
18 replacement to large schools has led to the
19 elimination of campus wide libraries because the
20 schools either need the space for classrooms or
21 aren't able to effectively share resources. In
22 some of the buildings that house a handful of
23 schools, no one could agree on who pays for the
24 services. I can go on reading, but I think I
25 won't since I heard the little bells. Chairman

1 Jackson, I feel your frustrations every day. One
2 of my responsibilities was to be the liaison to
3 the school library media chapter. I have been
4 doing that for a number of years now, and it has
5 been so frustrating because when we filed with the
6 commissioner that his regulations were being
7 violated we filed in October of a year, and it was
8 three years ago, he waited until July of the
9 following year and he made a decision that it is
10 now moot. It is now moot. The commissioner said
11 that it is moot. We filed it in October. He gave
12 us a decision in July. I went back to my folks
13 and said, hey, what is going here. We can't do
14 this. Why can't we do something? Well, maybe we
15 can go to court.

17 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: You are
18 talking about the state commissioner responding?

19 ROBERT ESTROWSKI: State
20 Commissioner John King [phonetic], who I spoke to
21 myself and said, how can you say this is moot when
22 here we are in the next year and the same thing is
23 going on? His response was, I will speak to the
24 people at the Department of Education, but I can't
25 do anything. So we then filed a second appeal,

1 and I said, well, what good is a second appeal?
2 Well, when we go to court, it will look better if
3 we have another appeal. So we filed that second
4 appeal, and we also filed in court. To this date,
5 we have had no decision from the commissioner and
6 we have had no response from the court. So it's
7 like your frustrations are what I feel, Chairman.
8

9 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: That is
10 terrible, and in fact we are going to be writing
11 to the commissioner and the board of regents about
12 their non-compliance for sure.

13 ROBERT ESTROWSKI: I would love for
14 you to do that.

15 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.
16 Next?

17 ROBERT ESTROWSKI: I'd like to have
18 Christine Hatami, who is a retired school
19 librarian, she recently retired. She was a
20 librarian at Flushing High School. Christine?

21 CHRISTINE HATAMI: Good morning,
22 Chairman Jackson and members--

23 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: [interposing]
24 Pull the mic up and turn it on please. Thank you.

25 CHRISTINE HATAMI: There we go.

Good morning, Chairman Jackson and members of this committee. My name is Christine Hatami, and I am a retired school librarian speaking on behalf of elementary and secondary school librarians serving in the New York City public schools. I have also represented school librarians for the UFT for the past seven years. I want to thank you for allowing us this opportunity to address our concerns and to briefly explain the role of school libraries and librarians. The library is the hub. The learning hub of the school. An effective school library program is one that provides equitable access to a wide variety of fiction and non-fiction books. Students coming to the library learn to select books according to their interests and reading levels. An effective school library also provides students with access to high quality electronic resources that have been carefully selected by the librarian based on the instructional needs and abilities of the students. These are materials that are required to complete school assignments while developing the 21st century skills they need to enter college and the workforce. Online searching, website evaluation,

the use of electronic databases, the ability to work with presentation tools such as PowerPoint, and utilizing proper bibliographic citation are all skills that need to be taught. The school librarian has the credentials and the expertise to teach these skills. Inquiry based learning and research projects have always been the specialty of the school library. With the flood of information that is now available, it is more important than ever that students have instructional support to ensure that the information they have is of high quality, current, and accurate. Working in collaboration with classroom teachers, school librarians teach students how to access, evaluate, use and produce information in a variety of formats. In the process, students develop critical thinking and problem solving skills, personal growth and social responsibility--skills defined by traditional library standards for many years. with the increased emphasis on technology, the library provides access to computers. For some students this may be the only opportunity to spend time building those 21st century skills. The

1 information fluency continuum, a document
2 developed by New York City school library services
3 identifies information literacy standards and
4 skills that students need from grades K to 12.
5 The standards and benchmarks cited in this
6 document are closely aligned with the new common
7 core learning standards, and it has been recently
8 endorsed and adopted by the New York State library
9 association. All New York City school librarians
10 have received professional development in the use
11 of this document. It is tragic that such a rich
12 resource is not being fully realized because so
13 many school libraries are not properly staffed by
14 the very people, certified school librarians, who
15 can contribute so much to the education of our
16 children. As we all work diligently to improve
17 the education that our students receive,
18 particularly our neediest students, I am hopeful
19 that this committee will continue to demonstrate
20 their support for school librarians and school
21 library programs throughout the city. Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you,
23 and Robert Estrowski, let me just say this to you.
24 I am glad that you mentioned in detail that the
25

1
2 frustration as a liaison for the school librarian
3 leadership, and I am glad that you mentioned about
4 the fact that UFT filed an appeal almost three
5 years ago in October and got a response back in
6 July saying the issue was moot. The issue is not
7 moot. It's an ongoing issue, and anyone that can
8 look at any documentation would know that. I am
9 really surprised and shocked if that was the
10 response. Believe me, I believe you, and I am
11 going to ask you. I have asked counsel to get the
12 documentation for your appeal, the response, the
13 second appeal. Are you in court now or was he
14 referring to--I mean you are referring to John
15 King that they were going to go into court?

16 ROBERT ESTROWSKI: No, no, no. We
17 went to court.

18 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: That is what
19 I thought. I wanted to make sure.

20 ROBERT ESTROWSKI: We went to
21 court, and I would be happy to provide you with
22 all of the documents you requested.

23 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Because you
24 were meaning that they was going to court, they
25 didn't even render a decision appropriate in my

1
2 opinion, and let me just express to you, and I am
3 sure I speak on behalf of the other chairs, we are
4 not happy with that decision, especially when we
5 know that the issue is not moot. It may have been
6 moot for that particular school year, but the
7 issue has been ongoing for years, and as the
8 statistics indicate, it has gotten worse.

9 ROBERT ESTROWSKI: And the next
10 appeal, which he never responded to at all.

11 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Let me thank
12 you. Obviously, counsels for the various
13 committees are going to be following up so that we
14 can draft a letter to the commissioner about this
15 and to the board of regents. We are not happy at
16 all. Thank you very much both of you for coming
17 in.

18 ROBERT ESTROWSKI: Thank you,
19 Chair.

20 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: I am sorry.
21 Council Member King had a question. Council
22 Member King of Brooklyn. I'm sorry Bronx. Thank
23 you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I haven't
25 made it to Brooklyn yet.

[laughter]

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: but thank you, Mr. Chair. I thank UFT for coming and sharing your testimony this afternoon now. Before I was elected, I was an organizer with 1199, the union, and I understand the importance of making sure that union is always represented, that the workers that we represent have jobs and making sure that the services that we are supposed to provide that we have quality people delivering them. I am a little bit off centered on this whole conversation when it comes down to administrations and unions from time to time because in the mist of all of this back and forth, the people who are receiving these services seem to get caught in the middle, and that is our children, and I want to ask you how can we figure out how we all can get to the table because I know sometimes when we have court issues, it kind of slows down any communications. I am trying to figure out how can UFT work with DOE in making sure that what you deliver as far as your membership can coincide with what they are required to do in DOE and not let any other thing

1
2 and whatever that thing is, you all know what that
3 thing is, get in the way of making sure that these
4 library services are delivered to our children?

5 ROBERT ESTROWSKI: I think the
6 problem clearly is when they said a number of
7 times in their testimony today we are out of
8 compliance, therefore, it is okay. we are out of
9 compliance, so what? What we have tried to do in
10 the past and we have done it with the previous
11 person who was in charge of the libraries to meet
12 with them and to come up with some kind of
13 solutions to the problem that we have without
14 providing the additional librarians because that
15 is the answer to the problem. We will try to work
16 with them as best as we can. It has been three
17 years since they have been know they are out of
18 compliance and they have not submitted an
19 alternative plan to even be approved by the
20 commissioner shows you where they are at.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: The new
22 director that is on now, has he made a commitment
23 to work with you now to figure out how to come to
24 a resolve or the last one...

25 ROBERT ESTROWSKI: The last one

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

did, and this one has not.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Has not yet.
Has UFT reached out to him yet?

ROBERT ESTROWSKI: Yes, we have.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: And no
response from him?

ROBERT ESTROWSKI: No response.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Is there
anything that we can do as a Council to help
mediate this conversation, to help move it
forward? Is there anything that you can ask of us
that we can possibly help out with?

ROBERT ESTROWSKI: I don't think
so. I think it's up to us and to them to get
together and see where we can go.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: And that
won't be three years from now we will be having
the same conversation, right?

ROBERT ESTROWSKI: Better not
believe it will not be.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Well, okay.
I know we are here. I know we - - , but again, I
just ask that--and this is no personal attack, I
just ask that the adults always come into the room

1
2 and sit down when it comes to our children and all
3 of that other stuff gets removed from the table so
4 we can have a real conversation. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you
6 Chair Gentile?

7 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Thank you,
8 Chairman Jackson. I think Ms. Hatami, you
9 answered this in your testimony, but I just want
10 to throw it out there because I hear this a lot,
11 the pushback argument a lot of times is that
12 school librarians aren't as important as they used
13 to be because children have laptops in the
14 classroom and they can do research in the
15 classroom. I think you answered that, but I just
16 want to throw that out there for you, and get your
17 response.

18 CHRISTINE HATAMI: Well, as I work
19 with students I observe their behavior on the
20 computers. They know how to Google and they know
21 how to copy and paste. Our job is to teach them
22 that that is not the most effective way to do it--
23 educational academic research, so we have to teach
24 them to evaluate the websites that they are using.
25 I have seen students taking information from chat

rooms to do their school assignments. They have to be taught that this is not appropriate. They have to be taught how to use databases. If any of you have tried a database recently, it is not Google. It has a specific search format that has to be taught. Students need to learn how to do this. We have to teach them proper quotation, proper citation procedures. They are copying and pasting and considering that adequate. We have to teach them how to be good citizens on the computers. This is essential when it comes to issues such as bullying and appropriate language on computers.

