CITY	COT	JNCII	
CITY	OF	NEW	YORK

----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

----X

January 18, 2013 Start: 10:04 a.m. Recess: 11:08 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers

City Hall

B E F O R E:

JULISSA FERRERAS

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Charles Barron Margaret S. Chin Annabel Palma Ruben Wills

APPEARANCES

Andrea Miller President NARAL Pro-Choice New York

Donna Lieberman Executive Director New York Civil Liberties Union

Sasha Ahuja Director of Government Relations Planned Parenthood NYC

Dr. Anne Davis Consulting Medical Director Physicians for Reproductive Choice and Health

Jordan Goldberg State Advocacy Counsel U.S. Legal Program Center for Reproductive Rights

Phillip Kim New York Abortion Access Fund

Alison Turkos New York Abortion Access Fund

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Good

morning. I am Council Member Julissa Ferreras. chair the Women's Issues Committee, and I'd like to thank my colleagues, Council Members Lappin, Mendez, Arroyo and Speaker Quinn for co-sponsoring Resolution 1635-A along with me. Forty years ago, women had relatively few choices in many aspects of society, but particularly, in the realm of reproductive rights. We have all heard of the horror stories of what happened when abortions were unlawful in most of the country. Illegal procedures were performed often in unsanitary conditions and many times resulting in severe injury or death of the mother. Wealthy women fared somewhat better by being able to travel out of the country to clinics with somewhat better outcomes. Roe v. Wade challenged all of that. Ιt concluded that abortion lies within a pregnant woman's zone of privacy, and therefore, was a fundamental right protected by the Constitution. In addition to providing the ability to access sound healthcare for termination of pregnancy Roe v. Wade helped move forward the notion of a woman being a full person because without freedom over

her own body, a woman is not truly equal. In
1973, women and feminists throughout the United
States thought that Roe v. Wade settled the issue
of freedom of choice, but since that time numerous
and rigorous challenges to women's rights have
been mounted over and over again. Some states
have passed laws limiting women's ability to
access abortion and often without consideration to
maternal health and privacy, and now as we take
the time to commemorate the $40^{ ext{th}}$ anniversary of the
Roe v. Wade decision challenges still exist.
According to the Guttmacher Institute, 2012 saw
the second highest number of abortion restrictions
ever. Additionally, since the passage of the
patient's protection and affordable care act also
known as the healthcare reform some states have
already enacted laws restricting the abortion
coverage that will be available in plans purchased
through state healthcare exchanges, many of which
won't be implemented until 2014. All women need a
range of reproductive healthcare throughout her
life including cancer screenings, contraceptive
services, prenatal care, labor and delivery
services and yes, possibly abortion care. No

woman should be denied proper healthcare nor should her insurance whether public or private be allowed to deny her such services. No woman should have to go back to life 40 years ago, and now we will hear from our first panel, and I'd like to—we have members that are going to be popping in and out, but we are going to have our first panel—Ms. Andrea Miller, NARAL Pro-Choice New York—and I want to thank you all for being here.

ANDREA MILLER: Thank you so much,
Chairwoman, for that wonderful statement of
support and for holding this hearing and thank you
to the members of the committee. We are so
appreciative of the opportunity to speak this
morning on this important matter. My name is
Andrea Miller. I am president of NARAL Pro-Choice
New York, and the National Institute for
Reproductive Health, and we work here in New York
as well as across the country to ensure that every
woman has the right and the ability to make her
own decisions about her reproductive health in
accordance with what is best for her life and her
family. Of course that includes preventing an

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

unintended pregnancy, bearing a healthy child and choosing safe legal abortion. The resolution before you marks the 40th anniversary of Roe v. Wade, and as you so eloquently put at the beginning of this, that is a landmark decision by the U.S. Supreme Court that recognized a woman's constitutional right to determine the course of her pregnancy. In so doing it invalidated scores of state laws across the country that banned almost all abortions in all circumstances and led to an immediate and dramatic reduction in maternal mortality and morbidity. Roe also as you pointed out helped to level the playing field for women, giving women the opportunity to determine our futures and therefore become more equal members of society. Perhaps, the most eloquently put of that was when Justice Sandra Day O'Connor, who at the time was the only justice who was a woman on the Supreme Court and was the first woman on the Supreme Court, stated when she refused to become the final fifth vote to overturn Roe in 1992 that the ability of women to participate equally in the economic and social life of this nation has been facilitated by their ability to control their

reproductive lives. Unfortunately, a barrage of
federal and state legislation has undermined the
full promise of Roe taking a disproportionate toll
on low income women. This includes onerous
federal policies and a host of copycat state laws
that withhold coverage for women who already have
the least access and the fewest options to obtain
a safe legal abortion. Women who qualify for
Medicaid along with women in the military and the
peace corps, federal employees, women in federal
prisons, Native Americans who are covered by
Indian Health Services and Congress also prevents
the District of Columbia from even using its own
funds to cover low income women's abortions in
that district. Commendably New York state has
stepped up to provide coverage for the full range
of reproductive health services for women who
qualify in New York for Medicaid, but that still
leaves more than 170,000 women in New York City
alone who are unable to use their health coverage
for abortion services. Largely that is because
they or their family members are members of the
military or are federal employees. Now one of
Roe's central tenants is that a woman should be

б

able to make her own reproductive healthcare
decisions without governmental interference.
Politicians should not make this right contingent
upon her economic circumstances or the type of
insurance she has. We thank the Council. We
thank this committee for not only considering this
commemoration of this important anniversary, but
for drawing the attention that is so needed to the
need to correct this unjust policy that withholds
coverage for abortion services for those women who
rely on public programs. By adopting this
resolution the City Council can take a timely and
principled stance against politicians who unable
yet to achieve their ultimate goal to make
abortion illegal or fully inaccessible, they have
instead callously limited abortion access for some
of the most vulnerable women among us. This
resolution epitomizes the kind of forward thinking
bold action that cities and municipalities can and
do take every day, including New York, to meet the
real needs of women and families, and it brings
home a message from the U.S. Conference of Mayors
last year in a resolution spearheaded in part by
our own Mayor Bloomberg that urged Congress and

2.

the states to pursue a positive agenda that
reaffirms fundamental rights and improves women's
access to safe and comprehensive reproductive
healthcare. We are so appreciate of your time.
We are so appreciative of this commemoration, and
thank you for the opportunity to speak this
morning.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you very much for your testimony, and I am going to ask some questions and you may have to repeat some of the things. I think you answered some of them, but it will be great to have on the record.

