CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY
COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

-----X

October 28, 2011 Start: 1:11 p.m. Recess: 1:44 p.m.

HELD AT:

Council Chambers

City Hall

B E F O R E:

GALE A. BREWER FERNANDO CABRERA Chairpersons

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Inez E. Dickens Erik Martin Dilan

Domenic M. Recchia, Jr. Peter F. Vallone, Jr.

Letitia James

G. Oliver Koppell Mark S. Weprin

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jason Nicolai Senior Manager of Community Relations CFY

Michael Capobianco Director of Development MOUSE

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Good morning.

I'm Gale Brewer, City Council Member for the west side and head of Governmental Operations, and we're here with an amazing individual who is head of technology--Fernando Cabrera. We will be sharing this hearing. So I am glad to be working with the Technology Committee; it's a Committee that I love and I love the work that they do. is my co-chairmen's important resolution, and it concerns two issues that are important to all of us--technology and our amazing not for profit organizations. That's why I think particularly this is an important issue. It's incredibly important that the community's served by the not for profit organizations. Those organizations work with seniors, individuals with disabilities and low-income families and individuals, and they must have access to computers and to software, to equipment. And in fact this morning I had a hearing in the Aging Committee on just this issue--how to get software and equipment to the seniors, but in these difficult economic times with budgets being cut and private contributions harder to come by, we have to think outside the box and come up

2.

with new ways to provide organizations with
support and resources they require. And that's
why the resolution sponsored by Council Member
Cabrera is so important and it would authorize the
Department of City-Wide Administrative Services,
known as DCAS, which is overseen by the
Governmental Operations Committee, to donate
surplus city-owned computers, software and
equipment to the not for profit organizations. I
look forward to hearing from these organizations
about how they would benefit and I know one of
their questions might be, "how good is the
equipment?" Thank you very much, and now we'll
hear from the wonderful chair of Technology.

much, Co-Chair Brewer and I'm really honored to be co-chairing this with you since you really have done a lot of work in foundational work [phonetic] in this Technology Committee, in which you're also a part of. It's very comforting to know that -- we have the historical background and expertise.

Good afternoon, and welcome to this hearing on proposed Resolution 999--interesting number--which authorizes the New York City Department of City-

Wide Administrative Services, DCAS, to donate 2 surplus city-owned computers, computer software 3 and computer equipment to public and private 4 5 institutions for secular educational use and to not for profit institutions for use by individuals 6 with disabilities, senior citizens or low-income individuals. Many educational programs and not 9 for profit institutions have insufficient supply 10 of computers or computers and computer equipment 11 of inadequate quality to keep up with the growing 12 demand for technology. DCAS does not currently 13 have the authority to create a policy for the 14 donation of surplus computer equipment to non-city 15 entities. Section 104-C of the New York State 16 General Municipal Law allows the governing board 17 of a municipality to adopt policies by resolution 18 authorizing the donation of computers to the types 19 of organizations previously mentioned. 20 donations will be required to be based on a public notification process and competitive proposals for 21 22 eligible organizations through which the 23 institutions requesting donations must demonstrate 24 need and specific plans for the use of such 25 equipment. Donations of computer equipment to

2.

institutions operating educational programs and
those providing services for persons with
disabilities, senior citizens or low-income
individuals will assist in the disposal [phonetic]
of needed equipment is mutually beneficial for the
city and the recipients of the donations and is an
efficient use of government resources. So while
I'm at it, let me just recognize the staff of the
Committee on Technology, Jeffrey Baker, counsel;
and Crystal Goldpon [phonetic], policy analyst and
I see Council Member Koppell from the Technology
Committee, and I'll turn it back to Council Member
Gale Brewer to introduce her Committee.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Councilman, we have wonderful Council Member from the village of Harlem, Inez Dickens. And now we also have the amazing Seth Grossman, who is counsel to Governmental Operations and Tym Matusov, who is the policy analyst, so I think now we'll just call the panel.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Let me just point out it is the policy of the administration not to come for resolutions, but this afternoon - privileged to have Michael Capobianco [phonetic]