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: So proper attribution, primary sources, credible sources, all of those things--

CHRISTINE HATAMI: [interposing]
All of these things are part of the common core and part of the IFC and that is what we do.

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Right. Okay. Great. That is a good response. Mr. Estrowski, are you suggesting that you have made suggestions to DOE in collaboration with them in the past, and they have rejected those suggestions?

1
2 ROBERT ESTROWSKI: No. I am not
3 suggesting that.

4 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Okay. Okay.
5 So the impasse led to the filing and the
6 subsequent lawsuit.

7 ROBERT ESTROWSKI: Correct.

8 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: I see. Okay.
9 Thank you both for coming.

10 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Council
11 Member Dickens, and then we move to the next
12 panel.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you,
14 Chair. Just to piggyback on Chair Gentile's
15 question and subsequent statement, the school
16 librarian works in conjunction with the in
17 classroom teacher and as Chair Van Bramer had said
18 earlier that DOE is doing excessive or a lot of
19 testing of our students. The school librarian has
20 been very instrumental, and that is because my
21 sister is a member of UFT and she feels that the
22 school librarians has been very instrumental in
23 helping to teach the children how to take a test.
24 That is something they do not get off of a
25 computer. The computer does not teach that, and

1
2 in fact, the computer has in my opinion caused our
3 children not to think, so I just want to put that
4 on the table as a reason why we need to support
5 our librarians and to see to it that we get into
6 compliance as soon as possible. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you
8 both for coming in. We look forward to working
9 with you. Next the public library systems. We
10 have Jeff Roth [phonetic] for the New York Public
11 Libraries and you have Bridget Quinn Carey
12 [phonetic], COO of Queens Library Systems and
13 Richard Reyes Gavallon [phonetic] of the Brooklyn
14 Public Library Systems. Would you please come
15 forward? Ladies first.

16 JEFF ROTH: We actually thought it
17 would be more efficient if we had a single
18 statement from the three systems, and I was
19 elected to do it, if that is okay.

20 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: That is fine
21 with us.

22 JEFF ROTH: I will redo the
23 introductions even though you just did them. Good
24 afternoon, I am Jeff Roth, vice president for
25 finance and strategic initiatives at the New York

1 Public Library. Joining me are Richard Reyes
2 Gavallon, chief librarian of the Brooklyn Public
3 Library and Bridget Quinn Carey, chief operating
4 officer of the Queens Library. Thank you to the
5 Committee Chairs, Council Member Van Bramer,
6 Council Member Jackson and Council Member Gentile
7 and members of the Committees who are here today.
8 Thank you also to Speaker Quinn and the entire
9 City Council for your continued strong support for
10 New York City libraries. Today we have an
11 opportunity to touch on how public libraries
12 enhance the educational opportunities available in
13 New York City as well as updating you on an
14 innovative new program that builds on our long
15 history of supporting New York City's public
16 school system. My library NYC provides
17 unprecedented access to critical books and
18 materials to the city's 1.1 million students as
19 they learn to deeply interact with informational
20 resources are part of the common core standards.
21 New York City's three public library systems are
22 critical components of our city's educational
23 infrastructure. Working with the public school
24 system and empowering students, families and
25

educators has long been central to the mission of all three libraries. Throughout our extensive branch system, local librarians actively partner with schools and other educational providers to make the rich resources of the public library systems as accessible as possible to schools.

Last year alone, New York City public libraries conducted over 10,000 outreach sessions for New York City schools, circulated over five million youth focused items, ran a large scale summer reading program and citywide, and offered unique borrowing privileges for educators. Every day in every community they serve, public libraries provide learning opportunities for all New Yorkers. Early learning programs and story times prepare students to enter the school system.

During the after school hours, thousands of students turn to their library to help them with homework or research that deepens their school experience and helps lead them to success. Public libraries are especially critical to children of immigrant parents who even when well-educated cannot help with school work in English.

Libraries have a hand in helping displaced youth,

1 youth who never made it to graduation and those
2 preparing to head to higher education. Libraries
3 in New York City are already doing a great deal to
4 support the educational lives of our students.
5 Interestingly most people think libraries should
6 do more. When the peer research center polled
7 Americans as to what programs public libraries
8 should provide, the top response was coordinating
9 with schools to provide resources to kids. New
10 York's public libraries have worked to improve our
11 partnership with the public school system and
12 deliver even better service to the city's school
13 children. Specifically, my library NYC creates a
14 new unified catalog that integrates school and
15 public library resources without barriers between
16 them. Students can easily browse and borrow from
17 the public library's holdings from their schools.
18 They can request items to be picked up at the
19 public library. Their teachers can request to
20 have materials delivered directly to their schools
21 on extended loans. Schools and students benefit
22 greatly. The seamless access to the 17 million
23 items in the public library's circulating
24 collections strengthens and supports school
25

1
2 libraries. It provides new models of access to
3 the quality texts and primary resources educators
4 need to implement the common core in every
5 classroom. It gives school librarians and
6 teachers a much broader range of resources from
7 which to educate. Leveraging the skills of
8 trained librarians in schools and public
9 libraries, my library NYC simply offers more
10 possibilities and more chances for a student to
11 read, learn and to be inspired. In addition to
12 providing boundless access to reading materials,
13 the new shared online catalog is itself a platform
14 for innovation. Every school librarian, public
15 librarian, teacher and student can now collaborate
16 around reading lists and share commentary in a
17 uniquely student safe social network. New
18 features for this online catalog will continue to
19 be developed through expert consultation and focus
20 groups with potential users. The my library New
21 York City program was launched successfully as a
22 pilot in 2011 at 84 schools in Manhattan, the
23 Bronx and Staten Island. From the outset, the
24 program served great promise. In the first year,
25 we found that students at participating schools

were more than three times as likely as students at non-participating schools to have a book checked out from the public library. Last year with the financial support of Citibank and the additional commitment of the DOE, the Brooklyn and Queens libraries joined the pilot and it has now been implemented in 292 schools in all five boroughs and in every City Council district. Eventually, all 1700 New York City schools will be offered the opportunity to participate. As of last week, the majority of the participating schools were taking advantage of the program and 70,000 books have circulated. Response from educators and students has been overwhelmingly positive. Since its launch, we have been contacted by Chicago, Boston, Seattle, San Francisco, Sacramento and Los Angeles to explore how this could be deployed in other cities. We have worked from day one with stakeholders including students, parents, teachers, school librarians and public librarians to design and improve this program. We conducted a survey, an assessment at the end of the first year. One of the key findings was that 89 percent of teachers

1 reported that the program better equipped them to
2 teach. We also learned however that more outreach
3 and training was needed. To address this, we
4 partnered directly with the United Federation of
5 Teachers to better inform teachers about the
6 program. we look forward to continuing to work
7 closely with all of our partners, including the
8 DOE and the UFT to continually improve and refine
9 my library NYC to have an even greater impact in
10 the coming year. Libraries in New York City
11 continue to lead the nation in cutting edge
12 programs and services that serve learners of all
13 ages and backgrounds. My library NYC is just one
14 example of an innovation that leverages technology
15 and public/private partnerships to better serve
16 the public. Our vision of New York City students
17 having unmatched access to the world of
18 information paired with the best possible
19 instruction and guidance will truly help ensure
20 the greatness of New York for the next century.
21 We thank you for the past support that allows us
22 to continue to raise the bar on the way we serve
23 all New Yorkers. We will look to you again this
24 year to support us in this year's budget to keep
25

1
2 libraries and the millions of New Yorkers who
3 benefit from our services strong. Thank you for
4 the opportunity to testify and my colleagues and I
5 would be happy to take any questions that you may
6 have.

7 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you
8 very much, and Jeff, I think it is the first time
9 I think you have read in front of us, you did a
10 great job. The others chose well. I do have a
11 couple of questions, but actually the first sort
12 of thing that just jumped out at me and I know and
13 like and respect all of you, but you said we look
14 forward to continue to work closely with all of
15 our partners including the DOE and the UFT to
16 continue to improve and refine my library NYC to
17 have an even greater impact on the coming year.
18 It seems to me glaring that DC 37 is not mentioned
19 here and not in your testimony because the workers
20 who are implementing this program are DC 37
21 members and so how is DC 37 left out of the
22 testimony and out of the conversation?

23 RICHARD REYES GAVALLON: Good
24 afternoon, and thanks again for having us. I am
25 Richard Reyes Gavallon, chief librarian for

1 Brooklyn Public Library. Certainly with a program
2 that involves three of the largest libraries in
3 the country and the largest educational
4 institution in the country, we have in fact
5 reached out to DC 37. Our local has been involved
6 in some of the contractual pieces that are
7 involved in becoming a formal partner of the DOE
8 and for library's long history, we have been my
9 understanding is informal partners of school, so
10 DC 37 has been informed. We have worked with them
11 and our staff members of DC 37 I need to stress
12 are not doing anything differently than they were
13 prior to the implementation of my library NYC.
14 What my library NYC does is really provide a
15 platform for our job, for our folks to do their
16 jobs much more easily and efficiently than they
17 have already done it, but we are not doing school
18 librarian work. We are doing public library work,
19 and that has always involved a very, very close
20 relationship with public schools and home schools
21 and private schools and parochial schools.