ANDREA MILLER: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: there seems to be an ongoing concern that Roe v. Wade might get overturned depending on the makeup of the U.S. Supreme Court. Is that a legitimate concern?

ANDREA MILLER: Absolutely. We have currently if you look at the trajectory of the U.S. Supreme Court's jurisprudence on this, we have a very bare majority—five to four—and even that is questionable. There have been a number of cases that have come before the court in the years since Roe that have steadily undermined that

2	fundamental right that you mentioned—whether it's
3	the 1992 case Planned Parenthood v. Casey, which
4	admittedly I do have a soft spot in my heart
5	because of Justice O'Connor's eloquent statements,
6	but nonetheless, it created a new lesser standard
7	for protection of women's decision making in this
8	realm. More recently there have been laws passed
9	both in Congress and at the state level that have
10	been upheld by the Supreme Court that further
11	restrict access to these services in a host of
12	ways and chip away at the ability to make these
13	decisions as well as physicians' ability to
14	provide the care that is best for their patients.
15	CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Can you
16	speak what would be the immediate and long terms
17	of effects on major-if this was overturned,
18	especially I think for some young women that may
19	be watching this live that are in their early 30s,
20	20s and really have only known their society with
21	these protections-
22	ANDREA MILLER: [interposing]
23	Thankfully.
24	CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Right.
25	Thank God. What would be the impact if we see

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

this overturned?

ANDREA MILLER: Well, we would see a far more dramatic example of what we are unfortunately seeing already, which is that women would have tremendous difficulty if not impossibility of accessing safe legal abortion care. It would require tremendous travel. would require jumping through so many hurdles, it could be virtually impossible-whether look at South Dakota. You already have a 72 hour delay they are trying to impose, a litany of government scripted, inaccurate information to try to convince a woman that this is not the right decision of her regardless of her circumstance, so you would see women having to find, navigate their way around the various states. This tremendous and terrible patchwork that we have already in place would only get worse. You would see potentially as many as half of the states immediately moving if their laws don't already allow it, but moving quite quickly to make abortions illegal in virtually every circumstance, and you would see just this domino effect across the country, and the result would be as you

pointed out in your opening statement, it would mean once again that very few women would have timely access to safe reproductive healthcare or when they are facing a pregnancy and realize that they need to terminate that, and that would have devastating consequences for their health and their lives.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: I know that often times when we have the conversation on abortion, it really is part of a general healthcare conversation for women. Can you please describe how access to reproductive healthcare in general is jeopardized through certain pro-life initiatives?

and any and any and the services and that those services shouldn't be piecemealed out and parsed out and segmented because that is not how our bodies work. It's certainly one of the efforts to undermine family planning funding and the ability of women's healthcare providers who recognize thankfully that women deserve and need the full range of reproductive healthcare services, and that those services shouldn't be piecemealed out and parsed out and segmented because that is not how our bodies work. It's not how healthcare

that the healthcare reform debate pointed out so
powerfully is how important it is for care to be
coordinated for patients to have the opportunity
to talk with their doctors honestly and fully and
have the full range of services available to them.
This effort to undermine women's access to and
right to choose abortion has unfortunately really
come back to a desire to prevent women from making
any of the reproductive healthcare decisions,
which is why there have been such severe attacks
on funding for family planning, which we know
includes making sure that women get the important
well woman care such as breast and cervical exams
that are so essential to their health as well as
access to contraceptive methods and well woman
care.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: New York state has long been pro-choice. Have you found any challenges to that standing recently?

ANDREA MILLER: Well, I will say we are very appreciative and thankful that New York has been a leader and certainly in 1970 even before Roe thanks to a bipartisan initiative, New York became one of the first states to begin to

decriminalize abortion care, and that was a really
important and forward looking thing now.
Unfortunately when you fast forward now four
decades, we have fallen behind, and there are some
real challenges that women have in terms of the
availability and accessibility of reproductive
healthcare services in the state as well as some
out statutory restrictions that impinge on the
practice of medical care and women's access to
safe legal abortions. Perhaps the most pernicious
is currently there is no exception if a woman's
health is threatened later in pregnancy, she
cannot get according to our state law, she cannot
get safe legal care if she determines that
terminating that pregnancy is the best for herself
and for her family, so we actually in this day and
age in 2013 have women who are facing a
circumstance where they are talking to their
doctors, what can I do? My health is at risk. My
family is trying to figure out how do we deal with
this incredibly tragic circumstance, and the
doctor says, well, the law tells me I can't help
you, and they actually—some of them leave the
state.

2.