1	TECHNOLOGY AND GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 7
2	from and Jason Nicolai from CFY. Could you
3	please come forward?
4	CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Computers for
5	Youthtranslate it.
6	CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Yes.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Mr.
8	Chairman, though I am sympathetic to the purpose
9	of the resolution, aren't you concerned that if
10	it's announced that we support Resolution 999, it
11	might be interpreted that we're getting involved
12	in a Republican primary?
13	CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: That's an
14	interesting suggestion. I didn't come up with the
15	numbers.
16	[background conversation]
17	JASON NICOLAI: The mic's on? Good
18	afternoon, Chair Cabrera, Chair Brewer and
19	honorable Council Members, my name is Jason
20	Nicolai. Thank you for the opportunity to speak
21	here today. I am the senior manager of community
22	relations for an education non-profit called CFY.
23	First, on behalf of the CFY team, I want to
24	personally thank the New York City Council for its
25	steadfast support of our program for the past six

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

years. CFY, formerly known as Computers for Youth, partners with low-income students to help students, families and teachers harness the power of digital learning to improve educational outcomes. Through our extraordinary partnership with the Department of Information Technology and Telecommunications and the Department of Education on the connected learning initiative, we currently serve over 70 high-poverty schools city-wide. served over 8700 families last year and are on track to serving the same number again this year. I also want to acknowledge the efforts of DUIT and DOE for the commitment to this program. we're making a big difference for low-income families throughout the city. When CFY learned that a resolution was being proposed by the City Council to urge the New York City Department of City-Wide Administrative Services to donate surplus city-owned computers, computer software and computer equipment to public and private institutions, our organization was eager to voice our support by sharing with you how this resolution could strengthen our ability to support students, teachers and parents in New York City's

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 low-income communities.

I would like to tell you a little bit more about how CFY brings technology, tools, training and resources to New York City communities through our digital learning program. First, we establish a partnership with a New York City public middle school in a low-income community, enlisting the support of both the principal and teachers. We organize Saturday training sessions at the school--what we call family learning workshops. At these workshops, families are working together on a refurbished computer that we call a home learning center. home learning center is preloaded with more than 50 high quality education software and titles. Families also learn about educational resources available on the Internet and learn how to gain access to hundreds of digital learning activities on CFY's free online learning platform, - -Learning dot com. After they complete the Saturday workshop with their families, students leave with the home learning center they were working on that day. It is theirs to keep. educational software, both on the home learning

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

center and through - - learning is designed to not only enhance a student's performance in the classroom, but also to extend their learning beyond the classroom. To maximize this expanded learning opportunity, CFY also provides training for teachers at the school, so they can take full advantage of these educational tools and resources the students now have. Lastly, qualifying families are also given the opportunity to sign up for discounted broadband services through Time Warner Cable or Cablevision, making it easier for them to access the online learning activities. Our organization has been providing services to New York City families for more than a decade, and has served over 25,000 families to date. Council's approval of the donation of surplus city computers, computer software and computer equipment will help broaden CFY's resources for helping students, teachers and parents across the New York City Metro Area. On a personal note, I'd like to share my favorite part of working for an organization like CFY. There is nothing like the feeling I get when I watch a student and parent head home with their computers. Their smiles and

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 the gratitude we get from families is priceless.

3 As they walk out the door, it's obvious that they

4 already know the positive impact the computer and

5 the educational resources will have in their

6 child's future. Access to more computers,

7 computer software and computer equipment would

8 deepen CFY's impact on that educational future of

9 thousands of New York City students in low-income

10 communities, leading to more smiles from students

and families and more importantly, deeper

12 | educational impact. Thank you for the opportunity

to speak on behalf of CFY.

MICHAEL CAPOBIANCO: Thank you to the Council for allowing me to make some brief remarks. Thank you Co-Chair Brewer and Co-Chair Council Member Cabrera. Good afternoon. My name is Mike Capobianco, and I'm the director of development at MOUSE [phonetic], a national non-profit based here in New York City. As many of you probably know, MOUSE is an innovative use development organization that empowers underserved students to provide technology support and leadership in their schools, supporting their academic and career success. We are the MOUSE