23 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: It's good
24 to hear that it was just an oversight and that DC
25 37 is part of the discussion. I ask this question

1 with many different agencies. The MTA was here
2 talking about train safety and I asked if they had
3 spoken to the workers, who actually drive the
4 trains to talk about safety in our subway system
5 and they had said no to that question, so I think
6 it is incredibly important and then the fact is DC
7 37 was not in the testimony, so it just kind of
8 jumped out at me that you didn't... You may have
9 heard earlier and I know you have been waiting a
10 while, and this doesn't necessarily have to do
11 with you. It is really a DOE question, but given
12 that they are not in compliance and given that
13 they are working on this application as good as
14 this program is you know I do have some concern
15 that it is part of their effort to provide
16 equivalent library service, and I just would not
17 want our public libraries to be used in that
18 manner. Do you have any concerns about being used
19 in that manner?
20

21 BRIDGET QUINN CAREY: Thank you for
22 the opportunity to be here today. I am Bridget
23 Quinn Carey from the Queens Library, and this
24 program we view as an extension of the work that
25 we already do in the public schools, which is key

1 outreach to support and enhance and complement the
2 work of school libraries. As my colleague has
3 said, we are in no way attempting or wanting to
4 attempt to replace the work that the school media
5 specialists do. We as librarians, although Jeff
6 is not, but is certainly one in spirit, as we know
7 the value of school media specialists and want to
8 work hand in hand with them in partnership. So
9 yes, it is of a concern, and we would encourage
10 the DOE to hire librarians. I think that that is
11 something that we would like to see as well;
12 however, it is something that we want to continue
13 a partnership with because it is all about the
14 students; and the students need both formal and
15 informal support for their learning and the public
16 libraries provide that informal support for them
17 out of school as well as increasing access to
18 their school resources, so we view this as a
19 partnership and one that we would like to continue
20 because we think it supports students in their
21 overall learning.

22
23 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Right. I
24 am not surprised to hear you say that. I am glad
25 to hear you say that. I think the truth is we

1
2 can't marry our schools and our libraries closely
3 enough, and I for one am old enough to remember
4 the connecting libraries and schools program, and
5 the fact is my library NYC is terrific in bring
6 access and ease of access, resources and the
7 catalog and the stats are great, but it works
8 perfectly when there is a school library and a
9 certified school librarian who is able to work
10 with that. At a much earlier hearing with the
11 CEOs and presidents of the library systems,
12 another Council Member talked about the funding
13 for this program, and how much do you get from the
14 Department of Education. Now obviously it piloted
15 NYPL [phonetic], but now it is expanding. How
16 much funding do you get and how do you spend that
17 funding?

18 JEFF TOTH: This is really the
19 first year that this funding model has been in
20 place so we don't have a factual answer yet. It
21 is in development. It is really volume based. It
22 is based on how much--what level of participation
23 there is at the school, so those numbers are still
24 happening. The basic structure of the budget is
25 that the public libraries fortunately were able to

1
2 raise money with Citibank to cover the one-time
3 set up costs of the project, and we funded that,
4 and the DOE is now funding the annual operating
5 costs. Again this being the first year, we don't
6 have numbers that have come in. We modeled this
7 program. It costs about five dollars per student
8 overall, and some of it is paid directly by the
9 DOE and some of it is reimbursed to the public
10 libraries, but will have better numbers, once this
11 year is completed.

12 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: I thought
13 there was a five million dollar number.

14 JEFF TOTH: Five million was the
15 amount Citibank pledged the program, and that was
16 used for the one-time set up of the system
17 building the software and integrating the catalogs
18 of the public libraries and the school libraries.

19 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: In the
20 ongoing operating cost, you have no estimate that
21 DOE is covering?

22 JEFF TOTH: I think the best
23 estimate - - in our modeling is about five dollars
24 a student and there is about 200,000 students
25 participating this year, but it has been a late

1
2 rollout, so it hasn't been a full year of expense,
3 and some of it again, is directly within the DOE
4 library's budget and some of it is being
5 reimbursed to the public libraries for their
6 expenses.

7 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: So I
8 heard, and I don't know if it is true a rumor that
9 librarians who work on my library NYC are
10 fingerprinted. Is that true and if so, why?

11 RICHARD REYES GAVALLON: It is
12 true, and maybe one of my colleagues can jump in
13 here. My understanding as it was presented to me
14 was that for millions of years staff have been
15 going into public libraries have been going into
16 schools through these informal channels where a
17 teacher says oh, you work in my local library.
18 Why don't you come on in and talk to the kids
19 about what you guys do and so on and so forth, and
20 that has all been fine, but now because we are a
21 formal contractor or subcontractor and maybe Jeff
22 can better define these terms, there is an
23 additional level of scrutiny that is required of
24 our staff, so there is fingerprinting that has
25 been--it is voluntary among our union staff in the

1 library, so if a union staff member doesn't want
2 to participate and does not want to be
3 fingerprinted, he or she can elect not to. I will
4 say that the vast majority if not 100 percent of
5 the staff who have been asked if they want to
6 volunteer in this fingerprinting program at
7 Brooklyn Public Library at least, have agreed to.
8 Everyone understand the value of getting into
9 schools, and they just see this as a sort of a
10 minor hiccup.
11

12 JEFF TOTH: Same thing. At NYPL it
13 has been voluntary, and again, it was part of I
14 think the relationship that we are providing
15 services now to DOE schools and it falls under
16 one of the chancellor's regulations.

17 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Do any of
18 you know if when we had class and librarians went
19 in to the schools, did they have to get
20 fingerprinted?

21 RICHARD REYES GAVALLON: I don't
22 believe so. I don't believe so.

23 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: And the
24 difference now...

25 RICHARD REYES GAVALLON: That is a

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

good question. Actually, I don't know.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: I have never heard of that before, and I certainly worked at the Queens Library when we had class, and - - .

RICHARD REYES GAVALLON: You are absolutely right.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: And there have been no grievances about this program? I have a few more questions, and we are off topic, but I just have to mention to Bridget that I have certainly heard a lot and I did speak to Mr. Galante [phonetic], but the hiring out of custodial services at central library is a concern, and I would like to chat more with you guys about that because I have heard a lot about it, and obviously having worked at the central library for 11 years, and seeing the good hardworking men and women in those roles, I am very concerned about what I understand the plan to be and look forward to talking with you more about that. Obviously, this hearing is mostly about the school librarians, but suffice it to say that it is a concern, so I have some more, but I will throw it over to Council Member Gentile. Chair

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Gentile?

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Thank you.

So do students use a different card in the system?
I am not clear on how that works. Could somebody
explain?

RICHARD REYES GAVALLON: Yeah, so
we did create a new card that would replace their
normal use library card. What is unique about it
is that you can use it for checkouts both at your
school library--

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Speak into
the mic.

RICHARD REYES GAVALLON: Sorry.
Yes, so what is unique about this new card that
was developed for students is that you can use it
for checkouts at both your school library and your
public library. It is a shared bar code in all of
our systems, so you can actually use it across the
city, not just at the borough that issued the card
and at least for a Brooklyn NYPL this is our first
time that we are modeling some fines free access
for students, which we thought was an important
part of it. Queens has had - - fines in place
already, so it is a card that doesn't incur fines,

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6

7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16

17

18

19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2 than once a week then the DOE would have to treat
3 that as a budget decision.

4 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Well, for
5 example, I mean if a high school ordered 200
6 copies of the Bonfire of the Vanities, you have to
7 somewhere, you don't have that at one branch,
8 right? You would have to get personnel from your
9 system to secure those 200 copies wherever,
10 somewhere in the system I would think, right?

11 JEFF TOTH: Absolutely, and that is
12 part of the operating costs, so the logistics of
13 pulling books and moving them around the system
14 and having them delivered, that is a big part of
15 the budget, and as I have said, we have sort of
16 modeled it based on the average use by schools
17 that are participating. And we have planned for
18 that and where we need additional staff, we add
19 additional staff to handle that.

20 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: So you have
21 hired staff?

22 JEFF TOTH: In our sorting and
23 logistics facility in Long Island City, which is a
24 big enabler of the project for at least Brooklyn
25 and NYPL.

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Okay, and that is using what? The money from Citibank?

JEFF TOTH: no, that is part of the money that is getting reimbursed. That is part of the operations of the project, so being able to sort and deliver the books is part of the budget that the DOE reimbursed for.

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Okay. so that is reimbursable money? So those employees at some point are not on your budget sheet?

JEFF TOTH: No, they are. They are employees of the public library system and through the contract with the DOE, they are reimbursing for those employees.

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Okay, so do you consider them temporary employees?

JEFF TOTH: Well, I mean the project is a pilot, and we are in kind of the first year of expanded roll out. No, we have hired them not as temporary, but to work specifically on this project.

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: I see. What I am trying to get at here is that we are all fighting to restore \$106 million to the three

1 library systems, and so I am trying to determine
2 in some way even if it is a short term where there
3 is some impact on the resources that you have to
4 provide to the public by running this program
5 whether it is dedicating staff to collect these
6 requests to collate whatever needs to be done,
7 there has to be some impact on your staff that
8 this program makes, and consequently, there is a
9 ripple effect as to what they are doing for the
10 program might not be doing in their other role as
11 a public librarian?
12

13 JEFF TOTH: Councilman Gentile, if
14 I may we have to keep in mind that there is a
15 tremendous amount of overlap between the students
16 that are being served by the DOE and the students
17 who are coming into our doors every single day, so
18 you have to keep in mind that everything that we
19 are doing is that we are doing it in a way that
20 makes it actually easier for us to serve these
21 kids who work are coming into our branches, if
22 they are not coming into our branches, we want
23 them to come into our branches, so it is not
24 necessarily a pilot reaching out to a group that
25 we haven't always made it a critical strategic

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

decision to get these groups if that makes sense.

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Right, but you don't see at some point deferring personnel to complete the mission of this project that they would otherwise not be doing? I am talking about just real basics here given the fact that you are facing budget cuts too.

BRIDGET QUINN CAREY: For Queens part what we have done to help with this is most of this has been in kind support, and we view it as the service that we would also provide to any kind of school collaboration, so this is the outreach part that we would want to do anyway with the schools. As far as the logistics of moving the books around, as you know, we do have that infrastructure in place, so it has not at least at this point this is part of the pilot, it has really just ramped up and we are just starting to get a sense of what the volume and requests will be. So far it is manageable, and we have been able to manage that workload with additional hourly rate hours in there, so for our part it is manageable right now. We are incredibly conscientious of the impact that it will have on

1
2 our budget and that is a discussion that Mr.
3 Galante and I have on a regular basis is how this
4 project affects our operating, so so far, we have
5 been able to make sure that it has not led to
6 additional costs on our end that we wouldn't
7 already provide for students and for the logistics
8 of moving materials around our borough.