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

take-

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: We have all
of the advocates here in the room, and eager
Council Members that are on their way. What can
we do on a state and local level as elected
officials? I know that you mentioned that some of
these statutory and we have legal, but what do you
think are maybe the first steps that we should

ANDREA MILLER: Well, obviously first for this Committee and for the Council is to adopt this resolution and also the Council has been tremendously supportive and very clear about making sure that access to reproductive healthcare is the norm here in New York. There are some terrific provisions that the Council has adopted to improve access to clinics, and that is really important continuing to make sure that that is enforced and that this is the norm in New York City is really important. In terms of the state level you raised that and I think we have a real opportunity especially since it is the 40th anniversary of Roe and given the impact it has had on women's equality wanted to point out that there is a bill that has been pending in the state

legislature called the reproductive health act,
which would take care of many of the problems that
I mentioned in terms of accessing safe legal
abortion care when a woman's health is at risk and
removing our governance of the provision of
abortion, taking it out of the criminal code, and
placing it where it belongs, so that abortion care
is governed like a medical service—the medical
service that it is and should be. That measure we
are thrilled. Governor Cuomo as you may recall
announced in his state of the state, the women's
equality act, and one of the ten provisions is the
reproductive health act because so clearly the
ability to make reproductive decisions and to
control your body in the context of pregnancy and
reproduction is so central to women's equality, so
we would be thrilled to see the council members as
individuals and as a Council to be supportive of
the women's equality act given that it
incorporates so many elements that are essential
to improving women's equality here in New York and
removing some of the barriers and the unequal
treatment that exists even to this day.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Great.

2	Well, I think you will probably be returning to
3	support that reso. Right, Danielle? Great.
4	Thank you very much.

ANDREA MILLER: Thank you so much for your time.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you for your testimony. We are going to call up our next panel. Thanks again. We have just been joined by Council Member Barron of Brooklyn. We are going to call up Donna Lieberman of New York Civil Liberties Union, Sasha Ahuja, Planned Parenthood NYC, and Anne Davis, the Physicians for Reproductive Choice and Health. And we have also been joined by Council Member Margaret Chin.

morning. Thank you for inviting us to this hearing, and thank you for introducing this resolution. I have written testimony I don't need to read to you. I would just like to say that this 40th anniversary of Roe v. Wade feels important as has every anniversary of Roe, but it feels different and better because as Andrea Miller noted while the right to the constitutional protection for the right to choose under Roe hangs

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

by a thread at the United States Supreme Court a much thinner thread than any of us every would have imagined. I think we are hopeful that the Supreme Court as it evolves over the next few years at least will not be plagued by appointees who have to pass a litmus test that they oppose Roe. So we are pleased, and we recognize that we have to be vigilant on that, but also I think what we learned in the last election is that those who are against a woman's right to choose are against not just abortion, but really almost everything that is part of the equation that amounts to women's dignity and equality. These guys who think that rape is something sometimes you ask for, and that contraception ought to be restricted if not made unavailable to women, so what we saw, those of us who were in Albany for the state of the state the other day were thrilled, excited that after many, many years of trying to get New York to really be the pro-choice state and the state of equal rights for women that we like to think of ourselves as, that we finally have strong governor support for a women's equality agenda that recognizes the core place of the right to

2	choose in women's equality, women's health,
3	women's dignity and also recognizes the importance
4	of issues like pay equity, like pregnancy
5	discrimination, like freedom from sexual
6	harassment. I love it. A lot of the details of
7	the women's agenda are still being flushed out,
8	but the notion that sexual harassment will be
9	against the law no matter how big or small the
10	employer. An employer who is one person will be
11	held accountable for sexual harassment in the
12	workplace is huge because so many women are
13	working in one on one environments, so the women's
14	equality agenda is exciting. It is critically
15	important, and I can't wait for the Council to be
16	dealing with the next resolution to endorse that
17	and it of course includes the reproductive health
18	act, which will bring our abortion law to where it
19	needs to be-out of the penal law ridiculously and
20	into the public health law. It's about health.
21	Thank you.
22	SASHA AHUJA: Good morning
23	everyone. My name is Sasha Ahuja, and I am
24	testifying on behalf of Joan Malin, President and

CEO of Planned Parenthood of New York City. I am

б

pleased to be here to provide testimony in support
of resolution 1635-A, a truly important resolution
that will continue to ensure that New York City
leads our nation in ensuring access to
reproductive healthcare. Of course I want to
thank Chair of the Women's Issues Committee, the
honorable Julissa Ferreras, and Council Members
Barron and Chin, who are also here, and also, the
many council members who have already signed on to
this resolution. Our Board, our staff and most
importantly, our patients are very very grateful
and really indebted for your continued support. I
also want to take the opportunity to recognize
Council Speaker, Christine Quinn, who has
continued to show unwavering leadership on issues
regarding women's health. We look forward to
continuing to work in partnership with the Speaker
and of course the New York City Council to promote
the health and well-being of New York's women, men
and teens. For almost 100 years, Planned
Parenthood has been the most trusted name in
reproductive health. In the past year alone, we
at Planned Parenthood of New York City have
provided high quality personalized healthcare to

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

over 50,000 women, men and teens in New York city at our four health centers in the Bronx, Brooklyn, Manhattan and Staten Island. We reached an additional 58,000 people through project street beat, Planned Parenthood's - - Planned Parenthood of New York City's unique HIV prevention and access to care program that serves women, men and teens, who work and live on New York City streets. We also connected an additional 20,000 New Yorkers youth and adults to comprehensive health education services throughout the five boroughs. We offer a full range of reproductive health services including gynecological care, lifesaving cancer screenings, male reproductive health services, contraception, pregnancy testing, abortion, testing and treatment for sexually transmitted infections, HIV testing and counseling and more. We have a threefold mission of clinical services, education and advocacy and through that threefold mission, we continue to bring better healthcare and more fulfilling lives to each new generation of New Yorkers. As a voice for reproductive justice in New York City, Planned Parenthood New York City supports legislation and policies to

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

continue to ensure that all New Yorkers and in fact all people around the world will have access to a full range of reproductive health services and information. This month marks 40 years since the landmark Roe v. Wade decision. On the $40^{\rm th}$ anniversary of Roe the need for continued access to safe and legal abortion for a woman if and when she decides and needs to consider it could not be more urgent. In the last two years, the antiwomen's health agenda that some in Congress have pursued was rejected by the American people. There was a powerful and unmistakable message to members of Congress and state legislatures all around the country that women do not want politicians to meddle in their personal medical decisions. We applaud and stand behind resolution 1635-A calling upon the United States Congress to continue to fund comprehensive reproductive healthcare for all Americans. As the nation's leading women's healthcare provider and advocate, Planned Parenthood knows firsthand why it's so critical that women have access to a comprehensive range of reproductive health services. courthouses to state houses to Capitol Hill,