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

squad and we are currently in 127 New York City Schools. MOUSE continues to pioneer innovate in school programs in all five boroughs of New York City in support of our mission, and we appreciate all the members of the City Council who have supported us over the almost 15 years that we have dedicated ourselves to serving New York City schools, students and the communities they live MOUSE supports Resolution No. 999 because of in. what it can mean for low-income families, individuals, students and for the many institutions with limited resources that provide vital services to these populations. resolution will also have the added benefit of delaying the added burden end of life electronics place on our environment. Resolution No. 999 is also an important step to ensuring that all organizations assisting the city's most vulnerable populations have access to computers and software, allowing them to spend their vital unlimited resources directly on serving their constituencies. On a personal note, since moving from the corporate sector to dedicate myself to the non-profit sector, I have seen the impact of

providing access to technology to individuals,
families and institutions that normally would have
to do without. I have worked for in the
Bronx, whose focus is on breaking the cycle of
poverty by offering technology, career training,
education and low cost computers to individuals
and families in low income communities. After
, I was a member of the CFY team, say your
mission, a national non-profit whose focus is to
help students in low-income communities together
with their teachers and families harness the power
of digital learning to improve educational
outcomes. Over the course of many years and in
many circumstances, I have seen firsthand how
access to technology and in turn all the
opportunities it offers can literally turn a
person's life around and help organizations
deliver vital services to assist in that process.
I am now with MOUSE, an organization that utilizes
technology as a catalyst to transform the lives of
thousands of New York City's youth, preparing them
for college and career success. We must do
everything to ensure every person has access and
we should do everything in our power to ensure

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

that all technology is utilized effectively, 2 meaning when it has run its life cycle, it is 3 disposed of following all the city, state and 4 5 federal regulations that were enacted ensuring the least amount of environmental impact. Let me end 6 by saying once again, we applaud you for taking the lead on such an important initiative and to 9 thank you again for the opportunity to speak in 10 front of all of you today.

> CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Thank you both. I know your organizations well. I feel like I live with you 'cause I know them so well. And - - extremely proud of and have the same high regard. My question is how do you get your equipment now? From donations or do you purchase it 'cause obviously--I don't know about the CFY, Computers for Youth obviously gets some that go out the door in the shopping carts or whatever is appropriate and MOUSE obviously works in the schools. So how do you get it now? And then, if it's not in top notch condition as might or might not be from DCAS, how would you go about restoring it so that it's useable for the individuals?

> > JASON NICOLAI: We currently get

most of our computer systems from a grant that we received from the Department of Commerce called the BTOP [phonetic] grant. That grant is actually scheduled to terminate in 2013. We have still been collecting donations from the city and are in the process of refurbishing those computers. When that grant ends, that process will continue when we receive donations, we will refurbish those computers and then we'll give them to families. Whenever we get a computer, we do what we possibly can to make sure that it can go out the door and go to a family, so we're just going to restart the process of refurbishing the computers going forward.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: How many do you get from the city now or do you not compile that information? Obviously I know you get a lot from corporate America.

JASON NICOLAI: We do--I don't have the exact number, but we do get some computers from HRA right now and we do refurbish those computers, but we have been getting computers from the city still.

MICHAEL CAPOBIANCO: Currently we

do not receive any computers from the city and MOUSE, although we are a technology non-profit, we use refurbished computers in a limited way, but from personal experience, I have definitely seen many non-profits that go without technology that are serving vital communities that obviously this initiative would help—this resolution would help greatly.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much. Just curious, what's the usual cost to refurbish the computers?

JASON NICOLAI: I'm unfortunately going to have to defer to - - response. Currently since most of our technology comes through the BTOP grant, and that's actually being purchased, I can't give you the exact amount of what the refurbish costs is. I, myself, am new to CFY and I am--because of the BTOP grant I was actually hired, so I haven't seen the cost associated before the BTOP grant, so unfortunately, I can't give you an exact response.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: So what do you foresee then would be the burden to your type of non-profit, technology based non-profits, in

this process? What will be like the toughest piece to this? Will it be the refurbishing? The storage?

The dissemination? Which part?

JASON NICOLAI: The refurbishing is definitely a complicated process, especially if we're loading the computer with our educational software, and if we are going to serve the same amount of families after the BTOP funding runs outs, that will be a significant investment in our staff to actually be able to refurbish those computers and actually get those donations in.

MICHAEL CAPOBIANCO: I was going to say to Council Member Brewer's point; it's the quality of the computer. CFY back when I was there in 2005 and 2006, I think Pentium 3 was the computer of choice or maybe Pentium 4 was cutting edge. It depends on what you're working with right now and what the city is working with. Typically from what I've seen, the city tends to use computers to their full life cycle and then disposes, but they can be upgraded; they can be utilized; they can be loaded with basic software and organizations can absolutely make use of that equipment. Most of the equipment coming out of

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

there is probably fully has the hard drive, has
the memory, has all the pieces that you would need

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Do you have a person that handles the criteria or do you just take all the computers in? What do you foresee doing here and then just disposing those you don't need? How would you go about it?

to use that equipment, and it should be utilized.