9 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: But as you
10 know, it sounds like it is ready for a large roll
11 out in the very near future I would guess, so you
12 are going to have to address that issue of
13 additional staff at some point if it gets to that
14 kind of a roll out.

15 JEFF TOTH: Yeah, exactly. And our
16 expectation is the additional staff would be
17 funded by the DOE if it is for the DOE project.
18 That is the agreement that the hard incremental
19 costs of running this project is covered by the
20 DOE, not absorbed within current library funding.

21 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: I see. I
22 think I am done on that. Thank you very much.

23 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: So let me ask
24 a couple of questions. So with respects to
25 understanding that how does schools if you know

1
2 from an actual experience point of view, those
3 schools approximately 200 do not have librarians,
4 how do they access this plan or have they? Or
5 they don't?

6 RICHARD REYES GAVALLON: Not yet,
7 no. The DOE sets the criteria for the schools to
8 participate and last year, this year and going
9 into next year, the first criteria is that they
10 have a library and they have a fulltime staff
11 member assigned to the library.

12 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: So they don't
13 have a full time staff member based on the
14 criteria, they won't access it.

15 RICHARD REYES GAVALLON: Speaking
16 as a parent, my daughter goes to public school and
17 having conversations with her principal, she now
18 wants to make it a priority to have somebody
19 working in the capacity of school librarian
20 because she loves the idea of the program, and as
21 a parent, not as a school administrator, I impress
22 upon her what a great service this is to have
23 books delivered straight to her door, and all the
24 other means of access that this facilitates.

25 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: So now this

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

program started I think in 2011. Is that correct?

JEFF TOTH: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: With a grant from you indicated City Corp?

RICHARD REYES GAVALLON: Actually last year was a small test pilot--not that small with 84 schools, and we actually had a foundation that supported that--the JPP Foundation.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: And I think you said it is basically about five dollars per student with about 200,000 students accessing it for about a million dollars.

JEFF TOTH: That was our projection for this year.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: A million or five million, I am sorry.

JEFF TOTH: For this year, the projection was a million 'cause the 292 schools projected to about 200,000 students.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Has it been fully implemented citywide to all of the schools? The answer is no.

JEFF TOTH: The 292 only so far.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: I guess from

1
2 an ideal point of view, this should be implemented
3 fully in all of the schools. Is that correct?

4 JEFF TOTH: Absolutely.

5 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: So in order
6 to--you talked about funding--in order for this to
7 continue at the current rate that you are now,
8 what would it cost and who is going to pay for it,
9 if you know? Even though this is not a budget
10 hearing, you may have some insight, and I am
11 asking those questions only because the issue was
12 raised by our colleague, what would it cost to
13 fully staff the system with certified librarians,
14 and the cost factor was thrown out, a general
15 guesstimate of about 24 million, round it off to
16 30 million.

17 JEFF TOTH: We don't have inside
18 access to the DOE's budget and some of it is their
19 library services budget that directly funds this,
20 but--

21 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: [interposing]
22 Which they said was not increased.

23 JEFF TOTH: Not increased, right,
24 and so but the five dollars is the model of how we
25 saw this sort of expanding, so if we reached all a

1 million kids, which is the goal, the annual cost
2 would be something like - - .

3
4 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Five to five
5 and a half million dollars. Okay. Considering I
6 think that the preliminary budget and the
7 executive budget have, I think the library systems
8 overall, how much Jimmy? 106 million reduction,
9 worst case scenario, if in fact that occurred,
10 would you be able to continue to implement this
11 realistically.

12 JEFF TOTH: I think we can all give
13 the answer to that. If we lost anything close to
14 that in our budget, the problem would be just
15 having enough staff to support any program that we
16 have at the library and having our hours open, so
17 no, this is all dependent on a good budget outcome
18 and strong support luckily that we have been
19 receiving.

20 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: So with
21 respect to certified librarians or the equivalent
22 or someone in the school, have you noticed that
23 there is difficulty from the time this program
24 started to currently to date as far as
25 communication or a reduction in the New York City

1 public schools or have you noticed any of that as
2 a result of the reduction in librarians in our
3 system? Because they indicated there were 306
4 that are currently active with X amount, I think
5 25 or something like that on leave or some other
6 type of administrative leave. Have you noticed
7 any negative experience or longer in accessing
8 more difficult to communicate with the schools as
9 a result of this program?
10

11 RICHARD REYES GAVALLON: We are
12 only working with schools who have dedicated
13 liaisons, so...

14 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: So in essence
15 you have full access for those 290 schools, I
16 think you said?

17 JEFF TOTH: Right.

18 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Alright.
19 Thank you very much.

20 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: I just
21 wanted to follow up, actually a couple of
22 questions of Chair Gentile, as I scroll through
23 and I see all of my e-mails from the New York
24 Public Library users asking us to stop cuts to
25 libraries and I am glad that the first name on

1
2 that e-mail is Mayor Bloomberg because it is Mayor
3 Bloomberg who has proposed this unconscionable cut
4 to you, not the City Council, the Speaker or
5 myself. I wanted to ask two questions. Chair
6 Gentile asked some really good questions, one
7 about the purchases in bulk and knowing a little
8 about the collections of our public libraries,
9 chances are even within the system you may not
10 have a couple hundred copies of a particular title
11 because there are a lot of hopefully high
12 circulating materials that you all have and then
13 there are some probably less highly circulating
14 materials you have, but we buy them in different
15 quantities for different reasons at different
16 times, so if a school requires or requests a
17 significant amount that goes beyond what you even
18 have in the collection, and by that I mean the
19 entire system's collection, do you buy more
20 materials for those requests and if so, how do we
21 pay for that?

22 JEFF TOTH: So with both last year,
23 the 84 schools, the support we received from the
24 private sector, the Foundation provided a few
25 dollars that could go to the collections budget,

1
2 and then this year with Citibank's funding some of
3 that dollars was available for the collections
4 budget, Beyond that we are not adding to the
5 collections budget based on requests, so that is
6 something that you know as this project continues
7 to grow we would look to do and hopefully could be
8 successful in finding some private support for
9 that, but we don't have it within our budgets to
10 buy new collections based on requests from the
11 schools.

12 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: But so
13 with whatever that percentage is of the budget
14 that is for materials, you just go and buy
15 materials that you think are useful to the
16 collection or could be requested? You are not
17 actually buying materials to match requests?

18 MALE VOICE: Exactly. And we
19 should point out with the common core standard
20 that we are talking about maximizing the public
21 library material that to your point doesn't
22 circulate as much as probably Bonfire of the
23 Vanities, so we are talking about science and math
24 and things typically, language might be too strong
25 a term, but it's not high demand material, so to

1
2 be honest what this program does is actually help
3 our operating dollars, our collections dollars
4 work harder because our material is getting used
5 more.

6 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: You
7 mentioned the processing facility in Long Island
8 City, which obviously we are happy to have in my
9 district, but you said that that was for the hub
10 of the distribution network, but I thought that
11 Queens Library does not participate in the Long
12 Island City processing center, so I am assuming
13 that Queens Library does it differently, and New
14 York and Brooklyn do participate in the Long
15 Island City processing center. Is that correct?

16 BRIDGET QUINN CAREY: That is
17 correct.

18 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: How do you
19 do it, Bridget, differently than the other two?

20 BRIDGET QUINN CAREY: The way that
21 we are processing the requests that get directly
22 sent to the schools is that the requests come into
23 the central library and they are processed to be
24 sent out via UPS to those individual schools. UPS
25 is the vendor we are all using, but because we

1
2 have our own shipping infrastructure and New York
3 and Brooklyn are putting theirs together, that is
4 working for us. So that a request would come in,
5 and just an example to your previous point too, is
6 we had a request that came in from one of the
7 teachers participating in a school for 34 copies
8 of a particular book, and it happened that
9 throughout the library system, our 62 libraries,
10 that all of those copies were on the shelf, so we
11 were very happy to pull those together for that
12 teacher and make those available for that teacher
13 as a classroom set, titles that wouldn't otherwise
14 circulate, so it was good for them and good for
15 us, and we put those together in a packet and sent
16 them out to this teacher.

17 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: But just
18 having said that, and knowing a little bit about
19 our systems that is an enormous undertaking, so if
20 you have got 34 copies, and they are in 22
21 different libraries throughout the borough of
22 Queens, right, you have got to get those 34 copies
23 in 22 libraries pulled and then shipped to central
24 where then they are collated or organized and then
25 shipped via UPS to the school in question.

BRIDGET QUINN CAREY: But as you know, every library gets a list every morning of the materials that they need to pull off of the shelves, so that is part of their regular routine. So for some libraries it may have been an extra book or an extra two books, but it just went into the overall shipping logistics that we have in each library every day. When they come to central because we have got that so streamlined with our process and logistics, it really did not add a lot of burden to that considering the hundreds and hundreds of books that come in every day or thousands of books that come in every day through our shipping department. Those additional books didn't really put on a strain, and we have created a workflow with our head of logistics, who is a master at these things to put together a way to do that seamlessly without a burden on the staff.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Who is the head of logistics?

BRIDGET QUINN CAREY: Mr. Daly [phonetic].

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: I thought that is who you were referring to.

BRIDGET QUINN CAREY: He has been very helpful in making sure that it is as efficient as possible. As you know, he is very sensitive to demands of time of his staff. For us, that has been working very well, and we are happy to provide those and get the circulation.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: I know Mike Daly well. He is a very sensitive man. To get to the cost of the shipping piece, right 'cause at Queens library anyway, there is a terrific and dedicated, talented team of individuals who drive the very pretty orange trucks all over the borough, deliver books and pick up books, but you said this is done differently, no, through...