Planned Parenthood works to protect access to
healthcare for women across the country, taking
action to ensure that women have access to care no
matter what. We care deeply. We care with
respect and without judgment. We are unwavering
in our belief that all people deserve high
quality, affordable healthcare. We are tireless
in our efforts to provide education and
information so people can make their own
healthcare decisions. We proudly fight for women
to be able to access the reproductive services
that they need. We speak before you like many
have mentioned before me at a truly opportune
moment. Just last week New York state Governor
Andrew Cuomo prioritized passing a ten point
women's equality act this session—a bold agenda
that intends to break down barriers that
perpetuate discrimination and inequality based on
gender. While New York has historically served as
a model for quality and fairness on women's
issues, the women's equality act ensures that New
York can again be a leader on the issues like pay
equity, increasing protections for pregnant
workers, strengthening human trafficking laws and

increasing protections for survivors of domestic
violence. The women's equality act encompasses
the reproductive health act, which guarantees that
a woman can make her own personal private
healthcare decisions, especially when her health
is endangered. The reproductive health act fixes
a troubling gap in New York's abortion law, making
it a potential crime to provide abortion to
protect a woman's health. The reproductive health
act will ensure that women can access safe and
legal abortion if that is what she decides she
needs. Planned Parenthood of New York City
applauds the call for women's equality act in New
York state because we know that reproductive
health exists at the intersections of the real
lives of women and their families in their
workplace, in schools, and we know that there is
where the services need to be provided. Today we
applaud the New York City Council for continuing
to take the lead on moving resolution 1635-A
forward. We urge Congress to continue to champion
funding for comprehensive reproductive healthcare
and hope that New York City can serve as the
national model for championing women's health.

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Thank you.

ANNE DAVIS: Good morning. My name is Anne Davis. I'm an OBGYN. I work at Columbia University Medical Center. I didn't know this morning when I was picking out-you know, thinking about what to wear-should I wear my white coat, a suit? No, it's okay. I kind of wanted to find a I love New York T-shirt. I didn't have one at home to put on, but I thought that would have been really the right message because that is how I am feeling. As I said, my name is Anne Davis. an OBGYN. I live in Washington Heights uptown. had to take four trains to get here partially because I got lost and I work at Columbia in Washington Heights. I am also the consulting medical director for Physicians for Reproductive Choice and Health, so we are a national non-profit physician led advocacy organization. We support comprehensive reproductive healthcare for everyone, and I am here today as are all of you to speak in favor of-I shouldn't say I know you are all going to speak in favor-of proposed resolution 1635-A, which commemorates the 40th anniversary of Roe and very importantly calls upon U.S. Congress

to support funding for comprehensive reproductive
healthcare. I'm an abortion provider, and so for
me, I am grateful for Roe every single day that I
go to work. My experience of abortion is very up
close and very real, and I wanted to share a story
with you that illustrates very well why we need
safe and legal abortion without government
interference. One morning I was at home having my
coffee, and I got paged at 7 o'clock. There was a
woman who had been admitted the night before to
the Allen [phonetic] Hospital, which some of you
may know. It's up by almost to Target in the
Bronx, at the tip of Manhattan, northern
Manhattan. She had had an uncomplicated desired
pregnancy, and then had some bleeding and had been
admitted to the hospital for observation. Right
before they called me, suddenly she started to
have sharp pain in her abdomen and very heavy
bleeding, so this is a real OB emergency. When I
was called, she had lost more than a quart of
blood in about 30 minutes, enough that if it
continued, her life would certainly be in danger.
She had something called a placental abruption,
which is when the placenta prematurely separates

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

from the uterus, and it is a real OB emergency, so I needed to get to the hospital as quickly as possible to provide a second trimester abortion. So that is the only treatment that we could do for her to stop the bleeding and keep her safe. took a cab, luckily I live close by so I got there within ten minutes. When I walked in the room, the patient was very pale. She was bleeding and very frightened and in pain. We talked about it briefly really that there was only one option to move forward and quickly do the procedure to save her life. The procedure was successful. recovered, and she left the hospital alive without needing an emergency hysterectomy, so she could have another baby in the future if she would like So Roe has allowed abortion to become safe. Everyone is sort of aware of that, but another thing that it has allowed is that because abortion has come more into mainstream medicine we have been able to develop techniques and standards and do research so that we have really improved abortion care for women. Unfortunately in the rest of the country, I could say we have a long way to go, but it's not that we have gone forward

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

since Roe. We have gone radically backwards, so we have a lot of catching up to do in the rest of the country, and Julissa, to your comment about what can the City Council do? You know, we are also grateful to live in New York and be able to do our job, but really to take this outside of New York City and really convey to other legislators and your colleagues why this is so important and why it's something that we really need to move forward outside New York City. Abortion is always going to be with us. It is always going to be medically necessary, yet many of the legislatures and courts give equal time and weight to those who say that that is not so. Never mind the patient that I just described, right, who I had to take care of, and the daily experiences like mine that doctors have around the country. In New York we are very fortunate not to have politicians interfering in decision making between women and doctors. We don't have arbitrary waiting periods, invasive ultrasound requirements or horrible mandated counseling with false information about abortion. We are very fortunate that Medicaid covers abortion for women in New York state. That