JASON NICOLAI: We make every effort possible to use the technology that we're given whether it's breaking it down and taking some of the pieces out, where there's a video card and using it in a different system, so whatever technology we get to the best of our ability we try to use that technology to help families. Although I'm new to CFY--I've only been there about 15 months--I have had the opportunity to see families come with a computer before the BTOP grant, and I can tell you that no matter what, the technology in the home makes a difference whatever that technology is. Many of the schools--all the schools are in low-income communities, title 1 schools, so some of these families don't have any technology in the household, so the fact that we

can get a piece of hardware with educationalcontent on it will make a difference.

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: My other question having seen this evolve for the last ten years and having started thinking about technology a long time ago, one of the challenges in the school and you know this from MOUSE and from CFY that you don't want to have incompatibility, so sometimes when you bring in a new piece I know the schools at one point started saying, "No, thank you." I don't want that because a) I have to refurbish it, but b) it's not going to be compatible, so how--again, is incompatibility a challenge in the schools or maybe in the senior center, et cetera? I'm all for donations, but I don't want to burden the running around computer tech who's may or may not - - MOUSE or may or may not have CFY in that school and they need to refurbish and they need to make it compatible. The teachers and the principals complain to me that there's nobody to do that. Not everybody has

a MOUSE squad, so I'm just wondering if

compatibility is an issue?

25

JASON NICOLAI: At least from CFY

and of course if MOUSE squad is in school, it's a huge benefit, but at CFY we have a 24 hour, 7 day a week bilingual tech support line. One of the things that we do as well is there any issue with the computer that can't be resolved over the phone, we allow the families to actually come in to our New York City location, and we swap that computer out, no questions asked. In terms of compatibility, we're doing everything in our power to make sure whatever equipment we're providing to families is compatible to the needs of the schools and to the families. If it's not, of course, we're going to try not to place that hardware in that family's hands.

MICHAEL CAPOBIANCO: To answer your question, Council Member Brewer, I think the senior centers are probably going to be an easier placement for this type of equipment, where schools will be difficult only because of the equipment itself, but the software has to be compatible and I think DOE gets pretty strict about what you place into the schools and what they're willing to support, so I think the senior centers would be a phenomenal receiver for this-=

but of course, we're always looking to the future

25

and handheld devices is of course something of t	:he
future, so that is something that we will	
obviously continue to monitor as the technology	
changes.	

MICHAEL CAPOBIANCO: Handheld meaning like a Blackberry or more an iPad?

MALE VOICE: Or both.

MICHAEL CAPOBIANCO: Both. MOUSE wouldn't be able to, but there are organizations that absolutely would love to have that type of mobility that they do not have at this time.

MALE VOICE: Some schools right know I know that the state level, they just a few months ago allow now for principals to purchase tablets instead of textbook and inserting the textbook inside the tablets and that's why I was asking because when it comes to the tablets maybe that's the way to go as we see that becoming more of the norm. Any feedback regarding that?

MICHAEL CAPOBIANCO: If you look at a school like Hudson High and schools like those-those technology high schools that are all--there are no textbooks. We have a MOUSE squad at Hudson High and that is a school absolutely would be--if

they're having success, other schools are going to

want to model that success and have the access to

that type of technology, so yes.

MALE VOICE: Do you see that the students are more engaged by the use of the tablets than textbook?

MICHAEL CAPOBIANCO: Yes. I think the question is is what's the outcome of that.

They are more engaged. Are they learning better?

Are they having more success? Are they--I think that question is still sort of out on the table, but certainly more engaged.

Question would be regarding this legislation.

Have you--you've obviously been working with HRA.

Do you know what HRA donates or do you know maybe from your past experience at Per Scholas if other city agencies have donated and if so, what? And if so, was it helpful? Obviously, if you suggest anything that's able to be rejuvenated and used is helpful, but I also worry that you could end up with a lot hardware that you don't want, and that's not something that would be helpful on any level. So I'm just wondering when you get from

HRA, what do you get? And if you've talked to people at Per Scholas or other organizations that do accept currently from the city or state or any government entity, what is the experience in terms of having to restore it?

Speak too much to the technology that we're receiving from HRA. I can tell you that we do try to refurbish those computers and we actually have used them to swap them out to families that were before the BTOP grant, so we are using that technology when we receive it. If it's technology that we can't use then we do recycle that way if it's something that cannot be used by any family.