BRIDGET QUINN CAREY: Once they come to central and are processed, the ones that are going to the schools are put aside to send via UPS, and that--

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER:
[interposing] Is that much more costly than though UPS?

BRIDGET QUINN CAREY: It is, but that is the cost that is being borne or reimbursed

1
2 by the Department of Education, so the rest of it
3 is embedded within our existing infrastructure,
4 but once they come to central and are processed
5 essentially like any other book would be that
6 would go out to a borrower requesting library, the
7 ones that are going to schools are set aside and
8 put together for UPS.

9 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: This is my
10 last comment. No one loves our public libraries
11 more than I do. Absolutely nobody. So I think
12 what you are trying to do, what we are trying to
13 do is always expand access to more programs, more
14 services, absolutely wonderful given the fact that
15 you are facing a \$106 million budget cut, which is
16 unconscionable. My concern about this program is
17 that to expand it fully for it to be everywhere it
18 will cost a lot of money, and for you to bear even
19 one penny of that cost is equally unconscionable
20 to the \$106 million cut you face today. So the
21 DOE is on the hook for this. They are strapped.
22 Their budget for libraries and school libraries is
23 strapped. So are we sacrificing one thing to do
24 another, and I just have a lot of very serious
25 questions because we are talking about this huge

1
2 roll out of this massive program that has cost
3 associated with it when the DOE hasn't hired a new
4 school librarian and there are 200 schools without
5 libraries, and you guys just cannot be used as a
6 way to get around providing basic school library
7 services and long term, I think there is real
8 issues with concern because if some of the private
9 funding bails, there is no long term commitment
10 from city - - also hugely based in my district,
11 but there is just a lot of questions about this.
12 It is sort of a great intent, but then a lot of
13 questions and the three public library systems
14 should not be left holding the bag with this huge
15 infrastructural thing, which does have an impact
16 on your staffs. It just does. So I just want to
17 say that on the record. No disrespect to anyone,
18 but I just have a lot of serious questions about
19 the long term viability and affordability and the
20 path to this and the public libraries, which are
21 amazing institutions that do amazing work given
22 what you all deal with all the time, and then to
23 be asked to do even more from the very same folks
24 who are proposing to decimate you is slightly
25 ironic and more then problematic. So Chair

Jackson?

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Let me thank you for coming in. This seems like it is going to continue in the executive budget hearings - - coming up pretty soon, but obviously, we appreciate you coming in, giving testimony about this very important issue about school libraries and the lack of school librarians in the system and the impact it has on the New York Public Library System, the Queens Public Library System and the Brooklyn Public Library System. Thank you all for coming in. Thank you. The final panel is Jessica Hawkman [phonetic] from Pratt Institute, Christian Zubrisky [phonetic] from the Urban Libraries Unite and Tula Junini [phonetic] from the Pratt Institute and John Monahan [phonetic] from the Regents Advisory Council on Libraries. So you can give it to the sergeant at arms as soon as he is finished here. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Mr. Chairman, I just want to mention that we have a letter from new York Library Association that we are putting into the record, and they advocate also for certified librarians in the elementary

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

schools.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

Okay, so with that, we have John, Tula, and Christian and Jessica. So in any order that you deem appropriate or maybe in the order that I called it. It depends on the four of you. Pull the mic up and give your name and position and you may begin your testimony.

TULA JUNINI: Okay. Thank you. I am Tula Junini, dean of the school of information and library science at Pratt Institute, and I have my little testimony that I am going to read.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Before you do that, can we just introduce the other individuals and their positions?

CHRISTIAN ZUBRISKY: Sure. My name Christian Zubrisky. I am the executive director of Urban Librarians Unite. We are a not for profit corporate here in the city to support libraries and librarianship.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Next?

JOHN MONAHAN: I am John Monahan. I am recently retired school library system director, and I am a member of the Regents

Advisory Council on Libraries.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Is that the New York State Board of Regents?

JOHN MONAHAN: Yes, New York State Board of Regents, and it is the RAC it's called.

JESSICA HAWKMAN: Hi. I am Jessica Hawkman. I am an assistant professor at Pratt Institute School of Information and Library Science and I am also the coordinator of the school library and preparation program.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Okay, thank you. At Pratt. Okay. Alright, Tula?

TULA JUNINI: Okay. Thank you for inviting me to speak today at this meeting, and I am grateful for this opportunity. As dean of Pratt School of Information and Library Science, I will present some new perspectives on the questions at hand, and then we will introduce Jessica Hawkman, our coordinator, and we will speak to today's topic informed by her many years of experience in preparing certified school librarians. I have a few points. It is going to be a little bit of a bullet point present. First, a new vision for school libraries in the 21st

1 century digital world steps forward. Today we
2 meet to address some key questions related to the
3 lack of school librarians in New York City public
4 schools. Importantly, we are asking these
5 questions now because in today's information
6 society, the world of teaching and learning has
7 changed dramatically and the good news is that it
8 presents New York City public schools with
9 exciting and expanding opportunities to meet
10 student learning objectives and outcomes. The
11 solutions are there for the taking if we have the
12 courage and commitment to approach these questions
13 with new vision and innovation. We have done the
14 research. The reports are in. We know the
15 problems and the issues and some say we are facing
16 an educational crisis. We wonder where has all
17 the learning gone and how can we better prepare
18 our students to be full participants in the 21st
19 century workforce? Viewed in this context, school
20 librarians become an essential part of the
21 solution, but what does this new vision look like,
22 how can we get there, and can we afford it? Some
23 of the key concept ways of thinking, classroom
24 teachers and library teachers, certified New York
25

1 City school librarians are certified New York City
2 teachers. That is fantastic, and that is really
3 critical because it is very similar in much the
4 same way you have academic librarians or faculty.
5 In both cases, the librarian is first and foremost
6 a teacher who has primary responsibility for
7 students achieving academic excellence. School
8 libraries are not public libraries. Why? Because
9 school libraries serve specifically the student
10 learning objectives and outcomes of the New York
11 City public schools and our learning space is
12 integral to the school's learning architecture.
13 Today's public school students desperately need
14 the individualized learning and mentoring provided
15 by certified school librarians. Students need to
16 be both classroom and independent learners to
17 succeed not only in high school, but to be
18 prepared for success in college. Student learning
19 in the classroom is not student learning in the
20 school library. Both are essential ingredients to
21 students' success and are pillars of an effective
22 learning environment. Key steps we at Pratt are
23 ready to take the first steps. One, create and
24 test a new model for the school library as a

1 learning and digital resource lab. That was a
2 fast three minutes. Should I just zoom ahead? I
3 will just say briefly the school--so this is not
4 your mother's or grandmother's school library.
5 The school library is the ideal place to create a
6 new vision of participatory interactive learning
7 for the digital world. What is new about this
8 vision? We have re-conceptualized the school
9 library as a learning and digital resource lab.
10 Students are engaged in directed learning
11 specifically addressing their individual learning
12 needs and enjoy a place where they practice and
13 apply their knowledge, skills and creative
14 thinking and become acculturated to academic
15 space. We often ask when students move from high
16 school to college, do they have the individual
17 learning and study skills, the research and
18 inquiry skills sought by higher education? We
19 need to start now to answer this in the
20 affirmative. Create digital resources to meet
21 needs of New York City public school students.
22 Rather than purchasing materials from vendors,
23 expensive but not very effective, classroom and
24 library teachers create and assemble digital
25

resources that speak directly to learning objectives and outcomes. Through this model the school library is transformed as a place to be and to become. Costs will be reduced while learning is increased. Digital collections and services offer great budgetary savings and the same time avoid the purchase of physical materials that sit unused. Support student use of digital tablets to give them access to learning materials and activity both during and after school. In this way the learning resource divide is addressed as it puts learning materials in the hands of students so that each student has equal access to materials. When students leave school, the learning environment goes with them. Place certified school librarians with a new 21st century vision in New York public city schools. This vision is exemplified in Pratt's school library curriculum and is made real by the many graduates of Pratt school library program working in New York City public schools. School teachers who would like to be school librarians take Pratt's 18 credit advanced certificate program featuring a curriculum that responds to the challenges of 21st

1 century learning. Retrain current school
2 librarians as needed for the new school model
3 library. Supplement school library workforce.
4 Engage students in Pratt's library program as
5 interns to work in New York City public schools,
6 and in sum, taking these steps, we create a
7 renaissance of student learning that will surely
8 be reflected in overall in individual student
9 achievement and outcomes. We need to begin now to
10 test and grow this model. It is time to take the
11 first steps.
12

13 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: thank you.