is a really big deal for doctors and patients.
Many states as we know deny that coverage, so we
see women every day in our hospital who rely on
Medicaid obviously since so many women do. Many
of them already have children. They have low
paying jobs, and they are really struggling just
to get from day to day and they know when they
can't have another baby, so we need to trust them
and let them make that decision when they need to
make that decision. All women deserve health
insurance that covers healthcare and includes
abortion so that people can get an abortion
without delay. That should be the standard for
everyone in the whole country. I often think to
myself you know, what happens to the poor woman
who lives in a state, literally poor, who doesn't
have access to abortion through Medicaid? And
those are some tragic tales to tell that I hear
from my colleagues in those states. It is really
unfortunate for them, and I think they are
voiceless, those women, because they are not here
to talk to you. The affordable care act has been
so fantastic in terms of contraception. We are
all super grateful for that, but unfortunately it

doesn't do much to advance abortion if anything at all really. We urge the City Council to adopt proposed resolution 1635-A and also to urge the U.S. Congress to support funding for comprehensive reproductive healthcare so all women can lead full healthy lives and participate equally in society regardless of their socioeconomic level. Thank you for the opportunity to speak.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you for your testimony, and thank you all for your testimony. My colleagues have some questions, but Doctor, thank you in particular for sharing your experience because I think oftentimes we think of the earlier terminations, and not the decisions that women have to make unfortunately every day and the stress that the doctors have to go through and I think that is amazing, so I thank you for your testimony. We are going to hear from Council Member Barron, Chin and then Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very much, and thank all of you for your testimony. You know I'm concerned about Roe v.

Wade. I know it's going to be a challenge in the Supreme Court, but there is so much being done to

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

make it almost ineffective—the things that they are doing around it, and that seems to be increasing even with the so-called affordable healthcare act, Obama Care, whatever they want to call it. It seems that we have to do something, and like you said in those states where they can't use Medicaid, that is a major, major issue, and then in some of the insurance companies because I'm not as crazy about the healthcare act that was passed as many are. I get beat up for that, but I just think that it didn't go nearly far enough, and it still left a whole lot of power into the hands of the insurance companies. In addition to that, I am concerned about these state exchangesthese health state exchanges that still have to be set up and in some states they are not set up, and what is going to happen with women's rights on how these state exchanges are set up, even with Medicaid 'cause Medicaid and Medicare is being attacked every day. We don't even know how long Medicaid is going to even exists and if it does exist and how much is it going to be helpful, so could you-and I want to comment you because being a care provider in the abortion area, you have to

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

have courage 'cause there is a lot of crazy people out here doing a lot of crazy things, but could you just elaborate on some more on some of those issues—the state exchanges, the healthcare act, and do you see them diminishing the original intent and purpose of Wade, and where are we at with that now?

ANNE DAVIS: My intent and their intent might be two different things.

SASHA AHUJA: I'm happy to answer some of those questions. We are all very closely watching the implementation of healthcare exchanges in New York. Of course, it varies based on different states' agendas, whether they have decided to set up exchanges themselves, whether they have chosen that the federal government will be involved in that process. So here in New York state there is a key opportunity for Medicaid expansion, in particular the expansion of what is called the expansion of the family planning benefits programs, which is the program under Medicaid that covers folks who are seeking family planning services, and that program is going to grow tremendously, and so we are very excited

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

about that, but also on the ground we are concerned about how women in communities are going to know that they will now be covered and coverage will expand, what the process is for enrollment, and that is something that we know we would like to continue work in partnership with your offices with other community advocates to talk to when you have constituents or we know that there are community members that are not sure what implementation is going to look like that we can especially talk about the growth in the family planning benefits program, meaning that more women are going to be covered under Medicaid and that more providers are going to again continue to provide better services. There are good things happening in the state of New York, which is fabulous for us and those of us who are concerned about family planning services, and at the same time, other states have sort of very different situations. The big question now is what the exchanges are going to look like and also the extent to which folks on the ground, community members are going to know that this great thing is happening, so really bridging that gap is

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

something that we are really concerned about and watching, and also we know many advocates here in the room and also folks in our offices are part of developing and implementing exchanges and so we're in regular conversations with the Governor's Office to watch that implementation process.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: While you are watching the implementation process, watch the Governor too. I know you're pleased with him. I'm not 'cause on the one hand while the exchanges are being set up, so is the Medicaid redesign committee being set up to cut funding to that, so everything is in the dollars. They can talk all of the stuff they want. Watch the budget, and the other piece is that in these exchanges, like I'm from Eastern New York, and out of nowhere I'm looking and checking the exchanges somebody represents us, and I've never heard of the person before in my life. No contact with the community and the Governor is setting up these representatives or committees to deal with the exchanges, and some of us don't even know who they are, where they came from. I don't trust the Governor. I know how they know how to front

liberalism, and it's a very political climate that
we are living in, and of course, you know that
already. And what appears to be working now and
when you compare it to other states and some
states are so horrible, you're going to look good,
but the bottom line, I think women are in trouble
unless we all unite and look at some serious
issues in this state and not go for the empty
rhetoric or even some of the structures that are
being put in place with the committees, but look
at the dollars in the budget all the time because
that is not the state of the state address-
irrelevant, and not a whole lot of committees—and
even what he is doing with hospitals in general,
shutting down hospitals. We are having major,
major issues there, so I'm very, very concerned
about how the so-called neo-liberal agenda gets
pushed forward in states across this country. But
I know you are very sharp and activism is staying
up, and I just hope we keep that part going.
SASHA AHUJA: Absolutely.

ANNE DAVIS: One thing to think about that I think would make our jobs—we could do so much more for patients and really make a

б

difference in terms of future unplanned
pregnancies as well as the budget because it saves
money, is to try to find a way to let us do long
acting reversible contraception at the time that
we provide abortion, so people may not know that
if you have an abortion and you have Medicaid, you
don't necessarily have coverage to get an IUD or
an implant at the time of your abortion, so that
one problem right there if we could do that, if we
could do an abortion and then give a woman an IUD
or give a woman an implant so that she would have
protection for five or even three or five or ten
or longer years, we would really see some major
change. So there have been a couple of projects-
one was in Iowa and one was in Missouri in St.
Louis and they showed it. It wasn't just this
will work. They did it. So they provided free
contraception long-acting reversible and they
dropped the unintended pregnancy rate, and they
dropped their abortion rate on a population level.
It was pretty amazing, so if we could do that in
New York City, we would really see a difference.
The abortions would go down, and we would have a
lot more women having planned pregnancies. That

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

would be fantastic for everyone, but our hands are tied 'cause we can't do the two things in one day.