MICHAEL CAPOBIANCO: I'm not sure if Per Scholas is still in the business of recycling, but from what I remember I was there, the organization was open to all types of equipment and the stuff that we did receive from the city a lot of times did lack parts and pieces because it was sort of pulling from one to make another work, but we were in that business, so we would purchase hard drives at bulk, memory at bulk—the things that computers needed—and then

we were able to refurbish and make it part of
their access programs, so in the end very
successful, but there were certainly challenges
and a little more expensive for us to refurbish to
get those ready to provide to families.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: It would be my experience, Per Scholas is still in the business.

I was at their training site fairly recently and -, but I think one of the challenges with the city is we tend to hold on to our hardware software longer than perhaps a corporation or a bank that's upgrading, and so you will find that I'm sure as an ongoing challenge. I have no idea what else might come from DCAS, but certainly it will have seen its day.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Do you have the staff--as you know this is going to be based on competitive bids--do you have the staff to handle the proposals that are going to be put forth?

JASON NICOLAI: We have a dedicated warehouse staff and that staff is dedicated to refurbishing the computers, if need be, so we do have the staff to refurbish the technology.

2.

MICHAEL CAPOBIANCO: MOUSE isn't
as part of our missionit does not refurbish
equipment.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Getting back to this issue, do you have experienced staff-
JASON NICOLAI: [Interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Okay.

Excellent. Excellent. Getting back to the school 'cause you just got me curious as to--and I know computers is a tool, and I saw your expression, so you just got me curious, do you think it's an effective tool as far as you have seen? I know it's anecdotal we don't have data on this yet that I know of--maybe you do... Do you have data on that? Okay, so tell me about the data. I have a tablet. I have a laptop. I have all the toys, but there is something about holding a book in your hands--what have you seen so far? What's the research on this area?

MICHAEL CAPOBIANCO: To be purely--what's the right word? Opinion and anecdotal by
observation, definitely the students are to your
point more engaged and because the technology does
allow immediate access to the Internet and all the

information obviously that's out there, they can support lesson plans and many many vendors out there that provide curriculum to the schools are providing as part of the curriculum Internet access. So in that sense, I think there's a great opportunity for kids to use technology, but at the end of the day, you still have to have effective teachers and effective leadership to really affect outcomes for kids.

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: So your concern is - - in the spectrum is not on the technology side; it's really on the teaching side.

MICHAEL CAPOBIANCO: Yeah. I should say before this I was a member of the New Leaders for New Schools team and we often struggled with technology in the classroom if that was a catalyst to improve student outcomes, and I mean you can look at a New York Times article that came out last week where they said it is not, and then you can look at another article that said it's absolutely a necessary piece of a child's education. So it depends what you're reading, I guess. Right?

CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Let me

acknowledge Council Member Weprin. He has joinedus right now.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: One other question is when you see light beyond the BTOP, do you have any sense of how many refurbished or even new computers, you'll need? How many are you using now that you're able to purchase with a federal grant? What do you think your needs are going to be into the future just for CFY I guess?

JASON NICOLAI: Obviously we would love to continue to serve the amount of families that we're currently serving. Without the BTOP grant, it's going to make it highly difficult to do that--

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: [Interposing]

I'm sure you'll find a way. What generally is the number that you need per year to keep the current level, and also, what happens if people's homes as we know--it lasts about 5 years, and then they're going to need something new?

JASON NICOLAI: So we've served 8700 families per year due to the BTOP grant. If we were able to maintain that obviously there are a lot of families that could use the technology

depends on the school 'cause we can go to a school like Hudson High, and they have the latest greatest--

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: [Interposing]
Yeah, but that's not a good example.

another school and their lab is barely running and they're using duct tape and wires and it seems unfair, but it's how funding is distributed, and those are the schools if this initiative could help get better computers into the schools, it would be such an incredible improvement. I spent a lot of years in New York City schools, and you definitely see the difference between school to school.

CHAIRPERSON BREWER: Okay. Well, we want to thank you for your many years of institutional support between the two institutions, the two non-profits that have made a huge difference in this city and both of you for not only being here today, but I think the fact that you shared your personal stories and how you got to where you are. That added for me anyway a lot to your testimony. It wasn't dry; it was

I, Kimberley Uhlig certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Kimberley Uhlig

Signature

Date _____11/11/11