14 Next please.

15 JESSICA HAWKMAN: Hi. I am going
16 to kind of build on some things that the dean
17 spoke about. I am going to kind of summarize my
18 testimony because it is rather lengthy. As the
19 coordinator of Pratt Institute's - - school
20 library program, I am delighted to speak today on
21 the future of school libraries within the New York
22 City public schools. At this pivotal moment, we
23 need school librarians more than ever. We have
24 heard a lot today about the common core standards,
25 creating this new challenging level of work and

1 school librarians are really poised to help and
2 they are in short supply. I see this shortage as
3 related to a pervasive nostalgic view that we hold
4 of the school library as this silent silo full of
5 books. This notion has to be set aside if we want
6 to realize the vision of the New York State
7 regents which - - the library as a school hub
8 where librarians and teachers to work as partners
9 to support student learning. When teachers and
10 librarians collaborate across disciplines, they
11 are actually modeling the kind of work that the
12 common core is asking our students to do, and I
13 think this is extremely important because they are
14 combining curricular content and research
15 processes with technology to create knowledge from
16 information, which is exactly what the common core
17 is asking of our students. I am going to tell you
18 a little about becoming a school librarian at
19 Pratt, which is similar, but not identical to
20 other schools in the area. At Pratt we prepare
21 school library candidates who are capable of
22 administering and teaching in the school libraries
23 we need right now. We currently have two paths to
24 certification, and I included a little handout for
25

you as an appendices to my testimony so you can kind of take a look at that at your convenience, but basically the two paths, one is a full masters of library and information science, which includes a focus on coursework relevant to school librarians, classes in pedagogy, working with technology, providing instruction, and then we have a second path that we call the post masters, which is for folks who already have a masters of library science so that they can earn the credentials they need to become a school librarian, and the dean alluded to a third program that we are exploring which would help people who already have teaching certification get the library piece that they need to work in a school library. Our curriculum really focuses on three major areas, which we view as the cornerstones to the 21st century library literacy, textual literacy, information literacy, digital literacy, supporting all students, meaning students of all different backgrounds, all different types of access to academic discourse, varying abilities and learning styles, so we emphasize culturally relevant pedagogy, differentiated learning and the

use of technology. Field experience is a huge part of our program. All school library students in the state of New York are mandated to do 100 hours of observation in school libraries and they then do 40 full days of student teaching, 20 in elementary, 20 in secondary schools, and then they also take all of the necessary exams to become a certified teacher, workshops in child abuse identification, school violence, and what else? It typically takes about two years to complete that degree--the post masters a little less time. So what is the outlook for my students when they graduate? To speak to my students or their mentors, you would never know there is a shortage of school librarians. In fact, as I prepared this talk every time I mentioned it to someone, they gave me a really quizzical look. Having said that, my students have a very strong rate of employment. We have a small program, but 100 percent of our students have found employment over the last three years either in a public school library or a related field, so maybe a private school, maybe a curriculum writing position, but all in education. But these jobs are really hard

won. When I am in the field, I hear from librarians and graduate students that jobs feel scarce and tenuous, and the best school librarians spend a lot of time defending their position as advocates of library programs. I also see them working tirelessly on admissions committees, curriculum committees, in other roles of school leadership, yet despite those efforts, budgets are tight, spaces is at a premium, classroom instruction is the focus of our test driven culture, and when cuts are made, the librarian is always the first to go. Every fall, I also receive a few calls from public school principals requesting in terms to staff their elementary school libraries. The principal wants my students to work for free without any supervision doing the exact same tasks they are in a master's program that requires 45 credits and certification credentials to do, and often I am told, this is such a great opportunity for your students, and I just find this presumption outrageous. We would never, never tolerate this claim from any other area of certification. Imagine if a math teacher was asked to work on their first day of graduate

1 school in a math classroom and just told, go. The
2 perception that the work of the school librarian
3 can be done by a solo grad student speaks to this
4 nostalgic notion we have of school libraries as
5 places where books are just stamped and stored.
6 School libraries are dynamic learning spaces and
7 librarians are teachers and multiple research
8 studies have demonstrated that when principals
9 have a limited awareness of the role of
10 contemporary school librarians they will not
11 prioritize the librarian as a staffing concern;
12 however, the same studies demonstrate that when
13 principals support school libraries, programs
14 flourish and this has a positive impact on student
15 achievement, and I should also add, I see a silo
16 effect not just in the school libraries, but even
17 in the way we think or professional development.
18 I think it would be very interesting if sitting
19 here with us today were some principals who could
20 talk fantastic high school programs, school
21 library programs or maybe why they don't have a
22 school librarian because that is an important
23 piece. If the librarian is just alone in the
24 library, we are not really again modeling that
25

collaborative spirit that our students really need to see to succeed. So I am not going to read this section on the benefits of school libraries. You can enjoy that on your own, but I will say that the highlights are that the library is a collaborative space, which I think everyone has sort of mentioned a lot today. This is a huge benefit of school libraries. Libraries positively impact student achievement and even when the data is disaggregated for free and reduced lunch librarians still demonstrate effectiveness in increasing test scores and this really speaks to the equity issue that school libraries are really a place where students who had the least amount of access to academic tools and academic discourse in their homes and communities, the school library is a place where those needs can really be met. I should also say that independent schools are definitely not cutting their libraries, and even when they acquire totally digital collections and get rid of print materials, they actually hire more librarians. An example is the Cushing School, and in my bibliography I link to a podcast you can listen to about that. They hired four

1 librarians when they went completely digital. So
2 I also talk in my testimony, which you can enjoy--

3 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: [interposing]
4 I am sorry. You are going to have to conclude.

5 JESSICA HAWKMAN: In conclusion, in
6 order to fully realize the potential of school
7 libraries we really need to address the shortage
8 of school librarians. Some strategies include
9 publically recognizing the library as a shortage
10 area--that is not articulated on the DOE or the
11 union's website--require certified school
12 librarians at both the elementary and the second
13 level to increase preparedness to do high school
14 level work, recertify classroom teachers who are
15 currently working in school libraries as
16 librarians so they have the special skills
17 necessary to support student learning, and finally
18 as I mentioned before, administrative support and
19 awareness of what libraries do. It is not enough
20 for us in this room to advocate for libraries. We
21 need principals to understand why the school
22 library is such an important space and the
23 librarian is such an important role. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: So before you
25

1
2 begin, I don't know if you identified even though
3 way in the beginning you did. Can we get your
4 name?

5 JESSICA HAWKMAN: My name is
6 Jessica Hawkman, and I am an assistant professor
7 at Pratt Institute School of Information and
8 Library Science, and I am the coordinator of the
9 school library program at Pratt.

10 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Did you
11 submit your testimony in writing as of yet?

12 JESSICA HAWKMAN: Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: You did? Who
14 is next please? Thank you.

15 JOHN MONAHAN: Chair Jackson, Chair
16 Van Bramer and Mr. Gentile, it is a pleasure for
17 me to be here today as a representative of the
18 RAC. The RAC has been around since 1894. There
19 is no original members left of course, but there
20 are 12 of us appointed by the commissioner of
21 education and passed on by the Board of Regents,
22 and we all have held administrative positions--
23 mine recently I retired from. This morning I
24 speak to you as a lifelong New Yorker and career
25 educator, who began as a social studies teacher

1 and continued for years as a certified school
2 library media specialist at the high school and
3 elementary levels later as a school district
4 administrator at two large districts with
5 responsibility for libraries and computers. Our
6 library programs were led by certified school
7 library media specialists. These school
8 librarians viewed themselves as teachers first who
9 as instructional leaders were committed to
10 partnership with classroom and content area
11 teachers in the design of curriculum and in the
12 integration of technology for quality instruction.
13 On superintendents' conference days, these school
14 librarians assume leadership roles by volunteering
15 to offer staff development workshops and
16 professional trainings in the areas of research,
17 inquiry based learning and technology. A few
18 years later upon assuming a regional leadership
19 position as a school library system director, I
20 worked to promote greater awareness of the
21 multifaceted and evolving role of the school
22 library media specialist or school librarian in
23 this relatively new century. Now knowledge of and
24 leadership in the integration of emerging
25

1 technologies, the awareness of new dynamic
2 informational databases, the incorporation of web
3 2.0 tools for student learning and with
4 responsible active role in implementing the common
5 core standards, the school librarian today not
6 only welcomes these opportunities for more visible
7 involvement in the overall school program, but the
8 librarian should also receive a greater level of
9 awareness of this expanded role from teacher
10 colleagues and from administrators who worked
11 collegiately in the school program of 2013. I
12 will jump down to halfway down on page two and
13 refer to the New York Library Association
14 Conference last year where everybody who
15 participated in the vision 20/20 plan for library
16 services had a chance to work with the seven
17 library groups including the school library group
18 and decide what would be the top priorities from
19 the original 60 down to 22, what you have in front
20 of you, in print. In the school library area
21 recommendation ten was unanimously passed and
22 endorsed, and it calls for a common core learning
23 standards, a statewide information fluency
24 curriculum and such a framework with the help of a
25

certified school librarian will further the school's ultimate goal of preparing students beginning at the elementary level with the literacy and digital skills knowledge base needed for career or college. Prior to -- progress to date is very favorable as about 36 of the 41 school library systems in New York state including New York City have endorsed this. As a matter of fact the empire state information fluency continuum originated in New York City school library system and we thank them very much for that. And you can imagine as you follow along, there is much benefit in teaching skills of inquiry and implementation through the CCLS classroom instruction project based learning with a collaboration of a librarian and a teacher. Now unfortunately, recommendation 11 is the problem area, and that calls for expanding the existing commissioner's regulations 91.2 to require an elementary school librarian in every school to strengthen instructional leadership, et cetera, and to support the common core. After experiencing the enthusiasm of recommendation ten, it is disappointing to read CR 91.2 in the present

1
2 format these regulations were last addressed in
3 1971 and 1972. They have been in the
4 commissioner's regulations since '73--over four
5 decades. Now when you think about it 40 years
6 ago, web based online data bases, use of the
7 internet and the availability of computers in
8 instructional design were not part of the world of
9 1973. The library was a place where students
10 visited at the elementary levels a weekly library
11 class while at the secondary level it was a place
12 to get a book or get information for a report, and
13 then really leave essentially. It is not like
14 that today where students go to the library often,
15 they go as needed and they can access the library
16 collection and online databases from the classroom
17 or from their home computer on a school night or
18 even in the middle of a vacation. This type of
19 library in 1973 had one search engine--a card
20 catalog, and it is really difficult to find in
21 2013. It would certainly not serve to prepare a
22 secondary school student for college and career
23 readiness in a 21st century world. There is really
24 a mandate that this time to talk about the
25 advantages of an elementary librarian at each