SASHA AHUJA: Can I just add to that? At Planned Parenthood we do have the ability to do both an abortion procedure and for example, insert an IUD in the same visit; however, I think we are also continuing to talk about sort of what does it mean to empower women to make these decisions to have sort of the full range of understanding and knowledge around birth control and how it works, and we are looking actively at what they have done in St. Louis and in Iowa and thinking about what could be the potential for replicating a project like this in New York City. So that conversation is very active, and we are excited about the potential opportunities that that provides and again under the guise that making sure that women can make the best decisions for themselves and their families and choose to have children and then how they raise those children and the environments that are most healthy and provide the most opportunities for those young people, so...

ANNE DAVIS: Can I just add one

more thing, which is the issue of the
marginalization of abortion care in the health
care exchanges is ongoing and important to keep
abreast of and the issue of confidentiality is
also important. Sometimes it's not a sexy issue I
guess, but it's really important that and for the
Council I think there is a role in looking at sort
of the electronic health record systems that are
developed and in the implementation of the health
care exchanges that the right to confidentiality
is protected. It impacts women of course with
regard reproductive healthcare, but it impacts all
New Yorkers. We should have the right to benefit
from electronic health records and the value that
that gives us by way of communications among our
providers without having to have our psychiatric
history, our substance abuse treatment, our
abortion treatment available to providers that we
don't want to have it and who have no interest in
having it in terms of the treatment that they need
to provide. Those are issues that I thought this
was an appropriate time to flag.
CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you

very much. We have been joined by Council Member

2 Annabel Palma. Council Member Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: 3 Thank you, 4 Madam Chair. I just wanted to follow up on the 5 whole issue in terms of community outreach and The issue is that for low-income 6 education. womens and immigrant womens how can we help to make sure that they know all these options are 9 available, and so my question is like, how does your organizations works with local health clinics 10 11 and local health care practitioners 'cause I think 12 if they do have an opportunity to go see a doctor 13 that the doctor should be the one actually helping 14 them and giving them these informations about 15 contraceptives and all the options that are 16 available to them, and then the other part is like 17 a lot of local health clinics, so are they 18 providing all these resources and all these 19 options for women, and if they don't know about it 20 because we don't hear a lot of talk about 21 contraceptive or abortion in the community. 22 Somehow it is still something that is not widely 23 talked about, and it shouldn't be. It should be 24 something very basic to family planning-it's 25 basic. So how do we sort of get that into the

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

community so people, so especially women will know how to exercise their right and not be so afraid and to prevent a lot of this probably abortion that is going on that might not be safe that are still happening in our communities.

SASHA AHUJA: Thank you, Council Member Chin, for that question. That is a question that we think about every day is how to do this work better, so I'll give an example to address the question of outreach that you proposed. At Planned Parenthood we recently started a brand new program called the - program, so it's health promoters, or health educator's program where we are training women in the community specifically in the South Bronx to essentially be the experts and the liaison between our Bronx health center and the community, so those folks are trained on sort of all aspects of family planning and are actually going to be trained very soon on breast health and essentially talking to women, and then do sort of like organizing one on one kind of outreach, going to where women in the community are at-so like in hair salons, in nail salons, at community centers,

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

at schools, and so making those connections with women in the community. It's a very small program right now in the Bronx, but one that we hope to grow, and then in particular, Latina women who are going to really focus on like addressing health disparities in the community and particular in the south Bronx, so we sort of finished our first year, are very excited to grow that program because we know-I often times reflect on when was the first time that I had an empowering healthcare experience. It was when somebody who looked like me, who spoke my language, who understood the community context in which I live, provided me access to that care, and so the - - program is one we hope to grow and in particular look at key health disparities that immigrant women and women of color New York City are dealing with when it comes to HIV rates, when it comes to just basic information about healthcare, and so that is an example on the community outreach side, and then again, I know we have talked about the affordable care act many times. There is such a key opportunity to provide access to information now, and we'd like to continue to work in partnership

again with council members to think about and strategize around how we provide that again that middle ground with trusted community leaders around both the growth and expansion of healthcare services and then also to undo structural barriers to accessing health care that we know are in place for so long, and so that is a conversation that we would love to continue to have. I think the - - program is an example, and a small example of that, and thinking about large scale growth is something that we are very interested in.

ANNE DAVIS: In our communities if we have a well-funded established title 10 clinic in the community, people know, sort of figure out that there is there. The one that we have on 21 Autobahn Avenue that is run through the School of Public Health—we have 25,000 individual patient visits per year in one clinic, and the clinics are tremendously effective. They are largely staffed by mid-level providers, nurse practitioners, physicians assistants, and they provide very top quality as Planned Parenthood does—very low cost, efficient care, so if we can—whatever we can do, whatever you can do to try to preserve funding for

in New York City, and it really makes a big difference for low income women. That is who it's for, but women are using that service. They know about it. They go to the clinic. At my clinic people wait in line for four or five hours to be seen, so we have a tremendous need. The people who are willing to lose a day of work and get somebody to take care of their kid so they can hang around and get a pap smear and get some birth control pills or maybe get an IUD, so whatever we can do to preserve it. Keep it there. Please.

ANNE DAVIS: It goes without saying that the school based clinics are an incredibly important health asset for all students, including young women and they need to be nurtured, protected, supported and respected as medical facilities. Right, you got it—that are really an integral part of the support system for our children's lives, and of course it all begins with education, and without going way too far field, but it's not really far field, sex education—there are great curricula that have been developed in New York City in terms of the content and the

question of course is, are they being taught, and you can't impose sex ed with a heavy hand. It just doesn't work, but I think supporting sex ed and sex ed that is respectful and inclusive of all students is a real challenge. It is critically important if kids know a little bit about their bodies and a little bit about how you can effectuate your own—what your wish is with regard to sexual activity and what you need to stay healthy. It's critical important.

Very much, and thank you for bringing up that very important point of the clinics and the - - , but also the school based clinics 'cause members of the BNT, we all often are faced with once a year, the challenges of trying to refund or trying to make sure that the administration understands that school based clinics are more than just there to test if someone—give a band aid or see if someone has a fever. It's a lot more—or a lice check.

DONNA LIEBERMAN: And I would add by the way that one thing just leads to another in this field, but I would add that equally important and part of women's equality and dignity is

22

2	ensuring that kids who get pregnant are supported,
3	are respected and are able to continue their
4	education, and when you have school based day care
5	services and health services available to high
6	school students for example and their babies, then
7	you are protecting two generations at once, and
8	the roll back over the last decade of the life
9	centers is a terrible, terrible tragedy for a lot
10	of kids because we know that they are proven to
11	work, and we ought to be looking to restoring
12	those and building them up.
13	SASHA AHUJA: And just to add I
14	think we can't forget CUNY and the childcare that
15	is available at our public higher ed institutions.
16	I'm a graduate of Hunter College, where we had a
17	robust childcare program , so we are very much
18	so thinking about again those connections—high
19	school, public higher ed and what that looks like.
20	CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you.

And now we will have Council Member Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Good

23 morning. My daughter graduated from Hunter too.

24 I just didn't want Barron to be the only one --

25 Don't get into my age. The panel has

basically—all of my colleagues have asked all of the questions that I really wanted to ask. I just want to leave with a comment. Dr. Davis, you had made a comment that a lot of these women are voiceless, and I wanted to encourage you and let you know that that is not the case because you are here. You three have presented incredibly and on this panel in this committee you have some of the most fierce activists and people who are champions for you—I mean, Chin, you have Annabel Palma and you have our great Chair that has been a champion of these rights for a long time, and Barron because I don't want to be gender biased. So I'll just leave with some encouragement that they are not voiceless. You are doing a great job.

GHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: I have great gentlemen on this Committee by the way. I just want to again thank you for your testimony, and we are trying to figure out if we can ask the council members to wait a few minutes. We may be able to vote this out today, so we are excited about that. Yay. So thank you, and if you can hang around, and watch us vote, that would be great. We are going to call up the next panel—Jordan Goldberg,

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

also.

Center of Reproductive Rights, Phillip Kim, NYAAF,

the New York Abortion Access Fund, Alison Lee

(phonetic) Turkos, New York Abortion Access Fund

JORDAN GOLDBERG: Thank you, Councilwoman and Chairwoman and the Committee for having me here to testify today. My name is Jordan Goldberg and I'm the state advocacy counsel with the U.S. Legal Program at the Center for Reproductive Rights. I'm here on behalf of the center to testify in support of this resolution, and again, I want to thank you again for having us and for considering this very important resolution. The center is a global human rights organization that promotes women's equality worldwide by securing reproductive rights as human rights that are constitutional and internationally protected and that governments all over the world must respect, protect and fulfill. We work in the U.S. and in countries all over the world on a wide range of reproductive health issues, including access to contraception, pregnancy care, abortion services and medically accurate and unbiased reproductive health information. Resolution 1635-

б

A commemorates the $40^{ m th}$ anniversary of the landmark
Supreme Court decision Roe v. Wade. The court in
Roe recognized that the right to privacy is
protected by the United States Constitution,
extends to individuals rights to choose when and
whether to have children. 20 years later in
Planned Parenthood v. Casey, the Supreme Court
reaffirmed those bedrock principles. I'm not
going to quote the amazing Sandra Day O'Connor
quote that Andrea Miller earlier quoted, but I
will not that the court recognized the necessity
of legal abortion to make sure that women have an
equal place in our society and recognize that for
two decades at the time, people had been planning
their lives around the availability of
contraception and abortion, and that that was
crucial to them. Abortion is one of the most
common surgical procedures sought by women in
America. In fact by age 45, approximately one in
three women in this country will have had an
abortion. Women seek abortions for many reasons-
some choose to terminate unwanted pregnancies,
other women with wanted pregnancies ultimately
must seek abortions to protect their own health or

б

to allow them to seek critical and sometimes
lifesaving care or sometimes in cases of fetal
anomalies; however, as the Council recognizes in
this resolution, those who oppose abortion have
spent the last 40 years trying to prevent women
from exercising their constitutional rights. They
have put forth restrictions and regulations
designed to make abortion inaccessible and
unaffordable and create unnecessary and harmful
barriers. One of the most insidious examples of
this type of regulation is the prohibition of both
public and private insurance coverage for abortion
care. Unfortunately since 1976, the federal
government has adopted the Hyde amendment and
related legislation, preventing many marginalized
women from accessing care. This resolution
recognizes that women need access to a full range
of reproductive health care whether through public
or private insurance. Bans on insurance coverage
for abortion including through the Hyde amendment
are harmful, unfair and disrespectful of women's
autonomy. It's the heavy hand of government used
to coerce women's decision making by withholding
coverage that should be available. When women