1 elementary school and expand the present
2 commissioner's regulations 91.2. We know research
3 has told us since the 1990s that students learn
4 more effectively through the constructivist
5 approach where the program of instruction is
6 focused more on the individual, on his or her
7 unique learning style and not on the more
8 traditional approach of one size fits all. This
9 realization is so important to the power of the
10 school librarian teacher collaboration. The
11 learning styles of individual students in a
12 classroom are not the same in this collaborative
13 instructional process between school librarian and
14 teacher should result in a lesson design richer in
15 resources and approaches to achieve a successful
16 learning outcome. At this time in New York state
17 there are many school districts that employ school
18 librarians at the elementary school. These
19 districts value the significant instructional role
20 of this librarian and the collaborative process
21 and in curriculum design. Educational leaders
22 have also shared with me that they support the
23 important role of the school librarian and the
24 successful implementation of the common core
25

learning standards and in the successful articulation of the K-12 library media program. The best school libraries are fully integrated into the p12 learning experience, and they are truly at the hub of the school's learning program. In bringing these comments to a close, it is important to recall the school library impact studies that were mentioned this morning. This research conducted in 22 states has proven a direct relationship between the presence of a full time certified school librarian and students' performance on standardized tests. A more significant study though impacting New York state is the impact of school libraries on student achievement and this is produced through the comprehensive center of New York. The blue links by the way, the links I have, you are all going to receive the electronic copy of this, so you can follow this on your own time, but specifically the comprehensive center showed that the librarians play a considerable role in the successful implementation of the Regents' reform agenda for New York State, specifically school librarians assist in strengthening teacher effectiveness and

1 school leader preparation. They supplement early
2 childhood education. They held to raise
3 graduation rates for at risk students. They
4 provide professional development and support for
5 aligning curriculum to standards and for
6 partnering with teachers to prepare students at
7 all levels for high quality assessments. I would
8 ask you when you have some time to take a look at
9 some of the input from people that are part of
10 this report on these links and hear what they are
11 doing in their libraries. One is Baldwin's Field
12 [phonetic] School District near Syracuse. Another
13 one is an article poised to partner the 21st
14 century librarian role, and finally, one of my
15 former librarians from Henry Cutson [phonetic]
16 talking in two and half minutes about her
17 collaboration with an English teacher and how they
18 talked to and planned with their sophomores. I
19 want to thank you very much for this opportunity
20 to speak before you. The RAC is preparing to do
21 our report in June before the Board of Regents and
22 we are looking for an endorsement of the statewide
23 curriculum, and we are also looking for some
24 movement in the areas of expanding the
25

commissioner's regulations to include an elementary librarian.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Next please.

CHRISTIAN ZUBRISKY: Once again my name is Christian Zubrisky. I am the executive director of Urban Libraries Unite. We are an independent not for profit corporation who exists to support libraries and librarians here in the city. I would like to thank the Committee for Cultural Affairs, Libraries and International Intergroup Relations, the Committee on Education and the Select Committee on Libraries for having me here today. I appreciate the opportunity to speak on this important issue. I should tell you at the outset, I am not an impartial witness. I am the product of the efforts an incredible public school librarian. In middle school, like many, I was bullied often quite a lot. I was intellectually curious, but bored at school. I had few friends, but lots of books. My school librarian discovered me and her library was where I developed the basis of a lifelong fascination with knowledge. I also learned to be me, to stand up for myself and to stick up for those who had it

1 even worse than me. Mrs. Blonden [phonetic],
2 wherever you are right now, this one is for you.
3 What is the role of the librarian? What is the
4 role of the librarian in the public school? The
5 library has the potential to be the intellectual
6 hub of the school and the librarian its creative
7 life spark. A good library can radiate out to
8 influence all classes in all grades of any school.
9 It can be a place of formal instruction, of
10 education resources, a - - meeting point and an
11 area of common exploration. The librarian is an
12 essential driving force in this. 20,000 books
13 without a librarian is just a really big pile of
14 books. 200 books with a trained and dedicated
15 librarian is a functioning library. The top
16 private schools in the country are not doing away
17 with school libraries. Philips Exeter Academy
18 [phonetic] in New Hampshire has a library that is
19 nine stories tall. While not every student needs
20 this kind of bounty, the reality is that this,
21 ladies and gentlemen, this is a question of
22 equity. Our students are being given short shrift
23 on what has always been seen as an essential
24 academic resource and the principle reason for
25

this is only due to a hopefully temporary embarrassment of budget shortfalls. There has been some attempts to cover these problems with half measures. There is a widespread use of classroom libraries in New York public schools, and with the respect for Councilman Dromm, these are ineffectual. They lack breadth and they lack range and they do not have the essential spark of curation that a trained library professional provides. When you take away the central library in a school, you lose the common intellectual meeting ground. You also take away individual anonymity. Students cannot explore the stacks and make selections in the private confidence in the librarian, but must make their choices in these classroom libraries, they must make their choices in full view of classmates. Now many students will not touch a book of any kind in front of peers, let alone one on controversial or personal issues. There are also those who suggest that volunteer parents or teachers can fill the gap. While these individuals are doubtless best intentioned, they cannot bring the training and time commitment of a dedicated fulltime library

1 professional. This is a common theme when it
2 comes to staffing libraries, and I have yet to
3 hear anyone suggest that we use volunteers to run
4 our banks or try our cases in court. I run an
5 organization made up entirely of volunteers,
6 myself included, but let me tell you folks, it is
7 like herding cats. Volunteers do not provide the
8 same reliable coverage over a range of time and
9 dates. Let's be honest. It is fun to do story
10 time with the little ones, but it takes a trained
11 professional to teach a class on internet safety
12 to 30 bored teenagers on a Friday afternoon.
13 Ladies and gentlemen, we have the potential for a
14 renaissance of school libraries in the city.
15 There are hundreds of recent masters in library
16 science graduates who did not do the school media
17 certification in our fair city just waiting to
18 start their professional careers, we haven't been
19 hiring any public librarians for the last few
20 years. These folks are hanging fire [phonetic]
21 and they are a resource that is just waiting on
22 the vine for us. If we can tap into this pool and
23 offer them certification through low or no cost
24 programs at our four excellent library science
25

1
2 departments within the city, the Palmer School at
3 LIU Manhattan campus [phonetic], St. John's
4 University, Queens College and of course, Pratt
5 Institute, and then pipeline them into our
6 schools, we could see an entirely new landscape of
7 libraries. I would like to ask you for your aid
8 and leadership in bringing access to a trained
9 library professional to every single student in
10 every single New York City school. Thank you for
11 your time today.

12 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you
13 very much. I just want to take executive
14 privilege because you are a constituent of mine,
15 Christian, and you were the very last person to
16 speak, so you waited three and a half hours, but
17 as much as we have worked together and as well as
18 we have come to know each other, I actually think
19 I learned something new about you in that
20 testimony, which only increases my already very
21 high regard for you and the work that you do, and
22 I thought it was perfect. You know, I love
23 librarians and I love libraries, and I want to
24 thank Jessica because a librarian would have an
25 appendix with a bibliography to her testimony

1 before the City Council, so I thank you for that.
2 Another reason why we love our librarians and
3 library professions. So I just want to say thank
4 you to all of you for sticking it out, for waiting
5 and for caring as much as you do about this issue.
6 I think a lot will come out of this hearing. I
7 know I am extremely energized to work on the
8 certified school librarian issue in elementary
9 schools and probably everyone else who was here
10 today and needless to say we will continue to
11 fight for our public librarians as well,
12 Christian, who are currently facing an enormous
13 and horrific potential reduction in funding. I
14 don't know if anyone else has anything else to
15 say. I will throw it to Chair Jackson first.

17 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you. I
18 don't know if all of you were here for the full
19 testimony of the Department of Education?

20 MALE VOICE: Yes, I was.

21 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Can you
22 please--more specifically concerning what UFT had
23 to say that they filed an appeal approximately
24 three years ago in October and subsequently got a
25 response back from the commissioner saying that

1 the issue was moot. So really, John, since you
2 serve on the Regents Advisory Council, what was
3 your reaction to that information, and were you
4 aware of that? I don't know if you were on at
5 that particular time, but it was to me outrageous
6 that that was the response of the commissioner,
7 and as all of you know, and you can comment, the
8 fact that I asked for - - you are out of
9 compliance, were you sanctioned, were you fined,
10 was there any penalty? Nothing whatsoever, so
11 clearly to me, if there is no penalty there is
12 really no incentive for them to get into
13 compliance, so if you can comment, John, and
14 anyone else on anything regarding DOE's testimony
15 regarding the fact that the certified librarians
16 are getting less and less and less. When they are
17 retiring they are really in essence are not being
18 replaced, and that the decisions are left up to
19 the principals as to their particular individual
20 school budgets. You have heard Council Member
21 Barron ask a question and he got a broad response-
22 -24 million, and I said up that to 30 million, and
23 out of a \$19 billion expense budget, that is
24 grains of sand comparatively, so please comment,
25

John and others.

JOHN MONAHAN: First of all, I was very disappointed because that is a lapse of time that is significant in the life of a student when you think about it. I remember doing some work for a school district in upstate New York, and I was very impressed by a superintendent who said to me that she wanted these librarians remediated or she was going to transfer them because she felt that every year that a student goes without outstanding library media teachers, that is a major loss in a 16 career in education, and I was very impressed by that, and I was disappointed to hear that. I had not heard about this situation. I have lived in Orange County, New York since I was 22, but our role as RAC members, we meet with the regents, the commissioner sits with us, but he hears what we want for libraries, but I don't hear much more than that. But I am disappointed.

TULA JUNINI: Can I just speak to that for a moment?

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Please identify yourself.

TULA JUNINI: Oh yes, I am sorry.