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

can't afford to end pregnancies when a women needs to, the impact on her and her family can be really far reaching. She may put off getting medical care or shut off her own hear or telephone in order to be able to pay for the medical care she needs. A few years ago, the Center for Reproductive Rights engaged in a fact finding to figure out exactly what the impact of the Hyde amendment has been on women, and we documented some really disturbing stories of women not paying their rent or choosing to go without food for themselves or their families or turn off their phone or get a second job. There was another story we documented of a women and her husband pawning basically everything they owned and still coming up short for the money that they needed to pay for the abortion service. There was another story of a woman who worked overtime, and her job was braiding hair, and so she worked around the clock 24 hours a day braiding hair in order to make the money that she needed to pay for the services. These stories prove the larger point, which is that it is a critical healthcare service sought by women who are far often forced to make

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

difficult untenable decisions and tradeoffs in their lives to pay for this. As sponsors have noted in this resolution, each woman should have the coverage that she needs for the full range of reproductive healthcare regardless of how her insurance is paid for to ensure that she can have safe care when she needs it. For 20 years, the Center for Reproductive Rights has been litigating in courts and engaging in legislative and other advocacy across the country trying to ensure the protections of the United States Constitution are available to all women in this country and that as the court has recognized in Roe and Casey that women have the right to choose when and whether to have children, we have litigated and continue to litigate in federal and state court to protect these rights. We have challenged legislation that interferes with women's rights to privacy and autonomy and to physician's rights as well. As Roe reaches its 40th anniversary, we are thrilled to have the opportunity to urge the Council to adopt this resolution and to stand with you and so many others as we continue our commitment to protecting and advancing women's reproductive

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 | freedom. Thank you for having me again.

3 ALISON TURKOS: Good morning.

First and foremost, I want to say thank you to the New York City Council for introducing this important resolution. My name is Alison Turkos, and I am member of the board of directors at the New York Abortion Access Fund, also known as NYAAF. NYAAF supports anyone who is unable to pay fully for an abortion and is living in or traveling to New York state by providing financial assistance and connection to other resources. When a clinic we work with sees a patient who needs assistance, NYAAF is one of the potential funding sources to which they turn. Over the last ten years, NYAAF has pledged over \$232,000 to help 764 people access abortion care. We are run completely by volunteers and 100% of donations made to NYAAF go directly to helping people in need pay for abortion. People come from all over the country to access abortion care in New York City. At NYAAF, we have helped people from as close as Pennsylvania and New Jersey to as far as California, Texas, Utah and Bermuda. Some people find that abortion is more affordable in New York

City than in their home states, while others come
from areas where there are no abortion providers
at all. Others come because they may be able to
have procedures done in later terms of pregnancy.
The need for abortion funding is so great that
there are more than 100 abortion funds across the
country. In New York we are fortunate enough to
be one of 17 states where Medicaid covers
abortion. NYAAF works primarily with people who
are uninsured, undocumented or for one reason or
another don't qualify for Medicaid. Believe it or
not, most other abortion funds would call NYAAF
lucky. You may ask yourselves why. Because most
funds are located in states where Medicaid does
not cover abortion or only covers abortion in very
limited and rare circumstances. The Hyde
amendment passed in 1976 prohibits Medicaid from
covering abortion services. In fact, abortion is
the only medical procedure banned from Medicaid
coverage. The intent of the Hyde amendment is to
make it more difficult for low income people to
get the abortions they need. Because of the Hyde
amendment, low income people sell their
belongings, go hungry for weeks as they save up

their grocery money or risk eviction by using
their rent money for an abortion. Some people
never manage to get the money they need to pay for
the abortion, which means that they are forced to
carry their pregnancy to term. Abortion funds
work every day to make sure this doesn't happen.
We here in New York are privileged to live in a
state where we have Medicaid coverage of abortion,
but we know that is not enough. NYAAF is thankful
for these courageous city council members who
recognize that abortion must be safe and legal,
but it also has to be accessible, affordable and
covered by health insurance. We hope this
resolution will push people to think about
abortion not just as a matter of choice, but as a
matter of economic and reproductive justice.
Thank you.

PHILLIP KIM: Hi. My name is

Phillip Kim, and I am a co-chair on the board of directors of the New York Abortion Access Fund. I work with Alison. Board members have to take week long shifts returning calls to the hotline and negotiating with clinics. I have witnessed how withholding comprehensive reproductive healthcare

affects real people. Real people who struggle to		
overcome cultural stigma, political injustices and		
economic barriers to access the care they want,		
the care they need and the care they deserve. Dr.		
Davis commented on people who fall outside of		
Medicaid, but don't make enough to have enough to		
afford these expensive procedures, and that is		
when they call these donor supported abortion		
funds. I've had calls from people varying in age		
from 15 to 42 who weren't ready or able to become		
parents. I've had calls from people who wanted to		
become parents, but had medical complications. I		
have had calls from people who got pregnant on		
purpose, by accident, and against their will. The		
two things these people had in common was their		
need for a medical procedure and not knowing how		
to pay for it. I witnessed firsthand that		
abortions are a medical necessity, always have		
been, and always will be. Until policies reflect		
that reality, it is an injustice that must be		
rectified. This is why I volunteer with the New		
York Abortion Access Fund, and this is why I		
support your resolution. Thank you.		

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: Thank you

very much for your testimony today, and it means a
great deal, especially I think the fund
perspective is an important perspective, the
advocacy and the points that you bring help make
the testimony even better for the record, so I
thank you for this, and I'm just really excited
that we are going to be voting on this today, so I
think if we have no further testimony, we are
going to ask for the roll call, and I just want to
say that I am hoping and highly recommending to
all of my colleagues to vote in support and in
favor of reso number 1635-A, so that we can
continue to send a clear message of where we stand
here in the Council, and then this will be voted
out in the next Stated. Again, I ask my
colleagues to vote aye. Thank you.
COMMITTEE CLERK: William Martin,
Committee Clerk. Roll call vote, Committee on
Women's Issues resolution 1635-A. Council Member
Ferreras?
CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS: I vote aye
and again, please vote aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Let's see ...

I, Kimberley Uhlig certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature	Kimberley	Uhlig
Date	1/24/13	