1 I am Tula Junini. I think there is sort of a big
2 elephant in the room is that outside there is this
3 assumption that with digital resources libraries
4 are not needed. Everybody has everything. They
5 have a little handheld, and this is sort of a very
6 common notion, and it is not taking into account
7 the librarian as a certified teacher, and it is
8 not taking into account that we are not about
9 stuff. It's when the public librarians and they
10 have a great plan express their plan, what was it?
11 It was brining stuff to schools. This is not what
12 we are talking about, and at a moment when two
13 things--when the common core is asking for
14 critical thinking skills and is asking for
15 students for higher level abilities, that is where
16 it is taught in this environment of information
17 science, the information field. All disciplines
18 now go through information science. My daughter
19 is in medical school. A huge amount of her work
20 involves what we call medical informatics. This
21 is across all fields now, so more than ever we are
22 keeping students away from the very information
23 and the very skills and knowledge they need by the
24 idea that it is just out there floating in
25

1
2 cyberspace, and I think we have to move away from
3 the idea that the library is about stuff in a
4 space. It is about the type of learning and
5 interactions that are going on, and that is why in
6 my statement I said re-envision the library as a
7 learning and resource space, and those resources
8 aren't the stuff you buy at Barnes and Noble.
9 It's stuff that specifically addresses the
10 students' needs and their learning needs, and I
11 think that is a huge difference, so somehow we
12 have to get past this commonly held fallacy of
13 what the--as - - -Hawkmán said, some of the old
14 school definition of a library, stuff on shelves.
15 We are in the digital age. We are in the
16 information age.

17 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Christian?

18 CHRISTIAN ZUBRISKY: Thank you,
19 Chairman Jackson. I would also pause it
20 [phonetic] that one of the things we need
21 leadership on is making it easier for libraries
22 with an MLS to move into the schools. I receive
23 e-mails from librarians in my work weekly, almost
24 daily asking me for advice for careers, how they
25 begin their career. I know lots of librarians who

1
2 are out there just hanging fire in bookstores, and
3 once we can corral that energy and once we can
4 pipeline that into our schools, I think we are
5 going to see a significant change. And also as
6 everyone has been speaking, this new information
7 literacy is incredibly important. Fortunately we
8 have this - - report which speaks principally to
9 the public libraries, but it is actually starting
10 to get the conversation at the levels of
11 leadership that you folks inhabit to see the
12 values of the libraries across in a more
13 statistically kind of business ready - - .

14 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Jessica, any
15 comments?

16 JESSICA HAWKMAN: Yes, I mean in
17 full support of what my colleagues have said. I
18 also think that it is troubling that there are so
19 many people who are qualified to teach in--well,
20 two things. My students graduate. They get jobs,
21 but many of them go to independent schools because
22 the DOE is not hiring outside of its own current
23 pool, which is problematic so these highly
24 qualified candidates who are prepared to be the
25 kind of 21st century librarians we need, they are

1 not going into the public schools, and then to
2 Christian's point, there are also people kind of
3 idling in career stasis who have a masters of
4 library science and thinking about how can these
5 folks get into schools, currently the only way
6 that the state has allowed us to get those folks
7 into schools is by doing an 18 credit masters that
8 really takes two years because it involves a lot
9 of student teaching, a lot of observation, and
10 piecing together a schedule of classes. I think
11 it is really important to think about the ways
12 that universities and the Department of Ed and the
13 State can have a real conversation about kind of
14 not reducing the rigor and not to deemphasize the
15 very important specific skills that people need to
16 be a school librarian, but we have got to make a
17 realistic path. This is a real crisis situation
18 as we have sort of talked about all day, and so if
19 we are going to take next steps, we can't keep
20 throwing roadblocks in front of people. We really
21 have to start thinking of ways that we can make
22 reasonable paths to these jobs.

24 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Just--what
25 about the lack of enforcement and holding

1
2 localities feet to the fire as to what the state
3 requirements are? John or anyone quickly?

4 JESSICA HAWKMAN: I don't know if
5 punitive measures are going to be--

6 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: [interposing]
7 Well, what measures are we going to do to enforce
8 them.

9 JESSICA HAWKMAN: To me the key to
10 this is education. The fact that my program never
11 talks to leadership programs is a huge problem. I
12 beg - - and Teacher's College to let me come and
13 talk about the importance of school librarians to
14 their principals academies. They don't return my
15 e-mails.

16 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: But you said
17 that you didn't think enforcement, but the State
18 of New York is enforcing and trying to withhold
19 back \$250 million because a teacher agreement has
20 not been reached. That's enforcement. That is a
21 penalty right, and that is why we went into court
22 to get a preliminary injunction against the state
23 because it is negatively impacting what my
24 colleague said, Andy King, that adults can't get
25 their act together and the people who are being

1
2 impacted are the children more specifically. And
3 once they lose a year, they can never get that
4 back. I think you said that, John.

5 JESSICA HAWKMAN: I think John is
6 more prepared to probably speak to the legalities
7 of this. From where I am as a teacher/educator
8 what I see is the need for a really expanded
9 conversation, and I think there are a lot of
10 points of entry here. It is not just one thing.

11 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: But I am
12 talking about how are we going to mandate, enforce
13 the Department of Education to come into
14 compliance?

15 JOHN MONAHAN: Well, one of the
16 things that I--first of all I have seen it happen
17 in Westchester County where parents called up the
18 division for library development and said that
19 this particular district was out of compliance and
20 then there was some action taken to address that
21 situation. It was about a middle school library,
22 ages grade 7 and 8 not being covered.

23 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: You are not
24 talking about a system that has 1.1 million in
25 1700 schools.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

JOHN MONAHAN: No, I am not, but I am trying to find a reason to be hopeful.

CHRISTIAN ZUBRISKY: Do our parents realize it? And that is one of the questions we have to ask.

JOHN MONAHAN: That was my point. Get the parents involved.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Don't you think that the state education department should force the issue with any municipality that is out compliance so out of whack for years and years and years?

JOHN MONAHAN: And the answer, sir, that you will get is they are understaffed. They can't keep up with that, and I feel that--

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: [interposing] You think that is the answer we are going to get? 'Cause we are going to write to them. You know that.

JOHN MONAHAN: Yeah, and I will tell the state librarian, Bernard Margales [phonetic], about this discussion too. He would be an entry person to discuss. He would certainly take this question from you, but I will mention it

1
2 to him as well. The other thing I will just say
3 when we were talking about getting people in
4 library science and getting certification, with
5 all due respect to Pratt I spent nine years at
6 Palmer School, I was an adjunct professor in the
7 school library program.

8 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Where is the
9 Palmer School located?

10 JOHN MONAHAN: Palmer School has a
11 Westchester campus, and it is in Long Island. We
12 actually--we took and I would say one-third of our
13 students did not have education backgrounds. They
14 came from corporate libraries. They can come from
15 government libraries, and some of them became some
16 of the best school librarians I had.

17 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Excellent.
18 Any last comments before we close out?

19 TULA JUNINI: I just want to
20 mention one thing.

21 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: You have got
22 to use the mic, Tula.

23 TULA JUNINI: I'm sorry. I think
24 it is still an essential idea that the pedagogy of
25 being a school librarian--a school librarian is

not a librarian. You have - - a big part of their--

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: [interposing]
You are saying a school librarian is not a librarian?

TULA JUNINI: A public librarian is not a school librarian. There is a huge difference. But sometimes this point is lost. It is - - suddenly become a librarian and then you get associated with just you are building your collections. I think this really becomes a barrier. We have to see the school librarian as absolutely essential to the learning and accomplishing this knowledge and skills part of the education program, and it is that pedagogy, and Jessica can tell you a huge part of the program is how to teach and the principles of teaching and how to build literacy school skills and visual skills and digital literacy skills, so I think we have to say it is an essential part. It's not, oh, this would be lovely to have. No, it is critical. It is essential. - -

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Vincent Gentile, Chair of Select Committee close us out.

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: I think part of the problem is that the school principals don't understand. They are the ones making decisions ultimately, and don't understand.

JESSICA HAWKMAN: [interposing] I totally agree, and I think that is the big disconnect. I am all for the empowering of principals to hire. I think people know their local communities best and principals are those people, but the problem is and with all due respect, I loved what you said about your librarian, but I am not that old and I don't recognize good school libraries to my own library experience. I loved my school librarian, but it is just a new world, and principals I think they tend to think of that sort of lovely person with a bun who is stamping books in their school library. That is like a silly generalization, but principals really need to know that the school librarian is an enormous added value to their community, and if they just had this nostalgic idea of what the library is, of course they are going to think a classroom library is adequate.

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Did you say,

1
2 Jessica, that you tried to approach the DOE to
3 explain and try to make a presentation?

4 JESSICA HAWKMAN: I talked to the
5 DOE, and they suggested that I talk to principals'
6 academies. Since I am an academic, they said talk
7 to other academics, so it has been a hard road to
8 hoe. I have pulled in every favor and connection,
9 and still I am not on the docket for these
10 conversations, and I think I need to keep pushing
11 harder.

12 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: So the DOE's
13 principals academy did not have you speak?

14 JESSICA HAWKMAN: No.

15 CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Interesting.
16 Yes, John.

17 JOHN MONAHAN: I just wanted to add
18 that the way we do it in upstate New York through
19 the - - is we become - - school library system
20 directors with the curriculum council. You have
21 the assistant superintendents for instruction that
22 are members of this council, plus you have the
23 elementary and the secondary principals meeting as
24 - - usually regionally, and again, we are not
25 talking about big numbers. We are talking about

18 districts, but that is the opportunity for a school library system director, maybe some of the people here, to go and talk to principals, reach out and say the library you had - - in high school and elementary school is not the library that it is today. It is an entirely different approach and mission.

CHAIRPERSON GENTILE: Thank you all very much.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: So let me just thank this panel for coming in. We appreciate it is a little different than some of the other panels, but it is very, very important all of you. So thank you very much. Continue to stay with us. For the record, we have received testimony from the New York Library Association dated May 6th from the president of the New York Library Association and from the president of New York Library Association, SSL [phonetic], Syracuse, Mineola school districts also. And with that, we thank you all for coming in. This oversight hearing on the availability of certified school librarians in New York City public school systems is hereby adjourned at 1:59 p.m.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Kimberley Campbell certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature

Kimberley CampbellDate 6/4/13